UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY

OU_170427

UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY

Agents for the Sale of Books published by the Superintendent of Government Printing, India, Calcutta.

IN EUROPE.

Constable & Co., 10, Orange Street, Leicester Square, London, W.C.

Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 68-74, Carter Lane, E.C., and 25, Museum Street, London, W.C.

Bernard Quaritch, 11, Grafton Street, New Bond Street, London, W.

P. S. King & Sons, 2 & 4, Great Smith Street, Westminster, London, S.W.

H. S. King & Co., 65, Cornhill, E.C., and 9, Pall Mall, London, W.

Grindlay & Co., 54, Parliament Street, London, S.W.

Luzac & Co., 46, Great Russell Street, London, W.C.

W. Thacker & Co., 2, Creed Lane, London, E.C.

T. Fisher Unwin, Ltd., 1, Adelphi Terrace, London, W.C.

Wm. Wesley & Son, 28, Essex St., Strand, London.

B. H. Blackwell, 50 & 51, Broad Street, Oxford.

Deighton Bell & Co., Ltd., Cambridge.

Oliver and Boyd, Tweeddale Court, Edinburgh.

E. Ponsonby, Ltd., 116, Grafton Street, Dublin.

Ernest Leroux, 28, Rue Bonaparte, Paris.

Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague, Holland.

IN INDIA AND CEYLON.

Thacker, Spink & Co., Calcutta and Simla.

Newman & Co., Calcutta.

R. Cambray & Co., Calcutta.

S. K. Lahiri & Co., Calcutta.

B. Banerjee & Co., Calcutta.

The Indian School Supply Depôt, 309, Bow Bazar Street, Calcutta, and 226, Nawabpur, Dacca.

Butterworth & Co. (India), Ltd., Calcutta.

Rai M. C. Sarcar Bahadur & Sons, 9-2-A, Harrison Road, Calcutta.

The Weldon Library, 57, Park Street, West, Calcutta.

Standard Literature Company, Limited, Calcutta.

Lal Chand & Sons, Calcutta.

Higginbotham & Co., Madras.

V. Kalyanarama Iyer & Co., Madras.

G. A. Natesan & Co., Madras

S. Murthy & Co., Madras.

Thompson & Co., Madras.

Temple & Co., Madras.

P. R. Rama Iyer & Co., Madras.

Vas & Co., Madras.

E. M. Gopalakrishna Kone, Madura.

Thacker & Co., Ltd., Bombay.

A. J. Combridge & Co., Bombay.

D. B. Taraporevala, Sons & Co., Bombay.

Mrs. Radhabai Atmaram Sagoon, Bombay.

Sunder Pandurang, Bombay.

Gopal Narayan & Co., Bombay.

Ram Chandra Govind & Son, Kalbadevi, Bombay.

The Standard Bookstall, Karachi.

Mangaldas Harkisandas, Surat

A. H. Wheeler & Co., Allahabad, Calcutta and Bombay.

N. B. Mathur, Supt., Nazir Kanun Hind Press, Allahabad.

Rai Sahib M. Gulab Singh & Sons, Mufid-i-Am Press, Lahore and Allahabad.

Rama Krishna & Sons, Lahore.

Supt., American Baptist Mission Press, Rangoon.

Manager, the 'Hitavada,' Nagpur.

S. C. Talukdar, Proprietor, Students & Co., Cooch Behar.

A. M. & J. Ferguson, Ceylon.

Manager, Educational Book Depôts, Nagpur and Jubbulpore.*

Manager of the Imperial Book Depôt, 63, Chandney Chauk Street, Delhi.*

Manager, 'The Agra Medical Hall and Co-operative Association, Ltd.' (Successors to A. John & Co., Agra.)*

Supt., Basel Mission Book and Tract Depository, Mangalore.*

P. Varadachary & Co., Madras.*

H. Liddell, Printer, etc., 7, South Road, Allahabad.*

Ram Dayal Agarwala, 184, Katra, Allahabad.*

D. C. Anand & Sons, Peshawar.*

Manager, Newal Kishore Press, Lucknow.*

* Agents for the sale of Legislative Department publications only.

Calcutta University Commission, 1917-19

REPORT

Volume I

PART I

Analysis of Present Conditions

CHAPTERS I—XIII



CALCUTTA
SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA
1919

CONTENTS.

REPORT.

PART I.—ANALYSIS OF PRESENT CONDITIONS.

VOLUME I.

		PAGE.
ANALYSES OF CHAPTERS II—XIII	. . . . .	(ix)
CLASSIFIED LIST OF COLLEGES AND INSTITUTIONS BELONGING TO OR AFFILIATED TO THE CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY	. . . . .	(xxiv)
CHAPTER I.—REFERENCE AND PROCEDURE OF THE COMMISSION	.	1
,, II.—PRELIMINARY OBSERVATIONS	. . . . .	19
,, III.—THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE WESTERN SYSTEM OF EDUCATION IN BENGAL	. . . . .	31
,, IV.—GOVERNMENT AND PRIVATE EFFORT IN EDUCATION IN INDIA	. . . . .	79
,, V.—THE STUDENT IN BENGAL	. . . .	105
,, VI.—THE MUSALMANS AND THEIR EDUCATIONAL NEEDS	. .	143
,, VII.—THE EDUCATION OF BACKWARD CLASSES	. . .	188
,, VIII.—THE HIGH SCHOOLS AS THE FOUNDATIONS OF THE UNIVERSITY	. . . . .	195
,, IX.—THE UNIVERSITY MATRICULATION EXAMINATION. ITS REQUIREMENTS, STANDARD AND INFLUENCE UPON THE SCHOOLS	. . . . .	247
,, X.—THE RECOGNITION OF SCHOOLS BY THE UNIVERSITY	.	295
,, XI.—THE EDUCATION OF EUROPEANS AND ANGLO-INDIANS	318	
,, XII.—THE INTERMEDIATE CLASSES AND THE SECOND-GRADE COLLEGES	. . . . .	327
,, XIII.—THE 'ARTS COLLEGES': THEIR UNDERGRADUATE WORK	355	

VOLUME II.

Analyses of Chapters XIV—XX.

CHAPTER XIV.—The Education of Girls and Women.

,, XV.—Post-Graduate Teaching and Research.

,, XVI.—Oriental Studies.

,, XVII.—The Examination System.

,, XVIII.—The Medium of Instruction and Examination; and the Teaching of English and the Mother Tongue.

,, XIX.—Conditions of Student Life.

,, XX.—The Site of the University.

VOLUME III.

Analyses of Chapters XXI—XXIX.

CHAPTER XXI.—The Training of Teachers.
" XXII.—Legal Education.
" XXIII.—Medical Education.
" XXIV.—Engineering and Mining Education.
" XXV.—Agricultural Education.
" XXVI.—Training in Technology (other than Engineering, Mining, Architecture and Agriculture) and in Commerce.
" XXVII.—Governance and Administration of the University of Calcutta.
" XXVIII.—The Relations between Government and the University.
" XXIX.—Inter-University Relations.

PART II.—RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE COMMISSION.

VOLUME IV.

Analyses of Chapters XXX—XXXIX.

CHAPTER XXX.—The Need for a New Departure.
" XXXI.—Reform of Secondary Education. Proposed New Authority.
" XXXII.—The Intermediate Colleges.
" XXXIII.—The University of Dacca.
" XXXIV.—A Teaching University in Calcutta.
" XXXV.—The Mufassal Colleges.
" XXXVI.—The Education of Women.
" XXXVII.—The Constitution of the University of Calcutta.
" XXXVIII.—The Site of the University.
" XXXIX.—Improved Conditions of Student Life.

VOLUME V.

Analyses of Chapters XL—LI.

CHAPTER XL.—Examination Reform.
" XLI.—The Medium of Instruction and Examination. The Teaching of English.
" XLII.—Oriental Studies.
" XLIII.—The Training of Teachers.
" XLIV.—Medical Education.
" XLV.—Legal Education.
" XLVI.—Engineering, Mining and Architectural Education.
" XLVII.—Agricultural Education.
" XLVIII.—Training in Technology (other than Engineering, Mining, Architecture and Agriculture) and in Commerce.
" XLIX.—The Special Educational Needs of Musalmans.
" L.—Relations of Government with the Universities.
" LI.—Financial Aspects of our Proposals.
" LII.—Summary of Recommendations.

Notes—

A. Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad and Dr. J. W. Gregory.
B. Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad.
C. Dr. J. W. Gregory.

APPENDICES.

VOLUME VI.

Appendices to the Report.

I.—Appendix to Chapter I.
Memorandum submitted by the Commission to the Subjects Committee (appointed in connexion with the Reforms).

II.—Appendix to Chapter III.
Macaulay's Minute on Education, 1835.

III.—Appendix to Chapter III.
Despatch from the Court of Directors of the East India Company to the Governor-General of India in Council, No. 49, dated the 19th July 1854.

IV.—Appendix to Chapter VI.
Memorandum on the Mohsin Fund by Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad.

V.—Appendix to Chapter IX.
Note on the age of candidates at the matriculation examination of 1918 by Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad.

VI.—Appendix to Chapter XI.
Memorandum on the Education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians by Mr. W. W. Hornell.

VII.—Appendix to Chapter XIV.
Scheme for a proposed School for Hindu Girls in *zananas*.

VIII.—Appendix to Chapter XV.
List of University Teachers in Post-Graduate Classes, 1918-19—
A. In Arts.
B. In Science.

IX.—Appendix to Chapter XV.
University College of Science.
A. Scheme sanctioned by the Senate on the 15th February 1919 for the Governing Body.
B. Description of the grounds and buildings.

X.—Appendix to Chapter XVI.
Calcutta University Regulations for the M. A. degree in Indian Vernaculars.

XI.—Appendix to Chapter XVI.
Scheme for the reorganisation and reform of Madrassahs in the Presidency of Bengal.
A. Time table for the Junior Department.
B. Detailed course of studies for Classes VII to X.

XII.—Appendix to Chapter XVII.
Excerpts from Calcutta University Regulations relating to Examinations.

XIII.—Appendix to Chapter XVII.
A. Memorandum on Frequency Curves of the Marks of a number of sub-examiners by Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad and P. J. Hartog.
B. On the Limits of Error in the Marking of Examination Papers and Certain Practical Consequences arising therefrom by Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad.

VOLUME VI—*contd.*

XIV.—Appendix to Chapter XVIII.
Summary of the Report of a Conference held at Simla in August 1917 on the Medium of Instruction in Secondary Schools.

XV.—Appendix to Chapter XIX.
Memorandum on the Organisation of Hostels by Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad.

XVI.—Appendix to Chapter XXIII.
Extracts from the Rules and Regulations of the Medical College of Bengal, Calcutta.

XVII.—Appendix to Chapter XXIII.
Memorandum on a Department of Public Health by Dr. C. A. Bentley, Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of Bengal.

XVIII.—Appendix to Chapter XXIV.
Resolutions passed at recent conferences on Agricultural Education.
A. Conference held at Pusa on 4th and 5th February 1916.
B. Conference held at Simla on the 18th and 19th June 1917.
C. Conference forming part of the tenth Meeting of the Board of Agriculture in India, held at Poona from the 10th to 15th December 1917.

XIX.—Appendix to Chapter XXIV.
Memorandum by Mr. L. Birley, Secretary to the Government of Bengal, Revenue Department, Calcutta.

XX.—Appendix to Chapter XXIV.
Extract from the Proceedings of the Conference on Veterinary Education at a Meeting of the Board of Agriculture in India held at Poona, December 1917.

XXI.—Appendix to Chapter XL.
University Diploma in Spoken English.
A. Draft Regulations of the Calcutta University.
B. Memorandum submitted by the Commission on these Regulations.

XXII.—Appendix to Chapter XLVI.
Report on the health conditions of the site of the Civil Engineering College, Sibpur, by Dr. C. A. Bentley, Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of Bengal.

XXIII.—Appendix to Chapter XLVII.
Memorandum by Mr. S. Milligan, Director of Agriculture, Bengal.

XXIV.—Appendix to Chapter XLVII.
Scheme of the University of London for the Degree in Estate Management.

XXV.—Appendix to Chapter LI (and Chapter XXXII).
Financial estimate of the Intermediate Colleges.

XXVI.—Appendix to Chapter LI (and Chapter XXXIX).
Financial estimate for Hostel Accommodation.

XXVII.—Appendix to Chapter LI.
Financial Estimate for the proposed reconstruction of Calcutta University.

XXVIII.—Appendix to Chapter LI (and Chapter XXXIII).
Financial estimates for the recurring expenditure on the proposed University of Dacca with a summary list of buildings required.

VOLUME VI—*concld.*

XXIX.—Percentage of Passes at University Examinations.
XXX.—Letters inviting representatives of private colleges to confer with the Commission.
A. Representatives of Missionary Bodies.
B. Representatives of Private Colleges in the Mufassal.
C. Representatives of Private Colleges in Calcutta.
XXXI.—List of witnesses.
XXXII.—List of institutions and places visited by the Commission.
XXXIII.—List of persons consulted by the Commission.
XXXIV.—Notes on the Statistical Statements printed in Volume XIII.

VOLUME VII.

General Memoranda and Oral Evidence.
I. Agricultural Education.
II. Commercial and Industrial Education.
III. Engineering and Architecture.
IV. Europeans and Anglo-Indians, University Education of.
V. Examinations and Appointment of Examiners.
VI. Government and Education.
VII. Health of Students.
VIII. Madrassahs.
IX. Medicine.
X. Musalmans, Special Needs of.
XI. Post-Graduate Instruction.
XII. Presidency College, Calcutta, Development of.
XIII. Religious and Social Conditions, Effects of.
XIV. Secondary Schools, Teaching and Examination of.
XV. Serampore College, Serampore, Development of.
XVI. Special Departments of Study.
XVII. Teachers, Training of.
XVIII. Teaching, Courses and Methods of.
XIX. Trust Deeds of Colleges.
XX. University, Organisation and Administration of.
XXI. University Policy, Changes in.

VOLUME VIII.

Classified Replies to the Commissioners' Questions 1—3.
1. Defects of the existing system of university education.
2. Essentials of the best kind of university training.
3. Resources of Calcutta as a seat of learning.

VOLUME IX.

Classified Replies to the Commissioners' Questions 4—7.
4. Dacca and mufassal universities.
5. Relation between the University and colleges.
6. University and professional requirements.
7. University courses.

VOLUME X.

Classified Replies to the Commissioners' Questions 8—12.

8. Conditions of admission to the University.
9. Use and abuse of examinations.
10. Improvements in university examinations.
11. Medium of instruction.
12. Scientific study of the vernaculars.

VOLUME XI.

Classified Replies to the Commissioners' Questions 13—16.

13. Subjects of study omitted in curricula.
14. Government and the University.
15. University examinations and public service.
16. Research in the University.

VOLUME XII.

Classified Replies to the Commissioners' Questions 17—23.

17. Conditions of student life in Bengal.
18. Health and physical development of students.
19. Organisation of residence.
20. Financial resources for higher education.
21. Removal of the University to the suburbs.
22. Special communal interests.
23. Women's education.

VOLUME XIII.

Statistics relating to Colleges.

STATEMENT I, (A) AND (B).—Number of students in the session 1917-18.
„ II.—Number of students in the session 1917-18, who have failed and are taking the course for a second or a later year.
„ III.—Localities from which students are drawn.
„ IV.—Number of Muslim students in the session 1917-18.
„ V, (A) AND (B).—Residential accommodation of students in the session 1917-18.
„ VI.—Particulars of teaching staff and teaching for the session 1917-18.
„ VII.—Conditions of service of teaching staff in non-Government colleges.
„ VIII.—List of publications of members of the teaching staff, 1913-17.
„ IX, (A) AND (B).—Number of working days in the session 1917-18.
„ X.—Periods which elapse between the first day of the session in the first and third years and the actual beginning of the teaching work for students in those years respectively.
„ XI.—Non-university examination courses.
„ XII.—Attendance by persons other than candidates for university examinations.

MAPS.

In Volume I.—Map of Bengal showing the Sites of Colleges.
,, II.—Map of Calcutta showing the Distribution of the University Buildings and Colleges.
,, IV.—Map showing the Site of the Dacca University and the Town of Dacca.

ANALYSES OF CHAPTERS.

Part I.—Analysis of Present Conditions.

VOLUME I.

CHAPTER I.—REFERENCE AND PROCEDURE OF THE COMMISSION.

CHAPTER II.—PRELIMINARY OBSERVATIONS.

Section I. Numbers and employment.—(1) The rapid increase in number of university students in Bengal. (2—5) Contrast with the United Kingdom. (6) Partly due to the fact that school work is included in the university course. (7) The courses too purely literary. (8—9) The 'intellectual proletariat' and its legitimate grievances. (10) The problem is a social as well as an intellectual one.

Section II. Social conditions.—(11—14) Lack of outlets in industry and commerce. (15—17) The agricultural community. (18—19) The *bhadralok*. (20—21) Their intellectual traditions. (22—23) Influence of the western system of education upon them.

CHAPTER III.—THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE WESTERN SYSTEM OF EDUCATION IN BENGAL.

Section I. The period of beginnings to 1854.—(1) No attempt to introduce western education in the first period of British rule. (2) Charles Grant and the missionaries. (3) The 'orientalist' policy, 1813-35. (4) The two influences at the beginning of western education: (*a*) rationalist—Hare, Ram Mohan Roy and the Hindu College; (5) (*b*) missionary—Carey and Duff. (6—7) The parallel of London. (8) The Act of 1833. (9—10) Macaulay's minute of 1835. (11) Rapid changes of this period: Government educational policy. (12) Government and other schools. (13) Numbers, 1835—54. (14—16) The western system takes root.

Section II. The organisation of the educational system, 1854—82.—(17) Parliamentary enquiry of 1853. (18—21) The education despatch of 1854. (22—25) The work of the Department of Public Instruction: growth of private schools. (26—29) The development of colleges and increase in number of university students, 1855—82. (30—32) The organisation of the universities, 1857. (33—37) The affiliating system: its defects and advantages. (38—39) The influence of the new system.

Section III. The Commission of 1882—83 and its results.—(40) New conditions with which the Commission of 1882 had to deal. (41) The political movement. (42) Desire of Government to delegate control of education. (43—44) Call of new interests to its support. (45—46) Principles laid down by the Commission;

(47—48) Effects of its policy in Bengal. (49—50) Difficulty of regulating private schools. (51—52) Failure of the attempt to introduce practical classes. (53) Lack of co-ordination between the University and the Department. (54—55) Policy of the Commission in regard to arts colleges. (56) Encouragement of private effort. (57—60) Effects of this policy in increase of colleges, (61) and of students.

Section IV. The Commission of 1902 and the Universities Act of 1904.—(62—64) Disorganisation of the university system. (65—66) Influence of changes in London. (67—68) But fundamental questions not yet raised. (69) Attitude of the Commission on new university projects. (70—71) Main recommendations of the Commission, (72) to be considered in conjunction with regulations. (73) Reorganisation of the Senate, (74) the Faculties, and the Syndicate. (75) Small part played by teachers. (76—77) Increase of Government control. (78—79) Relations of the Department of Public Instruction to the University. (80) Separation of colleges from schools. (81—83) Second-grade colleges: policy of hostility. (84) Reforms in college system. (85—86) New rules of affiliation. (87—88) Students' residence. (89) Limitations of the reform scheme. (90—92) The universities empowered to undertake teaching functions. (93—94) Defects still unremedied. (95—96) Continued growth of colleges. Need for reconsideration of the problem.

Chapter IV.—Government and Private Effort in Education in India.

Section I. The problem in Bengal.—(1—3) The number of high schools under private management in Bengal exceptionally large. In other provinces of India private effort covers a smaller part of the field of secondary education. The right relationship between the State and private enterprise in education, an urgent question both in Bengal and in England. A wise settlement of the question desirable in the interest of the University.

Section II. Its origin. Attitude of the Government from 1781-1854.—(4) Administrative practice in Indian education from an early date prepared the way for the policy which was systematically laid down in 1854. (5) The Court of Directors of East India Company, besides maintaining institutions of oriental learning and small establishments in other fields of education, gave grants-in-aid to the work of educational societies and in rare cases to schools not under their control. They subsidised individual teachers. (6—7) The Act of 1813 empowered the Directors to expend an annual sum in the encouragement of education; the directions given in 1814 as to the mode of expenditure. (8) The rapid growth among Hindus, especially in Bengal, of the desire for western education led to the establishment before 1831 of a number of English schools under private management. (9) After the resolution of Lord William Bentinck's Government in 1835, a great effort was made to meet the demand for English education by the establishment of schools and colleges under the direction of Government, but the funds available were insufficient to cope with the new movement. (10) European missionary opinion re-inforced the desire for the full recognition of non-Governmental effort in English education, especially after 1845. Proposal made in that year for the establishment of a university in Calcutta, partly in order to provide equal opportunity for students from Government and private colleges. (11) The action of the British Government

in 1846 in deciding that, on condition of inspection, elementary schools and training colleges of various types and under different forms of management should be eligible for State recognition and aid, suggested a way of dealing with the educational situation which had arisen in India, and especially in Bengal. (12) In 1853 the number of English schools under non-Governmental management had become so large in Bengal that it was convenient to apply in that sphere of education the practice of giving aid to approved schools under private direction.

Section III. Encouragement of private effort in education, 1854-1882.—(13) Policy of encouraging non-Governmental effort in education warmly recommended and precisely defined in the Court of Directors' general educational despatch of 1854. The point-of-view taken by the authors of the despatch similar to that which had been taken by the Committee of Council on Education in England and Wales in 1846. (14—17) The same policy reaffirmed by the Secretary of State in 1859. (18) The breadth and liberality of the principles upon which the Government of Bengal had made grants-in-aid to schools promoted by individual Indians or local communities specially commended by the Secretary of State in 1864. (19) Establishment of private high schools sedulously fostered by the Department of Public Instruction, Bengal. At this period under official encouragement privately managed secondary schools became, as they still are, a distinctive feature of the system of education in the Presidency. (20) The Government of India, in appointing the Indian Educational Commission, 1882, expressed the wish that every available private agency might be called into action in order that satisfactory progress might be made in education. (21—22) Report of the Indian Education Commission, 1882, on the degree of encouragement given to private effort in education in different parts of India. (23) The extent of private educational enterprise in Bengal favourably viewed by the Commission. (24) The proposals made by the Commission for the further encouragement of non-Governmental educational institutions. (25) Note of warning by Mr. Kashinath Trimbak Telang, a member of the Commission, who, quoting Matthew Arnold, deprecated over-reliance upon private enterprise for the effective developement of secondary education and while approving private effort as one factor in the problem, suggested that the chief work of organisation in secondary education must devolve upon the State. (26) View of the Government of India, 1884, on self-help in secondary education.

Section IV. The turn in the tide, 1884-1913.—(27) Change of feeling in England during the years 1884-1904 with regard to the relationship between the State and secondary education. Declining confidence in the adequacy of private enterprise to supply all the secondary education of the quality required and at school fees within the reach of families of moderate income. Increasing activities of the State in the sphere of secondary education in England. But the excellence of many private schools recognised and variety of types of educational effort valued not less than before. (28) Similar views expressed in the resolution on Indian educational policy, 1904. (29—31) Further growth of public opinion in England, 1904-13, in favour of extended activity of the State in the sphere of secondary education. (32—33) Corresponding change in the terms of the resolution on Indian educational policy, 1913.

Section V. The need for co-operation between private effort and the State.—(34—37) The relationship between Government and private educational enterprise in India

has, in each of its successive phases, followed the trend of public feeling in England. (38) Two distinct considerations confirmed English opinion in its reluctance to extend the activities of the State in the sphere of secondary education, (*a*) a desire to leave schools free from the pressure which a Government might exert in order to diffuse certain forms of opinion, (*b*) a supposition that through the activities of private enterprise the chief part of secondary education might be self-supporting through receipts from school fees. (39) The present condition of secondary education in Bengal the direct result of the prevalence of these two ideas in England, especially in the middle decades of the nineteenth century. No logical connexion between the two ideas. The first valid (subject to the duty of the State to prevent schools being used for purposes inimical to civil peace and to insist upon a reasonable standard of intellectual attainment among the pupils): the second, discredited by experience. (40—41) For a number of effective reasons the greater part of secondary education is passing in England out of the category of private effort into the category of public services supported by taxation. A similar change probable in Bengal. But such a change inevitably brings secondary education more under the control of the State. Therefore, both in Bengal and in England, it is desirable to take precautions not against State supervision of secondary education, but against undesirable forms of State control over the ideas imparted in the course of education. Education lying across the boundary which divides public functions from private initiative, a new synthesis between State supervision and private effort is needed.

Chapter V.—The Student in Bengal.

Section I. The adjustment of education to the student's needs.—(1—4) A short account of the characteristics of the student throws light upon the needs which should be met by higher education in Bengal.

Section II. His physique.—(5) Physical characteristics—memory; (6) eyesight; (7) want of manual skill in the case of boys; (8—9) their inaptitude not the result of innate aversion, but (10) due to tradition and lack of early training. (11) Neglect of personal health and of bodily exercise: effects of recent military training, and (12) of boy scout movement.

Section III. Disposition and gifts.—(13) Sensitive and affectionate disposition; (14—15) home influences in Hindu and Muslim families. (16) Sense of rhythm and gift for music and acting; (17) imaginative sympathy but weakness of power of observing facts. (18—19) Linguistic gifts; (20) strong sense of number, weak sense of time; (21) skill in drawing distinctions and love for abstraction; (22) quick sympathy with new ideas; (23) danger of instability of view and purpose.

Section IV. Some disabilities.—(24) Defects in early training and education; (25) anxiety as to examinations; its causes and (26) results; (27) cramming and (28) changes which would lessen it.

Section V. Temperament.—(29) Some effects of his impressionable temperament. (30) Instinctive reliance upon social rules which protect him from irresolution. Submission to ideas appealing to his sense of religion and chivalry; advantage taken of this by the organisers of sedition. (31) His defective power of complex co-ordination.

Section VI. Tension.—(32—36) Tension of mind produced by influx of new ideas from the West. (37) Description of an orthodox Hindu home in Bengal as modified by the influences of western education. (38—39) The new education, though producing inner conflict, is necessary to the unity of India, and (40) may lead to a reconciliation between the older Indian tradition and new industrial order. Social service as a preparation for this. (41) Obligation under social authority the main characteristic of the ancient Hindu society. (42—43) Stress laid upon individual rights and initiative in the phase of European thought prevalent at the time when western ideas burst upon India. The clash between these two tendencies of thought. (44) The search, both in the West and in India, for a synthesis between communal organisation and individual enterprise. (45—46) Each tendency reflected in the currents of educational ideas in India.

Section VII. Educational needs of girls.—(47) Education of girls; (48) quality of the work done by them in matriculation xamination; (49—50) aims of the traditional training of girls in Bengal; (51) their sense of order and neatness and deftness of hand. (52) Strong instinct for motherhood, (53—54) for religion and self-submission; (55) power to idealise. (56—57) Conflict between western and traditional Indian ideas upon their education. (58—60) New ideas producing dissatisfaction with its present aims and standards. Increasing danger of a deep division between the intellectual interests of men and women. Desire expressed for a form of education which will combine higher intellectual standards with Indian tradition, but without indiscriminate imitation of western methods and ideas. (61) Daily routine in the home of a middle-class Hindu family residing in a town. (62—63) Certainty of a widening in the intellectual gap between men and women unless the education of girls is improved along with that of boys. The qualities which an improved education should endeavour to preserve. (64) The educational needs of girls of exceptional ability. (65—66) Women of great administrative and spiritual power characteristic of India. (67) Description of the life and character of a holy woman quoted. (68) Movement among orthodox Hindu girls towards the study of ancient Sanskrit learning. (69) Remarks by an Indian woman student on the aims of girls' education in Bengal. (70) What might be achieved for India by better education of girls and women.

CHAPTER VI.—THE MUSALMANS AND THEIR EDUCATIONAL NEEDS.

Section I. The problem.—(1) Muslim traditions and ideals. (2) The present position as summarised in the Fifth Quinquennial Review of Education in Bengal. (3) The position as described by the Indian Education Commission, 1882. (4—5) This position has been modified, but the problem remains fundamentally the same. (6) The recommendations of the Indian Education Commission. (7) Dr. W. W. Hunter's statement of the problem in the 'Indian Musalmans' (published 1872). (8—9) The continuance of the madrassah and the maktab, and the significance of this fact.

Section II. The progress of Muslim education in Bengal from 1905-1917.—(10—11) The province of Eastern Bengal and Assam and the efforts of its Government towards the education of Musalmans. (12) Lord Hardinge's reply to the Muslim deputation of the 16th February 1912. (13—14) The Government of India addresses local Governments in 1913 and the Bengal Government appoints

Muslim Education Committee. (15) The Committee's demands as regards secondary education. (16) The Committee's claim that unaided schools should be made acceptable to all classes. (17) The Musalmans' suspicion of popularly constituted educational authorities. (18—19) The language problem. (20—21) The Committee's recommendations in the matter of collegiate education. (22) The Committee's attitude towards religious instruction and observances. (23) The resolution of the Government of Bengal on the Committee's report; its general attitude defined. (24—25) Orders *re* religious instruction and observance. (26) Orders *re* Urdu text-books, the appointment of Muslim head masters, reservation of vacancies for Muslim pupils and free studentships. (27) The question of languages at the matriculation examination referred to Calcutta University. (28) Other Muslim demands in the matter of linguistic courses and text-books. (29) Orders about hostel accommodation. (30) Orders about collegiate education. (31) Muslim complaints that these orders have not been carried out. (32) Orders about Muslim representation on the managing committees of schools. (33) Summary of the more important special arrangements made by the Government of Bengal between 1913—1917 to facilitate the education of Musalmans.

Section III. The present position.—(34) The proportion of Muslim literates. (35) Musalmans under instruction. (36) Proportion of Musalmans in (*a*) 'arts colleges,' (*b*) professional colleges, (*c*) high schools, (*d*) middle English schools, (*e*) middle vernacular schools, (*f*) primary schools. (37) Musalmans in the various grades of school education. (38) Musalmans in maktabs and madrassahs. (39) Musalmans in 'private institutions.' (40) Table illustrating progress of Muslim education since 1882. (41) Musalmans on the Calcutta University bodies. (42) Musalmans on the governing bodies of colleges. (43) Muslim teachers on the staffs of colleges. (44) Muslim teachers at the University Law College. (45) Percentage of Muslim students in the various types of university colleges. (46) The proposed Islamia College for Calcutta. The Anglo-Persian departments of certain Government madrassahs. (47) Muslim pupils in high schools and percentage of Muslim candidates who appeared at the last matriculation examination. (48) Table showing residential accommodation available for Muslim students.

Section IV. The education of women and girls.—(49) Some statistics. (50) *Zanana* instruction. (51) The Muslim Education Committee advocate a separate school system. (52) Other recommendations of the Committee. (53) Begum Khajesta Bano Suhrawardy on the need for Muslim women teachers. (54) The need for special *purdah* arrangements in connexion with university examination.

Section V. The proposed Calcutta 'arts college' for Musalmans.—(55) The history of the university classes at the Calcutta Madrassah. (56—57) The 'arts college' proposal and its present position.

Section VI. Madrassahs.—(58) Madrassahs during Muslim rule and the establishment of the Calcutta Madrassah by Warren Hastings. (59) Should the madrassah be regarded as a purely theological institution? (60) The attempt to bring madrassahs more into touch with the requirements of modern life culminating in the reformed madrassah scheme and the proposed Dacca University Department of Islamic Studies. (61) The madrassah is an essential factor in the problem of the education of Musalmans. The present condition of madrassahs.

Section VII. Muslim deputations and representations.—(62) The number of deputations received and their general significance. (63) The Muslim demand for more scholarships and stipends.

Section VIII. Musalmans and the problem of communal representation.—(64) General dissatisfaction. (65) Inadequate representation in the University. (66) A summary of Muslim grievances. (67) The charge of general indifference to Muslim requirements. (68) Some Musalmans urge the curtailment of the Calcutta University's scope. (69) Some general observations on the points raised by this suggestion. (70) The question of special communal needs in the university system. (71—72) The question of residence and religious instruction and observance. (73—74) Communal needs in the matter of university curriculum. (75) Some hold that there should be no consideration of special communal considerations either because such consideration is objectionable on principle or because it is unnecessary. (76) Communal representation in the government of a university—Hindu evidence both for it and against it. (77) Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee and Mr. P. Basu. (78) Mr. Sasi Sekhar Banerjee. (79) Dr. M. N. Banerjee ; The Bengal Landholders' Association and Sir R. G. Bhandarkar. (80) Rai Yatindra Nath Choudhury and Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta. (81) The Indian Association ; Sir Manindra Chandra Nandy ; Dr. Tej Bahadur Sapru ; Sir Nilratan Sircar ; the Rev. Garfield Williams ; Mr. R. P. Paranjpye. (82) Mr. K. Zachariah. (83) Mr. Saratlal Biswas. (84) Kumar Manindra Chandra Sinha of Paikpara and Mr. P. N. Nag. (85) Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur and Mr. Jogendra Nath Hazra. (86) Rai Sahib Nritya Gopal Chaki and Mr. N. C. Bardaloi. (87) The views of British witnesses. (88) Mr. R. N. Gilchrist. (89) Mr. S. G. Dunn and Mr. Mark Hunter. (90) Mr. H. Sharp. (91) Mr. W. C. Wordsworth. (92) Mr. J R. Cunningham and Mr. G. H. Langley. (93) The trend of Muslim opinion. (94) Sir Ali Imam. (95) Mr. Z. R. Zahid Suhrawardy and Maulvi Mohomed Habibur Rahman Khan. (96) Khan Bahadur Mohammad Ismail. (97) Mr. M. A. N. Hydari and Mr. Wahed Hossain. (98) Maulvi Abdullah Abu Sayied. (99) Mr. Justice Abdur Rahim. (100) The whole range of recorded opinion analysed.

Section IX. Some remarks in conclusion.—(101) The problem has been set out in all its difficulty. (102) The distinction between the problem of educational administration and that of university teaching. (103) The hope of the future lies in increased mutual understanding and esteem.

Chapter VII.—The Education of Backward Classes.

(1) The Indian Education Commission's reason for devoting special attention to the education of aboriginal tribes and low castes. The present importance of the problem. (2) A classification of the depressed classes in Bengal. (3) The habitat of some of the depressed classes. (4) Statistics of the boys and girls of the depressed and other backward classes under instruction. The comparative insignificance of special and indigenous schools. (5) The progress made by the Namasudras. (6) The demand for education in the Darjeeling hills. Schools in Bhutan. Calcutta University and the study of Tibetan. (7) Education among the Garos and other tribes of the Garo Hills. (8) Education in the Chittagong Hill Tracts and in the Cox's Bazar sub-division. The Rajbanshi hostel at Rangpur. Special scholarships for backward classes. (9) Difficulties experienced by backward classes students in securing accommodation

in Calcutta. (10) The recommendations of the Dacca University Committee in favour of a hostel for Namasudra students. (11) Summary of the recommendations made by the Commission in later chapters of the report.

CHAPTER VIII.—THE HIGH SCHOOLS AS THE FOUNDATIONS OF THE UNIVERSITY.

Section I. The educational movement in Bengal.—(1) Rapid increase in the number of boys attending secondary schools in Bengal. (2) Position compared with that in England. (3) Reasons for growing importance of education in national life. (4) Advantage to the individual, (5) but his interests have to be adjusted to those of the community. (6) The new educational movement in Bengal hemmed into a too narrow channel. (7) A new spirit needed in secondary education. (8) The future welfare of the University depends on this.

Section II. Its strength in all parts of the Presidency.—(9) The demand for increased facilities for secondary education strong throughout Bengal. (10) Generous gifts for the building of new schools, and local rivalries in regard to high schools. (11) Increasing desire for secondary education felt among the cultivator class, *e.g.* in the Khulna district, (12) at Berhampur, and (13) Rangpur. (14—15) Some signs of increasing demand for secondary education for girls in Calcutta and in Eastern Bengal.

Section III. The need for reform in the high schools.—(16) Conferences with school masters. (17—19) Views expressed by head masters at Berhampur and elsewhere. (20—21) The schools generally fail to supply what is really needed. (22) Mr. B. K. Basu's report on the social significance and vagueness of the new educational aspirations. (23) Mr. Ramananda Chatterjee's description of the type of secondary education which is needed. (24) Reaction of intellectual training upon character. (25) Aims of secondary education. (26) Mr. Panchanandas Mukherji on the requirements which should be met by secondary schools in Bengal.

Section IV. The disabilities of the teachers.—(27) At present most of the schools deaden intellectual curiosity. Mr. Justice Abdur Rahîm's evidence. (28) The difficulties under which the teachers work. The need for a much larger proportion of trained teachers. (29) Unattractiveness of the profession of teaching under present conditions. (30) Dr. Brajendranath Seal's plea for their improvement.

Section V.—A. Description of some representative schools.—(31) Types of schools described in this section. (32) Reference to the Oriental Seminary, Calcutta. (33—42) The South Suburban School, Bhowanipur, more fully described; organisation of classes, the whole class taken as a unit in all the subjects of its assigned course. The importance of this characteristic feature in the organisation of secondary schools; English method of re-division into 'sets' for various subjects, not followed; stages of promotion; school hours and holidays; plan of work in the higher classes. Comparatively little time given to training in the mother tongue; no science taught, except mechanics. (43—46) The special characteristics of the Mitra Schools in Calcutta —wider curriculum and regard to needs of individual pupils. (47) Efforts made at the Zilla School, Bankura, and other schools to secure closer co-operation between parents and teachers. (48) Work of the 'B' class at the Zilla School, Rangpur. (49) The Hindu School. (50) Teaching of science at the high school attached to the London Missionary Society's Institution, Bhowanipur.

B. Examples of a bad type.—(51) Description of a visit to a school working under very bad conditions in Calcutta. (52) Mr. M. P. West's report upon the unsatisfactory state of some of the proprietary schools in Calcutta. (53) Bad accommodation in some mufassal schools. (54) Evidence of Dr. C. P. Segard and Mr. W. C. Wordsworth. (55) Increasing inadequacy of private enterprise, except under specially favourable conditions, to supply the secondary education needed in Bengal. (56) Private initiative indispensable in education but often discredited by commercialism.

C. Two schools of outstanding interest.—(57) The existence of some secondary schools of exceptional interest affords hope for new educational developments in Bengal. (58) Sir Rabindranath Tagore's school at Bolpur. (59) Sir R. Tagore's view of what should be the aims of education in Bengal. (60) Organisation of Bolpur School. (61) Plan of work in the classes below the stage at which preparation for the university matriculation begins. (62) Plan of work in the two highest classes. (63) Views of Sir R. Tagore and members of his staff on points affecting the connexion between the high schools and the University. (64) Extension of school work to the intermediate stage approved. (65) Mr. Rewachand Animananda's Boys' Own Home in Calcutta. (66) Organisation of the school. (67—69) Mr. Animananda's statement of its aims. (70) Course of study and arrangement of school hours. (71) Character-training. (72) Manual labour and training. (73) Method of teaching.

Section VI. The private tuition of school boys.—(74) Private tuition of high school boys very prevalent in Bengal. A tax on many of the parents. It overtaxes the teachers who undertake it. It has a bad effect upon class-teaching and discipline.

Section VII. The schools and the formation of character.—(75) Concern felt at the ineffectiveness of most of the schools in the formation of character. (76) Some of the deeper causes of this failure lie beyond the control of teachers or administrators. (77) The difficulty not confined to India, (78) but for special reasons felt here with exceptional force because most schools have to rely upon the intellectual materials of secular study for moral influence and training. (79) Much in those materials gives inspiration and guidance. (80) In every system of schools designed to meet the needs of a whole nation there can only be approximate unity in intellectual and ethical outlook. Within the limits of such a system, therefore, place should be made for special groups of schools representing definite convictions not shared in full by the whole community. (81) Importance of membership in a school community as a means of training for responsibility. This side of school organisation unduly neglected in Bengal but capable of being developed. (82) The development of the organised life of the school-community does not derogate from the value of the personality of the teacher, or (83) of a well-planned course of intellectual training.

Section VIII. Dissatisfaction with the present state of the schools.—(84) Mr. Meghnad Saha's evidence that a wider view of the functions of a secondary school is to be desired in Bengal. (85) Comparative neglect of other than linguistic and mathematical studies. (86) The study of English necessary in secondary and higher education in India. (87) But training in the mother tongue of primary importance. (88) General conclusions as to the present state of secondary education in Bengal.

CHAPTER IX.—THE UNIVERSITY MATRICULATION EXAMINATION. ITS REQUIREMENTS, STANDARD AND INFLUENCE UPON THE SCHOOLS.

Section I. The range and requirements of the examination.—(1) Geographical range of this examination, the largest of its kind in the world; (2) conditions of admission to it; (3—4) total number of candidates and of passes 1912—1917; (5) number of candidates from schools in Bengal, and of passes from those schools; (6) the stated aim of the examination to serve as 'a general test of fitness for a course of university studies'; its obligatory and optional subjects; (7) definition of the requirements in English.

Section II. Dissatisfaction with it as a test of admission to the University.—(8) Eleven out of every twelve of the witnesses dealing with the point express dissatisfaction with the examination as a test of fitness for entering the University; (9) this dissatisfaction felt among Indians and Europeans alike but not universal; (10) names of some of the witnesses expressing satisfaction with the present conditions of admission to the University; (11—13) evidence of dissatisfaction in the colleges; (14) in the secondary schools; (15) among officers of the Department of Public Instruction; (16) on the part of public associations and of men holding important positions in the professions and in public life.

Section III. Criticisms of the standard of the examination.—(17) Criticism of the standard enforced in the obligatory subjects, (18—24) in mathematics, (25—26) in vernacular, and (27—30) in English. (31—32) Some evidence that the standard of general attainment in English is higher among students in Madras than in Bengal; though complaints on this subject are by no means confined to the latter; (33) work of colleges in Bengal clogged by the ignorance and immaturity of many who matriculate. (34—35) But the examination has also to take account of those candidates who will not proceed to a university course. (36) Summary of conclusions which may be drawn from the evidence cited above.

Section IV. Influence of the examination upon the high schools.—(37) The deeper causes of the desire for western education are partly concealed from view by the eager pursuit of certificates, valuable as qualifications for a career. (38—39) This anxiety to pass a critically important examination makes the matriculation the mainspring of the existing machinery of secondary education in Bengal. (40—42) The importance of the matriculation in a boy's career is so great that anxiety to make sure of passing it is not to be wondered at. (43) But pre-occupation with the aim of passing pupils through this examination is doing injury to the secondary schools, by narrowing their outlook and inducing wrong methods of teaching.

Section V. Proposals that the number of compulsory subjects should be increased.—(44—48) Therefore, as the rules of the matriculation determine what is taught in the secondary schools, many witnesses suggest that the course of study in the schools should be widened by an increase in the number of subjects compulsory in the examination; and recommend that the list of obligatory subjects should be enlarged by the addition of, (49) history and geography, and (50—51) elementary science. (52—55) Special difficulties in the way of introducing the teaching of elementary science into all the schools. Suggestions made by witnesses for meeting those difficulties.

Section VI. Other suggestions for a widening of the high school course.—(56—58) Other suggested additions to the high school course, preparatory to matriculation, include manual training, (59) drawing and music. (60) Religion and ethics. (61) Physical training. (62) The difficulty of testing work done in some of these subjects by means of a large scale examination applied to a great number of schools simultaneously has led several correspondents to suggest, (63) that the responsibility for declaring candidates fit for matriculation should be thrown, in certain subjects, upon the recognised schools. Arrangements made for the matriculation at the Osmania University, Hyderabad (Deccan). (64) Proposals that a similar system should be appointed in Bengal. (65) Objections raised to these proposals on the ground that the present teaching staff would as a rule not be regarded by public opinion as strong enough to bear the responsibility. (66) Prevailing view that the impersonality of the examination should be preserved.

Section VII. Various proposals for change in the arrangements of the examination.—(67—69) Suggestions as to the 'test examination', biennial examination 'examination by compartments', change in the method of marking the examination papers, and substitution of roll numbers for names in the registration of the candidates. (70) Recommendations of many witnesses that the standard of marking in the matriculation should be raised and the present classification of successful candidates in three divisions (of which the first is by far the largest) modified or abolished. (71—72) The difference between these recommendations and the changes in the matriculation proposed by the 'Committee of Sixteen' in 1917.

Section VIII. Proposals for the conversion of the present matriculation into a high school examination and for the postponement of entrance to the University to the end of the intermediate course.—(73) Should the matriculation examination be conducted in the vernacular? Close division of opinions on this point. (74—75) Arguments in favour of having the examination conducted in English. (76—78) Arguments in favour of allowing candidates to answer all papers, except those on English, in the vernacular. (79—80) This discussion raises incidentally a more fundamental question—what are the true aims of higher secondary education in Bengal? Answer suggested to this question. (81) Delusive uniformity of aim in the present matriculation course and in the plans of pupils for their future careers. (82) Typical answers from boys in a matriculation class to the question what calling they hoped to follow in life. Predominance of a desire (certain in most cases to be unrealised) of entering Government service. (83—84) Want of adjustment of the present matriculation course to the economic and social needs of Bengal. (85) The desire to enter a commercial career strong among the boys at Pachaiyappa's Collegiate School, Madras, and at the Marwari School, Calcutta. (86—87) Proposals made by many witnesses for the conversion of the present matriculation into a secondary school examination (with a wider scope of subjects than the existing matriculation) and the establishment of a new examination at the intermediate stage, to be used (among other purposes) as a matriculation test for the University.

Section IX. The age-limit for admission to the matriculation examination.—(88) Proposals for modification of the present age-limit for admission to the matriculation. (89—93) Earlier history of this question in the University of Calcutta. (94) Reasons adduced in previous discussions against lowering the age-limit. (95—96) Objections urged against continuance of the present rule. Views of our

correspondents on the subject. (97) Average age of candidates entering for the matriculation examination from schools in Bengal in 1918 The average age of Muslim students higher than that of non-Muslim. (98) Views of head masters in Bengal. (99) The controversy might be settled by the adoption of the suggested reorganisation of secondary school examinations in Bengal.

Section X. Summary of the evidence.—(100—104) General summary of the opinions disclosed in the evidence on the subject of the matriculation examination.

Chapter X.—The Recognition of Schools by the University.

Section I. Origin of the present system.—(1—2) Duty of recognition of secondary schools laid upon the University of Calcutta by regulations approved by the Government of India in 1906. (3—4) Steps taken by the University when those regulations came into force. (5—6) Standard of efficiency indicated by the regulations. (7) Procedure of the University in regard to recognition of schools. (8) Right of the Syndicate to withdraw the privilege.

Section II. The responsibility falling upon the University—(9) Significance of the powers conferred upon the University by the Government of India. (10—13) But these powers less efficacious than they appear. The plan devised in 1904 has broken down.

