TEXT FLY WITHIN
THE BOOK ONLY

UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY

OU_160016

UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY

This book is a gift to the library by
Dr. Pasupuleti Gopala Krishnayya,
President, Krishnayya's News
Service and Publications, New York
City, as part of a collection of
American books given in memory of
His Beloved Twin Brothers
Rama (Med. St) & Bala Krishṇayya
(Eng.)

OSMANIA UNIVERSITY LIBRARY

Call No. 277.3 | B96 C Accession No. G. 1105-1

Author Burr, Nelson R

Title Critical bibliography in America. 1961
Vol.4. pt.2

This book should be returned on or before the date last marked below.

A CRITICAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RELIGION IN AMERICA

PRINCETON STUDIES

IN AMERICAN CIVILIZATION

NUMBER 5

VOLUME IV, PARTS 1 AND 2

RELIGION IN AMERICAN LIFE

This book is a gift to the library by
Dr. Pasupuleti Gopala Krishnayya,
President, Krishnayya's News
Service and Publications, New York
City, as part of a collection of
American books given in memory of
Beloved Twin Brothers
R (ed. Stu.) & Bala Krishnayya
(Eng.)

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RELIGION IN AMERICA

BY NELSON R. BURR

IN COLLABORATION WITH THE EDITORS:
JAMES WARD SMITH AND A. LELAND JAMISON

PRINCETON, NEW JERSEY
PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS
1961

Copyright © 1961, by Princeton University Press
All rights reserved
L. C. Card 61-5383

The Editors wish to express their gratitude
to the Carnegie Foundation
for a generous grant which made these four volumes possible,
and to Mrs. Helen Wright
for her continuous invaluable assistance in many ways.

Printed in the United States of America
by Vail-Ballou Press, Binghamton, New York

FOREWORD

The Editors

This bibliography is the final volume (bound as two separate books) of a series of four volumes on the general subject, "Religion in American Life." The general principles of the series and a brief history of its development will be found in the introductory essay to Volume 1 (*The Shaping of American Religion*). The series as a whole emerged from the experience of the Special Program in American Civilization at Princeton University in offering seminars on this subject during the academic years 1948–1949, 1953–1954, 1957–1958. The conviction that a bibliography of the kind here presented is gravely needed, and a general conception of major headings and divisions grew out of the problems confronted in teaching those conferences. It became increasingly evident that no thorough and synoptic coverage of the subject exists either in the form of a general history of religious influences in American culture or in the form of a thorough and critical bibliography of the writings of limited scope which do exist. In teaching the conferences the faculty outlined approximately 100 topics for general reading and individual papers with selected bibliographical suggestions for each. The suggestions were cast in the form of brief critical essays designed to direct the students' attention to the most adequate literature in each area and to suggest what seemed to be the most fruitful avenues of approach to particular subjects of research. Some 2,000 titles of books and articles were thereby accumulated and classified. By the spring of 1957 it had become evident that we already had in hand the sketch of a more adequate bibliography than yet existed in print. At the same time it was fully evident that there were vast areas that we had as yet left untouched, and the decision was made to call in professional help. By what we have now learned to think of as a great stroke of good fortune we were able to obtain the services for three full academic terms of

Dr. Nelson R. Burr of the Library of Congress, to expand and to mold into shape the bibliography as it is here presented.

Dr. Burr in his own preface refers to his dependence upon the material accumulated by the Princeton Program—a dependence not only upon the material accumulated but also upon the already established principles of arrangement and selection. Nothing, however, should be allowed to distract attention from the enormity of Dr. Burr's accomplishment. The thoroughness, the accuracy, and the almost unbelievable readability of this bibliography in its final form are due almost wholly to him. The editors' tribute to Dr. Burr will be found on the title page, where we list him alone as author and relegate ourselves to the status of collaborators.

Apart from its value in achieving some kind of order out of chaos, we believe that this bibliography—perhaps even more than the essays of earlier volumes—will give the reader a synoptic sense of the breadth and the depth of the problem of tracing religious influences in American life. Even a cursory inspection of the table of contents should serve to indicate how widespread and how important have been the ways in which religious ideas and religious traditions have played a part in the total life of the American people.

PREFACE

This bibliography was compiled with a twofold intention: to provide a general review of the history of religion in the United States, and to supply references to illustrate the manifold influences of religion in American life and thought. The historical and critical notes and the titles are combined in a continuous text, which forms a kind of narrative. If the bibliographic details were removed, the notes in themselves would constitute, in some measure, an account of American religious development.

The literature of American religion is so colossal that a bibliography of this kind must be selective. A comprehensive bibliography merely for the denominations and sects would be as large as these two books. The intention has been to select titles which seemed to be essential and illustrative of movements and influences. The result is the inclusion of numerous articles, essays, and theses, located in various bibliographies. Some of the theses are unpublished, and for these locations have been supplied whenever possible.

The descriptive and critical notes, especially for articles, were derived from reading; or, for some books, from reviews or digests of reviews. The content of many theses was examined in the *Dissertation Abstracts*, in abstracts published by colleges and universities, and in *Doctoral Dissertations in the Field of Religion, 1940–1952* (New York, Columbia University Press, 1954).

In some sections, covering large areas with extensive good literature, the references are mostly books with large bibliographies. Other sections, with comparatively scanty historical literature in English, consist largely of articles. The treatment of Eastern Orthodoxy and Oriental faiths, in this way, may seem disproportionate. This is due to the fact that these usually are not extensively represented in bibliographies of American religion, and that they are influential out of proportion to their numerical strength. This is true also of such

small but important groups as the Unitarians, Transcendentalists, Deists, and Freethinkers.

The introductory notes to many of the sections were derived partly from reading, and partly from the unpublished annotated bibliographies compiled for use in seminars by the staff of the Special Program in American Civilization of Princeton University. In some instances the text was used practically verbatim. These lists supplied the basic general outline for this work. They represent many years of reading and discussion in the seminars, and this bibliography is virtually an expansion of them. The sections of Part Five on theology and philosophy are parallel to the essay, "American Theology" by Sydney Ahlstrom, in Volume One, and George Reuben Metcalf's long essay, "American Religious Philosophy and the Pastoral Letters of the House of Bishops," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1958), pp. 8–84 (see Part Five, sect. IV, *Religion and Philosophy*, A, *General*, for reference).

NELSON R. BURR

Washington, D.C.
November 6, 1960

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am indebted to many persons for their interest and assistance. Foremost among them are my colleagues of the Special Program in American Civilization at Princeton University. The editor, Professor James Ward Smith, has given constant counsel and encouragement. Doctor Albert Leland Jamison (now chairman of the Department of Religion, Syracuse University) read large portions of the text and constantly helped in locating books and numerous articles, especially in the history of denominations and sects, and in the fields of psychology and theology. Mrs. Helen Wright, secretary of the Program, patiently handled a large amount of correspondence, supervised the typing of portions of the manuscript, and assisted in proof-reading and indexing.

Professor Donald H. Egbert, of the Department of Art and Archaeology, generously gave suggestions regarding literature relating to church art and architecture. Professor Carlos Baker of the English Department examined the section of Part Four on religion and literature. Mr. Duncan Van Dusen, of the Princeton Class of 1958, gave the benefit of his research in the bibliography of the Ecumenical Movement. I am grateful to Kenneth S. Gapp and his staff at the Speer Memorial Library of the Princeton Theological Seminary, and to Mr. Malcolm Young, formerly the reference librarian of the Firestone Library of Princeton University. Mr. Milton Halsey Thomas, Archivist of the University, assisted me in locating biographical and genealogical references, in his former capacity as Archivist of Columbia University.

To Mr. L. Quincy Mumford, the Librarian of Congress, and to Mr. Herbert J. Sanborn, my former chief in the Exhibits Office of the Library, I owe my gratitude for a leave of absence in Princeton. Mr. Verner W. Clapp, the former Chief Assistant Librarian of Congress, recommended my services to the Special Program in American Civilization. For advice and assistance I am obliged to Mrs. Grace Hadley

Fuller and Mr. Donald Mugridge of the General Reference and Bibliography Division. Their colleague, Mr. Alan Anderson, gave many valuable suggestions in the field of religion and literature. Mrs. Lucile Haseman and Miss Virginia Daiker, of the Prints and Photographs Division, suggested bibliographies and collections of illustrations in American church art and architecture. The reference staff of the Music Division guided me to bibliographies and articles on American church music, and Dr. Leonard W. Ellinwood of the Subject Cataloging Division examined and enlarged by suggestions the portion of Part Four devoted to music. Dr. Lawrence Marwick and Mr. Myron Weinstein of the Hebraic Section suggested many titles on American Judaism, and Mr. John T. Dorosh of the Slavic and Central European Division supplied titles for the history of Eastern Orthodoxy. Colonel Willard Webb, Chief of the Stack and Reader Division, gave me permission to use study rooms during two extended visits to the Library.

I received help from Mr. Joseph L. Rubin of the B'nai Brith Library in Washington; the library of the Islamic Center in Washington; the library of the Virginia Theological Seminary, Alexandria; the library of the Catholic University of America; and Dr. Glanville Downey of Dumbarton Oaks in Washington, an authority on Byzantine history and the Eastern Orthodox churches. In New York City I was greatly indebted to the efficient assistance of the staffs of the New York Public Library, and the library of the General Theological Seminary, and to Robert F. Beach, the librarian of Union Theological Seminary.

The Rev. Dr. Carl S. Meyer, Director of Graduate Studies at the Concordia Seminary in St. Louis, advised concerning writings in Lutheran theology. Dr. Otto Kinkeldey, Professor Emeritus of Musicology at Cornell University, supplied many references regarding early American church music. Dr. William R. Hutchison, of the faculty of the American University in Washington, examined the sections of Part Two on Uni-

tarianism and Transcendentalism. James F. Hornback, leader of the Ethical Society of St. Louis, read the part on Ethical Culture and supplied titles and valuable suggestions regarding leaders. Professor Sydney E. Ahlstrom of the Yale Divinity School read Part Five and suggested additional titles. The Rev. Dr. Henry J. Browne of Cathedral College, New York City, gave advice concerning bibliography of the Roman Catholic Church.

N.R.B.

CONTENTS, VOLUME IV
PARTS ONE AND TWO

Foreword v
Preface vii
Acknowledgments ix

PART ONE

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL GUIDES: GENERAL SURVEYS AND HISTORIES

General Introductory Remarks 3

I. Bibliographical Guides

A. General Bibliographical Guides 4
B. General Religious and Ecclesiastical History 5
C. American History: General 7
D. American Church History 8
E. Guides to Dissertations and Theses 12
F. Archival Depositories: Source Materials 14

II. Periodical Indexes and Guides

A. Directories and Special Lists 19
B. Special Indexes and Lists 20
C. Histories of Periodical Literature 21

III. Religious Historiography

IV. Miscellaneous Guides

A. Almanacs 27
B. Dictionaries and Encyclopedias 28
C. Yearbooks 29
D. Directories and Handbooks 31
E. Censuses 34
F. Atlases 36

V. Biographical Sources

A. Bibliographies 37
B. Biographical Dictionaries and Encyclopedias (General) 39
C. Genealogical Sources 42
D. Clergy: Specific Directories, Encyclopedias, Lists 44
E. College Directories and General Catalogs 47
F. Seminary Directories and General Catalogs 53

VI. General Histories and Surveys

A. General Secular Histories 55
B. Factual Surveys and Histories by Churchmen 57
C. Early General Social Surveys 59
D. Later Sociological Interpretation 62

VII. European Background

A. General References 65
B. The Protestant Reformation 67
1. General Bibliography 67
2. General Histories 68
C. The Reformation in Various Countries 70
1. Germany: Lutheranism and the Sects 71
2. The Reformation in Scandinavia 73
3. The Reformed and Presbyterian Tradition 73
4. The Reformation in England 76
5. Protestant Nonconformity 78
D. Religious Motives in Colonization 79

PART TWO

EVOLUTION OF AMERICAN RELIGION

I. From State Churches to Disestablishment

A. The Anglican Church 87
1. Sources and General History 87
2. Colonial Establishments of Anglicanism 91

B. The New England Puritan Churches 98
1. The Theocratic Holy Commonwealth 98
2. Theocracy and Society 102
3. The Puritan Heritage and Controversy 105
C. The Reformed Dutch Church 109
D. The Swedish Lutheran Church 110

II. The Battle for Disestablishment

A. Roger Williams 111
B. Reaction Against the State Churches 113

III. The Eighteenth Century. Conflicting Anti-Traditional Movements

A. Revivalism and Its Continuing Influence 117
1. German Pietist Evangelism 117
2. The New Jersey Revivals 121
3. The New England Awakening 126
4. The Methodist Element in Revivalism 137
5. Whitefield, the "Wayfaring Witness" 144
6. Critics and Controversy 148
7. The Great Awakening: History and Interpretation 152
8. The Second Great Awakening 155
9. Revivalism as the Religion of the Frontier 158
10. The Emergence of Urban Revivalism 164
11. Defense of Revivalism 169
12. Criticism of Revivals 172
13. The Decline of Evangelism 174
14. Psychological Study of Revivals 176
15. Revivalist Biography 177
16. General Histories of Revivalism 181
B. The Rise of Rational Religion 184
1. The Eighteenth-Century Religion of Nature 184
2. English Deism 187
3. Deism Invades America 193
4. Deism and the Anglican Philosophers 200

C. The Liberalizing Influence of Jefferson 206
D. Universalism 210
E. Unitarianism 219
1. Origins 219
2. The English Background 221
3. American Origins 225
4. Early American Unitarian Thought 229
5. Modern American Unitarianism 233
6. Transcendental Unitarianism 237
F. Transcendental Religion 239
G. Free Thought; Free and Radical Religion 255
H. Ethical Culture 264

IV. Development of the Standard Denominational Pattern

A. General 272
B. Typical 274
1. Anglicanism (Episcopal Church) 275
a. Bibliography and General History 276
b. Organization: Republican Episcopacy 277
c. Low and High Church 279
2. Congregationalism 282
a. Bibliography and General History 282
b. Evolution of the Pilgrim Faith 283
3. Baptists 285
a. Bibliography and General History 285
b. Divisions 287
4. Disciples of Christ and Closely Related Groups 288
5. Methodists 291
a. Bibliography and General History 292
b. Divisions 294
c. Methodism in Action 297
6. Presbyterian and Reformed Churches 297
a. Presbyterians 297
Divisions and Reunions 300
b. Reformed Dutch Church 302

c. German Reformed Church 304
d. French Reformed (Huguenots) 306

V. Sects and Cults

A. Sects and Cults: Their Answer to the "Dilemma of the Church" 308
B. Social Origins 310
C. Sects of European Origin 311
1. German Sects 312
a. General History: Pietism 312
b. Moravians 314
c. German Baptists 314
d. Mennonites 316
e. Brethren Churches 317
2. Quakerism 318
a. Bibliography and General History 318
b. Quaker Social Conscience 320
D. Sects of American Origin 321
1. Origins of American Sectarianism: The Antinomians 322
2. Communal Sects 324
3. Shakerism 325
4. Millennial and Pre-Millennial Groups 326
5. Holiness and Pentecostal Bodies 327
6. Mormon Theocracy: An American Version of the Kingdom of God 329
a. Bibliography and General History 330
b. Communal Life 331
c. Biography 333
E. Cults 334
1. Jehovah's Witnesses 338
2. Christian Science: A Cult Organized as a Church 339
3. Spiritualism 340
4. New Thought, Faith Healing, and Unity 342
5. The Oxford Group and Moral Rearmament 345

VI. The Negro Church

A. The Negro Church: General 348
B. Historical: Early Missions 351
C. Later Missions: Moving Toward Independence 356
D. Negro Protestant Denominationalism 358
E. Catholicism and the Negro 364
F. The Negro Preacher, Social Leader 366
G. Religion and Education 368
H. The City Church and Its Problems 370
I. Religion and Segregation 372
J. Negro Cults: Messianism 374
K. Negro Religious Expression 376

VII. Movements Toward Unity

A. Early American Movements 382
B. Federal and National Councils 383
C. Denominational Unions and Federations 385
D. Federated and Community Churches 389
E. American Churches and the Ecumenical Movement 391
1. Bibliography and General History 391
2. Philosophy of Ecumenicalism 394
3. American Participation 397
F. Foreign Missions and Unity 398
1. Protestant Missions 398
a. Bibliography, Directories, Statistics, etc. 399
b. General History 401
c. Criticism and Appraisal 404
d. Missionary Cooperation: America's Mission to the World 407
2. Roman Catholic Missions 409

VIII. Missions and Religious Education

A. Home Missions: Protestant 415
1. General History 415
2. Denominational Home Missions 418
3. The Frontier and the West 421

4. Indian Missions 425
5. Missions to Immigrants and Other Special Groups 429
B. Religious Education 434
1. Philosophy: Religious Education and Democracy 435
2. Sunday Schools 440
3. Some Church School Systems 443
a. Roman Catholic 443
b. Lutheran 446
c. Presbyterian and Reformed 448
d. Methodist 449
e. Baptist 450
f. Congregational and Disciples 450
g. Sects 450

IX. Immigration and Religion: New Basic Elements

A. Immigration: General 452
B. Roman Catholic Church 453
1. Historiography and Bibliography 454
2. General and Diocesan Histories 456
3. Biography 458
4. Origins 460
5. Missions (Modern) 463
6. Religious Orders 466
7. Catholicism and Immigration: National Churches 469
8. Anti-Catholic Reaction 473
9. Catholicism and Politics 477
10. Roman Catholicism and American Democracy 479
C. Lutheranism 486
1. Bibliography and General History 487
2. German 489
3. Swedish 491
4. Norwegian 491

D. Eastern Orthodox Churches 493
1. Bibliography and General History 494
2. National Churches in the United States 496
a. Russian Church 496
b. Carpatho-Russian Orthodox Church 498
c. Ukrainians 498
d. Rumanians 498
e. Serbians 499
f. Albanians 499
g. Greeks 499
h. Syrians 500
i. Armenians 500
3. Revolution and Independence 500
4. Interpretation to Americans 502
a. Early Efforts 502
b. Growing Contacts 503
c. Americanization 504
E. Judaism 506
1. Bibliography and General History 507
2. General History: America 509
3. Immigration 512
4. Groups 513
a. Orthodoxy 513
b. Zionism 514
c. Conservatism 515
d. Reform 515
e. Reconstruction 518
5. Adaptation of Judaism to America 519
a. Conflicting Trends 520
b. The Struggle for Community 521
c. Religious Integration 522
F. Oriental Cults 523
1. Buddhism 526
2. Hinduism: Vedanta 529
3. Theosophy 534
4. Mohammedans 536
5. Bahá'ism 539

PART ONE

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL GUIDES: GENERAL SURVEYS AND HISTORIES

General Introductory Remarks

THIS section is intended to comprise essential aids to the study of American religious life in general, and of the religious organizations and strictly ecclesiastical institutions which largely inspire, direct, and express it. In its narrowly ecclesiastical aspect and in its character as a record of the influence of religion in society (or as a "sociological phenomenon"), American religious history is such a recent discipline that its bibliography is still unorganized, in comparison with that of "secular" history. This is true especially of organization and coordination in the area of general guides to the vast and rapidly increasing volume of literature. As some of the most scholarly American church historians have remarked, the field of American religious historiography is still not clearly defined, nor is it the peculiar province of professional churchmen. Much of the writing related to it actually is the product of social, literary, and philosophical historians, and even of biographers. It is, therefore, included in general and subject bibliographies and guides for general American history, rather than in those for "church history" as such.

The sociological approach to the history of religion in American life has inspired writing in the field by many outside the traditional institutions interested in it, such as theological seminaries and church colleges. The literature, therefore, is scattered through many "secular" books, university and college reviews, journals and proceedings of non-religious historical societies, and many other periodical publications. It cannot be classified within the comparatively narrow confines of "church history." Many of the titles in this section, therefore, are found in areas not comprised in the bibliography of strictly ecclesiastical or religious history. They include American history in general, comprehensive lists of dissertations on all subjects, periodical guides, directories of archival depositories, general biographical guides, and other publications.

I. BIBLIOGRAPHICAL GUIDES

A. General Bibliographical Guides

THE most fundamental source in this field is the section on "Ecclesiastical History" in Vol. 1 of Theodore Besterman, *A World Bibliography of Bibliographies and of Bibliographical Catalogues, Calendars, Abstracts, Digests, Indexes, and the Like, Revised and Greatly Enlarged Throughout* (Geneva, 1955–1956, 3rd ed., 4 vols., incl. 1 vol. "Index." Previous eds., London, 1939–1940, 2 vols., and London, 1947–1949, 3 vols.). Many entries pertain to American religious history. For recent publications the most complete source is the continuing *Bibliographic Index, a Cumulative Bibliography of Bibliographies* (New York, Vol. 1, March 1938– ; 6 vols., 1937–1957), under the headings: Christian, Christianity, Church, Religion, Religious, and Theology. Another necessary compilation is ch. IV, "Theology and Religion," in Robert L. Collison, *Bibliographies Subject and National, A Guide to Their Contents, Arrangement and Use* (London, 1951), a survey of general bibliographies, including several pertinent to any general survey of religion in America. *A Guide to Historical Literature,* George Matthew Dutcher, et al., eds. (New York, 1936, repr. New York, 1949) has a rich collection of bibliographies of American religious history in sect. F, "History of Christianity," edited by William Henry Allison, and a few further aids under "United States, Cultural History: Religion." Many essential titles are included in sect. K, "Religion," of Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951, 7th ed. and suppls., based upon 6th ed., by Isadore Gilbert Mudge). These include bibliographies, bibliographical guides, general history, denominations, yearbooks, and other types of guides.

The entries in these bibliographies are merely listed, usually without extended comments on content, or critical notes.

B. General Religious and Ecclesiastical History

A multitude of bibliographies, guides, indexes, directories, yearbooks, handbooks, and other signposts to literature on general and specific aspects of American religion and church history are gathered in John Graves Barrow, *A Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion* (Austin, Tex., 1955). This is a massive attempt to list all separately published bibliographies in American and European libraries (with evaluations wherever possible); and to suggest other types of reference material, with explanation of forms, symbols for locations in libraries, a complete classified table of contents, and a complete alphabetical index. Several general encyclopedias and bibliographies of religion and religious knowledge include titles that are helpful to the student interested in America. The most recent one is Katharine Smith Diehl, *Religions, Mythologies, Folklores: An Annotated Bibliography* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1956), with complete subject, author, and title indexes. American titles are numerous in the sections on general reference books and national histories, ch. I, "Universal Religious Knowledge," and ch. III, "The Judaeo-Christian Tradition," with general reference books, bibliographies, church histories, and denominational yearbooks. There are many bibliographies with the scholarly and authoritative articles on phases of American religion in James Hastings, John A. Selbie, et al., eds., *Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics* (New York, 1908–1929, 13 vols., incl. index, 1 vol.; 1955, 13 vols., repr. of ed. of 1908–1927), an indispensable authority. Many works published from 1850 to 1910 are in the subject bibliography, pp. 485–513, in Shailer Mathews and Gerald Birney Smith, *A Dictionary of Religion and Ethics* (New York, 1921), which has also biographies of some American religious leaders. Still useful are two large older compilations including American references: Howard Malcom's *Theological Index, References to the Principal*

Works in Every Department of Religious Literature (Boston, 1868); and John Fletcher Hurst's *Literature of Theology, A Classified Bibliography of Theological and General Religious Literature* (New York and Cincinnati, 1896), confined to writings in English. Some help is available also in William Moorehead Smith, *A List of Bibliographies of Theological and Biblical Literature Published in Great Britain and America, 1595–1931, with Critical Biographical and Bibliographical Notes* (Coatesville, Pa., 1931). Among general bibliographies of ecclesiastical history, one should consult J. A. Fisher, *A Select Bibliography of Ecclesiastical History* (Boston, 1885); J. P. Whitney's *Bibliography of Church History* (Historical Association Leaflets, no. 55, 1923), and *Church History, A Selection of Books Based on J. P. Whitney's Bibliography* (2nd ed., National Book Council, Book List, no. 76, 1930). A list issued during a very active period of writing (that of the "American Church History Series") is Samuel Macauley Jackson, "Works of Interest to the Student of Church History Which Appeared in 1891 [to 1894] a Bibliography," in American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 1st ser., IV, V, and VII (1892–1895). During the same period the Rev. G. W. Gilmore attempted a general, comprehensive, and continuing bibliography in his "Monthly Bibliography of Theology, Religion, and Ethics," in *The Magazine of Christian Literature* (Oct. 1889–Sept. 1892, 6 vols., Christian Literature Co., New York), beginning in Jan. 1890, and continuing to the suspension of the magazine, which also published for some time a monthly guide, "Contents of the Religious Periodicals." One of the superior sources for general bibliography, as well as for titles relating to America, is Shirley Jackson Case, et al., comps., *A Bibliographical Guide to the History of Christianity* (Chicago, 1931, and New York, 1951, rev. ed.). This selective list of works in various languages, with an author index, has a large section on the United States, with introductory remarks and topical divisions, and brief notes with some of the titles.

Many similar titles may be found in Besterman's *World Bibliography of Bibliographies*, 3rd ed., and in Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History* (New York, 1942, and Paterson, N.J., 1959, rev. ed., cit. below).

C. American History: General

Several "secular" aids to the study of general American history are among the most essential tools of the religious and ecclesiastical historian. None is more so than Homer Carey Hockett's *Introduction to Research in American History* (New York, 1948, 2nd ed.), with a fairly brief but very effective list of guides to reference works and to appraisal of books, indexes of periodical literature, bibliographies of bibliographies and of American history, guides to archives and manuscript collections, and descriptive and critical notes on all these, in the text. Fundamental is Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History, Guide to Materials for Research* (New York, 1938; rev. ed., New York, 1942, and Paterson, N.J., 1959). Chapter x, "Religious History," comprises works on general and denominational history and miscellaneous topics. Far less complete in the area of religion, but still useful, is Oscar Handlin, et al., eds., *Harvard Guide to American History* (Cambridge, Mass., 1954). Scattered entries cover source materials and bibliography, and a wide range of subjects from the early colonial period, including such special topics as the relation of religion to fiction, the frontier, slavery, reform, the Negro, and philanthropy. Josephus N. Larned, ed., *The Literature of American History, A Bibliographical Guide* . . . (Boston, 1902) has a still useful division, "Church History." The Library of Congress, General Reference and Bibliography Division, has included some religious references in *American History and Civilization, A List of Guides and Annotated or Selective Bibliographies* (Washington, D.C., 1950; 2nd ed., 1951, ed. Donald H. Mugridge). No researcher in any religious topic should fail to

consult the *Writings on American History*, 1902– (Princeton, N.J., 1904; Washington, D.C., 1905; New York, 1908–1910; Washington, D.C., 1911–1913; New Haven, 1914–1919; Washington, D.C., 1921– , with various editors and titles); also the *Index to the Writings on American History, 1902–1940, Compiled for the American Historical Association* (Washington, D.C., 1956), with numerous references to religion and churches. The entries throughout the *Writings* comprise books and articles, and in the earlier volumes are grouped mostly under the section, "Religious History," including general, denominational, and biographical material. Later volumes have greatly expanded the scope, have brief notes on content, and include many entries on bibliography, manuscript materials, libraries, and archival depositories. (See also Part One, sect. VI, A, *General Secular Histories.*)

D. American Church History

American religious and ecclesiastical history was scarcely recognized as an organized discipline until after the middle of the nineteenth century. Little effort, therefore, was made to compile general bibliographies of writings in the field until after the organization of the American Society of Church History in 1888, and the publication of the ambitious "American Church History Series" from 1893 to 1897. The establishment of the Society, and the series of denominational histories, marked the beginning of a partial departure from the previous conception that had prevailed in the theological seminaries and the church colleges, of "church history" as the history of the primitive and medieval church, and of the Reformation. The Society began to encourage the study of religion in America, and some bibliographical references in that area appeared in the *Papers of the American Society of Church History* (1st ser., 1889–1897, 8 vols.; 2nd ser., 1906/7–1933, 9 vols., with varying places and publishers). More or less extensive bibliographies, in the separate histories

of denominations by various authors, occur in *The American Church History Series . . .*, by Philip Schaff and many other authors (New York, 1893–1897, 13 vols.), written following the religious census of 1890, which aroused a new interest in the history of religion in the United States, and was the foundation of Vol. I, "Religious Forces of the United States." The series indicated the growth of a consciousness of American religion as a peculiar development in history. It produced also the first attempt to compile a comprehensive bibliography. Volume 12, pp. 441–513, contains Samuel Macauley Jackson's "A Bibliography of American Church History, 1820–1893," with a "Prefatory Note" indicating the main sources from which it was derived. The approximately 1,400 titles are unclassified, and consist mostly of records and histories of denominations, biographies of religious leaders, polemical writings, pamphlets, and some parish histories. Although now much outdated, the list is still valuable for its citations of comparatively rare works and old handbooks. A nearly contemporary compilation of some value is George Franklin Bowerman, comp., *A Selected Bibliography of the Religious Denominations of the United States . . . With a List of the Most Important Catholic Works of the World as an Appendix* (New York, 1896), which is a selected list rather than a complete bibliography, arranged alphabetically by denominations, and without annotations. A good recent list, with many entries for general and denominational church history and religious life and influence, is in ch. III, sect. C, "Church History," in Katharine Smith Diehl, *Religions, Mythologies, Folklores: An Annotated Bibliography* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1956). No scholar should neglect the fairly extensive bibliographies occasionally published in church historical magazines and theological journals, which may be located through sect. II, Periodical Indexes and Guides (see below). An excellent example, and a very helpful basic one, is by Robert S. Bosher, comp., "The Episcopal Church and American Christianity: a Bibliography," *Historical Maga-*

zine of the Protestant Episcopal Church, Vol. 19, no. 4 (Dec. 1950), pp. 369–384. Although relating largely to the American Episcopal Church, the nearly 500 titles include many on general history, religion in American life, other denominations, the planting of colonial religion, religion in the eighteenth century, the church and the Revolution, expansion of Protestantism, reform movements, the Civil War, Roman Catholicism, modern American religion, the Negro church, small sects, and biographies.

Robert T. Handy, "Survey of Recent Literature: American Church History," *Church History,* Vol. 27, no. 2 (June 1958), pp. 161–165, covers the past five years and summarizes recent trends in historiography by reference to the major published works on Protestantism.

One of the better and easily available sources of references is the bibliographical wealth in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of the Expansion of Christianity* (New York, 1937–1945), the later volumes of which contain in their lists many titles on religion in the United States from the early colonial period to the twentieth century. One should consult, particularly, Vol. 3, "Three Centuries of Advance, A.D. 1500–A.D.1800," pp. 458–485; Vol. 4, "The Great Century, A.D. 1800–A.D. 1914, Europe and the United States of America," pp. 463–496, with references also to Judaism and other non-Christian religions; and Vol. 7, "Advance through Storm," for a good general bibliography of religion in the United States since 1914, in the footnotes to ch. v, "The United States of America," and in the general bibliography at the end of the volume. The lists are unclassified, arranged alphabetically by authors, and have only brief comments, but contain a wide variety of subjects. A general, selective list, covering various denominations, movements, and personalities, follows ch. L, "The Nineteenth Century Course of Christianity in the United States," in Latourette's *A History of Christianity* (New York, 1953), pp. 1274–1278.

By far the most ambitious and thorough effort to focus the enormous bulk of scattered and uncoordinated literature

in books, journals, and source materials, is Peter George Mode's *Source Book and Bibliographical Guide for American Church History* (Menasha, Wis., 1921). This praiseworthy and essential work, which is rendered still more helpful by an admirable index, assembles the most significant documents of the colonial and national periods, previously but scantily represented in source books of American history, especially those illustrating recent movements, taking them mostly from printed sources. Chapter 1 reviews general "secular" histories of the United States to about 1920 with respect to their treatment of religion; chs. 2–11 are by colony and state; 12–28 are by religious groups; and 29 covers the post-Civil War period. Local areas, denominational and group activities, and general movements are covered; while the documents represent state, parish, university, diary and letter records, and in each section are accompanied by extensive bibliographies of books and articles. No comparable publication has been issued since Mode's work appeared, and another comprehensive source book of documents in American religious history is now a pressing necessity. The want has been supplied, in 1960, by the efforts of Robert T. Handy, H. Shelton Smith, and Lefferts A. Loetscher, who have compiled *American Christianity: An Historical Interpretation with Representative Documents* (New York, 1960, Vol. 1). The lack has been but partially filled by Henry Steele Commager, ed., in *Documents of American History* (New York and London, 1948, 2 vols. in 1, 4th ed.), which includes a few of the key documents, such as colonial charters mentioning religion as a motive in colonization, agreements and covenants, Maryland's toleration act, the Cambridge Platform, documents on disestablishment of religion, the Virginia Statute of Religious Liberty, the Social Creed of the Churches of 1908, etc.

Note: A recent and most valuable annotated bibliography is in U.S., Library of Congress, General Reference and Bibliography Division. *A Guide to the Study of the United States of America* . . . , ed. Donald H. Mugridge and Blanche Mc-

Crum (Washington, 1960), pp. 752–784. General bibliographies are located in sect. VI, "General Histories and Surveys" (see below), and bibliographies for denominations, sects, and special subjects are found under the proper headings. (See also Part One, sect. IV, D, *Directories and Handbooks*, and sect. VI, B, *Factual Surveys and Histories by Churchmen.*)

E. Guides to Dissertations and Theses

A major field of scholarly writing comprises theses submitted by candidates for advanced degrees in universities, colleges, and theological seminaries. The researcher is more fortunate here than in some other areas of bibliographic control, because of the wealth of reference compilations. A general bibliography of guides is available in "Section G" of Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951, 7th ed., continued in the 1st suppl., 1950–1952 and the 2nd, 1953–1955), including bibliographies for the United States, and "General Lists," with notes on contents of the entries. The only inclusive list of bibliographies is Thomas Rossman Palfrey and Henry E. Coleman, Jr., *Guide to Bibliographies of Theses, United States and Canada* (Chicago, 1936; enl. ed., Chicago, 1940), with general, special subject, and institutional lists. Additions and corrections appear in Ralph P. Rosenberg, "Bibliographies of Theses in America," *Bulletin of Bibliography*, Vol. 18, no. 8 (Sept./Dec. 1945–Jan./Apr. 1946), pp. 181–182, 201–203.

The oldest and most complete compilation of individual titles is the American Historical Association *List of Doctoral Dissertations in History Now in Progress at Universities in the United States and the Dominion of Canada, with an Appendix of Other Research Projects in History Now in Progress in the United States and Canada* (Washington, D.C., 1909–1939; New York, 1940–1941; Washington, D.C., 1947–), published annually except 1942–1946, 1948, with varying titles, by the Carnegie Institution and the American

Historical Association. The issues for 1939 and 1940 were supplements to the *American Historical Review*, 1941, Vol. 3, American Historical Association, *Annual Report*. The entries are arranged by field, with author and university indexes. Overlapping and supplementing this is the Library of Congress, Catalog Division, *A List of American Doctoral Dissertations Printed in 1921–38* (Washington, D.C., 1913–1940, 27 vols. in 15). The titles, derived from about 45 colleges and universities, include those printed during the year, with a supplementary list of prior ones, an alphabetical arrangement, a list according to the L.C. catalog classification scheme, authors by institutions, and an elaborate subject index. An extremely important successor is *Doctoral Dissertations Accepted by American Universities*, 1933/34– , compiled for the National Research Council and the American Council of Learned Societies, by the Association of Research Libraries (New York, 1934– , no. 1– , annual). The arrangement is by subject, and in the case of printed theses, there is bibliographic data on separate publication or inclusion in a periodical or collection. The index is by authors, and by subjects including "Religion," with references to other headings; and there are notes on university lending policies. Information on contents of numerous recent theses is accessible in the University of Michigan, *Microfilm Abstracts; a Collection of Abstracts of Doctoral Dissertations and Monographs Which are Available in Complete Form on Microfilm* (Ann Arbor, Mich., University Microfilms, 1938– , Vol. 1–). Vols. 1–11, 1938–1951, are entitled *Microfilm Abstracts;* Vols. 12– *Dissertation Abstracts*. The listing now includes nearly 70 institutions. Abstracts submitted by authors are printed, and the collection is sent to leading libraries and journals, accompanied by printed library cards for each abstract. Dissertations microfilmed in full are sold through University Microfilms. Each number now has a section on "Religion," including entries for theology, history, and biography.

Several excellent lists cover specific fields of religion and

church history. The Catholic University of America sponsored *Dissertations in American Church History, 1889–1932* (Washington, D.C., 1933, American Church History Seminar Bulletins, no. 1). Doctoral theses are listed alphabetically by authors, with degrees, dates, and full notes, and manuscript dissertations are classified by date and subject, with notes for those printed in journals. More than 400 titles are included in a list issued by the Council on Graduate Studies in Religion: *Doctoral Dissertations in the Field of Religion, 1940–1952*, as a supplement to the *Review of Religion*, Vol. 18 (New York, 1954), limited to theses submitted in the United States. Nearly 2,700 works are listed by Niels H. Sonne, ed., in *A Bibliography of Post-Graduate Masters' Theses in Religion (Accepted by American Theological Seminaries)*, compiled for the American Theological Library Association (Chicago, 1951). The American Society of Church History has endeavored to keep such lists up-to-date by publishing "Doctoral Dissertations" in each volume of its magazine, *Church History*, from Dec. 1954, with notes on institutions and directors, and analyses of contents and interpretations. Unpublished dissertations may be located in *The United States, 1865–1900; a Survey of Current Literature, with Abstracts of Unpublished Dissertations*, ed. Curtis Wiswell Garrison, Vols. 1–3, Sept. 1941–Dec. 1944 (Fremont, Ohio, 1943–1945). Vol. 3 includes religion.

One should consult also the *Index, 1902–1940*, and separate later volume indexes, of the *Writings on American History*, under Colleges—history, economics, political science, theses, dissertations, and bibliography.

F. Archival Depositories: Source Materials

The amount of unpublished manuscript source materials, and of little-used printed archives, is colossal. Much of it still is but very partially explored by historians, and has never

been inventoried, calendared, or described. It is scattered in many types of depositories. They include the national, regional, and local headquarters of denominations, church historical societies, offices of Bible and missionary societies, the libraries of church colleges, universities, and theological seminaries, state and local libraries and historical societies, and many private collections. Church officials often used to consider records as their private possessions, a fact which was frequently revealed to the researchers of the Historical Records Survey (see below) in the period 1936–1943. The first attempt to make even a partial survey of this huge terrain (until then largely unknown outside of denominational bounds) was made by William Henry Allison in his *Inventory of Unpublished Material for American Religious History in Protestant Church Archives and Other Repositories* (Washington, D.C., 1910), compiled and published under the auspices of the Carnegie Institution of Washington (Papers of the Department of Historical Research, ed. J. Franklin Jameson). This indispensable treasure was assembled by means of personal visits and by questionnaires sent to institutions. It contains some 10,000 entries arranged by states. The collections in each depository are classified and listed, with notes, and there is a general index. Allison did not include all materials relating to any one denomination or movement, or manuscripts in private collections unless deposited in the places examined. He covered, however, archives of governing bodies of Protestant churches and missionary societies, those deposited in their seminaries, colleges, and historical societies, also some in public, non-ecclesiastical libraries, but without critical annotations.

No guide to be compared with Allison's has since been published, and the field must be entered by a number of miscellaneous leads. One of these is an ambitious (and most unfortunately incomplete) attempt to compile guides to general and local church archives throughout the United States,

begun in the period 1935–1943 by the Federal Work Projects Administration's Historical Records Survey. Religious archives are included in its *Guide to Depositories of Manuscript Collections in the United States* . . . (Des Moines, Iowa, 1940–), 16 vols. in 13, reproduced from typewritten copy, withe indexes. The Inventories of Church Archives in the United States are listed by states in John Graves Barrow, *A Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1955), pp. 185–198. They include many calendars of archives in denominational headquarters, organizational offices, and institutions; guides to vital statistics in church records; directories of churches and religious organizations in states and subdivisions; calendars of manuscript collections in church and secular historical societies, libraries, and other locations. All publications of the Survey are listed in its *Bibliography of Research Projects Reports; Check List of Historical Records Survey Publications,* prepared by Sargent B. Child and Dorothy P. Holmes, rev. April 1943 (Washington, D.C., 1943, U.S. Work Projects Administration, Technical Services, Research Records, Bibliography no. 7). Unpublished inventories of church records, gathered by the Survey, were deposited in the sponsoring institutions in the states when the project was abandoned due to World War II. Copies of the inventory forms, or of the typed inventories, often were deposited in the church offices or institutions where the records were located.

There are several guides to the location of depositories of religious and ecclesiastical archives. One of the best is the section on "Bibliography, Library Collections," in George Matthew Dutcher, et al., eds., *A Guide to Historical Literature* (New York, 1936), pp. 235–236, which lists the most important collections in the United States for the general history of Christianity in university and seminary libraries, and in archives of religious groups, containing materials on denominational history and the more modern religious movements. Edmund L. Binsfield's "Church Archives in the

United States and Canada; a Bibliography," in *American Archivist*, Vol. 21, no. 3 (July 1958), pp. 311–332, 219 entries, compiled under auspices of the Church Records Committee of the Society of American Archivists, is a bibliography of published material relating to church archives, United States and Canada, tentative, consisting of general works, and guides to archives of denominations, with annotations. *The New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1949–1950) provides some help in its article on "Archives, Ecclesiastical," under the subheading "America," in Vol. 1, a listing of archival collections of nine major American denominations, not including the Roman Catholic Church. The article, "Theological Libraries," in Vol. 11, includes special collections for church history in 22 libraries in the United States. Miscellaneous sources of information on the location of original materials include the *Yearbook of the American Churches* . . . (New York, 1916–). The more recent volumes include a list of "Main Depositories of Church History Material and Sources," by denominations, comprising some twenty larger and smaller groups, and revised to date by the noted church historian, William Warren Sweet. He has reviewed the resources of the larger, and of some smaller denominations, also of state historical societies, in "Church Archives in the United States," *Church History*, Vol. 8, no. 1 (Mar. 1939), pp. 43–53, also published as an extract, n.p., n.d. He has published also a brief guide to manuscript collections in his *Religion in the Development of American Culture, 1765–1840* (New York, 1952), pp. 316–317. His *Religion on the American Frontier, A Collection of Source Material* (Chicago, 1931–1946, 4 vols.) covers the Baptists, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, and Methodists, 1783–1850, with bibliographies and indexes, and notes on the sources of the documents. Another guide to archives in the same area of study is the Chicago University Library *Union Catalog of Manuscript and Out-of-Print Sources for the History of Christianity on American Fron-*

tiers, which is listed and described as being "in progress," in Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History* (New York, 1942), p. 220.

Extensive sections relating to religious archives appear in Evarts Boutell Greene and Richard B. Morris, *A Guide to the Principal Sources for Early American History (1600–1800) in the City of New York* (New York, 1929); and its successor, Harry James Carman and Arthur W. Thompson, *A Guide to the Principal Sources for American Civilization, 1800–1900, in the City of New York: Manuscripts* (New York, 1960). Another useful guide, of broader scope, is E. Kay Kirkham's *A Survey of American Church Records for the Period Before the Civil War East of the Mississippi River* (Salt Lake City, Utah, 1959–1960, 2 vols.), including surveys by denominations and states, general inventories, local church records, and denominational bibliographies.

A few reviews of sources in particular libraries indicate the riches that await the student. The nation's largest "secular" library, the Library of Congress, has large and often unexpected religious collections, which have been described by Nelson R. Burr in "Sources for the Study of American Church History in the Library of Congress," *Church History,* Vol. 22, no. 3 (Sept. 1953), pp. 227–238: a review of the holdings in various divisions, with special emphasis upon manuscripts, transcripts of European archives, sermons, theological pamphlets, early American imprints, architectural archives, church music, religious and theological periodicals, and illustrative materials. An illustration of the sources in a denominational seminary library is an article by Charles Mampoteng, "The Library (i.e., of the General Theological Seminary, New York City) and American Church History," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 5, no. 3 (Sept. 1936), pp. 225–237, a survey of general materials and of the holdings of Episcopal Church periodicals. Another example is the library of Thomas Prince, described by the Boston Public Library, Prince Collection, in *The Prince Li-*

brary. A Catalogue of the Collection of Books and Manuscripts Which Formerly Belonged to The Reverend Thomas Prince . . . (Boston, 1870; previous eds. in 1846, 1868), an alphabetical list without notes, rich in material on New England and the Great Awakening. Many references to such catalogs and lists may be found in John Graves Barrow's *Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion,* cit. above.

References to depositories and collections of source materials in denominational colleges, seminaries, historical societies, other institutions, and offices, will be found in the sections relating to the particular denominations.

II. PERIODICAL INDEXES AND GUIDES

A. Directories and Special Lists

A VERY complete listing of works on bibliography and history of American periodicals is in Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books,* 7th ed. (Chicago, 1951, and its two supplements, 1950–1952, 1953–1955), sects. E and K. A section on religious publications, arranged by states and indicating denominations, is in *N. W. Ayer and Son's Directory of Newspapers and Periodicals* . . . (Philadelphia, 1880–), which in 1940 absorbed Rowell's *American Newspaper Directory* (1869–1908, 40 vols.). Religious papers are listed in *Lord & Thomas and Logan Pocket Directory of the American Press* . . . 1890–1927 (Chicago, 1890–1927, 26 vols.). A specific guide is *Geo*[rge] *Batten & Co's Directory of the Religious Press of the United States, A List of Nearly All Religious Periodicals, with their Denomination or Class* . . . (New York, 1892, 1895, 1897), giving full bibliographic details, editors and publishers, an invaluable guide to periodicals no longer issued. A highly useful modern guide is Joseph E. Wagner, Inc., *Religious Press Directory* (New York, 1943–), arranged alphabetically by denominations and titles, with full bibliographic information and notes. The As-

sociated Church Press *Directory, 1956–1957* (New York, 1957) contains a foreword by the Executive Secretary, William B. Lipphard; a list of officers; and "Directory of the Associated Church Press"; the constitution and by-laws of the Association; 131 periodicals arranged alphabetically, with addresses, denominational affiliations, editors, periodicities, circulations, etc. A list of German church periodicals is in *Tobias Brothers' German Newspaper Directory . . . also a Separate List of Religious Newspapers* (New York, 1885, 1890, 2 vols.). A brief listing of some important religious periodicals is in George Matthew Dutcher, et al., *A Guide to Historical Literature* (New York, 1936), helpful as indicating the location of articles on religion and church history, and book reviews. A larger list is in ch. IV, "Journals," in Katharine Smith Diehl, *Religions, Mythologies, Folklores: An Annotated Bibliography* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1956), with dates of issue and notes on content, especially useful for a study of the relations of religion to American life. The *Yearbook of American Churches* . . . (New York, 1916–) has a list, "Religious Periodicals," with denominations, editors, and addresses.

B. Special Indexes and Lists

The "Union Lists" and "Indexes" listed in Winchell, sect. E, *Poole's Index to Periodical Literature,* and the *Readers' Guide to Periodical Literature,* do not cover all articles and essays, and one should consult the indexes to individual periodicals. An indispensable guide, unfortunately not continued, is Ernest Cushing Richardson, comp. and ed., *An Alphabetical Subject Index and Index Encyclopedia to Periodical Articles on Religion, 1890–1899* (New York, 1907–1911, 2 vols.), 58,000 articles by 21,000 writers, in more than 600 periodicals and transactions in English and the principal foreign languages. The best recent aid, including about 30 periodicals, is American Theological Library Association, *Index to Religious Periodical Literature, An Author and Subject*

Index . . . Including an Author Index to Book Reviews (Chicago, 1952, 1954; 2 vols., 1949–1952, 1953–1954; Vol. 3, 1955–1956, and Vol. 4, 1957, in preparation). Reaching beyond strictly Roman Catholic literature is the *Catholic Periodical Index; a Cumulative Author and Subject Index to a Selected List of Catholic Periodicals . . .* 1930– , now published by the Catholic University of America Press, which indexes about 90 titles in many languages. Although now old, a few special lists note periodicals that probably still are available in the institutions they cover. Over 800 are included in *List of Theological Periodicals Currently Received in the Libraries of New York City* (New York, Columbia University, 1913). The New York Public Library's *List of Periodicals in the New York Public Library, General Theological Seminary, and Union Theological Seminary Relating to Religion, Theology, and Church History* (New York, 1905) has 1,250 titles. (*See New York Public Library Bulletin*, Vol. 9 (Jan. 1905), pp. 9–31). About 1,800 titles appear in Ernest Cushing Richardson, *A List of Religious Periodicals Currently Taken by Union, Princeton, Yale and Hartford Theological Seminaries* (Washington, D.C., 1934).

C. Histories of Periodical Literature

Writings on the American religious press are far from numerous or satisfactory. To a great extent this field still awaits exploration by secular and church historians. The student is compelled to rely mainly upon the meticulous scholarship of Frank Luther Mott, *A History of American Magazines, 1741–1905* (New York, London, and Cambridge, Mass., 1930–57, 4 vols.). This supplies a fairly complete account since the 1740's, including rise and growth, and histories and analyses of certain important periodicals, with a chronological list for each period, and bibliographical footnotes. The same author's equally scholarly *American Journalism, A History of Newspapers in the United States Through 250 Years, 1690 to 1940* (New York, 1941, rev. eds., 1947, 1950, with extensive bib-

liographical notes for each chapter) describes the rise of the religious press in the early 1800's and a few important religious papers, and comments on the general character of religious journalism. There are a few excellent studies in special areas. R. C. White's unpublished Harvard University thesis, "Writings Pertaining to Religion in Eighteenth Century American Magazines," is most helpful to the student of colonial religious life. An admirable regional study is Henry Smith Stroupe's *The Religious Press in the South Atlantic States, 1802–1865; an Annotated Bibliography with Historical Introduction and Notes* (Durham, N.C., 1956, with bibliography; Historical Papers of Trinity College Historical Society, ser. 32). The director of the Presbyterian and Reformed Historical Foundation at Montreat, N.C., Thomas Hugh Spence, presents a documented survey, "Southern Presbyterian Reviews," *Union Seminary Review*, Richmond, Va., Vol. 56, no. 2 (Feb. 1945), pp. 93–109, with footnotes. A much-needed kind of study is represented in an exhaustive essay by the Episcopalian journalist, Clifford P. Morehouse, "Origins of the Episcopal Church Press from Colonial Days to 1840," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 11, no. 3 (Sept. 1942), pp. 199–318, with a complete bibliography of sources used, and of periodicals in the library, General Theological Seminary, New York City, and indexes of periodicals and persons. Another desirable type of study is illustrated by Mary Patrice Thaman's *Manners and Morals of the 1920's; A Survey of the Religious Press* . . . (New York, 1954) with list of references and bibliography, on expressions of public opinion in official religious periodicals, and their reflection of contemporary history. (See also Part Four, RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. XI, *The Religious Press.*)

III. RELIGIOUS HISTORIOGRAPHY

CRITICAL writings on American religious and ecclesiastical historiography are scanty. There is no comprehensive study

of the philosophies, methods, and productions of the professors of church history and lay historians, who have added to knowledge of religion in American life. The contrast with scholarly studies of "secular" historiography is painful. A realization of this fact has been growing, and teachers in seminaries and colleges recently have described and analyzed the situation. The best essays are by Cyril Richardson, "Church History Past and Present," *Union Seminary Quarterly Review*, Vol. 5, no. 1 (Nov. 1949), pp. 5–15; James Hastings Nichols, "The Art of Church History," *Church History*, Vol. 20, no. 1 (Mar. 1951), pp. 3–9; Sidney E. Mead, "Recent Studies in United States Church History," *ibid.*, Vol. 21, no. 2 (June 1952), pp. 150–152; Leonard J. Trinterud, "Some Notes on Recent Periodical Literature on Colonial American Church History," *ibid.*, Vol. 20, no. 4 (Dec. 1951), pp. 72–74; and "The Task of the American Church Historian," *ibid.*, Vol. 25, no. 1 (Mar. 1956), pp. 3–15. These note the general opinion of church history as "dry," the dull methods of teaching, and the general neglect of it in seminaries. They deplore the general prevalence of denominational interest, "spotty" and uncoordinated research, lack of a true philosophy due to evangelical indifference to communal and historical sense, and the consequent assimilation to "secular" sociological history. They urge the necessity of gathering and organizing materials, and indicate the problem of finding a place for church history in a free and popular religion with its concept of the church as a redemptive society.

The organization of American religious and church history was due largely to Dr. Philip Schaff, Samuel Macauley Jackson, and James I. Good. Schaff's services are appreciated in George Park Fisher's essay, "Dr. Schaff as an Historian," American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 1st ser., Vol. 7, pp. 3–8, noting his emphasis upon the bearing of church history on contemporary problems, his study of original sources, and great contribution to bibliography. Jackson's

labors are reviewed by William Walker Rockwell, David Schley Schaff, and James I. Good in *ibid.*, 2nd ser., Vol. 4 (1914), pp. 1–20, "The Life Work of Samuel Macauley Jackson," "Samuel Macauley Jackson as a Co-worker with Philip Schaff," and "Reminiscences of Dr. Jackson," emphasizing his promotion of church history studies and his editing of religious encyclopedias and dictionaries. George Warren Richards, in "The Reverend James I. Good . . . as a Church Historian," *ibid.*, 2nd ser., Vol. 8 (1928), pp. 179–209, reviews his work as a collector of source materials, and in making American church history a professional, scientific discipline.

His ideals were furthered by a few church and "secular" historians who endeavored to view the study of church history from a broad sociological viewpoint. Ephraim Emerton promoted the new ideal in his inaugural address as professor of ecclesiastical history at Harvard: "The Study of Church History," *Unitarian Review and Religious Magazine,* Vol. 19, no. 1 (Jan. 1883), pp. 1–18, criticizing the prevalent unhistorical and almost wholly theological treatment, and pleading for independent research and criticism. He renewed this plea in "A Definition of Church History," American Society of Church History, *Papers,* 2nd ser., Vol. 7 (1921), pp. 55–68, pointing to the need of a scientific definition based upon purely historical considerations, and to the idea of the church as a living organism. Arthur Cushman McGiffert, in "The Historical Study of Christianity," *Bibliotheca Sacra,* Vol. 50, no. 197 (Jan. 1893), pp. 150–171, appealed for an evolutionary method regarding the church as a developing organism adapting itself to contemporary needs. His plea was seconded by John Fletcher Hurst's essay, "The Science and Literature of Church History," in *History of the Christian Church* (New York, 1897–1900), Vol. 1, pp. 15–57, noting the scantiness of American ecclesiastical historiography, and reviewing the works of American writers, with bibliographical notes. Around

1900 the importance of religious history engaged the attention of scholars connected with the American Historical Association. William Given Andrews presented a general survey of accomplishment in "A Recent Service of Church History to the Church," American Historical Association, *Annual Report . . . for the Year 1899* (Washington, 1900, Vol. 1, pp. 389–427), with extensive bibliographical footnotes. This reviews the stimulation of historical interest by the rise of denominational spirit, 1830–1860, the value of several eminent authors, and the rise of religious biography. But the persistent narrow denominational view was deplored by George James Bayles in "American Ecclesiology," *Annual Report for 1900* (Washington, 1901, Vol. 1, pp. 127–138), advocating a sociological attitude. The rising "scientific" spirit found expression also in Francis Albert Christie's "Report of the Conference on the Teaching of Church History," *Annual Report . . . for the Year 1904* (Washington, 1905, pp. 211–217), lamenting control by dogmatic and ecclesiastical interests, and the failure to develop a corps of true researchers. Increasing awareness of the social significance of church history appears in two addresses by presidents of the Association: Simeon E. Baldwin, "Religion Still the Key to History," *American Historical Review*, Vol. 12, no. 2 (Jan. 1907), pp. 219–243; and J. Franklin Jameson, "The American Acta Sanctorum," *ibid.*, Vol. 13, no. 2 (Jan. 1908), pp. 286–302. Both recognized the moulding power of religion in public opinion and society, and urged study of religious history as a means of insight into social life. These efforts to inspire interest, in a field then neglected by "secular" historians, are briefly appreciated in Herman Ausubel, *Historians and Their Craft: A Study of the Presidential Addresses of the American Historical Association, 1884–1945* (New York, 1950), with bibliography, which notes John Bach McMaster as a leading authority on the social history of American religion. The plea of Baldwin and Jameson was

renewed by William E. Dodd, who reviewed "Profitable Fields of Investigation in American History, 1815–1860," *American Historical Review*, Vol. 18, no. 3 (Apr. 1913), pp. 522–536, suggesting specific subjects in religious history.

Increasing concentration upon "social history" after World War I encouraged members of the American Society of Church History to make their field "properly scientific." This is evident in William Walker Rockwell's "Rival Presuppositions in the Writing of Church History: a Study of Intellectual Bias," American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 2nd ser., Vol. 9 (1934), pp. 1–52, appealing for honesty instead of mere "edification," and protection of revealed "truth," and challenging church historians to see all points in the Christian circumference. The social meaning of church history was ably pointed up by the Episcopalian scholar and editor, Walter Herbert Stowe, in "The Importance of Church History," an address to the Episcopal Church Historical Society in 1936 (Philadelphia, Church Historical Society Publications, 1936, no. 8). The shifting emphasis of religious historiography won more respect for it among "secular" scholars, and inspired increasing notice of it in general reviews of historical writing, such as Michael Kraus, *A History of American History* (New York, 1937, with bibliography; new ed., Norman, Okla., 1953), with subject index. He covers the field from the ministerial historians of colonial New England to the recent "rehabilitation" of Puritanism by Samuel E. Morison and others, and mentions many books, varying interpretations of religion in American life, and collecting of source materials. Brief remarks on a few socio-religious studies occur in Thomas C. Cochran, "A Decade of American Histories," *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, Vol. 73, no. 2 (Apr. 1949), pp. 143–166. An essay, "Church History," by George Huntston Williams, with notes on the United States, is included in Arnold Samuel Nash, *Protestant Thought in the Twentieth Century: Whence and Whither?* (New York, 1951), with

bibliographies and notes, which discusses the writings since 1888.

For numerous references to American historiography, one must consult *Writings on American History, Index, 1902–1940;* also indexes for 1948–51 and continuing, "History and Historiography," and "Historiography and Allied Disciplines."

The emergence of a new philosophy of religious and church history, blending scientific methodology with the traditional philosophy of a transcendent divine will in history, is suggested by James Hastings Nichols in: "Church History and Secular History," *Church History,* Vol. 13, no. 2 (June 1944), pp. 87–99; and "History in the Theological Curriculum," *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 26, no. 3 (July 1946), pp. 183–189. He states that history without "commitment" and meaning sinks into journalism or parochial nationalism, without insight into universal human and communal values. A similar mode of thought is expressed by Sidney E. Mead, "The Task of the Church Historian," *The Chronicle, A Baptist Quarterly,* Vol. 12, no. 3 (July, 1949), pp. 127–143, noting the shift in emphasis from strictly sociological history to the quest for some controlling principle in writing the history of the church as a fundamental unifying force above particular interests.

IV. MISCELLANEOUS GUIDES

A. Almanacs

HELPFUL sources of information on the condition of American religion are secular and ecclesiastical almanacs. An eminently reliable one is the *Tribune Almanac and Political Register* (New York, 1838–1914, 76 vols., title varying), after 1890 containing ample statistics on denominations, members and their distribution, ministers, value of church properties, and ecclesiastical offices and agencies. Compre-

hensive and miscellaneous information appears in the World Telegram's *World Almanac, and Book of Facts* (1868– , annual), and in John Kieran, ed., *Information Please Almanac* (New York, 1947– , annual, varying publishers). A few less well-known almanacs are valuable for the nineteenth century. The *New York Observer Year Book and Almanac* (New York, 1871–1873) has an "Ecclesiastical Department" with creeds, directory of churches, lists of ministers, necrology of the clergy, denominational statistics, periodicals, Sunday schools, church works, colleges and seminaries. The same type of information appears in Alexander J. Schem, ed. and comp., *American Ecclesiastical and Educational Almanac, for Ministers and Laymen* (New York, 1868–1869).

B. Dictionaries and Encyclopedias

References to religion and churches occur in standard religious and secular publications of this class. A basic reference in English is Philip Schaff, ed., *New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge . . .* , S. M. Jackson, editor-in-chief (New York, 1908–1912, 12 vols. and index; repr. Grand Rapids, Mich., 1949–1950, 13 vols.). Although Protestant in tone, it is unbiased, not limited to Christianity, and has articles on American religious and church history, denominations, sects, institutions, archives, libraries, organizations, societies, missions, doctrines, controversies, biographies, and excellent bibliographies. Also of great assistance is James Hastings, ed., *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics* (Edinburgh and New York, 1908–1927, 12 vols. and index; also a 7 vol. ed.; and 13 vols. in 7, 1951; 13 vols., 1955, repr. of ed. of 1908–1927): the most comprehensive work of its kind, with articles and full bibliographies by experts. Vergilius Ferm's *Encyclopedia of Religion* (New York, 1945), in dictionary style, has brief articles on theology, denominations, cults, fields of knowledge associated with religion, biographies, and bibliographies, sometimes annotated. For the

origin and history of creeds the most helpful source still is Philip Schaff's *The Creeds of Christendom; with a History and Critical Notes* (New York, 1890, 4th enl. ed., 3 vols.; 6th ed., rev. and enl., New York, 1931, 3 vols.), giving original texts with English translations, many bibliographical references, and an index of subjects. An encyclopedic review is Jergen L. Neve's *Churches and Sects of Christendom* (Blair, Neb., 1944, rev. ed.), with denominational histories, doctrines, problems of church unity, modernism and conservative theology, and group movements, with bibliographies. Another fairly recent authority is Rulon Stanley Howells, *His Many Mansions; a Compilation of Christian Beliefs, Illustrated with Diagrams of the Intricate and Interesting Organizations of the Leading Christian Churches . . .* (New York, 1940), with a brief list of special references. Numerous brief but authoritative articles, not including biographies, occur in James Truslow Adams, ed., *Dictionary of American History* (New York, 1942, 2nd rev. ed., 5 vols. and index), with brief bibliographies, covering denominations, religious events, movements, and sects, excellent for quick reference and access to important books. Still helpful is J. Franklin Jameson's *Dictionary of United States History . . . from the Earliest Explorations to the Present Time . . .* (Philadelphia, 1931, rev. ed. under supervision of Albert E. McKinley; analytical index): brief essays on denominations, events, movements, and declarations of faith and polity, but without bibliographies.

C. Yearbooks

A treasure of information, which never should be neglected, lies in secular and ecclesiastical yearbooks. A considerable list of general and denominational ones appears in "Section K" of Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951, 7th ed. and suppls.). Older publications are included in the Library of Congress *List of Year-*

books Issued by the Churches (Washington, 1926), comprising about 40 titles. A most reliable, even though far from complete list is in ch. III, sect. D, Katharine Smith Diehl, *Religions, Mythologies, Folklores: An Annotated Bibliography* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1956), which embraces societies, biographical dictionaries, almanacs, directories, denominational and general yearbooks, with brief notices of contents.

An old, still useful source is Alexander Jacob Schem, *The American Ecclesiastical Year-book . . .* (New York, 1860), with a mass of detail on statistics, creeds, and faiths, and "Ecclesiastical Annals." This was based upon extensive research in almanacs and annual reports to religious groups, and claims to be the most complete and reliable collection of ecclesiastical statistics ever published. Completely essential is the *Yearbook of American Churches* (Lebanon, Pa., New York, etc., 1916– , irregular 1916–1931, then biennial, now annual), with a wide coverage of information and statistics, on religious and related organizations in the United States, and some data on Canadian bodies. Recent issues have references to collections of yearbooks, proceedings, or minutes issued by most of the member communions. An immense collection of historical and sociological information is available in *Year Book of the Church and Social Service in the United States . . .* (New York and Chicago, 1914–1916, 2 vols.), issued by the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America, with bibliographies, especially valuable for materials on the social-service movement in the churches. During most of the period when that movement was very influential, information appeared in *The American Year Book; a Record of Events and Progress . . .* (New York and London, 1910–1942, 28 vols., 1911–1943, publication suspended 1920–1924 incl. and 1939). "Religion and Religious Organizations" has important news of the past year, interdenominational activity and unions, finances, denominational activities, controversies and statistics, Judaism and Jewish

communal affairs, periodicals, societies, research institutions, and missions.

D. Directories and Handbooks

No historian of American religion can afford to pass by the important but somewhat neglected class of volumes that may best be described as ecclesiastical compendiums. They were usually intended not as serial publications, but as repositories of general information for particular years. They are not always well arranged, and are usually dull and unattractive in appearance, but comprise a huge bulk of miscellaneous facts and statistics, which give a bird's-eye view of the influence of religion and its institutions. The first one, apparently, was compiled by Thomas Branagan, a Philadelphia litterateur, who flourished in the period 1800–1815. A wealth of factual material is packed into his *Concise View of the Principal Religious Denominations in the United States of America, Comprehending a General Account of Their Doctrines, Ceremonies, and Modes of Worship* (Philadelphia? 1811). An appendix of factual material and of events appears in Charles Buck's *Theological Dictionary . . . of all Religious Terms . . . of all the Principal Denominations . . . together with an Accurate Statement of . . . Transactions and Events . . . in Ecclesiastical History* (Philadelphia, 1831, 1832). Another useful compendium is John Hayward's *The Religious Creeds and Statistics of Every Christian Denomination in the United States and British Provinces . . .* (Boston, 1836). Compiled from works of acknowledged authority, with assistance from the clergy and laity, this arranges religious creeds by groups, and has a list of sources in the preface. The most ambitious early attempt to compile an American religious encyclopedia is Israel Daniel Rupp's *He Pasa Ekklesia, An Original History of the Religious Denominations at Present Existing in the United States, Containing Authentic Accounts of Their Rise, Progress, Statistics*

and Doctrines . . . (Philadelphia, 1844). This consists of 43 essays of varying merit and completeness, written by seminary professors, ministers, and laymen, and contains an enormous mass of interesting but poorly arranged information. Some of the denominational histories are the first ones ever written. A second, "improved and portrait edition" was compiled by John S. Ebaugh, J. Forsyth, et al., as *History of all the Religious Denominations in the United States* . . . (Harrisburg, Pa., 1849), with additional matter and new articles, somewhat better arranged and including Jews, with an analytical index and a summary of each article. There is a third edition, improved and with portraits, including 50 groups (Harrisburg, 1852). A thorough revision, entitled "Desilver's Edition," appeared as *Religious Denominations in the United States* . . . (Philadelphia, 1871), with complete statistics, 53 American groups, amended articles, new portrait engravings, analytical indexes, summaries of the articles, and data on periodicals, colleges, and seminaries. A competing but smaller publication is Peter Douglas Gorrie, *The Churches and Sects of the United States: Containing a Brief Account of the Origin, History, Doctrines, Church Government, Mode of Worship, Usages and Statistics* . . . (New York, 1850), compiled from extensive research with the assistance of ministers, and with a list of reference books; including 47 white and Negro groups.

In the next decade appeared Joseph Belcher's *The Religious Denominations of the United States: Their History, Doctrine, Government and Statistics* . . . (Philadelphia, 1857; new rev. ed., Philadelphia, 1861), a huge compilation, displaying obvious proofs of effort to be careful and impartial and to secure reliable information. It covers 49 denominations, and has essays on the influence of religion upon American society, and the religious state of the Indians. Almost contemporary is one of the most complete ecclesiastical compendiums ever issued: *The American Christian Record, Containing the History, Confession of Faith, and*

Statistics of Each Religious Denomination in the United States and Europe . . . (New York, 1860), based upon questionnaires, with a list of sources in the preface, and a directory of all American clergymen, with their post-office addresses. One of the latest of this series is Charles Herbert Small's *Cornerstones of Faith; or, The Origin and Characteristics of the Christian Denominations of the United States . . . with Corroborative Statements from Eminent Divines of the Leading Denominations . . .* (New York, 1898), with chapter bibliographies, statements of faith, many minor groups, movements toward unity, a chronology of American church history, and groupings of denominations according to origins, polity, worship, baptism, and teaching. Some further information is available in Montgomery F. Essig, *The Churchmember's Guide and Complete Church Manual . . .* (Nashville, Tenn., 1907).

Later compendiums are based upon modern scientific and sociological methods. Among the most essential is Macum Phelan, *Handbook of All Denominations, Containing an Account of Their Origin and History; a Statement of Their Faith and Usages; Together with the Latest Statistics on Their Activities, Locations and Strength* (Nashville, Tenn., 1916–1933; 6th and 7th eds. called *New Handbook . . .* etc.). The 1933 issue has federated churches, and a fair bibliography by denominations; 1930 and 1933 have state and national statistical summaries. C. Luther Fry, *The U.S. Looks at Its Churches,* issued by the Institute of Social and Religious Research (New York, 1930), has important sociological conclusions and factual material drawn from data collected by the Federal Census of Religious Bodies, with economic, geographical, and financial statistics. Recent summaries include Charles Cager Bishop, *Churches 253,762; Their Doctrines, History, Government* (Wellington? Tex., 1951). An up-to-date source, interestingly written, is Leo Rosten, ed., *A Guide to the Religions of America, The Famous LOOK Magazine Series on Religion—Plus Facts,*

Figures, Tables, Charts, Articles, and Comprehensive Reference Material on Churches and Religious Groups in the United States (New York, 1955). The volume is all that the title claims, and includes religious conditions as revealed by public opinion polls, sociological data, religion and class structure, and the Negro church. Another indispensable research tool is the *World Christian Handbook* (London, 1951– , ed. E. J. Bingle and Kenneth G. Grubb), with detailed national and regional surveys, reports on ecumenical affairs, and a directory of churches and missions. By far the best modern compendium is Frank Spencer Mead's *Handbook of Denominations in the United States* (New York, 1951– , issued biennially), with accounts and statistics of over 250 Christian and non-Christian groups, prepared from the latest available authentic data, with a glossary of ecclesiastical terms and a very complete index. Equally indispensable is Frederick Emanuel Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, Mo., 1954; new and rev. ed., 1956). Although revealing the compiler's conservative Lutheran opinions, this is a scholarly, critical, and very thorough summary. Denominations are classified according to creeds, and described, with many footnotes, bibliographies, a general bibliography, a glossary of dogmatic terms, and a census of larger denominations.

E. Censuses

The most complete body of statistics of American religion is the United States Bureau of the Census, *Census of Religious Bodies* for 1890, 1906, 1916, 1926, and 1936 (Washington, D.C., 1894; 1910, 2 parts; 1919, 2 vols.; 1930, 2 vols.; 1939–1940, bulletins 1–78, 78 vols.). These reports include membership by denominations and states, Negro churches, financial and property statistics, history, doctrine, organization, and descriptions of work. The census for 1936 is considered by religious authorities to be less reliable than

that of 1926. The census of 1890 was thoroughly summarized and evaluated by the scholar in charge of the Division of Churches: Henry King Carroll, *The Religious Forces of the United States Enumerated, Classified, and Described on the Basis of the Government Census of 1890. With an Introduction on the Condition and Character of American Christianity* (New York, 1893, Vol. I in the "American Church History Series"). A new edition (New York, 1912) compared returns for 1900, 1906, and 1910 with the census of 1890, with an analysis of methods of enumeration, varieties of religion and their causes, growth and distribution of groups, Negro relations with the church, membership by sex, value of church property, effects of urbanization and migration, and religious changes. Part IV discusses characteristics of American Christianity, evangelical dominance, interdenominational cooperation, federation and unity, and the influence of the church upon society, with essays on 42 groups and independent congregations. One should consult also his *Report on Statistics of Churches in the United States at the Eleventh Census: 1890* (Washington, D.C., 1894), with plates, maps, and diagrams. The situation before World War I is reviewed in his *Statistics of the Churches of the United States for 1914 . . .* (New York, 1915; Bulletin of Church Statistics, Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America, Feb. 1915, no. 68). A summary in 1898, between the censuses of 1890 and 1900, appears in "Statistics of the Churches," *The Independent*, Vol. 51, no. 2614 (Jan. 5, 1899), pp. 19–67, with "The Churches in 1898, Principal Events of the Year." An interesting commentary on the census of 1936 is Harry Sebee Linfield's *State Population Census by Faiths; Meaning, Reliability and Value* (New York, 1938), with a bibliography. The most recent and reliable breakdown of figures is being issued by the Bureau of Research and Survey, National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A.: *Churches and Church Membership in the United States;*

an Enumeration and Analysis by Counties, States and Regions (New York, 1956– , ser. A and B, issued in numbers).

F. Atlases

References are found in Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951, 7th ed., and suppls.). For the Reformation, illustrating the religious background of early colonists and of later immigrants, there is William Robert Shepherd, *Historical Atlas . . .* , 8th ed. (Pikesville, Md., 1956), with maps for 1560 and 1618, and for the exploration and settlement of America and colonial expansion in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. "Established Churches and Religious Minorities about 1600," with notes, appears in R. R. Palmer, ed., *Rand McNally Atlas of World History* (New York, Chicago, and San Francisco, 1957). The best series on religion in Europe, 1500–1650, is in Vol. 3 of *Grosser Historischer Weltatlas,* ed. Dr. Josef Enzel (Munich, Germany, 1957). These show ecclesiastical organization about 1500, the Reformation and the Counter-Reformation, 1517–1650, and France during the Wars of Religion. *Muir's Historical Atlas, Ancient, Mediaeval & Modern,* edited by George Goodall and R. F. Treharne (London, 1955) has "Ecclesiastical England in the Time of Henry VIII," illustrating the Reformation, and maps of Western and Central Europe during the Wars of Religion, 1555–1648, and the religions of Central Europe about 1618. Although now out-of-date, statistics for the Roman Catholic Church, and maps showing the division of the nation into archdioceses and dioceses, are in Karl Streit, *Atlas Hierarchicus . . .* (Paderborn and Freiburg im Breisgau, Germany, 1929, 2nd ed.), with descriptive, historical, and ethnological information. An English issue of the rev. ed. appeared with the title: *Catholic World Atlas . . .* (Paderborn, New York, 1929). The distribution of churches by

denominations, 1775–1890, with notes, is shown on maps in Charles Oscar Paullin, *Atlas of the Historical Geography of the United States*, ed. John K. Wright (Washington and New York, 1932, Carnegie Institution Pub. 401).

V. BIOGRAPHICAL SOURCES

A. Bibliographies

A RICH mine of information on American religion is the deep deposit of biographical materials. There is no comprehensive dictionary of American religious biography worthy of comparison with the standard general reference works listed below. For scope and reliability no modern compilation on the clergy can rival William B. Sprague's *Annals* (see below), now more than a century old. The researcher must consult a wide variety of sources, and this section is intended to include the most essential ones. The works listed are valuable for ministerial biography. We still have no general encyclopedia of lives of eminent religious laymen. The researcher must know the names, and rely upon general dictionaries, encyclopedias, and collective individual biographies.

A general list of guides to biographical sources is in Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951, 7th ed. and suppls.), sect. S. These include some for European nations, from which came many early American clergymen and prominent lay leaders. The *Guide to Historical Literature*, ed. George Matthew Dutcher, et al. (New York, 1936) has an excellent brief selection of collective biographical works and individual biographies. It will always pay to consult Phyllis M. Riches, *Analytical Bibliography of Universal Collected Biography, Comprising Books Published in the English Tongue in Great Britain and Ireland, America and the British Dominions . . .* (London, 1934), which has indexes of biographies in collected works,

a bibliography of the books analyzed, a chronological list of persons, and an index by professions. All types of biographical material are covered by the *Biography Index; a Cumulative Index to Biographical Material in Books and Magazines*, Jan. 1946– (New York, 1946– , in progress). It includes current books in English, material from 1,500 periodicals, obituaries from the *New York Times*, analyses of collective biography, and incidental material from non-biographical books, with indexes by nationality, profession, and occupation. Works devoted specifically to American biography, and to genealogy, are listed in ch. xii, "Biography and Genealogy," Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History* (New York, 1942). Bibliographies by and about religious leaders, including some Americans and Reformation leaders who influenced America, appear in ch. xv, "Individuals," in John Graves Barrow, *A Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion* (Austin, Tex., 1955). Hundreds of biographies of American clergymen and other religious leaders are listed in "Religious Biography," *Writings on American History*, 1902, 1903, 1906–1940, with a wide coverage of denominations. (See also "Ministers of the Gospel" in *ibid.*, 1948; under denominations, 1949 and 1950, and under autobiographies and collective and miscellaneous biography, college and university graduates and classes.) Necessary are the admirably thorough and scholarly compilations by Edward H. O'Neill. *Biography by Americans, 1658–1936, A Subject Bibliography* (Philadelphia, 1939) omits autobiographies, diaries, and journals, but its 7,000 entries include important works for famous men, all found for those less well known, individual and collective biographies, with many of clergymen and lay religious leaders. Another excellent guide by the same author is *A History of American Biography, 1800–1935* (Philadelphia, 1935), with many entries for religious leaders, a very large bibliography of biographical books and articles, and critical notes. About 40

religious leaders of various denominations appear in Marion Dargan, *Guide to American Biography* . . . part I, 1607–1815, part II, 1815–1933 (Albuquerque, N.M., 1949, 1952), with other leaders (especially laymen) listed under education, literature, philanthropy, and reform. Other helpful works of lesser importance are Edward P. Boon, *Catalog of Biographical Pamphlets* (New York, 1878); Agnes M. Elliott, *Contemporary Biography, References to Books and Magazine Articles on Prominent Men and Women of the Time* (Pittsburgh, Carnegie Library, 1903); Marian Grace Elliott, "Buried Bibliographies; a List of Sources for Biographical Material Which May Easily Be Overlooked; a Contribution to Bibliography," *Wisconsin Library Bulletin*, Vol. 28 (Apr.–June 1932), pp. 96–102, 137–145, 175–178; American Antiquarian Society, *Index of Biographies in Newspapers from 1875 to 1927* (Worcester, Mass., in progress), and *Index to Newspaper Biographies and Obituaries*, 1875 to date (Worcester, Mass., in progress).

B. Biographical Dictionaries and Encyclopedias (General)

These sources are very numerous, and only a selection of the most important ones seems advisable. For eminent ministers and laymen of colonial times one of the best authorities is the British *Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. Leslie Stephen and Sidney Lee (London, 1885–1901, 63 vols.), the most important reference for British biography, generally scholarly and reliable, with excellent bibliographies, and good especially for New England Puritan leaders. Although it has many inaccuracies, there is still value in *Appleton's Cyclopedia of American Biography*, ed. J. G. Wilson and John Fiske (New York, 1887–1900, 7 vols.; also new enl. ed., New York, 1915, 6 vols., omitting some older and including new articles, with suppl. list at end of each vol. and 6 suppl. vols., 7–12, 1918–1931). The old ed. has names of

men of foreign birth closely identified with American history. Appleton is still useful for many names not included in the *Dictionary of American Biography,* ed. Allen Johnson and Dumas Malone (New York, 1928–1937, 21 vols., with index, 1937, 1 vol., and 2 suppl. vols.). The index lists nearly 1,500 clergymen by denominations, also "Religious Leaders," and the sketches have bibliographies.

Much more comprehensive than the "D.A.B." and more up-to-date than Appleton's, but less selective than either, is the *National Cyclopaedia of American Biography* (New York, 1892–1949, Vols. 1–35, in progress), the most comprehensive American biographical dictionary, but generally lacking bibliographies. The current volumes in progress include only living persons, and are all cumulatively indexed in part 3 of the *General Index.* A useful summary is George Derby's *Conspectus of American Biography; Being an Analytical Summary of American History and Biography, Containing also the Complete Indexes of the National Cyclopaedia of American Biography* (New York, 1906; 2nd ed., rev. and enl. with title *White's Conspectus of American Biography,* New York, 1937). This is useful as a classified index to the *National Cyclopaedia,* and as an independent handbook, and contains "Founders of Sects, Societies and Movements in the United States." The best known clergymen and religious laymen are listed in *Who's Who in America; a Biographical Dictionary of Notable Living Men and Women of the United States,* 1899/1900– (Chicago, 1899– , biennial), and in its companion *Who Was Who in America . . . Biographies of the Non-Living with Dates of Deaths Appended* (Chicago, 1942, 1950, 2 vols., 1897–1950). Some lives of clergymen, with references to further sources of information, are included in the popular *Current Biography; Who's Who and Why* (Vol. 1, Jan. 1940– , New York, 1940– , in progress), with bound annual cumulation including all sketches and obituary notices. A considerable representation of clergy-

men, church historians, and lay academic religious leaders appears in the *Directory of American Scholars, A Biographical Directory*, edited by Jaques Cattell (New York, 1957, 3rd ed., without professional index).

Several miscellaneous publications describe the religious life of noted American laymen and women—not "religious leaders" in the strict sense, and in some cases not even identified with a particular church. Twenty men and women figure in Louis Albert Banks, *The Religious Life of Famous Americans* (Boston and New York, 1940), published with an obvious intent to demonstrate the religious motive. Clergy and laity are included in Louis Finkelstein, *American Spiritual Autobiographies, Fifteen Self-Portraits* (New York, 1948), which presents a broad regional, ethnic, and occupational representation, symbolizing religious cooperation, and demonstrates that American religion produces thinkers and saints as well as "activists." A similar collection, also edited by Finkelstein, is *Thirteen Americans: Their Spiritual Autobiographies* (New York, 1953), including convinced Christians and Jews and persons identified with no religious group, who have tried to transcend finite outlook and understanding. Another sheaf of spiritual autobiographies is David Wesley Soper, *Highways of Faith; Autobiographies of Protestant Christians* (Philadelphia, 1954), including some Americans. Several eminent Americans are included in Henry Kalloch Rowe, *Modern Pathfinders of Christianity, The Lives and Deeds of Seven Centuries of Christian Leaders* (New York and Chicago, 1928). An old but fairly reliable cyclopedia of lives of prominent American religious laymen is the massive work of Edward J. Giddings, comp., *American Christian Rulers or Religion and Men of Government . . . Who have had Connection with the National and State Governments and the Judicial Department . . .* (New York, 1889, 1890), including 195 men, beginning with the colonial period, with a list of civil officers who were also ministers of

religion. A curious compilation, containing American biographies, very "pious" and evangelical in tone, is David Francis Bacon, ed., *Memoirs of Eminently Pious Women of Britain and America* (New Haven, 1833).

C. Genealogical Sources

Dictionaries and encyclopedias do not speak the last word in religious biography, and it would be wise to supplement them by genealogical guides. A brief, authoritative list of American genealogical bibliographies is in Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951, 7th ed. and suppls.), sect. T, "Genealogy," United States. Another fairly extensive list is given in Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History* . . . (New York, 1942), ch. XII, "Biography and Genealogy." Among older but still authoritative guides should be mentioned Daniel Steele Durrie's *Index to American Genealogies and the Genealogical Material Contained in . . . Town Histories, County Histories, Local Histories, Historical Society Publications, Biographies, Historical Periodicals, and Kindred Works, Alphabetically Arranged* (Albany, 1900, 1933). The 1st to 3rd eds., also comp. by Durrie, were issued as: *Bibliographia Genealogica Americana* . . . (Albany, 1868 1878, rev. and enl., suppl. 1888; another ed., Albany, 1895). Also still valuable is *The American Genealogist, Being a Catalogue of Family Histories* . . . (Albany, N.Y., 1900, 5th ed.), with books and pamphlets on family history published in America from 1771 to 1900. Earlier editions, by William H. Whitmore, appeared in 1862, 1868, and 1875, and there is also one of 1897 (Albany). Several essential guides of much more recent date include Charles Shepard's "Genealogical Bibliographies and Handbooks," *National Genealogical Society Quarterly*, Vol. 12 (June 1923), pp. 25–27. Undoubtedly the best is Fremont Rider, ed., *American Genealogical Index* . . . (Middletown, Conn., 1942– , 71

vols. up to early 1958; since 1952 under title: *American Genealogical-Biographical Index*, ser. 2). For old American families one should consult John Farmer, *A Genealogical Register of the First Settlers of New England . . . To Which are Added Various Genealogical and Biographical Notes, Collected from Ancient Records, Manuscripts and Printed Works* (Lancaster, Mass., 1829); also Frederick Adams Virkus, ed., *Compendium of American Genealogy; the Standard Genealogical Encyclopedia of the First Families of America* (Chicago, 1925–1942, Vols. 1–7; Vols. 1–4 as *Abridged Compendium . . .*).

For articles, the best recent continuing guide is Donald Lines Jacobus, *Index to Genealogical Periodicals* (New Haven, 1932–), with name, place, and subject indexes, including 53 American periodicals. Two of the most scholarly periodicals, especially for old families and colonial and other early American ministers are: the *New England Historical and Genealogical Register* (Boston, 1847, Vol. 1– , and indexes, Vols. 1–50, for persons, subjects, and places, separate vols. publ. 1905–1911); and the *New York Genealogical and Biographical Record . . .* (New York, 1870, Vol. 1– , with subject index, Vols. 1–38, 1907). Many colonial clergymen and lay religious leaders may be located in James Savage, *Genealogical Dictionary of the First Settlers of New England Showing Three Generations of Those Who Came Before May, 1692, on the Basis of Farmer's Register* (Boston, 1860–1862, 4 vols.), which should be used with O. P. Dexter's *Genealogical Cross Index . . .* (New York, 1884). A little aid may be found in John Camden Hotten, *The Original Lists of Persons of Quality; Emigrants; Religious Exiles; Political Rebels; . . . and Others Who Went from Great Britain to the American Plantations, 1600–1700* (New York and London, 1874; repr. New York, 1931), derived from original manuscript records in England, with an index of names.

D. Clergy: Specific Directories, Encyclopedias, Lists

The lack of a modern biographical encyclopedia of American clergymen compels the researcher to roam far afield among various types of publications. Material on the lives of ministers is widely scattered, and no systematic and comprehensive effort has been made to assemble it in the century since William B. Sprague began the publication of his *Annals of the American Pulpit* (see below). The following list of references aims to provide some direction through this difficult maze of research.

Predominantly clerical are the articles on living religious leaders in Philip Schaff's *New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge . . .* (New York, 1908–1912, 12 vols. and index; repr. Grand Rapids, Mich., 1949–1950, 13 vols.). Biographies of some deceased religious leaders, mostly clerical, are found in Shailer Matthews and G. B. Smith, *Dictionary of Religion and Ethics* (New York, 1921). Some early American ministers appear in an old but reliable compilation by Erasmus Middleton: *Evangelical Biography . . . Both British and Foreign, in the Several Denominations of Protestants, from the Beginning of the Reformation to the Present Time . . .* (London, 1816, new ed., 4 vols.). The American references here are greatly amplified by Gerald Fothergill, *A List of Emigrant Ministers to America, 1690–1811* (London, 1904), an essential source for ministers of the late colonial and early national periods. A general survey of the more intellectual early clergymen, with appreciation and criticism of their additions to American culture, is contained in two excellent essays in Vol. 1 of *The Cambridge History of American Literature*, ed. William P. Trent and others (New York, 1917): Vernon Louis Parrington, "The Puritan Divines, 1620–1720," and Woodbridge Riley, "Philosophers and Divines, 1720–1789," with valuable bibliographies. Although they contain inaccuracies and omissions, one must not fail to consult four volumes by

Frederick Lewis Weis, compiled for the Publications of the Society of the Descendants of the Colonial Clergy: *The Colonial Clergy and the Colonial Churches of New England* (Lancaster, Mass., 1936); *The Colonial Churches and the Colonial Clergy of the Middle and Southern Colonies, 1607–1776* (Lancaster, Mass., 1938); *The Colonial Clergy of Virginia, North Carolina, and South Carolina* (Boston, 1955); and *The Colonial Clergy of Maryland, Delaware, and Georgia* (Lancaster, Mass., 1950). The first two have bibliographies of general and denominational sources, and all have alphabetical lists of clergy and their churches, with indication of denominations, containing thousands of names, but without biographical sketches.

The Revolutionary and early national periods down to the 1850's are partially covered by works founded upon considerable scholarly effort. A truly basic one is Frank Moore, *The Patriot Preachers of the American Revolution, with Biographical Sketches, 1766–1783* (New York, 1860). A heavily documented but entertainingly written study of the Congregational clerical patriots is Alice Mary Baldwin, *The New England Clergy and the American Revolution . . .* (Durham, N.C., 1928), with large bibliography, which demonstrates the powerful ministerial encouragement of resistance to tyranny, and contains much biographical information. Sketches of many Loyalist (mostly Anglican) ministers appear in the classic by Lorenzo Sabine, *Biographical Sketches of Loyalists of the American Revolution, with an Historical Essay* (Boston, 1864), the first American study in the field. Numerous eminent figures of the early national era are studied and appreciated in Samuel Lee Wolff's essay, "Divines and Moralists, 1783–1860," in *The Cambridge History of American Literature,* Vol. II (New York, 1918), with bibliography. For the colonial and early national periods the essential compilation is William Buell Sprague, *Annals of the American Pulpit; or, Commemorative Notices of Distinguished American Clergymen of Various Denomina-*

tions, from the Early Settlement of the Country to the Close of the Year Eighteen Hundred and Fifty-Five (New York, 1857–1869, 9 vols.). This comprises sketches of about 1,300 to 1,400 ministers of the major denominations, written in many cases by authors who personally knew the subjects, with citations of writings but without formal bibliographies. No other such compilation of this extent exists. A brief summary, which anticipated the first volume of Sprague's monumental work, is Henry Fowler's *The American Pulpit: Sketches of Living American Preachers, and of the Religious Movements Which They Represent* (New York, 1856), with portraits. Also valuable for the early period is John Franklin Jameson, "The American Acta Sanctorum," in *American Historical Review*, Vol. 13, no. 2 (Jan. 1908), pp. 286–302, on materials for American history in clerical biographies.

The period since Sprague is inadequately covered by miscellaneous publications. American ministers appear in the *Encyclopedia of Living Divines and Christian Workers of all Denominations in Europe and America; being a Supplement to Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge* (New York, 1887, ed. Philip Schaff and Samuel Macauley Jackson). The early years of the twentieth century are fairly well represented in Thomas William Herringshaw, ed. and comp., *American Clergyman and Theologian Blue Book, A Vocational Blue Book of Biography* (Chicago, 1923), with over 5,000 brief biographies of the foremost living bishops, clergymen, patrons of the church, men active in church and religious affairs, and others prominent in the religious world. The century to the 1940's is partly surveyed by J. C. Schwarz, ed., *Who's Who in the Clergy*, Vol. 1, 1935–1936 (New York, 1936), and its continuation, *Religious Leaders of America* (published as Vol. 2, 1941–1942, New York, 1941, rev. and enl. ed., with references to 1st ed. in cases where new material was not obtained). The first issue has sketches of over 7,000 leaders, and is the first bio-

graphical volume with representatives of all faiths. One should consult also *Who's Who in the Protestant Clergy* (Encino, Calif., 1957). There is usually a biographical section in recent issues of the *Yearbook of American Churches*. Many American divines are included in *Makers of Christianity* (New York, 1934–1937, 3 vols.). The third volume, by William Warren Sweet, has Americans from John Cotton to Lyman Abbott (roughly 1630–1920), with a selected bibliography. Another selection, ranging from the Puritan theocracy to the Social Gospel, is Joseph M. M. Gray's *Prophets of the Soul* (New York and Cincinnati, 1936, references with the chapters). An attempt to estimate the contributions and influence of the clergy is Daniel Dulaney Addison's attractive but not very profound *The Clergy in American Life and Letters* (New York and London, 1900), with strong emphasis upon "liberal" leaders of the nineteenth century.

E. College Directories and General Catalogs

Among the richest sources of biographical data are the alumni directories and general catalogs of the older and larger theological seminaries, and of the early, religiously-sponsored American and British colleges and universities. These gave a large portion of their graduates to the ministry, and to lay leadership in the churches. Unfortunately there is no up-to-date bibliography of these publications. Those for many colleges up to about 1915 are in Eva A. Cole's "Check List of Biographical Directories and General Catalogues of American Colleges," *New York Genealogical and Biographical Record,* Vol. 46, no. 1 (Jan. 1915), pp. 51–57. An excellent guide is the card catalog, "Biographical Registers and General Catalogues of American Colleges [and Seminaries] A Contribution toward a Bibliography," compiled by Milton Halsey Thomas, formerly curator, Columbiana Collection, Columbia University Library, New York City. This includes

several hundred institutions. Many alumni of Harvard, Yale, Princeton, and Columbia, who became ministers before 1900, are found in Joshua Lawrence Chamberlain, ed., *Universities and Their Sons* . . . (Boston, 1898–1900, 5 vols., particularly Vols. 2–5). Another general directory, early but still useful, is John Farmer, *List of Graduates of the Colleges in New York and New Jersey from the Founding of Each to 1834* (Boston, 1838).

American general catalogs and biographical directories generally include graduates and nongraduates, and the earlier ones ordinarily are in Latin. Many have officers and contemporary undergraduates; faculty members and trustees (who often have been ministers), in some cases with biographical data; recipients of honorary degrees (including many eminent clergymen); and graduates of associated divinity schools. A few list alumni who became clergymen or missionaries. Some have biographical sketches, with sources of information, and bibliographies of writings. Prefaces often contain references to previous issues. The latest publications are listed alphabetically by name of institution, with abbreviated titles, dates covered and dates of publication, and brief bibliographical notes when necessary.

AMHERST COLLEGE. *Biographical Record*, 1821–1921 (rev. 1939).

BATES COLLEGE (incl. Cobb Divinity School). *General Catalogue*, 1863–1915 (1915).

BOWDOIN COLLEGE. *General Catalogue*, 1794–1916 (1916).

BROWN UNIVERSITY. *Historical Catalogue*, 1764–1934 (1936), omitting classes prior to 1855. New ed., 1950.

BURLINGTON COLLEGE. "Alumni of Burlington College, 1850–60," in George Morgan Hills, *History of the Church in Burlington, N.J.* (Trenton, 1885, 2nd ed., pp. 575–577).

CHICAGO, UNIVERSITY. *Alumni Directory*, 1861–1919

(1920), incl. degrees in divinity and doctoral degrees in religion.

COLBY COLLEGE, Waterville, Me. *General Catalogue*, 1820–1920 (1920). *Obituary Record of Graduates*, 1822–1870, suppls. 1–3, 1873, 1877, 1884.

COLGATE UNIVERSITY. *General Catalogue*, 1819–1919 (1919). New ed., 1938, 2 vols. Includes seminary.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY. *Officers and Alumni*, 1754–1857 (1936), comp. by Milton Halsey Thomas. *Alumni Register*, 1754–1931 (1932).

FRANKLIN AND MARSHALL COLLEGE, Lancaster, Pa. *Catalogue of Officers and Students*, 1787–1903 (1903), incl. Franklin College, 1787–1853, Marshall College, 1836–1853. *Obituary Record*, 1837–1893, 1897–1900, 2 vols.

GEORGETOWN UNIVERSITY. James S. Easby-Smith, *Georgetown University . . . 1789–1907* (1907, 2 vols.). "Alumni Directory," 1912, in *Quarterly*, 9th ser., Vol. 2 (1912). *List of Graduates* (1909). Alumni lists, 1916, 1924, 1941, 1947.

GETTYSBURG COLLEGE. *Alumni Record*, 1832–1932 (1932).

HAMILTON COLLEGE, Clinton, N.Y. "Complete Alumni Register, 1812–1932," in *Bulletin*, Vol. 16, no. 1 (1932).

HAMPDEN-SIDNEY COLLEGE. *Dictionary of Biography*, 1776–1825 (1921). *General Catalogue*, 1776–1906, in *Bulletin*, Vol. 3, no. 4 (Nov. 1908). Suppls., 1907–1916, 1917–1926.

HARVARD UNIVERSITY. John Langdon Sibley, ed., *Biographical Sketches of Graduates*, 1642–1930 (1873–1951, 8 vols.), Vol. 4–8 ed. by Clifford K. Shipton. In progress.

HAVERFORD COLLEGE. *Biographical Catalogue of the Matriculates*, 1832–1922 (1922).

HOBART COLLEGE, Geneva, N.Y. *General Catalogue*, 1825–1897 (1897). *Necrology*, in "Addresses of Alumni and Former Students," in *Bulletin*, Vol. 25, no. 4 (Jan. 1927).

KENYON COLLEGE, Gambier, Ohio. *General Catalogue*, 1826–1899 (1899). *Triennial Catalogue*, 1825–1872. "Ad-

dresses of Alumni and Matriculates, 1851–1923," in *Bulletin*, no. 86 (Apr. 1924).

KNOX COLLEGE, Galesburg, Ill. *Directory of Knox People*, 1837–1923, in *Bulletin*, n.s., Vol. 17, no. 4 (1923). Rev., 1928. "Address List, 1846–1917," in *ibid.*, n.s., Vol. 12, no. 3 (1917). *Centenary Biographical Record*, 1937.

LAFAYETTE COLLEGE, Easton, Pa. *Biographical Catalogue*, 1832–1912 (1913). "Alumni Directory," 1857–1923, in *Bulletin*, Vol. 18, no. 5 (June 1924). *Biographical Record of the Men of Lafayette, 1832–1948* (1948).

MIDDLEBURY COLLEGE. *Catalogue of the Officers and Students*, 1800–1927 (1928). *General Catalogue*, 1950.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY. *General Alumni Catalogue*, 1833–1915 (1916).

OBERLIN COLLEGE. *Alumni Catalogue*, 1833–1936 (1937).

PENNSYLVANIA, UNIVERSITY. *Biographical Catalogue of the Matriculates*, 1749–1893 (1894). *General Alumni Catalogue*, 1928.

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY. *General Catalogue*, 1746–1906 (1908). Archibald Alexander, *Biographical Sketches of the Founder, and Principal Alumni of the Log College* (Princeton, 1845).

RUTGERS UNIVERSITY. *Alumni and Students of the Colleges for Men*, 1774–1932 (1929). *Biographical Notices of . . . Graduates and Professors*, 1891. *General Catalogue*, 1766–1909, 1916.

SWARTHMORE COLLEGE. *Alumni Register . . .* a *Biographical List*, 1862–1930, in *Bulletin*, Vol. 27, no. 4 (1930). Another issue, 1940.

TRINITY COLLEGE, Hartford, Conn. "Directory of Living Graduates, 1853–1923," in *Bulletin*, n.s., Vol. 21, no. 2 (Apr. 1924).

TUFTS COLLEGE. *Directory of Graduates*, 1857–1928 (1929).

TUSCULUM COLLEGE, Greeneville, Tenn. *Alumni Cata-*

logue, 1794–1929 (1929). Allen Edgar Ragan, *A History of Tusculum College, 1794–1944* (1945).

UNION UNIVERSITY, Schenectady, N.Y. *Centennial Catalog*, 1795–1895 (1895). Andrew VanVranken Raymond, *Union University; Its History* . . . (New York, 1907, 3 vols.), with biographies.

WESLEYAN UNIVERSITY, Middletown, Conn. *Alumni Record*, 1831–1931 (1931).

WESTERN RESERVE UNIVERSITY. *Centennial Catalogue of Graduates and Former Students*, 1826–1926, in *Bulletin*, Vol. 29, no. 8 (Aug. 1926).

WILLIAM AND MARY COLLEGE. *Catalogue*, 1859, officers, faculty and students to 1859. "Register of Students, 1827–81," in *William and Mary Quarterly*, 2nd ser., Vol. 4 (1924) and Vol. 5 (1925). "Catalogue of Alumni and Alumnae for the Years 1865–1923," in *Bulletin*, Vol. 18, no. 5 (1923); 1866–1932, Vol. 26, no. 2.

WILLIAMS COLLEGE. *General Catalogue*, 1795–1930 (1930). Calvin Durfee, *Williams Biographical Annals* (Boston, 1871), officers and alumni, classes 1795–1865. *Obituary record*, 1871– .

YALE UNIVERSITY. Franklin Bowditch Dexter, ed., *Biographical Sketches of the Graduates*, 1701–1815, 6 vols. (1885–1912). *Catalogue of the Officers and Graduates*, 1701–1924 (1924). Anson Phelps Stokes, *Memorials of Eminent Yale Men* (New Haven, 1914, 2 vols.). Henry Hallam Tweedy, "Yale's Contribution to the Christian Ministry in America, 1701–1921," in *Christian Activity at Yale*, 3:6, pp. 129–185. Franklin Bowditch Dexter, *Biographical Notices of Graduates . . . Including Those Graduated in Classes Later Than 1815, Who are not Commemorated in the Annual Obituary Records* (New Haven, 1913), covering 1815–1884, continued by: *Obituary Record of Graduates*, 1859– , annual.

BRITISH UNIVERSITIES. Their alumni records should be con-

sulted, because some Puritan and Anglican clergymen, who studied at the universities, later migrated to America and in many cases became prominent in religious affairs. A general guide to these records is Marjorie Johnson and H. Raven-Hart, *Bibliography of the Registers (Printed) of the Universities, Inns of Court, Colleges and Schools of Great Britain and Ireland,* London University, Institute of Historical Research, *Bulletin:* Vol. 9 (June, Nov. 1931; Feb. 1932), Vol. 10 (Nov. 1932). Most of the registers listed include biographical material. CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY: John and J. A. Venn, comp., *Alumni Cantabrigienses . . . from the Earliest Times to 1900* (Cambridge, 1922–1947, 7 vols., in progress), important because many early Puritan ministers and some early Anglican clergy in America were alumni of Cambridge. This rich mine should be supplemented by Charles Henry Cooper and Thompson Cooper, *Athenae Cantabrigienses, 1500–1611* (Cambridge, 1858–1861, 1913, 3 vols., with general index), containing many biographies, with about 700 names not in the *Dictionary of National Biography.* DUBLIN UNIVERSITY, TRINITY COLLEGE: *Alumni Dublinenses . . . 1593–1860,* new ed. with suppl. (Dublin, 1935), for Anglican colonial ministers who were alumni. UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW: *A Roll of the Graduates . . . From 31st December 1727 to 31st December 1897, with Short Biographical Notes* (Glasgow, 1898), cont. of *Munimenta Alme Universitatis Glasguensis* (1854), including graduates, 1450/51–1727. Some alumni, particularly Presbyterian ministers, emigrated to America. OXFORD UNIVERSITY: Joseph Foster, *Alumni Oxonienses: the Members of the University of Oxford, 1500–1714 . . .* (Oxford, 1891–1892, 4 vols.; 1715–1886, Oxford, 1887–1888, 4 vols.), for the considerable number of Oxonians among the Anglican colonial clergy. A convenient summary of the contribution of British universities to the early Puritan ministry and laity is Samuel Eliot Morison's "English University Men Who Emigrated to New England before 1646," in *Founding of Harvard College*

(Cambridge, Mass., 1935, appendix B), an extremely valuable list, including previous researches by Franklin Bowditch Dexter and Joseph Gardner Bartlett.

F. Seminary Directories and General Catalogs

These volumes are one of the best sources for religious biography, and follow a general pattern. They include trustees, officers and faculty members, various classes of students, honorary graduates, recipients of honorary degrees, and sometimes even librarians and visiting lecturers. Ordinarily they have alphabetical, class, and geographical indexes. Biographical notes vary from scanty to fairly complete; and some have lists of missionaries, statistical tables and summaries, necrologies, and sources of information. Prefaces usually give information regarding previous issues.

ANDOVER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY (dissolved 1931). *General Catalogue*, 1808–1927, with biographical data, 1909–1927 (1927). See issue of 1908, for notes on previous issues, 1815–1880. *Necrology*, 1880–1914, 32 nos., with extensive biographies.

ANDOVER-NEWTON THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL (incl. Andover Theological Seminary and Newton Theological Institution). *General Catalogue*, 1826–1943 (1943).

AUBURN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY (united with Union Theological Seminary, New York City, 1939). *General Biographical Catalogue*, 1818–1918 (1918).

AUGUSTANA COLLEGE AND THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Rock Island, Ill. *Alumni Register*, 1877–1924 (1924).

BANGOR THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Bangor, Me. *Historical Catalogue*, 1816–1916 (1916). Suppl. to 1926 (1928).

CHICAGO, PRESBYTERIAN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY (McCormick Theological Seminary). *General Catalogue* (1939), including alumni of the affiliated Lane Theological Seminary, formerly in Cincinnati.

COLGATE-ROCHESTER DIVINITY SCHOOL. *General Catalogue*, 1819–1930, in *Bulletin*, Vol. 3, suppl. to no. 1 (Oct. 1930), with suppls., 1940, 1952. With notes on previous catalogs of Colgate and Rochester seminaries.

CROZER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Chester, Pa. *Alphabetic Biographical Catalog*, 1855–1933, suppl. to *Bulletin* (Apr. 1933).

DREW THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Madison, N.J. *Alumni Record*, 1867–1925 (1926).

GENERAL THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY OF THE PROTESTANT EPISCOPAL CHURCH, New York City. "Alumni, 1822–1924," in *Bulletin*, Vol. 10, no. 3, sect. 1 (Oct. 1924).

GETTYSBURG SEMINARY. Abdel Ross Wentz, comp., *History of the Gettysburg Theological Seminary . . . 1826–1926* (1926), with much biographical material for faculty and students.

HARTFORD SEMINARY FOUNDATION (formerly Theological Institute of Connecticut). *General Catalogue*, 1834–1927 (1927).

HARVARD DIVINITY SCHOOL. *General Catalogue* (1915), with extensive notes on previous issues.

LUTHERAN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Philadelphia. *Philadelphia Seminary Biographical Record*, 1864–1923 (1923).

MEADVILLE THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL (Meadville, Pa., 1844–1926; Chicago, Ill., 1926–). *General Catalogue*, 1844–1930 (1930).

PACIFIC SCHOOL OF RELIGION, Berkeley, Calif. (formerly Pacific Theological Seminary). *General Catalogue*, 1866–1925 (1925).

PRINCETON THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY. *Biographical Catalogue*, 1815–1954 (1955), biographies 1865–1954, with reference to previous publications for classes before 1865. *Necrological Reports*, 1875–1929, 5 vols., continued in *Princeton Seminary Bulletin.*

PROTESTANT EPISCOPAL THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY IN VIRGINIA. Alumni list by classes, 1823–1954, in *Seminary Journal*,

Vol. 2, no. 1 (Oct. 1955); catalog and alumni list, 1955–1956, including alumni of Bishop Payne Divinity School (Negro), which united with the seminary. William A. R. Goodwin, *History of the Theological Seminary in Virginia . . .* (New York, 1923, 2 vols.), with lists of alumni, 1823–1923 in Vol. 2; biographical sketches of founders, professors, et al.

SOUTHERN BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Louisville, Ky. John R. Sampey, *The First Thirty Years, 1859–1889* (Baltimore, 1890), with biographical data.

THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY OF THE REFORMED CHURCH IN THE UNITED STATES, Lancaster, Pa. "Centennial Register," 1825–1925, in *Bulletin,* Vol. 8, no. 1, cont. to 1932.

THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY (Reformed Dutch), New Brunswick, N.J. *Biographical Record,* 1784–1934 (1934).

UNION THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, New York City. *History and Biographical Sketches of Its First Fifty Years* (New York, 1889). *Alumni Catalogue,* 1836–1936 (1937).

UNION THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Richmond, Va. *General Catalogue,* 1807–1924 (1924).

WESTERN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY, Pittsburgh, Pa. *Directory,* 1848–1914, in *Bulletin,* Vol. 6, no. 5 (July 1914).

YALE UNIVERSITY, DIVINITY SCHOOL. *Eighth General Catalogue . . . Centennial Issue,* 1822–1922, in *Bulletin of Yale University,* 19th ser., no. 2 (1922).

VI. GENERAL HISTORIES AND SURVEYS

A. General Secular Histories

RELIGION has commanded a considerable share of attention in "academic" historiography, independent of traditional presuppositions of ecclesiastical historians. Critical notes upon a few "secular" histories of the United States, with references to religion, introduce Peter G. Mode's *Source Book and Bibliographical Guide for American Church History* (Menasha,

Wis., 1921, ch. 1), from James Grahame (1824) to Edward Channing (1917), with general surveys by ecclesiastical writers, from Andrew Reed and James Matheson (1835) to 1912 (see B, below). Notes on religious references in general histories are scattered through Michael Kraus, *History of American History* (New York, 1937), with bibliography, but are difficult to find from the deplorable lack of a subject index. (See sect. III, *Religious Historiography*.) Generally factual and impartial reviews of the contribution of religion to American life abound in Albert Bushnell Hart, ed., *The American Nation, A History* . . . (New York and London, 1907–1908, 28 vols.), with bibliographies in individual volumes, and references in "Analytical Index," Vol. 28. Volume 26, written by Hart, *National Ideals Historically Traced, 1607–1907* (New York and London, 1907), with bibliography, has a chapter, "The American Church." He notes religious unity creating an American type of church, the decay of theological doctrine, and the rise of ethical religion. A sweeping review, from early Spanish missions to the depression of the 1930's, is an excellent feature of Arthur M. Schlesinger and Dixon Ryan Fox, eds., *A History of American Life* (New York, 1930–1948, 13 vols.), with sections on religion in the bibliographies, Vols. 1–8, 11–13. Religion is considered from the sociological viewpoint advocated by secular and church historians early in the present century (see sect. III, *Religious Historiography*).

This approach qualifies references to religion in many comprehensive histories by academic authors since 1920. Charles A. and Mary Beard, in *The Rise of American Civilization* (New York, 1933, new rev. and enl. ed., 2 vols. in 1) note religion's patronage of education and learning, gradual liberalization, rivalry with secular interests, and relation to Jacksonian democracy, social thought, politics, science, higher Biblical criticism, "Modernism," laymen's work, and philosophy. Jeannette P. and Roy F. Nichols, *The Growth of American Democracy; Social: Economic: Political* (New

York and London, 1939), with extensive bibliography, fairly and acutely emphasize gradual liberalization, the church's lag in confronting social problems, and conflicts arising from adjustment to modern social and intellectual circumstances. John D. Hicks, *The Federal Union* (Boston and New York, 1937, 1941, 2 vols.) gives prominence to separation of church and state, the slavery question, revivalism, immigrant and rural faith, and the practical emphasis of American religion. Good sections on religion appear in the bibliography of Oliver Perry Chitwood and Frank Lawrence Owsley, *A Short History of the American People* (New York, 1945, 1946, 2 vols.), an impartial survey, with portions on religious decline and revival, 1783–1860, the westward missionary movement, revivalism, the growth of Catholicism, and new denominations. *The Growth of the American Republic*, by Samuel Eliot Morison and Henry Steele Commager (New York, 1950, 2 vols., 4th ed. rev. and enl.) favors religion more than most "secular" accounts, due to the authors' concept of history as embracing life in the round. Their liberal philosophy stresses disestablishment and liberalization, the social gospel, and accommodation to the evolutionary outlook (see sect. III, *Religious Historiography*). "Americanization" of religion (with Southern conservatism as a brake) is delineated by Leland D. Baldwin, *The Stream of American History* (New York, 1952), with pointed remarks on growing tolerance, disestablishment, secularization, and westward missionary expansion. (See also sect. I, C, *American History: General.*)

B. Factual Surveys and Histories by Churchmen

Aside from ecclesiastical compendiums (see sect. IV, *Miscellaneous Guides*), there are some factual reports on general religious conditions. The earlier ones were intended to enlighten Europeans who were interested in the "voluntary system." Although frankly denominational in emphasis and

derived from rather brief observation, interesting general information is in F. A. Cox and J. Hobey, *The Baptists in America; A Narrative of the Deputation from the Baptist Union in England to the United States and Canada* (New York, 1836). Philip Schaff, the founder of American church historiography, included a broad report of religion, churches, and sects in two lectures delivered in Germany: *America, A Sketch of the Political, Social, and Religious Character of the United States of North America* . . . (New York, 1855), together with his report to the German Church Diet, 1854. A similar but briefer review is Henry Boynton Smith's *Report on the State of Religion in the United States of America, Made to the General Conference of the Evangelical Alliance at Amsterdam, 1867* (New York, 1867, repr. from *American Presbyterian and Theological Review*, Oct. 1867). He discusses separation of church and state, the "voluntary principle," societies and missions, and service in the Civil War and to Negro freedmen, with denominational statistics. A mass of data, poorly arranged, is presented by Daniel Dorchester, *Christianity in the United States from the First Settlement down to the Present Time* (New York and Cincinnati, 1888; rev. ed., 1895), with plates, maps, tables, diagrams, and chart. Also mainly factual is John Fletcher Hurst's manual, *Short History of the Church in the United States, A.D. 1492–1890* (New York, 1890), an "express" treatment. The first venture in encyclopedic history is *The American Church History Series, Consisting of a Series of Denominational Histories Published under the Auspices of the American Society of Church History* (New York, 1893–1897, ed. Philip Schaff, Henry C. Potter, and Samuel M. Jackson). Although omitting many minor groups and cults and heavily accenting denominationalism, this is still useful, especially for denominational bibliographies; a general bibliography, 1820–1893, by Jackson, Vol. 12; a statistical survey in Vol. 1, by H. K. Carroll, based upon the census of 1890; and Leonard W. Bacon's well-balanced general history, Vol. 13.

This monument of scholarship has been supplemented by many over-all views of religion and its varieties. One cannot overlook Frank Grenville Beardsley's fairly brief surveys: *Christian Achievement in America* (Chicago, 1907), with some bibliographical footnotes; and *History of Christianity in America* (New York, 1938). These range widely, from religious elements in early colonization to modern urban evangelism and the general influence of religion upon national life. A mine of official information on Protestant denominations is in Charles Stedman MacFarland, ed., *The Churches of the Federal Council; Their History, Organization and Distinctive Characteristics, and a Statement of the Development of the Federal Council* (New York, 1916), with bibliographies. George Percy Hedley's *The Christian Heritage in America* (New York, 1946) consists of popular addresses on traditions and contributions of larger Christian groups, Judaism, and revivalistic sects, with an essay on the Hebrew-Christian tradition. A wider spectrum of faiths is comprehended in Julius A. Weber, *Religions and Philosophies in the United States of America* (Los Angeles, 1931), with unedited accounts by acknowledged authorities, including mystical cults and "marginal" groups. Brooke Peters Church, *A Faith for You* (New York, 1948), with bibliography, written for the "unchurched" with the assistance of many religious leaders, includes interpretative notes and a glossary of religious terms. A broad and largely factual survey of Christianity is imbedded in Vols. III (chs. 3, 5, 6), IV (chs. 6–12), and VII (ch. 5) of Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of the Expansion of Christianity*, with bibliographical footnotes and a general unclassified bibliography for each volume. (See also sect. I, D, *American Church History*.)

C. Early General Social Surveys

American religion (especially evangelical Protestantism) by the 1830's displayed certain basic and permanent characteristics. That period produced some studies with literary

pretensions, frankly sociological and interpretative, and intended to explain and vindicate American religion to Europeans. One of the best is by Andrew Reed and James Matheson, *A Narrative of a Visit to the American Churches, by the Deputation from the Congregational Union of England and Wales* (New York, London, 1835, 2 vols.). They entertainingly revealed an "almost unexplored and unreported field," by observations mingled with travel narrative, and notes cast in the form of letters. A few years later the same service was performed by Robert Baird, a minister of superior literary ability. Wide acclaim greeted (and still greets) his books: *Religion in America; or, An Account of the Origin, Progress, Relation to the State, and Present Condition of the Evangelical Churches in the United States, with Notices of the Unevangelical Denominations* . . . (London, 1842; New York, 1844, 1845, 1856) considerably enlarged; Glasgow and Edinburgh, 1844; *The Progress and Prospects of Christianity in the United States of America* . . . (London, 1851); and a more complete supplementary report: *State and Prospects of Religion in America; Being a Report made at the Conference of the Evangelical Alliance in Paris, August 25th, 1855* (London, 1855, and New York, 1856). His most interesting observations concern voluntary support, relations of church and state, revivalism, missions, social influence, and types and effects of preaching. Baird's works are indispensable to a study of his period, and are sympathetic toward American religious tendencies. A less friendly view was expressed by Alexander Blaikie, the Scottish pastor of the Associate Reformed (First Presbyterian) Church of Boston, in *The Philosophy of Sectarianism; or, A Classified View of the Christian Sects in the United States; with Notices of Their Progress and Tendencies. Illustrated by Historical Facts and Anecdotes* . . . (Boston, 1855, 2nd ed.). He surveys worship, discipline, Sunday observance, morals, the influence of ecclesiastical upon civil polity, and religious intervention in public issues. A Christian-social philosophy inspired Jesse

Truesdell Peck's *The History of the Great Republic, Considered from a Christian Standpoint* (New York, 1868), which emphasizes struggles for religious and civil liberty, religious elements in the formation and actions of the nation, the social pervasiveness of Christianity, and the evolution of an "American Church." The centennial of the Declaration of Independence encouraged efforts to assess realistically the part of religion in American life. A condensed, scholarly, and readable one is J. Lewis Diman's "Religion in America, 1776–1876," *North American Review*, Vol. 122, no. 250 (Jan. 1876), pp. 1–47. He notices religious liberty and the "voluntary principle," a tendency to compact aggregations according to denominational type, problems in church-state relations, the rise of Roman Catholicism, historical and critical theology, and trends toward ethicism, sentiment, and liturgical worship. Similar observations characterize a popularly written series of 14 articles, "Religious Life in America" by Ernest Hamlin Abbott, in *The Outlook*, Vol. 69, no. 11 (Nov. 16, 1901)–Vol. 72, no. 9 (Nov. 8, 1902). Based upon nationwide travel, close observation, and interviews, these reveal a revolt from harsh doctrine, increasing indifference among workingmen, emphasis upon social religion and growing sympathy with labor, failures of churches in ethical influence, lagging adjustment to higher educational standards, church unity in practical works, the rise of fundamentalist sects, and the growth of liturgy in older churches. The rising sociological emphasis found a voice in the penetrating essay by David S. Schaff, "The Movement and Mission of American Christianity," *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 16, no. 1 (Jan. 1912), pp. 51–69: a closely packed survey, illuminating new religious expressions and the American school of theology, the rise of organized liberal religion, lay activity, union of diverse groups for common causes, and fusion of ethnic stocks in the churches.