Section III. Injury done to the University by the defective training given by the high schools.—(14—16) Present condition of the secondary schools in Bengal. Causes of the widespread dissatisfaction with their present state. (17—28) Evidence of our witnesses on the need for reform in secondary education.

Section IV. The future connexion between the schools and the University.—(29—31) Improvement of secondary schools by measures suggested by our correspondents would involve a re-consideration of the present form of the connexion between the University and the schools. Suggestion that intermediate classes are in reality school courses. A retention of the connexion with the University, though not necessarily in its present form, desired by the great majority of witnesses. (32—49) Various and conflicting views on this question. (50) Main conclusion towards which the evidence points.

Chapter XI.—The Education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians.

Section I. Descriptive.—(1) A separate school system. (2) Mr. Hornell's memorandum. (3) Statistics of institutions and pupils in Bengal. (4) European schools in Bengal according to management. (5) Local distribution of Bengal European schools. (6) The cost of the European school system in Bengal, Endowment Funds. (7) Mr. W. H. H. Arden Wood's account of the educational needs of the Domiciled Community. (8) Failure of Europeans and Anglo-Indians to avail themselves of university education. (9) Figures relating to the university education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians in Bengal. (10) Examinations and class promotion. (11) The recommendations of the Simla Conference of 1912 on the university education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians. (12) A separate university system for Europeans is impracticable.

Section II. Suggestions.—(13) The need for encouraging the secondary and university education of Europeans. (14) The European secondary school system should be continued on its present lines, but experience of the educational needs of the

Domiciled Community should be represented on the proposed new central authority for secondary and intermediate education. (15) The importance of the European Domiciled Community in the industrial and commercial development of Bengal. The advantages of young Europeans being brought into association with young Indians in the universities and higher technological institutes. (16) Suggestions for the closer coordination of the European secondary school system in Bengal with the university system of the Presidency. (17) Representation of the Domiciled European Community on the courts of the universities; residential accommodation in university towns. (18) The part which may be played by European and Anglo-Indian women teachers in the education of girls and women in India.

CHAPTER XII.—THE INTERMEDIATE CLASSES AND THE SECOND-GRADE COLLEGES.

Section I. The needs of the intermediate students.—(1) Their numbers. (2) They are unready for university work. (3—4) Why they flock to the colleges. (5) Their work essentially school-work. (6) Only about half of them proceed beyond the intermediate stage. (7—8) The intermediate is, in fact, a distinct stage.

Section II. The equipment of the students.—(9—10) A general urvey. (11) English. (12) Vernacular. (13) Classics. (14) Mathematics. (15) History. (16) Subjects usually omitted. (17) Inadequacy of this equipment. (18) The students are unprepared for university work, and (19) unready to associate with older students.

Section III The training given to the students.—(20—21) Limited range of subjects. (22) Absence of guidance in choice of subjects. (23—24) Absence of vocational training. (25) Failure to employ appropriate methods. (26) Classes too large. (27) Deficiencies in teaching. (28—31) Methods of lecture-instruction especially in English.

Section IV. The second-grade colleges.—(32—33) The intermediate classes in first-grade colleges, how they are conducted. (34) The second-grade colleges unusually treated as inferior first-grade colleges. (35) Views of the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan. (36—37) False notion of the function of second-grade colleges. (38) Probably due to the Commission of 1902. (39) Dissents from their view. (40—42) Later views as to the functions of the second-grade college. (43) The line between school and university drawn at the wrong point.

Section V. Suggestions for change.—(44—45) Views of Dr. Mackichan and others. (46) Proposals to prolong and vary the school course, or (47—48) to create special institutions preparatory to the University, or (49) special types of schools serving diverse ends. Views of (50) Mr. J. C. Coyajee, (51) Mr. Prasanta Chandra Mahalanobis, (52) Mr. C. W. Peake, (53) and others. (54) Action taken by the University of Mysore. (55) Summary of these views. (56—57) Importance of some such scheme from the point of view of relieving the pressure on Calcutta and saving young students from undesirable conditions of life.

CHAPTER XIII.—THE 'ARTS COLLEGES': THEIR UNDERGRADUATE WORK.

Section I. General dissatisfaction with the system.—(1) Importance of the arts colleges—the main body of the University. (2) Their various types (3) Materials for

our enquiry. (4) Deep dissatisfaction with the system shewn by our evidence. (5) Comparison with the old Indian system. (6) Lack of intimacy between teachers and students.

Section II. The weakness of the isolated colleges.—(7) Comments of our correspondents on this point. (8) Lack of co-operation between colleges, though it is attempted elsewhere in India. (9) Inadequate equipment of the colleges for university work. (10) Low cost of the student's training. (11) Cost of working an efficient college. (12—13) Dependence on fees the root of evil conditions. (14) Possibility of concentration. (15) Need of increased expenditure and possible sources of aid. (16) Tradition of private benefaction for education in India. Need for a revival.

Section III. The position of the teachers.—(17) Numbers and classes of teachers. (18—19) Conditions of work in Government colleges: average rate of pay. (20—21) Criticism of the Government educational services. (22) Need for Englishmen in university work. (23—25) Difficulties felt by English teachers. (26) Transference of teachers. (27—28) The difficulties of junior teachers. (29) Conditions of teachers in missionary colleges; the influence of the missionaries. (30) Indian teachers in missionary colleges. (31) Conditions of work in private colleges. (32) Low rates of pay. (33—34) Bitter comments on these conditions. (35) Provident funds in private colleges. (36) Low prestige of teachers.

Section IV. The control of the University.—(37) The power of the University over the colleges inadequate to secure good teaching. (38) But far too rigid in its control over curricula. (39) Relations of the University and colleges unfortunate. (40) It prevents adaptation to local needs, and (41) reduces all colleges to the same level. (42—43) The dominance of examinations under the existing system.

Section V. The methods of instruction.—(44—47) Summary of the disabilities under which teachers have to work. (48) Lack of co-ordination in the course of study, and of guidance in choice. (49) Requirement of attendance at lectures. (50) Description of lectures. (51) Criticisms by Mr. Chandi C. Mitra, Mr. Purnachandra Kundu, Mr. Jatindra Chandra Guha and Dr Jajneswar Ghosh. (52) Reaction against the system. (53) Tutorial work also unsatisfactory. (54—56) The need of a more generous kind of tutorial guidance.

Section VI. The neglect of the able student.—(57) The abler students, under this system, are chained down with the weaker. (58—59) Criticism of the honours courses. (60) Seriousness of this neglect of ability. (61—62) General disregard of this. (63) Yet even the average students suffer. (64) Impossibility of real honours schools under the existing system.

Section VII. The subjects of study.—(65) Narrow range of subjects. (66) Even the subjects offered are too narrowly treated. (67—68) The actual range of studies. (69—81) Criticism of the work done in various subjects. (*69*) Science. (*70*) Mathematics. (*71*) Philosophy and history. (*72*) Oriental languages (*73*) The vernacular. (*74—81*) English language and literature. Evidence of Mr. O. F. Jenkins (*75*).

Section VIII. The neglect of the library.—(82—83) General defectiveness of college libraries. (84—85) Though students and teachers are dependent on them. (86—87) Such as they are, they are little used. (88—89) Need of training in the use of a library.

Section IX. The colleges of Calcutta.—(90) A survey of the colleges necessary. (91—92) Tests to be applied: proportion of teachers to students—how far this is a

valid test. (93) Distinction between Calcutta and mufassal colleges. (94) Numbers and origin of Calcutta students. (95—99) Presidency College. (100) The Sanskrit College. (101—107) The mission colleges: (*102*) Scottish Churches College, (*103*) St. Paul's Cathedral Mission College, (*104*) St. Xavier's College, (*105—107*) religious instruction in the mission colleges. (108—115) The private colleges.

Section X. The mufassal colleges.—(116—117) Absence of intellectual centres. (118) Numbers of students in the mufassal degree colleges: preponderance of intermediate students. (119) Consequent narrow range of degree courses. (120) The Dacca colleges. (121—122) Berhampur. (123—125) Rajshahi. (126) Rangpur. (127) Serampore. (128) Cooch Behar. (129) Bankura. (130) Hooghly and Krishnagar. (131) Daulatpur. (132) Chittagong, Mymensingh, Comilla and Barisal. (133) Gauhati. (134) Conclusion.

Classified list of Colleges and Institutions belonging or affiliated to the Calcutta University.

The following is a classified list of colleges and institutions belonging or affiliated to the Calcutta University. The number given within brackets against each college is the number of students in 1917-18. For further statistical details with regard to these institutions see Volume XIII.

I.—IN BENGAL.

(A) In or near Calcutta.

(i) *Colleges or institutions for Post-Graduate work other than professional.*

1. The University Post-Graduate Classes in Arts* (1,400).
2. The University Post-Graduate Classes in Science* (189).
3. The University College of Science.*
4. The Palit Laboratories, Ballygunj.*

(ii) *Colleges or institutions for work in Arts and Science.*

1. Bangabasi College (1,431).
2. Bethune College (for women) (89)
3. Central College† (642).
4. City College (1,684).
5. Diocesan College for Girls (68).
6. Loreto House (for women)† (22).
7. Presidency College (1,036).‡
8. Ripon College (1,881).
9. Sanskrit College (200).
10. Scottish Churches College (1,142).‡
11. South Suburban College (537).§
12. St. Paul's Cathedral Mission College (238).
13. St. Xavier's College (701).
14. Vidyasagar College (late Metropolitan Institution) (1,805).

(iii) *Professional colleges or institutions.*

Engineering—

1. Civil Engineering College, Sibpur (98).

Law—

2. University Law College* (2,140).
3. Ripon Law College (374).

Medicine—

4. Medical College of Bengal (Calcutta Medical College) (1,041).
5. Belgachia Medical College, Cossipore (164).‖

---

* Under the direct management of the University.

† Second-grade college.

‡ The strength of the Presidency College and of the Scottish Churches College in the first four classes is 733 and 1,127 respectively. The numbers of post-graduate students attached to these classes are 303 and 15 respectively and are included in the totals given for University Post-Graduate Classes in Arts and University Post-Graduate Classes in Science.

§ The South Suburban College was only a second-grade college in 1917-18 and the number of students shown against it belong wholly to the intermediate classes.

‖ Only the first two classes were open in 1917-18 and so the strength of the college is only the total of the two classes.

I.—IN BENGAL—*contd.*

(A) In or near Calcutta—*contd.*

(iii) *Professional colleges or institutions*—contd.

Teaching—

6. David Hare Training College (28).
   Diocesan College for Girls¶ (8).
7. London Missionary Society's Institution** (16).
   Loreto House (for women)¶ (2).

(B) Outside Calcutta.

(i) *Colleges or institutions for work in Arts and Science.*

Bankura—1. Wesleyan College (380).

Barisal—2. Broja Mohan College (630).

Berhampur—3. Krishnath College (1,203).

Burdwan—4. Burdwan Raj College† (171).

Chinsura—5. Hooghly College (249).

Chittagong—6. Chittagong College (328).

Comilla—7. Victoria College†† (604).

Cooch-Behar—8. Victoria College (401).

Dacca—

9. Dacca College (995).
10. Jagannath College (843).

Daulatpur—11. Hindu Academy (489).

Faridpur—12. Rajendra College†§§

Hetampur—13. Krishna Chandra College† (80).

Khulna—14. Bagherhat College†§§

Krishnagar—15. Krishnagar College (243).

Midnapore—16. Midnapore College† (210).

Mymensingh—17. Ananda Mohan College (607).

Narail—18. Victoria College† (161).

Pabna—19. Edward College† (398).

Rajshahi—20. Rajshahi College (779).

Rangpur—21. Carmichael College (402).

Serampore—22. Serampore College (240).

Uttarpara—23. Uttarpara College† (165).

(ii) *Professional colleges.*

Dacca—

1. Dacca Law College (255).
2. Dacca Training College (63).

¶ See also under A(ii) above.
** Was closed in July 1918.
† Second-grade college.
†† Victoria College, Comilla, was not affiliated for the B.A. course in 1917-18 and the strength of the college refers only to the intermediate classes.
§§ The College was started and affiliated only in 1918-19.

II.—IN ASSAM.

(i) *Colleges for work in Arts and Science.*

Gauhati—1. Cotton College (359).

Sylhet—2. Murarichand College (462).

(ii) *Professional college.*

Gauhati—Earle Law College (55).

III.—IN BURMA.

Colleges for work in Arts and Science.

Rangoon—

1. Baptist College (125).
2. Rangoon College (583).

PART I

Analysis
—of—
Present
Conditions

CHAPTER I.

Reference and Procedure of the Commission.

1. We, the members of the Commission appointed by the Governor-General of India in Council to make enquiries and recommendations in regard to the University of Calcutta and its affiliated colleges, have the honour to submit our report.

2. The scope of our enquiry is described in a resolution of the Government of India in the Education Department, no. 783, dated the 14th September, 1917.

"The Governor-General in Council has decided to appoint a Commission to enquire into the condition and prospects of the University of Calcutta and to consider the question of a constructive policy in relation to the questions which it presents. An announcement on the subject was made by His Excellency the Chancellor of the University at the Convocation held on the 6th January, 1917.

2. It is the desire of the Governor-General in Council that the constitution of the Commission should ensure an investigation of the problems connected with the University and the formulation of recommendations in the light of the best expert opinion upon the present requirements of university instruction and organisation. The assistance of His Majesty's Secretary of State was accordingly enlisted for the selection of persons fully acquainted with recent developments of university education in the United Kingdom. With these will be associated three persons competent to advise upon the peculiar conditions which prevail in India. The composition of the Commission will be as follows :—

President.

(1) Dr. M. E. Sadler, C.B., M.A., Litt.D., LL.D., Vice-Chancellor of the University of Leeds.

Members.

(2) Dr. J. W. Gregory, F.R.S., D.Sc., M.I.M.M., Professor of Geology at the University of Glasgow.

(3) Mr. P. J. Hartog, C.I.E., M.A., B.Sc., L-ès-Sc., Academic Registrar University of London.

(4) Professor Ramsay Muir, M.A., Professor of Modern History at the University of Manchester.

(5) The Hon'ble Sir Asutosh Mookerjee, Kt., C.S.I., M.A., D.L., Puisne Judge, High Court of Judicature at Fort William in Bengal.

(6) The Hon'ble Mr. W. W. Hornell, M.R.A.S., M.A., Director of Public Instruction, Bengal.

(7) Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad, C.I.E., M.A., D.Sc., Ph.D., Senior Tutor and Professor of Mathematics, Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College, Aligarh.

Mr. G. Anderson, an Assistant Secretary in the Department of Education of the Government of India, will be Secretary to the Commission.

3. As regards general terms of reference, the Commission will be empowered to enquire into the working of the present organisation of the University of Calcutta and its affiliated colleges, the standards, the examinations and the distribution of teachers; to consider at what places and in what manner provision should be made in Bengal for teaching and research for persons above the secondary school age; to examine the suitability of the present situation and constitution of the University and make such suggestions as may be necessary for their modification; to make recommendations as to the qualifications to be demanded of students on their admission to the University, as to the value to be attached outside the University to the degrees conferred by it and as to the relations which should exist between the University and its colleges or departments and between the University and the Government; and to recommend any changes of constitution, administration and educational policy which may appear desirable.

4. It is expected that the Commission will assemble during the first week in November 1917. The President of the Commission will decide on the times and places of their meeting, on the witnesses to be called and on other similar matters. It is possible that the Commission may, for purposes of comparison, desire to study the organisation and working of universities in India other than that of Calcutta. The Commission will accordingly, through their Secretary acting under instructions from the President, correspond direct with local Governments, the universities and any educational officers and local authorities with whom direct communication may be authorised by local Governments as a matter of convenience. The Governor-General in Council trusts that all communications or requests for information which may be issued by the Commission may be treated as urgent and that, in the event of the Commission or its members visiting any locality, every facility may be afforded for their enquiries."

ORDERED that a copy of this Resolution be forwarded to all local Governments and Administrations.

ORDERED also that a copy of the Resolution be forwarded to the Finance and Foreign and Political Departments of the Government of India, to the President and Members of the Commission and that the Resolution be published in the Supplement to the *Gazette of India*.

H. SHARP,

Officiating Secretary to the Government of India.

3. In addition to the main reference, we have received the following subsidiary references :—

(*a*) " The question of recognition of the proposed school final examination for secondary English schools in Bengal as a qualifying test for direct admission to the university courses."[1]

(*b*) " The institution of a diploma in spoken English at the Calcutta University."[2]

(*c*) " The draft regulations for examinations in agriculture, technology and commerce " passed by the Senate of the Calcutta University on March 23rd, 1918.[3]

4. The President and those of our number who had been appointed in London arrived in Bombay on Sunday, October 28th, 1917; Sir Asutosh Mookerjee joined the Commission in Bombay on October 30th; Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad, on November 2nd at Poona; and Mr. Hornell, during the journey to Allahabad, on November 6th.

5. We reached Calcutta on Sunday, November 11th, and held our first meeting on the next day in the old Legislative Council Chamber which was reserved for our use. In the cold weather of 1918-19 we were accommodated in the same building through the kindness of Mr. H. S. Heysham.

6. We were anxious to receive guidance as soon as possible from the experience of those who were connected with, or interested in, the subject of our enquiry; and we made it our first duty to draw up a questionnaire which was circulated on November 26th to the Bengal members of the Imperial Legislative Council, the members of the Bengal Legislative Council, the ordinary fellows of Calcutta University, the members of the Post-Graduate Councils in Arts and Science, directors of public instruction, principals of colleges, inspectors and head masters of schools, the vice-chancellors of all Indian universities, and selected persons in Bengal and elsewhere, including landowners and members of the commercial community. In order that no one with evidence to offer should be precluded from submitting his recommendations to us, the

[1] Letter from the Government of India, no. 883 of October 30th, 1917.

[2] Letter from the Government of India, no. 752 of September 2nd, 1918.

[3] Letter from the Government of India, no. 481 of June 12th, 1918.

following communiqué was published in the Press in February 1918 :—

"The Calcutta University Commission have now received numerous replies to the set of questions issued by them in November last. Any communications which it may be desired to make to the Commission in regard to the questions or to other matters should be addressed to the Secretary of the Commission."

Copies of the questionnaire were forwarded to 671 persons or associations ; and 412 replies were received.[1]

7. The response to our enquiry was very full and varied. The volumes which contain the answers to the questions and other documents provide a survey and discussion from many points of view of the present conditions of higher and secondary education in Bengal. We desire to offer our thanks to our witnesses and correspondents, without whose assistance it would not have been possible for us fully to carry out the duties which have been entrusted to us. The evidence has been arranged in the order of questions. The proofs of the written answers and of the oral evidence have been forwarded to witnesses for their corrections ; and care has been taken to prevent mistakes. Should any have crept into the printed text, we offer our apology.

8. The questions which we circulated were framed in the following terms ; and correspondents were invited also to submit any suggestions or recommendations on aspects of the university problem in which they were specially interested and which were not covered by the questions.

"1. Do you consider that the existing system of university education affords to young Indians of ability full opportunity of obtaining the highest training ? If not, in what main respects do you consider the existing system deficient from this point of view ?

2. Do you consider that university training at its best involves—

(*a*) that the students should be placed under the personal guidance of teachers of first-rate ability and of recognised standing in their subjects ;

(*b*) that the teachers and students alike should have access to well-appointed libraries and laboratories ;

(*c*) that there should be a large degree of freedom of teaching and of study ; and

[1] The list of correspondents is printed in full in the volume of appendices to this report.

(*d*) that the teachers should have sufficient leisure to be able to pursue independent investigation in their own subjects ?

If you share this view as to the functions of a university, do you consider that the ideal is attained or attainable under the existing system in Bengal ? If you hold that the standard indicated above cannot fairly be applied, please explain your reasons for this conclusion.

3. What resources exist in Calcutta for the formation of a great centre of learning such as other cities of comparable size possess ? How far are these resources organised to serve this purpose ? What changes, if any, and what expansions would you suggest ?

4. (*i*) If you have studied the Dacca University scheme, have you any suggestions to make with regard to it ?

(*ii*) Do you think that universities on the lines of the Dacca scheme, or on other lines, could, with advantage, be established at other centres of population within the Presidency, either now or in the future ? If so, what centres would you suggest ?

5. (*i*) What, in your view, should be the relation between the University and colleges situated—

(*a*) in the university town ; and
(*b*) in other centres of population in the Presidency ?

(*ii*) How would you propose to ensure that every institution at which students are permitted to follow the course for a university degree is adequately staffed, and adequately equipped ?

(*iii*) To what extent do you consider it possible to grant to colleges some degree of freedom in the design of their courses and, under proper safeguards, in the conduct of the examinations of their students for university degrees ?

(*iv*) Should it be found practicable so to organise the intellectual resources of Calcutta as to create a powerful centralised teaching university in that city, how would you propose to deal with colleges not incorporated in that University ? Would you favour—

(*a*) the creation of a new controlling body to regulate the studies and examinations of such colleges, or
(*b*) the maintenance, as far as possible, of the existing system, or
(*c*) the establishment of a new kind of relationship between the University and such colleges, which would allow some autonomy to the latter ?

6. What are the callings and professions which are necessary for service to, and the advancement of, India and for which a high degree of training is required ? How far do the special needs, and the traditions and characteristic powers of India differentiate her requirements in these respects from those of other regions and notably from those of Great Britain ?

How far are these requirements met by the University and how far should it be within the province of the University to meet them ?

7. (*i*) Should the University provide or recognise approved courses of instruction in applied science and technology (including such departments as engineering, agriculture, and commercial science) as qualifying for degrees or diplomas or both ? Should the University also provide facilities for research in these branches of knowledge ?

(*ii*) Do you think that higher technological training should, or should not, be segregated from other branches of higher education ?

(*iii*) If, in your judgment, various branches of applied science and technology should be recognised as departments of university teaching and research,

(*a*) what safeguards would you suggest in order to secure that every university student of applied science and technology should also receive adequate training in pure science ?

(*b*) what relations should be established between the University and technological institutions including those which have at present no connexion with the university organisation ?

8. Are you satisfied with the present conditions of admission to the University of Calcutta and, if not, what changes would you suggest ?

9. We desire to ascertain the views of our correspondents as to the use and abuse of examinations with special reference to the educational opportunities and needs of Bengal. Will you favour us with your observations on the following points :—

(*i*) Whether, in your judgment, there is validity in the criticism that, in the existing university system, teaching is unduly subordinated to examination ?

(*ii*) Whether an attempt should be made to reduce the rigidity of the examination system and, if so, whether you consider that the use made of examinations might be varied to meet the needs of different subjects of study and of different groups of students in one or more of the following ways :—

(*a*) the teaching might for certain purposes be defined, as at present, by prescribed examination requirements,

(*b*) the teacher might be left with a maximum of freedom and the examinations be adjusted to the courses given by individual teachers,

(*c*) in some particular subjects or sections of a subject, though teaching might be given, there might be no test by a formal university examination.

(*iii*) The limits within which examinations may serve as a test of fitness for a specific career :—

e.g.,—the professions of medicine, law, teaching and engineering ; agriculture ; commerce and industry (including the aspects both of management and of scientific guidance and research) ; and administration in the public service.

(*We shall be glad if our correspondents will concentrate their attention on the points in which they are most interested.*)

10. Have you any further suggestions to make as to the improvement of the existing methods of the university examinations ?

11. (*i*) Do you hold that English should be used as the medium of instruction and of examination at every stage above the matriculation in the university course ?

(*ii*) (*a*) If your answer to (*i*) is in the affirmative, do you consider that university students have on their entrance to the University an adequate command of English ?

(*b*) To what extent do you think that English should be used as the medium of instruction in secondary schools for those students who are being prepared for the matriculation ?

(*c*) Are you satisfied with the kind of training now given in English before entrance to the University ? If not, what improvements do you suggest ?

(*d*) Would you draw a distinction, both in school and university, between practical training in the use of the English language and training in the study of English literature ?

(*e*) Do you think that the matriculation examination in all subjects should be conducted in English ?

(*f*) Do you think that English should be taught to all students during their university course and, if so, what kind of teaching would you advocate for those students whose general course of study may be other than linguistic ?

(*iii*) If your answer to (*i*) is in the negative (*i.e.*, if you think that English should not be used as the medium of instruction and of examination at every stage in the university course above the matriculation), what changes would you recommend, and at what stages in the university and pre-university courses ?

12. Do you think that the University should do more than is now done to encourage the scientific study of the vernaculars of the Presidency ? If so, what changes would you advocate ?

13. Are there any branches of science or learning not now represented in the curricula of, or not actually taught in, secondary schools in Bengal, and the University of Calcutta or its colleges, which, in your judgment, it is of importance to introduce ?

14. What, in your judgment, should be the relations of the Government of India and of the Provincial Government to the university or universities of a province such as Bengal ?

15. Do you hold it to be advantageous or the reverse,

(*a*) to the public services,
(*b*) to the students,
(*c*) to the progress and advancement of learning,

that university examinations should be regarded as the qualification for posts under Government ? Would you advocate the practice, adopted in many other countries, of instituting special tests for different kinds of administrative posts under Government ?

16. What steps would you recommend for the encouragement and stimulation of independent investigation into Indian and other problems among the alumni of the University ? Do you hold that the chief root of such work must be the existence of a widespread and genuine intellectual curiosity among the students ? Do you consider that the existing system creates and develops such curiosity ?

17. Do you consider that the conditions under which many students live

(*a*) in Calcutta,

(*b*) elsewhere in Bengal,

are such as to undermine traditional morality and family ties, or to be deleterious to the character or physical health of the students ? If so, to what causes do you attribute this, and will you suggest the steps which, in your opinion, should be taken to secure for the students wise guidance in matters of moral principle and of personal hygiene ; protection against injurious influences ; fuller opportunities for physical exercise and training ; and the discipline and comradeship of corporate life ?

18. What is your experience as to the health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal ? Have you any reason for thinking that the present system imposes an undue physical or mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust ? If so, please suggest remedies.

19. Will you contribute any suggestions arising from your experience regarding the organisation of residential arrangements for students, including hostels, messes and lodgings ?

In regard to hostels and ' attached messes,' will you discuss especially—

(*a*) the relation of these institutions to the University as well as to the colleges ;

(*b*) the functions and status which you would give to the Superintendent ;

(*c*) the methods of management, control and inspection ;

(*d*) the proper equipment of a hostel, including kitchen and dining-room arrangements, provision for the treatment of illness, library facilities, etc ;

(*e*) the best size for hostels ;

(*f*) the desirability of their providing tutorial assistance ?

In dealing with these problems, we beg that you will have careful regard to what you deem to be financially practicable.

20. Do you consider that the financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal are employed in the most economical way ? If not, with a view to the strengthening and expansion of higher education, can you suggest some form of university organisation which, while securing economical administration, would make a more powerful appeal for support from private liberality as well as from public sources ?

21. Have you any suggestions or criticisms to offer with regard to the proposal that the University (and such of its constituent colleges as may

desire) should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs, with a view to facilitating—

(*a*) an expansion of the activities of the University ;
(*b*) the erection of suitable buildings for colleges and residences for teachers and students ; and, generally,
(*c*) the growth of corporate university life.

22. To what extent do you consider that the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered—

(*a*) in the government of the University,
(*b*) in its courses of study,
(*c*) in its residential and other arrangements ?

23. (*i*) Are there any points in which your answers to the foregoing questions would be different in respect of the needs of men and of women ?

(*ii*) To what extent, and in what fields, are additional and special facilities for higher education required for women ?

(*iii*) What are the peculiar difficulties and needs which affect the higher education of women in India ? "

9. We also obtained from the colleges and institutions of the University of Calcutta statistical and other information of fundamental importance for the consideration of our problem, which is printed in Volume XIII. It relates to (1) the number of students in each class ; (2) the number of students attending the classes for a second or later year, after failure at an examination ; (3) the territorial origin of the students ; (4) the number of Muslim students ; (5) the residential accommodation of students ; (6) the work and salary of teachers ; (7) the security of tenure, age of retirement of the staff, and the arrangements, if any, for superannuation allowances, etc ; (8) the published contributions by members of the staffs to the advancement of science or learning ; (9) the number of working days in the session (a number which varies greatly from college to college) ; (10) the interval between the first day of the session and the beginning of the teaching work, in the first and third years ; (11) classes, if any, other than classes held in connexion with university examinations ; (12) attendance at the classes of persons other than candidates for university examinations. We are much indebted to the authorities of the colleges for the great trouble which they have taken in this matter.

We desire also to record our thanks to the registrars and other authorities of the other Indian universities, and to the various heads of the departments of public instruction, including those of Hyderabad and Mysore, for much information courteously furnished to us.

10. We hope that it will be found possible to publish the evidence in full because, as will be seen from our report, our analysis of the existing conditions and our recommendations are largely based upon it. We have constantly taken into consideration the constructive suggestions which we have received and have tried to show how far we are supported, either in our criticism or proposals, by the body of our evidence.

11. Concurrently with the preparation of the answers to our questions, we endeavoured to obtain a first-hand knowledge of the work conducted by the University, and by the colleges, schools and other educational institutions connected with it. We visited all these colleges, and many of the schools, hostels and other educational institutions in the city of Calcutta. Our usual procedure was first to hold a preliminary discussion with the principal, to enquire into the administrative organisation of the institution, to examine the time-tables, the registers of admission and attendance of students, the supervision of their residence, the conduct of college examinations, the accounts and minutes of the governing body. With the consent of the authorities concerned, we then had an opportunity, individually or in small groups, of attending a number of lectures in all subjects. We also inspected the library, examined the register of books taken out by the students, and noted more particularly the type of book which seemed popular with them. In some of the colleges which we visited, we were able to confer with the members of the staff. At such gatherings we were able to learn at first-hand difficulties which might otherwise have escaped our notice. We also enjoyed conversations with many of the students who talked to us with freedom. We desire to express our thanks for the help which was thus given us, and for the courtesy with which we were received. We are sensible of the inconvenience which may be caused by the appearance of strangers during a college lecture and therefore appreciate all the more the welcome which we received on entering the lecture rooms.

12. We have also visited the various centres of university teaching in the mufassal. In some of our tours we found it necessary to split up into groups, a practice which, though open to obvious objection, was imposed upon us by the limited time at our disposal. The whole Commission visited Dacca, Berhampur, Cooch Behar, Rangpur, Serampore and Rajshahi; and all collegiate

centres in Bengal were visited by some members of the Commission except, much to our regret, the three second-grade colleges at Pabna, Hetampur and Narail. We were thus enabled to appreciate the educational activities of the Bengal mufassal as well as to gain an insight into its educational needs.

13. In our visits to the mufassal we had to adopt a procedure slightly different from that pursued in Calcutta. We visited the colleges and schools as well as some *tôls* and madrassahs; and also received deputations from leading citizens, held interviews and examined witnesses. This procedure enabled us to obtain on the same day not only an experience of the colleges and schools but also suggestions for their improvement. We desire to record our thanks to all, officials, college and school authorities, students and others, who assisted us in so many ways during our enquiry in the mufassal. Wherever we went, we were received with the greatest courtesy and hospitality; great pains were taken in arranging our programme so as to use our time in the most economical way.

14. At Dacca, where we made a longer stay than was possible in the other mufassal centres, we received valuable help from Mr. F. C. French, Commissioner, Dacca Division, Mr. W. A. J. Archbold, Principal, Dacca College, Rai Lalitmohan Chatterjee Bahadur, Principal, Jagannath College, and many others to whom we are indebted.

15. We gladly accepted the invitation of His Highness the Maharaja of Cooch Behar to visit his State. We visited the Victoria College and some of the schools and hostels. We also held a conference with Mr. Narendra Nath Sen, the Diwan, Mr. J. A. Milligan, Superintendent of the State, the principal of the college and his staff.

16. Though the province of Assam was not definitely included in our terms of reference, the fact that there are two colleges in that province which are affiliated to the University of Calcutta brought it directly within the scope of our enquiry. We therefore readily accepted the invitation of Sir Archdale Earle, the Chief Commissioner, to visit Assam. Four of our members—the others being then in another part of India—spent a few days in Gauhati and Shillong. In the former place they visited the Cotton and Earle Law Colleges, and held discussions with a number of official

and non-official representatives. We regret that we have been unable to visit Sylhet, but Rai Bahadur Promode Chandra Dutta kindly journeyed to Shillong and explained the requirements of that locality to those of us who were present. We wish to express our gratitude to Sir Archdale Earle and those others who arranged our tour in Assam.

17. The province of Burma, though its colleges and some of its high English schools have connexion with the University of Calcutta, was not explicitly within the terms of our reference, and the proposal for the establishment of a university at Rangoon is a problem which we were not invited as a Commission to discuss. A suggestion was made that some of our members should visit Burma at the conclusion or in the course of our enquiry, but the continuous claims of the work of the Commission in Bengal made it impossible for any of us to go to that province for this purpose. In framing our recommendations we have borne in mind the special circumstances which arise from the present association of the University of Calcutta with parts of the educational system in Burma and we have held in view the changes which will necessarily follow upon the foundation of the new university in that province.

18. During our visits to colleges, both in Calcutta and in the mufassal, we paid particular attention to the question of students' residence and the general conditions of student life. Either singly or in groups we have visited a very large number of hostels and messes, both attached and unattached, as we considered that they form a very important element in the problem submitted to us.

19. After visiting the colleges and schools and having by that time received the answers of our correspondents to our questionnaire, we spent the month of February and part of March in Calcutta in the further examination of witnesses,[1] some of whom travelled long distances for the purpose. In all, 91 witnesses gave evidence before us in Calcutta; and later, in Darjeeling, Mr. Surendranath Banerjee and Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury. Summaries of the evidence given by most of the witnesses are given in an appendix.

[1] The list of people consulted is printed in the volume of appendices to this report.

20. One of these witnesses was the late Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee. On the news of his death on Tuesday, December 3rd, we passed the following resolution which was forwarded to his son :—

"The members of the Calcutta University Commission have received with deep regret the news of the death of Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee and desire to express their sympathy with his family in their bereavement. They feel that in him Bengal loses one of its great educational leaders, revered for his learning and courtesy and still more for the nobility of his character. By his writings, and by his active participation in the work of the University of Calcutta, in his earlier years as a teacher, afterwards as its Vice-Chancellor and as a member of the Senate, he had great influence upon university policy in the Presidency and upon public opinion in regard to educational questions. The Commission desire to record their obligation to his wide experience and to the valuable communications which he made to them in the course of their enquiry."

21. During the examination of witnesses in Calcutta we realised the necessity of consulting representatives of certain types of colleges upon various schemes which we were considering. We therefore addressed a series of letters[1] to representatives of all the Calcutta and mufassal colleges in Bengal, except those which are Government institutions. A very large number of the gentlemen to whom we sent invitations were able to meet us in Calcutta. Five conferences in all were held; with Anglican, non-episcopal and Roman Catholic missionaries, with representatives of other private colleges in Calcutta and with representatives of other private colleges in the mufassal. We felt that, owing to the probable inclusion of the Jagannath College in the proposed University of Dacca, it would be more convenient to ascertain the views of the authorities of that college separately. The principal, Rai Lalitmohan Chatterjee Bahadur, and Mr. E. E. Biss, the nominee of the President of the Governing Body, accordingly visited us at a later date in Darjeeling. We desire to express our thanks to the members of these conferences for the help which they gave us.

22. In our terms of reference it is stated that "the Commission may, for purposes of comparison, desire to study the organisation and working of universities in India other than that of Calcutta." The visits which we made to Bombay, Poona and Allahabad during the course of our journey to Calcutta helped us to realise the value of this suggestion. With the assistance of Mr. (now Sir) Chimanlal Setalvad and of Mr. A. L. Covernton, Principal, Elphinstone

[1] These letters are printed in the volume of appendices to this report.

College, in Bombay, of Mr. J. G. Covernton, Director of Public Instruction, in Poona, and of the late Sir Sundar Lal and Mr. C. F. de la Fosse, Director of Public Instruction, in Allahabad, we were enabled to gain a general but valuable impression of the educational organisation and requirements of these cities.

23. We therefore thought it desirable for purposes of comparison to see something of Southern India. We first visited Hyderabad, where Mr. M. A. N. Hydari and Mr. Ross Masood discussed with us the plans of the Osmania University and gave us an opportunity of studying valuable experiments in the teaching of English. We next visited Bangalore where, by the kindness of Mr. H. V. Cobb, the Resident, Sir M. Visvesvaraya, the Diwan, and Sir Alfred Bourne, we were able to see the Indian Institute of Science and the Central College, Bangalore. In Mysore city, the Vice-Chancellor, Mr. H. V. Nanjundayya, and the Registrar, Mr. T. Denham, showed us the new University, in which His Highness the Maharaja is deeply interested. We also had the pleasure of meeting the staff and students of the University.

24. At Madras we stayed four days. The help given us by the Vice-Chancellor, Sir P. S. Sivaswamy Aiyer, the Director of Public Instruction, Mr. (now Sir) J. H. Stone, and the Registrar, Mr. F. Dewsbury, enabled us to see a large number of institutions. We spent a few hours at Saidapet where Mr. H. S. Duncan conducted us over the Training College, an institution which plays a very important part in the educational life of the Madras Presidency. Through the personal kindness of many residents we had several opportunities of making the acquaintance of many of the leading educationists in Madras. Sir Asutosh Mookerjee visited colleges and schools in Trichinopoly.

25. Although the Commission as a whole was unable to make a tour in the north-west of India as they desired, individual members or bodies of members visited the following places :—Dr. Gregory, Mr. Hartog and Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad visited Benares, Cawnpore, Lucknow, Roorkee, Lahore, Delhi, Aligarh and Agra ; Dr. Zia-ud-din Ahmad and Dr. Gregory, Patna ; and Mr. Muir spent a few days in Lahore where he held some conferences on the invitation of the University of the Punjab. Dr. Gregory also accepted invitations from Pusa, Dhanbaid, Ranchi, Jharia, Giridih, Sakchi, Dishergarh and Nagpur ; Mr. Hornell accompanied Mr. Low and Mr.

Chatterton to Jamalpur for the purpose of seeing the railway workshops and schools; the President and Sir Asutosh Mookerjee paid visits to Dehra Dun, Aligarh, the Gurukul at Hardwar, and Benares; and the President to Sir Rabindranath Tagore's school at Bolpur.

26. We reached Darjeeling early in April, 1918. Our first work was to analyse the written evidence (extending to six volumes) which had been furnished to us in reply to our questionnaire, and to discuss a series of provisional resolutions prepared as a basis for the recommendations to be made in our report. The evidence, which deals with the many aspects of a very complicated problem, proved to be of even greater importance than we had anticipated alike in its criticisms of the operation of the existing system and in constructive suggestions for its improvement. In confirmation of the impressions which we had formed in the course of our personal enquiries, it disclosed the urgent need for reform and the far-reaching nature of the changes which any effective reform must involve. Our discussions opened out new branches of the subject and showed conclusively that any well-considered proposals for change must be based upon careful investigation of the needs and possible development of the whole of higher secondary and university education in Bengal, including those parts of technological and professional training which are or should be associated with the University. It became clear also that the issues which it was our duty to consider with special reference to Bengal had a direct bearing upon the present organisation of universities in the other parts of India and that, in considering what should be recommended for Bengal, we must keep in mind the wider implications of our plan. The nature of the problem referred to us, the interdependence of its various parts and its connexion with the corresponding problems in other parts of India, compelled us to the conclusion that our report should deal systematically with the issues of fundamental importance which necessarily arise in any plan for effective reform. To the preparation of such a report, based upon the evidence which we have received and upon the results of our personal enquiries, we have devoted the subsequent months of our work in Darjeeling and Calcutta. We have explored the problem in its various branches and have weighed the important and difficult questions of principle which are involved in it.

27. In the course of our work, we have held 191 meetings of the Commission, in addition to the less formal discussions which took place during our visits to colleges in Calcutta and the mufassal.

28. Our report being not yet complete when the Subjects Committee appointed in connexion with the Reforms met in Calcutta, we prepared for its use, by the instruction of His Excellency the Viceroy, a brief summary of our recommendations in so far as they bore upon the subjects under consideration by the Committee. A copy of this summary report will be found in an appendix.[1]

29. We now desire to offer our thanks to the very many people who have assisted us in our work; to the officers of the Government of India, in particular to Sir Sankaran Nair and Sir Edward Maclagan, for placing at our disposal the official records, and to Mr. H. Sharp, Educational Commissioner, and Mr. G. R. Kaye, Curator, Bureau of Education, for valuable information; to the officers of the Government of Bengal, in particular to Sir Satyendra Prasanna (now Lord) Sinha, the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, Mr. J. H. Kerr, Chief Secretary, Mr. L. S. S. O'Malley, Secretary, General Department, and Mr. W. C. Wordsworth, Officiating Director of Public Instruction; to Mr. C. P. Walsh and Mr. Zorab who arranged accommodation for us in Calcutta and Darjeeling; to Mr. W. R. Gourlay, Private Secretary to His Excellency the Governor of Bengal, and many others; to the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Calcutta (the Chief Justice of Bengal), the late Vice-Chancellor, Sir Deva Prasad Sarbadhikary, Dr. Brühl, the late Registrar, Mr. K. L. Datta, the officiating Registrar, and Mr. A. C. Bose, Controller of Examinations, for the records of the University which have been supplied to us; to the college and school authorities for their ready answers to our enquiries; to Mr. A. F. Scholfield, Officer in charge of the records of the Government of India, and Mr. S. C. Sanyal of that Department; to Mr. Chapman, Librarian of the Imperial Library; to the railway officials who provided so considerately for our comfort and convenience; to the Director-General, Posts and Telegraphs, for the arrangement of our correspondence; and to Colonel H. H. Turner, Superintendent, Map Publication, Survey of India, for the preparation

[1] See the volume of appendices to this report.

of the maps included in our report. The printing of our report and its numerous appendices has placed a heavy burden on Mr. J. J. Meikle, Superintendent, Government Printing, and the members of his staff, and we desire to record our appreciation of the work which they have carried out on our behalf. Mr. K. Zachariah, Professor of History, Presidency College, Calcutta, was deputed for service with the Commission during part of the university vacation, 1918. He gave us valuable assistance in the preparation of some of the materials for our report, especially through his fresh knowledge of undergraduate life in India and in England.

30. We thank our hosts and hostesses for their individual kindness to us. Their number is so great that we are unable to mention all by name, but we specially record our thanks to His Exalted Highness the Nizam of Hyderabad, His Highness the Maharaja of Mysore, Their Excellencies Lord and Lady Willingdon, Their Excellencies Lord and Lady Pentland, and His Honour Sir Harcourt Butler.

31. We desire to record our special and continuing obligation to His Excellency Lord Ronaldshay, Governor of Bengal, for assistance which has been invaluable to us throughout our enquiry. His and Lady Ronaldshay's prolonged and generous hospitality, especially to those members of the Commission who came to Calcutta from England, rendered possible the completion of our report in India instead of (as had been originally proposed) in England where the necessary documents and other sources of information would not have been so conveniently accessible.

32. We take this opportunity of expressing our cordial appreciation of the services rendered to the Commission by our Secretary, Mr. G. Anderson, Assistant Secretary in the Department of Education of the Government of India, and Professor of History, Elphinstone College, Bombay. His intimate knowledge of university problems in India and his keen interest in all proposals which have been made for their solution have been of very great value to us throughout our enquiry. But we are indebted in no less degree to his insight into the needs of Indian students, to his sympathy with them in their difficulties, and to his sense of the fundamental importance of the human side of the problems into which it has been our duty to enquire.

33. We desire also to make warm acknowledgment of the ability and devotion with which Mr. G. E. Jackson has discharged his responsible duties as Superintendent of the office of the Commission, and of the loyal and strenuous service of all the members of our staff.

CHAPTER II.

Preliminary Observations.

I.

One of the most remarkable features in the recent history of Bengal, and, indeed, of India, has been the very rapid increase in the number of university students which has taken place during the last two decades, and more especially since the Universities Act of 1904. In 1904, 2,430 candidates presented themselves for the intermediate examination[1] of the University of Madras, 457 for that of Bombay, and 3,832 for that of Calcutta. These numbers in themselves were striking enough, considering that the universities were in 1904 less than fifty years old. But the numbers in 1917 were 5,424 for Madras, 1,281 for Bombay, and no less than 8,020 for Calcutta. This means that while the increase in numbers has everywhere been striking, it has been much greater in Bengal than in any other part of India; nor is it easy to find any parallel to it in any part of the world. The flood of candidates for university training has put so heavy a strain upon the University and its colleges as to lead almost to a breakdown. It has brought out in high relief every deficiency of the system. And if justice is to be done to a great opportunity, and the eagerness of young Bengalis for academic training is to be made as advantageous to their country as it ought to be, it has become manifest that bold and drastic changes and improvements in the system are necessary.

2. The full significance of these facts can perhaps be most clearly brought out by a comparison between Bengal and the United Kingdom. The populations of the two countries are almost the same—about 45,000,000. By a curious coincidence the number of students preparing for university degrees is also almost the

[1] The number of candidates for the intermediate examination is chosen in preference to the number of matriculates because Madras has abandoned the matriculation in favour of a school-leaving examination; and also because the intermediate figure shows the number of persons who have not merely passed the matriculation, but proceeded to a university course.

same—about 26,000.[1] But since in Bengal only about one in ten of the population can read and write, the proportion of the educated classes of Bengal who are taking full-time university courses is almost ten times as great as in the United Kingdom.

3. Nor is this the most striking part of the contrast. The figures for the United Kingdom include students drawn from all parts of the British Empire, including Bengal itself; those of Bengal are purely Indian. Again, in the United Kingdom a substantial proportion of the student-population consists of women; in Bengal the number of women-students is—and in view of existing social conditions is likely long to remain—very small indeed. Still more important, in the United Kingdom a very large proportion of the student-population are following professional courses, in medicine, law, theology, teaching, engineering or technical science. In Bengal, though the number of students of law is very great, the number of medical students is much smaller than in the United Kingdom; there are very few students of engineering; students of theology, whether Hindu or Islamic, do not study for university degrees; students of teaching are extraordinarily few; and there are, as yet, practically no students of technical science, because the scientific industries of Bengal are in their infancy, and draw their experts mainly from England.

4. It appears, therefore, that while an enormously higher proportion of the educated male population of Bengal proceeds to university studies than is the case in the United Kingdom, a very much smaller proportion goes to the University for what is ordinarily described as vocational training. The great majority—over 22,000 out of 26,000—pursue purely literary courses which do not fit them for any but administrative, clerical, teaching and (indirectly) legal careers. In the United Kingdom (if the training of teachers be regarded as vocational training) it is possible that these proportions would be nearly reversed. A comparison with any other large and populous state would yield similar results.

[1] The number of students in Bengal was in 1917-18 just under 26,000; the number of 'full-time' students in the United Kingdom in the year before the War was 26,710 (*see* tables published in *Nature*, August 15th, 1918, page 474). The 'full-time' students included many who were not preparing for degrees. In Bengal all students are preparing for degrees. In the United Kingdom there were also a number of students taking one or two courses, but not giving their whole time to university work. There is no parallel to this class in Bengal.

Bengal is unlike any other civilised country in that so high a proportion of its educated classes set before them a university degree as the natural goal of ambition, and seek this goal by means of studies which are almost purely literary in character, and which therefore provide scarcely any direct professional training.

5. Yet another feature of the contrast, not only between Bengal and the United Kingdom, but between Bengal and all other countries with a student-population of comparable size, is the fact that while other countries have many universities, Bengal has only one. The 26,000 students of the United Kingdom are divided among eighteen universities, which vary widely in type; the 26,000 students of Bengal are all brought under the control of a single vast university mechanism, follow in each subject the same courses of study, read the same books, and undergo the same examinations. The University of Calcutta is, in respect of the number of its students, the largest university in the world. But it is a commonplace that a university, just because it is concerned with so individual a business as the training of the mind, can easily become too large. When the students of Berlin approached five figures, it was felt that their numbers were becoming too great to be effectively dealt with by a single organisation, even though they were all gathered in a single city. The University of Calcutta has to deal with 26,000 students scattered over an immense province wherein communications are very difficult; it is responsible also for the educational control of more than eight hundred schools, a function such as no university outside of India is called upon to perform; and under these conditions it is unreasonable to expect that its governing bodies should be able to deal with their immense and complex task in a wholly satisfactory way.

6. The striking facts which we have attempted to set forth briefly above can only be understood in the light of the social conditions of the country, and of the historical development of its educational system. On these subjects we shall have something to say in the following pages. But in the meanwhile there is one part of the explanation which ought to be noted at once, since it may help to correct some false judgments formed on a superficial consideration of the figures. As we shall demonstrate later, the secondary school system of Bengal as a whole is extremely inefficient. It is impossible for the vast majority of Bengali boys to obtain from their schools a really sound general education, such

as the schools of many other countries provide. For that purpose —and especially in order to obtain a good working knowledge of English, which is necessary for all important avocations—the young Bengali must go on to the university course; and having once begun it, he is naturally ambitious to pursue it to the end. As a very large number of our witnesses and correspondents have urged, the first two years of the present university course are occupied with what is really school work. The students in these two years form about 15,000 out of the total of 26,000. Only the remaining 11,000 are in any strict sense to be described as university students, except by the accident of organisation which places them under university control.

7. But even if we consider only this reduced number, it is difficult to resist the conclusion that an unduly large proportion of the able young men of Bengal are being trained in a manner too purely literary. Evidence from all sides, from Indians and Englishmen alike, shows that though some few have found the fullest scope for their abilities, and are occupying with distinction positions of the highest importance, and though practically all the graduates of the University do find employment of one sort or another, there is in Bengal a large number of men who, after having either obtained university degrees, or reached an earlier stage in the university course, find that there are no outlets available for them such as their academic standing justifies them in expecting. At first they not unnaturally "decline to take any post which they consider an inadequate recognition of the credential which has rewarded their laborious efforts. They thus lose chances, and sometimes spend months or years loitering about some district headquarters, and living on the joint family to which they belong. As a general rule, they sooner or later accommodate themselves to circumstances, but often with an exceedingly bad grace, and with a strong sense of injury."[1] When we consider the humble status and low pay of many of the posts with which university graduates are compelled to be content, it is impossible not to recognise that there is some justification for this sense of injury. It is impossible, also, not to recognise that a system which leads to such results must be economically wasteful and socially

[1] Bengal District Administration Committee Report, 1914, pages 13-14.

dangerous, and must in the end lead to the intellectual impoverishment of the country.

8. It is inevitable that men of ability who, after an arduous training, find themselves in such a situation should be deeply discontented, and should be inclined to lay the blame—as is the natural temptation of the dissatisfied in all lands, and above all in India—upon the Government of their country. The anarchist movement which has been so distressing a feature of recent years in Bengal has, by some, been attributed largely to the influence of these discontented classes; and undoubtedly it has drawn from among them many of its recruits. This does not mean that the colleges of the University have been, as has sometimes been alleged, in any large degree centres of revolutionary activity. Naturally the wave of unrest which has passed over Bengal has found a readier welcome among students than in other classes of the population; the ferment of new political ideas, drawn from the West, has of course worked most strongly among the students of western politics and thought. But, according to the Bengal District Administration Committee, whose opinion in this matter is confirmed by that of the Sedition Committee of 1918,[1] it has been in some of the high schools, rather than in the colleges, that the more reckless agitators have found their most fruitful fields. The reasoned discipline of scholarship is hostile to the madness of anarchy; and the better that discipline is made, the more sane and healthy must be its influence.

9. Nevertheless it must be admitted that the existence, and the steady increase, of a sort of intellectual proletariat not without reasonable grievances, forms a menace to good government, especially in a country where, as in Bengal, the small educated class is alone vocal. It must be an equal menace whatever form the Government may assume. So long as the great mass of the nation's intelligent manhood is driven, in ever increasing numbers, along the same, often unfruitful, course of study, which creates expectations that cannot be fulfilled, and actually unfits those who pursue it from undertaking many useful occupations necessary for the welfare of the community, any Government, however it may be constituted, whether it be bureaucratic or popular, must find its work hampered by an unceasing stream of criticism, and of natural demands for relief which cannot possibly be met.

[1] See the figures given in the appendix to their report.

10. The growing demand of the people of Bengal for educational facilities is one of the most impressive features of our age. It is in itself altogether healthy and admirable. It is increasing in strength and volume every year. But, owing in part to social conditions, and in part to the educational methods which the traditions of the last half-century have established, this powerful movement is following unhealthy and unprofitable channels; and unless new courses can be cut for it, the flood may devastate instead of fertilising the country. Thus the problem with which we have to deal is by no means purely an academic or intellectual problem. It is a social, political and economic problem of the most complex and difficult character; and the longer the solution is postponed. the more difficult it will be. Its very elements cannot be understood without some understanding of the social conditions from which it has arisen.

II.

11. The rapid growth in the number of university students which has taken place during the last two generations in western countries has been due very largely to the growth of industrial and commercial enterprise, which demanded, in the first place, an army of scientific experts and of administrators with wide outlook and trained imagination, and in the second place, an army of teachers able to create educated managers, clerks and workpeople. Until these demands became urgent, a quite modest number of graduates met all the needs of the old learned professions in all the western countries. But the yet more rapid increase of university students in Bengal has not been due to any such cause. It must be attributed in a large degree to social usages and traditions which are peculiar to India, and specially strong in Bengal.

12. In spite of their marked intellectual gifts, the Bengalis have not, especially since the Industrial Revolution, shown much capacity or inclination for commerce or industry. They have allowed even the retail trade of their own country to be captured, in a remarkable degree, by the Marwaris of Rajputana. The export trade of the country is mainly in the hands of Europeans, Armenians and Japanese. Since the days when the old handloom weaving industry was beaten by the products of machinery, the Bengali has taken very little part in the development

of those large-scale industries to which the soil and climate of his country lend themselves.[1] With a few conspicuous exceptions, the coal-mines, the jute-mills and the great engineering enterprises of the Presidency are mainly controlled and directed by immigrants. Even the labour employed in mine and mill is almost wholly drawn from other provinces;[2] so that in the great industrial city of Calcutta only 49 *per cent.* of the population is Bengali-speaking.[3] Alike in industry and in commerce the main function performed by Bengalis is that of clerical labour.

13. It is a complaint frequently heard among Bengalis that they are excluded from the most lucrative activities in their own country, and that this exclusion is due to prejudice. But there seems to be no tangible justification for this view. No disabilities are imposed upon Bengalis that do not equally weigh upon Marwaris, Parsis, Armenians or Japanese. The real obstacle is to be found in the strength of the tradition among the educated classes of Bengal which excludes them from practical pursuits. Hitherto tradition has forbidden men of the literate classes to take part in these occupations; and long abstention has perhaps bred among them a certain incapacity for practical callings. Fortunately there is evidence that this attitude of aloofness is breaking down.[4] The very complaints of exclusion are in themselves a good sign. Still more promising are the wide-spread demands that the educational system should be given a more practical turn. Educational reforms alone will not suffice to bring about the needed change. But at least it is well that the people of Bengal should be beginning to realise that the system as it stands, into which they have thrown themselves with so much ardour, is doing nothing to help or to hasten the change, because its whole bias is still in favour of purely literary forms of training.

---

[1] See the Report of the Indian Industrial Commission, 1918, para. 16, where an instructive comparison is drawn between Bengal and Bombay.

[2] See the remarkable figures quoted by the Indian Industrial Commission, in para. 15 of their report.

[3] Census Report, 1911.

[4] Thus the Indian Industrial Commission (para. 16) notes that while "Bengáli capitalists have taken little part, otherwise than as mere investors, in the starting, and none at all in the management, of jute mills," a feature of industrial life in recent years "is the number of small organised industries recently taken up by Indians, such as tanning, pottery and pencil-making."

14. Since industry and commerce, playing, as they do, but a small part in the real life of Bengal, have hitherto contributed nothing to the development of the educational system, we must look to the other sections of the population for the elements of this remarkable movement. These other sections are two: the agricultural population, and the professional classes.

15. It is from agriculture that almost the whole Bengali people has always derived, and still derives, its livelihood, directly or indirectly;. and the conditions of soil and climate decree that this must continue to be so, however great the commercial expansion of the future. But the agricultural needs of the country are not such as to demand or stimulate any marked educational development. The great landlords of the country—the zamindars—who were once mainly collectors of land-revenue for the State, and were turned into hereditary landowners by the Permanent Settlement, have never played in Bengal anything like the part played by the landowners of England, who filled the public schools and universities in order that they might be trained for the political leadership of the nation. Nor have the zamindars been tempted to develope their estates by the application of scientific methods of agriculture. Legislation for the protection of tenant-rights has in some degree tied their hands. But in truth the rich alluvial soil of Bengal is singularly well suited to the methods of culture by the hand-labour of small-holders which have been gradually developed through centuries; and the mechanical, scientific, large-scale methods of the West are difficult to adapt to the economic and social conditions of Bengal, and perhaps also to some of its crops. Hence agriculture, equally with industry and commerce, has hitherto made no direct demand upon the educational system.

16. The great majority of the population of Bengal consists of the actual cultivators of the soil. Many of them belong to the lower castes of Hinduism, or are outside the pale of orthodox Hindu society; and these are generally illiterate. But more than half of the cultivators, especially in the prosperous regions of Eastern Bengal, are Musalmans. The Musalmans form 52·7 *per cent.* of the total population of the Presidency;[1] in some districts of Eastern Bengal they number as much as 90 or 95 *per cent.*; and overwhelmingly the greater part of the Musalmans are

[1] Census Report, 1911.

cultivators. They also are, for the most part, illiterate; such rudiments of education as they obtain are valued mainly for religious purposes, and are commonly limited to the memorising of parts of the Quran, taught in the *maktabs* attached to the mosques. Hitherto the western educational movement has scarcely touched the cultivator, except through a primary school system which is, and always has been, largely out of touch with some of the economic needs of the community which it ought to serve. The cultivator has not yet learnt to value education as an equipment for his life: he often fears, not without reason, that his children may be tempted away from the land by a system of training which has no bearing upon the work of the fields.

17. Yet in recent years recruits have begun to come to the University in increasing numbers even from the cultivating classes. The jute-growing lands of Eastern Bengal in particular enjoyed until the period of the war great prosperity; and this has enabled many cultivators to send those of their sons who are not needed on the land through the normal routine of high school and college leading to the degree. This is the recognised pathway to respectability and social advancement, the course that leads to Government employment, or to success in the legal profession, wherein the most respected names of Bengal are enrolled. It is the one channel of escape from the rigid social barriers imposed by the system of caste. The adoption of academic ambitions by even a small proportion of the cultivating class is an event of great moment in the social history of Bengal. It may be the herald of a social revolution. But its immediate result, so long as the present system remains unchanged, must be to enlarge indefinitely the already swollen mass of aspirants after a purely literary training, and to increase that discontented intellectual proletariat whose rise has been so disturbing a feature of recent years; it threatens also to drain away much of the best talent from the villages, to the detriment of the country's supreme economic interest. The movement is but just beginning; it is not too late to transform its character and consequences by giving a more practical bent, and a more varied character, to the educational system.

18. But it is not from the agricultural classes, any more than from the commercial or industrial classes, that the eager demand for educational opportunities has come, which has led to the remarkable

results described above. The classes whose sons have filled the colleges to overflowing are the middle or professional classes, commonly known as the *bhadralok;* and it is their needs, and their traditions, which have, more than any other cause, dictated the character of university development in Bengal. Many of the *bhadralok* are zamindars, great or small, or hold land on permanent tenure under zamindars; but they seldom or never cultivate their own lands, being content to draw an income from subletting. Many, again, make a livelihood by lending money to the cultivators; and the high rate of interest which they are thus able to obtain is often adduced as a reason why they have abstained from the more precarious adventures of commerce. They are thus closely connected with the agricultural community, over which they have always held a real leadership; and they are distributed in large numbers over every part of the country.

19. Relatively few of the Musalmans are counted among the professional classes. The great majority of these classes belong to the three great Hindu literary castes, the Brahmins, the *Vaidyas* (doctors), and the *Kayasthas* (writers), who are relatively more numerous in Bengal than are the corresponding castes in any other part of India. For untold centuries they have been the administrators, the priests, the teachers, the lawyers, the doctors, the writers, the clerks of the community. Every successive Government in Bengal has drawn its corps of minor officials, and often also many of its major officials, from among them, the British equally with their Muslim predecessors. They have therefore always formed an educated class, and it may safely be said that there is no class of corresponding magnitude and importance in any other country which has so continuous a tradition of literacy, extending over so many centuries. It has always been the first duty of every father in these castes, however poor he might be, to see that his sons obtained the kind of education dictated by the tradition of their caste.

20. But this traditional system of education, which has lasted for untold centuries, has always been predominantly, and in most cases exclusively, literary in character: even the *Vaidyas* learnt their medical science mainly from books and from oral tradition. When the British administrators began, in the early nineteenth century, to investigate the existing educational system, they found a network of elementary schools spread over every part of the

country, supplemented by groups of *tôls*, or institutions of higher learning, where Brahmin *gurus* taught the traditional learning of the Sanskrit classics without fee. These institutions still exist, though in diminished numbers ; there are still, for example, a number of *tôls* at the once famous Nawadip in the district of Nadia. They existed, of course, purely for the use of the learned castes. The Musalmans developed a similar system, though on a less elaborate scale ; their *maktabs* for the elementary religious education of the many, and their *madrassahs* for the more advanced instruction of *maulvis*, confined themselves to the sacred learning in the Arabic tongue, and to the court language of Persian, which the Muslim conquerors had established in India ; and so long as Persian remained the language of the courts, as it did until 1837, these schools were to some extent used also by Hindus, anxious to qualify for Government employment.

21. Thus both among the literate Hindu castes and among the Musalmans, the traditional systems of learning were almost exclusively literary and religious in character. They consisted in the memorising of vast masses of ancient writings, and commentaries thereon, handed down from generation to generation. They cultivated, in an extraordinary degree, the memory-power of the classes which had pursued these studies for centuries ; and the influence of these methods was necessarily deeply felt when these classes began to devote their attention to western learning. Both in their concentration upon purely literary studies, and in their reliance upon memory-work, the indigenous systems of education helped to fix the character which was to be assumed by western education in India.

22. It was a great epoch in the history of India when the intellectual powers trained by so many centuries of culture began to be turned from the ancient learning of the East to the new learning of the West. The habits and traditions of the *bhadralok* made it natural that, when they seized upon the western system, they should mould it to suit their needs, emphasise its purely literary side, and leave undeveloped its more practical sides. But the transition could not be made in a moment. For half a century the new system competed with the old, and the allegiance of the *bhadralok* was divided between them, probably not without misgivings. What we have witnessed during the more recent years has been, in effect, the adoption by the Hindu *bhadralok* of the new western

system as, in practice, a substitute for the old, and as the necessary training which all their sons must undergo. Meanwhile the Musalmans of the *bhadralok* class, for the most part, stood aside from the new system. Long accustomed to regard themselves as the ruling race, they retained their devotion to the traditional Islamic studies in Arabic and Persian, which they had hitherto found not merely culturally valuable, but also practically useful. In recent years they have increasingly demanded a fuller share of the new learning. And beyond them we see the mass of the cultivators, stirring at last from their age-long acquiescence in unchanging modes of life.

23. Such, in broad outline, is the explanation of the remarkable movement with which we have to deal. The problem before us is as inspiring as it is complex and difficult. We have to consider whether the system now existing in Bengal is capable of meeting the demand, which has developed so rapidly in recent years, and will certainly develope yet more rapidly in the future; and, if it is not so capable, how it can best be modified. But these are questions which cannot be intelligently answered unless we first gain a clear idea of the stages through which the existing system has passed, and the ideals at which it has aimed; and unless we also analyse carefully its actual working.

CHAPTER III.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE WESTERN SYSTEM OF EDUCATION IN BENGAL.

1.—The period of beginnings to 1854.

1. It was no part of the policy of the East India Company, during the first two generations of its dominion in Bengal, to impose a western, or English, system of education upon its Indian subjects. Warren Hastings, the dominating figure of the early part of the period, entertained a genuine admiration for the laws and the literatures of India. It was his belief that, if the British power was to be lasting, it must become an Indian power, and that its greatest gifts would be the gifts of order and justice, under which the ancient indigenous culture might revive and flourish. Nor, in spite of the literary achievements of the time, did there yet appear to be, elsewhere than in the political sphere, any very distinctive intellectual contribution which England could make to the education of her new dominion. Orthodox English education was then dominated, almost as completely as Indian, by reverence for 'classics,' and by dogmatic theology.[1] To substitute one set of classics for another might well seem futile; to attempt to substitute one system of dogma for another appeared, to all but those who were touched by missionary zeal for the Christian faith, at once dangerous and hopeless. The results of the industrial revolution were not yet apparent; the doctrines of modern economic and historical science were only beginning to be formulated; the vast revolution of modern scientific discovery had but just commenced. Quite apart from the political motive, which urged Anglo-Indian statesmen to disturb the minds of their subjects as little as possible, it might well appear that, on the intellectual side, India would profit most if she were left free to cultivate her own ancient learning and her own system of thought without interference.

2. The first assertion that it was the duty of England to communicate to her Indian subjects, by the channel of education, her

[1] In England Priestley was advocating and practising a more modern system; but his was a voice in the wilderness, to which few hearkened.

own intellectual and moral conceptions, came not from statesmen and administrators but from religious reformers. Charles Grant, whose advocacy of English education for India in 1792[1] may be called the beginning of the whole movement, had served in India, and was a Director of the East India Company. But his inspiration came from the evangelical revival, a movement which gave a new impetus to missionary enterprise, and at the same time brought into British imperial policy a humanitarian spirit, of which the abolition of the slave trade was the most striking manifestation. Grant was a member of the 'Clapham School,' which included Wilberforce and Zachary Macaulay. It was largely the influence of this group which obtained the inclusion in the India Act of 1813 of a clause requiring the Directors to spend at least a lakh of rupees annually on education. Meanwhile the activity of Christian missionaries in Bengal, which was to play so vital a part in the development of a new educational system, had begun. William Carey (whom Grant had befriended in India), had, with his heroic colleagues, settled at Serampore, where he enjoyed greater freedom under the Danish flag than the Government of Calcutta would have allowed him; and had begun to open schools, and to employ the still more potent instrument of the printing press. Western education, in Bengal as in the rest of India, owes its first impetus to the missionaries.

3. But the authorities of the East India Company, both at home and in India, still clung to the old view. The Directors interpreted the clause of the Act of 1813 as only requiring them to subsidise institutions of oriental learning.[2] Even in this policy Government showed no activity until 1823, when a Committee of Public Instruction was set up. The available funds for educational purposes were spent partly in printing oriental classics; partly in grants to educational societies, such as the Calcutta School Book Society, founded in 1817, and the Calcutta School Society, founded in 1818; partly in supporting the Calcutta Madrassah, founded by Warren Hastings in 1781, and in establishing a Sanskrit College at Calcutta, which was opened in 1824. Throughout the

[1] "Observations on the state of society among the Asiatic subjects of Great Britain... and on the means of improving it."

[2] Thus in a despatch of 1814 they definitely rejected the method of founding colleges 'upon a plan similar to those that have been founded at our universities," because they would be unacceptable to Indians, and proposed instead to give recognition, and possibly small gratuities, to *pandits*. Select Committee of 1832, Minutes of Evidence, page 486.

period 1813 to 1835 there was continual controversy between the orientalists and the western school; but the orientalists held the upper hand, and no Government support was available for English teaching. That had to be undertaken by private enterprise; and it was not until 1815 that, by a minute of Lord Hastings, Government gave freedom to private enterprise.

4. In the earliest efforts to introduce western learning into India two rival and conflicting influences were perceptible. On the one hand, there was the influence of a semi-rationalist school, concerned mainly to foster secular training, and sympathetic with corresponding movements in England. On the other hand, there were the missionaries, for whom English education was mainly important as a vehicle for religious teaching. In the sphere of higher education the former school was first in the field. In 1816 the admirable David Hare,[1] an English watchmaker, and a sort of Francis Place of Calcutta, joined hands with the brave and enlightened Brahmin, Ram Mohan Roy, who had found his own way to a remarkable mastery of western culture, had abandoned orthodox Hinduism, and later made friends with the unitarian leaders in England. Hare and Roy formed a Committee of Indians and Englishmen, among whose members was included the Chief Justice, Sir Edward Hyde East, and raised a fund for the establishment of a school and college of western learning, Hare himself providing the site. Thus was founded the Hindu College (1817), which is represented to-day on the higher side of its work by Presidency College, and on the lower side by the Hindu School. Distrusted both by Christian missionaries and by orthodox Hindus, in its earlier years, as a secularist institution which was undermining the foundations of belief, the Hindu College passed through some troublous times; but it introduced the more daring Hindus of Calcutta to the teachings of the West.

5. If the Hindu College was partly rationalist, Bengal had not long to wait for an antidote. In 1818 Carey, Marshman and Ward opened the first missionary college at Serampore. It rested upon the foundation of a whole group of schools which they had earlier established; and in 1827 it actually received, from the King of

[1] Hare's tomb stands on the south side of College Square; on June 1st, the anniversary of his death, Indians may still be seen going barefoot to the tomb, to do honour to one of the founders of western education in India.

Denmark, a Charter empowering it to grant degrees. In 1820 Bishop's College was opened by the Anglicans at Sibpur. In 1830 the great Scottish scholar, missionary and statesman, Alexander Duff, inaugurated, under the name of the General Assembly's Institution, a school in Calcutta, to which college classes were later added, and which was the origin of the modern Scottish Churches College and School. With Duff there came into Indian education that powerful Scottish influence, which has ever since been one of the strongest factors in shaping its growth. Missionaries and Hindu reformers between them succeeded in arousing a remarkable ferment of new ideas in the Calcutta of the thirties; the educational revolution had begun.

6. It is important to observe that from the outset these two more or less hostile strains were perceptible in the new movement; and the situation presents a very instructive parallel to that which was created almost simultaneously in London, when the establishment of the secular University College (1828)[1] was immediately followed by the institution of the ecclesiastically controlled King's College (1829). In London, when the University was established in 1836, the necessity of co-ordinating these conflicting forces led to the establishment of a system which, though it rendered many valuable services, obscured the teaching responsibilities of the University as such. In Calcutta similar causes would probably have produced similar results even if the model of London had not been deliberately adopted for imitation.

7. Another marked feature of the early development of western education in Bengal was that, under the mere pressure of circumstances, it was found impossible to draw any clear line between the school and the college. This absence of differentiation continued down to the Act of 1904; but even that Act could not wholly cure the defect; and, as we shall see, it still survives in some respects to-day.

8. The political revolution of 1830-32 in England had an immediate effect in India, and not least in the sphere of Indian education. One of the main achievements of the Whigs was the India Act of 1833. This Act not only brought to an end the commercial privileges of the East India Company; it gave free admission

[1] Known as 'the University of London' until the foundation of the present University in 1836.

to India to British subjects, abolishing the requirement of a licence, until then exacted by the Company. This left the field clear for the missionaries; henceforward their activities were limited only by the funds they were able to raise at home, and the English missionary societies were now at the beginning of their most active period. As many of the missionaries adopted the view of Duff, that education presented the most fruitful field for their labours, the result was a very rapid expansion of missionary schools and colleges.

9. The Act of 1833 also added a legal member to the Governor-General's Council; and the first Legal Member was Macaulay, a rationalist by instinct, but at the same time an inheritor of the traditions of Grant and the 'Clapham School,' to which his father had belonged. Macaulay, as a distinguished man of letters, was made Chairman of the Committee of Public Instruction, then almost equally divided between partisans of the oriental and the western schools. His famous minute[1] of February 1835 marks the definite victory of the western school. Its policy was adopted by the Governor-General, Lord William Bentinck; and the principles were laid down, first that Government would maintain an absolute neutrality in religious matters, and secondly that henceforth all the funds available for educational purposes should be mainly devoted to the maintenance of schools and colleges of western learning, to be taught through the medium of English.

10. The nature of the new principles introduced into Indian educational policy in 1835 has been often misinterpreted. It was decided that Government must undertake a steady encouragement and expansion of western education; and as a sign of this the funds devoted to educational purposes were greatly increased. It was decided, also, that the medium of instruction in higher work should be English, rather than the ancient learned tongues, Sanskrit and Arabic. But this did not mean that Government wished to discourage oriental learning; still less did it mean that they intended to discourage the development of the vernacular. The eastern and the western schools were agreed that the Indian vernaculars were not yet developed sufficiently to be used as the media of western knowledge, and the only question between them was whether English or the classical languages should be used for this purpose. But the now victorious western school always held that the

[1] Reprinted in the volume of appendices to this report.

vernaculars ought to be improved and developed; they insisted that the vernacular should be properly taught in all schools; and they looked forward to the time when western knowledge would be widely diffused through the vernacular.[1]

11. Other changes, introduced in the same years, powerfully contributed to foster the new system. In the same year which saw the issue of Macaulay's Minute, freedom of the press was established.[2] And two years later a still greater encouragement to western learning was given by the supersession of Persian as the language of the courts.[3] Under these favouring conditions it is not surprising that there should have been a rapid development of the new system, under Government direction and encouragement. An admirable survey of the indigenous system of education, carried out in 1835 and the following years by Mr. W. Adam, showed that a network of primitive vernacular schools existed throughout Bengal. But no attempt was made to develope these schools. Government preferred to devote its energies to secondary and higher schools, on the theory that if western education were introduced to the upper classes it would 'filter down' by a natural process to the lower classes. Time has shown that it was not safe to trust to this alone. But the 'filtration theory' dominated the educational policy of Bengal until 1854. The main work of these years was the creation by Government of a series of high schools in each district, some of which, by the addition of classes for higher work, developed into colleges; but, including the work of the missionaries, there was an increasing amount of private effort during the twenty years following 1835. In Calcutta, Government practically took over the Hindu College and School, which henceforth mainly depended on public funds. Among the Government schools at mufassal centres, four expanded into colleges during the next twenty years; Hooghly in 1836, Dacca in 1841, Krishnagar in 1845 and Berhampur in 1853. Even more striking was the introduction of the western system of medical training by the foundation of the Medical College in 1835.[4] The teaching was given in English; and the courage of Pandit Madusudan Gupta in defying an ancient

[1] See Chapter XVIII, where this point will be more fully developed, and illustrated by documents.

[2] Act XI of 1835.

[3] Act XXIX of 1837.

[4] See Chapter XXIII, where the early development of medical training is traced.

prejudice by beginning the dissection of the human body, marks an era in the history of Indian education almost as important as Macaulay's minute.

12. Practically all the public funds available for education were between 1835 and 1854 expended on schools and colleges founded and controlled by Government. But valuable work was also carried on by private agencies. In Calcutta there were, before 1853, a number of English schools founded and conducted by Indians, though no statistical details of their work survive. The activities of the missionaries also continued to thrive and expand. They founded many schools, in the mufassal as well as in Calcutta. Duff's College grew steadily in numbers and influence; and when in 1843 Duff himself joined the great party which seceded from the Established Church of Scotland, his indefatigable energy created a second college, the Free Church Institution, now merged in the Scottish Churches College.

13. Numbers, as might be expected, remained small during this period. As late as 1854 there were only 129 students in all the Government colleges of Bengal, Bihar and Orissa; the numbers in the mission colleges are not known. Nevertheless, the progress made in English education during the decade following 1835 was sufficient to justify Lord Hardinge, in 1844, in announcing that thenceforward preference would be given, in all appointments under Government, to men who had received a western education; and a series of examinations in English was instituted for the selection of candidates. It is true that the candidates were at first disappointingly few; and the missionaries complained that an unfair advantage was given to students trained in the Government colleges. But the great step had been taken; western education had become the passport to the public services. This decision had been made possible by the Act of 1837, whereby Persian ceased to be the official language of the courts.

14. The influence of the Act of 1837 and the Resolution of 1844 upon the Hindu *bhadralok*, from among whom all the minor officials had long been drawn, was bound to be decisive. They had long been in the habit of learning a foreign language Persian—as a condition of public employment; they now learnt English instead. It was, indeed, the Hindus who alone took advantage of the new opportunites in any large numbers. The Musalmans naturally

protested strongly against the change; which was, indeed, disastrous for them. Hitherto their knowledge of Persian had given them a considerable advantage. They refused to give up learning it—it was for them the language of culture. To take up English in addition would be too heavy a burden; moreover they had learnt to think of English as associated with Christian teaching, owing to the activity of the missionaries, and they were less willing than the Hindus to expose their sons to missionary influences. Their pride and their religious loyalty revolted; and they stood aloof from the movement.

15. But, in spite of opposition, by 1853 the system of English education had definitely taken root in Bengal. Only a small proportion, indeed, of even the educated classes passed through the new institutions; and it still needed some courage for an orthodox Hindu, and even more for an orthodox Musalman, to enrol himself as a student. But a western training had become the avenue to Government service, and to professional distinction; and many Bengalis had acquired that enthusiasm for English literature which was to lead to such momentous consequences, political as well as intellectual.

16. And already what was to be, until our own days, one of the most distinctive features of Indian education had become clearly marked. Higher education, instead of being concentrated, as in the West, in a few highly organised university centres, was carried on by a number of scattered colleges, none of which deserved full university rank, and nearly all of which had grown out of schools, from which they were not in any clear way differentiated. It now seemed to be necessary not only to extend the system, but to provide some means of regulating and standardising the work carried on at these scattered institutions; some means also of testing the candidates for Government posts in a manner not open to the objections raised against the system of 1844. As early as 1845 it had been suggested that these needs could best be met by the institution of universities on the model of that of London, but the Directors were not, in 1845, ready for such a step.

II.—The organisation of the educational system, 1854—1882.

17. The most important epoch in the history of Indian education is marked by the great parliamentary enquiry into the

condition of India which preceded the confirmation of the Company's charter in 1853. For the first time Parliament investigated, seriously and sympathetically, the development of Indian education. Enough evidence to fill volumes was submitted to Committees of the Lords and Commons. The most important of the witnesses were Sir Charles Trevelyan (Macaulay's brother-in-law), J. C. Marshman, the son of Carey's colleague, and Alexander Duff. Their evidence all tended in the same direction. It formed the basis of Sir Charles Wood's epoch-marking education despatch of 1854, which determined the whole subsequent course of Indian educational development. In the ideas, and even in the phrasing, of this despatch, the influence of Duff is very clearly perceptible.

18. The despatch of 1854 was, in its main conceptions, a bold, far-seeing and statesmanlike document. It imposed upon the Government of India the duty of creating a properly articulated system of education, from the primary school to the university; perhaps its most notable feature was the emphasis which it laid upon elementary education, hitherto disregarded by Government, and therefore its implicit repudiation of the more extreme forms of the 'filtration' theory. To carry out this constructive work, it ordained the creation of a Department of Public Instruction in every province, with a staff of inspectors; and it clearly anticipated that this department would undertake the direction of all educational policy—an anticipation which was destined to be disappointed, especially in Bengal.

19. In the belief that Government activity alone could never suffice to create such a system as it contemplated, it broke away definitely from the practice followed since 1835, whereby most of the available public funds had been expended upon a few Government schools and colleges, and instituted a systematic policy of 'grants-in-aid,' to be distributed by the Departments of Public Instruction to all institutions which should reach an approved standard. It "looked forward to a time when any general system of education provided by Government might be discontinued" with the advance in the number of spontaneously organised schools which this policy was expected to produce. And, taking the view that public funds would be most profitably used if they were employed to stimulate local activity or private benevolence, it even contemplated the ultimate abandonment by Government of direct control over many

of its existing institutions, while recognising the necessity of their maintenance for the present. This policy was modelled upon the educational policy of the British Government at that date.[1] The plan was that every honest educational agency, whether religious or not, should be encouraged to the utmost, under the inspection and direction of a Government department, and with the encouragement and assistance of the local officers of Government, upon the value of which emphasis was laid. The establishment and development of the policy of grants-in-aid was to be of such importance to the history of Indian education that we have thought it well to give fuller treatment to it in a separate chapter.[2]

20. But the most important sections of the despatch, from our point of view, were those in which the establishment of provincial universities was advocated. They were to be constituted on the model of London University, at that date a purely examining body which admitted to its tests only the students trained in affiliated institutions. The system seemed to be the latest device of educational statesmanship. It had been suggested, in London, by conditions which resembled those of Bengal, and seemed to afford the readiest solution of the problem of Bengal. Its defects were not yet apparent, though it was to be profoundly modified by London itself four years later. It had the advantage of costing very little. It enabled all the existing collegiate institutions, whether Government or missionary, to be worked into the same scheme, and promised to provide a quite impartial mode of testing the qualifications of students for Government service. Above all, it gave freedom to the non-Government colleges—all, at that date, mission colleges—to carry on their work in their own way, and offered them help from public funds for the secular side of their work. Undoubtedly this aspect of the system had real merits; it encouraged a variety of type which is always valuable, and was especially valuable in that period of innovation.

21. The authors of the despatch of 1854 assuredly did not intend that their system should be so narrowly conceived as it came to be in practice. They did not mean that university examinations,

---

[1] In effect it applied to India the principles enunciated in the minutes of the English Committee of the Privy Council on Education in 1846.

[2] Chapter IV.

as such, should be accepted as the sole tests qualifying for public posts; they also recommended the institution of special civil service examinations. And while they manifestly contemplated that the ordinary subjects of study should be dealt with by the colleges, they did not intend that the universities should be deprived of all teaching functions; on the contrary, they recommended the establishment of a number of university chairs, "in branches of learning for the acquisition of which, at any rate in an advanced degree, facilities do not now exist in other institutions." Finally, they were fully aware of the dangers of a too purely literary course of instruction. Not only did they recommend that professional training, especially in medicine and law, should be given under the direct control of the University; they insisted upon the necessity of training teachers for all classes of schools; they advocated the institution in the universities of courses of study and degrees in civil engineering—a proposal to which effect was given by the foundation of the College of Engineering in 1856;[1] they emphasised the importance of communicating 'useful and practical knowledge,' and urged that 'practical agriculture' should be taught in the schools. They hoped that the system of education would rouse the people of India to develope "the vast resources of their country... and gradually, but certainly, confer upon them all the advantages which accompany the healthy increase of wealth and commerce." If the plan had been carried out as conceived in the despatch, it is probable that the development of the Indian educational system would have followed a very different course.

22. The departments of public instruction provided for by the despatch were instituted in 1855; the universities were not established till 1857. It will be convenient first to observe some features of the work of the Bengal Department, and the effects of the new grant-in-aid system, before we turn to analyse the working of the new university system. We are not here concerned with the varied and interesting experiments which were made during the next quarter of a century in the attempt to develope and improve the indigenous village schools without destroying their character. Nor does it fall within the sphere of our enquiry to note the character and extent of the growth of the system of vernacular secondary (middle)

[1] For the history of the beginnings of the teaching of medicine and engineering, see Chapters XXIII and XXIV.

schools which was brought about during the period, under the influence of the grants-in-aid. More germane to our enquiry is the striking increase in the number of English high schools which was the immediate result of the new policy; since it was from these that the colleges of the University drew their recruits. The offer of grants-in-aid brought into existence, with astonishing rapidity, a number of new high schools, managed by local committees, and staffed almost wholly with Indian teachers who had learnt English from the schools and colleges created during the previous twenty years. In 1855 there were only 47 English schools in the whole of Bengal, Bihar and Orissa. Within eighteen months of the inauguration of the new system 79 English schools had applied for grants. By 1871 there were 133 high schools, and no less than 551 schools of the lower (middle English) grade. By 1882 the number of high schools had risen to 209.

23. The main reasons for this rapid increase were, no doubt, that a knowledge of English was becoming more and more essential for Government service and other occupations; and that the creation of the University, and the opportunity of winning its degrees, had begun to fire the ambitions of the Hindu literate classes: the high schools were already being regarded by many, not as providing an education worth having by itself, but mainly as portals to the University.

24. But the most striking feature of the story is that while there was a very large increase in the total number of high schools, there was, during the decade 1871-1882, an actual decrease in the number of Government schools, and even of aided schools. This was due to a diminution in Government expenditure on secondary education, which in its turn was due to three causes: financial stringency caused by famine; a deliberate concentration during these years on the development of elementary education; and the exaction of a higher standard of efficiency from high schools as a condition of grants. The striking thing is that in very large numbers the organisers of Bengal high schools were discovering that these schools could be run on a self-supporting basis without Government grants, and that they need not therefore submit to the conditions which the Department imposed. The flood of candidates which made the rise of these schools possible all aimed at one single goal: success in the entrance examination of the University; and the require-

ments of this examination were already the only regulating or controlling influence for a large part of the schools of Bengal.

25. Thus the Department found, during the decade preceding 1882, that it was losing influence over a very important part of the educational system. Its place was being insensibly taken by the University, which had no proper organisation for the purpose. The University and the secondary schools were influencing one another, not wholly for the better. The University (not of set intention) was helping the schools to dispense with the conditions and equipment necessary for good work, and encouraging them to content themselves with preparing for examinations. The schools were sending up candidates who, though they might get through an examination, were ill-qualified to follow with intelligence the university courses, and especially poorly equipped in English, the medium of instruction.[1]

26. The influence of the grant-in-aid system upon higher or collegiate education was far less marked than its influence upon secondary education. It is remarkable that between 1854 and 1880 only two colleges under private management were started. One was St. Xavier's College of the Society of Jesus (1862). The other—the first college founded and conducted wholly by indigenous agency—was the Metropolitan Institution, founded in the first instance as a school, by Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar, and in 1869 developed into a college: the founder, who was one of the leaders of the Bengali educational movement, provided the college with a building and the beginnings of a library, but its cost of maintenance has throughout been met almost wholly out of fees. Two other colleges, also outgrowths of schools, were opened in 1881 by members of the Brahmo Samaj: the City College, and the now defunct Albert College. But when the Commission of 1882 began its enquiries, these were institutions of yesterday.

27. During the first twenty-two years of the University's existence the numbers of students produced by the high schools steadily increased, and they either had to be accommodated in

[1] This was in part due to the low standard of the entrance examination: the Bengal Committee of the Education Commission of 1882 reported that 'the standard of the entrance examination appears to be below that attainable in present circumstances by high schools.' *Bengal Provincial Committee's Report*, page 153.

the existing colleges, or new institutions had to be created for them by Government. Hence the policy suggested by the despatch of 1854, of a gradual withdrawal of Government from the direct management of some of these institutions, was out of the question. Instead, new Government colleges had to be created. In 1855 Lord Dalhousie created Presidency College, with which the old Hindu College was incorporated. Planned on a more ample and generous scale than any other college that had yet been established in India, it was designed to be the backbone of the new University; and it is worth noting that, when the University was founded two years later, the reason put forward for the failure to establish a series of university professorships such as the despatch had recommended, was that the ample endowments of Presidency College met the need.[1] It would appear, therefore, that at the time of its foundation Presidency College was not intended to be merely a self-contained teaching institution parallel with other colleges; it was meant, in some way never defined, and certainly never realised, to supplement and assist the work of the other colleges.

28. But Presidency College did not suffice to meet the need. In 1872 the Zilla School at Rajshahi in Northern Bengal was developed into a second-grade college, and in 1878 into a first-grade college. It is noteworthy that in this instance the stages of progress were rendered possible by large local benefactions,[2] to which there had hitherto been little parallel elsewhere.[3] New Government colleges, also, were founded in Bihar and Orissa, then parts of the Province of Bengal; but with these we are not concerned. The important point is, that while indigenous enterprise was bringing about an extraordinary expansion of secondary schools, the provision of facilities for higher training for the increasing number of matriculates was, until 1879, still left wholly to Government and to the missionaries.

---

[1] See the report of the Committee on the foundation of the University.

[2] The foundation of the college was rendered possible by an endowment yielding Rs. 5,000; the advance of 1878 by a subscription of Rs. 1,50,000.

[3] There were instances, not on so large a scale, at Krishnagar, Midnapur and Chittagong. In all these cases the contributions were given on the distinct understanding that the colleges should be managed by Government, and the contributions made on this condition were much larger than any obtained by private institutions.

29. How considerable was the increase in the number of degree students during this period is sufficiently shown by the figures. In 1854 there were 129 students in Government colleges in Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, and an unknown, but much smaller, number in the missionary colleges. In 1882 the students in the Government colleges numbered 2,394, the students in the non-Government colleges 1,433, a total of 3,827. This was a remarkable development for less than a single generation.

30. The last few pages have been devoted to an analysis of the progress in the number of students and of teaching institutions which resulted from the adoption of the policy of 1854. It is now necessary to turn to the other side of the story—the organisation of higher teaching by the establishment of the University in 1857. It is possible and natural to adopt this order, because the establishment of the University did not in itself involve any increase in the teaching resources of the province, or in the opportunities of study available for students; but only the institution of a series of administrative bodies for the definition of curricula and the conduct of examinations, and, by these means, for the regulation and supervision of the work of the colleges, to which the function of teaching was wholly reserved.

31. We do not here propose to discuss in detail the constitution given to the new University. It must suffice to say that from the first the ruling bodies of the University, the Senate, and its executive the Syndicate, were mainly drawn, not from among the teachers who were doing the actual work of training young Bengal, but from among distinguished administrators and public men: the list of its Vice-Chancellors includes many eminent names, not least that of Sir Henry Maine. Some leading spirits in the Calcutta colleges were of course included in the Senate; and a man like Duff was able to play a vitally important part in defining the policy of the University. But the teachers were present as it were by accident, not by right; and many of the colleges, especially those in the mufassal, were never represented at all.

32. There were three possible alternatives open to the organisers of the new University, given that they had to work with the existing material, and to recognise and make use of all the existing colleges. They might have used the University as a means of supplementing

the resources of the colleges, and of enabling them, in Calcutta at any rate, to co-operate by a system of inter-collegiate instruction. This method does not seem to have suggested itself to anybody; and the colleges were left as watertight compartments, each providing the whole of the instruction required by its students. Or, again, without interfering with the independence of the colleges, they might have organised the University upon a federal basis, treating every college as a partner, giving representation to all, trusting representative bodies of teachers to devise the schemes of study to be followed by their students, and perhaps allowing to the stronger colleges some measure of autonomy in the construction of their curricula and the conduct of their examinations. But this plan also was not mooted. The University was organised, in the manner suggested by the despatch of 1854, as a corporation quite distinct from the colleges wherein all the work of teaching was done; it dictated their curricula and conducted their examinations without consulting them. The only relation established between the University and the colleges was that of 'affiliation', whereby the 'affiliated' institution was licensed to provide instruction and to present candidates for particular examinations. The adoption of an 'affiliating' rather than a 'federal' basis for the University was no doubt suggested by the analogy of London. But there is a curious irony in the fact that London (except in regard to medical schools) abandoned 'affiliation' the very next year (1858) after her example had persuaded India to adopt it, and substituted for it a system of open examinations without regard to the candidates' place of education.

33. The power of granting or withholding affiliation ought to have implied the power and duty of exercising supervision over the staff and equipment of the colleges. But no such functions were imposed upon the University until 1904. Each college, once it was affiliated, was left to its own devices, and there was no guarantee that the degree of efficiency which had won for it its original recognition was maintained or increased. This was perhaps natural in the early years, when there were but few colleges, all of which were able to draw upon the resources of Government or upon the help of missionary organisations in the West. But at a later date, when colleges began to spring up in large numbers, the dangers became more apparent.

34. Ever since 1857 what is known as the '*affiliating*' type of university[1] has been the dominating factor in the educational development of India. The most distinctive feature of the system is that it makes the University primarily an examining and regulating body, not a teaching body. And since one of the primary duties of a university of this type is to make regulations, these tend to become extremely elaborate, and the freedom of the teacher tends to be proportionately restricted.

35. As a mode of organisation for higher education such a system is open to many criticisms. In its earlier form, down to 1904, it rested upon the assumptions that a university might have as its primary functions the conduct of examinations and the definition of their subject matter; that by means of examinations and regulations alone the continued efficiency of teaching institutions could be adequately guaranteed; and that the duty of training men for life could safely be left to self-contained colleges organised primarily with a view to the preparation of candidates for an examination. But even within the formal limits of degree-subjects, teaching is so individual a business that it depends in a high degree upon the personality of the teacher, and for that reason the teacher ought to have great freedom, if he is to do justice to the varying needs of his pupils. In so far as he is denied this freedom, his sense of responsibility for the advancement of his students is apt to be weakened.

36. The traditional idea of a university, which has survived the test of centuries, is something far different from this. According to the accepted view of almost all progressive societies, a university ought to be a place of learning, where a corporation of scholars labour in comradeship for the training of men and the advancement and diffusion of knowledge. On this definition the Indian univer-

[1] The term has received official sanction, and is, indeed, a convenient shorthand term. But like all such terms it is open to misunderstanding. Other universities 'affiliate' institutions; Calcutta University itself is 'affiliated' to the University of Oxford, and the modern universities of the West frequently 'affiliate' special institutions for particular kinds of work; but this does not mean that they are 'affiliating universities' in the Indian sense. We shall so far as possible because of this confusion avoid using the term. But wherever it is employed in this report it means a system in which practically the whole of the teaching for university degrees is normally given in self-contained colleges, according to curricula defined by university authorities over which these teaching organisations have, as such, no direct power. The lack of control over curricula by the responsible teachers is a characteristic feature of the system.

sities, in their first form, were no true universities. They were not corporations of scholars, but corporations of administrators; they had nothing to do directly with the training of men, but only with the examining of candidates; they were not concerned with learning, except in so far as learning can be tested by examinations. The colleges were the only 'places of learning,' and the system tended to weaken the responsibility of the stronger colleges and, under the conditions prevailing in India, to reduce them to coaching institutions. The University, being merely a group of administrative boards, had no direct contact with the real work of teaching; it could contribute nothing to strengthen the intellectual resources of the colleges, and little to stimulate free criticism and independent thought among teachers or students. With its uniform curricula, and its exaggerated emphasis upon examinations, the system reduced the colleges too much to the same pattern. It encouraged them, for the sake of economy, to limit their teaching to the ordinary conventional subjects, and to disregard those more practical issues to which the despatch of 1854 had attached so much importance; it often prevented the teacher within his subject from teaching the things he cared most about and understood best; it led the student to value the discipline of his training not for its own sake, but mainly as a means for obtaining marketable qualifications. In the long run such a system must have a sterilising influence.