D. Later Sociological Interpretation

After 1920 the environmental, "evolutionary" historiography attained its triumph. Religious historians adopted more scientific and objective methods and tried to forsake denominational and theological presuppositions, as suggested by Ephraim Emerton and others (see sect. III, *Religious Historiography*). The new viewpoint is illuminated by four publications covering the period since 1800. The long-advocated delving into contemporary records is the foundation of Peter Oliver's "'Probationers for Eternity,' Notes on Religion in the United States in the Year 1800," *Harvard Theological Review*, Vol. 37, no. 3 (July 1944), pp. 219–235, with bibliographical footnotes, and showing revivalist evangelism in conflict with liberalism and indifference. The evolution of "American religion," under separation of church and state, is the keynote of Martha L. Edwards, "Religious Forces in the United States, 1815–1830," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 5, no. 4 (Mar. 1919), pp. 434–449. This period determined the outlines of development, with Calvinistic Protestantism dominant, and showed uniformity of religious traits emerging from environment and commonly accepted religious ideals. The same method, on a far greater scale, appears in Winfred Ernest Garrison's readable, brilliantly generalizing, and dispassionate *The March of Faith; the Story of Religion in America Since 1865* (New York and London, 1933), with sources and bibliography. This heavily accents social background, relations to cultural life, the social gospel, missions and territorial expansion, relations with big business, changes in institutional religion, ethical influence, and awareness of international issues. Transformations since 1900 are studied, by a combination of historical and scientific methods, in Herbert Wallace Schneider, *Religion in 20th Century America* (Cambridge, Mass., 1952), with bibliographic references in notes, and statistical

tables. The chief concern is with experience, change, and growth in the inner core of religion.

This method of approach has owed much to the example of Henry Kallock Rowe, *The History of Religion in the United States* (New York, 1924). This is one of the first attempts at a clear, brief interpretation of the broad significance of religion in American history. It abandons the clerical viewpoint and speaks for laymen, showing gradual emancipation from European tradition, and the growth of an activist, free evangelism. Among "church" historians this trend flowered in the comprehensive histories of William Warren Sweet and Willard Learoy Sperry. Sweet's *The Story of Religion in America* (New York, 1930; rev. ed., 1939; 2nd rev. ed., 1950) has an extensive bibliography and a census of religious bodies. Encyclopedic but readable, it stimulated interest among academic students of American society by scholarly and sensitive explanation of the origin and evolution of our complicated religious pattern, and by comprehensive grasp of all factors in religious life, and the parallel between religious and political history. A brief version, *The American Churches, an Interpretation* (New York, 1948), with bibliographic footnotes, indicates basic trends and the importance of "left-wing" Protestantism, especially in the colonial period. Sperry's *Religion in America* (Cambridge, Eng., 1945, 1946), with bibliographical footnotes and references, a popular, lecture-style survey, explains our religious variety and sectional diversity, departure from European norms, proliferation of sects with freedom from state control, individualism, optimism, popular preaching, and lack of a hard line between church people and the "unchurched." The sociological method reaches its culmination in *Organized Religion in the United States* (Philadelphia, 1948, ed. Ray Abrams for the American Academy of Political and Social Science, *Annals*, Vol. 256, Mar. 1948, with bibliography): a completely objective study by 17 authors, covering practically all groups

and phases in religious life. A similar survey is *Religion in American Society* (Philadelphia, 1960), ed. by Richard D. Lambert for the American Academy of Political and Social Science, *Annals*, Vol. 332, Nov. 1960, consisting of essays by various authorities on past and present trends, lay action, the relation of the church to secular life, and the problems of division and unity. The most ambitious one-volume survey of American church history is Clifton E. Olmstead, *History of Religion in the United States* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1960). Olmstead gives extended attention to theological movements, as well as to the details of denominational history.

The sociological method has been given an idealistic interpretation in Luther Allan Weigle, *American Idealism* (New Haven, 1928), a survey giving prominence to freedom of conscience, religious support of political liberty in the Revolution, frontier revivalism, religious idealism in education, and the socially minded free church. The shaping power of religious ideals is stressed by H. Richard Niebuhr, *The Kingdom of God in America* (Chicago and New York, 1937), with bibliography in notes, viewing American Christianity as creative faith in the Kingdom of God. *The Christ of the American Road*, by Eli Stanley Jones (New York and Nashville, 1944) discusses this interpretation and its application to social problems. Other sociological reviews display special emphases and viewpoints. John Coleman Bennett, et al., *The Church Through Half a Century; Essays in Honor of William Adams Brown, by Former Students . . .* (New York, 1936) is a "liberal" survey of religious thought and action, 1886–1936, temperate and illuminating, revealing the mutual relations of church and community. The unequaled diversity of our religious life has inspired a few interesting studies of belief and expression. The anthology treatment prevails in Charles Samuel Braden's *Varieties of American Religion . . .* (Chicago and New York, 1936), essays by exponents of 17 types of thought, including some

"unorthodox" ones. John Paul Williams, *What Americans Believe and How They Worship* (New York, 1952), with bibliography in notes, dispassionately explores the varied terrain, attempting to grasp the distinctive group qualities, their place in society, and contribution to religious development. Increasing Roman Catholic interest in interpreting American religion appears in Francis X. Curran, *Major Trends in American Church History* (New York, 1946), with bibliography, noting origins and types of Protestantism, the "decline" of Protestant creeds, the Negro problem besetting all churches, and Roman Catholicism as a missionary element in a still predominantly Protestant environment. (See also Part Three, sect. 1, B, *Religion and Society in America.*)

VII. EUROPEAN BACKGROUND

A. General References

THERE are numerous accounts of the expansion of Europe and of Christianity, with reference to the preparation for religious migration to America in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Among the best summaries is ch. 1, "Introductory," with its bibliographical footnotes, in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of the Expansion of Christianity*, Vol. III, *Three Centuries of Advance*, A.D. *1500*–A.D. *1800*, with a bibliography at the end. A sweeping view of the background of Christian migration, and of the religious character of the colonies, is supplied by Edward P. Cheyney's *European Background of American History 1300–1600* (New York and London, 1904, Vol. 1 of "The American Nation: A History"), with "Critical Essay on Authorities," ch. XVII, including works on religion in various colonizing nations. The Renaissance and Reformation religious movements and conflicts in imperialist nations are well covered in Wilbur Cortez Abbott, *The Expansion of Europe, A Social and Po-*

litical History of the Modern World, 1415–1789 (New York, 1929, rev. ed., 2 vols. in 1), with special attention to English-Spanish rivalry, and to the Thirty Years' War as the background of Pietism, which inspired many German emigrants to America. Carl L. Becker, *The Beginnings of the American People* (Boston, 1915) stresses sixteenth-century Protestant sectarianism as a wellspring of American religion, and the eventual incompatibility of Reformation principles with state-churchism, which became evident in America. The state churches and the sects that were transferred to America are reviewed in ch. III, "The Reformation and the New World," in Curtis Putnam Nettels, *The Roots of American Civilization, A History of American Colonial Life* (New York, 1939, 1946), with extensive bibliographical notes and footnotes. Excellent bibliographical notes and references abound also in a superior study of colonial culture: Louis Booker Wright, *The Atlantic Frontier: Colonial American Civilization, 1607–1763* (New York, 1947), ch. I, "The Old World Background," dwells at length upon the English Reformation, Puritanism, and the English dissenting refugees, and calls special attention to the mingling of religious and secular motives in colonizing. Chapter I of Max Savelle, *Seeds of Liberty, The Genesis of the American Mind* (New York, 1948) comments on the pre-Reformation and Reformation background, and upon Calvinism and its transition to America, and describes the rise of dissenting groups from fissions in the medieval Church. A penetrating study of the European genesis of American religious characteristics is in the first two chapters of F. Ernest Johnson, ed., *Wellsprings of the American Spirit* (New York, 1948, "Religion and Civilization Series," Institute for Religious and Social Studies, Jewish Theological Seminary of America). Herbert W. Schneider expertly handles the Puritan tradition, and John T. McNeill, considering the Dissenting tradition, takes exception to Thomas C. Hall's view of Lollardry as the source of Dissent and of free church-and-state relationships in

America, holding that the filiation with medieval dissent is unproven. Chapter II, "Backgrounds of the New World in the Old," in Sherwood Eddy's *The Kingdom of God and the American Dream, The Religious and Secular Ideals of American History* (New York and London, 1941) underscores the fact that many colonists belonged to persecuted sects. He sees Wyclif, Luther, and Calvin as creators of America, and the broad social influences of the Reformation as foundations of the "American way," criticizes the class structure of Protestantism, and views sectarian insistence upon justice as the root of religious idealism. A brief treatment of European origins, without bibliography, is in Henry Kallock Rowe, *The History of Religion in the United States* (New York, 1928), ch. I, "The Heritage from Overseas."

B. The Protestant Reformation

1. GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY. Even though now outdated, there are excellent bibliographies in *The Cambridge Modern History* (New York, 1902–1934), Vol. I, *The Renaissance*, and Vol. II, *The Reformation*, covering the eve of the Reformation, and its progress to the close of the Thirty Years' War and the English Civil War, 1648–1649. Although it does not pretend to be complete, there is a wealth of assistance in Roland Herbert Bainton's *Bibliography of the Continental Reformation: Materials Available in English . . .* (Chicago, 1935; American Society of Church History Monographs in Church History, no. I, ed. Matthew Spinka and Robert Hastings Nichols). It omits the Counter-Reformation, includes both books and articles, with discriminating notes, and has biographies of leaders, general histories, writings on special phases, and collections of sources. A valuable brief list closes ch. XXXI in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (New York, 1953). A critical review of Roman Catholic and Protestant writers, with bibliographical footnotes, is in chs. LIX and LX of James Westfall Thompson and Ber-

nard J. Holm, *A History of Historical Writing* (New York, 1940–1942, 2 vols.). Modern Roman Catholic scholarship, dealing especially with the Counter-Reformation, is summarized in part II of Raphael M. Huber, "Recent Important Literature Regarding the Catholic Church during the Late Renaissance Period, 1500–1648," *Church History*, Vol. 10, no. 1 (Mar. 1941), pp. 3–37. Older bibliographic aids include the Cornell University Library's *Catalogue of the Historical Library of Andrew Dickson White . . .* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1889, 4 vols.), in Vol. 1, "The Protestant Reformation and its Forerunners," a classified list with critical notes. A review of important sources is L. Franklin Gruber, *Documentary Sketch of the Reformation* (St. Paul, Minn., 1917, reprint from *Lutheran Church Review*, July, Oct. 1917, pp. 399–420, 541–565), with discussion.

2. GENERAL HISTORIES. Since vast areas are adequately covered in general bibliographies, this section includes strictly selected general works on the origins and progress of the Reformation. Works on specific countries occur in a later section. The most thorough modern study of the movement's genesis is James Mackinnon, *Origins of the Reformation* (London, New York, etc., 1939), with many bibliographical footnotes, which traces the sources to changes in civilization in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, monarchical conflicts with the papacy, humanism, and dissenting and mystical religious movements. The ties between the cultural Renaissance and the Reformation are reviewed in two massive scholarly works: Edward Maslin Hulme, *The Renaissance, the Protestant Revolution and the Catholic Reformation in Continental Europe* (New York, 1923, rev. ed.); and Henry S. Lucas, *The Renaissance and the Reformation* (New York and London, 1934), with a bibliography of essential works. The former sympathizes with Reformation elements favoring democracy, rationalism, and toleration; the latter emphasizes the growing secular and ethical tone of religion derived from humanism, the concept of the

priesthood of all believers, and the association of Protestantism with national states and cultures. Religious, intellectual, and economic forces that prepared the way are analyzed by Matthew Spinka, *Advocates of Reform, from Wyclif to Erasmus* . . . (London, 1953), with bibliography; also by Johannes Janssen, *History of the German People at the Close of the Middle Ages* (St. Louis, 1896–1909, 14 vols., tr. M. A. Mitchell and A. M. Christie), which carries the account to the opening of the Thirty Years' War, 1618. The modern school of "economic determinism" is well represented by Charles Michael Jacobs, "The Economic Background of the Reformation," *Lutheran Church Review*, Vol. 41, no. 2 (Apr. 1922), pp. 97–112; and by Roy Pascal, *The Social Basis of the German Reformation; Martin Luther and His Times* (London, 1933), with bibliography. The creedal and doctrinal aspect is emphasized in Philip Schaff's classic *History of the Reformation* (New York, 1892, 2 vols., being Vols. 6–7 of his *History of the Christian Church*, 2nd ed., rev.), with bibliographies and bibliographical footnotes, covering the German and Swiss movements. This should be used with his earlier *The Creeds of Christendom*, Vol. III, *The Evangelical Protestant Creeds, with Translations* (New York, 1877), including basic creeds of early American Protestantism.

General histories are almost innumerable, and many have now been superseded by modern scholarship. An older, classical account, still useful and widely read, is Thomas Martin Lindsay, *A History of the Reformation* (New York, 1916, 1917, 2 vols.), which covers all countries and the Counter-Reformation, but is now considered unsatisfactory for the Anabaptists. Still unsurpassed for the general student and valuable to the scholar, is Preserved Smith's massive *The Age of the Reformation* (New York, 1920), with huge bibliography, an excellent summary of Protestant and Catholic aspects, and of the European setting, social and cultural conditions, and interpretations of the movement. Smith's own

interpretation is summarized in "The Reformation Historically Explained," American Society of Church History, *Papers,* 2nd ser., Vol. 7 (1923), pp. 111–130: a mingling of secular and religious views. Two essential summaries by a specialist are Roland Herbert Bainton, *The Reformation of the Sixteenth Century* (Boston, 1952), with bibliography, in a popular vein; and *The Age of the Reformation* (Princeton, N.J., 1956), with bibliography. Also based upon wide knowledge of sources and bibliography is Harold John Grimm, *The Reformation Era, 1500–1650* (New York, 1954), a somewhat prosaic work from the standpoint of a judicious scientific historian, with full appreciation of the movement's setting and of its profound essentially religious character, and with respectful consideration of the Counter-Reformation. A synthesis of several generations of detailed scholarship, with a view of Europe about 1500 and a concluding section on the 16th-century mind, is Elmore Harris Harbison, *The Age of the Reformation* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1955), with bibliography, which views the movement as a broad reorganization of life. The Reformers speak for themselves in Harry Emerson Fosdick's *Great Voices of the Reformation, An Anthology* (New York, 1952), an attempt to present the major strands of Protestant thought from Wyclif to Wesley, stressing their affirmative character. The background of the Reformers' conception of the state church, which was transferred to America and there opposed successfully, is explained in Conrad Bergendoff, "Church and State in the Reformation Period," *Lutheran Church Quarterly,* Vol. 3, no. 1 (Jan. 1930), pp. 36–62.

C. The Reformation in Various Countries

For an understanding of the origins and characteristics of national Lutheran and other reformed churches, which were transplanted to America, and of the far greater migrations of the nineteenth century, one should consult at least

one standard history of the Reformation in each country, and bibliographies including other authoritative works on national movements.

1. GERMANY: LUTHERANISM AND THE SECTS. Selected bibliography on Luther and Lutheranism is found in Bainton, *Bibliography of the Continental Reformation;* and with ch. xxxii, "Luther and the Rise and Spread of Lutheranism," in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (New York, 1953), general works on Protestantism with extensive Lutheran references, biographies and works of Luther, and the progress of his doctrines outside Germany, especially in Scandinavia. A large, older, classified list, with good brief comments, is George Linn Kieffer's *List of References on the Reformation in Germany,* edited and annotated by William Walker Rockwell and Otto Hermann Pannkoke (New York, 1917). This should be supplemented by Johann Michael Reu, *Thirty-five Years of Luther Research . . .* (Chicago, 1917), with extensive footnotes; and by the section, "The Lutheran Church," in F. E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, 1958), which has an annotated list of Luther's works, his theology and relation to the Reformation, and the Lutheran confessions, cultus, and doctrines. The vast literature since 1920 is surveyed by critical articles in *Church History:* Wilhelm Pauck, "The Historiography of the German Reformation during the Past Twenty Years," Vol. 9, no. 4 (Dec. 1940), pp. 305–340; John Dillenberger, "Survey, Literature in Luther Studies, 1950–1955," Vol. 25, no. 2 (June 1956), pp. 160–177; and relations with the Reformed in Bard Thompson, "Bucer Study Since 1918," Vol. 25, no. 1 (Mar. 1956), pp. 63–82. These include general bibliographies, biographical works, and detailed studies of special or little-known phases. The basic, classical history, heavily stressing political aspects, is Leopold von Ranke, *History of the Reformation in Germany* (London, 1845–1847, 3 vols., tr. Sarah Austin). A sober modern treatment, abreast of the latest research, is James Mackinnon, *Luther*

and the Reformation (London, 1925–1930, 4 vols.), by a noted Scottish Presbyterian scholar. A pupil of Preserved Smith, Ernest George Schwiebert, in *Luther and His Times, The Reformation from a New Perspective* (St. Louis, 1950), with chapter and bibliographical notes, emphasizes philosophical, theological, and social factors, and Luther's university environment at Wittenberg. A highly respected modern biography is Roland Herbert Bainton, *Here I Stand, A Life of Martin Luther* (New York and Nashville, 1950), deeply scholarly, penetrating, vivid and readable, with a superb bibliography of primary and secondary sources.

Because of their influence in America, particularly in colonial Pennsylvania, studies of radical German Reformers are highly important. Selected bibliographies occur in Bainton's *Bibliography of the Continental Reformation;* and Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (New York, 1953), ch. xxxiv, including biographies of Grebel, Simons, Denck, Hubmaier, and Hetzer. A sympathetic view of the usually misunderstood radicals, particularly the Anabaptists, is in a general history by Henry C. Vedder, the noted American Baptist scholar and historian: *The Reformation in Germany* (New York, 1914). Other very interesting works on the radicals are R. J. Smithson, *The Anabaptists: Their Contribution to Our Protestant Heritage* (London, 1935), popular and yet scholarly; George Huntston Williams, *Spiritual and Anabaptist Writers, Documents Illustrative of the Radical Reformation* (Philadelphia, 1957, Vol. 15 in "Library of Christian Classics"); Robert Friedmann, "Recent Interpretations of Anabaptism," *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 2 (June 1955), pp. 132–151. A review of recent studies and a general account of the Anabaptist movement is given by Henry Sweetser Burrage, "The Anabaptists of the Sixteenth Century," American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 1st ser., Vol. 3 (1891), pp. 145–164. Recent bibliography is exhaustively considered in two articles in *Church History:* George Huntston Williams, "Studies in the Radical

Reformation (1517–1618): A Bibliographical Survey of Research Since 1939," Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1958), pp. 46–69, with references; and Robert Friedmann, "Progress in Anabaptist Studies: A Comprehensive Review, 1955–1957," Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1958), pp. 72–76. The Mennonites are satisfactorily covered in J. Horsch, *Mennonites in Europe* (Scottdale, Pa., 1942), based upon extensive research; and J. C. Wenger, *Glimpses of Mennonite History and Doctrine* (Scottdale, Pa., 1947), with bibliographies and translations of sources.

2. THE REFORMATION IN SCANDINAVIA. Scandinavian Lutherans have contributed handsomely to the quality of American Protestantism, but bibliography in English on the Reformation in the home countries is somewhat scanty. A brief review is in Roland Bainton's *Bibliography of the Continental Reformation.* A good summary, based largely upon secondary works in Danish, is E. H. Dunkley, *The Reformation in Denmark* (London, 1948). The background of the Icelandic synod in America is reviewed through the nineteenth century in J. C. F. Hood, *Icelandic Church Saga* (London, 1946). A good semi-popular essay on the more important Norwegian tradition is Thomas Benjamin Wilson, *History of Church and State in Norway from the Tenth to the Sixteenth Century* (London, 1903), the last chapter being a description of the Reformation. The relatively peaceful protestantizing of Sweden is competently outlined in Conrad J. I. Bergendoff, *Olavus Petri and the Ecclesiastical Transformation of Sweden (1521–1552)* . . . (New York, 1928), in part a life of the preeminent exponent of the Scandinavian Reformation. A thoroughly documented chapter on the Reformation occurs in John Wordsworth, *The National Church of Sweden* (London, 1911), a sympathetic appreciation by an Anglican. These works are helpful in understanding the religious situation in Scandinavia during the migrations to America after 1840.

3. THE REFORMED AND PRESBYTERIAN TRADITION. The im-

mense influence of Calvinism in the establishment and history of American Protestantism, and in the development of American political ideals, demands reference to the Reformed churches of Continental Europe and of Scotland. An excellent selected bibliography follows ch. xxxiii, "The Rise and Spread of the Reformed and Presbyterian Churches," in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (New York, 1953), including works on and by Zwingli, Calvin, Bucer, and Beza, and covering all important states affected. Sections on the same nations are in Roland Bainton's *Bibliography of the Continental Reformation.* A critical summary of recent studies has been made by Edward A. Dowey, Jr.: "Survey, Continental Reformation: Works of General Interest, Studies in Calvin and Calvinism Since 1948," *Church History,* Vol. 24, no. 4 (Dec. 1955), pp. 360–367. By far the most comprehensive and authoritative source on the international influence of Calvinism is John T. McNeill's *The History and Character of Calvinism* (New York, 1954), from the Reformation to the present era, giving a more than usually favorable view of Calvin, and a lengthy account of the spread of his doctrines, with emphasis upon Scotland and America. The numerous biographies of Calvin are well represented by the accurate and fair standard work of the American Williston Walker, *John Calvin, the Organizer of Reformed Protestantism 1509–1564* (New York, 1906); and James Mackinnon, *Calvin and the Reformation* (London, 1937). A vast range of modern writings is studied by John T. McNeill, "Thirty Years of Calvin Study," *Church History,* Vol. 17, no. 3 (Sept. 1948), pp. 207–240, with notes on content, critical remarks, and bibliographical guides. The French Huguenots, who exerted a marked influence in early American Protestantism, are treated with both solid scholarship and warm sympathy by Henry Martyn Baird (an American of Huguenot ancestry) in *History of the Rise of the Huguenots of France* (New York, 1879, 2 vols.), which has never been superseded. Conditions which inspired Hugue-

not migration can be appreciated by study of James Westfall Thompson, *The Wars of Religion in France, 1559–1576* (Chicago, 1909), based upon deep research in new material; Caleb Guyer Kelly, *French Protestantism, 1559–1562* (Baltimore, 1918), with special attention to social and economic forces in the French Reformation; and Frank Charles Palm, *Calvinism and the Religious Wars* (New York, 1932), an excellent brief introduction.

Switzerland, the Netherlands, Hungary, and Scotland have made heavy contributions to the Calvinistic-Reformed tradition in America. For Americans there is still no authority on the Swiss Reformation better than Vol. VII of Philip Schaff's *History of the Christian Church* (New York, 1894, 2nd ed., rev.), drawn from long study of original records. His colleague, Samuel Macauley Jackson, wrote the standard English work on the great Swiss Reformer: *Huldreich Zwingli; the Reformer of German Switzerland* . . . (New York, 1901, Vol. 5 of "Heroes of the Reformation," 2nd ed., rev.). Semi-popular, yet scholarly, and with an excellent bibliography, is S. Simpson's *Life of Ulrich Zwingli, the Swiss Patriot and Reformer* (New York, 1902). His work and the Swiss movement are both adequately covered in a bibliography by Bard Thompson, "Zwingli Study Since 1918," *Church History*, Vol. 19, no. 2 (June 1950), pp. 116–128. The Dutch Reformation, which contributed to the American ideal of religious toleration, is sufficiently detailed in two works: Carlos Martyn, *The Dutch Reformation: a History of the Struggle in the Netherlands for Civil and Religious Liberty in the Sixteenth Century* (New York, 1868), with bibliographical notes; and the heavily documented classic by John Lothrop Motley, *The Rise of the Dutch Republic* (New York, 1906, 3 vols.), warmly sympathetic, with abundant material on the rise of the Reformed Dutch Church. The Scottish Reformation can be quite thoroughly known through three works: the excellent biography of the great leader by Percy Eustace Lord: *John Knox*

(London, 1937); W. G. Dickenson, ed., *John Knox's History of the Reformation in Scotland* (London, 1949, 2 vols.), with an excellent introduction, notes, and full bibliography; and G. D. Henderson, *Religious Life in Seventeenth-Century Scotland* (Cambridge, Eng., 1937), drawn from sources and good especially for the background of the Scottish migration to America. The Reformation in Hungary and Poland is important in American religious history because of the immigration of many Magyar Reformed Protestants and the influence of Socinian (Unitarian) doctrines, which for a time flourished in Poland and Transylvania, and spread over Europe and to America. Hungarian Protestantism is reviewed ably by J. H. Merle d'Aubigné, ed., *History of the Protestant Church in Hungary, from the Beginning of the Reformation to 1850, with Special Reference to Transylvania* (Boston, 1854, tr. J. Craig); also E. Revesz, et al., *Hungarian Protestantism. Its Past, Present, and Future* (Budapest, 1927); and a brief summary by W. Toth, "Highlights of the Hungarian Reformation," *Church History*, Vol. 9, no. 2 (June 1940), pp. 141–156. Polish Socinianism is treated in Valérian Krasinski, *Historical Sketch of the Rise, Progress and Decline of the Reformation in Poland* (London, 1838–1840, 2 vols.), a work of solid scholarship.

4. THE REFORMATION IN ENGLAND. The bibliography of the English Reformation is enormous, and is briefly and ably summarized after ch. xxxvi, "The English Reformation," in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (New York, 1953), extending to 1750, and including titles on the leading Reformers and Roman Catholic opponents. Other good aids are Henry Gee and William J. Hardy, eds., *Documents Illustrative of English Church History* (London, 1914), with abundant material on the period; Shirley Jackson Case, *A Bibliographical Guide to the History of Christianity* (Chicago, 1931), with a section on the English Ref-

ormation; and Conyers Read, *Bibliography of British History, Tudor Period, 1485–1603* (Oxford, 1933). The origin of English Protestantism, and particularly the controverted subject of Lollard influence, have been admirably explored in studies which illuminate the character of early American Puritanism and sectarianism. One of the most authoritative is H. M. Smith, *Pre-Reformation England* (London, 1938), which begins with 1485 and has extensive excerpts from sources. Three excellent works discuss pre-Reformation religious dissent and its influence. James Gairdner's *Lollardry and the Reformation in England, An Historical Survey* (London, 1908), with bibliographical footnotes, regards Lollardry as the driving power of reform and the background of Puritanism and sectarian movements. This thesis is generally maintained by William Alva Gifford, "Wyclif and the Independence of the Church of England," American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 2nd ser., Vol. 7 (1923), pp. 133–155, stressing Lollard exaltation of the Bible as a preparation for religious revolt. Ernest Gordon Rupp supports the idea in *Studies in the Making of the English Protestant Tradition, Mainly in the Reign of Henry VIII* (Cambridge, Eng., 1949), with select bibliography and bibliographical footnotes, exploring certain Continental religious influences, and rejecting solely economic and political explanations. The best standard work on the early English Reformation is James Gairdner, *The English Church in the Sixteenth Century from the Accession of Henry VIII to the Death of Mary* (London, 1902). For the period 1558 to 1625 an authoritative study is Walter H. Frere, *The English Church in the Reigns of Elizabeth and James I* (London, 1904), especially notable on the rise of Puritanism. A good collection of biographical sketches is Marcus L. Loane, *Masters of the English Reformation* (London, 1954). An able and fairly objective view by a Roman Catholic is G. Constant's *The Reformation in England* (New York, 2 vols., 1934, 1942,

tr. R. E. Scantlebury and E. L. Watkin), based on extensive research, and carrying the narrative to 1553. (See also Part Two, sect. 1, A, *The Anglican Church.*)

5. PROTESTANT NONCONFORMITY. The distinguished authority, one of the best works on English religion, is Henry W. Clark, *History of English Nonconformity from Wyclif to the Close of the Nineteenth Century* (London, 1911–1913, 2 vols.), with bibliographies, written from an avowed Nonconformist viewpoint. It surveys the entire background of early Anglo-American colonial dissent, and appreciates the "Nonconformist Spirit," a lasting influence in evangelical American Christianity. The rise and history of the Puritan, "covenant," and Separatist churches, which determined the character of New England religion, is thoroughly studied in Champlin Burrage, *The Early English Dissenters, in the Light of Recent Research, 1550–1641* (Cambridge, Eng., 1912, 2 vols., Vol. 2 being documentary sources). The English Nonconformist background is heavily emphasized by Thomas Cuming Hall, *The Religious Background of American Culture* (Boston, 1930), with extensive bibliographies, accenting its democratic tendencies and filiation with medieval Lollardry. The latter note is repeated by Kenneth B. MacFarlane's *John Wycliffe and the Beginnings of English Nonconformity* (London, 1952), with bibliography, which exalts Lollardry as the spiritual forebear of Brownists and Independents, the sources of American Congregationalism. Early Puritanism is competently described by Allen Banks Hinds, *The Making of the England of Elizabeth* (London, 1895), carefully studying Continental origins and the Reformation under Mary I, 1553–1558. Continental sources are deeply examined by C. H. Hallowell, *The Marian Exiles, A Study in the Origins of Elizabethan Puritanism* (Cambridge, Eng., 1938), containing brief biographies of nearly 500 persons, who returned to England bent upon a thorough reform. The rise of Puritanism in the reign of Elizabeth I, preparatory to migration to America,

has never been better told than by William Pierce's *An Historical Introduction to the Marprelate Tracts . . .* (London, 1908). An admirable account of general Puritan history is M. M. Knappen, *Tudor Puritanism, A Chapter in the History of Idealism* (Chicago, 1939). The immediate connection of Separatism and Puritanism with religion in American life is clarified by three important studies. Champlin Burrage, *The True Story of Robert Browne (1550?–1633), Father of Congregationalism* (Oxford, 1906) holds that the history of New England religion began in his principles, and analyzes his views, with a list of his writings. George M. Stephenson's *The Puritan Heritage* (New York, 1952), with bibliographical notes, attributes the vitality of English and American Puritanism to Bible study, and sees the Puritan contest for freedom as won in America. George Peabody Gooch, *English Democratic Ideas in the Seventeenth Century* (Cambridge, Eng., 1927, 2nd ed.), with bibliographical footnotes, illuminates political and religious ideals and activities of sectarians whose influence penetrated the American colonies. (See also Part Two, sect. 1, B, *The New England Puritan Churches.*)

D. Religious Motives in Colonization

Early American historians assumed that religion was a determining factor in the massive migration of Europeans to the New World. This was true of New England Puritan chroniclers and of authors closely identified with the founding of Virginia. Defenders of American rights in the Revolution, especially in New England, alluded to the incentive to migration in the desire for freedom from the established Church of England. The school of economic interpretation, early in the present century, minimized religious influence, and magnified mercantile and industrial transformations inspiring European imperial expansion. More recent research has restored a higher position to religious incentives.

Important observations on religious impulses appear in modern special studies and comprehensive histories. They are noticed at length in Charles Lemuel Thompson, *The Religious Foundations of America, A Study in National Origins* (New York, 1917), with a brief bibliography on European backgrounds of religious colonists. The "Critical Essay on Authorities," ch. XIII of Herbert Ingram Priestly, *The Coming of the White Man, 1492–1848* (New York, 1929), refers to the relative potency of religious motives in Spanish, French, and Dutch colonies. Many such allusions are in Charles A. and Mary R. Beard, *The Rise of American Civilization* (New York, 1933, new rev. and enl. ed., 2 vols. in 1), noting profound religious changes that stimulated colonialism, Church of England participation in colonial companies, the liberal English policy of allowing dissenters to colonize, schisms in America promoting new colonies, and the relatively weak religious element in Dutch expansion. Religion as a basic urge is mentioned in Charles M. Andrews, *The Colonial Period of American History* (New Haven, 1934–1938, 4 vols.), Vol. I, ch. III, "Factors Influencing Colonization," with bibliographical footnotes. Marcus Lee Hansen's thorough study, *The Atlantic Migration, 1607–1860, A History of the Continuing Settlement of the United States* (Cambridge, Mass., 1940) has remarks on the association between religion and nationalism, and the longing for relief from state-church oppression.

Close interactions of religious and "worldly" motives have been exhaustively explored. An essential reference is Louis Booker Wright, *Religion and Empire: The Alliance between Piety and Commerce in English Expansion, 1558–1625* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1943), with bibliography in "Notes," on the partnership between commercial companies and the clergy, who aroused sympathy for overseas expansion, and voiced the nobler ideals of "imperialism." Religion as an ethical basis for Anglican and Puritan colonization is revealed by sermons, pamphlets, and charters, cited in George Louis

Beer, *The Origins of the British Colonial System, 1578–1660* (New York, 1908), with bibliographical references in footnotes, which also mentions zeal for converting the Indians. Further proofs are adduced in Edward Eggleston, *The Beginnings of a Nation; a History of the Source and Rise of the Earliest English Settlements in America . . .* (New York, 1897), with special reference to English sectarianism. Ardent longings for freedom of conscience are underlined in George Bancroft's *History of the United States from the Discovery of the American Continent* (Vol. 1, Boston, 1852, chs. 7–9). Volume 1 of Edward Channing's *History of the United States* (New York, 1907) points to conflict with the Anglican Church, likens the great Puritan migration to the exodus of the Israelites, and mentions religious freedom as a motive in Maryland and the Quaker "holy experiment" in Pennsylvania. Religious unrest, persecution, and conflict appear again in Max Savelle, *The Foundations of American Civilization, A History of Colonial America* (New York, 1942). Religion in the early settlement of Virginia generally has been underestimated by "economic determinist" historiography, but receives due credit from the "secular" historian, Edward P. Cheyney, in "Some English Conditions Surrounding the Settlement of Virginia," *American Historical Review,* Vol. 12, no. 3 (Apr. 1907), pp. 507–528. A more extensive treatment occurs in Alexander Brown, *The Genesis of the United States, A Narrative of the Movement in England, 1605–1616, Which Resulted in the Plantation of North America by Englishmen . . .* (Boston and New York, 1890, 2 vols.). He notes the desire to counterbalance Spanish Roman Catholic imperialism, and to convert the Indians, in propagandist sermons. The argument is reinforced in his *The First Republic in America, An Account of the Origin of This Nation . . .* (Boston and New York, 1898). Religion as a motive of the New England colonies is firmly established by George E. Ellis's essay, "The Religious Element in the Settlement of New England," Vol. 3

of Justin Winsor, ed., *Narrative and Critical History of America* (Boston and New York, 1884), with a critical essay on bibliography. After a long period of neglect, this element is correctly appreciated also by Nellis M. Crouse, in "Causes of the Great Migration, 1630–1640," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 5, no. 1 (Jan. 1932), pp. 3–36, with bibliography, claiming religion as an immediate and pressing motive, because of efforts to compel uniformity.

While the tolerant Dutch did not migrate for religious freedom, their liberal policy inspired those persecuted elsewhere to settle in New Netherland. This is noted by Arnold Mulder in *Americans from Holland* (Philadelphia and New York, 1947). In contrast, the vast German swarming to the Middle Colonies proceeded largely from longing to escape harsh persecution. The religious motive is reviewed in Andrew D. Mellick, "German Emigration to the American Colonies, Its Cause, and the Distribution of the Emigrants," *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (1886), on pp. 241–250, 375–391; and in Albert Bernhardt Faust, *The German Element in the United States* . . . (Boston and New York, 1909, 2 vols., New York, 1927, 2 vols. in 1), with large bibliography, especially ch. III, "Increase in German Immigration in the Eighteenth Century, and Its Causes." French Huguenot settlement, resulting from suffering for faith, is related in great detail gleaned from investigation in foreign archives, by Charles W. Baird, *History of the Huguenot Emigration to America* (New York, 1885, 2 vols.). The genesis of American Huguenot colonization is described also in Lucian J. Fosdick, *The French Blood in America* (New York and Chicago, etc., 1906). Oppressive landlords, commercial restrictions, and Episcopalian intolerance, which drove Scottish and Irish Presbyterians to America, are exhaustively investigated in works founded upon wide acquaintance with original sources. Charles A. Hanna, *The Scotch-Irish or the Scot in North*

Britain, North Ireland, and North America (New York and London, 1902, 2 vols.) has several chapters on the religious situation in Scotland and Ireland as a cause of migration. Conditions in Ulster, particularly in 1714–1718, are analyzed by Charles Knowles Bolton, *Scotch Irish Pioneers in Ulster and America* (Boston, 1910). Scottish Presbyterian emigration before 1701, encouraged especially by religious toleration in Maryland, is reviewed by Henry Jones Ford, *The Scotch-Irish in America* (Princeton, N.J., 1915), with bibliography.

English, Dutch, French, and Scottish migration set the colonial ethnic pattern. It determined the basic American religious traditions, until new mass migrations after 1840 modified it by vastly expanding the Roman Catholic Church, and by introducing Judaism and the various Eastern Orthodox and Uniate churches. Nearly all the larger colonial elements were established religions in European states: the Episcopal Church in England, Wales, and Ireland; the Lutheran in Germany and Scandinavia; the Reformed Calvinist or Presbyterian in certain Swiss cantons, some German states, the Netherlands, and Scotland. The Puritan Nonconformists of New England established Congregationalism as a quasi-Presbyterian state church. Anglicanism became the official religion of most of the other colonies. Rhode Island, Pennsylvania, New Jersey, and Delaware had no state churches, but their religious freedom and diversity were destined to prevail. The story of American religion in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries therefore falls naturally into three parts: (1) the institutional development of state churches; (2) the rise of sects, and of evangelical Methodist and Separatist groups within the established churches; and (3) the growth of liberal expressions, such as Deism, Unitarianism, Universalism, and "freethinkers." The last two movements foretold the emergence of a new, typically American religious expression—the voluntary free

church. They prepared the way for the crusade to abolish state churches and attain complete religious freedom, which was aided by the rise of political democracy and the influence of the revivalistic frontier. This evolution of American religion is the subject of Part Two.

PART TWO

EVOLUTION OF AMERICAN RELIGION

I. FROM STATE CHURCHES TO DISESTABLISHMENT

A. The Anglican Church

ADHERENTS of the established Anglican Church were the first English Christians to found a permanent settlement in America. (See Part One, sect. VII, c, 4, *The Reformation in England.*) No churches fully loyal to the establishment existed north of Maryland until the last two decades of the seventeenth century. There the rise of Anglicanism began after the organization of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts, in 1701. In the Middle and New England Colonies Anglicanism was nowhere the established religion, except in certain southern counties of New York.

The history of the established Church therefore centers in the Southern Colonies. Some historians have maintained that the Anglican founders of the Southern Colonies were concerned with commercial more than with religious aims, and were less devout than the Puritan Congregationalists of New England. Recent investigators have been more ready to concede to the Anglican Church a major part in colonizing the Southern provinces, particularly Virginia, and in promoting a popular religious life that has been favorably compared with that of New England.

The following two sections include selected bibliographical references, and general and special authorities to illustrate the legal position of Anglicanism. Some titles indicate its significance in Southern society previous to the extensive rise of dissent, which encouraged the decline and eventual disestablishment of the Anglican Church.

1. SOURCES AND GENERAL HISTORY. Edgar Legare Pennington, "Manuscript Sources of Our Church History (Colonial Period)," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 1, no. 1 (Mar. 1932), pp. 19–31, describes collections of transcripts of original documents in public and

ecclesiastical offices in England, and indicates their location in the United States. With this should be consulted Charles M. Andrews and Frances G. Davenport, *Guide to the Manuscript Materials for the History of the United States to 1783, in the British Museum, in Minor London Archives, and in the Libraries of Oxford and Cambridge* (Washington, D.C., 1908); and Charles M. Andrews, *Guide to the Materials for American History, to 1783, in the Public Record Office of Great Britain* (Washington, D.C., 1912, 1914, 2 vols.).

William Stevens Perry, ed., *Historical Collections Relating to the American Colonial Church* (Hartford, Conn., 1870–1878, 5 vols. in 4) includes Virginia, Maryland, Pennsylvania, Delaware, and Massachusetts, and consists largely of letters from clergy and laity to the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel. The documents are not accurately edited, and portions are omitted, but this is the only extensive printed collection. Another indispensable printed source is Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts, *Abstract of Proceedings*, 1704–1783, published in the pamphlets containing the annual sermons before the Society. The abstracts contain lists of missionaries, and notes on their reports.

The most complete guide to special writings is William Wilson Manross, "Catalog of Articles in the 'Historical Magazine,'" Vols. 1 (1932)–22 (1953), *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 23, no. 4 (Dec. 1954), pp. 367–420, containing many articles and book reviews concerning the Anglican Church in the American Colonies, and particularly the legal establishments in New York, Maryland, Virginia, the Carolinas, and Georgia.

The general history of Colonial Anglicanism is reviewed in Elizabeth H. Davidson, *The Establishment of the English Church in the Continental American Colonies* (Durham, N.C., 1936). Evarts B. Greene, "The Anglican Outlook in the American Colonies in the Early Eighteenth Century," *American Historical Review*, Vol. 20, no. 1 (Oct. 1914), pp.

64–85, with bibliography in footnotes, indicates the depressed situation at the end of the seventeenth century, without adequate supervision or enough clergy. Missionary expansion, started early in the next century, was semi-official, and was in part an aspect of imperialism. Anglican worship and discipline emphasized inherited conservative values, which did not always agree with the emergent free American spirit. Frank J. Klingberg, "The Expansion of the Anglican Church in the Eighteenth Century," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 16, no. 3 (Sept. 1947), pp. 292–301, describes the Church as a promoter of humane culture, and its vast labor in converting and civilizing the Negro.

The chief instruments in promoting Anglican religion and culture were two missionary societies. The colonial work of the earlier one is surveyed in W. O. B. Allen and Edmund McClure, *Two Hundred Years: The History of the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1698–1898* (London, 1898), derived from letter-books, reports, and minutes. Samuel Clyde McCulloch, "The Foundation and Early Work of the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 18, no. 1 (Mar. 1949), pp. 3–22, gives an exhaustive study of Thomas Bray's efforts to establish the Society, and of its civilizing work by disseminating literature. The Rev. Dr. Thomas Bray was the moving spirit in this enterprise. His huge and poorly rewarded labor receives adequate appreciation in John Wolfe Lydekker, "Thomas Bray (1658–1730), Founder of Missionary Enterprise," *ibid.*, Vol. 12, no. 3 (Sept. 1943), pp. 187–214, which emphasizes his great service in making the Church a meliorating influence in colonial society. Samuel Clyde McCulloch, "The Importance of Dr. Thomas Bray's Bibliotheca Parochialis," *ibid.*, Vol. 15, no. 1 (Mar. 1946), pp. 50–59, is an account of the founding of parish libraries, which helped to raise the intellectual level of the clergy and laity.

There are numerous competent narratives of the work of the great Anglican missionary society commonly known as

the "S.P.G." The earliest is David Humphreys, *An Historical Account of the Incorporated Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts . . . to the Year 1728* (London, 1730), compiled by a secretary, which stresses efforts to convert and civilize Indians and Negroes. Charles Frederick Pascoe's *Two Hundred Years of the S.P.G. . . . 1701–1900* (London, 1901, 2 vols.), by an assistant secretary, considers each colony in detail, and is an essential source-book, with quotations from missionary reports. Samuel Clyde McCulloch, "The Foundation and Early Work of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (June 1951), pp. 121–135, pays tribute to the Society's great influence in education of the Negro, and in stimulation of intellectual development. Frank J. Klingberg, "Contributions of the S.P.G. to the American Way of Life," *ibid.*, Vol. 12, no. 3 (Sept. 1943), pp. 215–244, surveys the Society's work as the first organized colonial effort to improve the status of laboring and dependent classes. A similar appreciation of its religious and cultural influence is W. A. Bultmann, "The Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts and the Foreign Settler in the American Colonies" (Doctoral dissertation, University of California, 1952). The first general missionary was a distinguished cultural as well as religious ambassador, and is estimated in Ethyn (Williams) Kirby, *George Keith, 1638–1716* (New York, 1942), with bibliography. She accords to Keith his due place in colonial intellectual and religious history, and as the founder of the Church of England over wide areas of the colonies.

In spite of heroic efforts by the two societies and their missionaries, the Church of England was handicapped everywhere by the lack of a colonial bishop. The situation is reviewed in Simeon Eben Baldwin, *The American Jurisdiction of the Bishop of London in Colonial Times* (Worcester, Mass., 1900), reprinted from American Antiquarian Society, *Proceedings* (Oct. 1899), pp. 179–221, with bibliography in

footnotes. He reviews efforts to secure bishops from 1661, and the reasons for colonial opposition to the movement as a phase of political and cultural imperialism. Arthur Lyon Cross, *The American Episcopate and the American Colonies* (New York and London, 1902) is the classic work, narrating in detail the efforts to secure a colonial episcopate, and indicating them as a contributing cause of the revolution against British efforts to control the growth of American cultural, political, and economic independence. William Nelson, *The Controversy over the Proposition for an American Episcopate, 1767–1774, A Bibliography of the Subject* (Paterson, N.J., 1909), with critical notes, consists mostly of pamphlet literature arising from the acrimonious disputes between Anglicans and Dissenters.

Without a bishop, the colonial clergy were compelled to improvise ways of introducing a semblance of order and discipline by voluntary meetings, which assumed more and more independence. Edgar Legare Pennington, "Colonial Clergy Conventions," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (Sept. 1939), pp. 178–218, with references in footnotes, maintains that the conventions helped to hold the Church together, and to train the clergy in concerted action and self-government, thus preparing the way for an independent Anglican church in America. "The Seabury Minutes of the New York Clergy Conventions of 1766 and 1767, with Introduction and Notes by Walter Herbert Stowe," *ibid.*, Vol. 10, no. 2 (June 1941), pp. 124–162, indicates that the leaders became organizers of the independent church, an expression of the new idea of republican episcopacy.

2. COLONIAL ESTABLISHMENTS OF ANGLICANISM. Virginia was a typical colony with an Anglican state church. The Church of England, established by law, enjoyed privileges comparable to those of Puritan Congregationalism in the theocratic commonwealths of Massachusetts and New Haven. The Church was an instrument of state policy and a social function. This is not to say that it had no intellectual and

spiritual influence in forming the distinctive social characteristics of colonial Virginia. Anglicanism undoubtedly furnished important elements in the character of the typical Virginian, who was more spiritual than has sometimes been alleged. And it should not be forgotten that the Anglican clergy in the mother country lent powerful support to the early colonizing impulse.

Perry Miller, "The Religious Impulse in the Founding of Virginia: Religion and Society in the Early Literature," *William and Mary College Quarterly*, 3rd ser., Vol. 5, no. 4 (Oct. 1948), pp. 492–522, demonstrates that clerical propagandists considered the Virginia Company in Christian terms. Religion and economics were fused into one conception, and Virginia's government was "formed by a conscious and powerful intention to merge the society with the purposes of God"—the basic idea of a state church. E. Clowes Chorley, "The Planting of the Church in Virginia," *ibid.*, 2nd ser., Vol. 10, no. 3 (July 1930), pp. 191–213, stresses religious devotion in the colony, the Church's contribution to education, the improvement of its life under commissarial government, local government by wardens and vestrymen, and the rise of opposition to the state church after 1750, due to growth of dissent.

Edward Lewis Goodwin, *The Colonial Church in Virginia with Biographical Sketches of the First Six Bishops of the Diocese of Virginia and Other Historical Papers together with Brief Biographical Sketches of the Colonial Clergy of Virginia* (Milwaukee, 1927), with bibliography, is a useful general account, with a table of parishes and ministers, a chapter on the first diocesan convention (1785), and a narrative of the reorganization of the Church after the Revolution. The character of the Church as a social institution is closely studied in Philip Alexander Bruce, *Institutional History of Virginia in the Seventeenth Century* (New York and London, 1910, 2 vols.), with bibliography. This reviews the part of Anglicanism in the emergence of a distinctive colonial

culture. William A. R. Goodwin, "Laws Relating to the Early Colonial Church in Virginia, From Volume I, Hening's Statutes at Large," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 3, no. 1 (Mar. 1934), pp. 34–47, and no. 2 (June 1934), pp. 96–110, illustrates the deep concern of the colonists for the welfare and government of the established church as a pillar of society. William H. Seiler, "The Church of England as the Established Church in Seventeenth-Century Virginia," *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 15, no. 4 (Nov. 1949), pp. 478–508, with bibliographical references, points out that the essential direction in the evolution of the Church was assumed by the Governor, the Assembly, and the parish vestry. The self-contained parish became the essential institutional unit, with obvious results in the growth of a republican movement for American independence.

The most comprehensive study of the Anglican establishment is G. MacLaren Brydon's *Virginia's Mother Church and the Conditions under Which It Grew* (Richmond, 1947–1952, 2 vols.), which is based upon thorough study of provincial records and displays a high standard of scholarship. Its full description of the political and economic environment reveals the Church as part of a society planted not by refugees but by loyal Englishmen determined to found a new England. Brydon redresses the balance of judgment upon the Virginia Church, so unfavorably tipped by evangelical critics. This work is indispensable to an understanding of Virginia religion in the colonial and Revolutionary periods. Brydon's "James Blair, Commissary," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 14, no. 2 (June 1945), pp. 85–118, reviews the failure of his attempt to introduce church courts with large powers (a feature of the establishment in England), as an example of the general failure to transplant the state church idea to America. His "New Light upon the History of the Church in Colonial Virginia," *ibid.*, Vol. 10, no. 2 (June 1941), pp. 69–103, with an excellent bibliography, demonstrates the falsity of the generally accepted picture of the low state of the Virginia Church and

clergy, and their supposed "alienation from the life of the people," and presents evidence of the generally good character of the clergy, and of the vestries as nurseries of self-government.

William H. Seiler, "The Anglican Parish Vestry in Colonial Virginia," *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 22, no. 3 (Aug. 1956), pp. 310–337, with bibliographical references, is a detailed review of the numerous religious and secular functions of the parish, stressing its many sociological activities. Environment and the absence of a bishop compelled the evolution of a new form of local government. Louis B. Wright, "Pious Reading in Colonial Virginia," *ibid.*, Vol. 6, no. 3 (Aug. 1940), pp. 383–392, with bibliography in footnotes, corrects the impression that the planters were materialistic and not interested in religion, by revealing the surprising amount of religious literature in their libraries. Such reading "undoubtedly helped to shape their ideas and to confirm some of their conceptions of social responsibility."

In the long run the Anglican establishment in other colonies also suffered a decline, due to unfriendly new circumstances in American society. Its history in Maryland is interestingly and learnedly reviewed by Nelson Waite Rightmyer's *Maryland's Established Church* (Austin, Tex., 1957), tracing its fortunes from 1632 until its incorporation into the Episcopal Church in 1784. Richly documented, it presents biographical sketches of all Anglican clergymen in the colony, and dispels the legend of their generally low character. Spencer Ervin, "The Established Church of Colonial Maryland," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 24, no. 3 (Sept. 1955), pp. 232–292, is an interesting and well-documented essay, reviewing variances between the clergy and the laity, and pointing out that the establishment was not a real success, became unpopular, and was destroyed by the Revolution. George R. Scriven, "Religious Affiliation in Seventeenth Century Maryland," *ibid.*, Vol. 25, no. 3 (Sept. 1956), pp. 220–229, determines the proportions of religious groups as a basis for

understanding the colonists' part in establishing the Church of England. Most of the initiative in erecting and maintaining churches came from laymen.

An authentic picture of Anglican religious life in this proprietary province emerges in the three following works: Theodore C. Gambrall, *Church Life in Colonial Maryland* (Baltimore, 1885), with bibliography, closely studies the establishment's relations with government and society, religious conditions, parish organization and life, religious reading, and the social influence of religion under a legal establishment. Percy G. Skirven, *The First Parishes of the Province of Maryland* . . . (Baltimore, 1923), with "Sources," sketches the story of legal establishment, and is essential to a study of the Church and its relations to the life of the people. Nelson Waite Rightmyer, "The Character of the Anglican Clergy of Colonial Maryland," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 19, no. 2 (June 1950), pp. 112–132, attempts to redeem the reputation of a much-maligned group of men, showing by investigation of documents that the picture is unfair, drawn from a few cases of openly scandalous living, and that the accusations in many cases were political rather than moral.

The most outstanding failure to found a permanent establishment of Anglicanism was in North Carolina. The truth of this statement is amply demonstrated by Spencer Ervin, "The Anglican Church in North Carolina," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 25, no. 2 (June 1956), pp. 102–161, a general study of the establishment and its environment, illustrating the obstacles to its prosperity in a colony with a rather cosmopolitan population. The establishment proved to be a mere legal shell and faded away in the Revolution. Alfonzo Theodore Stephens, "An Account of the Attempts at Establishing a Religious Hegemony in Colonial North Carolina, 1663–1773" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1955) is a critical study of the problems faced in trying to establish the Church of England in a population composed largely of Dissenters. The Church was compelled

to adjust itself to colonial conditions, which eventually defeated establishment.

Greater success attended the effort in South Carolina where Anglicanism was supported by a vigorous and intelligent planter class. Edgar Legare Pennington, "The Beginning of the Church of England in South Carolina," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Dec. 1933), pp. 178–194, with bibliography in footnotes, emphasizes legal establishment with religious toleration, efforts to convert Negroes and Indians, and missions to the rural population. Lay control resulted from the absence of the episcopate and the ineffectiveness of commissarial government. Quentin Begley Keen, "The Problems of a Commissary: The Reverend Alexander Garden of South Carolina," *ibid.*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (June 1951), pp. 136–155, discourses on the practically insuperable difficulty of trying to run an established Anglican church without a bishop, because the commissary was a vice-bishop with limited powers. The establishment was but fairly successful and crumbled with the Revolution. Charles Woodmason, *The Carolina Backcountry on the Eve of the Revolution* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1953) is the journal of an Anglican itinerant missionary, 1766–1768, and affords an insight into the general state of religion and of the established Church, which did not prosper in the back country. Other groups gained and the Church of England relatively declined with the advance of evangelistic religion.

As in North Carolina, Anglicanism failed to secure a solid foothold in the southernmost province. The early missionary effort is narrated by Edgar Legare Pennington, "Beginnings of the Church of England in Georgia," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (Dec. 1932), pp. 222–234; Vol. 2, no. 1 (Mar. 1933), pp. 3–12, with bibliography in footnotes. He mentions Church of England backing of early colonization, and the association with the colony of John and Charles Wesley and George Whitefield.

North of Maryland, Anglicanism never had any legal

establishment, except a questionable one in the southern counties of New York. E. Clowes Chorley, "The Beginnings of the Church in the Province of New York," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 13, no. 1 (Mar. 1944), pp. 5–25, with bibliography, refers to the ineffective legal establishment in certain counties, and the Church's real support by voluntary lay contributions and by the "S.P.G." R. Townsend Henshaw, "The New York Ministry Act of 1693," *ibid.*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Dec. 1933), pp. 199–204, discusses the establishment, and the bitter controversy with other groups, which really did the Church more harm than good. Frank J. Klingberg, *Anglican Humanitarianism in Colonial New York* (Philadelphia, 1940), with a fine select bibliography, is a heavily documented study of educational and welfare services to Negroes, slaves, Indians, and laboring and dependent classes, emphasizing the Church's sense of social responsibility and civilizing agency, even though its legal position was insecure.

Nelson R. Burr, *The Anglican Church in New Jersey* (Philadelphia, 1954), with extensive bibliography, indicates the effectiveness of the Anglican Church without establishment, and relates it to social, economic, and political events, to other religious groups and various ethnic stocks, and to the life of the people. Nelson Waite Rightmyer, *The Anglican Church in Delaware* (Philadelphia, 1947), with a scholarly bibliography, emphasizes the colonial period, methods of support, parish life, "usages," encouragement of education, Negro missions, and adjustment of the Church to the republican order. This is a superb picture of religious life where the Church was strong from tradition rather than formal establishment.

In Puritan New England, Anglicanism was a zealous minority faith, struggling with other dissenters against the established Congregational churches. Thomas E. Jessett, "Planting the Prayer Book in Puritan Massachusetts," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 21, no. 3 (Sept. 1952), pp. 300–406, with exten-

sive bibliography, offers a thorough study of the struggles of the Church as an unprivileged minority, won by conversion rather than tradition and legal establishment. Francis Lister Hawks and William Stevens Perry, eds., *Documentary History of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America, Containing Numerous Hitherto Unpublished Documents Concerning the Church in Connecticut* (New York, 1863–1864, 2 vols.) extends to the period of reorganization after the Revolution, illustrating the Church's battle for existence against the rival Puritan state church, and its consequent great spiritual strength. Maud O'Neil, "A Struggle for Religious Liberty, an Analysis of the Work of the S.P.G. in Connecticut," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (June 1951), pp. 173–189, with bibliography in footnotes, reviews the penetration of a Puritan theocracy by missionaries and books, the efforts of the state church to resist the thrust, the gradual wearing down of the resistance, and the emergence of a new type of republican episcopacy, with separation of church and state.

B. The New England Puritan Churches

1. THE THEOCRATIC HOLY COMMONWEALTH. When the first English colonies were planted in the seventeenth century, Europeans had scarcely begun to question the immemorial assumption that the church and the state must necessarily be closely related. The Protestant Reformation had two immediate consequences for church-state relations. In Lutheran states and England, state churches were subservient to the interests of secular rulers. (See also Part One, sect. VII, C, 5, *Protestant Nonconformity*.)

On the other hand, the Calvinist wing of the Reformation tended to subordinate the state to the church. Under ideal circumstances (such as the city-state of Geneva or the relatively isolated colony of Massachusetts Bay) the clergy exercised extensive if unofficial powers. Apart from the radical

sectarians, it was not until the eighteenth century that the implicit individualism and self-determination of Protestantism became apparent. In the seventeenth century it was generally assumed that the state existed to protect and promote godliness. Under the spur of a fervent piety, this assumption might justify such regimentation as is now identified with the totalitarian state. American theocracy became practically identified with the political or public aspects of seventeenth-century Puritanism in Massachusetts and Connecticut.

Alan Simpson, *Puritanism in Old and New England* (Chicago, 1955), with bibliographical references in "Notes," regards Puritanism with its covenanted church as the last representative of the medieval effort to synthesize all experience. This impulse produced theocracy, which because of disagreement and circumstances became a regime of toleration with separation of church and state. The basic ideas of theocracy are explained in Stanley Gray, "The Political Thought of John Winthrop," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 3, no. 4 (Oct. 1930), pp. 681–705, with bibliography in footnotes. This demonstrates his paternal and theocratic outlook: the elect must rule according to God's word, and are accountable to God, and laws must conform to God's commandments. In contrast, the democratic element in Puritan Congregationalism appears in Hubert Ray Pellman, "Thomas Hooker, A Study in Puritan Ideals" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pennsylvania, 1958), which underlines his deep concern for conversion and experimental religion with a redemptive outlook, and mutual covenanting as the basis of society.

George E. Ellis, *The Puritan Age and Rule in the Colony of Massachusetts Bay, 1629–1685* (Boston and New York, 1888) indicates the source of Puritan political theory and practice in religious principles, which they were intended to protect and foster. John Fiske, *The Beginnings of New England; or, The Puritan Theocracy in Its Relations to Civil and Religious Liberty* (Boston and New York, 1892), with

bibliographical note, delineates the principal traits of the theocracy and its ideals, and emphasizes the ethical impulse of the Puritan state. Daniel Wait Howe, *The Puritan Republic of the Massachusetts Bay in New England* (Indianapolis, 1899) reviews literature on the "Puritan Commonwealth" to 1856, including anti-Puritan writing. The emphasis is mainly upon the Puritan struggle to establish a peculiar type of society, and the development from theocracy of republican ideas and institutions. Ezra Hoyt Byington, *The Puritan in England and New England* (Boston, 1900, 4th ed.), with bibliography, thoroughly surveys the origin and growth of Puritanism in England, and the development of the New England commonwealths, and emphasizes the progressiveness of Puritanism. The picture of Puritan religious life and manners is both appreciative and critical, standing between the depreciators like James Truslow Adams and such defenders as Clifford K. Shipton.

In Herbert Wallace Schneider's *The Puritan Mind* (New York, 1930) a modern philosopher surveys New England's intellectual history, and maintains that the "Holy Commonwealth" ideal was "only gradually built up." Perry Miller's review (*New England Quarterly*, Vol. 4, no. 2 (Apr. 1931), pp. 340–343) asserts that, when they came, the leaders already had decided upon the form of government, based upon a covenant with God. Arthur H. Buffinton, "The Massachusetts Experiment of 1630," *Publications of the Colonial Society of Massachusetts*, Vol. 32 (Apr. 1935), pp. 308–320, with sources in footnotes, declares that the system was patterned after the Hebrew commonwealth and the Christian medieval church-state. Charles E. Banks, "Religious 'Persecution' as a Factor in Emigration to New England, 1630–1640," *Proceedings of the Massachusetts Historical Society*, Vol. 63 (Mar. 1930), pp. 136–154, views the theocracy as a kind of Christian socialism, and its downfall as the effect of growing capitalist individualism. Ralph Barton Perry, *Puritanism and Democracy* (New York, 1944), with bib-

liography in references, discusses the Puritan background and theocracy to the Massachusetts charter of 1691, and the tendency of Puritanism to become theocratic. Chapters 9–14 offer an appraisal of Puritanism and of its critics. The theocracy broke down partly because it was too strenuous for the masses, who were interested in the virtues of economic individualism. Liberalism solved the tensions between individualism and the solidarity demanded by theocracy. Thomas Jefferson Wertenbaker, *The Puritan Oligarchy* (New York, 1947), with bibliography, studies the history and characteristics of the "Bible State," in the first half century, following Samuel E. Morison, Perry Miller, and other modern students of Puritanism. The breakdown of theocracy came with the rise of mercantile interests, the end of isolation, and the rise of advanced intellectual currents. Chard Powers Smith, *Yankees and God* (New York, 1954) has excellent bibliographical comments and a clear account of the theocracy, with notes on its intellectual, theological and spiritual foundations, and the reasons for its decline: a picture of the replacement of Puritan, idealist New England by Yankee New England.

The most extreme example of theocratic experimentation was in the settlement founded by John Davenport and Theophilus Eaton. Charles McLean Andrews, *The Rise and Fall of the New Haven Colony* (New Haven, 1936) views the little theocracy as the quintessence of the Puritan ideal of a "Holy Commonwealth." Isabel MacBeath Calder, *The New Haven Colony* (New Haven, 1934) studies this determined effort to establish a government based solely upon the Bible: the "smallest and strictest of the Puritan commonwealths."

Causes of the decline of the Puritan theocratic experiment are reviewed in A. Hastings Ross, "Church and State in New England: Effects upon American Congregationalism," *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 49, no. 194 (Apr. 1892), pp. 213–239. The legislation of the Puritan state church contemplated compulsion by the state in behalf of the church, and clashes with dissenters were inevitable. Perry Miller's "Declension in a

Bible Commonwealth," *American Antiquarian Society Proceedings*, new ser., Vol. 51 (1941), pp. 37–94, with bibliography in footnotes, is based largely upon sermons lamenting decline from the early ideal of a godly commonwealth. Puritanism encouraged work and thrift, which produced wealth and worldliness and so helped to destroy the theocracy. Herbert A. Perluck, "Puritan Expression and the Decline of Piety" (Doctoral dissertation, Brown University, 1955; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 13,182; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 15, no. 8 (1955), pp. 1389–1390) examines the evolution of forms of expression in Puritan literature, reflecting the inner spiritual state, and sees the cause of decline as a failure of spirit rather than defeat by outside forces. Wilford Oakland Cross, "The Role and Status of the Unregenerate in the Massachusetts Bay Colony, 1629–1729" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1957; *University Microfilms* (1957), pub. no. 23,072; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 17, no. 10 (1957), p. 2326) describes the characteristics of the covenant theology as the basis of social and ecclesiastical life, and closely examines the governmental and church discipline of the colony. Conflict between the pulpit and business interests weakened the theocracy, while the appeal of sectarianism won the "unregenerate."

2. THEOCRACY AND SOCIETY. Ezra Hoyt Byington, *The Puritan as a Colonist and Reformer* (Boston, 1899), a semi-popular study, assesses the general political and social impact of Puritanism in early American life. Perry Miller, *The New England Mind: The Seventeenth Century* (New York, 1939) successfully distills the essential features of the Puritan intellectual outlook from a vast number of wordy tracts and treatises. It is not a defense, but a candid portrait of a peculiar people engaged in a novel social experiment. Perry Miller and Thomas H. Johnson, eds., *The Puritans* (New York, 1938), with bibliographies, make a succinct statement of the relations between church and society. A general introduction, "The Puritan Way of Life," is a compressed, lucid

statement of Puritan thought. Samuel Eliot Morison, *The Intellectual Life of Colonial New England* (New York, 1956) was intended to correct and counteract modern disparagement of Puritan culture—the "glacial period" theory of Charles Francis Adams, Brooks Adams, and James Truslow Adams. The dominant clergy were not indifferent to culture or hostile to science, but stimulated intellectual activity under difficulties, through colleges and schools. Babette May Levy, *Preaching in the First Half Century of New England History* (Hartford, 1945), with bibliography, analyzes representative sermons, from literary, intellectual, and religious viewpoints, and is an insight into the type of intellectualized religion that sustained the Puritan theocracy and gave to it religious and moral sanction. Ola Elizabeth Winslow, *Meeting-house Hill, 1630–1783* (New York, 1952), with bibliographical references in "Notes," is the story of religion with the meeting house as the center of community life, the source of attitudes and group actions that became typical and habitual in the area of the legally established Congregational churches. It was the focus of a life shaped by divine intent, by the Bible as the people's rule of life.

Economic thought in the Puritan "Bible Commonwealth" is analyzed by Joseph Dorfman, *The Economic Mind in American Civilization, 1606–1865* (New York, 1946, 2 vols.), with bibliographical notes, an impartial, monumental work, essentially not a history but a bibliography. Edgar A. J. Johnson, *American Economic Thought in the Seventeenth Century* (London, 1932), with extensive bibliography, stresses the aspiration of the theocracy to make economic life conform to moral ideals. Its economic thought was derived from medieval sources, and the Reformation revival of interest in relations between Christian ethics and economic conduct. His "Some Evidence of Mercantilism in the Massachusetts-Bay," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 1, no. 3 (July 1928), pp. 371–395, with bibliography in footnotes, states that the ideal was an economic, geographical, cultural,

religious, and ethnic unit. Richard B. Morris and Jonathan Grossman, "The Regulation of Wages in Early Massachusetts," *ibid.*, Vol. 11, no. 3 (Sept. 1938), pp. 470–500, with sources in footnotes, sees the regulation as based upon the theocracy's heavy borrowings from medieval and current mercantilist economic thought.

The state of morals in the Puritan theocracy has long been a subject of dispute, frequently with much heat and little light. A more favorable view than that which was long prevalent is expressed in Henry Bamford Parkes, "Morals and Law Enforcement in Colonial New England," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 5, no. 3 (July 1932), pp. 431–452, which contends that an overwhelming majority of the first-generation householders were Puritans, that very few were discontented with theocracy, and that the colonists generally accepted its moral standards. Charles Francis Adams, "Some Phases of Sexual Morality and Church Discipline in Colonial New England," *Proceedings of the Massachusetts Historical Society*, 2nd ser., Vol. 6 (June 1891), pp. 477–516, by examination of church records shows how the Puritan parish dealt with such matters, and indicates a large amount of immorality. Emil Oberholzer, Jr., *Delinquent Saints* (New York, 1956), with a bibliography, describes how the early churches dealt with the shifting problems of human ethics, and concentrates upon the Puritan attitude toward marital and domestic life, as seen in the church records.

Arthur W. Calhoun, *A Social History of the American Family from Colonial Times to the Present* (Cleveland, 1917–1919, 3 vols.), with a full bibliography, provides the best general study of the Puritan family, but may be criticized for a too heavily economic interpretation. Edmund Sears Morgan, *The Puritan Family* (Boston, 1944), with bibliography in the "Notes," explores the connection between religious beliefs and domestic relations, and relates the family to the general social organization of the theocracy. The author comments that theocracy declined because conversion

experience could not be compelled in the children of the founders. Sandford Fleming, *Children and Puritanism; the Place of Children in the Life and Thought of the New England Churches, 1620–1847* (New Haven, 1933), with bibliography, carries the story to Horace Bushnell's doctrine of "Christian nurture," considering the theocracy's attitude toward religious education of children, their place in church life, their religious reading, and their response to education.

3. THE PURITAN HERITAGE AND CONTROVERSY. The Puritan theocracy was by far the most dynamic intellectual and religious force in seventeenth-century America. There is little doubt that it has had a profound influence on the development of American culture. But almost since its establishment there has been sharp disagreement over whether the influence of Puritanism has worked for good or ill.

During the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries most of the writing about the Puritans, or about their theocratic church-state, was the work of their "filiopietistic" descendants. Those authors tended to picture the early settlers as heroic souls who fled from harsh, Old-World oppression and braved the terrors of the wilderness in order to establish political and religious liberty. The first dissent from this point of view came from two New England-born, Harvard-bred brothers, who were grandson and great-grandson of the two Presidents Adams. Imbued with the scientific spirit that was being carried over into historical research in their day, they began to present a radically different view of the first New England Puritans.

Charles Francis Adams, *Massachusetts: Its Historians and Its History* (Boston, 1893) attacks the "filiopietism" of historians who accepted or defended the presuppositions of the theocracy, and views the period 1640–1760 as the "Glacial Age." The story of Massachusetts he sees as one of emancipation from Puritanism. This volume originated the tendency to regard the theocracy as completely benighted. Brooks Adams, *The Emancipation of Massachusetts; the Dream*

and the Reality (Boston, 1919), on the political overthrow of the theocracy, makes a rather extreme use of economic interpretation to explain the decline from early idealism. James Truslow Adams in his *The Founding of New England* (Boston, 1921) was largely responsible for the popular idea that the clergy were bigoted priests who tyrannized until the people cast out the system root and branch. Vernon L. Parrington, *Main Currents in American Thought* (New York, 1927, 3 vols.) brilliantly synthesizes history and literature, but with respect to the Puritans is vitiated by his presupposition that Puritanism was primarily an economic movement.

The popular attack upon Puritanism was led by certain literary critics. The spirit of the campaign is characterized by Frederick J. Hoffman in "Philistines and Puritans in the 1920's," *American Quarterly*, Vol. 1, no. 3 (Fall, 1949), pp. 247–263. He includes numerous references in the footnotes, and criticizes the modern historical distortion of the Puritan image, which made him the scapegoat of the "revolt" against convention. "Anti" literature pictured Puritanism as an ally of oppressive and hypocritical exploitation, but the critics probably were unaware of scholarly works trying to find out what Puritanism really was. Henry L. Mencken's *A Book of Prefaces* (New York, 1917), in "Puritanism as a Literary Force," together with Randolph Bourne's famous essay, "The Puritan's Will to Power" (*Seven Arts* magazine, Apr. 1917), established the anti-Puritan tone in literature of the 1920's. Mencken attacked Puritanism as a purely negative force, a struggle against the joy of life, a persecuting mania. Ernest A. Boyd, *Portraits: Real and Imaginary* (New York, 1924), in the essay "Puritan: Modern Style," presents a typical view of the "modern Puritan" as a conspirator against freedom and personal liberty, a degeneration from the Puritanism of Milton and his contemporaries.

The inevitable reaction from a shallow Puritan-baiting began to appear in the 1930's. One of the earliest evidences of the change of mood was Samuel Eliot Morison's *Builders*

of the Bay Colony (Boston, 1930), with an excellent bibliography, including critical notes on the chief sources. He points out that the little Puritan theocracy, often accused of stifling individualism, contained an astonishing number of interesting and eminent individuals. His effort to appreciate the Puritan way of life started a reaction from the popular "debunking" school. His "Those Misunderstood Puritans," *Forum and Century*, Vol. 85, no. 3 (Mar. 1931), pp. 142–147, reiterates his thesis that the Puritan theocrats cherished the ideal City of God of medieval theorists, and were nearer to the medieval Catholic than to the twentieth-century Protestant. The economics of the theocracy was Thomistic. One of the leading critics of the theocracy, James Truslow Adams, took issue with Morison in a review of his *Builders of the Bay Colony* (*New England Quarterly*, Vol. 3, no. 4 (Oct. 1930), pp. 741–746). This reveals the duel between the appreciative and the "iconoclastic" attitudes toward the Puritan theocracy. Adams claims that he had no hostile intent, admits that he could have made the shadows too dark, and disputes Morison's argument that the emigration motive was chiefly religious.

Morison's matured view is best expressed in *The Puritan Pronaos, Studies in the Intellectual Life of New England in the Seventeenth Century* (New York, 1936), which maintains that the theocracy enjoyed a richer intellectual life than has been supposed, and pays a tribute to the Puritan founders as transmitters of civilization to the New World. One of the ablest defenders of the Puritans, Clifford K. Shipton, summarizes the favorable reaction in "A Plea for Puritanism," *American Historical Review*, Vol. 40, no. 3 (Apr. 1935), pp. 460–467, with bibliography in footnotes. He criticizes the thesis of a very unpopular theocracy, overthrown by an "oppressed" people after removal of the religious requirement for the franchise in 1691. The clergy praised the new charter, while the popular party wanted to restore the old one. The mass of the voters were not anti-clerical. His "The New

England Clergy of the 'Glacial Age' (1680–1740)," *Publications of the Colonial Society of Massachusetts*, Vol. 32 (Dec. 1933), pp. 24–54, with bibliographical references, is another able criticism of the Adams-Morison-Parrington thesis. There is, it declares, no contemporary evidence of mass discontent with the theocracy. The clergy, far in advance of the masses, were real intellectual leaders and were their own severest critics.

The present, generally favorable attitude toward the Puritans appears in several scholarly efforts to appreciate their real contributions to American life. One of the most notable is George Malcolm Stephenson, *The Puritan Heritage* (New York, 1952), with bibliography, maintaining that the Kingdom of God in the United States was founded and defended largely by the Puritans, and that to them America owes the worship of God in spirit and in truth as the foundation of civil liberties. Amos N. Wilder's "The Puritan Heritage in American Culture," *Theology Today*, Vol. 5, no. 1 (Apr. 1948), pp. 22–33, with bibliography in the footnotes, declares that the American democratic faith is a compound of elements from Puritanism and the Enlightenment. He points to the influence of Calvinism upon authors, especially Calvinist affinities in our twentieth-century literature, and the current role of the novelist as preacher. The Puritans speak for themselves in George M. Waller, *Puritanism in Early America* (Boston, 1950), with bibliography, consisting of readings selected by the Department of American Studies, Amherst College. The introduction discusses the modern literature on Puritanism, and the essays are by nineteenth- and twentieth-century defenders and critics. The critical bibliography is an excellent brief survey of literature on the Puritan theocrats since the seventeenth century. At the present time, the general disposition is to discern two contributing strains in the Puritan heritage. This idea finds a convincing defender in Austin Warren, *New England Saints* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1956), with "Sources." The strains are

the trader and the saint, the latter "often a complex of scholar, priest and poet," sometimes not active in organized religion or almost hostile to it. The treatment is more aesthetic than spiritual, and the essays are scattered and uneven.

American experience with the state church was not confined to Anglicanism and the Puritan theocracy. Before the attainment of England's hegemony on the Atlantic Coast, two other colonial powers established outposts of European state churches. The Dutch planted their Reformed Church in the colony of New Netherland, and a Lutheran state church flourished in the short-lived colony of New Sweden on the Delaware River. These brief establishments disappeared with the English conquest of 1664, and their churches were accorded a freedom that became the American way in church-state relations. (See also Part Four, RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. IV, *Puritanism and Literature.*)

C. The Reformed Dutch Church

Ecclesiastical Records, State of New York, Published by the State under the Supervision of Hugh Hastings, State Historian, Vol. I (Albany, 1901) has many documents relating to establishment and support of the Reformed Church in New Netherland. The articles on religion in the "New Charter of Patroonships" show that no other religion was publicly admitted, and taxes for support of ministers are mentioned. Frederick James Zwierlein, *Religion in New Netherland, a History of the Development of the Religious Conditions in the Province of New Netherland, 1623–1664* (Rochester, N.Y., 1910), with select bibliography, shows that the explicit legal recognition of the Reformed Dutch Church in the Charter of Freedoms and Exemptions (1629) bound patroons and colonists to provide for it. In 1640 a new charter prohibited public exercise of any other religion. His "New Netherland Intolerance," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 4, no. 2 (July 1918), pp. 186–216, with

bibliography in footnotes, cites the policy of repression against organized dissent, and the role of the clergy as custodians of orthodoxy. Charles E. Corwin, *A Manual of the Reformed Church in America (Formerly Reformed Protestant Dutch Church) 1628–1922* (New York, 1922, 5th ed.), with bibliography, reviews the founding of the church in America, its full establishment under the auspices of the West India Company, and its persecution of Lutherans and other groups; and mentions the official rebuke of Governor Stuyvesant for intolerance, which foreshadowed a new attitude. (See also Part One, sect. VII, c, 3, *The Reformed and Presbyterian Tradition.*)

D. The Swedish Lutheran Church

Amandus Johnson, *The Instruction for Johan Printz, Governor of New Sweden . . .* (Philadelphia, 1930) includes the order by the Queen of Sweden to have divine service performed according to the Augsburg (Lutheran) Confession, and to enforce church discipline, but to tolerate Reformed Dutch colonists. Amandus Johnson, *The Swedish Settlements on the Delaware, Their History and Relation to the Indians, Dutch and English, 1638–1664* (New York, 1911, 2 vols.), with a very large bibliography, has a short account of the established Lutheran Church, and the promise of religious liberty to the Dutch colonists by charter, 1640. Adolph B. Benson and Naboth Hedin, *Americans from Sweden* (Philadelphia and New York, 1950) describes the life of the Swedish churches on the Delaware until 1789 (when the parishes were transferred to the American Episcopal Church), and the church's part in cultural contacts between America and Sweden. Christopher Ward, *The Dutch and Swedes on the Delaware, 1609–64* (Philadelphia, 1930), with brief bibliography, gives an account of religious life under the auspices of the state church, 1640–1655. (See also Part One, sect. VII, c, 2, *The Reformation in Scandinavia.*)

II. THE BATTLE FOR DISESTABLISHMENT

DETERMINATION to abolish state churches originated almost with the founding of the colonies. The Puritan state churches had scarcely been established, when they were assailed by bold critics (particularly Roger Williams, the libertarian) as inimical to human rights. From that time until the end of the colonial period, there was no time when state churches were not being attacked by some religious group.

As the tide of religious liberalism gained ground, it merged with political and philosophical impulses of the Enlightenment and the Revolution, which questioned established political and religious institutions. During and within a few years after the Revolution, the States adopted constitutions and statutes, proclaiming religious liberty and abolishing the privileges of state churches. The struggle was especially severe and prolonged in Virginia and New England. In Virginia determined advocates of the Anglican Church even presented a plan to retain its privileges. In Massachusetts and Connecticut the Congregational state church was closely allied with the Federalist Party, by which it was defended.

The victory of disestablishment and toleration was won only after long struggles: in Connecticut in 1818, and in Massachusetts as late as 1833. From that time, nearly two hundred years after Roger Williams' flight to Rhode Island, the United States was free from established religion.

A. Roger Williams

Williams (1603–1682/83), founder of the colony of Rhode Island and Providence Plantations, generally has been regarded as the apostle of American religious liberty as well as of truly popular government. After becoming a clergyman, he migrated to Massachusetts in 1630. He soon became critical of the theocratic oligarchy, was banished and pursued, and finally escaped to Rhode Island. There, in 1636, he founded

his own colony, based upon the principles of religious liberty, separation of church and state, and popular government. The rest of his life he spent in Rhode Island and in England, battling for causes, well in advance of his time, which threatened the idea of a state church.

The clashing concepts of religious conformity and religious freedom are personified by Henry Bamford Parkes in "John Cotton and Roger Williams Debate Toleration, 1644–1652," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 4, no. 4 (Oct. 1931), pp. 735–756, with bibliography in footnotes. He maintains that Cotton, arguing against toleration to support the state church, stood on the medieval ground that the community must be protected against heresy. Williams' phraseology and concepts were modern, and his argument for toleration was based on the idea that none has monopoly of truth, and that religion is not a social function to be identified with the state.

Williams' fundamental contribution to abolition of state-churchism, and to the eventual triumph of religious liberty, are appreciated by several modern biographies and critical essays. James Emanuel Ernst, *Roger Williams, New England Firebrand* (New York, 1932) presents an adequate study of his life and revolutionary ideas, and corrects the distortions and misrepresentations of his opponents, and the exaggerations of his apologists, basing its contentions on original documents and contemporary pamphlets. Samuel Hugh Brockunier, *The Irrepressible Democrat, Roger Williams* (New York, 1940), with bibliographical references in footnotes, is considered to be the best factual modern biography, but has been criticized as presenting Williams too easily in the light of twentieth-century thought. The same is true, to some extent, of Emily Easton, *Roger Williams; Prophet and Pioneer* (New York, 1930), which regards him as representing the libertarianism of "outcast stepchildren of the Reformation," who protested against compulsion in religion and regarded inward, spiritual regeneration as essential. Ola Elizabeth Winslow, *Master Roger Williams, A Biography* (New York,

1957), with bibliography, is an essential book, packed with information and not "glamourized," doing justice to his long and painful service to liberal ideals.

Perry Miller, *Roger Williams, His Contribution to the American Tradition* (Indianapolis and New York, 1953) has bibliographical references in the "Notes," and critical remarks on biographies and other sources. The American character has been moulded by him as a prophet of religious liberty. His reputation is a reminder that "no other conclusion than absolute religious freedom was feasible in this society." R. E. E. Harkness, "Roger Williams—Prophet of Tomorrow," *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 15, no. 4 (Oct. 1935), pp. 400–425, emphasizes his separatism, and intense opposition to exercise of power in church affairs by civil magistrates. His interest in religious freedom was not theological or philosophical, but practical, based upon the sacredness of personality, which state-churchism violated.

B. Reaction Against the State Churches

State churches existed in all the Continental American Colonies except Rhode Island, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, and Delaware. Their disestablishment during the Revolutionary and post-Revolutionary periods was one of the major social transformations in American history, and in most places was accomplished only with great difficulty. The varied and complicated causes of the change, and the course of the various conflicts, are analyzed in the following section.

The general advance of the concept of religious liberty, and its embodiment in legal principles, are recounted in Sanford H. Cobb, *The Rise of Religious Liberty in America, A History* (New York, 1902), with bibliography: a systematic account of the historical development through which American civil law struggled to entire liberty of conscience and worship—the unique American solution of the church-state problem. Allan Nevins, *The American States During and After*

the Revolution, 1775–1789 (New York, 1924), with an unusually excellent bibliography, discusses religious consequences of the social upheaval, with reference to religious liberty, as embodied in new state constitutions and in statutes.

In New England the brunt of the battle for freedom was borne largely by the Baptists and the Congregational Separatists. David B. Ford, in *New England's Struggle for Religious Liberty* (Philadelphia, 1896) emphasizes Baptist contributions to the crusade for toleration, and carries the account to the final separation of church and state in Massachusetts in 1833. Silas Leroy Blake, *The Separates; or, Strict Congregationalists of New England* (Boston and Chicago, 1902), with bibliography, considers the movement as a revolt against the rigid ecclesiasticism of established churches, and as inspired by the intense emotion of the Great Awakening, which attracted the humbler people.

The struggle was most prolonged in Massachusetts and Connecticut. Jacob Conrad Meyer's *Church and State in Massachusetts from 1740 to 1833* (Cleveland, 1930) has a comprehensive, classified bibliography, and is an impartial study of the fight for separation, exceptionally well documented and of excellent literary quality. M. Louise Greene, *The Development of Religious Liberty in Connecticut* (Boston and New York, 1905) outlines the struggle for freedom, culminating in the Constitution of 1818, which decreed religious liberty, the outcome of a peaceful crusade. Richard Joseph Purcell, *Connecticut in Transition, 1775–1818* (Washington, D.C., 1918) is a thoroughly objective and massively documented study, which considers the struggle of dissenters for religious liberty as part of the emergence of the state from provincialism into modern enlightenment. It clarifies the association between dissent and Jeffersonian politics, and between the state church and Federalism.

In Virginia, the principal seat of Anglicanism, the battle for liberty was won by an alliance of liberal Anglicans, Bap-

tists, and Presbyterians. Perhaps the most complete general account is Hamilton James Eckenrode, *Separation of Church and State in Virginia, A Study in the Development of the Revolution* (Richmond, 1910), with references in footnotes, a study of the campaign for disestablishment to the confiscation of the glebes in 1802. The victory was due to a radical spirit, which wanted to destroy all relics of the colonial past. The causes of that agitation are explored in Daniel Durham Rhodes, "The Struggle for Religious Liberty in Virginia, 1740–1802" (Doctoral dissertation, Duke University, 1951).

Lewis Peyton Little, *Imprisoned Preachers and Religious Liberty in Virginia, A Narrative Drawn Largely from the Official Records of Virginia Counties, Unpublished Manuscripts, Letters, and Other Original Sources* (Lynchburg, Va., 1938), with sources noted in the text, vividly presents an exhaustive study of the Baptist part in breaking down the established Church, and claims for the Baptists the credit for victory. William Taylor Thom, "The Struggle for Religious Freedom in Virginia: The Baptists," *Johns Hopkins University Studies in Historical and Political Science,* ser. 18, nos. 10–12 (1900), with bibliography, states that Virginia was conservative and Anglican until late in the colonial period, when political events encouraged a revolutionary religious individualism, which was consolidated by Baptist polity and Biblical faith. Thomas Cary Johnson, *Virginia Presbyterianism and Religious Liberty in Colonial and Revolutionary Times* (Richmond, Va., 1907), with bibliographical references in footnotes, claims that the struggle for religious liberty was waged by all dissenters, no one denomination being the only aggressive force. Presbyterians, however, generally furnished the effective leadership. Jacob Harris Patton, *The Triumph of the Presbytery of Hanover; or, Separation of Church and State in Virginia* (New York, 1887) relates the movement for separation begun by this presbytery in 1773, and renders due justice to a neglected episode in the struggle

for freedom. The burden of educated leadership fell upon educated Presbyterians, while Baptists exerted pressure by numbers. G. MacLaren Brydon, "Memorial on Proposed Disestablishment of the Church in Virginia," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 2, no. 1 (Mar. 1933), pp. 48–50, traces the course of disestablishment from 1776 until the sequestration of the Church's property in 1801, and indicates that liberal Episcopalians believed that the time had come to remove church taxes from other groups.

In New York the Lutherans and the Quakers began the agitation for freedom of conscience and worship, which was guaranteed by the Revolution. *Ecclesiastical Records, State of New York*, Published by the State under the Supervision of Hugh Hastings, State Historian, Vol. 1 (Albany, 1901) contains documents on persecution of Lutherans and other dissenters from the Reformed Church, protests against it, a petition of Lutherans to be allowed public worship, and a remonstrance against anti-Quaker laws. *The Lutheran Church in New York, 1649–1772, Records in the Lutheran Church Archives at Amsterdam, Holland*, translated by Arnold J. H. Van Laer (New York, 1946) includes references to the suppression of the Lutherans in New Netherland, which furnish a clear insight into the struggles of dissenters with a typical state church. Harry Julius Kreider, *Lutheranism in Colonial New York* (New York, 1942), with a bibliographical essay, stresses the role of aggressive lay leaders in the struggle to secure freedom of worship under the intolerance of New Netherland, and the attainment of partial freedom with the English conquest of 1664.

Sidney E. Mead, "From Coercion to Persuasion: Another Look at the Rise of Religious Liberty and the Emergence of Denominationalism," *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 4 (Dec. 1956), pp. 317–337, regards the attainment of liberty as the background of the rise of American denominations, which is the theme of sect. III. (See also Part Three, sect. II, B, *The Rise of Religious Freedom.*)

III. THE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY. CONFLICTING ANTI-TRADITIONAL MOVEMENTS

IN THE eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries American religion was subject to two new forces that became determinants in American culture. One was new scientific knowledge from Europe—prevailingly rationalistic and a countercurrent to the revivalist emotion in evangelical Protestantism. It was the parent of several forms of free and radical religion. The other dominant factor was the westward faring of the people, which originated the culture of the frontier. To meet its peculiar needs, frontier culture imposed upon religion the new technique of the revival, which attained its first general expression in the Great Awakening of the 1740's. The Awakening and the revivalist tradition stemming from it expressed a profound revolution against both rationalism and the state-church orthodoxy brought to the colonies in the seventeenth century.

A. Revivalism and Its Continuing Influence

1. GERMAN PIETIST EVANGELISM. Among the most vital inheritances of the Awakening was German Pietism, one of the deepest religious currents in Western civilization. During the first half of the eighteenth century it became an international force in the Lutheran and Reformed churches and the Anglo-American Protestant denominations. It profoundly modified Protestant Christianity and national cultures. German Pietism, British Wesleyanism, and the American Great Awakening seemed to start independently, but essentially were manifestations of the same movement. They emphasized the subjective aspect of religion, and aimed to kindle vital religious feeling in the heart, and to make a sense of unity with the Divine the source of a religion that could be experienced as well as believed. Eighteenth-century re-

vivalist doctrines really were not novel, for in great part they reflected the teaching of Martin Luther and other sixteenth-century Reformers. They rejected ecclesiastical formalities, and stressed the need of regeneration, and the priesthood of all believers. Emotional religion followed the subjective trend in the Reformation, the essence of which was appeal to individual conscience. A succinct discussion of the nature of the German evangelical movement is John Preston Hoskins, "German Influence on Religious Life and Thought in America during the Colonial Period," *Princeton Theological Review,* part 1 in Vol. 5, no. 1 (January 1907), pp. 49–79; also Kuno Francke, *A History of German Literature* (New York, 1905, 6th ed.).

Pietism was born in the religious revival which infused fresh courage into exhausted Germany after the fearful Thirty Years' War of 1618–1648. Pietism was a pure stream of primitive Christian emotion, flowing from a rebirth of Lutheran evangelism and of the Bohemian Brethren or Moravian Church. It reflected the religious ideals of two Lutheran pastors, Philip Jacob Spener (1635–1705) and August Hermann Francke (1663–1727). (See Hoskins, part 1, p. 64; and James Bryce, *The Holy Roman Empire* (New York, 1905, rev. ed.), an important estimate of the significance of Pietism by a secular historian.) Braving hostility and ridicule, they redeemed religious education as a means of cultivating a warm and personal piety. In 1670 Spener originated his "Collegia Pietatis" (College of Piety). Expelled from Leipzig in Saxony, Francke was invited to a professorship at the University of Halle, where he established schools and philanthropic institutions.

Pietism became a second Protestant Reformation, encouraging personal religion and preparation for missionary and social service. Its sources and character are thoroughly explored by Chauncey David Ensign's "Radical German Pietism c.1675–1760" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1955; original copy in Boston University School of

Theology, with extensive bibliography). A much briefer treatment, with bibliography, is in *The New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge* (New York and London, 1909), Vol. 9, pp. 53–67. Persuaded by urgent pleas of German settlers for pastors, some Pietists migrated to Pennsylvania, where their evangelism permeated the German churches and inspired revivals.

The Moravians or Bohemian Brethren originated in the fifteenth century, and revived the simplicity, equality, and charity of the bright dawn of Christian faith. They lived together as one family to support their ministry, missions, and schools. An early account of their origin and progress is Heinrich Rimius, *A Candid Narrative of the Rise and Progress of the Herrnhutters, Commonly Call'd Moravians or Unitas Fratrum* (London, 1753). In the seventeenth century fearful persecutions descended upon them, and in 1722 some took refuge on the estate of Count Nicholas von Zinzendorf in Saxony. With later refugees they built the village of "Herrnhut" (the Lord's Watch). There they were visited by John Wesley, whose piety was deeply influenced by their example. (See 4, *The Methodist Element in Revivalism,* below.) The character and influence of their peculiar piety are authoritatively described in David Cranz, *The Ancient and Modern History of the Brethren . . .* (London, 1780, English translation by Benjamin Latrobe), and by J. Taylor Hamilton in *A History of the Unitas Fratrum, or Moravian Church, in the United Seates of America* (New York, 1895) and his *A History of the Church Known as the Moravian Church . . .* (Bethlehem, Pa., 1900).

Lutheran Pietism and Moravianism were blended during the German migration to Pennslyvania. Pietism permeated the "Pennsylvania Dutch" country through clergymen like the Lutheran founder and Patriarch, Henry M. Muhlenberg, educated at Halle. A general review of these movements, with remarks on their influence in America, is J. A. Brown, "The Pietistic Controversy," *Quarterly Review of*

the Evangelical Lutheran Church, n.s., Vol. 4, no. 2 (April 1874), pp. 278–301. Later philanthropic, cultural, and religious effects of revivalist piety are suggested by references to Francke's Halle Orphan House, the immense distribution of Bibles and tracts, and Pietist elements in Methodism and pious societies within established churches. Widespread Pietist penetration is described by Julius Friedrich Sachse in "The Influence of the Halle Pietism in the Provincial Development of Pennsylvania," *Lutheran Quarterly,* n.s., Vol. 31, no. 2 (April 1901), pp. 170–176. It began with the settlement of Johann Kelpius and his followers in 1694. Kelpius corresponded with religious people, and his major influence in the spread of Pietist feeling is suggested by Francis Howard Williams, "John Kelpius, Pietist," *The New World. . .* , Vol. 3, no. 10 (June 1894), pp. 218–232, indicating the origin of his religiosity in Spener's Collegia Pietatis, and the spread of Pietism into northwestern Germany, whence it came to New Jersey through the Reverend Theodorus Jacobus Frelinghuysen (see 2, *The New Jersey Revivals,* below).

Several other sources emphasize Pietism in guiding colonial sympathy toward evangelistic and personal religion. It was clearly recognized by contemporary colonial writers, especially by Thomas Prince, Jr., in his *Christian History . . .* (Boston, 1743–1744, 2 vols.), Vol. II. Friendly relations between Lutheran and Reformed churches, promoted by Pietism, are emphasized by Joseph Henry Dubbs, "The Founding of the German Churches of Pennsylvania," *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography,* Vol. 17, no. 3 (1893), pp. 241–262. Revivalism was familiar to Pennsylvania Germans many years before the Great Awakening. Julius Friedrich Sachse, *The German Sectarians of Pennsylvania, 1708–1742* (Philadelphia, 1899) alludes to revivals led by itinerant Dunker preachers in the 1720's, and to an awakening among the Germans in 1735.

The diverse Middle Colonies were ripe for a religious

revival. Many churches were dependent upon Europe for ministers and were tragically neglected. The Dutch Church's decline from lack of ministers and the increase of the English language is revealed in Samuel Tanjore Corwin, *History of the Dutch Reformed Church in the United States* (New York, 1895), chs. II–IV. The Quakers had lost their early zeal, the Presbyterian Church was small and mostly unenthusiastic, and the German churches were isolated by a language barrier. There was a lamentable ignorance of true, practical religion and of the necessity of "new birth." (See Hoskins, part I, pp. 71–72; see also sect. V, C, 1, a, *General History: Pietism*, below.)

2. THE NEW JERSEY REVIVALS. German settlement spread into the upper Raritan valley and mingled there with Dutch pioneers, who were affected by the Pietistic Theodorus J. Frelinghuysen. The history of that German frontier is related in detail by Theodore Frelinghuysen Chambers, *The Early Germans of New Jersey* . . . (Dover, N.J., 1895), with an appreciation of Frelinghuysen. He had been preceded by another Pietist, the Rev. Guliam (William) Bertholf, from Flanders. He had been attracted to the "Coelmanists," who provoked disapproval like that later visited upon "New Lights" in the Great Awakening. Bertholf was the Reformed apostle of New Jersey, and a forerunner of evangelism in the Dutch Church. His service is appreciated by Nelson R. Burr in "The Religious History of New Jersey Before 1702," part I, *Proceedings of the New Jersey Historical Society*, Vol. 56, no. 3 (July 1938), pp. 169–190. Other accounts of his apostolate are found in Abraham Messler, *Forty Years at Raritan, Eight Memorial Sermons* . . . (New York, 1873); David D. Demarest, *The Reformed Church in America* . . . (New York, 1889, 4th ed., rev. and enl.); Hugh Hastings, State Historian, ed., *Ecclesiastical Records of the State of New York* (Albany, 1902), Vol. II, which contains original documents; Reformed Church in America (Dutch), *Tercentenary Studies* (New York, 1928),

with considerable biographical information, and notes on his ordination and settlement in New Jersey; and Edgar Franklin Romig, ed., *The Tercentenary Year, A Record of the Celebration of the Three Hundredth Anniversary of the Founding of the First Church in New Netherland* (The Church, n.p., 1929), ch. XIII.

Bertholf prepared the way for Frelinghuysen, whose challenge to religious apathy is detailed by Peter H. B. Frelinghuysen, *Theodorus Jacobus Frelinghuysen* (Princeton, N.J., 1938), with bibliography. This corrects errors in previous works, and indicates Frelinghuysen's debt to Pietist emphasis upon experimental and emotional religion, and reformation of morals. His advocacy of spiritual regeneration and truly inward religious experience, in vividly and personally directed sermons and in his promotion of revivals, is described sympathetically in Abraham Messler, *Forty Years at Raritan,* and in Edgar Franklin Romig, ed., *The Tercentenary Year,* particularly ch. XIII, which mentions his association with the Presbyterian Tennents and George Whitefield (see below). The quality of Frelinghuysen's stirring sermons appears in William Demarest's edition, *Sermons, Translated from the Dutch, and Prefaced by a Sketch of the Author's Life, by William Demarest: with an Introduction by Rev. Thomas DeWitt, D.D.* (New York, 1856).

Frelinghuysen's ministry stirred fierce opposition from conservative clergy and laity, and provoked a lengthy controversy, which displayed characteristics of many later ones over revivalism. The bitter dispute is thoroughly explained in two scholarly essays: (1) James J. Bergen, "The 'Rebellion' at Raritan in 1723," *Somerset County Historical Quarterly,* Vol. 3, no. 3 (July 1914), pp. 173–184, and no. 4 (October 1914), pp. 241–249; and (2) W. S. Cranmer, "The Famous Frelinghuysen Controversy," *ibid.,* Vol. 5, no. 2 (April 1916), pp. 81–89. These summarize complaints against the pastor, particularly concerning his "unorthodox" doctrines, insistence upon true penitence for sin and upon con-

version, repelling "unrenewed" persons from communion, and "rambling" revivalist preaching. The charges strikingly resemble those later hurled at the great New England revivalist ministers, Whitefield and the Tennent brothers (see below). Bergen's work is based largely upon original documents, which are available in *Ecclesiastical Records of the State of New York*, III, 2141ff., and IV, 2309ff. The specific charges may be examined in *A Complaint Against T. J. Frelinghuysen and His Consistories* (New York, 1725). Other accounts are in Theodore Frelinghuysen Chambers, *The Early Germans of New Jersey* (Dover, N.J., 1895); Henry Post Thompson, *History of the Reformed Church, at Readington, N.J., 1719–1881* (New York, 1882); "Historical Discourse by the Rev. B. V. D. Wyckoff," in *Historical Discourse and Addresses Delivered at the 175th Anniversary of the Reformed Church, Readington, N.J., October 17th, 1894* (Somerville, N.J., 1894); *Tercentenary Studies* (New York, 1928); and Charles E. Corwin, *A Manual of the Reformed Church in America . . . 1628–1922* (New York, 1922, 5th ed., rev.). Frelinghuysen has been hailed as the morning star of the Great Awakening by Leonard W. Bacon, *The History of American Christianity* (New York, 1897); also in the biography by Abraham Messler, in William B. Sprague, ed., *Annals of the American Pulpit*, IX.

Frelinghuysen's labors came to fruition in the intercolonial passion of the Great Awakening. One of its leaders was a Scotch-Irish Presbyterian minister, whom he could claim as a spiritual son: The Rev. Gilbert Tennent, pastor of the Presbyterian church in New Brunswick. Tennent acknowledged his debt to Frelinghuysen for a clear view of the necessity of personal conversion (see Hoskins, part II, pp. 227–230). Gilbert, his father William, Sr., and his three brothers, William, Jr., Charles, and John, formed an evangelistic band. The father became pastor of the Presbyterian church in Neshaminy, Pennsylvania, close to the Pietistic

German sectarian country where revivals were occurring, and conducted his "Log College," a domestic theological academy to train evangelistic ministers—the first American Presbyterian seminary. Tennent's life and influence are detailed in Archibald Alexander, *Biographical Sketches of the Founder, and Principal Alumni of the Log College . . .* (Princeton, N.J., 1845; Philadelphia, 1851). By far the most powerful of his pupils (except Whitefield, the most effective preacher of the Great Awakening) was Gilbert Tennent. This estimate, founded upon close study, is expressed by K. Ludwig De Benneville in "Memorabilia of the Tennents," *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (June 1902), pp. 344–354.

The influence of German Pietism came to Tennent in part, possibly, from the nearby Pennsylvania Germans, and certainly from Frelinghuysen. (See Hoskins, part II, pp. 227–230.) It was confirmed by contacts with the Moravian leader, Count Zinzendorf, who visited Pennsylvania in the early 1740's. Direct Pietist influence is revealed by Tennent's publication of *Some Account of the Principles of the Moravians, Chiefly Collected from Several Conversations with Count Zinzendorf* (London, 1743). From these associations and from his father, Tennent derived his conviction of "personal experience with Christ," and his habit of passionate preaching. Further evidences for the sources of this passion are presented by William Thomas Hanzsche, "New Jersey Moulders of the American Presbyterian Church," *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, Vol. 24, no. 2 (June 1946), pp. 71–82; and *The Presbyterians; the Story of a Stanch and Sturdy People* (Philadelphia, 1934). The author emphasizes Tennent's awakening of his church to a realization of its evangelistic mission, his influence in breaking up mere conformity, and his part in founding the evangelistic New Brunswick Presbytery.

The evangelism of the Tennents aroused the ire of Presbyterian conservatives, who accused the revivalists of trying

to staff the pulpits with "mere" enthusiasts and ranters. Their attempt to block ordination of Log College alumni resulted in a conflict similar to the controversy in the Dutch Reformed Church. The revivalists defied the Synod of Philadelphia and established their own Presbytery of New Brunswick. This movement is recounted in detail by George H. Ingram in "The Erection of the Presbytery of New Brunswick . . . ," *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, Vol. 6, no. 6 (June 1912), pp. 212–233, with bibliographical references in footnotes. Subsequent essays, under the title "History of the Presbytery of New Brunswick," trace the course of revivalism in the presbytery. Official minutes of the establishment of the New Brunswick Presbytery and the Synod of New York occur in *Records of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America . . . , 1706–1788* (Philadelphia, 1904).

The new zealots started to reform the Presbyterian Church, which had been admitting as members all people not scandalous in life. Their consecrated lives prepared the way for Whitefield and brought his work to its zenith in the Middle Colonies. Their contributions are reviewed critically by Thomas Stacy Capers in "The Great Awakening in the Middle Colonies," *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, Vol. 8, no. 7 (Sept. 1916), pp. 296–315, with some bibliographical footnotes, which emphasizes the Tennents' influence, the decidedly Presbyterian character of the movement in the Middle Colonies, and local revivals in New Jersey and Pennsylvania. The new evangelism and Tennent's criticism of formal religion are illustrated by typical discourses of Gilbert and William Tennent and Samuel Blair, in *Sermons on Sacramental Occasions by Divers Ministers* (Boston, 1739). They stress attachment to Christ as the personal savior, the sanctifying efficacy of the Gospel, self-examination, and judgment. A similar collection is Samuel Davies Alexander, comp., *Sermons and Essays by the Tennents and Their Contemporaries* (Philadelphia, 1855), with biographical notes on the preachers. These

sermons point up the keynotes of evangelical preaching: God's justice, mercy and grace, His wisdom in redemption, regeneration, the means of grace, the necessity of the sinner's striving, and the contrasting themes of sin and holiness. Gilbert Tennent was a storm center for his scathing criticism of "unregenerate" preachers, which attained its height in his sermon *The Danger of an Unconverted Ministry . . . A Sermon on Mark* VI, *34* (Philadelphia, 1740, 2nd ed., and Philadelphia and Boston, 1742, from 2nd ed.). It reveals his mighty earnestness, and the growing schism in the Presbyterian Church. His defense of revivalism, in reply to an attack upon himself and six Boston ministers, is summarized in *The Examiner Examined; or, Gilbert Tennent, Harmonious . . .* (Philadelphia, 1743), a typical argument against attacks by Dr. Charles Chauncy of Boston and other conservatives. (See 6, *Critics and Controversy*, below.)

Tennent and his evangelistic brethren came to the critical notice of Dr. Chauncy through their sympathy with revivalist ministers of New England Puritan lineage, such as James Davenport, Benjamin Pomeroy, Joseph Bellamy, Jonathan Dickinson, Aaron Burr, and Jonathan Edwards. In 1740 Gilbert Tennent accompanied George Whitefield on a preaching tour to Boston. These contacts strengthened the ties between groups of evangelists, and gave to the Awakening an intercolonial character, while bringing it into world-wide currents including German Pietism, Wesleyan Methodism, and New England's rebirth of primitive Puritanism.

3. THE NEW ENGLAND AWAKENING. The most dynamic aspect of the Great Awakening was an effort to recover the original Puritan ideal of religion and the church. Various causes, including economic ones, have been suggested to explain the first Puritan settlements. Religious idealism should be admitted as a major motive of the leaders, who believed that God had assigned them to construct a perfect, theocratic church-state. The early Puritan patriarchs cherished

the ideal of founding churches upon personal conversion and a "covenant" among true believers. The ideal of the theocratic church commonwealth is lucidly expressed by several eminent Puritan treatises, notably by Richard Baxter's *A Holy Commonwealth . . .* (London, 1659); Thomas Hooker's *A Survey of the Summe of Church-Discipline* (London, 1648); and John Cotton's *Of the Holinesse of Church-Members . . .* (London, 1650). With a wealth of references, the ideal is discussed in Herbert Wallace Schneider, *The Puritan Mind* (New York, 1930). Hooker's concept of the church is treated at length in Warren Seymour Archibald, *Thomas Hooker* (New Haven, 1933). A typical church organization was that of Salem, Mass., as described in Daniel Neal, *The History of the Puritans, or Protestant Nonconformists; from the Reformation in 1517, to the Revolution of 1688* (New York, 1856, 2 vols., in Vol. 1). The same procedure, followed at Windsor, fixed the type for Connecticut, according to Benjamin Trumbull, *A Complete History of Connecticut, Civil and Ecclesiastical . . . to the Year 1764* (New Haven, 1818, 2 vols., in Vol. 1). It is described for the first churches of Boston and New Haven in John Winthrop, *The History of New England from 1630 to 1649 . . .* (Boston, 1853, 2 vols., new ed., in Vol. 1); and in Leonard Woolsey Bacon, *Thirteen Historical Discourses, on the Completion of Two Hundred Years, from the Beginning of the First Church in New Haven* (New Haven and New York, 1839). That these events typified early Puritan procedure is established by the authority of Williston Walker in *A History of the Congregational Churches in the United States* (New York, 1894). Penetrating comment on the custom is offered by Thomas J. Wertenbaker's *The Puritan Oligarchy; The Founding of American Civilization* (New York, 1947), stressing the admission of none but "saints" (regenerate or sanctified persons) as members.

The covenanted church was the foundation of the Puritan theocratic commonwealths, whose civil governments also

were founded upon covenants made by church members. This was the principle of the Connecticut Fundamental Orders of 1639, the text of which is in Royal R. Hinman, *Letters from the English Kings and Queens . . . to the Governors of the Colony of Connecticut . . . from 1635 to 1749* (Hartford, 1836). The New Haven Colony established its civil government upon a covenant adopted after a day of fasting and prayer, a procedure noted in New Haven (Colony), *Records of the Colony and Plantation of New Haven, from 1638 to 1649* (Hartford, 1857); also in James Luce Kingsley, *A Historical Discourse, Delivered by Request before the Citizens of New Haven, April 25, 1838, the Two Hundredth Anniversary of the First Settlement . . .* (New Haven, 1838). The theocracy was governed by a spiritual aristocracy of converted church members, believing themselves to be in full covenant with God. Authoritative treatments of the typical Puritan theocracy are Charles M. Andrews, *The Rise and Fall of the New Haven Colony* (New Haven, 1936), and Isabel M. Calder, *The New Haven Colony* (New Haven, 1934), which is favorably discussed in a review by Perry Miller, *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 8, no. 4 (Dec. 1935), pp. 582–584, as an ideal study of Puritan theocracy in its purest form.

The "Holy Commonwealth" leaders soon discovered that their ideal of a perfect church-state governed by "saints" could not be easily maintained. The second and third Puritan generations lacked the impelling vision of the forefathers, and many were attracted more by business enterprise than by the "Holy Commonwealth." The decline, especially marked in the church, is admirably described by Leonard W. Bacon in *A History of American Christianity* (New York, 1897), which accents the embarrassment of compelling men to support churches of which they, being "unconverted," could not be full members. The decline in spiritual life prevailed throughout the English-speaking world, according to Robert Leonard Tucker, *The Separation of the Methodists from the*

Church of England (New York, 1918), which points to a similar condition in England after the fall of Puritan rule in 1660. New England history from 1670 to 1730 abounds in lamentations of religious decline, some of which are quoted in Mary Hewitt Mitchell, *The Great Awakening and Other Revivals in the Religious Life of Connecticut* (New Haven, 1934). Under the impact of increasing worldliness the covenant relation had to be modified. The dilemma is pointedly and learnedly explained by Hermann Ferdinand Uhden in *The New England Theocracy, A History of the Congregationalists in New England to the Revivals of 1740* (Boston and New York, 1859, tr. from 2nd German ed. by H. C. Conant). This mentions the growth of a strong party willing to admit to full communion, without inquiry regarding true conversion. A synod in 1657 decided that grown children of church members, although not yet communicants, were still members and ought to "own the covenant," but could not vote in church affairs without professing conversion. The synod is noted in Connecticut (Colony), *The Public Records of the Colony of Connecticut* (1636–1776), Vol. 1, 1636–1665. Far from dampening discussion, this decision merely heated it further, and the bitter controversies are considered at length in Trumbull and Uhden. The adoption of the "Halfway Covenant" illustrates an increasing accommodation of Puritan religion to the "World." It was ardently defended by some ministers, and preeminently by the Reverend Solomon Stoddard of Northampton, Mass., the maternal grandfather of one of its great critics, Jonathan Edwards. Stoddard's *The Doctrine of Instituted Churches . . .* (Boston, 1700) was widely circulated and helped to promote the new compromising way. The resistance of Edwards and others was a chief cause of the rebirth of Puritan religious passion in later revivals. Promotions of revival had been occurring for many years, and various churches in Connecticut had experienced "soaking showers" (see Mitchell, passim). Stoddard had promoted revivals, because under the

Halfway Covenant the only way to secure full church members was to give people an opportunity for an emotional experience of the "new birth."

By the late 1730's these efforts had proved ineffective to change the prevalent religious tepidity, and conditions in New England were ripe for a profound change. The situation is described brilliantly in Leonard W. Bacon, *A History of American Christianity* (New York, 1897) as one of "unstable equilibrium" in politics, church, theology, and morals. That conditions favoring a sudden rise of revivalism had been preparing for many years, is amply demonstrated by Edwin S. Gaustad in "The Theological Effects of the Great Awakening in New England," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 40, no. 4 (March 1954), pp. 681–706. He holds that the Awakening was not due solely to the preaching of George Whitefield, and that in many respects the way had been prepared for his mission. The remoter psychological extreme causes are touched upon in an essay by S. P. Hayes: "An Historical Study of the Edwardian Revivals," in *American Journal of Psychology*, Vol. 13, no. 4 (Oct. 1902), pp. 550–574. This emphasizes also the powerful influence of Solomon Stoddard, which lent prestige to revivals. Traits of Puritanism which encouraged evangelical religion are subjected to careful exploration, based upon a wealth of references, in Herbert Wallace Schneider, *The Puritan Mind* (New York, 1930), with large bibliography. This studies the undermining of Calvinistic determinism by eighteenth-century beliefs in divine benevolence, natural rights, and democratic humanitarianism, which made it easier for revivalists to appeal to individual conscience and spiritual effort. New England in the course of its slow intellectual and spiritual preparation for the Awakening is depicted by Perry Miller's *The New England Mind: From Colony to Province* (Cambridge, Mass., 1953). The mental and spiritual ferment on the eve of the great upheaval is appreciated by Henry B. Parkes in "New England in the Seventeen-

Thirties," *The New England Quarterly*, Vol. 3, no. 3 (July 1930), pp. 397–419, with bibliographical references in footnotes. The region was being readied for "some great convulsion" by the shift toward secularism in its culture. This provoked a reaction toward old ideals, combined with a new psychological emphasis in religion, and an appeal to the individual and to benevolence. Thomas J. Wertenbaker's *The Puritan Oligarchy* . . . (New York, 1947) gives a good general description of background developments in New England's secular life and culture in the early part of the Awakening period.

An obscure but important cultural development brought New England into contact with German Pietism. It became known through the influence of Anton Wilhelm Boehm, a Lutheran court chaplain in London, who spread information about its institutions in England and the Colonies. Through Boehm the Reverend Cotton Mather corresponded with August Hermann Francke, as is recounted in Kuno Francke, "Cotton Mather and August Hermann Francke," in *Harvard Studies and Notes in Philology and Literature*, Vol. 5 (1896), and in his "Further Documents Concerning Cotton Mather and August Hermann Francke," in *Americana Germanica*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (1897), pp. 31–66. Francke described to Mather the Halle institutions and the mode of maintaining them. This inspired Mather's *Nuncia Bona E Terrâ Longinquâ, A brief Account of some Good and Great Things A Doing for the Kingdom of God in the Midst of Europe* (Boston, 1715), reprinted in *Americana Germanica*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (1897), pp. 54–66, summarizing Francke's account, with sympathetic comments and moral reflections. The Francke letter was published in English translation by Boehm, *Pietas Hallensis*, part III (London, 1716). Mather presented Pietist works to Harvard College, and Governor Belcher of Massachusetts was a benefactor of Francke's institutions. This correspondence is an early evidence of the American interest in Pietism that rose to a climax during the Awakening. It was

continued by the sons of the two men, Samuel Mather and Gotthilf A. Francke, and the former published a *Vita B. Augusti Franckii* (Boston, 1733). Some New England Puritan ministers probably read this work, as well as the books presented by Mather to Harvard.