37. Yet it must be recognised that the system afforded the easiest solution of the problem as it presented itself in 1857, and perhaps met the immediate need better than any other system could have done. Few of the colleges were yet ripe for that freedom of teaching which we have learnt to regard as the essence of university work. Clearly defined standards of attainment were needed, and a system of examinations can give these, even if in a rather mechanical way. The Indian universities were founded in the Mutiny year; and it was not to be expected, in the political and financial circumstances of that time, that Government should undertake any large and ambitious programme involving great expenditure. The new system gave to Government an impartial means of picking out young Indians of ability for the public service. It made use of all the institutions of various types which had grown up during the previous forty years, and gave them a real stimulus

and guidance. It immensely accelerated the conversion of the Hindu *bhadralok* to a zeal for western education, by opening to their sons widespread and easily accessible facilities for attaining university distinctions, labels which had a real and concrete value. And the evils inherent in the system did not become fully apparent for a long time, because the number of students was still small enough, in each college, to render possible that intimate contact between teacher and pupil which is (when the teacher is a good man) the most valuable element in any system of training.

38. By 1882 western education, with the affiliating university as its guardian, had fully taken root in India, and most completely in Bengal. The university degree had become the accepted object of ambition, the passport to distinction in the public services and in the learned professions. Of the 1,589 students who obtained arts degrees in the University of Calcutta between 1857 and 1882,[1] 526 had in 1882 entered the public service, 581 the legal profession, and 12 had become doctors:[2] the 470 who remained were, no doubt, largely employed as teachers in the colleges and the high schools. These were the modes of life most esteemed by the *bhadralok* of Bengal. A university career had obviously become the best career for the sons of the *bhadralok* to follow; and already the social value of western education was reflected in the fact that a man who had taken his degree, or even only passed the entrance examination of the University, had a definitely improved value in the marriage-market. Western education had made its way into the social system. All the principal leaders of Bengal society had now received some degree of western education, and could speak English. The time was approaching when the high school and college course would be accepted as the correct and orthodox course for every boy of the Hindu literate castes to follow.

39. But the results of the great revolution were yet deeper than this. All these thousands of students, two generations of the ablest sons of Bengal, had been taught to study in the English language. Undertaking this study in the first instance because of the practical utility of the language, they had all been forced to

[1] Table printed in the *Report of the Bengal Provincial Committee* to the Education Commission of 1882, page 103.

[2] Most of the medical men had of course proceeded direct to medical degrees without taking arts degrees; there were 164 of these.

drink deeply from the wells of English literature, which is, beyond all others, the literature of liberty. The leaven of the thought of Bacon and Milton, Locke and Burke, Wordsworth and Byron, was working in the minds of Bengal, whose age-long ideals had been those of submission and self-renunciation, not those of freedom and individual initiative. Such ideas, difficult to assimilate with the traditions of the East, could not but have formidable and often perturbing results. With the political aspects of these results we are not directly concerned. But political ideas can never be separated from intellectual movements; and the generation after 1882 was to see the influence of the new currents of thought powerfully reflected in the development of the educational system.

III.—The Commission of 1882-83 and its results.

40. The third great era in the history of Indian education was marked by the Education Commission of 1882, which was appointed to review the working of the policy laid down in 1854, after an interval of nearly thirty years. Not that the decisions of 1882 had anything like the importance of those of 1854. In 1854 it was still possible for the course of educational policy to be effectively controlled by edicts from above; and the Governmental decisions of 1835 and 1854 had exercised a determining effect. But by 1882 the educational movement had obtained so great a momentum of its own that it was already, in Bengal if not in other provinces, beyond the control of the Department of Public Instruction. We have observed how this had come about, especially in the sphere of secondary education, during the decade preceding 1882. The Commissioners do not appear to have realised the significance of the change; in their report they nowhere explain it clearly, or analyse its causes; and, even if they had grasped it, they were, as we shall see, precluded by the terms of their reference from dealing with the problem as a whole. The importance of the Commission of 1882 is, therefore, not that it initiated any great new departure, but merely that it brought into prominence, and gave greater freedom of action to, forces which were already at work.

41. It is impossible to estimate aright the educational development of this period without considering it in the light of the concurrent political development. Fifty years' study of English literature, English history, and English political theories had made

the educated classes of India, and especially the *bhadralok* of Bengal, familiar with the phrases and forms of western politics, and had inspired them with the desire to reproduce in India the methods of self-government which seemed to be triumphant in the West. The Indian National Congress was soon to begin its sittings; it could never have met, or brought together in common consultation the representatives of all the races and languages of India, if the spread of English education had not created a common vocabulary and a common set of political ideals. English statesmen could not regard these ideals with disfavour, though they might doubt whether they could be rapidly realised: and Lord Ripon, the Viceroy who appointed the Commission of 1882, was also responsible for the important step towards self-government represented by the establishment of municipal councils and district boards.

42. Now, since, of all departments of public affairs, that of education had hitherto appeared—at any rate in the secondary sphere—to have aroused the keenest public interest, and the most spontaneous local activity, it seemed natural to endow the new local bodies with educational functions, such as had already been entrusted to the School Boards in England during the preceding decade. One of the main questions referred to the Education Commission, therefore, was the extent to which educational functions might be devolved upon the new local bodies. "It is especially the wish of the Government," ran the formal instructions of the Commission, "that municipal bodies should take a large and increasing share in the management of the public schools within their jurisdiction. The best way of securing this result should be considered by the Commission."[1]

43. But this was not the sole, or the main, function of the Commission. If India was to make progress towards self-government, there must be a wide diffusion of popular education, not merely among the already literate classes, but among the masses of the people. The despatch of 1854 had recognised the importance of primary education. The departments of public instruction which it brought into existence had laboured, with varying success, perhaps with greater results in Bengal than in any other province, to create a system of primary instruction, or, rather, to expand and improve

[1] Report of the Indian Education Commission, page 3.

the indigenous systems. But they had been hampered by two facts. On the one hand, the bulk of the available public funds were already ear-marked for colleges and high schools supported or aided by Government; on the other, it was not possible, in the elementary sphere, to count upon any such public interest or co-operation as had been so strikingly exhibited in the sphere of secondary education.

44. Since the available resources were 'extremely limited in amount', no great expansion of primary education could be hoped for unless the pressure upon public funds of the other branches of education could somehow be relieved. The best means of achieving this seemed to be that "every available private agency should be called into action to relieve and assist the public funds." This was the policy laid down by the despatch of 1854, with its system of grants-in-aid; and the solution of the problem seemed to lie in a bold and courageous extension of this policy. The despatch of 1854 had suggested the gradual withdrawal of Government from direct responsibility for the conduct and maintenance of many of the institutions which it had founded. No steps had yet been taken in this direction; on the contrary, as we have seen, it had been found necessary to create new Government colleges. But now that private enterprise was beginning to be active in Bengal, if not elsewhere—not only in the creation of secondary schools, but in the foundation of new colleges,—the time seemed to have come when Government might begin to devolve most of its responsibilities for higher education upon private agencies, and concentrate its attention upon the primary field. The justification for this view was to be found in the belief that substantial funds would be forthcoming for the endowment of colleges and schools. At no point, either in the Government resolution appointing the Commission, or in the report of the Commission itself, was it suggested that the upgrowth of a system of schools and colleges wholly dependent upon the small fees which Bengal students could afford to pay would form a desirable solution of the problem. Yet this was the kind of system which was to result from the new policy.

45. The policy suggested by Government in the resolution by which the Commission was appointed was adopted *con amore* by the Commission itself; and the outstanding feature

of its whole scheme was its anxiety to find means, at every stage, for the enlistment of the co-operation either of local bodies or of private agencies in the conduct of education of every type. The new local bodies, wherever they existed, were to be charged with the responsibility of developing and organising elementary education under the guidance of the Department, and it was recommended that they should be required to spend a certain proportion of their revenues on this work; they were also to be empowered to conduct either secondary or collegiate institutions.

46. In the primary field alone Government was to regard it as its duty to undertake direct responsibilities for large expenditure, wherever necessary. In the secondary field it was to be made a rule that, apart from the maintenance of a single model school in each administrative district, Government should take no action except where it was met by local effort, and its work was to be (apart from the model schools) confined to the distribution of grants-in-aid, and the inspection of schools, aided or unaided, the maximum grant being in no case more than one-half of the entire expenditure. In the collegiate field the existing Government institutions were to be divided into three classes. The first class was to consist of "institutions on which the higher education of the country mainly depends," like Presidency College; these were to be still maintained by Government. The second class was to consist of colleges that might be advantageously transferred, under adequate guarantees, to 'bodies of native gentlemen'. In this class the Krishnagar and Rajshahi colleges were included. The third class was to consist of colleges which ought to be suppressed, unless some local body was formed to carry them on. In this category were included the colleges at Midnapur, Berhampur and Chittagong. In general, therefore, the policy recommended by the Commission to the provincial Governments was that they should withdraw as rapidly as possible from the direct control of secondary and collegiate institutions, except for the maintenance of a few models; and that, for expansion in these spheres, private and local effort should be trusted, and encouraged to the maximum extent.

47. The principles laid down by the Commission of 1882 were on the whole faithfully observed by the Government of Bengal. Indeed, in the main, they had already been acted on, and in several points of view Bengal appears as the model province in the report

of the Commission.[1] It remains to enquire what were the effects of the policy thus defined, during the twenty years which elapsed between this Commission and the Universities Commission of 1902. With the results in the primary sphere we are not here concerned; but it may be briefly noted that the effects of thrusting responsibility upon the local boards were not altogether happy; and instead of an increase, there was a decrease in the expansion of primary relatively to secondary education during the period. The preponderant and disproportionate development of the secondary branch, which the Commission had deplored and hoped to cure, was actually intensified between 1882 and 1902. What is more, the growth of the higher types of secondary schools was proportionately far greater than the growth of the more elementary types; there was actually a decrease in the type of schools known as 'middle vernacular'.[2] Nothing could more clearly show that it was not education at large, but English education, and especially English education preparatory to the university course, which aroused the enthusiasm of Bengal.

48. But the growth in the number of English schools (which does directly concern us, since these schools formed the feeding ground of the University) was indeed remarkable under the system of 1882. The number of high schools in Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, rose from 209 in 1882 to 535 in 1902. The total number of English schools, including those of the middle grade, many of which aspired to become high schools, was in 1902 no less than 1,481, and they employed over 12,000 teachers in the instruction of nearly 250,000 boys. But only 54 of these schools were under Government management, only 35 under the control of local boards; all the rest were privately managed, and more than one-third of them, in 1902, were not even in receipt of grants, partly because the available funds were insufficient, but partly also because many of these schools could not, or would not, accept the conditions laid down by the Department. Only a minute proportion of the teachers were trained for their work; one-sixth of them had no qualifications capable of being defined. They were paid at miserable rates. In the best high schools under public control, the salary scale ranged from Rs. 25

[1] Report, especially page 369.

[2] The number of pupils in vernacular secondary schools decreased from 64,000 in 1886 to 53,000 in 1902. Fourth Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in India 1897-98 to 1901-02, Volume II, page 72.

to Rs. 200 per mensem; in the privately managed schools, from Rs. 5 to Rs. 78.[1] The average annual cost of a boy's training in a Bengal secondary school was only 18 rupees as compared with 38 rupees in Bombay, 36 in the United Provinces and 23 in Madras.[2] Manifestly it was impossible that good work should be done under such conditions and at so low a cost. Boys could be crammed for an examination; except in rare instances they could not be given a sound training. It was because the salary rates for teachers were so low, and the demands for accommodation and equipment so unexacting, that venture schools could be run in large numbers on the pupils' fees, though these were lower in Bengal than in any other province. That is to say, the education in these schools was cheap because it was bad, and bad because it was cheap.

49. In theory it ought to have been the business of the Department of Public Instruction to see that these evils were remedied. But the Department was quite unable to undertake this function. Its inspectorial staff was neither large enough to keep in touch with all the schools, nor was the staff as a whole organised for this grade of work, even if it had had the power to undertake it. But it had not the power. The Department had, and could have, no influence over any schools which did not accept grants-in-aid; even upon those which did, it could not impose very exacting conditions, lest they should be placed in a disadvantageous position as compared with the private venture schools, and be tempted to resign their grants and live on fees. Over the venture schools the only controlling authority was that which was exercised by the University through its entrance examination, which controlled the curriculum of the higher classes in all the high schools, Government, aided, and unaided alike.

50. The University did its best to meet its responsibility by refusing to admit candidates from any school which it had not recognised. But university recognition, although it gave a valuable standing to the schools, was loosely and easily given. This was inevitable; because the University had no machinery for inspecting or supervising the schools, and its governing bodies were not constituted with a view to this kind of work, and were loaded with

[1] Fourth Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in India, 1897-98 to 1901-02, Volume II, page 71.

[2] *Ibid*, page 76. The relatively low figure of Madras was due to the very great educational activities of the missionaries in that Presidency.

a multiplicity of other labours. Moreover the University necessarily fixed its attention solely upon the qualifications of candidates for academic work. It could not take into account all the many aspects of school life which cannot be tested in an examination room. It could not consider the suitability of the school course for those boys whose education would end when they left school; and who are in all countries, even in Bengal, the great majority.

51. The effect of this controlling influence of the University, and of the comparative impotence of the Department, was remarkably illustrated by the fortunes of a scheme of reform to which the Commission of 1882 attached great importance. The Commission felt strongly the danger of a too purely literary course of study such as circumstances and tradition were imposing upon all the pupils in the high schools. "It has been felt in all provinces," they report, "and urged by many witnesses, that the attention of students is too exclusively directed to university studies, and that no opportunity is offered for the development of what corresponds to the 'modern side' of schools in Europe. It is believed that there is a real need in India for some corresponding course which shall fit boys for industrial or commercial pursuits, at the age when they commonly matriculate, more directly than is effected by the present system. It appears to be the unquestionable duty of that Department of State which has undertaken the control of education, to recognise the present demand for educated labour in all branches of commercial and industrial activity, and to meet it so far as may be possible with the means at its disposal."[1] Accordingly the Commission recommended that "in the upper classes of high schools there be two divisions; one leading to the entrance examination of the University, the other of a more practical character, intended to fit youths for commercial or non-literary pursuits." And in order that a solid inducement might be given to boys to follow these courses, they recommended that "the certificate of having passed by the final standard ... of either of the proposed alternative courses, be accepted as a sufficient general test of fitness for the public service."

52. There can be no two opinions as to the desirability and importance of such a scheme of practical education as was here advocated. But the attempts which were made to give effect to the

[1] Indian Education Commission Report, 1883, page 220.

recommendation by the establishment of special classes preparatory for commercial or industrial careers, and not leading to the university entrance examination, were unsuccessful. And the reasons were obvious. In the first place, the institution of these alternative courses would cost money, which few of the schools could afford to spend. In the second place, the abler and more ambitious boys were not in the least likely to take up, at the age of fourteen or earlier, a course of study which must necessarily exclude them from the University, the goal of all ambitions in Bengal. The suggested bribe of easy admission to the public services was not likely to have any effect. It could only have been effective if boys who took the matriculation course were excluded from Government posts. This would not only have been unfair, it would have deprived the public services of their ablest and most industrious recruits. The Commission thrust upon the departments of public instruction the responsibility for making these courses successful. In doing so they showed that they had not realised the impotence to which the departments had been reduced by the recent developments of the educational system. As things were in Bengal, it was only by the co-operation of the University that the proposed scheme could be made effective ; and the Commission was actually precluded by its terms of reference from dealing with questions of university organisation, curricula and examinations. That is to say, they were precluded from dealing with one of the main roots of the problem on which they were asked to report.

53. There was only one mode in which the growing evils and deficiencies of the school system of Bengal, and the waste of young talent which they were causing, could be satisfactorily dealt with. This was the co-ordination and strengthening of all the agencies that were concerned in the control of the schools—the Department, the University, and the various public interests involved. There could be no satisfactory solution until the unhappy division of powers, which was leading to such unfortunate results, and which was impairing the influence both of the Department and of the University, was brought to an end. Some sense of the need for such a reform was shown in the proposal, debated by the Commission, that there should be instituted in each province " a consultative Board of Education, consisting of representatives of the University, of the Department of Public Instruction, and of the

community at large."[1] This reform was advocated on the ground that " it would, on the one hand, bring about and maintain a complete understanding between the Department and the University; and, on the other, it would be in a position, as representing the feelings and wishes of the community at large, to aid the Department with information and advice on educational questions of every kind." The Commission rejected the proposal, mainly on the ground that such a Board would become a sort of debating society which would only retard action. It did not consider the possibility of entrusting to such a Board the combined functions of control over secondary education exercised by the University on the one hand, and by the Department on the other. It could not consider this possibility; because the powers of the universities were definitely excluded from its purview. But it is permissible to conclude, from the general tenour of the report, that if the Commission had been free to deal with the problem as a whole, it would have seen the necessity for some organised and co-ordinated control of the whole school system.

54. Although the Commission of 1882 was debarred from considering the organisation and working of the universities, and—a still more remarkable omission—from dealing with professional and technical training, they were not excluded from dealing with the 'arts colleges' and the mode in which they were administered; and the general policy which they recommended therefore had a material bearing upon the development of university education. There was, indeed, one important question bearing upon the organisation of 'arts colleges' upon which the Commission, or at any rate their provincial committee for Bengal, held clearly defined views to which the restriction of their reference forbade them to give effect. " If educational institutions in this country," the Bengal Committee writes,[2] " are classified in accordance with systems which obtain in Europe, those only will be called colleges which teach up to recognised degrees, those high schools which teach up to the first arts, and those middle schools which teach up to the present entrance standard;" and they argue that " in the classification now made, under which institutions teaching up to the first arts standard are called colleges," there was a departure from the in-

[1] Report, page 318.

[2] Bengal Committee's Report, page 14; *see* also page 87.

tentions of the great despatch of 1854. In other words, they held that the first arts, or intermediate, standard represented the real line of division between university and school work, and that the second-grade college ought to be regarded as the highest form of secondary school.

55. But they could not discuss this question fully, or make recommendations on it, because this would have been to invade the province of the University. They could not discuss the relation of collegiate courses of study to the practical needs of the students and of the community. They could not discuss the value or appropriateness of these courses of study in themselves. They collected a great mass of statistics about colleges and their work. They spoke with a lukewarm enthusiasm about the effects of the system upon the students.[1] They made certain proposals designed to remedy the defects which they perceived; they urged, for example, that a 'moral text-book' should be compiled, and that the principal or one of the professors in every college should deliver to every class a course of lectures on the duties of a man and a citizen. They commended the benefits of properly organised residential facilities, but made no suggestions for their expansion. But although they fixed their hopes upon the "system of instruction becoming more thorough and more scientific," they had no measures to recommend whereby it could be made so; for that would have been to trench upon the sphere of the University.

56. Indeed, their main policy, that of reducing Government expenditure in this sphere, and encouraging local and private effort, was essentially irreconcilable with any large scheme for deepening and strengthening the intellectual vitality of the colleges. Extensive, not intensive, growth was the necessary result of the

[1] Report, page 300. "Of superficial learning, and of pretentious self-assertion manifested in a variety of ways, there has no doubt been plenty. It would be strange if it were otherwise. For in no country under any circumstances has there been equal or similar encouragement for such and other faults. The surroundings of the Indian student are not always favourable to the development of a high type of character. Neither in the labour nor in the recreations of those about him does he find much that sorts with his intellectual pursuits....All the greater, therefore, is the credit due to him when he rises above the influences by which he is surrounded; and, whatever his weaknesses, it may be safely said that they who best know the educated Indian have the most to urge in his favour. It may also safely be said that .... some of these faults were born of the time and the circumstances; some had root in a system of instruction now everywhere becoming more thorough and more scientific."

policy which they recommended; and most of the new colleges which were stimulated into existence by their policy during the following twenty years were necessarily weak, understaffed and incapable of affording the individual attention to the needs of the student, or of providing the varied courses of study, practical as well as literary, which were necessary for the healthy development of Bengal. The main feature of the twenty years following 1882 was to be the rapid creation of colleges which depended mainly or wholly upon fees, and throve as coaching institutions, rather than as places of learning. That is the dark side of the picture. The more favourable side is that, under the new conditions, the *bhadralok* of Bengal, more fully than ever before, threw themselves into western education, and adopted the course of high school and university as the natural and proper course to be pursued by the literate castes. Unfortunately, the methods and traditions established during this period made the adoption of a new policy, of individual and practical training, and of real learning as distinct from examination-coaching, exceedingly difficult.

57. The effects of the 1882 policy upon the development of the university system may be very rapidly reviewed, since they consisted in the transfer of Government colleges to non-Government control and the creation of a number of new colleges under private management.

58. In the first place, two Government colleges, whose suppression the Commission had recommended unless local agencies were willing to undertake their management, were transferred to local control. The Midnapur College, founded in 1873, was transferred in 1887 to the control of the municipality, and forms the only Bengal example of a college managed by a local authority. Since the transfer it has remained a second-grade college of a modest type, and has subsisted on fees and Government grants, the support given by the local authority averaging only about Rs. 1,000 per annum. In 1887 the Berhampur College, which had passed through many vicissitudes, was transferred to the control of the Maharajah of Kasimbazar, with a board of management. So generously have the Maharajah and his successor regarded their trust that this college has developed into one of the largest in the Bengal mufassal, and draws its students from every part of the Presidency. Happily the Government of Bengal did not take the advice of

the Commission in regard to the other colleges included in its lists. If it had done so, the Chittagong College, which meets the needs of a large and isolated area, would have been suppressed; and the college at Rajshahi, which is a real centre of learning for Northern Bengal, and has, in a degree unknown elsewhere, attracted the generosity of local benefactors, might have shared the fate of Midnapur.

59. The main result of the policy of 1882 was to stimulate the foundation of private colleges in all parts of the Presidency. In every case these colleges grew out of previously established high schools, and were, for a long time, not separated from them either in buildings or staff. In the majority of cases the mufassal colleges were founded by local zamindars, who provided the buildings and in some cases contributed to the upkeep; but the cost of maintenance was nearly always met for the most part out of fees and small Government grants, and revenue and expenditure were commonly made to balance by the payment of exiguous salaries to the teachers, and by the avoidance of subjects of study which necessitated costly equipment. In some cases the colleges were purely proprietary institutions, run by the head master of the school from which they sprang. Sometimes they were run at a loss, which was made good from the current profits of the school; but as the flood of candidates for degrees increased with the increase of secondary schools, the colleges also became profitable, at any rate in their more elementary departments. One of the outstanding features of all these new colleges was that, while, like their predecessors, they gave English education, unlike them they gave it without the aid of Englishmen, their students rarely or never having any contact with anyone who spoke as his native tongue the language in which all their studies were conducted.

60. It may be convenient to catalogue briefly the colleges of this type which were founded between 1882 and 1902 in Bengal—omitting Bihar and Orissa, Burma and Assam. In the metropolitan city of Calcutta the period saw the institution of four colleges: the Ripon (1884), the Bangabasi (1887) and the Central (1896), three proprietary colleges linked with schools, of which the two first rose to the first-grade in 1885 and 1890 respectively; and the St. Paul's Cathedral Mission College of the Church Missionary Society,

refounded in 1899.[1] The Ripon and the Bangabasi Colleges, along with the Metropolitan Institution[2] and the City College, which had been established at the close of the previous period, were to develope into immense and populous institutions. In the mufassal the results of the period were even more remarkable. In 1882 was founded the Burdwan College, maintained by the Maharajadhiraja; in 1884 the Jagannath College at Dacca, alongside of the flourishing Government College in that town; in 1886 the Victoria College, Narail, in the district of Jessore; in 1887 the Uttarpara College, in the district of Howrah, just across the river from Calcutta; in 1888 the Cooch Behar College, founded by the Maharaja in commemoration of the Queen's Jubilee; in 1889 the Broja Mohan College, Barisal; in 1897 the Krishnachandra College, Hetampur, in the district of Birbhum; in 1898 the Edward College, Pabna; in 1899 the Victoria College, Comilla, in the district of Tippera; and in 1901 the college at Mymensingh. It is worth noting that the last three colleges were all in Eastern Bengal, which had hitherto been less affected by the movement than the western part of the Presidency. To-day it is from Eastern Bengal that the largest number of students come; the beginning of the demand for education in that relatively isolated but fertile and populous region is an event of no small importance.

61. The very rapid increase in the number of high schools and colleges which had been encouraged by the system of 1882 was, of course, reflected in an immense increase in the number of university students. The total number in 1882 had been 3,827, of whom 2,394, or not much less than two-thirds, were students in Government colleges. The total number in 1902 was 8,150, of whom only 1,937, or much less than one-fourth, were students in Government colleges. In other words, practically the whole of this increase, which had already placed Calcutta in the position of being the numerically largest university in the world, was due to the non-Government colleges. And no less than 4,541—more than the total number of university students twenty years earlier—were studying in unaided colleges, which depended for their existence almost entirely upon the extremely low fees of the students, and were hence incapable of providing adequate equipment.

[1] It had been started in 1865 but discontinued.

[2] Now known as the Vidyasagar College.

IV.—The Commission of 1902 and the Universities Act of 1904.

62. The extraordinarily rapid development both of high schools and of colleges which had taken place since 1882 imposed upon the university system, unrevised since 1857, a very severe test; and, in the judgment of the most competent observers, it broke down under the strain. In the first place, experience showed that the governing bodies of the universities were very ill suited to the complicated and exacting work they had to perform. No limit had been placed upon the membership of the supreme body, the Senate, in which all powers were vested. The senates of all the universities had consequently been swollen by very numerous nominations of men who were appointed by Government often for purely honorific reasons, and not on the ground of their capacity for, or interest in, academic work. The members of the Senate sat for life. Many were busy officials, many were ambitious pleaders, anxious for opportunities of winning status and popularity. And this large and varied body had, in Bengal, become the chief arena of public discussion. It was only by accident that the teachers, upon whom the main work of the University fell, were represented in the Senate or its executive, the Syndicate; many teachers of distinction never had an opportunity of making their voices heard; many colleges never obtained representation. The nominally Academic Bodies. Faculties and Boards of Studies, which were responsible for drafting schemes of study and suggesting books, were appointed by the Senate from among their own number, and often consisted largely of men who had no special knowledge of the subjects they had to deal with.

63. That an organisation of this character should be entrusted with the supervision of all the high schools and colleges throughout the area of the University could not but lead to unhappy results. The multiplication of inefficient venture-schools, badly staffed and often most unhealthily housed, yet officially recognised by the University, was one of these. Another was that the collegiate system had fallen into disorganisation. There was no adequate consideration, before a college was affiliated, of its staff, equipment, and general fitness to undertake the training of young men. No clearly defined standards were imposed either in regard to staff or to equipment. Some colleges were profit-making enterprises; and the temptation to the proprietor to starve at once his

teachers and his students was dangerously strong. No requirements were made as to the proper supervision of students' residence; and the evils which had grown up as a result of the flocking of students to Calcutta threatened alarming consequences to the moral and social life of Bengal. Thus, while the University was so organised as to do nothing either for the advancement of learning or the provision of efficient teaching, it also did nothing directly to help the colleges, to which these functions were left, in dealing fairly by the young men under their care.

64. Under the old régime, which had lasted until the end of the 'seventies,' the absence of efficient university supervision had not seriously mattered, because the colleges which then existed were of manageable size, commonly imposed a limit upon the number of students they would accept, and were on the whole not ill equipped, being all either Government institutions or missionary colleges, aided by Government as well as by their home organisations. But the situation had now altogether changed. The policy of 1882 had encouraged the rise of numerous unendowed colleges, dependent upon the fees of students, and therefore tempted to admit all comers without limit or enquiry; and at the same time the Commission of 1882 had not suggested, and indeed, had no powers to suggest, any means of strengthening the control of the University over the colleges. In fact university control had become less instead of more efficient, owing to the change in the character of the Senate, and the increase in its numbers. It was widely believed that the standards of attainment represented by the examinations of the University had shown a steady decline. Such assertions are difficult to test or prove; but the enormous numbers of ill trained candidates who were now being sent in, from the schools to the entrance examination, and from the colleges to the higher examinations, made this conclusion appear probable. In any case, it was difficult for examinations on so gigantic a scale as those of Calcutta now were, to be efficiently conducted.

65. All these considerations made it appear to be urgent that the university system, left untouched by the Commission of 1882, should be overhauled; and these were the main reasons for the appointment of the Universities Commission of 1902. But another motive came to reinforce these. The University of London, the model on which all the Indian universities had been formed, was

in the throes of reconstruction. Since 1884 there had been a growing opinion that the University ought to undertake teaching functions, and that it was no true university unless it did so. Two Royal Commissions, in 1888 and in 1894, had reported that a reconstruction of the London system was necessary; both, but especially the last, had emphatically asserted that it was the duty of the University, without being deterred by considerations affecting outlying students and colleges working for London degrees, to co-ordinate the existing teaching resources in London itself, and to supplement them. And in 1898 an Act of Parliament had provided for the transformation of the University of London into a teaching university, while maintaining its system of examinations for external students. Its provisions were by no means final; before many years passed there was to be another Royal Commission which dealt with the whole problem afresh. But the changes made in London as a result of the Act of 1898 had an inevitable echo in India, where the conditions were in many respects similar to those of London. In 1902, as in 1857, the policy of London seemed to be the latest word of educational statesmanship.

66. There were four features of the London changes whose influence is directly perceptible in the Indian discussions. The first was the assertion that every university ought to be a teaching university. The second was the principle that no college should be allowed full privileges unless it was thoroughly well staffed and equipped. The third was the principle that teachers must always be intimately associated with the government of the University. The fourth was the contention that the supreme governing body of the University—called, in London as in India, the Senate—ought not to be too large. Thus once again, as so often before, educational controversy in England had its echo in India.

67. By a curious irony, the Commission of 1902 presented its report just the year before the great discussion of the principles of university organisation which accompanied the disruption of the federal Victoria University of Northern England in 1903: it is impossible not to recall the fact that the affiliating universities were set up in 1857, the very year before affiliation, as the basis of university organisation, was abandoned in London. If the Commission had followed instead of preceding 1903, it is possible that it would not have come to the decision not to discuss the

fundamental problems of university organisation, but to deal only with the immediate difficulties of the Indian system; it is possible also that having observed the rejection in England of the federal system as being, in some conditions at any rate, difficult to work and not the most favourable to rapid growth, it would have considered whether the existing Indian system showed any greater promise of adaptability.

68. But the Commission did not in its report discuss these fundamental questions. It did not ask whether the affiliating system ought ultimately to be replaced by some other mode of organisation, or suggest means whereby a transition to a new system might be gradually made. On the contrary, it assumed the permanent validity of the existing system, in its main features, and set itself only to improve and strengthen it.

69. Nothing illustrates this more clearly than the fact that in considering the projects of new universities then beginning to be advocated in India, it took for granted that they must be organised upon an affiliating basis, and rejected them mainly on the ground that there must be many colleges before there could be a university. Thus in Burma there were only two colleges, both in Rangoon. To any body of men accustomed to the working of European universities, this would have appeared a positive advantage, since it opened the possibility of organising a strong centralised university, instead of distributing the resources of the province over many weak institutions: to the Commission of 1902 it seemed to make the idea of a university in Burma unthinkable. Again, a university was desired in Nagpur: the Commission condemned the idea, on the ground that even if colleges were set up in every likely place throughout the Central Provinces, they would at the most only number eight.

70. The report of the Commission, therefore, and the Act of 1904 which was based upon it, aimed not at any fundamental reconstruction of the Indian university system, but at a rehabilitation and strengthening of the existing system. And just as the Commission of 1882 was excluded from considering university problems, so the Commission of 1902 was excluded from directly considering school problems: with the result that, equally with its predecessor, it was unable to deal with the problem as a whole.

71. The recommendations of the Commission fall into five main categories. It recommended—

(*i*) The reorganisation of university government.

(*ii*) A much more strict and systematic supervision of the colleges by the University, and the imposition of more exacting conditions of affiliation.

(*iii*) A much closer attention to the conditions under which students live and work.

(*iv*) The assumption of teaching functions by the University, within defined limits.

(*v*) Substantial changes in curricula, and in the methods of examination.

The first, second and fourth of these groups of recommendations were, with some changes, embodied, in general principle, in the Act of 1904; the third and fifth were necessarily left to be dealt with in detailed regulations, which also wrought out in detail the rest of the new system.

72. These regulations, indeed, must be taken along with the report and the Act if we are to understand the character of the new departure. The drafting of them was left by Government, in the first instance, to the new Senate. But as the Calcutta Senate had, after two years, found it impossible to complete this work, it was referred to a small committee presided over by Mr. Justice (now Sir) Asutosh Mookerjee, which completed its task in two months. It was a very great labour, whose results fill no less than 320 pages of the University Calendar. The regulations were, of course, conditioned by the terms of the Act; and they were themselves submitted in detail to the approval of Government. They constitute a thorough, careful and honest attempt to carry out in detail the principles laid down in the Act; and, while it would be inappropriate to analyse them in detail, they form a very important part of our material for the analysis of the new system.

73. In regard to government, the Senate was still retained by the Act as the supreme governing body, and, indeed, as the legal 'body corporate,' of the University. Elsewhere all the organised bodies of a university, taken together, are regarded as the body corporate; in India those teachers who do not happen to be members of the Senate are, in a legal sense, not members of the University at all. The numbers of the Senate were reduced; in the case of

Calcutta to a maximum of 100 and a minimum of 50 ordinary fellows, together with not more than ten *ex-officio* fellows. This *ex-officio* element included the directors of public instruction in all the provinces served by the University. Ten members were to be nominated by the faculties (themselves mainly composed of senators) and ten by the graduates; the remainder were to be nominated by the Chancellor, who was to be the Viceroy. At least two-fifths of the members of the Senate were to be teachers; but no provision was made for the direct representation of the teachers, or of particular subjects, or of the colleges as such.

74. Under the Senate were to be Faculties, responsible for curricula, etc.; they were to consist of members of the Senate assigned by the Senate itself, together with a limited number of co-opted members. But there was no security that even the most important teachers should be included. The executive body of the University, called the Syndicate, was the body in which reconstruction was perhaps most drastic. It was to be a small body, not more than seventeen in number. Besides the Vice-Chancellor, its Chairman, it was to include the Director of Public Instruction; and it was provided that the Syndicate should consist largely of college teachers, who were to number at the minimum one less than a majority, while they might constitute an actual majority. But only teachers who were members of the Senate were eligible.

75. The Act thus, in fact, gave to teachers, or to those teachers who by election or nomination became members of the Senate, a real voice in the government of the University. But the teachers as a body were given no place on the Senate, nor were the colleges as such; even the professors whom the Act empowered the University to appoint were in no way recognised in the scheme of government; and no means were provided for ensuring that the ablest and most stimulating teachers should be ensured of any power of influencing university policy. It was therefore only a half-hearted and imperfect advance which was made towards that constant and vital consultation of the teachers which is of the essence of a genuine teaching university.

76. But perhaps the main result of the Act was to make the control and supervision of the Government over university policy more direct and effective than it had hitherto been. Not only was the Viceroy, as Chancellor, empowered to nominate an overwhelming majority of the Senate (a possible 80 of the non-official

members); his approval was made necessary for the election of the remaining 20; and the Government of India retained the power, conferred upon it by the Act of 1857, of cancelling any appointment. Moreover, the Vice-Chancellor, the chief executive officer of the University, was to be appointed by the Government; all regulations of the University must be submitted to the Government for its approval; all affiliations and disaffiliations of colleges must be finally determined by it; all professors, readers and lecturers of the University must be approved by it; in short, almost every detail of university policy was made subject to its supervision.

77. The object of these provisions was no doubt to prevent a renewal or extension of the evils which had come into being during the previous twenty years. As we shall see, they have not been successful in this end. The universities of India are, under the terms of the Act of 1902, in theory, though not in practice, among the most completely governmental universities in the world. Since the Act, the Government of India has been removed from Calcutta to Delhi. It is therefore a Government 1,000 miles away from the seat of the University, and not itself engaged in any kind of academic work, which is ultimately responsible not merely for the general supervision and assistance which such a Government, by its very aloofness, may be well able to give, but for the direction of university policy, and for almost every detail of university action. It may perhaps be permissible to suggest that such a system is apt to undermine the sense of responsibility of the governing bodies of the University. A university which deserves the name ought to be so constituted that it can be trusted to carry on its purely academic affairs without constant interference.

78. One of the objects of the Act of 1904 seems to have been the production of a greater harmony between the University and the Department of Public Instruction in the regulation of schools; and it was doubtless in part for this reason that four directors of public instruction were made *ex-officio* members of the Senate, and the Bengal Director a permanent member of the Syndicate. The Commission had recognised[1] the importance of the subject, and had noted that "the universities have no adequate machinery for ascertaining the condition of schools, and at Calcutta the Syndicate has sometimes insisted on recognising new venture schools without

[1] Report, page 20.

due regard to the interests of sound education and discipline." They had recommended that the University should only recognise schools recognised by the Department of Public Instruction, and this principle was in fact adopted at Allahabad and in the Punjab. But it was, in Bengal, an impracticable condition, because the Department only had contact with the Government and aid-receiving schools, the remainder never even submitting to inspection.

79. Accordingly the new system attempted a compromise. Elaborate provisions were laid down in regulations as to the conditions which a school must fulfil before receiving recognition. It was provided that reports on these points from the Government Inspectors, submitted through the Director, now an *ex-officio* member of the Syndicate, should usually be accepted as sufficient. But to the Syndicate—a body already burdened with the whole complex business of administering an immense university—was reserved the final power of decision. The new system was an improvement on its predecessor. But it has not worked, and it could not work, with perfect smoothness; if for no other reason, because the Syndicate was not a body specially qualified for such work, since it was only by accident that it could include any members experienced in school conditions; and also because the relations between the Syndicate and the staff of the Department, who were called upon to do its work, but were not its servants, could not but be delicate. The new system perhaps dealt with the problem—one of the most difficult and important in Bengal—as well as it could be dealt with in a measure which was concerned only with university organisation. But for a wholly satisfactory solution a far more intimate co-ordination of the interests involved was needed.

80. The second feature of the new system was the introduction of a stricter and more systematic regulation of the colleges. One aspect of this problem was the necessity of making a clearer definition between school and college. "When a college has grown out of a high school," the commission reported, "we think it important that the college classes should be conducted in a separate building and under separate management,"[1] and although this provision was not incorporated in the Act, it has been gradually put into force by the exercise of the powers of recognition and affiliation vested in the University. This constitutes a real reform.

[1] Report, page 19.

81. But its application was difficult in the case of second-grade colleges, which were generally "only high schools which have added two college classes to their curriculum, in order to keep their pupils two years longer." Different views were possible as to the desirability of this arrangement. In the *Fourth Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in India, 1897-1902*, which was written by Mr. R. Nathan, the Secretary of the Commission, it was stated that "the first half of the course for the degree of B. A. is in reality a prolongation of the school course, and from this point of view the complete Indian school is the second-grade college teaching up to the standard of the first arts or intermediate examination of the University."[1] In these opinions Mr. Nathan was in agreement with the Bengal Committee of the Education Commission of 1882. If he and they were right in thinking that the intermediate course was really school work, it would appear obvious that it would be best carried on by school methods, that the linking of it with the high school was by no means undesirable, and that the real line of diversion ought rather to be at the intermediate than at the matriculation stage. In any case, the second-grade college would be, on this view, a very useful type of institution.

82. But the Commissioners do not seem to have shared this view. They assumed that the intermediate work must be regarded as pure university work; and recommended "that the universities should decline to affiliate new second-grade colleges. In the case of those now affiliated," they continued, "we consider that the aim of Government and of the University should be to effect gradual separation, so that university students should receive their education in colleges properly so called. Those second-grade colleges which cannot hope to rise to the first grade ought, we think, to revert to the position of high schools."[2] In other words, the second-grade college, instead of being regarded as a useful institution—'the complete Indian school,' in Mr. Nathan's words,—was to be condemned because it did not undertake the whole university course.[3]

83. The policy of hostility to the second-grade colleges thus defined was not, in fact, adopted by the Government of India.

[1] Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in India, 1897-98 to 1901-02, pages 93-94.

[2] Report, page 19.

[3] It ought to be noted that Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee recorded his dissent from this commendation, very much on the ground here stated: Report, page 79.

Every provincial Government save one has declared that it would be a mistake to dispense with these institutions; and one of the reasons for this view undoubtedly is that, just because the intermediate work is largely school work, it can be reasonably well done by modest institutions near the homes of the students, which will make it unnecessary to drain away boys from their homes, at the early age of 16 or 17, to the often unsatisfactory conditions of city life. The second-grade college, therefore, survived in spite of the condemnation of the Commissioners. But it had been told that it was an inferior and undesirable institution; and that, instead of being content to do what it could do reasonably well, it ought to provide the whole of the teaching necessary to enable its students to take the B. A. degree. We cannot conceal our belief that this was an unfortunate conclusion.[1]

84. The recommendations of the Commission also led to other reforms in college organisation about whose desirability there was much less ground for doubt. It was laid down that every college must be provided with a governing body, in which representatives of the teachers must be included, and that it must be a public educational institution, the whole of whose income was expended for its own purposes. This provision (in theory, at any rate) should have brought to an end the evils of the profit-making proprietary colleges; it also introduced the principle of the participation of the teachers in academic administration in the sphere of the college as in that of the University, though only somewhat tentatively and ineffectively.

85. But the most important change in the position of the colleges was due to the new rules of affiliation. Instead of being affiliated in general terms, the colleges were henceforth to be affiliated in particular subjects, and up to defined stages of the curriculum; the Government, after report from the University, having the deciding voice as to whether any individual college had sufficient staff or equipment for teaching a given subject at a given stage; and all the existing affiliations were revised from this point of view. Moreover all colleges were to be open to periodical inspection and report, and all changes in their staff were to be reported to the University; which now obtained the power, subject to Government approval, not merely of totally disaffiliating a college—the only

[1] See Chapter XII, where this question is more fully discussed.

power it had earlier possessed, and one so extreme that it could not be exercised—but of disaffiliating it in a particular subject at a particular grade.

86. Unquestionably these provisions have led to great improvements in the staff and equipment of the colleges. But they could not be wholly satisfactory. In spite of its increased powers, the University could not in practice ensure that the teaching in the colleges was of adequate quality, or stipulate for a sufficient salary for the teachers. If the college made an unsatisfactory appointment in (say) English, the theoretical power of disaffiliation in that subject could not in practice be employed; because to disaffiliate a college in English would be to exclude all its students from practically all examinations, and to do this on the ground that one out of three or four teachers of the subject was insufficiently qualified must obviously be impracticable. So long as the college paid the whole salaries of its staff, and provided the whole teaching of its students, adequate control of teaching by the University was out of the question. At the same time, the attempt to make this control a reality involved, in some cases, an undue amount of interference with the freedom of the colleges. Strict rules such as the new regulations imposed, regarding the number of hours of instruction to be given in each subject, and the number of attendances to be exacted from each student, were intended, of course, as a safeguard against an insufficient provision of instruction, but they needlessly, and sometimes mischievously, tied the hands of the better colleges in dealing with the individual needs of their students. Such a provision as that which ordained that no teacher should teach more than a single subject was aimed against obvious abuses, but was liable to lead to unfortunate results in particular cases.

87. Even more important than the regulations affecting college teaching, from the point of view of the welfare of students, were the provisions now made in regard to students' residence: a problem which had been hitherto almost wholly disregarded, except in a few colleges. The Commission had urged the need for attention to the subject, and suggested that "in course of time...the provision of quarters for all students not residing with parents and guardians may be made one of the conditions of affiliation." Accordingly the Act laid it down, as one of the conditions on which a college had to satisfy the Syndicate, that "provision will be

made in conformity with the regulations for the residence, in the college or in lodgings approved by the college, of students not residing with their parents or guardians."[1]

88. But the enforcement of adequate residential accommodation was in practice impossible. The resources of the colleges did not permit of it. It was not until the State found large funds for the erection of hostels that any material improvement could be brought about; and even then the difficulty of acquiring land in Calcutta, its high cost, and the constantly increasing stream of students drawn in from the mufassal, made any adequate solution of the problem impossible. Still, the problem had been raised, and was being tackled. It can only be solved in the end by some device which will enable at any rate the younger students to obtain the training they need near their homes, or in places where residence can be provided at a reasonable cost.

89. The conditions of student life, and the character of the training afforded by the colleges, were thus very materially improved as a result of the Act of 1904 and of the work which it set on foot; and we desire cordially to recognise the reality and value of these achievements. Nevertheless there remained much need for further improvement; and the system outlined by the Commission and in the Act suggested no solution for some of the difficulties. No means had been discovered for ensuring to the teachers adequate salaries and a reasonable security of tenure, without which it is impossible to expect work of high quality. Above all, in spite of the closer supervision of the colleges by the University, the colleges were still left, under the revised as under the unrevised system of affiliation, organised as entirely distinct units, each responsible for the whole of the teaching received by its students; each, therefore claiming to be, in practice, so far as teaching was concerned, a university *in petto*. This was the case even in Calcutta, where many colleges were clustered closely together. Though the regulations permitted a student to take a course in another college in a subject in which his own college was not affiliated, no means of facilitating such interchange were devised; and it was not even suggested as desirable that the colleges should supplement one another's work in those subjects in which they were affiliated, and thus avoid waste and increase their efficiency. Nor was it suggested

[1] Clause 2(*c*).

that the University ought to supplement the resources of the colleges for the training of the undergraduate. In spite of the proclamation of the principle that the University must become a teaching corporation, it was still held that it ought not to meddle in the teaching of undergraduate students; so strong were the traditions of the affiliating system.

90. Hence, though the transformation of the universities into teaching universities was stated to be one of the principal aims of the new system, this change did not affect the undergraduates. Clause 3 of the Act, indeed, described the University as being incorporated for the purpose (among others) of "making provision for the instruction of students," a phrase which might seem to include undergraduates. But the Act was interpreted in the light of the recommendations of the Commission, whose view was that "inasmuch as the better colleges already make adequate provision for the instruction leading up to the degrees of B.A. and B.Sc., it does not appear that the intervention of the University at this stage would be attended by good results."[1] The provision made by even the best of the colleges was not as good as that of most universities in the West. But however 'adequate' their provision might be, according to Indian standards, it is not easy to understand why their ablest students should be denied the opportunity of hearing university professors, or why those professors should be denied the opportunity of teaching them. Moreover, if it was only in the better colleges that the provision was even 'adequate,' it is hard to see why the students in the other colleges should not be afforded some means of making good their inadequacy. A possible reason for this conclusion which has been adduced by others, though not by the Commissioners, was that the students in the mufassal colleges could not take advantage of these opportunities if they were offered; in other words, the weakness of the mufassal was to be regarded as a ground for debarring Calcutta from making full use of its resources.

91. It was only in the sphere of post-graduate or advanced studies, then, that the provision of instruction by the University was contemplated. "We suggest," said the Commission, "that the universities may justify their existence as teaching bodies

[1] Report, page 6.

by making further provision for advanced courses of study." For this purpose alone professorships, readerships and lecturerships were to be established, but the teachers thus appointed, however distinguished, were to be debarred from exercising any direct influence upon the mass of students in the most critical period of their training, or from picking out and giving guidance to young men of special promise. The fallacy and danger of drawing a sharp line of division between undergraduate and higher teaching has been often demonstrated. Yet this line of division was definitely drawn, for no apparent reason, unless it were the fear that the jealousy of the colleges might be aroused. But the jealousy of the colleges was surely less likely to be awakened by an offer of relief and help in their own work than by a proclamation that their work was of an inferior character, such as was implied in these proposals. Thus the principle that the University ought to be a teaching body was adopted only in a timid and deprecating way, and in a form which drew an unfortunate distinction between the University and its colleges. No attempt was made to achieve, what has been partly attained as a result of the London University Act of 1898, a sort of synthesis of university and college, wherein each should help and supplement the other.

92. The remarkable expansion of post-graduate teaching under the direct auspices of the University which has been achieved as a result of the new principle laid down in 1904, and by the help of large grants from the State, and private benefactions on a scale hitherto unexampled in Bengal, will be described elsewhere.[1] It showed that much could be done by the University to concentrate and consolidate the teaching resources of Calcutta. It showed that these resources were greater than had been supposed. It set, in some respects, new standards of method in university teaching which might be expected to exercise their influence in course of time upon the work of the colleges. Taken in conjunction with the concurrent reorganisation of the colleges rendered necessary by the Act, and with the attempt to deal with the problem of students' residence rendered possible by large government grants, it represents an expenditure of labour and thought so great, and a skill in organisation so considerable, as to inspire solid hopes for the future.

[1] Chapter XV.

93. But it cannot be denied that the whole process of reconstruction begun in 1904 was in several respects open to criticism. The creation of a large university staff, to which it ultimately led, inevitably had the effect of drawing many of the best teachers from the colleges; and as the colleges were still left wholly responsible for the training of undergraduates, this meant that the improvements effected by the new regulations were to some extent discounted. The artificial line of division between the 'higher' work undertaken by the University and the 'lower' work left to the colleges, which had been suggested by the Commission of 1902, could not but be unhappy in its results: no work can be 'higher' or more exacting than the training of the ablest youth of a whole nation in the methods of study and independent thought during the critical years of their adolescence. An effective synthesis between college and university was still undiscovered when the reforms of 1904 had been worked out to their conclusion.

94. In truth, the foundations of a sound university organisation had not yet been laid. The problems of high school training and organisation were unresolved. The critical period of training when the young student is being emancipated from the rigid curriculum of a 'general' school education, and has to begin to choose among divergent paths, had not been carefully enough considered; in most countries this period belongs to the upper end of the school course, and is still treated by school methods; in India, though many recognised that it was essentially school work, it was included in the university curriculum, and the Commission of 1902 had confirmed and strengthened this mode of treating it by banning the second-grade college, which might have been made into a useful compromise between school and college. The problem of students' residence had been realised, but found to be baffling; there had been little serious consideration of the question whether it was really necessary that boys should be drawn into big centres like Calcutta at a very early age, and whether the problem might not find some solution in devices for providing them with the earlier part of their training nearer home. Large amounts of public money had been expended, but mainly on the highest branches, not on the strengthening of the foundations.

95. It is a surprising fact that in spite of the increased strictness of the requirements for affiliation only one of the colleges ex-

isting in 1902 was disaffiliated for non-compliance; and in 1907 two new colleges (the Wesleyan Mission College, Bankura, and the Hindu Academy, Daulatpur) were founded, while the college at Mymensingh, disaffiliated in 1908, was promptly reorganised by a local committee and reaffiliated. The main reason for this was that the number of aspirants after a university education was still increasing more rapidly than ever, not checked, but rather encouraged, by the provisions of 1904; and the colleges found that an increasing fee-revenue enabled them to meet the new demands. By 1917 the number of pupils in high schools, which in 1902 had been 191,648 for Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, had risen to 218,070 for Bengal alone; and the number of candidates for the matriculation examination had reached 16,088. The rate of increase since 1902 had thus been greater than the rate of increase in any other period.

96. The problem of controlling so large a mass of students, and of providing them with the kind of training they needed, was as difficult as ever, in spite of the improvements made since 1904. Even the problem of organising the examination of candidates in such vast numbers was becoming extremely difficult. And it was evident that the time had come for exploring the problem once more, and for considering whether changes even more fundamental than those suggested in 1902 had not become necessary. Since the report of 1902 the growth of the University has been such that on that ground alone reorganisation must have become necessary. Such reorganisation, in our view, should be something more than a mere readjustment or enlargement of administrative machinery. To be effective and fruitful it must be based on a fresh examination, as searching as possible, of the whole system of education of which the University forms part.

CHAPTER IV.

Government and Private Effort in Education in India.

Historical note with special reference to Bengal.

I.

1. A characteristic feature of Bengal is the exceptionally large proportion of high schools which are under private management. There is nothing like it elsewhere in India. In the United Provinces nearly half the high schools are managed either by Government or by a public local authority. In the Punjab, one out of every three. In Bombay, one out of every four. In Madras, about one out of every five. But in Bengal, only one out of every fourteen.[1]

2. The ubiquity of privately managed high schools in Bengal is in part due to the influence upon the Government, especially during the years 1854—1884, of ideas then prevalent in England as to the limits within which the State should confine its action with regard to secondary education. The reasons which at that time carried great weight with statesmen and administrators in England and made them disinclined to extend the activities of the

[1] These figures are based upon the following statistics for the year 1914-15.

Presidency or Province.	English high schools managed by Government.	English high schools managed by municipal or district boards.	English high schools aided by Government or by municipal or district boards.	Unaided English high schools.
Bengal, including Eastern Bengal and Assam, but excluding Bihar and Orissa.	38	4	225	319
Bombay	21	4	58	16
Madras	4	32	130	4
United Provinces	47	4	54	8
Punjab	29	12	65	14
Central Provinces	18	4	15	1
North-West Frontier Province	6	..	8	..
Burma	16	..	18	..

State in this sphere of education operated hardly less powerfully in Bengal. But during the last thirty years experience has more fully disclosed the value and importance of secondary education as a means of enhancing the social welfare and economic resourcefulness of the community. It has therefore been found necessary in England to employ on a very considerable scale the authority and resources of Government for the extension and financial support of secondary education and for the increase of its efficiency. The experience of Germany however shows that a very highly organised system of Governmental control over the teaching and management of secondary schools may weaken independence of individual judgment. Events have shown the importance of combining variety of educational influence with better organisation of educational effort. This raises in a new form the question of the part which Government should take in influencing the aims and methods of secondary education, and what degree of freedom it should permit to private schools. The problem of the right relationship between the State and private enterprise in secondary education is probably more urgent in Bengal and in England than anywhere else in the world. In both countries a wise and acceptable settlement of this question is much to be desired, both in the interest of the community as a whole and in the interest of the University, of which the secondary schools are the foundation.

3. As the matter has a close bearing upon university problems in Bengal and upon the educational policy of the province, we propose in this chapter to examine it in the light of the relationship which has hitherto subsisted between the Government and private effort in education in India.

II.

4. The policy of developing education in India not only by the foundation of colleges and schools which the Government itself would manage and support but also by the offer of grants-in-aid to inspected non-Governmental institutions was first laid down upon a systematic plan in 1854. But for more than half a century before that time, administrative practice had gradually prepared the way for such an arrangement and in some cases had actually anticipated it.

5. The foundation of the Calcutta Madrassah in 1781 and of the Hindu Sanskrit College at Benares in 1791 were the most conspicuous instances in which the Court of Directors of the East India Company established at an early date educational institutions at the public cost and under official superintendence. In addition to this, the Company maintained regimental schools in the three presidencies[1] and encouraged its chaplains at the headquarters of the Government and at some other stations to give elementary instruction to the children of Indian parents.[2] In a few cases the Court of Directors adopted the plan of making grants to educational societies (for example to the Bombay Society for the Education of the Poor in 1815, and to the Calcutta School Society in 1823) and even of aiding schools which were not under their own control, as for example in 1787 when they made a permanent annual grant to a small group of Protestant Mission schools in Madras Presidency which were under the direction of Mr. Swartz. And indirectly the Directors gave contributions towards the education both of Musalmans and of Hindus by continuing the payment of grants of money made "in former times to learned or religious persons who maintained a school for one or more of the sciences and taught therein gratuitously. Though not expressed in the deed itself, the duty of continuing such gratuitous instruction was certainly implied in all such grants."[3]

6. In 1813 an Act of Parliament empowered the Governor General in Council to apply not less than one lakh of rupees in each year "to the revival and improvement of literature and the encouragement of the learned natives of India, and for the introduction and promotion of a knowledge of the sciences among the inhabitants of the British territories in India."[4] This section

[1] The schools were for "the education of natives who enter the military service of the Company, and of their children." Report of the Select Committee of the House of Commons on the affairs of the East India Company, 1832. Appendix I, pages 460-465.

[2] Memoir submitted by Mr. Fisher, Searcher of the Records at the East India House, page 396. "From a very early period the charge of instructing the natives of India devolved principally upon the Company's chaplains. To excite them to the diligent performance of this branch of their duty, the local Governments (acting under the orders of the Court of Directors and under the authority of the Company's Charter) occasionally granted to them gratuities for special services rendered in the performance of this duty."

[3] *Ibid.*

[4] Chapter XVI, para 4.

of the Act also provided that "any schools, public lectures or other institutions for the purposes aforesaid which shall be founded at the Presidencies of Fort William, Fort St. George or Bombay or in any other parts of the British territories in India, in virtue of the Act, shall be governed by such regulations as may from time to time be made by the said Governor General in Council ....provided always that all appointments to offices in such schools, lectureships and other institutions shall be made by or under the authority of the Governments within which the same shall be situated."

7. In June 1814 the Court of Directors, in a letter to the Governor-General in Council of Bengal, gave directions as to the mode in which it was desirable to proceed in giving effect to the clause. The Directors wrote: "We have kept in view those peculiar circumstances of our political relation with India, which, having necessarily transferred all power and pre-eminence from Native to European agency, have rendered it incumbent upon us from motives of policy as well as from a principle of justice, to consult the feelings, and even to yield to the prejudices, of the Natives wherever it can be done with safety to our dominions. Neither of these objects is, we apprehend, to be obtained through the medium of public colleges if established under the rules of, and upon a plan similar to, those that have been founded at our universities, because the Natives of caste and reputation will not submit to the subordination and discipline of a college; and we doubt whether it would be practicable to devise any specific plan which would promise the successful accomplishment of the objects under consideration. We are inclined to think that the mode by which the learned Hindoos might be disposed to concur with us in prosecuting those objects would be by our leaving them to the practice of usage, long established among them, of giving instruction at their own homes, and by our encouraging them in the exercise and cultivation of their talents, by the stimulus of honorary marks of distinction and in some instances by grants of pecuniary assistance."[1]

[1] The sums spent upon education under the authority of this section of the Act of 1813 were small, rarely reaching £10,000 in any one year before 1824 and amounting to £363,000 for the period 1813-30. The grants were for the chief part devoted to the encouragement of oriental learning.

8. For some years after the passing of the Act of 1813, Indian opinion, both Muslim and Hindu, continued to show a strong preference for education upon traditional lines. Wherever it was thought desirable to give financial aid to such education apart from that provided in the institutions founded by Government, the need was met in a way consonant with Indian feeling by the Government making personal grants to individual teachers. But the desire for western education began to show itself among the Hindus, especially in Calcutta. In 1816 a number of wealthy and public spirited Indian gentlemen, warmly supported by the Chief Justice, Sir Edward Hyde East, by David Hare and other Europeans, subscribed a capital sum of more than a lakh of rupees for the foundation of a college in Calcutta for the instruction of sons of Hindus in the European and Indian languages and science. The work of this institution, the Hindu College, had a widespread influence. Ram Mohan Roy's memorial to Lord Amherst in 1823, advocating western education and expressing disappointment at its omission from the plan for the Calcutta Sanskrit College mooted in 1821, showed the strength of the new current in Hindu opinion and gave direction to it. In 1831 the Bengal Committee of Public Instruction, which had been established by the Government in 1823, reported that " a taste for English had been widely disseminated and independent schools, conducted by young men reared in the Hindu College, were springing up in every direction." Several rich Indians had founded English schools at their own expense. The Committee of Public Instruction received more applications for the establishment of new English schools than they were able to meet. The action of Government was thus insufficient to satisfy the rapidly growing demand among the Hindus for western education. The question what attitude Government should adopt towards schools not under its own control had arisen in a new form through the eagerness of the Hindus for instruction in English and in the knowledge of the West. The time was evidently coming when the Government would be called upon to decide whether it should give financial aid to schools which under Indian management imparted education on western lines.

9. The desire among the Hindus, especially in Bengal, for English education continued to grow rapidly. The Calcutta School Book Society in 1834-35 sold two books in English for every one

in any Indian vernacular. In 1835 Lord William Bentinck and his Council resolved that "the great object of the British Government ought to be the promotion of European literature and science among the natives of India and that all funds appropriated for the purposes of education would be best employed upon English education alone," without however the abolition of any "college or school of native learning while the native population shall appear to be inclined to avail themselves of the advantages which it affords." The funds at the disposal of Government were devoted in the main to the establishment of Government colleges for the supply of western education. But, though Muslim opinion was still adverse to the new learning, the demand for English schools was greater than Government could meet by the foundation of institutions under its own control. Independent English schools grew quickly in number.

10. In the decade 1835-45, another body of opinion strongly re-inforced that among the Hindus which desired freedom of initiative in the diffusion of English education. This new force was directed by leaders among the European missionaries. They desired freedom for the growth of their own educational institutions and were adverse to any preferential treatment being given to pupils educated in Government colleges, still more to any tendency towards making western education a monopoly of Government. The issue was joined when Lord Hardinge's resolution of 1844 was put into operation. The resolution had noted "the results of the measures adopted of late years for the instruction of the people, as well by the Government as by private individuals and societies." It declared that "in every possible case a preference shall be given, in the selection of candidates for public employment, to those who have been educated in the institutions thus established, and especially to those who have distinguished themselves therein by a more than ordinary degree of merit and attainment." But the Committee of Public Instruction, when it proceeded to frame regulations for the conduct of examinations for candidates for Government service, gave prominence to the subjects of study in the Government colleges and felt it necessary to exclude certain books and subjects which were studied in the missionary colleges. This provoked an animated controversy, and protests were made by some of the missionary leaders against what they regarded as preferential treatment given to

pupils from colleges under Government management. This sharp conflict of opinion was one of the causes which led the Council of Education in Calcutta to propose in 1845 the establishment of a university. The University was to be an examining body. Its examinations, which would show the qualifications of candidates for posts in the public service, were to be open to all institutions whether Government or private, approved by the Senate of the University. The need for such a university was urged by its promoters on the ground of " the present advanced state of education in the Bengal Presidency with the large and annually increasing number of highly educated pupils both in public and private institutions." It was hoped that after a few years the fee-fund would be more than sufficient to defray all the expenses of the University. The adoption of the plan would enable the claims of students both from Government and from private colleges to be met by an impartial authority so constituted as to command the confidence of all engaged in the work of English education.

11. The plan for the establishment of a University of Calcutta made in this form in 1845 was not favourably received by the authorities in England. But, owing to the rapid increase in the desire for English education and the inability of the Government to provide from public funds all the schools which were required, the situation became more complex and the need for a new declaration of educational policy increased. It happened that an emergency, similar in regard to many of the questions involved, was successfully met in English elementary education in 1846 by a policy which gave, on condition of inspection, Government recognition and aid to schools and training colleges of various types and under different forms of management. The analogy between some of the factors in the English situation and those in Bengal suggested the application to education in India of the principles which had proved acceptable to the mass of public opinion in England. The outcome was the general educational despatch of July 19, 1854.

12. The problem in Bengal was to determine the relation of Government to three distinct types of English schools ; those under Government, those conducted by missionary societies and those under private management. In Bengal and Bihar in 1853 there were about 31 English schools and colleges under the immediate direction of Government. The missionary schools and colleges

numbered 22. The number of proprietary and private schools, though admittedly large, was not accurately known. It was estimated that the total number of pupils (about 4,000) in Government schools and colleges was about half of the number of pupils in the missionary and other non-Governmental institutions taken together. Thus, within forty years from the date of the establishment of the Hindu College, there had arisen in the field of English education a position similar to that in the field of oriental education, in which also there were two types of institution—those maintained by Government and those independent of Government control. And, as it had long been the practice of Government to grant subsidies to privately managed institutions for oriental learning, administrative experience was likely to incline to the adoption of a similar policy with regard to English education, especially as the method of making grants-in-aid to the work of independent educational societies had been found convenient in many parts of India since 1815 when the Government began to make an annual grant to the Bombay Society for the Education of the Poor.

III.

13. In their general educational despatch of July 19th, 1854, to the Governor-General of India in Council, the Court of Directors of the East India Company gave a precise and memorable definition of their policy in regard to the encouragement of private effort in education. The despatch embodies the principles which underlay the famous minutes of the English Committee of Council on Education, issued in 1846. Just as those minutes, due in great measure to the influence of Sir James Kay-Shuttleworth, were of determinative importance in deciding the relation of Government to non-Governmental schools in England and Wales, so was the despatch of 1854 with regard to the relations between Government and education in India. The following sections of the despatch deal with the subject of private effort in education and the system of grants-in-aid.

"(51) The consideration of the impossibility of the Government alone doing all that must be done in order to provide adequate means for the education of the natives of India, and of the ready assistance which may be derived from efforts which have hitherto received but little encouragement from the State, has led us to the natural conclusion that the most effectual method of providing for the wants of India in this respect will be to combine with the agency of the Government the aid which may be derived

from the exertions and liberality of the educated and wealthy natives of India and of other benevolent persons.

(52) We have, therefore, resolved to adopt in India the system of grants-in-aid which has been carried out in this country with very great success; and we confidently anticipate, by thus drawing support from local resources in addition to contributions from the State, a far more rapid progress of education than would follow a mere increase of expenditure by the Government; while it possesses the additional advantage of fostering a spirit of self-reliance upon local exertions and combination for local purposes which is of itself of no mean importance to the well-being of a nation.

(53) The system of grants-in-aid, which we propose to establish in India, will be based upon an entire abstinence from interference with the religious instruction conveyed in the school assisted. Aid will be given (so far as the requirements of each particular district, as compared with others, and the funds at the disposal of Government, may render it possible) to all schools which impart a good secular education, provided that they are under adequate local management (by the term 'local management' we understand one or more persons, such as private patrons, voluntary subscribers or the trustees of endowments, who will undertake the general superintendence of the school and be answerable for its permanence for a given time); and provided also that their managers consent that their schools shall be subject to Government inspection and agree to any conditions which may be laid down for the regulation of such grants . . . .

(61) We desire to see local management under Government inspection and assisted by grants-in-aid taken advantage of wherever it is possible to do so, and that no Government colleges or schools shall be founded in future in any district where a sufficient number of institutions exist, capable with assistance from the State of supplying the local demand for education . . . .

(62) We look forward to a time when any general system of education entirely provided by Government may be discontinued, with the gradual advance of the system of grants-in-aid. But it is far from our wish to check the spread of education in the slightest degree by the abandonment of a single school to probable decay."[1]

14. Five years later (April 1859), the Secretary of State for India re-opened the subject in a despatch to the Government of India. He wrote that—"The time seems to have arrived when some examination may be instituted into the operations of the orders despatched from this country in 1854 for the prosecution of measures on a more extended scale for promoting education in India. Such an examination seems more especially required since the measures, and more particularly the recent measures, of Government for the promotion of education have been

[1] *A Collection of Despatches from the Home Government on the Subject of Education in India, 1854 to 1868* (Calcutta, Published by Authority, 1870), pages 13 and 15.

alleged to be among the causes which have brought about the recent outbreak in the army of Bengal, and the disquietude and apprehension which were believed to have prevailed in some portions ot Her Majesty's Indian territories."

15. In his summary of the chief points of the despatch of 1854, the Secretary of State made it plain that, in his opinion, the aim of the Government in introducing the system of grants-in-aid had been to stimulate and encourage the efforts of " private individuals and of local committees " by pecuniary grants in consideration of a good secular education being given in the aided schools.

16. He said " on the whole, Her Majesty's Government can entertain little doubt that the grant-in-aid system, as hitherto in force, is unsuited to the supply of vernacular education to the masses of the population." But with regard to secondary education the case was different. " Assistance for the establishment or improvement of anglo-vernacular schools has been obtained to a great extent by natives, whether individually or in association, and in some cases proposals have been made by natives with a view to the formation of higher or collegiate schools where the instruction was to be conveyed by means of English, though from different causes no such institutions have yet been formed."[1]

17. It is clear that the Government contemplated the continuance of schools under private management and was not disposed to interfere with the establishment of new schools which sprang from private effort. It was hoped that the offer of grants-in-aid would draw an increasing number of such schools within the sphere of inspection and guidance and thus gradually improve the standard of the education which they gave. " Such a system as this, placed in all its degrees under efficient inspection, beginning with the humblest elementary instruction and ending with the university test of a liberal education, ... would, we firmly believe, impart life and energy to education in India, and lead to a gradual but steady extension of its benefits to all classes of people."[2]

18. In 1864 the same principles were re-affirmed. In a despatch dated January 23rd of that year, the Secretary of State,

[1] *A Collection of Despatches from the Home Government on the Subject of Education in India, 1854 to 1868* (Calcutta, Published by Authority), pages 123-125.

[2] Despatch of 1854, para. 47.

discussing some difficulties which had arisen through the operation of the rules prescribed by the local Governments, remarked that "the amount of grants-in-aid after the lapse of eight years from the system being brought into actual operation, bears, except in Bengal, a very small proportion to the direct expenditure of Government on education." He observes that "the rules in Bengal, which are framed on broad and liberal principles, have not, as a general rule, been applied in a stringent manner. Under the operation of those rules, assistance has been afforded in the establishment and maintenance of a large number of vernacular and anglo-vernacular schools, promoted by individual natives or by the local community."[1] Bengal is thus singled out for praise as having liberally encouraged private effort in education. The Secretary of State ends his despatch with an expression of his desire (reiterated in paragraph 4 of a later despatch, dated March 9th, 1866) that the grant-in-aid rules should "interfere as little as possible with the free action of those who may seek under their operation to promote the spread of education among the masses of the people."

19. During the next twenty years "the establishment of private high schools was sedulously fostered by the Department of Public Instruction in Bengal, so that in 1882 there were 156 high schools under native management, 96 of which received grants-in-aid."[2] It was during this period that privately managed secondary schools became a distinctive feature of the system of education in the Presidency. The officers of the Department of Public Instruction described their efforts to encourage private enterprise in secondary education in the following terms. "As no distinction is made in the exercise of patronage in appointments, which is entirely guided by the results of university examinations, and as scholarships are competed for on equal terms by students of both Government and private institutions, the relations of departmental officers with the managers of private schools are thoroughly cordial. Educational officers are frequently invited by private managers to visit

[1] Despatch No. 1, January 23rd, 1864, para. 6. In the "Report of the Bengal Provincial Committee" (Calcutta, 1884), page 20, it is stated that "in 1863 the expenditure by the Bengal Government on aided schools amounted to 33 per cent. of its outlay on Government institutions of all classes."

[2] Report by the Bengal Provincial Committee (addressed to the Indian Education Commission) of 1882, page 135.

their schools.....and they are ordinarily consulted on matters connected with school management and the course of instruction. Whenever, in the opinion of the officers of the Department, the establishment of a competing school is likely to prove injurious to the interests of the scholars concerned by the substitution of two comparatively weak schools for one strong one .....the departmental officers have not encouraged the opening of such a school, although their interference has generally taken no more active form than the refusal to recommend a grant-in-aid in such cases. The Department has acted on the principle that, if the new school is essentially a bad one, real and often lasting harm is done : the discipline of both schools suffers, and a lower standard, both of instruction and of conduct, is substituted for a higher. Where such a case arises, it is found that the evil is in general only temporary ; and that, though a badly managed school may do harm for a time, it contains the seeds of its own extinction..... Even when no aid is given, the Government school has never entered into competition with the private school but has invariably kept its fee rates much higher. A policy similar to that described in regard to the relations of Government with aided schools has also governed the officers of the Department when they have had to deal with private schools in competition with one another. That policy is to promote education in its best and cheapest form." This view was in harmony with that expressed by the Government of Bengal in 1880 in the following words : "The general extension of education at a cheap rate is a solid gain to those benefited by it, outweighing the loss of pupils and of income which any individual school may suffer and which a zealous head master naturally regards with regret."[1]

20. The Indian Education Commission was appointed by the Government of India in February 1882 with the particular duty of inquiring into the manner in which effect had been given to the principles of the despatch of 1854. In the resolution appointing the Commission, the Government remarked that "it would be altogether contrary to its policy to check or hinder in any degree the further progress of higher or middle education. But the different branches of public instruction should, if possible, move forward together and with more equal step than hitherto.....

[1] Bengal Provincial Committee's Report, 1882, pages 138-139.

If satisfactory progress is to be made at all, every available private agency must be called into action to relieve and assist the public funds in connexion with every branch of public instruction. In pursuance of this policy it is the desire of the Government to offer every encouragement to native gentlemen to come forward and aid, even more extensively than before, in the establishment of schools upon the grant-in-aid system. It is chiefly in this way that the native community will be able to secure that freedom and variety of education which is an essential condition in any sound and complete educational system. It is not, in the opinion of the Governor-General in Council, a healthy symptom that all the youth of the country should be cast, as it were, in the same Government educational mould. Rather is it desirable that each section of the people should be in a position to secure that description of education which is most consonant to its feelings and suited to its wants."[1]

21. The Commission, under Sir W. W. Hunter's presidency, enquired into the growth of private enterprise in Indian education. It found that "in the North-Western Provinces and Madras the general tendency in the years 1871-1882 had been to provide higher education more and more by means of departmental agency and to lessen the encouragement given to private managers of advanced institutions, thus reversing the policy of the despatch of 1854. ..... In Bombay, the Punjab, Coorg and the Haidarabad Assigned Districts, at no time have sufficient endeavours been made to carry out those provisions of the despatch of 1854 which bear on private effort..... In Bengal, Assam and the Central Provinces the state of matters, so far as encouragement to private effort in the provision of advanced education is concerned, is substantially the same as in 1870-71. If there has been no further progress towards carrying out the policy laid down in 1854, for placing the main reliance for the provision of advanced education on private effort, there has been at least no important retrogression."[2]

22. The Commission found that in Bengal in the year 1882 the proportion of scholars in aided secondary schools was 60·3 per

[1] Resolution of the Government of India appointing the Education Commission, February 3rd, 1882, printed in the report of the Commission, Volume I, Appendix A, page 623.

[2] Report of Indian Education Commission, Volume I, page 400.

cent. of the total number of scholars in institutions of the same grade. The corresponding percentage for the North-Western Provinces and Oudh was 29·1; that for the Punjab 16·49; that for Bombay 23·91; and that for Madras 53·75.

23. "Bengal," the Commission reported, "stands pre-eminent among the Provinces for the ease and speedy success which attended the introduction of the system of grant-in-aid.....It is probable that, at least in the great centres of population, and particularly in Calcutta, the amount of private enterprise that existed before it came to be aided by the State was much greater than in either Madras or Bombay. The State had done more than in any other province to awaken a desire for English education. There had come into existence among the people a widespread desire for education of a European type.....The indigenous schools of Bengal possessed remarkable vitality and they must have made the idea familiar to the public mind that the provision of the means of education is a proper object for private effort.....From the outset, Bengal has been remarkable for the extent to which private enterprise in education has been displayed by the people of the country themselves..... Under the operation of the scheme for eliciting private effort, by far the larger proportion—in mere amount it may almost be said to be the whole—of the education of Bengal has come to be provided by the people themselves. At the same time it must be remembered that a small but highly important part of the educational system is in other than native hands and that the most influential of all its parts rests on a different basis from that of grants-in-aid."[1]

24. The Commission enumerated several "conditions of the success of the private effort" which they desired to preserve and to encourage in Indian education. The chief of these were (*a*) that the managers of the non-Governmental educational institutions should be consulted on matters of general educational interest and that their students should be admitted on equal terms to competition for certificates, scholarships and other public distinctions; (*b*) that its freedom of educational initiative should not be interfered with, and especially ..... that care be taken lest public examinations become the means of practically imposing the same text-books or curriculum on all schools; (*c*) that revised rules for grants-in-aid

[1] Report, Volume I, page 369.

should not merely be published in the Official Gazette but translated into the vernacular and communicated to the Press, to the managers of aided and private institutions and to all who are likely to help in any way in the spread of education ; (*d*) that the fees in all secondary schools and colleges that are managed by the Department be kept as high as possible and higher than in aided institutions of a corresponding class ; (*e*) that room be made for private effort as its area gradually expands. Whenever private effort becomes fit to do the work needed, the Department should remove its own institutions, as the despatch of 1854 contemplates ; (*f*) that the fuller extension of female education should preferentially be promoted by affording liberal aid and encouragement to managers who show their personal interest in the work, and, only when such agency is not available, by the establishment of schools under the management of the Department or of Local or Municipal Boards ; (*g*) that there should be a periodically increasing provision in the educational budget of each province for the expansion of aided institutions ; (*h*) that the proximity of a Government aided school should not be regarded as of itself a sufficient reason for refusing aid to a non-Governmental school ; and (*i*) that, whilst existing State institutions of the higher order should be maintained in complete efficiency wherever they are necessary, the improvement and extension of institutions under private management should be the principal care of the Education Department.[1]

25. One member of the Indian Education Commission, Mr. (afterwards Mr. Justice) Kashinath Trimbak Telang, recorded an important minute upon the question of public policy involved in these recommendations. "I hope that the local Governments concerned will not allow themselves to be influenced by the cry that too much is being spent on higher education in India. With that cry, in the form in which it has been raised, I have no sympathy whatever. I unreservedly accept the view that without mass-education the country will never be able to enjoy to the full the fruits which it has a right to expect from the higher education. For that purpose, you must bestow brains, as Mill has it, on those who have only hands. And in my judgment the time has now come when, with that view, mass-education must be pushed onward ... On the other hand, I hold an equally strong opinion

[1] Report, Volume I, pages 436-441 and 594.

that, without the higher education, mass-education cannot be of much avail, even if it can be secured. The argument that for the money spent on giving higher education to one student, you might give primary education to more than one hundred is to my mind utterly futile and unworthy even of a moment's consideration. "We have nearly all of us," says Mr. Matthew Arnold, "reached the notion that popular education is the State's duty to deal with. Secondary and superior instruction, many of us still think, should be left to take care of themselves." After pointing out what has been done in European countries on this matter, Mr. Arnold winds up thus: "In all these countries the idea of a sound civil organisation of modern society has been found to involve the idea of an organisation of secondary and superior instruction by public authority or by the State." .....In my opinion, the whole religious, social, political and industrial advance of the country depends on steady adhesion to that enlightened policy, as regards high education, which has probably been the most generally approved portion of British Indian policy in the past. This opinion is quite consistent with a desire which I strongly feel, that all private efforts in education, especially the efforts put forward by my own countrymen, should receive a fair field and due encouragement. But in order that such private effort should be forthcoming in any district, high education must as a general rule have been in existence in that district for some time. And therefore I trust that no embarrassment will be felt by the local authorities in consequence of any *a priori* idea of the superiority of private enterprise over State action—an idea which, however well founded in many respects, is just now, I fear, likely to be set up as a fetish and likely to dominate in regions which, in present circumstances at all events, lie entirely beyond its sphere."[1]

26. In October 1884 the Government of India accepted "the cautious and well-expressed proposals of the Commission on the subject of the gradual withdrawal of Government from the charge of institutions of a high order, and especially of colleges ..... It is in no degree the wish of the Government of India to discourage high education in any way whatever. On the contrary, it believes it to be one of its most important duties to spread and foster it. What it specially desires, however, is to secure assistance to the

[1] Report, page 609.

limited funds of the State, by calling forth every available private agency in connexion with every branch of public instruction. It is in connexion with high education, and in view of the direct pecuniary advantages which it holds out to those who follow it, that the Government thinks it can most properly insist on the fullest development of the policy of self-help."[1]

IV.

27. More than twenty years passed before another public statement of conspicuous importance was made by the Government of India on the relation between the State and private enterprise in education. In the meantime in England and Wales the Government had given, on condition of inspection, greatly increased grants to secondary and higher education. In England Government action in educational matters, so far from dwindling, had become more extensive than ever before. The example of the United States, of Switzerland and of Germany had shown the value of public funds and public authority in the development of a wide reaching system of efficient secondary and technical schools. Faith in the adequacy of private enterprise to cope with educational destitution, or even to supply what is needed in secondary education for the less well-to-do classes, had declined. But the value of independent initiative was still appreciated : the excellence of many private schools was cordially recognised : variety of educational types was desired ; and neither Government nor public opinion showed any disposition to declare, as the Government of Prussia had declared in 1794, that "all educational institutions are to be under the supervision of the State and are subject at all times to its examination and inspection."[2]

28. The view thus prevalent in England at the time was reflected in the resolution on Indian educational policy issued by the Governor-General in Council on March 11th, 1904.

"From the earliest days of British rule in India private enterprise has played a great part in the promotion of both English and vernacular education, and every agency that could be induced to help in the work of imparting sound instruction has always been welcomed by the State.... The progressive devolution of primary, secondary and collegiate education upon private enterprise, and the continuous withdrawal of Government from competition therewith, was recommended by the Education Commission of 1883,

[1] Resolution of the Government of India, $\frac{10}{309}$, October 23, 1884.

[2] Allgemeine Landrecht, 1794, T. II. Tit. 12, paras. 1 and 2.

and the advice has been generally acted upon. But, while accepting this policy, the Government of India at the same time recognise the extreme importance of the principle that, in each branch of education, Government should maintain a limited number of institutions, both as models for private enterprise to follow and in order to uphold a high standard of education. In withdrawing from direct management, it is further essential that the Government should retain a general control, by means of official inspection, over all public educational institutions."[1]

29. During the next few years (1904-13) there was a fairly rapid growth of public opinion in England with regard to the national importance of secondary education and the part which the State should take in encouraging it and in guaranteeing its soundness. The Board of Education pressed the matter upon local administrators and upon the governing bodies of endowed schools. Associations of teachers were active in calling attention to the need for more and better secondary schools. The experience of the new Education Committees established under the Act of 1902 in the large towns and rural districts convinced the more public-spirited among their members that money should be spent more freely and more systematically upon this grade of education. There was a growing demand, on the part of parents with moderate incomes (including many among the skilled artisans) for better schools, publicly managed, well-equipped and accessible at a small fee. In other social groups there was an increasing uneasiness about the shortcomings of many of the secondary schools, both public and private. People were proud of the traditions of the older schools, were satisfied on the whole with their moral tone, felt a strong loyalty towards them, but were dissatisfied with much of their teaching and considered that changes were becoming necessary in the subjects taught. Competent secondary schools, widely distributed and meeting in different ways the needs of boys and girls with different prospects in life, had come to be regarded by a large number of influential people as indispensable to the nation's economic vigour and (though the issue could not clearly be defined) to its social welfare.

30. Moreover, the confidence shown in education by public opinion in the United States, in Switzerland, in Scandinavia and in Germany impressed English observers more and more. It was seen that in those countries public authority, whether municipal

[1] *Indian Educational Policy—being a resolution issued by the Governor-General in Council on the 11th March, 1904* (Calcutta, 1904), pages 13-14.

or State, was playing the chief part in supporting secondary schools. English opinion had become a little more favourably disposed to the idea of public supervision and State action in educational affairs. The old idea that, apart from what could be done by means of endowments, secondary education should be left as far as possible to private enterprise or to the efforts of associations organised as companies with limited dividends was gradually fading into the background. In England, the best kinds of private enterprise held their own and furnished a type of educational excellence rarely, if ever, found in schools established and controlled by public authorities. But the proportion which private enterprise of this fine quality bore to the whole number of private adventure schools and to the mass of national education was comparatively small. The cost of supplying secondary education of good quality was rising and, except when high fees could be charged, was passing beyond the reach of unaided private effort.

31. Science teaching was seen to be an indispensable part of a liberal secondary education, but laboratories and their equipment were expensive. The training of the hand called for encouragement: historical and geographical teaching had to be improved. Teachers, well-equipped by university training and by preparation in the art of teaching, were indispensable to the efficiency of the schools, and therefore to the welfare of the nation which relied on the schools. External examination had passed out of favour as a sole test of a school's efficiency. In 1911 the Consultative Committee of the English Board of Education had issued its report on Examinations in Secondary Schools. Systematic inspection, watching every side of a school's work and encouraging improved methods of teaching, was advocated as a necessary guarantee of the progressive efficiency of secondary education.

32. Such was the temper of expert educational opinion in England when the resolution on Indian educational policy was issued by the Governor-General in Council on February 21st, 1913.

"The policy of Government is to rely so far as possible on private enterprise in secondary education. This policy, laid down in the despatch of 1854, was restated and amplified by the Education Commission of 1882, which, while doubtful as to how far the process of withdrawal on the part of Government should be carried, agreed that, whatever degree of withdrawal from the direct provision of education might be found advisable, there should be no relaxation of indirect but efficient control by the State. The admixture

of private management and State control was again emphasised in the resolution of 1904. To this policy the Government of India adhere. It is dictated not by any belief in the inherent superiority of private over State management, but by preference for an established system and, above all, by the necessity of concentrating the direct energies of the State and the bulk of its available resources upon the improvement and expansion of elementary education. The policy may be summarised as the encouragement of privately managed schools under suitable bodies, maintained in efficiency by Government inspection, recognition and control, and by the aid of Government funds.

Some idea of the extension of private enterprise may be gained by the reflection that, of 3,852 high and middle English schools, only 286 are Government institutions. These figures, however, cover many types of schools, from the most efficient to the least efficient. Admirable schools have been and are maintained by missionaries and other bodies. But the underlying idea of the grant-system, the subvention of local organised effort, has not always been maintained. Schools of a money-making type, ill-housed, ill-equipped, and run on the cheapest lines, have in certain cases gained recognition and eluded the control of inspection. Schools have sprung into existence in destructive competition with neighbouring institutions. Physical health has been neglected and no provision has been made for suitable residential arrangements and playfields. Fee-rates have been lowered; competition and laxity in transfer have destroyed discipline; teachers have been employed on rates of pay insufficient to attract men capable of instructing or controlling their pupils. Above all, the grants-in-aid have from want of funds often been inadequate. No fewer than 360 high schools with 80,247 pupils are in receipt of no grant at all, and are maintained at an average cost of less than half that of a Government school, mainly by fee-collections. Especially do these conditions prevail in the area covered by the old provinces of Bengal and Eastern Bengal and Assam; a result due, no doubt, to the rapid extension of English education beyond the ability of the local Governments to finance it. In Bengal and Eastern Bengal the number of high schools is greater than in the rest of British India put together, and the cost of their maintenance to public funds is proportionately less than a third of the cost prevailing in other provinces. A special inquiry showed that, out of some 4,700 teachers in privately managed high schools in these areas, about 4,200 were in receipt of less than Rs. 50 a month, some 3,300 of less than Rs. 30 a month, while many teachers of English and classical languages drew salaries that would not attract men to superior domestic service. The great variations in conditions in different parts of India point to the difficulty of making any but the most general statements about the results of private enterprise and the special measures that are needed to assist it to perform efficiently its work in the educational system.

Subject to the necessities of variation in deference to local conditions, the policy of the Government of India in regard to secondary English schools is—

(1) To improve the few existing Government schools, by—

(*a*) Employing only graduates or trained teachers;

(*b*) Introducing a graded service for teachers of English with a minimum salary of Rs. 40 per month and a maximum salary of Rs. 400 per month ;

(*c*) Providing proper hostel accommodation ;

(*d*) Introducing a school course complete in itself with a staff sufficient to teach what may be called the modern side with special attention to the development of an historical and a geographical sense ;

(*e*) Introducing manual training and improving science teaching.

(2) To increase largely the grants-in-aid, in order that aided institutions may keep pace with the improvements in Government schools on the above-mentioned lines, and to encourage the establishment of new aided institutions where necessary.

(3) To multiply and improve training colleges so that trained teachers may be available for public and private institutions.

(4) To found Government schools in such localities as may, on a survey of local conditions and with due regard to economy of educational effort and expense, be proved to require them.

The Government of India also desire that the grant-in-aid rules should be made more elastic so as to enable each school, which is recognised as necessary and conforms to the prescribed standards of management and efficiency, to obtain the special assistance which it requires in order to attain the fullest measure of utility. As larger grants become available and as the pay and the personnel of the teaching staff are improved, it will be possible for the inspecting officer to concentrate his attention more and more upon the general quality of instruction. Full encouragement can then be given to improved and original methods of teaching and courses ; and gradually the grant-earning capacity of an institution will come to be judged on grounds of general efficiency and desert rather than by rigid rules of calculation."[1]

33. In the same important resolution the Government of India expressed its views as to the manner in which the attainments of individual pupils in secondary schools should be tested and the soundness of the work of the schools, on all the necessary sides of education, be guaranteed.

"The value of external examination cannot be overlooked. It sets before the teacher a definite aim and it maintains a standard ; but the definite aim often unduly overshadows instruction, and the standard is necessarily narrow and in view of the large numbers that have to be examined must confine itself to mere examination achievement, without regard to mental development or general growth of character. On the other hand, the drawbacks of external examinations are becoming more generally apparent, and attention was prominently drawn to them in the Report of the Consultative Committee on Examinations in Secondary Schools in England. They fail,

[1] *Indian Educational Policy, 1913, being a resolution issued by the Governor-General in Council on the 21st February, 1913* (Calcutta, 1915), pages 18-21.

especially in India, in that they eliminate the inspecting and teaching staff as factors in the system, that they impose all responsibility upon a body acquainted but little (if at all) with the school examined, that they rely upon written papers, which afford no searching test of intellect, no test at all of character or general ability, and that they encourage cram.

A combination of external and internal examinations is required. The Government of India consider that, in the case of a school recognised as qualified to present candidates for a school leaving certificate, a record should be kept of the progress and conduct of each pupil in the highest classes of the school, and that the inspector should enter his remarks upon these records at his visits and thus obtain some acquaintance with the career of each candidate during the two or three years before examination. These records, together with the marks obtained by pupils at school tests, would be valuable and would supplement a test conducted partly through written papers on the more important subjects of instruction, but also orally and with regard to the pupil's past career. The oral examination would be conducted by the inspector in consultation with members of the staff. A large increase in the superior inspecting staff would be required to work a system of this kind, and safeguards would be necessary to protect teachers from undue influences; the Government of India are prepared to assist, with such grants as they may be able to afford, the introduction of any such system which may be locally practicable. .... Adapted to local conditions, it would be most beneficial and do more than anything else to foster a system under which scholars would be taught to think for themselves instead of being made to memorise for examination purposes. Next to improvement of the pay and prospects of teachers, which must accompany and precede its introduction, this is perhaps the most important reform required in secondary English education."

V.

34. In the earlier sections of this chapter we have traced the relationship between Government and private enterprise in education, especially in secondary education, in India and have found how closely it has followed the trend of public feeling in England in each of its successive phases. For more than sixty years the Government in India has shewn its strong desire to allow variety alike of educational aims and of management, in secondary education and its belief in the value of non-Governmental initiative and enterprise in this important sphere. It has therefore recognised the existence of three categories of secondary schools—

(*a*) those provided and directly managed by Government;

(*b*) those inspected and aided by Government, but provided and maintained by public local authorities or by duly constituted committees of private persons, and

(*c*) those established and maintained by private bodies or by private individuals, but not aided by Government,

though required to submit to inspection in order to enjoy the privilege of presenting candidates for the matriculation examination of the University.

35. Thus, in effect, Government in India has sanctioned not only a dual system consisting (1) of Governmental schools, and (2) of non-Governmental schools inspected and aided by Government, but also (3) a large and undefined category of other schools not aided and only in some cases inspected.

36. It has frequently expressed the hope that the third category may in time disappear and that all schools under non-Governmental management may ultimately come under an inspection conducted by Government and may thus be qualified to receive grants-in-aid from public funds. It has never given its assent to the doctrine, laid down by the Government of Prussia in 1794, that all schools are State institutions and may be established only with the previous knowledge and approval of the State. Reserving, as the supreme authority of every State must reserve, its right to secure public order and therefore the right to prevent schools from being put to purposes inimical to civil peace, it has steadfastly maintained the principle of liberty in education. It has respected the rights of conscience. It has encouraged education as an instrument of social and intellectual progress. It has relied upon freedom as the surest guarantee of moral and intellectual advance and in confident expectation of ultimate success has deliberately preferred liberty in education, even at the cost of slower progress and of varied inefficiencies, to the swifter returns and more organisable excellence which a stricter and more uniform pressure might have secured

37. In England also, and for the same reasons, freedom of educational initiative and variety of educational enterprise have been respected by Government and consistently guarded by Parliament during the whole period in which the educational system of the country has been remodelled on modern lines. The principle of grants-in-aid to educational institutions of different types and representing different forms of belief was adopted in England in respect of training colleges in 1839, in respect of elementary schools in 1846, in respect of the teaching of science in 1859, and in respect of secondary education in its widest sense in 1895. The delay of the application to secondary schools in England of the principle clearly laid down in India by the despatch of 1854 was due not to

any desire to establish a Government monopoly of secondary education, but to an extreme reluctance to interfere with that grade of instruction and to a sanguine belief that secondary education for the people could be self-supporting. Confidence in the power of private enterprise to supply whatever secondary education was needed in addition to that provided by endowments delayed in England for nearly half a century effective State action in that sphere. This confidence, however, gradually waned when it was realised that, through the lack of State aid and inspection, England had lagged behind other nations in western Europe in the organisation of schools whose work is vital to economic progress and to public culture.

38. The belief that secondary education ought to rely for the most part upon the fees paid by scholars, together with such further help as endowments and private subscriptions may provide, influenced public opinion and public policy not only in England but also, though less deeply, in India. In the report of the Indian Education Commission of 1882 there are many traces of this idea. It became associated, though not by any logical connexion, with the view that, subject always to the maintenance of civil order and of a reasonably sufficient standard of knowledge, secondary education should be free from intellectual constraint. It was, however, but a phase of the economic doctrine which minimised the functions of the State and the value of collective organisation. It must be held distinct from the more deeply rooted conviction that the spirit of education should be kept free from the dominion of ideas authoritatively imposed from above.