No direct evidence proves that Mather's contact with Francke influenced Jonathan Edwards, but a striking similarity to Pietism appears in certain early traits of his spirituality, which prepared him for his great role. They color his "Personal Narrative," published in Clarence H. Faust and Thomas H. Johnson, eds., *Jonathan Edwards, Representative Selections* (New York, 1935), indicating his youthful realization of the centrality of inward experience. His own inner experience predisposed Edwards to adopt a technique of preaching aimed to persuade the will and engage the affections. Its effectiveness was clearly discerned by the Reverend Dr. Samuel Finley, in his appreciation of Edwards prefixed to the latter's *The Great Christian Doctrine of Original Sin Defended* . . . (Boston, 1758), published in "A Contemporaneous Account of Jonathan Edwards," *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, Vol. 2, no. 3 (Dec. 1903), pp. 125–135. A similar view is presented by Ezra Hoyt Byington's "Jonathan Edwards, and the Great Awakening," in *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 55, no. 217 (Jan. 1898), pp. 114–127, with bibliographical footnotes, expanded in his *The Puritan as a Colonist and Reformer* . . . (Boston, 1899). This emphasizes the theologian's determination to present truth so as to deepen the sense of personal responsibility (the source of humanitarian impulses in revivalism); also the similarity of his early inner experience to that of the Wesleys (see 4, *The Methodist Element in Revivalism*, below).

Edwards' stress on inward religion required a direct, personal mode of preaching, illustrated by the warning or "minatory" sermon, "Sinners in the Hands of an Angry God" (see Faust and Johnson), which accounts for the heavily

overdrawn traditional portrait of its author as a "hell-fire" preacher. The personal and emotional appeal was brilliantly defended by Edwards in his "Treatise Concerning Religious Affections" (see Faust and Johnson), the most mature statement of his position regarding personal religion, and the place of emotion in religious experience. It is also his fully developed defense of revivals. His theological convictions are fully discussed in Ezra Hoyt Byington's "The Theology of Edwards, as Shown in his Treatise Concerning Religious Affections," *American Theological Review*, Vol. 1, no. 2 (May 1859), pp. 199–220, which regards the work as a standard authority, correctly discriminating between affections of the regenerate and the unregenerate, real and spurious conversions. The essay completely expounds his doctrine of regeneration, and its connection with his understanding of Locke's theory of the origin of ideas as derived from sensation and reflection.

Edwards' action upon this theory promoted the great revival at Northampton in 1734–1735, which inspired his epoch-making report, *A Faithful Narrative of the Surprizing Work of God in the Conversion of Many Hundred Souls in Northampton . . .* (London, 1736, 1738, and Boston, 1738). It reached John Wesley and is regarded as an immediate promoter of revivals in Great Britain, as well as of renewed and widespread American religious enthusiasm in 1740, when the Awakening merged into the greater international movement (see below). This work became a revivalist manual, and was repeatedly reprinted during the Second Great Awakening (see below) after 1800, together with Edwards' *Some Thoughts Concerning the Present Revival of Religion in New-England, and the Way in which it Ought to be Acknowledged and Promoted . . .* (Boston, 1742). For various editions, see Thomas Herbert Johnson, *The Printed Writings of Jonathan Edwards* (Princeton, 1940) below. Edwards resumed his defense in *A Humble Attempt to Promote an Explicit Agreement and Visible Union*

of God's People Thro' the World, in Extraordinary Prayer . . . Occasioned by a Late Memorial Publish'd by a Number of Ministers in Scotland . . . (Boston, 1747), which illuminate his effort to unite various revival movements, and the stress upon prayer groups, a general feature of American revivalism for the next century and a half. Edwards' stimulating influence upon later revivals and the reliance upon his defensive arguments appear in Noah Porter's "President Edwards on Revivals," *Christian Spectator*, n.s., Vol. 1, no. 6 (June 1827), pp. 295–308.

Edwards' revival theology and practice implied a profound change in doctrine regarding church membership, and a gradual disuse of the Halfway Covenant. This phase is fully explored in George Leon Walker, "Jonathan Edwards and the Halfway Covenant," *New Englander*, Vol. 43, no. 182 (Sept. 1884), pp. 601–614, with bibliographical references. This essay traces the Covenant's history, and notices its acceptance by Edwards' grandfather, Solomon Stoddard, in his *Doctrine of Instituted Churches* (see ref. above), and even by Edwards in his early ministry, and the final rejection of it that caused his dismissal. His attack upon it unfolds in *An Humble Inquiry Into The Rules of the Word of God Concerning the Qualifications Requisite to a Compleat Standing and full Communion In the Visible Christian Church . . .* (Boston, 1749), which prevailed for generations as an armory of arguments for admission upon conversion only.

For close study of Edwards' writings on revival controversies, reference should be made to several highly competent bibliographies, particularly: (1) Paul Elmer More and John J. Coss, in *The Cambridge History of American Literature* (New York, 1917–1921), Vol. 1; (2) U.S. Library of Congress, Reading Room, *A List of Printed Materials on Jonathan Edwards, 1703–1758* (Washington, D.C., 1934, typewritten); (3) Thomas Herbert Johnson, *The Printed Writings of Jonathan Edwards, 1703–1758, A Bibliography*

(Princeton, N.J., 1940), including all editions, and a foreword on Edwards' works and reputation. Penetrating comment on American literature about Edwards since the early nineteenth century, with the attitudes and interpretations of the various authors, is contained in William S. Morris, "The Reappraisal of Edwards," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 30, no. 4 (December 1957), pp. 515–525, which is in part a review of *The Works of Jonathan Edwards* (Yale Edition), Vol. 1, *Freedom of the Will*, edited by Paul Ramsey. The essay includes a lengthy critique of Ramsey's analysis of Edwards' thinking.

Recent consideration of the Great Awakening in New England has produced a few studies suggesting its character as something more than a strictly religious phenomenon. Edwin Scott Gaustad, *The Great Awakening in New England* (New York, 1957) is the first full-scale study in more than a century. It emphasizes its socially and religiously disruptive tendencies, with many quotations from contemporary sources, and is a valuable analysis of its deep and lasting effects upon many aspects of New England life. The spirit of democracy in religion overflowed into political and social life. Economic and social undertones are probed by John C. Miller's "Religion, Finance, and Democracy in Massachusetts," in the *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 6, no. 2 (March 1933), pp. 29–58. The viewpoint stresses religious class conflict, coinciding with a politico-economic controversy over the Land Bank scheme: discontent shifted from economics to religion, rising democracy was strengthened by its link with religious fervor, and the influence of evangelistic itinerants helped to form a popular party. A penetrating study of Edwards' social views is Perry Miller's "Jonathan Edwards' Sociology of the Great Awakening," in the *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 21, no. 1 (March 1948), pp. 50–77: linking Edwards with Pietism, and pointing to his "sense of the pattern of human relations," quoting three sermons indicating his social analysis of the community by classes, re-

specting religious and moral attitudes and conduct, and indicating his concept of grace as operating in a social setting.

There have been many biographies, approaching the problems of Edwards' personality and thought from widely variant angles. His earliest biographer, Samuel Hopkins, admired his originality as a philosopher and theologian, in *The Life and Character of the Late Reverend Mr. Jonathan Edwards* . . . (Boston, 1765), with a number of his sermons; issued also as *Memoirs of Jonathan Edwards* . . . (London, 1815, rev. and enl. ed.). A standard modern life is Alexander V. G. Allen's *Jonathan Edwards* (Boston and New York, 1889, 1896), with bibliography. Allen wrote also "The Place of Edwards in History," in Harry Norman Gardiner, ed., *Jonathan Edwards, a Retrospect* . . . (Boston and New York, 1901), a collection of ably written, appreciative addresses. A depreciating viewpoint informs Henry B. Parkes's *Jonathan Edwards, the Fiery Puritan* (New York, 1930), with bibliography, which furnished sociological data for a very derogatory view of Edwards as an "anachronism," in Vernon L. Parrington's *Main Currents in American Thought,* Vol. I, *The Colonial Mind, 1620–1800* (New York, 1927). The tide began to flow more favorably in Arthur C. McGiffert, Jr., *Jonathan Edwards* (New York and London, 1932), with bibliography, an admirable appreciation of Edwards as a man, and as a first-rate religious psychologist of modern significance. Ola Elizabeth Winslow's *Jonathan Edwards, 1703–1758: A Biography* (New York, 1941), stresses his role in and defense of the Awakening, his "tragic" attempt to reconcile Calvinistic theology with the inward emotional experience of conversion. Perry Miller's *Jonathan Edwards* (New York, 1949), with note on sources, regards Edwards as one of the few great American philosophers, and perhaps the most original, and reveals the significance of his thought for the twentieth century. (For titles relating more specifically to Edwards as a theological thinker, see Part Five, sect. II, c.)

The Awakening shattered the religious unity of New England and broke up religious inertia, and its controversies helped to produce the ferment in which the Revolution was born. Unfavorable criticism (see 6, *Critics and Controversy*, below) stimulated growth of Arminian and liberal trends, which dominated the period from the 1760's to about 1800, before the Second Great Awakening reversed the trend. Emphasis upon personal moral responsibility influenced Protestant evangelical reform movements for more than a century, and even the Social Gospel after 1865 (see Part Three, sect. VI, B, below). Religious meetings for children encouraged interest in their spiritual nature, and consequently favored religious education. Through Edwards' influence upon John Wesley, the Awakening brought the Colonies into contact with Methodism, which eventually penetrated America, became the religion of the frontier (see 9, *Revivalism as the Religion of the Frontier*, below), and fused elements of evangelical Protestantism into a typically American denomination.

4. THE METHODIST ELEMENT IN REVIVALISM. Methodism arose in England in the 1730's, amid conditions strikingly like those which produced the religious awakenings in New Jersey and New England. English clergymen and laymen had long been uttering warnings of spiritual decline similar to those of the New England ministers (see 3, *The New England Awakening*, above). Allowing for some exaggeration in complaints by reformers, there was an obvious decline from Puritan enthusiasm during the Deist era of the early eighteenth century. Authorities on this topic are summarized by Mark Pattison, "Tendencies of Religious Thought in England, 1688–1750," in *Essays*, Vol. II (Oxford, 1889), noting spiritual lethargy after fierce religious and civil conflicts, the failure of Laudian High Churchmanship, distrust of "fanaticism" among the Independent sects, and a collapse of faith in the established Anglican Church. A cautious compromise attempted to counteract Deism in educated circles,

and to base Christianity upon the rational grounds of Bishop Joseph Butler's *Analogy of the Christian Religion . . .* (London, 1736), which is critically examined in Matthew Arnold's essay, "Bishop Butler and the Zeit-geist," in *Last Essays on Church and Religion* (London, 1877). Evidences of deterioration are presented, with supporting documentation, by Alexander Clinton Zabriskie, "The Rise and Main Characteristics of the Anglican Evangelical Movement in England and America," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 12, no. 2 (June 1943), pp. 83–115. He claims to discern a definite connection between depravity of morals and loss of Christian faith, and indicates secularized corruption and lack of living faith in the Established Church. Robert Leonard Tucker reinforces this view in *The Separation of the Methodists from the Church of England* (New York, 1918) by reference to candid Methodist strictures on Church and nation, buttressed by admissions of eminent Anglicans. The situation affronted a coterie of Anglican scholars at Oxford University, who in derision were dubbed "the Holy Club," and "Methodist," from their desire to practice a *methodical* piety. Their leaders were the brothers John and Charles Wesley, and George Whitefield. The group's origin and history is covered in Luke Tyerman's exhaustive *Life and Times of John Wesley, M.A., Founder of the Methodists* (New York, 1872, 3 vols.), with bibliographic footnotes, perhaps the best account. Briefer and more readable, with special reference to social conditions that gave rise to Methodism, are C. T. Winchester, *The Life and Times of John Wesley* (New York, 1906, particularly ch. iv); and J. M. Buckley, *A History of the Methodists in the United States* (New York, 1896).

Methodist piety was largely of Anglican origin. John Wesley owed much to Jeremy Taylor's *Holy Living and Dying* and to the mystic and pietist, William Law (1686–1761), whose works were widely read also in America. The debt to Law is critically estimated by J. Brazier Green, *John*

Wesley and William Law (London, 1945), with bibliography, notes, and references with chapters. Law is said to have influenced Wesley's doctrines of atonement and Christian perfection, and dutiful attendance upon all means of grace, including the sacraments. Wesley admired Law's ethical ideal, which was supplanted by the influence of Moravian and other German Pietists, who taught him the real meaning of justification by faith and atonement. Law and Wesley were deeply tinged with Pietism. England was affected by the passage of German colonists to America, and by the high prestige of a Lutheran court chaplain, Anton Wilhelm Boehm (1673–1722). Henry Eyster Jacobs, *A History of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the United States* (New York, 1893) notices the influence of Boehm, who was associated with the Anglican Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge. His translations of Pietist works, particularly Johann Arndt, *Of True Christianity* . . . (London, 1720, 2nd ed.) made known to Wesley and Whitefield the religion of the heart. Pietist influence spread through Law's *A Practical Treatise Upon Christian Perfection* . . . (London, 1726, 1741), and *A Serious Call to a Devout and Holy Life* . . . (London, 1729), a fact established by J. H. Overton's *William Law, Non-Juror and Mystic* (London, 1881), which indicates its transmission to Wesley. Law's writings contain aspects of later American evangelical religion, particularly subjectivism, direct communication with the Divine, and cultivation of grace and holiness through good works. Wesley's pietism was fortified by meeting Moravian settlers on a voyage to Georgia, which is fully described in Edgar Legare Pennington, *John Wesley's Georgia Ministry* (Chicago, private ed., repr. from *Church History*, Vol. 8, no. 3, Sept. 1939), noting a meeting with pastor August Gottlieb Spangenburg, and a visit to the Pietist Salzburgers. Wesley's full conversion was due to the minister Peter Böhler of the London Moravian meeting, who grounded him in justification by faith. His concept of

personal religion was deepened by a trip in 1738 to the University of Halle and Moravian Herrnhut, which is fully narrated in John Preston Hoskins (part II, pp. 210–224). Moravians gave Wesley his plan of "classes" to promote spiritual life, which became a feature of American Methodism. The first American Methodist class, in New York City in 1764–1765, was founded by descendants of Pietist German refugees, Philip Embury and Barbara Heck. (Hoskins, part I, p. 69). Moravian coloring of English evangelical religion spread through such publications as J. Gambold, comp., *Maxims, Theological Ideas and Sentences, Out of the Present Ordinary of the Unitas Fratrum . . .* (London, 1751), an anthology of extracts; and Augustus Gottlieb Spangenburg, *Exposition of Christian Doctrine as Taught in the Protestant Church of the United Brethren . . .* (London, 1784). A complete summary of Pietist impact upon Methodism is Clifford W. Towlson, *Moravian and Methodist Relationships and Influences in the Eighteenth Century* (London, 1957), with brief bibliography.

John Wesley and George Whitefield jolted the Church's frigid decorum by field preaching, and soon were out of sympathy with official Anglicanism. News of their work penetrated America and heightened the fervor incited by the New Jersey and New England revivals. They had ties of sympathy with Edwards, through Whitefield's ardent Calvinism and Wesley's teaching of free grace and God's love, and with Frelinghuysen through Pietist associations. Wesley's sympathy with Edwards appears from his publication of the latter's *A Narrative of the Late Work of God, at and near Northampton in New-England, Extracted from Mr. Edwards's Letter to Dr. Coleman, by John Wesley* (London, 1744?); also *The Distinguishing Marks of a Work of the Spirit of God, Extracted from Mr. Edwards, Minister of Northampton in New England* (London, 1755). Wesley made Edwards' sentiments his own, and from him learned to guide emotional power into channels of effective evangelism.

This argument is supported by E. R. Hendrix, "Jonathan Edwards and John Wesley," *Methodist Review*, Vol. 62, no. 1 (Jan. 1913), pp. 28–38.

Elements of Methodist piety, which became acclimatized in America, are authoritatively summarized in several scholarly works. One of the best is Wilfred R. Wilkinson, *Religious Experience: The Methodist Fundamental* (London, 1928), with references in footnotes. This recalls Wesley's transition from observance to experience, his awareness of danger in appealing to experience only, and his saving of Methodism from individualism by belief in free operation of grace, and by the corporate experience of the societies. A briefer but complete analysis is Umphrey Lee, *The Historical Backgrounds of Early Methodist Enthusiasm* (New York, 1931), with a fairly encyclopedic bibliography, emphasizing traits of later American Methodism, especially the fatherhood of God and the brotherhood of man as an incentive to philanthropy. Richard M. Cameron, ed., in *The Rise of Methodism, A Source Book* (New York, 1954), with bibliography and bibliographic references in footnotes, illustrates these characteristics with editorial comment, and is a valuable background for study of American Methodism, and the international character of revivalism.

The foundation of this type of pietism was Wesley's personal theology, which is intensively studied by William Ragsdale Cannon, *The Theology of John Wesley, with Special Reference to the Doctrine of Justification* (New York, 1946), with large bibliography, and is outlined in Robert W. Burtner and Robert E. Chiles, eds., *A Compend of Wesley's Theology* (New York, 1954). Wesley's strongly sacramental emphasis (derived from Anglican High Church tradition) differed from later American revivalism, which often lightly esteemed sacraments as means of grace. Allusion to the churchly character of his early piety is found in F. J. Foakes-Jackson, "The Wesleys," *American Church Monthly*, Vol. 14, no. 1 (Sept. 1923), pp. 22–30. This

refers to his Arminian theology of free salvation to willing recipients, and his methodical piety as a survival of the best elements in Non-juring High Churchmanship. The vitality of Wesleyan sacramentalism in America is insisted upon by Paul S. Sanders, "An Appraisal of John Wesley's Sacramentalism in the Evolution of Early American Methodism" (Doctoral thesis, typescript, Union Theological Seminary, New York; reviewed in *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 3 (Sept. 1955), pp. 277–278). Wesley is herein regarded as an evangelical Anglican of the seventeenth-century or "Caroline" school, firmly believing in the necessity of corporate Christian life within the Church.

Wesleyan Methodism was a social influence, with later far-reaching effects realized through American revivalism. The results are detailed in Maldwyn Edwards, *John Wesley and the Eighteenth Century: A Study of His Social and Political Influence* (Cincinnati, 1933), with an elaborate bibliography, a useful supplement to studies of his personal and religious development. Wesley's long-range impact upon society is estimated in Umphrey Lee, *John Wesley and Modern Religion* (Nashville, Tenn., 1936), with extensive bibliography in notes, tracing his theological growth, and depicting him in the context of his own century. His individual religion of feeling provided color and warmth to lowly people alienated from old religious institutions. It affected the later Social Gospel by transferring belief in individual perfection to faith in achieving a perfect society through spiritual reformation. (See also Part Three, sect. VI, A, 1, *Holiness Movement, Perfectionism,* and B, *Social Gospel,* below.) This side of Wesleyanism is closely investigated in F. A. J. Harding, "The Social Impact of the Evangelical Revival, A Brief Account of the Social Influences of the Teaching of John Wesley and his Followers," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 15, no. 4 (Dec. 1946), pp. 256–284, with many bibliographical footnotes. Wesley's change of heart is seen as the motive of his

benevolent social doctrine. Appreciation of that immense regenerative current inspires Edwin Paxton Hood's study, *The Great Revival of the Eighteenth Century . . . With a Supplemental Chapter on the Revival in America* (Philadelphia, 1882, rev. ed.), indicating the layman's awakening to social responsibility, and its effect upon innumerable benevolent enterprises. The same tendencies are underlined in John Smith Simon, *The Revival of Religion in England in the Eighteenth Century* (London, 1907), with footnote references, especially the changed attitude of many upper-class people toward religion, penetration of evangelicalism into the churches, the emergence of an apostolic type of minister, spiritual comradeship, the itinerant minister (an American institution), and spiritual equality as a spur to social reforms. Equally definite on these points is Joel Wellman Warner, *The Wesleyan Movement in the Industrial Revolution* (London, New York, and Toronto, 1930), with bibliography, alluding to revivalist propagation of a moral theory of society, derived from the Christian ethic and stressing moralized individual initiative as the mainspring of social welfare, and the ideal of stewardship of wealth (see Part Three, sect. VI, B, 5, *The Gospel of Wealth*, below). A few other excellent works, embodying the considered judgments of historians, refer to the significance of Wesleyanism as a socially regenerative dynamic. John Richard Green, *A Short History of the English People* . . . (New York, 1893–1894, 3 vols.) sees its noblest influence in the steady effort to remedy guilt, ignorance, suffering, and degradation. F. M. Davenport, *Primitive Traits in Religious Revivals* (New York, 1905) notices Wesley's distinct service in promoting democracy, and in spreading good popular literature. Superior special studies include John Wesley Bready, *England before and after Wesley; the Evangelical Revival and Social Reform* (London, 1938); Robert Featherstone Wearmouth, *Methodism and the Common People in the Eighteenth Century* (London, 1945), with bibliography; and Kathleen

Walker MacArthur, *The Economic Ethics of John Wesley* (New York, 1936), with bibliography.

The immense bibliography of Methodist revivalism comprises many references to its direct and indirect influence upon American religion and society. Among the best sources are the bibliographical footnotes in Luke Tyerman's *Life and Times of the Rev. John Wesley* . . . (New York, 1872, 3 vols.); Richard Green, *The Works of John and Charles Wesley, A Bibliography* . . . (London, 1906, 2nd ed., rev. and with many additional notes); and Edward H. Sugden, ed., *Wesley's Standard Sermons* . . . (London, 1955, 2 vols., with annotations), containing several on salient points of Wesley's theology, and with his own preface stating his desire to express the great truths of "experimental" religion to plain people. Wesley's Pietist and American connections are shown in John Telford, ed., *The Letters of the Rev. John Wesley, A.M., Sometime Fellow of Lincoln College, Oxford* (London, 1931, 8 vols.), the first complete collection, with exhaustive notes. T. B. Shepherd, *Methodism and the Literature of the Eighteenth Century* (London, 1940), with bibliography, is a comprehensive survey of books by and about the Wesleys and other Methodists, and the more important books commented upon by John Wesley.

5. WHITEFIELD, THE "WAYFARING WITNESS." The unrivaled pulpit orator and emotional awakener was George Whitefield, a wayfaring priest of the Church of England. He carried the torch of revival from Georgia to New Hampshire, and symbolizes the Awakening more clearly than any other figure. He was predestined to popularity and influence in America because, unlike the Wesleys, he cherished the Calvinistic theology, which still dominated most New England Puritans, the Presbyterians, and the increasingly powerful Baptists. Whitefield's preparation for his American triumphs, and his conversion to Calvinism, are discussed in Charles Wesley Lowry, Jr., "Spiritual Antecedents of Anglican Evangelicalism," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant*

Episcopal Church, Vol. 12, no. 2 (June 1943), pp. 121–156. He maintains that although Whitefield was influenced by New England theology, he derived his views not directly from Edwards, but from the sermons of dissenting Scottish ministers, Ralph and Ebenezer Erskine.

Another essential phase of Whitefield's preparation was his "rebirth" at Oxford in 1735, by release from spiritual oppression. His electrifying eloquence soon inspired popular belief in the necessity of a "new birth," which he defended in his first published sermon, *The Nature and Necessity of Our New Birth in Christ, in Order to Salvation* (London, 1737), which reveals the direct influence of William Law. This conviction was undergirded during a mission to Georgia, described by John Preston Hoskins (part 1, 74–75). On the voyage he became acquainted with the emotional and introspective religion of the exiled Salzburger Pietists, an experience narrated in his *Journal of a Voyage from London to Savannah in Georgia . . .* (London, 1743, 6th ed.). He visited the Salzburger colony, whose pastors had been trained under Francke. The religious atmosphere there has been appreciated by a Methodist writer, John F. Hurst, in "The Salzburger Exiles in Georgia," *Harper's New Monthly Magazine,* Vol. 85, no. 507 (Aug. 1892), pp. 392–399, a description of Ebenezer and other devout communities. Whitefield's impressions are recorded in *A Continuation of the Reverend Mr. Whitefield's Journal from his Arrival at Savannah, to his Return to London* (London, 1739, 2nd ed.), and *A Continuation . . . after his Arrival at Georgia, to a few Days after his Second Return thither from Philadelphia* (London, 1741). His emulation of the colony's orphan house inaugurated the evangelical philanthropic impact upon American life. Preparation for his part in the Great Awakening was completed by cultivating emotional religion with Peter Böhler and other Pietist Moravian leaders in London.

Whitefield's fame as a field preacher inspired many colo-

nists to hope that he would instigate a revival in America. Especially significant for future American revivalism was his tour of New England in 1740, which is followed in *A Continuation of the Reverend Mr. Whitefield's Journal from Savannah . . . to his Arrival at Rhode Island, his Travels in the other Governments of New England . . .* (Boston, 1741). During this year he reached the climax of his emotional influence. A favorable appreciation of his preaching powers is J. B. Wakeley's *The Prince of Pulpit Orators: a Portraiture of Rev. George Whitefield . . .* (New York, 1871), which touches also upon his friendly relations with Edwards. A vivid depiction of his emotional effect is rendered by George Leon Walker in *Some Aspects of the Religious Life of New England* (Boston, 1897), drawn partly from original materials. His sermons in print usually convey but slight impression of his personal impact. A sampling is provided by *Eighteen Sermons . . . Taken Verbatim in Short Hand, and Faithfully Transcribed by Joseph Gurney; rev. by A. Gifford . . .* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1802; New York, 1809).

Whitefield's astonishing grip upon a multitude of affectionate admirers is illustrated by many references. Among the most useful is *A Select Collection of Letters of the late Reverend George Whitefield . . . from the year 1734, to 1770 . . .* (London, 1772, 3 vols.), revealing wide American connections, and a few sympathizers even among the generally critical Anglicans. Their admiration is typified by the Rev. Matthew Graves of New London, whose sympathy is revealed in Maud O'Neil, "Matthew Graves: Anglican Missionary to the Puritans," in Samuel Clyde McCulloch, ed., *Anglican Humanitarianism, Essays Honoring Frank J. Klingberg . . .* (Philadelphia, 1950). Many superlatively affectionate letters are included in "Original Letters from Various Persons in Great Britain and America to the Revd. Geo. Whitefield from the year 1738 to 1769" (MS, 2 vols., in Manuscript Division, Library of Congress, Washington,

D.C.), a collection which appears to have been little if at all used. One should consult also John Gillies, ed., *The Works of the Revd. Mr. George Whitefield* . . . (London, 1771, 6 vols.), the only full and detailed collection containing sermons, tracts, and letters.

Appreciation of Whitefield's life and American influence has inspired several biographies with varying interpretations. One of the earliest is Joseph Belcher, *George Whitefield; a Biography, with Special Reference to his Labors in America* (New York, 1857), based upon extensive researches, emphasizing his American tours and his personal character and qualities as a preacher. The earliest exhaustive biography is Luke Tyerman's *The Life of the Rev. George Whitefield* . . . (London, 1876–1877, 2 vols., New York, 1877, 2 vols.), still the authoritative source, stressing Whitefield's appeal to the feelings, his influence in starting the evangelical movement in the Church of England, his preparation of the road for American Methodist itinerants, and his promotion of philanthropy. The approaching bicentennial of his first American tour was marked by a sympathetic appreciation in Edwin Noah Hardy's *George Whitefield, the Matchless Soul Winner* (New York, 1938), which recalls his preaching to the "unchurched," influence on American Methodism, inspiration of evangelists and missionaries, and pioneering in child welfare, higher education, church union, and field preaching. A somewhat too laudatory but well-documented account is given by Albert David Belden, *George Whitefield, the Awakener; A Modern Study of the Evangelical Revival* (New York, 1930; rev. ed., 1953), pointing to the remarkably close parallel between spiritual conditions in Great Britain and those in America. The best modern critical study, correcting too favorable or unfavorable prejudices of earlier biographers, is Stuart Clark Henry, *George Whitefield, Wayfaring Witness* (New York and Nashville, 1957), with selected bibliography, and notes with references, discerning his great traits, sense of his redemptive destiny, hon-

esty, willingness to labor for essentials in all communions, and ability to heal people's inner lives. Whitefield could not be ignored, and presented the inescapable alternatives of conversion or controversial criticism.

6. CRITICS AND CONTROVERSY. Whitefield's invasion of New England began a new era. Supported by Edwards, he seemed to carry all before him, but his intensely emotional preaching disturbed the thoughtful and conservative, and even some defenders of the revival, including Edwards himself. Disorders in their congregations painfully shocked and embarrassed some ministers who had longed for a genuine revival. Whitefield's meteoric journeys split the New England Congregationalists and the Middle Colony Presbyterians into warring camps: "New Lights," who heartily supported the Awakening, and "Old Lights," who regarded it as an ecstatic spasm.

Opponents of revivalism unfavorably contrasted its "enthusiasm" with the controlled spiritual zeal of Puritan forefathers who desired a religiously controlled theocratic social order. This particular objection is prominently noticed in Perry Miller, "Jonathan Edwards' Sociology of the Great Awakening," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 21, no. 1 (Mar. 1948), pp. 50–77. This predominantly clerical criticism colored the upper-class layman's attitude expressed in Jared Ingersoll's "An Historical Account of Some Affairs Relating to the Church, Especially in Connecticut . . . Yale College, Octbr 20: 1740." (MS, 1 vol., 1740–1743, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress), an apparently unused source, deploring the exaggerated importance accorded to "inward feelings, and immediate dictates of ye Spirit." This coldly objective opinion illuminates an essential point in the looming conflict between radically different views of religious experience, which culminated in the Edwards-Chauncy controversy. (For Chauncy's criticism, see below.) Opposition and criticism sprang up in various religious groups. Controversy and schism in the Presbyterian Church are recounted at

length in L. J. Trinterud, *The Forming of an American Tradition* (New York, 1949, particularly chs. 3–6). Harvard and Yale Colleges and the presbyterianized state church in Connecticut condemned revival methods and severely criticized Whitefield. The official Congregational attitude, as expressed by Yale, appears in Maud O'Neil's scholarly study, "A Struggle for Religious Liberty . . . ," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (June 1951), pp. 173–189. At first favorably disposed, the chief assembly of Connecticut Congregational ministers later took stern action against evangelism, recorded in *The Records of the General Association of ye Colony of Connecticut . . . 1738 . . . 1799* (Hartford, 1888, ed. L. Perrin), with minutes barring Whitefield from the pulpit, warning people against him, and scoring revivalist doctrines, practices, and schisms. Conservative Anglican disapproval is vividly pictured in numerous letters from missionaries to the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts, which are abstracted in the Society's "Proceedings" in *Annual Sermons* (London, especially 1742, 1743, and 1745). Letters from all colonies are available in "Transcripts, Great Britain, Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts," Manuscript Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C.; also in microfilm. Those from Connecticut are poorly edited in Francis Lister Hawks, ed., *Documentary History of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America . . . Connecticut* (New York, 1863–1864, 2 vols., in Vol. 1). Episcopalian criticism was based upon conviction of the superiority of sacramentalism, rational piety, and Christian nurture to sudden conversion. Equally unfavorable was the conservative Quaker attitude, which is studied from a sociological viewpoint by Frederick B. Tolles, "Quietism Versus Enthusiasm: The Philadelphia Quakers and the Great Awakening," *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, Vol. 69, no. 1 (Jan. 1945), pp. 26–49, with many bibliographical references in footnotes. The root of disap-

proval is discerned in the recession of prosperous Friends from primitive enthusiasm, and their suspicion of socially radical lower class elements in popular evangelism.

The philosophical battle was waged in Puritan New England, with Jonathan Edwards and Charles Chauncy as the antagonists. Edwards' understanding of John Locke's sensational theory of knowledge enabled him to vindicate the place of emotion as well as reason in religious experience. Some rational and urbane Harvardian ministers of eastern Massachusetts were unconvinced by his conviction that the Holy Spirit was at work in the Awakening. The resulting war of ink foreshadowed the great debate about revivals in the nineteenth century (see 12, *Criticism of Revivals,* below). Opposition was headed by the Reverend Charles Chauncy of Boston, a symbol of rationalist "Enlightenment." His importance in colonial thought is established in a study by Harold Ernest Bernhard, *Charles Chauncy: Colonial Liberal, 1705–1787* (Chicago, 1948, extract from thesis, University of Chicago). Chauncy sounded the alarm in *A Letter from a Gentleman in Boston to Mr. George Wishart, one of the Ministers of Edinburgh, Concerning the State of Religion in New England* (Edinburgh, 1742; also [Edinburgh] 1883). In the same year he published a sermon attacking extravagances which was widely circulated as *Enthusiasm Describ'd and Caution'd Against . . . with a letter to the Reverend Mr. James Davenport* (Boston, 1742). This was followed by his anonymously published attack on revivals: *The Late Religious Commotions in New England Considered, An Answer to the Reverend Mr. Jonathan Edwards's Sermon, Entitled, The Distinguishing Marks of a Work of the Spirit of God . . .* (Boston, 1743). In the same year appeared his *Seasonable Thoughts on the State of Religion in New England . . .* (Boston, 1743), the most complete colonial exposition of objections to revivalist methods. Later criticisms, in more scientific terms, added little to the cogency of Chauncy's strictures. Unitarian criticism of nine-

teenth-century revivals followed Chauncy's line of thought, as is evident from William Henry Channing's "Jonathan Edwards and the Revivalists, A Chapter of New England Ecclesiastical History," *Christian Examiner*, Vol. 43, no. 11 (Nov. 1847), pp. 374–394.

The battle over revivalism included a bitter contest involving the right to dissent from legally established churches. It originated in a "Separate" schism from the established Congregational churches by those who insisted upon the original Congregational ideal of churches composed of "regenerate" persons. A complete and scholarly study, favorable to the schismatics, is Silas Leroy Blake, *The Separates; or, Strict Congregationalists of New England* . . . (Boston and Chicago, 1902), stressing their championship of the strictly congregational "Cambridge Platform" of 1648. A more sociological study of Separatism is in John Winthrop Platner, et al., *The Religious History of New England; King's Chapel Lectures* (Cambridge, Mass., 1917), viewing it as a democratic trend of the humbler classes against aristocratic conservatism. The conflict was most intense and brutal in Connecticut, where the state church had departed most widely from original congregationalism. Its historical significance is learnedly and fairly presented by Edwin P. Parker in "The Congregationalist Separates of the Eighteenth Century in Connecticut," *New Haven Colony Historical Society Papers*, Vol. 8 (1914), pp. 151–161, which accents the issue of religious freedom. Evidence of governmental efforts to suppress Separatism is abundant in Connecticut (Colony), *The Public Records of the Colony of Connecticut* (1636–1776), particularly Vol. 8 (1735–1743) and Vol. 9 (1744–1750), containing laws against itinerant ministers and schismatic churches. Typical of local official opposition throughout New England is Windham County (Conn.) Association of Congregational Ministers, *A Letter . . . to the People in the several Societies in said County* (Boston, 1745), a warning against relations with Separatists. The Separatist viewpoint is

completely expounded in a pamphlet issued by the Strict Congregational Churches in Connecticut, *An Historical Narrative, and Declaration* . . . (Providence, 1781). Their struggle for liberty later merged into the greater post-Revolutionary battle for separation of church and state.

7. THE GREAT AWAKENING: HISTORY AND INTERPRETATION. A few contemporaries recognized the moulding power of the Awakening in American religion, and began diligently to collect records of its manifestations. The leading contemporary authority was Thomas Prince, Jr. Students must still consult his weekly magazine, *The Christian History, Containing Accounts of the Revival and Propagation of Religion in Great Britain & America* . . . (Boston, 1744–1745, 2 vols., nos. 1–104, March 5, 1743–February 23, 1744/5, with index), and consisting mainly of letters from ministers on the progress and condition of religion. Numerous references to the excitement and controversies, especially in Connecticut, are found in diaries. Notably useful is Joshua Hempstead, *Diary* . . . [1711–1758] (New London, 1901), expressing opposition to revival preachers. Daniel Wadsworth, *Diary* . . . [1737–1747] (Hartford, 1894) has many troubled notes on Whitefield and other evangelists, and their clashes with ecclesiastical and civil authorities.

Documented historiography began with Joseph Tracy, *The Great Awakening: A History of the Revival of Religion in the Time of Edwards and Whitefield* (Boston, 1842), with a critical estimate of sources, full accounts of New England and Southern revivals, noting the emphasis upon regeneration, and the consequences in mental and social revolution. Later awakenings stirred a resurgence of interest, and those led by Dwight L. Moody inspired a superior interpretative essay by Lyman H. Atwater, "The Great Awakening of 1740," *Presbyterian Quarterly and Princeton Review*, Vol. 5, no. 20 (Oct. 1876), pp. 676–689, with bibliography in footnotes. The movement is viewed as a protest in behalf of "experimental" religion, and as an intercolonial

phenomenon, with similarities to contemporary English Methodism. The bicentennial of Edwards' birth called forth a critical survey by Frederick Leonard Chapell, *The Great Awakening of 1740* (Philadelphia, 1903), regarding Whitefield as the cosmopolitan and unifying element, and the revival as the inspiration of a continuous evangelical impulse, interrupted by political and Deistic interests in 1775–1800, but eventually affecting society through gradual reform by humanitarian impulse rather than revolution. The same facets are inspected in Edward Waite Miller, "The Great Awakening and its Relation to American Christianity," *Princeton Theological Review*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Oct. 1904), pp. 545–562: calling attention to Edwards' stern evaluation of revivals by communal moral improvement, and Whitefield's insistence upon benevolence to correct spiritual self-centeredness.

Modern sociological historiography has produced some useful studies. A brief factual one, viewing the Awakening in its setting, is in Herbert L. Osgood, *The American Colonies in the Eighteenth Century* (New York, 1924, Vol. 3, part 3, ch. 1). A more popular short treatment is presented by James Wager Johnson, *The Great Awakening* (New York, 1938). Valuable notes on the background in the 1740's appear in Mary Hewitt Mitchell, *The Great Awakening and Other Revivals in the Religious Life of Connecticut* (New Haven, 1934), with authorities in footnotes and a bibliographical note. This rightly accents the note of moral reform and the revolt against intolerance, but perhaps too much identifies revivalism with lower classes and younger people, and leading citizens with the opposition. Twentieth-century studies include some essays on regional revivals. New England is specifically considered in Lawrence Lavengood, *The Great Awakening in New England* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, copy at the University). One of the best is Lawrence E. Brynestad, "The Great Awakening in the New England and Middle Colonies," *Journal of the Presbyterian*

Historical Society, Vol. 14, no. 2 (June 1930), pp. 80–91; no. 3 (Sept. 1930), pp. 104–141, with bibliography. This is one of the few advocate tributes to Pietist influence, affords a broad view of transformations wrought in secular and religious culture, and notes many local revivals and intercolonial, humanitarian, and missionary aspects. Two very detailed monographs, based upon source material, comprehensively survey revivals outside New England. Charles Hartshorn Maxson, *The Great Awakening in the Middle Colonies* (Chicago, 1920) is biased against opponents of the movement and is unfair especially to the Anglican Church, but admirably explains the Awakening's profound and varied sources, indicates Whitefield's fusion of its elements, and describes the effects in various churches, especially the Presbyterian. Previously neglected Southern aspects are carefully and interestingly appreciated, with references to little-known materials, in W. M. Gewehr, *The Great Awakening in Virginia, 1740–1790* (Durham, N.C., 1930), with bibliography. This traces religious, social, and political results, and closely examines Presbyterian, Baptist, and Methodist phases and their leaders, including the Anglican parson, Devereux Jarrett. The latter, a pioneer of the potent evangelical group in the Episcopal Church, is noticed by John Preston Hoskins (part 1, p. 76), and by Charles C. Tiffany, *A History of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America* (New York, 1895).

A general review of the broad, permanent impact upon American life is given by Thomas Cuming Hall, *The Religious Background of American Culture* (Boston, 1930, particularly ch. 12). Recent works have added more detail to basic observations on this topic in John Preston Hoskins' little cited "German Influences on Religious Life and Thought in America during the Colonial Period," *Princeton Theological Review*, particularly part 1. After the first fervor subsided, permanent and deeper influences slowly became evident. They comprised the startling rise of Methodism,

missions to Negroes and Indians, a communal sense among previously sundered groups, unity of action in cultural and political affairs, and pressure for religious liberty arising from growing Protestant sectarian diversity. The Awakening assured the prevalence of "experimental" religion for more than a century, and originated a distinctly American type of theology stemming from Edwards (See Part Five, sect. II, D, below). Personal vital piety demanded a fresh departure in religious music, and the creation of a new pious literature for the evangelical Protestant masses (See Part Four, RELIGION AND THE ARTS, sect. IV, and RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. II, below).

8. THE SECOND GREAT AWAKENING. The quarter of a century after the Declaration of Independence was unfavorable to evangelical religion. The Revolutionary War brought mental confusion, corruption, and relaxed moral standards. The moral climate favored crass materialism, and infidelity, which pious churchgoers attributed to the influence of French Revolutionary and other freethinkers. The Great Awakening had opposite long-range effects. Thousands became converts, but others recoiled from revivalistic preaching and became skeptics. The period was marked by the prevalence of Deism and free thought, and by the rise of Unitarianism and Universalism. Revivalism seemed to have been discredited, and the prevalent condition of religion was torpid. Following the Revolution, most denominations were wrestling with exceedingly difficult problems of reorganization and ministerial supply, which left slight energy to devote to the gigantic looming problem of evangelizing the West and the "unchurched."

With respect to revivals, however, the era was not a "lost generation," but rather a period of preparation for another great awakening, which began around 1800, continued almost uninterruptedly for a generation, and set the pattern for later revivalism. The new movement was derived from various intellectual, spiritual, and political currents. One was a pas-

sionate reaction against liberal and rational religion, which was identified with social and political radicalism, and particularly with the French Revolution. This current was powerful in New England, where the dominant Congregational-Federalist political party looked to religion as a safeguard of the social order. Their typical spokesman was President Timothy Dwight of Yale College, who was determined to shake the colleges of New England from religious inertia. Another factor was the spiritual destitution of "new settlements" in the West, and of unchurched masses in old eastern regions. A typical New England reaction to this challenge was the establishment of the Connecticut Missionary Society in 1798. Its emissaries labored in areas that later became strongholds of revivalism, and of the holiness and perfectionist movements, especially central and western New York and northern Ohio. (See Part Three, sect. VI, A, 1, *Holiness Movement* and *Perfectionism*, below.) The new denominations, which owed their growth to the Great Awakening, rose to the occasion, and began to send itinerant ministers into the growing cities of the eastern seaboard and the swiftly rising transmontane Western settlements. The Presbyterians organized their General Assembly in 1789, and began to prepare for expansion. The result was that renewal of the revival spirit which has become known in history as the Second Great Awakening.

Largely due to the influence of Dwight and his sympathizers, the awakening first appeared prominently in 1798, in Connecticut, where it continued for many years at intervals, and whence it spread to other areas. Its course, character, and influence (1798–1826) are minutely explored in Charles Roy Keller, *The Second Great Awakening in Connecticut* (New Haven, 1942), with extensive annotated bibliography, indicating the profound changes it wrought in theology and in preaching, and the beginnings of organized benevolences and reforms inspired by its spiritual zeal. The new type of revival preaching is illustrated by sermons of one of its lead-

ing promoters: Nathan Perkins, *Two Discourses on the Grounds of the Christian's Hope . . .* (Hartford, 1800). Another champion of the Connecticut revival was Nathan Strong, whose *Sermons on Various Subjects, Doctrinal, Experimental and Practical* (Hartford, 1798–1800, 2 vols.) were intended to awaken genuine personal religion, and to develop and confirm piety in recent converts. The tradition was continued by innumerable later collections, a good example of which is one by Chauncey Lee: *Sermons on the Distinguishing Doctrines and Duties of Experimental Religion, and Especially Designed for Revivals* (Middletown, Conn., 1824).

The Second Great Awakening produced abundant accounts of revivals. One of the better general accounts is Ashbel Green's *Report on the Revival of Religion, 1815* (Philadelphia, 1815). Many relate to towns and cities of the eastern seaboard, and illustrate the development of a more studied and organized type of appeal, with less stress upon emotion and more upon inward conviction. A typical early example is by Samuel Buell, minister in Southampton, L.I.: *An Account of the Revival of Religion in Bridgehampton and Easthampton, in the Year 1800* (Sag Harbor, 1808). Another from the opening years of the movement is by Thomas Baldwin, *A Brief Sketch of the Revival of Religion in Boston in 1803–5* (Boston, 1804). These witness to some striking differences from earlier revivals, particularly the absence of passional elements, and to greater stress upon preceding prayerfulness, weekday and other special meetings, counseling by ministers, and moral reformation. These features became normal during the great revivals of the 1820's and 1830's led by Asahel Nettleton and Charles Grandison Finney. Numerous accounts, especially of revivals in towns, attest the trend toward a type. Excellent and readable samples are Albany, Presbytery, *A Narrative of the Revival of Religion, within the Bounds of the Presbytery of Albany, in the Year 1820* (Schenectady, 1821; 2nd ed., Philadelphia, 1821); William C.

Talton, *Narrative of a Revival of Religion in the Third Presbyterian Church of Baltimore, with Remarks on Subjects Connected with Revivals in General* (Baltimore, 1824); and Joseph Huntington Jones (pastor, Sixth Presyterian Church, Philadelphia), *Outline of a Work of Grace in the Presbyterian Congregation at New Brunswick, N.J., during the Year 1837* (Philadelphia, 1839). These display strikingly similar methods of promoting and conducting revivals, the emergence of interdenominational cooperation, age-group meetings, and a lack of extravagant emotion, controversy, and opposition.

Acceptance of revivals as normal procedure is emphasized by general accounts. The lack of apprehension appears in Increase Niles Tarbox, ed., *The Diary of Thomas Robbins, D.D., 1796–1854* . . . (Boston 1886–1887, 2 vols.) with annotations, an excellent source of information on the general progress of revivalism in the early 1800's. The impulse merged into the nationwide Finney revivals, and eventually into the urban movements of 1857–1859, the Civil War awakenings, and the Moody crusades of 1870–1900. Among the better more or less critical histories is William W. Woodward, *Surprising Accounts of the Revival of Religion in the United States of America* . . . (Philadelphia, 1802), intended partly to silence cavils, an anthology of anecdotes and letters about revivals and conversions in various regions. Another valuable source, laboriously assembled from letters and reports, is Joshua Bradley, *Accounts of Religious Revivals in Many Parts of the United States from 1815 to 1818* . . . (Albany, 1819). A later interpretative treatment, from a Presbyterian viewpoint, is William Speer, *The Great Revival of 1800* . . . (Philadelphia, 1872), which links the movement with a worldwide awakening of Christianity, and indicates its ultimate effects in missions, humanitarianism, reforms, and educational and literary phases.

9. REVIVALISM AS THE RELIGION OF THE FRONTIER. While the Second Great Awakening on the eastern seaboard was

laying foundations for a vast later development of urban revivalism, a similar passion swept through the West, from its cradle in Kentucky. Awakenings in Kentucky and the Ohio Valley, around 1800, originated revivalism as the typical religion of the frontier. It was peculiarly adapted to the spiritual needs of a continually migrating folk, even as in the colonial period it had been the way of answering the same longings in transplanted Europeans who had lost sympathy and contact with conservative state churches. From the first, revivalism had appealed strongly to the "back country" and was coolly received among the more cultured classes of the seaboard and the larger towns.

Revivalism survived as a distinctive American religious trait, as westward migration kept ahead of ecclesiastical organization. Until the frontier and the new settlements could attain social stability, revivalism was a fairly successful "experimental" mode of satisfying their spiritual hungers and implementing religious values. It persisted for generations, because American social evolution was continually repeated as the frontier advanced. It became a national characteristic, because American life was in continuous contact with the relative simplicity of frontier and near-frontier society. The thesis of frontier influence is expounded in Frederick Jackson Turner's classic, *The Frontier in American History* (New York, 1920), particularly chs. I and III. A useful exposition of the frontier's cultural coloring of American life is in Carl Bridenbaugh, *Myths and Realities* (Baton Rouge, La., 1952), particularly the section "The Back Settlements." Pertinent to an understanding of frontier expansion in the eighteenth century is Ray Billington, *Westward Expansion, a History of the American Frontier* (New York, 1949), especially ch. v, "The Old West, 1700–1763," and ch. VIII, "Settlement Crosses the Mountains," showing the emergence of back-country traits that prepared the way for the flowering of revivalism. Good local references are Thomas J. Wertenbaker, *The Founding of American Civilization: The Middle*

Colonies (New York, 1938), and Thomas P. Abernethy, *Three Virginia Frontiers* (Baton Rouge, La., 1940). Early state-church attempts to evangelize the southern back country are studied in ch. IV of George M. Brydon, *Virginia's Mother Church and the Political Conditions under Which It Grew* (Philadelphia, 1952), which examines the religious circumstances favoring the independent evangelical spirit. The type of spirituality derived from such an environment is surveyed in William Warren Sweet's *Religion in the Development of American Culture, 1765–1840* (New York, 1952), particularly ch. IV, "Religion Follows the Frontier," and ch. V, "Barbarism Versus Revivalism," which pay tribute to the general meliorating and civilizing effect of western evangelism. The same author's *Revivalism in America* . . . (New York, 1944) conveniently summarizes historical data on the peculiarities of revivalism as a distinctive religious expression of the westward faring. Similar material is available in Peter G. Mode's scholarly treatise, *The Frontier Spirit in American Christianity* (New York, 1923), with bibliography in footnotes. A less exhaustive account, with a popular appeal, is that of Grover C. Loud, *Evangelized America* (New York, 1928), with special references to evangelism on the frontier in chs. I, VIII, and IX–XIII.

As the frontier advanced across the continent, it constantly recreated the pattern in which revivalism flourished: lack of traditional ecclesiastical organization, lack of college-bred clergymen, and lack of respect for liturgical forms, but with a prevalence of spontaneous expression. These features became prominent in the great western revivals, and are delineated in the best and only scientific account of this particular movement: Catharine C. Cleveland, *The Great Revival in the West, 1797–1805* (Chicago, 1916), with bibliography and appendix of original narratives. This classic explains an uninhibited type of emotional religiosity in modern psychological terms, with accounts of regional conditions, revival leaders, their teachings and methods, and the spread, culmination,

and results of the awakening. A calm, intellectual, Presbyterian appraisal of the movement is given by David Rice, *A Sermon on the Present Revival of Religion, &c. in this Country, Preached at the Opening of the Kentucky Synod . . .* (Lexington, Ky., 1803). Emphasis here rests upon its spontaneity, and its effects in reformation of morals, the family, and social life. The contrast between pre- and post-revival Kentucky is vividly portrayed by the Shaker apostle, Richard M'Nemar, in *The Kentucky Revival; or, A Short History of the Late Extraordinary Outpouring of the Spirit of God in the Western States of America . . .* (New York, 1846). Writing close to the events, he stresses supernatural causation, conversion, and the revival as a means of entrance into the Kingdom of God. Another intimately personal record by a participant is Levi Purviance, *Biography of Elder David Purviance, with His Memoirs . . .* (Dayton, O., 1848, repr. 1940), portraying a leader in the New Light or Christian Connection church, and with valuable sketches of other revivalists, and an account of the famous Cane Ridge meetings in Kentucky.

This spiritual grass-roots movement thoroughly domesticated revivalism as a frontier institution. Its social meanings are thoroughly studied in Peter G. Mode, "Revivalism as a Phase of Frontier Life," *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (July 1921), pp. 337–354, accenting its function as an emotional release, relation to the itinerant preacher system, and promotion of the camp meeting. The camp meeting made an intense appeal to diffuse, unorganized frontier society, which did not wear off until several generations after primitive conditions had vanished. Methodism, by combining the circuit-rider system and camp meetings, was the greatest beneficiary of western revivalism, and within fifty years (1790–1840) became the largest Protestant group in America. Probably the best brief study of the camp meeting is Charles A. Johnson's "The Frontier Camp Meeting: Contemporary and Historical Appraisals, 1805–1840," *Mississippi Valley His-*

torical Review, Vol. 37, no. 1 (June 1950), pp. 91–110. This is greatly expanded in his *The Frontier Camp Meeting; Religion's Harvest Time* (Dallas, 1955), with extensive bibliography, a well-documented and judicious examination of the institution up to 1840. It dispels some derogatory misconceptions, views it as a force for moral improvement and civilization, and considers irregular conduct as a phase of primitive society rather than of the meetings themselves.

Methodism as the frontier camp-meeting religion is described in numerous studies. Among the more outstanding efforts is W. M. Gewehr, "Some Factors in the Expansion of Frontier Methodism," *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 8, no. 1 (Jan. 1928), pp. 98–120, with many bibliographical references in footnotes, describing Methodism as the prototype of all later American revivalism, with typical expressions in the camp meeting, emotional hymnody, appeal to spiritual equality, and cultural influence through cheap literature. This study covers the old Western Conference, which is more closely examined in William Warren Sweet, *The Rise of Methodism in the West, Being the Journal of the Western Conference, 1800–1811* (New York and Cincinnati, 1920), bibliographical references in footnotes, with notes on the circuit-rider as a civilizing and moralizing influence, and on Methodism as a social binder and a trainer of laymen for public life. These observations are reinforced in Sweet, ed., *Circuit Rider Days Along the Ohio, Being the Journal of the Ohio Conference from its Organization in 1812 to 1826* (New York, 1923), with introduction and notes; and by regional studies, including: Francis I. Moats, "The Rise of Methodism in the Middle West," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 15, no. 1 (June 1928), pp. 69–88, with bibliographical footnotes, stressing Methodism's equalitarian, democratic, and free-salvation character. Walter Brownlow Posey's *The Development of Methodism in the Old Southwest, 1783–1824* (Nashville, 1933), carefully documented from old and new sources, effectively portrays the circuit-rider's varied social

services and the increasing stress upon education. Similar conclusions respecting civilizing effects are formed in T. M. Eddy's "Influence of Methodism upon the Civilization and Education of the West," *Methodist Quarterly Review*, 4th ser., Vol. 9, no. 2 (April 1857), pp. 280–296, which indicates particularly the stress upon man's dignity and personal responsibility, good life, hopefulness, social harmony, and female education. Elizabeth K. Nottingham, *Methodism and the Frontier, Indiana Proving Ground* (New York, 1941), with bibliography, emphasizes the appeal to people not controlled by established social customs and institutions, the refinement and "respectability" of Methodism with the passing of the frontier, the grafting of revivalism upon the cities to reach the "unchurched," and Methodist survivals in holiness sects, the Chautauqua, and summer conferences. Other noteworthy studies in the local penetration and influence of western Methodism are John G. Jones, *A Concise History of the Introduction of Protestantism into Mississippi and the Southwest* (St. Louis, 1866), a fairly careful but undocumented study by a descendant of early settlers; V. Alton Moody, "Early Religious Efforts in the Lower Mississippi Valley," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 22, no. 2 (Sept. 1935), pp. 161–176; and F. A. Archibald, *Methodism and Literature* (New York? 1883), with bibliographical information on western Methodism.

Among the entertaining sources for study of frontier religion, especially Methodism, are numerous biographies and autobiographies of preachers. Among the outstanding performances are two edited by W. P. Strickland: *Autobiography of Rev. James B. Finley; or Pioneer Life in the West* (Cincinnati, 1853), and Finley's *Sketches of Western Methodism: Biographical, Historical, and Miscellaneous, Illustrative of Pioneer Life* (Cincinnati, 1854). These reveal typical spiritual struggles, conversions, preaching, persecutions, and the training of backwoods preachers. A vivid life story is that of William Henry Milburn, the nearly blind preacher, in

The Rifle, Axe, and Saddle-Bags (New York, 1856; also 1860 as *The Pioneer Preacher . . .*), and his *Ten Years of Preacher Life: Chapters from an Autobiography* (New York, 1859), interesting accounts of the pioneer life which nourished revivalism, and of the itinerant's work and great hardships. Biographical sketches of many preachers are comprised in James Ross, *Life and Times of Elder Reuben Ross* (Philadelphia, n.d.), with its setting in early Tennessee, describing religious life, the emergence of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church from the revival about 1800, the eccentric preacher Lorenzo Dow, and Peter Cartwright. The latter, a symbolic figure of frontier religion, is unforgettably portrayed by himself in *Autobiography of Peter Cartwright, the Backwoods Preacher*, ed. W. P. Strickland (New York, 1856; also Centennial Edition, Nashville, 1956, with introduction and bibliography by Charles L. Wallis): relating the conquest of the Ohio and Mississippi Valleys by revivalism, and its yielding to a more sophisticated evangelism by the 1850's. The more eccentric type of evangelist is portrayed by himself in *Autobiography of Abraham Snethen, The Barefoot Preacher*, compiled by Mrs. N. E. Lamb, corrected and revised by J. F. Burnett (Dayton, O., 1909).

By far the most useful and reliable collection of source materials on frontier revivalism, with bibliographies, is William Warren Sweet's *Religion on the American Frontier, 1783–1840* (New York and Chicago, 1931–1946, 4 vols.), including Baptists, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, and Methodists.

10. THE EMERGENCE OF URBAN REVIVALISM. The frontier exerted a reverse influence through the popularizing of revivalism in settled Eastern communities. Evangelical appeal became a feature of urban religion when cities contained many Protestant migrants from rural regions, and a large working class without religious ministry. These classes constituted an urban religious frontier, which challenged the Protestant churches to redeem it from practical heathenism.

With industrialism and immigration toward the middle of the nineteenth century, Protestant leaders saw the urgent necessity of adapting revival techniques to urban life. Evangelists of the Second Great Awakening already had worked in cities, and by the 1820's reports of revivals in urban congregations were a feature of religious literature.

Urban evangelism came of age in the awakening that swept across the nation in 1857–1859. In part, it expressed disillusionment with the material prosperity that suddenly collapsed in the "panic" of 1857. Due to improved communications and greater mobility of population, this revival flourished almost simultaneously in many cities and towns, and exhibited a consciously planned similarity of expressions, such as publicity, daily noon prayer-meetings, interdenominational cooperation, and the initiative of laymen, and so anticipated features of present-day evangelistic campaigns. It confirmed the dependence of many Protestant churches upon revivals, and spread abroad the ideals of the Holiness and Perfectionist movements (see Part Three, sect. VI, A, 1, below), which helped to create the theological and spiritual climate of the Social Gospel.

The movement was heralded by inquiries into serious defects of smug and selfish piety in prosperous years before the "panic." One of the most influential stimulants was a prize essay by Henry Clay Fish, *Primitive Piety Revived, or the Aggressive Power of the Christian Church* (Boston, 1855), which foretold Baptist and Congregational awakenings, and promoted revivals in previously reluctant churches. The most potent immediate inspiration was an interdenominational, noon prayer-meeting for business men, inaugurated before the "panic" by a New York lay missionary, J. C. Lanphier. Indispensable to comprehension of the inward workings of this revival are: Talbot Wilson Chambers, *The Noon Prayer Meeting of the North Dutch Church, Fulton Street, New York; its Origin, Character and Progress, with Some of its Results* (New York, 1858); and Samuel Irenaeus Prime,

The Power of Prayer, as Illustrated in the Wonderful Displays of Divine Grace . . . in 1857 and 1858 (New York, 1859, 5th and 7th eds.), including religious experiences of all classes of people, lay participation, and results in individual and social reform. Basic information is an uncritical summary of newspaper reports by William C. Conant: *Narratives of Remarkable Conversions and Revival Incidents . . .* (New York, 1858). Typical sermons are included in collections compiled by James Waddel Alexander: *The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 . . .* (New York, 1858), and *The Revival and Its Lessons . . .* (New York, 1858), a collection of seventeen popular sermons, by an "Old School" Presbyterian. The revival in Philadelphia is estimated in a booklet issued by the local Y.M.C.A.: *Pentecost; or, The Work of God in Philadelphia, A.D., 1858 . . .* (Philadelphia, 1859), which points up its interdenominational character. Numerous critical reviews are fairly represented by H. Loomis, Jr., "Revivals of 1858–59," *New Englander*, Vol. 16, no. 63 (Aug. 1859), pp. 646–665, favorable, but considering hostile criticism, and admitting that revivals should be supplements to regular church work. An impartial explanation for her countrymen is given by the noted English traveler, Isabella Bird Bishop, in *The Aspects of Religion in the United States of America* (London, 1859, 2 vols.).

The revival had a long-influential effect during the Civil War, and stiffened the morale of the northern states to endure the strains of conflict. Its wartime enthusiasm is chronicled by Samuel Irenaeus Prime in *Five Years of Prayer, with the Answers* (New York, 1864), emphasizing civilian as well as military aspects, and notable conversions. No activity more strikingly displays the humanitarian impulse than the evangelistic and social labors of the United States Christian Commission, detailed in its official report: *Christ in the Army: a Selection of Sketches of the Work of the U.S. Christian Commission* (Philadelphia, 1865). This indicates the danger to democracy in a demoralized army,

and regards military evangelism as a start toward converting the nation and the world. Social aspects are indicated in Lemuel Morse, *Annals of the United States Christian Commission* (Philadelphia, 1868), revealing church support of this combination of Red Cross and chaplain service; and in M. Hamlin Cannon, "The United States Christian Commission," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review,* Vol. 38, no. 1 (June 1951), pp. 61–80. Revivals in the Confederate armies are surveyed in two source books, compiled by chaplains from official and personal records, and many recollections of witnesses: William W. Bennett, *A Narrative of the Great Revival Which Prevailed in the Southern Armies during the Late Civil War . . .* (Philadelphia, 1877); and John William Jones, *Christ in the Camp; or, Religion in Lee's Army . . .* (Richmond, Va., 1888). Both illustrate the sustaining of morale through evangelical zeal.

It was noted at the time (see Loomis) that the revival of 1857–1859 was not identified with any great leaders, and displayed no novel theological aspects. It was spontaneous and laical, with *activism* as a prominent feature. Later revivals usually were elaborately organized long in advance, and featured a return to individual leadership, with the familiar Moody and Sankey combination of evangelist and hymn-singer.

Between the Civil War and the 1920's, the two towering figures in urban evangelism were Dwight L. Moody and "Billy" Sunday. (See references in 15, *Revivalist Biography,* below.) Urban adaptation of revival techniques is briefly and ably narrated in Winthrop S. Hudson, *The Great Tradition of the American Churches* (New York, 1953), with bibliographical references in notes. Especially notable are excellent accounts of Christian action by working closely with churches and educating converts. A less scholarly treatment is Grover C. Loud's *Evangelized America* (New York, 1928). From the 1870's to 1900 innumerable organized campaigns were held in American cities. Typical reports, packed with valuable

source material, are souvenirs of revivals led by the Reverend B. Fay Mills and the hymn-singer L. B. Greenwood: John Junkin Francis and Charles B. Morrell, eds., *Mills' Meetings Memorial Volume; an Account of the Great Revival in Cincinnati and Covington, January 21st to March 6th, 1892* . . . (Cincinnati, 1892); and Joseph D. Lowden, comp., *The Story of the Revival; a Narrative of the Mills Meetings, Held in Elizabeth, N.J., from Dec. 29, 1891, to Jan. 15, 1892* . . . (Elizabeth, 1892). Urban enthusiasm for revivals was already cooling. The inexorable decline from the Moody and Sankey triumphs of the 1870's is well described by Lefferts A. Loetscher in *Presbyterianism and Revivals in Philadelphia since 1875* (Philadelphia, 1944, extract from *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, Vol. 68, no. 1 (Jan. 1944), pp. 54–92). This notes the lack of great campaigns since Sunday's in 1915, and of inward vitality in general revivals, the greater success of parochial efforts, and causes of decline in liberal theology, new social ideals, Christian nurture, and liturgical trends.

Sunday's campaigns in Philadelphia (1915) and New York (1917) came when urban revivalism was on the downgrade under the influence of publicity-seeking and superficiality. Moody had increasingly realized the inadequacy of evangelism in cities, and favored regular religious education. Within a few years after his death, the shifting emphasis appeared in two editorials in the widely read *Biblical World*: "The Modern Spirit and the New Evangelism," Vol. 18, no. 6 (Dec. 1901, pp. 403–409; and "Education vs. Revivals, or Education and Revivals?" Vol. 25, no. 5 (May 1905), pp. 323–326: pleading for recognition of natural science, Biblical criticism, psychology, and sociology, to reach intelligent "unchurched" people. A new mode of urban evangelism by lay group action is explained by Samuel M. Shoemaker, Jr., "How a City was Evangelized," *Missionary Review of the World*, Vol. 54, no. 9 (Sept. 1931), pp. 651–656, stressing prayer, conferences, and individual

"witnessing." Further developed, the method appears in Richard Roberts, "Companies of the Upper Room," *Christian Century*, Vol. 58, no. 20 (May 14, 1941), pp. 650–651, a critique of "made to order" spiritual quickenings, and a plea for quiet and patient group study and prayer.

II. DEFENSE OF REVIVALISM. In rebutting attacks, advocates of revivals have produced a formidable body of special pleading, which like the criticism appears largely in periodical articles. The controversy has cut across major denominational lines, and examination of the vast literature suggests that the transcendently important subject in nineteenth-century American Protestantism after 1830 was revivalism rather than theology or polity.

Among the most scholarly and effective defenses were those written for foreigners by the ministers, Calvin Colton and Robert Baird. The former's *History and Character of American Revivals of Religion* (London, 1832) considers social traits favoring revivalism, justifies it by appeal to the divine plan to reform the world, and examines obstacles and criticisms. Baird, a "New School" Scottish traveling minister and a student of American Protestantism, endeavored to allay European prejudice in *Religion in the United States of America* . . . (Glasgow, 1844), and in *The Progress and Prospects of Christianity in the United States* (London, 1851), and *State and Prospects of Religion in America* (London, 1855). Congregationalists early became champions of evangelism, none more ably than Lyman Beecher and Asahel Nettleton in *Letters on the "New Measures" in Conducting Revivals of Religion* . . . (New York, 1828). Perhaps the most competent brief defense is in Beecher's essays, "American Revivals," *Christian Observer*, Vol. 28, no. 8 (Aug. 1828), pp. 472–481; no. 9 (Sept.), pp. 537–544. These laud the revival as an opportunity for unusually direct and powerful appeal, and voice nearly all criticisms of excesses and errors. A cogent defense came from the eminent Congregational historian, Henry M. Dexter: his "Congrega-

tionalism Specially Adapted to Promote Revivals of Religion," *Congregational Quarterly*, Vol. 3, no. 1 (Jan. 1861), pp. 52–58, underlines freedom, informality, and individualism as assets in evangelism. Little new is added by countless later defenses. Among the superior ones are: the Boston Congregational Council's *Addresses to Church Members by the Congregational Pastors of Boston . . .* (Boston, 1866); A. H. Quint's strongly affirmative answer to the query "Are Revivals of Religion Natural?", *Congregational Quarterly*, Vol. 11, no. 1 (Jan. 1869), pp. 34–41; and in *ibid.*, Vol. 13, no. 4 (Oct. 1871), pp. 551–561, J. E. Twitchell's "Revivals: How Discerned and Promoted"; Edward Norris Kirk, *Lectures on Revivals*, ed. David O. Mears (Boston, 1875); and an editorial in the *Andover Review*, Vol. 5, no. 27 (Mar. 1886), pp. 291–296: "The Signs of Spiritual Energy in the Church." All accept revivals as natural, existing in the church from its origin. The *Andover Review* indicates the emerging association of revivals with social relations and missions, increasing concern about social problems, responsibility in politics and civic life, and the connection between belief and duty.

The Presbyterian Church boasted many eminent protagonists. Probably no author could have improved upon Sprague's arguments in *Lectures on Revivals of Religion* (Albany, 1832, New York, 1833, 2nd ed.), covering means of promotion, treatment of converts, and errors, with illustrations in letters from eminent and experienced ministers. The same ground is surveyed by Charles Grandison Finney's *Lectures on Revivals of Religion . . .* (New York and Boston, 1835, 2nd ed.), which are amplified by his *Sermons on Important Subjects* (New York, 1836, 3rd ed.), and *Lectures to Professing Christians* (New York, 1837). These works reveal also the deepest spiritual aspects of Christian perfectionism. Albert Barnes, more conservative than Sprague and Finney, became an advocate of evangelism in "Revivals of Religion in Cities and Large Towns," *The*

American National Preacher, Vol. 15 (1841), pp. 1–72, a series of sermons. The reluctant approval of "Old School" Presbyterianism found a voice in Lewis Cheeseman's *Differences Between Old and New School Presbyterians* (New York, 1848), and Robert Aikman's *The Relations of the Ministry to Revivals of Religion* (New York, 1863). Presbyterian arguments are summarized by James Waddel Alexander's *Hope and Power of the Church . . .* (Philadelphia, 1868), comprising selections from his writings.

An outstanding Baptist defense is Henry Clay Fish, "Power in the Pulpit," *Christian Review*, Vol. 27, no. 107 (1862), pp. 118–142, advocating enthusiastic, Scriptural preaching. Episcopalian evangelicalism was ably represented by Stephen H. Tying's *Lectures on the Law and the Gospels* (New York, 1848, rev. ed.), which emphasized redemption through Christ. The anti-ritualist, Bishop Charles P. McIlvaine of Ohio, favored the great awakening of 1858 in *Bishop McIlvaine on the Revival of Religion . . .* (Philadelphia, 1858). The Lutheran churches produced surprisingly numerous defenses of revivalism. Its triumph in the General Synod colors Samuel S. Schmucker's *The American Lutheran Church . . .* (Philadelphia, 1852, 5th ed.). Many excellent articles advanced the cause through the *Evangelical Quarterly Review*. Among the more notable ones are: Francis Springer, "Lutheranism in the United States," Vol. 11, no. 41 (July 1859), pp. 96–110; Levi Sternberg, "Revivals," Vol. 15 (1864), pp. 273–292; and G. A. Lintner, "The Influence of Revivals on the State of Religion and the State of Benevolent Enterprise in the Lutheran Church," Vol. 21, no. 1 (Jan. 1870), pp. 9–24, citing many examples. Even Quakerism felt the impulse, and the attitude of its evangelical party was expressed in Elisha Bates, *The Doctrine of Friends* (Philadelphia, 1868).

Simeon Walcher Harkey composed a popular manual of revivals: *The Church's Best State; or, Constant Revivals of Religion* (Baltimore, 1842), maintaining that the church's

chief purpose is regeneration, and even that opposition to revivals is disobedience to God. Some twentieth-century defenses have attempted justification from the standpoint of social and national welfare. Arthur B. Strickland's *The Great American Revival; A Case Study in Historical Evangelism with Implications for Today* (Cincinnati, 1934), with selected bibliography, ardently defends revivals as props of national morale and of social and economic betterment. The "New Theology" or "Neo-Orthodoxy" has compelled a critical rethinking of revival evangelism. The new apology, taking account of past criticisms, is admirably illustrated by Willis B. Glover, "In Defense of Evangelism," *Christian Century*, Vol. 69, no. 49 (Dec. 3, 1952), pp. 1404–1406. Modern theology is here seen as intellectually competent, but ineffective in personal religious commitment, while evangelical appeal to "intellectuals" and sophisticated churchmen is still an unresolved problem.

12. CRITICISM OF REVIVALS. Criticism began with the Raritan Valley revivals in the 1720's, and attained intellectual respectability with Charles Chauncy's strictures on the Great Awakening (see *Critics and Controversy*, above). Following the general direction of his thought, consistent and determined attacks later proceeded from liberal Christians, like the noted Universalist minister, Menzies Rayner. His *Six Lectures on Revivals of Religion, Delivered in the Universalist Church in Portland* (Portland [Maine], 1834) castigates revivalism as artificial, emotionally unhealthy, and heedless of the test of a good life. A conservative criticism was voiced by the Rev. William B. Sprague in *Religious Ultraism* (Albany, 1835), on the "excitements" in the "burned-over" district of western New York. A Unitarian minister, Orville Dewey, calmly and judiciously objected to overwrought emotionalism in *Letters of an English Traveller to His Friend in England on the 'Revivals of Religion' in America* (Boston, 1828). Representative of the humanist attitude is Charles K. Whipple: "The Boston Revival and its Leader,"

The Radical, Vol. 1, no. 7 (July 1866), pp. 429–438, attacking the evangelist, A. B. Earle. Another assault column consisted of conservative Episcopal and Lutheran elements. A fairly typical High Church Anglican attitude is that of "Presbyter of Connecticut" in *Revivalism and the Church; a Letter to a Reviewer in Reply to Several Articles in the New Englander* (Hartford, 1843), holding that revivalism depends upon "annual galvanizing," and is fanatical and provincial. In "The Revival System: Its Good and Evil," *Church Review*, Vol. 7, no. 3 (Oct. 1854), pp. 356–375, Bishop Henry C. Lay criticized southern revivalism as superficial, spasmodic piety, inferior to parochial, liturgical, and sacramental religion in permanent effectiveness. The influential Lutheran *Evangelical Quarterly Review* (Gettysburg, Pa.) tried to be impartial in a period of violent controversy, 1856–1865. Among its superior critical articles are: A. M. Ziegler, "Treatment of the Awakened," Vol. 9, no. 34 (Oct. 1857), pp. 237–256; and an anonymous attack, "The Present Position of the Lutheran Church," Vol. 11, no. 41 (July 1859), pp. 12–43, supporting the confessional position. Perhaps the fairest Lutheran view is J. A. Singmaster's "Modern Evangelism" (n.s., Vol. 7, no. 3, July 1877, pp. 400–409), acknowledging benefits in united effort, and simple presentation of the gospel when controlled by the church, but pointing to dangers in irregularity, undervaluing steady work, and irresponsible, incompetent leadership.

Revivalist evangelism was wounded even in the houses of its friends, the Calvinistic Reformed denominations. In 1828 a criticism like Charles Chauncy's came from the Congregational seminary at Andover, Mass.: Grant Powers, *Essay upon the Influence of the Imagination on the Nervous System, Contributing to a False Hope in Religion . . .* (Andover, 1828). The Reverend William Mitchell of Rutland, Vt., sharply questioned the value of revivals in "An Enquiry into the Utility of Modern Evangelists, and Their

Measures," *Literary and Theological Review*, Vol. 2, no. 7 (Sept. 1835), pp. 494–507, defending the sufficiency of the regular ministry and means of grace. The professional revivalist is useful only in preparing the way for a settled ministry, according to Edwin P. Pond, in "Evangelists," *New Englander*, Vol. 2, no. 6 (Apr. 1844), pp. 297–303. The many conservative "Old School" Presbyterian critics are well represented by Alexander Blaikie, who exhausted anti-revival arguments in *The Philosophy of Sectarianism; or, a Classified View of the Christian Sects in the United States* . . . (Boston, 1855, 2nd ed.), lamenting the tendency to multiply sects and substitute popularity for sound doctrine. Even the Baptists were not without cavilers. The anti-revival Calvinist position was defended by the *Christian Review* (see Vols. 20–27, Boston, 1855–1856, New York, 1857–1862). Modern criticism was anticipated by W. H. H. Marsh in "Strictures on Revivals of Religion," *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 34, no. 134 (Apr. 1877), pp. 334–354, scoring sensational novelty, neglect of regular instruction, and frequent lack of real change in character. A similar deprecation of revival practices in German Lutheran and Reformed churches was voiced by the noted scholar, Philip Schaff, in *A Sketch of the Political, Social, and Religious Character of the United States of North America* (New York, 1855).

Marsh's espousal of regular Christian training indicates an obvious cause of decline in revivalism. The new note was sounded by William B. Clarke's widely read article, "Shall the Church Rely on Revivalism or Christian Nurture?", *New Englander*, Vol. 38, no. 153 (Nov. 1879), pp. 800–806. From the standpoint of St. Paul's doctrine of edification, he saw religion's true mission as the building of holy character by gradual and regular discipline.

13. THE DECLINE OF EVANGELISM. Under a cloud of criticism, evangelism was fading by the 1890's, especially in the cities. Dwight L. Moody was conscious of truth in such temperate criticisms as A. R. Kremer's essay, "Evangelists,"

Reformed Quarterly Review, Vol. 42, no. 2 (Apr. 1895), pp. 178–194: viewing evangelism as a special function of the regular ministry, not of glib performers who made it a business based upon emotion. Such opinions appeared more and more frequently in secular magazines, often with a cutting edge of sarcasm. David Utter, pastor of Unity Church in Denver, noted the lack of appeal to youth, due to weakening of belief in the "fall" of man, and increased confidence in the power of social melioration and the natural religion of personal effort: "The Passing of the Revivalist," *Arena,* Vol. 21, no. 1 (Jan. 1899), pp. 107–113. Frederick Morgan Davenport, a profound student of revivals, advanced similar arguments in "The Religious Revivals and the New Evangelism," *Outlook,* Vol. 79 (Apr. 8, 1905), pp. 895–899, adding a note on the grave social and political danger of wholesale emotionalism. An attempt at critical scientific analysis is Samuel W. Dike, "A Study of New England Revivals," *American Journal of Sociology,* Vol. 15, no. 3 (Nov. 1909), pp. 361–378, concluding that revivalism had been outmoded by modern religious education, and that it did not consider social ethics and reforms. "The Mechanics of Revivalism" by Joseph H. Odell, in *Atlantic Monthly,* Vol. 115, no. 4 (Apr. 1915), pp. 585–592, deplores reduction of evangelism to a business-success formula, commercialization of hymnody, lack of healthy ethical tone, and Bible fetishism. Similar observations were made later by the Presbyterian religious sociologist, Charles Stelzle, in "The Passing of the Old Evangelism," *World's Work,* Vol. 55, no. 2 (Dec. 1927), pp. 195–202; and "The Evangelist in Present-Day America," *Current History,* Vol. 35, no. 2 (Nov. 1931), pp. 224–228. These are probably the best brief general reviews of the reasons for the diminished power of revivalism in the twentieth century. Criticism has not been averted by the emergence of a more intelligent appeal with "Billy" Graham in the 1940's. A temperate appraisal of him by Frank Fitt, "In the Wake of Billy

Graham," *Christian Century*, Vol. 71, no. 48 (Dec. 1, 1954), pp. 1458–1459, concludes that declarations in meetings are of less value than quieter and more thorough parochial methods.

14. PSYCHOLOGICAL STUDY OF REVIVALS. From the age of Jonathan Edwards until far into the nineteenth century, there was little attempt to study the psychological phenomena of revivals from a scientific standpoint. Many manuals and critical essays expounded methods of organizing and conducting, and dealing with converts, or pointed to doctrinal errors or the evils of emotionalism. Exploration of inward motives and feelings was not usually considered or attempted. One of the pioneer psychological studies was made by Heman Humphrey in *Revival Sketches and Manual; in Two Parts* . . . (New York, 1859). The second part is a guide to methods of promotion and conduct, and of ministering to converts, based upon psychological study and including ways of self-examination. The first thorough psychological analysis is that of William James, *The Varieties of Religious Experience* (New York, 1902), which scientifically defines the traits noted by Edwards and Chauncy. A basically sociological and constructive approach was followed by Frederick Morgan Davenport, *Primitive Traits in Religious Revivals; A Study in Mental and Social Evolution* (New York, 1905, 1917): regarding revivals as normal spiritual experiences, but as liable to irrational emotion, which might endanger democracy through mob behavior; and tracing the emergence of a more educational and ethical type from Finney to Moody. Also constructively critical is O. C. Helming, "Modern Evangelism in the Light of Modern Psychology," *Biblical World*, Vol. 36, no. 5 (Nov. 1910), pp. 296–306: contrasting revivalist appeal to an inborn "faculty" with the psychological method of regarding religion as the product of the whole personality through training. This viewpoint stemmed from liberal theology and the Social Gospel, and probably exaggerated the emo-

tionally unhealthful aspects. Later studies have tended to follow the lead of Sydney George Dimond, *The Psychology of the Methodist Revival, an Empirical & Descriptive Study* (London, 1926), with bibliography: evangelism is the spiritual and emotional dynamic, the moral and social redemption and integrating force of the humble. A similar analysis of psychological origins and manifestations, from the viewpoint of modern liberal and social Christianity, is Whitney Rogers Cross, *The Burned-Over District, the Social and Intellectual History of Enthusiastic Religion in Western New York, 1800–1850* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1950), with bibliographical footnotes. He relates the emotional psychology of revivalism to economic, social, and political environment, and to reform movements. An analysis of revivals and conversion by George Godwin, in *The Great Revivalists* . . . (Boston, 1950), with brief bibliography, defines revivalism as mobilization of emotions, with the preacher moved by inner conflict, the convert by the quest for personal and social integration.

15. REVIVALIST BIOGRAPHY. American Protestant revivalists have always spoken an intensely personal message. The evangelist has been considered (and often has considered himself) as a special agent of the Holy Spirit, sent at a particular time to arouse a renewed sense of redemptive mission in the world. Periods of revival usually have borne the stamp of peculiar personalities. The personal element and its relation to the development of revivalism, as traced in previous sections, requires a selected bibliography of biographical sources.

Biographical and autobiographical study kept pace with upsurges of revival, and during the Second Great Awakening became a popular literary form. Among the more important and typical examples of that era may be mentioned the following titles: Gardiner Spring, *Memoirs of the Rev. Samuel J. Mills, Late Missionary to the South Western Section of the United States* . . . (New York, 1820); William B.

Sprague, *Memoir of the Rev. Edward D. Griffin, D.D., Compiled Chiefly from His own Writings* (Albany, 1838, New York, 1839); Bennet Tyler, *Memoir of the Life and Character of the Rev. Asahel Nettleton* (Hartford, 1844); Cyrus Yale, *Life of the Rev. Jeremiah Hallock . . .* (New York, 1854); Samuel Griswold Goodrich, *Recollections of a Lifetime . . .* (New York, 1856, 2 vols.); Edward A. Lawrence, *Joel Hawes* (Hartford, 1871); Jacob Knapp, *Autobiography of Elder Jacob Knapp . . .* (New York, 1868); Emerson Andrews, *Living Life . . .* (Boston, 1872); and Helen Dunn Gates, *Life and Labors of Rev. Ransom Dunn . . .* (Boston, 1901). Andrews, Knapp, and Dunn represent the triumph of revivalism in the Baptist churches, while the others are Congregational and Presbyterian. (For Methodist biographies, see 9, *Revivalism as the Religion of the Frontier*, above.) Written mostly by participants, these biographies are derived largely from original documentary material, personal acquaintance, and recollections. The task of compiling a standard biographical encyclopedia was undertaken by Phineas Camp Headley. His *Evangelists in the Church, Philip, A.D., 35, to Moody and Sankey, A.D., 1875* (Boston, 1875) comprises numerous sketches derived from rare contemporary sources.

It would be impossible to include biographies of more than a few of the most eminent and interesting evangelists. (References to many are included in preceding sections, and in *General Histories of Revivalism*, below.) Lyman Beecher speaks for himself in his *Autobiography, Correspondence, &c.*, ed. Charles Beecher (New York, 1864–65, 2 vols.). He is appreciated as an evangelist in Lyman Beecher Stowe, *Saints, Sinners and Beechers* (Indianapolis, 1934, London, 1935), with bibliography, which is critical and without obtrusive family piety. More than any other before Moody, the preacher who organized and symbolized revivalism was Charles Grandison Finney. The basic source for estimating his career is *Memoirs of Charles G. Finney Written by Him-*

self (New York, 1876), remarkably objective and based upon his journals and other writings. His mature thoughts on revivals appear in M. W. Knapp, ed., *Revival Fire from C. G. Finney, Letters on Revivals . . .* (Cincinnati, 1898), originally published in the *Oberlin Evangelist*, 1845–46. While revivals are essential to true religion, they must not degenerate into fanaticism, emotion, and disorder. Excellent appraisals of the man and his work are: George Frederick Wright, *Charles Grandison Finney* (Boston, 1891); and Preston Franklin Strauss, "The Revivals of Religion in the State of New York (1825–1835) under the Leadership of Charles G. Finney" (Ph.D. thesis, 2 vols., typescript, Speer Library, Princeton Theological Seminary, with large bibliography). The former stresses his labor to unite faith and works and his immense social and political influence. The latter emphasizes economic, social, theological, and moral change as the most important feature of his era. Finney's revival theology is discussed at length by George F. Wright, "President Finney's System of Theology in Its Relations to the So-Called New England Theology," *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 34, no. 136 (Oct. 1877), pp. 708–741.

After Finney the transcendant figure was the lay preacher, Dwight Lyman Moody, representing the culmination of the "New Revivalism." An indispensable but uncritical source for studying him at the height of his powers is Edgar Johnson Goodspeed, *A Full History of the Wonderful Career of Moody and Sankey, in Great Britain and America . . .* (New York, 1877), underscoring his urban ministry to neglected immigrants and depressed classes, his work for the Y.M.C.A. and interchurch cooperation, and Sankey's new, inspiring hymnody. Moody's personal appeal and vast influence through books and tracts are clarified by these works: *Heaven; Where It Is: Its Inhabitants, and How to Get There* (Chicago, 1880, rev. ed.); *Secret Power; or, The Secret of Success in Christian Life and Christian Work* (Chicago, 1881); and *Overcoming Life and Other Sermons*

(New York, 1896). The keynotes are personal salvation, holiness of life, the impotency of knowledge without zeal, the Bible as the source of spiritual power, unbelief as the root of sin, and the Christian life requiring repentance and effort of will. Charles F. Goss, "The Story of Moody's Life and Work" in *Echoes from the Pulpit and Platform . . . As Related by Dwight L. Moody . . .* (Hartford, 1900), based upon stenographic reports of his sermons, stresses his wide culture, his reaching the "unchurched," and proclamation of brotherhood and God's love. Lyman Abbott, who personally knew him, composed a critical estimate and a vivid portrait in *Silhouettes of My Contemporaries* (Garden City, N.Y., 1921). Another personal acquaintance, Charles R. Erdman, presented a compact account in *D. L. Moody: His Message for Today* (New York, 1928), with chronology, bibliography, and list of Moody's works, appreciating his permanent influence through transformed lives, and the movements and institutions originated by him. The most authoritative biography is by his son, William Revell Moody: *D. L. Moody* (New York, 1930), with extensive bibliography, which escapes the temptation to filial eulogy, and is a documented review of his many contributions to a better society, without obscuring the humble and sincere man.

No evangelist since Moody has spoken with his power and authority, or commanded the same general respect, even from skeptics. Later revivalist biography depicts lesser characters striving to maintain a fading tradition. Undoubtedly the greatest popular impact was that of William Ashley ("Billy") Sunday. His sensational appeal, vividly contrasting with Moody's dignity, is strikingly illustrated by *Sermons in Omaha, as Reported by the Omaha Daily News . . .* (Omaha, 1915), remarkable for stinging rebukes to the lethargy of church members. The complete unconventionality of the ex-baseball player is revealed in William T. Ellis, *"Billy" Sunday, the Man and His Message, with his Own Words*

. . . (Philadelphia, 1914), with editorial comments on his breaking of the barrier between church and world, and "making religion news." The only competent biography, based largely upon personal records and interviews, is William Gerald McLoughlin, *Billy Sunday Was His Real Name* (Chicago, 1955), with a note on sources. Objectively presenting his unique personality, this notes his appeal to those who sought personal and social certainty in religion, making church membership a test of Americanism, and failure to understand new social trends. Of a more dignified caliber was Rodney ("Gipsy") Smith, who tried to avoid sensationalism, and to appeal to conscience and will. His considered view of evangelism is expounded in "Reaching the Hearts of Millions, A Personal Statement," *The World Today*, Vol. 17, no. 6 (Dec. 1909), pp. 1313–1316, defining it as preparation for the pastor and the teacher, and as compatible with high culture. Smith's estimate of his own work is corroborated in a temperate article by Shailer Mathews: "Gipsy Smith, Evangelist," *ibid.*, pp. 1316–1319, testifying to his disinterested, dignified presentation of the gospel, and comparing him favorably with Moody as an evangelist to "unchurched" masses. A later rehabilitator of evangelism is William Franklin ("Billy") Graham, who has assumed Moody's international quality. A vast amount of comment is summarized by Stanley High in *Billy Graham, the Personal Story of the Man, His Message, and His Mission* (New York, Toronto, and London, 1956). While too laudatory and presenting him as socially "respectable," this discerns his ability to proclaim a simple and direct gospel to a "sophisticated" era.

16. GENERAL HISTORIES OF REVIVALISM. Comprehensive accounts are very numerous and of widely varying merits. They range from references to past revivals, in pleas for renewal, to modern sociological studies of the meaning of revivalism in American life. Generally they follow the pat-

tern set by one of the first remarkable efforts to create an analytical historiography of revivals: A. P. Marvin, "Three Eras of Revivals in the United States," *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 16, no. 62 (Apr. 1859), pp. 279–301, showing the peculiar doctrines of each period, manifestations, and leaders, reactions against certain teachings or doctrinal perversions, and social results in reforms and benevolences. The following selected titles cover the field from German Pietism to the decline of the early twentieth century. All emphasize continuous common features and variant periodical emphases, leaders and their contributions, history and effects in various denominations, and religious, cultural, and social influences.

Charles Lemuel Thompson, *Time of Refreshing; a History of American Revivals from 1740–1877, with Their Philosophy and Methods* (Chicago, 1877), with bibliography, stresses the inevitability of revivals, modern lay evangelism, hymnody, inquiry meetings, and the role of women. Samuel Bryan Halliday and D. S. Gregory, *The Church in America and its Baptisms of Fire . . .* (New York, 1896), a heavily detailed source book, has much material on missions, philanthropy, and education. Frank Grenville Beardsley, *A History of American Revivals* (New York, 1904), a popular account, draws attention to denominational aspects, lay movements, and organized philanthropy. Warren Akin Candler, *Revivals and the Great Republic* (Nashville and Dallas, 1904), with bibliography, accents the connection between evangelistic religion and civil development, and revivalism as a redemptive force. Benjamin Rice Lacy, Jr., *Revivals in the Midst of the Years* (Richmond, Va., 1943) includes revivals in the Confederate Army, reasons for decline, the debate between the social and the personal gospel, and suggestions of a new evangelism preserving both elements. Irvin Willetts Emmons, "A History of Revivalism in America Since the Civil War" (Th.M. thesis, typescript, Speer Library, Princeton Theological Seminary, with bibliography) studies individual evangelists and their methods, urban

effects upon revivalism, philanthropic aspects, reasons for decline, and the revival in "Buchmanism" and the National Preaching Mission. William Luther Muncy, *A History of Evangelism in the United States* (Kansas City, Kan., 1945), with bibliographical footnotes, heavily accents reforms, benevolent institutions, democracy, religious freedom, education, literature, and missions. Grover C. Loud's *Evangelized America* (New York, 1928), with extensive bibliography, popular and unusually readable, presents a scholarly, judicious, and accurate review since about 1740, and studies revivalism's nature and various forms, spawning of sects, and yielding to new modes of evangelism. By far the most understanding historical appraisal is William Warren Sweet's relatively brief *Revivalism in America, its Origin, Growth and Decline* (New York, 1944), with good selected bibliography. He describes revivalism as an Americanization of Christianity, declining with the vanishing frontier, and with the increasing complexity of society, which made religion institutional.

Bernard A. Weisberger, *They Gathered at the River, The Story of the Great Revivalists and Their Impact upon Religion in America* (Boston and Toronto, 1958) describes the successive patterns of revivalism and their relations to contemporary movements of thought and the character of the times. The author stresses the basic traits of revivals since Moody, and points out the important influence of protracted meetings. William G. McLoughlin, Jr., *Modern Revivalism: Charles Grandison Finney to Billy Graham* (New York, 1959), offers a well-documented and scholarly analysis of the part of American evangelistic tradition associated with professional revivalists from 1825 to the present day, and subscribes to the cyclical theory of revivalism. Finney is considered as the founder of modern revivalism as a big business, related to many aspects of American life but usually not friendly to social reform.

B. The Rise of Rational Religion

1. THE EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY RELIGION OF NATURE. Repulsion from emotional excess in the Great Awakening was not fully expressed by ephemeral controversial pamphlets, or even by scholarly treatises like Chauncy's *Seasonable Thoughts on the Present State of Religion in New England* (Boston, 1743). It continued beyond the immediate occasion, because it was an American phase of the eighteenth-century "Age of Reason." As part of an emerging "Atlantic Civilization," the American colonial mind was tinged by writings of "enlightened" Europeans, who regarded dogmatic or emotional religion as an embarrassing and obstructive inheritance from "ages of ignorance and superstition."

The really vital faith of many intelligent persons was that, by exercising reason, humanity could attain complete freedom from spiritual, religious ("priestly"), mental, moral, and physical bondage. The startling progress of natural science and of mathematics encouraged that idea. A rational and optimistic temper pervaded western Europe, and inspired two movements that deeply influenced American religious and philosophical thought. One was the German "Aufklärung" (Enlightenment), the other was its English counterpart. The first influenced American theology (see Part Five, sects. I and III) and the New England Transcendentalists (see F, *Transcendental Religion*, below). The second, more immediately, either caused or aided various movements in America, including Deism, Unitarianism, Universalism, and (ultimately) Free Religion (see B, D, and E, below). The typical religious expression of "Enlightenment" was Deism.

A general review of European rationalism appears in Clarence Crane Brinton's *Ideas and Men, the Story of Western Thought* (New York, 1950), with bibliography. The Newtonian concept of a "world machine" run by strictly consistent laws, and the character of the "Religion of Rea-

son," are clearly explained in John H. Randall, Jr., *The Making of the Modern Mind, A Survey of the Intellectual Background of the Present Age* (Boston, 1940, rev. ed.), comprising an adequate treatment of the formal development of ideas in the eighteenth century, with references and bibliographies. A stimulating estimate of the intellectual quality of that era is Paul Hazard's *European Thought in the Eighteenth Century from Montesquieu to Lessing* (London, 1954, tr. from the French by J. Lewis May). Indicating the collapse of traditional values, this stresses the substitution of a virtual adoration of reason for faith, and of the "pursuit of happiness" for the imitation of Christ. (See c, *The Liberalizing Influence of Jefferson,* below.) The age favored the concept of "the Man of Feeling," which colored romantic thought, and stimulated the later rise of Transcendentalism (see F, *Transcendental Religion,* below). Hazard's emphasis is upon French thought, with occasional references to English. A superior work, less brilliant and more solid, is Carl L. Becker, *The Heavenly City of the Eighteenth-Century Philosophers* (New Haven, 1932). Becker's studies of the Revolution lend relevance to his connection of the rationalist ideal with American thought. The philosophers of the "Enlightenment" unconsciously remained in the grip of Saint Augustine's transcendent ideal of the City of God, which they believed to be attainable by reason on earth. Popular and less scholarly treatises are: Frank Edward Manuel, *The Age of Reason* (Ithaca, N.Y., c.1951), with bibliography, bibliographical references in the footnotes, and numerous references to religion; and Louis Leo Snyder, *The Age of Reason* (New York, 1955), with "Sources for Selected Readings" and bibliography. Manuel reviews the influence of Newtonianism, the attitude of science toward sectarian theology, the appeal to reason and the influence of Bacon and Locke, the application of scientific method to religion, the attack on Christianity and religion as frauds, and the defense of Christianity as "reasonable," sometimes end-

ing in sentimental pantheism. Snyder stresses faith in science, the mechanical interpretation of nature, the transition from Deism to materialism, and the application of natural law to religion.

Rationalism and Deism affected all churches. They generally won the educated upper class, which maintained a formal and social connection with established state churches while adhering to the "Religion of Nature." Examples of such a contradiction between formal and actual religion might be cited among American Revolutionary statesmen. Most branches of Protestantism were influenced or, as some said, "infected." Many clergymen sought to apologize for Christianity as "reasonable," and decried the warm emotions and ecstatic conversions of revivals and of Methodism as "enthusiasm." Intellectual development in the Protestant churches of the early eighteenth century, before the revival of idealism, is explained by Arthur Cushman McGiffert in *Protestant Thought before Kant* (New York, 1912), with bibliography.

For America the immediately influential currents of rationalism were those traced in detail in Leslie Stephen's *History of English Thought in the Eighteenth Century* (New York, 1876, 2 vols.). The "Religion of Nature" and the idea of "Nature's God," as they were known in English-speaking countries, are expounded by Basil Willey in *The Eighteenth Century Background, Studies on the Idea of Nature in the Thought of the Period* (London, 1940, New York, 1950), with bibliographical footnotes. One of the best intellectual histories of the period, this semi-popular but searching survey demonstrates that there was no quarrel between science and religion, but only between science and theology. Many intellectuals conscientiously believed that efforts to discover natural laws glorified divine wisdom. Their religious concept of "Nature," the century's germinal philosophical idea, colored advanced religious thinking, and was reflected in the Declaration of Independence. Willey

has been criticized, however, as not clearly estimating the influence of thought upon practice.

The Deist movement claimed to be the philosophical-religious expression of the world-view implicit in the scientific advance of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, as seen in the work of Copernicus, Galileo, Descartes, Newton, and Locke. These ultimate sources of Deism are closely studied in David Rice McKee, *Simon Tyssot de Patot and the Seventeenth-Century Background of Critical Deism* (Baltimore, 1941), with a general bibliography, and a list of Tyssot de Patot's works, 1694–1727. This exiled French Protestant influenced eighteenth-century Deism in his expression of the critical viewpoint of the Descartes philosophy. It reflected his interest in experimental science, his sensationalism, (possibly) Cartesian naturalism and materialism combined with Spinoza's pantheism, his faith in progress through science, and his consideration for human dignity and equality. He influenced Voltaire and other eighteenth-century French freethinkers, especially by his Biblical criticism opposed to revelation and miracles, in which he reflected the English Deist, John Toland (see ref. to Toland, below). Tyssot's effect reveals the cosmopolitan quality of Deism, whose exponents freely borrowed from one another, and sometimes were associated by international friendship or acquaintance. It was an expression of Renaissance humanism and criticism, developing in the seventeenth century, maturing in the eighteenth century, and ultimately merging into nineteenth-century free thought and "Free Religion." (See G, *Free Thought,* below.) The Deist cosmology and view of "Man" pervaded the literary and philosophical activities of many revolutionary leaders of the later eighteenth century. By its impression upon English religion and philosophy, it drew American thought into close bonds with the Atlantic Civilization of the "Age of Reason."

2. ENGLISH DEISM. English Deism expressed a conviction that the state-church Reformation had but partly released

the mind from "slavish truckling" to authority, and had not fully realized liberty of thought. Rational and liberal religion seemed to the Deists to be long overdue. Yet English Deism had been on the way since early in the seventeenth century. Edward Herbert, Baron Herbert of Cherbury (1583–1648), grasped its first principles in his conviction that primitive man had a "natural" religion. Man owes to God worship, the service of virtuous living, and repentance of sins, and after death will be rewarded for right and punished for wrong conduct. Herbert's views are summarized in his *De Religione Laici* [On the Religion of a Layman], ed. Harold R. Hutcheson (New Haven and London, 1944), with Latin and English texts, a long introduction on Herbert's life and philosophy, a critique of Deism from Herbert to Blount, and a comprehensive bibliography of his works and works about him. This thorough and thoughtful study points out that Herbert esteemed charity and righteousness as counting more for salvation than orthodox doctrine and ritual worship—a basic principle of humanists and liberals during the next two centuries, and particularly of Ethical Culture. (See H, *Ethical Culture*, below.) He accepted universal and rejected particular divine providence, desired to promote tolerance, and hoped that sound religion would promote moral and spiritual harmony. More light on sources of English Deism is kindled by study of another of Herbert's works, expounding the same essential ideas: his *De Veritate* [On Truth] (Bristol, Eng., 1937, tr. from the 1645 London ed., with introduction by Myrick H. Carré). It is a defense of theological rationalism, a protest against uncritical acceptance of revelation, an assertion of the right of religious private judgment; a pioneer exposition of natural theology, identifying religious ideas with the principle of reason. Leland (see below) called Herbert the most eminent Deist, and his principles appeared in Toland, Collins, and Tindal.

Herbert's bold type of inquiry originally was confined to learned aristocrats and scholars. Later in the century Deism

received potent intellectual sustenance from John Locke (1632–1704), who popularized philosophy and inspired a larger circle of educated people to test religion by reason. His popular *The Reasonableness of Christianity* began a new era by so testing doctrines previously regarded as too sacred to investigate. (For text see: *The Works of John Locke . . . with a Preliminary Essay and Notes by J. A. St. John*, London, 1882–1883, 2 vols.). Locke's service to rational religion is assessed in Samuel Ging Hefelbower, *The Relation of John Locke to English Deism* (Chicago, 1918), relating Lockean philosophy and English Deism as coordinate parts of the broader current of progressive thought by direct evidence, concisely defining Locke's religious opinions, and comparing them with those of the Deists. Further light is beamed upon the scope of Locke's influence by Herbert John McLachlan, in *The Religious Opinions of Milton, Locke, and Newton* (Manchester, Eng., 1941). The author stresses their layman's philosophical and scientific view of theology, and their common basic tenets of free inquiry, use of reason, and toleration. They belong to American religious thought because of their wide effect in the colonies, and their common ground with William Ellery Channing and other "rational" Unitarians. The prevalence of Locke's sensational philosophy in early American liberal religion eventually provoked the protest of idealistic Transcendentalism (see E, 4, *Early American Unitarian Thought*, and F, *Transcendental Religion*, below). Through popularizing, Locke's rationalism sometimes became merely fashionable and superficial "free-thinking." But in the long run, guided by wise and solid scholarship, it helped English and American Protestantism to become established as firmly upon reasoned conviction as upon emotion and free will.

Deism was elaborated into a "system" by an English contemporary of Locke, John Toland (1670–1722), who was almost its high priest. In 1696 he published his best known work, *Christianity Not Mysterious* (see London, 1702 ed.).

It became the Deist's bible, a popular rationalist approach to religion. Toland argued that anything in the Bible, apparently beyond reason's grasp, will prove to be entirely understandable upon further investigation. Nothing in the Gospel is either contrary to reason—or above it!—and it is wrong to call any Christian doctrine a "mystery." God is not aloof, but universally present (a pantheistic, Transcendental idea), and never acts in a suprarational or unintelligible way. The book became a dominant influence in English liberal theology, and deeply colored the religious mentality of the English and American educated minority. Toland and other English Deists were read in America, and are mentioned in many letters of the Anglican missionaries. Especially in the period from 1713 to 1753, Deism exerted a powerful appeal through the persuasive and brilliant (if sometimes superficial) style of certain books. The English or colonial gentleman or clergyman of good breeding usually read Anthony Collins (1676–1729), *A Discourse of Free-thinking, Occasioned by the Rise and Growth of a Sect Call'd Free-thinkers* (London, 1713). Another well-read volume was William Wollaston (1660–1724), *The Religion of Nature Delineated* (London, 1722). It went through many editions, and type for the third (1726) was set by Benjamin Franklin, who then worked in a London printing house and leaned toward Deism. Another fashionable writer was Matthew Tindal (1653?–1733), especially in *Christianity as Old as the Creation; or, The Gospel, a Republication of the Religion of Nature* (London, 1730). These were sober, closely-reasoned treatises, to which defenders of traditional Christian doctrine could reply in the same vein. (See B, 4, *Deism and the Anglican Philosophers*, below.)

More irritating, and more subtly dangerous, was the elegant ridicule of religion by sophisticated and sometimes cynical intellectuals. Among them was Bernard Mandeville, who attacked organized religion in *Free Thoughts on Religion, the Church, and National Happiness* (London, 1729,

2nd ed., rev., cor., and enl.), which appeared only with his initials and caused his exile. Rationalist appeals were powerfully promoted by the elegant raillery of Anthony Ashley Cooper, third Earl of Shaftesbury (1671–1713), in *Characteristicks of Men, Manners, Opinions, Times* (London, 1723, 3rd ed., 3 vols.). Attributed to him, also to Robert Hunter, is an essay excoriating religious fervor: *A Letter Concerning Enthusiasm to My Lord . . .* (1708, in *Characteristicks . . .*, Vol. 1, Treatise 1). While bowing with cool politeness to "established rites of worship," he mocked positive doctrine and scorned "enthusiasm" as "that greatest incendiary of the earth." His attitude is strikingly similar to that of Charles Chauncy toward the Great Awakening in New England. (See 6, *Critics and Controversy*, above.) Shaftesbury attractively presented Herbert's Deism, and affected like-minded French thinkers. That contact is investigated by Dorothy B. Schlegel in *Shaftesbury and the French Deists* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1956), with bibliography. Covering practically the entire field of eighteenth-century Deism, this indicates Shaftesbury's impact upon Rousseau, and upon the French Revolutionary cult of the Supreme Being, which evoked sympathy among American Deists. Also stressed is Shaftesbury's aim to eradicate the doctrine of original sin and increase self-confidence and intellectual liberty. He is held to have influenced Schelling and Wordsworth, whose ideas attracted Emerson and the Transcendentalists (see F, *Transcendental Religion*, below). A competent survey of Shaftesbury's position is afforded in Alfred Owen Aldridge, *Shaftesbury and the Deist Manifesto* (Philadelphia, 1951, in *Transactions* of the American Philosophical Society, new ser., Vol. 41, part 2, with bibliography).

The relation between English and French intellectual radicalism is ascertained also by Norman Lewis Torrey, in *Voltaire and the English Deists* (New Haven, 1930), with a bibliography. Devoted to John Toland, Anthony Collins, Thomas Woolston, Matthew Tindal, Peter Annet, and others

before 1750, it is a meticulous but readable analysis, based upon study of Voltaire's private library. French and English Deism met in the brilliant English Tory statesman, wit, and philosopher, Henry Saint-John, first Viscount Bolingbroke (1678–1751), who spent years of exile in France, and attempted to reduce Deism to a philosophical "system." His effort is exhaustively treated in Walter McIntosh Merrill, *From Statesman to Philosopher, a Study of Bolingbroke's Deism* (New York, 1949), with bibliography of primary and secondary sources. Bolingbroke knew Voltaire, whose thought was indebted especially to his theories of providence, natural religion, ethics, miracles, evil, and immortality, and his criticism of metaphysics and theology. Another excellent study, reaching independent conclusions by examination of original sources, is David Gwilym James, *The Life of Reason; Hobbes, Locke, Bolingbroke* (London and New York, 1949). He accentuates the salient points of each man's philosophy, the relations between them, and their impacts upon contemporary thought. The international quality of Deism, as revealed in Shaftesbury and Bolingbroke, was paralleled by and associated with the libertarian and revolutionary international movement of the later eighteenth century, which included such American Deistic sympathizers as Paine, Allen, Palmer, Franklin, and Jefferson. Their religious and political liberalisms were inextricably interwoven. (See c, *The Liberalizing Influence of Jefferson*, below.)

The Deistic attack upon traditional religion went far beyond the elegant and cultivated wit of Shaftesbury and Bolingbroke. A small army of more popular authors joined in the cry, and often sank into coarse abuse, giving the Church and the clergy no quarter. Their bitter invectives derived support from Matthew Tindal's *The Rights of the Christian Church Asserted Against the Romanish, and all Other Priests Who Claim an Independent Power Over It* (London, 1706, 2nd ed. cor.); and Anthony Collins' *Priestcraft in Perfection* (London, 1710). The tone of these works, which were

read in America, was later reflected in the freethinkers' assaults on American established churches. (See sect. II, *The Battle for Disestablishment*, above.)

By the 1750's there was such a vast Deistic literature that the demand arose for a critical bibliography, which John Leland supplied in his *View of the Principal Deistical Writers that Have Appeared in England in the Last and Present Century* (London, 1757, 2 vols., 3rd ed.). It was imported into America, especially in the libraries sent to the Anglican clergy by the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel. There are two excellent comprehensive estimates of the English Deistic movement and temper. John Mackinnon Robertson, in *The Dynamics of Religion: an Essay in English Culture* (London, 1926, 2nd ed., rev.), in part II covers its rise and decline in various phases, the counterattack by Bishop Joseph Butler, and the moral and intellectual results of Deism. John Orr, in *English Deism: Its Roots and Its Fruits* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1934), with bibliography, defines its positive and negative elements, the causes of its decline, its general influence in Europe, its impact upon American "modernism" and Biblical criticism, and even upon such comparatively recent free thinkers and liberals as Robert G. Ingersoll, Clarence Darrow, and Harry Emerson Fosdick.

3. DEISM INVADES AMERICA. By the 1750's Deism was beginning to fade in England, but its golden age in America was still to come. Many Englishmen were repelled by the abusiveness of Deist popularizers, and were convinced by defenders of Christianity—Berkeley, Butler, and Warburton (see 4, *Deism and the Anglican Philosophers*, below). Many intelligent (even though not "pious") persons felt that Deism tended to strip religion of its most impressive elements, and reduce it to bare intellectual moralism. As Emerson said of rational Unitarianism, it forgot that men are poets. To America, English Deism transmitted principles that have always inspired liberal religionists, particularly: that God is a "Supreme Being" rather than a personal savior,

and that religion is morality and ethics established upon reason. This is the principle of liberal Unitarianism and Universalism, and of Ethical Culture. (See D, E, and H, below.) The multiple forms of English religion encouraged the Deists' positive search for a common faith: not only what all Christians believe, but the universal element in all religion. In the United States, even among Christians, this ideal partly inspired a reaction against "the scandal of a divided church" in the early nineteenth century, and later efforts to encourage an undenominational, non-creedal faith.

Deism penetrated the colonies easily, because they were not a culturally isolated fragment of frontier, but an integral part of European civilization. They were sensitive, although somewhat belatedly, to European intellectual pulsations. The transition of ideas is illustrated in a scholarly and authoritative study by Michael Kraus, *The Atlantic Civilization: Eighteenth Century Origins* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1949), with bibliography and bibliographical footnotes, including analysis of cultural exchange between America and Europe (chiefly Great Britain) through books and learning and religious relations. The religious aspect is amplified in William Warren Sweet, *Religion in Colonial America* (New York, 1942), with selected bibliography, which has a significant chapter on "The Unchurched Liberals," the spiritual children of rationalism.

Deism penetrated America the more easily, because liberal ministers (especially in New England) attempted to solve religious problems raised by rationalism. The rational viewpoint of Jonathan Mayhew (1720–1766) is indicated by excerpts from his sermons in Alden Bradford's *Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Rev. Jonathan Mayhew,* D.D (Boston, 1838), pointing up his defense of a moral and ethical rather than a theological religion. Even more influential was Charles Chauncy (1705–1787). His effort to rationalize religion is discussed by Norman Brantley Gibbs in "The Problem of Revelation and Reason in the Thought of Charles Chauncy"

(Duke University Thesis, 1953, reviewed in *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 1 (March 1955), pp. 68–69), the first systematic and definitive evaluation of Chauncy's reinterpretation of earlier Puritan doctrine by the new rationalism. Chauncy argued for "fallen" man's innate rational and moral abilities and the role of reason in recognizing Biblical authority, and demonstrated the qualitative difference between rational and revealed religion, as well as the impossibility of a purely irrational approach to faith.

This rational attitude broadened the colonial Deist currents of the early 1700's into a main stream of liberal religion that attained great velocity in the formative years of the United States, 1775–1805. It spread especially among young people, during the post-Revolutionary political and social upheaval and weakness of the churches. Deism derived immense popular prestige from its identification with several Revolutionary heroes. Eminent among them was the poet and diplomat Joel Barlow, one of the literary coterie known as "The Connecticut Wits." Leon Howard in *The Connecticut Wits* (Chicago, 1943), with bibliographical notes, and a check-list including his writings, traces Barlow's search for a philosophical religion of human betterment founded upon a common, innate human ability to perceive essential abstract moral truths, and upon trust in humanitarian sentiment. Not a trained philosopher, he ignored the incongruity between his idealism and his acceptance (as a basis for democratic optimism) of deterministic materialism derived from the sensational philosophy of pleasure and pain. A more specific study of the poet's Deistic religious orientation is Joseph L. Blau's "Joel Barlow, Enlightened Religionist," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (June 1949), pp. 430–444, with bibliographical references in the footnotes. By contact with Thomas Paine and other radical Deists, Barlow's New England conservative religion was transformed into a rational, moralistic, personal, informal, anti-church faith, advocating freedom of worship and a mundane concept of sal-

vation through a free democratic social order. One should consult also Merton A. Christenson, "Deism in Joel Barlow's Early Work . . . ," in *American Literature*, Vol. 27, no. 4 (Jan. 1956), pp. 509–520. As described in his patriotic poem, "The Columbiad" (1807), this gospel of progress would be achieved first in the United States, and inspire a league of enlightened nations. Barlow represents what Jefferson and other liberal political leaders thought about free religion. Another eminent patriotic poet influenced by Deism was Philip Morin Freneau (1752–1832), as appears in the critical introduction to Harry Hayden Clark's edition, *Poems of Freneau* (New York, 1929), with remarks on the general Deistic influence in American verse.

By far the greatest sage claimed by the Deists was Benjamin Frankin. His early shift from Calvinistic to scientific determinism, the source of his religious temper, is briefly accounted for in Paul Russell Anderson and Max Harold Fisch, eds., *Philosophy in America from the Puritans to James, with Representative Selections* (New York, 1939), with references and a general bibliography. Other pertinent studies of his philosophical-religious tenets are in Isaac Woodbridge Riley, *American Philosophy, the Early Schools* (New York, 1907) and Willard Thorp, Merle Curti, and Carlos Baker, eds., *American Issues* (Chicago and Philadelphia, 1941, in Vol. 1, "The Social Record"). A more detailed analysis is Herbert Wallace Schneider, "The Significance of Benjamin Franklin's Moral Philosophy," in *Studies in the History of Ideas* (New York, 1935), Vol. II, pp. 291–312, with bibliographical references in footnotes, and extensive quotations from Franklin's writings. Further light is thrown upon his Deism by Merton A. Christenson's "Franklin on the Hemphill Trial . . . ," in *William and Mary Quarterly*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (July 1953), pp. 422–440. His moral code, derived from practical experience, was a humanist "art of virtue," rejecting philosophical and theological speculation. A Deist early in life, he yet saw the difficulty of Deistic ethics claim-

ing religious authority without divine sanction, and so became an empirical advocate of Puritan moral virtues.

Thomas Paine's literary championship of Deism derived prestige from his services as a Revolutionary pamphleteer. Unlike the suave and tactful Franklin, he was a notorious and reprobate priest-baiter and ridiculer of revealed religion. His religious influence is assessed in many works. Any selection should include Thorp, et al., Vol. 1, "The Social Record," pp. 349–357; pp. 94–103 of Walter G. Muelder and Laurence Sears, eds., *The Development of American Philosophy; a Book of Readings* (Boston, 1940), with introductory notes and bibliographies. Especially enlightening is the section on Paine in G. Adolf Koch, *Republican Religion: The American Revolution and the Cult of Reason* (New York, 1933), covering the period from the Revolution to 1810, when Paine, Ethan Allen, and Elihu Palmer led a campaign to organize Deism as a religious cult. The study is accurate, well-documented, and objective, founded upon thorough and intelligent collection and interpretation of sources, the first comprehensive treatment of a long-neglected movement. Paine's most famous (or infamous) work is his *The Age of Reason,* which gave its title to a period, and became a bible of rational religion. (See Howard Melvin Fast, *The Selected Work of Tom Paine & Citizen Tom Paine,* New York, 1945, Modern Library ed.) Paine's works may be consulted in Moncure D. Conway's edition, *The Writings of Thomas Paine* (New York, 1894–1896, 4 vols.). Paine's religion and its effects upon his general radical philosophy are closely analyzed by Harry Hayden Clark, in two painstaking essays: "An Historical Interpretation of Thomas Paine's Religion," in *University of California Chronicle,* Vol. 35, no. 1 (Jan. 1933), pp. 56–87; and "Toward a Reinterpretation of Thomas Paine," in *American Literature,* Vol. 5, no. 2 (May 1933), pp. 133–145. Paine's ideas are explained by his relations to the ideological pattern of the Enlightenment, and particularly of scientific Deism,

heavily reinforced by the Newtonian doctrine of natural law and order. His reformist religious, social, economic, political, educational, and literary theories all resulted from his faith in the Deistic idea of the creator's harmonious order of the universe, to be apprehended by reason. He attacked organized religion as opposed to the realization of a similar rational harmony in human life. This view differs markedly from that of Moncure D. Conway, *The Life of Thomas Paine* (New York, 1892, 2 vols.), and of Mary A. Best, *Thomas Paine, Prophet and Martyr of Democracy* (New York, 1927), with bibliography. These ascribe Paine's thought to his early Quakerism. Clark believes that they exaggerate, although he admits "considerable" influence of the Quaker doctrines of the fatherhood of God, the brotherhood of man, immediate knowledge of deity, and humanitarianism inspired by divine benevolence. Best considers Paine the greatest contemporary exponent of Quakerism.

Paine's fame was all but equaled by the *succès de scandale* of Ethan Allen's *Reason the Only Oracle of Man* (Bennington, Vt., 1784), believed to have been the first American book to attack Christianity openly. A facsimile edition (New York, 1940) has a valuable introduction by John Pell, the author of a standard modern biography, *Ethan Allen* (Boston and New York, 1929), with extensive bibliography, key to chronology, and notes. Pell minutely probes the early influences that moulded Allen's tenets, particularly questioning of the Bible and creeds because of radically variant interpretations, the Deism of Charles Blount, Newtonian philosophy, and his disgust with the Calvinism of Edwards' sermons. A far more searching analysis of his contribution is Bradford Torrey Schantz, "Ethan Allen's Religious Ideas," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 18, no. 2 (1938), pp. 183–217, with numerous bibliographical references in the footnotes. The roots of Allen's convictions are said to have been the Newtonian concept of a harmonious system of universal natural law, the Lockean sensational psychology, and reason

as the interpreter of God's will revealed in nature. He was akin to the scientific Deists, and shared their republicanism (also their arrogance and conceit), and was more concerned about immortality, less about service to man, denying the theory of man's innate goodness. Other useful references to Allen occur in Koch, pp. 28–50; Riley, pp. 46–58; Anderson and Fisch, pp. 159–183; and Muelder and Sears, pp. 84–93, selections from *Reason the Only Oracle of Man*, preceded by introduction and bibliography.

The third member of the American Deistic trio, for a long period nearly forgotten, was Elihu Palmer (1764–1805). He attempted to organize the movement, and to popularize it through books and magazines. Probably his most significant work is *Principles of Nature; or, A Development of the Moral Causes of Happiness and Misery, among the Human Species* (London, 1823). This typical Deist polemic views evil as resulting from laws of nature rather than divine judgments, and morality as based upon human nature rather than theology; and attacks Biblical inconsistencies, the idea of miracles, and Christianity. Palmer's radicalism persisted in free-thought currents of the workingmen's parties after 1820 (see G, *Free Thought*, etc., below).

An overwhelming majority of American Christians regarded Deism with intense disapproval, but were more or less consciously motivated by its opposition to state churches, creedalism, and denominational exclusiveness. Its stress upon the common heritage of religious belief appealed to convinced Christians who advocated a simple gospel and reunion, like the Disciples of Christ, founded largely by Alexander Campbell. The opposition of these groups to other aspects of Deism is revealed by Robert Frederick West's *Alexander Campbell and Natural Religion* (New Haven, 1948), with bibliography, derived from close examination and evaluation of Campbell's writings, addresses, and debates (particularly his celebrated debate with Palmer), as the champion of revealed religion against Deistic naturalism and atheism.

A complete, scholarly study of American Deism awaited the research of Herbert Montfort Morais, who wrote the standard work, *Deism in Eighteenth Century America* (New York and London, 1934), with an extensive "List of Authorities." It traces the movement from 1713, when Cotton Mather published the first American work on Deism, until the death of Elihu Palmer, the organizer of militant Deism, in 1805, and the triumph of the "Second Great Awakening" of evangelical Christianity. Emphasis is given to the origins and background of Deistic speculation, its relation to other types of rationalism, the development of organized Deism, and its connection with Freemasonry and French culture in America. Especially interesting features mentioned are the movement's social-class support, its prevalence among statesmen, anti-clerical connection, militant phase after 1783, spread from the intellectuals to the masses, the temporary collapse of 1805–1825, and the militant anti-Christian revival in 1825–1835, connected with secular socialism in workingmen's political parties.

4. DEISM AND THE ANGLICAN PHILOSOPHERS. By 1810 American Deism was beginning to wane. Strong opposition had appeared in England long before, pointing out that purely rational religion, lacking the elements of mystery and emotion, is inadequate for most of mankind. Even in the early 1700's defenders of Christianity began a counterattack. One of the most popular defenses was by Charles Leslie (1650–1722): *Short and Easie Method with the Deists, Wherein the Certainty of the Christian Religion is Demonstrated* (London), which reached eight editions by 1723. It was widely circulated in America, especially among Anglicans, who received large quantities of it from the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel. Philip Doddridge, a noted Dissenting minister, took the field with his *Three Discourses on the Evidences of the Christian Religion,* which was much read in the colonies, and was published as late as the 1820's (Princeton, N.J., 1827). John Leland (1691–1766) replied

to Matthew Tindal in *Answer to a Book Intituled, Christianity as Old as the Creation* (London, 1740, 2 vols,, 2nd ed., cor.). Among the most effective champions of Christianity was the saintly William Law (1686–1761). Many were fortified by his *Appeal to All That Doubt, or, Disbelieve the Truths of the Gospel* (London, 1742), and his *Spirit of Love* (see William Law, *Works*, London, 1726–1762, Vol. 8). Law's works were disseminated far and wide in America by the Anglican clergy. His general influence is revealed by John Henry Overton's biography, *William Law, Nonjuror and Mystic . . . A Sketch of His Life, Character, and Opinions* (London, 1881), which considers his opposition to such critics of Christianity as Mandeville and Tindal (see above).

Bishops of the Church of England enjoyed unlimbering heavy scholarly artillery against the Deist ranks. Rationalism met a fair and profoundly learned antagonist in Bishop Joseph Butler of Durham (1696–1752). His *Analogy of Religion, Natural and Revealed, to the Constitution and Course of Nature* (London, 1736) for decades supplied stock arguments to Christian apologists, as a standard textbook for pulpit and pew. The Deists were roughly handled by Bishop William Warburton of Gloucester (1698–1779), whose works were everywhere quoted, particularly *The Divine Legation of Moses Demonstrated, on the Principles of a Religious Deist* (London, 1738, 3 vols., issued as late as 1846, 10th ed.); *The Principles of Natural and Revealed Religion Occasionally Opened and Explained* (London, 1753–1754, 2 vols.); and *Remarks on Mr. David Hume's Essay on the Natural History of Religion* (London, 1777, new ed.), in opposition to the Scottish rationalist and skeptic, who openly attacked Christianity. Warburton's hammer blows probably made a broader (if not deeper) impression than Butler's calm reasoning, or Law's appeals to mystical emotions. Numerous Anglican works defending Christianity are included in *Three Centuries of Anglican Theology, A*

Catalogue of the Works of English Divines of the Sixteenth, Seventeenth, and Eighteenth Centuries (Oxford, 1858), and in John Dowden, *Outlines of the History of the Theological Literature of the Church of England from the Reformation to the Close of the Eighteenth Century* (London and New York, 1897). Anglican relations with Deism are described at length in Charles J. Abbey, *The English Church and its Bishops, 1700–1800* (London, 1887, 2 vols.).

Because of his appeal to American intellectuals, perhaps the most effective idealist-Christian apologist was Bishop George Berkeley of Cloyne. The principles of his idealistic philosophy appear in *Treatise Concerning the Principles of Human Knowledge* (Dublin, 1710; modern edition ed. Philip E. Wheelwright, Garden City, N.Y., 1935, with selected bibliography); and in T. E. Jessop, *Berkeley; Philosophical Writings* (Edinburgh, 1952), with bibliographical note. Berkeley made a considerable impression upon America through his writings, his patronage of Yale College, and his visit to Rhode Island in 1729–1731, during his ill-starred effort to found a college in America. That brief but influential episode is lucidly and learnedly related in Benjamin Rand, *Berkeley's American Sojourn* (Cambridge, Mass., 1932). He reveals many previously unknown facts, and emphasizes the American debt to Berkeley's effect upon intellectual life and philosophical development, through friends after his return to Ireland. One of the friends was the Rev. Dr. Samuel Johnson (1696–1772), of Stratford, Connecticut. He was converted from Congregationalism in 1722, and became the dean of the New England Episcopal clergy, and the first rector of King's College (now Columbia University). He corresponded with Berkeley, and visited him at his home, "Whitehall," near Newport, when the philosopher was writing his anti-Deist *Alciphron; or, The Minute Philosopher, in Seven Dialogues. Containing an Apology for the Christian Religion, Against Those Who are Called Free-Thinkers* (London, 1732, 2 vols.).

Johnson became perhaps the most effective early American opponent of Deism. As a youthful student he had felt the attraction of the "new science" of Sir Isaac Newton, and of the "pure and simple Religion of Nature," with its premise of a first cause, acceptance of a future state, and emphasis upon virtuous living. He was receptive toward the more conservative English Deists, and read Wollaston's *Religion of Nature*, and Anthony Collins's *Discourse of the Grounds and Reasons of the Christian Religion* (London, 1724), with its rather mild criticism of the Bible's inconsistencies, and its plea for free expression in religion. Johnson entertained some "broad" views, but remained firmly Christian. Although admitting the greatest possible freedom of discussion in nonessentials, he would not neglect revelation and accept rational religion as the sole basis of agreement. His general philosophical and religious position is outlined in Adam Leroy Jones, *Early American Philosophers* (New York, 1898), with bibliography, chs. II–III. In this it appears that Johnson was the first and most prominent exponent of Berkeley outside of England, making the Berkeleyan system a defense against skepticism, and the foundation of his own opposition to Locke's sensationalism. A briefer review is Theodore Hornberger's essay, "Samuel Johnson (1696–1772) of Yale and King's College; a Note on the Relation of Science and Religion in Provincial America," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (Sept. 1935), pp. 378–397. The author accents Berkeleyan idealism, which made Johnson suspicious of Deists like Governor William Burnet of New York, with whom he corresponded for a time. He defended Christianity upon grounds of both reason and revelation, and insisted that there was no conflict between the "new science" and revealed truths. The "light of nature" is insufficient and reason must be supplemented by divine revelation to teach the average man just ideas of God. In a sermon at Stratford in 1727 he thus illustrated the necessity of Christianity. His *Introduction to the Study of Philosophy* (London, 1744)

took the same line, adding that the good life consists in promoting individual and public welfare, and that personal conduct determines the future state. A broad view of his philosophical and religious mentality is comprised in Herbert and Carol Schneider, eds., *Samuel Johnson, President of King's College; His Career and Writings* (New York, 1929, 4 vols.), with bibliography and chronological index. See especially Vol. II, "The Philosopher," with introduction, "The Mind of Samuel Johnson"; and notes, pp. 313–323, on Johnson's *Introduction to the Study of Philosophy*. As Johnson aged, he perceived more clearly the liabilities of a purely rational religion, and by the 1750's was quite orthodox and opposed to Deistic ideas.

Somewhat more liberal was his friend and correspondent, Dr. William Smith (1727–1803) of Philadelphia, a spirited Scottish clergyman who profoundly affected American education, and had a wide general intellectual influence. He approached the views of the English "broad" clergy, heavily accenting reason and understanding, and seeking to advance both natural and revealed religion in *A Great Idea of the College of Mirania* (New York, 1753), and *Philosophical Meditation, and Religious Address to the Supreme Being* (London, 1754)—a quite Deistic title. These works are included in Smith's *Discourses on Public Occasions in America* (London, 1762, Appendices II and III). Smith's philosophy is accented in a well-written and balanced study by Albert Frank Gegenheimer, *William Smith, Educator and Churchman* (Philadelphia, 1943), with bibliographical note, which temperately and urbanely rectifies the "misdirected filial piety" of the official biography by a great-grandson, Horace Wemyss Smith: *Life and Correspondence of the Rev. William Smith . . . with Copious Extracts from his Writings* (Philadelphia, 1880, 2 vols.).

Johnson and Smith represent the general opinion of the more intelligent American Christians, that the authority of natural religion rests not upon reason alone, but also upon

clarifying and strengthening revelation. They handled Deism far more politely than their fellow Anglican priest, Uzal Ogden of New Jersey, who wrote in the post-Revolutionary period, when it was a militant force. One of the most popular and hard-hitting answers to Deist arguments was his *Antidote to Deism: The Deist Unmasked* (Newark, N.J., 1795, 2 vols.), intended to refute Thomas Paine's anti-Christian polemic in *The Age of Reason*, and significantly "Addressed to the citizens of these states."

American Deism had reached its climacteric, and soon began to fade. People wearied of the controversy, and many were repelled by the coarse irreligion and scurrility of some Deist writers. Deists of high character and learning sincerely tried to seek truth, abolish religious corruption, and purify Christianity. But they were too cautious, speculative, cool, and refined for the masses. Benjamin Franklin candidly admitted that Deism was not a belief for ordinary people, and it is debatable whether it ever was really popular. Johnson's dread of Deism was exaggerated, for it remained largely an aristocratic intellectual cult in the large towns. Its true importance lies partly in the fact that it forced Christians to reexamine the grounds of their belief, and stirred a genuine interest in theology and morals. Many gladly regained, upon firmer ground, a gospel which they had hastily doubted or forsaken. Deism influenced many eminent intellectual and political leaders, who challenged various forms of authority. Although America never produced a first-rate Deist philosopher, liberal propagandists handled Deistic ideas effectively in political and religious controversies. Their works were not of real theological importance, and today seem immature and shallow, but cannot be measured solely by philosophical or religious competence. Deistic spokesmen contributed not a little to American tolerance of diverse religious traditions and institutions, and suspicion of ties between church and state. Deism helped to prepare the way for various expressions of liberal and rational religion. It derived much prestige

from one man who united the political and religious aspects of liberalism and rationalism—Thomas Jefferson.

C. The Liberalizing Influence of Jefferson

The religious ideas of Thomas Jefferson were one of the important atmospheric currents of American religion for several decades after 1775. Contrary to a widespread belief, especially among his Federalist political enemies, Jefferson was neither anti-Christian nor atheistic. The American Revolution, of which he was a spiritual champion, was not anti-Christian. It derived some of its basic ideals from John Locke, who rationalized but did not repudiate Christianity. The way for it had been indirectly prepared by the republicanism of Reformed churches. More directly, the people had been indoctrinated in the idea of religion as a prop of natural liberty, by the sermons of the clergy, especially in New England.

Jefferson appreciated the support of the pulpit, which is assessed, with a wealth of painstaking scholarship, in Alice M. Baldwin, *The New England Clergy and the American Revolution* (Durham, N.C., 1929), with a very comprehensive bibliography. The earlier sections suggest the relation between the religious and political views of the liberals. Intimate associations between religion and secular ideals of liberty, with special reference to the eighteenth century, are generally stated in Max Savelle's *Seeds of Liberty: The Genesis of the American Mind* (New York, 1948), with a bibliography at the end of each chapter. The study concentrates upon the thought of the "grandfathers of the Revolution," 1740–1760, and by using little-known sources reveals the part played by religion in the libertarian development. In this period began the formation of Jefferson's libertarian-religious principles. The association is clarified more particularly in Carl F. Raeusch's study, "The Religious View of the Doctrine of Natural Rights," in *Journal of the His-*

tory of Ideas, Vol. 14, no. 1 (Jan. 1953), pp. 51–67, with some bibliographical footnotes and references to judicial decisions. This reviews the problem since ancient times, and mentions the influence of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century developments in natural science upon the doctrine of natural law, and the impact of Locke, directly affecting the American Revolution and the Bill of Rights. Jefferson knew that the basis of the attitude of Coke and Blackstone (opposed to sovereignty in *persons*) was the "concept of the Law of Nature as it had been largely conserved by religious and ecclesiastical thought." And in the spirit of Locke's "appeal to heaven," the Declaration of Independence derived from "the laws of nature and of nature's God." Like many rationalist and Deist philosophers and statesmen, Jefferson believed that religion was not truly spiritual unless it *was* the religion of human liberty. That was the meaning of his defiant declaration, that he had sworn upon the altar of God to combat every form of tyranny over the mind of man. His philosophical-religious opinions supported and justified his political activity.

Like other contemporary American statesmen, Jefferson lived in a militantly rational atmosphere, and was more Deist than Christian. He was no churchman in the conventional sense: his aim was to emancipate morality from what he regarded as the distorting influence of orthodox Christianity and arbitrary ecclesiasticism. He shared the somewhat unrealistic purpose of the Deists, to strip off the supernatural "miraculous accretions" upon the sublimely "reasonable" ethical teachings of Jesus. He believed that rational religion is the firmest support of morality. At the request of his friend Benjamin Rush in 1798–1799, he occupied some of his leisure in writing a "Syllabus of an Estimate of the Merit of the Doctrines of Jesus, Compared with Those of Others." In 1803, the strenuous and dangerous year of the Louisiana Purchase, he compiled "The Philosophy of Jesus of Nazareth." Sixteen years later, in his preoccupied retirement at

Monticello, he prepared a much longer "Bible" in Greek, Latin, French, and English. It was not published in his lifetime, but eventually was issued as *The Life and Morals of Jesus of Nazareth* (Washington, D.C., Government Printing Office, 1904) with an introduction by Cyrus Adler, an adherent of the Ethical Culture movement. (See H, *Ethical Culture*, below.) This experiment in revising the Gospels, sometimes called "The Jefferson Bible," reveals that his religious opinions were extremely important to him. The key to his approach is his desire to free morals and ethics from dogma. He felt that Jesus was the greatest of ethical teachers, but that the conception of him should be humanized, and that his teachings should be harmonized with those of Greek philosophy and ethics.

Jefferson never wrote an extensive critical essay on religion, and his opinions must be culled largely from his voluminous writings, including his private letters. Statements may be located by consulting the indices in the last volume of *The Writings of Thomas Jefferson* (Thomas Jefferson Memorial Association, 1903, 20 vols.); and *The Works of Thomas Jefferson* (Federal Edition, 1905, 12 vols.).

The most thorough and equitable analysis of his religious and philosophical opinions is in chs. I–V, X and XV of Adrienne Koch, *The Philosophy of Thomas Jefferson* (New York, 1943), with an extended bibliography. The thesis is that Jefferson has been studied as President and political leader, to the comparative neglect of his role as "the chief philosophical founder of the American way of life." Daniel Joseph Boorstin's *The Lost World of Thomas Jefferson* (New York, 1948), with especially valuable bibliographical notes, discusses the tenor of his thought in relation to the atmosphere of the intellectual "Jeffersonian Circle," especially his fellow members of the American Philosophical Society, who shared his general theological outlook, although with real differences which the author tends to minimize. Pertinent excerpts from his letters, and other references to religion, are in Saul K.

Padover, ed., *The Complete Jefferson* (New York, 1943), with a selected bibliography. References to the association of his religion and philosophy with contemporary Deism are found in Herbert Montfort Morais, *Deism in Eighteenth Century America* (New York, 1934).

An early and rather unfavorable study is T. Leslie Hall's "The Religious Opinions of Thomas Jefferson," in *Sewanee Review*, Vol. 21, no. 2 (Apr. 1913), pp. 164–176. This locates him in the anti-Trinitarian camp, "near the Deists or Free-thinkers," and not in any Christian body, and estimates him as an inconsistent amateur critic of religion, not candid in his editing of the Gospels. A more extensive and unpartisan essay is W. D. Gould, "The Religious Opinions of Thomas Jefferson," in *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (Sept. 1933), pp. 191–209, with sources in the footnotes. Jefferson was not an atheist, regarded religion as a purely personal concern, and made no effort to propagate his opinions even in his family. Generally agreeing with the Unitarians, he warily avoided committing his thoughts to the orthodox, but gave generously to ministers and churches, while believing in a religion of justice and goodness, and regarding Jesus as a sublime *ethical* teacher. George Harmon Knole, in "The Religious Ideas of Thomas Jefferson," *ibid.*, Vol. 30, no. 2 (Sept. 1943), pp. 187–204, with sources in the footnotes, declares that his religious was not as large as his political impact, partly because of his belief that religion should be entirely personal, partly because of politico-religious opposition that would unfavorably exploit any public statement. He ruled out revealed religion, placing his faith in natural moral instincts, making a good life his criterion and utility to mankind the standard measure of virtue, while believing in God's interest in man's present and future happiness. His chief significance lies in his part in the crusade for tolerance. The last two essays rely heavily upon his letters for documentation. Another interesting reference is Edward P. Vandiver, Jr., "Thomas Jefferson's Religion," in

Lutheran Church Quarterly, Vol. 18, no. 3 (July 1945), pp. 300–305.

Among the numerous references to Jefferson's part in attaining religious freedom, two recent studies are outstanding. Henry Wilder Foote, *Thomas Jefferson: Champion of Religious Freedom, Advocate of Christian Morals* (Boston, 1947), in a series of ten essays reviews Jefferson's religious views from his youth, his part in the development of religious liberalism, and his law for establishing religious freedom in Virginia. Foote's mature views of Jefferson's religion are summarized in *The Religion of Thomas Jefferson* (Boston, 1960). A briefer but more critical consideration is that of Sidney E. Mead, in "T. Jefferson's 'Fair Experiment,' Religious Freedom," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 23, no. 4 (Autumn, 1954), pp. 566–579, with some bibliographical footnotes. Mead surveys historical developments leading to contemporary doubt of the experiment's success, and summarizes the concept of religious freedom emerging from careful study of Jefferson's "Bill for Establishing Religious Freedom in Virginia" and Madison's "Memorial and Remonstrance on the Religious Rights of Man," 1784. Jefferson wished to discover whether religious freedom could be compatible with "order in government, and obedience to the laws."

Jefferson championed the ideal of free religion, when it was not generally accepted because the basic tradition of colonial state-churchism was still prevalent. Convinced that history would vindicate him, he directed that his tombstone should record his authorship of the Virginia statute of religious freedom.

D. Universalism

The inspiration and progress of liberal Christianity in America usually are assigned largely to Unitarianism. The seminal influence of Universalism (which came earlier as an

organized movement) has been far less appreciated. Its fundamental tenet, confidence in the ultimate reconciliation and salvation of all men, was widespread in the later colonial and Revolutionary periods, and became a formative element in liberal Protestant doctrine. Although Universalism as a denomination is of fairly recent American origin, its protagonists usually trace its source to Origen, one of the early Church Fathers. He believed that all spirits alienated from God will, by their own motion, be finally restored to full harmony with Him. The early church generally rejected this view as heretical, but it persisted, and was revived during the Reformation.

Universalism was first propagated in America by the ecstatic and visionary, Dr. George de Benneville (1703–1793), a Pennsylvania physician. Born in London of French Protestant refugee parents, he was persecuted for preaching in France, and studied and preached in Germany and Holland. He came to America in 1741, and as early as 1745 preached Universalism at Oley, Pennsylvania. His startingly vivid (but generally unknown) spiritual autobiography was first edited by his disciple, the Rev. Elhanan Winchester (see below) as *Some Remarkable Passages in the Life of Dr. George de Benneville* (Germantown, Pa., rev. and cor., with previously unpublished notes and addenda; a reprint from the American ed. of 1800, tr. from Benneville's original French MS by Winchester, with a preface). Benneville's zeal prevailed upon Winchester (1751–1797), an eloquent and popular Baptist preacher, and a noted Biblical scholar, born in Massachusetts, and converted to Universalism in 1781. Resigning his pulpit in Philadelphia, Winchester led in forming a Universalist church there, and then traveled in England and through the Eastern States, preaching Universalism and establishing churches until his death at Hartford, Conn. He wrote diligently in defense of his new faith. His best known work is *The Universal Restoration, Exhibited in Four Dialogues between a Minister and his Friend,*

the substance of Winchester's conversations with various persons in Europe and America. The volume became immensely popular, and was repeatedly reissued: London, 1792, new ed.; London, 1799, 4th ed., with critical and explanatory notes by Winchester's earliest biographer, William Vidler; Boston, 1831, with biographical notes, and an index of Biblical texts quoted and cited. The best life still is Edwin Martin Stone's *Biography of Rev. Elhanan Winchester* (Boston, 1836), with a catalog of his publications, 1781–1795; based partly upon William Vidler's *A Sketch of his Life and a Review of his Writings,* 1797. These primitive developments of Universalism are briefly and lucidly surveyed by Robert Cummins, the General Superintendent of the Universalist Church of America, in ch. xvii, "The Universalist Church of America," in Vergilius Ferm, ed., *The American Church of the Protestant Heritage* (New York, 1953), with an excellent selected bibliography. (For other bibliographies, see below.)

The intellectual and spiritual ground for the spread of Universalism was prepared also by the learned and eloquent Charles Chauncy (1705–1787), pastor of the First Church in Boston. He was converted to Universalism by seven years' close study of the Pauline Epistles. For some years he made no public profession of his conviction, but in 1783 declared it in a sermon, *Divine Glory Brought to View in the Final Salvation of All Men* (Boston, 1783). This is generally conceded to be his most radical sermon, one of the earliest—and perhaps the ablest—American exposition of Universalism. Some years before Chauncy's bold sermon, Universalism was becoming known in eastern Massachusetts through the writings of James Relly (1722?–1778), a preacher in London. They were being read at Gloucester in 1769, and their admirers at first were known as "Rellyites." Among Relly's works that were then or later widely circulated are: *The Trial of Spirits* (London, 1762, 2nd ed.); *The Sadducee Detected and Refuted* (London, 1764); *Christian Liberty; or,*

The Liberty Wherewith Christ hath made us Free . . . (London, 1775); *Epistles; or, The Great Salvation Contemplated, in a Series of Letters to a Christian Society* (London, 1776); and *Salvation Compleated* (London, 1779).

Universalism, already a quiet current flowing from mind to mind, became a torrent through the itinerant preaching of the Rev. John Murray (1741–1815). He was its earliest popularizer in America, and its founder as an organized church. He was an admirer of Relly, who converted him from Methodism. Unhappy personal circumstances led him to abandon preaching and decide to live a retired life in America. A storm changed his mind and his life by driving his ship aground on the New Jersey coast in 1770, at a place appropriately named (for him) "Good Luck." Warmly greeted there as a long-awaited minister, he resolved to resume the ministry, and began a missionary apostolate with few equals in American history. Appointment as a chaplain in the Continental Army made him extensively known as a rarely appealing and persuasive preacher. Until his death Murray continued to spread Universalism, especially in New England. He recounted his often exciting experiences in an autobiography: *The Life of Rev. John Murray . . . Written by Himself . . . Extended to Some Years after the Commencement of his Public Labors in America. To Which is Added a Brief Continuation to the Closing Scene* (Boston, 1833; Universalist Library, Vol. 1). This is the fifth, greatly improved edition, with notes and an appendix by the Rev. L. S. Everett. Other editions appeared at varying intervals, and a new one, with an introduction and notes, was edited by the Rev. G. L. Demarest, and issued by the Universalist Publishing House, as *The Life of Rev. John Murray, Preacher of Universal Salvation, Written by Himself, With a Continuation, by Mrs. Judith Sargent Murray* (Boston, 1896). A briefer but more scholarly biography was prepared for the bicentennial of George de Benneville and the 170th anniversary of Murray's landing, by Clarence Russell Skin-

ner and Alfred Storer Cole: *Hell's Ramparts Fell, the Life of John Murray* (Boston, 1941), with an extensive list of references. This includes especially readable narratives of Murray's conversion to Universalism, the opposition, his voyage to America, and the beginning of his career as a Universalist apostle.

The way for Murray had been smoothed by De Benneville, Relly, Chauncy, and Winchester. Especially in New England, the reaction against the Calvinistic doctrine of special election, as emphasized in the Great Awakening, had created a widespread receptivity toward the idea of universal salvation. It was, therefore, not insuperably difficult for Murray to establish Universalism as an organized denomination by founding the first church at Gloucester in 1779. After tedious litigation, in 1786 the congregation was exempted from state-church taxes. This is believed to have been the first such test case, a landmark in the history of free religion.

Benneville and Murray were relatively conservative Universalists, merely holding that reconciliation and redemption of fallen man were accomplished once and for all by Christ. They preached the ultimate salvation of all souls after a purgation, while modern Universalists preach universal salvation with no reference to future punishment, believing that retribution is complete in life. Neither they nor Relly provided a solid broad theological base for Universalism. That huge task was accomplished by the Rev. Hosea Ballou (1771–1852), a native of New Hampshire, who became a Boston preacher of Arian views. The best succinct exposition of his more advanced liberal position is a sermon by the noted Universalist minister, John Coleman Adams: *Hosea Ballou and the Gospel Renaissance of the Nineteenth Century* (Boston and Chicago, 1903), published in commemoration of the centennial of the Universalist creed adopted at Winchester, N.H. The author considers the influence of Universalism upon American religious thought in the nineteenth century as a revival of Jesus' primitive Gospel, and Murray's work

as an attempt to free popular religion from both despair and infidelity. Ballou is estimated as anticipating William E. Channing's concept of the unity and fatherhood of God, Horace Bushnell's doctrine of atonement, and Henry Ward Beecher's denunciation of Calvinism. He was the formulator of the principles of American Universalism: the fatherhood of God, the brotherhood of man, the atonement as expressive of God's love, and the natural character of retribution. A Unitarian in his doctrine of God, Ballou was a foremost preacher to the common people, and a pioneer of American liberal Christianity of the later nineteenth century. An early landmark in its development was his *Treatise on Atonement* (1805), considered by Adams as the first American book to urge a "broad church" theology. It established Ballou's place as an original thinker framing a truly Biblical theology, and passed through many editions. The fourteenth, with a list of the editions up to that date, appeared as *A Treatise on Atonement; in which the Finite Nature of Sin is Argued, its Cause and Consequences as such; the Necessity and Nature of Atonement; and its Glorious Consequences, in the Final Reconciliation of all Men to Holiness and Happiness* (Boston, 1902). Another popular work by Ballou, which defines Universalist doctrine, is *An Examination of the Doctrine of Future Retribution, on the Principles of Morals, Analogy and the Scriptures* (Boston, 1834), previously published in part in the *Universalist Magazine* and the *Universalist Expositor.* Also influential was his *A Voice to Universalists* (Boston, 1849; Boston and Cincinnati, 1851). Some of Ballou's sermons were collected and published after his death. An especially good edition is the third: *Sermons on Important Doctrinal Subjects, with Critical and Explanatory Notes* (Boston, 1856). The intense orthodox opposition to Ballou's teachings is well illustrated by an effort of the Presbyterian Board of Publication to counteract them: Archibald Alexander (1772–1851), *Universalism False and Unscriptural; an Essay on the Duration and Intensity of Future*

Punishment (Philadelphia, 1851). Ballou's career is reviewed at length, with a wealth of personal reminiscence, by the youngest of his several sons, Maturin Murray Ballou: *Biography of Rev. Hosea Ballou* (Boston, 1852).

The Universalist Church is one of the earliest of American origin, having been organized when Ballou was a youth, at a convention held in Philadelphia in 1790. Three years later the New England Universalists established their own convention, which at a meeting in Winchester, N.H., in 1803, adopted a "Profession of Belief." For nearly a century this remained the creed of American Universalism. In 1899 the National Universalist Convention accepted a modern, liberalized statement, known as the "Five Principles." These stress the universal fatherhood of God, the spiritual authority and leadership of Christ, the trustworthiness of the Bible as God's revelation, just retribution for sins, and the final harmony of all souls with God. New England became the stronghold of Universalism, but the belief spread throughout the United States, and late in the nineteenth century was represented by over forty state conventions. It was strongest in regions heavily populated by New England emigrants, especially up-state New York and Ohio. A vast literature bears upon regional and local history, especially during the period of rapid progress before about 1850. Substantial histories of typical Universalist evangelism are Stephen Rensselaer Smith's *Historical Sketches and Incidents Illustrative of the Establishment and Progress of Universalism in the State of New York* (Buffalo, 1843); and Nathaniel Stacy's *Memoirs of the Life of Nathaniel Stacy . . . Comprising a Brief Circumstantial History of the Rise and Progress of Universalism in the State of New York* (Columbus, Pa., 1850). The brevity of these works is more titular than real, fortunately, as they are highly valuable compilations of source materials, by ministers who were deeply involved in the events. A modern work of the same character, but founded upon a more scientific concept of historiography, is Elmo

Arnold Robinson, *The Universalist Church in Ohio* (Akron? Ohio, 1923), issued by the Ohio Universalist Convention. Especially valuable are the "Biographical Notes of Ohio Ministers," and the extensive bibliography. This is one of the few substantial histories of Universalism in a state. It comprises accounts of its rise and progress, tours by ministers, the theology of Ohio Universalism, its extent and significance 1830–1920 (with maps), statistical appendices, reviews of organizations, education, attitudes on current questions, notes on local church history and old and new beliefs.

Universalism reached its peak in 1830–1860, and thereafter gradually declined. Several hundred churches were abandoned before 1940. Universalism had become so pervasive, however, that its decline as a denomination did not represent a similar fading of its influence. The period of closing churches displayed a remarkable interest in Universalist history. The historiography owes a vast debt to the scholarly and devoted Richard Eddy, author of *Universalism in America, A History* (Boston, 1884–1886, 2 vols.), the only really adequate account ever written. It is a thorough chronological history, emphasizing the evangelistic work of Murray, Winchester, and the Ballous; progress in the states; surveys of general phases of activity; organizations; and the association of Universalism with moral reform. It is rich in ministerial and lay biography, and information on Sunday schools, academic and theological education, and periodical literature. The massive bibliography in volume two, with an index, comprises 2,278 titles in chronological sequence, 1753–1886, a complete list of all American publications for or against Universalism, with a few foreign titles, and articles from various denominational reviews. An abbreviated form is the author's *History of Universalism* (New York, 1894, in Vol. 10 of The American Church History Series, New York, 1893–1897), with a brief bibliography. An excellent selected bibliography follows ch. XVII,

"The Universalist Church of America," by Robert Cummins, in Vergilius Ferm, ed., *The American Church of the Protestant Heritage* (New York, 1953). An essential supplement to these authorities is the huge compilation of data published by the Massachusetts Works Projects Administration, Division of Community Service Programs, Historical Records Survey: *An Inventory of Universalist Archives in Massachusetts* (Boston, 1942), cosponsored by the Universalist Historical Society, under the auspices of the Massachusetts Universalist Convention. This is an indispensable source for a study of Universalism in Massachusetts and the United States. It contains a history of Universalism in Massachusetts, and inventories of records of local churches and of state and national organizations, including the Universalist General Convention, and the rich collections of the Universalist Historical Society, Tufts College, Medford, Mass. The bibliography has many later works not included in Richard Eddy's. Official proceedings and statistics appear in the Universalist Church of America, *Biennial Reports and Directory* (Boston, Universalist General Convention, 1894– , issued annually 1894–1934, and with varying titles).

The message of modern Universalism to American life is inspired largely by its fidelity to the cause of reformed social morality. The record is described as unsurpassed by any other denomination, in the Rev. Leonard Bacon's *History of American Christianity*. Its appeal stresses the primacy of man in the scheme of creation, the essential unity of all men, and the universality of truth. It is not a merely social creed, nor a protest against what it regards as past errors of orthodoxy, but a unifying and reconciling faith. This orientation is clarified by such thoughtful essays as L. B. Fisher, *Which Way? A Study of Universalists and Universalism* (Boston, Universalist Publishing House, 1921) and Alfred Storer Cole, *Our Liberal Heritage* (Boston, 1951). The liberal attitude is illustrated also in the book of liturgy,

Services of Religion for Special Occasions (Boston, 1943). This has been used since 1937, and was prepared by the Universalist Commission on Hymns and Services, in cooperation with a commission of the same name appointed by the Unitarian Churches. It evidences increasing sympathy among Universalists toward a long-discussed merger with the other group, which emerged from the same matrix of eighteenth-century liberalism. (See also Part Five, sect. II, H, 4, *Universalist Theology*.)

E. Unitarianism

1. ORIGINS. As Thomas Jefferson sought for the fundamentals of an ethical religion, he was acutely aware of a quiet but powerful current moving toward the same goal. In a letter to his friend, Benjamin Waterhouse, he confessed his belief that the future American religion would be Unitarianism. He undoubtedly observed with unusual interest the Unitarian capture of the Hollis Professorship of Divinity at Harvard College in 1805. It was the first sensational triumph of liberalism in that one-time orthodox stronghold.

The movement had been gathering momentum for more than fifty years. It reached the New World by a long and often obscure route, which is briefly and clearly traced by the scholarly Unitarian minister, Edwin T. Buehrer, in ch. VIII, "Unitarianism," of Vergilius Ferm, ed., *The American Church of the Protestant Heritage* (New York, 1953). The tradition is followed from the Old Testament prophets—Amos, Hosea, Micah, and Isaiah—who placed morality above ceremonial, and Christian scholars of the first nine centuries, including Origen, Arius, Pelagius, and Claudius of Turin. It revived in the Reformation era, especially in the writings of Michael Servetus (1511–1553), who in 1531 published his *Errors of the Trinity*. Unitarian views were promulgated in the late sixteenth century by Italian re-

formers named Sozzini, hence Unitarianism's name "Socinianism." They found refuge from persecution in Poland, which became a seedplot of anti-Trinitarian belief. The complicated history, full of intense drama and human interest, has been definitively related by Earl Morse Wilbur in *A History of Unitarianism: Socinianism and its Antecedents* (Cambridge, Mass., 1945, with bibliographical footnotes, being Vol. I of *A History of Unitarianism*). Based upon a lifetime of exhaustive research, this carries the story through the seventeenth century, and reveals the rich background of New England's brilliant Unitarian renaissance. Also indispensable as a guide in extensive exploration is Wilbur's *A Bibliography of the Pioneers of the Socinian-Unitarian Movement in Modern Christianity, in Italy, Switzerland, Germany, Holland* (Rome, 1950). A brief, more popular survey, from the Apostolic period to 1925, is the same author's very readable *Our Unitarian Heritage, An Introduction to the History of the Unitarian Movement* (Boston, 1925), which lacks a bibliography but has "Important Dates in Unitarian History," c.1660–1925, five chapters on America since 1740, and a summary of the significance of Unitarianism in the costly battle for free thought and religion.

A fertile early garden of Unitarianism was Transylvania, where it still attests the careful, scholarly nurture of Francis David (1510–1579), under the enlightened and unusually tolerant policy of King Sigismund. Seeds sprouted also among the Dutch Anabaptists, who in 1535 fled to England, only to encounter savage persecution. English Unitarianism became a harassed, underground movement. Its first avowed defender is supposed to have been John Bidle (born 1615), of the University of Oxford, who founded a short-lived society of "mere Christians." From his time the current never dried up in England, whence various rills flowed to America. The transition from nation to nation, and across the Atlantic, has been traced by several Unitarian scholars. An old but still useful authority is Joseph Henry Allen's *Historical*

Sketch of the Unitarian Movement Since the Reformation (New York, 1894, in Vol. 10 of "The American Church History Series," New York, 1893–1897), with bibliographical footnotes. English-speaking Unitarianism cannot be adequately comprehended without reference to movements with which it established mutually sympathetic and fruitful contacts. A summary and appreciation is a series of sixteen lectures delivered in 1888–1889 by various authors in Channing Hall, Boston. These were edited by the well-known Unitarian minister, George Willis Cooke, as *Unitarianism: Its Origin and History* (Boston, 1895, 2nd ed.). They include Unitarianism and the Reformation; English Unitarianism; Early New England Unitarians; the relations of American Unitarianism to German thought, Transcendentalism, modern Biblical criticism, literature, scientific thought and philosophy; and appreciations of William Ellery Channing and Theodore Parker. By far the best account of the budding and American flowering of Unitarianism is a product of the meticulous scholarship of Earl Morse Wilbur: *A History of Unitarianism in Transylvania, England, and America* (Cambridge, Mass., 1952, being Vol. 2 of *A History of Unitarianism*). Skillfully the author unravels, in a packed but clear narrative, the complicated relations of various forms of Unitarianism to the centuries-long pattern of Christian thought in many countries. The documentation is massive, and the want of a bibliography is supplied by footnotes, some of which are miniature bibliographies of intricate controversies, and historical and theological developments.

2. THE ENGLISH BACKGROUND. Early English Unitarianism arose primarily from the gradual and somewhat clandestine liberalizing of Protestant, and particularly Presbyterian theology. The influence seeped into England through works of Polish and Dutch Socinians, and quietly swung some nonconformist and Anglican ministers toward "broad churchmanship." That silent transformation is ex-

haustively examined by the great English Unitarian scholar, Herbert John McLachlan, whose works are essential to an understanding of the sources of American Unitarianism. Basic is his *Socinianism in Seventeenth-Century England* (London, 1951), with bibliographical footnotes. He stresses the importance of ideal rather than purely economic motives in socio-religious history, and illumines the origin and development of intellectual and religious strands that were woven into the fabric of emergent rationalism, religious freedom, and tolerance. Socinianism was modified by Bidle and his followers into simple Unitarianism, and was not merely a sect or a body of doctrine with certain views about the nature of God and the person and work of Christ, but also a mental and spiritual climate encouraging principles rather than dogma. As part of a larger movement toward free inquiry, Socinianism reinforced the supremacy of private judgment, undermined the dominance of Calvinism, and prepared the way to John Locke's rationalism and the eighteenth-century "Age of Reason." (See B, 2, 3, and 4, *Deism*, above.) This superb study may be supplemented by McLachlan's *Essays and Addresses* (Manchester, Eng., 1950), revising and enlarging his studies (with some bibliographic footnotes) on the biographies, ideas, scholarship, and influence of liberal English nonconformists from the seventeenth through the nineteenth century, with particular references to their worship, and to their academies (see below). The broad intellectual influences of Unitarian leaders are minutely assessed in the same author's *The Unitarian Movement in the Religious Life of England*, Vol. I, "Its Contribution to Thought and Learning, 1700–1900" (London, 1934), which has bibliographical footnotes and an "Index of Periodicals." The broad sweep of this study comprises Unitarian contributions to periodical and general literature, doctrine, philosophy, history, biography, Biblical scholarship, and education, especially in the nonconformist academies.

Those institutions were one of the seminal influences in English Unitarianism and general religious liberalism. Their principles partly explain the penetration of liberalism into nonconformist churches after the Anglican and Royalist Restoration of 1660, and the "Test Act" of 1662, which drove about two thousand clergymen from the Church of England. Small private schools, established by some of the "silenced ministers," felt no compulsion to respect orthodox Anglican formulations, and sometimes became remarkably liberal and rationalistic. Their example inspired the establishment of similar academics by American Protestant clergymen and laymen. An appreciation of their spirit appears in Irene Parker's *Dissenting Academics in England, Their Rise and Progress and their Place among the Educational Systems of the Country* (Cambridge, Eng., 1914), which indicates their progressive trend to modern "practical" studies, their favor toward mathematics and science, and their encouragement of free inquiry. After the Toleration Act of 1689, some new academies resembled modern theological seminaries. Their encouragement of theological liberalism appears in Herbert John McLachlan's *English Education under the Test Acts, Being the History of the Non-conformist Academies, 1662–1820* (Manchester, Eng., 1931), with an extensive bibliography of primary (including manuscript) and printed sources. This emphasizes the tolerant atmosphere of schools where lay and divinity students worked together and liberal religious leaders received inspiration. The strong intellectual background of English liberal nonconformity, which was paralleled in America, is suggested by two scholarly monographs. The first is McLachlan's *The Story of a Nonconformist Library* (Manchester, Eng., London, and New York, 1923), primarily a history of the influential library of the Unitarian Home Missionary College in Manchester, but illuminating also as a picture of liberal dissenting mentality in the early nineteenth century, which affected American Unitarianism. Olive M. Griffiths, in *Religion and*

Learning; a Study in English Presbyterian Thought from the Bartholomew Ejections (1662) to the Foundation of the Unitarian Movement (Cambridge, Eng., 1935), with a bibliography, reviews the modernist theological movement with sound historical investigation, and displays a clear comprehension of the basic issues in the transformation to liberalism. The emergent reformist ideals of some Unitarians were reflected in America by ministers like Joseph Tuckerman and Theodore Parker. They were realized in a movement among humble people in Lancashire (1811–1858), which is described in Herbert John McLachlan's *The Methodist Unitarian Movement* (Manchester, London, and New York, 1919), with a bibliography. Combining piety and rationalism, the group promoted liberal social and political ideals and the economic cooperative movement.

In the eighteenth century, English Unitarianism became part of the broad current of "advanced" thought, which is reviewed in Roland N. Stromberg, *Religious Liberalism in Eighteenth-Century England* (London, 1954), with many bibliographical footnotes, and an exhaustive bibliography of original and secondary sources. Stromberg points out that while Unitarianism lacked religious poetry, it opened the way to social reform through religion, as in the scientist, Joseph Priestley (1733–1804), who helped to plant Unitarianism in America.

With Priestley and his contemporaries Unitarianism became an organized and aggressive force. Especially before the Toleration Act of 1689, the law had curbed open expression. The new confident tone was due largely to Priestley's intimate friend and correspondent, the Reverend Theophilus Lindsey (1723–1808), who adopted Priestley's Unitarian views, and in 1773 raised an ecclesiastical furor by resigning his living in the Church of England. In the following year he opened the first avowedly Unitarian meetinghouse in England—the Essex Street chapel, London. His attractive preaching won many followers, including Thomas Paine,

who later popularized rational religion in America (see B, 3, *Deism*, above). His revision of the Anglican Book of Common Prayer, by omitting the Trinitarian creeds, was soon followed by the Reverend James Freeman at King's Chapel in Boston. He promoted the movement to abolish penalties against Unitarian beliefs, which attained success in 1813. The influence of this pioneer is appreciated in Herbert John McLachlan's *Letters of Theophilus Lindsey* (Manchester, Eng., London, and New York, 1920), with explanatory introduction.

3. AMERICAN ORIGINS. Congregational and Anglican churches in New England had felt the liberal impulse even before Lindsey and his friends dramatized it by public avowal. Some ministers and laymen had long been familiar with Unitarian books, and the earliest English Unitarian periodical, *The Theological Repository* (1769–1788). Many minds had been affected by the slow liberalizing of Calvinism, which was accelerated by repulsion from emotional excesses of the Great Awakening. Reactions to the Awakening are differentiated by Herbert W. Schneider in *The Puritan Mind* (New York, 1930), particularly pp. 192–264. Neo-Calvinism, stemming from Edwardsean theology, transformed that dynamic and somewhat mystical system into a repellant legalism, which later was increasingly liberalized to make it palatable to a more rational and humane temper. A much smaller group of rationalists, typified by Benjamin Franklin, moved toward undogmatic Deism. (See B, 3, *Deism*, above.) Another group, the liberals, flourished among cultivated, urbane ministers and laymen in the seaboard towns, especially in Massachusetts. They rapidly forsook traditional Calvinism, believing in the capacity of man to win salvation through moral effort (Arminianism), a Unitarian conception of God (Arianism), and the possibility of ultimate salvation for all men (Universalism). Unitarianism and Universalism were fruits of Congregational and Anglican liberalism.

Between 1740 and 1775 many Massachusetts Congregational ministers were "liberals," and cherished Unitarian and Universalist views. Harvard College was "infected," and Joseph Willard (said to have been the first anti-Trinitarian on the faculty) corresponded with Deistic followers of Voltaire in France, and with Priestley. The boldest proponents of liberalism were Jonathan Mayhew and Charles Chauncy. The former's advanced position appears in quotations from his writings in Alden Bradford's *Memoir of the Life and Writings of Rev. Jonathan Mayhew, D.D.* (Boston, 1838). Chauncy's is typified by his radical Universalist sermon, *Divine Glory Brought to View in the Final Salvation of All Men* (Boston, 1783). These men, especially Mayhew, were excoriated by the conservative Anglican, Thomas B. Chandler, as enemies of both the Trinity and loyalty to the Crown. The relation between religious and political liberalism is displayed with a wealth of supporting evidence (especially sermons) by Alice M. Baldwin, in *The New England Clergy and the American Revolution* (Durham, N.C., 1929), with bibliography.

Once openly avowed, Unitarianism spread with astounding speed. The soil had been broken for it by the Awakening and the Revolution, and new seed was scattered by English immigrants. Lindsey's influence came with William Hazlitt (father of the famous essayist), who about 1785 persuaded James Freeman, the Harvard minister of Boston's King's Chapel, to omit Trinitarian references and prayers to Christ. Thus was founded the first avowed Unitarian church in America. In 1791 the movement gathered prestige from Priestley, who sought a haven from persecution in England, established a Unitarian church in Philadelphia, and influenced the religious ideas of his lifelong friend, Thomas Jefferson (see c, *The Liberalizing Influence of Jefferson*, above). The movement gained speed through the liberalizing of the First Church in Plymouth (1800), and the election of Henry Ware, Jr. as Professor of Divinity at Harvard

College (1805). About 1815 liberals began to accept the name "Unitarian," largely through the influence of the Reverend William Ellery Channing. In 1818 the Massachusetts Congregational churches began to split into Unitarian and "Orthodox" parishes, and in 1825 the liberals reluctantly became a denomination by forming the American Unitarian Association. The germinal period is attractively reviewed in Conrad Wright, *The Beginnings of Unitarianism in America* (Boston, 1955, with a biographical appendix and a bibliographical note), which covers the years 1735–1805. The view of two generations of religious liberals, commonly called "Arminians," reveals the development of their ideas of human nature and destiny, and corrects the error of lumping them with the Deists. There are two older but still useful reviews of the general development up to the twentieth century: (1) Joseph H. Allen and Richard Eddy, *A History of the Unitarians and the Universalists in the United States* (New York, 1894, Vol. 10 in "The American Church History Series," with bibliography); and (2) George Willis Cooke, *Unitarianism in America; a History of its Origin and Development* (Boston, 1902), without bibliography, but based upon a wide range of original (including manuscript) and secondary sources, and with a list of Unitarian periodicals, 1827–1899. Tracing the movement from obscure New England origins, the narrative briefly reviews its early theological controversies. It was not a body of churches, but a way of life, illustrated by the careers and influence of eminent Unitarians, an example of religious evolution in a sincere effort to harmonize religion with philosophy and science, and to reconcile Christianity with the modern spirit. A rich source of published materials is the Unitarian Historical Society of Boston, *Proceedings* (Boston, 1925–1941, Vols. 1–7), containing essays and addresses not found elsewhere. Vol. 1, part 1, 1925, has a list of addresses delivered previous to the publication of the *Proceedings*, 1901–1925. The Society, founded in 1900, has large collections on Uni-

tarian history and personalities. Other necessary sources are the American Unitarian Association's *Annual Report* (Boston, 1851-[1940], 41 vols.), published since 1944/5 in the *Unitarian Year Book* (Boston, 1911–). The course of Unitarian thought and propaganda, with much historical and biographical material, may be followed in *Catalogues of Publications of the American Unitarian Association* (Boston, 1889– , and undated), listed in John G. Barrow, *A Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1955).

Unitarianism advanced rapidly among the wealthy and educated classes, whose prestige lent influence far out of proportion to numerical strength. Unitarian churches outside New England flourished mostly in larger cities. The movement encountered determined and bitter opposition, centering in the newly organized "Orthodox" seminary (1809) at Andover, Mass., and in Yale-dominated Connecticut Congregationalism. The latter organized an anti-liberal crusade, led by the formidable Reverend Lyman Beecher. His "war of the godly" is most ably and vividly chronicled by Sidney E. Mead's essay, "Lyman Beecher and Connecticut Orthodoxy's Campaign against the Unitarians, 1819–1826," in *Church History*, Vol. 9, no. 3 (Sept. 1940), pp. 218–234. This reveals Beecher as the protagonist of the orthodox revival, begun by President Timothy Dwight of Yale, and prolonged in the "Second Great Awakening" of the 1820's. Another Hercules of orthodoxy was the eloquent, truculent, and laborious Reverend Jedidiah Morse of Massachusetts. His massive and prolonged assault upon Unitarianism is described by James King Morse in *Jedidiah Morse, a Champion of New England Orthodoxy* (New York, 1939), with extensive bibliography. This is not a biography, but a clarification of the orthodox hero's part in the theological controversy, and a well-documented effort to reveal the intricate religious pattern of the emergent era of Unitarianism, 1783–1819.

Beecher, Morse, and their sympathizers largely succeeded in stemming the Unitarian tide, at least to outward appearance. After about 1830 it ceased to grow rapidly *as a denomination* in New England. In Connecticut it was effectively halted. The real influence was its quiet penetration of the mind. And whatever it lost in New England was compensated by striking gains in some large cities elsewhere, especially by a westward sweep to the Pacific. Recent Unitarian historiography has realized this significant fact in Charles H. Lyttle's *Freedom Moves West: a History of the Western Unitarian Conference, 1852–1952* (Boston, 1952). The author, sometime professor of church history, Meadville Theological School, reviews early Unitarian penetration of the West, largely by New Englanders, the founding of Meadville, the organization of Western Unitarianism, and its struggle for free expression of more radical views than those of the East, including religious humanism. The model "Bibliographical Guide" lists and reviews all pertinent original and secondary sources. By 1850 Unitarianism was striking root on the Pacific Coast. It soon won acclaim through the heroic efforts of the Reverend Thomas Starr King to keep California on the union, anti-slavery side as the Civil War loomed. The Reverend Arnold Crompton, minister of the First Unitarian Church of Oakland, relates this thrilling story in *Unitarianism on the Pacific Coast: the First Sixty Years* (Boston, 1957), with bibliographical notes on the sources, mostly original and previously unexplored records, now in the Earl Morse Wilbur Library of the Starr King School for the Ministry. The volume reviews the planting in San Francisco, extension along the coast, organization, the work of Charles Wendte, and the half-century jubilee of 1900.

4. EARLY AMERICAN UNITARIAN THOUGHT. Like all new religious movements, Unitarianism was soon compelled to define its position, to meet the demands of internal discussion and external criticism. Unitarians from the first were wary of

being defined. The only authority who approximated the role of systematizer was the exquisitely cultured Reverend William Ellery Channing (1780–1842), a saintly, disinterested, and persuasive advocate. His earlier writings still are esteemed as expositions of "classical" or rational Unitarianism before about 1850. Insofar as his Arminianism, Moralism, and humanitarian sentiment continued to characterize Unitarians, he may be considered as their "founder." Probably the clearest expression of the objection to Calvinism is his "The Moral Argument Against Calvinism" (1809). His classic definition of early Unitarianism is his sermon in 1819 at the installation of editor and historian Jared Sparks as pastor of the church in Baltimore: *Unitarian Christianity; a Discourse on Some of the Distinguishing Opinions of Unitarians, Delivered at Baltimore, May 5, 1819* (Boston, 1948). Other eloquent discourses expounding his opinions are: "Christianity a Rational Religion," "The Great Purpose of Christianity," "The Inimitableness of Christ's Character," "Love to Christ," "Self-Denial," and "The Evil of Sin." These titles appear in *The Works of William E. Channing, D.D.* (Boston, 1847, 7 vols.). Channing's contribution to liberal Christianity is adequately summarized in a sympathetic biography by J. W. Chadwick: *William Ellery Channing, Minister of Religion* (Boston, 1903).

Channing's theology, although far from the old New England orthodoxy, was still as relatively conservative as the titles of his discourses (see above). But its liberal principles were capable of development, and initiated a steady progress toward modern radicalism. This has been elucidated in successive histories of Unitarian theology and thought. Among the earliest and best is Joseph Henry Allen, *Our Liberal Movement in Theology, Chiefly as Shown in Recollections of the History of Unitarianism in New England, Being a Closing Course of Lectures Given in the Harvard Divinity School* (Boston, 1882), including a memorial address by the Reverend Frederic H. Hedge on the Reverend

Messrs. Henry W. Bellows and Ralph Waldo Emerson. An excellent summary of Unitarian theological evolution is in F. H. Foster, *A Genetic History of the New England Theology* (Chicago, 1907), with biographical and bibliographical footnotes. A former long-time pastor of the Brookline, Mass. Second Church, Thomas VanNess, gives a similar bird's eye view in *The Religion of New England* (Boston, 1926), explaining the background of religious thought from colonial times, and the contributions of such eminent Unitarians as W. E. Channing, R. W. Emerson, James Freeman Clarke, and Edward Everett Hale. A far more scholarly and penetrating interpretation is Joseph Haroutunian, *Piety Versus Moralism: the Passing of the New England Theology* (New York, 1932). Comprising the period 1750–1850, from Edwards to Channing, this new-Calvinist interpretation justly depicts the struggle between Calvinist God-centered salvation and man-centered salvation by character. It maintains the close connections of the logical process of transformation into liberalism, and yet sustains dramatic interest by quoting sources and letting great antagonists speak for themselves. This individual and personal quality of liberal theology is emphasized by two monumental biographical compilations: William Buell Sprague, ed., *Annals of the American Pulpit* (New York, 1857–[1869], Vol. 8, "Unitarian Congregational," 1865); and Samuel Atkins Eliot, ed., *Heralds of a Liberal Faith . . . with an Introduction* (Boston, 1910–[1952], 4 vols.). The latter contains biographies of over 500 ministers since about 1750, including many later ones personally known to the editor; selected bibliographies of their writings; and introductions to Vols. 1 and 4 containing much general Unitarian history.

Early Unitarianism was distinctly Christian, formally rational, and on the whole conservative. One of its exponents is now better known than formerly, through a brief but very significant essay by George Huntston Williams: *Rethinking the Unitarian Relationship with Protestantism; an Examina-*

tion of the Thought of Frederic Henry Hedge, 1805–1890 (Boston, 1949), with bibliographical references showing extensive research, in the "Notes." Hedge's conservatism is indicated by notes on his idea of religion undergirded by revelation, and by his unwillingness to sacrifice tested and valid Christian doctrine and tradition or to let the church become a mere philanthropic society. Also considered are the relations of this central figure to the early ecumenical movement, German idealism, the emerging Social Gospel, and Transcendentalism (see F, *Transcendental Religion,* below). A variant type of conservatism, representing the mid-nineteenth-century Boston "right wing," was the philosophy of Andrew Preston Peabody. It is expounded in his *Christianity the Religion of Nature* (Boston, 1864; also 2nd ed., 1870), expressing a view akin to the eighteenth-century deistic "Religion of Nature." His views may be further explored in *Christianity and Science* (New York, 1875), a series of lectures given in 1874 at Union Theological Seminary, New York. Peabody praised Paley's conservative *Evidences of Christianity* as a convincing refutation of historical skepticism, also Andrews Norton's *Genuineness of the Gospels.* He opposed naturalism as rank "infidelity," and regarded Christianity as revealed because essentially true and right. The beliefs of the moderate majority which opposed Theodore Parker are explained at length in George Ellis, *Half-Century of the Unitarian Controversy* (Boston, 1857). The character of moderate and evangelical Unitarianism appears in the rather neglected files of the *Monthly Religious Magazine* (Boston), especially in the period 1853–1861, when it was edited by Frederic Dan Huntington, who became an Episcopalian, and recorded his evangelical Unitarian phase in his *Memoir and Letters* (Boston, 1906).

The cautious "Boston religion" is charmingly described by Octavius Brooks Frothingham in *Boston Unitarianism, 1820–1850; a Study of the Life and Work of Nathaniel Langdon Frothingham* (New York, 1890), a study of a type which

the author (once a Transcendentalist) had left behind. It was a simple rationalism, lying between the "spiritualism" of William E. Channing and the "naturalism" of Theodore Parker. "The religion of unadorned good sense" was scholarly, gentle, not deeply creative, at ease with existing institutions. (See also Part Five, sect. II, H, 2, *Unitarian Theology*.)

5. MODERN AMERICAN UNITARIANISM. "Boston Brahmin" religion was weighed and found wanting by some of the younger ministers. Before his death Channing distressfully contemplated the crystallizing of the Unitarianism into a new mould of orthodoxy and social conservatism. He was disturbed by the complacency of eminent clergymen and laymen, which to him indicated a failure of nerve and a lack of progressive attitude. Shortly before his death he wrote to his English Unitarian friend, the celebrated minister James Martineau, complaining that Unitarians had become insipid, zestless, timid: "Now we have a Unitarian orthodoxy." He was repelled by the religion represented by N. L. Frothingham and his Boston circle: literary, but unspeculative, and pious; as Emerson said, "corpse-cold." The younger men wanted a new Unitarianism, historical and experimental, open to new scientific and spiritual minds. It was long in coming, and in 1853 the conservative tendency prevailed, when the American Unitarian Association adopted a statement of belief in "the divine origin and authority of the religion of Jesus Christ, through the miraculous interposition of God as recorded by divine authority in the Gospels." Channing would have been displeased by such an iron-clad creed, and after 1860 the younger ministers openly rebelled against it. In 1866 they organized the Free Religious Association, to save Unitarianism from hardening into a "system," and to promote liberal religion in America. The genesis of the more radical movements may be studied in the proceedings of the first formed meeting: *Free Religion. Report of Addresses at a Meeting held in Boston, May 30, 1867, to Consider the Conditions, Wants, and Prospects of*

Free Religion in America, Together with the Constitution of the Free Religious Association there Organized (Boston, 1867). The F.R.A. declined in the 1880's, but by that time had achieved its purpose. The liberalizing of Unitarianism was marked in 1882 by the adoption of an amendment to the constitution of the Unitarian National Conference. Proposed by Dr. Minot Judson Savage (1841–1918), it rejected any requirement of an authoritative test of belief.

The more progressive leaders had not waited for the invitation to free thought. They did not follow the American Unitarian Association, which invited some of the older ministers, in the winter of 1871–1872, to deliver a series of ten lectures at the Hollis Street Church and King's Chapel, Boston. These were published by the A.U.A. as *Christianity and Modern Thought* (Boston, 1872), and were intended to provide an answer to materialism and skepticism and promote "enlightened Christianity." The tide that was carrying Unitarianism onward moved Octavius Brooks Frothingham, a former Transcendentalist, to publish *The Safest Creed, and Twelve Other Recent Discourses of Reason* (New York, 1874), emphasizing nondogmatic radical religion, the joy of a free faith, the "Gospel of Character," the "scientific aspect" of prayer, and the endless pursuit of truth. This open-mindedness is heavily emphasized in Arthur S. Bolster, Jr., *James Freeman Clarke: Disciple to Advancing Truth* (Boston, 1955). Darwinism had already begun to permeate advanced Unitarian thinking. The 1867 meeting of the F.R.A. had considered the significance of the theory of biological evolution to religion, and Unitarians were the only American religious group to accord it an enthusiastic welcome. Minot Judson Savage naturally was on the reception committee, and announced his role as an interpreter of the "evolutionary gospel" in *The Religion of Evolution* (Boston, 1876). The mature fruit of his thought is *The Passing and the Permanent in Religion, a Plain Treatment of the Great Essentials of Religion* . . . (New York and London, 1901).

Lack of doctrinal tests made Unitarianism, at the opening of the twentieth century, representative of many bands in the religious spectrum, from conservative theism to radical humanism and even agnosticism. A kind of semi-official review of that period, issued under the auspices of the A.U.A., is Joseph Henry Crooker's *The Unitarian Church; a Statement* (Boston, 1901), with a bibliography on the history and affirmations of Unitarianism. The volume emphasizes Unitarianism's covenantal rather than creedal character, lack of imposed beliefs and supernaturalism, and its positive accomplishments in various areas of culture and improved civic life. Practical contributions increased as the century progressed, and are stressed in Ephraim Emerton's *Unitarian Thought* (New York, 1911; new ed., 1925), in which a layman states the constructive propositions of advanced Unitarianism, and justifies their functions in contemporary religion, with slight attention to technical theology. The general intellectual spirit in the humanistic 1920's found attractive presentation in the essays by various English leaders, edited by Joseph Estlin Carpenter as *Freedom and Truth; Modern Views of Unitarian Christianity* (London, 1925), with references to America, and a review of "Unitarian Christianity in the Twentieth Century," by Sydney Herbert Mellone. Western Unitarianism, with its pronounced humanistic tendency, inspired Curtis Williford Reese's *Humanist Sermons* (Chicago and London, 1927), defining humanism as a protest against supernaturalism, nonexperiential speculation, and denial of human ability to comprehend the universe; and recording the work of pioneers of the humanistic faith.

As Unitarians celebrated their centennial in 1925, a mood of assessment and stock-taking prevailed. What had their faith accomplished in American life? One of the clearest estimates is Edward Caldwell Moore, "A Century of Unitarianism in the United States," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 5, no. 4 (July 1925), pp. 342–355. This appreciates Unitarianism's initiative in interdenominational theological edu-

cation at Harvard (1816), its view of religion as uncoerced belief and consecration, its ethical zeal, optimistic preaching and sublime hymnology, and its intent to keep its witness alive in an age of overvaluation of mergers, mere bigness, and "efficiency." Continuing into the 1930's, the critical mood inspired the A.U.A. to appoint a Commission of Appraisal. Its report, *Unitarians Face a New Age* (Boston, 1936) attempted to rethink and redefine the Unitarian witness in the light of new conditions and thought. It suggested a program of endeavor, in organization, interdenominational cooperation, leadership, doctrine, worship, religious education, and social relations.

During the past quarter-century American Unitarianism generally has taken a "radical" course, and has attracted many "unchurched" liberals and intellectuals. It is a varied group of humanists and theists, united by a common faith in man and his progressive ability, and by a conviction of the necessity of religious union without fixed dogmas. Among the most popular affirmations is one by John Haynes Holmes, the former nationally known pastor of the Community Church in New York City: *My Faith* (New York, 1933, in "The Community Pulpit," ser. 1933–1934, no. 2). A rapid survey of modern thought, on a wide variety of subjects, is W. H. Johnson's "The Current Preaching of Unitarian Ministers," in *The Christian Register*, Vol. 127 (Nov. 1948), pp. 16–35, a periodical with influence far beyond the Unitarian fold. At present there is a growing effort to present liberalism to the world in an era of "Neo-Orthodox" revival. Perhaps the most convincing of these efforts is a collection of essays, mostly by liberal Unitarian ministers: *Voices of Liberalism* (Boston, Beacon Press, 1948–1949, 2 vols.), intended to be an annual publication, demonstrating that mere authority in religion has failed, and that liberal religion can provide unity in life without regimentation and with variety, as an adventure of faith, best exemplified in the attitude of liberal Unitarianism. In *A Uni-*

tarian States His Case (Boston, 1949) Robert W. Sonen pleads for undogmatic religion and removes misconceptions of the Unitarian church. He endeavors to make free religion acceptable, by examining alternatives to Christianity, explaining Unitarian religious and philosophical attitudes, and reviewing the relations of religion to social issues such as education and labor. A more militant and provocative presentation is Stephen Hole Fritchman's *Unitarianism Today* (Boston, 1950), a collection of slightly edited radio addresses, 1949–1950, issued by the A.U.A. as a 125th anniversary publication. Radically departing from the older Unitarian reticence respecting evangelism, the author protests against blind religious conformity and defends deviation of free thinkers from orthodoxies.

6. TRANSCENDENTAL UNITARIANISM. Even before William E. Channing's death, and partly due to his influence, Unitarianism drifted farther away from Orthodoxy. It began to make contacts with other movements that were not necessarily Christian, such as Transcendentalism (see F, *Transcendental Religion*, below). Although he was an exponent of "classical" or rational Unitarianism, close to John Locke's *Reasonableness of Christianity*, in the 1820's and 1830's Channing responded to the German philosophical idealism and romantic literary influences that inspired the Transcendentalists. His interpretation of Unitarianism moved close to them, and his nearest approach was "Likeness to God" (1828), in *The Works of William E. Channing, D.D.* (Boston, 1847, 7 vols., Vol. 3, 227–255); also in *The Works of William Ellery Channing, D.D., with an Introduction* (Boston, American Unitarian Association, 1891). It is sometimes said that preparation of Unitarian soil as the seedplot of Transcendentalism was the labor of Channing. (See Henry David Gray, *Emerson*, p. 17, referred to in F, *Transcendental Religion*, below.) A profoundly different interpretation is presented by Arthur J. Ladu, in "Channing and Transcendentalism" (*American Literature*, Vol. 11, no. 2,

May 1939, pp. 129–137, with footnote bibliographical references). Noting the wide variances among scholars regarding Channing's relation to the movement, Ladu finds that he really rejected the Transcendentalist concept of the divinity of human nature and the infallibility of human conscience, and accepted the divinity of Christ and the Christian idea of sin. Channing's real interest was in a purer form of Christianity.

The transcendental spirit agitated the restless and brilliant mind of the Reverend Theodore Parker (1810–1860), the very learned and nationally famous (some said "notorious") minister of Boston's Music Hall congregation. He was the Unitarian "extreme left," far beyond Channing, and much too far for the "Boston Religion." He became a "Christian Transcendentalist," interpreting religion as "the felt and perceived presence of Absolute Being infusing itself" into the soul. Such pantheistic phraseology shocked the majority of his fellow ministers. The obvious slant of his thought was that dogmas, ceremony, and organization are irrelevant. His view is epitomized in his "Discourse of Matters Pertaining to Religion" in Perry Miller, *The Transcendentalists: An Anthology* (Cambridge, Mass., 1950), pp. 315–324. Another summary of his philosophy appears in "A Discourse of the Transient and Permanent in Christianity," in Miller, pp. 259–283, and in *The Critical and Miscellaneous Writings of Theodore Parker* (Boston, 1867, 2nd ed.), pp. 152–189. Parker regarded Transcendental philosophy as a revision of human experience, testing its teachings by the nature of mankind, "ethics by conscience, science by reason . . . the creeds of the churches, the constitutions of the states, by the constitution of the universe" (see Gray, pp. 9–10). A discussion of his position is found in H. Shelton Smith's essay "Was Theodore Parker a Transcendentalist?" in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 23, no. 3 (Sept. 1950), pp. 351–364. Parker's theological "speculations" were severely attacked as "unsound" by the conservative Unitarians, whose appalled re-

action is depicted in Joseph Cook's discourse, "Theodore Parker's Absolute Religion," in *Boston Monday Lectures* (Boston, 1878, Lecture III, pp. 53–82). This is a searching critique of his natural religion as materialistic, and as not carefully distinguishing intuition from instinct, inspiration from illumination, the supernatural from the unnatural. Parker's four religious principles are discerned as man's instinctive intuition of God's existence, of the existence and authority of moral law, of immortality, and of infinitely perfect deity omnipresent in matter and spirit. This was bad enough for the conservatives; worse were some of his other principles, criticized by Cook as "dangerous": rejection of Biblical miracles, and his view of sin as a necessary, inculpable stage of progress. Parker's spiritual autobiography, a description of the Christian Transcendentalist movement, is "Theodore Parker's Experience as a Minister," in Perry Miller, pp. 484–493. The most penetrating, scholarly, and absorbing study of his stimulating personality and influence is Henry Steele Commager, *Theodore Parker* (Boston, 1947), with a large annotated bibliography, drawn almost entirely from writings of Parker and his contemporaries. More than a biography, it depicts Parker's era, revealing him as a religious "realist," an independent thinker, a remover of "religious rubble," promoting liberal and socialized religion, a bridge between "practical" Unitarianism and mystical Transcendentalism. Contemporaries noticed his marked social emphasis, and Cook believed that his campaign against slavery was of more lasting significance than his theology (see above).

F. Transcendental Religion

Transcendentalism was indebted for its philosophy to free spirits of radical Unitarianism, like Theodore Parker and Ralph Waldo Emerson (1803–1882). Its romantic, individualistic ideals bespoke a revolt of younger leaders against the practical, rational, and respectably orthodox attitude of older,

"classical" Unitarianism. It was far more than a local philosophic reaction; actually it arose from a confluence of long-prevalent systems of thought. These are explored at length in John Hunt, *Pantheism and Christianity* (London, 1884), with bibliographical references in footnotes. His exposition of pantheism, idealism, and transcendentalism reviews the philosophical background in Kant, Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel. The German revival of idealism restored pantheism and mysticism after the dominance of Lockean sensational philosophy, which encouraged materialism. This reaction was the mainspring of the Transcendentalist movement, with its assertion that man has "an overwhelming conviction of the existence of God"—or the "Over-Soul." Other sources are seen in Hindu and Persian religion, seventeenth-century Platonism and neo-Platonism, the mysticism of Boehme and William Law, Berkleyan idealism, and Schleiermacher's theology. Transcendentalism's intimate relation to idealistic seventeenth-century literature and philosophy has been deeply explored in "Emerson's Debt to the Seventeenth Century," by J. Russell Roberts, in *American Literature*, Vol. 21, no. 3 (Nov. 1949), pp. 298–310, with numerous references. The essay points to Emerson's deep reading (which influenced others) in the scientists, poets, devotional writers, historians, and biographers, as a source of his faith in intuitive knowledge, and his perception of man's "oneness" with the universe, which helped him to challenge materialism and believe in a moral order, and to reconcile faith with science. Attention is directed also to his attraction toward the Quaker doctrine of the "inner light." The anti-materialist aspect may be studied in George Frisbie Whicher, ed., *The Transcendentalist Revolt Against Materialism* (Boston, 1949), with "Suggestions for Additional Reading," a collection of essays by and about Transcendentalists. A critical introduction emphasizes German idealist influence upon the group that met in Emerson's Concord study, their clerical background, derivation of "Transcendental" from Kant, opposition to ma-

terialism, formal Unitarianism and sensational philosophy, and concern for a "regenerated humanity." An illustration of the Transcendental idealism appears in Norman A. Brittin's "Emerson and the Metaphysical Poets," in *American Literature*, Vol. 8, no. 1 (Mar. 1936), pp. 1–21, which illuminates Emerson's influential love for Donne, Marvell, and especially Herbert, whose intuitional faculty he used to support his Transcendental principle of the "wonderful congruity" between man and the world. From these poets, in part, he derived his doctrine of symbols in poetry, strengthening his concept that material objects are symbols of truths behind nature, and that natural and moral laws correspond. This uncompromising idealism impressed one of the earliest American students of the movement, Charles Mayo Ellis, who anonymously published *An Essay on Transcendentalism* (Boston, 1842). He noted its insistence upon the reality and independence of man's soul, conscience, religious and moral discernment, intuitional grasp of truth, sense of duty, love for beauty and holiness, and capacity for indefinite improvement.

A rich literature considers the varied, confluent sources of American Transcendentalism. A brief summary of the various sources of the Transcendental "breath of mind" is given by Howard Mumford Jones in "The Influence of European Ideas in Nineteenth Century America," in *American Literature*, Vol. 7, no. 3 (Nov. 1935), pp. 243–273. A current arising in Emanuel Swedenborg (1688–1772) is followed in a study by Herbert Stanley Redgrove, *Purpose and Transcendentalism; an Exposition of Swedenborg's Philosophical Doctrines in Relation to Modern Thought* (London and New York, 1920), with bibliographical references in footnotes. He traces the influence upon Coleridge, Carlyle, and Emerson, especially in his doctrine of direct personal revelation of knowledge of the divine, with particular references to Emerson, who was acquainted with American Swedenborgians.

A consideration of German idealistic and romantic influence is available in Josiah Royce, *The Spirit of Modern Philosophy, An Essay in the Form of Lectures* (Boston and New York, 1892). The eclectic quality of Transcendentalism, with extensive indirect borrowings from Germany, appears in Marjorie H. Nicholson's intensive essay on a Congregational minister who is now regarded as one of its earliest exponents: "James Marsh and the Vermont Transcendentalists," in *The Philosophical Review,* Vol. 34, no. 1 (Jan. 1925), pp. 28–50, with bibliographical references in the footnotes. She establishes the fact that many regarded Marsh (1794–1842) as the founder of the movement. His writings were read by the first members of the Transcendental Club in Concord. He was an early transmitter of theologically interpreted Platonism, German philosophy, literary romanticism, and Coleridge's works; the first American translator of German authors and philosophers; the original New England teacher of (presumed) German metaphysics. Marsh affected the St. Louis school of Hegelian philosophers, who befriended the Concord group. (See below, ref. to Henry August Pochmann.) As president, he made the University of Vermont the original American center of academic idealistic philosophy. He taught that Christian belief is the perfection of human reason, an idea which greatly influenced the younger clergy. His work was continued by others, particularly the Vermont Unitarian minister, Frederic Henry Hedge (1805–1890), whose revision of Marsh's edition (1829) of Coleridge's *Aids to Reflection* became an important source of Emerson's knowledge of Kant, Fichte, and Schelling. With Marsh and the Episcopalian priest Caleb Sprague Henry (1804–1884), Hedge intellectually led a group of "Christian Transcendentalists." Their importance is revealed by Ronald Vale Wells, in *Three Christian Transcendentalists: James Marsh, Caleb Sprague Henry, Frederic Henry Hedge . . .* (New York, 1943), with a bibliography, including letters. This agrees with Henry David Gray's *Emerson* (see below), that the assimila-

tion of German philosophy was mainly Hedge's work. All three ministers defended "reasonable" and personal religion against rigid orthodox formulas. Hedge's thought, over a long period, may be studied in several of his works: *Conservatism and Reform* (Boston, 1843), an oration at Bowdoin College; *An Address Delivered before the Graduating Class of the Divinity School in Cambridge* (Cambridge, 1849); *Reason in Religion* (Boston, 1867); *Ways of the Spirit, and other Essays* (Boston, 1878); *Sermons* (Boston, 1891).

Marsh and Hedge were perhaps rivaled, as "Germanists," by two other Transcendentalists, a noted musicologist and a Christian social reformer. Their contributions to the swelling Germanic stream are detailed in documented essays: J. Wesley Thomas, "John Sullivan Dwight: A Translator of German Romanticism," *American Literature*, Vol. 21, no. 4 (Jan. 1950), pp. 426–441; and Arthur R. Schultz and Henry A. Pochmann, "George Ripley, Unitarian, Transcendentalist, or Infidel?", *ibid.*, Vol. 14, no. 1 (Mar. 1942), pp. 1–19. Dwight stimulated the movement by his conviction that poetry and music could inspire a more spiritual religion. Ripley disseminated and defended German philosophy and theology, and inspired the social reform aspect by his zeal for educational and economic betterment. Except Brownson, no Transcendentalist better illustrates the difficulty of the idealists who tried to realize their beliefs in society.

The first definitive work concerning German literature and the major American Transcendentalists (when they were forming the doctrines first expressed in Emerson's *Nature*) is Stanley Morton Vogel's *German Literary Influences on the American Transcendentalists* (New Haven, 1955), with bibliographies and bibliographical footnotes, and a list of helpful studies in the Introduction. Vogel claims that German influence was only one of several, and that its philosophical and literary strands cannot be made distinct, because they were not so to the New Englanders, who gained their knowl-

edge *indirectly* from Coleridge, Carlyle, or German commentators. A thorough examination of New England knowledge of German literature, 1790–1845, is illustrated by lists of literary manuscripts, and of German books accessible to the Massachusetts Transcendentalists, or included in Emerson's library and reading. That Carlyle, particularly, was almost an idol of the younger New England intellectuals, is definitely established by Silas William Vance, "Carlyle in America Before *Sartor Resartus*," *American Literature*, Vol. 7, no. 4 (Jan. 1936), pp. 363–375, with bibliographical references. This describes the considerable Carlylean penetration in the decade before 1836 (when the Transcendental ideas and groups were forming), and the derivation of knowledge of German literature and thought through his works. Reference is made to Emerson's visit to Carlyle in 1832 and his return full of enthusiasm for his "Germanism." German philosophy was not a source of precise doctrine, but a confirmation of his own conviction of God's presence in the heart. This view is supported by René Wellek's two articles in the *New England Quarterly*. "The Minor Transcendentalists and German Philosophy," Vol. 15, no. 4 (Dec. 1942), pp. 652–680, reflects the importance of German thought, and the nature of the problem of influence. "Emerson and German Philosophy," Vol. 16, no. 1 (Mar. 1943), pp. 41–62, with many bibliographical references in the footnotes, reviews numerous direct and indirect channels of German influence, and argues that he found in them support for a world-view that repelled eighteenth-century materialism, a faith already rooted in the Transcendentalists by "their own spiritual ancestry."

The source of Transcendental pantheism is traced by Perry Miller's "Jonathan Edwards to Emerson," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 13, no. 4 (Dec. 1940), pp. 589–617. It stemmed not from Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason*, but from the seventeenth-century mystics' idea of divine knowledge immediately communicated by an indwelling spirit.

This was expressed by New England Antinomians and Quakers (see sect. v, D, 1, *Origins of American Sectarianism*), and by the indestructible, dynamic, joyful pantheistic element in Edwards' theology. Like Hunt and Whicher (see above), Miller sees Transcendentalism as a revolt against the reasonable, socially cautious, "pallid and unexciting liberalism" of orthodox Unitarianism that had stripped New England theology of restrictive dogmas, and left Emerson and others "free to celebrate purely and simply the presence of God in the soul and in nature." Miller's attribution of Quaker inspiration is solidly affirmed by Frederick B. Tolles' essay, "Emerson and Quakerism," in *American Literature*, Vol. 10, no. 2 (May 1938), pp. 142–165, with extensive bibliography in footnotes. Emerson, he proves, had many literary and personal contacts with Quakerism in 1827–1836, the formative years of his intellectual life; and he establishes striking similarities between Quaker and Emersonian religious convictions, pointing also to the practical and social side of Emerson's ideals as shown by his interest in Quaker abolitionism. This analysis is reaffirmed, together with the English and German romantic influences, by critical comments in Miller's *The Transcendentalists: An Anthology* (Cambridge, 1950, especially pages 3–15, with bibliography). The leading Transcendentalists speak in selected writings, assembled from tracts and periodicals, and their efforts toward political and social reform are included.

Into the variegated texture were woven threads of French idealistic philosophy, especially of Victor Cousin. These are traced by Walter Leatherbee Leighton, in *French Philosophers and New England Transcendentalism* (Charlottesville, Va., 1908), with bibliography and bibliographical references in footnotes. German Transcendentalism was modified by French urbanity and rationalism into the eclectic philosophy (reconciling intuition and reason) of Théodore Jouffroy, and Victor Cousin, whose eclectic method was adopted by Emerson. French influence extended and humanized the Con-

cord philosophical and literary horizons, and the French socialist Fourier brought a zeal for social reformation; but the total effect was far less (especially with Alcott) than that of the bolder and more speculative German philosophy.

The familiarity of the Concord school with Oriental pantheism and mysticism is well known. They imported the varicolored stuffs of thought as Boston and Salem ships sailed home with spices and silk, porcelain and tea. A thorough study of this fascinating phase is Arthur Edward Christy, *The Orient in American Transcendentalism; a Study of Emerson, Thoreau, and Alcott* (New York, 1932), with "Books and Marginalia" and "Notes." Largely through unpublished documents, Christy thoroughly explores the sources of American interest in Eastern thought, its flowering in Emerson and Thoreau, and especially in Alcott, who at "Fruitlands" gathered the largest contemporary American library of Oriental literature. The account of borrowings from India, China, and Persia reveals the eclectic taste and inspirations of the Transcendentalists. Inherently sympathetic toward Oriental philosophy, they approached it poetically and mystically, and Emerson especially used its stress upon inner spiritual resources to refute eighteenth-century rationalistic materialism. The penetration of the Transcendental circle by Eastern philosophical, religious, and literary influences is indicated in great detail by three essays in *American Literature*. Arthur Christy's "Orientalism in New England: Whittier," Vol. 1, no. 4 (Jan. 1930), pp. 372–392, notes that to Emerson the Oriental sacred scriptures revealed the wisdom that linked man with the Over-Soul, and claims that he is the one American author whose art and philosophy really absorbed Oriental thought. In "Immortality from India," Vol. 1, no. 3 (Nov. 1929), pp. 233–242, Frederick J. Carpenter points out Emerson's derivation from Hindu philosophy of his peculiar expression of the "larger immortality of the life process itself," and his concept of the immortality of spiritual and physical energy. He grasped the Hindu idea of an essential identifica-

tion of man with the natural order, while preserving the Western idea of individual distinction. J. D. Yohannen in "Emerson's Translations of Persian Poetry from German Sources," Vol. 14, no. 4 (Jan. 1943), pp. 406–420, suggests Persian poetry as one significant source not only of his aesthetic theory but also of his Transcendentalist interest in nature. The Hindu strain is discussed also by V. Krishnamachari, in "Transcendentalism in America," in *Calcutta Review*, Vol. 116, no. 3 (June 1950), pp. 10–27. (See also: Frederick J. Carpenter, *Emerson and Asia*, Cambridge, Mass., 1930.) All these sources have bibliographical references in footnotes.

Thoreau was too pronounced a solitary to appear as a representative Transcendentalist, and was satisfied to let Emerson and Alcott speak. Emerson stands for the moral approach to regeneration of life, aloof from politics. Alcott chose direct reform, of which the communal experiment at "Fruitlands" was one expression. Although Emerson was unwilling to appear as such, he has been considered the vanguard of the Concord group. His withdrawal from traditional and formal religion was marked by a sensational farewell sermon at the Second Church in Boston: *The Lord's Supper* (Boston, 1832), frankly stating his reasons for unwillingness to administer the sacrament. He soon became the intellectual and spiritual leader of those Unitarians who were leaning away from organized religion. Descendant of a long line of ministers, he did not openly attack Christianity, but forsook some of its central beliefs. No account of American religious thought in the nineteenth century can avoid a detailed consideration of him. As propagated by his national influence, Transcendental religion helped to promote American youthful self-reliance and optimism.

Emerson never presented a complete account of his religious views, and in fact had no "system" of theology. The impossibility of attempting to classify his religious position exactly is illustrated by the real difficulty of defining his

"mysticism," which is pointed out by Patrick F. Quinn's essay, "Emerson and Mysticism," *American Literature*, Vol. 21, no. 4 (Jan. 1950), pp. 397–414, with a wealth of references. The writer clearly explains that the Concord sage was not a "true" religious mystic, attempting to transcend life by continued spiritual discipline to attain complete holiness and divine union, but a practical one, considering true holiness as inseparable from useful intellectual and spiritual power in daily life and conduct. Statements of his religious convictions are scattered through his essays. Probably the clearest expression of his central doctrines is *Nature* (Boston, 1836). Transcendentalism thus attained its first convincing voice in philosophy and literature, and the movement is usually dated from its publication. (See Gray, p. 16.) Other pertinent essays are "Spiritual Laws," "The Over-Soul," and "Circles." These may be studied in Brooks Atkinson, ed., *The Complete Essays and Other Writings of Ralph Waldo Emerson* (New York, 1940, Modern Library Edition, with a biographical introduction); also in *Emerson's Complete Works* (Boston, 1888–1890, 11 vols., Riverside Edition; new and rev., with preface by J. E. Cabot): particularly Vol. 1, *Nature, Addresses, and Lectures*, and Vols. 2–3, *Essays*, 1st and 2nd series. "The Transcendentalist" (1843) summarizes the movement's character and significance. It may be amplified by Emerson's "Historic Notes of Life and Letters in New England," in Perry Miller, *The Transcendentalists: An Anthology*, pp. 494–502. Perhaps the best account of his religious temperament is in James Elliot Cabot, *A Memoir of Ralph Waldo Emerson* (Cambridge, Mass., 1887, 2 vols., with "Chronological List of Lectures and Addresses" in Vol. 2). See particularly Vol. 1, ch. IX, pp. 298–348. Cabot defines the Transcendentalist fundamentals as sentiments, grasped by the imagination as poetic wholes rather than defined as propositions. Emerson's religious position isolated him from the orthodox, including the conservative Unitarians. The immediate reason was his

rejection of any formal creed, in his famous pronouncement at Harvard in 1838: *An Address Delivered before the Senior Class in Divinity College, Cambridge, Sunday Evening, 15 July, 1838* (Boston, 1838, 1st ed.). This has usually been regarded as the "manifesto" of the Transcendental assault upon "classical" or rational Unitarianism. The audience was so outraged that for thirty years Emerson was unwelcome at Harvard. A different view is presented by Clarence Gohdes in "Some Remarks on Emerson's Divinity School Address," in *American Literature*, Vol. 1, no. 1 (Mar. 1929), pp. 27–31, with bibliography in the footnotes. It was not really a startling spiritual adventure, but one of many notes in a general controversy, and was regarded by many as quite mild. Theodore Parker is adduced as authority for the belief that the address expressed many thoughts previously voiced in an article which Emerson might have read, by the Reverend Samuel D. Robbins, in the *Boston Quarterly Review*, a Transcendental periodical edited by Orestes A. Brownson.

Even less acceptable was the Connecticut teacher, lecturer, and idealistic social reformer, Bronson Alcott (1799–1888), who was an intimate of the Concord group. Transcendentalism became identified with impractical theory through the noble failure of his experiment in Transcendental living at "Fruitlands." The romance is sympathetically, intelligently, and humorously chronicled by Clara Endicott Sears, in *Bronson Alcott's Fruitlands, With Transcendental Wild Oats by Louisa M. Alcott* (Boston and New York, 1915). Included is a catalog of the original Fruitlands library, which illustrates the wide range of sources for Transcendental thought. A similar sympathetic insight informs the scholarly biography of Alcott by Odell Shepard, *Pedlar's Progress, The Life of Bronson Alcott* (Boston, 1937), with a long bibliographical note, which is a most helpful guide to a study of Transcendentalism. Numerous references to Alcott's philosophy point to formative pressure by the Quaker doctrine of the "inner light," Platonism, Unitarianism, Oriental thought, and the

influence of William Russell. Shepard stresses the character of Transcendentalism as a religion, and as a philosophy of reform.

Alcott outlived all other early leaders of the movement. He presided benignly over its brief revival in the Concord School of Philosophy, 1879–1888. It was a symposium of two schools of American idealism, whose relations are depicted with a sure scholarly touch in Henry August Pochmann, *New England Transcendentalism and St. Louis Hegelianism; Phases in the History of American Idealism* (Philadelphia, 1948), with notes and references, and a wealth of bibliographical information. This traces the extensive influence of Hegel in the West, through Henry Conrad Brokmeyer (1826–1906) and the philosopher-educator, William Torrey Harris (1835–1909). Relations between the St. Louis Hegelians and the New Englanders flowered in philosophy, literature, and education, and especially in the Concord School of Philosophy. Both groups opposed naturalism and materialism, and were phases of the broader idealistic movement from Marsh to Josiah Royce and J. E. Creighton, which sought to free American philosophy from domination by Lockean sensationalism and Scottish "common-sense." The brief, bright history of the Concord school is related in Austin Warren's pleasantly written essay, "The Concord School of Philosophy," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 2, no. 2 (Apr. 1929), pp. 199–233, with bibliographical footnotes. Inspired by Alcott's Western "conversations" on philosophy, the school depended upon other survivors of early Transcendentalism, the Platonist Hiram K. Jones, and William T. Harris. It attracted as lecturers nearly all eminent contemporary American thinkers, and was the center of a persistent idealist influence, combatting current materialistic philosophy and promoting theistic principles. Some of the proceedings appeared in Harris' *Journal of Speculative Philosophy*. The tie with early Transcendentalist spirit is evident also in Raymond L. Bridgman's collection, *Concord Lectures on Philosophy, Com-*

prising Outlines of all the Lectures at the Concord Summer School of Philosophy in 1882, with an Historical Sketch (Cambridge, Mass., 1883). Among the lecturers were Alcott, Franklin B. Sanborn, Emerson, and Hedge, and the subjects included formative elements of Transcendental philosophy.

The newspapers tended to ridicule those gatherings of idealists, their eccentricities and individualism. They identified "Orchard House" (Alcott's home) and the "Hillside Chapel," where the lectures were given, as opinion mills of the lunatic fringe. Unique personalities and highly figurative and sometimes esoteric language had exposed the movement to ridicule from the start, and sometimes obscured its real import and influence. That its own adherents perceived its humorous aspect appears in F. De Wolfe Miller's monograph, *Christopher Pearse Cranch and his Caricatures of New England Transcendentalism* (Cambridge, Mass., 1951), with a bibliography of Cranch's works, a guide to unpublished materials, and bibliographic notes. Cranch (1813–1892) was a Unitarian minister and a Transcendentalist, who became a landscape painter, caricaturist, and parodist. He made sport of the movement in caricatures of expressions in Emerson's essays and addresses, and poked fun at leaders like Theodore Parker, also opponents, including the formidable Professor Andrews Norton of the Harvard Divinity School. The quality of Cranch's minor contribution to the movement is attractively appreciated by J. C. Levenson in his essay, "Christopher Pearse Cranch: The Case History of a Minor Artist in America," in *American Literature*, Vol. 21, no. 4 (Jan. 1950), pp. 415–426, with bibliographic notes. Cranch defined the Transcendentalists as opponents of Lockean "materialism" and of the earlier "rational" Unitarian theology, stressing the spirit rather than the letter. His own Transcendental religion was a revery, one of nature and not of duty, lacking action and the homely human communion of Emerson and others. Another representative

critic was Joseph Cook, who joined the attack in a discourse, "Transcendentalism in New England," Lecture II in *Boston Monday Lectures* (Boston, 1878). He considered extreme Transcendentalism as an erratic, left-wing aberration of the liberal movement, a break with Christianity, a rankly rationalistic individualism.

As Transcendentalism was beginning to fade in the 1880's, its first comprehensive history appeared in Octavius Brooks Frothingham's *Transcendentalism in New England; a History* (New York, 1886). From the standpoint of a sympathetic former adherent, the movement is considered as a philosophy, a religious faith, and a wave of reform; a gospel, not a uniform doctrine, but an attitude of mind asserting man's inalienable worth and capability of divinity. This study reviews European influences upon and personal contributions of the leaders, and estimates their long-range effects upon thought, institutions, politics, morals, and social reform. There have been a few later satisfactory estimates of Transcendentalism. William R. Hutchison, *The Transcendentalist Ministers: Church Reform in the New England Renaissance* (New Haven, 1959) proves definitely that Transcendentalism was essentially a religious movement, and that its leaders were deeply concerned with theological problems and the nature of the church. This very scholarly study lays the foundation for a reappraisal of their achievements in literature, philosophy, and social reform. The familiar image of "Boston Unitarianism," fashioned by literary histories, does them less than justice. Harold Clarke Goddard's *Studies in New England Transcendentalism* (New York, 1908), with bibliography, is a minutely detailed but readable investigation of its genesis and nature. It studies critically the intellectual and literary influences affecting each and all of the foremost representatives, who led the movement from traditionalism to free thought, and indicates their relations to practical life. A briefer, mainly historical account is in William P. Trent et al., eds., *Cambridge History of American*

Literature (New York, 1943, 3 vols.), Vol. 1, Book 1, ch. 8. A chapter is devoted to Transcendentalism in Herbert W. Schneider, *A History of American Philosophy* (New York, 1946), with a bibliography. Primary sources for study are the periodicals, like the famous *Dial*. These efforts to promote their views were the Transcendentalists' closest approaches to anything like concerted activity. Eleven of these, issued from 1835 to 1886, are thoroughly and lucidly analyzed in Clarence Louis Frank Gohdes, *The Periodicals of American Transcendentalism* (Durham, N.C., 1931), with a list of the magazines, and a wealth of bibliographical footnotes. The Introduction is a sympathetic and interesting historical review, emphasizing the variety and indefinable quality of Transcendentalism, which Emerson happily described as a "leaven" of platonic idealism. The leaven was especially effective in stimulating a new ferment in poetry, a mystical "breath of mind," completely antipathetic to eighteenth-century rationalism and urbanity in heroic couplets. Its untrammeled organ was the *Dial* magazine, in which some of Emerson's early verse appeared. This phase of the spiritual and literary awakening is illustrated and critically assessed in George Willis Cooke, ed., *The Poets of Transcendentalism, an Anthology, with Introductory Essay and Bibliographical Notes* (Boston and New York, 1903), with biographical notes. The selections include 42 poets, and many poems never republished from magazines, illustrating the literary influence and deeply religious quality of the Transcendentalists. A clear, fluent introduction calls Transcendentalism the most creative influence in American literature, an indigenous one stemming from Puritanism, eighteenth-century liberal theology, and democracy. Transcendental poetry, primarily ethical and religious rather than aesthetic, voices the immediate revelation of the Over-Soul to the prophet and seer.

Probably the best modern studies of this intellectual revolution are Henry David Gray's *Emerson; a Statement of New England Transcendentalism as Expressed in the Philosophy*

of its Chief Exponent (Stanford, Cal., 1917), with bibliography of articles and books; and Kenneth Walter Cameron, *Emerson the Essayist; an Outline of his Philosophical Development through 1836 . . . and Selected Documents of New England Transcendentalism* (Raleigh, N.C., 1945, 2 vols.), with bibliographical footnotes and appendices. While ostensibly studies of Emerson, these actually are general critical histories, and the second is an indispensable annotated bibliography and source-book. Gray emphasizes Emerson's contribution to sociology in his theories of education and of the individual and the state. He points out the essentially religious nature of Transcendentalism and of the controversy about it, its transformation of the conservative Unitarian churches, and its "pragmatic mysticism," testing idealism by its practicability—a trait of its Puritan heritage. German inspiration is dated from the return of Bancroft, Everett, and Ticknor from Germany in the 1820's, its inception from *Nature* (1836), and its decline from the end of the Brook Farm communal experiment in 1847. Cameron exhaustively reviews the sources and influences that flowed into Transcendentalism from various European philosophies and literatures, and minutely analyzes Emerson's career and studies at Harvard, his subsequent reading, his early lectures, and *Nature*. The selected documents, 1821–1836 (Vol. 2), indicate sources of Emerson's philosophy that have usually been neglected. This work corrects the impression that Emerson is too indefinite or complicated to be effectively analyzed.

After 1847 Transcendentalism as a "movement" declined. Several of its leaders died, including Margaret Fuller, and Theodore Parker, who had become its public enunciator. The abolitionist agitation and the Civil War intervened. After the struggle, some voiced the Transcendental freedom of thought by opposing Unitarian conservatism through the Free Religious Association (see E, 5, *Modern American Unitarianism*, above). The philosophical individualists often were swept into currents of free thought and free religion. Some

"Christian Transcendentalists" disapproved the naturalistic and materialistic trends in the "new liberalism," but it was the expression of their own insistence upon reason and inquiry. (See also Part Five, sect. II, H, 3, *Transcendentalist Theology.*)

G. Free Thought; Free and Radical Religion

In the post-Civil War era Unitarians, Universalists, and Transcendentalists made the discovery that they did not comprehend all shades in the broad spectrum of liberal religion. The lines ranged from conservative, rational Unitarianism to radical, non-theistic religion and frank agnosticism. Radical religion often has been anti-ecclesiastical, critical of Christianity and Judaism, and sympathetic toward secular reform movements. Free religion has been compelled to maintain hard-won ground against both orthodox criticism and sheer unbelief. The struggle has been constantly waged in a general atmosphere of skepticism, inspired by vast advances in physical science. It has been affected and sometimes infiltrated by deterministic and materialistic thought, particularly Marxian socialism and communism.

The background of both free thought and unbelief may be supplied by a selection of histories. A very general one is John Bagnell Bury: *A History of Freedom of Thought* (New York, 1913), with a bibliography. This comprehends the development from ancient Greece to the twentieth century, emphasizing the rise of rationalism from the seventeenth through the nineteenth century. It justifies liberty of thought, and justly condemns religious intolerance, but fails to perceive that Christianity was not solely responsible for the decline of Greek science. Indispensable are the laborious works of John Mackinnon Robertson, particularly *A Short History of Freethought, Ancient and Modern, to the Period of the French Revolution* (London, 1914–15, 2 vols., 3rd ed., with bibliographical footnotes; 4th ed., 2 vols., 1936, with

bibliography in Vol. 2). A warmly sympathetic account by the same author is *A History of Freethought in the Nineteenth Century* (New York, 1930, 2 vols.). Unbelief in traditional religion frequently has been associated with diverse elements of free thought treated in these works. The later currents flowed in part from eighteenth-century rationalism and Deism (see *Deism*, above), and in part from nineteenth-century scientific skepticism. American free thought often has stemmed directly from English sources. The later English phase is intelligently and sympathetically even if not profoundly reviewed, with personal recollections of intellectual controversies, in Janet Elizabeth (Hogarth) Courtney's *Freethinkers of the Nineteenth Century* (London, 1920). Radical intellectualism is reflected in biographical studies of such leaders as Frederick D. Maurice, Charles Bradlaw (a professed atheist), Thomas H. Huxley, and Leslie Stephen. A significant review, from the standpoint of a Christian scholar, is Henry Clay Sheldon's *Unbelief in the Nineteenth Century, A Critical Survey* (New York, 1907). This examines the various philosophical, scientific, theological, ethical, and critical theories that have more or less radically questioned orthodox Christian beliefs since Kant, and concludes that Christianity has been generally vindicated by the test. Some of the opponents mentioned are included in a still useful compendium by Joseph Mazzini Wheeler: *A Biographical Dictionary of Freethinkers of all Ages and Nations* (London, 1889), frankly partisan, but about the only superior work of its kind, with valuable bibliographical notes on similar compilations. In it appear numerous Americans, including some pioneers of free thought—Thomas Paine, Ethan Allen, and Elihu Palmer—and such later figures as Francis Abbot and Felix Adler.

Free thought struck deep roots during the Revolutionary Deistic period, and the post-Revolutionary battle to win complete religious liberty. It contributed not a little to the victory. Descended from eighteenth-century rationalism, it

was bolstered by anti-church and anti-Christian tendencies in the French Revolution. Later it was inspired by and associated with secular revolutionary socialism, scientific determinism, and radical criticism of the Bible and orthodox theology. It appealed to leaders of the early urban workingmen's parties of the 1820's and 1830's, like Seth Luther and Stephen Simpson. The course of early American free thought is explored in two documented essays. The period from the Revolution to about 1830 is covered thoroughly by Isaac Woodbridge Riley in *Early Free-thinking Societies in America* (reprinted from the *Harvard Theological Review*, Vol. 11, July 1918, with bibliographical references in footnotes). Redressing the neglect of this phase in general histories of liberal thought, the closely packed narrative fills in the background of Deism, unbelief, and revolutionary French thought, and comprises the battle between conservative New England ministers and the "Illuminati," the New York Deistical Society, the "Theophilanthropy" of Tom Paine and Elihu Palmer, and the later naturalism of Robert Dale Owen in opposition to the Rev. Alexander Campbell. (For Campbell, see B, 3, *Deism*, above.) The next period was characterized by a more determined effort to organize the individualistic movement. It has been described, with abundant research and documentation, in Albert Post, *Popular Freethought in America, 1825–1850* (New York, 1943), with extensive bibliography. Concentrating upon the religious aspect, this study emphasizes free thought's cardinal principal of disbelief in divine revelation and providence, and its faith in human reason and natural law.

After 1850 religious free thought declined for a time. Radicals and reformers generally were more interested in such causes as the anti-slavery crusade. A great religious revival in the late 1850's, and the national absorption in the effort to preserve the Union, were not favorable to religious doubts. Even the American Unitarian Association became conservative (see E, 5, *Modern American Unitarianism*,

above). But the forces of radicalism were quietly gathering strength, especially among the younger Unitarian leaders. Many of them participated in or sympathized with the Free Religious Association, organized in 1866 under radical Unitarian auspices. The F.R.A. inaugurated a new era in free religion in its meeting at Boston in 1867, and by the publication of its proceedings: *Free Religion. Report of Addresses at a Meeting . . . to Consider the Conditions, Wants, and Prospects of Free Religion in America . . .* (Boston, 1867). The Association flourished more or less for many years, and published much literature. It was still active as late as 1914, and issued the proceedings of its 47th annual meeting with the somewhat ironic title *World Religion and World Brotherhood* (Boston, 1914). The meeting in 1867 was typically comprehensive, including Universalists, Unitarians, Quakers, Transcendentalists, the Reform rabbi Isaac M. Wise, and the Spiritualist, Robert Dale Owen. Their sole bond of union was a conviction that religious freedom should know no limits. The movement which they inaugurated has been definitively chronicled and evaluated by Stow Persons in *Free Religion, an American Faith* (New Haven, 1947), with an extensive bibliographical note. Essentially a history of the F.R.A., including the Chicago World Parliament of Religions in 1893, this illuminates a previously neglected phase of religious and intellectual history. Clearly indicated are the movement's insistence upon free individual inquiry, judgment, and criticism. It relied upon general enlightenment rather than organization, and helped to break down mere bigoted creedal authority, and to make the churches more hospitable toward an evolutionary philosophy and social religion (see Part Three, sect. VI, B, 2, *The Social Gospel*, below), rather than individualistic pietism. It shifted the emphasis from strict theology to morals and humane service.

Although they usually shared the anti-orthodox and anti-ecclesiastical spirit of earlier freethinkers, most free-religionists from 1865 to 1914 were devout and thoughtful men, not

mere "priest-haters." Often unwillingly, they clashed with the established denominations because of their conceptions of religious truth. A typical representative was the provocative Francis Ellingwood Abbot, who addressed the F.R.A. meeting of 1867 on the oneness of science and religion. A former Unitarian minister, he disseminated radical religious views through his journal, *The Index, A Weekly Paper Devoted to Free Religion* (Toledo, Ohio, 1870–1886, 18 vols., with varying titles). It was published by an incorporated board of trustees nominated by the F.R.A., and was its semi-official organ. Abbot's manifesto, and his attack upon Christian orthodoxy, were promulgated in certain widely known articles: "Fifty Affirmations" and "Christianity and Free Religion Contrasted as to Cornerstones" (Vol. 1, no. 4, Jan. 22, 1870); "Christianity and Free Religion Contrasted as to Institutions, Terms of Fellowship, Social Ideal, Moral Ideal, and Essential Spirit" (Vol. 1, no. 5, Jan. 29, 1870). Abbot summarized his religious outlook in *Scientific Theism* (Boston, 1886, 2nd ed.), enlarged from a lecture delivered in 1885 at the Concord Summer School of Philosophy. Abbot attempted to reduce scientific theism to a system, conceiving God as infinite creative life, wisdom, will, love, moral perfection, and holiness. He is personal, immanent in the part of creation known to man, transcendent in the unknown. He does not exist outside of space and time, but works in the universe as an evolutionary organism, "an infinitely self-conscious intellect," infinitely intelligible to man and revealed by science. Abbot's welcome at the "Hillside Chapel" reveals the sympathetic bonds among free and liberal religionists, notwithstanding individual differences.

Free Religion had other convincing and popular defenders, largely of Unitarian clerical background. Cyrus Augustus Bartol (1813–1900) challenged traditionalism in *Radical Problems* (Boston, 1872), discussing Transcendentalism, radical religion and theism, the nature of faith, naturalism, and materialistic philosophy. Even better known was Octavius

Brooks Frothingham, whose *The Religion of Humanity* (New York, 1875, 3rd ed.) is one of the clearest expositions of the later nineteenth-century religious radicalism that originated in Unitarianism. For millions of Americans, the radical and critical position was most eloquently expressed and vividly dramatized by a layman, Robert G. Ingersoll (1833–1899), the brilliant agnostic son of an orthodox evangelistic minister. Although lacking in definite viewpoint and somewhat superficial, the most readable account of him is Clarence H. Cramer, *Royal Bob; the Life of Robert G. Ingersoll* (Indianapolis, 1952), with notes, and a bibliography of primary and secondary sources. The writer stresses Ingersoll's agnosticism (*not* atheism), his revolt against evangelistic orthodoxy, and his position as the symbol of a little understood era, shaken by a great debate between traditional religion and rationalism. Ingersoll was so persuasive, because the ground had been prepared for him by science and "higher criticism" of the Bible. The intellectual quality (not very profound) and the emotional appeal of Ingersoll's writing and oratory may be appreciated by consulting *The Works of Robert G. Ingersoll* (New York, 1907, 12 vols.), also issued by the Ingersoll League (New York, 1929, 12 vols.), including his lectures and discussions; and two typical lectures attacking the orthodox Christian position: *What Must We Do To Be Saved?* (New York, 1892), and *About the Holy Bible* (New York, 1894). The phase of radicalism which he represented is thoughtfully and interestingly analyzed by Sidney Warren in *American Freethought, 1860–1914* (New York and London, 1943), with a bibliography, which reviews the leaders and trends, with references to the continuing problem of church-state relationships and religious freedom.

Ingersoll died when radical religious free thought had begun to lose some of its distinct fervor and appeal, and was becoming hardly distinguishable from modernist and humanist trends in Protestant theology. The movement received fresh impetus from aggressive Fundamentalist attacks upon

liberalism, which challenged Free Religionists to redefine their position and aims. Again under Unitarian auspices, they held a general convention, reminiscent of the F.R.A. meeting over half a century before. The International Congress of Free Christian and Other Religious Liberals met in October 1920 in Boston, also in Plymouth, during the tercentenary of another band of free religionists. The deliberations were published as *New Pilgrimages of the Spirit, Proceedings and Papers of the Pilgrim Tercentenary Meeting* (Boston, 1923). The volume was widely circulated, and gave a new impulse. Since that time the movement has remained true to its basic qualities. The most important are: (1) association with socialist and other secular reform movements, (2) criticism of authoritarianism, and (3) continual reexamination of liberal theology in the light of intellectual and social change.

The first trait appears in the influential periodical *Radical Religion* (1936–1940), which became *Christianity and Society* (1940–1956), published by the Fellowship of Socialist Christians (New York, 1936–1956, 21 vols.). The battle against authority and for free, natural religion pressed steadily forward during this period. The more recent line of argument is typified in an analysis and defense of free religion, by a professor of theology at Harvard, Julius Seelye Bixler, in *Religion for Free Minds* (New York and London, 1939, 1st ed., with notes), expanded from Lowell Institute lectures in King's Chapel, Boston. Aimed against the cult of "unreason," this is an able reestablishment of the liberal view, with little interest in Biblical theology or ideas of sin and divine grace. It advocates a warm, naturalistic religion, contradicting the supposition that "free minds" cannot really worship. A similar untraditional attitude toward religion as related to social morality appears in Joseph Lewis, *The Ten Commandments . . . an Investigation into the Origin and Meaning of the Decalogue and an Analysis of its Ethical and Moral Value as a Code of Conduct in Modern Society* (New York, 1946), with a bibliography which is practically a

catalog of rationalist works. Written from an anthropological viewpoint, it assesses the Decalogue's ethical and moral significance, and reflects the influence of Ingersoll, Frazer's *Golden Bough,* Westermarck's *Origin and Development of the Moral Ideas,* and similar studies. It represents a provocative and (to conservatives) irritating type of free thought. Antagonism toward traditional organized religion is expressed by Duncan Howlett in *Man Against the Church; the Struggle to Free Man's Religious Spirit* (Boston, 1954), with bibliographical references in the notes; and by William Floyd's *Christianity Cross-Examined* (New York, 1951). The general history of the contest between free thought and ecclesiasticism is ably and learnedly reviewed by Martin E. Marty in "The Uses of Infidelity. Changing Images of Freethought Opposition to American Churches" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, with bibliography, 1956; microfilm 5222 BL, University of Chicago Library).

Throughout their history free and liberal religious leaders have undertaken periodic appraisals of their beliefs, and projects for future action. The 1930's and 1940's, a period of depression and war, inspired several such heart-searchings. A. C. McGiffert of the Chicago Theological Seminary assayed an assessment in "The Future of Liberal Christianity in America," in *The Journal of Religion,* Vol. 15, no. 2 (April 1935), pp. 161–175. Liberal Christianity, holding no common doctrine, may be idealist, realist, or naturalist, but always strives to discover permanent reality underlying various philosophies, to assimilate and Christianize new ideas and values in fluctuating nonreligious culture, and to seek for Christian unity on common ground. It must never stand fast on previous achievement, and must realize values in corporate religious life and in traditional dealings with emotional problems. It can save religion from both dogmatism and superficiality. Another searching survey is a series of essays in honor of the liberal theologian Eugene William Lyman, by John C. Bennett and others, edited by David E.

Roberts and Henry Pitney Van Dusen: *Liberal Theology, an Appraisal* (New York, 1942). This considers Lyman as a representative liberal Christian thinker, and surveys the foundations and history of liberal theology, the meaning of liberalism, and its attitude toward a wide variety of religious, theological, Biblical, Christological, and church problems.

Among the boldest voices on the side of liberalism are Waldemar Argow's *What Do Religious Liberals Believe?* (Yellow Springs, O., 1950), and *The Case for Liberal Religion* (Yellow Springs, O., 1954). The latter, "a protest . . . against the pitiful about-face of religion in our time," was written for laymen from a nontheological viewpoint, and attacks the "new orthodoxy" as pessimistic, defeatist, dogmatic, and inimical to freedom, and pleads for a new harmony between enlightened reason and emotional commitment to basic religious and moral values. The effort is to present liberal religion as *positive,* a reasoned faith in the upward progress of an evolutionary world, and in man's uniquely important place in it, with his godlike powers. The emotion of wonder at the mystery of the universe and passionate commitment to great ideals are made effective toward a better life by action, not mere belief in certain doctrines. A comprehensive discussion, with extensive influence in America, was issued by a commission of the English General Assembly of Unitarian and Free Christian Churches: *A Free Religious Faith* (London, 1945). The authors present an exposition of the meaning of free faith, examine the causes of the decline of religion, and suggest adjustments of religion to a society profoundly altered by science, economic and social changes, modern psychology, and other factors.

Free Religion has been discredited—sometimes deliberately—by being confused with secular anti-Christian or atheistic movements. Actually, it has been mostly a counter-attack against secular unreligion, on behalf of true religious values. It has made a definite and often successful appeal to the "unchurched," who cannot accept the religion offered by

the churches. It has comprehended a wide variety of theists, non-theists, agnostics, radical Unitarians, and others, who consider human nature as the root of all religion, and stress "the universality of the religious sentiment." It has persuaded many American Protestants to consider and realize the extent of their common traditions and values, and to be aware of those in non-Christian religions. (See also Part Five, sect. IV, H, *Humanistic Alternatives to Religion.*)

H. Ethical Culture

The influence of liberal and rational religion was not confined to those who had been reared in a Christian environment. Parallel to the growth of radicalism in "left wing" Protestantism, a similar development appeared in Reform Judaism. Both trends led toward the formation of Ethical Culture Societies, cutting across Jewish-gentile lines, with varying degrees of success under the leadership of Felix Adler (1851–1933), who founded the first one in New York City in 1876. Of Jewish ancestry, he was an educator, reformer, and teacher of religion. Coit, Salter, Weston, and Sheldon, his first four U.S. colleagues, were all of Protestant background. Some came with him from the Free Religious Association, of which he was president.

Like Transcendentalism, the Ethical Movement discovered inspiration in Immanuel Kant's contemplation of man's "sense of law," the ideal of duty and virtue as a religion. It shared Emerson's view of the progress of religion toward its identification with morals. The essence of religion is in cooperation through living the moral life. The debt of the Ethical Movement to Kant and Emerson is emphasized in the preface to W. R. Washington Sullivan, *Morality as a Religion; an Exposition of Some First Principles . . .* (London, 1898), with some bibliographical footnotes. This work typifies the attitude of the movement in its plea for a

reconstruction of religion, by establishing it upon man's moral nature rather than upon "inscrutable dogmas."

The movement soon spread to other American cities, especially Philadelphia, Chicago, and St. Louis. The founding and first thirty years, with special reference to the United States, are recounted by M. W. Meyerhardt in "The Movement for Ethical Culture at Home and Abroad," in *American Journal of Religious Psychology and Education*, Vol. 3, no. 1 (May 1908), pp. 71–153, with references. Written with the aid of leaders in various countries, this excellent essay alludes to the influence of liberal Unitarianism, Transcendentalism, and the Free Religious Association in promoting a new type of ethical religion, and surveys all the movement's social and school work. About 1890 it began to spread in Europe, especially in Germany and Austria, where the way had been prepared by German idealistic philosophy. The movement sprang up independently in England, among such university men as Henry Sidgwick, Bernard Bosanquet, J. H. Muirhead and J. S. Mackenzie, but soon established contact with the societies elsewhere, particularly those in the United States, which were influenced by the English leaders. Although the societies remained quite independent, an International Ethical Union was formed in 1896. The Union was revived after World War II as the International Humanist and Ethical Union. The leaders cooperated in editing *The International Journal of Ethics*, and in conducting the summertime "School of Applied Ethics" at Plymouth, Massachusetts (a mecca of free religionists), for courses in ethics, economics, and religion. In harmony with the contemporary Social Gospel Movement and with their own principles, the societies undertook social reform and social service work, and the New York Society conducted the Workingmen's School, which grew into the Ethical Culture Schools. The societies bore striking resemblances in their blend of ethical religion and social reform, and in their democratic idealism,

which brought all classes together for the Sunday lectures. All acknowledged but one principle—the absolute independence and supremacy of morality. These characteristics are stressed in Sullivan, who also mentions the founding of the "Ethical Religion Society" in 1897, and summarizes the Sunday teachings generally emphasized by the movement, such as the relation of ethics to religion, science, theism, and the philosophy of Kant; and the general attitude of the movement toward the concept of God, the law of compensation, conscience, priests and prophets of religion, prayer, death, war, marriage, the philosophy of positivism, and the Transcendentalist idea of the "Over-Soul." The historical background is covered also by an essay, "A Few Words about the Ethical Societies," in a volume of lectures by the lecturer of the St. Louis Ethical Society: Walter Lorenzo Sheldon, *An Ethical Movement* (New York and London, 1896), dedicated to Felix Adler, the author's teacher. Without considering metaphysical aspects, the lectures cover the movement's attitude toward religion in general, other beliefs, God, Christ, stoicism, poetry, spiritual self-culture, marriage, the family, law and government, social ideals, property, and current issues.