39. To-day in the condition of secondary education in Bengal we see the effects of the influence of both ideas. In Bengal, more than in any other province of India, the view of secondary education which prevailed in England in the middle decades of the nineteenth century has left a permanent impression. The exceptionally large number of privately managed secondary schools in the Presidency is directly due to the fact that, when educational opinion in Bengal was in its most impressionable stage, English sympathies were strongly in favour of private initiative in secondary education on the ground that privately managed schools would be more likely to remain immune from Governmental interference with intellectual liberty. The not less noticeably large proportion of these privately managed secondary schools which carry on their

work without State aid is as directly due to the former prevalence among English administrators of the belief that secondary education could be in great measure self-supporting and that competition would make it both good and cheap.

40. The conviction that in the long run it is against public policy for the State to 'tune the pulpits' in schools and colleges is as strong as ever in England. But the great mass of English opinion has been convinced by experience that secondary education according to modern standards of excellence cannot be provided or maintained in efficiency by private enterprise alone, except where there are large endowments or where much higher school fees are charged than any but well-to-do parents can afford. Five chief reasons have led to this departure from the opinion which was held half a century ago. First, it is recognised that the needs of modern life, and especially of scientific industry, call for a variety of courses in secondary schools, a variety which entails a greatly increased expenditure upon staff and equipment. Secondly, it is admitted that secondary schools cannot be competent unless the services of efficient teachers, trained in the art of teaching, are secured and retained. But the raising of the payment of teachers to a point which will attract a sufficient number of able and highly educated men into the teaching profession involves great expenditure and will greatly increase the cost of providing secondary education. Thirdly, the study of hygiene has disclosed the importance of securing healthy conditions of school life for boys and girls and abundant provision for their physical development. This again entails great expenditure. Fourthly, secondary education now appeals to classes of the community which in earlier days were tacitly regarded as lying in great measure outside its pale. Families with small incomes demand good education at low fees, and in the interest of the community it is desirable to meet this demand Fifthly, with the increase in the number of pupils, all requiring some test of their educational progress and most of them seeking to qualify for a certificate of attainment, the older forms of public examination have been put to a severe test, from which they have not escaped without criticism. Hence there has arisen a strong feeling that methods of school examination and of school-inspection should be reformed and brought into more continuous relation with the work and inner life of the schools. But, unless all inspection is paid for by the State, the introduction of these reforms would

involve a system so costly as to be more than private schools, except in rare cases, could afford.

41. For these reasons, secondary education (at any rate in its more popular forms) is steadily passing out of the category of private effort into the category of those public services which are supported from taxation. Such a change in the relation of secondary education to the State brings inevitably with it an increase of State control over secondary schools. This has already happened in England. We believe that it will also happen in Bengal. But it is well therefore to take precautions with a view to guarding secondary education not against State supervision which is salutary, but against State interference with freedom in the schools. It is very true that by no means every school makes use of its freedom. Many, though free from State interference, are in bondage to routine and are intellectually inert. But at the heart of the matter there is an element of danger in any great extension of Governmental control over schools. Education is not wholly a matter of public concern. It lies across the boundary which divides public functions from private initiative. It is too important a factor in national life for the State to abrogate its responsibilities in regard to it. But at the same time it is too intimately connected with family life and with private conviction to be entrusted to Governmental management alone. Therefore, it is desirable to seek for some new synthesis between State supervision and private effort, especially in the spheres of secondary and higher education. Such a synthesis will be suggested in later chapters of this report.

CHAPTER V.

The Student in Bengal.

I.

1. The education of a people is not given by schools and colleges alone. Other influences blend with theirs—the spirit and temper of the community which they serve, the power exerted over its thoughts and character by prevalent aspirations and beliefs, the tone of its family life, the rules and restraints imposed by its social organisation, the conditions under which its daily work for livelihood is done. At a time, therefore, like the present, when our evidence discloses a wide-spread conviction that the aims and methods of higher education in Bengal require re-orientation and change, it is well to take freshly into account the special needs of the Bengali student, Hindu or Musalman, and to consider what kind of education would be best designed to fit the circumstances and obligations of the society in which he is born, and best adapted to the physical and mental characteristics of the student himself. What, it may be asked, (remembering always that, in speaking of a type, many variations must be borne in mind) are the sensibilities which in his case such an education should guard and guide; guard against perversion or discouragement, and guide into full development of strength? And what are the defects of his good qualities, defects which education may lessen and perhaps remove?

2. All who know him will attribute to the Bengali a full share of the 'keen intelligence and apt capabilities' upon which the King-Emperor based the expectations disclosed in his Proclamation to the Princes and Peoples of India in November 1908. We shall attempt an analysis of his gifts and qualities, with an appreciation of his characteristic excellences and of their related defects, endeavouring in our description of the strength and weakness of his traits and temperament to avoid both overstatement in criticism and any unmerited meed of praise.

3. In no country is it easy to arrive at an estimate, both general and just, of the powers of mind possessed by the younger generation, or of the quality of their gifts of heart and brain.

involve a system so costly as to be more than private schools, except in rare cases, could afford.

41. For these reasons, secondary education (at any rate in its more popular forms) is steadily passing out of the category of private effort into the category of those public services which are supported from taxation. Such a change in the relation of secondary education to the State brings inevitably with it an increase of State control over secondary schools. This has already happened in England. We believe that it will also happen in Bengal. But it is well therefore to take precautions with a view to guarding secondary education not against State supervision which is salutary, but against State interference with freedom in the schools. It is very true that by no means every school makes use of its freedom. Many, though free from State interference, are in bondage to routine and are intellectually inert. But at the heart of the matter there is an element of danger in any great extension of Governmental control over schools. Education is not wholly a matter of public concern. It lies across the boundary which divides public functions from private initiative. It is too important a factor in national life for the State to abrogate its responsibilities in regard to it. But at the same time it is too intimately connected with family life and with private conviction to be entrusted to Governmental management alone. Therefore, it is desirable to seek for some new synthesis between State supervision and private effort, especially in the spheres of secondary and higher education. Such a synthesis will be suggested in later chapters of this report.

CHAPTER V.

The Student in Bengal.

I.

1. The education of a people is not given by schools and colleges alone. Other influences blend with theirs—the spirit and temper of the community which they serve, the power exerted over its thoughts and character by prevalent aspirations and beliefs, the tone of its family life, the rules and restraints imposed by its social organisation, the conditions under which its daily work for livelihood is done. At a time, therefore, like the present, when our evidence discloses a wide-spread conviction that the aims and methods of higher education in Bengal require re-orientation and change, it is well to take freshly into account the special needs of the Bengali student, Hindu or Musalman, and to consider what kind of education would be best designed to fit the circumstances and obligations of the society in which he is born, and best adapted to the physical and mental characteristics of the student himself. What, it may be asked, (remembering always that, in speaking of a type, many variations must be borne in mind) are the sensibilities which in his case such an education should guard and guide; guard against perversion or discouragement, and guide into full development of strength? And what are the defects of his good qualities, defects which education may lessen and perhaps remove?

2. All who know him will attribute to the Bengali a full share of the 'keen intelligence and apt capabilities' upon which the King-Emperor based the expectations disclosed in his Proclamation to the Princes and Peoples of India in November 1908. We shall attempt an analysis of his gifts and qualities, with an appreciation of his characteristic excellences and of their related defects, endeavouring in our description of the strength and weakness of his traits and temperament to avoid both overstatement in criticism and any unmerited meed of praise.

3. In no country is it easy to arrive at an estimate, both general and just, of the powers of mind possessed by the younger generation, or of the quality of their gifts of heart and brain.

But in Bengal the task is made more difficult by the differences in the early upbringing and social environment of Musalmans and Hindus, as well as by the temperamental distinctions which are characteristic of the eastern and western parts of the province. We have also to remember the differences in the mental outlook of the dwellers in villages and of those in towns. The problem is further complicated by the presence of other communities, not least by that of the domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians, whose capacities and needs call for careful consideration in any survey of the educational requirements of Bengal. Nor must our analysis, if it is to include all the chief factors in the problem, fail to take into account the educational needs of girls as well as of boys. And, lastly, as no single generation lives to itself alone but finds its freedom of development affected by the habits of mind and fixed preferences of its seniors, we must remember that young Bengal has to adjust many of its new thoughts and aspirations to the social tenets of the older generation.

4. In every land the typical and average boy compares favourably with his contemporaries of other nations in regard to some characteristic qualities of mind and disposition, untavourably in regard to others. The English boy and the Scottish, like the French, or Swiss, or Dutch, or Dane, have their different points of strength and weakness, whether congenital or acquired through the influences of the surroundings in which they have been bred. If a general inventory be taken of his powers and disabilities the Indian boy living in Bengal will be found to come up to a good average, when he is compared with his like in other countries. But he has some strongly marked gifts and sensibilities which give him distinction and are accompanied by certain compensatory defects

II.

5. To begin with the physical basis of his mental powers, he has, as a rule, a very retentive memory and good powers of hearing. The ear and the memory have, between them, furnished the chief physical basis for the traditional learning of Bengal. From time immemorial, scholarly lore was chiefly transmitted by oral tradition from *guru* to *chela*, from old to young. *Sruti*, or The Thing Heard, is the term given even to the highest kind of learning, namely, Revelation. And in a Hindu family of orthodox habits and old-fashioned ways, powers of memory far beyond

present-day western standards are displayed. In the discussion of intricate points in the *Sastras*, a combat of words and of quoted precedents may be continued through many hours. Many of the older men can recite thousands of passages from memory, and without hesitation, or prompting, or need for reference, can repeat hundreds of pages of books. A typical Hindu grandmother of the old stock has an unfailing memory for sacred tales and folklore, both of which she imparts to her grandchildren from their infancy.[1]

6. The eye-sight of the boys in Bengal is often injured by lack of attention to the conditions under which they read and write. "At home, as at school," Mr. Rames Chandra Ray reports to us in his evidence,[2] "absolutely no heed is paid to the amount and direction of the light that falls upon the paper; the glaze and thinness of the paper, the smallness and clumsiness of the print, the slant of the desks, the posture of the learner, are all matters of absolute unconcern to most of the guardians and the school authorities." The eye-sight of many a student in Bengal has been impaired by poring over books by the insufficient light of a small oil lamp. And the visitor to many of the schools is shocked at the darkness of some of the class rooms in which boys are huddled.[3]

7. In the homes of the professional and middle-class families of Bengal, the boy finds little opportunity for developing aptitude with his hands or encouragement to excel in it. But Sir Rabindranath Tagore, who knows Bengali boys intimately through his experience in his school at Bolpur, assures us that natural aptitude for hand-work exists among them. Give them the opportunity of developing it, he says, and they excel. Dr. Brajendranath Seal writes:[4]—"We Bengalis are backward in mechanical and manipula-

[1] Remarkable as are the feats of memory achieved by the contemporary Indian student, his memory may nevertheless be less permanently retentive than was that of an older generation. Now-a-days a scholar or a man of business has no need to forego books of reference. Printed books are more accessible to him. The traditional pride in 'having all one's learning in one's head' is naturally fading away. And a boy who is clever at memorising may also cultivate, however unconsciously, the convenient habit of forgetting when the examination is behind him much of what he crammed up in preparation for it.

[2] Question 18.

[3] Physical deficiencies among students are also aggravated by the conditions (including bad and insufficient diet) which often prevail in hostels and messes. On these points there is full discussion in Chapter XIX of our report.

[4] General Memoranda, page 373.

tive dexterity, (excepting, in part, our hereditary artisans) and it is not merely our brains and physiques that suffer. Our prospects of industrial advance as a people are bound up with our scientific education. A writ of 'Mandamus' is necessary to overcome the *non possumus* of our 'pure culture men'." Given the necessary changes in methods of education, a large number of the boys would probably disclose an aptitude for constructive work, and nothing would be better for the economic interests of Bengal than that boys of the educated classes should feel less averse from callings which involve work with the hands.

8. In many of the colleges we have found laboratory workmen whose craftsmanship is excellent; and in charge of the workshop attached to the Department of Physics at the Hindu Academy, Daulatpur, we met a remarkable man who told us that, after receiving a college education up to the first examination in arts, he gave up the thought of a clerical career in order to indulge his strong taste for mechanical pursuits. As the knowledge which he had acquired at school and college enabled him to read English, he bought a set of twenty-five old volumes of "The English Mechanic and World of Science." This work served to provide him with a good foundation of mechanical knowledge and instructed him in the exercise of his natural skill. At the Hindu Academy we saw how valuable his work is not only in the laboratories but in other ways. The college clock is his handiwork, and he has installed the college telephone. His work interests many of the college students, but we did not find that arrangements were made for their receiving any training in manual work under the direction of this skilled and intelligent mechanic.

9. We are informed by Captain Petavel that, at the Institute which, by the generosity of the Maharajah of Kasimbazar, he has opened in Calcutta,[1] some boys have already been able to earn rather more than their school fees by their work in the carpentry shop. In several parts of the Presidency, and especially in Calcutta, we heard that many boys now show a strong interest in mechanics and in engineering, and have a good knowledge of the parts and running of petrol-driven engines through the rapidly extending use of motor cars. The fact that in Bengal a chauffeur can command (besides food and clothing) twice as large a wage as many clerks

[1] 1, Nandlal Bose Lane, Baghbazar, Calcutta.

is a sign that some of the clerical callings are over-crowded, and boys are naturally thinking of careers in which they may gain larger incomes than as subordinates using the pen. On the whole, the evidence points decisively against any idea that the Bengali boys have an innate aversion from the use of their hands in mechanical arts. If they had a more suitable training in their early years, many of them would develope a fair measure of manual skill and would, in some cases, reveal an aptitude for constructive occupations like engineering.

10. This view is confirmed by the evidence which we have received from Mr. C. F. Payne, Chairman of the Municipal Corporation of Calcutta. He writes :—

"The point which I particularly wish to press is the readiness of Indian young men now-a-days to undergo the practical training which is the necessary accompaniment of any useful form of technical education. It is frequently urged that technical education has not succeeded in India, because of the unwillingness of Indians to undergo this practical training, and probably past experience has given some ground for this belief. I am strongly of opinion, however—and I know that a large number of the members of the Calcutta Corporation agree with me in this—that at least in Calcutta and elsewhere in Bengal, there is a large number of young men who are only looking for the opportunity to fit themselves for some trade or profession in which practical training is required, and who would willingly undergo that training if it were available. The natural tendency of the young men of Bengal is undoubtedly towards a literary education, but of recent years they have had such bitter experience of the difficulty of obtaining remunerative employment without technical training of some kind, that no natural dislike of manual labour will now deter them from undergoing that training. I have seen a good deal of the practical work of Bengalis in the Engineering Department of the Calcutta Corporation who have been trained at Sibpur ; and, generally speaking, I find that they are by no means unready to 'take off their coats' and tackle a job of work. Given adequate facilities for training in other trades and professions in which technical education is necessary, I do not think that there is any doubt that Indian young men would show aptitude in those directions as well. At present there are no opportunities open to them, and I am confident that it is this lack of opportunity rather than the disinclination to manual labour which stands in the way of the economic progress of Bengal."[1]

11. On another aspect of the physical side of the education of the student, one who well knows the Indian student has written :— "He is notoriously careless of his health, but the fault is seldom wholly his own. The opportunities for recreation have generally come to him when he has already become a victim to a course of

[1] General Memoranda, page 302.

indolent inactivity." But in attempting to judge the Indian student's capacity for physical development we should remember his skill in Indian games and in football, and how many young Indians have attained a high degree of proficiency in (and in some well-known cases have shown extraordinary aptitude for) games like cricket, racquets and polo which require quickness of eye and movement, balance, and swift decision. Among students in India public opinion does not set nearly so high a value as is set in England upon these kinds of athletic skill. Nor can the great majority of the boys afford the expense which many games entail. But if they paid more attention to their health and took more trouble about exercise, the students would be happier and more vigorous.[1] The influence which military training and camp life can exercise upon their physical condition and morale were shown by the report of Brigadier-General Strange on the training of the Calcutta University Corps in the cold weather of 1917-18. The General wrote :—

"The men showed marked adaptability to military training, and they learnt their manual exercises with surprising rapidity. They displayed great steadiness in the ranks, and discipline was good. Their powers of endurance were not put to any great test, but they were marched to Belghuria for their musketry course, a matter of eight miles, and successfully accomplished it. The standard of shooting was good, considering the lack of experience and the short time available for preliminary practice. The men promoted to temporary non-commissioned rank showed considerable ability and developed a good word of command. I consider these men show great promise.

I was certainly surprised at the rapid progress made. They had British officers and British non-commissioned officers as instructors with whom they got on excellently. They could not have made the same progress with Indian instructors. I think the most valuable lesson they learnt was discipline."

12. The handiness and practical resourcefulness of the Bengali boys would be increased by a further growth of the boy scout movement in the schools of the province. The boys take well to its interests and discipline. Mr. J. A. Kirkham, writing recently of the Bengali Scouts' Camp at Chandipur of which he was in charge,

[1] Chapter XIX. The Bengali student's carelessness in looking after his health is lamented by many of our experienced witnesses. Reference should especially be made to the evidence of the Rev. W. H. G. Holmes, Dr. Brajendranath Seal, Dr. C. P. Segard, the Rev. Hedley Sutton and Dr. Rames Chandra Ray, in answer to Question 17. To the bearing of these matters on personal morals allusion is made by some of the above and by other witnesses.

reports that "the boys soon settled down to the discipline and conditions of camp life and showed that they had caught the true scout spirit. They were quick to obey without question, always cheery and bright, and with an insatiable thirst for knowledge in scouting matters. Often I had a crowd of boys round me, plying me with question after question."

III.

13. Turning now to the more complex and emotional characteristics of the Bengali student, we may select as pre-eminently significant and admirable his power of imaginative sympathy. By nature he is very sensitive, far more sensitive than some men of robuster temperament can readily understand. He is instantly aware of sympathy or of dislike, of welcome or of coldness, of approval or of blame. It has been said of him that "he is shy, reserved, self-centred in his interests, suspicious of a stranger, but eager to show gratitude for any kindness bestowed upon him, and long-suffering in the face of difficulties and of harsh surroundings." What Wordsworth said of his own nature in youth is true in a very high degree of the Bengali boys. Each of them is 'a sensitive being.' They are sensitive and as a rule diffident, but, in some cases, (partly perhaps because their quick sympathies put them so quickly *en rapport* with states of mind and of knowledge maturer than their own) tempted to form too favourable an estimate of their own attainments and powers. A Bengali student is likewise prone to quick discouragement, a discouragement the more acutely felt in reaction from an excess of self-confidence, and sometimes so overwhelming as to provoke despair. He is very sensitive to ridicule; he deeply resents sarcasm (especially from a teacher or other person in authority) and, unless he has been disciplined by the friendly criticism of seniors whose judgment he respects, is liable, like European boys of similar temperament, to show conceit, or at least, especially when challenged or rebuked, to adopt a manner of speaking and a tone which may wear the appearance of conceit but are more truly ascribed to the sting of a wound in self-esteem. These however are but the defects of his qualities. The Bengali student is affectionate; quickly responsive to kindness; happy when he can enter into the confidences of intimate friendship; a thoughtful host; naturally courteous and polite, though sometimes awkward through nervousness and at

times not unnaturally oblivious of some of the conventional western proprieties. He is tender in his loyalty to the memories of childhood and of kindred; but at the same time (and not seldom because of lack of discipline at home or from having been spoiled in childhood) apt to be self-willed, and resentful of censure and punishment.

14. Around him, as he grows up, if he is born into a Hindu family of the older tradition, is the web of the obligations of the family life. To his father he stands in a relationship the sacredness of which is emphasised by religious duties which he knows that it may be at any time incumbent upon him to render in the hour of ultimate bereavement. If he belongs to an orthodox Brahmin family he is subjected, not least under his mother's care, to strong religious influences, which colour his view of life and duty. However far below its ideal conception such a family system may have fallen or have been content to remain, it has in it more than the vestige of a noble doctrine of fellow-service, of other-worldiness, of renunciation.

15. If, on the other hand, it is his lot to grow up in a devout and educated Muslim home, he is surrounded from the first by the atmosphere of his religion.[1] From his mother he learns his duty towards God; with her, he says his prayers; by her he is taught the duty of speaking the truth as a religious obligation. And, along with this and under the same religious sanction, he learns the duty of showing respect to his parents and teachers. The courteous manners (an inheritance from Islamic culture) and the very shades of the language which he acquires from his earliest years teach him what reverence is due to the age and rank of those whom he is called upon to address.

16. Sensitiveness and quick response to emotion are characteristic of the Bengali student. But he possesses another quality, not unconnected with these. He has an innate sense for certain aspects of beauty, and, though the Bengali people has not the genius for the graphic arts which is possessed by the Umbrian and the Chinese, it is noteworthy that, of the modern artists and poets in India, many have lived in Bengal. The gifted Bengali

[1] In this paragraph we speak of the practice of a cultivated Muslim family. Where the mother is uneducated, the religious instruction is imparted by the maulvi. Down to the present time the great majority of Muslim homes in Eastern Bengal suffer from a defective culture largely due in part to poverty.

boy has, in his own language at any rate, a feeling for rhythm, for harmony, for the appropriate gesture which fits the word. Too little indeed is done in the course of his education, from infancy onwards, to foster these gifts. He has a gift for music, but a quasi-Puritanical tradition, unforgetful of the evil use to which songs and music have been put, bans music too indiscriminatingly from his early and later education. He is a clever actor, but (on account of old memories of the abuses of the stage and, among the Musalmans, in deference to religious tradition) little scope is given in the course of his school life to the dramatic instinct of which the Jesuit teachers were quick to discern the educational power.

17. And out of this sensitiveness, this capacity for affection, this swiftness of emotional response, springs his imaginative sympathy. He enters very quickly into the state of mind of one whose experience and pre-suppositions are somewhat foreign to his own. Thus he has an affinity and natural liking for imaginative poetry. And it is significant that, in spite of what is unfamiliar or unintelligible to him in the metaphors which it draws from western landscape and western life, English imaginative poetry has been to many a Bengali student a fountain of inspiration. But, sensitive as he is to currents of feeling and to new ideas, his power of direct observation of nature, and indeed of significant facts of any kind, is relatively weak and imperfectly trained. He has 'the inward eye' but sees too little with the outward eye. In him the eye of the mind is more developed than the eye of the body.

18. His imaginative sympathy is aided, by linguistic capacity—a capacity which of course is not the prerogative of any one province in India. In no part of the continent of Europe are there so many men and women who speak the English language with faultless accuracy of authorised phrase as among the highly educated Indian community.[1] In listening to long addresses by some of the great Indian lawyers and scholars, the most exacting critic would rarely detect an error even in expression. In the course of visits to the colleges affiliated to the University of

[1] Writing so far back as 1838, Sir Charles Trevelyan remarked:—"It is unusual to find, even in the literary circles of the Continent, foreigners who can express themselves in English with so much fluency and correctness as we find in hundreds of the rising generation of Hindus." (*On the Education of the People of India*, page 111.)

Calcutta we have heard a very considerable number of lectures, but the errors in grammar could be counted upon the fingers of one hand. At the Victoria College, Cooch-Behar, we had the privilege of hearing a lecture upon the position of Sir Walter Scott in British fiction, a discourse so admirable in its structure, diction and critical insight that it would have been received with applause by any company of European scholars. Though, among those who have not learnt the language direct from European lips, there are many signs of a lack of feeling for the rhythm of spoken English and of unfamiliarity with the tones and cadence of its pronunciation, and though in many cases a student is so ill at ease in English that he finds consecutive thought in it beyond his powers and is often the victim to the mere jingle of a familiar phrase, nevertheless the mastery of the English tongue possessed by so large a number of educated Bengalis only fails to excite admiration because it has become familiar through everyday's experience. A people must possess great linguistic capacity to have achieved such a high level of customary skill. Where else in the world but in India could so many writers have been found able to express their opinions through a foreign medium, with lucid ease (and in some cases with eloquence and high distinction of style) upon the intricate and many-sided problems raised in our questionnaire? After every allowance is made for the incentive to the study of English afforded by the administrative conditions and the commercial circumstances of India, this mastery of a foreign tongue gives proof of high linguistic power. And our appreciation of it is enhanced when we remember that the Muslim members of the Bengali people acquire for religious and cultural reasons some knowledge of other languages besides their vernacular and English; that, in addition to a working acquaintance with other Indian vernaculars, the educated Hindu has in his turn some knowledge of Sanskrit and, in rare cases, of Pali also; and that not infrequently both Hindu and Muslim scholars have studied the classical European languages as well as French and German.

19. During recent years many gifted writers in Bengal have excelled in their use of the vernacular, but it is felt that, in ordinary cases, this side of the Bengali's racial culture has suffered by the absorption of so much time and nervous energy in the necessary study and use of the English language. It is remarked that the study of the vernacular is in many cases perfunctory and

not carried to the point of scholarship or of flexibility of diction which is required for the finer kinds of literary expression.

20. Aptitude for number is one of the strongest points in the intellectual equipment of many Bengali students, who share this gift with their fellow-countrymen in other parts of India. Their skill in computation and in the symbolic operations of algebra shows that their natural sense of number is strong. On the other hand, their sense of time is defective. Even when things have happened before his eyes, a Bengali student is apt to be far out in his estimate of their duration in point of time. The unpunctuality in keeping engagements, which is often one of his noticeable characteristics, may very well be due to casualness, but vagueness about time has something to do with it. Even to-day there are traces of the vagueness about chronology which is found in the *Puranas* with their vast and cloudy æons, cycles and *yugas*.

21. Yet, prone as he is to slur over differences in points of time, the Bengali student has a brilliant capacity for drawing other kinds of distinction. This gift stands him in good stead in the practice of the law, provided that in exercising it he does not indulge himself to the point of becoming tedious and unconvincing. Often in logic and metaphysics he shows a considerable power of acute analysis.[1] He has also a love for abstraction and generalisation, a love sometimes displayed to excess but springing from qualities of mind which might achieve grandeur of conception when playing upon rich masses of observed and assimilated fact.

22. For such assimilation of facts the Bengali student has excellent equipment by reason of his quickly assimilative power. To any new ideas which appeal to his sympathies, to any new fashions of thought for which he feels affinity, his mind naturally and quickly adheres. First of all Indians, the Bengali appropriated western learning. He has been, of all Indians, the quickest in adopting western culture. And this quality of the Bengali's mind and temperament is connected with his power of imaginative sympathy. His quick sympathy gives him insight; his insight, the desire for assimilation. Dr. Brajendranath Seal records in his evidence the quickening of intellectual interests which he has observed among many of the university students

[1] Mr. G H. Langley, Professor of Philosophy at Dacca College, told us that each year in his class there are three or four students who show marked philosophical ability which could be stimulated and trained to independent philosophic thought.

during the last triennium. And we find that in Calcutta, as in London and Paris, the more eager minds among the undergraduates are now pre-occupied with those books in which are debated, whether in fiction or in philosophy, in poetry or in drama, the poignant issues of contemporary life.

23. Nevertheless, in any such sympathetic open-mindedness to new ideas and ideals there is a danger of instability. Vivid impressions may be overwashed by new impressions, not less vivid than those which went before. Thus the Bengali student's very gift of sympathy exposes him to the danger of instability of mind. He may feel in rapid succession new intellectual interests, new objects of desire, the attractions of new points of view, each in turn distractingly modified by that which follows. And it is perhaps to this trait in his temperament that is due his lack of endurance in working his way with stubborn, undeflected purpose through the granite of a difficult subject. Of drudgery indeed he is capable, at times only too capable. No one who has heard him from an early hour reciting in tedious monotone and endless repetition the words which he has set himself to memorise for a difficult examination will think of the Bengali student as lacking in assiduity and patience. He is intensely diligent in those last feverish months of self-preparation. He displays powers of absorption and of unceasing, though rather mindless, toil. But these are very different powers from those exerted by a man who digs his way through the intractable mass of a difficult subject, applying at every stage in his progress all his mental power to the problem of the next advance.

IV.

24. Something may be said here of the student's way of working at his tasks in school and college. It must be remembered that, except in homes which, though still rare, are happily becoming more common, he has had in his earliest years too little of the training which inculcates habitual self-discipline, cultivates the power of observation, enjoins the duties of regular exercise, and imparts a sense of personal responsibility for his conduct. At home, indeed, he has seen much to love and to revere. But he has missed some of the discipline of that kind of early education which is at once affectionate and strict. And then, in what might be the most formative stage in his young life, when his mind is open

to new suggestions and to guidance, he is usually sent to a school which is far from answerable to his many and subtle needs. The majority of the vernacular teachers are untrained men, keeping the wolf from their door on a miserable stipend and as a rule unaccustomed to take any strong interest in their individual pupils or to rise above a mechanical compliance with a dull tradition or with the requirements of the code. "During the first years of his school career," it has been said, "the Indian boy rarely owes anything to his teacher beyond receiving instruction in the code subjects. Of his early teachers he rarely, in later years, remembers even the names." At the high school, the uninspiring routine continues to run its course. There is little of individual stimulus, and practically none of the interests and discipline of corporate life. The course of study is narrow, the methods of teaching perfunctory and dull. Too little is done, save by exceptional teachers, to rouse the boy's interests, to train his powers of observation, to impart to him the habit of independent study, to give him the first lessons of practical experience in managing the affairs which arise in the social life of any community, even in the community of a school. And, as the shadow of the distant matriculation examination falls upon the boy, he may ask for, or be given, the help of private tutors, who coach him early or late at home. He gets into the habit of sitting over his books, at home and in school, for hours which would be incredibly long to a European boy. But he gets much less than he should get out of the time which he lavishes on his tasks. Too often, except in the walk to and from school, he gets little vigorous exercise and hardly ever any all-round development of his body or timely care for its remediable defects. School life draws towards its close without having made any systematic improvement in his physique.

25. To this should be added the further disablement which the boy may suffer from the extreme poverty of his home. Education in Bengal often entails the utmost strain upon the family purse. Great sacrifices are made by parents who can ill afford it, in order to send their boys to school or college. In many cases, savings are exhausted in meeting this expense, and money is borrowed to defray the cost of what cannot, in the interests of the boy and his family, be foregone. As soon as the boy is old enough to become aware of the difficulty with which his school fees are afforded, he begins to feel the pressure of his parents' anxiety that

he should succeed in attaining the purpose for which he has been sent to school. He is made to feel how much is expected of him; he begins to dread failure; he inclines naturally to the use of all the helps, whether private coaching or cram books or memorising of school-texts, likely to increase his chances of success in the examinations upon which so much depends. Often disposed by his natural temperament to be morbid, sensitive to the anxieties and expectations of his family, the boy hates the idea of failure and dreads what he regards as its disgrace. But the educational system under which he grows up throws into high relief certain examinations. Over these fences he must leap, if he is to put his foot upon the highway of a respectable career. The certificates or the degrees which he may win are among the passports to social consideration. They will fix his status as an educated member of the community. They are the keys which open the doors to professional callings. And therefore can we wonder if, with home anxieties so often in the background, with parents counting upon his success, with his own prospects in marriage and in his future avocation depending so largely on the issue of his examination and with his own sensitive self-esteem at stake, the boy is haunted by thoughts of the coming test, and if examinations loom menacingly large in his thoughts of the future and in his outlook on life?

26. Under such influences as these, it has been said by an experienced observer, "the Indian boy acquires at college a habit of excessive industry, but the craving for a degree outrides his thirst for knowledge. There is often a competition among students to find out who is the hardest worker among them, and that one is envied and respected who is reputed to be champion in this respect. He is usually too timid to play with those few of his colleagues who have already acquired some proficiency in games. At college therefore he reads for three hours in the early morning, attends four lectures, and after a mild walk of an hour and his evening meal, settles down for a further three hours of study before going to bed. Most of his reading is confined to his text books. The Indian student's love of cram need not imply an innate aversion from acquiring sound knowledge. Far from it. It is due solely to his intense dread of his examinations, a dread which makes it impossible for him to be more than he is. To pass his examination is the sole object of his activities during

the year. Too often, Indian parents judge their sons by the results of their examinations, and woe to him who fails."

27. In the long hours during which a boy crams himself for an examination, it is not necessarily from any lack of natural ability that he turns himself into a parrot. What explains his method of procedure is an anxiously persistent endeavour to compass his end by the means which he believes to be the surest at his command. The end which he has in view is to pass his examination, because that is what is expected of him by his family and friends and because success in it will help him forward on his way towards gaining admission to a coveted career.

28. If, along with better teaching and with careful training of his power of observation; if along with a richer and modernised course of study, which would give him a new outlook upon the world and the part which he might play in its service; if along with cultivation of manual skill and of the power of appreciating beauty in nature and in art as well as in human conduct and achievement; if, along with these things, the student in Bengal could do more of his high school course in his vernacular, and nevertheless get a better and more practical knowledge of English, the habit of mechanical memorising in preparation for examinations would in time become less general.

V.

29. In a disposition so impressionable as that of the Bengali student, and so responsive to new ideas; with a mind which can skim quickly over the unfamiliar region of another's thought, and yet is housed in a body for whose vigorous health but little care is given; it is inevitable that there should sometimes be a pause of hesitation between insight and action, a mal-adjustment between knowledge and will. And thrown off his guard by the swift response of his nerves to an unexpected stimulus, the young man may on the instant show towards some rougher and more self-confident personality an outward deference which is no true expression of his inner nature. But, though on such an occasion he may be momentarily and outwardly submissive, in the central and less accessible part of his nature assent and deference may be withheld. Inthe citadel of his more private feelings the Bengali remains unconvinced, brooding though seemingly subdued. Recovering from the shock of an assent which was involuntary rather than

deliberate, he records his secret protest, and may nurse a sense of grievance and of humiliation at having, partly through his own fault and weakness, been defeated and misunderstood.

30. It is partly from a consciousness of this defect, a defect associated with his quality of imaginative sympathy, that he clings instinctively to the protective support of traditional and customary regulation, in the family, in the village community and in his caste. He knows that they uphold him by the steady pressure of their expectations and of their rules. At moments when he is threatened by weakness in his will, their obligations will stiffen his wavering purpose. He relies therefore upon their sanction. In a communal responsibility his irresolute individuality is merged and fortified. And it is in consonance with this trait in his temperament that, under the dominion of a passionately-felt ideal, he is capable of devotion to a brotherhood, and of showing undaunted courage and endurance of pain. The Bengali may be for a time transformed under the spell of a political ideal. Under such an influence his timidity and instability may disappear. Thus, in the movement of revolutionary nationalism, which had become publicly significant in 1906, impressionable students were attracted by the doctrines which invested nationalism with a religious tendency.[1] These boys were taught by fanatics and unscrupulous men " to discount ordinary morality, to disbelieve in human intelligence, to despise anything that savoured of the materialism of Europe and to seek inspiration from a Divine Energy, whereby

[1] Remark of the principal of a college, quoted in the report of Bengal District Administration Committee, 1914, page 4. Reference may also be made to Chapter VI of the report of the Sedition Committee, 1918, " Revolutionary Recruiting from Bengal Schools and Colleges," in which the following remarks are quoted from observations made by a judge at the trial of a conspiracy case. " Those responsible for the conspiracy ..... realised that their best chance was to get hold of the youth of the country and influence them by appealing to their sense of religion and sense of chivalry. "

The statistics as to age, occupation, etc., of persons convicted in Bengal of revolutionary crimes or killed in the commission of such crimes during the years 1907-17 show that, out of 186, 68 were students. Fifty were under 20 years of age. (Report of Sedition Committee, 1918. Annexure 2).

" The secondary English schools, and in a less degree the colleges, of Bengal have been regarded by the revolutionaries as their most fruitful recruiting centres." (*Ibid.*, page 75).

" The revolutionary associations have spared no pains to secure recruits from schools and colleges. By elaborate endeavour and astutely devised methods they have achieved a degree of success which, unless strongly countered by official and non-official effort, must gravely prejudice the future of Bengal. " (*Ibid.*, page 80).

they might prepare themselves to take part in a mighty struggle."[1] Hypnotised by these ideas, which had their counterpart in the revolutionary propaganda in Europe, many boys and young men (among them some whose affectionate natures and imaginative minds had won the regard of their European and Indian teachers) were induced to believe that "foreign rule was *per se* bad for India, bad for the Hindu religion and Hindu manhood; that every effort should be made to get rid of the foreigners by fair means or foul; that emancipation could only be a gradual process, the result of a lengthy and arduous struggle; that, in spite of the weakness of their fellow-countrymen and their unfitness for such a struggle, the long agony would regenerate them; and that, though the struggle might be fruitless, it must, in any case, be undertaken. It would be a holy war."[2] Under the mastery of this belief, these young men were lured into an "abominable propaganda which devoted its energy to assassinations of brave and loyal servants of Government and to dacoities committed on unguarded and helpless persons."[3]

31. Yet, capable as he is of concerted effort under the duress of an idea, the Bengali student is judged by some of his fellow-countrymen who have made a life-long study of his powers to be deficient in the capacity for complex co-ordination, whether in the sphere of thought or of action. These observers detect in him a certain degree of weakness in the grasp of complex factors, in their adjustment to one another and in keeping them in equilibrium, be it in the study of a complicated intellectual problem or in the maintenance of an organisation. This defect is one of the impediments to the progress of the Bengali not only (though there are conspicuous exceptions) in the study of such subjects as sociology and economics, but also in complex industrial undertakings, in the wide but still too much neglected field of municipal enterprise, and in the responsible duties of commercial management upon a large scale. To find a cure for this defect, partly by means of changes in education, partly in other ways, is a most difficult problem. So far as the contribution of education is concerned, hardly anything would more help the Bengali student than further opportunities of learning both at school and college

[1] Report of Sedition Committee, page 12.

[2] Bengal District Administration Committee Report, page 7.

[3] *Ibid.*, page 15.

the habit of co-operation with his fellows through the manifold interests and responsibilities of a well-ordered corporate life. But there would also be required changes in methods of teaching and more independent study under the guidance of experienced teachers, so as to strengthen a boy's power of grappling with questions in which many factors have to be weighed in the balance of judgment and then applied.

VI.

32. We now turn to an even deeper cause of the unsettlement which is affecting the minds of many Indian students and is reflected in educational discussions in Bengal.

33. It is through the contact between Indian culture and that of the outer world, and especially the culture of Europe and the West, that painful dilemmas are created in the mind of the thoughtful student of Bengal. He feels the eddying current of western thought, which is forcing its way, in some degree unseen, into the quiet waters of his traditional life. The current brings with it an unfamiliar, but vigorous and agitating, literature; a mass of political formulas, charged with feeling and aspiration and sometimes delusively simple in their convenient generalisation; fragments of philosophies; some poisonous weeds of moral scepticism; bright-hued theories of reform; the flotsam and jetsam of a revolutionary age. The young man's necessary study of English has given him the power of reading what the inrushing stream brings with it. His own instinctive yearnings for social reform, for intellectual enlightenment and for moral certainty make him eager for fresh truth. And behind this new foreign literature and philosophy, behind the pressure of those invisible influences for which printed books and journals are but some of the conduits of communication, there stands the great authority of colossal Power; Power evinced in political achievement, in religious conviction, in the world-wide ramifications of commerce, in stupendous industrialism, in the startling triumphs of applied science, in immeasurable resources of wealth; Power, which, even under the strain of a titanic struggle, puts out new manifestations of energy and suffers no eclipse.

34. These influences fix upon his thoughts and bind them by their fascination. And yet, admire them as he may, he feels by instinct that in them evil is mixed with good. By instinct also he

knows that in part they are alien to his own racial tradition, and that, while some are ameliorative to it, others are baneful. But it is beyond his strength to disentangle what will help from what will hurt his country and his individual life. He is overmastered by the force of the new stream, and finds that even the back-waters of Indian life are invaded by its waters. Not a student in Bengal or elsewhere in India can be wholly insensible to some of the influences of western thought and experience, though he may not be conscious of their significance to him and to his country, and, even if conscious of it, may not be able to express his feeling in words. Some however of the students are aware of the tension in their thoughts and ideals which is caused by the two-fold appeal of western influence and of Indian tradition.

"The atmosphere of industrial revolution and of industrial progress," writes Mr. J. C. Coyajee,[1] "is beginning to permeate India; older ideals are being shaken; and in such a condition of national psychology the universities with their present lines of teaching cannot appeal to the enthusiasm of students It would be otherwise if the main body of our teaching was of a practical nature, and the literary and the speculative side was only one of the features, or, at least, if there was an equilibrium and fair intermingling of literary and technical studies.. . . Such an arrangement will at once excite the enthusiasm of the students, will be a corrective of the national psychology, and will form a national asset."

35. The Rev. W. E. S. Holland goes so far as to write :—

"India has magnificent traditions of education in the *guru-chela* system. These have been displaced *in toto* by the introduction of a great system of western education which has never been assimilated..... It is entirely unconnected with the home life of India and domestic education. It has no roots in the soil of the land ..... It involves a complete breach with the reverences and moral sanctions of childhood and the home. For western civilisation contains within it forces which are inevitably the solvent of the whole system of Indian thought and faith, and life. Western education cannot, therefore, be other than a very destructive influence. The wonder is that the explosions are not much more violent. The problem of supreme difficulty is to find or create new universities; to institute a really constructive system of modern education. The all but complete neglect, until quite recently, of physical, moral and spiritual considerations in the Indian educational system has had disastrous results."[2]

36. We do not ourselves accept in their entirety the implications of these words. Moreover, we know from his oral evidence that their writer is not other than hopeful of a new synthesis

[1] General Memoranda, page 416.

[2] Question 1.

being found between what is best in western and eastern thought, and that he is not in any way unmindful of the intense moral and spiritual zeal which, from the days of Dr. Duff, the neutrality of Government has allowed to express itself alongside of the requirements of the secular curriculum. But Mr. Holland's view has the weight which is rightly attached to the judgment of one whose personality has been deeply felt in the recent educational developments in India. And some of the points hinted at in his diagnosis are confirmed by many others of our witnesses, as for example by Mr. Prasanta Chandra Mahalanobis, who writes :—

"In Bengal, while our mind is highly imaginative and our intellect peculiarly subtle, our actual social life is wholly circumscribed by conventional custom and completely fettered by artificial rules. This divorce of our actual life from the life of our ideas has made us a race of neurasthenics. In addition it is destroying our intellectual power. At present we are too often content merely to imagine and almost never really to achieve. Our only hope lies in a true university education. It must awaken in us a real sense of independence in both thought and action."[1]

37. We have received from a young Indian correspondent, Mr. Amarnath Mazumdar, a description of an orthodox Hindu home in Bengal as modified under the influence of western education.

"The majority of students who flock to the schools and colleges belong to the orthodox middle classes. Most of these families still live in the villages. Since the introduction of English education, however, there has been a regular influx of the *bhadralok* classes towards the metropolis, or to one or other of the mufassal towns. They have been attracted thither by the new openings created by the British administrative machinery, so that people who were in the past content to live and die within the surroundings of their own village, have, in order to share the lights of the metropolis, transformed themselves into an urban society which is composed of lawyers, doctors, engineers, school-masters, clerks and officials. Many of these, however, have not yet cut off all ties with their original village homes. The temporary house in town is called *basha*, the word *bari* (home) being confined to the ancestral home in the village. It is in the latter (unless economic considerations stand in the way) that marriages, *sradhs* (ceremonial offerings to the dead) and other family rites are preferably celebrated; it is there that the holidays are spent; it is there that the family gods are enshrined and worshipped throughout the year. Economic considerations and the difficulties of communication are, however, effecting a change here also. There is an increasing tendency to cut off all ties with the village, and to convert the town residence into a new home.

[1] General Memoranda, page 430.

Even in these cases, however, there persists a sentimental tie with the old village.

A typical Hindu home is a composite structure. At the head there is very often the old grandfather or grandmother. Then there are the sons of the house, who are the earning members of the family. The grandfather continues to be the head of the family, although he may have ceased to earn; and to the son, marriage or settling down in life gives rise to no question of his leaving his parental home. Even when the exigencies of livelihood require a man to spend the greater part of the year away from the central home, he invariably returns to it during holidays. He regards himself as belonging to the same parental home and contributes to the joint income of the family.

The grandfather and the grandmother represent the primitive orthodox tradition. The traditional honour of the family is one of their main concerns. It lies with them to see that the traditional ideas of purity, decency and propriety are kept intact. But it would be a mistake to think that austerity or severity is one of their prominent characteristics. If the grandson in his childhood receives any indulgence, it is generally from the grandfather or grandmother. There is a certain reserve and severe reticence in the relation of the parent to the son. But a perfect freedom and affectionate indulgence and unreserved confidence characterise the relations of the grandfather or the granny to the grandchild. She especially is very often the confidante of the grandson, and acts as mediator and intercessor between parent and child. But this liberalism on the part of the grandparents is within the bounds of their orthodoxy. The grandsire's twofold functions of 'head of the family' and 'comrade of the grandchild' are well indicated in the two appellations given to him —*karta* (supreme or head) and *thakurdada* (lit. 'godbrother'). From this it comes about that the grandparent often has a much greater influence on the grandchild's mind than have the parents. These old people, comparatively free from the cares and toils of active life, have plenty of leisure; this they devote to the children, to the practice of piety and to a study of the scriptures. In most cases the rigour of the orthodox tradition is, however unconsciously, tempered in them, through the affectionate indulgence which they feel towards the younger generation as also by their shrewd sense of affairs. They refrain from forcing on the younger members of the family practices and observances to which they themselves would strictly adhere. Very often they display a willingness to concede to the younger generation liberty to live the new life, so far as that is inevitable, provided always that it does not militate violently against their most dearly cherished ideas.

The father of the family belongs in most cases to one of the learned professions or to the machinery of administration. He has had his education in English schools and colleges. Perhaps in his youth the intoxication of the new culture threw him off his balance and drew him into the ranks of social or religious revolutionaries. But since those days he has married and has settled down in life. He has had children, and has had his real experience of life. This experience, and the suitable income he derives from his occupation, have sobered him down. His actual experience of life has led him to doubt the dark and livid picture of caste and superstition, which

was painted by the reforming imagination of his youth. He has come into touch with the humanity and neighbourliness and serene spirituality which underlie the crust of Hindu ritual and ceremony. And in this he has been confirmed perhaps by the writers of the new Hindu school, who have begun an appreciative study of Hindu life and culture in the light of the newly developed thought. Or, if he has not come under these influences, he leads a two-fold life, namely his intellectual life which is fed by memories of Byron and Shelley, of Mill, Macaulay and Huxley; and his family life fed by domestic affections and protected from external shocks by an indulgent and amused compliance with the forms and rigours of the old social order. In either case, however, the intellectual influence exerted by the father on the son is not very considerable. The father's real preoccupation is the earning of his livelihood and the economic management of the household. What intellectual life he has is seldom shared with the son, because of the habitual reticence and reserve which characterise their mutual relations. There are, of course, numerous exceptions to this. But I am speaking of the average family, and especially of one living close to the town.