There have been variant ideals among and within the societies, some members emphasizing immediate social reform, and some the anterior spiritual reformation of the individual. There has always been, however, a general agreement on the ideal of ethics as a pattern of good and right human relationships, on satisfying the demand for the superlative, and on keeping alive the sense of "first-rateness." The original ideal, as expounded by Felix Adler, is that mere belief is secondary in importance to leading an excellent life. This is most clearly and historically expressed in four of Adler's own works, which had an influence upon American life far beyond the limits of the Ethical societies: (1) *Creed and Deed; a Series of Discourses* (New York, 1877). It considers (among other topics) religion, the new ethical ideal of

religion and its form, immortality, the evolution of Hebrew religion, Reform Judaism, and Jesus. (2) *A New Statement of the Aim of the Ethical Culture Societies* (New York, [1904], Ethical Pamphlets, no. 6), stresses the essentially religious character of the movement as opposed to "polite atheism," its freedom of religious thought, and lack of dogmatic pronouncements upon such questions as the existence of God and immortality, and its basis of union in desire for a better, divine way of life and dedication to moral striving. (3) *The Religion of Duty* (New York, 1905), a series of ten essays, partly published also in *Ethical Addresses* and *The Ethical Record*, ed. Leslie Willis Sprague. An especially significant essay is "The Essential Difference between Ethical Societies and the Churches," surveying the contrasting attitudes toward religion, the conception of God, Jesus' teachings, duty, conduct, other persons, pleasure, suffering, etc. The volume contains some of his most earnest, vital, and characteristic expressions of the Ethical ideal of noble and unselfish life and thought. (4) *An Ethical Philosophy of Life Presented in Its Main Outlines* (New York and London, 1918), an exposition of his mature ethical philosophy as evolved from Judaism, Ralph Waldo Emerson's philosophy, Jesus, socialism, and ethical culture activities, and indicating applications of ethical theory to personal life and social and political institutions, international society, the church, and the use of force to preserve freedom. The emphasis lies upon the spiritual aspect and harmonious development of human nature and spiritual self-discipline.

The development of the Ethical Movement's ideals and activities, from Adler's original impulse, may be traced in some of the very extensive writings of its advocates, many of whom were his personal disciples. Whether they were English or American is immaterial, as their writings were internationally influential. Although generally disclaiming any intention of expressing "official" views, they really summarize the basic, agreed principles of Ethical Religion, and

their relation to American society and life. One of the most eminent protagonists, a pupil of Adler, was William Mackintire Salter, through his *Ethical Religion* (Boston, 1899), a series of lectures delivered mostly for the Society for Ethical Culture of Chicago. The bond of union is indicated as not speculative or intellectual, but moral and political, largely through Adler's influence. Significant features are the discussions of Darwinism and ethics, and of the social-reform aspect of the movement as related to social idealism and the rights of labor; a consideration of the success and failure of Protestantism; and a criticism of Unitarianism as lacking in really deep seriousness. Since the Ethical Movement itself was criticized around 1900 as lacking a serious and general philosophical basis, the leaders in England and America replied in a widely read publication by the Society of Ethical Propagandists: *Ethics and Religion: a Collection of Essays*, by Sir John Seeley, Dr. Felix Adler, and others (London, 1900), in which the essayists (American or English founders or leaders of Ethical societies) assert the undogmatic but undeviating principle that the movement should not commit itself to any theory of the universe or be primarily interested in the metaphysics of ethics. It should rise from effort and experience to universal truths, and promulgate moral ideas rather than ideas *about* morality.

This attitude has remained much the same since the turn of the century, and appears clearly in a readable volume by a leader of the Chicago Society, Horace James Bridges, *The Emerging Faith; Answers to Questions on Ethical Religion*, with a Foreword by the Rt. Hon. Lord Snell (London, 1937), dedicated to Stanton Coit, American founder of the Congregational Ethical movement in England, as against the university movement of Sidgwick, Bosanquet, and Leslie Stephen. Coit, first American assistant to Felix Adler, assumed leadership of the old South Place Religious Society in London in 1887, changing the name to "Ethical Society." He was the last of several American ministers there, in-

cluding his predecessor Moncure Conway and the founder (1793), Elhanan Winchester. Bridges' book is a resolute declaration of the aim of the societies to promote "the religion of the open mind," as expressed in the attitude toward belief in God and immortality, problems of evil and of human nature, consolation in sorrow and death, resurrection, etc. Bridges edited a volume with a similar purpose: *Aspects of Ethical Religion: Essays in Honor of Felix Adler on the Fiftieth Anniversary of His Founding of the Ethical Movement, 1876, by His Colleagues* (New York, 1926), in which each contributor wrote on a part of the movement that most appealed to him, resulting in a many-sided exposition of the whole in such aspects as ethical mysticism, ethical experience as the basis of religious education, and relations to social reform. The unchanging basic quality appears in the writings of the eminent leader, David Saville Muzzey. He was, significantly, a biographer of that exponent of the religion of morality, Thomas Jefferson. Muzzey's *Ethical Religion, Its Historical Sources, Its Elements, Its Sufficiency, Its Future* (New York, 1943), consists of addresses before the New York society in 1943, with suggested reading, and expounds the principle of ethical religion as not derived from a creed giving primary significance to faith in a supernatural revelation. Ethics *is* religion, not founded upon dogma, and yet strengthened by the testimony of the past as seen in prophets, not priests. The same author's *Ethics as a Religion* (New York, [1951]), a sort of valedictory, succinctly states the ethical culturist's position as opposed to traditional religion, and is one of the best defenses of humanistic idealism as a substitute for supernaturalistic theology, even though expressing a somewhat old-fashioned and too optimistic social idealism.

Ethical culturalists always have been highly literate and historically conscious, and have therefore produced an unusually rich historiography for such a numerically small group. Especially important as a survey of the earlier phases

is Leo Jacobs, *Three Types of Practical Ethical Movements of the Past Half Century* (New York, 1922), with a bibliography. The volume comprises surveys of the religious, social, and "pure" ethical movements with respect to principles and historical development: the Christian socialism of Maurice and Kingsley; the social movement founded by Denison and Toynbee; and the ethical-culture movement of Adler. A more exhaustive, detailed survey is *The Fiftieth Anniversary of the Ethical Movement, 1876–1926* (New York and London, 1926), comprising an essay by Felix Adler on the founding, development, and interpretation of the American movement; autobiographical sketches of leaders in various countries, stressing their motives for joining the societies; a chronology of the American societies; and a statement of the work of the international ethical organization. The best recent account, written for the 75th anniversary of the Society in New York, is Henry Neumann's *Spokesmen for Ethical Religion* (Boston, 1951), with notes and a reading list. The writer, a long-time leader in the movement, explains the ideal set forth by the founder, and by other American and European leaders, including some unknown to the general public. Most of the text is devoted to the life of Adler, the movement's philosophy, and ideals of education and community service, and the remarkably consistent position of its leaders in considering the societies as "religious" groups, in the broad sense of that term, which would include scientific humanists and diligent "secularists" as "religious." Dr. Neumann's position here is perhaps hortatory as well as descriptive, and directed against the tendency of several younger leaders to use the term "religious" provisionally, and to avoid its popular connotations as much as possible. Provisional use has been traditional. Even Adler, who regarded himself as religious *because* transcendentalistic, said in an address of 1910: "The Ethical movement is religious to those who regard it as religious, and merely ethical to those who regard it as merely ethical." By "merely ethical,"

he would have meant those who are scientific naturalists, and eligible for lay membership only.

IV. DEVELOPMENT OF THE STANDARD DENOMINATIONAL PATTERN

A DISTINCTIVE feature of Anglo-American religion is the denomination. The various Protestant churches ordinarily are referred to as "denominations." The origins of American denominationalism were already evident in the steadily multiplying religious divisions of the colonial period. They originated in European sectarianism, schisms caused by the Great Awakening, and above all in the increasing dissent from the legally established churches of Congregational New England and the Anglican Southern Colonies. After disestablishment, even these churches became denominations, on the same legal footing as those groups which they had regarded as schismatic sects, such as the Baptists, the Methodists, and the Separate Congregationalists.

A prominent trait of American Protestant religion has been the tendency of new groups to conform to the denominational pattern. This fact could be illustrated by the history of some evangelistic sects, which have originated in spiritual and social protest against long-established churches. In the course of their development, these eventually assume the distinguishing denominational characteristics, such as a more or less elaborate organization, adoption of a creed, and forms of worship. In time this tendency characterizes even those groups which, like the Disciples of Christ, have originated in reaction against ecclesiasticism and creedal orthodoxy.

This evolution is accepted as normal, and formerly was regarded as a natural characteristic of Protestantism to produce denominations living with each other in "healthy competition." Since the rise of the Ecumenical Movement, and of sentiment for greater cooperation and unity, the traditional denominationalism has been seriously questioned.

One result has been the movement for federated and community churches. (See sect. VII, *Movements Toward Unity*, particularly D.)

A. General

The thesis that denominationalism is the most significant general characteristic of American Protestantism is maintained in Sidney E. Mead's essays on "Denominationalism: The Shape of Protestantism in America," *Church History*, Vol. 22, no. 3 (Sept. 1933), pp. 279–297; and Vol. 23, no. 3 (Sept. 1954), pp. 291–320. The general background of the denominations is thoroughly reviewed by Andrew Landale Drummond's *Story of American Protestantism* (Boston, 1950), with bibliography, which explains it in the light of its past, noting modifications caused by transplantation from Europe, and the fundamental characteristic as the lack of an established church. Emphasized also are the influence of the Great Awakening in fusing a large section of Protestants, revivalism as a dominant pattern, the rise of the interdenominational Social Gospel caused by industrialism and urbanism, the influence of immigrant groups, and the frontier influence in remaking Protestantism in the American image. The frontier effect is studied closely by Arthur George Wiederaenders, "The American Frontier as a Factor in Protestant Denominationalism in the United States" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Texas, 1942).

The general history of the development of Protestant denominationalism is well represented by Frank Spencer Mead, *See These Banners Go; the Story of the Protestant Churches in America* (Indianapolis and New York, 1936). The denominations speak for themselves in Vergilius Ferm, ed., *The American Church of the Protestant Heritage* (New York, 1953), including bibliographies, and twenty-one articles written by members of the groups. They present the European background, American development, characteristic features, chief doctrines, confessional bases, theological de-

velopments, type of polity, organizational life, pioneer leaders, conspicuous theologians, schools, journals, etc. A Roman Catholic survey is John A. Hardon's *The Protestant Churches of America* (Westminster, Md., 1957), with references, statistics, and bibliography. This presents a thoroughly objective study by a Jesuit, to enable Roman Catholics to understand the fundamental characteristics of Protestant denominationalism.

The common elements in American Protestantism are presented in a reportorial style by Archibald Thomas Robertson, in *That Old-Time Religion* (Boston, 1950). He combines historical study of the characteristics of Protestant denominations with appreciation of the common, personal, orthodox religion of millions of Americans, which crosses class, denominational, and sometimes even racial barriers, and is devoted to freedom and faith, the bedrock of our morals and our democracy. Jerald C. Brauer, *Protestantism in America; a Narrative History* (Philadelphia, 1953), with a bibliography, is a dramatic, readable, brief summary of the rise, history, and contribution to American religious life of the Protestant denominations. It adopts the view that, in spite of their many variances, they really are united in one great movement. Common characteristics and enterprises are studied in Harlan Paul Douglass, *The Protestant Church as a Social Institution* (New York and London, 1935), which has an extensive bibliography by chapters, and summarizes many research projects sponsored by the Institute of Social and Religious Research, to study organized religion and its processes, and to supply background for understanding religious problems. The study was conducted in collaboration with President Herbert Hoover's Research Committee on "Recent Social Trends in the United States."

Modern trends are closely analyzed in a lengthy study by Archer B. Bass: *Protestantism in the United States* (New York, 1929), with bibliography, presenting a rather complacent view of the pattern of denominationalism, and em-

phasizing the drive toward interdenominational cooperation and outlook. Far less complacent is Marcus Bach's *Report to Protestants; a Personal Investigation of the Weakness, Need, Vision and Great Potential of Protestants Today* (Indianapolis, 1948), which suggests the necessity of presenting a Protestant united front to cope with the social and religious problems of a new age. Fundamental similarities are seen as promising an accelerated trend toward unity, in Ronald E. Osborn, *The Spirit of American Christianity* (New York, 1958), with a bibliographical note. This sketch stresses the distinctive characteristics and similarities of various denominations, the distinction between official doctrines and actual beliefs, the upsurge of membership, and the movement toward unity. The pressing questions and problems of Protestant denominations at the mid-century are pointed up in two books by distinguished authorities: Charles Clayton Morrison, *Can Protestantism Win America?* (New York, 1948); and David Wesley Soper, ed., *Room for Improvement; Next Steps for Protestants, with Chapters by Chad Walsh* [and others] (Chicago, 1951).

A moving portrayal of the new Protestantism in action is presented by Clarence Wilbur Hall and Desider Holisher, *Protestant Panorama: a Story of the Faith that Made America Free* (New York, 1951), with bibliography and many illustrations. It includes the origins of the American Protestant heritage of religious freedom, worship, laymen's activities, church women, youth organizations, the unity of diverse Protestant groups, their plans to meet social disorder, Protestantism in education, the home, foreign missions, and international affairs. Each section has a narrative and descriptive text, and every picture a caption.

B. Typical

The following sections, 1–6, present the bibliography and general history of the old, major Protestant churches in the

denominational pattern. The mass of writings about them is so vast that anything like a complete bibliography would be impractical here. The intention is to present guides to the bibliography of each denomination, including all those published in recent years in *Religion in Life*, which are carefully selected. Selected general histories and special studies illustrate the rise and development of these churches, their distinctive characteristics, parties and divisions, and their contributions to American life.

1. ANGLICANISM (EPISCOPAL CHURCH). After its disestablishment in the Revolutionary period, Anglicanism in America was compelled to readjust its relations to society and to the state. Being no longer established by law, it received no further financial support from the local governments or from the missionary societies in England.

The inevitable choice lay between ceasing to exist as an organized church, and effecting a complete reorganization upon new principles. Although greatly weakened by the ravages of war, confiscations, the exile of many Loyalists, and the separation of the Methodists, the Anglican Church slowly attained a new organization, as the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America. State conventions of clerical and lay delegates established dioceses with written constitutions and canons, and *elected* bishops. National conventions, composed of clerical and lay delegates from dioceses, organized the church on a national scale, with a constitution.

The result was something new in the history of Anglicanism, an episcopal church organized not on monarchial but on republican principles. A state church had, in fact, become an American denomination. It fully recognized the right of lay participation in ecclesiastical government and the election of bishops. The bishops were of a purely religious and spiritual character, elected, not appointed by a monarch as head of the Church. In this development America contributed a new concept to religious life—republican epis-

copacy. The post-Revolutionary period witnessed a slow recovery of Anglicanism, which soon was followed by a rapid missionary expansion.

a. Bibliography and General History. The location and character of major archives are noted in Niels H. Sonne, "Bibliographical Materials on the Episcopal Church," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 25, no. 3 (Summer, 1956), pp. 442–451. This lists also, with some comment, a selection of general histories, published source materials, diocesan histories, and many works on specific subjects. Robert S. Bosher, comp., "The Episcopal Church and American Christianity: A Bibliography," *Hist. Mag.,* Vol. 19, no. 4 (Dec. 1950), pp. 369–384, is a classified list of histories and studies arranged according to lectures, which form a conspectus of the progress of Anglicanism in the United States, with attention to the religious environment.

William Stevens Perry, *The History of the American Episcopal Church, 1587–1883* (Boston, 1885, 2 vols.) is the standard nineteenth-century history, packed with valuable material from sources not readily accessible. Volume 2 has bibliographical monographs: "The Literary Churchmen of the Ante-revolutionary Period," by Henry Coppée; and "Church Literature since the Revolution," by J. H. Ward, on writers and their works in the first century of the Church in the United States. Two scholarly general histories have superseded all earlier ones, except Perry's. William Wilson Manross, *A History of the American Episcopal Church* (New York, 1950, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.), with bibliography, describes it as a living institution, internally and in relation to society, with a lessened stress upon dramatic incidents and striking personalities. The bibliography lists official and semi-official documents of the colonial and post-revolutionary periods, personal papers, and periodicals representing various viewpoints. James Thayer Addison, *The Episcopal Church in the United States, 1789–1931* (New York, 1951), with a bibliography, is a popular account, which stresses organiza-

tion, missions, education, growth of social viewpoints, and great leaders, and is written with a social background, and with references to developments in other churches and to secular events in terms of religious meaning. The author frankly faces the Church's limitations, failures, and faults.

A series of unusually valuable monographs carries the history by periods, from the Revolution to the middle of the twentieth century, emphasizing the Episcopal Church's relations to American society and thought: (1) Richard James Hooker, "The Anglican Church and the American Revolution" (Doctoral dissertation with bibliographical footnotes, University of Chicago, 1943, typewritten copy and microfilm). (2) Charles N. Brickley, "The Episcopal Church in Protestant America, 1800–1860; a Study in Thought and Action" (Doctoral dissertation, Clark University, 1950). (3) William Wilson Manross, *The Episcopal Church in the United States, 1800–1840, A Study in Church Life* (New York and London, 1938), with a bibliography. (4) George Edmed DeMille, *The Episcopal Church Since 1900; a Brief History* (New York, 1955) has bibliographies. Joseph Blount Cheshire, *The Church in the Confederate States; a History of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the Confederate States* (New York, 1914) studies in detail a generally little known phase of Anglican church life.

The Episcopal Church is a federation of dioceses, whose influence in shaping the church's administration and policy is expressed and implemented by the delegated General Convention, with its representation of the clergy and the laity. The most complete history of this legislature is Calvin Rankin Barnes, *The General Convention: Offices and Officers, 1785–1950* (Philadelphia, 1951), with a bibliography, and "Book List, Principal Writings of the Persons Mentioned in this Study."

b. Organization: Republican Episcopacy. Distinctive features of Anglicanism in America emerged during the post-Revolutionary reorganization. One is the adaptation of

episcopacy to republicanism, in a new nation that was abolishing the vestiges of state church organization. The other is the constitutional recognition of the rights of the laity, which had originated during the colonial period, in the absence of a bishop. The difficult readjustment to the new situation has been most thoroughly studied by Clara O. Loveland, in *The Critical Years; the Reconstitution of the Anglican Church in the United States of America: 1780–1789* (Greenwich, Conn., 1956), with a "Catalogue of Correspondence" and a bibliography. E. Clowes Chorley, "The Election and Consecration" [of Bishop Samuel Seabury], *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 3, no. 3 (Sept. 1934), pp. 146–191, calls attention to his election by the clergy, and his consecration by bishops of the Scottish Episcopal Church, which was free from state control. G. MacLaren Brydon, "New Light on the Origins of the Method of Electing Bishops Adopted by the American Episcopal Church," *ibid.*, Vol. 19, no. 3 (Sept. 1950), pp. 202–213, stresses the American democratic method of election by the clergy and lay deputies.

Lay participation in legislation and in election of bishops was a natural outgrowth of certain customs that originated or grew in strength during the colonial era. These are clearly explained in G. MacLaren Brydon, "The Origin of the Rights of the Laity in the American Episcopal Church," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 12, no. 4 (Dec. 1943), pp. 313–338; and Daniel Dulaney Addison, "The Growth of the Layman's Power in the Episcopal Church," *Papers of the American Society of Church History*, 2nd ser., Vol. 3, pp. 65–77. The democratizing of Anglicanism through the participation of laymen in councils is obvious throughout the following accounts of reorganization: (1) Walter Herbert Stowe, "The State or Diocesan Conventions of the War and Post-War Periods," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (Sept. 1937), pp. 220–256. (2) William Wilson Manross, "The Interstate Meetings and General Conventions of 1784, 1785, 1786 and 1789," *ibid.*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (Sept. 1939), pp. 257–280. (3)

E. Clowes Chorley, "The General Conventions of 1785, 1786 and 1789," *ibid.*, Vol. 4, no. 4 (Dec. 1935), pp. 246–266.

c. Low and High Church. The reorganization of Anglicanism was followed by the emergence of party distinctions that have endured to the present day. The broad division into Low and High or Catholic and Evangelical attitudes frequently gives almost the impression of two churches comprehended in one, sometimes in conflict but never separating.

The Protestant Episcopal Church therefore represents both conformity and exception to the usual denominational pattern. Conformity includes all the ordinary aspects of constitution, organization, and administration. The divergence consists in a dual Protestant and Catholic character, and in the federal relationship of the American Church with other branches of Anglicanism throughout the world, through international conferences and congresses.

Because of these peculiar characteristics, the American Episcopal Church has been a leader in the international Ecumenical Movement, which aims to draw together all the sundered branches of Christianity. Its hospitality toward divergent views has served as an example of intelligent tolerance.

E. Clowes Chorley, *Men and Movements in the American Episcopal Church* (New York, 1950), with bibliography, informatively accents leaders, and the character and influence of the Evangelical, Catholic, and Social Gospel movements. The background of the Low or Evangelical party appears in G. R. Balleine, *A History of the Evangelical Party in the Church of England* (London, 1951), and in Leonard Elliott Binns, *The Evangelical Movement in the English Church* (London, 1928), a fairly objective and semi-popular study by a liberal Anglican clergyman. It is important, because of the widespread influence of this movement upon the Episcopal Church in the United States through bishops like

Alexander V. Griswold, William Meade, and Philander Chase. The tone of Anglican Evangelicalism is revealed in an essay by Charles Wesley Lowry, Jr.: "Spiritual Antecedents of Anglican Evangelicalism," *Hist. Mag.*, Vol. 12, no. 2 (June 1943), pp. 121–156. Alexander Clinton Zabriskie, "The Rise and Main Characteristics of the Anglican Evangelical Movement in England and America," *ibid.*, Vol. 12, no. 2 (June 1943), pp. 83–115, has a good account of "Early American Evangelicalism."

The best brief appreciation of the High Church spirit and teaching is Walter Herbert Stowe's *The Essence of Anglo-Catholicism* (New York, 1942). Its origin in America is briefly and accurately reviewed in an essay by W. G. Andrews: "The Parentage of American High Churchmanship," *Protestant Episcopal Review*, Vol. 12, no. 4 (Jan. 1899), pp. 196–221. This ascribes the origin to the Rev. Dr. Samuel Johnson of Connecticut and his followers, in the colonial period from 1720 to 1770. Johnson's spirit was the animating force in the life and teaching of the first bishop of the Anglican Church in America. His strengthening of the High Church attitude appears clearly in Eben Edwards Beardsley, *Life and Correspondence of the Right Reverend Samuel Seabury, D.D., first Bishop of Connecticut, and of the Episcopal Church in the United States of America* (Boston, 1881). The best modern appreciation of Seabury's enduring influence is by Edward Rochie Hardy, Jr., "The Significance of Seabury," *American Church Monthly*, Vol. 37, no. 1 (Jan. 1935), pp. 26–40.

Seabury's tradition was solidified and promoted by John Henry Hobart, the Bishop of New York. The origin of his doctrine is discussed in John McVickar, *The Early Life and Professional Years of Bishop Hobart* (Oxford and London, 1838). Although American High Churchmanship long antedated the agitation in England known as the Oxford Movement, it was considerably affected and strengthened by the international penetration of that trend. The most complete

account of the modern High or Catholic spirit and doctrine in the United States is George Edmed DeMille, *The Catholic Movement in the American Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1950, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.), with bibliography.

The tolerant character of the Episcopal Church, in comprehending diverse views, is revealed by the history of the unofficial organization that has provided a forum for all parties: Protestant Episcopal Church in the U.S.A., Church Congress, *Honest Liberty in the Church; a Record of the Church Congress in the United States on its Fiftieth Anniversary, A.D. MCMXXIV*, with an Introduction by the General Chairman, Charles Lewis Slattery (New York, 1924). One of the best studies of this peculiar type of unity with diversity is J. H. Scambler's "The Anglican Synthesis (Catholic and Evangelical)" (Doctoral dissertation, Northern Baptist University, 1953). The comprehensiveness of Episcopalian doctrine is set forth in Frank Damrosch, Jr., *The Faith of the Episcopal Church* (New York, 1946), and by Powel Mills Dawley, *The Episcopal Church and its Work . . . with the Collaboration of James Thayer Addison* (Greenwich, Conn., 1955), with bibliography. This should be read together with a popular work by W. Norman Pittenger, *The Episcopalian Way of Life* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1957).

Understanding of the liturgy of the Episcopal Church is essential to any study of the Church's history, worship, and influence, especially because the *Book of Common Prayer* is used far beyond its bounds. A popular study, with an excellent bibliography, is Massey H. Shepherd, Jr., *The Worship of the Church* (Greenwich, Conn., 1952), with attractive literary presentation, and annotations. More detailed, and also with an excellent bibliography, is Edward L. Parsons and B. H. Jones, *The American Prayer Book* (New York, 1937). The standard authority on the subject is John Wallace Suter and George Julius Cleaveland, *The American Book of*

Common Prayer; its Origin and Development (New York, 1949), with bibliography. (See also Part Five, sect. II, H, 5, *Anglican Theology.*)

2. CONGREGATIONALISM. Like the Anglican Church, Congregationalism was compelled by the Revolution to abandon its status as an established religion, and to assume the role of an American denomination. The approach to disestablishment was slower than in Virginia, and in Massachusetts the separation from the state was not complete until 1833. The explanation lies in the fact that Congregationalism in Massachusetts and Connecticut had become closely associated with the dominant Federalist Party. The churches were supported by that political power during the long conservative reaction against revolutionary radicalism. The churches became identified with a defensive reaction against the rise of Jeffersonian democratic liberalism.

The triumph of the toleration and reform parties placed Congregationalism on the same legal footing as other denominations. After a brief period of depression, the churches were renewed by revivals and missionary zeal, which eventually (through the missionary societies) carried Congregationalism across the nation.

a. Bibliography and General History. For references to the disestablishment of the Congregational churches in Massachusetts and Connecticut, see sect. II, B, *Reaction Against the State Churches.* The classic, comprehensive bibliography is that of Henry Martyn Dexter, *The Congregationalism of the Last Three Hundred Years, as Seen in Its Literature . . . With a Bibliographical Appendix* (New York, 1880), which has many footnotes. The second part, "Collections toward a Bibliography of Congregationalism," is arranged chronologically and indexed. References to related churches are given in Charles Surman, *A Bibliography of Congregational Church History, Including Numerous Cognate Presbyterian/Unitarian Records and a Few Baptist* (Congregational Historical Society, 1947), with eight hun-

dred entries. The best collection of documents on the expansion of Congregationalism outside New England is William Warren Sweet, ed., *The Congregationalists, a Collection of Source Materials* (Chicago, 1939), "Religion on the American Frontier, 1783–1850," Vol. 3, with bibliography.

The most authoritative among the older general histories will always be Williston Walker, *A History of the Congregational Churches in the United States* (New York, 1894), with bibliography, still regarded as a standard work. It has been revised and brought up-to-date by Gaius Glenn Atkins and Frederick Louis Fagley, *History of American Congregationalism* (Boston and Chicago, 1942), with a bibliography. Based upon dependable documentation, it makes no effort to cloud over the "more unhappy phases of early American Puritansm." Its most important contribution is its orderly and accurate account of growth, thought, and work since the beginning of the federal period. It has been commended for comprehensive scholarship and vivacious style, and criticized for emphasizing organization too much and faith too little. Other good general histories are Albert Elijah Dunning, *Congregationalists in America; a Popular History of Their Origin, Belief, Polity, Growth and Work* (New York, 1894), and Leonard Woolsey Bacon, *The Congregationalists* (New York, 1904), with bibliography. (See also Part Two, sect. 1, B, *The New England Puritan Churches.*)

b. Evolution of the Pilgrim Faith. The basis of acceptance into membership in the early New England Congregational churches was profession of faith and acknowledging the covenant between the members of the church, and between the church and God. The standards of belief and the character of covenants, during three centuries, are displayed in a collection compiled by William Eleazar Barton: *Congregational Creeds and Covenants* (Chicago, 1917). The accepted expression of belief and polity for nearly two hundred years is reprinted with historical commentary in Henry Wilder Foote, ed., *The Cambridge Platform of 1648, Ter-*

centenary Commemoration at Cambridge, Massachusetts, October 27, 1948 (Boston, 1949), with bibliography. The classic account of the origins of New England Congregationalism is Leonard Woolsey Bacon, *The Genesis of the New England Churches* (New York, 1874), with bibliographical footnotes.

Congregational separatism as it was professed and lived in the earliest New England churches is the theme of Ozora Stearns Davis, *The Pilgrim Faith* (Boston and New York, 1913). Its organization as a community is explained fully by Paul Sturtevant Howe, *The Religious and Legal Constitution of the Pilgrim State; the Facts of Early Pilgrim History* (Cape May, N.J., 1923), with bibliography; and in Walter A. Powell, *The Pilgrims and Their Religious, Intellectual and Civic Life* (Wilmington, Del., 1923), with bibliography. The organization of Congregationalism as a "Holy Commonwealth," based upon religious homogeneity, is the theme of Perry Miller, *Orthodoxy in Massachusetts, 1630–1650; a Genetic Study* (Cambridge, Mass., 1933), with bibliography. The evolutionary result of gradual departure from the theocratic ideal, and of the adoption of theological liberalism, appears in statements by Walter M. Horton in *Our Christian Faith, Congregationalism Today and Tomorrow* (Boston, 1945), and by Daniel Thomas Jenkins in *Congregationalism: a Restatement* (New York, 1954).

The liberal attitude has made modern American Congregationalism receptive toward union with other churches of congenial beliefs. In the 1930's a merger was effected with the Christian Church, whose development is narrated in Milo True Morrill's *A History of the Christian Denomination in America, 1794–1911* (Dayton, O., 1912), with "Sources" at the end of each chapter. The union is described in detail in Frederick Louis Fagley, *Story of the Congregational Christian Churches* (Boston and Chicago, 1941), with bibliography. The most recent merger is related by Malcolm

King Burton, *Destiny for Congregationalism* (Oklahoma City, 1953), on the union of the Congregational Christian Church with the Evangelical and Reformed Church.

3. BAPTISTS. The Baptists, numerically the largest group of Anglo-American Protestants, in their numerous divisions represent the essence of American denominationalism and democratic religion. In the early colonial period they were a small minority, and were considered by the established churches as a schismatic sect. The Great Awakening vastly increased them, by its emphasis upon adult conversion, intense personal religion, and opposition to state churches. Baptists were champions of religious liberty.

They took full advantage of the vast opportunity opened by disestablishment, and by the westward push of settlement between the close of the Revolution and the Civil War. Their congregational polity, recognizing no higher authority than local associations for consultation and fellowship, appealed to the democratic ways of a newly settled country. Further advantages were their friendliness to revivals and to protracted meetings. They won multitudes among the rural population, and the "unchurched" masses in the cities.

The Baptists became the rallying church of the Anglo-American masses, in rivalry with the Methodists. They became also a successful expression of American denominationalism, through the multiplication of their divisions based upon doctrinal, sectional, and other differences.

a. Bibliography and General History. Leo T. Crismon, "The Literature of the Baptists," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 25, no. 1 (Winter, 1955–1956), pp. 117–131, includes sources mostly in English and mostly by Baptists, books, and some periodicals. It has bibliographies, biographies, encyclopedias, general Baptist history, Baptists in England and the United States, missions, ecclesiology, hymnology, theology, and statistics. Albert Henry Newman, ed., *A Century of Baptist Achievement* (Philadelphia, 1901) is especially valuable for an essay by Kerr Boyce Tupper, "Baptist Contributions to

Literature during the Nineteenth Century." The most extensive work attempted is Edward Caryl Starr, *A Baptist Bibliography, Being a Register of Printed Material by and about Baptists; Including Works Written against the Baptists* (Philadelphia, 1947–1958, 6 vols.), continuing, with index to joint authors, translators, publishers, etc. William Warren Sweet, ed., *The Baptists, 1783–1830, a Collection of Source Material* (New York, 1931), "Religion on the American Frontier," Vol. I, with bibliography, comprises the expansion of the Baptists into the Allegheny Mountains and the Mississippi Valley.

Garnett E. Puckett, "Struggles of Baptists in America to Sustain Their Distinctive Principles, 1639–1791" (Doctoral dissertation, Southern Baptist University, 1947) tells the story of the evolution of a small, oppressed group, considered as schismatic and sectarian, into an American denomination on the eve of a great expansion under religious freedom. Albert Henry Newman, *A History of the Baptist Churches in the United States* (New York, 1915), with bibliography, is a revision and enlargement of the volume written by him for the "American Church History Series" in the 1890's. Although it is much out of date, nothing comparable, covering the whole field, has been written. John T. Christian, *A History of the Baptists of the United States from the First Settlement of the Country to the Year 1845* (Nashville, 1926), to the organization of the Southern Baptist Convention, covers the period of growth and organization. Robert G. Torbet, *A History of the Baptists*, with a Foreword by Kenneth Scott Latourette (Philadelphia, 1950), succeeds in being both popular and scholarly and comprehensive, with footnotes, and references to the literature and the sources. Walter Sinclair Stewart, *Early Baptist Missionaries and Pioneers* (Philadelphia and Boston, 1925) and his *Later Baptist Missionaries and Pioneers* (Philadelphia, 1928–1929, 2 vols.), with bibliographies, include a vast amount of information on American Baptist history.

There are several reliable, scholarly histories of the denomination in various regions, in the "Baptist History Series." Examples are: Henry Sweetser Burrage, *A History of the Baptists in New England* (Philadelphia, 1894); Justin Almerin Smith, *A History of the Baptists in the Western States East of the Mississippi* (Philadelphia, 1896); and Benjamin Franklin Riley, *A History of the Baptists in the Southern States East of the Mississippi* (Philadelphia, 1898). Walter Brownlow Posey, *The Baptist Church in the Lower Mississippi Valley, 1767–1845* (Lexington, Ky., 1957), with bibliographical footnotes, takes the story to the organization of the Southern Baptist Convention, and is based upon primary sources. It explains the factors in the rapid growth, and illustrates the gradual transformation of a nonconformist group into a popular church—a denomination—governed by associations.

b. Divisions. Arthur Hinson, "The Differences among Baptist Groups in the United States of America" (Doctoral dissertation, Southwestern Baptist University) is the best scholarly study of the branching of denominations from a parent stock, a typically American trait. William Wright Barnes, *History of the Southern Baptist Convention, 1845–1953* (Nashville, 1954) points out the wide divergence from liberalism in the Northern churches, and should be used with the *Encyclopedia of Southern Baptists* (Nashville, 1958, 2 vols.). The variances are explored by Robert Andrew Barker in *Relations Between Northern and Southern Baptists* (Fort Worth, 1948), with bibliographical note.

G. A. Burgess, *Free Baptist Cyclopaedia, Historical and Biographical, The Rise of the Freewill Baptist Connection and of those General and Open Communion Baptists which, Merging Together, Form One People* (Free Baptist Cyclopaedia Co., 1889) is still a standard, authoritative source for the history of this group. Norman Allen Baxter, *History of the Freewill Baptists: A Study in New England Separatism* (Rochester, N.Y., 1957), with a bibliography,

traces their history from origins under the leadership of Benjamin Randall, about 1770, to their merger with the Northern Baptists in 1911. It is a scholarly and readable study of a revolt against Calvinism that was influential out of proportion to its numerical strength, remarkable for its open communion influence, education, missions, and work for welfare of Negroes. *Seventh Day Baptists in Europe and America* (Plainfield, N.J., 1910, 2 vols.) is still the most comprehensive and authoritative work on this denomination. Another small group of Baptists is documented by Ellen Starr Brinton, *A Check List by and about the Rogerenes, Arranged Chronologically, with Later Editions Following the First Date* (Swarthmore, Pa., 1942), typewritten. It has a list of "References Consulted," and forty-nine entries, with full notes.

Scandinavian Baptist groups, which originated as schisms from the Lutheran state churches, and became American denominations, are studied in Jonas Oscar Backlund, *Swedish Baptists in America, a History* (Chicago, 1933), with bibliography; Adolf Olson, *A Centenary History, as Related to the Baptist General Conference of America* (Chicago, 1952), with bibliography; and P. Stiansen, *History of the Norwegian Baptists in America* (the Norwegian Baptist Conference of America and the American Baptist Publication Society, 1939).

4. DISCIPLES OF CHRIST AND CLOSELY RELATED GROUPS. A fairly typical American denominational pattern is that of the Disciples of Christ. It illustrates the process by which several groups, begun as non- or interdenominational movements, have been assimilated to the familiar denominational pattern. The Disciples began in movements led by Barton Warren Stone of Kentucky in 1804, and by Elder Thomas Campbell in West Virginia and Pennsylvania in 1809. Three groups emerged from the general movement: the Disciples of Christ; the conservative Disciples, sometimes preferring to be called the Church of Christ; and the Churches of Christ,

generally located in the Southern States. The last-named group separated from the parent stem in the latter part of the nineteenth century, and the division was virtually complete by 1906. Since the groups have a common origin and their lines of demarcation have not been very rigid, the writings about them are gathered into one bibliography.

Claude Elbert Spencer, *An Author Catalog of Disciples of Christ and Related Religious Groups* (Canton, Mo., 1946), published by the Disciples of Christ Historical Society, is the most scholarly and extensive work in the field, arranged alphabetically, with writings by and about virtually every literate Disciple. It omits most corporately published works of various official and semi-official agencies. Alfred Thomas DeGroot and Enos E. Dowling, *The Literature of the Disciples of Christ* (Advance, Ind., 1933), while not carefully compiled, is the longest bibliography of Disciple publications in this form, and is classified, with very brief entries including periodicals, and a few footnotes. Roscoe M. Pierson, "The Literature of the Disciples of Christ and Closely Related Groups," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 26, no. 2 (Spring, 1957), pp. 274–288, discusses the major literature of the three larger groups with a common origin—Disciples of Christ, Disciples or Church of Christ, and Churches of Christ. The list includes bibliography, history, missions, collected and individual biography, directories, doctrinal works, periodicals, and collections of historical material.

In a peculiar sense, the birth of the Disciples movement may be ascribed to personal leadership of the Campbells, father and son, and of Barton Warren Stone. Far more than in the history of most American denominations, the church has been the lengthened influence of outstanding individuals. Lester G. McAllister, *Thomas Campbell, Man of the Book* (St. Louis, 1954) is the standard life of the elder Campbell, father of Alexander, and the founder of the Disciples movement. Robert Richardson, *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell* (Philadelphia, 1868–1870, 2 vols.), written by one of

Campbell's close associates, is considered by Disciples to be the best of all the biographies of their leader. Charles C. Ware, *Barton Warren Stone, Pathfinder of Christian Union* (St. Louis, 1932) has a good chronology and intimate biographical detail. William G. West, *Barton Warren Stone, Early American Advocate of Christian Unity* (Nashville, 1954) makes an admirable complement to Ware's biography, and is a theological interpretation, with special stress upon Stone's contribution to the modern Ecumenical Movement.

The first effort to write a comprehensive history is Winfred Ernest Garrison, *Religion Follows the Frontier: A History of the Disciples of Christ* (New York and London, 1931). It is both a source book and a narrative, based upon materials collected in a lifetime of research and experience. It reviews the character of religion on the American frontier, with a section on the Campbells as founders of a movement for a new and nonsectarian Christianity. This characteristic American venture grew into one of the largest denominations of purely American origin. Winfred E. Garrison and Alfred Thomas DeGroot, *The Disciples of Christ, a History* (St. Louis, 1948), together with Garrison's previous publications, marks the attainment of full maturity in the historiography of the Disciples.

The history of the Disciples reveals, with peculiar clarity, the process by which American denominations originate and develop, and experience inner tensions that result in divisions and the creation of new denominations. The group's genesis, in a professedly nondenominational movement, is traced in fine detail in Walter Wilson Jennings, *Origin and Early History of the Disciples of Christ, with Special Reference to the Period between 1809 and 1835* (Cincinnati, 1919), with bibliography. The process of separation from denominationalism, and the rise of variance in the movement itself, are clarified by Errett Gates, *The Early Relation and Separation of Baptists and Disciples* (Chicago, 1904), with bibliography. This is said by Pierson to be "of value to those

who have difficulty distinguishing between the two major groups in the Disciples movement." Alfred Thomas DeGroot, *The Grounds of Divisions among the Disciples of Christ* (Chicago, 1940), with bibliography, is a doctoral dissertation on the first major division in the movement, giving rise to a new denomination. Stephen Jared Corey, *Fifty Years of Attack and Controversy; the Consequences among Disciples of Christ* (Des Moines, 1953) has a bibliography, and is the first attempt to describe the growing disunity—the only comprehensive book on the subject. One of the divergent groups has been completely described in John Thomas Brown, ed., *Churches of Christ; a Historical, Biographical, and Pictorial History of Churches of Christ in the United States, Australasia, England and Canada* (Louisville, Ky., 1904). It is an exceedingly useful collection of biographies, general history, and parish histories.

Although the Disciples originated largely in reaction against theological controversy, the group has evolved its own theology, which is carefully explained in Hiram Van Kirk, *A History of the Theology of the Disciples of Christ* (St. Louis, 1907), with bibliography. A popular and definitive modern work on the distinctive beliefs of the group in general is Howard E. Short, *Doctrine and Thought of the Disciples of Christ* (St. Louis, 1951), by one of the ablest theologians. World Convention of Churches of Christ, Study Committee, *Doctrines of the Christian Faith, Six Reports* (St. Louis, 1956) contains the most mature consideration of the faith as held by Disciples.

5. METHODISTS. American Methodism is an outstanding example of the evolution of a pious sect into a major denomination. Originating as a devotional group within the Anglican Church, American Methodists became restive within the parent body, and in 1784 became the independent Methodist Episcopal Church.

The Methodists soon became one of the principal religious expressions of the American democratic way of life.

Their circuit riders, local "classes," and camp meetings met the challenge of the natural and spiritual frontiers. Before the Civil War, Methodism became the largest American Protestant denomination, with great social and political as well as spiritual and moral influence. Methodism became a mother of denominations, originating in schisms caused by doctrinal differences, protests against central control, and controversies about the morality of slavery.

Methodism has become a stimulant in the steadily growing movement toward Protestant unity, particularly in the combination (1939) of the Methodist Episcopal Church, the Methodist Episcopal Church South, and the Methodist Protestant Church. Methodism has represented both the centrifugal and the centripetal tendencies in American Protestant denominationalism. Its highly organized administration is an outstanding example of the development of denominational government.

a. Bibliography and General History. Francis A. Archibald, ed., *Methodism and Literature: a Series of Articles from Several Writers on the Literary Enterprise and Achievements of the Methodist Episcopal Church* (Cincinnati and New York, 1883) includes biographical and historical literature, writings on music, Bible study, doctrine, theology, Christian life, evangelism, missions, etc. It was the pioneer American bibliography, uneven in quality but interesting and informative. Edward L. Fortney, "The Literature of the History of Methodism," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 24, no. 3 (Summer, 1955), pp. 443–451, with critical notes, includes a few general bibliographies, selected works on the Wesleys, general histories, doctoral dissertations on Wesley biography, Wesleyan theology, the doctrine of perfection, Methodist social teachings, the American Methodist Church, hymnology, and missions. William Warren Sweet, ed., *The Methodists, a Collection of Source Materials* (Chicago, 1946), "Religion on the American Frontier," Vol. 4, with bibliography, is considered by Fortney as the best single bibliographical

source for American Methodism, and includes manuscripts by location, official documents, periodicals, autobiographies, and secondary materials.

The English origins of Methodism, and its transition to America as a sect are explained in Robert L. Arends, "Early American Methodism and the Church of England" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1948). Robert Emerson Coleman, "Factors in the Expansion of the Methodist Episcopal Church from 1784 to 1812" (Doctoral dissertation, State University of Iowa, 1954; *University Microfilms* (1954), pub. no. 10,201; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1954), Vol. 14, no. 12, pp. 2419–2420) places the expansion, "one of the overlooked marvels of modern history," in its historical setting, and compares it with the growth of other churches. The itinerant system, local organization under lay leaders, evangelism, and revivalistic technique appealed to the socially oppressed. Through Sunday-schools, literature, and the popular spirit of nationalism, Methodism was identified with the people.

John Atkinson, *Centennial History of American Methodism* (New York and Cincinnati, 1884) was the first modern comprehensive history, and is still valuable, especially for the period of origins. James M. Buckley, *A History of Methodists in the United States* (New York, 1903) is a competent general account, but does not have an adequate bibliography. John F. Hurst, *The History of Methodism* (New York, 1902–1904, 7 vols.) is described by Fortney as "immensely serviceable because of its lucidity and indexes," and has three volumes devoted to American Methodism. Halford Edward Luccock, *The Story of Methodism, with 2 Final Chapters by Robert W. Goodloe* (New York, 1950, rev. ed.), illustrated by Harold Speakman, is competent and written in a popular style. William Warren Sweet, *Methodism in American History* (New York, 1954), with bibliography, was issued because "Methodism is a living and ever-growing phase of the history of the American people,"

and because in the years 1933–1953 it underwent "greater change and more far-reaching developments than in any other like period in its history." Methodism is considered in relation to the history of the people, and a new chapter and an appendix include important developments in the last twenty years. Elmer Talmage Clark, *An Album of Methodist History* (New York, 1952) is a folio-size picture book of a very superior kind, with portraits, maps, facsimiles, etc.

b. Divisions. John Nelson Norwood, *The Schism in the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1844: a Study of Slavery and Ecclesiastical Politics* (Alfred, N.Y., 1923), with bibliography, covers the origins of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. It should be supplemented by Albert H. Redford, *History of the Organization of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South* (Nashville, 1871) and Gross Alexander, *History of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South* (New York, 1894), with bibliography. The adjustment of Southern Methodism to Reconstruction and to the status of a conservative denomination is narrated by Hunter Dickinson Farish, in *The Circuit Rider Dismounts, A Social History of Southern Methodism, 1865–1900* (Richmond, 1938), with bibliography. The factors that kept it estranged from the Northern churches are discerned in Ralph Ernest Morrow, *Northern Methodism and Reconstruction* (East Lansing, Mich., 1956), with bibliography.

The origins of the other large branch of Methodism appear in the story of a secession from the parent body, due to a protest against centralized polity: Ancel H. Bassett, *A Concise History of the Methodist Protestant Church, from Its Origin . . . with Biographical Sketches of Several Leading Ministers of the Denomination* (Pittsburgh, 1877), and in Thomas Hamilton Lewis, *Handbook of the Methodist Protestant Church; Sketching its History, Form of Government, Doctrines, Institutions, Work, Support, Extent and Resources* (Baltimore, 1925).

The eventual healing of these schisms, in a typical expres-

sion of the reaction against denominationalism and toward unity, is recounted by Charles Edwin Schofield, *We Methodists* (New York, 1939), written after the merger, in 1939, of the Methodist Episcopal Church, the Methodist Episcopal Church South, and the Methodist Protestant Church. Nolan B. Harmon, *The Organization of the Methodist Church, Historic Development and Present Working Structure* (Nashville, 1953, 2nd ed.), with bibliographical footnotes, discusses the ecclesiology of the great church formed by the merger. An important group that did not participate illustrates the tendency of early Methodism to follow the pattern of schism and denominationalism. Ira Ford McLeister, *History of the Wesleyan Methodist Church in America* (Syracuse, N.Y., 1934), with bibliography, is the only adequate account of this body.

A typical example of American denominational schism and reunion is a group of German churches, closely related to Methodism, and dating from the period 1789–1800. The United Brethren Church originated in revival meetings conducted by Philip William Otterbein among the Germans in Pennsylvania, Maryland, and Virginia. The group was Methodist in spirit, polity, and theology, and was prevented only by language from joining the new Methodist Episcopal Church. A good account is by Augustus Waldo Drury, *History of the Church of the United Brethren in Christ* (Dayton, O., 1924).

A similar development was the Evangelical Church, established by Jacob Albright in 1803, and called by its adherents the "Evangelical Association." There is a rich bibliography of this denomination, including: Robert Sherer Wilson, *Jacob Albright, the Evangelical Pioneer* (Myerstown, Pa., 1940); Reuben Yeakel, *History of the Evangelical Association*, Vol. 1, 1750–1850 (Cleveland, O., 1924); Ammon Stapleton, *Annals of the Evangelical Association of North America and History of the United Evangelical Church* (Harrisburg, 1900); and Raymond Wolf Albright, *A His-*

tory of the Evangelical Church (Harrisburg, Pa., 1942), with bibliography.

The United Evangelical Church seceded from the Evangelical Association and organized as an independent body in 1891. In 1922 it reunited with the Evangelical Association to form the Evangelical Church. In 1942 a merger with the Church of the United Brethren in Christ was proposed, and in 1946 this resulted in the Evangelical United Brethren Church. Paul Himmel Eller, *These Evangelical United Brethren* (Dayton, O., 1950), with bibliography, is a general history of the church formed by the merger of the Church of the United Brethren in Christ and the Evangelical Church.

These churches, fundamentally Methodist, were not absorbed into the main stream of Anglo-American Methodism. They stemmed from the impact of Methodism upon Germans of the colonial immigration. The effect of Methodist missions upon the later immigrants, both abroad and in the United States, produced definite denominations of German and Scandinavian Methodists.

A brilliant insight into this evolution is provided in Paul Franklin Douglass, *The Story of German Methodism; Biography of an Immigrant Soul*, with an Introduction by Bishop John L. Nuelson (New York and Cincinnati, 1939), with bibliographical references in the "Notes," and a bibliography. A similar process among Swedish immigrants is traced in Evald B. Lawson, "The Origin of Swedish Religious Organizations in the United States, with Special Reference to Olof Gustaf Hedstrom and the Early Structure of Swedish Methodism" (Doctoral dissertation, Biblical Seminary, 1937). The development is shown by Arvid P. Lakeberg, "A History of Swedish Methodism in America" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1937). Assimilation of this "foreign" denomination into American life—typifying the process with many immigrant groups—is discussed in Henry C. Whyman, "The Conflict and Adjustment of Two Religious Cultures—The Swedish and the American as Found

in the Swede's Relation to American Methodism" (Doctoral dissertation, New York University, 1937).

c. Methodism in Action. William K. Anderson, ed., *Methodism* (New York, 1947) consists of twenty-five essays by eminent authors, on important phases of Methodist beliefs and practices. The practical activity of the vast ecclesiastical and social enterprise is outlined in detail by Charles Edwin Schofield in his *The Methodist Church; a Study of the Organization and Work of the Methodist Church* (New York, 1949, rev. ed.), with bibliography. The spiritual and doctrinal inspiration that issues in the immense variety of good works is the theme of John Monroe Moore, *Methodism in Belief and Action* (New York, 1946), and the sacramental motivation is closely studied in Robert W. Goodloe, *The Sacraments in Methodism* (Nashville, Tenn., 1953). Henry C. Jennings, *The Methodist Book Concern; a Romance of History* (New York and Cincinnati, 1924) narrates the great enterprise of religious propaganda and cultural evangelism.

6. PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED CHURCHES. Like Anglicanism, the Scottish Presbyterian and the Reformed Churches came to America from countries where they had been legally established religions. The Reformed Dutch Church was considered to be the state religion in New Netherland for about forty years, before the English conquest of 1664. Because of William Penn's policy of religious toleration, the German Reformed Church in Pennsylvania and New Jersey was a voluntary denomination, because no legal establishment was possible. The same condition prevailed for the Scottish and other Presbyterian churches in all the colonies.

These churches therefore did not experience the hazards of disestablishment, which were imposed upon the Anglican and Congregational churches. They simply carried into the national period their government by synods, presbyteries, and classes, and soon conformed to the emerging American denominational pattern.

a. Presbyterians. Bibliography and General History.

Thomas H. Spence, Jr., "A Brief Bibliography of Presbyterian History," *Religion in Life*, Vol. 25, no. 4 (Autumn, 1956), pp. 603–612, begins with John Calvin and the Genevan theocracy, and traces Presbyterianism through its early British phase to America, with a few references to its history outside the English-speaking world. Consisting mostly of historical works, this is indispensable to a study of general history since the organization of the Philadelphia Presbytery (1706), the schisms and divisions and the Southern churches, biography, and the Presbyterian press. Spence's *The Historical Foundation and Its Treasures* (Montreat, N.C., 1956) has a list of deposited records and minutes and a bibliography, and is a full account of the origin and history of a superb archival depository and its holdings. The archives are especially rich in materials on Southern Presbyterianism, but have materials for American Presbyterianism in general, and a huge collection of histories of churches and of women's work. The *Index of the Titles and Authors of Articles in the Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society, 1901–1946* (repr. from Vol. 25, no. 4, Dec. 1947, pp. 223–254) includes Vols. 1–24, with an explanatory preface. Together with the separate indexes for later volumes, this is an indispensable guide to Presbyterian historiography, including essays on early colonial churches, commemorative articles on major anniversaries, periods of church history, book reviews, essays on branches of the church, the frontier, individual parishes, confessions of faith, source materials, education, biography, missions, worship, regional history, seminaries, etc. Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, *Records of the Presbyterian Church, 1706–1788* (Philadelphia, 1904) contains the proceedings of the first presbytery (1706–16), the Synod of Philadelphia (1717–58), the dissident New Side Synod of New York (1745–58), and the united Synod of New York and Philadelphia (1758–88). Maurice Whitman Armstrong, Lefferts A. Loetscher, and Charles A. Anderson, *The Presbyterian Enterprise;*

Sources of American Presbyterian History (Philadelphia, 1956), with a bibliography, is a documentary source book, with brief explanatory notes. William Warren Sweet, ed., *The Presbyterians, 1783–1840, a Collection of Source Materials* (New York and London, 1936), "Religion on the American Frontier," Vol. 2, has a bibliography which is considered by Spence as "particularly satisfying."

J. G. Craighead, *Scotch and Irish Seeds in American Soil: the Early History of the Scotch and Irish Churches, and Their Relations to the Presbyterian Church in America* (Philadelphia, 1878) relates at length the persecutions of Presbyterians by the Anglican government, and other motives that led to a great migration to America in the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. Guy S. Klett, *Presbyterians in Colonial Pennsylvania* (Philadelphia, 1937) is a careful study, important because of the central position of Pennsylvania's Scotch-Irish conservatism in the growth of the church. Leonard John Trinterud, *The Forming of an American Tradition, a Re-examination of Colonial Presbyterianism* (Philadelphia, 1949), with bibliography, also is valuable for its account of the church, not as exclusively Scotch-Irish, but rather as an influence composed of various national elements. His "The New England Contribution to Colonial Presbyterianism," *Church History*, Vol. 17, no. 1 (Mar. 1948), pp. 32–43, explores a generally little-known phase, including the non-Scottish influences. Charles Augustus Briggs, *American Presbyterianism; Its Origin and Early History, Together with an Appendix of Letters and Documents, Many of Which have Recently been Discovered* (New York, 1885) is useful especially for the history of colonial Presbyterianism, and for its account of the numerous schisms and reunions and controversies. Henry D. Funk, "The Influence of the Presbyterian Church in Early American History," *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, Vol. 12, no. 1 (Apr. 1924), pp. 26–63; no. 3 (Apr. 1925), pp. 152–189; no. 5 (Apr. 1926), pp. 281–316, with many bibliographical references,

surveys the origins before 1705, growth to 1763, notable schools and educators, 1728–1800, and the moral influence through ecclesiastical discipline.

Charles Hodge, *The Constitutional History of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America* (Philadelphia, 1857, 2 vols. in 1) views the rise of the church to 1788, stressing the conservative, Old School Scottish origins, and is good especially for the colonial period. William Hill, *History of the Rise, Progress, Genius, and Character of American Presbyterianism* (Washington, D.C., 1839) is a reply to Hodge, emphasizing the varied origins, in contrast to Hodge's view of its Scottish character and conservatism. Andrew Constantinides Zenos, *Presbyterianism in America: Past, Present and Prospective* (New York, 1937) describes the major doctrinal, organizational, and administrative characteristics, and traverses the background and history of the church, its influence in history, and its international importance. Chapters III–VI treat the history and development of Presbyterianism in America, from the origins of the Reformed Dutch Church in New York. William Thomson Hanzsche, *The Presbyterians, the Story of a Staunch and Sturdy People* (Philadelphia, 1934) relates mostly to Presbyterianism in the United States, and is a survey for popular reading. (See also Part One, sect. VII, C, 3, *The Reformed and Presbyterian Tradition.*)

Divisions and Reunions. John Vant Stephens, *The Presbyterian Churches, Divisions and Unions, in Scotland, Ireland, Canada and America* (Philadelphia, 1910) provides a clear account of the many and complicated causes of schisms, which originated denominations conforming to the general American denominational pattern. Committee of the Synod of New York and New Jersey, *A History of the Division of the Presbyterian Church* (New York, 1852) presents the New School argument concerning the great schism of 1837–38, caused by controversy over doctrines and the slavery question; and S. J. Baird, *History of the New School* (Phila-

delphia, 1868) presents the Old School argument regarding the schism.

Thomas Cary Johnson, *History of the Southern Presbyterian Church* (New York, 1894; "American Church History Series," Vol. 11, pp. 311–479), with bibliography, is vigorously written, and although much out of date, is still valuable as a clear, popular general account. For the earlier history of the Southern branch, one should consult the biographies of leaders, listed in Spence's "A Brief Bibliography of Presbyterian History," *Religion in Life*, Vol. 25, no. 4 (Autumn, 1956), pp. 603–612. Ernest Trice Thompson, *The Changing South and the Presbyterian Church in the United States* (Richmond, 1950) has bibliographical references in "Notes and Acknowledgements," and goes a long distance toward filling the need of a detailed history. The other strong Southern branch of Presbyterianism is adequately reviewed in John Vant Stephens, *The Genesis of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church* (Cincinnati, Ohio, 1941), with bibliography; and Thomas H. Campbell, *Studies in Cumberland Presbyterian History* (Nashville, 1944), with bibliographical footnotes.

Several other branches of Presbyterianism have adequate histories. James Brown Scouller, *History of the United Presbyterian Church of North America* (New York, 1894; "American Church History Series," Vol. 11, pp. 143–255) is still the standard account because, according to Thomas H. Spence, there is no more recent general one. The archives of this church are in the Pittsburgh Seminary, Pittsburgh, Pa. William Melancthon Glasgow, *Cyclopedic Manual of the United Presbyterian Church of North America, Comprising a Brief History of her Ancestral Branches, Ministry, Congregations, Institutions, Courts, Boards, Missions, Periodicals, etc.* (Pittsburgh, 1903) has a rather brief historical sketch. Complementing it is his *History of the Reformed Presbyterian Church in America: with Sketches of all her Ministry, Congregations, Missions, Institutions, Publications, etc.* (Baltimore, 1888). Robert Lathan, *History of the Associate Re-*

formed Synod of the South, to Which is Prefixed a History of the Associate Presbyterian and Reformed Presbyterian Churches (Harrisburg, Pa., 1882) furnishes a clear account of the two earlier groups that united into the Associate Reformed Church. Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church, *The Sesquicentennial History . . . Mainly Covering the Period, 1903–1951* (Clinton, S.C., 1951) continues *The Centennial History of the Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church, 1803–1903* (Charleston, S.C., 1905).

Lefferts Augustine Loetscher, *The Broadening Church; a Study of Theological Issues in the Presbyterian Church Since 1869* (Philadelphia, 1954), with bibliographical references, covers the era since the reunion of the Old and New Schools, considering the controversies following the union, and closing with the organization of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church, a schism stemming from the Fundamentalist controversy. Edwin Harold Rian, *The Presbyterian Conflict* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1940) presents an account of the Fundamentalist-Modernist controversy, and the schism of the Orthodox group led by J. Gresham Machen. Ned Bernard Stonehouse, *J. Gresham Machen, A Biographical Memoir* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1954), with "Notes and References," describes the origins of this Fundamentalist denomination. (See also Part Five, sect. II, E, *The Princeton Theology*.)

b. Reformed Dutch Church. The Reformed Dutch Church in the United States consists of two distinct groups. The Reformed Church in America (formerly the Reformed Protestant Dutch Church) is derived directly from the Dutch Calvinists who settled in New Netherland (New York and New Jersey) previous to 1664, and is confined largely to the Middle Atlantic States. It is an example of an established church that became a denomination.

The Christian Reformed Church in North America originated in a migration from Holland in the period between the Revolution and the Civil War. It arose from a revival and

reform movement in the national church, in protest against liberalism and in a return to orthodox Calvinism. It is an example of a schism that became a denomination. The membership is mostly in the Middle West, and the center is in western Michigan.

David D. Demarest, *The Reformed Church in America, Its Origin, Development and Characteristics* (New York, 1889, 4th ed., rev. and enl.), with a bibliography, is the pioneer study of the church of the pre-Revolutionary Dutch. Another scholarly account is Edward Tanjore Corwin, *History of the Reformed Church, Dutch* (New York, 1895; "American Church History Series," Vol. 8, pp. xi–xviii, 1–212), which has a bibliography. Charles E. Corwin, *Manual of the Reformed Church in America (formerly Reformed Protestant Dutch Church) 1628–1933* (New York, 1922–33, 5th ed., rev.) has a large amount of reference information, and is useful especially for its bibliographies, biographical sketches, and many references to biographies in earlier editions. Reformed Church in America, Tercentenary Committee on Research and Publication, *Tercentenary Studies, 1928, Reformed Church in America; a Record of Beginnings* (New York, 1928) has bibliographies, and is a series of scholarly essays on interesting and generally little-known phases of the colonial period. It commemorates the tercentenary of the first parish in New Amsterdam (New York City).

The origins of the Christian Reformed Church of the Western States, in orthodox Calvinist tradition, are explained at length in Diedrich Hinrich Kromminga, *The Christian Reformed Tradition from the Reformation till the Present* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1943). Henry S. Lucas, *Netherlanders in America, Dutch Immigration to the United States and Canada, 1789–1850* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1955) emphasizes the religious motive in emigration in many references to the "Seceders" from the established Reformed Dutch Church in the 1830's, who settled in Michigan, Iowa, and some other Western states. Albert Hyma, *Albertus C. Van*

Raalte and His Dutch Settlements in the United States (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1947) studies the split of an orthodox group from the established church, and its migration to America, and illustrates the intensity of confessional convictions, which has originated many American denominations. Henry Beets, *The Christian Reformed Church in North America* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1923), with bibliography at the end of each chapter, gives a general survey of this very orthodox Reformed group that settled largely in western Michigan, and includes its schools, missions, creed, liturgy, distinctive principles and practices, and government. Another excellent history, written more from the theological viewpoint, is John Henry Kromminga, *The Christian Reformed Church, a Study in Orthodoxy* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1949), with bibliography.

c. German Reformed Church. The German Reformed Church, long known as the Reformed Church in the United States, was established in Pennsylvania early in the eighteenth century. Largely through the efforts of the Rev. John Philip Boehm, it was organized as a "Coetus." In 1793 was formed the "Synod of the German Reformed Church of the U.S.A." In 1934 this church merged with the Evangelical Synod of North America to form the Evangelical and Reformed Church, which in turn united with the Congregational Christian Church. (See 2, *Congregationalism*, above.)

William John Hinke, *Life and Letters of the Rev. John Philip Boehm, Founder of the Reformed Church in Pennsylvania, 1683–1749* (Philadelphia, 1916), the classic biography, reveals the aid received from the parent church in Germany, and the difficulties of missionary work. The best early collection of biographies of ministers is Herman Julius Ruetinik's *The Pioneers of the Reformed Church in the United States of North America* (Cleveland, O., 1901). This has been greatly amplified by William John Hinke, *Ministers of the German Reformed Congregations in Pennsylvania and Other Colonies in the Eighteenth Century* . . . , ed.

George W. Richards (Lancaster, Pa., 1951), with a bibliography. The reliable standard histories are: (1) Joseph Henry Dubbs, *History of the Reformed Church, German* (New York, 1895; "American Church History Series," Vol. 8, pp. 213–423), with bibliography; James Isaac Good, *History of the Reformed Church in the United States, 1725–1792* (Reading, Pa., 1899); and (3) his *History of the Reformed Church in the United States in the Nineteenth Century* (New York, 1911). Harry Martin John Klein, *The History of the Eastern Synod of the Reformed Church in the United States* (Lancaster, Pa., 1943) covers the period 1747–1940.

The organization resulting from the union of the Evangelical Synod of North America and the [German] Reformed Church in the United States, in 1934, was the Evangelical and Reformed Church. Carl E. Schneider, "The Genius of the Reformed Church in the United States," *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 15, no. 1 (Jan. 1935), pp. 26–41, gives a genetic appraisal of the union. A readable review of the background of the new church, since the German Reformation, is provided by Julius Herman Edward Horstmann and Herbert H. Wernecke, *Through Four Centuries; the Story of the Beginnings of the Evangelical and Reformed Church, in the Old World and the New, from the Sixteenth to the Twentieth Century* (St. Louis, 1938). Alfred Clinton Bartholomew, "An Interpretation of the Evangelical and Reformed Church" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1950), explains the urge toward union by slow growth to early distribution, the methods of expansion, language difficulties, and competition with other denominations. Changes in rural America require changes in church methods to retain leadership.

Seeking unity as a way to strengthen the church's ministry is the theme of Calvin Flessner Schmid's essay, "A Study of the Efforts to Unite the Congregational Christian Churches and the Evangelical and Reformed Church" (Th.M. thesis,

Princeton Theological Seminary, 1954, typewritten), with bibliography; an insight into the typical process of blending denominations. Malcolm King Burton, *Destiny for Congregationalism* (Oklahoma City, 1953) discusses this union —an interesting and significant triumph of the ecumenical spirit in the rapprochement of an Anglo-American and an originally German group. (See also Part Five, sect. II, F, *The Mercersburg* [Reformed] *Theology.*)

d. French Reformed (*Huguenots*). French Calvinist Reformed churches were established in the American Colonies by exiles in the seventeenth century. The Huguenots, as they were popularly called, never became an American denomination, but followed the tendency of some smaller religious communities to amalgamate with larger ones of like doctrine and practice. In the Middle Colonies, many joined the Presbyterian and Reformed Dutch churches. Others, in the Southern provinces, became Anglicans, as in South Carolina. Only a few of the colonial parishes survived, as in New York and Charleston. The group became Anglicized, was influential out of proportion to its numbers because of its general intelligence, and contributed many leaders to various denominations. It was a leavening influence in the prevalent American denominationalism.

Charles Weiss, *History of the French Protestant Refugees, from the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes to Our Own Days,* translated from the French by Henry William Herbert, with an American Appendix (New York, 1854, 2 vols.) has an essay, "American Huguenots," in Vol. 2, and a bibliography, and is still a standard reliable work. Settlements in the Continental American Colonies, which established several Reformed parishes, are surveyed in George Washington Baird, *History of the Huguenot Emigration to America* (New York, 1885, 2 vols.), with bibliographical footnotes. Lucian J. Fosdick, *The French Blood in America* (New York, 1906), a popular work, was written in obvious admiration of the Huguenots, but is significant because of its ref-

erences to their influence in several American Protestant churches, particularly the Presbyterian, Reformed Dutch, and Episcopal. William Henry Foote, *The Huguenots; or, Reformed French Church . . .*, part 3, "The Huguenot at Home in America" (Richmond, 1870), includes the settlements and churches in the Continental Colonies, and their later history. R. P. Duclos, *Histoire du Protestantisme Francais au Canada et aux Etats-Unis* (Lausanne, 1913, 2 vols. in 1), with bibliography, is indispensable, and therefore is included in disregard of the general rule to cite only English titles.

A deep mine of data on the French Protestant communities and churches is the Huguenot Society of America, *Proceedings*, May 1883–1931 (New York, 1883–1931, 9 vols. in 6), and *Collections of the Huguenot Society of America* (New York, 1886, Vol. 1), which contains records of the French Church in New York City, 1688–1804, and historical documents relating to French Protestants in New York State. There are several scholarly publications relating the history of French Reformed congregations in particular regions: (1) Donald Douglas, *The Huguenot; the Story of the Huguenot Emigrations, Particularly to New England* (New York, 1954), with bibliography. (2) Robert Alonzo Brock, comp. and ed., *Documents, Chiefly Unpublished, Relating to the Huguenot Emigration to Virginia and to the Settlement at Manakin-Town* (Richmond, 1886; *Collections* of the Virginia Historical Society, new ser., Vol. 5). (3) Arthur Henry Hirsch, *The Huguenots of Colonial South Carolina* (Durham, N.C., 1928), with bibliography. Every aspect of the settlement in South Carolina is explored in (4) the Huguenot Society of South Carolina, *Transactions* (Charleston, 1889–1955, 60 vols. in 14, nos. 1–60).

Louis A. Kalassay, "The Educational and Religious History of the Hungarian Reformed Church in the United States" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1940) is the most complete account of this group, which

represents a generally little-known phase of the Calvinistic Reformation.

V. SECTS AND CULTS

A. Sects and Cults: Their Answer to the "Dilemma of the Church"

To THE extent that any religious group has a code of personal and social ethics, it must have some solution to the problem of evil. It may be to attempt active intervention in the social order, or in individual conduct. Evil then becomes something to be actively combatted, or even defeated. While this ideal seemingly gives the group a place as an active intervener in the battle against evil, its members may be more or less bound into a system of social relations that requires non-religious or irreligious conduct.

This is one way of stating the frequently expressed "dilemma of the church." The denomination represents a parallelism between religious and other special-interest groups. The sect and the cult attempt to make religious orientation and group membership the primary focus of individual allegiance, which determines or narrowly limits attitudes and activities in other spheres.

Contemporary America teems with sects and cults. Some are communities that originated in Europe (for example, the "Pennsylvania Dutch" sects) and have shown remarkable powers of survival. Others are of native American origin and also have lasted. Still others are typically urban phenomena, and may quickly die. Their "mortality" may be in the form of dissolution, or it may come as transformation into a denomination.

A vast wealth of data concerning American sects and cults is readily available in Part One, sect. IV, *Miscellaneous Guides*, especially in subsections C–F, comprising year books, directories, handbooks, and censuses; also in sect. VI, *General*

Histories and Surveys, subsections B–D, comprising general reviews and histories of American religion.

Especially useful are: *Look, A Guide to the Religions of America* (New York, 1955), comprising the entire series of articles published in *Look,* 1952–1955; Frederick Emanuel Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, 1958, 3rd ed.), with bibliographies; and Mary Parker Johnson, *The Shortest Path to Heaven; a Book Dealing with the Principal Religions of the World and the Chief Religious Cults and Sects of the U.S.A.* (New York, 1959), with bibliography. There are useful and interesting comments on American sectarianism and cultism in Charles Ewing Brown's *Modern Religious Faiths* (Anderson, Ind., 1941); and Brooke (Peters) Church, *A Faith for You* (New York, 1948), with a bibliography; also Richard R. Mathison, *Faiths, Cults and Sects of America From Atheism to Zen* (Indianapolis, New York, 1960).

The sectarian tendency in American Protestantism is examined in two excellent scholarly works by Roman Catholic writers: John A. Hardon, *The Protestant Churches of America* (Westminster, Md., 1956); and William Joseph Whalen, *Separated Brethren; a Survey of Non-Catholic Christian Denominations in the United States* (Milwaukee, 1958), with a bibliography. The tendency to fission and sectarianism is noted also by Protestant scholars, who deplore it as an obstacle to Christian unity and fellowship. Two worthy examples are: Hugh Thomson Kerr, *What Divides Protestants Today* (New York, 1958), with bibliography; and Robert S. Bilheimer, *The Quest for Christian Unity* (New York, 1952).

Other helpful and interesting works on the origins and beliefs of sects, are: Gunnar Westin, *The Free Church Through the Ages,* translated from the Swedish by Virgil A. Olson (Nashville, 1958); Stanley Irving Stuber, *How We Got Our Denominations; a Primer on Church History* (New York, 1959, rev. ed.), with bibliography; Reginald

Dickinson Manwell and Sophia Lyon Fahs, *The Church Across the Street* (Boston, 1947), illustrated and with a bibliography; and Edward J. Tanis, *What the Sects Teach; Jehovah's Witnesses, Seventh-Day Adventists, Christian Science* [*and*] *Spiritism* (Grand Rapids, 1958).

B. Social Origins

Robert E. Park and Ernest W. Burgess, *Introduction to the Science of Sociology* (Chicago, 1921) is a systematic treatise with selected readings, and observations on religion and sects, stressing cultural conflicts as causes of sectarianism, the relation of beliefs and conflict, and the relation of religion to social control. John L. Gillin, "A Contribution to the Sociology of Sects," *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 16, no. 2 (Sept. 1910), pp. 236–252, is an effort to analyze the problem of the sect's reactions to social conditions, and the needs it serves. He explains the social backgrounds of origin, growth and decay, and the relation of sects to regional social classes. Leopold Von Wiese and Howard Becker, *Systematic Sociology* (New York, 1932) in ch. 44, "The Abstract Collectivity: the Church," has a good discussion of "the dilemma of the church" in adapting to or conflicting with secular society—the impasse that frequently inspires the origin of sects and cults.

Ellsworth Faris, *The Nature of Human Nature, and Other Essays in Social Psychology* (New York and London, 1937), in its chapters on "The Sect and the Sectarian" and "The Sociology of Religious Strife," concludes that the sect results from collective forces, to which its own inner life is partly a reaction. The sect produces a type with definite attitudes toward life and the world. He suggests closer study of sectarianism to throw light upon perennial social problems. H. Richard Niebuhr, *The Social Sources of Denominationalism* (New York, 1929) briefly expounds the differences between churches and sects, with respect to doctrine, ecclesi-

astical forms, and social teaching, which must be recognized before some of the most important characteristics of American religion can be understood. It is a powerful indictment of the moral inadequacies of denominations subservient to the social structure. Joachim Wach, *The Sociology of Religion* (Chicago, 1944) has extensive bibliographical material and is an analysis of the phenomenon of "protest" against established religions.

Kurt Hutten, *Seher, Grübler, Enthusiasten Sekten und Religiöse Sondergemeinschaften der Gegenwart* (Stuttgart, 1954, 4th ed.) has an exhaustive account of Adventist and apocalyptic movements, healing cults, "inner-light" groups, perfectionists, legalists, etc.; a useful handbook with a theological emphasis. William H. Lyon, *A Study of the Christian Sects* (Boston, 1926, 13th ed.) is a popular survey from a liberal viewpoint. Horton Davies, *Christian Deviations, Essays in Defense of the Christian Faith* (New York, 1954) is a brief and popular treatment. His "Centrifugal Christian Sects," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 25, no. 3 (Summer, 1956), pp. 323–358, with remarks by Charles S. Braden and Charles W. Ranson, is a distillation of *Christian Deviations,* and concentrates upon contemporary sects of the Pentecostal, Millennial and Holiness types. Robert Murray, *Group Movements Through the Ages* (New York, 1935) deals mostly with medieval European and English movements, the background of certain American sects and cults. Gilbert Seldes, in *The Stammering Century* (New York, 1928) offers a spirited survey of nineteenth-century "movements," including American sects and cults that stemmed from them.

C. Sects of European Origin

The early pattern of American sectarianism was determined partly by German dissent from state churches in the Reformation period, particularly the Anabaptist and Mennonite movements. These groups earnestly protested against

the subjection of the spiritual to the temporal power. Dissent was further inspired and strengthened by the Pietist movement of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. It was led at first by August Hermann Francke and Philip Jacob Spener, and was centered in certain universities, notably Halle.

This movement influenced the Lutheran and Reformed churches, as well as the sects, and was stimulated in America by the Great Awakening and its attendant controversies and schisms. Some German sects brought into American life the gift of communal spiritual living, together with many attractive literary and artistic traits. Others cast off their cultural and communal peculiarities, and gradually became English-speaking denominations.

Some German sectarians have preserved to this day the spirit of the bright dawn of the Reformation and of the primitive Christians. They have a way of identifying religion with daily life, which often has been almost lost in the established Anglo-American Protestant denominations. They are "communitarian," blending facets of piety and social life into a peculiar cultural pattern.

1. GERMAN SECTS. *a. General History: Pietism.* Emil Meynen, comp. and ed., *Bibliography on German Settlements in Colonial North America, Especially on the Pennsylvania Germans and Their Descendants, 1683–1933* (Leipzig, 1937) contains bibliography on sectarian emigration to America. Walter Allen Knittle, *Early Eighteenth Century Palatine Emigration* (Philadelphia, 1937) shows how the emigration from western Germany brought varied religious influences to America, notably that of sectarians, who were important far beyond their numbers. Oscar Kuhns, *The German and Swiss Settlements of Colonial Pennsylvania, A Study of the So-Called Pennsylvania Dutch* (New York and Cincinnati, 1900, new ed.), with German and English bibliography, surveys the Pietist background, and the religious intolerance that drove German Protestants to America. Chap-

ter 6, "The Religious Life," stresses the influence of Pietism upon most of the settlers of all denominations, and communications with Halle, the German Pietist center.

Chauncey David Ensign, "Radical German Pietism, c.1675–c.1760" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University School of Theology, 1955, with bibliography; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 12,296; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1955), Vol. 15, no. 7, pp. 1267–1268) describes and analyzes the history, beliefs, and practices of the separatist, sectarian, mystical type, originating in the theosophy of Jakob Boehme. The Ephrata group in Pennsylvania, the Church of the Brethren, and the Inspirationists of Amana, Iowa, were derivations from radical Pietism. Lucy Forney Bittinger, *German Religious Life in Colonial Times* (Philadelphia and London, 1906), with a bibliographical note, describes the pressure of circumstances which encouraged migration to America; the influence of Johann Arndt and of Pietism; mysticism; the flowering of religious literature; and the rise of separatism and revolt against state churches. Julius Friedrich Sachse, *The German Pietists of Provincial Pennsylvania, 1694–1708* (Philadelphia, 1895) includes "The Woman in the Wilderness" and "The Hermits on the Wissahickon." Ralph Wood, ed., *The Pennsylvania Germans* (Princeton, N.J., 1942), with "Bibliographical Guide," includes "The Sects, Apostles of Peace," by G. Paul Musselman, "Lutheran and Reformed, Pennsylvania German Style," by Wood, a note on the German background of Quakerism, and of the sectarians, and the ideal life as conceived by them before migration to Pennsylvania. An interesting and little-known American expression of German sectarian religiosity is closely examined in George John Eisenach, *Pietism and the Russian Germans in the United States* (Berne, Ind., 1948), with bibliography, which studies the origin and development of the religious brotherhood, transplanted in 1875–1900, a lay movement based upon universal priesthood of believers, salvation of the individual

soul, and local prayer meetings and evangelism, with numerous revivals. John Horsch, *The Hutterian Brethren, 1528–1931, A Story of Martyrdom and Loyalty* (Goshen, Ind., 1931) is a sympathetic study, based upon careful research. (See also Part Four, RELIGION AND THE ARTS, sect. IV, B, 3, *Pennsylvania German Music;* also Part One, sect. VII, C, 1, *Germany: Lutheranism and the Sects.*)

b. Moravians. John Taylor Hamilton, *A History of the Church Known as the Moravian Church* (Bethlehem, Pa., 1900) is still the most reliable, authoritative standard history of this sect-originated church, whose spiritual and cultural influence has been far out of proportion to its size, especially in religious music. E. De Schweinitz and A. Schultze, *The Moravians and Their Faith* (Bethlehem, Pa., 1930) is a more popular treatment. Edwin Albert Sawyer, "The Religious Experience of the Colonial American Moravians" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1956; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 17,079; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1956), Vol. 16, no. 8, pp. 1516–1517) covers the period 1740–1770 in Pennsylvania, North Carolina, and Ohio, and emphasizes the Pietist, revivalistic, ethical, and missionary aspects, conservative and radical types, great sense of corporate fellowship, and stress upon religious experience as the basis of church unity. J. E. Hutton, *A History of Moravian Missions* (London, 1923) includes American missionary work of the church, with a bibliography. The gradual assimilation of this German group to American ways receives a scholarly treatment in Marie J. Kohnova, "The Moravians and Their Missionaries, a Problem in Americanization," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review,* Vol. 19, no. 3 (Dec. 1932), pp. 348–361.

c. German Baptists. Franklin Hamlin Littell, *The Anabaptist View of the Church: An Introduction to Sectarian Protestantism* (Hartford, Conn., 1952), with bibliography, states that Anabaptists were concerned primarily with restoration of the New Testament Church, in opposition to both

Rome and the Protestant Reformers, believing in the church as a voluntary association, bound together by faith, not political coercion. They were forerunners of free churches, and early champions of religious liberty as it was later conceived in America. His more mature views are expressed in *An Anabaptist View of the Church; A Study in the Origins of Sectarian Protestantism* (Boston, 1958), which declares that the Anabaptists saw no hope in the old ecclesiastical system, and wanted to build a church solely upon the Bible, and therefore had to become a sect. R. Friedman, "The Concept of the Anabaptists," *Church History*, Vol. 9, no. 4 (Dec. 1940), pp. 341–364, analyzes historically and theologically the various "left-wing" groups of Protestantism in Germany and elsewhere, and provides a background for understanding the later Pietists and other sectarians.

Alfred Coutts, *Hans Denck, c.1495–1527, Humanist and Heretic* (Edinburgh, 1927) reviews the influence of a German Anabaptist, converted by Thomas Munzer; a mystic, one of the sectarians who helped to form the background of German sects in America, particularly the Baptists. Martin Grove Brumbaugh, *A History of the German Baptist Brethren in Europe and America* (Mount Morris, Ill., 1899) is largely an account of the Brethren in the Pennsylvania colonial period, and is based upon wide research in original sources. Two other good accounts, contemporary with this one, are: (1) George N. Falkenstein, "The German Baptist Brethren or Dunkers," in Pennsylvania German Society, *Proceedings*, Vol. 10, pp. 1–148, being part 8 of a "Narrative and Critical History," prepared at the request of the Pennsylvania-German Society (Lancaster, Pa., 1900). (2) Julius Friedrich Sachse, *The German Sectarians of Pennsylvania, 1708–1742, A Critical and Legendary History of the Ephrata Cloister and the Dunkers* (Philadelphia, 1899). (3) A. Monroe Aurand, Jr., *Historical Account of the Ephrata Cloister and the Seventh Day Baptist Society* (Harrisburg, Pa., 1940, illus. ed.).

d. Mennonites. The superlative source of information regarding the background and history of American Mennonites is *The Mennonite Encyclopedia, A Comprehensive Reference Work on the Anabaptist-Mennonite Movement* (Hillsboro, Kan., 1955–1959, 4 vols. and 1 vol. supplement). This is the first such reference work in English, covering four hundred years of history, theology, faith, ethics, life, and culture, under the joint editorship of historians and scholars of the three major North American Mennonite bodies. Harold Stauffer Bender, *Two Centuries of American Mennonite Literature; a Bibliography of Mennonitica Americana, 1727–1928* (Goshen, Ind., Mennonite Historical Society, Goshen College, 1929) is a classified list, with critical notes and index. The general historical background is thoroughly covered by John C. Wenger, *Glimpses of Mennonite History and Doctrine* (Scottdale, Pa., 1947), and his *Doctrines of the Mennonites* (Scottdale, Pa., 1951). The causes and course of settlement in America appear in C. Henry Smith, "The Mennonite Immigration to Pennsylvania in the Eighteenth Century," Pennsylvania-German Society, *Proceedings*, Vol. 25 (Norristown, Pa., 1929), pp. 1–142.

Once settled in Pennsylvania, the Mennonites developed the close-knit type of communal living that has made them unique in the American religious scene. The development and adjustment are described in great detail in Samuel Floyd Pannabecker, "The Development of the General Conference of the Mennonite Church of North America in the American Environment" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1944; microfilm in Goshen College Library, Bethel College Historical Library). This traces the historical background of immigrant groups, and attempts to find how environmental forces affect a religious group primarily based upon separation from society. Some changes indicate disintegration of the traditional system, others show positive contribution. Elmer Lewis Smith, *The Amish People: Seventeenth Century Tradition in Modern America*

(New York, 1958) is an account of the "Old Order" sect of Southeastern Pennsylvania. Calvin George Bachman, "The Old Order Amish of Lancaster County," Pennsylvania-German Society, *Proceedings*, Vol. 49 (Norristown, Pa., 1942), pp. 1–294, is a useful historical treatise on the outstanding remaining example of the communitarian sect, with notes on its origin. Walter M. Kollomergen, *The Old Order Amish of Lancaster County, Pennsylvania* ("Rural Life Studies," no. 4, Bureau of Agricultural Economics, U.S. Dept. of Agriculture, Sept. 1942) is an "intensive study of Amish life and culture . . . with especial attention to their economic adjustment in relation to their religious principles." Joseph Winfield Fretz, "Mennonite Mutual Aid: A Contribution Toward the Establishment of a Christian Community" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1941, abstract published by University of Chicago; other portions by Bethel College and the Mennonite Central Committee) sees the significance of such social practices in development of a communal sense; mutual aid is both a cause and a result of religious and social cohesion within the group. Melvin Gingerich, *The Mennonites in Iowa* (Iowa City, 1939) presents a general history of the group, their principal beliefs, and some examples of their adjustment to secular society.

e. Brethren Churches. Donald F. Durnbaugh, comp. and tr., *European Origins of the Brethren: A Source Book on the Beginnings of the Church of the Brethren in the Early Eighteenth Century* (Elgin, Ill., 1958) consists of documents on the genesis of this German Pietist sect, its persecutions, and migration: the background of a foreign sect that became American. William George Willoughby, "The Beliefs of the Early Brethren" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1951; available also at Bethany Biblical Seminary; Bridgewater College; abstract published by Boston University) reveals a profound influence of Anabaptist tradition as mediated to the Brethren through Mennonites; the

early Brethren were fundamentally piestistic. James O. Bernesderfer, "Pietism and its Influence upon the Evangelical United Brethren Church" (Doctoral dissertation, Temple University, 1951) emphasizes a theme which is traced through the histories of the Brethren churches that were closely similar to Methodism. (See sect. IV, 5, *Methodism*, b, *Divisions.*)

Ernest S. Larson, "The Evangelical Mission Covenant Church of America" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1945; abstract, Chicago, 1948, with bibliographical footnotes) critically studies the origins of the church, and is an effort to put the Covenant movement in its proper place among American religious bodies. It clarifies the underlying causes of the dissenting movement in Sweden and America, and its consummation in the Evangelical Mission Covenant, after struggle for toleration and freedom from the powers of church and state; an answer to new political and religious demands. A brief summary of this movement is available in Karl A. Olsson, "The Evangelical Mission Covenant Churches and the Free Churches of Swedish Background," in Vergilius Ferm, ed., *The American Church of the Protestant Heritage* (New York, 1953), pp. 249–276.

2. QUAKERISM. *a. Bibliography and General History.* Emerson Wayne Shideler, "An Experiment in Spiritual Ecclesiology: The Quaker Concept of the Church" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1948, typewritten; microfilm, University of Chicago Library) declares that the Quakers held the original idea of a church as an invisible fellowship created by the Holy Spirit working through every man, and made visible in relationships. Toleration and quietism moulded the external form into a culture, conformity to which became a criterion of the church. The result was schism. The present reunion movements emphasize the early spiritual basis. William Charles Braithwaite, *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, with Introduction by Rufus M. Jones (London, 1912), based upon extensive research, ex-

presses the same thesis. Other useful histories of the rise and development are: Elbert Russell, *The History of Quakerism* (New York, 1942), with "Bibliography and Symbols," and Sidney Lucas, *The Quaker Story*, Foreword by C. E. M. Joad (New York, 1949), with bibliography.

Allen Clapp Thomas, *A History of the Friends in America* (Philadelphia, 1930), with an extensive bibliography, includes origins in England, development of discipline and doctrine, early history in America, the growth of the humanitarian spirit, divisions after 1827, reorganization, the anti-slavery movement, modern educational and philanthropic work, leaders, the peace crusade, foreign missions, summer schools, youth movements, Indian and Negro work, the American Friends Service Committee, and growth of unity among Quaker groups. It narrates the formation as a sect, and its reawakening to take its place as a great force in mystical religion and the Social Gospel. Quakerism in America is appreciated also in Rufus Matthew Jones, Isaac Sharpless, and Amelia M. Gummere, *The Quakers in the American Colonies* (London, 1923), an account of the most influential sect of the colonial period. There is a discussion of the social ethics of Quakerism, and of the conduct of affairs in Rhode Island under Quaker control. Early American Quaker culture and spirituality are examined in detail in Edward Earle Stibitz, "The Quaker Mind in Colonial America: A Study in the History of Ideas" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1948).

The evolution of Friends' spiritual and social ideals has been largely the result of the influence of ministers with special "concerns." Eminent American leaders are included in Caroline N. Jacob, *Builders of the Quaker Road* (Chicago, 1953). Typical religious and social leadership at the highest level is seen at work in several biographies of representative American Friends. Janet Payne Whitney, *John Woolman, American Quaker* (Boston, 1942) is derived largely from his journals and some other far less accessible sources. It

gives a true impression of the man and of his cultural and spiritual environment, in which he lived and worked as an apostle of love. Bliss Forbush, *Elias Hicks, Quaker Liberal* (New York, 1956) represents him as the most popular Quaker preacher of his time, an expression of the rebellion of primitive Quaker conscience against staid and socially unprogressive leadership. David Hinshaw, *Rufus Jones, Master Quaker* (New York, 1951), with bibliography, begins with a general appreciation of the man, then shifts to the origin of the Quakers in England, their planting and development in America, and traces his life as the growth of a modern saint, one of rugged intellectual strength and high thinking. Elbert Russell, *Elbert Russell, Quaker, An Autobiography* (Jackson, Tenn., 1956) traces spiritual growth and formation of religious and social ideals in a modern American Quaker.

b. Quaker Social Conscience. The religiously guided state or "Holy Experiment," which the early Friends projected in Pennsylvania and New Jersey, inevitably underwent an evolution into something more worldly. The chief causes of the slow transformation were the pressure of recalcitrant human nature, increasing wealth, involvement in the complexities of colonial politics, and a large immigration of non-Friends.

The result was a dual character of the Quaker group. This is best described in the words: "The Society of Friends has always tended to produce two distinct types . . . on the one hand, a small body of individuals unreservedly committed to the ideal . . . on the other hand, a somewhat larger number 'who have held it to be equally imperative to work out their principles of life in the complex affairs of the community and the state, where to gain an end one must yield something . . . where to achieve ultimate triumph one must risk his ideals to the tender mercies of the world not yet ripe for them.' "

Rufus Matthew Jones, *The Faith and Practice of the Quakers* (London and New York, 1927) and his *The Flowering of Mysticism* (New York, 1939) outline the

spiritual principles of Quaker social action. E. C. O. Beatty, *William Penn as Social Philosopher* (New York, 1939) is a scholarly exposition of his ideals, which he endeavored to fulfill in the Quaker-founded colonies of West Jersey and Pennsylvania, established upon constitutions embodying his views of freedom, tolerance, and peace. Isaac Sharpless, *A Quaker Experiment in Government* (Philadelphia, 1898) presents a detailed analysis of the embarrassing problems in Pennsylvania, arising from the attempt to apply Penn's ideals to the conduct of society and government. Frederick B. Tolles, *Meetinghouse and Countinghouse: The Quaker Merchants of Colonial Philadelphia, 1682–1763* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1948) in chs. 1–6 and 10 has the best study of the secularizing of the Quaker pattern, and describes the "group of Friends of less heroic and saintly mold"—the other side of the dual character.

Amelia Mott Gummere, ed., *The Journal and Essays of John Woolman* (New York, 1922) presents a case history of the saintly, uncompromising type of Quaker, idealistic and interested in social reform. The practical working-out of the ideals of Woolman and like-minded Friends is narrated in great detail by Auguste Jorns, *The Quakers as Pioneers in Social Work* (New York, 1931). Anna Louise Spann, "The Ministry of Women in the Society of Friends" (Doctoral dissertation, State University of Iowa, 1945) investigates the unique contribution of certain eminent ministers to education and social service, and the influences prompting them. The basic idea of Quaker faith has emphasized vocational equality and the work of women, an important contribution to the American way of religion and life. (See also Part Three, sect. VI, A, 2, *Quakerism and Slavery*.)

D. Sects of American Origin

A considerable number of sects came fully organized from European countries to America. They were offshoots of the Protestant Reformation, and of the second reformation in

Continental Protestantism, the Pietist movement of the period 1680–1750. Among them were the Society of Friends or Quakers, and such German groups as the Mennonites and Dunkards.

Once established in America, the sectarian spirit became active and prolific to an extent unrivaled in any other country, in the complete religious freedom that developed during and after the Revolutionary period. American sects generally have originated in the personal appeal and influence of prophetic leaders, or by the branching of groups from parent denominational stems. In the latter case, the cause often has been a disagreement about doctrine and practice, a personal rivalry, or the uneasiness of a social group in the larger body.

Many of the so-called Protestant "denominations" really are sects. They conform to the literal meaning of the term, being sections cut off from a denomination or another sect. Some do not remain sectarian; as they become well organized and gain in social standing and religious recognition, they incline to assimilate to the standard American denominational pattern. Examples of this trend are the Church of the Nazarene and the Church of God of Anderson, Indiana.

I. ORIGINS OF AMERICAN SECTARIANISM: THE ANTINOMIANS. Some important characteristics of American sectarian religion cannot be understood without recognizing differences regarding doctrine, ecclesiastical forms, and social teaching, which sprang from protest against state churches. Most of the Anglo-American Colonies had established churches of the Puritan or Anglican type. It would seem to be no accident that the first native sectarian tendencies appeared in the very citadel of the Puritan theocracy.

Sectarian protest erupted in Boston in 1636, in the Antinomian controversy, which resulted in the expulsion of Ann Hutchinson and her followers from the colony. This incident clearly indicated the social and religious differences between the church and schismatic tendencies. The Puritan ministers and magistrates immediately recognized the sectarian im-

plications of the subjective character of Antinomian religious experience, and dreaded the disruptive consequences of such views in a state church. Charles Francis Adams, ed., *Antinomianism in the Colony of Massachusetts Bay, 1636–1638* (Boston, 1894) provides a general account of Antinomianism. The chief source of information about the episode is Thomas Welde's *Short Story,* which follows the introduction.

The rise of sectarianism since Puritan times has been ably chronicled in John Moffatt Mecklin, *The Story of American Dissent* (New York, 1934). William Hepworth Dixon, *Spiritual Wives* (London, 1868, 2 vols., 2nd ed.) is a comprehensive history of sectarianism and its association with religious socialism and "spiritual marriage," in Germany, Great Britain, and the United States. There are many references to revivalistic sects, Adventists, Pietism, Mormonism and plural marriage, Bible Communists, perfectionism, spiritualism, millennialism, Shakerism, the Swedenborgians, etc. Insight into the basic causes of American sectarianism may be obtained from the remarks on religion in Alice Felt Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment; Phases of American Social History to 1860* (Minneapolis, 1944), with bibliography and notes. Whitney Cross, in *The Burned-Over District* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1950) has excellent remarks on the origins of many "ultraist" and other religious peculiarities in western New York, 1800 to 1850.

Elmer Talmage Clark, *The Small Sects in America* (New York, 1949, rev. ed.), with bibliography, has an index of religious bodies in the United States, said to be the most extensive one ever published. This is the first study to bring together information concerning the numerous little-known religious bodies. It is based upon research and gathering of literature for a quarter of a century, and a large correspondence with representatives of the groups. Emphasis is placed on distinctive principles and points of view. A close-up view of small and little-known groups is given by John Bernard Oliver, Jr., in "Some Newer Religious Groups in the U.S.:

Twelve Case Studies" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1946). The humbler type of sectarian religion is clearly explained in G. Norman Eddy, "Store Front Religion," *Religion in Life*, Vol. 28, no. 1 (Winter, 1958–1959), pp. 68–85. Its milieu is the socially disorganized areas of big cities. Its most prominent characteristics are marked deviation from established religion, bizarre theology, emotionalism, no strong interchurch affiliations, and appeal to the economically and socially insecure, who are not reached by the large denominations.

2. COMMUNAL SECTS. William Alfred Hinds, *American Communities* (Chicago, 1908, 2nd ed.) presents a practically exhaustive survey of communistic societies (including many religious ones) from early colonial times, with illustrations, and reveals the deep influence of religious zeal and mysticism in the inspiration of such communities. Mark Holloway, *Heavens On Earth, Utopian Communities in America, 1680–1880* (London, 1951) declares that such groups benefited themselves and the nation, and that they pioneered in many reforms with respect to women, treatment of Negroes, eugenics, etc.

Arthur Bestor, *Backwoods Utopias, the Sectarian and Owenite Phases of Communitarian Socialism in America, 1663–1829* (Philadelphia, 1950), with bibliographical footnotes and a bibliographical essay, is one of the best scholarly treatments of religious communism; and should be read together with Stow Persons, "Christian Communitarianism in America," in Donald Drew Egbert and Stow Persons, eds., *Socialism in American Life* (Princeton, 1952), Vol. 1, pp. 127–151, with bibliography. Excellent similar studies are Robert J. Hendricks, *Bethel and Aurora: An Experiment in Communism as Practical Christianity, with Some Account of Past and Present Ventures in Collective Living* (New York, 1953); and Bertha Shambaugh, "Amana That Was and Amana That Is," *The Palimpsest*, Vol. 17 (1936), pp. 149–184, reprint, June 1950. Robert V. Hine, *California's Uto-*

pian Colonies (Santa Monica, Calif., 1953), with an excellent bibliographical note, describes communistic colonies, 1850–1950, their origins and generally brief lives, and the causes of their decline. It includes some with religious inspiration, such as the Theosophical ones at Point Loma and Temple Home.

3. SHAKERISM. Always in the background of the "American Dream" has been the human urge to make life anew. Throughout American history, and particularly in the early nineteenth century, some simple folk have taken the promise of American life literally, to the astonishment of the more conservative mass of their countrymen. Of all the radical religious utopian ventures, one of the most important and interesting was the experiment of the Shakers.

Their radical character can be measured theologically or socially. Their theological perfectionism received direct social expression in celibacy, pacifism, and communitarian socialism. America might have tolerated their religious radicalism, but when it extended its fervor to the social sphere, strong opposition was inevitable. Not the least amazing fact about the Shakers is the persistence of their experiment in the face of considerable unpopularity.

Marguerite Fellows Melcher, *The Shaker Adventure* (Princeton and London, 1941), with "Sources," and "List of Shaker Societies," begins with the origins of the group in Manchester, England, describes the migration of leaders to America, the movement's organization and expansion, communal life of order and security, relations with the world, functional ideal, music, dancing, etc. Its decline came with the passing of craftsman civilization and the revival spirit, and loss of the nice balance between spiritual adventure and physical security. Edward Deming Andrews, *The People Called Shakers; a Search for the Perfect Society* (New York, 1953), with bibliography, is another excellent general history, derived from a wide range of original and secondary sources. Henri Desroche, *Les Shakers Américains: D'un Néo-*

Christianisme à un Pré-Socialisme? (Paris, 1955) probably is the most important appreciation by a European.

4. MILLENNIAL AND PRE-MILLENNIAL GROUPS. Shirley Jackson Case, *The Millennial Hope* (Chicago, 1918) traces Christian apocalyptic ideas through history, and shows that they receive new acceptance in periods of crisis, as in World War I. Their penetration of American religion is amply demonstrated by C. Raymond Ludwigson, "The Apocalyptic Interpretation of History of American Premillennial Groups" (Doctoral dissertation, State University of Iowa). Robert Ward McEwen, "Factors in the Modern Survival of Millennialism" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1933; abstract photolithographed, 1936), maintains that the millennial doctrines provide a sense of security in a highly uncertain world.

Francis D. Nichol, *The Midnight Cry* (Washington, D.C., 1944) is devoted to the career and teaching of William Miller, and is an apologetic by an Adventist, a good statement of the Seventh-Day Adventist position on eschatology. Ira V. Brown's "Watchers for the Second Coming: The Millenarian Tradition in America," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review,* Vol. 39, no. 3 (Dec. 1952), pp. 441–458, traces the movement from the colonial period, discussing both pre- and post-millennial doctrines, and is fairly sympathetic toward Miller. Clara Endicott Sears, in *Days of Delusion* (Boston, 1924) gives a historical and critical story of the Millerite and Milton movement. M. Ellsworth Olsen, *A History of the Origin and Progress of Seventh-Day Adventists* (Washington, D.C., 1932, 3rd ed.) is based upon official records, as studied by a member of the denomination. James E. Bear, "The Bible and Modern Religions, I, The Seventh-Day Adventists," *Interpreter,* Vol. 10, no. 1 (Jan. 1956), pp. 45–71, is theologically oriented, and criticizes the Adventist theology from the viewpoint of orthodox Protestantism.

John Wick Bowman, "The Bible and Modern Religions,

II, Dispensationalism," *Interpreter*, Vol. 10, no. 2 (Apr. 1956), pp. 170–187, consists chiefly of a very clear discussion of the theology of the Dispensationalists, derived from the Schofield Bible, concerning the second coming of Christ. Plato E. Shaw, *The Catholic Apostolic Church, Sometimes Called Irvingite* (New York, 1946) is devoted to an exposition of the church's history and doctrine.

5. HOLINESS AND PENTECOSTAL BODIES. Two of the best general accounts of the worldwide phenomenon of the growth of Holiness and Pentecostal churches are F. M. Davenport's *Primitive Traits in Religious Revivalism* (New York, 1905), which is the standard early attempt to make a psychological and sociological analysis of revivalistic behavior; and Timothy L. Smith's *Revivalism and Social Reform* (New York, 1957), which includes much material on holiness movements of the nineteenth century. Merrill Elmer Gaddis, "Christian Perfectionism in America" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1929, typewritten, with abstract and bibliography; also microfilm, 1947), discusses American Holiness movements, and is cited by all serious writers on the perfectionist movements. The history and analysis are useful for a study of Methodist sectarian and Holiness groups. John Leland Peters, *Christian Perfection and American Methodism* (New York, 1956) reexamines the Wesleyan doctrine of perfection and studies its treatment in nineteenth-century American Methodism. The organized Holiness movement emerged from Methodism in order to realize the doctrine more fully.

One of the most vivid and socially effective expressions of the branching of Holiness movements from Methodism has been the Salvation Army. Its story is attractively narrated in P. W. Wilson, *General Evangeline Booth of the Salvation Army* (New York, 1948); and in Herbert Andrew Wisbey, Jr., "Religion in Action; A History of the Salvation Army in the United States" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia Uni-

versity, 1951; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 2868; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1951), Vol. 11, no. 4, pp. 1025–1026).

Another influential group that emerged from the background of Methodist perfectionism is admirably surveyed in M. E. Redford, *The Rise of the Church of the Nazarene* (Kansas City, 1951), which studies in fine detail the birth of a perfectionist sect which is now merging into the general denominational pattern. Oscar Ferguson Reed, "Some Religious Assumptions of the Church of the Nazarene and Their Impact upon the Objectives of Religious Education" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1947; abstract published by the University of Southern California Press) indicates no doctrinal shift, but a growing tendency to redefine the position in contemporary terms. The church is emerging from conflict-consciousness, from sect type to church type.

George B. Cutten, *Speaking with Tongues* (New Haven, 1927) is a general discourse on modern ecstatic religion, which in the United States has proliferated into many sects. R. M. Riggs, *The Spirit Himself* (Springfield, Mo., 1949), a study of the nature and effect of the "Baptism of the Holy Spirit," is considered by Mayer as "almost indispensable for an understanding of the theology of Pentecostalism." Stanley J. Frodsham, *With Signs Following* (Springfield, Mo., 1946, rev. ed.) is a history of modern Pentecostalism, especially of the "tongues" movement, by one of its early advocates. Samuel C. Kincheloe, *Religion in the Depression* (New York, 1937) offers a sociological analysis of the Pentecostal sects in the cities, during the period of economic and spiritual distress, when they offered a measure of security and hope.

Irwin Winehouse, *The Assemblies of God, A Popular Survey,* with an Introduction by J. Roswell Flower (New York, 1959) is the first authenticated and comprehensive ac-

count of the world's largest Pentecostal group since its origin in 1914. The author reviews its worldwide spread, its evangelism and special missions, from extensive research and personal interviews. Charles E. Flower, *When the Trumpet Sounds, History of the Church of God* (Anderson, Ind., 1951) is by a leader of the Church of God of Anderson, Ind. Aubrey Leland Forrest, "A Study of the Development of the Basic Doctrines and Institutional Patterns in the Church of God" (doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1948; abstract, with bibliography, published by University of Southern California) notices the recurrence of protest religious groups, their development from informal groups centered in one or two leaders into regularly organized churches with clearly defined doctrinal and institutional patterns. The group chosen, the Church of God of Anderson, Ind., is studied as an example of accommodation to the church pattern. Charles W. Conn, *Like a Mighty Army Moves the Church of God* (Cleveland, Tenn., 1955) is the best history and defense of the Church of God movement.

A. B. Simpson, *The Fourfold Gospel* (New York, 1925) is by one of the chief exponents of the movement. Jules Bois, "The New Religions of America, I—The Holy Rollers, the American Dervishes," *Forum*, Vol. 73, no. 2 (Feb. 1925), pp. 145–155, bears down upon the keynotes of the entire series, an account of those who are striving to find religious expression outside the orthodox ranks: Biblical inspiration, religion as an act of faith, the reality of the pentecostal event, confidence, and "sacred familiarity."

6. MORMON THEOCRACY: AN AMERICAN VERSION OF THE KINGDOM OF GOD. Central New York State, a region settled largely by New Englanders at the beginning of the nineteenth century, was swept by successive waves of revivals, until it became known as the "burned-over region." Out of this area emerged numerous religious leaders and move-

ments. They fulfilled certain persistent needs of some Americans, particularly of persons on the lower rungs of the social and economic ladder.

Of all the millennialist and perfectionist sects, the "Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints," commonly known as Mormons, attracted most adherents, and has survived as a permanent feature of the American religious scene. Its founder, Joseph Smith, seems to have sensed the frontier need of an authoritarian church as a counterpoise to the prevailing individualism.

His successor, Brigham Young, was an eminently practical leader, who guided his army of "saints" in one of the most thrilling ventures in American history, the trek across plains and mountains to the promised land of "Deseret," now Utah. There the Mormons established a theocracy which far exceeded the earlier Puritan experiment, both in scope and in visible results. Although the strictly theocratic structure soon broke down, the Mormon religious and social pattern survives, and continues to attract new adherents in America and in other parts of the world.

a. Bibliography and General History. Marvin S. Hill, "The Historiography of Mormonism," *Church History,* Vol. 28, no. 4 (Dec. 1959), pp. 418–426, comprises a critical review of the writings during many years, on Joseph Smith, Jr., the background of Mormonism, the Book of Mormon, settlement and society in Utah, aspects of group life, general history, leaders; and criticizes most of the historiography as too emotional and descriptive, with too little interpretation. One of the most complete bibliographies is in J. Cecil Alter's four articles on "Utah, The Mormons, and the West: A Bibliography," *Utah Historical Quarterly,* Vol. 22, no. 3 (July 1954); Vol. 23, no. 1 (Jan. 1955), pp. 79–85; Vol. 23, no. 3 (July 1955), pp. 279–285; Vol. 24, no. 3 (July 1956), pp. 215–231.

William A. Linn, *The Story of the Mormons from the Date of Their Origin to the Year 1901* (New York, 1902) is

considered one of the best books written about the Mormons. Two "official" histories, rich in detail from the Mormon archives, are: Brigham H. Roberts, *A Comprehensive History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints* (Salt Lake City, 1930, 6 vols.), and Joseph Smith, *History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, Period I, 1830–1847* (Salt Lake City, 1932, 7 vols.).

William Mulder and A. Russell Mortensen, eds., *Among the Mormons* (New York, 1957) chronicles the movement from its dramatic origins in New England and New York to its present prosperity as an accepted denomination, through quotations from contemporary letters, newspaper accounts, memoirs, and other original materials. Thomas F. O'Dea, *The Mormons* (Chicago, 1957), with bibliography in notes, the most recent analysis and the best book of its kind, is primarily ideological and sociological, treating history, cultural pattern, and religious beliefs. The final chapter, "Sources of Strain and Conflict," discusses difficulties of adjustment to the prevailing intellectual and social currents of the twentieth century. Ray B. West, *The Kingdom of the Saints* (New York, 1957) is a scholarly and exciting review of the Mormon adventure, with a brief account of the period following Brigham Young to the end of the nineteenth century. He emphasizes the uniqueness of the Mormons in their transformation of the ideal of "Manifest Destiny" into an image of the Kingdom of God. Nels Anderson, *Desert Saints; the Mormon Frontier in Utah* (Chicago, 1942), with bibliographical references in "Notes" at the end of each chapter, and bibliography, begins with the establishment of the Mormon church, and discusses the ideal of a State of Deseret, a religious commonwealth of industrious people with no rich and no poor. With the passing of the frontier period, the ideal also passed and Deseret became the State of Utah. The ideal state could have survived only if the people had been single-minded.

b. Communal Life. Therald N. Jensen, "Mormon Theory

of Church and State" (Doctoral dissertation with bibliographical footnotes, University of Chicago, 1938; abstract, 1940, from typewritten copy in library), explains the philosophy of the early theocracy—an ideal community based upon religious principles, not unlike the Puritan theocracy of colonial Massachusetts. William J. McNiff, *Heaven on Earth, A Planned Mormon Society* (Oxford, 1940) discusses the efforts of the Mormons to build a distinctive culture, up to 1877. Leonard J. Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom: An Economic History of the Latter-Day Saints, 1830–1900* (Cambridge, Mass., 1958), derived from primary sources, with dramatic power shows the actual concern of the church leaders for material welfare, and studies specific projects. Church leadership was closely associated with economic development of the Great Basin, and was inspired by Puritan attitudes regarding the relations of the individual to the community.

The recruitment of settlers for the ideal community by evangelism is described in William Muelder, *Homeward to Zion* (Minneapolis, 1957), exploring an interesting phase of immigration and Americanization, and vividly describing the migration of 30,000 Mormon proselytes from Scandinavia to America between 1850 and 1905, to live in a purportedly ideal community. It is an apologetic account by a Mormon. Readable and generally fair accounts by earlier observers from outside are: Jules Remy, *A Visit to Great Salt Lake City* (London, 1861), presenting an objective, fair, first-hand observation of the Mormon society; and Richard F. Burton, *The City of the Saints* (New York, 1862), which regards Mormonism as a new chapter in the long history of religious societies, the "recurrence of an essential eclecticism present in all new religions."

Ephraim E. Ericksen, *The Psychological and Ethical Aspects of Mormon Group Life* (Chicago, 1922) is a classic account. The general social aspects are minutely described in a thesis by Wilfred C. Bailey: "The Social Organization of

the Mormon Village" (University of Chicago, 1955, with a bibliography; microfilm by the University library). Kimball Young, *Isn't One Wife Enough?* (New York, 1954) is a sociological study of plural marriage by a grandson of Brigham Young, considering its origin and extent, views of it inside and outside the community, and its abolition. The work is derived from the controversial publications, diaries, journals, and autobiographies, and is presented in a rather popular but objective and sensitive manner. Roy Arthur Cheville, "The Role of Religious Education in the Accommodation of a Sect" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1942; abstract published by the Herald Publishing House, Independence, Mo., as "The Latter Day Saints and Their Changing Relationship to the Social Order," 1942), with bibliography, examines the inner life after the first generations. The chief index of transition is the program of religious education in the Reorganized Church. Group unity is now achieved through internal development rather than outside pressures.

Mormon communal life since the founding of the Church has been described in a number of novels, of which the following are really important: Vardis Fisher, *Children of God* (New York, 1939); Maurine Whipple, *The Giant Joshua* (Boston, 1941); Susan Ertz, *The Proselyte* (London, 1933), about English converts to Mormonism; Frank C. Robertson, *The Rocky Road to Jericho* (New York, 1935); Jean Woodman, *Glory Spent* (New York, 1940), on contemporary Mormonism; and Virginia Sorenson, *A Little Lower than the Angels* (New York, 1942). (See Part Four, RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. V, A, refs. to Mormons.)

c. Biography. Harry M. Beardsley, *Joseph Smith and His Mormon Empire* (Boston, 1931), by a non-Mormon, is friendly, with a good bibliography on the period of Smith. John Henry Evans, *Joseph Smith, An American Prophet* (New York, 1933) is a partisan treatment, relating Smith to American "Manifest Destiny." Fawn McKay Brodie, *No*

Man Knows My History, the Life of Joseph Smith, the Mormon Prophet (New York, 1935), bibliography, is based upon extensive documentation, and upon research in the religion and politics of the United States in 1800–1850. The new religion was "intended to be to Christianity as Christianity was to Judaism . . . a reform and a consummation." He dared to oppose such sacrosanct American traditions as the separation of church and state, private property, monogamy, and freedom of the press, but his movement was a purely American product.

M. R. Werner, *Brigham Young* (New York, 1925) includes a broad treatment of the Mormon movement, with a brief analysis of the religious and social conditions out of which it grew. A less well-known early leader is appreciated by Reva Stanley, *The Archer of Paradise; A Biography of Parley P. Pratt* (Caldwell, Idaho, 1937). Milo M. Quaife, *The Kingdom of St. James, A Narrative of the Mormons* (New Haven, 1930) is a careful, frank, and fair study of the life and labors of James J. Strang, a schismatic Mormon leader who attempted to found a kingdom on Beaver Island in Lake Michigan. O. W. Riegal, *Crown of Glory, Life of James J. Strang, Moses of the Mormons* (New Haven, 1935) is a rather laudatory account.

E. Cults

Gaius Glenn Atkins, *Modern Religious Cults and Movements* (New York and Chicago, 1923) considers the relation between new religious movements and old faiths, starting with the decade 1880–1890. He regards cults as part of modern creative religious consciousness, and notices the reciprocal influences of the cults and Christianity. Cults are rooted in longing for inward rather than external religion, and for healing. Louis Richard Binder, *Modern Religious Cults and Society; a Sociological Interpretation of a Modern Religious Phenomenon* (Boston, 1933), with bibliography,

explains cults in terms of social and psychological aberration. Raymond J. Jones, *A Comparative Study of Cult Behavior* (Washington, D.C., 1939) emphasizes the connection between white and Negro revivalism and the sources of cultism.

William R. Catton, Jr., "What Kind of People Does a Religious Cult Attract?", *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 22, no. 5 (Oct. 1957), pp. 561–566, discusses the question whether or not adherents can be identified in terms of objective characteristics observable prior to their actual affiliation, and studies the Krishna Venta cult in Seattle. The reasons for attraction are examined further in Lee R. Steiner, *Where Do People Take Their Troubles?* (Boston, 1945); also in Charles S. Braden, "Why Are the Cults Growing?", *Christian Century*, Vol. 61 (Jan.–Feb. 1944), pp. 45–47, 78–80, 108–110, 137–140; his essay, "What Can We Learn from the Cults?", *Religion in Life*, Vol. 14, no. 1 (Winter, 1944–45), pp. 52–64; and Marcus Bach, *Report to Protestants* (Indianapolis, 1948) in an interesting chapter, "The Cults Are Coming."

Charles S. Braden, *These Also Believe; a Study of Modern American Cults and Minority Religious Movements* (New York, 1949), with annotated bibliography, contends that while much has been written on the subject, most of it has been violently partisan or hostile, or has exploited the bizarre element merely to amuse people, or to cast discredit. This book met the need for a careful scholarly study. Julius Bodensieck, *Isms New and Old* (Columbus, O., 1938), with bibliography, includes Christian Science, Spiritism, Adventism, Russellism, Mormonism, Unitarianism, Theosophy, and Communistic churches, and is in a popular vein. Marcus Bach, *They Have Found a Faith* (Indianapolis, 1946), also popular, includes (among others) the Foursquare Gospel, Spiritualism, the Oxford Group and Moral Rearmament, the Baha'i faith, Unity, and Psychiana. His *Faith and My Friends* (Indianapolis, 1951), another of his explorations in the by-paths of American cult religions, includes even the New Mexican Penitentes.

Charles W. Ferguson, *The Confusion of Tongues, A Review of Modern Isms* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1936), originally *The New Books of Revelations* (New York, 1930), includes groups from the old-time Shakers and Swedenborgians to modern swamis and yogis and the Dukhobors, and is popular but mostly reliable. Walter R. Martin, *The Rise of the Cults* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1955), with bibliography, is one of the most significant works, discussing Christian Science, Jehovah's Witnesses, Mormonism, Unity, Father Divine, Theosophy, and "the Sleeping Giant of Orthodoxy." Also worth consulting is his *The Christian and the Cults; Answering the Cultist from the Bible* (Grand Rapids, 1956), with a bibliography.

The startling increase of cults has propounded to the churches the difficult and embarrassing question of how to deal with them. That the problem has been caused partly by the churches' failure to appeal to certain classes of people is indicated by Miles Mark Fisher, "Organized Religion and the Cults," *The Crisis*, Vol. 44, no. 1 (Jan. 1937), pp. 8–10, 29, 30, emphasizing the failure of "old-line" churches to reach the masses because of too much education and fashion, and noting the democracy of the cults, with their charity, social service, and equality of women and races. The "respectable" Protestant churches have forgotten that they once were or resembled cults. Arnold B. Rhodes [and others] eds., *The Church Faces the Isms* (Louisville, Ky., 1958) has select bibliographies with chapters. Written for Protestants by members of the faculty of the Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary, this approaches the problem of dealing with cults, and gives a brief description and criticism of each. John Casper Mattes, *The Missionary Faces Isms* . . . (Philadelphia, 1937) was published by the Board of American Missions of the United Lutheran Church in America, and discusses "The difficulties and problems of the home missionary as they concern individual doctrinal vagaries both of sects and individuals."