The son is a student at college. His one ambition in life is to take his father's place as the earning member of the household. This domestic outlook governs all his studies. Education leads to a degree and the degree leads to a livelihood. Naturally his studies are regulated in such a way as to fit him for the examination. In his mind, there is very little of genuine enthusiasm for the wider bearings of his university studies. But he is not in every case devoid of intellectual interests. Perhaps it may be that he has come under the influence of the new poetry of Bengal. This interest in Bengali literature may be the only real intellectual element in his life. When he reads the works of Bengali poets, he reads them as poetry. But when he reads Milton, he is generally thinking of his examination. What genuine interest he has in English literature is really reflected from his study of Bengali poetry. As regards the other subjects in his curriculum, whether it be history or politics or economics or philosophy, he has no conception of these studies from the standpoint of his own national life. He has not the citizen's outlook. His outlook is exclusively domestic. There is very little of original thinking among such men as he. His thinking is done for him by the newspapers and by the Bengali magazines. He lives in a students' mess or hostel in Calcutta; gets used to a smarter style of living than he has been used to in his home; and shares with his elder fellow-students the political and nationalistic aspirations which fill the atmosphere. But his aspirations do not include any severe discipline of the intellect. His mind has not grasped the importance of the severe, devoted application of the mind to different branches of study or how indispensable such application is to success in the task of nation-building. During the last ten years the younger minds in Bengal are turning to a study of the latest developments of western thought, to Russian fiction, Scandinavian drama, and among English writers to H. G. Wells and Bernard Shaw. Up to the present time, however, this new leaven of thought and feeling has been at work in but a very restricted field. The effect of it has been, as yet, that of a challenge or of a dazzling light. The young mind of Bengal has not yet been able to grasp the new issues, but there is a genuine groping for light. His interest and attention are

however attracted by some of the latest developments in Indian social movements. These are :—

(1) The movements for the elevation of the depressed classes.
(2) The movement in favour of foreign travel.
(3) The movement for the redress of crying social abuses—such as the marriage dowry system.
(4) The movement for the appreciation and revival of ancient Indian achievement in the fields of religion, of social organisation, of art and of literature.

The new ideas with which at the coming of the college holidays the student returns to his home do not cause any serious conflict in the family circle. Even in the most orthodox Indian minds there is a toleration for all shades of thought. It is in the field of practice or observance, especially in the matter of prohibitions, that strictness is demanded and enforced. You may *think* as you like; but you must not eat the forbidden flesh of cows and pigs; you must not eat food cooked by a man of lower caste; you must not marry outside your caste; you must not take out your women-folk to mix in male society; you must abide by such restrictions, in so far as they are established and correct, until you attain the highest stage of the doctrine. Otherwise you come to grief.

But, though the atmosphere of large tolerance and affection which pervades the Hindu home has averted any serious conflict between the young generation and its elders within the family circle, there has certainly been a divergence of ideas. An intellectual crisis has been reached; and only a very careful and sympathetic handling of the education of the country can reconcile the elements of progress with the healthy features of the old order. The original Indian culture and civilisation have elements of stability and of permanence which ought to contribute to the richness and variety of human civilisation. And the education of the Indian youth cannot afford to neglect them."

38. This picture is different in some significant respects from that drawn by the late Sir George Birdwood, who, with reference to a time when the pendulum had swung to its extreme limit of 'westernism,' spoke of modern education in India as having "destroyed in Indians the love of their own literature, the quickening soul of a people, their delight in their own arts and, worst of all, their repose in their own traditional and national religion," as having "disgusted them with their own homes, their parents and sisters, their very wives," and as having "brought discontent into every family so far as its baneful influences have reached." Our own view is that modern education has been but one of the channels, though admittedly a principal channel, through which the influences of the West have penetrated into India; that such penetration was in any case inevitable; that modern education, whatever its defects, met a need which was

keenly felt by the Indians themselves; that it is indispensable to India if she is to achieve an inner unity and take her rightful place among the peoples of the world; that its results, though not free from grave dangers or even from actual mischief, have on the whole been highly beneficial; and that, though unavoidably producing some tension of mind and spirit, and even leading in some cases to what Sir John Woodroffe describes as 'a paralysing inner conflict,'[1] it has in the main prepared the way for a culture which will harmonise with and supplement the national culture and will stimulate the latter into new manifestations and achievements.

39. The Bengali student, like many a student in other lands, feels upon his mind the pull of two loyalties, the loyalty to the old order and the loyalty to the new. But in his case the difficulty of combining these two loyalties is very great. Each loyalty needs fuller and clearer definition to him. He finds it hard to light upon any real adjustment between them. Therefore, it is often his fate to lead what is in effect a double intellectual life. He is two-minded and lives a parallel life in the atmosphere of two cultures. He too, as a great administrator from Europe said of his own life in India, has to keep his watch set for two longitudes, and indeed for more than two longitudes. It is not only with Calcutta and London but with New York, Chicago and Tokyo that the intelligent young Bengali has to keep in time.

40. Of considerable importance in this connexion is the new movement for social service which is spreading in Bengal. Several of our witnesses including Mr. Hira Lal Roy, Dr. Brajendranath Seal and Dr. D. N. Maitra emphasise the value of this work in school and college education.[2] Apart from its direct service to the poorer classes in the community, it has educational power in character-building. It cultivates the sympathies. It trains the power of observation. It enhances the sense of moral responsibility. It directs attention to the problems of local government.

---

[1] General Memoranda, page 310.

[2] We may instance the social work which is being done by senior students of St. Paul's Cathedral College, Calcutta, among the poorer families, and specially among leather workers, in the neighbourhood of the college.

It emphasises the duty of disinterested municipal enterprise.[1] It teaches, by direct experience, that

'Mercy has a human heart, Pity a human face.'

And it revives the old Indian sense of social obligation in such a way as to link with it a readiness to use modern science and methods of prevention for the welfare of the community and the betterment of the race. It is possible that, under influences like those of social service, the Bengali student may come to find some deeper harmony between the old Indian tradition and the new industrial order of our days.

41. The main characteristic of the ancient Hindu society (and a vast number of the Muslim homes among the cultivating class in Bengal have absorbed the colour of Hindu social ideas) was not aristocracy nor democracy nor hierarchy but a communal organisation of households. It did not disregard the need for, or the social value of, the institution of private property. But it limited the rights and range of private ownership, not by legal enactment so much as by the pressure of social custom. Its characteristic was (at least in the narrowly legalistic sense of the words) neither purely status nor contract, but obligation under the guise of social authority. How far the dictates of such obligation were in practice reciprocally fulfilled, how far evaded or by casuistry explained away, the historian of ancient India must determine. But the ideal of that ancient polity is not obscure. It was to combine (for the upper castes), in due measure and balance, the rights of the individual and the rights of the community, and to transmute economic relationships (once again within the narrow limits of the twice-born) into the bonds of moral and neighbourly obligation.

42. In Europe, along with the breakdown of the mediaeval system, and under the influence of the thinkers of the renaissance, there was an increasing accentuation of individual rights. In the surge of new political ideals and of revolt from the older religious allegiance, (though not from its teaching of social duty), in the outthrust of economic ambitions and of commercial

[1] In this connexion, reference should be made to the reports on town-planning which have been made by Mr. Patrick Geddes at Dacca, Indore and elsewhere. The work which he is doing for India derives much of its stimulus and practical value from his insight into the relationship between education and the other aspects of civic duty and into the social and economic context of all kinds of education.

adventure, individual self-realisation (along with the discharge of duty to the State) became an ideal of life, individual enterprise a conspicuous virtue, individual ownership a vitally necessary and almost sacred institution. And in Britain, where factory production first developed industrialism on a vast scale and gave new stimulus to activities of foreign trade, the age of Industrial Revolution coincided, not accidentally, with a phase of political thought which minimised the authoritative powers of the Central Government of the State. '*Laissez faire*' and 'No State Interference with Industry' became the watchwords of a school of economists and politicians, whose teaching was not more than half the truth.

43. At the time when European ideas first broke with full force upon India, the new thought and enterprise of the West were self-confident with individualism. And to the West, the traditions and social organisation of India wore the appearance—not exclusively but with undue neglect of her philosophy and of the inner spirit of her ancient polity—of an unprogressive, if not stagnant, community held fast in the bonds of Status and of Caste. In the main, each presented to the other its less attractive side. That West to East and East to West had each a message was for the time obscure, except to thinkers of rare insight and discernment.

44. At the present time, however, a growing number of the younger minds in India feel the need of industrial enterprise, and of individual freedom from what they judge to be obsolete restraints. And, simultaneously, an ever-growing body of opinion in the West seeks to set further limits upon individual profit-making and, so far as the circumstances of each great department of production and distribution allow, to supplement, if not to supersede, private profit by collective control. Each tendency is conditioned by the need for safeguarding the play of its corrective opposite. But this drawing together of East and West towards a central point of balance between communal organisation and free scope for individual enterprise suggests the possibility of a synthesis, in regard to the structure and maintenance of which East and West may learn each from the other's experience.

45. If this be so, the significance of some of the present currents in Indian educational opinion becomes clearer. Those currents seem at first sight to be running in opposite directions. One is setting towards changes in education which will give more self-

reliance, impart more vigour to individual initiative, and furnish a training of the hand and mind which will fit the younger generation for industrial enterprise and for a more industrialised agriculture. But another, and in some respects an apparently opposite, current of opinion inclines towards extended Government action in industry and commerce; towards the creation therefore of new cadres of Government service; and consequently towards increased facilities for getting the type of education which will qualify young men for Government posts. With the first of these two tendencies in public opinion goes an eager demand for widely extended primary education, with the object of raising the standard of mental efficiency among the masses of the people, out of whose ranks will rise, if aided by abundant opportunities of higher education, men of grit and power, competent to take their place among the vigorous leaders of the new industry. But with the second tendency goes a feeling of some alarm at the danger of any sudden extension of primary education among the masses of the Indian people; a conservative disposition towards existing methods of higher education (a disposition modified by willingness to add technology and agriculture to the list of university studies); and a distinct, though rarely expressed, reluctance so to throw open the avenues of access to higher education as to impair the preferential advantages enjoyed by the sons of the already educated classes.

46. Yet, between these two conflicting shades of opinion harmony is possible if India is moving neither towards a régime of individual enterprise alone nor alone towards a régime of Governmental monopoly in industry and commerce; if it is in some juxtaposition of these two forces, and in some reciprocal and guarded relation between them, that the way for India's economic advancement will be found. In such an event, a general system of primary education, if it were wisely adapted to the real needs of life and livelihood, and were not merely thrown like an explosive into the vast magazine of Indian life, might be welcomed without reserve, because such a system would enhance the productivity of labour, would increase its mobility, and would give to the children of the poor wholly new opportunities for advancement and for the full development of their natural powers. And the sons of the middle and professional classes, gaining on their part new vigour and initiative from better teaching

and more inspiring influences in school and college, would find the freshly opened fields of employment so wide that they themselves would not suffer, but would rather gain, from the intellectual competition forced upon them by increasing numbers of students rising from a humbler class.

VII.

47. Though in the vast majority of cases distinct from that of their brothers and of their husbands, the education of girls in Bengal affects the moral and intellectual atmosphere of the homes in which the young people of both sexes live together. At this point therefore we must touch upon some aspects of a topic which is discussed more fully in later chapters of our report.[1]

48. The evidence of two witnesses should be quoted here, because both of them have had experience in teaching boys and girls at college and elsewhere, and one of the two has had exceptional opportunities of judging the quality of the work done by girls in the Calcutta University matriculation examination. Dr. Adityanath Mukerjee, writing from some years' personal experience on the staff of a women's college, records his opinion that "as regards intellectual ability and power of grasp, the girls of Bengal are not inferior to the boys."[2] Dr. Brajendranath Seal confirms this judgment, but in greater detail. He has found the work done by girls in matriculation and other Calcutta University examinations as good in quality as that of the work done by boys, but in some respects different. Allowing in the case of both sexes for candidates of exceptional ability whose work has individual merits from which it would be erroneous to generalise, he regards the written English style of the girls as the better and the more direct in expression —the difference being so marked that, without knowing the names of the candidates or having any other clue to their sex, he believes that he could pick out the answers written by girls from a mixed bundle of examination scripts. But he finds that a girl's work shows signs of her being more dependent than a boy upon what the teacher has said, except in regard to any point in which her personal taste or judgment happens to have been touched. In that case, the girl shows independence of opinion as well as of

[1] Chapters XIV and XXXVI.

[2] Question 23.

expression. Reviewing the whole of his experience he thinks, so far as the numbers of candidates whose work has come before him justify a general conclusion, that in intellectual calibre at the matriculation stage the girls are equal to the boys, though in some respects different in the quality of their minds.

49. Apart from the teaching which is given privately to the *purdahnashin* whether among the Musalmans or the Hindus, the school-life of Indian girls in Bengal, except in the case of the daughters of families connected with the Brahmo Samaj, ends in about the fourteenth year, if not before. But, though the school-life of these girls may be short, they receive in other ways and through other kinds of discipline a training which is often very strict. Severe, indeed, is the moral and spiritual discipline which many a Bengali girl receives from the elder women in the home of her husband during the first years of her married life. And that discipline, though very unlike what a European girl undergoes during the same years of youth, has a deliberate purpose. It is intended to produce (so far as variations of individual temperament may allow) adaptation to an ideal of life, conformity with a type which is honoured by tradition, and acceptance of certain canons of conduct which ancient usage prescribes. Such a discipline, though it does not comprise many of the intellectual factors which modern European standards presuppose, is nevertheless a purposeful education. Whatever our view of the ideal at which it aims, and in whatsoever degree it may be exposed to the dangers of harshness when administered without careful and tender regard to the sensibilities and physical immaturity of the girl, we are not entitled to withhold from it recognition as being in fact and in its way a deliberate kind of training. It is an education of the old pattern—a domestic or workshop training for the discharge of certain functions or for the practice of an art.

50. One of its purposes is to train a woman in the art of household management. In this art, under the difficult conditions imposed by the joint family system and not seldom by restricted means, the Hindu woman frequently attains to a high degree of skill, tact and resource. In fact, her abilities (as is shown by history as well as by the experience of to-day) find congenial tasks in the sphere of administration. There is a striking type of Hindu woman, racy with mother-wit, whose strong will and

character impress themselves much more vigorously upon the family life than outside observers would imagine.

51. The Bengali girl has an instinct for order and for neatness. She has natural grace of bearing, deftness of hand, simplicity in taste. If she has been taught to make on the floor the traditional designs (*alipana*) in rice or flour, her hand is often skilful in drawing patterns, and the weaving of necklaces of beads (*punthis*) or garlands of flowers (*malas*) has quickened her sense of colour. For music, as a rule, she has no exceptional gift. Her verbal memory is good, generally better than a boy's. She matures a little earlier than he does, and sooner reaches the stage of arrest. She has perhaps a little more marked individuality than he, in the earlier years of her education. As a rule she is more plodding than he is, and more apt to drudge. It was intended that her gifts and aptitudes should find special encouragement on strictly Hindu principles in the *Mahakali Patshala*, founded by the Mataji Tapaswini under the patronage of the Maharajah of Darbhanga in Calcutta, and similar institutions elsewhere.

52. Three instincts and powers show themselves with significant beauty in the nature of the Indian girl. From an early age, she discloses in very marked degree the instinct of motherhood. This natural disposition is strengthened and evoked by the spoken teaching and by the silent assumptions of the Hindu home in which she is born. The mystical aspect of life is very sacred to the Hindu soul. Reverence for what is symbolised by the life of husband and of child is central in a devout Hindu woman's conception of duty.[1] Lying behind its earthly manifestation and yet inseparably merged in it is a divine principle, of which she prays that she may be a channel and in the service of which pain is at times transmuted into ecstasy, anguish into joy. Hers is the duty of the life-bringer. In her worship of a divine mystery, instinct is transfigured into faith, self-will is conquered by devotion, personality is uplifted by submission.

53. Thus in the Indian girl's nature the instinct of motherhood is linked with another power, a sense of religion. By religion, in

[1] *Cf.* the passage on the education of women in Mr. Pramathanath Mukhopadhyaya's *Some Thoughts on Education in India* (Protiva Press, 211-A, Bowbazar Street, Calcutta), page 30 and page ix of Sir John Woodroffe's introduction to that essay.

devout Hindu home, every act of a good woman's day is ruled.

"Every milestone on the journey of herself or her children is a religious milestone. She knows no other division of the days and months and years as they pass by."[1] "Even the ordinary business of the day—bathing, dressing, eating—is a religious act. The Hindu woman recognises no claims, but those of religion. Her worship of the gods, of her husband, of her children, they are all part of her religion, and they make her life. Her husband has brought God close to her. She is created to serve him with all her powers of mind and body. The habit of her life is expressive of her relationship. The day is planned round his needs. She brings water to wash his feet, cooks for him, anticipates his smallest want while he eats. At his hand she holds her life."[2]

54. In her home-service, the devout Hindu wife is true as steel, asking for no recognition, selfless, and constant to the end. Hers is not the will to power but the will to submission, a submission courageously self-enforced and bringing with it a spiritual power of service and of insight.

"In her are thoughts akin to the mysticism of Christian saints, selflessness that transcends experience. In her quiet life, she gives the ministry of prayer and *puja* and sacrifice, fasting while she prays."[3]

55. And this brings us to the third chief instinct of the devout Indian girl, her power to idealise. She can invest an object, in itself simple and humble, with a mystic significance, and in the symbol sees the unseen. Through the visible, her eyes and soul discern the invisible. And at last, through self-curtailment and discipline, she may attain to the power of entering, in moments of intense feeling, beyond the entanglements of distracting thoughts, into a peace which passes understanding.

56. It is believed by many Hindus that some of the tendencies and preoccupations of modern school and college education jeopardise those of their daughters' gifts and qualities. They think that some of the pre-suppositions of a westernised training clash with their ideals of wifely devotion. Other objects of interest, other aims (such as passing an examination) would, they think, be interposed by it in such a way as to deflect a girl's thoughts from preparation for the wifely duties which the older views of a

[1] *The Purdahnashin* by Cornelia Sorabji (Calcutta: Thacker, Spink & Co., 1917), page 42.

[2] *Between the Twilights, being Studies of Indian Womanhood by One of Themselves* by Cornelia Sorabji (London: Harpers, 1908), pages 32, 120.

[3] The *Purdanashin*, pages 16 and 21.

woman's calling impose. The subtle influences of another environment would, it is suggested, counterwork the influences of the home. The strain of submitting during every day to the two very different disciplines and demands of a Hindu home and of a Europeanised school might, it is feared, impair a girl's physique. Corresponding doubts and hesitations were expressed by several of our Muslim witnesses with regard to the education of their daughters.

57. It is alleged indeed that, in the case of many girls, the results of the more Europeanised type of education of girls in Bengal have hitherto achieved neither what is best in the Hindu or Muslim ideals nor what is enviable in the European. A Hindu correspondent, while not forgetting how admirable have been effects of such an education in many instances, thus describes one of its failures or misfits:

"The young woman has perhaps a smattering of Bengali which enables her to read books, but generally she has neither the wide folk-culture nor the sacred lore of her grandmother. The result is a sentimental type of feminity, more or less averse to the cares and occupation of the household, and with a strong individualistic tendency that menaces the break-up of the family group. The newest fashions in dress and ornament engross her attention. With her poorer and narrower culture and with her selfish individualistic propensities, the young girl forms a disruptive influence in the family. The proper education of these girls is the most serious problem that confronts the educationist. The claims of the old ideal of the home have to be reconciled to those of the modern outlook."

58. Yet the messengers of a new age are knocking at the door of girls' education as at that of boys in modern India, and not least in Bengal. More penetrating than words written or spoken is the spirit of the time. And that spirit challenges many traditional submissions; awakens new longings after self-realisation; tears off the mask of authority which is worn by some ancient traditions; and sends a current of disquiet and unrest even into the recesses of the home. Aroused by such a challenge, conservatism shows itself in self-defence the more conservative. And, in retort, innovation wears its most defiant look. The current, which in some natures stimulates individualism, may for a time polarise old and new ideas in the sphere of women's education in Bengal. But there are signs of a desire for some adjustment between the new ideals and the old, and for some accommodation between what the West offers and what the East can teach.

59. For example, one of our younger witnesses, Mr. N. N. Dey of Calcutta, speaking of the trend of opinion among his contemporaries in Bengal, tells us that the desire that girls should enjoy further educational opportunities is already strong and will, in his judgment, rapidly grow. "Many young men feel that the happiness of their future married life is jeopardised by any deep gulf between the intellectual interests of men and women, and that under modern conditions of thought and feeling domestic sympathies are in danger of estrangement when husband and wife live on two very different planes of culture." He has noticed among young men a growing wish that marriages should be contracted at a maturer age than is at present the general rule.

60. It is evident from this and similar testimony that the question of the education of girls is pressing for a wise solution. More than this, the issue is a crucial one in the mental and spiritual crisis which now affects India and, in a high degree, Bengal. The approach to the problem lies through sympathy, sympathy alike with those, who, deeply imbued with loyalty to the older rules of a woman's duty, dread the results of any inconsiderate tampering with its foundations, and with those others who are convinced that the widening and deepening of the education of men calls for a widening and deepening in the education of women also.

61. It may be well at this point to describe the daily routine in the home of a Hindu family residing in a town. The following account has been written by Mr. Amarnath Mazumdar:—

"The mistress of the house rises early in the morning, and after the daily wash puts on a rough silk '*sari*' in which she performs her daily worship. This done she settles down to the work of the kitchen. The children in the meanwhile have risen from their beds, and are given their morning lunch, which consists of light food, such as the humble '*muri*' (fried rice) or the richer '*luchi*' (cakes of flour fried in *ghee*). At about ten, the students and the officials in the family have their principal meal, consisting of rice, curry and fish. The rest of the family dine a little later, and food is taken last of all by the elderly women, of whom the widows never take more than one meal in a day, which invariably excludes fish and meat. After mid-day there is a period of rest. Some of the women enjoy a nap, while others talk among themselves, or with any neighbours that may turn in. Sometimes the elder women, especially the widows, will ask some one of the younger members, boys or girls, to read to them portions from the Bengali ***Ramayan*** or ***Mahabharat*** (sacred books), or, if it be a 'Vaishnava' family, from the metrical lives of Chaitanya, the great mediaeval saint. At about three, there are preparations for the afternoon meal—the boys will return from

school, the men from office. The afternoon meal is of the same character as the morning one, unless there is tea in addition in some families. The young men go out for a walk, or to the play-ground, the elder males enjoy their smoke and the pleasures of conversation with neighbours and friends in the outer verandah or *baitakhana*, and the women busy themselves in preparations for the evening meal. In the evening very often the elderly ladies take their rosaries and say their prayers. The evening meal consists of '*luchi*' or *ruti* (fried bread), or rice and curry. It is generally served between 8 and 9 P.M., and the whole family retires to bed by about 10 o'clock."

62. Were no changes whatever to be made in the training of girls, inevitable developments in the education of boys and young men would affect the spirit and the atmosphere of such a home as is described above. Year by year, the intellectual gap between the men and women in the home would widen. An increasing number among the younger generation of men are sorry that modern ideas about the care of little children and their education during early years are so little known to their wives and to the women members of their household. They realise how much of health and happiness is lost through obsolete notions of sick-nursing and hygiene, and how unnecessarily the young mother often suffers because she and the older women who watch over her in the crises of her life have not gained by education the power of discriminating between a faulty tradition and common-sense. It will be a good thing if wise changes in the education of women bring about closer intellectual companionship between wife and husband without injury to those most precious of all the attributes of the good Indian woman, her selfless devotion and her sense of religious duty.

63. In a novel[1] recently written by Mr. Birendra Kumar Datta, a graduate of Calcutta University, a picture is drawn of the contrasted types of character and of ideals of life found in contemporary Bengal among those of the educated classes who feel the moral, intellectual and social perturbations of the present time. The author does not fail to show what part may be played in an epoch of perplexing transitions by the serene and unselfish spirit of a Bengali girl, though he himself appeals earnestly for "the total abolition of caste, of the accumulated prejudices and superstitions of ages, of unnecessary rituals and ceremonials,

[1] *Prahelika* (the Riddle) (Gurudas Chatterji and Sons, Calcutta). See the review in *The Modern Review* (Calcutta), September, 1917, page 322.

and advocates universal education, widow-remarriage, the emancipation of women and of the depressed classes, and for free thought and the spirit of scientific enquiry as opposed to mere tradition and authority."

64. But it is not only of the average girl that reformers think in their plans for an enriched and more inspiring education for women. They remember also the needs of the exceptional girl, the girl of unusual powers of mind and of unusual capacity for serving her country in the liberal professions of medicine, education and social administration. Of such girls, there are not a few in contemporary Bengal. And they come in the line of a great succession of noble-minded and able Indian women. Many auguries portend the success of higher education for women in India if the right formula or formulas can be found for their education.

65. For, in India, there has been a continuous, though slender, succession of women eminent among their contemporaries for their powers of mind, insight and judgment. As in Europe, so in India, some women have been illustrious in rule and in administration, whether on the throne or in the government of their estates. The Hindu and the Muslim law recognised the right of wives to hold property independently of their husbands, long before the English law secured to married women the exercise of such a right, and even before the practice of marriage settlements gave its substance to many of them. From time immemorial widows, as well among Musalmans as among Hindus, have held property of great value and extent, both in lands and in personal estate. And, though in the majority of cases they may have relied in the management of their property upon the advice of agents and stewards, there have been among these propertied Indian women not a few examples of conspicuous sagacity and wisdom in the responsible conduct of intricate affairs.

66. For many of the women of India the highest training which a university can offer will not be inappropriate, or the most difficult studies too exacting. During the last thirty years there have been in Bengal women writers of distinction and power, especially in poetry and in the imaginative interpretation of life. Far more characteristic, however, of the Indian temperament and tradition have been her holy women, in whose personalities and gifts we recognise the same spiritual discernment, self-abnegation and

shrewd commonsense which mark many others whose influence is profound in the homelife of India, though never known beyond the narrow limits of their family.

67. Of one such holy woman, who was known by many still living, this portrait has been drawn by a skilful hand:

"At her birth, so many years ago that her devotees bring data to prove her a hundred years old, it was prophesied that she would be 'a religious,' and her father built her a shrine and taught her things which only priests may know. Her face was the face of one who has attained, and her dignity and self-poise I have nowhere seen surpassed. She dressed oddly—the sex of the devotee must not be proclaimed—in the nether garments of a man, *i.e.*, loose white drapery about the legs, and a long coat. Her hair was worn in coils on the top of her head and round her neck hung sacred beads, and a Kali necklet of skulls in gold and enamel work. To her the symbol was not gruesome. Kali, she would tell you, was the power of God, the 'Energy of the Gods' and the heads represent the giants of wickedness whom she has slain.

She was extraordinary in her dealings with people, quick to discern true from false; fearless in her denunciation of hypocrisy, withal that she was never aught but courteous. Pilgrims from all parts of India came and fell at her feet and passed on to other shrines, or lingered in the outer courtyard on the chance of a word; the meaning of a text, some family or caste difficulty, advice as to the moment's physical or worldly need, all were brought her; for she shut out nothing, and was a shrewd saint about business other than her own. I have known her wave off a pilgrim—'she would not insult her feet' was the reason given. She seemed to gather all that mattered about this type of person in a single glance. To one who came in curiosity pure and simple, though he pretended interest in some Sanskrit text, she said, quietly looking him in the eyes while he stumbled over his unveracities: 'No, you shall not hear whence I came, nor anything about me.' But to another more sincere, though equally curious, she said, 'I come from a land where women ride and men wage war.'

In 1857 she was already a famous Sanskrit scholar, so powerful that her influence, purely religious, was mistaken for political.....When the country settled down, she wandered to the different places of pilgrimage all over India, meditating and buying merit. Everywhere had she been, everywhere that is holy, and as an old woman, eyes dim with prayer, throat drawn with fasting, she settled in Bengal and devoted herself to the religious education of her community. 'I have spent a lifetime in prayer; now I am ready to work.' But the praying was not over.

From 5 to 9 of a morning, she shut herself away in her House of Gods, and no one dared disturb her....Not one of her devotees or friends had any knowledge of what was within her House of Gods, yet all alike, alien in faith, disciple or visiting devotee saw her face as she left that house after her communings with eternity.....

Shortly before her time was come, she left the town where she lived for the holy City of Death....There, one morning she said quite calmly

to her disciples, after the ceremonial bath and *pooja*, 'this is the last time I shall worship in this house (her body) waste no time in regret, let us talk of the things we should be sorry to have left unsaid.' And all that day the faithful gathered round her and she expounded the scriptures with an insight unequalled even by herself. She ate nothing—'why prop up the house that is falling?'

At night she asked to be taken down to the sacred river and there sat on the stone steps of the ghat, claiming no support, no physical comfort, and then in the hour of dawn 'It is right,' she said, and fell back. They put her into a boat and took her across to the ghat of the soul's departure and there slipped her quietly into the stream, for that is all the burial service for one who is holy." [1]

68. There is now a steadily increasing movement among orthodox Hindu girls (some of them widows, others of an age beyond the ordinary age of marriage) to acquire a competent knowledge of ancient Sanskrit learning and culture. Year after year, such girls are appearing at, and successfully passing, the first and second Sanskrit examinations conducted by the Government. Some of these girls have even passed the title examination which is of a very high standard. In two of these subjects one woman candidate was first. Another girl has passed the title examination in two departments of philosophy—the *Vedanta* and the *Sankhya*. This significant movement is spreading over the different parts of the country. The successful candidates come from Eastern and Central Bengal, from the United Provinces and even from so far west as the Punjab. One of the girls who passed the title examination is now in the Asram at Jagatpur in the district of Chittagong, where she is training other girls on like lines with a view to their teaching Sanskrit learning in the *zananas*.

69. The most conservative-minded of Indians would repudiate a wish to allow 'the living to be governed by the dead.' It is because the dead signify something that still lives that the great majority of our witnesses plead for loyalty to the best traditions of the past in the working out of new educational plans for the girls of the present. And the response which is given to such an appeal by some of the young women who are now receiving higher education in Bengal is illustrated by the following passage from an essay on 'The Message of the Age to Girls' by

[1] *Between the Twilights, being Studies of Indian Women by One of Themselves*, by C. Sorabji (Harpers, 1890), pages 66-72.

Miss Ashabati Sarkar, a third year student of the Bethune College, Calcutta.[1]

"The girls of Bengal have been receiving education for about forty years. The time has come when we shall have to choose one or other of the ways. What way are we going to choose? The first glamour of awakening has passed. It is time some of the unpleasant features of the emancipation of women should pass also, and make room for reason and clear thought which will make every girl of Bengal a true woman.....It is the spirit in which life is led that matters. The power of self-control is another name for liberty. Liberty consists in the right of choosing according to conscience and reason. This control was forced upon women by men before, but is now to come from within ourselves. To this, love must be added. Reason is supreme only by the side of love. Love has worked miracles and will work thus for ever. It is impossible to be just unless one has the power of loving. 'Love is the fulfilment of the Law.'"

70. Received and given in this spirit, education may impart the power alike of self-realisation and of self-restraint. It may bring, through the mother's trained insight and loving knowledge, wiser but not less affectionate care to the children in health and in illness, and a more far-seeing but not less tender guidance of their wills and thoughts during those first impressionable years when body and mind need the most delicate and yet deliberate touch. It can enlighten, by a knowledge of what cleanliness and fresh air may do both in warding off disease and in curing it, the thoughts and affections of women in the hours when they tend the sick. It can induce that attitude of mind which is reverent and loyal towards the spiritual wisdom of the past and yet sure in its discrimination of false from true. It can give a tenderness which is not weakened by timidity, a simplicity which is not ignorance, a freedom which is not disobedient. The woman is true guardian of the early education of the children of the race, and she herself must have that which she alone can impart in turn to them. The way to much of what is best in education lies through the education of girls and women. And, as the ancient law-giver said, "When the women of a house are satisfied and happy, the Gods are pleased."

[1] *The Bethune College Magazine*, March, 1918.

CHAPTER VI.

The Musalmans and their Educational needs.

I.—The problem.

1. Musalmans have their own traditions and ideals—traditions and ideals which are the common property of Islam but which cannot be wholly identical with those of any other community. Prominent among the ideals which sway the ordinary Musalman is the conviction that nothing would compensate him for the loss of conscious membership of the great Muslim community of the world. So, while the Bengali Musalman is genuinely anxious that his community should reap the full benefits of secular education, he is not prepared to take those benefits at the price of any real sacrifice of Islamic tradition or custom. Certain things he has with reluctance foregone; others he may concede; but reluctance there will always be, and that reluctance will be all the more real, because it is not so much individual as corporate, communal rather than personal in its instincts and unity. The feeling of the Musalman is tinged with a not unnatural pride. His traditional culture is the culture which was evolved during the great days of Islam. It recalls the University of Baghdad and Haroun-al-Raschid. It is something for a boy in a remote village in Eastern Bengal to find that he is following the same line of study as that taught in the Azhar Mosque at Cairo. "It has to be borne in mind," writes Maulvi Abdul Karim, an ex-Inspector of Schools and a protagonist of English education, "that in Islamic countries the education that makes great statesmen and administrators is similar to that imparted in the madrassahs in this country."[1] To-day the Hindu, like the Musalman, looks out on the world which lies outside India and feels the impulse of a more than national life. But his ideals spring from the soil of India. To him India is the abiding background of his thoughts and hopes. The Indian Musalman, like the Hindu, is an Indian patriot and feels towards India as towards his motherland. But

[1] General Memoranda, page 172.

rooted in his heart are other ideals also, the ideals of Islam, the conception of a society at once cosmopolitan and exclusive, traditions which carry his imagination back to a past which holds not only Indian history but much beside.

"We beg to point out", wrote the Musalmans of Calcutta in a petition which they brought to us, "that no scheme of reconstruction can be useful or beneficial, unless it recognises the existence of conflicting ideals and conflicting interests in almost every sphere of life—social, political, and religious—among the different sections of the population. The principle and practice of education which might have proved beneficial in a country with uniform people, uniform interests and uniform ideals, must necessarily be modified to suit the special circumstances that exist in this country."[1]

2. The chapter on the education of Musalmans in the Quinquennial Review of Education in Bengal, 1912-17, begins as follows:[2]—

"The Moslem population of Bengal is 23,989,719 out of a total of 45,183,077, that is to say, 52·7 per cent. of the total population of Bengal is Moslem. Of the total Moslem population 22,988,168 are illiterate, while 62,301 only are literate in English. This review records a certain amount of progress, but the figures are not reassuring. It is impossible to lay too much stress on the urgency of raising the standard of literacy in the Moslem community of Bengal. The ideals of this community differ to some extent from those of the other inhabitants of the Presidency. Their history and traditions are stored away in Arabic and Persian manuscripts. They are followers of Islam and the illiterate are readily swayed by *maulvis*, who profess to be learned in Moslem law and to speak as its interpreters.

The largest Moslem population in Bengal is in the northern and eastern districts of the Presidency. The people of these parts are generally conservative, and their only concern outside their own immediate personal interests is the propagation of Islam. The successful Moslem cultivator of these parts who desires to educate his son will send him to a *madrassah* to learn Moslem law, literature, logic, rhetoric and philosophy and to study *Hadis* and *Tafsîr*.[3] He is not interested in the study of Arabic for its literature, but only because it is the language of the Koran. If a Moslem in Eastern Bengal wants to endow an educational institution, he founds a *madrassah* and puts it under the charge of *maulvis*, who claim to be versed in Islamic lore.

One thing which it is necessary to emphasise is that the backwardness of this community is primarily due to the apathy of the people in the matter of education, and until this indifference is removed progress is impossible. Moslems represent more than half the total population of Bengal

[1] General Memoranda, page 209.

[2] Progress of Education in Bengal 1912-13 to 1916-17. Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), paras. 593-595.

[3] *Tafsîr* is Quranic exegesis and *Hadis*, the science of Apostolic tradition.

and until they are educated sufficiently to be able to take an interest in the affairs of public life, it is difficult to conceive of Bengal as a part of a self-governing dominion within the British Empire. Indeed it seems that the only possible way in which these people can be made to realise their privileges and responsibilities as subjects of the British Empire is by giving them every facility for English education."

3. The great disparity between the educational progress of the Hindus and the Musalmans attracted the attention of the Indian Education Commission of 1882. They pointed out that, whereas 32·3 per cent. of the population of the provinces of Bengal and Assam, as they were then constituted, was Muslim, the percentage of Musalmans under instruction in all schools of which the Provincial Education Department had cognisance was 14·4 only. They quoted the Bengal Director of Public Instruction as having reported to them that :—

"During the last five years, out of 3,499 candidates who passed the entrance examination from these provinces, 132 or 3·8 per cent. only were Musalmans. They ought to have been ten-fold more numerous. Out of 900 passed for the first arts in the same period, Musalmans gained only 11 passes or 1·2 per cent., and out of 429 passes for the B.A., they gained only 5 or 1·1 per cent. Hence, not only the number of Musalmans who pass the entrance is less than one-tenth of what it ought to be, but this painful inferiority steadily increases in the higher examinations."[1]

4. During the 35 years which have passed since the Indian Education Commission wrote their report, there have been many and great changes in India. While the Commissioners were still deliberating, Mr. Ameer Ali published an article in the *Nineteenth Century* in which he expressed the conviction that "unless effective measures of reform are adopted, and that without delay, the unsatisfactory condition of the Muhammadans threatens to become a source of anxiety and danger to British administration in India."[2] About this time Sir Syed Ahmad entered the lists against the general opinion of his co-religionists. By popular lectures and in the columns of his two journals he fought the view which advocated an almost exclusive devotion on the part of Musalmans to an oriental education of a traditional type. He founded several associations and ultimately organised the All India Muhammadan Educational Conference. His greatest achievement was the establishment of the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental

[1] Report of the Indian Education Commission, Chapter IX, para. 563, (Calcutta, 1883.)

[2] *Nineteenth Century*, August 1882, pages 193-215.

College at Aligarh. But he was not alone in his work. Writing in the Fifth Quinquennial Review of Education in India (1902-1907), Mr. H. W. Orange, who was then Director General of Education in India, recorded the view that among the causes contributory to the improvements which were then taking place in the education of Musalmans "a high place must be assigned to the propaganda carried on by public-spirited leaders such as the late Nawab Mohsin-ul-Mulk and to the Muhammadan educational conferences annually organised by them." All this has not been without effect. The Musalmans throughout the length and breadth of India have been deeply stirred. But the difficulties are deep-seated. The following passage in which the Indian Education Commission discussed the backwardness of the Bengali Musalmans might almost have been written yesterday :—

"Various causes, some general and some particular, were assigned by the officers consulted as the obstacles which had barred the progress of education, both higher and lower. Among the general causes assigned by them were the apathy of the Musalman race; their pride, their religious exclusiveness; the love of their own literature among those of them who cared for any education at all; the idea so persistently held that education ought to be a free gift. Among the particular causes, a want of sympathy between Hindu teachers and Musalman pupils; a want of consideration in the arrangements of the Education Department and, perhaps above all, the depressed condition of the bulk of Bengali Musalmans."[1]

5. If an Education Commission, with the whole of India as its scope, were now to investigate the reason why in the matter of education the Muslim community is still lagging behind the Hindu, we doubt whether they would get much nearer the truth than the Commission of 1882. After discussing the deterrent causes—a subject of debate, the report explains, even among the Musalmans themselves—it suggested that a candid Musalman would probably admit, that the most powerful factors are to be found in pride of race, a memory of bygone superiority, religious fears, and a not unnatural attachment to the learning of Islam.[2]

6. The recommendations recorded by the Indian Education Commission in connexion with the education of Musalmans were concerned mainly with secondary and primary education. The

[1] Report of the Indian Education Commission, Chapter IX, para. 563, page 489.

[2] *Ibid.*, para. 556, page 483.

Commission proposed that Muslim education should be helped by special grants, scholarships and free studentships, by encouraging the addition of secular subjects to the curricula of Muslim schools; by prescribing special standards for Muslim primary schools; by the use of Hindustani as the principal medium of instruction in many primary and middle Muslim schools; by better provision for instruction in Hindustani and Persian; by the encouragement of higher education among Musalmans; by the training of Muslim teachers; by the appointment of Muslim school inspectors; by devoting special attention to Muslim education in the annual report of the Department of Public Instruction; by the encouragement of associations for the prosecution of Muslim education; and by the distribution to Musalmans of a larger share of Government patronage.

7. In 1871 Dr. W. W. (later Sir William) Hunter had published a book on the Musalmans of India, in which he attributed the general indifference towards western education evinced by the Bengali Muslim community to three main causes: (*a*) the want of Muslim teachers, (*b*) the absence of the provision of Muslim languages, and (*c*) the absence of religious education.

"The truth is", he wrote, "that our system of public instruction ignores the three most powerful instincts of the Musalman heart. In the first place, it conducts education in the vernacular of Bengal, a language which the educated Muhammadans despise, and by means of Hindu teachers, whom the whole Muhammadan community hates. The Bengali school master talks his own dialect and a vile Urdu, the latter of which is to him an acquired language almost as much as it is to ourselves. Moreover, his gentle and timid character unfits him to maintain order among Musalman boys. 'Nothing on earth', said a Muhammadan husbandman recently to an English official, 'would induce me to send my boy to a Bengali teacher.' In the second place, our rural schools seldom enable a Muhammadan to learn the tongues necessary for his holding a respectable position in life, and for the performance of his religious duties. Every Muhammadan gentleman must have some knowledge of Persian, and Persian is a language unknown even in our higher class district schools. Every Musalman, from the peasant to the prince, ought to say his prayers in one of the sacred languages, Persian or Arabic, and this our schools have never recognized.....In the third place, our system of public instruction makes no provision for the religious education of the Muhammadan youth. It overlooks the fact that among the Hindus a large and powerful caste has come down from time immemorial for supplying this part of a boy's training, while among the Muhammadans no separate body of clergy exists. Every head of a Musalman household is supposed to know the duties of his religion, and to be his own family priest. Public ministrations are indeed conducted at the

mosques; but it is the glory of Islam that its temples are not made with hands, and that its ceremonies can be performed anywhere upon God's earth or under His heavens. A system of purely secular education is adapted to very few nations. In the opinion of many deeply thinking men, it has signally failed in Ireland, and it is certainly altogether unsuited to the illiterate and fanatical peasantry of Muhammadan Bengal."[1]

8. During the Muslim rule in Bengal there were madrassahs all over the country, and, as Maulvi Abdul Karim says, "every mosque was a madrassah in miniature."[2] Arabic scholars taught the theology, the law and the literature of Islam, and asked for no remuneration from their pupils. With the break up of the Muslim power most of these institutions collapsed. But in the time of Warren Hastings and until 1837 Persian still continued to be the language of the law courts, and when Warren Hastings established the Calcutta Madrassah in 1782, he did so mainly for the purpose of training Musalmans to be officers in the East India Company's service. When in 1837 Persian was discontinued as the language of the courts, the Calcutta Madrassah and other institutions which had been founded on similar lines ceased to be of value as training grounds for the public service. Other schools and colleges were open to them, but the Musalmans held aloof from English education, which they regarded with suspicion not unmixed with contempt, as being secular not religious, technical rather than liberal—not in fact, in their opinion, the education of a gentleman. The feeling of the community has been modified. During the last few years the Musalmans of Bengal have taken more and more advantage of the ordinary courses of instruction. Their enrolment in secondary schools and colleges has considerably increased. It has been suggested to us that this development is due to economic pressure as well as to an increased regard for the education which secondary schools and colleges impart. We have referred elsewhere to the pressure on the soil, which forces the cultivator to look for the support of some of his sons to callings which take them away from the land.[3] The small landholder moreover finds that his rents do not go so far as they went once, and that

[1] *The Indian Musalmans* by Dr. W. W. Hunter, pages 181 and 182, (Second Edition, London, Trübner & Co., 1872.)

[2] Para. 58, *infra*.

[3] Chapter VIII. para. 11.

more of his dependents are compelled to earn something for themselves. In spite of this a considerable proportion of the Musalmans under instruction are still pupils in maktabs and madrassahs. Whenever private Muslim educational enterprise is concerned, it tends to develope purely Islamic institutions. Muslim associations often ask Government to increase the facilities for Muslim boys, but they plead at the same time for special Muslim institutions, special text-books, special inspecting officers. This means that the community is anxious for a system of education which will enable it to preserve its social and religious personality and its communal traditions.

9. The position was described by the Committee which was appointed by the Government of Bengal in 1914, and to which reference is made in the next section of this chapter.

"Although there has been a tendency during the past few years for Moslems to take more advantage of the ordinary courses of instruction, and although the number of Moslems in various kinds of schools has increased, yet wherever private Moslem enterprise is concerned, it tends to develope purely Islamic institutions. The reason is that there is still a strong feeling in the community that a separate system of education will preserve the social and religious independence of Moslems.

We fully realise this tendency and at the same time we feel that, with the limited funds which are at the disposal of the Government for the encouragement of education, it is impracticable to insist that a Moslem boy shall, throughout his educational career, be educated in schools intended exclusively for Moslems. At the same time we cannot ignore the fact that a large section of the community regards general educational institutions with suspicion and we therefore think that it is still necessary for Government to aid and in some cases to maintain a number of separate institutions for Moslems. In this connexion we record the following recommendation :—

That, while it is necessary to maintain special institutions for Moslems, it is undesirable to develope further a system of education for this community separate from that of other communities. The existing systems should be carefully examined to see where they fail to satisfy members of the community, and necessary modifications should be introduced."[1]

This general statement of policy, which should be read in connexion with the specific recommendations which followed it, applied to the education of boys and men and not to the education of girls and women.

[1] Report of the Committee appointed by the Government of Bengal to consider questions connected with Muhammadan education, page 16 (Calcutta, 1915.)

II.—The progress of Muslim education in Bengal from 1905 to 1917.

10. In 1905 the Province of Eastern Bengal and Assam was constituted. This province ceased to exist on the 1st April 1912. During this period the educational progress made by the Musalmans of Eastern Bengal was marked. Among the measures adopted by the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam for the encouragement of the education of Musalmans, the following were the most important :[1]—

(1) the introduction of Urdu teaching into selected primary schools ;
(2) the provision of liberal grants-in-aid ;
(3) the reservation of special scholarships and free studentships ;
(4) the provision of extended hostel accommodation ; and
(5) the appointment of a larger proportion of Musalmans to the educational services.

11. As regards hostels the following extract from the resolution of the Government of Bengal on the Quinquennial Review of Education in Eastern Bengal for the period 1908-1913 is of interest :—

" The question of hostel accommodation is of urgent importance. The great majority of Muhammadans live in the villages, and they experience great difficulty in finding homes for their boys who attend school in the towns. Suitable accommodation amidst desirable surroundings is expensive or not available, and parents are naturally reluctant to send their boys away to live in conditions which may be harmful to them. Many, it is believed, are prevented from educating their sons by these obstacles. The remedy lies in providing adequate hostel accommodation for Muhammadan boys in connexion with the schools.