Jan Karel Van Baalen, *Our Birthright and the Mess of Meat: Isms of Today Analyzed and Compared with the Heidelberg Catechism* (New York, 1929) from a conservative Reformed viewpoint indicates their often essentially non-Christian character. His attitude is further expounded in *The Chaos of Cults; a Study in Present-day "Isms"* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1938), a revision of the previous work, with a selected bibliography, issued in response to popular interest; and in his *Christianity Versus the Cults* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1958), an elaborate exposition of their alleged non-Christian character. A similar criticism is his *The Gist of the Cults; Christianity Versus False Religion* (Grand Rapids, 1944). One of the severest orthodox attacks upon cultism is Casper B. Nervig, *Christian Truth and Religious Delusions* (Minneapolis, 1941), with a bibliography.

Peculiar regional manifestations of cultism are interestingly described by Harold Preece and Celia Kraft, in *Dew on Jordan* (New York, 1946), on varieties of "folk religion" in the Southern hill country, a personalized account of religion in Appalachia. A similar but journalistic account is Archie Robertson's *The Old Time Religion* (Boston, 1950), with vivid descriptions of the Southern mountaineer snake-handlers, and of the Pillar of Fire Church of Zarephath, New Jersey.

The Depression of the 1930's, with its mental and spiritual distress, was a seedplot of cults, or greatly promoted some already established. A classic example is described in Henry Theodore Dohrman, "'Mankind United,' a Modern Cult of California" (Doctoral dessertation, Harvard University, 1949, available on restricted circulation, Harvard University Library), a close study of an esoteric cult that flourished in the late 1930's and the 1940's. It emphasizes the types of cult prophet and adherent, and surveys the literature, myth, communal discipline, financial administration, doctrine and dogma, and relations with the world. The I AM movement, another cult that expanded rapidly in the 1930's and 1940's, is de-

scribed in detail by Gerald B. Bryan, in *Psychic Dictatorship in America* (Los Angeles, 1940). The general trend that produced this riotous proliferation of cult faiths is reviewed in Kenneth Jones, *Strange New Faiths* (Anderson, Ind., 1954).

1. JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES. The best description of this group, and an outstanding performance in the literature on sects, is Herbert Hewitt Stroup, *The Jehovah's Witnesses* (New York, 1954). Among the most effective interpretations is Walter E. Steuermann's essay, "The Bible and Modern Religions, III, Jehovah's Witnesses," *Interpreter*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (July 1956), pp. 323–346. The social sources of the movement are explored in Werner Cohn, "Jehovah's Witnesses as a Proletarian Movement," *American Scholar*, Vol. 24, no. 3 (Summer, 1955), pp. 281–298. N. H. Knorr's "Jehovah's Witnesses of Modern Times," in Vergilius Ferm's *Religion in the Twentieth Century*, pp. 381–392, offers a pedestrian but authoritative statement of beliefs, by a current leader of the movement. A. H. Macmillan, *Faith on the March* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1957) has an introduction by Knorr, and is partly autobiographical; the author, having been in the movement for sixty years, presents a sympathetic official account. Two attempts to make a "good case" are Marley Cole, *Jehovah's Witnesses: The New World Society* (New York, 1955), which is very sympathetic; the attitude is more fully developed in his *Triumphant Kingdom* (New York, 1957), expounding the doctrines and success of the Witnesses, in a sophisticated defense. A typical example of hostile criticism is Walter R. Martin and Norman H. Klann, *Jehovah of the Watchtower; a Thorough Exposé of the Important Anti-Biblical Teachings of Jehovah's Witnesses* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1956, rev. and enl. ed.), with bibliography. This should be supplemented by Walter R. Martin, *Jehovah's Witnesses* (Grand Rapids, 1957). (See also Part Three, sect. II, D, 3, *The Jehovah's Witnesses and Religious Freedom.*)

2. CHRISTIAN SCIENCE: A CULT ORGANIZED AS A CHURCH. The nineteenth century was extraordinarily productive of new religious movements, sects, cults, and "isms" of many kinds. Some of them, while professing to be fully Christian, introduced innovations in doctrine and practice which made their claim seem dubious in the eyes of the more orthodox. The most successful of these so-called "marginal" groups were the Mormons and the Christian Scientists. The former found their sphere of operation on the frontier, and wrote some of the truly thrilling chapters in the expansion of that boundary. Christian Science, by contrast, arose in New England and made its appeal primarily to city folk.

Whereas Joseph Smith, Jr. derived his distinctive principles from unique revelations, Mrs. Mary Baker Eddy more modestly expounded a philosophy of absolute idealism. In her writings the New England version of idealism was aimed to cure the fears and frustrations of ordinary people.

Mrs. Eddy quickly assumed the role of leader of a dynamic cult. The early history of the movement was largely her life story. In a very real sense she *was* the Church of Christ, Scientist, and there has been no important development of ideas or practices since her death. Thanks to her organizing genius, Christian Science is no longer a "movement." It is a cult, with the aspects of a church, and with a well-defined orthodoxy and a powerful hierarchy, although it remains quite sharply isolated from the churches of the Catholic and Reformed traditions.

The origins of Christian Science are best examined in the biographies of the founder. The official study is that of Sybil Wilbur, *The Life of Mary Baker Eddy* (Boston, 1938), issued by the Christian Science Publication Society. A critical account of her early experiences and character appears in Ernest S. Bates and John V. Dittemore, *Mary Baker Eddy* (New York, 1932). Edward F. Dakin's *Mrs. Eddy, the Biography of a Virginal Mind* (New York, 1930) gives a

clear account of the writing of *Science and Health* and the formation of the church, and is a balanced appraisal of the founder and her work, but is criticized by Scientists as unfair to Mrs. Eddy.

The most extensive account of the group is Norman Beasley's *The Cross and the Crown: the History of Christian Science* (New York, 1952), by a non-Scientist, who used sources outside official records and interviewed members. He depicts a typically American religious movement, which originated in the convictions of a converted individual and became a church with a body of sacred scripture. He does not analyze the religious background of Mrs. Eddy, and gives the impression that she was entirely self-contained. The social background for her success is thoroughly explored in Harold Winston Pfantz, "Christian Science: The Sociology of a Social Movement and a Religious Group" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1954).

Robert Peel, *Christian Science, Its Encounter with American Culture* (New York, 1958) attempts to relate Christian Science to the cultural movements of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. It considers, from the viewpoint of an adherent, the origins and significance of the church, especially in its Transcendentalist relations. Charles S. Braden, *Christian Science Today: Power, Policy, Practice* (Dallas, 1958) is an objective, full-length history, drawn from abundant sources, and devoted mostly to an exposition of the growth of a powerful organization, its controversies, the evolution of its thought and practice, and of its doctrine. A critical, orthodox Protestant view is that of Conrad H. Moehlman's *Ordeal by Concordance* (New York, 1955), strongly anti-Scientist. The Roman Catholic viewpoint is expressed by Augustin M. Bellwald, *Christian Science and the Catholic Faith* (New York, 1922).

3. SPIRITUALISM. Probably the most thorough bibliography ever published, up to its time, and including works on American Spiritualism, is that of London University, Council for

Psychical Investigation, Library: *Short-title Catalogue of Works on Psychical Research, Spiritualism, etc. circa 1450 A.D. to 1929 A.D.*, compiled by Harry Price (London, 1929), together with a supplement (London, 1935). An excellent supplement to this, for the American movement, is the library of Harry Houdini (1874–1926) on magic, spiritualism, occultism, and psychical research, in the Rare Book Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C. A very valuable bibliography is included in William C. Hartmann, comp. and ed., *Who's Who in Occult, Psychic and Spiritual Realms . . . in the United States and Foreign Countries* (Jamaica, N.Y., 1927, 2nd ed.). This includes leaders in psychic science and spiritualism, and eminent mediums, descriptions of movements and societies, libraries, periodicals in various countries, publishing houses, and portraits. Henrietta Lovi's *Best Books on Spirit Phenomena, 1847–1925; Notes Describing Representative Volumes; Belief-Unbelief-Disbelief* (Boston, 1925) has a selected bibliography on spirit phenomena, and an index of authors and titles, and is virtually a historical survey of Spiritualist literature, with notes on authors and the trends in Spiritualism.

The most complete history, to the beginning of the twentieth century, is Frank Podmore, *Modern Spiritualism: A History and a Criticism* (London and New York, 1902, 2 vols.), with a large section, "American Spiritualism," Vol. 1, book 2. The author, a student of psychical research, presents an exhaustive history of the movement in the Western World, indicating the importance of the American, Andrew Jackson Davis, and analyzing early American Spiritualism, and the claim of Spiritualism to be a later and fuller Christian revelation, and the contemporary circumstances that caused its rapid spread and popularity. Emma Hardinge Britten, *Modern American Spiritualism: a Twenty Years' Record of the Communion between Earth and the World of Spirits* (New York, 1870, 4th ed.) tells the story from personal knowledge, including the first public investigation, and

traces the movement in various states and during the Civil War, with copious quotations of source documents. No other early history of American Spiritualism equals this for thoroughness and inclusion of sources, such as letters and press reports.

Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, *The History of Spiritualism* (New York, 1926, 2 vols.) claims to be the first comprehensive history, criticizes the works of Podmore and other writers, and includes accounts of the investigators of Spiritualism. An important chapter on religious aspects claims that Spiritualism can be reconciled with any religion. The American movement is extensively surveyed. Harvey Metcalfe, *The Evolution of Spiritualism, with an Introduction by Max Metcalfe* and a preface by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle (London, n.d.) is an apologia, with references to American originators. It includes two lengthy chapters on modern American spiritualism, the first meeting and church, the "conversion" of Horace Greeley, the interest of Robert Owen, and reference to Abraham Lincoln's alleged relation with the movement. Ernest Thompson, *The History of Modern Spiritualism, the Scientific Foundation of Modern Spiritualism* (Manchester, Eng., 1948) sketches the history from the pioneers, including the American Andrew Jackson Davis, research in the twentieth century, a chapter on America, and a bibliography on the history of the movement.

4. NEW THOUGHT, FAITH HEALING, AND UNITY. William Walker Atkinson, *The Message of the New Thought, a Condensed History of Its Real Origin with a Statement of its Basic Principles and True Aims* (Holyoke, Mass., 1911) demonstrates the rootage of New Thought in the oldest philosophical systems, its close connection with Transcendentalism, and its character as a convergence of streams of thought, such as Christian Science, the Emmanuel Movement, and kindred systems of healing. The bibliography makes perfectly clear its nature as a "success cult." One of the most influential early books was John Herman Randall's

A New Philosophy of Life (New York, 1911), which illustrates the mingling of Transcendental philosophy, the success cult, and Christianity, the influence of mind upon physical health, the conquest of fear and worry, and the "rediscovery of Jesus" as a New Thought philosopher. James Mann Campbell's *New Thought Christianized* (New York, 1917) suggests Norman Vincent Peale's *The Power of Positive Thinking*, heavily emphasizing this as a sovereign antidote to fear and worry, and the relation of this technique to sayings of Jesus and Saint Paul. Jesse Charles Fremont Grumbine, *The New Thought Religion, What It Stands For in Relation to the Christian Theology and to Divinity; the Absolute* (Boston, 1921) attempts to define New Thought in the light of traditional Christian doctrines, emphasizing especially "attunement and at-one-ment," immortality, the resurrection, and regeneration.

The book *53 Experiences in New Thought, by 49 Writers* (Holyoke, Mass., 1916), with a bibliography, contains testimonials of "personal experiences in the realization of health, wealth, happiness, and achievement" through New Thought, including a discussion of its principles with a vaguely Christian tone. The stress upon this-worldly happiness suggests the present-day cult of "peace of mind." Horatio Willis Dresser, ed., *The Spirit of the New Thought; Essays and Addresses by Representative Authors and Leaders* (New York, 1917), with a large bibliography, including the history and periodicals of the movement, stresses mental health, positive thinking, and healing, and includes criticisms of the movement and its contemporary state, and references to its connection with Christianity. Ernest Shurtleff Holmes, *New Thought Terms and Their Meanings, a Dictionary of the Terms and Phrases Commonly Used in Metaphysical and Psychological Study* (New York, 1942) shows relations with the Bible and Christianity, and abounds in quotations from the Bible, explained in a New Thought sense. Ralph Waldo Trine, *The Best of Ralph Waldo Trine* (Indianapolis, 1957), an an-

thology of New Thought inspirational and optimistic essays, includes the famous "In Tune with the Infinite," emphasizing the aim of the movement as the power to "win through," and suggesting the influence of New Thought upon Norman Vincent Peale and similar authors.

Henry Clay Sheldon's *Theosophy and New Thought* (New York and Cincinnati, 1916), with bibliographical footnotes, from a Methodist viewpoint presents a critical analysis of both movements, pointing out similarities and differences in spirit and content. This is one of the best and most authoritative critiques of New Thought by a Christian thinker. Another examination, not as profound as Sheldon's, is in Thomas Cary Johnson's *Some Modern Isms* (Richmond, Va., 1919), with bibliographies. Written from a Presbyterian viewpoint, this is severely critical, but admits that the new cults should put Christians on guard to practice the best in their own religion. Gaius Glenn Atkins, *Modern Religious Cults and Movements* (New York and Chicago, 1923) characterizes New Thought as an attitude of mind, with roots in Transcendentalism and George Quimby's healing, but with a broader range as a universal and loosely defined religion, modifying orthodox theology and risking the danger of over-optimism. Alfred Whitney Griswold, "New Thought: A Cult of Success," *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 40, no. 3 (Nov. 1934), pp. 309–318, with a select bibliography, maintains that New Thought is rooted in the mesmerism of Quimby and in Transcendentalism, and that it flourished in the period 1890–1915 as a metropolitan religion whose adherents were impelled by the traditional philosophy of success. (See also his *The American Cult of Success*, Baltimore, 1934; see also Part Five, sect. v, B, *Popularizing Religious Psychology*.)

An excellent essay on faith healing cults is in Gaius Glenn Atkins, *Modern Religious Cults and Movements* (New York and Chicago, 1923). A general review suggesting the popularity and widespread nature of the movement is W. W. Dwyer's *Spiritual Healing in the United States and Great*

Britain (New York, 1956, rev. ed.). An American origin is suggested in one of the earlier American publications: Horatio Willis Dresser, *Health and the Inner Life; an Analytical and Historical Study of Spiritual Healing Theories; with an Account of the Life and Teachings of P. P. Quimby* (New York, 1906). The philosophical background of modern American faith healing is outlined by Leslie D. Weatherhead, *Psychology, Religion and Healing* (Nashville, 1951), an examination of the search for bodily and mental health, with the conclusion that both religion and psychology are essential to success of healing methods; also by Wade H. Boggs, Jr., *Faith Healing and the Christian Faith* (Richmond, Va., 1956). Criticism, from an orthodox Protestant viewpoint, is voiced in William E. Biederwolf, *Whipping Post Theology* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1934), an exhaustive discussion of the theological premises of faith healing.

A brief bibliography of Unity is in Frederick E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (1958). There are references in Marcus Bach, *They Have Found a Faith,* ch. 8; and Charles S. Braden, *These Also Believe,* ch. 4. Abundant material on the beliefs and practices of the movement is available in *Weekly Unity,* edited at "Unity Center," Kansas City, Mo. Modern books on the Unity movement include: James W. Teener, *Unity School of Christianity* (Chicago, 1942); Charles Fillmore, *Prosperity* (Lee's Summitt, Mo., 1936, 1955) and his *The Unity Treasure Chest* (Lee's Summitt, 1950); and a general history of the movement in James Dillett, *The Story of Unity* (Lee's Summitt, 1954).

5. THE OXFORD GROUP AND MORAL REARMAMENT. The Oxford Group, sometimes called "Buchmanism" for its internationally known leader, Doctor Frank Buchman, is a fundamentally Christian movement, with some aspects of both sect and cult. The element of fresh guidance in it is often overstressed by commentators, and some view its element of inward guidance as not far from authentic Quakerism. Good references are in Marcus Bach, *They Have Found*

a Faith, ch. 5; Charles S. Braden, *These Also Believe,* ch. 12; Horton Davies, *Christian Deviations,* ch. 9; and in the last chapter of Robert Murray, *Group Movements Throughout the Ages.* A thorough analysis is in a doctoral dissertation by Walter H. Clark, *The Oxford Group, Its History and Significance* (New York, 1951).

Allan W. Eister, *Drawing-Room Conversion: A Sociological Account of the Oxford Group Movement* (Durham, N.C., 1950) relates the story of its founding and development, and notices its principal aims and methods, attempting an analysis of the basic motives that lead people into it, and its characteristics of both sect and cult. A fairly typical criticism, in this case from an orthodox Lutheran viewpoint, is W. W. Schwehn's *What Is Buchmanism?* (St. Louis, 1940). One of the best recent assessments is Geoffrey Williamson's *Inside Buchmanism* (New York, 1954), based upon personal experience. The Moral Rearmament movement, which often attracts the same type of seeker, is thoroughly studied in Sir Arnold Lunn, *Enigma: A Study of Moral Rearmament* (London, 1957).

VI. THE NEGRO CHURCH

THE Negro church in the United States is a unique institution because of the American Negro's singular religious experience and expression. His contact with a Christian religious development, more advanced than the faith he brought from Africa, made his religious experience necessarily imitative in its outward form, and yet assimilated to his own temperament and outlook in inward spirit.

His legal and social condition, both as a slave and as a freedman, closed to the Negro the road to participation in many phases of life. His church therefore became a dominant influence, because through it he achieved satisfaction and leadership that was not possible elsewhere. It was his medium of expression in business, politics, and the professions, an out-

let for his talents in music, drama, poetry and oratory. Through these means the church helped to raise the general intelligence of the whole group, while at the same time offering "social compensation" for the restrictions of segregation. It has given hope; the Negro felt that God respected and cared for him, even if "the World" did not.

The church has unified the Negro group and at the same time aided in its adjustment to environment. It has given a sense of solidarity, while developing common moral customs, along with similar mental and social traits. While helping him to grow in education, intelligence, and wealth, the church has promoted adjustment between the Negro and the surrounding white population and its culture. This factor has been obvious in economic relations, the rights and privileges of citizenship, interracial contacts, and the Negro's many contributions to the common American way of life. In short, the Negro church has been an indispensable factor in "acculturation."

The church has always been the social focus of the Negro community, a center for distribution of information, for emotional stimulation, and for leisure-time activities. With the vast migration of Negroes from country to city, the church has been compelled to adapt itself to meet the pressing needs of the "transplanted Negro peasant." His conflict with the new and often bewildering environment has frequently placed church leaders in the van of the movement for social recognition, economic justice, better educational opportunity, and civil rights. The new urban environment has caused another development which is not so fortunate. The inevitable social stratification of a more complex life has been increasingly reflected in social cleavages in the churches, and in the proliferation of small sects and cults.

The transition from rural to urban life has laid a great burden upon the Negro church. While many churches, especially those with eminent preachers, have stepped into a place of leadership, many potential members drift away

from others because of the lack of an adequate program. There is a widely felt and growing need for better education of the clergy and the teachers in both country and city, to bring the influence of the church to bear upon contemporary life as it has to be accepted and lived.

By the early 1900's probably forty per cent of American Negroes were church members, and today the proportion is even higher. The church is still an immense influence, especially through the unifying effect of its press, and its numerous congresses, institutes, and conferences. It has made and is still making effective contributions to American religious life. Its appeal still stimulates philanthropic and missionary impulses in the white churches. Its emotional fervor and its zeal are a counter-influence to the temptation of other churches to become too "respectable," commonplace, and tepid. The religious life cultivated by the Negro church always has exemplified many Christian qualities, such as kindliness, patience and optimism, charity, fidelity, and loyalty. Growing cooperation with white churches affords an opportunity for practical application of the principle of Christian brotherhood.

A. The Negro Church: General

The sweep of American Negro religious history, and the impact of the Negro church upon American life, are suggested by the wide (although not exhaustive) list of titles in Monroe N. Work, comp., *A Bibliography of the Negro in Africa and America* (New York, 1928), under the headings "Religious Instruction of the Slaves," "Slavery and the Bible," "Slavery and the Church," "The Negro Church and Religious Life," and "Boards and Foundations Carrying on Education Work among Negroes." Historical facts, biographical references on noted preachers, denominational statistics, and the work of Christian organizations appear in the *Negro Year Book, An Annual Encyclopedia of the Negro* (Tuskegee Institute, Ala., Negro Year Book Publishing Co., 1912– , with gaps and

slight variations of title). A record of the religious activities of the American Negro, and of national and international co-operation through the medium of his churches, appears in the *Year Book of Negro Churches*, 1935/36– , issued at various places and with varying titles and editors, by authority of the bishops of the African Methodist Episcopal Church. The data comprise many religious and secular organizations, schools and colleges, the Negro religious press, etc. *The Journal of Negro History* (Lancaster, Pa., Washington, D.C., 1916–) contains many articles of interest to the student of Negro churches, religious life, problems, and expression.

Appreciation of the general role of the church in Negro life began to appear after the vast effort of conversion and organization following the Civil War and Emancipation. The most valuable and complete of the early scientific studies is that by W. E. Burghardt DuBois, ed., *The Negro Church, Report of a Social Study made under the Direction of Atlanta University* (Atlanta, Ga., 1903, Atlanta University Publications, no. 8). Resulting from the Eighth Conference for the Study of Negro Problems, May 1903, this is one of the most thorough surveys ever made of Negro churches and religion, including historical development and contemporary conditions, statistics for 1890 and 1902–03, local studies of religious influence in various regions, moral conditions, opinions on the Negro church, religious education and children, notable preachers, and ministerial training. The important role of the Negro minister as a social leader in the 1800's and early 1900's is stressed in Booker T. Washington's *The Story of the Negro* (New York, 1909, 2 vols.), Vol. I, ch. XIII, "The Negro Preacher and the Negro Church." Another valuable early study is Richard Clark Reed, "A Sketch of the Religious History of the Negroes in the South," in American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 2nd ser., no. 4 (1914). This reviews in detail the progress of conversion from the earliest colonial times through denominational and individual efforts, the establishment of separate Negro churches, the work of North-

ern missionaries, and the rise of Negro leadership through education.

With the awakening of an informed racial and social consciousness after World War I, eminent Negro scholars sought to evaluate the influence of the church in comprehensive studies, based upon research and wide reading of previous works. The first, and still the most important, is Carter G. Woodson, *The History of the Negro Church* (Washington, D.C., 1945, 2nd ed.), a revision of the first edition published in 1921, with an added chapter to consider recent trends, and especially the "cult leaders." Although unfortunately lacking a bibliography, this work is admirably comprehensive, stimulating particularly in its consideration of church schools and their influence, the emergence of conservative and progressive tendencies, the church's socialization, the effects of urbanism, consolidation of churches, and the growth of foreign missions, with the ideal of a redeemed and Christian Africa. The first comprehensive contemporary study is that of Benjamin E. Mays, *The Negro's Church* (New York, 1933), made under the auspices of the Institute of Social and Religious Research at the request of some Negro leaders, and based upon first-hand analyses of nearly 800 urban and rural churches, with information from thousands of Negro and white ministers and laymen. The volume is considered as essential to an understanding of the forces that have made the Negro church what it is, although it is criticized for stressing the character of Negro worship as "escape." W. D. Weatherford, *American Churches and the Negro, An Historical Study from Early Slave Days to the Present* (Boston, 1957) is abundantly documented, and points out the deep concern of white churches for the Negro's religious welfare, early nonsegregated worship, and the amazing success of early evangelization.

Another essential sociological study is that of Gunnar Myrdal in *An American Dilemma; the Negro Problem and Modern Democracy* (New York, Harper, 1944, 2 vols.), ch. 40, "The Negro Church." A Swedish social economist, free

from the prejudices and presuppositions of an American, renders an excellent analysis of Negro religious life, explicitly oriented to the relation between class structure and religious organization. Catholic criticism points to neglect of Catholic work among Negroes, and of the role of religion in solving a problem which the author acknowledges as a moral one.

Lesser studies bearing on the general social influence of the Negro church include an unusually perceptive one by Richard R. Wright, Jr., "Social Work and Influence of the Negro Church," in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol. 30 (Nov. 1907), pp. 509–521, emphasizing the role of the church schools, press and national gatherings, the churches as business enterprises and their political pressure for Negro advancement, and the comparative effectiveness of rural small-town and urban churches. The primary influence of the church in Negro development and acculturation is assessed in George E. Haynes, "The Church and Negro Progress," *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol. 130, no. 229 (Nov. 1928), pp. 264–271. The author was the secretary of the Commission on the Church and Race Relations, Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America. The Christianizing and educational influence of the Y.M.C.A. among Negro youth is reviewed in Charles Howard Hopkins, *History of the Y.M.C.A. in North America* (New York, 1951), and in Jesse E. Moorland, "The Young Men's Christian Association among Negroes," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 9, no. 2 (Apr. 1924), pp. 127–138. The latter stresses especially the factor of interracial cooperation in work not *for* but *with* the Negro, and the major role of the Negro secretary, William A. Hunton.

B. Historical: Early Missions

The Negro had scarcely become domiciled in America, when he met Christian teachers and evangelists—Anglican catechists, traveling Quaker ministers, and later the Baptist

and Methodist "exhorters." The evangelist soon encountered a fear that Christianizing the Negro would inevitably involve his freedom, and it became necessary to secure special legislation permitting the baptism of slaves.

Christians in Great Britain took a keen interest in conversion of the slaves. An early landmark in the movement is a pamphlet published in 1673 by the eminent Puritan Nonconformist minister, Richard Baxter. But Negro missions were not efficiently organized and supported until the chartering, in 1701, of the Anglican Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts. The Moravian Brethren organized their Negro mission in 1738. The Methodists and the great evangelist of the Awakening, George Whitefield, were concerned for the slaves.

Renewed zeal for Christianization stemmed from the awakening of 1799–1800, especially in the West. Led by the Methodists, it rapidly penetrated the South, especially South Carolina and Georgia, about 1830. The Presbyterians were not far behind, urged by Archibald Alexander and John H. Rice. Associations of planters promoted religious education, and Episcopalian bishops made earnest personal efforts in behalf of the Negro.

Obstacles to evangelism were almost fantastically difficult, and included the continual fresh importation of slaves before the abolition of the slave trade in 1808, and the constant dread of such insurrections as those in South Carolina and Virginia in 1822 and 1831. Northern Abolition apostles excited such intense dislike of outside missionaries that the South was practically sealed against them, and the Negro was condemned to illiteracy by laws (often laxly observed) forbidding teaching him to read.

After the Methodist Church split in 1844 because of disagreement over slavery, Southern churches began to evangelize the Negro in their own way. The panic passed, and the fifteen years after 1845 witnessed such intense activity that by

the outbreak of the War of Secession at least one-eighth of the Negroes were church members.

The Anglican colonial church set the example of organized education and evangelism, and one of the primary sources for an account of its efforts is Charles F. Pascoe's *Classified Digest of the Records of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts*, 1701–1892 (London, 1893). Contemporary Anglican views on Negro conversion are succinctly expressed by William Knox in his *Three Tracts Respecting the Conversion and Instruction of the Free Indians and Negro Slaves in the Colonies* (London, 1768; new ed., London, 1789). The S.P.G. accomplishment is adequately summarized by C. E. Pierre in a study based mainly on original records, "The Work of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts among the Negroes in the Colonies," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (Oct. 1916), pp. 349–360; and by Faith Vibert, a member of the S.P.G. staff, who had access to the MS reports of missionaries and teachers in the Society's office, in "The Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts: Its Work for the Negroes in North America before 1783," *ibid.*, Vol. 18, no. 2 (Apr. 1933), pp. 171–212. These emphasize the settled policy of the S.P.G. regarding the Negro, with the official backing of the bishops. Another useful summary, written from a sociological viewpoint, is Marcus W. Jernegan, "Slavery and Conversion in the American Colonies," in *American Historical Review*, Vol. 21, no. 3 (April 1916), pp. 504–527, also separately published, New York, 1916. This study considers the economic and social forces favoring or opposing conversion, and the indifference or hostility of masters who feared that conversion would imply religious, social, and political equality.

More than any other scholar, Frank J. Klingberg has enlarged appreciation of the religious effort, especially of the Anglican Church, to elevate the colonial Negro, in his *Anglican Humanitarianism in Colonial New York* (Philadelphia,

1940); in his *An Appraisal of the Negro in Colonial South Carolina* (Washington, D.C., 1941); and in two heavily documented essays in the *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church:* "The S.P.G. Program for Negroes in Colonial New York," Vol. 8, no. 4 (Dec. 1939), pp. 306–371, and "The African Immigrant in Colonial Pennsylvania and Delaware," *ibid.*, Vol. 11, no. 1 (Mar. 1942), pp. 126–153. All these works point clearly to the Society's civilizing mission, its amelioration of the relations between master and slave, and the fact of conversion as an obstacle to considering the Negro as mere property. The S.P.G. work started the drift of opinion toward freedom and civil rights, and made it possible for the Negro eventually to have his own churches and schools. Another Anglican scholar, Edgar Legare Pennington, explored a significant phase of Anglican work in *Thomas Bray's Associates and Their Work Among the Negroes* (Worcester, 1939, repr. from American Antiquarian Society, *Proceedings,* Oct. 1938). Appreciation of the contributions of humble individual laborers are Pennington's "The Reverend Francis LeJau's Work Among Indians and Negro Slaves," in *Journal of Southern History,* Vol. 1, no. 4 (Nov. 1935), pp. 442–458; and Richard I. Shelling's "William Sturgeon, Catechist to the Negroes of Philadelphia and Assistant Rector of Christ Church, 1747–1766," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 8, no. 4 (Dec. 1939), pp. 388–401. These men pioneered in devising methods of religious instruction, from which later teachers benefited.

Those methods prevailed in the Slave States in the early 19th century, but without the aim of ultimate freedom, because the Protestant churches came to accept slavery as an institution, and concerted their efforts to instruct the Negro within it. Many meetings and publications revealed the tendencies of such evangelism and teaching. The Reverend Charles Colcock Jones in *The Religious Instruction of the Ne-*

groes in the United States (Savannah, Ga., 1842) reviewed the methods and experiences of various churches, stressed their obligation to teach, answered the objections, and discussed the means and benefits of instruction. A most important source for comprehension of the Southern policy, after 1844, is *Proceedings of the Meeting in Charleston, S.C., May 13–15, 1845, on the Religious Instruction of the Negroes, together with the Report of the Committee, and the Address to the Public* (Charleston, S.C., 1845). An excellent example of the type of exhortation addressed to slave-owners is a sermon by the influential Reverend James H. Thornwell, on *The Rights and Duties of Masters* (Charleston, S.C., 1850), preached at the dedication of a church for Negroes. A standard text, used by "plantation missions" throughout the South, is A. F. Dickson's *Plantation Sermons for the Instruction of the Unlearned* (Charleston and Philadelphia, 1856), from which countless Negroes absorbed their knowledge of the Bible and Christianity. That slaves were instructed, despite laws and adverse public opinion, appears in *Memorials of a Southern Planter*, (Baltimore, 1887, 2nd ed.), by Mrs. Susan Dabney Smedes, who had herself taught slaves.

There are numerous general accounts of evangelism and instruction. Among the more scholarly ones are W. P. Harrison, ed., *The Gospel Among the Slaves, A Short Account of Missionary Operations Among the African Slaves of the Southern States* (Nashville, Tenn., 1893), written by a member of the M.E. Church South, but including other churches, with notes by pioneer preachers, memorials of Christian slaves, and testimonies of prominent freedmen concerning evangelization. Other insights into the work of denominations appear in Eugene Portlette Southall, "The Attitude of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, toward the Negro from 1844 to 1870," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 16, no. 4 (Oct. 1931), pp. 359–370; J. M. Carroll, *History of Texas Baptists* (Dallas, Tex., 1923); John Hope Franklin, "Negro Episco-

palians in Ante-Bellum North Carolina," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 13, no. 3 (Sept. 1944), pp. 216–234; and A. W. Ellerbee, "The Episcopal Church among the Slaves," in *American Church Review*, Vol. 7 (1855), pp. 429–437. These emphasize the genuine eagerness to Christianize the Negro, the promotion of plantation missions, and the evolution of methods that persisted into the Reconstruction period. The general results of the peculiar Southern type of approach may be studied in a documented work by Haven P. Perkins, "Religion for Slaves: Difficulties and Methods," in *Church History*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (Sept. 1941), pp. 228–245, confined mostly to the period 1830–1850, and pointing out the purpose of making religion the bulwark of a peculiar form of society, with the Bible and the catechism as the foundations of teaching. Two studies tracing Negro religious development in Virginia, and together covering the entire period from 1619 to the 20th century, are Joseph B. Earnest, *The Religious Development of the Negro in Virginia* (Charlottesville, Va., 1914), and Luther P. Jackson, "Religious Development of the Negro in Virginia from 1760 to 1860," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 16, no. 2 (April 1931), pp. 168–239. These call attention to emergence from ante-bellum oversight to independent striving, the latter especially indicating the rise of Negro churches in the cities, which were the leaders in progress after the Civil War.

C. Later Missions: Moving Toward Independence

The smoke had scarcely lifted from the Civil War battlefields, when missionaries began their ministry to the bewildered Southern Negro freedman. Largely in their hands lay the future of the Negro church, for the freedman and his former master were estranged. In the years 1865–1900 Negro religious leadership and denominationalism developed through evangelism, and through schools taught by religiously devoted white people. As control gradually shifted to Negro

hands, the churches experienced a growth perhaps unexampled in any other religious group in the nation.

The way for postwar missionaries had been prepared in 1846–1861 by the American Missionary Association. It was an anti-slavery organization, which encouraged unsegregated congregations, in opposition to the Southern Aid Society, founded in 1853 to cooperate with the slave-holders in evangelism. The work of the "A.M.A." is ably summarized by Fletcher M. Green, "Northern Missionary Activities in the South, 1846–1861," in *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 21, no. 2 (May 1955), pp. 147–172; also in Harlan Paul Douglass, *Christian Reconstruction in the South* (Boston and New York, 1909), based largely upon the archives of the "A.M.A."; and Augustus Field Beard, *A Crusade of Brotherhood, A History of the American Missionary Association* (New York, 1909). The Northern missionary's zeal was sometimes rivaled or even surpassed by Southern Protestant leaders, and one of the most eloquent appeals ever voiced for the Negro's religious freedom is Bishop Atticus G. Haygood's *Our Brother in Black: His Freedom and His Future* (New York, 1881). The astonishing transformation of the Negro church and religious expression, in a single generation, is reviewed in two works by Alrutheus A. Taylor, *The Negro in South Carolina during the Reconstruction* (Washington, D.C., 1924), and *The Negro in the Reconstruction of Virginia* (Washington, D.C., 1926). These expansions of articles, in the *Journal of Negro History* for July 1924 and July 1926, stress the development of independent Negro churches, the transition from emotional to instructional religion, and the training of Negro leaders. The prolonged discussion of the debated question of white *vs.* Negro leadership is succinctly summarized in a volume published by the Southern Society for the Promotion of the Study of Race Conditions and Problems in the South: *Race Problems of the South; Report of the Proceedings of the First Annual Conference at Montgomery, Ala.*, May 8–10, 1900 (Richmond, Va., 1900).

D. Negro Protestant Denominationalism

The question of leadership already had been rendered quite academic by the rise of Negro Protestant denominations. The trend toward independence became discernible in 1773, in the organization of a Baptist church at Silver Bluff, South Carolina. The Revolution accelerated the movement, and local independent churches sprang up between 1787 and 1810. Before 1860 Protestant policy generally comprehended the Negro in white denominations. But denominationalism was aided by the religious and moral argument against slavery, and the effort of Protestant churches to make an accommodation with the "peculiar institution." The movement quickened with the emergence of the race from slavery and the participation of Negro clerical leaders in Reconstruction politics. The separatist feeling was strongest in the churches that still comprise the vast majority of Negroes—the Methodist and the Baptist. It became obvious in the rapid rise of Negro Methodism after 1810, in the Northern and Border States, and its later division into denominations.

As Carter G. Woodson once pointed out, the study of Negro denominations often is hindered by the lack of adequate records. That is not true of the earliest one, the African Methodist Episcopal Church. It originated in Philadelphia in 1787–1814, in a desire to enjoy greater freedom and to escape humiliating discriminations. Organization was perfected in 1816, by a conference of societies in Pennsylvaina, New Jersey, Delaware, and Maryland, and the consecration of Richard Allen as a bishop. From the beginning the "A.M.E." has been highly literate, with well-educated leaders, and its historiography therefore is far more complete than that of most Negro denominations, comprising several competent general histories: Daniel A. Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Nashville, Tenn., 1891); John T. Jenifer, *Centennial Retrospect; History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Nashville, 1916); George A. Singleton,

The Romance of African Methodism, A Study of the African Methodist Episcopal Church (New York, 1951), with an extensive bibliography and biographies of preachers; L. L. Berry, *A Century of Missions of the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1840–1940* (New York, 1942); and Richard R. Wright, ed., and John R. Hawkins, *Centennial Encyclopedia of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1916), a factual review of the church's history and contemporary state, doctrines, laws, statistics, education, and past and present leaders, based largely upon original sources. This work is generally considered the best Negro church encyclopedia up to its time.

The second Negro denomination, the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church, originated in a congregation founded in New York City, 1796, by a group from the John Street M.E. Church, led by James Varick. The denomination derived its name (in 1848) from its first church, "Zion," built in 1800. It was formally organized in 1821, at a conference with societies in other states, and by the consecration of Varick as a bishop in 1822. The history of this group is quite adequately covered by John Jamison Moore, one of its bishops, in *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church* (York, Pa., 1884); by J. W. Hood, also a bishop, in *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church* (New York, 1895), which heavily accents the biographies of the bishops; and by David Henry Bradley, Sr., *A History of the A.M.E. Zion Church,* part 1, 1796–1872 (Nashville, 1956), with a good bibliography of primary sources, such as church magazines, journals, diaries, and minutes of conferences, and with stress upon this church's part in the battle for religious democracy.

Negro Methodism quickly evinced the besetting Protestant tendency toward repeated schisms, often stemming from relatively minor differences, and produced a number of smaller groups, such as the Colored Methodist Protestant Church (1840), the Union American Methodist Episcopal Church

(1813), the African Union Methodist Protestant Church (1866), the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church (1870), the Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Church (1869), the Reformed Methodist Union Episcopal Church (1884), and the Independent African Methodist Episcopal Church (1897). Representative accounts of these bodies that reveal the motives of separation are Daniel James Russell, *History of the African Union Methodist Protestant Church* (Philadelphia, 1920), and C. H. Phillips, *History of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church in America* (Jackson, Tenn., 1925, 3rd ed.). A general review of Negro Methodist bodies is found in U.S. Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, *Census of Religious Bodies, 1936*, "Methodist Bodies" (Bulletin no. 27, Washington, D.C., 1940), including nine groups.

Baptists, although by far the largest group of Negro denominations, were organized later than the Methodists. Because of their loose, democratic polity, they have had less sense of solidarity, and consequently less tendency to write general histories. Indeed, a comprehensive history of Negro Baptist churches would be a colossal task, rendered supremely difficult by the lack of early local church and association records. At first Negro Baptist churches belonged to white associations, but in the 1830's separate associations began to spring up in Northern States. Rapid growth in the South following the Civil War, with the help of sympathetic Northern friends, steadily impelled Negro Baptists toward large-scale organization. Their first national convention met in 1866, and in 1880 the present National Baptist Convention was formed in Montgomery, Ala. The American National Baptist Convention followed six years later at St. Louis, and in 1895 the National Baptist Convention of the U.S.A. was founded in Atlanta. Several other smaller conventions now exist. A general survey of the history, doctrines, organizations, and "works" of Negro Baptists appears in *Census of Religious Bodies, 1936*, "Baptist Bodies" (Bulletin no. 28, Washington,

D.C., 1940); also in *Year Book of American Churches*, 1956, under "Baptist Bodies."

The origins of independent Negro Baptist churches are studied in appreciations of two Negro preachers, who established the first Negro congregation in Savannah and set the pattern for innumerable others. These are John W. Davis's essay, "George Liele and Andrew Bryan, Pioneer Negro Baptist Preachers," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 3, no. 2 (Apr. 1918), pp. 119–127; James Meriles Simms, *The First Colored Baptist Church in North America, Constituted at Savannah, Georgia, January 20, A.D. 1788* (Philadelphia, 1888), with biographies of the pastors; and Edgar Garfield Thomas, *The First African Baptist Church of North America* (Savannah, Ga., 1925). General reviews of Negro Baptist history may be found in Walter H. Brooks, "The Evolution of the Negro Baptist Church," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 7, no. 1 (Jan. 1922), pp. 11–22, which emphasizes freedom and local democracy as a potent motive for growth; and Joseph Julius Jackson, *A Compendium of Historical Facts of the Early African Baptist Churches* (Bellefontaine, Ohio, 1922). The astounding accomplishments of the "Revival Period," from the Civil War to 1900, are reviewed in A. W. Pegues, *Our Baptist Ministers and Schools* (Springfield, Mass., 1892), a general survey of Negro Baptists, with biographies of 137 prominent ministers, and notices of 15 higher schools. Regional histories are scanty, and may be adequately described by two of the better examples: Benjamin Franklin Riley, *History of the Baptists in the Southern States East of the Mississippi* (Philadelphia, 1898), which has a section "Work among Negroes"; and General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, *Diamond Jubilee of the General Association* (Louisville, Ky., 1943).

The separatist movement did not influence all Negro church members, and a sizable minority has remained within the institutional framework of white denominations. One of

the largest groups is still within the Methodist Church (the Methodist Episcopal Church, previous to the merger of 1939). For this group there is a fairly extensive bibliography, including L. M. Hagood's *The Colored Man in the Methodist Episcopal Church* (New York and Cincinatti, 1901); Isaac L. Thomas, *Methodism and the Negro* (New York and Cincinnati, 1910); and Joseph C. Hartzell, "Methodism and the Negro in the United States," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (July 1923), pp. 301–315, which clarifies the complex history of divisions in Negro Methodism, and outlines philanthropic work after the Civil War, as well as the progress of education following the establishment of Wilberforce University in Ohio, 1855. The often acrimonious debate over the Negro's status in the union of the Methodist churches, North and South, is completely reviewed in Paul A. Carter's essay, "The Negro and Methodist Union," in *Church History*, Vol. 21, no. 1 (Mar. 1952), pp. 55–69, with remarks hinting that segregation was intended because of an obscuring of the historic crusading spirit of Methodism. A calmer view of the Negro's place in the united church is expressed in J. B. F. Shaw's *The Negro in the History of Methodism* (Nashville, Tenn., 1954), which deals with outstanding accomplishments and leaders, considers the Negro Methodist groups, and describes missionary work in Africa.

Lutheranism has made more progress among American Negroes than one might suppose, through the long-time efforts of an organized mission, whose accomplishments are described and assessed in N. J. Bakke, *Illustrated Historical Sketch of Our Colored Missions* (St. Louis, 1914), and Christopher F. Drewes, *Fifty Years of Lutheranism Among Our Colored People, A Jubilee Book* (St. Louis, 1927), both relating to the Missouri Synod missions. A comprehensive review of conservative Lutheran work among Negroes is the "Forty-Seventh Report of the Missionary Board for Negro Missions," 1954–1956, in *Proceedings of the Forty-Fourth Convention of the White Lutheran Synodical Conference of*

North America, December 4–7, 1956 (St. Louis, Mo., Concordia Publishing House, 1957), pp. 72–124. The efforts of the United Lutheran Church are represented by Ervin E. Krebs, *The Lutheran Church and the American Negro* (Columbus, Ohio, 1950), with a bibliography.

Presbyterianism in the South began Negro evangelization long before the Civil War, and in 1901 the Committee on Colored Evangelization of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S. (Southern) reviewed its efforts in *The Evangelization of the Colored Race in the United States; Report to the General Assembly of 1901* (Richmond, Va., 1901). Northern Presbyterian accomplishment from the beginning is summarized by Jesse Belmont Barber in his *A History of the Work of the Presbyterian Church among the Negroes in the United States of America* (New York, 1936), with a bibliography; and his *Climbing Jacob's Ladder* (New York, 1952), with a statistical appendix and a bibliography, showing the vast work of a white church not popularly identified with the Negro.

The Protestant Episcopal Church has never encouraged efforts to form a separate group for its Negro communicants. The difficult task of assembling the fragments of history from records of diocesan conventions and the General Convention was ably performed by George F. Bragg, Jr., a Baltimore priest, in *The History of the Afro-American Group of the Episcopal Church* (Baltimore, 1922), which contains biographies and a list of the Negro priests before 1866. A work of somewhat similar complexity was the research in records of Quaker meetings done by Henry J. Cadbury for "Negro Membership in the Society of Friends," in *Journal of Negro History,* Vol. 21, no. 2 (Apr. 1936), pp. 151–213, with many biographical notes on Negro members and ministers.

Minor Negro Denominations are a fascinating but still superficially explored subject, except the areas where they overlap the bewildering mass of cults. Interesting data on a few of them are contained in some of the monographs pub-

lished by the *Census of Religious Bodies*, 1936 (Washington, D.C., 1940), particularly "Apostolic Overcoming Holy Church of God" (Bulletin no. 29); "Church of God in Christ" (Bulletin no. 44); "Independent Negro Churches" (Bulletin no. 75); and "African Orthodox Church" (Bulletin no. 34). The latter is one among few of these groups that have published historical sketches, having commissioned its secretary, the Reverend Arthur C. Terry-Thompson to write *The History of the African Orthodox Church* (New York, 1956), since its founding in 1921.

The best comprehensive review of the development of Negro Protestantism is by Leonard L. Haynes, *The Negro Community within American Protestantism, 1619–1844* (Boston, 1953). Although limited to the formative period, it really describes the enduring features of the community, particularly the segregated church and both Negro and white reactions to it. This was the first thorough study of its kind, based on a sweeping examination of the literature, with an extensive classified bibliography, and is an indispensable work.

E. Catholicism and the Negro

The Roman Catholic Church promoted missions to the Negro in former Spanish and French possessions now included in the United States, such as Louisiana and Florida, and defended the ideal of spiritual equality of the slave within the Church. Catholic leaders of the early national period were interested in his religious and secular welfare, and in the 1820's the Church encouraged Negro schools under episcopal auspices. A general review of Roman Catholic concern for the Negro before the close of the Civil War is an essay by the Reverend Stephen L. Theobald, "Catholic Missionary Work among the Colored People of the United States (1776–1866)," in *American Catholic Historical Society Records*, Vol. 35 (1924–25), pp. 325–356. After the Civil War, evangelism expanded, supported by pronouncements of the Plenary Coun-

cils, and sustained by missionary associations and religious orders, particularly the Society of St. Joseph ("Josephites"). Negro civil rights found defenders in eminent members of the hierarchy, notably Cardinal Gibbons of Baltimore and Archbishop Ireland of St. Paul. The growing appeal to the Negro was brought to public attention especially about the time of World War I by the studies of a Josephite brother, Joseph Butsch: "Negro Catholics in the United States," in *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 3, no. 1 (Apr. 1917), pp. 33–51, and "Catholics and the Negro," in *Journal of Negro History,* Vol. 2, no. 4 (Oct. 1917), pp. 393–410. Another author in the field was Thomas F. Meehan, who contributed to Catholic magazines such articles as "Mission Work among Colored Catholics," in United States Catholic Historical Society, *Historical Records,* Vol. 8 (1915), pp. 116–128; and in *Catholic Mind,* Vol. 20 (Apr. 22, 1922), pp. 141–152.

A most reliable authority on the history and contemporary status of Negro Catholicism is the late Josephite Father, John T. Gillard, whose brochure, first published in 1934, was issued in a fourth edition in 1948 after his death, as *The Negro American, A Mission Investigation* (Cincinnati, 1948), published by the Catholic Students' Mission Crusade, under the supervision of the Josephite Fathers, with statistics brought up to date. The work gives a comprehensive picture of the various agencies working among Catholic Negroes, and discusses the factors aiding or retarding progress, with a well-documented survey of Negro Catholic history, and a bibliography. See also his *The Catholic Church and the American Negro* (Baltimore, 1929); and *Colored Catholics in the United States* (Baltimore, 1941). Jesuit missions are reviewed in Edward D. Reynolds, *Jesuits for the Negro* (New York, 1949), which also has an extensive list of references. Probably the most competent work of Negro Catholic historiography is Albert S. Foley (a "Josephite"), *God's Men of Color, The Colored Catholic Priests of the United States, 1854–1954* (New York, 1955), with a foreword by Archbishop Richard

J. Cushing of Boston, a promoter of Negro missions. This is an absorbing account of 72 priests who realized their vocations despite most discouraging obstacles, including the remarkable Bishop James Augustine Healy of Portland, Maine, and twelve college and seminary teachers. The work is critical of American overcaution in implementing the papal insistence upon training Negro clergy.

F. The Negro Preacher, Social Leader

Even while their race was yet living in slavery, intelligent Negroes rose to be religious leaders. It would be hard to exaggerate the role of the Negro minister as a social leader—indeed, for many years, practically the *only* one. Especially after Emancipation, the church became the clearing house of the Negro community, with the pastor as secretary. No longer appealing to the master for guidance, the freedman sought counsel from his minister. During the agonizing era of Reconstruction, some eminent ministers even became political guides of their people.

The minister's role appeared in Richard Allen, the first bishop of the "A.M.E." Church, whose life has been written by Charles H. Wesley, *Richard Allen: Apostle of Freedom* (Washington, D.C., 1935). Although not well written, this biography is based upon Allen's autobiography and published works, and reveals his part in the Free African Society, which took care of economic and social as well as religious interests. The importance of the Negro clerical leader as a statesman is clearly emphasized in J. Minton Batten's "Henry M. Turner, Negro Bishop Extraordinary," in *Church History*, Vol. 7, no. 3 (Sept. 1938), pp. 231–246, based on original sources. His sixty-four years of ministry in the "A.M.E." Church (1851–1915) spanned the most critical period in American Negro history, and helped the bewildered ex-slaves to adjust to the new environment of freedom, while contributing political leadership and definition of religious and social policies.

Of the same denomination was Theophilus Gould Steward, whose autobiography, *Fifty Years in the Gospel Ministry* (Philadelphia, 1922) illustrates not only his own efforts to uplift the freedman, but also the general emergence of his people into religious independence, and affords insights into the characters and contributions of other eminent churchmen of the Reconstruction and Revival period, 1864–1914.

Other Negro denominations also produced remarkable leaders, such as Bishop Isaac Lane of the "C.M.E." Church, who published his *Autobiography . . . with a Short History of the C.M.E. Church in America and of Methodism* (Nashville, 1916). One of his contemporaries in the "C.M.E." episcopate, Charles Henry Phillips, also wrote an autobiography, *From the Farm to the Bishopric* (Nashville, 1932), a record of a rather typical Negro upbringing, conversion, education, ministry, and efforts to achieve recognition of the Negro as a man, during the critical era of adjustment to freedom. General appreciations of the Negro ministry include two documented studies: *The Negro Baptist Ministry; an Analysis of its Profession, Preparation, and Practices* (Philadelphia, 1951), being a report written by Ira De A. Reid, of a survey conducted by the Joint Survey Commission of the Baptist Interconvention Committee, representing the American Baptist, National Baptist, and Southern Baptist Conventions. More intimate and personal and far more colorful is Ralph Almon Felton's *Go Down, Moses; a Study of 21 Successful Negro Rural Pastors* (Madison, N.J., 1952), written for the Department of the Rural Church of Drew (Methodist) Seminary.

Negro ministers figure rather prominently in general biographical works, such as John W. Cromwell, *The Negro in American History, Men and Women Eminent in the Evolution of the Americans of African Descent* (Washington, D.C., 1914). The modern urban pastor appears in a sketch, "A City Pastor, William Lloyd Imes," in Mary Jenness, *Twelve Negro Americans* (New York, 1936). Benjamin Brawley's *Negro*

Builders and Heroes (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1937) includes thirty leaders in several denominations from the late 18th century to the 1930's. A similar work is Rebecca Chalmers Barton, *Witnesses for Freedom; Negro Americans in Autobiography* (New York, 1948), with a foreword by the late Alain Locke, and a bibliography.

G. Religion and Education

Even in colonial times, churches tried to compensate for the willful secular neglect of Negro education. They never abandoned their ideal, in spite of hostile pressures, especially in the slaveholding Southern States. After Emancipation they vastly increased their enterprise, to meet the challenge of introducing the ex-slave and his children to the opportunities of freedom. Their missionary associations and denominational administrations founded schools of higher learning. These followed the general pattern of other colleges and universities, and of the first such Negro institution, Wilberforce University in Ohio, founded in 1855. The religious schools helped in adapting the Negro to his environment, inculcated racial pride, developed leadership, became centers of independent thought, and were a leavening influence in exertions for social reconstruction and reform.

The best summation of pre-Civil War enterprise in Negro education is still Carter G. Woodson's *The Education of the Negro Prior to 1861* (New York and London, 1915), with an excellent bibliography, many references to ecclesiastical efforts, including Sunday Schools, based upon church histories and sermons, denominational reports, and writings of religious leaders; and a documentary appendix selected largely from religious sources. Because of his primary role in leadership, the training of the Negro minister long had a dominant influence in higher educational thinking. A determined effort to estimate and heighten its efficiency was undertaken in 1921 under direction of the Institute of Social and Religious re-

search, at the request of religious and Negro educational agencies. The results appeared in William A. Daniel, ed., *The Education of Negro Ministers* (New York, 1925), with a sketch of the origins, development, and problems of theological schools, and an estimate of their students. Shortly after the appearance of this study, Rufus E. Clement attempted to assess the over-all influence of the church school in his essay, "The Church School as a Factor in Negro Life," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 12, no. 1 (Jan. 1927), pp. 5–12, which reveals the striking fact that more than ⅝ of Negro college students were in church schools. An extremely detailed, official appraisal of Negro schools is that of the Department of the Interior, Bureau of Education, *Negro Education, A Study of the Private and Higher Schools for Colored People in the United States* (Washington, D.C., 1917, 2 vols.), prepared in cooperation with the Phelps-Stokes Fund under the direction of Thomas Jesse Jones, and including church schools. A recent sociological survey, including church schools, is by Horace Mann Bond, *The Education of the Negro in the American Social Order* (New York, 1934).

Typical accounts of denominational efforts and accomplishments are Jay S. Stowell's *Methodist Adventures in Negro Education* (New York and Cincinnati, 1922); and Robert W. Patton, *An Inspiring Record in Negro Education; Historical Summary of the Work of the American Church Institute for Negroes* (New York, 1940), an address before the National Council of the Protestant Episcopal Church. The growth of Roman Catholic concern for an educated Negro laity is indicated by Richard J. Roche's massively documented study, *Catholic Colleges and the Negro Student* (Washington, D.C., 1948), under the auspices of the *Catholic University of America Studies in Sociology*. Based upon questionnaires sent to the institutions, this reviews their policies in the light of the Catholic view of race relations, and with an implied desirability of equal opportunity. A review of local Roman Catholic efforts, from the historical angle, is Michael Francis Rouse,

A Study of the Development of Negro Education under Catholic Auspices in Maryland and the District of Columbia (Baltimore, 1935), by a Xaverian Brother long devoted to education.

Doubts of the efficacy of religious instruction in Negro higher schools inspired the survey made by David H. Sims in his "Religious Education in Negro Colleges and Universities," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 5, no. 2 (Apr. 1920), pp. 166–208, which presents a rather severely critical view of the inadequacy of traditional methods and teachers, but sees hope in the almost universal recognition of the religious motive in efficient education, and in the growing number of trained teachers. A more encouraging and recent estimate is in Richard I. McKinney, *Religion in Higher Education among Negroes* (New Haven and London, 1945), the first such comprehensive study, considering the Negro social background and the current secularizing of life in their effect upon religious policies and programs, and perceiving a crescent interest in the function of religion among administrators and faculty members.

H. The City Church and Its Problems

Increased awareness of the school's obligation, to interpret religion to youth in terms of his adjustment to life, is timely in view of a startling phenomenon in contemporary Negro society. For half a century the traditionally rural and small-town Negro has been moving to the city, and has been compelled to adjust his religion to that fact. He has experienced the problem that confronted the white churchman (especially the immigrant) at an earlier date, with the rise of industrialism and urban life.

Even before the Civil War Negroes began to move cityward, and the large cities had thriving churches composed of free Negroes, including fugitives from slavery. The first Negro denominations—the A.M.E. and A.M.E. Zion

Churches—began in Philadelphia and New York. Many freedman migrated northward after the Civil War, and by 1890 the Negro city church was an important institution. Its social ministry was indicated by its relief work during the depression of 1893, which answered the growing criticism of its social ineffectiveness. One of the earliest studies of the urban Negro, including his religion, is by W. E. Burghardt DuBois, *The Philadelphia Negro, A Social Study* (Philadelphia, 1899), based upon prolonged and detailed investigation. Migration to industrial centers, stimulated by World War I and continuing even in the depressed 1930's, challenged city churches to minister to the newcomers. The profound shock administered to the Negro church and clergy by World War I is clearly appreciated by Miles Mark Fisher in "The Negro Church and the World-War," *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 5, no. 5 (Sept. 1925), pp. 483–499. Wide study of recent Negro literature revealed to the author a new interest in social and political problems, a broader idea of the church's function, a new racial consciousness in religious life, and growing cooperation between Negro and white and among Negro churches. Social displacement brought insecurity, and often turned the Negro to his traditional churches, or to the increasing number of store-front churches and "cults."

In the 1920's more students of Negro life began seriously to study the city churches. Notable results include an essay by George E. Stevens, "The Negro Church in the City," in *The Missionary Review*, Vol. 49 (June 1926), pp. 435–439, a discussion of the problems facing the urban Negro in a period of heavy migration to cities, and an illustration of the Negro churches' contributions to the city's welfare. About the same time a special survey staff, directed by the Detroit Bureau of Governmental Research, prepared for the Mayor's Inter-racial Committee a massive study, *The Negro in Detroit* (Detroit, 1926, 12 vols., typewritten but not printed), of which Vol. x is a study of "The Negro and the Church." A similar study, *New Haven Negroes, a Social History* (New Haven and

London, 1940), with bibliographical footnotes, was made by the Yale University Institute of Human Relations, and includes observations on the churches.

The most exhaustive examinations of city churches naturally concerns the nation's largest Negro communities, in New York City and Chicago. Somewhat dated but still valuable is one published by the Greater New York Federation of Churches, *The Negro Churches of Manhattan* (New York, 1930). Perhaps the most comprehensive study ever made is that by Robert Sutherland, *Analysis of the Negro Church in Chicago* (Chicago, 1928). This provided the basis for a survey made in 1938 by the Work Projects Administration superintended by Horace R. Cayton, St. Clair Drake, ed., *Churches and Voluntary Associations in the Chicago Negro Community* (Chicago, December 1940, mimeographed from typewritten copy). This heavily factual account considers the background of the pre-urban period, the Negro's "institutional heritage," economic factors conditioning the churches and their role in Negro social life, the ministry of churches to newcomers, the increase of sects and store-front churches, the problems of white churches becoming Negro, the whole being based largely upon a statistical analysis of 475 churches and their social functions, with a comparison to 1928. Drake and Cayton later collaborated in the admirable sociological study of Chicago's Negroes, *Black Metropolis, A Study of Negro Life in a Northern City* (New York, 1945), with an introduction by Richard Wright, and an observation of churches focusing on the different religious behavior of various social classes.

I. Religion and Segregation

Social stratification among Negro congregations parallels the same phenomenon in white churches. It is part of the general prevalence of class-consciousness in religion, which assigns the Negro church generally to a segregated position. The vast migration of Negroes to Northern cities has made

the problem especially acute. The customary reaction of the white Protestant church to the oncoming "black tide" is to retreat to a higher level of the beach, often in the suburbs. Scarcely ever is an interracial solution considered as practical, or desirable.

During the "migratory period," 1919–30, the Protestant churches gradually became sensitive to the vast difference between their professed belief about Christian brotherhood, and their actual practice when the Negro appeared. They eased their collective conscience by contributions to Negro health and education. And their Commission on Interracial Cooperation was inspired and led by devout men, who spoke out sincerely against lynching, denials of civil and political rights, and other evils in race relations.

But the basic problem has remained unsolved, and has inspired a growing number of thoughtful and critical studies. The practice of a single denomination is ably expounded in Dwight Wendell Culver's *Negro Segregation in the Methodist Church* (New Haven, 1953, Yale Studies in Religious Education, no. 22, with a comprehensive bibliography). A predominantly hopeful view for realization of the Christian ideal is voiced by Robert Moats Miller in "The Attitudes of American Protestantism Toward the Negro, 1919–1939," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 41, no. 3 (July 1956), pp. 215–240. While pointing to the almost universal practice of segregation, the author presents many examples of church efforts in behalf of social justice, particularly by the Federal Council of Churches, and reviews the policies of various denominations, commending the liberalism of Northern Methodists, Baptists and Congregationalists. A far less optimistic view is expressed by Frank S. Loescher's *The Protestant Church and the Negro* (Philadelphia, 1948), which has been called "unpleasant reading for those who love the church," for it concludes that the church has accepted segregation, and that the often liberal pronouncements of national bodies have not penetrated the mass of members or deeply influenced

local practices, in church or school, but expresses confidence that the sensitive minority will win. A still more challenging study, by a Southerner, is W. D. Weatherford's *American Churches and the Negro, An Historical Study from Early Slave Days to the Present* (Boston, 1957). The author, a trustee of Berea College, declares that 11:00 a.m. on Sunday is "the most segregated hour on the weekly calendar of American life," that Southern Protestant churches are more exclusive than before the Civil War, and that the churches are lagging behind the state respecting segregation; but he also presents facts on efforts of major denominations to express concern for Negro religious life.

Roman Catholic efforts to surmount the secular and religious barriers between the races are closely studied, estimated, and criticized in Thomas J. Harte, *Catholic Organizations Promoting Negro-White Race Relations in the United States* (Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C., 1947), with very comprehensive bibliographical notes. This primary attempt to make anything like a complete study analyzes the ideas, organizations, areas of action, and techniques of five types of voluntary and non-authoritative race-relations agencies, which have rejected the idea of race assimilation, and conceive adjustment as achievable by a peaceful, indirect, and long-range educational process, and emphasize the role of teaching as the force in social change, through the efforts of the lay apostolate. (See also Part Three, sect. III, C, *The Church and the Race Problem.*)

J. Negro Cults: Messianism

Growing differences in economic status, education, and "respectability" (among city Negroes especially) have reproduced the familiar marked social stratification of the white churches. Conservatism and security in the older, established denominations, and the social displacement of poorer newcomers, favor a proliferation of cults, outside and sometimes

opposed to traditional religious expressions. Many of them, significantly, first appeared or became prominent in the economic depression of the 1930's. To a large extent they were social "distress signals," assuming religious and emotional rather than political manifestations. Their more obvious and colorful features, and the frequently eccentric behavior of their leaders and devotees, have furnished ample material to sensational reporting. But to the informed student of sociology and religious psychology they represent an age-old messianic religious element that always appears among the lowly and the neglected, especially in times of distress. To the objective and yet compassionate observer they are witnesses to the failure of institutional religion to cope successfully with unhappy and troublesome segments of society.

Serious study of the cults began in the 1930's, probably in part because of the notoriety of the "Father Divine" movement. Although it has been criticized by Negro reviewers as drawing too sweeping conclusions from a narrow field of observation, one of the significant studies is Raymond J. Jones, *A Comparative Study of Religious Cult Behavior among Negroes with Special Reference to Emotional Group Conditioning Factors* (Washington, D.C., 1939). It considers thirteen cults in New York and Washington from anthropological, economic, and psychoanalytic viewpoints, and concludes that the high incidence of cult religion among Negroes is an expression of their condition rather than of "inherent religiousness" or racial traits. The volume has a bibliography, and a classified directory of Negro cults in the United States. The same general conclusion appears in Arthur Huff Fauset, *Black Gods of the Metropolis: Negro Religious Cults of the Urban North* (Philadelphia and London, 1944), based upon two years of study of five cults in Philadelphia, interviews with teachers and leaders, and visits to places of worship and homes of members. He rejects the thesis that the cults represent African religious survivals, while holding that they satisfy emotional and social longings not regarded by orthodox

churches. Critical opinion notes the failure to compare with similar white cults and with Negro cults elsewhere, as in the West Indies.

By far the most publicized Negro cult is the "Father Divine" movement, probably because it has attracted white as well as Negro adherents, and had certain political implications. The interracial feature is noted in a discussion of this cult in Marcus Bach's *They Have Found a Faith* (Indianapolis, 1946). John Hoshor in *God in a Rolls Royce, The Rise of Father Divine, Madman, Menace, or Messiah* (New York, 1936) emphasizes the appeal to those seeking social fulfillment and to people of various social classes and (apparent) degrees of intelligence, and Divine's evident intent to break down segregation and achieve complete freedom for the Negro. A less sensational and far more sympathetic approach is Robert Allerton Parker's *The Incredible Messiah, The Deification of Father Divine* (George Baker) (Boston, 1937), written with the aid of some of Divine's followers, not as a biography but as a study of "the creation of a man-god of many imaginations," an exponent of social-religious messianism, a distress signal; with reference to similar and much older American movements, including the Shakers, to whom Divine likened his group, which is essentially a protest movement against social injustice and racial prejudice. Sara Harris and Harriet Crittenden, *Father Divine: Holy Husband* (New York, 1953) is a highly readable account stemming from two years of research in the growth and various aspects of this cult, and is notable especially for its analysis of the motives of middle- and upper-class whites in the movement.

K. Negro Religious Expression

Although some folk beliefs and customs undoubtedly survived, African religion mostly disappeared from the consciousness of the early American Negro. It was supplanted by

a primitive Biblical Christianity, with an "otherworldly" coloring derived in part from the lack of secular satisfactions. Religious concepts and practices reflected the unique experience and outlook of a race transplanted into another cultural and religious environment under the conditions of servitude. Later, religious expression reflected varying levels of education and social status, especially in the cities. Traditional religion has been modified by cultural ascension, adjustments to modern living, and stimulating contacts with other groups and new ideas. Members become dissatisfied in traditional Protestant churches and become Roman Catholics or cultists, or even yield to secularism and become indifferent or hostile to religion.

Until recently, especially in the rural South, the Negro relied heavily upon his church and his minister for effective organization of life and for counsel. This is no longer so true, as he can turn to intelligent secular leaders. Recent decades have seen emerging differences between younger educated people and adherents of "that old-time religion." The Negro church confronts the problem of straying youth, and has been compelled to meet it effectively by revising the method and content of its teaching.

A generalized review of Negro religious expression is Bishop L. W. Kyles' "The Contribution of the Negro to the Religious Life of America," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 11 (Jan. 1926), pp. 8–16, an address delivered in September 1925, at the celebration of the tenth anniversary of the Association for the Study of Negro Life and History. This eloquent summary emphasizes the interaction of influences between white and Negro churches. There are few good studies of Negro religious spirituality before Emancipation, but this controversial subject is skillfully handled in a documented essay by Gold Refined Wilson, "The Religion of the American Negro Slave: His Attitude Toward Life and Death," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 8, no. 1 (Jan. 1923), pp. 41–71, defending the thesis that African

religion faded and that the Negro became a new type of primitive Christian; with many references to literature on slavery, scientific studies, stories of slaves, and spirituals. This fact became evident when Northerners came into contact with Negro refugees and freedmen during the Civil War and discovered a new world of religious experience. The impact upon a sensitive and observant mind is seen in Charles A. Raymond's series of essays in *Harper's Magazine*, Vol. 27 (Sept., Oct., Nov. 1863), pp. 479–488, 676–682, 816–825. These were written from the experience of fourteen years of daily contacts with slaves, and include observations upon the importance of the Negro deacon as a link between Negro members and their white associates, portraits of Negro city and country pastors, and notes on devotional singing, church government and meetings, "experience meetings," Negro religious concepts, African inheritances, and peculiar religious experiences of men and women. A modern study, with the same general observations, is Elmer Talmage Clark, *The Negro and His Religion* (Nashville and Dallas, 1924, in "Homeland Series," no. 2).

Probably no aspect of Negro religion is more subject to controversy than that of the proportion of primitive African and white Christian elements in beliefs and practices. One of the first studies of the subject, which provoked heated disagreement, is Newbell N. Puckett, *Folk Beliefs of the Southern Negro* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1926), essentially a study of acculturation, based upon several thousand specific beliefs collected by travel and interviews, emphasizing the African background. It is criticized by some Negro scholars as lacking real study of the Negro background in Africa and the West Indies, and ignoring the fact of extensive borrowings from the American white man. A later and more scientific study by the same author, which modifies the first, is "Religious Folk-Beliefs of Whites and Negroes," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 16, no. 1 (Jan. 1931), pp. 9–35, derived from many examples and touching upon the difference

between folk and formally creedal beliefs. The religious folkways, including spirituals, are mostly of European origin, and are rapidly disappearing because of educational progress.

Fundamental to the old-time Negro religion was the crisis of conversion. Yet there are few really perceptive and sympathetic perceptions of its real meaning. As the old type of Negro is passing, there may never be anything better than *God Struck Me Dead, Religious Conversion Experiences and Autobiographies of Negro Ex-Slaves* (Social Science Source Documents, no. 2, Fisk University, Nashville, 1945, mimeographed). Fifty conversion experiences and six autobiographies illustrate the thesis that the crises, permeated with Christian doctrine, reveal the power of religious ecstacy to integrate the individual into his world, and to empower the Negro to make the transition from slavery to nominal freedom without demoralization and failure to enjoy life, and to receive assurance of acceptance rather than mere knowledge of a formal creed. The role of the sermon is presented by William H. Pipes in *Say Amen, Brother! Old-Time Negro Preaching: A Study in American Frustration* (New York, 1951), with an annotated bibliography. Recording and analysis of sermons in Macon County, Ga. supplied a realistic even if narrow field of study, and are used to fortify the idea that the Negro church was partly the result of African survivals and unique emotional characteristics. The position is doubtful, but the work is valuable for its observations on the origin and development of the Negro minister, his style of preaching, and the relation of the church and the minister to democratic social ideals and rural Negro institutions.

An analysis of the "old-time" religion in a local setting appears in Glenn N. Sisk, "Negro Churches in the Alabama Black Belt, 1875–1917," in *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, Vol. 33, no. 2 (June 1955), pp. 87–92. In a depressed and predominantly Negro region, religion was primarily emotional rather than ethical or related to daily living, but still hopeful and happy, with the humble church as a social

center. The story of growth after the Civil War features separate organization with services patterned after white churches, emergence of seminaries and trained ministers, and the survival of camp meetings and revivals. Very comprehensive and quite depressing is the picture in Harry VanBuren Richardson's *Dark Glory, A Picture of the Church among Negroes in the Rural South* (New York, 1947), with a bibliography. The first study devoted wholly to the Negro rural church, as seen in heavily Negro counties in four states, this laments "a great institution deserted by its leading minds," and weighed down by inadequate buildings, bad organization, inefficient methods, poorly trained preachers, lack of social vision and appeal to youth, and bled by migration and poverty; but with bright exceptions under really capable leaders.

A decline in the Southern rural type of religion is noted in two studies by Ruby Funchess Johnston: *The Development of Negro Religion* (New York, 1954), and *The Religion of Negro Protestants, Changing Religious Attitudes and Practices* (New York, 1956). Both note a lessening influence of Negro churches generally, but slower than among the whites. The first analyzes beliefs and worship in Boston and South Carolina churches only, and without comparing earlier periods. The second, a definitely better work, considers the factors in the decline of traditional religion, changing goals and programs with cultural modifications, religious attitudes, expressions and ideas, emotionalism, integration of the church into the community, the rise of sects and cults due to dissatisfaction, and the need of more relation of religion to life.

The effects of these trends upon youth, at once both discouraging and hopeful, are explored in three studies written during the period of increasing urbanism and of social and religious stress. Charles H. Wesley, "The Religious Attitudes of Negro Youth," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 21, no. 4 (Oct. 1936), pp. 376–393, notes that in Baltimore, Md., and Nansemond County, Va., high school and college students were still not appreciably "modernist," but were beginning to

demand a practical Christianity and to forsake tradition because of illiberal attitudes toward innocent amusements, and lack of intelligent ministry to them. A few years later E. Franklin Frazier, in his *Negro Youth at the Crossways, Their Personality Development in the Middle States* (Washington, D.C., 1940) noted social cleavages in the churches, and growth of doubt among lower-class youth, respecting the sincerity of religion and the value of the church, contempt for "old-time religion," and resentment of lack of social vision, but response to adequate efforts to meet young people halfway. Similar observations confirm these conclusions, in a study of 2,200 youths by Charles S. Johnson, *Growing up in the Black Belt, Negro Youth in the Black Belt, Prepared for the American Youth Commission* (Washington, D.C., 1941), which notes the conflict between interests of the older and younger generations, and a greater respect for the ministry in non-plantation churches with more provision for basic needs of youth. (See also Part Four, RELIGION AND THE ARTS, sect. IV, F, *Negro Spirituals;* and RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. IX, *Negro Religious Literature.*)

VII. MOVEMENTS TOWARD UNITY

THERE are some 250 Protestant denominations in the United States. Divisiveness has characterized their development throughout, and sectarian competition often has been extremely bitter. Within the past half-century, however, movements in the direction of unity have gained momentum, and older theological and national divergences have become less meaningful. Several significant unions have been achieved, notably the reunion of three branches of Methodism. Other similar combinations of formerly competing groups are in prospect.

Of greatest importance is the centripetal tendency represented by the National Council of Churches of Christ in America, in which most of the major Protestant denomina-

tions have cooperated, in social action and other projects in which theological differences do not weigh heavily. Beyond the Federal (now National) Council, the Ecumenical Movement has become a major enterprise of American Protestantism. Its advocates have produced a voluminous literature to advance their ideal.

A. Early American Movements

John Rudolf Weinlick, *Count Zinzendorf* (Nashville, 1956), with bibliographical footnotes, in ch. 16 has a passage on his work for church union, "the compelling reason" for his coming to America. He took part in the Pennsylvania synods (1742), being the dominant figure in the first seven, including representatives of several religious groups. His influence appears in Gilbert Tennent, *Irenicum Ecclesiasticum; or, A Humble Impartial Essay upon the Peace of Jerusalem* (Philadelphia, 1749). Tennent's thought about Christian union was considerably affected by the Moravians, through his meeting with Zinzendorf, who promoted the ideal of union in America. J. M. Mason, *A Plea for Sacramental Communion on Catholick Principles* (New York, 1816) tries to prove, from historical facts, that such communion always has been agreeable to the faith and practice of the Church. He notes recent relaxation of sectarian rigor in several denominations, due to influence of the Bible and missionary societies. Samuel Simon Schmucker, *Appeal to the American Churches, with a Plan for Catholic Union* (New York, 1838), addressed to all American denominations, appeals for an end to strife and a union of energies to convert the world, also for discussion of union.

No group promoted the ideal of Christian unity more energetically than the leaders of the Christians or Disciples of Christ, particularly Alexander Campbell, in his *The Christian System in Reference to the Union of Christians and the Restoration of Primitive Christianity* (Cincinnati, 1835).

Campbell, one of the founders of this group, was also a pioneer advocate of unity. William Garrett West, *Barton Warren Stone: Early American Advocate of Christian Unity* (Nashville, 1954) is a biography of one of the founders of the Disciples, who became an ardent ecumenist, in reaction against rigid Calvinist orthodoxy, and was in sympathy with contemporary liberalism. He was influenced by the Great Awakening, Methodism, New Light Presbyterianism, and the Great Western Revival—all sect-transcending, interested in souls, not strict doctrine. Peter Ainslie, *The Message of the Disciples for the Union of the Church* (New York, 1913) is by one of the greatest ecumenical advocates, who wrote very extensively on the subject. These lectures, delivered at the Yale Divinity School, clearly state the Disciples' position, and are essential in any collection of works on the American ecumenical movement. Howard E. Short, *Christian Unity is Our Business, Disciples of Christ Within the Ecumenical Fellowship* (St. Louis, 1953), with bibliography, is the most important present-day work on the subject circulated among the Disciples, and has had a great influence.

Charles A. Young, ed., *Historical Documents Advocating Christian Union, Epoch-Making Statements by Leaders Among the Disciples of Christ for the Restoration of the Christianity of the New Testament* (Chicago, 1904) contains many of their important utterances on unity. Winfred E. Garrison, *Christian Unity and Disciples of Christ* (St. Louis, 1955) presents a historical study, with an extensive list of the books produced by the Disciples movement on the subject of a united Christian Church.

B. Federal and National Councils

Inter-Church Conference on Federation, New York, November 15–21, 1905: *Church Federation*, ed. Elias B. Sanford (New York and Chicago, 1906) briefly sketches the unity movement since the organization of an American branch

of the Evangelical Alliance, 1867. This conference marked a new era in the history of American Christianity. The volume is essentially a documentary source-book on the beginnings of the Federal Council of Churches. Elias B. Sanford, *Origin and History of the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America* (Hartford, 1916), with an appendix of documents, was written by a long-time official of the Council, thoroughly versed in movements that led up to it. He reviews the history of the first eight years, as reflected in the literature that he gathered as secretary of organizations interested in Christian unity and church federation. John Hutchinson, *We Are Not Divided* (New York, 1941) offers an account of the origins and early years of the Federal Council, a form of rapprochement between denominations for cooperation in the pursuit of common interests. Carl Curtis McIntire, *Twentieth Century Reformation* (Collingswood, N.J., 1944), with bibliographical references, "Presents the real issues involved in the movements which gave rise to the organization of the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America and the American Council of Christian Churches" (Fundamentalist). National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America: *Christian Faith in Action, Commemorative Volume* (1951) outlines the founding of the Council, with the constitution, and the proceedings of the constituent convention, Cleveland, Nov. 28–Dec. 1, 1950.

Alfred Williams Anthony, "The New Interdenominationalism," *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 20, no. 4 (Oct. 1916), pp. 494–516, reviews three directions of centralizing tendencies since 1906: interdenominational voluntary organizations for common tasks; consultative interdenominational bodies; and a tendency to draw churches together in unity. Peril is seen in superorganization, a loss of spirit in forms, dissipation of responsibility in officialism. Charles S. MacFarland, "The Progress of Federation among the Churches," *ibid.*, Vol. 21, no. 3 (July 1917), pp. 392–410, considers the Christian Unity Foundation and the proposed Conference on

Faith and Order, and stresses "Christian unity at work." The Federal Council is regarded as an example of unity without uniformity, diversity without divisiveness, genuine cooperation without regard to the ultimate results to the individual churches. George Cross, "Federation of the Christian Churches in America—An Interpretation," *ibid.*, Vol. 23, no. 2 (Apr. 1919), pp. 129–145, declares that the Council represents the principle of the age—the passing of divisiveness and provincialism—and reviews work undertaken and contemplated. The aim is "to make the whole community feel the impact of the Christian conscience," through local federations and encouraging already existing non- and inter-denominational organizations.

Archer Bryan Bass, *Protestantism in the United States* (New York, 1929), with bibliography, sketches the European background of the origin and development of Protestant denominationalism, the rise of denominations, and reasons for separation, and considers the progress and problems of inter-denominationalism. An example of local cooperation is closely studied in Frank Arthur Sharp, "The Development of Protestant Cooperation in Allegheny County, Pennsylvania" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1948; abstract published in the *University of Pittsburgh Bulletin*, Vol. 45, no. 8, June 5, 1949). He recounts the work of several agencies now combined in a local Council of Churches, outlines major emphases in programs, factors, and needs stimulating cooperation, and the emergence of a congregational rather than connectional type of polity in cooperation: mutual agreement rather than official pronouncement.

C. Denominational Unions and Federations

Harlan Paul Douglass, *Church Unity Movements in the United States* (New York, 1934) is solidly founded upon evidence contributed by more than 20,000 persons, and reveals wide agreement on the value and timeliness of current dis-

cussions of union, and the recent development of agencies to deal with the matter. "No period of American religious history has seen concern over the divisions of the church coming to the point of effecting actual ecclesiastical changes as have the last two decades." This study explains why, by exploring the mind of the rank and file. Peter G. Mode, "Aims and Methods of Contemporary Church-Union Movements in America," *American Journal of Theology,* Vol. 24, no. 2 (Apr. 1920), pp. 224–251, reviews unity movements in the nineteenth century, since the Presbyterian-Congregational Plan of Union, 1801, the history of the Federal Council since 1905, cooperative movements in missions, city federations, the purposes and working of the Federal Council, and its enlarging field.

William E. Gilroy, "Church Union in Canada and in the United States," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 6, no. 3 (Summer, 1937), pp. 392–405, emphasizes slow progress in the United States in contrast to Canada, because religion in this country has been characterized by individualism and separatism. Union in the United States lacks the solidity, organized intensity, and dominating psychology of the Canadian movement, and has been predominantly sentimental and emotional. The trend is toward federation more than toward union, but there is much practical cooperation without union. Factors in the slow rate of progress are perceived in Charles Harold Dodd, G. R. Cragg, and Jacques Ellul, *Social and Cultural Factors in Church Divisions,* with a preface by Oliver Tomkins and the report of a conference held at the Ecumenical Institute at Bossey in November 1951 (New York, 1952).

George Lease Glauner, "A History of the Movements to Unite the Methodist Episcopal Church and the Methodist Episcopal Church, South" (Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University, 1935, typewritten and abstract) illustrates the difficulty of reconciliation. The victory of ecumenicity is recorded in John Monroe Moore, *The Long Road to Methodist Union,* with Forewords by Edwin Holt Hughes [and]

James H. Straughn (New York, 1943). Paul S. Sanders, "The Possibility of Methodist and Episcopal Union," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 17, no. 4 (Autumn, 1948), pp. 579–596, with bibliography in footnotes, studies the issues involved in forming a complete union of two great communions, offering special values to the ecumenical movement. The author traces the proposals since 1791, and assesses the advantages from fusion of evangelical passion and institutional stability.

Wayne H. Christy, "The United Presbyterian Church and Church Union" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1947) studies previous negotiations for union, and thirteen efforts for union with other churches, 1858–1946, and shows theological and nontheological barriers to union, in the hope of churches avoiding them in the future. The problems and negotiations are described in Presbyterian Church in the U.S., General Assembly, 1954: *Statement on Issues Concerning Presbyterian Union, by the Special Committee of the General Assembly, 1954* (n.p., 1954), a presentation of the attitude of Southern Presbyterianism. The United Presbyterian Church and the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A. have now been amalgamated, but the Southern branch still is independent. William Fullerton Parker, "A Historical Analysis of the Proposed Union of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America and the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America" (Th.M. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1947), with bibliography, explores the difficulty of uniting churches with diverse concepts of ecclesiastical polity.

Lucien C. Warner, "Proposed Union of the Congregational, United Brethren, and Methodist Protestant Churches," *Bibliotheca Sacra,* Vol. 63, no. 250 (Apr. 1906), pp. 264–276, foretells the uniting of the Methodist Protestant Church with the Methodist Episcopal Church and the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. The Congregationalists united with the Evangelical and Reformed Church, one element of which had previously attempted union, as appears in Donald

Herbert Yoder, "Church Union Efforts of the Reformed Church in the United States to 1934" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, originally B.D. thesis, "Interdenominational Contacts of the German Reformed Church, 1800–1850," 1945). Calvin Flessner Schmid, "A Study of the Efforts to Unite the Congregational Christian Churches and the Evangelical and Reformed Church" (Th.M. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1954), with bibliography, narrates the details of negotiations that led to the union of an Anglo-American and a "foreign" (German) group—one of the most striking accomplishments of the unity movement.

Maude Lucille Lindquist, "Efforts Toward Lutheran Union in the United States to 1860, with a Brief Synopsis of the Developments Arising Therefrom to 1949" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1949) relates concerted efforts to effect union of diverse elements of various national origins in the colonies and early republic. After 1860 successful efforts were undone by schisms, influx of immigrants influenced by Pietism, doctrinal interpretations, foreign languages and pastors, and suspicion of Americanization. Solidarity grew from increase of English and cooperation in missions and war effort. By the 1940's the union idea had captured all but the Missouri Synod, and the larger bodies are approaching further collaboration. Other excellent general surveys are: J. L. Neve, *The Lutherans in Movements for Church Union* (Philadelphia, 1921); Evangelical Lutheran Church, *Union Documents, with a Historical Survey of the Union Movement* (Minneapolis, 1948); and Theodore Conrad Graebner and Paul E. Kretzmann, *Toward Lutheran Union, a Scriptural and Historical Approach* (St. Louis, 1943). The actual accomplishment in practical cooperation is revealed in Osborne Hauge, *Lutherans Working Together; a History of the National Lutheran Council, 1918–1943, Supplementary Chapter, 1943–1945, by Ralph H. Long* (New York, 1945). The progress in one branch is studied in Eugene C. Nelson, "The Union Movement among Norwe-

gian-American Lutherans from 1880 to 1917" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1951–52).

D. Federated and Community Churches

One of the most important developments in American religion is the widespread formation of federated and community churches, which began late in the nineteenth century. The varied causes included the decline of rural and small-town population, "overchurching" of small communities, and the fading of old, divisive theological and doctrinal variances in new communities.

A distinction should be observed between federated and community churches. The former are unions of two or more churches of different denominations, which decide to cooperate and to use the same building. The latter are churches composed of persons of various or no religious background, who form a new organization without denominational affiliation. These movements are regarded as peculiarly American, and include hundreds of thousands of church members.

John Williams Hoyt, Jr., *Uniting for Larger Service . . . What Can be Accomplished by Federated Churches, and How to Organize Them* (New York and London, 1935) has a bibliography on federated, cooperative, and community churches, presents a practical method of solving the problem of "overchurched" communities, and includes model services. There are many studies of the organization and programs of federated churches. Among the superior ones, since the movement began to take hold, are: Roy Bergen Guild, ed., *Community Programs for Cooperating Churches; a Manual of Principles and Methods* (New York, 1920); Elizabeth Robbins Hooker, *United Churches* (New York, 1926), and her *How Can Local Churches Come Together? A Handbook of Principles and Methods* (New York, 1928), with a bibliography; Clarence R. Athearn, *Ten Reasons for Federation, an Essay on the Advantages of Federation as Exemplified*

by the Federal Council of Churches of Christ in America (Boston, 1928); and Harlan Paul Douglass, *United Local Churches; an Interpretation Illustrated by Case Studies* (New York, 194–?), with a bibliography.

Ralph Leroy Williamson, "Factors of Success and Failure in Federated Churches" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1951; abstract published by the Rural Church Institute, Cornell University, Ithaca, N.Y., c.1951) notes the lack of objective knowledge about the causes, and surveys the principal psycho-social factors in decline. He declares that success is related to ability to secure able pastors with long tenure, gradual federation, friendly relations with parent denominations, and social integration.

John Haynes Holmes, *New Churches for Old; a Plea for Community Religion* (New York, 1922) calls for a wholly new statement of religion and a new form of church organization, in place of sectarian theological beliefs. New churches should be based on democratic social idealism: community churches founded upon loyalty to a group, held together by common social interests, free inquiry, and the ideal of universal religion. Holmes has been criticized for failing to see the necessity of dependence upon a common tradition, and for neglecting the fact that "social religion" depends for full development upon a common faith.

The earlier Community Church movement has been succinctly reviewed by David Roy Piper in *Community Churches, the Community Church Movement* (Chicago, 1928), and in his *Handbook of the Community Church Movement in the United States* (Excelsior Springs, Mo., 1922). The more recent development may be studied in an official publication of the National Council of Community Churches: *"That They All May Be One," A Handbook of the Community Church Movement, Its Organization and Its Program* (Columbus, Ohio, 1948?).

The suggested use of the community church to attain a larger religious unity has been studied by Albert Clay Zum-

brunnen in *The Community Church; a Probable Method of Approach to the Bases for Denominational Unity* (Chicago, 1922), with illustrations including plans, and a large bibliography. The same outlook inspired essays by J. Robert Hargreaves [and others] in *Community Religion and the Denominational Heritage* (New York and London, 1930), reviewing the principles of denominational and community religion, with two essays by Hargreaves on "Unity Methods in Overchurched Communities." Recent aspects of the movement appear in Roy Abram Burkhart, *How the Church Grows*, with a Foreword by Henry R. Luce (New York, 1947). An interesting experience in founding an early community church is told in Henry Ezekiel Jackson, *A Community Church; the Story of a Minister's Experience Which Led Him from the Church Militant to the Church Democratic* (Boston and New York, 1919), with references. This illustrates the spiritual struggle that has led many into the community church movement.

E. American Churches and the Ecumenical Movement

1. BIBLIOGRAPHY AND GENERAL HISTORY. Although it does not pretend to be complete, a very broad list of the international Christian unity movement is Auguste Senaud, *Christian Unity, a Bibliography; Selected Titles Concerning International Relations between the Churches and International Christian Movements*, with an Introduction by Dr. Adolf Keller (Geneva, 1937). The nearly 2,000 titles are limited to recent literature, and survey the trends since the middle of the nineteenth century. A brief but most useful list is Paul Griswold Macy's "An Ecumenical Bibliography," in William Adams Brown, *Toward a United Church; Three Decades of Ecumenical Christianity* (New York, 1946), pp. 234–236. It was separately issued (New York, 1945) by the Committee on Education and Promotion, for the American Committee for the World Council of Churches, and in a

third, revised edition (New York, 1952) by the Conference of the American Member Churches of the World Council of Churches. A comprehensive list with titles since the beginning of the nineteenth century, with annotations, is in Henry R. T. Brandreth's *Unity and Reunion; a Bibliography* (London, 1948, 2d ed., with supplement). This is limited to writings dealing more or less directly with the visible unity and reunion of Christendom, but has about 1,200 titles with full notes and indexes.

A distinguished leader of the ecumenical movement, Bishop Angus Dun of the Protestant Episcopal Diocese of Washington, has compiled a brief, selective bibliography, "Church Unity, Special Reading List," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 32, no. 1 (Oct. 1939), pp. 8–11, with annotations. It includes historical surveys, the Faith and Order and Life and Work Movements, the nature of the church, specific proposals for unity, recent discussions of the problem, and study outlines. In the same publication are Richard M. Cameron, "The Ecumenical Movement," Vol. 36, no. 4 (July 1944), pp. 5–7, a selected, briefly annotated list, including histories, the causes and nature of denominational separations, reports and appraisals, and ecumenical periodicals; and William J. Wolf, "The Ecumenical Movement," Vol. 47, no. 1 (Oct. 1954), pp. 3–5, with brief notations, on the period since July 1944, with historical and descriptive works, theological views, conference study records, and periodicals. All these lists contain titles on the American contribution to the movement.

A vast number of essays on all phases, including American participation, may be found in two periodicals. *The Ecumenical Review* (Geneva, 1948–) is published by the World Council of Churches in the interest of ecumenical theology, and absorbed *Christendom*, another ecumenical magazine, in the winter of 1949. For articles one should consult also the magazine *World Unity* (New York, 1927–1935).

The best collection of original sources is George Kennedy Allen Bell, *bp.* of Chichester: *Documents on Christian Unity* (London, 1924–1948, three series). The third series includes the period since the Anglican Lambeth Conference of 1930, including all churches of importance in the movement, and the process of formation of the World Council of Churches. Chapter 12 covers the movement in the United States. The first two parts are summarized in *Documents on Christian Unity; a Selection from the First and Second Series, 1920–30* (London, New York, 1955).

The most comprehensive account of modern ecumenicalism is Ruth Rouse and Stephen Charles Neill, eds., *A History of the Ecumenical Movement, 1517–1948* (Philadelphia, 1954), consisting of well-documented essays by authorities, extending from pre-Reformation unity efforts to the genesis of the World Council. Chapter 5, by Donald Herbert Yoder, considers in detail the impact of international unity sentiment upon American churches. There is a glossary of terms, together with explanatory notes and a large bibliography, with a section on America. Among competent histories is John T. McNeill's *Unitive Protestantism, A Study in Our Religious Resources* (New York and Nashville, 1930), an admirable analysis of union efforts, chiefly in the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries. The two succeeding centuries are traversed by a detailed account and compendium with chronological tables, by Gaius Jackson Slosser: *Christian Unity, Its History and Challenge in All Lands* (New York, 1929).

Another definitive work, with special reference to the important participation of Americans, is W. R. Hogg's *Ecumenical Foundations: A History of the International Missionary Council and Its Nineteenth Century Background* (New York, 1952). An excellent briefer survey, by a long-time American leader, is William Adams Brown's *Toward a United Church, Three Decades of Ecumenical Christianity* (New York, 1946), an interpretation of the worldwide unity

crusade. An epilogue records some developments in the World Council of Churches after the author's death. There are a list of publications of the World Council and an ecumenical bibliography by Paul Griswold Macy. Another distinguished American champion of ecumenicalism, Walter Marshall Horton, examines unity trends in his *Toward a Reborn Church; a Review and Forecast of the Ecumenical Movement* (New York, 1949). Kenneth Scott Latourette's *The Emergence of a World Christian Community* (New Haven, 1949), a series of lectures, stresses the turn of the tide in Christian affairs from division to union, and growing world fellowship as the needed spiritual and moral tie for an endangered world, and reviews unsolved problems and the prospects for their solution.

2. PHILOSOPHY OF ECUMENICALISM. Latourette presents a forceful statement of the philosophy of Protestant ecumenicalism in his *Toward a World Christian Fellowship* (New York, 1938), which has a brief bibliography, and indicates the movement's imperative nature, its essentials, and the recent advances toward fellowship. The period 1910–1950 is covered, with emphasis upon the principles, in Leonard Hodgson's three lectures, *The Ecumenical Movement* (Sewanee, Tenn., 1951), a clear, brief outline by one who intimately shared in some phases of the movement. Charles Clayton Morrison, *What Is Christianity?* (Chicago, 1940) is a liberal view, illustrating the ideological position and the forms of unity which are regarded as desirable and possible. Another eminent American leader, Henry Pitney Van Dusen, in *What Is The Church Doing?* (London, New York, 1944, 4th ed.), points to facts apparently indicative of the emergence of a more dynamic future church, such as the survival of Christianity under Nazi and Communist rule, and the successful union in the Church of South India.

The theological implications are thoroughly considered in a series of eight lectures by Clarence Tucker Craig, *The*

One Church in the Light of the New Testament (New York, 1951), with an index of Bible references. The author, a former member (1937) of the American Theological Committee of the Faith and Order Movement, frankly estimates the barriers to more complete unity, in crucial differences arising from firmly-held evangelical convictions, with special attention to groups founded upon "radical independency" and those that have rejected participation in ecumenical movements. These lectures emphasize the goals of the movement and the faith of a united church. Charles Clayton Morrison's lectures, *The Unfinished Reformation* (New York, 1953), rest upon the concept that the movement is "the reemergence in Protestantism of the unfinished task of the Reformation." The discussion is limited to American Protestantism, and contends that worldwide unity cannot be achieved without *intranational unity* and the combination of loyalty and freedom in a united church. The author suggests that America, where practical union appears to be more advanced than elsewhere, must lead the way.

Various philosophies of ecumenicalism are discussed at length by Theodore Wedel, Taito Almar Kantonen, and Charles Clayton Morrison, in "The One Church and Our Many Churches, Toward What Sort of Union?" in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 24, no. 2 (Spring, 1955), pp. 163–194. An Anglican, a Lutheran, and a free Protestant leader estimate the state of the unity movement from their respective standpoints: the historic episcopate; unity not by amalgamation and coercion but by voluntary cooperation; and criticism of American Protestant "bureaucracy," considering the denominational and federal structure as extraneous, and the true goal as the ecumenical *local* church. Other valuable discussions of ecumenical philosophy by American leaders are: Norman Victor Hope, *One Christ, One World, One Church; a Short Introduction to the Ecumenical Movement* (Philadelphia, 1953), with a bibliography; Christopher Glover, *The Church for*

the New Age, A Dissertation on Church Unity (New York, 1956), with bibliographical footnotes; and Winfred Ernest Garrison, *The Quest and Character of a United Church* (New York, 1957).

A critical view of ecumenicalism is presented by Theodore O. Wedel, an American leader, in *The Coming Great Church* (New York, 1945), a series of lectures with bibliographical footnotes. He limits the area of discussion to Western churches and refers but briefly to notable experiments in unification. His intention is to clarify the basic "doctrine of the church," and the related doctrine of the Holy Spirit, which have been comparatively neglected. These lectures survey the ecumenical and liturgical movements, the "return to orthodoxy," the church as an expression of faith, differences of ideas respecting authority, tradition, and liturgy between Catholics and Protestants, and the problem of church order in apostolic succession.

The vexed question of the nature of the church, a persistent obstacle to unity, is thoroughly discussed by Wesley Dennis Osborne, in "An Emerging Ecumenical Doctrine Concerning the Nature of the Church" (doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1951; abstract published by the University). The churches are rediscovering the church's corporate nature as the whole body of Christ. A practical program for unity demands theological study of other communions for the fullest realization of Christian cooperation, and revelation of the whole doctrine of the church in the fullness of Christian faith and life. The "doctrine of the church" obstacle is penetratingly discussed by Reinhold Niebuhr in "The Ecumenical Issue in the United States," in *Theology Today*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Jan. 1946), pp. 525–536. He points to the irrelevance of ecumenical debates which do not consider the fact that American churches are predominantly influenced by the sectarian idea of the church, and are comparatively indifferent to problems of "churchly" order, liturgy, and theology. The problem in America is that of resolving the truth and falsity

in both the church and the sect idea, rather than that of the "right order" in church.

A liberal view is presented in Marion John Bradshaw, *Free Churches and Christian Unity: A Critical View of the Ecumenical Movement and the World Council of Churches* (Boston, 1954), with a bibliography. A full discussion of the ecumenical movement and its relation to American churches is available in Frederick E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, 1956), part nine, "Interdenominational Trends and Organization," sect. IV, "Ecumenical Theology," with bibliographical footnote references and a general bibliography including books and articles; sect. IX has a similar treatment of the World Council of Churches. There has been severe criticism of the Council and of American participation in it, from the standpoint of evangelical groups declining to participate. This attitude is voiced in a publication based upon the principles of the International Council of Christian Churches: Carl Curtis McIntire, *Servants of Apostasy* (Collingswood, N.J., 1955), with bibliographical references in the notes.

3. AMERICAN PARTICIPATION. No study of American participation in the movement for international and interfaith unity should neglect the general review in Volume IV of Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of the Expansion of Christianity* (New York, 1937–1945, 7 vols.). This considers the part of American churches in the missionary and ecumenical movements. Other very valuable studies are Daniel Thomas Jenkins, *Europe and America, Their Contributions to the World Church* (Philadelphia, 1951), and Ronald Eugene Ossmann, "Some Aspects of the American Contribution to the Ecumenical Movement" (doctoral dissertation, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1955, with a bibliography; typewritten copy in the Seminary's library). American contributions are considered also in Paul Griswold Macy, *The Story of the World Council of Churches* (New York, 1943), and in George Kennedy Allen Bell, *bp.* of Chichester, *The*

Kingship of Christ; the Story of the World Council of Churches (Harmondsworth, Middlesex, and Baltimore, 1954), with a bibliography.

American contributions to world ecumenicalism are evident in biographies of several eminent protagonists of the cause. One of the earliest leaders is appreciated in J. Minton Batten's *John Drury, Advocate of Christian Reunion* (Chicago, 1944), which has a list of his published writings and a general bibliography, and reveals aspects of the movement's early background, which have not been well known and have been little mentioned in discussions of church unity. Basil Mathews' *John R. Mott, World Citizen* (New York, 1934) is based upon painstaking research by a personal friend, and information provided by Mott. Although rather uncritical, it reveals Mott's great part in the formation of modern ecumenicalism, particularly in the Student Christian Movement, the International Missionary Council, and the World Council of Churches. A briefer tribute is Galen Merriam Fisher's *John R. Mott, Architect of Co-operation and Unity* (New York, 1952). The important participation of American Episcopalian leaders is reviewed in John Wallace Suter's massive and scholarly *Life and Letters of William Reed Huntington, a Champion of Unity* (New York, 1925), and in Alexander Clinton Zabriskie, *Bishop Brent, Crusader for Christian Unity* (Philadelphia, 1948). The latter work is from notes gathered and a text partly written by Brent's close friend, Doctor Remsen B. Ogilby, a former president of Trinity College, Hartford, Conn. The Bishop of Western New York was the outstanding American promoter of the Faith and Order Movement, as is shown by the included bibliography of his published writings.

F. *Foreign Missions and Unity*

1. PROTESTANT MISSIONS. This section outlines the history of American participation in foreign missions and its relation

to the Ecumenical Movement. The origins of foreign missionary enterprise around 1800 coincided not only with the Second Great Awakening, but also with the rise of trends toward interdenominational unity, such as the Disciples movement (see Part Two, sect. IV, 4, *Disciples of Christ and Closely Related Groups*). The great outburst of foreign missionary enterprise later in the century was contemporary with the first inspirations of modern ecumenicalism.

Much of the foreign missionary enterprise has been cooperative, and has raised questions regarding the maintenance of denominational separatism at home. The selected titles below represent a vast literature. They include not only bibliographies and general histories, but also some that reveal the impact of the foreign missionary movement upon the churches and the nation. Some indicate the rise of a critical attitude toward denominational emphasis and methods, and toward the persistence of the sectarian idea of the church, as obstacles to the progress of both missions and ecumenicity.

a. Bibliography, Directories, Statistics, etc. One of the best extensive early bibliographies, including American missions, was compiled by the distinguished church historian, Samuel Macauley Jackson, with the assistance of G. W. Gilmore: *A Bibliography of Foreign Missions* (New York, 1891), reprinted from the *Encyclopedia of Missions*. This contains all important work on early American enterprises. John Lovell Murray's *A Selected Bibliography of Missionary Literature* (New York, 1912), compiled by the educational secretary of the Student Volunteer Movement, is the first of a series constituting the best bibliographies of American Protestant missions. A reissue with a supplement appeared in 1914, and a second edition in 1920. Another supplement (1923) was compiled by Hollis W. Herring of the Missionary Research Library, New York. That library issued her further revisions of 1925 and 1928. The titles are nearly all in English, and are classified, and most of them have brief descriptive notes.

Bibliographies on missions, foreign and home, and refer-

ences to missionary archives are available in Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History, Guide to Materials for Research* (Paterson, N.J., 1959, rev. ed.). Bibliographies appear from time to time in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin.* One of these, unclassified and with brief notes, is by John W. Brush, in vol. 38, no. 3 (Apr. 1946), pp. 6–9. An excellent, detailed bibliography of American contributions to foreign missions is in Peter G. Mode, *Source Book and Bibliographical Guide for American Church History* (Menasha, Wis., 1921), in ch. 19, "The Era of Organization," including general and denominational writings, biographical materials, works on missionary societies and periodicals, and illustrative documents. Bibliography of foreign missions, including those sustained by the churches of the United States, appears in Kenneth Scott Latourette, vols. 4–7 (New York, 1941–1945), covering the period since 1800.

The early extent of American foreign missions is comprised in Bela Bates Edwards, *The Missionary Gazetteer; Comprising a Geographical and Statistical Account of the Various Stations of the American and Foreign Protestant Missionary Societies of All Denominations* (Boston, 1832). A highly valuable and complete source for the early years of the twentieth century is Henry Otis Dwight, Henry Allen Tupper, and Edwin Munsell Bliss, eds., *Encyclopedia of Missions, Descriptive, Historical, Biographical, Statistical* (New York, 1904, 2d ed.), edited under the auspices of the Bureau of Missions. The period preceding World War I is summarized also by Harlan P. Beach, *A Geography and Atlas of Protestant Missions* (New York, 1906, 2 vols.), published by the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions; and by Harlan P. Beach and Burton St. John, eds., *World Statistics of Christian Missions* (New York, 1916), issued by the Committee of Reference and Counsel of the Foreign Missions Conference of North America. During the period between the two World Wars, the Committee issued *The Contemporary Foreign Missions of the Protestant Churches of North*

America; a Digest of Statistical Summaries, Agencies, Policies and Methods (New York, 1930), with "Bibliography on missionary policy," pp. 27–30. In contrast to the period of Edwards' *Missionary Gazetteer* (1832), the present immensely widespread enterprise is revealed by the *World Christian Handbook,* 1949, 1952, 1957 (London, 1949–1957, 3 vols.), ed. K. G. Grubb and E. J. Bingle, with information concerning the present location and activities of American missions. Also necessary is the *International Review of Missions* (London, 1912–), the standard Protestant journal of foreign missions, together with New York, Missionary Research Library, *Directory of North American Protestant Foreign Missionary Agencies* (New York, 1958, 3d ed.). A great wealth of information on the missions of American Protestant churches throughout the world is available in John Caldwell Thiessen, *A Survey of World Missions* (Chicago, 1955), with an extensive bibliography; and in Robert Hall Glover, *The Progress of World-Wide Missions,* revised and enlarged by J. Herbert Kane, M.A. (New York, 1960), with a bibliography and statistics.

b. General History. The origins of the foreign missionary movement in the United States are surveyed in Oliver Wendell Elsbree, *The Rise of the Missionary Spirit in America, 1790–1815* (Williamsport, Pa.), which is based upon printed sources, especially missionary journals and reports of societies. A typical zealous leader in this movement is appreciated by Thomas Cole Richards, *Samuel J. Mills, Missionary Pathfinder, Pioneer and Promoter* (Boston, 1906), whose life was identified with the establishment of American foreign missions. The author considers the formative influences in his awakening to the importance of missions, his plans for foreign work, and his ceaseless activity in America and Africa. The early decades of American foreign missions are reviewed at length in *History of American Missions to the Heathen, from Their Commencement to the Present Time* (Worcester, Mass., 1840), with illustrations and a list of missionaries,

and including the history of various denominational enterprises and of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions.

The Board, popularly known as the "A.B.C.F.M.," was organized in 1810, and was the first major agency of American evangelization overseas. The incident to which its origin is ascribed is reviewed, together with a large amount of other historical material, in American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, *The One Hundredth Anniversary of the Haystack Prayer Meeting Celebrated at the Ninety-Seventh Annual Meeting of the American Board in North Adams and by the Haystack Centennial Meetings at Williamstown, Mass., October 9–12, 1906* (Boston, 1907). The earliest extended account of the Board's many enterprises is Joseph Tracy's *History of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions Compiled Chiefly from the Published and Unprinted Documents of the Board* (New York, 1842). Twenty years later appeared Rufus Anderson's *Memorial Volume of the First Fifty Years of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions* (Boston, 1862, 5th ed.), with a bibliography of the Board's literature and of its missions. Ten years later Anderson published his *History of the Missions of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions to the Oriental Churches* (Boston, 1872, 2 vols.), with a list of missionaries and a large catalog of publications. For the one hundredth anniversary, a history was published by William Ellsworth Strong: *The Story of the American Board: An Account of the First Hundred Years of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions* (Boston, 1910). This semi-official record, written by the editorial secretary, reviews the origins, purposes, and accomplishments, and includes missions throughout the world. An indispensable source of information is its *Annual Reports,* beginning in 1810. Another is its official magazine, *The Missionary Herald,* begun at Boston in 1821.

Another widely active missionary organization is described

at length by one of its presidents, Archibald McLean, in *The History of the Foreign Christian Missionary Society* (New York, 1919). The author included American foreign mission leaders in his *Epoch Makers of Foreign Missions* (New York, Chicago, 1912). The Society's activities are fully covered by its official monthly magazine, *The Missionary Intelligencer*, begun in Cincinnati in 1888. Rich sources of information are in other missionary magazines, such as *The American and Foreign Christian Union*, published in New York City from 1850 by an association with the same title. This succeeded the *American Protestant* and the *Quarterly Paper*, and was followed by *The Christian World*, an official magazine of the Union (New York, 1850–1884). An excellent source is the *Missionary Review of the World* (Princeton, New York, 1878–1939). One should consult also the Annual Reports of the American Missionary Association, beginning in 1847, and Augustus Field Beard, *A Crusade of Brotherhood, A History of the American Missionary Association* (Boston, 1909), by the secretary.

One of the most influential agencies in promoting American overseas missions was the Student Volunteer Movement. It was organized largely as a result of revivals in the later years of the nineteenth century. The movement started in 1886 at the Mount Hermon School in Northfield, Massachusetts (founded by Dwight L. Moody), at a conference of students from many colleges. Within fifty years it attracted sixteen thousand volunteers into the missionary crusade. The story of that half century is related by one of the general secretaries, Robert Parmelee Wilder, in *The Great Commission, the Missionary Response of the Student Volunteer Movements in North America and Europe; Some Personal Reminiscences* (London, 1936). This clearly demonstrated that the motive power of foreign missions was revivalism. The causes of this movement's rise and decline are closely studied in William McKinley Beahm, "Factors in the Development of the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign

Missions" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1941, typewritten copy; abstract published in *Schwarzenau*, Vol. 3, no. 1, 1941). This indicates that the movement flourished until the 1920's, because it was in harmony with student life and with the revivalism that culminated in the career of Moody. It declined with the diversification of student interests after World War I, and the loss of former favorable factors.

It would be impossible to list here even all of the most important writings concerning the foreign missions of American churches in many countries. These may be located in the bibliographies and general histories in sect. 1. Hundreds of titles are included in the general bibliographies and the footnotes, of Kenneth Scott Latourette's *History of the Expansion of Christianity*, Vols. 4–7.

c. Criticism and Appraisal. The accelerating trend toward cooperation for the evangelization of the world, among American missionary agencies and between Americans and other nationalities in the overseas field, was accompanied by a constant growth of critical appraisal. There had been critical assessments of motives and accomplishments in missions, since the establishment of the American Board. A broad, scholarly review of attitudes is given in Ortha May Lane, *Missions in Magazines; an Analysis of the Treatment of Protestant Foreign Missions in American Magazines since 1810* (Tientsin, 1935), with illustrations and a bibliography of magazines specially studied. American views are conveniently summarized by James Stuart Udy, in "Attitudes within the Protestant Churches of the Occident towards the Propagation of Christianity in the Orient—An Historical Survey up to 1914" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1952; abstract published by the University). This comprises the earliest evidences of interest, opinions of leaders, the rise of missionary enthusiasm among church members, and the development of missionary attitudes. This study reveals that foreign missions were not the venture of a few leaders and devout followers,

but generally influenced church people, and through them the national religious interests and attitudes. The dynamic came chiefly from insistence, by the "New Calvinism" of Edwards and Hopkins, upon "disinterested benevolence," which deeply penetrated the mass of church people. The impact is examined also in Kenneth Scott Latourette's "The Effect of the Missionary Enterprise upon the American Mind," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 13, no. 1 (Winter, 1944), pp. 53–70.

Pressures of interest and opinion compelled leaders to favor cooperation and to examine accomplishments, as in James Shepard Dennis, *Foreign Missions After a Century* (New York, Chicago, 1893), lectures given to students at the Princeton Theological Seminary, with a selection of recent publications concerning missions. An effort to assess past endeavors, and to provide a program for the future, appears in the results of the Ecumenical Missionary Conference, New York, 1900: *Report of the Ecumenical Conference on Foreign Missions, held in Carnegie Hall and Neighboring Churches, April 21 to May 1 . . .* (New York, 1900, 2 vols.). Another evidence of stock-taking is Stephen Livingston Baldwin's *Foreign Missions of the Protestant Churches* (New York, Cincinnati, 1900).

The early twentieth century has witnessed the rise of American criticism of foreign missions, which produced the Laymen's Foreign Missions Inquiry (see below). The persistence of unfavorable criticism over many years is illustrated by Isaac Lockhart Peebles, *Objections to Foreign Missions, Stated and Answered* (Nashville, Tenn., Dallas, Tex., 1904), by a writer in the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. More determined criticism after World War I is reflected in such a typical pro-missionary pleading as Cornelius Howard Patton's *Foreign Missions under Fire; Straight Talks with the Critics of Missions* (Boston, Chicago, 1928); in Charles Albert Selden, *Are Missions a Failure? A Correspondent's Survey of Foreign Missions* (New York, Chicago, 1927),

illustrated; and in Robert Elliott Speer, *Are Foreign Missions Done For?* (New York, 1928). Contemporary financial contributions toward the cause (far from satisfactory to defenders of missions) appear in Charles Harvey Fahs, *Trends in Protestant Giving; a Study of Church Finance in the United States* (New York, 1929), sponsored by the Institute of Social and Religious Research.

For arguments, defenders of American missions could resort to a considerable number of studies, which are fairly represented by Thomas Laurie, *The Ely Volume; or, The Contributions of Our Foreign Missions to Science and Human Well-being* (Boston, 1881). A vast array of favorable views was provided by James Shepard Dennis in his *Christian Missions and Social Progress; a Sociological Study of Foreign Missions* (New York, Chicago, 1897–1906, 3 vols.). This is a series of lectures, with a general bibliography and a selection of recent mission literature. A brief summary of accomplishments is William Williams Keen, *The Service of Missions to Science and Society; the Presidential Address Delivered before the American Baptist Missionary Union, at Dayton, Ohio, May 21, 1906* (Boston, 1906), with an extensive bibliography. A similar, extended study is William Herbert Perry Faunce, *The Social Aspects of Foreign Missions* (New York, 1914), illustrated, consisting mostly of lectures at the Baptist Crozer Theological Seminary, with a large bibliography.

Prolonged discussion resulted in a determination of the Protestant churches to inaugurate a searching inquiry into the aims, methods, accomplishments, and value of foreign missions. With William E. Hocking as editor, the Laymen's Foreign Missions Inquiry, Commission of Appraisal, issued its conclusions, derived from years of investigation, in its epoch-making, illustrated report, edited by Orville A. Petty: *Missions; a Laymen's Inquiry after One Hundred Years* (New York and London, 1932). An organized mass of information and criticism was published also in the *Laymen's*

Foreign Missions Inquiry . . . Supplementary Series (New York, 1933, 7 vols.), consisting of selections setting forth results of a sweeping investigation of American Protestant missions in the Orient. Inquiries often were highly critical of the entire foreign missionary enterprise, and were interested especially in the attitude of laymen. Growing indifference in some churches was a marked contrast to early zeal, which carried the movement through its first century. Examples of the widespread discussion inspired by the investigations are Peter Hugh James Lerrigo, comp., *Northern Baptists Rethink Missions: A Study of the Report of the Laymen's Foreign Missions Inquiry* (New York, 1933), illustrated; and Frank Stanton Burns Gavin, *The Church and Foreign Missions; a Series of Three Editorials in the Living Church* (Milwaukee, 1933), by a nationally known Episcopal scholar. A critique by a well-known author, with experience in the Chinese mission field, is Pearl S. Buck's *The Laymen's Mission Report* (n.p., 1932), reprinted from the *Christian Century* for Nov. 23, 1932.

d. Missionary Cooperation: America's Mission to the World. Efforts to promote cooperative effort among American churches, and between them and missionary agencies of other countries, were furthered especially by two influences of worldwide scope—the Student Volunteer Movement, and the swift expansion of American and European colonialism in the later nineteenth century. The approach of cooperation was heralded by an association of American missionary zeal with overseas territorial expansion, which broadened the contacts between American churches and missions sustained from other nations. A typical evidence of the sense of an American mission to the world is Luther Tracy Townsend's *"Manifest Destiny" from a Religious Point of View, An Address Delivered before the Boston Music Hall Patriotic Association, November 6, 1898* (Baltimore, 1898).

Awareness of the world obligation of American foreign missions already had drawn Protestant organizations together

for cooperative ventures. An important expression of the new spirit was the establishment of the Foreign Missions Conference of North America, whose *Reports* (New York, 1893–1950) are a principal source of information regarding American Protestant foreign missions. In 1950 the Conference became the Division of Foreign Missions of the National Council of the Churches of Christ. Growth of fraternity between American missions and those of other nations is shown by William Richey Hogg, *Ecumenical Foundations; a History of the International Missionary Council and Its Nineteenth-Century Background* (New York, 1952), with a bibliography.

Common interest inspired hope of converting the world to Christianity in the twentieth century: "The World for Christ in Our Time" became a missionary slogan. An early expression of this crusade coincided with the overseas territorial expansion of the United States: John Raleigh Mott's *The Evangelization of the World in This Generation* (New York, 1900), with a bibliography, published by the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions. This is a typical illustration of the blend of religious sentiment and the conviction of American national destiny, in a desire to convert the world to Christianity and democracy, which often were practically identified. Enthusiasm for bringing American democracy to the world in association with missions rose to the character of a crusade in the period of World War I. This fact appears vividly in Stephen Earl Taylor and Halford E. Luccock, *The Christian Crusade for World Democracy* (New York, Cincinnati, 1918), a religious reflection of the secular democratic ideal, with suggestions for reading, and emphasis upon Methodist missions. The long-range effect in promoting cooperative effort is described in Leslie B. Moss, *Adventures in Missionary Cooperation* (New York, 1930), issued by the Foreign Missions Conference of North America.

Hope for worldwide conversion, through missionary cooperation, persisting throughout the 1930's, found a notable

champion in the internationalist Christian, John Raleigh Mott, whose *Cooperation and the World Mission* (New York, 1935) was published under the auspices of the Institute of Social and Religious Research. Other typical expressions of the movement are Charles Harvey Fahs and Helen E. Davis, *Conspectus of Cooperative Missionary Enterprises* (New York, 1935); Kenneth Scott Latourette, *Missions Tomorrow* (New York and London, 1936), and his *Toward a World Christian Fellowship* (New York, 1938), with a selected bibliography. Emergence of an international Christianity through the work of missions (including American ones) is reported in Henry Pitney Van Dusen, *For the Healing of the Nations; Impressions of Christianity Around the World* (New York, 1940), illustrated. This describes Far Eastern missions before the international missionary conference at Madras in 1938, and discusses the basic ideal of the Christian campaign for worldwide conversion.

The sentiment of American responsibility for fulfillment of this ideal was furthered by the second crusade for defense of democracy in World War II. It became, more than ever, a feature of the persistent, religiously motivated concept of a special American mission to edify and unify the world. The relation of foreign missions to international unity and cooperation, as promoted by American efforts, is popularly reviewed by Frank Charles Laubach in *Wake Up or Blow Up! America: Lift the World or Lose It!* (New York, 1951).

2. ROMAN CATHOLIC MISSIONS. The Roman Catholic Church in the United States has entered the foreign mission field upon a large scale only within the last fifty years. The immigrants, who composed the bulk of its membership in the nineteenth century, were mostly poor, and were under heavy pressure to meet the needs of their parishes and of home missions. Until 1908 the Vatican considered the United States as a missionary field, and the church here was a recipient rather than a bestower of missionary support. This fact is made clear in Edward John Hickey's study of the chief

agent in missionary giving: *The Society for the Propagation of the Faith; Its Foundation, Organization and Success, 1822–1922* (Washington, 1922; Catholic University of America Studies in American Church History, Vol. 3), with a critical essay on sources, bibliographical footnotes, and an extensive bibliography. This volume relates the farflung activities of the international and pontifical organization, which has an American branch. The works are detailed in its *Annual Report,* and in *Catholic Missions* (New York, 1924–), illustrated, the official periodical, formed by uniting *Annals of the Propagation of the Faith* (to 1907) and *Catholic Missions* (1907–1923, 17 vols.).

About the turn of the century the American Roman Catholics experienced an upsurge of interest in foreign missions, which is briefly reviewed in Joseph Schmidlin's *Catholic Mission History . . . a Translation,* ed. Matthias Braun, tr. T. J. Kennedy and W. H. Robertson (Techny, Ill., 1933), published by the Mission Press of the Society of the Divine Word. It has bibliographies and extensive bibliographical footnotes. Among the first evidences of awakening interest was the establishment of the Catholic Church Extension Society of the United States of America, which was intended to support home missions, but helped to arouse a general interest in the missionary cause, overseas as well as at home. Its successful apostolate is reviewed in detail in Bishop Francis Clement Kelley's *The Story of Extension* (Chicago, 1922), illustrated, and in its illustrated monthly *Extension Magazine* (Chicago, Apr. 1906–), which has some references to work in the Philippines.

The Society infused into the missionary cause a previously lacking unity of spirit and purpose, by holding congresses attended by hundreds of clerical and lay delegates. The initial one is completely summarized in American Catholic Missionary Congress, 1st, Chicago, 1908, *The First American Catholic Missionary Congress . . . Containing Official Proceedings . . . as well as a Complete Report of all Papers*

Read . . . ed. Very Rev. Francis C. Kelley (Chicago, Ill., 1909). This is combined with the proceedings of the second Congress, held at Boston in 1913, in *The Two Great American Missionary Congresses* . . . ed. Very Rev. Francis C. Kelley (Chicago, Ill., 1914, 2 vols. in 1), illustrated. The many addresses by clergymen and laymen considered foreign as well as home missions.

Since the period of the Congresses, American Roman Catholics have founded a multitude of other associations to sustain foreign missions. This development is studied in Society for the Propagation of the Faith, U.S., *The Mission Apostolate, a Study of the Mission Activity of the Roman Catholic Church and the Story of the Foundation and Development of Various Mission-aid Organizations in the United States* (New York, 1942), compiled by the Society's national office. This collection includes essays on American sisters in overseas missions, administration of missions, religious orders engaged, the Society and its auxiliaries, medical missions, and the Catholic Students' Missionary Crusade.

The present vast extent of the organizational structure is revealed by a lengthy list of clerical and lay orders and societies in the *Official Catholic Directory for the Year of Our Lord 1960* (New York, 1960), pp. 797–818, and pp. 880–886. It comprises missions in many parts of the world, assigned to religious orders, and numerous missionary societies and boards, with their diocesan branches. The great spread of present American efforts appears also in a publication by the Mission Secretariat, Washington, D.C., *U.S. Catholic Overseas Missionary Personnel* (Washington, D.C., 1951–1960, 4 vols.), which succeeded Catholic Students' Mission Crusade, U.S.A., *A Missionary Index of Catholic Americans; Catholic Priests and Religious of the United States in Missionary Work Outside the U.S.A.* (Cincinnati, 1940–1949, 6 editions).

Growth of interest in foreign missions is revealed by the founding of the Institute of Mission Studies, which sponsors

the Fordham University Conference of Mission Specialists. The discussions of methods in missionary work are published in the annual *Proceedings* (New York, 1953–), and in *Incidental Papers* (New York, 1957–).

Meetings of this conference bring together representatives of numerous associations and orders, many of which publish periodicals and reports of their enterprises. Most of the religious clergy engaged in foreign work are members of American provinces of long-established orders founded in Europe, such as the Benedictines, Claretians, Dominicans, Franciscans, Jesuits, Marists, Oblates, and Passionists, the Society of the Divine Word, and many others. Their members in overseas mission fields collaborate with missioners from other countries, and so help to achieve unity and an international ecumenical spirit in the Roman Catholic Church.

Almost innumerable references to missionary enterprises, conducted by these American provinces, occur in Robert Streit, *Bibliotheca Missionum* (Münster, 1916–, 21 vols. through 1958). This vast bibliographic source covers missions throughout the world over many centuries, and contains all classes of literature, with author, person, subject, and place indexes. Its thousands of references include books and articles concerning missions conducted by American branches of religious orders. (See, for example, Vol. 19, part 1, African missions literature, 1910–1940; Vol. 21, Australia and Oceania, 1525–1950, pp. 515–717, writings after 1909.)

Another helpful guide is Stephen J. Brown, comp., *Catholic Mission Literature, A Handlist* (Dublin, 1932), containing sections on missions by countries, orders, and congregations, entries for periodicals, pamphlets, and other publications, and references to Catholic foreign missions in books and periodicals. Several American mission periodicals issued by religious orders are included. The most up-to-date source is the *Bibliografia Missionaria* (Isola del Liri, 1935–), published by the Unione Missionaria del Clero in Italia, Rome, and including literature since January 1, 1933. This also

has numerous books on American Catholic foreign missionary work in various countries, and articles in periodicals issued by American missionary organizations and orders.

The *Catholic Periodical Index* (New York, 1930/33–), published by the Catholic Library Association, has references to a large number of articles on American Catholic foreign missions, including personal narratives, writings about the enterprises of religious orders, and missions in many countries. News of missions sustained by Americans is reported in *Worldmission* (New York, Sept. 1950–), edited by Bishop Fulton J. Sheen, and published quarterly under the sponsorship of the national office of the Society for the Propagation of the Faith and the American missionary sending societies. The Society issues an up-to-date news service for missions: *World Mission Fides Service,* an American edition of the service Agenzia Internazionale Fides, Rome. It comprises a vast amount of information from fields all over the world, including American enterprises.

There are references to American Catholic foreign missions also in *Histoire Universelle des Missions Catholiques* (Paris, 1956–1959, 4 vols.), in Vol. 3, "Les Missions Contemporaines" (1800–1950), by S. Delacroix, with bibliography.

A development parallel to the multiplication of societies, and the enterprises of American provinces of European orders, was the growth of a desire to establish a distinctively American missionary venture. The result was the Catholic Foreign Missionary Society of America, the American-born organization most generally identified with the foreign missionary movement. Known as the Maryknoll Fathers, it was officially established in 1911, and has its mother house at Ossining, New York. This was the first such society of purely American origin, and founded the first distinctively American seminary devoted entirely to the training of missionaries, under the auspices of the American hierarchy.

The Society's early life is described in Bishop Raymond

A. Lane's *The Early Days of Maryknoll* (New York, 1951), which carries the story through the period of World War I, emphasizing in attractive style the personal heroism and sacrificial character of the apostolate. The Society at first concentrated upon missions in China, but later planted its stations in other Far Eastern countries, Hawaii, Africa, and several Latin American nations. The earliest comprehensive history is George Cornelius Powers, *The Maryknoll Movement* (Maryknoll, N.Y., 1926), with a "Critical Essay on the Sources." It reviews origins of the American Catholic foreign enterprise, and its early organizations, and comprises a vast amount of factual material regarding various mission fields.

The Maryknoll movement has inspired an amount of interesting literature, out of proportion to the length of its history, largely because of its heroic record in the Far East. A well-illustrated account is Robert Bernard Considine, *The Maryknoll Story* (New York, 1950), vividly written, with much human interest. Albert J. Nevins, *The Meaning of Maryknoll* (New York, 1954), has brief accounts of the several training schools, and of work in the United States as well as abroad. His *Adventures of Men of Maryknoll* (New York, 1957) is a collection of stories full of heroism, compassion, and humor. The full story of the Chinese mission is told in Catholic Foreign Mission Society of America, *Maryknoll Mission Letters, China; Extracts from the Letters and Diaries of the Pioneer Missioners of the Catholic Foreign Mission Society of America* (New York, 1923–1942, 32 vols.), illustrated, a complete portrayal of the apostolate in China since 1918, when the first group arrived. The work of the Maryknoll Sisters of Saint Dominic is narrated in a spirited manner by Sister Mary de Paul Cogan, in *Sisters of Maryknoll Through Troubled Waters* (New York, 1947), consisting mainly of reports for the period of World War II in the Orient, with many quotations from letters, and references to ministrations to prisoners of war and refugees. An-

other account of the women's ministry is Sister Marcelline's *Sisters Carry the Gospel* (Maryknoll, N.Y., 1956).

The literature of the first twenty-five years has been gathered in James Vincent O'Halloran, "A Bibliography of the Works by or About the Maryknoll Fathers, 1911–1936" (Washington, 1957), a thesis for the Catholic University of America, typescript in the library. The most comprehensive source of detailed information is the Society's illustrated periodical, *The Field Afar* (Maryknoll, N.Y., 1907–), comprising a vast collection of relations from missionary areas around the world.

VIII. MISSIONS AND RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

A. Home Missions: Protestant

1. GENERAL HISTORY. American Protestant home missions originated in the post-Revolutionary period, when westward expansion required special exertion to prevent lapse of members, and to win settlers without religion. The work of evangelism was undertaken by many denominational home missionary societies.

Home missions exerted a deep influence upon American life, as unifying and civilizing agencies. They bound the Eastern Seaboard to the West, by personal contact, and through the societies' reports. The societies founded many schools and distributed general as well as religious literature. It has been remarked that, without them, the frontier might have declined into barbarism. They were promoters of religious cooperation, for some were interdenominational and were therefore harbingers of movements toward unity.

To the Indians home missionaries introduced settled life, agriculture, industry, schools, and printing. Reconstruction challenged the societies to minister to the spiritual and material wants of Negro freedmen (see sect. VI, *The Negro Church*) and of Southern white Highlanders. Later, with the

flooding of large cities by tides of European immigration, the societies greatly expanded their work in the "city mission," which had been started before the Civil War. (See Part Three, sect. VI, *The Later Social Gospel.*) Home missions were one of the most effective means of assimilating the immigrant.

Protestant domestic missions have been and still are one of the most extensive religious enterprises in the world. The literature about them is vast. This section includes selected titles on general history, accomplishments of particular denominations, adjustment to new conditions, local missions, and a few biographies of well-known typical leaders. (Roman Catholic missions are included in sect. IX, 5.)

Aside from reports and archives of the societies, which have been used by authors of general histories, the chief sources of information are the periodicals which they cite. One of the most valuable is *The Home Missionary* (New York, 1829–1899, 28 vols. in 18). A typical denominational home mission magazine is the Presbyterian *Home Mission Monthly* (New York, 1886–1924, 38 vols. in 36), which united with *Woman's Work* to form *Women and Missions.*

The sources of interest in home missions have been repeatedly explored. Perhaps the best general study is Oliver Wendell Elsbree, *The Rise of the Missionary Spirit in America, 1790–1815* (Williamsport, Pa., 1928), with bibliography. It is drawn chiefly from missionary journals and society reports, and reveals the strong impulse from revivals in the Second Great Awakening, broadening into many benevolences. It is a social study of religious ideas as effectively changed by missionary appeals. The enterprise is traced through the nineteenth century in Joseph B. Clark, *Leavening the Nation, The Story of American Home Missions* (New York, 1903), an excellent, comprehensive, standard history, following the course of settlement, with frequent references to fuller treatment of special topics, and documents supplied by secretaries of home mission boards.

Typical comprehensive accounts of organizations are: Wil-

liam Robert King, *History of the Home Missions Council, with Introductory Outline History of Home Missions* (New York, 1930); and Augustus Field Beard, *A Crusade of Brotherhood, A History of the American Missionary Association* (Boston, 1909), by the secretary, who had full access to the archives. This indicates missionary effects of the humanitarian principles of the Pietist John Frederic Oberlin.

Many general accounts cover the period since the turn of the century. Among the better ones are: Edith Hedden Allen, *Home Missions in Action* (New York and Chicago, 1915), issued under the auspices of the Council of Women for Home Missions; Hermann Nelson Morse's *Toward a Christian America; the Contribution of Home Missions* (New York, 1935) and his *Again Pioneers* (New York, 1949); John Ryland Scotford, *Spanning a Continent* (New York, 1939); Frank Spencer Mead, *Right Here at Home* (New York, 1939); Arthur Henry Limouze, *Homeland Harvest* (New York, 1939); and James W. Hoffman, *Mission: U.S.A.* (New York, 1936). Most of these works have bibliographies or reading lists.

With the advance of the Social Gospel, a new ideal stressed not doctrine and denominationalism, but social service and cooperation. A few selected titles illustrate the emergence of this attitude. Harlan Paul Douglass, *The New Home Missions, An Account of Their Social Redirection* (New York, 1914), with bibliography, was written as a study manual for Protestants, and illustrates the "rethinking of missions." North American Home Missions Congress, Washington, D.C., 1930, *Data Book . . . for the Use of Delegates . . .* (New York, 1930, 2 vols.) is another evidence of "rethinking" by the Home Missions Council, the Council of Women for Home Missions, and the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ. It surveys status and work at the beginning of the Depression. John Milton Moore, *The Challenge of Change, What is Happening to Home Missions* (New York, 1931) reveals a conception of home missions not as "church extension," but as

the Christianizing of America in all areas of life at a time of cataclysmic social change. This is considered to be the most complete and intelligent contemporary review of the problems. Hermann N. Morse, *Home Missions Today and Tomorrow, A Review and Forecast* (New York, 1934) is an authoritative official study by a Presbyterian minister devoted to the cause. It was effected under the auspices of the Joint Committee on the Five-Year Program of Survey and Adjustment.

The increasingly social trend inspired William Payne Shriver's *Missions at the Grass Roots* (New York, 1949), with a bibliography, on the relation of home missions to social problems. Truman B. Douglass, *Mission to America* (New York, 1951), with a bibliography, announces that the Christian Church, a remnant loyal to the old American democratic way of life, must lead missions to redeem the nation. The note of social redemption and basic rights runs through a number of recent works, such as *How Home Missions Work for Human Rights*, ed. Betty Stewart (New York, 1952), illustrated; Louisa Rossiter Shotwell, *This Is Your Neighbor* (New York, 1956), on the relations of home missions to social problems; and R. Dean Goodwin, *There Is No End* (New York, 1956), a general study of home missions, religion, and social conditions. Joint effort to attain the ideal is considered by Robert T. Handy, in *We Witness Together* (New York, 1956), with bibliography, and a thorough discussion of cooperative home missions.

2. DENOMINATIONAL HOME MISSIONS. Histories of denominational home missions are practically innumerable. They are included in the bibliographies of general histories. The following titles illustrate typical work of various churches, and the attitudes of representative persons who took part in it.

One of the most stimulating accounts is that of Baptist enterprise in Charles L. White, *A Century of Faith . . . Centenary Volume Published for the American Baptist Home Missionary Society* (Philadelphia, 1932). This is based on

original sources and reviews achievements since 1832, the heroic service of frontier preachers, the broadening conception of missions, and their statesmanlike planning and execution. The story is continued by G. Pitt Beers, *Ministry to Turbulent America* (Philadelphia, 1957), covering the fifth quarter century. The important part of women in supporting domestic missions appears in Bertha Grimmell Judd, *Fifty Golden Years; the First Half Century of the Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society, 1877–1927* (Rochester, N.Y., 1927), with bibliography. Regional activities are summarized in Frank W. Padelford, *The Commonwealths and the Kingdom, A Study of the Missionary Work of State Conventions* (Philadelphia, 1913), a standard history of ventures conducted by Northern conventions. Accomplishments of the Southern Baptist Convention are described by Victor I. Masters, ed., *The Home Mission Task* (Atlanta, 1912).

The Disciples' home missions are described in a comprehensive *Survey of Service, Organizations Represented in the International Convention of Disciples of Christ* (St. Louis, 1928), including all contemporary missionary, evangelistic, and social work, with some historical background.

The most thorough narrative of Episcopalian home missions is by Julia C. Emery, a leader in the Woman's Auxiliary: *A Century of Endeavor, 1821–1921, A Record of the First Hundred Years of the Domestic and Foreign Missionary Society of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America* (New York, 1921), the result of minute research in original sources. Hugh Latimer Burleson, a distinguished Western missionary bishop, in *The Conquest of the Continent* (New York, 1912, 2nd ed.), with bibliography, tells the full story of home missions. An excellent brief summary of origins is in E. Clowes Chorley, "The Missionary March of the Episcopal Church, 1789–1835," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 15, no. 3 (Sept. 1946), pp. 169–208.

The earliest general history of Methodist home missions

is included in J. M. Reid, *Missions and Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church,* revised and extended by J. T. Gracey (New York, 1895–1896, 3 vols.), derived from rich manuscript and printed sources, and ascribing the rebirth of missionary spirit to the Wesleyan revival. Wade Crawford Barclay's *History of Methodist Missions* (New York, 1949–1957, 3 vols.) includes bibliographies, and is an official account derived from extended research, and comprising early motivation and expansion, reform, and the broadening horizon, 1845–1895. A good brief summary is Jay Samuel Stowell's *Home Mission Trails* (New York and Cincinnati, 1920).

Work in the Southern branch, nearly to the reunion of 1939, is covered by James Cannon, III, *History of Southern Methodist Missions* (Nashville, 1926), with an extensive bibliography including primary records. He notices the influence of zealous Thomas Coke and Francis Asbury, and includes Western, Indian, Negro, immigrant, urban, industrial, and rural missions. An excellent discussion of the obligation of home missions is Elmer Talmage Clark's *Healing Ourselves, The First Task of the Church in America* (Nashville, 1924). Missions of the Free Methodist Church are narrated in Carrie Turrell Burritt, *The Story of Fifty Years* (Winona Lake, Ind., 1935).

Presbyterian home missions are most comprehensively described by Hermann Nelson Morse's *From Frontier to Frontier; an Interpretation of 150 Years of Presbyterian National Missions* (Philadelphia, 1952). The contributions of several eminent Presbyterian missionaries, among white settlers and Indians, are described in *Home Mission Heroes; a Series of Sketches* (New York, 1904). Another good biographical source is Homer McMillan, *Other Men Labored* (Richmond, Va., 1937), an account of missions in the Presbyterian Church, U.S.A. Those of the United Presbyterian Church are surveyed by Ralph W. McGranahan, *At Work in the Homeland; Home Mission Study* (Pittsburgh, 1930). Expansion

in the South is reviewed in Ernest Trice Thompson, *Presbyterian Missions in the Southern States* (Philadelphia, 1934).

General histories and surveys of some other denominations illustrate the immensity of missionary enterprise within the United States. Charles Edmund Schaeffer's *Beside All Waters, a Study in Home Missions* (St. Louis, 1937) discusses efforts of the former Evangelical and Reformed Church. For the Evangelical Synod of North America there is Paul Albert Wobus, *Little Sections of a Big Job* (St. Louis, 1933), with references. Another comprehensive story of denominational evangelism is Suzanne E. Weddell, *Marching Thousands; a Story of the Domestic Missions Program, Carried on Within the United States and Mexico, by the Reformed Church in America* (New York, 1933), with bibliography. A story of missionary work, large out of proportion to the denomination's size, is told in Harry Emilius Stocker, *A Home Mission History of the Moravian Church in the United States and Canada, Northern Province* (New York, 1924). Lutheran missions are reviewed by Johan Carl Keyser Preus, *Widening the Frontier; Sketches and Incidents from the Home Mission Field* (Minneapolis, 1929); Joel Ranson Ellis Hunt, *Lutheran Home Missions; a Call to the Home Church* (Rock Island, 1913); and Axel Erickson Berg, *On the Border Line* (Rock Island, 1939), a collection of missionary narratives.

3. THE FRONTIER AND THE WEST. The best general authority on frontier evangelization is Colin B. Goodykoontz, *Home Missions on the American Frontier, with Particular Reference to the American Home Missionary Society* (Caldwell, Id., 1939), with a selected bibliography. Inspired by Frederick Jackson Turner's thesis of the influence of the frontier, it is well documented, judicious, and accurate. It emphasizes cooperative work of the Congregationalists and Presbyterians, and includes various aspects of missions. The Congregational-Presbyterian missionary alliance is emphasized by Frederick Irving Kuhns, "The Operations of the American Home Mis-

sionary Society in the Old Northwest, 1826–1861" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1947, typewritten copy). Drawing heavily upon unpublished letters of missionaries, official church records, newspapers, and magazines, this traces relations and accomplishments, disputes about missions and the slavery question, and influence in establishing colleges and seminaries.

Especially important in setting the pattern of Western missions was the Congregational Missionary Society of Connecticut, whose work has been described in Edwin Pond Parker, *Historical Discourse in Commemoration of the One Hundredth Anniversary of the Missionary Society of Connecticut* (Hartford, 1898). Using missionaries' letters, he sketches the endeavor that founded nearly 500 churches by 1859.

A fairly typical record of local work is Joseph Badger's *A Memoir . . . Containing an Autobiography, and Selections from his Private Journal and Correspondence* (Hudson, Ohio, 1851), recording his labors in the Western Reserve. Another, written by a close friend from personal knowledge, is George F. Magoun's *Asa Turner, A Home Missionary Patriarch and His Times* (Boston, 1889), the experiences of a Congregational minister. Equally interesting is Gardiner Spring's *Memoirs of the Rev. Samuel J. Mills, Late Missionary to the South Western Section of the United States* (New York, 1820), issued by the Evangelical Missionary Society. Supplementing such individual labors was the work of "missionary bands," like the one described in John Randolph Willis, "The Yale Band in Illinois" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1946). It was typical of groups that went to the frontier to establish churches and schools and encourage the anti-slavery cause. These inspired later groups of young seminary alumni.

Early Presbyterian efforts are typified by the story told in James Haldane Brown, "Presbyterian Beginnings in Ohio" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1952), de-

scribing missionary origins of presbyteries and synods, and the favorable influence of this strict and highly educated church upon society, morals, and public questions.

The Western push of Presbyterianism is well illustrated by the lives of three notable pioneer missionaries. Dwight Raymond Guthrie's *John McMillan, The Apostle of Presbyterianism in the West, 1752–1833* (Pittsburgh, 1952), with bibliography, traces the exciting career of a frontier pastor, missionary zealot, and educator, the outstanding clergyman in the West around 1800. Clifford Merrill Drury, *Pioneer of Old Oregon; Henry Harmon Spalding* (Caldwell, Id., 1936), with bibliography, remedies the neglect of him due to the greater fame of the martyred Whitman, and is a source book containing much previously unpublished material. Jackson and his family provided the materials for Robert Laird Stewart's *Sheldon Jackson, Pathfinder and Prospector of the Missionary Vanguard in the Rocky Mountains and Alaska* (New York, 1908, 2nd ed.). The story of this intrepid minister's effort to win the West for Presbyterianism is interestingly related by Alvin Keith Bailey's "The Strategy of Sheldon Jackson in Opening the West for National Missions: 1860–1880" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1948, partly published in the *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*). This reveals his departure from established policies and practices to fashion his own strategies to meet unprecedented problems, while he fought conservative opposition. Jackson wrote his own missionary epic in *Alaska, and Missions on the North Pacific Coast* (New York, 1880), and has found appreciation as a great civilizer of the frontier, in J. Arthur Lazell, *Alaskan Apostle, the Life Story of Sheldon Jackson* (New York, 1960).

The best known and most colorful phase of Methodist missions is their penetration of the Far Northwest, as described by Archer Butler Hulbert and Dorothy Printup Hulbert, eds., in *The Oregon Crusade, Across Land and Sea to Oregon, with Bibliographical Résumé, 1830–1840* (Denver,

1935), consisting chiefly of selected documents of the Methodist and American Board Missions. This should be used together with their *Marcus Whitman, Crusader* (Colorado Springs, 1936–1941, 3 vols.); and with Cornelius J. Brosnan, *Jason Lee, Prophet of the New Oregon* (New York, 1932), with bibliography, an appreciation of an outstanding leader in the colonization of Oregon, tending to glorify the missionaries, and containing valuable source materials. Methodist enterprise in another inland empire is narrated by Walter Brownlow Posey in "The Advance of Methodism into the Lower Southwest," *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Nov. 1936), pp. 439–452.

The Baptists have one of the most complete records of home missions in Walter Sinclair Stewart's *Early Baptist Missionaries and Pioneers* (Philadelphia, 1925–1926), with bibliography; and *Later Baptist Missionaries and Pioneers* (1928–1929, 2 vols.), with bibliography in Vol. 1. Excellent studies of regional activities are: Robert A. Baker, "The American Baptist Home Missionary Society and the South, 1832–1894" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1947); Walter Brownlow Posey, "The Early Baptist Church in the Lower Southwest," *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 10, no. 2 (May 1944), pp. 161–173; and R. P. Rider, "The Pioneer Period of Baptist History in Missouri (1796–1834)," *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 7, no. 4 (July 1927), pp. 387–395.

Episcopalian pioneer Western evangelism is illustrated by the remarkable career of the first Bishop of Ohio. His labors as missionary and educator are appreciated in James Arthur Muller's documented essay, "Philander Chase and the Frontier," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 14, no. 2 (June 1945), pp. 168–184. One of the most interesting Episcopal missionary stories is by Cyrus Townsend Brady, *Recollections of a Missionary in the Great West* (New York, 1901).

An excellent general review of Protestant evangelism in a frontier state is Robert Edgar Ledbetter's "The Planting and

Growth of the Protestant Denominations in Texas Prior to 1850" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1950, microfilm), which considers recruiting of missionaries, administration, expansion, and education of a native ministry, and includes biographies of significant missionaries. A similar story is his "Religion among the Early German Settlers of Texas, 1830–1860" (B.D. thesis, University of Chicago, 1944, typewritten).

Thrilling ventures undertaken simultaneously by several denominations penetrated the region from the Great Lakes to Puget Sound. A missionary tells part of the story in Stephen Return Riggs' "Protestant Missions in the Northwest," *Minnesota Historical Society Collections*, Vol. 6 (1894), pp. 117–188, which chronicles the Chippewa and Dakota missions. John Martin Cause, *Pilgrim and Pioneer; Dawn in the Northwest* (New York and Cincinnati, 1930) appreciates Jason Lee's journey to Oregon and his conspicuous labors there. The efforts of several churches are included in Myron Eells, *History of Indian Missions on the Pacific Coast, Oregon, Washington and Idaho,* with an Introduction by the Rev. G. H. Atkinson (Philadelphia and New York, 1882).

Domestic missions would have been greatly hampered without the assistance of the American Bible Society. Its contribution, especially in the West, is appreciated in Henry Otis Dwight, *The Centennial History of the American Bible Society* (New York, 1916, 2 vols.). This ascribes its origin to a peculiarly American condition, the isolation of unlettered frontier communities. The appendices contain an immense mass of detailed information.

4. INDIAN MISSIONS. Early Protestant missions to American Indians were due almost entirely to the devotion of lone ministers, like John Eliot, Samson Occum, David Brainerd, Marcus Whitman, Stephen Riggs, and John Lewis Dyer. Their work is described in Mary Gay Humphreys, ed., *Missionary Explorers among the American Indians* (New York, 1913). One of the most effective laborers (although one of

the lesser known) has received due credit in Lloyd Custer Mayhew Hare, *Thomas Mayhew, Patriarch to the Indians, 1593–1682* (New York, 1932), with a short bibliography and authorities mentioned in the text. This English merchant, a missioner on the islands of southeastern Massachusetts, stands with William Penn and John Eliot as a statesman of Indian evangelism. A later apostle receives a worthy tribute in Richard Ellsworth Day, *Flagellant on Horseback; the Life Story of David Brainerd* (Philadelphia, 1950). A notable Indian missionary to his own people has been carefully delineated in William DeLoss Love's *Samson Occum, and the Christian Indians of New England* (Boston, 1899).

Among the more successful Indian missionaries were the Moravian Brethren, inspired by the Pietist evangelism of Halle. The greatest of their early apostles is exhaustively discussed by Edmund De Schweinitz, in *The Life and Times of David Zeisberger* (Philadelphia, 1871), which is still the best biography. Origins of Episcopalian missions to the Red Man appear in a scholarly monograph by Frank Joseph Klingberg: *Anglican Humanitarianism in Colonial New York* (Philadelphia, 1940), with bibliography, which gives much attention to the Mohawk mission of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts.

Samuel Colcord Bartlett, *Historical Sketch of the Missions of the American Board among the North American Indians* (Boston, 1876) is a brief and not scholarly but informative account of the beginnings and progress of organized efforts. The new spirit, arising directly from the Second Great Awakening, is perceived in William Whites Graves, *Annals of Osage Mission* (St. Paul, Kan., 1935), and in his *The First Protestant Osage Missions, 1820–1837* (Oswego, Kan., 1949), with a mine of information in the bibliography.

Culturally, the most remarkable mission was established in 1817 among the Cherokees of Tennessee, and continued until they moved to Oklahoma in 1838. It is reviewed in a lively narrative of great human interest by Robert Sparks Walker,

Torchlights to the Cherokees, The Brainerd Mission (New York, 1931), based largely upon archives of the American Board, and indicating the civilizing influence of cooperation between missionaries and the United States Government. Colorful details of Cherokee mission life, related in a literary style above average, is in Althea L. B. Bass, *Cherokee Messenger* (Norman, Okla., 1936), an account of the Rev. Samuel A. Worcester's mission (1825–1835) in Georgia and Oklahoma. Ralph H. Gabriel's *Elias Boudinot, Cherokee, and His America* (Norman, Okla., 1941) depicts an Indian religious leader who left Georgia and tried to found a civilization in Oklahoma. It is drawn from many previously unpublished letters and documents, and treats Boudinot as one in whom two cultures mingled.

The vast work of other groups may be reviewed by a few selected titles. For the Quakers Rayner Wickersham Kelsey in *Friends and the Indians, 1655–1917* (Philadelphia, 1917) presents a carefully written study, from the first missionary activity of the Society in America.

Baptist enterprise in the early nineteenth century is related in great detail by Isaac McCoy, *History of the Baptist Indian Missions: Embracing Remarks on the Former and Present Condition of the Aboriginal Tribes* (Washington and New York, 1840). Robert Hamilton, *The Gospel among the Red Men, the History of Southern Baptist Indian Missions* (Nashville, 1930), with bibliography, is drawn from primary and secondary sources including government bulletins, and relates the author's thirty years of experience and observation as a missionary. Recent Baptist progress is reflected in Benjamin Franklin Belvin's *Warhorse Along the Jesus Road* (Shawnee, Okla., 1952), and Dorothy O. Bucklin's *Strong Hearts for God* (Philadelphia, 1955).

Presbyterian missions, from their origin into the early twentieth century, are described quite fully in George Fletcher McAfee, *Missions among the North American Indians under the Care of the Board of Home Missions of the Presbyterian*

Church in the U.S.A. (New York, 1903, 2nd ed.); and in Belle Marvel Brain, *The Redemption of the Red Man; an Account of Presbyterian Missions to the North American Indians of the Present Day* (New York, 1904), with references to literature. Presbyterian enterprise is emphasized in William Brown Morrison, *The Red Man's Trail* (Richmond, Va., 1932), with bibliography. Valuable information on missions of the Reformed Church in America appears in Elizabeth Merwin Page, *In Camp and Tepee; an Indian Mission Story* (New York and Chicago, 1915). Lutheran endeavors are related by Albert Keiser's *Lutheran Mission Work among the American Indians* (Minneapolis, 1922), with bibliographical notes, and in John Theodore Mueller, *Early Missionary Endeavors among the American Indians* (Columbus, Ohio, 1942).

About the time of World War I the churches began to move toward a new and more "social" concept of Indian missions. This was caused partly by the Missionary Education Movement of the United States and Canada, which issued Thomas C. Moffett's *The American Indian on the New Trail* (New York, 1914), with bibliography. An objective assessment of the task appears in *Facing the Future in Indian Missions* (New York, 1932), with a reading list, and an introduction by Hugh Latimer Burleson, a Western missionary bishop of the Protestant Episcopal Church. George W. Hinman considers the topic exhaustively in *The American Indian and Christian Missions,* Introduction by Samuel A. Eliot (New York, 1933). Elaine Goodale Eastman's *Pratt, The Red Man's Moses* (Norman, Okla., 1935) is less a biography than a history of his idea that the Indian should be educated away from the reservation and the soil, led into industry and the professions, and Americanized. It contains a wealth of information on the Indian problem, welfare organizations, and schools, also biographies of Indians trained by Pratt.

A section is devoted to modern missions in a collaborative work by Gustavus Elmer Emanuel Lindquist, Erna Gunther,

John H. Holst, and Flora Warren Seymour: *The Indian in American Life* (New York, 1944), which has references with the chapters and a selected reading list. An assessment of the achievement and value of Indian missions is Lindquist's *Indians in Transition; a Study of Protestant Missions to Indians in the United States,* with collaboration of E. Russell Carter (New York, 1951). Benjamin Franklin Belvin's *The Status of the American Indian Ministry* (Shawnee, Okla., 1949), with a selected bibliography, considers only Protestants.

5. MISSIONS TO IMMIGRANTS AND OTHER SPECIAL GROUPS. Early in the twentieth century Protestants became acutely aware of the serious problems presented by hosts of unassimilated and often "unchurched" immigrants, especially in great cities. The result was a large number of books aimed to arouse interest in missions to them. A typical one is Howard Benjamin Grose, *The Incoming Millions* (New York and Chicago, 1906), an interdenominational home mission study course, with bibliography. His *Aliens or Americans?* (New York, 1906) challenged the Protestant churches to evangelize "unchurched" aliens, through a course directed toward inspiring women's work among newcomers. The approach was assisted by numerous guides, such as Samuel McLanahan's *Our People of Foreign Speech; a Handbook Distinguishing and Describing Those in the United States . . . with Particular Reference to Religious Work among Them* (New York, 1904, 2nd ed.). A similar one, by Amy Blanche Greene and Frederic A. Gould, *Handbook-Bibliography on Foreign Language Groups in the United States and Canada* (New York, 1925) was compiled for the Committee on New Americans of the Home Missions Council and Council of Women for Home Missions.

A principal aim of missions to immigrants was Americanization. The aims and methods are evident in a publication issued by the Interdenominational Conference on Work with New Americans, Chicago, 1935: *New Americans Today; Proceedings . . . Chicago, November 21 and 22, 1935* (New

York, 1936). The meeting was held under the auspices of the Chicago Church Federation, the Home Missions Council, and the Council of Women for Home Missions. The Americanizing role of the churches is considered in Georgia Elma Harkness, *The Church and the Immigrant* . . . with an Introducton by G. W. Tupper (New York, 1921), with bibliography; and in Charles Alvin Brooks, *Christian Americanization; a Task for the Churches* (New York, 1919), with bibliography, published jointly by the Council of Women for Home Missions and the Missionary Education Movement of the United States and Canada.

Protestant proselytizing among Roman Catholics and Jews played a large part in the religious-Americanizing effort. Theodore F. Abel, *Protestant Home Missions to Catholic Immigrants* (New York, 1933) studies their nature and scope, results and problems, principally among Italians, Czechs, Hungarians, and Poles, and supports the conclusion that the work is worth while and reasonably successful. A. E. Thompson, *A Century of Jewish Missions* (New York, 1902) is confined to Protestant missions and is warmly sympathetic, but undocumented.

Publications relating to home missions in various immigrant communities are almost innumerable. Most of them have been written by those who personally approached the newcomers. There is an intenser interest in seeing them with the eyes of the immigrants, as in Margaret Rebecca Hines Seebach's *Land of All Nations* (New York, 1924), an account of home missions as viewed by new Americans of varied origins. A similar insight is gained from Bessie Olga Pehotsky, *The Slavic Immigrant Woman* (Cincinnati, 1925), with a reading list.

Antonio Mangano, *Sons of Italy, A Social and Religious Study of the Italians in America* (New York, 1917), by an Italian Protestant leader, has much material on Protestant missions. Another valuable general survey is John B. Bisceglia's *Italian Evangelical Pioneers* (Kansas City, Mo.,

1948). An objective and frank estimate of results in a large community is Francis D. DeBilio, "Protestant Mission Work Among Italians in Boston" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1949; abstract published by Boston University). He describes work begun by denominations in 1890 in "store front" missions serving temporal needs, but without great permanent success after fifty years of effort. The failure was due to emphasis upon "immediacy," and to discrimination, denominationalism, snobbery, over-expensiveness, over-churching, and lack of a sound sociological approach.

Missions to Spanish-speaking peoples have been, traditionally, the special province of the Roman Catholic Church. That Protestant churches can enter the field with considerable success is shown by Robert McLean and Grace Petrie Williams, in *Old Spain in New America* (New York, 1916), with bibliography, concerning missions in the New Southwest. Missions to Mexicans in the Southwest, and to Cubans in Florida, are reviewed in Elmer Talmage Clark and Harry C. Spencer, *Latin America, U.S.A.* (New York, 1942). A general account of such efforts is given in *Who? Spanish-speaking Americans in the U.S.A.*, ed. Mae Hurley Ashworth (New York, 1953), illustrated. Southern Methodist work among Italians, Mexicans, and Cubans is described by Elmer Talmage Clark in *The Latin Immigrant in the South* (Nashville and Dallas, 1924), illustrated, reprinted from his *Healing Ourselves*. Surprising success of one denomination is revealed in Una Roberts Laurence, *Winning the Border; Baptist Missions among the Spanish-speaking Peoples of the Border* (Atlanta, 1935).

Protestant missions to Oriental peoples have been one of the more successful enterprises, winning many and acting as a potent Americanizing influence. The earliest, directed to the Chinese, is chronicled in Ira M. Condit, *The Chinaman as We See Him and Fifty Years of Work for Him* (New York, 1900), which reflects his personal experience as a missionary on the Pacific Coast. A broad survey of endeavors in

all Oriental groups is Philip Francis Payne's *Gold Mountain* (New York, 1934). Attention is given to missions by Albert Wentworth Palmer, *Orientals in American Life* (New York, 1934), with an annotated book list. Allan Armstrong Hunter gives a more extensive account in *Out of the Far East* (New York, 1934), with a selected reading list, covering all Orientals in the United States. A most interesting and detailed narrative is Toru Matsumoto, *Beyond Prejudice; a Story of the Church and Japanese Americans* (New York, 1946), with reading references, and special attention to experiences in concentration camps during World War II. Rose Hum Lee, *The Chinese in the United States of America* (Hong Kong, 1960), with bibliography, in ch. 13, "Chinese Christian Churches," discusses Chinese beliefs in America, the home mission movement among Chinese, and the churches as "hybrid institutions."

Denominational work with special groups is covered by a fairly extensive literature. The approach of a missionary society to a particular group is well illustrated by the history of the Evangelical Church Society of the West: Carl Edward Schneider, *The German Church on the American Frontier; a Study in the Rise of Religion among the Germans of the West, based on the History of the Evangelischer Kirchenverein des Westens . . . 1840–1866* (St. Louis, 1939), with bibliography, a detailed and scholarly account, based upon extensive research. A similar experience is related in George J. Eisenach's *A History of the German Congregational Churches in the United States* (Yankton, S.D., 1938), derived largely from documentary and personal sources, with a bibliography. These churches sprang from Pietism in the homeland, and from revival meetings and appeals to immigrants dissatisfied with confessional and denominational restrictions.

The scope of Anglican efforts to win the "unchurched" stranger is outlined by a report of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the U.S.A., National Council, Dept. of Missions and Church Extension: *Neighbors, Studies in Immigration*

from the Standpoint of the Episcopal Church (New York, 1920), with reference books, and accounts of missions to Near Easterners, Italians, Scandinavians, and Slavs, and the translation of the Prayer Book into foreign tongues. Presbyterian approaches have been briefly described in Jacob Avery Long, *Scotch, Irish, and* — (New York, 1943), with bibliography.

Southern Baptist missions to the foreign-born have found a competent appreciation in Marie Buhlmaier's *Along the Highway of Service* (Atlanta, 1924). One community is closely analyzed in a study by Samuel M. Ortegon, "Religious Thought and Practice Among Mexican Baptists in the United States, 1900–1947" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1950, typewritten). He shows the influence of economic status upon their organization and their Fundamentalist belief, and lack of strong, educated leadership —a picture of a low-income group struggling with handicaps. A much better organized, higher-class immigrant denomination is the Danish Baptist General Conference of America, whose history is told in detail in *Seventy-five Years of Danish Baptist Missionary Work in America* (Philadelphia and Boston, 1931).

One of the most interesting peculiar missionary areas is the mountain South. Elizabeth R. Hooker has written perhaps the best account in her *Religion in the Highlands; Native Churches and Missionary Enterprises in the Southern Appalachian Area* (1933).

The Depression of the 1930's, with its unsettling social influences, confronted Protestant churches with a vast problem: ministering to migrant workers and interstate movements of population caused by new industrial patterns. Adela J. Ballard's *Roving with the Migrants* (New York, 1931), with "Source Material," points up the difficulties of maintaining their church and social affiliations. Various ways in which home missions can serve displaced families are described by Benson Young Landis, ed., *Uprooted Americans; 5 Pamphlets on Population Shifts in America Today* (New York, 1940),

with reading lists. Home missions and internal migration are considered in a brief but penetrating study by Mark A. Dawber: *America's Changing Frontiers* (New York, 1945, new ed.). A noted Presbyterian authority on missions, Hermann Nelson Morse, give a comprehensive list of readings in *These Moving Times; the Home Mission of the Church in the Light of Social Trends and Population Shifts* (Richmond, Va., 1945). Problems presented by rapidly shifting population are thoroughly explored in the National Lutheran Council's *Christ for the Moving Millions, a Conference on Mobility . . . Detroit, Michigan, December 14–15–16, 1954* (Chicago, 1955), with bibliographical footnotes. Special ministries in war-created settlements are briefly summarized in a booklet issued by the Christian Commission for Camp and Defense Communities, Inter-church Committee for Volunteer Service in Defense Areas: *A Guide to Church Volunteer Service in Defense Areas* (New York, 1944), with bibliography and resource materials. (See also Part Three, sect. VI, D, 5, *The City Church.*)

B. Religious Education

Religious education, operating in complete freedom, is one of the greatest and most effective enterprises of American religious "voluntarism." Outside the vast Roman Catholic parochial school system, it is administered mostly by the Protestant Sunday School. Among larger Protestant denominations, only the Lutheran Church has an extensive organized system of parochial schools.

Sunday Schools are staffed almost entirely by volunteer teachers and superintendents; ordinarily, only professional directors of religious education in larger churches are paid. They are among the world's largest educational enterprises, with a far greater number of pupils than all Protestant and Roman Catholic parochial schools. To administer and guide

them the churches have developed efficient departments in their national and local offices.

By means of selected works the following sections trace the evolution of the American Protestant philosophy of religious education, and illustrate representative Sunday School movements and Protestant parochial schools.

I. PHILOSOPHY: RELIGIOUS EDUCATION AND DEMOCRACY. Sandford Fleming, *Children and Puritanism* (New Haven, 1933) explains the orthodox, conservative view of Christian education, with which Protestant religious training began. Lewis B. Schenck, *The Presbyterian Doctrine of Children in the Covenant* (New Haven, 1940) reviews the strict and conservative-orthodox view of religious education, against which Horace Bushnell protested (see below). A very extensive bibliography of catalogs and lists of Sunday School literature, 1832 onward, is under the heading "b. Books recommended," ch. 12, "Religious Education," in John G. Barrow, *A Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion.* It illustrates the materials and the changing philosophy of religious education since the Sunday School movement got under way. A. B. Cushman, "A Nineteenth Century Plan for Reading," *Horn Book,* Vol. 33, no. 1 (Feb. 1957), pp. 61–71, no. 2 (Apr. 1957), pp. 159–166, illustrates the influence of the American Sunday School movement on children's literature with a moral purpose.

The beginning of a shift from both the didactic and the revivalist views of religious education, under the impact of Horace Bushnell's theory of Christian nurture, is strikingly revealed in A. J. W. Myers, *Horace Bushnell and Religious Education* (Boston, 1937), which gives an account of his life and influence. Included are the origins of his *Views of Christian Nurture,* its reception by reviewers, Bushnell's controversy with the Calvinist Bennett Tyler, an analysis of his theory of Christian nurture, and his continuing influence upon religious education. Rachael Henderlite, *The Theological Basis*

of Horace Bushnell's Christian Nurture (New Haven, 1947) avers that the founder of the modern Christian education movement was *associated* with the development of liberal theology, and concludes that he was not strictly a "liberal" theologian, but in harmony with the main stream of Christian faith in all essentials. Robert Varnell Ozment, "Conversion in Christian Education and Revivalism" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University School of Theology, 1956; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1956), pub. no. 17,036; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1956), Vol. 16, no. 8, pp. 1515–1516) sees evangelism and Christian education as not mutually exclusive, but as parts of the same process, both implying direct dependence upon God; but Christian nurture is to be preferred.

The close connection between changing theology and new concepts of religious education is suggested by Riley Herman Pittman, "The Meaning of Salvation in the Thought of George Albert Coe, William Clayton Bower, and George Herbert Betts" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1946; abstract published by the University). This compares their thought with that of eminent twentieth-century theologians in the light of recent criticism of modern religious education. They emphasized social-psychological insights rather than philosophical and theological; salvation means the realization of self through spiritual values. Recent development is traced by Theodore Goodwin Belote in "The Theology of Leading Religious Educators of the Twentieth Century" (Th.M. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1956), with bibliography.

The new sociological "slant" was deeply concerned with the democratic way of life. This ideal of education for citizenship appears in such works as Walter Scott Athearn, *Religious Education and American Democracy* (Boston and Chicago, 1917), with references; and his *Character Building in a Democracy* (New York, 1924), with essays on remedies for spiritual illiteracy, evolution of the church school, organiza-

tion and supervision of religious education, selection and training of teachers, evangelism and religious education, and future church schools; and Francis Greenwood Peabody, *The Religious Education of an American Citizen* (New York, 1918).

Much of the more recent thought emphasizes religion as the foundation of democracy, and cooperation between the churches and public education. The problem of religious education as related to liberty is posed in Gaines Stanley Dobbins, *Can a Religious Democracy Survive?* (New York, 1941), with an introduction by John R. Sampey, and a bibliography.

The discussion centers in secularization of public education, and modern effort to achieve a measure of cooperation between church and secular school. The long-dominant secular trend is traced by William Kailer Dunn in *What Happened to Religious Education? The Decline of Religious Teaching in the Public Elementary School, 1776–1861* (Baltimore, 1958), with bibliography. The reaction toward cooperation appears in Harold Saxe Tuttle, *Character Education by State and Church* (New York and Cincinnati, 1930), with bibliography and references at the end of most of the chapters. Growing advocacy of religious education in the secular school is the theme of Conrad Augustine Hauser, *Teaching Religion in the Public School* (New York, 1942); Edward K. Worrell, *Restoring God to Education* (Wheaton, Ill., 1950), with bibliographical footnotes; Clyde Lemont Hay, *The Blind Spot in American Public Education* (New York, 1950); and James Gregory Keller, *All God's Children; What Your Schools Can Do For Them* (Garden City, N.Y., 1953).

A few selected works illustrate trends in the past generation, respecting religious education in the church-related and secular public schools. (1) Walter Albion Squires, *Educational Movements of Today; an Attempt to Define, Analyze, and Evaluate Some of the Educational Tendencies of Today as They Exist in the Schools of the Church and the Schools of the State with a View to Discovering their Significance for Morality and Religion* (Philadelphia, 1930), with bibliog-

raphy. (2) Hugh Hartshorne, Helen R. Stearns, and Willard E. Uphaus, *Standards and Trends in Religious Education* (New Haven, 1933), with references, including general practice, Sunday Schools, colleges, and universities. (3) Tilford Tippett Swearingen, *The Community and Christian Education* (St. Louis, 1950) "includes, in part, a summary of the findings of the Conference on the Community and Christian Education, Columbus, O., Dec. 2–5, 1947." (4) Renwick Harper Martin, *The Fourth R in American Education* (Pittsburgh, 1957). (5) Philip Henry Lotz, *Orientation in Religious Education* (New York, 1950), with selected bibliography. (6) Philip Henry Phenix, *Religious Concerns in Contemporary Education; a Study of Reciprocal Relations* (New York, 1959).

Emphasis in the Sunday, weekday, and vacation church schools has shifted toward democratic and tolerant citizenship. This trend is noticed in Mildred Olivia Moody Eakin and Frank Eakin, *The Sunday School Fights Prejudice* (New York, 1953). Evolution and activity of weekday schools are surveyed in the following titles: (1) Nathaniel Frederick Forsyth, *Weekday Church Schools, Their Organization and Administration* (New York and Cincinnati, 1930), with illustrations and references. (2) Donald Rex Gorham, *The Status of Protestant Weekday Church Schools in the United States* (Philadelphia, 1934), with bibliography. (3) Mary Dabney Davis, *Weekday Classes in Religious Education, Conducted on Released School Time for Public-School Pupils* (Washington, D.C., 1941), with bibliography. (4) Minor Cline Miller, *Teaching the Multitudes, A Guidance Manual in Weekday Religious Education . . .* , Forward by Edward B. Paisley (Bridgewater, Va., 1944), with bibliography. (5) Kenneth Leroy Thompson, *Weekday Religious Education in the High Schools of the United States* (Philadelphia, 1938), with illustrations and selected bibliography.

The vacation church school, one of the important forces in religious and moral training, was well under way by the

1930's, and is described in Winfred Dyer Blair, *The New Vacation Church School* (New York and London, 1939, 5th ed., enl.), with bibliographies. The most scholarly comprehensive appreciation is Elsie Miller Butt, *The Vacation Church School in Christian Education* (New York, 1957), with illustrations and bibliography.

On a deeper level, educational thinkers have been seeking a philosophy of religion for the church-related and secular colleges, as in Horace Carlton Hathcoat, *The Christian College in a Secular Age* (Nappanee, Ind., 1947); Nels F. S. Ferré, *Christian Faith and Higher Education* (New York, 1954); John Paul von Grueningen, ed., *Toward a Christian Philosophy of Higher Education* (Philadelphia, 1957); Merrimon Cuninggim, *The College Seeks Religion* (New Haven, 1947), with bibliographical references; and Henry Pitney Van Dusen, *God in Education; a Tract for the Times* (New York, 1951), with bibliography.

Actual and practical programs of religious education at higher levels have been the subject of many valuable scholarly studies. One of the earliest and best is by Christian Frederick Gauss, ed. [and others]: *The Teaching of Religion in American Higher Education* (New York, 1951). Various essays on this topic are gathered in *Religious Perspectives in College Teaching*, by Hoxie N. Fairchild [and others] (New York, 1952). Among the more thorough investigations of the contemporary status of religious teaching on the campus is a report issued by Cornell College, Mount Vernon, Iowa: *Religion in Higher Education; Report of the Centennial Convocation and Conference on Religion in Higher Education* (Mount Vernon, 1954), with bibliographical footnotes. The revival of interest is disclosed by Charles S. McCoy and Neely D. McCarter, *The Gospel on Campus; Rediscovering Evangelism in the Academic Community* (Richmond, 1959), with bibliography.

These general reviews of the growing reaction toward religious education in higher learning should be considered with

reference to studies of actual programs, particularly in Protestant colleges. Such an examination is Theron Charlton McGee, *Religious Education in Certain Evangelical Colleges —a Study in Status and Tendencies* (Philadelphia, 1928), with selected bibliography. A more thorough study is in Paul Everett Mininger, "Religious Programs in Selected Protestant Church-related Colleges" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pennsylvania; *University Microfilms* (1952), pub. no. 3631; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1952), Vol. 12, no. 3, p. 269). A similar study is Eugene Rone Arnold, "Survey of Religious Activities of Liberal Arts Colleges Related to Churches Composing the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh; *University Microfilms* (1957), pub. no. 20,997; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1957), Vol. 17, no. 5, pp. 1008–1009, with bibliography). The Council for Religion in Independent Schools has promoted interest in religious training, and has issued one of the most perceptive studies of the situation in *The Christian Faith and Youth Today*, edited by Malcolm Strachan and Alvord M. Beardslee (Greenwich, Conn., 1957), with bibliography. This should be read together with Robert Cecil Mildram, *A Study of Religion in the Independent Schools* (New York, 1950), with bibliographical footnotes. (See also Part Three, sect. V, B, *Higher Education and Religion*, and D, *Religion and Public Education*.)

2. SUNDAY SCHOOLS. Henry Clay Trumbull, *The Sunday-School, Its Origin, Mission, Methods, and Auxiliaries* (Philadelphia, 1888) was delivered as the Lyman Beecher Lectures before Yale Divinity School, 1888, and has a bibliography. Also valuable, and with many references to the United States, is Henry Frederick Cope, *The Evolution of the Sunday School* (Boston and New York, 1911), with a reading list. Marianna C. Brown, *Sunday-School Movements in America* (New York, 1901), with bibliography, was derived partly from unpublished materials, obtained from notes and verbal statements of leading Sunday-School workers. The bibliog-

raphy includes a variety of books and articles on American Sunday Schools, and the work itself is a very complete history up to its date, with critical comment, especially in the conclusions.

One of the best general histories is an illustrated volume issued under the auspices of the International Sunday-School Convention of the United States and British American Provinces, 11th, Toronto, 1905: *The Development of the Sunday-School, 1780–1905* (Boston, 1905). Edwin Wilbur Rice, *The Sunday-School Movement, 1780–1917, and the American Sunday-School Union, 1817–1917* (Philadelphia, 1917) has some bibliographical notes, especially on Sunday-School literature. It is the most complete volume on the subject, comprising the origins of Sunday Schools, and extensive notes on curricula, unions, creation of children's literature, missionary and extension work, housing, finances, evolution of uniform and graded lessons, conventions, associations, institutes, assemblies, and organized denominational work. E. Morris Fergusson, *Historic Chapters in Christian Education in America, A Brief History of the American Sunday School Movement and the Rise of the Modern Church School* (New York, 1935) is written with romantic zeal, and is invaluable for study of the progress of Christian nurture in recent decades. The influence of the Sunday School upon the general character of the Protestant churches is studied in Oscar Stewart Michael, *The Sunday-school in the Development of the American Church* (Milwaukee, 1904).

Frank Glenn Lankard, *A History of the American Sunday School Curriculum* (New York and Cincinnati, 1927), with bibliography, is an authoritative and definitive work, covering the period 1800–1925, and is based upon original sources, reports of Sunday-School unions, and histories of Sunday Schools in various churches. It attempts to show the evolution of the curriculum from socio-religious processes, to the modern graded curriculum. Marvin J. Taylor, "Changing Conceptions of the Role of the Bible in the Curriculum of

American Protestant Religious Education, 1903 to 1953, as Reflected in Certain Selected Periodical Literature" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh; *University Microfilms* (1954), pub. no. 9992; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1954), Vol. 14, no. 12, p. 2420, with bibliography) is the most complete study.

A thorough study of the beginnings in a region is in George Stewart, *A History of Religious Education in Connecticut to the Middle of the Nineteenth Century* (New Haven, 1924), which has a bibliography of manuscripts, newspapers, periodicals, sermons, pamphlets, histories, and biographies. It emphasizes the connection between Sunday Schools and revivals. Reports are cited to demonstrate that most converts were regularly instructed in Bible class or Sunday School.

Probably the most complete and best documented accounts of Sunday Schools in any American denomination are three volumes by Clifton Hartwell Brewer: *A History of Religious Education in the Episcopal Church to 1835* (New Haven, 1924), with bibliography, a definitive study based upon original source material; *Early Episcopal Sunday Schools, 1814–1865* (Milwaukee and London, 1933), with bibliography, derived from biographies and histories, journals of diocesan conventions, reports, periodical articles, lesson manuals, library books, and liturgical material; also a complete and definitive work; and *Later Episcopal Sunday Schools* (New York, 1939), with bibliography, which covers the period from 1865 to the 1930's, including methods of teaching, courses of study, worship services, the Sunday-School library, and various types of schools.

Robert Henry Thurau, "A Study of the Lutheran Sunday School in America to 1865" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1946; available also at Lutheran College Seminary Library, Philadelphia, and Wittenberg College Library, Springfield, Ohio) traces the history from the beginnings, and concludes that the outlook at the time of writing is not hopeful, showing deep concern for the future.

3. SOME CHURCH SCHOOL SYSTEMS. *a. Roman Catholic.* The largest and most complete religious school organization is that of the Roman Catholic Church. The Church's doctrine being that education is an essentially religious function, the system therefore comprises all stages of instruction, from the elementary parochial school to the senior college. Except the Lutheran Church, no other major religious group has such an integrated concept of a system of church-controlled schools.

The rise and growth of this vast organization, to the early twentieth century, are adequately reviewed in James Aloysius Burns, *The Principles, Origin, and Establishment of the Catholic School System in the United States* (Cincinnati, 1912), derived chiefly from well-known printed material, and partly from manuscript sources. It is continued by his *The Growth and Development of the Catholic School System in the United States* (Cincinnati, 1912), covering the period after about 1840. A formal outline, by Burns and Bernard J. Kohlbrenner, is *A History of Catholic Education in the United States* . . . (New York and Cincinnati, 1937), selected references with chapters.

The philosophy and spirit of Catholic schools are explained by William Joseph McGucken's *The Catholic Way in Education* (Milwaukee, 1934). The status of the Church's educational philosophy in American democracy are discussed in Catholic University of America, *Vital Problems of Catholic Education in the United States,* edited by Roy J. Deferrari (Washington, D.C., 1939), consisting of lectures, including some with bibliography. This is continued in his *Essays on Catholic Education in the United States* (Washington, D.C., 1942). The modern American Catholic philosophy appears in Leo Richard Ward, *New Life in Catholic Schools* (St. Louis, 1958), and in James Milton O'Neill, *The Catholic in Secular Education,* Introduction by George N. Shuster (New York, 1956).

There are some well-documented histories of Roman Cath-

olic systems in states and dioceses. Especially enlightening are Sister M. Salesia Godecker's *History of Catholic Education in Indiana; a Survey of the Schools, 1702–1925* (Washington, D.C., 1925), with bibliography; Arthur James Heffernan, *A History of Catholic Education in Connecticut* (Washington, D.C., 1937), with bibliography; Richard Joseph Bollig, *History of Catholic Education in Kansas, 1836–1932* (Washington, D.C., 1933), with extensive bibliography; William E. North, *Catholic Education in Southern California* (Washington, D.C., 1936), with bibliography; William H. Jones, *The History of Catholic Education in the State of Colorado* (Washington, D.C., 1955); and Mary Ancilla Leary, *The History of Catholic Education in the Diocese of Albany* (Washington, D.C., 1957).

The basis of the Roman Catholic system is the elementary parochial school. An excellent exposition of its philosophy is Laurina Kaiser's *The Development of the Concept and Function of the Catholic Elementary School in the American Parish* (Washington, D.C., 1955), with extensive bibliography. The position of elementary schools in the Catholic and the general community is thoroughly explained and analyzed by Joseph Henry Fichter, *Parochial School, a Sociological Study* (Notre Dame, Ind., 1958). A typical system of elementary schools is fully described from its origins in Sister Marie Patrice Gallaghan, *The History of Catholic Elementary Education in the Diocese of Buffalo, 1847–1944* (Washington, D.C., 1945), with illustrations and a large bibliography.

The second stage of Roman Catholic education comprises the private academies that have existed since the colonial period (usually conducted by religious orders), and the modern parochial and central high schools. Its origins are narrated in close detail by Edmund Joseph Goebel, *A Study of Catholic Secondary Education During the Colonial Period, up to the First Plenary Council of Baltimore, 1852* (New

York and Chicago, 1937), with a very comprehensive bibliography.

The classic older institution is the girls' boarding school, very completely described by Mother Benedict Murphy, "Pioneer Roman Catholic Girl's Academies: Their Growth, Character, and Contribution to American Education; a Study of Roman Catholic Education for Girls from Colonial Times to the First Plenary Council of 1852" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1958; *University Microfilms* (1958), pub. no. 58,2541; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1958), Vol. 19, no. 2, p. 267), with a large bibliography. Other scholarly studies are Sister Catharine Frances, *The Convent School of French Origin in the United States, 1727 to 1843* (Philadelphia, 1936), with bibliography; and Virginia Arville Kenny, *Convent Boarding School* (New York, 1944).

In addition to the boarding school, Catholic secondary education is increasingly administered by parish and central high schools, whose curriculum is being oriented toward moral training for democratic citizenship. The most complete account is that of Edward Francis Spiers, *The Central Catholic High Schools; a Survey of Their History and Status in the United States* (Washington, D.C., 1951), with illustrations and bibliography. Their training for civic responsibility has been reviewed by Sister Judith Long's *Preparation for Citizenship in Current Courses of Study in Catholic High Schools* (Washington, D.C., 1950), with bibliography. The entire field of Catholic secondary instruction is critically examined in Sister Mary Janet Miller, *Catholic Secondary Education, a National Survey*, Foreword by Frederick G. Hochwalt (Washington, D.C., 1949), with a bibliography; and in her *General Education in the American Catholic Secondary School* (Washington, D.C., 1952).

A comprehensive documented review of Roman Catholic secondary education is presented by scholarly studies of its history, administration, and character in several dioceses and

archdioceses: (1) Sister Mary Agnes O'Brien, *History and Development of Catholic Secondary Education in the Archdiocese of New York* (New York, 1949). (2) William P. A. Maguire, *Catholic Secondary Education in the Diocese of Brooklyn* (Washington, D.C., 1932), with bibliography. (3) Sister Mary Innocenta Montay, *The History of Catholic Secondary Education in the Archdiocese of Chicago* (Washington, D.C., 1953). (4) Sister Mary Clarence Friesenhahn, *Catholic Secondary Education in the Province of San Antonio; Its Development and Present Status* (Washington, D.C., 1930), with a small bibliography.

A special phase of Roman Catholic education is reviewed by Margaret Agneta Diggs, in *Catholic Negro Education in the United States* (Washington, D.C., 1936).

The origins and development of Roman Catholic higher education are traced by Francis Patrick Cassidy, in *Catholic College Foundations and Development in the United States, 1677–1850* (Washington, D.C., 1924), with bibliography; and Sebastian Anthony Erbacher, *Catholic Higher Education for Men in the United States, 1850–1866* (Washington, D.C., 1931), with bibliography and a list of colleges. The most comprehensive treatment of higher education for women is Sister Mariella Bowler, *A History of Catholic Colleges for Women in the United States of America* (Washington, D.C., 1933), with bibliography. Junior colleges are thoroughly and critically studied in Joseph B. Tremonti, *The Status of Catholic Junior Colleges* (Washington, D.C., 1951), an abstract of a thesis at Temple University; published also in *Catholic Educational Review* (Jan., Feb., Mar., and May, 1951). Extensive bibliographical references are given in Sister Mary Gratia Maher, *The Organization of Religious Instruction in Catholic Colleges for Women* (Washington, D.C., 1951), and Ronald Gerard Simonitsch, *Religious Instruction in Catholic Colleges for Men* (Washington, D.C., 1952).

b. Lutheran. The origins of Lutheran education, during

the early German settlement of Pennsylvania, are described in Charles Lewis Maurer, *Early Lutheran Education in Pennsylvania* (Philadelphia, 1932), with extensive bibliography; part of "A Narrative and Critical History of the Pennsylvania Germans," published by the Pennsylvania German Society. The evolution of these beginnings into the modern system of parish schools is traced by Walter Herman Beck, *Lutheran Elementary Schools in the United States, A History of the Development of Parochial Schools and Synodical Educational Policies and Programs* (St. Louis, Mo., 1939), with bibliography.

The most complete organization of schools has occurred in the Missouri Synod. Its development is illustrated by three excellent studies: (1) John Frederick Stach, *A History of the Lutheran Schools of the Missouri Synod in Michigan, 1845–1940* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1942), with an exhaustive bibliography. (2) Albert G. Merkens, "Origin and Development of Lutheran Elementary Schools of the Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod—in Northern Illinois" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1947; abstract published in *University of Pittsburgh Bulletin*, Vol. 44, no. 6, Apr. 10, 1948). This affords an insight into the development of typical orthodox Lutheran parish schools. It traces the growth from non-confessional to strictly confessional schools, without state support, and with Lutheran trained teachers, organized around the Christian ideal of life as citizen and church member. (3) Arthur Leonard Miller, *Educational Administration and Supervision of the Lutheran Schools of the Missouri Synod, 1914–50* (Chicago, 1951). The educational principles of this conservative synod are thoroughly discussed by Allan Hart Jahsmann, *What's Lutheran in Education; Explorations into Principles and Practices* (St. Louis, 1960).

The best account of high schools is that of Carl Stamm Meyer, ed., *The Lutheran High School* (River Forest, Ill., and St. Louis, Mo., 1945), with bibliographical footnotes, and

"Materials and Books." A representative picture of collegiate and university education under Lutheran auspices is by Robert Josselyn Leonard, E. S. Evenden, and F. B. O'Rear: *Survey of Higher Education for the United Lutheran Church in America* (New York, 1929, 3 vols.), illustrated; made at the direction of the Church's Board of Education by members of the Teachers College, Columbia University.

c. Presbyterian and Reformed. The Presbyterian system of education originated largely in the early Scottish settlement of Pennsylvania. Its salient characteristics, as developed in the colonial and early national periods, are outlined in Margaret Adair Hunter, *Education in Pennsylvania Promoted by the Presbyterian Church, 1726–1837* (Philadelphia, 1937), with bibliography; tracing its development to the great schism between the Old and New Schools. Lewis Joseph Sherrill, *Presbyterian Parochial Schools, 1846–1870* (New Haven, 1932) presents, from original records, an excellent and detailed study of an important but almost forgotten movement: an abortive effort to start a Protestant parochial school system.

Robert John Bowden, "The Origin and Present Status of Educational Institutions Affiliated with the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1946) discovers and characterizes the origin and present status of parochial schools, academies, colleges, and seminaries. It stresses the Scottish educational heritage, and the effort to build a complete system with centralized control, and contemporary practice in courses, and notes loss of parochial schools, and nearly all academies.

The historical development and philosophy of higher learning in this branch of American Presbyterianism is summarized in: (1) Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A., College Board, *Presbyterian Colleges* (New York, 1913). (2) C. Harve Geiger, *The Program of Higher Education in the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A.; an Historical Analysis of its Growth in the United States* (Cedar Rapids, Iowa, 1940),

with large bibliography. (3) De Witt Carter Reddick, ed., *Church and Campus; Presbyterians Look to the Future from Their Historic Role in Christian Higher Education* [by] J. J. Murray [and others] (Richmond, 1956), with illustrations.

Education in the Southern branch of Presbyterianism is surveyed in Presbyterian Church in the U.S., General Assembly, *Report of a Survey of the Colleges and Theological Seminaries of the Presbyterian Church in the United States* (Louisville, Ky., 1942); and Presbyterian Church in the U.S., Executive Committee of Christian Education and Ministerial Relief, *Our Presbyterian Educational Institutions* (Louisville, Ky., 1914).

Frederick George Livingood describes the origin of the German Reformed system in *Eighteenth Century Reformed Church Schools* (Norristown, Pa., 1930), with illustrations and a bibliography, in part xxxv of "A Narrative and Critical History of the Pennsylvania Germans," prepared at the request of the Pennsylvania German Society. The spirit of education in the conservative branch of the Reformed Dutch Church is deeply studied in a doctoral dissertation by Jerome Bernard DeJong: "The Parent-Controlled Christian School; a Study of the Historical Background, the Theological Basis, and the Theoretical Implications of Parent-Controlled Education in the Schools Associated with the Christian Reformed Church in America" (Doctoral dissertation, New York University, 1954; *University Microfilms* (1955), pub. no, 10,628, with a bibliography; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1955), Vol. 15, no. 2, pp. 221–222).

d. Methodist. The beginnings of the Methodist educational system are thoroughly studied, with abundant bibliographical references, in Sylvanus Milne Duvall, *The Methodist Episcopal Church and Education up to 1869* (New York, 1928). This denomination's contribution has been notable especially in the area of collegiate education, and is reviewed by *The Liberal Arts College; Based upon Surveys of Thirty-*

five Colleges Related to the Methodist Episcopal Church, by Floyd W. Reeves, John Dale Russell, H. C. Gregg, A. J. Brumbaugh, and L. E. Blauch (Chicago, 1932), a study made at the direction of the Board of Education of the Church, by order of the General Conference. A further view of modern Methodist philosophy in higher education appears in Charles Pinckney Hogarth, *Policy Making in Colleges Related to the Methodist Church* (Nashville, 1949).

e. Baptist. The best general account of education, under the auspices of the largest group of American Baptists, is in Edith Clysdale Magruder, *Historical Study of the Educational Agencies of the Southern Baptist Convention, 1845–1945* (New York, 1951). This denomination's accomplishments in colleges and universities are narrated in one of the most complete accounts of higher education in a major denomination: Charles D. Johnson, *Higher Education of Southern Baptists; an Institutional History, 1826–1954* (Waco, Tex., 1956). The animating philosophy is expounded in Hubert Inman Hester, *The Christian College* (Nashville, 1940), a study prepared for the Education Commission of the Southern Baptist Convention.

f. Congregational and Disciples. Congregationalism's principal contribution to American learning has been through its numerous colleges, founded chiefly during the impulse stirred by the revival and home missionary movements of the nineteenth century. These schools are briefly reviewed by the Congregational Christian College Council in *Here Are Your Colleges!* (Grinnell, Iowa, 1952). Liberalism has readily adjusted them to modern requirements, and has operated likewise with those of the Disciples, as appears in Sterling Wade Brown's study, *The Changing Function of Disciples Colleges* (Chicago, 1939), with bibliographical footnotes; part of a thesis, University of Chicago, 1936.

g. Sects. Distinguished contributions to American education have been made by smaller churches and sects, of both European and American origins, and notably by the Quakers.

Their early efforts are learnedly studied in two representative works, derived largely from primary sources: Thomas Woody, *Early Quaker Education in Pennsylvania* (New York, 1920), and his *Quaker Education in the Colony and State of New Jersey, A Source Book* (Philadelphia, 1923). The spirit of Quaker education is illustrated in a collection of documents issued by the Friends Council on Education: *Source Book on Religious Education in Friends Elementary Schools* (Philadelphia, 1951); and by Howard Haines Brinton, *Quaker Education in Theory and Practice* (Wallingford, Pa., Pendle Hill, 1958, 2nd rev. ed.).

Schools of the German sects generally have been oriented toward the preservation of communal peculiarities in doctrine and life. This trait is observed by John Ellsworth Hartzler, *Education Among the Mennonites of America . . . with an Introduction by Professor Elmer E. S. Johnson* (Danvers, Ill., 1925), with extensive bibliography. A general history of schools in the Church of the Brethren, by John S. Flory, is included in William Arthur Cable, ed., and Homer F. Sanger, *Educational Blue Book and Directory of the Church of the Brethren, 1708–1923, with Biographies* (Elgin, Ill., 1923), illustrated.

Two "sect" groups, which have experienced their principal growth in America, have published histories of their schools. For those of the Latter-Day Saints there is Milton Lynn Bennion, *Mormonism and Education* (Salt Lake City, 1939), a semi-official account, with illustrations and a large bibliography. The Adventist movement is well represented by Edward Miles Cadwallader, *A History of Seventh-Day Adventist Education* (Lincoln, Neb., 1958, 3rd ed.).

IX. IMMIGRATION AND RELIGION: NEW BASIC ELEMENTS

UNTIL the fifth decade of the nineteenth century, the religious composition of the United States was overwhelmingly

British Protestant. The striking exceptions were Eastern Pennsylvania and parts of New Jersey and Appalachia, where early German and Dutch migrations had planted the Continental European Lutheran and Reformed churches. Judaism was represented by a few synagogues in the larger towns, and was not aggressive. Roman Catholics were a small and thinly scattered minority, except in the southern counties of Maryland.

This pattern was not greatly altered until the 1840's, so that the Anglo-American churches had a long period to settle into the now familiar denominational ways. But the onset of massive Irish and German immigration modified the nation's religious composition by the settlement of large blocks of devout Roman Catholics, orthodox Lutherans, and liberal Jews. That change marked the beginning of American religious and cultural "pluralism," which now is the accepted national way of life.

The composition has been altered still further by later infusions of Eastern Orthodox and Oriental churches, cults, and philosophies. From all these ingredients there has emerged a generally accepted concept: a politically and economically unified nation with autonomous churches, which are recognized and accepted as cultural communities. As Will Herberg has observed, the nation is a federation of religious minorities, the "three faiths"—Protestant, Catholic, and Jewish—to which some would add a "fourth faith," Eastern Orthodoxy.

A. Immigration: General

David F. Bowers, *Foreign Influences in American Life, Essays and Critical Bibliographies* (Princeton, 1944) has a bibliography including some works useful for the study of European religious background and influences, and discusses the social and cultural impact and Americanization of the immigrant. Marcus Lee Hansen, *Immigrants in American*

History (Cambridge, Mass., 1940) in ch. 5 comments on the relation of immigrants to religion. Peter Roberts, *The New Immigration* (New York, 1912) includes an interesting discussion of the relations of Catholicism to immigration, and the ensuing religious and cultural problems. The impact of this wave of newcomers is discussed in Archibald McClure, *Leadership of the New America, Racial and Religious* (New York, 1916); and in Edward Alfred Steiner, *The Making of a Great Race; Racial and Religious Cross Currents in the United States* (New York and Chicago, 1929).

Indispensable to any study of the cultural and religious effects of immigration are the works of Oscar Handlin, and especially his *The American People in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge, Mass., 1954); *Immigration as a Factor in American History* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1959), with some notes on churches and religion; and *Race and Nationality in America Life* (Boston, 1957). W. Lloyd Warner and Leo Srole, *The Social Systems of American Ethnic Groups* (New Haven, 1945) in ch. 7, "The Church," has extensive notes on the European national background of ethnic churches, the development of their structures, and their sacred symbols. This is a study of the religious-ethnic traditions of immigrants, and of their modifications and adjustments. Religion has been the binding force of communities whose national feeling in the secular sphere had been suppressed. Minorities were organized as nationalities around their churches and religious traditions.

B. Roman Catholic Church

Although the first explorers of the Eastern Seaboard were Roman Catholics, and the Roman Church evangelized Florida and the Southwest, the faith did not become numerically important in the thirteen colonies that were the genesis of the United States. The English and Irish Roman Catholics of early Maryland were almost submerged in the flood of British

and German Protestantism, and because of prejudice they could not be ardently missionary.

The spread of Roman Catholicism was hindered by harsh penal laws until the liberal era of the Revolution. New constitutions then abolished many anti-Catholic restrictions inherited from English law. There was no diocese until 1790, when Baltimore was established, and the Roman Catholic population was so small that the diocese was not divided until 1808.

A great expansion began after 1830, when vast migrations from Ireland and Germany transformed the small and struggling church into a formidable spiritual, material, and social power. That impressive development was one of the outstanding triumphs of Christian propaganda and organization in the world's history.

But the triumph involved painful problems. The most difficult ones were bitter conflicts between nationalities, resentment of Irish dominance in the Church, anti-Catholic and Nativist agitation, and controversies over school funds. Having largely overcome these obstacles, the Roman Catholic Church in the United States is now the most powerful segment of Catholicism in the world. The following sections of selected titles outline its history, and its relations with and adjustment to the American environment.

1. HISTORIOGRAPHY AND BIBLIOGRAPHY. Thomas F. O'Connor, "Catholic Archives of the United States," *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 31, no. 4 (Jan. 1946), pp. 414–430, with bibliographical footnotes, reviews the Church's archival legislation. He points out the distinction between ecclesiastical and corporate institutional archives, and describes the most important collections, also the characteristics of institutional records and collections in secular, extra-Roman Catholic depositories in America and abroad.

John Paul Cadden, *The Historiography of the American Catholic Church: 1785–1943* (Washington, D.C., 1944) contains comments on the works of John Gilmary Shea, and

Catholic historical societies, with an index, and is the first part of a three-part project: Part II is "The Literature of American Church History," and Part III, "Selected Catalogue of the Literature of American Catholic Church History." Peter Keenan Guilday, *John Gilmary Shea, Father of American Catholic History, 1824–1892* (New York, 1926) is an interestingly written biography, with a critical appreciation of his work in preserving records and writing many articles and books, including his massive *History of the Catholic Church in the United States;* an extensive bibliography of his works in itself is a good guide to American Catholic historiography. Edward R. Vollmar, "Publications on United States Catholic Church History, 1850–1950" (Doctoral dissertation, St. Louis University, 1955) is a thorough critical survey. It should be supplemented by Henry J. Browne, "American Catholic History: A Progress Report on Research and Study," *Church History,* Vol. 26, no. 4 (Dec. 1957), pp. 372–380, with references in notes, which reviews the quality, content, and general accomplishment over the past ten years. The historiography during the period of reawakened interest since 1920 is illustrated by the many scholarly writings in Catholic University of America, *Studies in American Church History* (Washington, D.C., 1922–1953, 40 vols.).

The most comprehensive bibliography is Edward R. Vollmar's *The Catholic Church in America: An Historical Bibliography* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1956), alphabetically arranged by authors, with an introduction that explains its selectivity. It is a general survey of writing since the colonial period, with a topical index. John Tracy Ellis, *A Select Bibliography of the History of the Catholic Church in the United States* (New York, 1947) has been revised (1958), and includes guides, archival centers, general works, the colonial (1492–1789), middle (1789–1866), and later eras, periodicals, and historical societies.

The best documentary source books are: Donald C. Shearer, *Pontificia Americana: A Documentary History of the Cath-*

olic Church in the United States, 1784–1884 (Washington, D.C., 1933), which has important documents in the original languages, with introductory comments and summaries in English; and John Tracy Ellis, *Documents of American Catholic History* (Milwaukee, 1956).

Apollinaris William Baumgartner, *Catholic Journalism; a Study of Its Development in the United States, 1789–1930* (New York, 1931) is the first complete work on the topic, tracing the rise of newspapers published in English, but not including other Catholic periodicals, which are more numerous than the newspapers; not intended to be exhaustive. The last chapter has titles in all languages, arranged alphabetically by states, with places of publication, dates of founding, editors, and 1930 circulation. Paul Joseph Foik, *Pioneer Catholic Journalism* (New York, 1930) has comments on about forty periodicals, 1809–1840, with bibliographical information. The succeeding period, almost to the present time, is well covered by David Martin, "A History of Catholic Periodical Production in the United States, 1830–1851" (Master's dissertation, University of Chicago, Graduate Library School, 1951).

2. GENERAL AND DIOCESAN HISTORIES. John Dawson Gilmary Shea, *A History of the Catholic Church Within the Limits of the United States, from the First Attempted Colonization to the Present Time* (New York, 1886–1892, 4 vols.) is a monumental, critical, impartial work based upon some forty years of research in first-hand material, begun in 1882–1883. The first volume was "recognized by all as a splendid achievement." In spite of the mass of material, the work is written with charm of style, particularly in Vol. 2, *Life and Times of Archbishop Carroll.* The whole neglects nothing of importance, telling every detail of Catholic life, especially in Vol. 3, 1808–1843. All volumes have many illustrations, maps, portraits of bishops and priests, illustrations of old churches and institutions, and facsimiles of episcopal seals.

Theodore Maynard, *The Story of American Catholicism* (New York, 1949), with extensive bibliography, is by a convert and is therefore rather biased, and was written largely because the Church seemed to have been neglected in the standard general histories. It tries to show distinctively American characteristics, and emphasizes social and political matters, to correct the older way of writing about the Church as if it existed independently of such factors, and to make it seem a part of the American epic. Roman Catholic scholars regard it not as a work of deep scholarship, but as a needed colorful and dramatic treatment of a neglected subject. Peter Keenan Guilday, *A History of the Councils of Baltimore, 1791–1884* (New York, 1932) reviews the plenary councils of 1829, 1866, and 1884, which enacted formative legislation for the Church in the United States.

Louis J. Putz, ed., *Catholic Church, U.S.A.* (Chicago, 1956), with bibliographical footnotes, is a symposium by eminent writers, with essays including history, present state and influence, and a survey of regions, with good chapters on the liturgical movement, church-labor relations, and racial segregation. The over-all contributions of Roman Catholicism to the founding, growth, and civilization of the nation are reviewed in *The Church in United States History, America's Debt to Catholics*, Adapted with the author's permission by F. A. Fink (Huntington, Ind., 1944, 4th ed.). The history and character of the Church are surveyed in John Tracy Ellis, *American Catholicism* (Chicago, 1956), with bibliographical references in the notes, and suggested reading; and in Theodore Roemer, *The Catholic Church in the United States* (St. Louis, 1950), with a bibliography.

Catholic Historical Review, "The 'Catholic Encyclopedia' Diocesan Bibliography," *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 4, no. 2 (July 1918), pp. 264–273; no. 3 (Oct. 1918), pp. 389–393; and no. 4 (Jan. 1919), pp. 542–546, includes the bibliographies with all articles on dioceses and archdioceses, with

comments on United States Catholic bibliography, and is an invaluable guide to diocesan history, including secular as well as ecclesiastical sources.

The following titles are among the better diocesan histories, and are examples of the increasing emphasis upon scientific historiography: John Talbot Smith, *The Catholic Church in New York, A History of the New York Diocese from its Establishment in 1808 to the Present Time* (New York and Boston, 1905, 2 vols.); Robert H. Lord, John E. Sexton, and Edward T. Harrington, *History of the Archdiocese of Boston in the Various Stages of its Development, 1604 to 1943* (New York, 1944, 3 vols.); John K. Sharp, *History of the Diocese of Brooklyn, 1853–1953, the Catholic Church on Long Island* (New York, 1954, 2 vols.); John Ernest Rothenstein, *History of the Archdiocese of St. Louis in its Various Stages of Development from A.D. 1673 to A.D. 1928* (St. Louis, 1928, 2 vols.); James Henry Bailey, *A History of the Diocese of Richmond, the Formative Years* (Richmond, 1956), based upon a thesis written at Georgetown University. These are heavily ballasted with bibliography and factual detail, and are greatly concerned with "brick and mortar" history, but include observations on inner, spiritual life, the Church's relations with society, education, social work, charities, missions, and the press. A splendid illustration of the new type of diocesan history is George Paré, *The Catholic Church in Detroit, 1701–1888* (Detroit, 1951), solidly grounded upon wide research in documents and written with a broad historical background.

3. BIOGRAPHY. Constantine E. McGuire, ed., *Catholic Builders of the Nation, A Symposium of the Catholic Contribution to the Civilization of the United States* (New York, 1935, 5 vols.) is useful, but has been criticized by some Roman Catholic scholars as being too popular and superficial. Theodore Maynard, *Great Catholics in American History* (Garden City, N.Y., 1957), with a bibliography for each chapter and

person, is a fair example of the Catholic popular biographical tendency, not profoundly learned but informative.

The most complete listing of sources for the lives of Roman Catholic prelates is Peter Keenan Guilday's "Bibliography: Guide to the Biographical Sources of the American Hierarchy," in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 5, pp. 120–128, 290–296; Vol. 6, pp. 128–132, 267–271, 548–552 (Apr. 1919–Jan. 1921). J. H. O'Donnell, *The Catholic Hierarchy of the United States* (Washington, D.C., 1922) consists of brief biographies of the bishops, and extensive bibliographies. Joseph Bernard Code, *Dictionary of the American Hierarchy* (New York, 1940) has biographies of more than 500 bishops from 1790 to date, is very complete and reliable in details, and is being revised. Those of the American hierarchy who have been admitted to the Sacred College appear in Brendan A. Finn, *Twenty-four American Cardinals; Biographical Sketches* . . . with a Foreword by Francis Cardinal Spellman (Boston, 1948).

The following few selected titles are examples of the modern and scholarly type of hierarchical biography. Peter Keenan Guilday, *The Life and Times of John Carroll, Archbishop of Baltimore, 1735–1815* (New York, 1922, 2 vols.), with a critical essay on sources including a vast mass of ecclesiastical archives and published works, is virtually a history of the Church in the United States to Carroll's death. It presents detailed pictures of religious and secular life, leaders in church and state, and his relations with them, and shows Carroll as an ecclesiastical statesman, and a promoter of religious orders and education. Guilday's *The Life and Times of John England, First Bishop of Charleston, 1786–1842* (New York, 1927, 2 vols.) is based upon careful study of archives and of his writings, and presents him as the foremost prelate of the American Church in his time: an apologist, an educator, a high-minded liberal deeply attached to democratic government and the "American Way." This prob-

ably is the finest biography of an American Roman Catholic bishop.

Annabelle M. Melville, *John Carroll of Baltimore, Founder of the American Catholic Hierarchy* (New York, 1955) is popular but well documented. Her *Jean Lefebvre De Cheverus, 1768–1836* (Milwaukee, 1958) is a scholarly and entertaining life of a prelate, an exile from France, who became the first Bishop of Boston, and was beloved by Catholics and Protestants alike. Based largely upon primary sources, it portrays a man hitherto largely unknown to students of American history.

John Tracy Ellis, *The Life of James Cardinal Gibbons, Archbishop of Baltimore, 1834–1921* (Milwaukee, 1952, 2 vols.) is a definitive biography, with a broad social background in Ireland and America. It includes less known aspects of his ministry, as well as his important contribution to solving national conflict in the Church, liberalizing the policy toward organized labor, moulding Catholic social thought, and accommodating the Church to American ways. J. L. Spalding, *The Life of the Most Rev. Martin J. Spalding, D.D., Archbishop of Baltimore* (New York, 1873), a standard biography, has a list of his works, including his essays on theological subjects, and notes on his contribution as an apologist, and his writings on church and state. Hugh J. Nolan, *The Most Reverend Francis Patrick Kenrick, Third Bishop of Philadelphia, 1830–1851* (Washington, D.C., 1948), with large bibliography and documentary appendices, is a detailed life to his transfer to Baltimore, with emphasis upon his work as the Church's leading American theologian, and a survey of the literature about this many-sided prelate. Columbia Fox, *The Life of the Right Reverend John Baptist Mary David, 1761–1841, Bishop of Bardstown and Founder of the Sisters of Charity of Nazareth* (New York, 1925) is based partly upon manuscript archives, and reviews the apostolate of a missionary prelate on the frontier.

4. ORIGINS. Frank C. Lockwood, *Story of the Spanish Mis-*

sions of the Middle Southwest, Being a Complete Survey of the Missions Founded by Padre Eusebio Francisco Kino . . . (Santa Ana, Calif., 1934) specializes in the sites. Herbert Eugene Bolton, *Kino's Historical Memoir of Pimeria Alta . . . 1683–1711* (Cleveland, 1919, 2 vols.) is derived from an enormous knowledge of the literature of the Southwestern Spanish borderlands, including the missions, and the comment is presented in a very readable style. It is a superb introduction to his *Rim of Christendom, a Biography of Eusebio Francisco Kino, Pacific Coast Pioneer* (New York, 1936).

Zephyrin Engelhardt, *The Missions and Missionaries of California* (San Francisco, 1908–1915, 4 vols.) is a cumbersome, heavily documented, and authoritative masterpiece, and should be used with Omer Englebert, *The Last of the Conquistadors, Junipero Serra (1713–1784)*, translated from the French by Katherine Woods (New York, 1956), with bibliography. Francisco Atanasio Dominguez, *The Missions of New Mexico, 1776; a Description, with Other Contemporary Documents*, translated and annotated by Eleanor B. Adams and Angelico Chavez (Albuquerque, N.M., 1956), with bibliographical footnotes, presents the achievement of one hundred and fifty years.

Edward W. Heusinger, *Early Explorations and Mission Establishments in Texas* (San Antonio, Tex., 1936) is based upon minute research. Carlos E. Castañeda, *The Mission Era* (Austin, 1936–1939, 4 vols.) concentrates upon the missions in Texas and is the definitive authority. Thomas P. O'Rourke, *The Franciscan Missions in Texas, 1690–1793*, "Catholic University of American Studies in American Church History," Vol. 5 (Washington, D.C., 1927) is very strongly favorable to the missionaries. Herbert Eugene Bolton, *Texas in the Middle Eighteenth Century, Studies in Spanish Colonial History and Administration* (Berkeley, Calif., 1915) is founded upon study of original manuscript sources, and upon other extensive research, and travel, and includes all the work of Spanish missions.

Maynard Geiger, *The Franciscan Conquest of Florida, 1573–1618,* "Catholic University Studies in Hispanic-American History," Vol. 1 (Washington, D.C., 1937), with a bibliography and an extensive essay on sources, gives due credit to secular agencies that supported the missions, and is written objectively as an appreciation of a neglected phase of missions. Michael J. Curley, *Church and State in the Spanish Floridas, 1783–1822,* "Catholic University of America Studies in American Church History," Vol. 30 (Washington, D.C., 1940), with a large bibliography including manuscript sources, reviews Catholicism in Florida during both the British regime and the second Spanish occupation (1763–1822), claiming that the relation with the state was not beneficial to the Church and its missions, destroying initiative and associating the cause of religion with a moribund monarchy. John Tate Lanning, *The Spanish Missions of Georgia* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1935) is the result of careful research, and reveals the unexpectedly extensive missionary enterprise in the Sea Island region.

Mary Doris Mulvey, *French Catholic Missionaries in the Present United States, 1604–1791* (Washington, D.C., 1936) is a general survey in a doctoral dissertation. The material was derived largely from Reuben G. Thwaites, *The Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents: Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France, 1610–1791,* the Original French, Latin, and Italian Texts, with English Translations and Notes; Illustrated by Portraits, Maps, and Facsimiles (Cleveland, 1896–1901, 73 vols.). Francis Parkman's classic, *The Jesuits in North America in the Seventeenth Century* (Boston, 1903) also is derived chiefly from the *Jesuit Relations.* Jean Delanglez, *The French Jesuits in Lower Louisiana, 1700–1763* (Washington, D.C., 1935), a documented doctoral dissertation by a Jesuit, is controversial, due to the rivalry of religious orders under French rule. J. B. Culemans, "Catholic Explorers and Pioneers of Illinois," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 4, no. 2 (July 1918), pp. 141–169, with bibliographical footnotes, comprises a detailed narrative of explora-

tion and missions from 1673 to about 1690, the planting of religion in the French settlements, the difficulty of keeping it alive, the decline in 1762–1790 after the expulsion of the Jesuits, and remarks on the Church as a civilizing influence.

William J. P. Powers, "The Beginnings of English Catholic Emigration to the New World," *American Catholic Historical Society Records*, Vol. 40, no. 1 (Mar. 1929), pp.1–37, with a bibliography of original documents and books, reviews the movement from 1578 to the settlement of Maryland in 1634, the efforts to found a Catholic colony, and the opposition of Spain. Martin I. J. Griffin, "Catholics in Colonial Virginia," *ibid.*, Vol. 22 (1911), pp. 84–100, with bibliographical notes, is a detailed account of Irish, French, Italian, and Polish Catholic immigrants in the seventeenth century. St. Alban Kite, "William Penn and the Catholic Church in America," *Catholic Historical Review*, new ser., Vol. 7, no. 3 (Oct. 1927), pp. 480–496, attributes to Penn's toleration the fact that Pennsylvania was the only colony where Mass could be said lawfully, and where Roman Catholics had full rights of citizenship and power to hold office. Arthur J. Riley, *Catholicism in New England to 1788*, "Catholic University of America Studies in American Church History" (Washington, D.C., 1936), with a comprehensive bibliography and documentary appendices, shows that there were some Catholics throughout the colonial period, much suppressed, and thoroughly explores the attitudes of the Puritan mind toward the Church. William H. J. Kennedy, "Catholics in Massachusetts before 1750," *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 17, no. 1 (Apr. 1931), pp. 10–28, with bibliographical footnotes, presents evidence of a growing number down to about 1755, acquiescence in their presence except in time of danger, their exclusion from toleration in 1772, and the introduction of freedom by the Revolution and French aid.

5. MISSIONS (MODERN). Society for the Propagation of the Faith, U.S., *The Mission Apostolate, a Study of the Mission Activity of the Roman Catholic Church and the Story of the*

Foundation and Development of Various Mission-Aid Organizations in the United States (New York, 1942) is the most comprehensive account. Edward John Hickey, *The Society for the Propagation of the Faith, Its Foundation, Organization and Success, 1822–1922* ("Catholic University of America Studies in American Church History," Vol. 3) is a particular history of a missionary organization, which contributed heavily to Roman Catholic expansion. Theodore Roemer, *The Leopoldine Foundation and the Church in the United States (1829–1839)* in "United States Catholic Historical Society Monograph Series," Vol. 13, pp. 141–211, appreciates the debt of the Church to German Catholics, and to the efforts of this Vienna missionary society, whose reports are an indispensable source of American Catholic history.

The Church regarded the Middle Western frontier as the most promising field of missions to the foreign-born, and of possible native converts. Raphael N. Hamilton, "The Significance of the Frontier to the Historian of the Catholic Church," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 25, no. 2 (July 1939), pp. 160–178, with good references in footnotes, is a somewhat sketchy initial treatment of the subject.

The successes of evangelism are recorded in several documented studies of the westward missionary push of Roman Catholicism. The earliest Anglo-American field was Kentucky. Mary Ramona Mattingly, *The Catholic Church on the Kentucky Frontier, 1785–1812* (Washington, D.C., 1936) is based partly upon manuscript archives. Martin J. Spalding, *Sketches of the Early Catholic Missions of Kentucky; from Their Commencement in 1787, to the Jubilee of 1826–7* (Louisville, 1844), written by a bishop of Louisville, was compiled with the aid of an early missionary, S. T. Badin. Camillus P. Maes, *The Life of Rev. Charles Nerinckx; with a Chapter on the Early Catholic Missions of Kentucky* (Cincinnati, 1880) is drawn largely from unpublished documents, especially letters of Father Nerinckx, who was a Catholic counterpart of the Methodist, Peter Cartwright, in his vigor-

ous preaching. Joseph A. Griffin, *The Contribution of Belgium to the Catholic Church in America, 1523–1857* (Washington, D.C., 1932) is based upon extensive research, largely in printed materials, and has considerable information on Father Nerinckx.

Thomas Timothy McAvoy, *The Catholic Church in Indiana, 1789–1834* (New York, 1940), with a large bibliography of manuscript and printed sources, studies the transition from French origins to the later cosmopolitan Church, relates portions of missionary history never before told, and discusses the sources of information for Roman Catholic missionary history in the West. William McNamara, *The Catholic Church on the Northern Indiana Frontier, 1789–1844* (Washington, D.C., 1931) is founded in part upon manuscript archives. Sister M. Aquinata Martin, *The Catholic Church on the Nebraska Frontier, 1854–1885* (Washington, D.C., 1937) is detailed and carefully documented. Peter Beckman, *The Catholic Church on the Kansas Frontier, 1850–1877* (Washington, D.C., 1943), with a bibliography of archives and printed sources, represents the character of all these frontier studies. It discusses missionary problems, efforts to found Catholic colonies, political disturbances and Nativism, and places the missionary epic in its secular setting.

M. M. Hoffman, *The Church Founders of the Northwest, Loras and Cretin and Other Captains of Christ* (Milwaukee, 1937) also is based largely upon study in archives. Sister Mary Aquinas Norton, *Catholic Missionary Activities in the Northwest, 1818–1864* (Washington, D.C., 1930), with bibliography, is devoted largely to Indian missions in Minnesota and the Dakotas. Pierre Jean de Smet, *De Smet's Oregon Missions and Travels over the Rocky Mountains, 1845–1846;* repr. of New York ed., 1847, in Reuben G. Thwaites, ed., *Early Western Travels, 1748–1846* (Cleveland, Ohio, 1906) Vol. 29, pp. 103–424, is the classic account of missions in the mountains and the Pacific Northwest, especially among the Indians. John Gilmary Shea, *History of the Catholic Missions*

among the Indian Tribes of the United States, 1529–1854 (New York, 1899), with a large bibliography, is favorable to missions and carries the story from the Norse apostles of the eleventh century to the Oregon apostolate of the 1840's.

Frontier missions were promoted by many Catholic immigrant societies and land companies. Their story is completely told for the first time in James P. Shannon, *Catholic Colonization on the Western Frontier* (New Haven, 1957), with a long topical essay on sources, and sketches early failures due to democratic individualism, then reviews the successful efforts in Minnesota of John Ireland, Archbishop of St. Paul, in the period 1876–1881, illustrating the Church as an agent of Americanization. Raymond Witte, *Twenty-five Years of Crusading; a History of the National Catholic Rural Life Conference* (Des Moines, 1948) reveals the Church's effort to colonize and evangelize rural America, which furnishes the backlog of the population, rather than the cities where Catholicism has had its greatest strength. A good authority on the relation of rural sociology to the Roman Catholic Church is Edgar Schmiedeler's *The Better Rural Life* (New York, 1938). Luigi Ligutti and John Rowe, *Rural Roads to Security* (Milwaukee, 1940) reviews the studies of the Catholic Rural Life Conference, and attempts to attract attention to the Church's weakness in rural areas, pointing out that the mission effort has had some good results in spite of a negative reaction by some urban Catholics.

6. RELIGIOUS ORDERS. It would be impossible to list here the numerous histories of Roman Catholic religious orders in the United States. The following section includes bibliographies, general accounts, and some representative histories of individual orders.

Brother Ernest, *Our Brothers* (Chicago and Atlanta, 1931) has short sketches of the men's orders in the United States.

The first order to be extensively active in the Anglo-American Colonies was the Society of Jesus (Jesuits), with its head-

quarters in colonial Maryland. After a successful ministry, the order was suppressed by Papal decree, but later was restored, as is related by Peter Keenan Guilday in "The Restoration of the Society of Jesus in the United States, 1808–1815," *American Catholic Historical Records,* Vol. 32, no. 3 (Sept. 1921), pp. 177–232, with bibliographical footnotes and a historical survey. This gives a general view of the period of suppression (1773–1814) and its effect upon the Society in the United States, its revival and full reconstitution, and its part in edifying the Church. Gilbert J. Garraghan, *The Jesuits of the Middle United States* (New York, 1938, 3 vols.), with a large bibliography and bibliographical references in footnotes, probably is the most thorough history of an order yet written in the United States. It is based largely upon primary sources in archives, with emphasis upon Indian missions and education. John La Farge, *A Report on the American Jesuits, Photos by Margaret Bourke-White* (New York, 1956) is a review of the order's activities in the United States.

"Passionist Foundations in the United States, A.D. 1852–1894," *American Catholic Historical Society Records,* Vol. 10, no. 1 (Mar. 1899), pp. 90–96, is a very factual general history from the introduction of the order by Bishop O'Connor of Pittsburgh in 1852, including founding and description of houses and missions. John F. Byrne, *The Redemptorist Centenaries: 1732, Founding of the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer; 1832, Establishment in* [the] *United States* (Philadelphia, Pa., 1932), with extensive bibliography, includes not only the founding, but also the history of the community in the United States.

Joseph B. Code, "A Selected Bibliography of the Religious Orders and Congregations of Women Founded within the Present Boundaries of the United States (1727–1850)," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 23 (Oct. 1937), pp. 331–351, Vol. 26 (July 1940), pp. 222–245, includes the important works on many of the communities now in existence. The details are brought up to date by Thomas Patrick McCarthy,

in his *Guide to the Catholic Sisterhoods in the United States,* with a Foreword by Amleto Giovanni Cicognani (Washington, D.C., 1958, 4th ed., rev. and enl.), with illustrations.

Sister Mary Agnes McCann, "Religious Orders of Women in the United States," *Catholic Historical Review,* new ser., Vol. 1, no. 3 (Oct. 1921), pp. 316–331, distinguishes two periods: to 1840, when most of the American foundations were made; and the later period of introducing European orders and derivations from earlier American ones; and describes the works of the orders since 1790. Elinor Tong Dehey, *Religious Orders of Women in the United States: Catholic; Accounts of Their Origin, Works and Most Important Institutions, Interwoven with Histories of Many Famous Foundresses,* with an Introduction by the Right Reverend Joseph Schrembs (Hammond, Ind., 1930, rev. ed.), with illustrations, including portraits, is a massive compilation of factual material. The data on founders of orders is excellently supplemented in Joseph Bernard Code, *Great American Foundresses* (New York, 1929), with portraits.

The foundress who set the pattern for the establishment of orders was Mother Seton, of the Sisters of Charity. A detailed account of her life, including letters and journals, is Helene (Roederer) Bailley de Barberey, *Elizabeth Seton . . . Translated and Adapted from the Sixth French Edition, with a Brief Sketch of the Community of the Sisters of Charity Since the Death of Mother Seton,* by the Reverend Joseph B. Code . . . , with an Introduction by the Most Reverend Michael J. Curley (New York, 1927). Annabelle Melville, *Elizabeth Bayley Seton, 1774–1821* (New York, 1951) considers the full life of the saintly and charming foundress of the American Sisters of Charity, and avoids the sentimentality that often distinguishes the "pious" biographies of members of religious orders. Mary Agnes McCann, *The History of Mother Seton's Daughters, the Sisters of Charity of Cincinnati, Ohio, 1809–1917* (New York, 1917, 2 vols.) has a bibliography of manuscripts, books and periodicals, and a list of members. It is a

detailed account of the life, conversion, and work of Mother Seton, and of the establishment and history of the order. It is one of the best stories of religious communities, full of quotations from source materials and evidently accurate, although somewhat sentimental.

Ettie Madeline Vogel, "The Ursuline Nuns in America," *American Catholic Historical Society Records*, Vol. I (1884–1886), pp. 214–243, traces the order's history, its transition to Canada and Louisiana, and early history in the United States. There are descriptions of the several houses and the character of their work, especially in education.

Several notable works relate certain contributions of Roman Catholic sisters to American life. A general account is Daniel Aloysius Lord, *Our Nuns, Their Varied and Vital Service for God and Country* (New York and Cincinnati, 1924), an informal appreciation for popular reading, derived from notes taken on visits to charitable institutions, dealing mainly with the human interest aspects of their ministries. Their first great service in wartime, which won the nation's respect and admiration, is related by Ellen Ryan Jolly, *Nuns of the Battlefield* (Providence, 1927), an account of the communities represented among the sister nurses who ministered to soldiers during the Civil War, with a bibliography. The burden borne by nuns in the establishment of the Church's great educational enterprises is revealed by Sister Maria Alma's *Standard Bearers; the Place of the Catholic Sisterhoods in the Early History of Education and Schools Within the Present Territory of* [the] *United States, as Seen by Contrast and Comparison with the Education Provided for by Federal and State Legislation from Earliest Sources until 1850* (New York, 1928), with bibliography.

7. CATHOLICISM AND IMMIGRATION: NATIONAL CHURCHES. Mary Gilbert Kelly, *Catholic Immigrant Colonization Projects in the United States, 1815–1860* (New York, 1939) explores one of the origins of national churches in the planning of ethnic communities. N. A. Weber, "The Rise of the Na-

tional Churches in the United States," *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (Jan. 1916), pp. 422–434, with bibliographical references in footnotes, ascribes the healthy state of the Church in the United States to wise concessions to national demands, characteristics, and customs. It is almost entirely confined to the period before the great immigration of the 1840's, and deals mostly with German and French congregations.

Joseph E. Ciesluk, *National Parishes in the United States* (Washington, D.C., 1944) reviews numerous sociological factors which, at first, were intensely favorable to religious life in immigrant national congregations. He points out that formerly such parishes and groups contributed heavily to keeping urban Catholics loyal to the Church. C. J. Nuess and Thomas J. Harte, *The Sociology of the Parish* (Milwaukee, 1950) predicts a rapid decline in the numerical strength and importance of national parishes, under the new policy of restricted immigration. Harte in the chapter "Racial and National Parishes in the United States" emphasizes dissatisfaction of the younger generation with isolation, even among the exclusive French Canadians, the endless administrative confusion, and the reluctance of ecclesiastical authorities to erect new national parishes, for example among Puerto Ricans in New York City. Francois Houtart, "A Sociological Study of the Evolution of American Catholics," in *Sociaal Kompas*, 2c Jaargang, no. 5/6 (Jan./Apr. 1955), pp. 189–216, has maps, diagrams and tables, and bibliography in the footnotes. This is by far the best scientific investigation, covers the history of Catholic immigration, and suggests future trends. It minutely discusses group settlement and organization in city and country, national parishes, and their structure and influence. It notes also trends in assimilation of the Catholic population, adaptation of the Church's structure and functions, conversions, attendance, chances of survival under various conditions, opportunity among Negroes, and the influence of the Catholic press. A similar study is Joseph B. Schuyler's *North-*

ern Parish, A Sociological and Pastoral Study (Chicago, 1960), with a large bibliography, describing minutely a parish in New York City.

Gerald Shaughnessy, *Has the Immigrant Kept the Faith? A Study of Immigration and Catholic Growth in the United States, 1790–1920* (New York, 1925) is learned, and optimistic about the future, but must be read with the reservation that there are no really reliable statistics about lapsed Roman Catholics. F. J. Fichter, "Catholics in the United States, How Many Are We?", *America*, Vol. 82, no. 18 (Feb. 4, 1950), pp. 523–524, notes the uncertainty of estimates, since no official census of religious confessions is regularly undertaken. Diocesan censuses sometimes are inadequate, especially in big cities, so that it is impossible to say how many immigrants and others defect. G. A. Kelly, *Catholics and the Practice of the Faith* (Washington, D.C., 1946) comprises a remarkable study of the Diocese of St. Augustine, where Catholics are 87 per cent urban. Regular attendance is 70 per cent, indicating that the largely immigrant constituency has remained quite loyal.

Oscar Handlin, *Boston's Immigrants, 1790–1865* (Cambridge, Mass., 1941) should be consulted for analysis of various aspects of the foreign-born as related to religion, together with his *The Uprooted* (Boston, 1951), which considers problems arising from Roman Catholic immigration, mainly Irish and Italian. Robert A. Woods, *The City Wilderness* (Boston, 1899), written before assimilation of the group, is a discussion of the problem of Irish immigration into Boston, and its religious aspects, and should be supplemented by his *Americans in Process* (Boston, 1902).

Lambert Schrott, *Pioneer German Catholics in the American Colonies, 1734–1784* (New York, 1933, "United States Catholic Historical Society Monograph Series," Vol. 13), with references in footnotes, and bibliography, claims to be the first appreciative study of the German Catholics, and reviews various German contributions to Catholic growth and develop-

ment before 1917. Colman J. Barry, *The Catholic Church and German Americans* (Milwaukee, 1953) discusses the tensions between German and Irish Catholics, typical of tensions between immigrant groups in the Church; and should be supplemented by Emmet Herman Rothan, *The German Catholic Immigrant in the United States, 1830–1860* (Washington, D.C., 1946), with a bibliography. Matthew Anthony Pekari, "The German Catholics in the United States of America," *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society*, Vol. 36, no. 4 (Dec. 1925), pp. 305–358, has an extensive bibliography in German and English. It reviews German Catholic immigration since 1683, Catholic Germans in the colonies, early schisms and troubles. The rise of Middle Western parishes, especially, was aided by missionary societies, and promoted the rise of a strong German Catholic press, and German religious orders in education. The defeat of the Cahensley plan for German bishops is discussed in "The Cahensleyism Turmoil of 1891," in Colman J. Barry, *The Catholic Church and German Americans* (Milwaukee, 1953), pp. 131–182. He considers the nationalistic jealousies caused by the predominance of Irish clergy in the hierarchy, and German dissatisfacton with the distribution of parishes, which caused many defections and an outcry for German bishops.

Giovanni Schiavo, *The Italians in America before the Civil War* (New York and Chicago, 1934), published under the auspices of the Italian Historical Society, has a chapter on Italians and the Catholic Church, with an extensive bibliography. Emphasis is upon individuals rather than upon Italians as a community, without record of a strictly Italian parish. John V. Tollino, "The Church in America and the Italian Problem," *American Ecclesiastical Review*, Vol. 100 (Jan. 1939), pp. 22–32, estimates that of six million Italian-Americans only two million were then fervent Catholics. One million had been lost, and three million were doubtful and could be lost without special action to gain their loyalty.

"Hungarian Catholics in America," in Condé B. Pallen, ed.,

A Memorial of Andrew J. Shipman, His Life and Writings (New York, 1916), pp. 155–161, includes immigration, settlements, missionary labors, the founding of churches and associations, schools, and periodicals. William I. Thomas and Florian Znaniecki, *The Polish Peasant in Europe and America* (New York, 1927) devotes much attention to religious problems, especially in relation to immigration and Catholicism. Theodore Andrews, *The Polish National Catholic Church in America and Poland* (London, 1953) illustrates the Roman Church's difficulties in handling nationalistic groups, which in this case caused the formation of a schismatic church.

Adrian Fortescue, *The Uniate Eastern Churches: The Byzantine Rite in Italy, Sicily, Syria and Egypt* (London, 1923) has a complete bibliography of works on these churches, and gives the background of Eastern Rite groups in the United States, in communion with Rome, which generally are little known. Donald Attwater, *The Catholic Eastern Churches* has been issued as Vol. 1 of his *Christian Churches of the East* (Milwaukee, 1947–48, 2 vols.), which is in a popular vein and yet complete. This should be used together with his liturgical study, *Eastern Catholic Worship* (New York, 1946), and both should be supplemented by a publication of the Liturgical Arts Society, New York: *The Eastern Branches of the Catholic Church, Six Studies in the Oriental Rites* (New York and Toronto, 1938), with a bibliography; and by Clement C. Englert, *Eastern Catholics* (New York, 1940). Legal relations of the Eastern Rite Catholics with the Roman Church and with their branches abroad are studied in John A. Duskie, *The Canonical Status of the Orientals in the United States* (Washington, D.C., 1928), with bibliography. Condé B. Pallen, ed., *A Memorial of Andrew Shipman, His Life and Writings* (New York, 1916) has essays on Italian Greek Catholics; Catholics of the Eastern Rites, including notes on Slavonic liturgy; the Ruthenians; the Greek Catholic Church and its rites; the Slavonic language and liturgy; and various groups of Greek Catholics in America.

8. ANTI-CATHOLIC REACTION. About the middle of the

nineteenth century the Roman Catholic Church began to loom larger in the American scene. Its numerical growth was accelerated chiefly by tides of immigration from Ireland and Germany, which persisted until well into the twentieth century. The Church seemed to many observers to contain elements hostile to the "American way of life," and there soon developed a vigorous propaganda against it.

This crusade found political expression in such Nativist movements as the Know-Nothings. In the words of a fairly respectable opponent, Samuel F. B. Morse, "The question of Popery and Protestantism, or Absolutism and Republicanism, which in these opposite categories are convertible terms, is fast becoming and will shortly be the great absorbing question, not only of this country, but of the whole civilized world." This fear was echoed throughout the century, not only by bigoted political opportunists, but also by scientific rationalists and evangelical Protestants. A typical attack is Josiah Strong's *Our Country, its Possible Future and its Present Crisis* (New York, 1885, 1891), which discusses the Catholic "menace" at length.

Mary Augustina Ray, *American Opinion of Roman Catholicism in the Eighteenth Century* (New York, 1936) is a thorough and scholarly study, illustrating the obstacles to growth thrown up by prejudice, the root of later Nativism. Colman J. Barry, "Some Roots of American Nativism," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 44, no. 2 (July 1958), pp. 137–146, with bibliographical footnotes, considers writings on Nativism and sees its motives as basically religious. It is not to be equated with anti-Catholicism, since its sources included also economic, ethnic, and cultural factors. Nativism was a state of mind rather than an organized movement. Sister Marie Leonore Fell, *The Foundations of Nativism in American Textbooks, 1783–1860* (Washington, D.C., 1941), with very extensive bibliography and footnotes, presents a detailed study of readers, geographies, and histories to determine the extent to which books accounted for anti-Catholic and anti-

foreign attitudes. Indoctrination was intentional, aimed at causing Catholics to be considered as second-class citizens.

Charles Louis Sewry, "The Alleged 'Un-Americanism' of the Church as a Factor in Anti-Catholicism in the United States, 1860–1914" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1955; *University Microfilms,* pub. no. 13,793; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1956), Vol. 16, no. 1, p. 111) explores in detail the relations between anti-Catholicism and the belief that the Church threatened American institutions. Anti-Catholicism was based partly upon genuine ideological differences between the traditional Catholic teaching and the American viewpoint, and its decline was due to a feeling that Catholics had become partly Americanized. John Higham, "Another Look at Nativism," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 44, no. 2 (July 1958), pp. 147–158, with bibliographical footnotes, suggests that Nativism was not a mere ebullition of religious and ethnic prejudice, but reflected struggles for social and economic status and acceptance, with religion as only one part of the motivation.

Ray Allen Billington, *The Protestant Crusade, 1800–1860* (New York, 1938) describes the sources of anti-Catholic prejudice, and the outbreak of intensified bigotry in 1820 and later. Religious and patriotic sentiments combined to produce the notion that loyalty to the Papacy is incompatible with national patriotism. His "Anti-Catholic Propaganda and the Home Missionary Movement, 1800–1860," *Mississippi Valley Historical Review,* Vol. 22, no. 3 (Dec. 1935), pp. 361–384, referring to the fear of Roman Catholic capture of the West, recalls Lyman Beecher's conviction that the religious future of the nation would be decided there. These titles should be used with his "Tentative Bibliography of Anti-Catholic Propaganda in the United States, 1800–1860," *Catholic Historical Review,* new ser., Vol. 12 (Jan. 1933), pp. 492–513.

Anti-Catholicism was not slow to implement its attack by political action, either by inspiring new parties or by boring

from within the established ones. Paul J. Foik, "Anti-Catholic Parties in American Politics, 1776–1860," *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society*, Vol. 1 (Mar. 1925), pp. 41–69, with bibliography in footnotes, traces the movements in detail since the 1790's, with quotations from contemporary sources. The essay notices their part in elections, and Republican disapproval of Nativism in the 1850's. W. Darrell Overdike, *The Know-Nothing Party in the South* (Baton Rouge, La., 1950), with an extensive bibliography of manuscript and other documentary sources, shows wide variance in anti-Catholicism from state to state. It appealed to distrust of Ultramontane Catholicism and to the most narrow Protestants, and sometimes attracted Roman Catholics, including even a few priests. William A. Russ, "Anti-Catholic Agitation during Reconstruction," *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society*, Vol. 45, no. 4 (Dec. 1934), pp. 312–321, with bibliographical footnotes, mentions a Radical Republican effort to use the Negro vote to oppose Catholic political power, the test oath to disfranchise Catholics, and efforts to link Catholicism with rebellion.

John Higham, *Strangers in the Land: Patterns of American Nativism, 1865–1925* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1955) states that the most active movement, previous to the revived Ku Klux Klan of the 1920's, was the American Protective Association or "A.P.A." The earliest extensive account of it is Humphrey Joseph Desmond's *The A.P.A. Movement, A Sketch* (Washington, D.C., 1912). Donald Louis Kinzer, "The American Protective Association: A Study in Anti-Catholicism" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Washington, 1954; *University Microfilms*, pub. no. 8097; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1954), Vol. 14, no. 6, pp. 970–971) ascribes the agitation to fear of the "Catholic vote," the controversy over public schools, and alleged Catholic influence in organized labor. While the organization conducted a sensational propaganda, it was short-lived (1887–1896) and had little real

political influence. Helen Knuth, "The Climax of American Anglo-Saxonism, 1898–1905" (Doctoral dissertation, Northwestern University, 1958; *University Microfilms* (1958), pub. no. 58-5763; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1958), Vol. 19, no. 6, pp. 1355–1356) in Chap. 5, "The Anti-Catholic Movement," discusses organizations and literature, Catholicism and Americanism, and the relation of Catholicism to politics and the public-school controversy.

John F. Moore, *Will America Become Catholic?* (New York, 1931) is an objective study, by a Protestant. Harold E. Fey, "Can Catholicism Win America?", *Christian Century*, eight articles, Vol. 61, no. 48 (Nov. 29, 1944)–Vol. 62, no. 3 (Jan. 17, 1945) emphasizes the coordination of all Catholic activities to convert America, a challenge to Protestants, and analyzes the more important aspects of the program, headed by the National Catholic Welfare Council. James Milton O'Neill, *Catholics in Controversy* (New York, 1954), with bibliography, discusses the Roman Catholic viewpoint on the church-state issue, education, and censorship questions, and is criticized for exaggerating the unanimity of opinion, and for a "doctrinaire" approach to constitutional questions. John Joseph Kane, *Catholic-Protestant Conflicts in America* (Chicago, 1955), with bibliographies, by a Catholic sociologist, is notably objective and balanced, and is the first extensive analysis of the American Catholic's place in social, economic, and political life from an inside vantage point. It is severely critical of the Catholic laity, pleading for better leadership. (See also Part Four, RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. VI, E, 1, *Anti-Catholic Propaganda.*)

9. CATHOLICISM AND POLITICS. A dominant reason for anti-Catholic agitation was the association between immigration and religious groups (especially the Catholic Irish) and the growth of "machine" politics within the American party system, especially in the cities. The most obvious examples are those of Irish Roman Catholics in Massachusetts and New

York City. The following studies indicate the nature of this relationship, and attempt to account for its development and persistence.

Michael Williams, *The Shadow of the Pope* (New York and London, 1932) offers a comprehensive, temperate, well-documented survey of the history of political anti-Catholicism from the early colonial period to the election of 1928, from the viewpoint of a Roman Catholic layman. It does not adequately recognize the underlying causes of opposition among intelligent people, as well as the mere bigots. "The Catholic Church in the United States during the Civil War Period, 1852–1866," *American Catholic Historical Society Records*, Vol. 39 (1928), pp. 272–346, includes a discussion of the Nativist movement, the surge of anti-Catholic feeling due to the question of diplomatic representation at the Vatican, and the participation of Catholics in the Civil War and in preventing recognition of the Confederacy.

The rise of Alfred E. Smith as a presidential candidate reopened the wounds of the old controversy about "political Catholicism." A typical attack upon "Rome" is James Scott Vance, *Proof of Rome's Political Meddling in America* (Washington, D.C., 1927). This contains as "proof" reports of the administrative committee and departments of the National Catholic Welfare Council, Sept. 22–23, 1920, and is one of the publications that inspired anti-Catholicism in the presidential election of 1928.

Charles C. Marshall, *The Roman Catholic Church in the Modern State* (New York, 1928) discusses indirectly the import of Smith's presidential candidacy in the light of the Church's claim to be superior to the state, as seen by a non-Roman Catholic lawyer. The bibliography includes legal decisions regarding the relations of church and state. His *Governor Smith's American Catholicism* (New York, 1928) completely analyzes Smith's contention that his Roman Catholic idea of church and state is compatible with American constitutional and political ideals, and has quotations of press

comments on Marshall's *The Roman Catholic Church in the Modern State.*

James McMahon Graham, *Has the Pope Any Political Power in the United States? A Reply to Professor John H. Wigmore* (Quincy, Ill., 1928) replies to an editorial in the *Illinois Law Review* (Apr. 1928), taking the negative side of the question "Should a Papal State be Recognized Internationally by the United States?" Edward John Byrne, "The Religious Issue in National Politics," *Catholic Historical Review,* new ser., Vol. 8, no. 3 (Oct. 1928), pp. 329–364, with an extensive bibliographical note, discusses in detail the anti-Catholic phase of politics since colonial times, and reviews the issue in presidential elections, and particularly the Smith-Marshall controversy in 1928. Edmund Arthur Moore, *A Catholic Runs for President; the Campaign of 1928* (New York, 1956), with bibliography, probably is over-optimistic about the election of a Catholic president, although recognizing that anti-Catholicism may be only dormant. It is the most painstaking study of the campaign. John A. Ryan and F. J. Boland, *Catholic Principles of Politics* (New York, 1940) professes to prove that the Papacy can accommodate itself to contemporary political principles without yielding any of its own basic claims.

The possibility of another Roman Catholic nominee for the presidency has provoked another review of the relation between the Church and politics. Paul Blanshard, *God and Man in Washington* (Boston, 1960) reviews the impact of religion upon American political life and the presidency, and discusses the questions involved in the possible presidential candidacy of a Roman Catholic, listing the issues in controversy between Catholics and non-Catholics. The book also shows the influences of religious groups upon Congress, their cooperation and rivalries.

10. ROMAN CATHOLICISM AND AMERICAN DEMOCRACY. Adjustment of the Church's political and social theory and culture to the peculiar conditions of American democracy has

been a perennial problem. The Church claims to be and is an international and, in some respects, a "supernational" organization. Over the centuries it has developed a vast body of doctrine dealing with every concern of human life, including the family and the relations of men in society and government. Divine sanction is attributed to the Church's teachings, and every loyal Catholic is obligated to be guided by their authority.

The doctrines, however, are sufficiently elastic to leave the "Catholic position" on many specific issues open to debate. Such debate has been carried on, among Catholics and between Catholics and others, during more than a century. Among the controversial problems are the legality of tax support for parochial schools, divorce laws, the dissemination of contraceptive information, and the Church's influence over Catholic citizens and public officials in political matters. These and other problems included in this section must properly be understood in the context of the whole Catholic conception of society and of the state.

The effort of adjustment began as early as the 1820's, in the philosophy of a liberal prelate, who is appreciated in Joseph L. O'Brien, *John England, Bishop of Charleston, the Apostle of Democracy* (New York, 1934). He gives a warmly sympathetic interpretation of his attempt to adjust his Church's thinking to American democracy.

The Americanizing philosophy attained intellectual prestige in the writings and influence of two notable converts—Orestes A. Brownson and Isaac Hecker. Arthur M. Schlesinger, Jr., *Orestes A. Brownson; a Pilgrim's Progress* (Boston, 1939), with an annotated bibliography, is a popular but scholarly account of his intellectual life and conversion, and makes him appear as a part of the American as well as of the Catholic heritage. Theodore Maynard, *Orestes Brownson, Yankee, Radical, Catholic* (New York, 1943), with bibliography, through use of his papers at the University of Notre Dame presents a fuller view than previous biographies, and indicates

his real importance as an apologist for American Catholicism. Carl F. Krummel, "Catholicism, Americanism, Democracy and Orestes Brownson," *American Quarterly*, Vol. 6, no. 1 (Spring 1954), pp. 19–31, with footnotes (especially to Brownson's works) contends that his Catholicism was not really liberal. The apparent liberalism was an effort "to strengthen Catholicism and conservatism by rendering the Church less objectionable to Protestant America." Sister Mary Rose Gertrude Whalen, *Some Aspects of the Influence of Orestes A. Brownson on His Contemporaries* (Notre Dame, Ind., 1933), with bibliography, reveals his social and political influence. The writer recognizes him as an extraordinary power, particularly in apologetics, pointing the way to Isaac Hecker and his circle. His conversion is seen as a turning-point in the history of the Church in America.

Vincent F. Holden, *The Early Years of Isaac Thomas Hecker, 1819–1844* (Washington, D.C., 1939), with a large bibliography of manuscript and printed sources, discusses the causes of his conversion from secular humanitarianism, and is a typical story of a converted intellectual, who became a leader in the Americanizing of the Church. Hecker's *The Church and the Age* (New York, 1896) insists eloquently upon the compatibility of Catholicism with Americanism, particularly in chs. 1–3 and 7. Joseph McSorley, *Father Hecker and His Friends* (St. Louis, 1952) is a scholarly and interesting account of a group who would reconcile the Church with democracy and American life.

Robert D. Cross, *The Emergence of Liberal Catholicism in America* (Cambridge, Mass., 1958) combats the commonly accepted belief that there can be no diversity of opinion among Roman Catholics on public matters, and attempts to prove this point by tracing the emergence and development of liberalism in the Church since the late nineteenth century. There have been sharp divergences of opinion on questions concerned with the American democratic way of life.

The beginning of modern Roman Catholic liberalism was

in the "Americanism" controversy of the period 1880–1900. Peter E. Hogan, "Americanism and the Catholic University of America," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 33, no. 2 (July 1947), pp. 158–190, with bibliography in footnotes, discusses a disturbance that rocked the Church, because of efforts to accommodate immigrant groups to American culture. It caused a rift between conservative and progressive groups in the hierarchy, with the "Americanizers" on the winning side. Thomas T. McAvoy, "Americanism, Fact and Fiction," *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 31, no. 2 (July 1945), pp. 133–153, with bibliography in footnotes, discusses the identification of "Americanizing" ideas with heresy. Distinctive characteristics of the Church in America were misunderstood in Europe as departures from ecclesiastical authority and doctrine. Isaac Hecker is considered as the originator of accommodating the Church to the "American way." McAvoy's *The Great Crisis in American Catholic History, 1895–1900* (Chicago, 1957) considers fully and in a scholarly manner the heated controversy over "liberal" Americanizing efforts, and is favorable toward the liberals, who were led by Archbishop Ireland of St. Paul.

John Ireland, *The Church and Modern Society, Lectures and Addresses* (Chicago and New York, 1897, 2nd ed.) reviews the Catholic attitude regarding some burning questions of the time, such as the Church and civil society and the mission of Catholics in America, in the "liberal" vein of adjustment to American life, and in accordance with the encyclicals of Pope Leo XIII. Joseph P. Conway, *The Question of the Hour: a Survey of the Position and Influence of the Catholic Church in the United States* (New York, 1911) reflects the struggle to adjust the Church to an American and predominantly Protestant environment, mentioning particularly the clashes on school questions and with nonreligious propaganda. Frederick Joseph Kinsman, *Americanism and Catholicism* (New York, 1924), by the former Anglican bishop of Delaware, a convert, was written to vindicate Catholic "Ameri-

canism," when the issue of nominating Alfred E. Smith for president was coming to the fore.

The controversy was renewed in the 1940's by Paul Blanshard in *American Freedom and Catholic Power* (Boston, 1958), with bibliography, presenting the thesis that the danger to American free institutions, implied in the "undemocratic" attitude and policy of the hierarchy, should be candidly discussed. Catholic power is considered as political and cultural, bringing pressure to bear in controversial areas of social policy. The book is addressed to Catholics and non-Catholics, to show that a free culture cannot be reconciled with an "anti-democratic" church. Catholic sources are given for almost all the major facts cited, and the text is generally dispassionate, although criticized by Catholics as "intellectualized nativism." James Milton O'Neill, *Catholicism and American Freedom* (New York, 1952) is a competent reply to Blanshard, including his *Communism, Democracy, and Catholic Power*. Another, by Currin Shields, in *Democracy and Catholicism in America* (New York, 1958) discusses anti-Catholic campaigns, relating them to other religious persecutions, and arguing that there is no incompatibility between the Church and democracy. Blanshard's *My Catholic Critics* (Boston, 1952) is largely a rebuttal of O'Neill. James H. Nichols, *Democracy and the Churches* (Philadelphia, 1951) in ch. 9 discusses Catholic social action since World War I from a Protestant viewpoint, chiefly for the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and is critical of Catholic policy.

"Blanshardism" aroused Catholic intellectuals to a vigorous defense of the Church's doctrine, and a determined campaign to demonstrate its compatibility with the "American way." Jacques Maritain, *Christianity and Democracy* (New York, 1950), from the viewpoint of a Neo-Thomist and of an American by adoption, expresses the considered attitude of the ablest spokesman for the Roman Catholic view of society and the state. His *Man and the State* (Chicago, 1951), in chs. 1, 5, and 6, outlines the Roman Catholic concept of so-

ciety and the state. Leo Richard Ward, ed., *The American Apostolate; American Catholics in the Twentieth Century* (Westminster, Md., 1952) is a series of essays on various phases of Catholic thought and action, particularly the effort to make the faith intelligible and acceptable to Americans.

The Commonweal, *Catholicism in America, A Series of Articles from the Commonweal* (New York, 1954) is a collection of essays by Roman Catholic laymen, except Reinhold Niebuhr's and Will Herberg's on Protestant and Jewish views of Roman Catholics. Most interesting are the views of important aspects of Catholic life, and assessments of the position and attitude of Catholic groups toward each other, with critical estimates of weaknesses: cultural lag, isolationism, complacency, smugness, and "ingrownness." Catholics must proclaim Christian principles without being politically and socially reactionary. Theodore Maynard, *The Catholic Church and the American Idea* (New York, 1953) is a most important evaluation of the Catholic contribution to American life, but is presented from the somewhat overenthusiastic standpoint of a convert. John Tracy Ellis, "Church and State: An American Catholic Tradition," *Harpers*, Vol. 207, no. 1242 (Nov. 1953), pp. 63-67, assembles little-known statements by leading bishops over 150 years, revealing an authentic tradition of acceptance of separation of church and state and universal toleration, emphasizing the views of Archbishop John Carroll and other "liberals in the hierarchy." John Cogley's "Catholics and American Democracy," an essay in the *Commonweal's Catholicism in America* (New York, 1954) argues the absorption of Roman Catholics into "Americanism," and the gradual disappearance of the view of Catholicism as a non-American religion. He expresses an uneasiness about non-critical acceptance of the values of "Americanism," which could be as objectionable as the position of anti-Catholic bigots.

John J. Kane, "The Social Structure of American Catholics," *American Catholic Sociological Review*, Vol. 16, no. 1

(Mar. 1955), pp. 23–40, reviews their rise in the social and economic scale, through gradual assimilation, and points out that the Catholic is ceasing to be the poor immigrant. Francois Houtart, *Aspects Sociologiques du Catholicisme Americain; Vie Urbaine et Institutions Religieuses* (Paris, 1957), with bibliography and illustrations, greatly amplifies the conclusions of studies which demonstrate the adjustment of Catholicism to American society. Andrew M. Greeley, *The Church and the Suburbs* (New York, 1959) is a book of essays indicating another kind of adjustment of Catholicism to American life.

During the past thirty years a considerable number of American Catholic authors have endeavored to demonstrate the compatibility of their church with American culture, through the phenomenon of conversion and in the intellectual life. Among the most informed and interesting works are: George Nauman Shuster, *The Catholic Spirit in America* (New York, 1927); Katherine Kurz Burton, *In No Strange Land; Some American Catholic Converts* (New York and Toronto, 1942), with bibliography; Edward J. Mannix, *The American Convert Movement* (New York, 1923); John Tracy Ellis, *American Catholics and the Intellectual Life* (Chicago, 1956); Walter J. Ong, *Frontiers in American Catholicism; Essays on Ideology and Culture* (New York, 1957). Ong's *American Catholic Crossroads, Religious-Secular Encounter in the Modern World* (New York, 1959) summarizes much of these writings by considering the dialogue between religion and secularism in a pluralist society, and the Roman Catholic attitude toward relations between secular knowledge and revealed religion, research and American Catholic education, and the religious apostolate of the secular arts and sciences. The active participation of the laity in this fruitful new life is shown in Leo Richard Ward, *Catholic Life, U.S.A.; Contemporary Lay Movements* (St. Louis, 1959), with a bibliography. College of New Rochelle, New Rochelle, N.Y., *Catholicism in American Culture, Semi-*

centenary Lecture Series, 1953–54 (New Rochelle, 1955) is a collection of essays on divisiveness and "pluralism," and the Church's position in American society. The theme is that the Church can maintain its absolute identity and yet be completely American, that it can transcend a particular culture as a supernatural analyst and critic. (See also Part Four, RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. V, C, *Roman Catholic.*)

C. Lutheranism

Lutheranism has been rooted in the present territory of the United States since the settlement of New Netherland on the Hudson and New Sweden on the Delaware, before 1650. Its constituency was vastly enlarged by migration from Germany after the founding of Pennsylvania, owing to war, economic distress, and persecution of Pietists. Long before the Revolution the Lutheran Church had been solidly organized, chiefly by the efforts of the Rev. Henry Melchior Muhlenburg. Its assimilation into American culture already had begun, with the growing use of English in worship.

Until the 1840's Lutheranism's chief strength was in the colonial German and Dutch regions of the Middle Atlantic States, but it had been extended southward by migration through the Appalachian valleys and highlands. Renewed migration from Germany, beginning in 1839, consisted largely of orthodox conservatives opposed to state-church formalities. It radically altered the situation, by introducing strictly confessional faith, and by extending it to the Middle West and New England. Later came hosts of Scandinavian Lutherans.

American Lutheranism became a mosaic of nationalities and languages, with a complex system of overlapping national, territorial, and confessional synods. Preservation of the old languages for a long time somewhat isolated it from Anglo-American Protestants. Lutheranism entered more into the mainstream of American life, after the patriotic emphasis in World War I, widespread introduction of English, and the

beginnings of a Protestant trend toward interdenominational cooperation. One of the results is a strong movement for union among Lutherans. (See sect. VII, C, *Denominational Unions and Federations.*)

I. BIBLIOGRAPHY AND GENERAL HISTORY. Herbert H. Schmidt, "The Literature of the Lutherans in America," *Religion in Life,* Vol. 27, no. 4 (Autumn, 1958), pp. 583–603, includes bibliographies, general and synodical histories, ethnic groups, periodicals, biography, doctrinal and controversial works, liturgy and hymody, cyclopedias and year books, and major collections of books and archives. A selected general bibliography is in Frederick E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (1958), including Luther and the Reformation, confessions of faith, American Lutheranism, and histories of American synods. Documentary evidence of important stages in the development of American Lutheranism is excellently presented by Herman Ottomar Alfred Keinath, *Documents Illustrating the History of the Lutheran Church in America, with Special Emphasis on the Missouri Synod* (River Forest, Ill., 1947).

The establishment of Lutheranism in the Anglo-American Colonies is excellently covered by Lars Pederson Qualben's *The Lutheran Church in Colonial America* (New York, 1940), which has selected bibliographies with the chapters. An older but still useful work, with illustrations, is William John Finck's *Lutheran Landmarks and Pioneers in America, a Series of Sketches of Colonial Times* (Philadelphia, 1913).

The beginning of great expansion, the history of organization and doctrinal controversy, and the problems of assimilation to American life, are reviewed by Charles R. Keiter, in "Immigration in the Nineteenth Century in its Relation to the Lutheran Church in the United States," *Lutheran Church Review,* Vol. 31, no. 2 (Apr. 1912), pp. 272–279; and no. 3 (July 1912), pp. 466–473.

Among the best general histories of American Lutheranism are: Edmund Jacob Wolf, *The Lutherans in America, A*

Story of Struggle, Progress, Influence and Marvelous Growth, with an Introduction by Henry Eyster Jacobs (New York, 1890), with authorities; F. Bente, *American Lutheranism* (St. Louis, 1919); J. L. Neve, *The History of the Lutheran Church in America,* Revised by Willard D. Allbeck (Burlington, Iowa, 1934, 3rd ed.); William Gustave Polack, *The Building of a Great Church, A Brief History of the Lutheran Church in America* (St. Louis, 1941); *One* (Columbus, Ohio), *America's Lutherans,* edited by Omar Bonderud and Charles Lutz, Reprinted from *One* magazine (Columbus, Ohio, 1955).

Assimilation to American life is stressed by Abdel Ross Wentz, *The Lutheran Church in American History* (Philadelphia, 1933, 2nd ed.), which has a general bibliographical note and a bibliography with each chapter. Although later immigration greatly strengthened it, he says, the Lutheran Church came with early colonists and is an integral part of American Christianity, not a mere foreign body, and lives in a reciprocal relationship with American culture. The church and the nation were born at the same time, and grew up side by side, with similar stages of progress. The book views the church's history in the general framework of American civilization. Assimilation is closely studied in Paul W. Spaude, *The Lutheran Church under American Influence; a Historico-philosophical Interpretation of the Church in its Relation to Various Modifying Forces in the United States* (Burlington, Ia., 1943), with bibliography. This study presents the European background and specific Lutheran movements in Europe, and discusses in detail the various factors influencing the Church in America and certain branches: democracy, industrial and financial organizations, the modern social gospel, evolutionism, Puritan traditions, etc.

Aspects of adaptation to American conditions are seen in alterations in (1) government and (2) doctrine. The first is studied by Robert Fortenbaugh's *The Development of the Synodical Polity of the Lutheran Church in America, to 1829*

(Philadelphia, 1926), with a bibliography. The latter is explained in Vergilius Ferm, *The Crisis in American Lutheran Theology; a Study of the Issue Between American Lutheranism and Old Lutheranism* . . . , with a Foreword by Luther Allan Weigle (New York and London, 1927), with a bibliography. Reginald W. Deitz, "Eastern Lutheranism in American Society and American Christianity, 1870–1914: Darwinism, Biblical Criticism, the Social Gospel" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pennsylvania, 1958; *University Microfilms* (1958), pub. no. 58,3317; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1958), Vol. 19, no. 4, pp. 784–785) analyzes reactions of the General Synod and the General Council, as discerned in a wide range of literature. There was enough liberalism to save the church from a Modernist-Fundamentalist schism, but no striking progress in social action, and conservative immigration retarded Americanization. Awareness of movements in American life and liberal Protestantism accompanied resistance to compromises, and the Church tried to be at once American, evangelical, relevant, and churchly. Variances in belief and worship are outlined in *The Distinctive Doctrines and Usages of the General Bodies of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in the United States* (Philadelphia, 1914, 4th ed., rev. and enl.).

2. GERMAN. Theodore Emanuel Schmauk, "The Lutheran Church in Pennsylvania (1638–1800)," Pennsylvania German Society *Proceedings*, Vol. 11 (Lancaster, Pa., 1902) is part IX of "A Narrative and Critical History," prepared at the request of the Pennsylvania-German Society. This surveys the development of the older Lutheranism, which gradually became "liberal" and later came into conflict with and was modified to some extent by the coming of conservative "Missouri Lutheranism." Richard Charles Wolf, "The Americanization of the German Lutherans, 1683–1829" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1947) concentrates upon the eighteenth-century immigrants. Under the impact of American environment, Lutherans developed an indigenous ec-

clesiastical structure, different from the German and that of later immigrant groups. The earlier immigrants became both thoroughly American and truly Lutheran. H. J. Kreider, "The English Language Schism in the Lutheran Church in New York City, 1794–1810," *Lutheran Church Quarterly*, Vol. 21 (Jan. 1948), pp. 50–60, describes a typical assimilation conflict in a struggle for the predominance of English over German. Modern Americanization, in a fairly typical urban setting, including Lutheranism, is closely examined in Sharvy Greiner Umbeck, "The Social Adaptations of a Selected Group of the German-Background Protestant Churches in Chicago" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1940; abstract, lithoprinted, Chicago, 1944).

Resistance to liberalizing and assimilating tendencies came with the new immigration after 1839, as is shown in Ernest Theodore Bachmann, "The Rise of 'Missouri Lutheranism'" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1946; microfilm, University of Chicago). He traces the origins in Germany and in the later American setting, in relation to the environment of a free society and existing Lutheran movements and organizations, parallel to a similar conservative trend among certain Eastern Lutherans. The recovery of theological orthodoxy was influenced by a similar movement in Germany, and opposed liberal Lutheranism at Gettysburg Seminary. "Missouri" Lutheranism is uncompromising, group-conscious, and aggressively different. This is the theme of William Gustave Polack, *The Building of a Great Church, A Brief History of the Lutheran Church in America, with Special Reference to the Evangelical Lutheran Synod of Missouri, Ohio, and Other States* (St. Louis, Mo., 1941, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.), with bibliography. Similar is the theme of Carl Mauelshagen, *American Lutheranism Surrenders to Forces of Conservatism* (Athens, Ga., 1936), with a bibliography, an account of the recapture of the church by confessional orthodoxy. (See also Part One, sect. VII, C, 1, *Germany: Lutheranism and the Sects.*)

3. SWEDISH. Florence Edith Janson, *The Background of Swedish Immigration, 1840–1930* (Chicago, 1931) illustrates the religious as well as the secular factors, particularly those which determined the future of Swedish-American Protestantism, including Lutheranism. George M. Stephenson, *The Religious Aspects of Swedish Immigration, A Study of Immigrant Churches* (Minneapolis, 1932) includes also other Protestant churches, in a detailed study based upon original sources and much printed literature. Adolph B. Benson and Naboth Hedin, eds., *Swedes in America, 1638–1938* (New Haven, 1938) has remarks on religion by George M. Stephenson, who refers to the transition to America of the Swedish Pietist movement, and to the background of democratic protest against the aristocratic state and the established Lutheran Church—an agitation parallel to English Puritanism. This attitude profoundly modified the character of the Lutheran Church in America, which abandoned episcopacy for synodical polity, and tended to simplify its liturgy.

O. Fritiof Ander, *The Cultural Heritage of the Swedish Immigrant, Selected References* (Rock Island, Ill., 1956) in ch. 2, "The Background of Swedish Emigration," discusses religious motives, and in chs. 6 and 7 treats the church's influence in education, and the growth of religious as well as secular literature. Gene Jessie Lund, "The Americanization of the Augustana Lutheran Church" (Doctoral dissertation, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1954) reviews the transformation, by environment, of a "typical immigrant communion" from Swedish episcopacy into an English-speaking American church with a modified congregational form of government, but retaining a conservative theology, noting the factors that produced the changes. (See also Part One, sect. VII, C, 2, *The Reformation in Scandinavia.*)

4. NORWEGIAN. Rasmus B. Anderson, *The First Chapter of Norwegian Immigration (1821–1840), Its Causes and Results* (Madison, Wis., 1896, 3rd ed.) notes the spread of dissent from the Lutheran state church, and particularly the followers

of the reformer Hans Nielsen Hauge, and their protest against rationalism and secularization. Persecution of the Pietists was one of the main causes of the first large exodus to America. Magnus Nodtvedt, "Hans Nielsen Hauge and the Rebirth of Norway" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1950) is a history of the movement initiated by Hauge (1771–1824), inheriting Pietism and orthodox evangelical elements in Germany and Scandinavia. It inspired political, religious, and economic freedom and many social and moral changes. This movement influenced early Norwegian Lutheranism in the United States, in much the same way as with the Swedes.

Carlton C. Qualey, *Norwegian Settlement in the United States* (Northfield, Minn., 1938) surveys the religious motive of nineteenth-century migration, "manifesting itself most notably in the pietist movement inaugurated by Hans Nielsen Hauge in the early nineteenth century, and in the growth of minor dissenting sects." Clergymen sometimes led emigrant groups. The bibliography includes books and articles on churches and religious life, and Norwegian groups in various states. Theodore C. Blegen, *Norwegian Migration to America, 1825–1860* (Northfield, Minn., 1931) presents a well-documented account of religious as well as secular motives, and of early communities and churches.

Olaf Morgan Norlie, *History of the Norwegian People in America* (Minneapolis, 1925) reviews the religious situation in Norway, 1825–1860, as a motive for emigration, and has statistics of Norwegian churches and remarks on religious conditions in America in the same period, the religious character of the emigrants, their religious books and periodicals. J. Magnus Rohne, *Norwegian American Lutheranism up to 1872* (New York, 1926) is a carefully documented general history. It is continued by Eugene Lysne Fevold, "The History of Norwegian-American Lutheranism, 1870–1890" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1951), which studies a critical period, briefly reviewing Norwegian back-

grounds, migration to America, and growth before 1870, with histories of several groups. The motives of controversy and union and the most important controversies are analyzed. A union of synods in 1890 brought a remarkable growth of organization and activities. A very complete review is provided in E. Clifford Nelson and Eugene L. Fevold, *The Lutheran Church Among Norwegian Americans, A History of the Evangelical Lutheran Church* (Minneapolis, 1960, 2 vols.), with bibliographical references, and emphasis on the trend toward unity. The Norwegian-American Historical Association, *Publications, Studies and Records* (Minneapolis, 1926–) have some articles relating to Lutheran and other church history. (See also Part One, sect. VII, C, 2, *The Reformation in Scandinavia.*)

D. Eastern Orthodox Churches

Eastern Orthodox churches were late-comers in the American religious scene. Except Russian missions in Alaska, planted in the eighteenth century, Orthodoxy gained no foothold in America until after the Civil War. Its rise to a constituency of several millions began with the attraction of industrial workers from Eastern Europe. From about 1890 to World War I, multitudes came from Slavic, Greek, and Near Eastern lands to work in heavy industries and mercantile business.

American Orthodoxy for the most part is less than seventy-five years old. Because its various branches in the Old World were national churches, they earnestly wished to maintain contacts with the home lands, and cherished their identity by preserving national cultures, languages, and liturgies. The result was a long isolation from the mainstream of American religion, and the loss of many young people who wished to become Americanized. After World War I, the Communist revolution caused schisms among the Orthodox in America, and the expansion of Communist power after World War II caused further alienations from the old home lands.

Until recently, persistence of the old languages has prevented publication of much information in English about these churches. With few exceptions, American Protestants have been slightly informed about Orthodoxy, and a centuries-old schism has kept it aloof from the Roman Catholic Church. Although it is sometimes called America's "fourth faith," Orthodoxy has been the least known major division of Christianity.

This section therefore is intended to make it better known, and so may seem disproportionately large. This seems to be justified by recent Orthodox efforts to accommodate to American life, and to achieve unity among the national branches. This policy has recovered many lapsed members and won some Anglo-American converts. The fairly rapid increase of some branches bids fair to obtain for Orthodoxy a more conspicuous place in American religion and life.

1. BIBLIOGRAPHY AND GENERAL HISTORY. John T. Dorosh, comp., *The Eastern Church; a Bibliography of Publications in the Roman Alphabet with Indication of Location* (Washington, D.C., 1946, typewritten and microfilm no. 52, 361) is available at the Library of Congress, and contains publications available in American libraries, classified by subject. A large section for the United States includes references and year books, general works, periodicals, statutes, constitutions and by-laws, biography, churches, and schools. Dean Timothy Andrews, *The Eastern Orthodox Church, a Bibliography* (New York, 1957, 2nd ed.) comprises about 750 titles. It includes religious thought and doctrine, worship, the arts, general histories, works on various divisions, relations with other churches and the Ecumenical Movement, biography, missions, bibliographies, directories, periodicals, and publishers and booksellers in the United States.

Henry Renaud Turner Brandreth, *An Outline Guide to the Study of Eastern Christendom* (London, 1951) has general surveys, liturgy, spirituality and monasticism, iconography and art, doctrine, national orthodox, separated and

Uniate churches, books on reunion with the Anglican Church, and periodicals, with critical notes. Sergius Bulgakov, *The Orthodox Church* (New York, 1935) is a complete and authoritative reference book, including statements of theological position, and of relations with the secular world, and expressing strong belief that exiles in the Western nations may save Orthodoxy. Michael Constantinides, *The Orthodox Church* (London, 1931), by a Greek archbishop in America, provides a conspectus of the organization and life of the various independent churches. It is considered the most useful American work of its kind in English, and has a bibliography. Theophilus Nicholas Pashkovsky, *A Short History of the Christian Church and the Ritual of the Eastern Orthodox Church, Its History and Meaning* (San Francisco, 1934), a popular official statement, is addressed to Americans, to promote understanding.

Donald Attwater, *The Christian Churches of the East* (Milwaukee, 1947–1948, 2 vols.) includes bibliographies. Chapter 7 in Vol. 2, "The Orthodox in America," comprises a general historical sketch, and reviews the history and condition of the branches, and their attitudes toward the Roman Catholic Church and each other. It is a somewhat partisan treatment by a Roman Catholic. Stephen H. R. Upson, *Orthodox Church History* (Brooklyn, N.Y., 1954, 2nd ed.) was written by a convert with the assistance of clergymen and laymen of Orthodox communions, for the benefit of English-speaking people. It includes national churches, and a section on their branches in North America, with descriptions of development and condition. An extremely useful reference, by the best informed American authority on Eastern Orthodoxy, is Matthew Spinka's essay, "Orthodox Eastern Church," *Encyclopedia Britannica*, Vol. 16 (1958), pp. 938–942. This includes the branches, and the history since World War I, with a bibliography. A section, "The Eastern Orthodox Churches in America," has a brief bibliography in Russian and English, heavily emphasizing events in the twentieth century.

2. NATIONAL CHURCHES IN THE UNITED STATES. Work Projects Administration, Historical Records Survey, New York City, *Inventory of the Church Archives in New York City, Eastern Orthodox Churches and the Armenian Church in America* (New York City, 1940) surveys history, organization, and records of Eastern Churches in the United States. It explains their record system, includes a glossary of Orthodox terms, and has a heavily documented historical sketch giving the European background, comments on churches and liturgy, and a review of the manifold repercussions of the Russian Revolution. The volume consists mainly of sections on the branches, with directories of churches, inventories of records, and a directory and a chronology of churches in the United States, Alaska, and Canada. The bibliography has references to national groups and periodicals. David Feodor Abramtsov, *Complete Directory of Orthodox Catholic Churches in the United States* (Philadelphia, 1953) lists the primates of the national churches and parishes by states, with their denominations and addresses.

a. Russian Church. Much enlightening material on Russian missions in Alaska may be traced through Frank A. Golder, *Guide to Materials for American History in Russian Archives* (Washington, D.C., 1917), which has numerous references to documents in the archives of the Ruling Senate and the Holy Ruling Synod, c.1768–1887. James Wickersham, *A Bibliography of Alaskan Literature, 1724–1924* (Cordova, Alaska, 1927) opens further sources of information through many entries of histories, voyages and travels, newspapers and periodicals, and public archives. V. Basanoff, "Archives of the Russian Church in Alaska in the Library of Congress," *Pacific Historical Review,* Vol. 2, no. 1 (Mar. 1933), pp. 79–84, describes the collection dating from 1762, but concerned mostly with the nineteenth century, and consisting of parochial registers, annual reports to the bishop respecting the clergy, documents on ecclesiastical jurisdiction, reports of missionary work, property, and financial accounts.

Eugene K. Smirnoff, *A Short Account of the Historical Development and Present Position of Russian Orthodox Missions* (London, 1903), based on original sources, includes briefly the missions in Alaska. The most authoritative English treatment of the great missionary apostle of Alaska is A. P. Kashevarov, "Ivan Veniaminoff, Innocent, Metropolitan of Moscow and Kolomna; His Life and Work in Alaska, Drawn from his Biography in Russian," *Alaska Magazine,* Vol. 1 (1927), pp. 48–56, 145–150, 217–224.

Serge Bolshakoff, *The Foreign Missions of the Russian Orthodox Church* (London and New York, 1943), with bibliography, has in ch. 4, "The Missions in the Americas," a history of the Russian Church in the Western Hemisphere. Arthur Inkersley, "The Greek Church on the Pacific," *Overland Monthly,* Vol. 26, 2nd ser., no. 155 (Nov. 1895), pp. 469–482, traces the influence of the Russian Church in Alaska and along the Pacific Coast from the first exploration in 1759–60, and the beginning of missionary work at Kodiak Island in 1794. He describes work among the Aleuts, and of Veniaminoff in the 1820's, and the creation of a diocese in 1840. After the purchase of Alaska, the diocese was transferred to San Francisco, and work in Alaska declined. There are comments on the cathedral of Sitka, and churches in California, Oregon, and Washington. Basil M. Bensin, *History of the Russian Orthodox Greek Catholic Church of North America* (New York, 1941), with bibliography, sketches its history from the first Alaskan mission (1794), its development in the United States, the principal movements of the past half-century, and the part of Russian Orthodoxy in American social and cultural development. The author comments on conversions of Anglo-Americans, publications, education, translation of services into English, the founding of a theological seminary, encouragement of music, growth of autonomy, aid from the Episcopal Church, and the progress of parish life.

The *Russian Orthodox Journal,* 1927– , published

monthly by the Federated Russian Orthodox Clubs of America, successively at Pittsburgh, Grand Rapids, and Cleveland, is an official magazine with many articles on history and contemporary activities. For other periodicals, see Part One, *Bibliography and General History,* notes in bibliographies.

b. Carpatho-Russian Orthodox Church. Basic information is available (in the absence of a general history) in two pamphlets issued by the American Carpatho-Russian Youth Organization: *The Dawn of a New Day* (Johnstown, Pa., 1954), giving a survey of the movement back to Orthodoxy since 1891, the history of the faith in America, and a general description of the diocese in the United States. *What Is the Orthodox Greek Catholic Church?* (Johnstown, Pa., 1954) is a general history of organization, doctrine, etc., in Europe and America. The *American Carpatho-Russian Youth Annual,* Vol. 9 (1957) contains a large body of facts on this church, and its separation from communion with Rome in 1938, with illustrations of its work and some of its churches, and a full directory of the diocese, with its see at Johnstown, Pa.

c. Ukrainians. Wasyl Halich, *Ukrainians in the United States* (Berkeley, Calif., 1937) is founded upon both research and personal knowledge, and has much material on the Orthodox churches. Peter Bilon, *Ukrainians and Their Church,* translated by Rev. S. P. Symchych (Johnstown, Pa., 1953) considers the position of the church with respect to the See of Rome and the so-called "Uniate" Church, and gives a brief general American history.

d. Rumanians. The origins of the Rumanian Church in the United States are reviewed in an article by A. A. Stamouli, "Rumanian Orthodox Church in the United States and Canada," in *New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge* (New York and London, 1911), Vol. 10, p. 112. A comprehensive description is *Episcopia Ortodoxă Română din America, Album Aniversar Congresul Episcopiei "Vatra Românească" 3, 4 si Julie 1954* (Romanian Orthodox Episcopate of America, 1954), illustrated, issued for the twenty-

fifth anniversary, with a general history, and accounts of parishes, personalities, and correspondence.

e. Serbians. A comprehensive account, in Serbian and English, with illustrations, has been published by the St. Sava Serbian Orthodox Monastery, Libertyville, Ill.: *Spomenica of the Thirtieth Anniversary of the St. Sava Monastery and the Sixtieth Anniversary of the Serbian Orthodox Church in the United States and Canada* (Libertyville, Ill., 1953), including a general history, parish histories, a directory, and other materials. Historical Records Survey, New York City, *Calendar of the Episcopal Correspondence of the Serbian Orthodox Church, 1898–1925, Located at St. Nicholas' Cathedral,* 15 East 19th Street, New York City (New York, 1942), typewritten copy at the Cathedral with numerous MS corrections, and a bibliography, is a valuable source for the history of this national group. Many articles on the history of the Serbian communion have appeared in the daily newspaper, *American Srbobran* (Pittsburgh, Pa., 1906–), especially in its English edition.

f. Albanians. Bishop Fan S. Noli's essay, "Albanian Orthodox Church in N[orth] America," in *Russian Orthodox American Messenger,* Vol. 15, no. 3 (Feb. 14, 1911), pp. 50–53, comprises a general history and description, with remarks on the great obstacles to organization and growth, due to scattered settlement, and lack of funds and clergy.

g. Greeks. Early years of the Greek Orthodox communion are noted in Thomas Burgess, *Greeks in America, an Account of Their Coming, Progress, Customs, Living and Aspirations* (Boston, 1913), with a bibliography. J. P. Xenides, *The Greeks in America . . .* , with an Introduction by Charles Hatch Sears (New York, 1922), has a bibliography, and is one of the studies of ethnic groups in the "New American Series," made under the auspices of the Interchurch Movement. Greek Archdiocese of North & South America, *Greek Orthodox Year Book,* contains a sketch of the origin and organization of the Greek (Eastern) Orthodox Church, a

history of the Archdiocese in Greek and English, with a list of the 20 oldest parishes, and hierarchy and directory of the Archdiocese, mostly in the United States. Two mines of information concerning the Greek Church are its *Orthodox Observer,* issued for the laity in English and Greek, with serious articles on theology, education, and other topics; and the *Greek Orthodox Theological Review,* published at the theological seminary in Brookline, Mass.

h. Syrians. There are extensive notes on the founding of the Syrian Orthodox churches in K. Hitti, *The Syrians in America* (New York, 1924).

i. Armenians. M. Vartan Malcolm, *The Armenians in America* (Boston, 1919) includes observations on the planting and growth of the Armenian Apostolic Church, and its part in the lives of the people. Shnork Vartabad Kaloustian, *An Outline of the History of the Armenian Church,* Published by the Diocese of the Armenian Church of North America (New York, 1953) has a short section, "The Armenian Church in the United States."

3. REVOLUTION AND INDEPENDENCE. The struggle for American Orthodox independence is vividly portrayed in articles by various authors in the *Christian Century,* 1946–1950. These reveal the resistance of the Russian, Serbian, Rumanian, etc. churches to foreign control, their insistence upon autonomy, the rise of a new generation to leadership, and the promotion of education for the ministry in America. Typical articles are: (1) "Moscow Invades Orthodoxy in America," Vol. 61, no. 7 (Feb. 16, 1944), p. 197. (2) "The Rift in the Russian Church," Vol. 62, no. 26 (June 27, 1945), pp. 753–755. (3) "Russian Church Declares Its Independence," Vol. 62, no. 32 (Aug. 8, 1945), pp. 900–901. (4) "Reject Proposal of Soviet Bishop, Prelates of Russian Orthodox Church Refuse to Admit Moscow Rule as Ordered by Alexei," Vol. 62, no. 52 (Dec. 26, 1945), pp. 1453–1454. (5) "What Does Alexei Want?", Vol. 63, no. 1 (Jan. 2, 1946), pp. 5–7. (6) "Russian Church in America Keeps Its

Independence," Vol. 63, no. 52 (Dec. 25, 1946), p. 1557. (7) "Spiritual Ties Only with Moscow," Vol. 64, no. 1 (Jan. 1, 1947), p. 5. (8) "Admit Alexei as 'Spiritual Head,' Sobor of Russian Orthodox Church in America Reserves Right, However, to Name Own Ruling Bishop," Vol. 64, no. 1 (Jan. 1, 1947), p. 20. (9) "Moscow Again Woos Russian Orthodox Churches," Vol. 64, no. 36 (Sept. 3, 1947), pp. 1036–1037. (10) "American Orthodox in East-West Struggle," Vol. 67, no. 51 (Dec. 20, 1950), p. 1508.

The struggle was especially fierce in the Russian Church. William C. Emhardt, "The Russian Church at the American Bar," in his *Religion in Soviet Russia* (Milwaukee, 1929) depicts the trials of Orthodoxy in Russia because of the Bolshevist revolution, and their effects in splitting the Russian Church in America into factions. Michael Karpovich, "Church and State in Russian History," *Russian Review,* Vol. 3, no. 2 (Spring, 1944), pp. 10–20, presents the background of a long controversy about autonomy, and the effort to cut ties with the Russian state church, while retaining a purely spiritual affinity. A general review of government relations of the Church in Russia, and of relations of the Church in America with Russia, is given by N. S. Timasheff, "The Moscow Council and the Russian Orthodox Church in America," *Russian Orthodox Journal,* Vol. 19, no. 3 (July 1945), pp. 3–6, 19. He notes the rejection of conditions of union offered by the Russian Church in 1945, and the misunderstanding of American religious and ecclesiastical circumstances, on the part of the Moscow Patriarchate.

"The Non-Red Orthodox," *Newsweek,* Vol. 36, no. 25 (Dec. 18, 1950), p. 82, describes the election of Archbishop Leonty as metropolitan of 300,000 Russian Orthodox, by the eighth all-American Sobor (general council), which condemned communism and rejected the rule of the Moscow Patriarch, Alexei. The present autonomy of Russian Orthodoxy in the United States is thoroughly reviewed by the Very Rev. John Chepeleff, "The Canonical Standing of the

Russian Orthodox Church in America," *Russian Orthodox Journal,* Vol. 23, no. 9 (Jan. 1950), pp. 4–8, 34–36, 38. He asserts the *de facto* status of the Church in America as an autonomous metropolitan district, in accordance with action by the all-Russian Church Council of 1917–1918. Edward R. Hardy, Jr., "The Russian Orthodox Church at Home and Abroad," *Christendom,* Vol. 11, no. 2 (Spring, 1946), pp. 153–164, emphasizes the growing autonomy of the American Church since 1934, along with a desire for merely spiritual fellowship with Russia.

4. INTERPRETATION TO AMERICANS. *a. Early Efforts.* David F. Abramtsov, "Father Nicholas Bjerring—His Work in Orthodoxy," *Russian Orthodox Journal,* Vol. 19, no. 12 (Apr. 1946), pp. 5–6, 19, relates the unusual story of a Danish convert who founded the first Orthodox church in eastern America and was a pioneer interpreter of Orthodoxy to Americans. He conducted English services in New York City, and founded a magazine, *The Oriental Church Magazine Devoted to Religion, Science, Literature and Art* (New York, 1878–1881, 4 vols.). In this he attempted to promote understanding of Eastern church life and qualities, with many entertaining articles on Eastern lands and services. Perhaps the first volume to explain the Orthodox liturgical tradition to Americans is his *The Offices of the Oriental Church, with an Historical Introduction* (New York, 1884), which has a thorough description of the services and administration of the sacraments.

The future dependence of Russian and other Orthodoxy in America, upon services in English, was frankly foretold by the Rev. Ingram N. W. Irvine, a convert from Anglicanism to Orthodoxy. His "Bishop Raphael in His Relation to the English Work of the Archdiocese of North America," *Russian Orthodox Messenger,* Vol. 19, no. 5 (Mar. 15, 1915), pp. 70–71, notices the introduction of English services by Archbishop Tikhon, and Irvine's own work in English at the Russian cathedral in New York. The missionary labors of

this devoted convert have been sympathetically described by David F. Abramtsov, "The Rev. Ingram N. W. Irvine 1850–1921 Orthodox Catholic Priest," *Russian Orthodox Journal*, Vol. 20, no. 1 (May 1946), pp. 9–11, describing his reception from the Anglican Church in 1905, his English-speaking apostolate in New York, and his advocacy of adapting Orthodoxy to American ways.

b. Growing Contacts. Plato Ernest Shaw, *American Contacts with the Eastern Churches, 1820–1870* (Chicago, 1937), with bibliography, studies contacts of American Protestant churches with Eastern Christendom, a long effort to promote friendly relations, which paved the way for later understanding. He remarks on difficulties of Eastern churches in the United States, and the partial remedy in the good will of the Episcopal Church. Evangelicals and Orientals are once more in contact, with opportunity for mutual benefit, which is hampered by lack of literature for English readers. W. G. Tinckom-Fernandez, "Eastern Orthodox Peoples and Churches in the United States," *Christendom*, Vol. 4, no. 3 (Summer, 1939), pp. 423–436, stresses Orthodoxy as a link between the Old and the New World, and attempts to promote friendly understanding with the American Christian majority. The essay rapidly sketches American Orthodox groups, their rise in social status, ecclesiastical dissensions due to political troubles in Europe, and the usual indifference of the older American churches, except the Episcopal. Adaptation to American conditions will come, if the Protestant churches are understanding, and with it will come the rise of unity among the Orthodox.

Ruth Korper, *The Candlelight Kingdom; a Meeting with the Russian Church* (New York, 1955) is a reflective but popular essay, attempting to idealize, explain, and understand the mystical piety and liturgy, and to provide information for the increasing number of Americans who are interested in the Eastern churches. William Chauncey Emhardt, *The Eastern Church in the Western World* (Milwaukee and London,

1928) explains the Eastern churches to Americans. His account traces missionary labors and the rise of these groups, American relations with them since 1828, factionalism since World War I, and the efforts of the Episcopal Church in adapting them to American life.

T. J. Lacey, "The American Church and the Eastern Orthodox Churches," *American Church Monthly*, Vol. 4, no. 4 (Dec. 1918), pp. 334–343, traces the relations between the Episcopal Church and the Orthodox in America since 1862, quoting correspondence, and showing the possibility of union. A detailed account of negotiations for Anglican-Orthodox unity is Percy V. Norwood's "Reunion with the Eastern Churches," *Anglican Theological Review*, Vol. 23, no. 1 (Jan. 1941), pp. 47–66. This has bibliographies on Orthodoxy and Anglican-Orthodox relations, a general review of the conferences, and friendly relations in the United States since the Greek revolution and the purchase of Alaska. One of the most sensitive interpretations of Orthodoxy to Americans is by an American Episcopalian: W. Norman Pittenger, "The Spirit of Eastern Orthodoxy," *Christendom*, Vol. 8, no. 4 (Autumn, 1943), pp. 503–513. He emphasizes the peculiar ethos of Eastern Orthodoxy, its long isolated life, and the revival of its theology, and explains to Americans the metaphysical and mystical character of Eastern religious life and doctrine.

c. Americanization. The vexed question of an Americanized Orthodoxy is thoroughly canvassed in an essay by the then Bishop (later Archbishop) Leontiĭ (Leonid) Turkevich, "Problems of the Eastern Orthodox Church in America," *Constructive Quarterly*, Vol. 3, no. 2 (June 1915), pp. 311–327. This discusses the inner life of American Orthodoxy and its relation to other groups, and the necessity of displaying independence and constructive power, with English as the language binding national groups together, in preparation for eventual unity, and union with the "Uniate" churches and the Episcopalians. Basil M. Bensin's "The Future of Ortho-

doxy in America," *Russian Orthodox Journal*, Vol. 18, no. 9 (Jan. 1945), pp. 3–5, 20, discusses the problems involved in Americanizing; in short, adjustment to American life without losing essential principles and character. Nicholas T. Kiryluk, "The Present and Future of Orthodoxy in America," *ibid.*, Vol. 18, no. 10 (Feb. 1945), pp. 3–4, 14, deplores the chaotic effect of nationalistic divisions, and advocates a united American synod and a workable relation with the Orthodox groups abroad. The young people want an American church to interpret their faith to themselves and other Americans. The *American Review of Eastern Orthodoxy* (New York, 1955–), published by the Eastern Orthodox Catholic Church in America, aims to promote the faith in American terms, and contains news, book reviews, editorial comments, etc.

The approach of an English-speaking Orthodoxy is suggested by Michael B. Draovich, "Use of the English Language in Our Church Services," *Russian Orthodox Journal*, Vol. 24, no. 2 (June 1950), pp. 7, 34. English is necessary for the proper training of future priests and singers, converts, people in mixed marriages, and attracting the lapsed, while preserving the essentials of Orthodoxy. David Feodor Abramtsov, "An Orthodox Vocabulary," *ibid.*, Vol. 17, no. 10 (Feb. 1944), pp. 8, 18, suggests the determined effort to adapt the Russian and other churches to an English-speaking environment, by translation of the spiritual, ecclesiastical, liturgical, and doctrinal terms. Eastern churches are engaged in translating their services into English, while preserving their ancient beauty, especially to keep young people loyal to the faith and to attract others. One of the best evidences is Abramtsov's *The Orthodox Companion* (Bridgeville, Pa., 1956), an explanatory prayer book, and a handbook or guide to devotional practice and behavior in church.

An example of contributions to Orthodox doctrinal thought in the United States is Leontiĭ G. Turkevich's *Essays of Orthodox Theology* (New York, 1918). Basil M. Kherbawi,

The Old Church in the New World; or, The Mother Church . . . Her Doctrine, Her Sacraments (Brooklyn, N.Y., 1930) is mostly doctrinal, for English-speaking non-Orthodox people, and youth of Orthodox ancestry. A clarification and interpretation of the sacraments for American readers appears in George P. Michaelides, "The Sacraments from the Eastern Orthodox Point of View," *Christendom*, Vol. 6, no. 1 (Winter, 1941), pp. 96–107, with bibliographical references. The author points to differences in the Orthodox, Protestant, and Roman Catholic positions, but stresses similarities in a detailed and technical discussion. Leonid Soroka and Stan W. Carlson, *Faith of Our Fathers: The Eastern Orthodox Religion* (Minneapolis, 1954) was intended as a popular guide for Orthodox and other Americans, comprising the history of American Orthodoxy, architecture, liturgy, feast days, doctrine, prayers, Bible references, a calendar, and a dictionary.

Paul Zaichenko, "The Popularization of Russian Church Music in America," *Russian Orthodox Journal*, Vol. 19, no. 4 (Aug. 1945), pp. 7–9, 18; no. 6 (Oct. 1945), pp. 5–6, 26, includes the history from the introduction of *a cappella* singing in New York City in the 1880's, with many interesting and detailed references to choirs, choruses, and quartets, and mention of church music composers. Probably the most comprehensive work on music is Egon Wellescz, *A History of Byzantine Music and Hymnography* (Oxford, Eng., 1949). The best general American study is Constantine Cavarnos, *Byzantine Sacred Music; the Traditional Music of the Orthodox Church—Its Nature, Purpose and Execution* (Belmont, Mass., 1956), issued by the Institute for Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies.

E. Judaism

Judaism has been domiciled in the United States since the early colonial period. The three hundredth anniversary of the first congregation, in New York City, was observed in

1954, and emphasized the emergence of a new American Judaism.

The impact of Judaism upon American life was slight until well into the nineteenth century. The colonial Spanish and Portuguese (Sephardic) Jews were a small and rather scattered group. But the situation changed rapidly after 1840, with the large immigration of well-educated and socially alert Jews from Germany and Bohemia. Another important chapter began with the mass migration from Eastern Europe after 1880.

The new American environment stimulated a tendency toward the modernization and acculturation of Judaism, which grew from the Reform movement of the early nineteenth century, especially in Germany and Bohemia. The division of American Judaism into Reform, Conservatism, and Orthodoxy has even assumed something of the familiar aspect of denominationalism. Freedom from the ghetto exclusiveness of Europe has encouraged varying degrees of assimilation. Secularism has resulted in the new phenomenon of the nonobservant or "disintegrated" Jew.

Persecution under Nazism, the rise of Zionism and the State of Israel, and fear of complete assimilation have inspired a reemphasis upon distinctive features and a return to religious observance. This movement finds expression in preservation of the religious and communal essentials of Judaism, which is regarded as one of the creative elements in American pluralistic culture. An evidence of the trend is the emergence of Reconstructionism, which insists that "Jews be Jews" as well as loyal and devoted Americans.

1. BIBLIOGRAPHY AND GENERAL HISTORY. Abraham Simon Wolf Rosenbach, *An American Jewish Bibliography, Being a List of Books and Pamphlets by Jews or Relating to them Printed in the United States from the Establishment of the Press in the Colonies until 1850* (Baltimore, 1926) contains 689 entries in chronological order, with notes, locations in libraries, and index. Hebrew Union College, Jewish Institute

of Religion, Library, *Jewish Americana . . . A Supplement to A. S. M. Rosenbach, An American Jewish Bibliography* (Cincinnati, 1954) is a catalog of books and articles by or relating to Jews, printed up to 1850, and found in the library of the Hebrew Union College, Jewish Institute of Religion, Cincinnati. Anita Libman Lebeson, *Pilgrim People* (New York, 1950) has one of the best bibliographies ever compiled for American Judaism, including many articles, essays in the American Jewish Historical Society, *Publications*, bibliographical references in the extensive notes, and much material on Judaism in the United States, synagogue histories, religious leaders, and movements.

Journal of Jewish Bibliography, a Quarterly, edited in collaboration with eminent scholars by Joshua Bloch (New York, Oct. 1938–) is a useful guide to collections of Judaica in libraries, and to books on American Jewish history. *Jewish Book Annual* (Jewish Book Council of America, New York, 1943/44–) has excellent notes on Jewish books and bibliographies of new books with comments, and is a guide to writing by and about American Jews.

American Jewish Archives, Devoted to the Preservation of American Jewish Historical Records and Their Study (Cincinnati, June 1948–), issued by the Hebrew Union College, is a vast repository of bibliography and studies, local history, documents, religious history, Jews in particular states, book reviews, etc. Moses Rischin, *An Inventory of American Jewish History . . .*, with a Foreword by Oscar Handlin (Cambridge, Mass., 1954) is a bibliographical manual with materials on the Jew in American social, economic, and cultural history.

American Jewish Historical Society, *Publications* (New York, 1893–), a mine of information on all aspects of American Jewish life and Judaism, is valuable especially for its many essays on local Jewish communities and synagogues since colonial times. Joshua Bloch, *Of Making Many Books; an Annotated List of the Books Issued by the Jewish Pub-*

lication Society of America, 1890–1952 (Philadelphia, 1954) is chronological, with author and title indexes. It gives indexes of authors, compilers, editors, and titles, and a list of serials, and includes titles on Judaism in America, with comments. *The American Jewish Year Book* (New York, 1899/1900– , with complete index in Vol. 50) has important statistical information, special articles, biographies, necrologies, and bibliographies. Beginning with Vol. 44 each issue has an American Jewish bibliography. Recent issues list national organizations, welfare funds and community councils, and periodicals, and have bibliography by and about Jews during the past year.

Albert M. Friedenberg, "American Jewish Journalism to the Close of the Civil War," American Jewish Historical Society, *Publications*, Vol. 26 (1918), pp. 270–273, includes religious journals with notes, and provides a guide to early American Jewish religious opinions and movements. Fannie M. Brodie, "The Hebrew Periodical Press in America, 1871–1931: A Bibliographical Survey," *ibid.*, Vol. 33 (1934), pp. 127–170, has an explanatory historical introduction, a general bibliography, and a list of periodicals with bibliographical details and notes. Mordecai Soltes, *The Yiddish Press, an Americanizing Agency* (New York, 1925, reprinted 1950), with bibliography, discusses origin, growth, and influence, with references to deliberate Americanizing efforts and to religion, and summarizes changes and developments.

2. GENERAL HISTORY: AMERICA. Abraham Sachar, *A History of the Jews* (New York, 1953, 4th ed., rev.) has valuable references to American Jews, especially in ch. 23. Howard M. Sachar, *The Course of Modern Jewish History* (Cleveland and New York, 1958) has four chapters on the rise and development of the American Jewish community, a survey of Jewish life about 1950, its varieties of religious experience, and the revival of deep Jewish loyalties. Morris Urman Schappes, *A Documentary History of the Jews in the United States, 1654–1875;* edited with Notes and Introductions . . .

Preface by Joshua Bloch (New York, 1950), with bibliographical references in notes, fills a gap in American historiography. It presents 159 documents illustrating religious as well as other phases of life, including some printed for the first time; 170 pages of notations with biographical, bibliographical, and other data, and introductory comments to the documents. His *The Jews in the United States; A Pictorial History, 1654 to the Present* (New York, 1958) was compiled in commemoration of the 300th anniversary of the first American Jewish community, in New Amsterdam (New York), and has some illustrations of religious life.

Peter Wiernik, *History of the Jews in America, from the Period of the Discovery of the New World to the Present Time* (New York, 1931, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.), with a bibliography in the preface, is a standard work, with references to religious life. Lee Joseph Levinger, *A History of the Jews in the United States* (Cincinnati, 1949, 4th ed., rev.) is another standard work, similar in scope to Wiernik's. Meyer Waxman, *American Judaism in the Light of History; Three Hundred Years,* by Rabbi Louis J. Lehrfield (Chicago, 1955), inspired by the three hundredth anniversary, studies successive waves of immigration and their degrees of assimilation. It is hopeful for the continuance of Judaism as a religious and cultural force, and has many references to culture, education, periodicals, and community life. Harry Lewis Golden and Martin Rywell, *Jews in American History, Their Contribution to the United States of America* (Charlotte, 1950), with a bibliography, approaches the Jewish contributions to American religious life from the biographical angle, and emphasizes the peculiar contributions of Judaism to American religious pluralism and democracy. Howard M. Sachar, *The Course of Modern Jewish History* (Cleveland and New York, 1958) has chapters on Jewish migration to America, the rise of a new kind of Jewish life, the development of the Jewish community, its life about 1950, and varieties in its religious expression.

The early eras of American Judaism, through the Sephardic and German immigrations, are studied in several works of high scholarly quality. Salo Wittmayer Baron, *The Jewish Community, Its History and Structure to the American Revolution* (Philadelphia, 1942, 3 vols.), with bibliographical references in notes, and bibliography in Vol. 3, has some material on early religious life. *American Jewry Documents: Eighteenth Century, Primarily Hitherto Unpublished Manuscripts,* ed. Jacob Rader Marcus (Cincinnati and New York, 1959) includes many references to religious life, and illustrates Jewish participation in the American community. Marcus' *Early American Jewry* (Philadelphia, 1951–53, 2 vols.), with bibliography in notes, has a chapter in Vol. 2 on "Religio-Communal Organization" to c.1790, with a sketch of early Jewish religious life, leaders, synagogues, officers, membership, congregational meetings, discipline, observances, etc. Hyman B. Grinstein, *The Rise of the Jewish Community of New York: 1654–1860* (Philadelphia, 1945) has an extensive bibliography of manuscript sources, books and periodicals, and bibliographical references in the notes. There are well-organized sections on synagogues, religious leadership, worship, religious dissent, nonconformity, and those without synagogue connections. This probably is the best history of the origins of an American Jewish community and the early adjustment of its religious life to the new conditions. Philip S. Foner, *The Jews in American History, 1654–1865* (New York, 1946) has a select bibliography, a list of congregations in 1850, and an appendix of historical documents. It stresses the services of Jews in the Revolution, their sympathy with Jeffersonian democracy and with the anti-slavery cause, and surveys their communities on the eve of the Civil War.

Anita L. Lebeson, *Jewish Pioneers in America, 1492–1848* (New York, 1931) contains little specifically relating to religion, but has a large and well-chosen bibliography. Jacob Rader Marcus, ed., *Memoirs of American Jews, 1775–1865* (Philadelphia, 1955–56, 3 vols.) has selections on the first

American Jewish Sunday School, and by Rabbis Isaac Leeser and Isaac Mayer Wise on new Jewish settlements and early efforts to organize American Jewry. Bertram Wallace Korn, *Eventful Years and Experiences; Studies in Nineteenth Century American Jewish History* (Cincinnati, 1954) has bibliographical references, and valuable chapters on "American Jewish Life in 1849," and "The First American Jewish Theological Seminary, Maimonides College, 1867–1873." It explores the beginnings of the ideals, movements, and institutions of the present day.

Harry S. Linfield, *The Communal Organization of the Jews in the United States, 1927* (New York, 1930) has a chapter on "The Communal Organization for Religion," with extensive statistics, and a description of the work, buildings, and rabbis. Maurice Joseph Karpf, *Jewish Community Organization in the United States; an Outline of Types of Organizations, Activities, and Problems* (New York, 1938) has a section on religious organization, and a valuable bibliography with religious references. Theodore Friedman and Robert Gordis, eds., *Jewish Life in America* (New York, 1956) includes a lengthy section on religion, with essays on Orthodox, Conservative, and Reform Judaism, Jewish Reconstruction, "Secularism and Religion in the Jewish Labor Movement," the changing role of the American rabbi, education and music (including religious), interfaith relations, and Zionism. Bernard Postal and Lionel Koppman, *A Jewish Tourist's Guide to the U.S.*, with a Foreword by Dr. Jacob R. Marcus (Philadelphia, 1954) is arranged by states, with historical notes on Jews and Judaism in each, listing Jewish congregations and institutions, with illustrations and a complete index. A new edition is projected.

3. IMMIGRATION. George Washington University, Washington, D.C., *A Report on World Population Migrations as Related to the United States of America* (Washington, D.C., 1956) has bibliographies on Jewish migrations to the United States. Paul Masserman and Max Baker, *The Jews Come to*

America (New York, 1932) is a general account of waves of Spanish-Portuguese, German, and Eastern immigration. Rudolf Glanz, "The Immigration of German Jews up to 1880," *Yivo Annual of Jewish Social Science*, Vols. 2–3 (New York, 1947/48), pp. 81–89, with bibliographical footnotes, refers to its causes, the settlements, synagogues and religious life, and strength contributed to the Reform movement. Eric E. Hirshler, ed., *Jews from Germany in the United States*, Introduction by Max Gruenewald (New York, 1955), including bibliography, has an essay by Adolf Kober, emphasizing their early integration into American life, their spirit of liberty and influence for Reform, and their efforts to create a new Judaism, with American conditions influencing thought and worship.

Guido Kisch, *In Search of Freedom, A History of American Jews from Czechoslovakia* (London, 1949) has a very large bibliography, and references, and in ch. 2, "Contributions to American Judaism," includes a history of synagogues, and interesting notes on representatives of Conservatism, Orthodoxy, and Reform. Joseph Kissman, "The Immigration of Rumanian Jews up to 1914," *Yivo Annual of Jewish Social Science*, Vols. 2–3 (New York, 1947/48), pp. 160–179, with bibliographical footnotes, is mostly statistical and secular, but gives a clear picture of the causes (partly religious) for the migration of this Orthodox community. Samuel Joseph, *Jewish Immigration to the United States from 1881 to 1910* (New York, 1914) discusses the great Orthodox immigration from Eastern Europe.

4. GROUPS. *a. Orthodoxy.* J. D. Eisenstein, "The History of the First Russian-American Jewish Congregation, The Beth Hamedrosh Hagodol" (1852), in American Jewish Historical Society, *Publications*, Vol. 9 (1901), pp. 63–74, gives a general account of the origins of American Orthodoxy, and of the movement to unite all Orthodox congregations, 1879–1886. Elias Tcherikower, "Jewish Immigrants to the United States, 1881–1900," *Yivo Annual of Jewish Social Sciences*,

Vol. 6 (New York, 1951), pp. 157–176, concerns the problems of Orthodox Eastern European immigrants in organizing and directing their community life, and the reaction to them of Gentiles, and of previous Jewish settlers. Samuel Belkin, *Essays in Traditional Jewish Thought* (New York and Philadelphia, 1956) includes several chapters dealing with the problems of preserving Orthodoxy.

Traditional Jewish religion and civilization are viewed through American Orthodox eyes in Trude Weiss-Rosmarin, *Jewish Survival; Essays and Studies* (New York, 1949), with a bibliography. Among the most scholarly and informed presentations of Orthodox thinking are the works of Leo Jung: *Foundations of Judaism* (New York, 1923), which consists of sermons at the Jewish Center, New York City; and his *Living Judaism* (New York, 1927, 2nd ed.) on Judaism as a religion. His contribution to American Jewish religious thought has found appreciation in Joshua Modlinger's *Leo Jung, Talmudist, Scholar, Author, Editor, Educator* (New York, 1950). The Orthodox viewpoint is presented in Herman Wouk, *This is My God* (New York, 1959), and in two notable works by Meyer Waxman: *A Handbook of Judaism, as Professed and Practiced Through the Ages* (New York, 1953, 2nd ed., enl.), and *Judaism: Religion and Ethics* (New York, 1958). The ethics taught by Orthodox Judaism are expounded very ably by Aaron Rosmarin's *Golden Rules* (New York, 1947). The Orthodox tone in American Jewry appears in scholarly seminars and addresses by rabbis in the Rabbinical Assembly of America, *Proceedings* (1937–), covering law, theology, religious practices, and community life.

b. Zionism. Isadore S. Meyer, *Early History of Zionism in America, Papers Presented at the Conference on the Early History of Zionism in America,* New York City, Dec. 26–27, 1955 (New York, 1958), with bibliography in notes, is a general survey to 1921. It has references to movements and their records, Orthodox Judaism and early Zionism, the rela-

tions of Zionism with Hebraism (1897–1921): important because of the religious roots of Zionism. Israel Cohen, *The Zionist Movement*, Edited and Revised with Supplementary Chapter on Zionism in the United States by Bernard G. Richards (New York, 1946), with bibliography, presents a well-considered defense of the movement. Jacob Rader Marcus, "Zionism and the American Jew," *American Scholar*, Vol. 2, no. 3 (Summer, 1933), pp. 279–292, reviews reaction to the movement on the part of various schools of thought, from enthusiastic acceptance to critical rejection.

c. Conservatism. Mordecai Waxman, ed., *Tradition and Change; the Development of Conservative Judaism* (New York, 1958) traces the history of the middle way of Judaism in America. Robert Gordis, *Conservative Judaism; an American Philosophy*, with a Special Guide for Study and Discussion by Josiah Derby (New York, 1945), with bibliography, discusses contemporary Conservatism, its origin and development, and makes a prophecy of its success as the future American Judaism. Marshall Sklare, *Conservative Judaism; an American Religious Movement* (Glencoe, Ill., 1955), with bibliographical references, is the first complete study of this peculiarly American movement, resulting partly from the relations between Jews and non-Jews, and based upon a moderate reform of strict tradition. The author surveys its history, ideas, worship, social activities, synagogues and rabbis, and the Jewish Theological Seminary of America, New York City. Louis Finkelstein, *Tradition in the Making; the Seminary's Interpretation of Judaism* (New York, 1937) offers the American Conservative interpretation, as expounded at the Jewish Theological Seminary of America.

d. Reform. David Philipson, *The Reform Movement in Judaism* (New York, 1931, new and rev. ed.), with bibliographical references, analyzes liberalism from its origins in Germany and England, traces its progress in the United States since 1824, and foretells "greater rapprochement of conservatism to the reform position." His "The Progress of

the Jewish Reform Movement in the United States," *Jewish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 10 (Oct. 1897), pp. 52–99, includes its background and philosophy and its beginning in Charleston. He reviews early congregations, leaders and rabbinical conferences, evolution of the prayer book, union of congregations, and the founding of the Hebrew Union College. Beryl Harold Levy, *Reform Judaism in America: a Study in Religious Adaptation* (New York, 1933) traces the history of Reform, its transplantation to the United States, and its development here. The author examines its major religious phases, particularly its emphasis upon ethics and universality rather than exclusiveness, and considers criticisms of the movement, as too respectable and timid.

Israel Knox, *Rabbi in America, The Story of Isaac M. Wise*, Edited by Oscar Handlin (Boston and Toronto, 1957) appreciates the Bohemian rabbi who became the recognized leader of Reform, as editor, author, lecturer, and preacher. Most interesting to non-Jewish readers are chapters on his relation to liberal Protestantism, and on Reform today. Stephen Samuel Wise, *Challenging Years; the Autobiography of Stephen Wise* (New York, 1949) affords one of the clearest portraits of Reform Judaism, as seen in the developing thought of a rabbi, who was long regarded as its greatest American leader, an ardent Zionist, a defender of labor, a champion of democracy, and an interpreter of Judaism to Christians.

Reform has not been a uniform set of beliefs and practices. It has arrived at its present status through many conflicts, which are suggested by three studies: Martin B. Ryback, "The East-West Conflict in American Reform Judaism," *American Jewish Archives*, Vol. 4, no. 1 (Jan. 1952), pp. 3–25, discusses ideological differences between David Einhorn and Isaac Mayer Wise, and the triumph of Wise's vision of unity over radical and sectarian influence, in the effort to establish an American Judaism. The variety of viewpoints is revealed in Robert I. Kahn, "Liberalism as Reflected in Jew-

ish Preaching in the English Language in the Mid-nineteenth Century; an Examination of Jewish Life and Faith (particularly in the United States) between 1830 and 1870, as Revealed in the Sermons of that Period" (Doctoral dissertation, Hebrew Union Seminary, 1951). Martin Lloyd Goldberg, "Fluctuations between Traditionalism and Liberalism in American Reform Judaism from 1855 to 1937" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1955; *University Microfilms* (1955), pub. no. 13,866; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1955), Vol. 15, no. 10, pp. 1920–1921), studies the shifts as reflected in actions and pronouncements of four major conferences of lay and rabbinic leaders. He identifies and explains the causes, such as German liberalism, unity sentiment, American environment, East European conservative immigration, and militant Zionism.

The early effort of Reform to develop a solid foundation is shown by Max Leopold Margolis, *The Theological Aspect of Reformed Judaism* (Baltimore, 1904), which reveals growth of liberalism, and effort to find some standard of belief. Modern American Reform finds a clear expression in *Reform Judaism; Essays by Hebrew Union College Alumni* (Cincinnati, 1949), which consists of essays on Reform thought, and its views of Conservative and Reconstructionist Judaism and Zionism. The authors consider the changing functions of the synagogue and of the rabbi in modern American life, the practice of Reform, and the relation of American Reform to world-wide Jewry.

Several books of superior quality illustrate the development of Reform ideology during the past forty years. James Waterman Wise, *Liberalizing Liberal Judaism* (New York, 1924), one of the best expositions, examines its defects and virtues, and attempts to discover the causes of its failures. Solomon Bennett Freehof, *Reform Jewish Practice and Its Rabbinic Background* (Cincinnati, 1944), with extensive bibliography, presents a justification, tying Reform to tradition as a development rather than a departure. Ferdinand Myron Isserman,

This Is Judaism (Chicago and New York, 1944) defines the principles of Reform in the light of the historic beginnings of Judaism, and notes its acceptance of modern Biblical criticism, the fundamentals of prophetic religion and their practical application to life, and the liberal attitude on social issues. Irving Frederick Reichert, *Judaism & the American Jew, Selected Sermons and Addresses* (San Francisco, 1953) considers the Jew's place in the modern world, and his own outlook on social problems and the meaning of religion in life, and appeals for Christian and Jewish fellowship to overcome modern problems.

e. Reconstruction. Mordecai Menahem Kaplan, ed., *The Jewish Reconstructionist Papers* (New York, 1936) protests against negative responses to the need of creating a Judaism loyal to tradition and to American life. Reconstruction tries to transcend divisions by creating a general desire to remain Jews, promoting a culture based upon religious conviction and social justice, not merely Zionism and charity. His *The Future of the American Jew* (New York, 1948) analyzes the difficult social and psychological position of the Jew in the United States. The result is a tendency to drift away from religious and cultural moorings. The situation calls for a radical reconstruction of Jewish life, based upon the premise that Judaism is a religious civilization. He assumes the willingness of Jews to live in two cultures, and the tolerance of democracy toward such a minority. In *Basic Values in Jewish Religion* (New York, 1957), with bibliographical references, Kaplan carries forward the argument that Jews should not assimilate and forsake their peculiar function, and that Judaism is a religious civilization which can live with Americanism.

Michael Alper, *Reconstructing Jewish Education* (New York, 1957), with bibliography in notes, promotes a Reconstructionst type of education to enable young American Jews to live in and justify both Judaism and the American heritage, inspired by the ideal of a revived Jewish culture in a democratic society. Ira Eisenstein, *Judaism under Freedom*, with

a Foreword by Mordecai M. Kaplan (New York, 1956), and bibliography of previous publications, includes essays inspired by the philosophy of Reconstructionism. He relates his own conversion from alienation and his adoption of a philosophy agreeable to both Judaism and American civilization, centered in the synagogue, with a revitalized education for life in a democratic and pluralistic culture. Israel Goldberg, *The Jews in America, a History* (Cleveland, 1954), with bibliographical note, refers to the rise of conservative tendencies, including the rebirth of mystical Chassidism, the return from rationalism to traditional beliefs, and the Reconstructionist belief in Judaism as *religious* culture.

5. ADAPTATION OF JUDAISM TO AMERICA. Samuel Dinin, *Judaism in a Changing Civilization* (New York, 1933), with references at the end of each chapter, emphasizes the adaptation of Judaism to American life, without complete assimilation. Oscar Isaiah Janowsky, *The American Jew, a Composite Portrait* (New York and London, 1942), with bibliography by chapters, in a very readable style reviews difficulties in the American environment, the outlook for Judaism, and the emergence of a new type of American Jewish community life in centers combining religious and secular activities. He explores problems involved in adjusting Judaism to the environment, and mentions the return toward traditionalism. Nathan Glazer, *American Judaism* (Chicago, 1957) cautiously estimates the revival of Judaism, from the viewpoint of a religious sociologist who appreciates the inner dilemma of American Jews. Milton Steinberg, *A Partisan Guide to the Jewish Problem* (Indianapolis and New York, 1945) analyzes anti-Semitism, suggests a strategy for opposing it, and proposes a positive program of Jewish adjustment to the American pattern. The emergence of new, American types of Judaism is reviewed in Mordecai Menahem Kaplan, *The Greater Judaism in the Making; a Study of the Modern Evolution of Judaism* (New York, 1960), with sections on various types of Jewish thought.

a. Conflicting Trends. Solomon Bennett Freehof, *The Synagogue and the Disintegrated Jew* (Philadelphia, 1938) considers the non-religious Jew who has lost touch with traditional culture, but is still "Jewish." Marvin Nathan, *The Attitude of the Jewish Student in the Colleges and Universities towards His Religion; a Social Study of Religious Changes* (Philadelphia, 1932), with a bibliography, thoroughly studies shifts in attitudes, generally away from traditionalism, and the nature and causes of change, with special attention to the conflict between religion and science; and compares the Orthodox, Conservative, and Reform groups. Emil G. Hirsch, *My Religion* (New York, 1925) is an interesting example of almost total adaptation to non-traditional influences.

In striking contrast is Milton Steinberg, *A Believing Jew; the Selected Writings of Milton Steinberg* (New York, 1951), by a Conservative, who deplores the loss of God-consciousness, worldliness, and conversion of churches into social research schools. He points out the inadequacy of merely secular "culturalism." His review of Judaism in the American scene considers the problem of the disintegrated Jew, and challenges Jews to be Jews. Ludwig Lewisohn, *The American Jew, Character and Destiny* (New York, 1950), by a Zionist, in chs. 6–7, "Faith and Form," pleads for centering Jewish life in essential religious tradition to avoid rootlessness, by the recreation of the *forms*, and belief in a transcendent God and his law. Jacob Bernard Agus, *Guideposts in Modern Judaism, An Analysis of Current Trends in Jewish Thought* (New York, 1954) considers the impact of American culture, and deplores adulation of the "Spirit of the Age" and Jewish nationalism. He reviews the trends in Reform, Conservatism, and Reconstruction, the ends and means of American Jewish life, and the unique character of the Jewish community as a creative minority, with a new synthesis of faith and reason and an "orchestration" of Christian and Jewish traditions. Horace M. Kallen, *"Of Them Which Say They Are Jews"*

and Other Essays on the Jewish Struggle for Survival, edited by Philip Pilch (New York, 1954) sees no incompatibility between Judaism and Americanism, and opposes "flight from Judaism." Knowledge of the religion is necessary to a wholesome community life, and the Jew should be part of the cultural pluralism of a democratic society.

Solomon Liptzin, *Generation of Decision; Jewish Rejuvenation in America* (New York, 1958) discusses the most recent developments of Jewry with relation to American life.

b. The Struggle for Community. Joseph Buchler, "The Struggle for Unity, Attempts at Union in American Jewish Life: 1654–1868," *American Jewish Archives,* Vol. 20, no. 1 (June 1949), pp. 21–46, reviews attempts to secure a united front to meet the challenge of life in a new country, general and local efforts, periodicals promoting the ideal, union plans, and educational projects. Oscar Handlin, *Adventure in Freedom: Three Hundred Years of Jewish Life in America* (New York, 1954), with bibliography and glossary, interprets the main lines of development and their effects upon the present and the future, notices the emergence of two communities representing the old and the new immigration, the reordering of communal life after 1920, and its sources of stability. Philip David Bookstaber, *Judaism and the American Mind in Theory and Practice* (New York, 1939), with bibliography, accepts the premise that Jews have a definite mission to fulfill by adjusting to American life, and creating an American Judaism. The Jew is part of a "community of peoples," in which each ethnic group gives to the others the best it possesses. The ideals of democracy have a spiritual kinship with Judaism, but assimilation usually leads to a loss of both Judaism and Christianity.

Ben M. Edidin, *Jewish Community Life in America* (New York, 1947), with selected bibliography, emphasizes the tendency toward organization of Jewish life in the "community center," for both religious and secular activities. Marshall Sklare, ed., *The Jews, Social Patterns of an Amer-*

ican Group (Glencoe, Ill., 1958) has bibliographical references in the notes, and with the essays on accommodation to America and the growth of a different type of Jewish life. Albert I. Gordon, *Jews in Transition* (Minneapolis, 1949) minutely examines the Jewish community of Minneapolis, and observes changes during acculturation, which have been slowest in religious thought and practice. Ritual and formality are not considered necessary for survival, but the revitalizing of holidays and some customs inspires increase in synagogue membership, and strengthening of institutional life by affirmative Jews. W. Gunther Plaut, *The Jews in Minnesota; the First Seventy-five Years* (New York, 1959), a detailed history founded upon extensive research, emphasizes organic growth of communities, divergent religious philosophies, and the bearing of sociological situations upon theology and ritual. A chapter on the church and the synagogue discusses associations with Christian neighbors, and anti-Semitism.

c. Religious Integration. Ralph Philip Boas, "The Problem of American Judaism," *Atlantic Monthly*, Vol. 119, no. 2 (Feb. 1917), pp. 145–152, states that the lack of severe persecution raises the threat of gradual loss of ethnic and religious consciousness, and of self-satisfied materialism and apathy. He suggests the necessity of a mystical and enthusiastic *religious* consciousness of a mission. The real hope lies in the small group striving to revive Judaism and to adapt it to American conditions. Samuel Marcus Gup, *Currents in Jewish Thought and Life in America in the Twentieth Century* (Wawasee, Ind., 1931) surveys both religious and secular tendencies. Jacob Bernard Agus, *Modern Philosophies of Judaism, a Study of Recent Jewish Philosophies of Religion* (New York, 1942) includes American contributions to Jewish thought, objectively discusses the "common core" of philosophy of religion, and emphasizes creative and positive forces needed in an era of contention. Abraham G. Duker, "On Religious Trends in American Jewish Life," *Yivo Annual of Jewish Social Science*, Vol. 4 (New York, 1949), pp. 51–63,

with bibliographical references, deals with practices rather than theology, the penetration of Christian customs into daily life, the decline of certain traditional observances, youthful ignorance of Jewishness, and the trend toward a middle-of-the-road Judaism. Eli Ginzberg, *Agenda for American Jews* (New York, 1950), with bibliography, in "Synagogue and School" analyzes the difficulties of organized religious life in the American environment, the decline of Orthodoxy, and the emergence of a not specifically religious communal life, along with growth of doubt and a longing of Jews to find themselves religiously. (See also Part Four, RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. V, B, *Jewish;* and sect. VI, F, *Religious Historical Novels.*)

F. Oriental Cults

In the Pacific Coast States and in large Eastern cities Oriental religions, philosophies, and cults probably are more familiar to Americans than some of the "fringe" Christian sects, or Eastern Orthodoxy. Interest and attraction derive partly from the appeal of the strange and exotic, partly from dissatisfaction in certain classes with traditional churches. Another cause of attention is ardent missionary zeal, which is in part a reaction from Christian missionary activity in Eastern lands, and a counter-force to the aggressiveness of Western culture.

The penetration has not been due entirely to missions. The way was prepared to some extent by the interest of Transcendentalists and other groups in Oriental thought. The greatest immediate stimulation arose from the influence of Hindu swamis in the first World Parliament of Religions at Chicago in 1893.

Since that time the Eastern "invasion" has penetrated through immigration of Asiatic peoples and aggressive propaganda. The missionary outreach has been accompanied by an increasing effort to assimilate the new religions and cults to American ways of thought. It is evidenced also by adoption

of certain features of Christianity, such as forms of worship, hymns, and religious education, and even the term "church." This interesting evolution is traced through the following sources regarding the introduction and development of Oriental religions and cults.

Arthur E. Christy, ed., *The Asian Legacy and American Life* (New York, 1945), with bibliography in notes, is a series of essays on long-established cultural exchanges. It explains the rise of Transcendentalism (partly of Oriental origin), and of Eastern cults after the World Parliament of Religions, in 1893.

Although the spread of Eastern religions usually is said to date from the Parliament, Americans had become interested long before that event. An interesting but far from historically accurate evidence is Lydia Maria Child's essay, "The Intermingling of Religions," *Atlantic Monthly*, Vol. 28, no. 63 (Oct. 1871), pp. 385–395, claiming Oriental influence upon early Christianity, and commenting favorably upon the Buddha's teachings. An earlier and more scholarly evidence is "The Sympathy of Religions," in *The Writings of Thomas Wentworth Higginson* (Cambridge, Mass., 1900, Vol. 7). This was written in 1855–1856 and was reprinted for the Parliament of Religions, and as a tract in the Chicago "Unity Mission" series. Its sympathetic remarks on Buddhism, Hinduism, and Islam probably helped to prepare the way for interest in Eastern religions.

A more profound understanding is indicated in Kurt F. Leidecker's *Josiah Royce and Indian Thought* (New York, 1931), with bibliographical footnotes. From early contact with Orientalism in California, Royce derived a life-long interest in Eastern religion and philosophy. His interest in Buddhism and Hindu monism influenced his idealistic philosophy, and his contacts stimulated widespread curiosity.

The interest attained universal public notice through the Parliament of Religions, which is described in John Henry Barrows, ed., *The World's Parliament of Religions* (Chicago,

1893, 2 vols.). Barrows' interest in Eastern ethnic religions appears in the article on him in the *Dictionary of American Biography*, Vol. 1, pp. 651–652, with a bibliography. He was chairman of the Committee on Religious Congresses for the Worlds Columbian Exposition, which promoted the Parliament of Religions, attended by representatives of Eastern faiths. The counter-influence of the East upon the West is discussed in Gaius Glenn Atkins, *Modern Religious Cults and Movements* (New York, 1923). Chapter 9, "The Return of the East upon the West, Theosophy and Kindred Cults," discusses the difficulties of adjusting them to Christian thought, and their partial Christianization in America.

Their great progress is portrayed by an excellent general review of Asiatic religious penetration of the United States in a series of essays, "The Mission to America," *Religion in Life*, Vol. 28, no. 3 (Summer, 1959), pp. 323–364. This includes: (1) Swami Akhilananda, "The Comprehensive Teachings of Vedanta," which reviews its meaning, the life and work of Sri Ramakrishna, and the American influence, especially among scientists. (2) Charles S. Braden, "Moslem Missions in America," surveys particularly the Ahmadiyya movement since 1921; and its appeal for peace, racial brotherhood, Negroes, temperance, and economic equality. (3) Stewart H. Holmes, "The Significance and Value of Zen to Me," illustrates its influence upon an Episcopalian layman, training himself in the Zen Buddhist technique of meditation. (4) Stillson Judah, "Indian Philosophy and the Metaphysical Movement in the United States," points out the growing power of the trend toward Indian *monism*, which has become indigenous. The author reviews American metaphysical movements since 1845, their interrelations, challenge to Christian theism, and influence. Protestantism, he claims, is losing the initiative to them, because of its alleged lack of emphasis upon religion as a physician to individual souls.

Florence E. Evermeyer, "How Some Orientals Worship in America," *Missionary Review of the World*, Vol. 57, no. 6

(June 1934), pp. 271–273, is a brief description of the chief Oriental religions. It refers particularly to Tenrikyo ("Japanese Christian Science") and Sikhism in California, the winning of American converts, translation of rituals into English, and the introduction of popular Japanese Nichirenism. William Carlson Smith, *Americans in Process, a Study of Our Citizens of Oriental Ancestry* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1937) in ch. 11 notices the lapse of American-born children from Eastern religions, and the rise of a syncretic religious attitude, partly Christian, partly Oriental.

1. BUDDHISM. Among the potent causes of American interest in Buddhism were the writings of Sir Edwin Arnold. Brooks Wright, *Interpreter of Buddhism to the West: Sir Edwin Arnold* (New York, 1957) in "Buddhism for the West" discusses his American influence, especially through *The Light of Asia,* and has references to the interest of Emerson, Thoreau, and James Freeman Clarke. Buddhism began to appeal to persons not satisfied with Christianity, and was popularized by such writings as Lydia Maria Child's "Resemblances between the Buddhist and the Roman Catholic Religions," *Atlantic Monthly,* Vol. 26, no. 158 (Dec. 1870), pp. 660–665, which emphasizes outward observances and ignores the profound differences in philosophical and theological outlook. More substantial but popular is James Freeman Clarke's *Ten Great Religions* (Boston, 1899), including the noted Unitarian minister's views of Buddhism.

By the 1890's Buddhist propaganda was arousing the attention reflected in Edward Conze, *Buddhism, Its Essence and Development* (New York, 1951), with a bibliography, a readable account for laymen, concerning its spread outside Asia, with references to early American students, particularly Colonel Henry S. Olcott. One of the most significant appreciations is Kenneth Scott Latourette's *Introducing Buddhism* (New York, 1956), with a brief reading list, an effort to acquaint Americans with the faith's history, and its meaning to contemporary followers, comparing and contrasting it with

Christianity. M. L. Gordon and Paul Carus, "Shall We Welcome Buddhist Missionaries to America?", *Open Court*, Vol. 14, no. 5 (May 1900), pp. 301–303, a typical debate, reveals the divided American opinions regarding the continuous "invasion" of Oriental religions. Gordon takes the negative side, Carus defends the Shinshu priests recently arrived in San Francisco, and sees permanent benefits in exchange of thought. Buddhism has not lacked later American defenses, such as: Paul Carus, *The Gospel of Buddha, According to Old Records* (Chicago, 1921), first published in 1894, shortly after the Parliament of Religions; Frederick Harold Smith, *The Buddhist Way of Life, Its Philosophy and History* (London and New York, 1951); and Clarence Herbert Hamilton, *Buddhism, a Religion of Infinite Compassion; Selections from Buddhist Literature* (New York, 1952), with a bibliography.

A lengthy and sympathetic study by a noted American religious psychologist is James Bissett Pratt's *The Pilgrimage of Buddhism and a Buddhist Pilgrimage* (New York, 1928), with bibliographical footnotes, an interpretation of Buddhist spirituality and observances in a clear and readable style, after residence in Far Eastern lands. Pratt does not suggest Buddhism as a religion for Americans, but this thought is frankly advanced by Agampodi Paulus DeZoysa, in *The Religion for Americans* (New York, 1929), with a bibliography, a collection of the Buddha's sayings, and a dedication to "the Friends of America." He suggests Buddhism as a religion of rationality, tolerance, and self-reliance for the independent American mind, and criticizes American Christianity as lacking these qualities. Dwight Goddard, *Followers of Buddha; an American Brotherhood* (Santa Barbara, Calif., 1934), including "Buddhist Books, by Dwight Goddard," is an explanation of the doctrines and practices of American Buddhism, by a leading convert. His most influential work is *A Buddhist Bible, Revised and Enlarged* (New York, 1952), compiled to win Americans dissatisfied with Christianity and longing (as he asserts) for a religion of rationality, discipline,

simplicity, sincerity, love for all life, restraint of desire, thoughtfulness, and cheerful industry.

The earliest Buddhist periodical in the United States apparently was the *Buddhist Ray* (Santa Cruz, Calif., Vols. 1–7, 1884–1894). The First Zen Institute of America (prior to 1943 the Buddhist Society of America) publishes the *Cat's Yawn* (New York, July 1940–). The Buddhist Institute of America issues the *New World Buddhist* (Chicago, Mar. 1949–).

The acclimatization of Buddhism is suggested by the Buddhist Brotherhood of America's *Book Containing an Order of Ceremonies for Use by Buddhists at Gatherings* (Los Angeles, 1943), issued in the hope of its use by all sects for English services. It contains also a history of Buddhism, an account of its sects, its spread to America, and the organization of the Brotherhood. The resemblance to a Christian service book is striking. The nature of a Buddhist sect in America is examined in William C. Rust, "The Shin Sect of Buddhism in America: Its Antecedents, Beliefs, and Present Condition" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1951, with illustrations; typewritten, and microfilm copy).

The spread of Americanized Buddhism appears in the following selection of news articles: "Buddhists Meet: 40th Annual Convention held at San Francisco, New Temple Started," *Literary Digest*, Vol. 123, no. 9 (Feb. 13, 1937), pp. 34–35, comments on the aggressive Buddhist Mission of North America, with both Oriental and Caucasian members, 40 missionaries, and 300 Jodo-Shinshu congregations, and mentions the activity of other sects, and projected new temples. "Relocated Buddhists," *Newsweek*, Vol. 23, no. 1 (Jan. 3, 1944), pp. 60–61, describes the removal of West Coast Buddhists to Utah during World War II, the flourishing missionary program, and the efforts to adjust the creed to modern life and to give the young a working philosophy. "Buddha on 94th Street," *Newsweek*, Vol. 29, no. 23 (June 9, 1947), pp. 82–83, describes a New York Buddhist "church," and estimates the

numerical strength and influence of American Buddhism. Mentioned also are the promotion of cultural and scholarly ties with Japan, and the effort to appear as a democratic religion without caste, rank, or class and color bars.

Progress is indicated by occasional stories of notable conversions. "Teiun," *Time,* Vol. 27, no. 19 (May 11, 1936), p. 32, describes the ordination of the first white Buddhist priestess in the United States, at a temple in Tacoma, Wash. "Buddhist from Brooklyn," *Life,* Vol. 28, no. 12 (Mar. 20, 1950), pp. 77–80, relates the conversion of a young American, his study in India and Ceylon to become a priest, and his plan to return to the United States as a missionary.

Another indication of steady progress is the erection of many temples, some of which are described in the following articles: Agnes Lockhart Hughes, "Buddhism in Seattle," *Outlook,* Vol. 116, no. 10 (July 4, 1917), p. 375, records the erection of a temple and describes active missionary work among Japanese immigrants. "Fresno Betsu-in," *Time,* Vol. 29, no. 12 (Mar. 22, 1937), pp. 34, 36, reports the ceremonial at the dedication of a temple in Fresno. "A Temple to Buddha Is Opened in New York City," *Newsweek,* Vol. 12, no. 8 (Aug. 22, 1938), pp. 24–25, reveals growing Buddhist strength (about 100 temples in California alone), and explains the tenets and propaganda of the Shin sect. "Buddhists Build Their Own Church," *Life,* Vol. 33, no. 19 (Nov. 10, 1952), pp. 97–98, 100, with illustrations, describes the erection of a building in San Francisco, by the typically American method of help donated by members and outsiders.

2. HINDUISM: VEDANTA. Wendell Marshall Thomas, *Hinduism Invades America* (New York, 1930), with numerous bibliographical references in the notes, is described by the author as "a study of the amazing adventure of an Eastern faith in a Western land . . . an account of the serious impact on American life of Hindu philosophy and culture, especially in the form of organized religion." Harry Emerson Fosdick's introduction calls this "the first thoroughgoing treatise setting

forth with patient research both the direct and the indirect invasion of Western thought by Hinduism." Charles Francis Potter, "The Hindu Invasion of America," *Modern Thinker and Author's Review,* Vol. 1, no. 1 (Mar. 1932), pp. 16–23, perceives Hindu syncretic influences in Emerson, Thoreau, New Thought, Christian Science, liberal Unitarianism, Ethical Culture, and Vedanta, and attributes their success to a revolt from sensational revivalism and anti-intellectualism.

The following are a few of the many magazine articles that review the American progress of Hinduism. Clifford M. Drury, "Hinduism in the United States," *Missionary Review,* Vol. 44, no. 4 (Apr. 1921), pp. 281–283, relates proselytizing efforts among Occidentals by missionary centers, and the partial Christianizing of the doctrines. *Vedanta* is the peculiar American form: an absolute, inclusive pantheism. Jules Bois, "The New Religions of America: v, Hindu Cults," *Forum,* Vol. 77, no. 3 (Mar. 1927), pp. 413–422, regards Oriental religious propaganda as a reaction to Christian missions, and reviews the history and activities of the Vedantist Ramakrishna mission. He deplores its pantheistic, monistic, "unpractical" and "dechristianizing" influence. Theodore Fieldbrave, "East Indians in the United States," *Missionary Review,* Vol. 57, no. 6 (June 1934), pp. 291–293, traces Hinduism since the beginning of immigration in 1905, in the introduction of Sikhism, the influence of swamis and yogis, the promotion of Vedantism, and the building of ashrams as centers of propaganda. "Oriental Solace: Hindu Ritual of Peace and Tolerance Gains U.S. Devotees," *Literary Digest,* Vol. 122, no. 20 (Nov. 14, 1936), p. 20, indicates the growth of Hindu cults (with 30,000 adherents) since the establishment of the first temple in San Francisco, 1900, and the introduction of Yogoda, 1925. Robert V. Hine, "Cult and Occult in California," *Pacific Spectator,* Vol. 8, no. 3 (Summer, 1954), pp. 196–203, comments on the success of Hindu cults among uprooted Californians, fulfilling Ralph Waldo Emerson's advice "to guide our steps to the East again, where the dawn is."

The way was prepared by Transcendentalism, Spiritualism, and New Thought, and Hindu cults have been surprisingly adaptable to the American mentality.

In spite of opposition and criticism, Hinduism has found sympathetic appreciation among Anglo-Americans. A learned missionary scholar, Hervey DeWitt Griswold, in *Insights into Modern Hinduism* (New York, 1934), with a bibliography, surveys general characteristics and various movements, especially Vedanta. He considers the thought of Vivekananda as eclectic and inclusive of Christian elements. One chapter discusses Hindu influence upon Christian leaders, including Americans. Kenneth W. Morgan, ed., *The Religion of the Hindus* (New York, 1953), with bibliography, glossary, and biographical notes, comprises seven essays by Hindus for Western readers on beliefs and practices. It is neither propagandist nor apologetic, and is regarded as the most comprehensive book on the subject in English. Malcolm Pitt, *Introducing Hinduism* (New York, 1954), with a popular reading list, is a brief general discussion of religious authority in Hinduism, the rise of the Ramakrishna Mission and Vedanta in America, common problems of Hinduism and Christianity, and the possibility of cooperation. The most brilliant contemporary Indian apologist in America is the philosopher, Swami Nikhilananda. His *Essence of Hinduism* (Boston, 1948) presents it as a faith for today, spiritualizing Western culture and emphasizing immortality. The theme is pursued further in his *Hinduism: Its Meaning for the Liberation of the Spirit* (New York, 1958).

George Stephen Goodspeed, *The World's First Parliament of Religions* (Chicago, 1895) describes the brilliant assembly in 1893, at which Vedanta first won a friendly American hearing through Sri Ramakrishna's pupil, the Swami Vivekananda. His impression may be judged by his *The Yogas and Other Works, Including the Chicago Addresses . . . Chosen and with a Biography by Swami Nikhilananda* (New York, 1953, rev. ed.). This contains letters to American disciples, and

relates the establishment of the movement in America. The deep impression of his appearances was strengthened by V. R. Gandhi's *India's Message to America* (New York, 1894).

The rise of Vedanta was made easier by the previous interest of Americans in Eastern philosophy. A detailed study of the Hindu influence upon Emerson, Thoreau, Whitman, and Mary Baker Eddy is in Romain Rolland's *Prophets of the New India* (New York, 1930), book II, ch. 4; also in Wendell Thomas, *Hinduism Invades America*, sect. 8. A more heavily documented study is Swami Paramananda, *Emerson and Vedanta* (Boston, 1918, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.). A new chapter, "Emerson and Hindu Classics," notes striking similarities between his thought and sacred books of the East, and claims him as an inspired interpreter of Vedic ideals to the West. Arthur E. Christy, "Emerson's Debt to the Orient," *The Monist*, Vol. 38, no. 1 (Jan. 1928), pp. 38–64, stresses Eastern influence upon the "greatest spokesman of American monists," explores the sources of his philosophy, and notices his synthesis of Eastern and Western thought. Guido Ferrando, "Emerson and the East," in *Vedanta for Modern Man*, edited by Christopher Isherwood (New York, 1951) points to Emerson's familiarity with all sacred books of the East that had been translated, and their pervasive effect upon him, confirming his own religious intuitions. "Thoreau on Vedanta," *Vedanta Monthly Bulletin*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (July 1905), pp. 59–60, contains a passage from an essay by Thoreau (possessor of a library of Eastern philosophical and religious works) published in the *Atlantic Monthly*, expressing admiration of Vedanta.

Interest in Vivekananda has been maintained by a continual stream of biographies. One of the most influential is Romain Rolland's *The Life of Vivekananda and the Universal Gospel*, translated from the original French by E. F. Malcolm-Smith (Almora, India, 1931), Vol. 2 of *Life and Gospel of Vivekananda*. This mentions early American interest in Oriental thought, Vivekananda's appreciation of Whitman's

Leaves of Grass, and his preaching throughout the United States. Other important appreciations are: Swami Abhedananda, *Swami Vivekananda and His Work in America* (Almora, India, 1937); Sister Nivedita [Margaret E. Noble], *The Master As I Saw Him—An Intimate Study of Swami Vivekananda* (Calcutta, 1939, 5th ed.); and Swami Nikhilananda, *Vivekananda, A Biography* (New York, 1953), an earnest, scholarly, and readable life, stressing Vivekananda's role as Vedanta's American founder. After the death of Vivekananda, a succession of swamis and American disciples propagated Vedantic thought and adjusted it to the native religious climate. One of the most popular missionaries is appreciated in Sister Devamata's *Swami Paramananda and His Work* (La Crescenta, Calif., 1926), with an account of his American travels and of his founding of the Ananda Ashrama in La Crescenta.

The Vedantic impact upon the United States is described by Swami Satprakashananda in "Ramakrishna Movement," in Vergilius Ferm, ed., *Religion in the Twentieth Century* (New York, 1948), pp. 395–413, with a bibliography. Anna Josephine Ingersoll, "The Swamis in America," *Arena,* Vol. 22, no. 4 (Oct. 1899), pp. 482–488, favorably reviews the Vedantic philosophy of Vivekananda, its growth, schools, and influence, especially through the Greenacre School of Comparative Religion. Girindra Mukerji, "The Hindu in America," *Overland Monthly,* new ser., Vol. 51, no. 4 (Apr. 1908), pp. 303–308, reviews Hindu missions since 1893, the founding and spread of Vedantism, and the establishment of intellectual centers, temples, and the influential magazine, *Vedanta. With the Swamis in America,* by "A Western Disciple" (Almora, India, 1938) reviews the pioneer Vedantic mission, and emphasizes the undermining of orthodox religion, and the acceptance of Vedanta as a Christianized version of Hindu thought and a spiritual leaven embracing the best in Western culture. Swami Jagadiswaranda, *Hinduism Outside India* (Rajkot, India, 1945) has a chapter on "Hindu-

ism in the Modern West," including its spread in America, the founding of Vedanta centers, and the demand for Vedantic literature among earnestly seeking Americans.

Recent literature reveals Americanizing of the missionary effort, and a tendency to identify Vedanta with early American writers. The Vedanta Society's *Hinduism Comes to America* (Chicago, 1933) lists the swamis who have taught in the United States, the centers and their leaders, sketches the progress of the movement, and asserts that the way was prepared by Emerson, Thoreau, Whitman, and Mary Baker Eddy. Bryan Sewall Stoffer, *The Modernizing of the Vedanta* (Chicago, 1934) reveals changes reflecting the thought of modern India, and reviews the modern trend toward an anti-materialist, individualistic religious philosophy, which advocates social service as a necessary practical application.

3. THEOSOPHY. A very extensive bibliography of the Theosophist movement is in Hartmann's *Who's Who in Occult, Psychic and Spiritual Realms* (Jamaica, N.Y., 1927, 2nd ed.). An excellent list on Theosophy in the United States is in Dittakavi S. Sarma, *Studies in the Renaissance of Hinduism in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries* (Benares, 1944), including works by and about Henry S. Olcott, Helena P. Blavatsky, and Annie Besant. The best American bibliography, up to its date, was issued as *The Theosophical Society in America, the National Library Lending Division* (Wheaton, Ill., 1943), including works on Theosophy, Hinduism, Buddhism, Sikhism, Islam, and Baha'i, and a wide range of other subjects.

Although Theosophy had long been represented in the United States by a society, it first attracted popular attention by its participation in the World Parliament of Religions. An account was issued by the Theosophical Society, as *The Theosophical Congress Held by the Theosophical Society at the Parliament of Religions, World's Fair of 1893, at Chicago, Ill.* . . . (New York, 1893). Charles James Ryan, *H. P. Blavatsky and the Theosophical Movement, A*

Brief Historical Sketch (Point Loma, Calif., 1937) presents the life and influence of the highly controversial leader, from the viewpoint of a Theosophist. Gertrude Marvin Williams, *Priestess of the Occult* (New York, 1946) is a popular account, with many references to her relations with America, and a bibliography by and about her and her philosophy, and of philosophical magazines established in her lifetime. Many other Theosophist personalities appear, including Americans.

United Lodge of Theosophists, New York, *The Theosophical Movement, 1875–1925, A History and a Survey* (New York, 1925) is comprehensive, including controversies and divisions, from the founding of the original society, with much attention to Madame Blavatsky, Annie Besant, Henry S. Olcott, and William Q. Judge. This is continued by *The Theosophical Movement, 1875–1950* (Los Angeles, 1951), which summarizes earlier events and has bibliography in the "Notes." Henry Steel Olcott, *Old Diary Leaves, the True Story of the Theosophical Society* (New York and London, 1895) comprises recollections of the American convert who became the founder and president of the society. He presents a favorable picture of Madame Blavatsky, and an "inside" story of the movement, as a defense against detractors.

An excellent exposition of teaching, issued by the Theosophical Society, Covina, Calif., is *The Theosophical Society, Its Nature and Objectives* (Point Loma, Calif., 1940, 2nd ed.), which defines Theosophy as a spiritual movement, promoting the ideals of brotherhood and service as the keynotes of true civilization. This probably is the the best account of modern American Theosophy. Charles James Ryan's *What Is Theosophy? A General View for Inquirers* (Covina, Calif., 1944, 4th ed.) is one of the best expositions, emphasizing the unity of religion, science, and philosophy, and the relation of Theosophy to science, mythology, religion, and the Bible. Jules Bois, "The Worship of Human Gods," is no. 11 in "The New Religions of America," *Forum*, Vol. 73, no. 5 (May

1925), pp. 649–660. He ascribes the spread of Theosophy to religious unbelief due to scientific skepticism, and sees beneficial effects in a quickening of interest in philosophy, science, and Eastern literature. More or less objective studies and criticisms are: A. P. Warrington, "Theosophy," in Charles S. Braden, ed., *Varieties of American Religion;* "Theosophy" in his *These Also Believe; A Study of Modern American Cults and Minority Religious Movements* (New York, 1949), ch. 6, with selected bibliography; Jan K. Van Baalen, *The Chaos of Cults* (1947, 6th ed.); Mrs. Lee R. Steiner, *Where Do People Take their Troubles?* (Boston, 1945), ch. 7; and Horton Davies, *Christian Deviations; Essays in Defence of the Christian Faith* (New York, 1954).

Recent Theosophical literature emphasizes the universality of the philosophy and often attempts to relate it to the Bible and American Christianity. One of the early evidences of the trend is Ernest Wood, *The New Theosophy* (Chicago, 1929). Henry T. Edge's *Theosophy and Christianity* (Point Loma, Calif., 1941) insists that Theosophy is the essential, underlying truth of all religions, not hostile to Christianity, but not acknowledging it as the final religion. Typically American is an ecumenical movement, which has been expressed by F. Pierce Spinks in *Theosophists: Reunite!* (Boston, 1958), a plea for unity among the various societies, and an obvious effort to arrest decay of the movement.

4. MOHAMMEDANS. An outline history of Islam in the United States is by Nadim al-Maqdissi: "The Muslims of America, 80,000 Muslims and 12 Mosques in the United States and Canada," *Islamic Review,* Vol. 43, no. 6 (June 1955), pp. 28–31. This mentions immigration before 1884, and describes the missionary work of the first American convert [Muhammad] Alexander Russell Webb (1846–1916). The article reviews Moslem immigration, settlements, missions among Negroes, establishment of societies and of the Islamic Missionary Society in Brooklyn, erection of mosques, the Islamic Center in Washington, D.C., formation of local

councils for public relations, social work and missions, the beginning of national conventions in 1952, and the formation (1954) of a Federation of the Islamic Associations in the United States and Canada. A brief summary by the same author appears in *Christian Century*, Vol. 76, no. 34 (Aug. 26, 1959), pp. 969–971, as "The Moslems of America."

[Muhammad] Alexander Russell Webb, *Islam in America, A Brief Statement of Mohammedanism and an Outline of the American Islamic Propaganda* (New York, 1893) contains his biography, the reasons for his conversion, an explanation of Islam, and an account of its American mission, organizations, and publications. "Moslem Mission to America," *Missionary Review*, Vol. 44, no. 4 (Apr. 1921), pp. 265–266, describes a visit of the Mufti Mohammed Sadiq of India to convert Americans to the Mirza sect, Moslem immigrants and places of worship, and the friendly attitude of American Unitarians toward Islam. "Moslem Missionaries in America," *Literary Digest*, Vol. 90, no. 3 (July 17, 1926), p. 28, states that the "invasion" is extensive, with missionaries seeking converts and keeping immigrants loyal. Emphasized are the Ahmadiyya movement, work among Negroes, racial equality, American converts to Bahá'ism and Suffism, and Islamic libraries and reading rooms.

"Moslems Praying for World Unity," *Literary Digest*, Vol. 122, no. 17 (Oct. 24, 1936), p. 23, briefly reviews Islam in ten American cities, with special reference to the missionary, Samuel Refalowich of Brooklyn, N.Y., and to the growth of Islam among Negroes. Pierre Crabites, "American Negro Mohammedans," *Muslim World*, Vol. 23, no. 3 (July 1933), pp. 272–284, is a critical account of the conversion of American Negroes to Islam, and of their connection with Egypt. A glance at religious practices is in a news article, "Ramadan," *Time*, Vol. 30, no. 20 (Nov. 15, 1937), p. 46, on observance of a month of fasting and prayer at the Polish Tartar mosque in Brooklyn. This refers also to a convention of Moslems from all parts of the United States, representing various na-

tional groups. G. H. Bosquet, "Moslem Religious Influences in the United States," *Muslim World,* Vol. 25, no. 1 (Jan. 1935), pp. 40–44, considers traditional Islam and the Sunni and Shi'a immigrants, estimates the number of Moslems, and describes Bahá'i and Ahmadiyya, and the Moorish Scientific Movement. He lists the chief Moslem centers, mosques, and periodicals, and refers to the possibility of growth by appeal to racial equality.

The *Islamic Review* (Woking, Eng., Feb. 1913– , with varying titles) has articles on American Islam. Its section "What Our Readers Say" publishes letters from American Moslems, with remarks on local activities and progress. Several American periodicals have information on missionary progress. The first was the *Moslem World, Devoted to the Interests of the American Islamic Propaganda* (New York), established in 1893 and published for many years by the convert, Alexander Russell Webb. *Muslim World* (New York, London, 1911–1935) was issued as the *Moslem World,* 1911–Oct. 1947. *Muslim Sunrise* (Chicago, July 1921– , suspended May 1924–June 1930) was issued in 1921–1949 as *Moslem Sunrise.*

The obstacles to American missions are surveyed by M. A. A'Zam in "America and Islam," *Islamic Review,* Vol. 41, no. 7 (July 1953), pp. 34–35. This mentions the failure to present the Islamic viewpoint successfully at the Parliament of Religions in 1893, the general ignorance of Islam, and the inadequacy of literature in English. The author's mission is explained in "My Presentation of Islam to America," *ibid.,* Vol. 38, no. 4 (Apr. 1950), pp. 9–11. He discusses principles and practices, and the attitude toward women and democracy. This popular lecture was intended to minimize opposition between Islam and Christianity, and to present the former in a modernized version.

The beginning of more vigorous organized propaganda was announced by Hasan Hosny's article, "First Mosque and Islamic Institute in America," *Islamic Review,* Vol. 40, no. 6

(June 1952), pp. 15–16, on the laying of the cornerstone of the Islamic Center, Washington, D.C., to promote understanding of Islamic culture, and relations of Islam to democracy. The culmination of Islamic activity is described at length in "The Opening of the Islamic Centre and the Mosque at Washington, The United States of America," *ibid.*, Vol. 45, no. 10 (Oct. 1957), pp. 29–32. This quotes the utterances of Muslim ambassadors, describes the erection of the building, and gives in full the address of President Dwight D. Eisenhower.

Philip K. Hitti, "America and the Arab Heritage," in N. A. Faris, ed., *The Arab Heritage* (Princeton, N.J., 1946) estimates the importance of the Moslem Arab world to America, and the rise of Islamic settlement and Islamic studies in the United States.

5. BAHÁ'ISM. The tenets of Bahá'ism are expounded in a selection from writings, especially those of Bahá'u'lláh, in *Universal Principles of the Bahai Movement: Social, Economic, Governmental* (Washington, D.C., 1912). Also enlightening is Horace Holley, *Bahai, the Spirit of the Age* (New York, 1921), with a reading list.

The most comprehensive account of the American movement has been published by the National Spiritual Assembly of the Bahá'is of the United States and Canada: *The Bahá'i Centenary, 1844–1944; a Record of America's Response to Bahá-'u'-lláh's Call to the Realization of the Oneness of Mankind, to Commemorate the One Hundredth Anniversary of the Baha'i Faith* (Wilmette, Ill., 1944). This has a list of Bahá'i literature and "References to the Bahá'i faith in books and pamphlets." A much briefer survey, issued by the Bahá'i Publishing Committee, is *The Bahá'i Community; a Summary of Its Foundation and Organization* (Wilmette, Ill., 1947).

E. Denison Ross, "Babism," *North American Review*, Vol. 172, no. 533 (Apr. 1901), pp. 606–622, is an exposition of Bahá'i and of its propaganda in America since 1893, mentioning about twenty lecture centers and 3,000 adherents.

Gaius Glenn Atkins, in *Modern Religious Cults and Movements* (New York and Chicago, 1923) sketches the history and principles of Bahá'ism, and its penetration of America. Marcus L. Bach presents an impartial study in ch. 7 of *They Have Found a Faith* (Indianapolis and New York, 1946), which sketches the origin and history of the Bahá'i religion in Persia and the Near East, its introduction into America at the World Congress of Religions in 1893, the visit of Abdul-Bahá to America in 1912, the erection of the temple at Wilmette, Ill., and efforts to unite all faiths.

In proportion to its size, the Bahá'i faith has inspired an unusual number of expounders, within and outside its circle of believers. M. A. Soharb, a believer, contributed "The Bahá'i Cause" to Vergilius Ferm, ed., *Religion in the Twentieth Century* (New York, 1948), with a bibliography. J. E. Esslemont's *Baha-'u'lláh and the New Era* (Wilmette, Ill., 1953, rev. ed.) is a general account of aspects of the faith, particularly religious unity, peace, and relations of religion and science. Perhaps the best recent exposition is by the noted leader, Shoghi Effendi, *The World Order of Bahá'u'lláh* (Wilmette, Ill., 1955). His life and teachings are reviewed by the authority on cults, Marcus L. Bach, in his *Shoghi Effendi* (New York, 1958). George Townshend's *Christ and Bahá'u'lláh* (London, 1957) emphasizes the syncretism of the Bahá'i movement, and its effort to comprehend other religious elements, a characteristic feature of the appeal of Eastern religions in America.

Criticisms of the Bahá'i movement often have been inspired by this appeal, which has caused irritation among orthodox Christians. John Richards, *The Religion of the Bahá'is* (London and New York, 1932) has a bibliography and expresses an Anglican viewpoint. William McElwee Miller, *Bahá'ism; Its Origin, History, and Teachings* (New York and Chicago, 1931), by a missionary in Persia, considers its teachings as incompatible with Christianity.

In spite of opposition and hostile criticism, the movement

has made considerable progress in America. An important element in success is the influence of periodicals. The National Spiritual Assembly of the Bahá'ís for many years has published *The Baha'i World*, 1925/26– , a biennial international record of the group's activities. Overlapping this is the *Baha'i Magazine* (Chicago and Washington, Mar. 21, 1910–Mar. 1935, under varying titles, which united with *World Unity* to form *World Order* (New York, Apr. 1935–). One should consult also *Bahá'i Youth; an International Bulletin* (New York, 1935–Feb. 1942), published by the National Spiritual Assembly of the Bahá'ís.