Special efforts have been made during the quinquennium to effect an improvement in this direction, with the result that every college and nearly every Government high school has now a Muhammadan hostel. Private schools have been encouraged to follow suit. It is satisfactory to note a readiness among the Muhammadans themselves to provide funds for the establishment of hostels in towns where there are large aided schools."[2]

12. Shortly after the territorial readjustment had been announced Lord Hardinge visited Dacca. On his return from there he received in Calcutta on the 16th February 1912 a deputation,

[1] Review of the Progress and Education in Eastern Bengal and Assam, 1907-08 to 1911-12, Volume I, para. 262.

[2] *Ibid.*, para. 267.

headed by Dr. (now Sir) Rash Behary Ghose. In reply to this deputation His Excellency said :—

"When I visited Dacca I found a widespread apprehension, particularly among the Muhammadans, who form the majority of the population, lest the attention which the partition of Bengal secured for the eastern provinces should be relaxed, and that there might be a set-back in educational progress. It was to allay this not unreasonable apprehension that I stated to a deputation of Muhammadan gentlemen that the Government of India were so much impressed with the necessity of promoting education in a province which had made such good progress during the past few years that we have decided to recommend to the Secretary of State the constitution of a university at Dacca and the appointment of a special officer for education in Eastern Bengal."[1]

The whole question of the proposed Dacca University is discussed in Chapter XXXIII of this report.

13. In 1913 the Government of India asked the various local Governments to consider and report on certain general questions affecting the education of Musalmans. The Bengal Government appointed a committee to consider the suggestions made by the Government of India. Mr. W. W. Hornell presided over this committee as Director of Public Instruction.

14. We quote below what the Secretary to the Government of India in the Education Department said in his letter with regard to secondary and collegiate education (the italics are in the original) :—

"The reasons which have retarded the spread of secondary education among the Muhammadans are the *poverty of the community, the linguistic difficulty, the demand for religious instruction and want of Muhammadan representation on the Governing Bodies of educational institutions.* The first has been to a large extent met by special Government scholarships and by endowments. This is essentially a matter for the local Governments and the community themselves. I am merely to observe that in part of the country where Muhammadans are slow to enter institutions for technical and industrial training (and it has been noticed that very few Muhammadans have been selected for the State Technical Scholarships) it may be found desirable to offer some special facilities by way of stipends or scholarships. As to the second, it is alleged that Muhammadans suffer when they have to study English through the medium of a *prakritic* vernacular with which they are little acquainted. Special schools or classes may go far to meet this difficulty. The demand for religious instruction can be arranged for in privately-managed

[1] The outcome of the latter part of this proposal was not the appointment of a special officer for education in Eastern Bengal, but the appointment of an Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education throughout the Bengal Presidency.

hostels attached to Government institutions. It is represented that, in certain parts of the country, the great majority of secondary schools are managed by Hindu bodies, and it was recently observed that, among the 100 ordinary members of the Calcutta Senate, only six were Muhammadans. The establishment of *special Muhammadan schools and colleges* would simplify these matters. But this is an expedient which for financial reasons cannot be adopted generally. And, where it is not feasible, a good deal may be done by *reserving a certain number of vacancies for Muhammadan pupils* in institutions which, by reason of their reputation, draw many applicants for admission and by safeguarding the interests of the community in other ways. A subsidiary difficulty which may sometimes present itself is that of advance from a semi-secular *maktab* to an institution of higher grade. This, however, is a matter of arrangement in the codes of the various provinces. The suggestions which the Government of India think may be of practical utility in the matter of secondary and collegiate education are—

(*i*) The improvement of existing institutions for Muhammadans, such as the Calcutta Madrassah, the Islamia College, Lahore, and Islamia schools.

(*ii*) The establishment of separate Muhammadan institutions in places where this can be done without detriment to efficiency or discipline and without unreasonable expense.

(*iii*) When this is not possible (and it is apprehended it will but seldom be possible) the addition to the staff of a school of a teacher or teachers who will be able either to teach classes in English through the medium of Urdu, or to give special help to Muhammadan boys where a knowledge of some other vernacular is desirable either for the study of English or for general reasons.

(*iv*) The maintenance of hostels for Muhammadans under private management with religious teaching.

(*v*) The appointment of a reasonable number of Muhammadans to the committees (where such exist) of Government institutions and to the governing bodies of aided institutions.

(*vi*) The provision of Muhammadan teachers and inspectors."[1]

15. The Committee examined the working of the secondary school system in close detail and recorded in their report no less than sixty-seven resolutions embodying the requirements of the Musalmans with regard to it. The chief demands were (1) that there should be more schools in centres convenient to Musalmans and an easier access for Muslim pupils to schools already in existence; (2) that Musalmans should be more adequately represented on the governing bodies of schools; (3) that there should be more Muslim head masters and assistant masters; (4) that there should be more adequate and effective provision for the teaching

[1] Report of the Committee appointed by the Bengal Government to consider questions connected with Muhammadan Education, page iii (Calcutta 1915).

of Arabic, Persian and Urdu; (5) that there should be more scholarships and free-studentships; (6) that there should be more hostels and that these should be under the supervision of properly qualified Musalmans; (7) that there should be an increase in the number of the special officers of the Education Department charged with the special task of fostering the education of Musalmans (such officers are at present the Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education and the special Muslim inspecting officers), and that the work of these officers should be so arranged as to make their influence most widely and expeditiously effective.

16. On one matter the Committee laid special emphasis. It pointed out that the secondary school system comprised (*a*) Government schools, (*b*) schools managed by local bodies, (*c*) aided schools and (*d*) unaided schools, and observed that whereas the Department of Public Instruction had some control over Government schools and schools managed by local bodies and could impose on aided schools certain regulations by way of conditions involved in the acceptance of grants, the authority of the Department over unaided schools was slight; and that the real control over high schools generally rested with the University of Calcutta. In the face of this situation the Committee found it necessary to record in their report that "even unaided schools recognised by the University are public institutions and as such the University should insist on their being made acceptable to all classes and communities of His Majesty's subjects in Bengal."[1]

17. This suggests a general consideration which is of importance. We have referred elsewhere to a certain popular suspicion of Government control over education.[2] The Muslim community does not appear to share in this suspicion; on the contrary it still looks with confidence to Government and appears reluctant to entrust its destinies to any popularly constituted body. A note submitted to the Commission by Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury contains the following passage:—

"The appointment of a board for secondary education in order to advise Government about the distribution of grants and other matters of policy, was first proposed in 1914 during the lifetime of the late Nawab of

[1] The Report of the Committee appointed by the Bengal Government to consider questions connected with Muhammadan education, Chapter VI, page 24 (Calcutta 1915).

[2] Chapter X, Section IV.

Dacca. He considered the scheme detrimental to the interests of Muhammadans and, on account of his opposition, the proposal was dropped. Last year again a resolution for creating an advisory board for secondary education was moved in the Bengal Legislative Council and all Muhammadan members and the member in charge of the Education portfolio opposed it and, consequently, the resolution fell through. The Muhammadans of Bengal consider it a question of vital importance in their own interest that the distribution of grants and the control of educational policy should rest with Government. The creation of a large secondary education board, with powers to distribute grants and to advise Government on questions of policy, will be detrimental to the interests of Muhammadans. Muhammadans will never be able to derive their full share from the institutions maintained or started by public funds, until a special treatment, similar to that accorded by Lord Hardinge and Lord Carmichael, be reserved to them. Muhammadans are afraid that the special facilities which now exist in secondary education will no longer exist, if secondary education be entrusted to a board. . . . . From the experience of the University of Calcutta Muhammadans will be afraid that the advantages and special facilities which they now enjoy, and which they expect to get in future, will all be set aside by the board should it unfortunately be created."[1]

18. As regards the language problem, the Committee pointed out that, while a Bengali Hindu who takes a high school course has only to read three languages, English, Sanskrit and Bengali, a Bengali Muslim boy who takes the same course has to read as many as five languages, *viz.*, English, Arabic, Persian, Urdu and Bengali, and that this burden of language has told seriously upon the general educational progress of the Musalmans of Bengal. To lighten the burden, the Committee recommended that Urdu should be recognised by the University of Calcutta as a second language for those whose vernacular is not Urdu.[2] The deputation of the Musalmans of Calcutta which appeared before us made on this question the following statement:—

"The Muhammadan leaders have come to the conclusion that though we cannot drop the study of any one of the five languages it is not necessary for every individual boy to study all of them. The Muhammadan boy whose mother tongue is Bengali should receive his primary education in Bengali and should study a classical language, Arabic, Persian or Urdu..... We can confidently assert that Urdu for a Bengali-speaking boy is even more difficult than Persian is for an Urdu-speaking boy."[3]

19. The present regulations for the matriculation examination of the University of Calcutta prescribe that male candidates

[1] Question 4

[2] Report of the Committee appointed by the Bengal Government to consider questions connected with Muhammadan education, paras. 94-95 (Calcutta 1915).

[3] General Memoranda, page 212.

(some exceptions are made for women and girls) (*a*) should be examined in other subjects of which English is one, and in one of the following languages:—Sanskrit, Pali, Arabic, Persian, Hebrew, Classical Armenian, Classical Tibetan, Greek, Latin, and (*b*) that they should be required to write a composition in one of the following vernacular languages:—Bengali, Hindi, Uriya, Assamese, Urdu, Burmese, Modern Armenian. Modern Tibetan, Khasi. If the vernacular of a candidate is a language not included in the above list he has to take an alternative paper, either (i) in English composition, or (ii) in French, or (iii) in German. The proposal is that Urdu should be added to the languages under (*a*) above for those boys whose vernacular is not Urdu and who therefore do not offer it under (*b*).

20. The Committee passed twenty-six resolutions on collegiate education and described the general position of the Musalmans in this regard in the following words:—

"We notice with regret that, out of 14,746 students studying in arts colleges in Calcutta, only 1,154 are Moslems, and we appeal to Government to take such action as will enable Moslems to have a greater share in the facilities which are offered for college education. We consider the poverty of the community, its inadequate representation on the Senate, Syndicate and boards of studies of the University, as also on the governing bodies of colleges, the non-affiliation of colleges in Arabic and Persian, and the lack of hostel accommodation for Moslem college students are the chief reasons why Moslems do not take greater advantage of the collegiate system."[1]

21. The Committee recommended that no college should be given a grant-in-aid unless there are professors of Arabic and Persian and Urdu on its staff, and that in order to enable the aided colleges to make this provision increased grants should be given where necessary.

22. In Chapter X of their report, which deals with religious and moral instruction, the Committee insisted that moral education for Musalmans cannot be separated from religious education. They desired to enforce religious observances in Muslim hostels and they urged the importance of Muslim pupils in all schools and colleges wearing their distinctive dress, including a cap.[2]

---

[1] Report of the Committee appointed by the Bengal Government to consider questions connected with Muhammadan education, paras. 114-139.

[2] *Ibid.*, para. 145. The wearing of a cap by Muslim students was also urged by the Muslim deputation which waited on the Commission at Rangpur.

The question of religious instruction in hostels is discussed in Chapters XIX and XXXIX of this report.

23. The Governor of Bengal in Council dealt with the Committee's report in his resolution No. 1227-Edn., dated 3rd August 1916. On the general question of the educational progress of the Musalmans of the Presidency, the resolution said :—

"The inequality of the progress in education made by the Hindu and Muhammadan communities is patent. The comparatively slow advance made by the Muhammadans, more especially in the higher branches of education, has prevented them taking as full a part in the political, professional and industrial life of the province as the Hindus; and many of the present administrative difficulties in Bengal are due to the educational inequality between the two communities. Comparatively few Muhammadans are engaged in professional pursuits. They are largely outnumbered by the Hindus in industries and commerce. The deficiency of Muhammadans qualified for appointment to administrative posts is a not infrequent source of embarrassment to Government. Their disabilities are largely due to their having failed to keep pace with the Hindus in the matter of education. The development of the country, in political as well as in other directions, is dependent on the uniform educational progress of the two main constituents of the population and on their equal capacity to take advantage both of the opportunities now open to them and of the fuller opportunities which may be available hereafter. The Government of India are anxious that all reasonable facilities should be provided for the education of Muhammadans, and the Governor in Council is convinced that it is in the interests both of the Government and the people as a whole that the Muhammadans who, in spite of recent efforts, have still much lost ground to make up, should receive such special facilities as may be necessary to enable them to benefit as fully as the Hindus from the educational institutions which are maintained, wholly or partially, out of public funds."

24. As regards religious instruction, the Governor in Council expressed his sympathy with the desire of the Committee, but pointed out that the whole question of religious and moral instruction in schools was then (as it still is) under the consideration of the Government of India, and that, pending the issue of orders by that Government, the local Government were unable to take any action.

25. The Muslim deputations and representations which we have received (see Section VII below) laid stress on the subject of religious instruction and observances. The general contentions were (*a*) that religious instruction should be included in the courses of the University; (*b*) that provision should be made for religious instruction in all hostels in which Muslim students reside and that in all such hostels and in all colleges a room should be set

apart for the prayers of the Musalmans; (*c*) that provision should be made for the religious instruction of Musalmans according to the tenets and practices of Islam in all those high English schools in which the students are wholly or mainly Muslim.[1]

26. The Governor in Council agreed to the introduction of the teaching of elementary Urdu in schools in order to facilitate the study of the Quran; the introduction of books, written in current Bengali, dealing with subjects of interest to the Muslim community; the direct appointment of a certain number of specially qualified Muslim head masters to Government high schools; the reservation of seats for Muslim boys in high schools and certain relaxations, in favour of Musalmans, in the rules regarding free studentships.

27. On the language difficulty the resolution said :—

"His Excellency in Council has read with interest the remarks of the Committee on the difficulties which the Moslem community experience in connexion with the languages which its members desire to study owing to their association with Muhammadan religion and history. He will forward to the University for their consideration the recommendation that Urdu should be included among the second languages which can be taken for the matriculation examination."

The University has not as yet seen its way to make any change in the matriculation conditions referred to in paragraph 19 above.

28. Other demands put forward in this connexion are that Arabic should be excluded from all the Persian courses prescribed for examinations of the University; that Sanskrit quotations should be excluded from Bengali text-books;[2] that a separate board should be established in connexion with the study of Bengali and that Musalmans should be adequately represented on it[3] (the basis of this demand is the alleged rejection of books written in Bengali by Muslim authors as also of books which deal with Muslim traditions and heroes); that the study of the vernacular as a distinct subject should be excluded from the courses of the University.[4]

29. In the matter of hostel accommodation the Governor in Council desired that the Musalmans should be in as favourable

---

[1] The memorial of the Musalmans of Chittagong, para. 10—General Memoranda, page 215.

[2] Memorial of the Musalmans of Rajshahi, para. 14—General Memoranda, page 218.

[3] Memorial of the Musalmans of Calcutta, para. 15 (*d*)—General Memoranda, page 213.

[4] Muhammadan Deputation, Dacca—Question 4

a position and have the same facilities as Hindus. He accepted the principle that Government should establish hostels for Muslim students in connexion with Government high schools, where the number of such pupils is sufficient to justify separate accommodation. He pointed out, however, that this was entirely a question of the funds at the disposal of the Government. Some of the representations which have been made to us contain complaints about the inadequacy of the hostel accommodation available for Muslim students in connexion with colleges not only in Calcutta but in the mufassal also. This point is dealt with in paragraph 48 below.

30. As regards collegiate education the Governor in Council said :—

"The recommendations of the Committee on the subject of collegiate education mostly concern matters on which the Governor in Council is not competent to pass orders. The contention of the Committee that in spite of the growing recognition of the value of hostels, the accommodation for Muhammadan students is inadequate is unfortunately only too true."

So far as Government colleges were concerned the Governor in Council accepted the suggestion that a certain number of seats should be reserved for Muslim students.

"The Governor in Council," the resolution runs, "is prepared to reserve a definite proportion of places in Government colleges for Muhammadan students, and he accepts the suggestion that the ratio should be 25 per cent. which will for the present be regarded as the minimum and be liable to modification from time to time. He will further consider whether similar action can be taken to ensure that Muhammadan students will be regarded as having a preferential claim to vacancies in aided colleges up to the same limit."

The reservation for Muslim students of a certain number of vacancies in aided 'arts colleges' has since been ordered.

31. Some of the Muslim deputations which waited upon us complained that this order of the Government of Bengal which reserved for Musalmans 25 per cent. of the vacancies in colleges is not observed.[1] The number and percentage of Muslim students in the various types of university colleges in Bengal will be found in paragraph 45 below. Demands are put forward that the minimum of 25 per cent. of vacancies should be raised. The percentages suggested are 30, 33, 40 and 50 according to the proportion of

[1] Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury—Question 4.

the Muslim population to the total population of the area concerned.[1]

32. In order to increase the number of Muslim teachers, the Governor in Council agreed that the adequate representation of Musalmans on the managing committees and on the teaching staffs of schools should be a condition of grant-in-aid.[2]

33. It is convenient at this point to sum up the more important arrangements which have been made by the Government of Bengal to facilitate and encourage the education of the Musalmans of the Presidency. The summary which follows is taken almost word for word from the Fifth Quinquennial Review of Education in Bengal :—

(*a*) Twenty-five per cent. of the vacancies each year in all Government and aided colleges must be reserved for Musalmans.

(*b*) In all Government schools a certain percentage of the vacancies each year in each class must be reserved for Musalmans. This percentage is fixed by the head masters in consultation with the divisional inspectors of schools and has reference not only to the Musalmans in the school, but also to the Muslim population of the locality.

(*c*) In order to provide funds for special scholarships in colleges and high schools, Government undertook the entire responsibility for the support of the madrassahs at Dacca, Chittagong, Hooghly and Rajshahi, thus setting free from the Mohsin fund[3] a certain amount of money belonging to the fund. This amount has been utilised to establish a number of stipends tenable by Musalmans in arts and professional colleges and in madrassahs.

(*d*) In order to remove, as far as possible, the disabilities of Muslim pupils in ordinary schools and colleges, the Government of Bengal have tried to insist on there being a Muslim element on the staff of every school, in addition to the teachers of Arabic and Persian. Annual reports have now to be submitted by the appointing authorities to the Director of Public Instruction, showing how vacancies during the year have been filled. A similar procedure is prescribed in respect to the appointment of clerks in offices.

(*e*) An Assistant Director of Public Instruction and five special assistant inspectors for Muslim education were appointed. Such appointments are not found outside Bengal.

---

[1] The memorial of the Musalmans of Rajshahi, para. 2, 40 per cent.—General Memoranda, page 217; and memorial of the Musalmans of Assam, para. 5, 30 to 50 per cent.—General Memoranda, page 207.

[2] See Resolution No. 1227-Edn., dated the 3rd August 1916, of the Government of Bengal, General Department, Education, *Calcutta Gazette*, the 9th August 1916.

[3] An endowment fund left by Haji Muhammad Mohsin of Hooghly, part of which is devoted to the education of Musalmans, see the volume of appendices to this report.

(*f*) In order to allow Muslim boys in colleges and schools to perform their *jumma* prayers, orders have been issued (1) that in all Government colleges work should be suspended for an hour about midday on Fridays, (2) that in Government schools the managing committees shall decide whether (*a*) the school shall be closed for a half-day on Fridays instead of on Saturdays (in this case schools would close on Fridays at 12-30 P.M.) or (*b*) work should be suspended for one hour on Fridays.

(*g*) Orders have been issued to divisional inspectors of schools to insist on the appointment of maulvis (*viz.*, Muslim teachers of Arabic and Persian) where, in view of the Muslim population of the locality, a large number of Muslim pupils might be expected in the school.

(*h*) In order to mitigate the difficulties of Muslim students in Calcutta, a non-collegiate hostel with accommodation for 73 boarders was opened by the Bengal Government in Wellington Street, Calcutta, in July 1915. At the request of the Muslim community this hostel has been called the Taylor Hostel after Mr. J. A. Taylor, the Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education; Government has also provided additional accommodation for 70 boarders in two wings which were added to the Baker Madrassah Hostel (the hostel for college students attached to the Calcutta Madrassah).

(*i*) During the quinquennium a sum of Rs. 84,000 a year was earmarked from 1914-15 from one of the recurring Imperial grants for the improvement of the education of Musalmans with special reference to what is known as the reformed madrassah scheme (see paragraph 60 of this chapter and Chapter XVI). This allotment has enabled the Education Department to increase the grants of all the six aided senior madrassahs and seven aided junior madrassahs and also to aid 55 junior madrassahs which had previously not been aided.

(*j*) During the quinquennium a scheme was worked out for establishing a Government 'arts college' in Calcutta for Musalmans. This scheme has been held up mainly on financial grounds. The original Dacca University scheme included a college for Musalmans (see Chapter XXXIII of this report).

(*k*) Facilities have been provided for Muslim students in connexion with professional colleges :—

(*i*) *The Civil Engineering College, Sibpur.*—The dearth of Muslim students in the various departments of this college was said to be chiefly due to the heavy charges that the students had to bear on account of messing. In order to remove this disability the Governing Body of the College proposed in 1914 that the charges on account of establishment, lighting, and superintendence of the Muslim hostel should be defrayed by Government, and that stipends should be paid to Muslim students according to a sliding scale. These proposals were sanctioned by the Bengal Government who, in terms of their resolution no. 4147, dated the 16th November 1915, created four Mohsin stipends [see under (*c*) above] of Rs. 10 each tenable for two years in the civil engineering department of the College.

(*ii*) *The Medical College, Calcutta.*—The Government Resolution just referred to created six Mohsin stipends of Rs. 15 a month and made them tenable in the Medical College [see under (*c*) above].[1]

III.—The present position.

34. The following table, which is based on the census of 1911, compares for each division of the Bengal Presidency, the number of Hindu and Muslim males and females (*a*) who are literate and (*b*) who are literate in English :[2]—

Number of literate per 1,000.

Division.	Hindus.		Musalmans.	
	Males.	Females.	Males.	Females.
Dacca	238·8	28·5	60·1	1·5
Presidency	249·8	35·5	96·1	3·2
Burdwan	208·4	11·6	150·4	7·0
Chittagong	262·7	20·1	80·3	2·2
Rajshahi	130·5	9·4	76·7	1·7

Number of literate in English per 1,000.

Division	Hindus.		Musalmans	
	Males.	Females.	Males	Females.
Dacca	36·9	·6	3·7	·03
Presidency	62·5	1·8	7·9	·1
Burdwan	26·5	·6	12·4	·4
Chittagong	30·3	·5	4·6	·04
Rajshahi	15·4	·2	3·4	·02

It will be noticed that in the Eastern Bengal divisions, where the Muslim population is much the largest, the proportion of Muslim literates is much smaller than in the Presidency and Burdwan divisions.

[1] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17, Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), para. 598.

[2] The test of literacy for the purposes of the census is that the individual should be able to write a letter to a friend and read the answer to it. The ordinary literate is one who can do this in the vernacular; a literate in English is one who can do it in English.

35. According to the recently issued Quinquennial Review of Education in Bengal the total number of Musalmans under instruction on the 31st March 1917 in all classes of institutions both public and private was 864,195. Of these 817,105 are returned as in colleges and schools of public instruction, *viz.*, institutions working in accordance with courses and standards recognised, or prescribed, either by the Education Department or by the University.

36. The number of Muslim students in 'arts colleges' (*i.e.*, institutions teaching for the ordinary university degrees in arts and science) was 1,639 or 8·8 per cent. of the total number of students of all creeds, as against 810 or 7·3 per cent. in 1912. In professional colleges the number was 303 or 6·8 per cent. of the total number of students, as against 94 or 4·2 per cent. in 1912. In high schools the number was 45,179 or 20·5 per cent. of the total number, as against 26,629 or 18·3 per cent. in 1912. In middle English schools the number was 54,039 or 33·2 per cent. of the total, as against 43,238 or 34·1 per cent.; and in middle vernacular schools 8,258 or 34·1 per cent., as against 10,598 or 29·7 per cent. in 1912.[1]

In primary schools Musalmans almost hold their own. Their number was 680,273 or 49·5 per cent. of the total of pupils under instruction, as against 525,980 or 42·8 per cent. of the total in 1912.

37. To sum up the position as regards schools of public instruction, on the 31st March 1917 the Musalmans represented less than one-fifth of the total number of pupils in the high stage, less than a quarter of the pupils in the middle stage and just over a fifth of the pupils in the high and middle stages of school education taken together. In other words, though the Musalmans represent 52·7 per cent. of the population of the Bengal Presidency, their children constitute only about a fifth of the boys and girls who are receiving a secondary school education. On the other hand

[1] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17. Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), para. 599, and General Tables III A and III B. The slight discrepancies between the figures given in para. 599 and the General Tables is due to the fact that Musalmans in European schools are included in the tables, but omitted from the totals in the text. There were 864,195 Musalmans in colleges and schools not specifically designed for Europeans and 64 in European schools. Thus the total number of Muslim students in public and private institutions including European schools was 864,259.

56·6 per cent. of the children receiving primary education including the primary grade in secondary schools are Musalmans.

38. Of the total 817,105, which represents Muslim pupils in colleges and schools of public instruction, no less than 228,438 or 27·9 per cent. were in those Muslim primary schools (maktabs) which give some secular instruction according to recognised departmental curricula, or in madrassahs which teach the courses prescribed by the Education Department (*viz.*, 207,495 in maktabs and 20,945 in madrassahs).

39. The 'private' institutions which are included in the official statistics are institutions which do not work in accordance with courses or standards prescribed, or recognised, either by the Education Department or by the University. The statistics for 1916-17 show 62,920 pupils as being in those institutions in Bengal. Of these students 47,183 or 75 per cent. were Musalmans; these figures include 25,458 boys and 7,393 girls, who were pupils of schools which teach nothing beyond the chanting of the Quran.

40. The following table indicates the educational progress of Bengali Musalmans during the last 35 years, *i.e.*, since the Education Commission of 1882. The figures are all the more striking, because the figures in the first column include Bihar and Orissa, while those in the last column refer to the existing Presidency of Bengal only :—

Institution.	Number of pupils in 1881-82 in Bengal, Bihar and Orissa.	Number of pupils in 1916-17 in Bengal.
Colleges—General	106	1,639
Colleges—Professional	.	303
High English Schools	3,831	45,179
Middle English Schools	5,036	54,061
Middle Vernacular Schools	7,741	8,258
Primary Schools	218,786	680,273

41. In 1917 the number of Musalmans who were Fellows of the Calcutta University was 7 out of a total of 110. No Musalman has been elected a member of the Syndicate since its reconstruction

in 1904. In 1917 there was no Muslim member of the Students' Committee of Residence nor was the Muslim community represented on any of the other administrative bodies of the University. But some representation of the Muslim community has since been arranged.

42. The number of Musalmans in the governing bodies of the colleges is inadequate. The Mymensingh College is the only one which has two Musalmans on its governing body. Eight Government and aided colleges have one Muslim member each; the remaining 23 colleges have no Musalmans on their governing bodies.

43. The table below shows how few Musalmans were employed in 1917 on the staffs of the various colleges. This is a serious difficulty arising largely from the small number of Musalmans available for appointment. An adequate number of Muslim teachers is necessary not only to secure confidence among the Muslim students but also for the organisation of Muslim hostels for the provision of social life and tutorial guidance for the students of that community.

Colleges.	Teachers of oriental subjects.		Teachers of other subjects.			Total.
	Hindus (Sanskrit, Bengali and Pali).	Musalmans (Arabic and Persian).	Europeans.	Hindus.	Musalmans.	
11 Government Colleges	39	15	28	213	17	258
9 Aided Colleges[1] .	20	8	...	120	8	128
8 Mission Colleges[1] .	18	1	47	78	...	125
11 Unaided Colleges .	33	4	4	231	4	239
University Staff (Arts and Science).	25	5	11	125	6	142
6 Professional Colleges[2] (except Law).	...	...	24	69	2	95
University Law, Ripon, Earle, and Dacca Law Colleges.	...	...	2	76	...	78
Total .	137	33	116	912	37	1,065

[1] Some of the mission colleges are aided, but no mission colleges are included under the head 'aided colleges' as used in this table.

[2] The teaching departments of the Diocesan College for Girls and Loreto House are not included.

44. The deputation of the Musalmans of Calcutta referred to the fact that there was no Musalman on the staff of the University Law College. They stated that competent Musalmans were available.[1] Three Musalmans have been appointed since then.

45. The following table shows the number and percentage of Muslim students in 1917 in the various types of colleges:—

Colleges.	Total number of students.	Total number of Musalmans.	Percentage of Musalmans.
11 Government Colleges	5,323	811	15·2
9 Aided Colleges	4,343	589	13·5
8 Mission Colleges	2,916	180	6·1
11 Unaided Colleges	10,692	765	7·6
University Post-Graduate Classes in Arts and Science	1,583	66	4·2
8 Professional Colleges (except Law)	1,120	74	5·2
University Law, Ripon, Earle and Dacca Law Colleges.	2,824	198	7·0
TOTAL	28,410	2,683	9·5

46. There is no Muslim college in Bengal but proposals for the establishment of an Islamia college in Calcutta are now under consideration. We have referred to this in Section V below.[2] There are three Muslim high schools maintained by the Government of Bengal. The Anglo-Persian Department of the Calcutta Madrassah is a high school. The Anglo-Persian departments of the Government madrassahs in Dacca and Chittagong were recently transferred to the divisional inspectors as Muslim high schools. Besides these high schools Government also maintains madrassahs teaching the reformed madrassah course.[3]

47. We have already shewn[4] that in 1916-17 the Muslim pupils in the high schools of Bengal represented 20·5 per cent. only of the total number of students. The percentage of the Musalmans who appeared at the matriculation examination of 1918 was 17·3 only.

48. As regards residential accommodation, the following table shows the total number of Muslim students against the places

[1] General Memoranda, page 210.

[2] See also para. 33(*j*) above, and Chapter XXXIV.

[3] See also Chapter XVI.

[4] Para. 36 above.

available for them in recognised hostels, *i.e.*, college and non-collegiate hostels (for university students) :—

Places.	Total number of Muslim students.	Total number of Muslim students for whom hostel accommodation is available.	The percentage of Muslim students for whom hostel accommodation exists.
Calcutta	1,241	515	41·4
Dacca	250	180	72·0
Mufassal	1,192	355	29·8
TOTAL .	2,683	1,050	39·6

IV.—The education of women and girls.[1]

49. We have already stated (see paragraph 1 above) that according to the figures of the last census, the Muslim population of Bengal was 23,989,719. This figure includes women and girls, of whom 131,380 are in recognised colleges or schools. In 1916-17 there were two Muslim girls only in colleges, 36 in high schools, 205 in middle schools, 129,341 in primary schools including maktabs, and 1,796 in special schools.[2] No Muslim girl passed the Calcutta University matriculation examination in 1918. The recent Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in Bengal says that the demand for women's education is steadily rising.

"The advance of education among Moslem women of the upper classes depends almost entirely upon the establishment and maintenance of strictly *purdah* schools, which should be staffed by Muhammadan women and confined exclusively to Muhammadan girls. There are a certain number of such schools already, and if any real progress is to be made the number of these schools must be increased. The difficulty in the way of increasing these schools is the dearth of teachers. If these schools are really to appeal to Muhammadans they must be staffed by qualified Moslem women and such women are almost unobtainable in Bengal."[3]

[1] The education of Muslim women and girls is also dealt with in general in Chapter XIV.

[2] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17. Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), para. 506.

[3] *Ibid.*, para. 510.

50. Some of our witnesses advocated the house-to-house teaching of Muslim girls. Miss Bose, one of the Bengal inspectresses, wrote recently :—

" The system of education by means of house-to-house visitation and in central gatherings is a great boon to *purdah* women, both Hindu and Muhammadan, and is very highly appreciated by people of both communities. . . . . I am sorry to say that some of these teachers are not competent to carry on the work. The women now employed with the exception of one or two have the most meagre education . . . . . The Muhammadans are still in their infancy, as far as female education is concerned, and need encouragement and help no doubt, but it is impossible to open new schools and *zananas* [centres] until we can secure the services of trained qualified teachers. A Muhammadan training institution—the scheme of which has had to wait for financial stringency owing to the war—is essentially needed for the purpose. We shall never get qualified teachers until this is done."[1]

51. The Muslim Education Committee[2] recorded the opinion that a separate system of schools would have to be established and maintained for Muslim girls. It stated that the atmosphere of the existing schools was not congenial to Muslim girls and that it was therefore necessary to establish and maintain schools which would admit none but the daughters of Musalmans. The Committee did not, however, think it would be distasteful to the community if Muslim girls, where necessary, continued to attend the ordinary primary schools.[3]

52. The Committee also recommended that provision should be made for the religious instruction of Muslim girls in primary schools ; the establishment in Calcutta and Dacca of model girl schools for Musalmans ; the employment of Muslim women as assistant inspectresses ; the endowment of liberal stipends for Muslim girl pupils ; and the employment of more peripatetic women teachers for Muslim girls and women.[4]

53. On the question of the training of Muslim women teachers Begum Khajesta Bano Suhrawardy, in the course of a written statement forwarded to us, said :—

" Indeed it is now difficult even to get non-Muslim Indian Urdu speaking trained teachers, having sufficient knowledge and capabilities of being useful

[1] Progress of Education in Bengal. Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell, para. 513.

[2] Para. 13 above.

[3] The Report of the Committee appointed by the Bengal Government to consider questions connected with Muhammadan education, para. 135 (Calcutta, 1915).

[4] *Ibid.*

in a secondary school. The teachers from Bankipore school appear fit only for primary education. Therefore unless a training school for Muslim teachers is established at Calcutta, on the lines of the one for Hindus of which Mrs. Mitter is the principal, the education of Muslim girls will remain seriously handicapped."[1]

54. The Muslim Education Committee recommended[2] that the University of Calcutta should be asked, where necessary, to make special arrangements for the examination under strictly purdah conditions of Muslim ladies. No application has ever been made to the University, but we understand that, if there was a demand, there would be no difficulty in meeting it.

V.—The proposed Calcutta 'arts college' for Musalmans.

55. We have already referred[3] to the scheme for the establishment in Calcutta of a Government 'arts college' for Musalmans. At one time there were intermediate classes attached to the Calcutta Madrassah. In 1887 a question arose as to the raising of the status of the Madrassah to that of a first grade college and on the recommendation of the Principal of the Madrassah, Dr. Hoernle, and Sir Alfred Croft, who was then Director of Public Instruction, the Madrassah as an 'arts college' was amalgamated in 1888[4] with the Presidency College. The students, however, continued to appear at the university examinations as the students of the Calcutta Madrassah and to pay fees at the same rate of Rs. 2 a month. No restriction was imposed as to the number of the Muslim students who could be admitted to the Presidency College classes under these conditions. This arrangement continued till 1908 when the University disaffiliated the Madrassah. On the recommendation of Mr. (later Sir Archdale) Earle, Director of Public Instruction, and Dr. (now Sir) E. Denison Ross, the Principal of the Calcutta Madrassah, orders were issued by the Government of Bengal that 35 Muslim students should be admitted to each of the first and second year classes of the Presidency College at a fee of Rs. 2 a month. The number 35 was calculated on the average number

[1] Question 23.

[2] Report of the Committee appointed by the Bengal Government to consider questions connected with Muhammadan education (Calcutta, 1915). Resolution 168, page 54.

[3] Paras. 33(*y*) and 46 above.

[4] Resolution of the Government of Bengal, General Department, Education, dated the 31st July 1888.

of Muslim students who had during the immediately preceding years been under instruction in the first and second year classes of the Presidency College, as students of the Madrassah. We understand that in 1909 certain proposals which had been put forward in connexion with the Presidency College included the establishment of a Muslim arts college in Bengal, preferably in Calcutta. The suggestion was offered that such a college might be provided by removing the Calcutta Madrassah to a more suitable site and reorganising it on the model of the Aligarh College.

56. The gradual increase in the number of Musalmans passing the matriculation and intermediate examinations suggested to the Government of Bengal the desirability of reopening the question of a Muslim college; a scheme was worked out and in 1914 land was purchased in Wellesley Street, Calcutta, at a cost of Rs. 1,23,000.

57. The scheme is awaiting the issue of our report. We consider it desirable that a college for Musalmans should be established in Calcutta. This matter is dealt with in Chapter XXXIV.

VI.—Madrassahs.

58. Maulvi Abdul Karim has informed us in his "Short Note on the Education imparted in Madrassahs" that during Muslim rule in Bengal there were madrassahs all over the country. He continues:—

"Besides the well organised institutions of the kind every *mosque* was a madrassah in miniature. Distinguished Arabic scholars, who devoted their lives to advancing Islamic learning, taught their co-religionists, without any remuneration from their pupils, theology, law and literature of Islam. Many of these institutions collapsed when the Musalmans lost their wealth and influence on account of the loss of sovereignty. As in the beginning of British rule in India Persian was retained as the court language, it was necessary to have an institution, well-equipped and well-staffed, for the training of officers. Warren Hastings established the Calcutta Madrassah in order to meet this requirement. Its course of studies was so framed as to give Government servants a good training. Some of the private madrassahs also adopted this course. As long as a knowledge of Persian was a passport to posts of honour and emoluments, the education given in the madrassahs was very useful. When Persian was replaced by English and the provincial vernaculars, the madrassahs lost their utility and consequently also their popularity. But still a large number of orthodox Musalmans, who cared more for religious than for secular

education, continued to send their children to the madrassahs instead of to the schools and colleges."[1]

59. Mr. Harley, the Principal of the Calcutta Madrassah, does not think that it is fair to treat madrassahs as mere theological departments, to provide special degrees and stipends for their students, and after that to leave them with no better prospects than they have at present. He reminds the Commission that students of madrassahs would in an Islamic country be qualified for Government posts.[2]

60. In the early part of the last century the madrassahs of Bengal (including those located in the present provinces of Bihar and Orissa and of Assam) were organised round the Calcutta Madrassah, the Principal of which held regular public tests for madrassah students, called the central madrassah examinations. Frequent efforts have been made to bring the Calcutta Madrassah and the madrassahs associated with it more into line with ordinary colleges and schools and more into touch with the requirements of modern life. In 1903 the Government of Bengal had before them a proposal that from a certain stage in the course upwards two different courses should be taught in the Arabic Department of the Calcutta Madrassah—one partly English and partly oriental, the other wholly oriental. This proposal was rejected, mainly because it was felt that while a knowledge of English was to be acquired at the expense of oriental studies, the standard attained in that language would not be sufficiently high to justify the experiment. In a resolution issued by the Government of Bengal on the 24th February 1903 the view was expressed that, if a Musalman wished to learn English thoroughly, he should enter the Anglo-Persian Department of the Calcutta Madrassah, in which Arabic and Persian were taught as optional subjects for the matriculation examination. In 1906 Mr. (now Sir Archdale) Earle, as Director of Public Instruction, Bengal, reopened the general question of the education of the Musalmans of the Provinces of Bengal and of Eastern Bengal and Assam. A series of conferences were held in 1907 and 1908, and at these conferences the discussion centred mainly round two questions, (1) the institution of a title examination for madrassah students in literature, law and theology, similar to the

[1] General Memoranda, page 171.
[2] *Ibid.*, page 164.

Sanskrit title examination and (2) the revision of the course to enable madrassah students to acquire such a knowledge of English as would fit them for Government service and other profitable employment. There was considerable diversity of opinion on the question whether English should be made a compulsory subject in madrassahs. The proposal that English should be made a compulsory subject was ultimately negatived, but the Muslim representatives of Eastern Bengal were unanimous in supporting it. In 1909-10 a conference representative of Muslim opinion in Eastern Bengal was summoned by the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam to meet in Dacca. This conference drew up a revised syllabus, but Mr. Sharp, the present Educational Commissioner, who was then Director of Public Instruction in Eastern Bengal and Assam, pointed out, in submitting the revised curriculum to Government, that it attempted too much and comprised a heterogeneous mixture of subjects. He was unable to recommend its general adoption. At this point Mr. Nathan took up the case. The position which he assumed was that the revised curriculum should be as simple as possible and should be introduced into as many madrassahs as financial considerations would permit. A second conference was held in Dacca in March 1912, when the proposals of the 1910 conference were taken as the basis of discussion, and modifications were suggested with the object of making the course simpler and more practicable. These revised proposals were before the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam when the territorial readjustment took place which resulted in the Presidency of Bengal; and, before any further progress had been made, the question of establishing a university at Dacca had been taken up. The committee appointed by the Government of Bengal to frame a scheme for the new University decided to adopt the suggestion of the Government of India that a department of Islamic studies should be included in the new University and appointed a sub-committee to work out the details. As the university course must necessarily be an extension of the course followed in the madrassahs, the sub-committee had to take into consideration the madrassah curriculum. The proposals made by the Dacca conference of 1912 were taken as a starting point and in 1913 after an informal conference, over which Mr. Nathan presided, a scheme known

popularly as the reformed madrassah scheme was evolved, the adoption of which in all Government and aided madrassahs (except the Calcutta madrassah) was ordered by the Government of Bengal in their Resolution of the 31st July 1914.[1] The proposals for the Dacca University Department of Islamic studies are dealt with in Chapter XXXIII of our report. The whole question of the courses of study followed in madrassahs is dealt with in detail in Chapter XVI.

61. In our opinion there can be no solution of the problem involved in the educational backwardness of the Muslim community, which does not include a persistent attempt not only to make madrassahs places of real intellectual culture and training but also to bring them into touch with the needs of modern life. The Government of Bengal resolution[2] to which we have just referred prefaces its announcement by stating that the private madrassahs of the Presidency, though numerous, are, as a rule, small understaffed institutions in which a mere smattering of Arabic and Persian is taught, but practically nothing else.

"Such an education is ill suited for the requirements of the present day. The students find themselves unable to earn a living and, for the most part, degenerate into useless members of society.[3] The leading Muhammadans

---

[1] Resolution no. 450-T-G., dated the 31st July 1914, by the Government of Pengal, General (Education) Department.

[2] *Ibid.*, para. 10.

[3] This is curiously reminiscent of what Sir Richard Burton wrote in 1853 of the students of the Azhar at Cairo in his *Personal Narrative of a Pilgrimage to Al-Madinah and Mecca* (by Col. Sir Richard F. Burton edited by Lady Burton with an introduction by Stanley Lane-Poole: London. G. Bell and Sons, Ltd. 1915, Vol. I), pp. 103-109:— "The following is the course of study in the Azhar. The school-boy of four or five years standing has been taught by a liberal application of the maxim 'the Green Rod is of the Trees of Paradise' to chant the Koran without understanding it, the elementary rules of arithmetic, and, if he is destined to be a learned man, the art of writing. He then registers his name in Al-Azhar, and applies himself to the branches of study most cultivated in Al-Islam, namely *Nahw* (syntax), *Fikh* (the law), *Hadis* (the traditions of the Prophet) and *Tafsir*, or exposition of the Koran. The young Egyptian reads at the same time *Sarf*, or inflexion, and *Nahw* (Syntax). But as Arabic is his mother tongue, he is not required to study the former so deeply as are the Turks, the Persians and the Indians. If he desires, however, to be proficient he must carefully peruse five books in *Sarf*, and six in *Nahw*. Master of grammar, our student now applies himself to its proper aim and purpose, Divinity. Of the four schools those of Abu Hanifah and Al Shafe'i are most common in Cairo, etc. . . . . In order to become a *Fakih*, or divine of distinguished fame, the follower of Abu Hanifah must peruse about ten volumes, some of large size, written in a diffuse style; the Shafe'i's reading is not quite so extensive.

of Bengal are fully alive to this evil and have repeatedly expressed their desire for a general reform of madrassahs. They hold that the course of study pursued therein, whilst not being exclusively secular, should be such as is likely to produce cultured Muhammadans fit to enter one or other of the careers open to educated men, and to play their part in the various activities which go to make up the public life of modern India. They are alive to the need for scholars versed in the lore of Islam, but, while they recognise that scholars of this type will necessarily be few in number, they realise that, unless the community is to suffer, these exceptional persons must be genuine *savants* and real enthusiasts for religion and learning."[1]

VII.—Muslim deputations and representations.

62. One of the striking indications of the interest which the Musalmans now take in education was the number of Muslim deputations which waited upon us. We received deputations at Calcutta, Chittagong, Comilla, Dacca, Gauhati, Midnapore, Murshidabad Rajshahi and Rangpur.[2] The resolutions of the All-India Muhammadan Conference and of the Bengal Presidency Muhammadan Educational Association were also submitted to us.[3] These documents are printed in the volume of General Memoranda, and all the

---

Theology is much studied, because it leads directly to the gaining of daily bread, as priest or tutor; and other scientific pursuits are neglected for the opposite reason. The theologian in Egypt, as in other parts of Al-Islam, must have a superficial knowledge of the Prophet's traditions. Of these there are eight well-known collections, but only the first three are generally read. School boys are instructed, almost when in their infancy, to intone the Koran. . . . And after learning to read the whole volume, some savants are ambitious enough to wish to understand it; under these circumstances they must dive into "*Ilm al-Tafsir*, or the exegesis of the Koran. Our student is now a perfect *Fakih* or *Mullá*. But the poor fellow has no scholarship or fellowship—no easy tutorship—no fat living to look forward to. After wasting seven years, or twice seven years, over his studies, and reading till his brain is dizzy, his digestion gone and his eyes half blind, he must either starve upon college alms, or squat like my old Shaykh Mohammed, in a druggist's shop, or become pedagogue and preacher in some country place, on the pay of £8 per annum. With such prospects it is wonderful how the Azhar can present any attractions; but the southern man is essentially an idler, and many become Olemá, like Capuchins, in order to do nothing. A favoured few rise to the degree of *Mudarris* (professors) and thence emerge *Kazis* and *Muftis*. This is another inducement to matriculate; every undergraduate having an eye upon the *Kazishíp* with as much chance of obtaining it as the country *parocco* has of becoming a cardinal. Others again devote themselves to laical pursuits, degenerate into *Wakíls* (lawyers) or seek their fortunes as *Kátibs*—public or private accountants."

[1] Resolution no. 450-T.G., dated the 31st July 1914 by the Government of Bengal, General (Education) Department, paras. 2 and 3.

[2] General Memoranda, pages 207-218.

[3] *Ibid.*, pages 201-206

points raised therein are dealt with either in this chapter or in other parts of our report.

63. Among the points on which the deputations were emphatic was the desirability of providing increased pecuniary aid for Muslim students in the shape of stipends, scholarships and free studentships. They also urged that a certain proportion of Muslim students should be accommodated in hostels rent free.

VIII.—Musalmans and the problem of communal representation.

64. Practically all the Musalmans who have appeared before us or have favoured us with written statements are agreed in representing the present state of affairs in the University of Calcutta as unfavourable to the interests of their community. When, in 1912, the Government of India announced their intention of establishing a University of Dacca, they expressed the view that there seemed but little chance of a large increase in the number of Muslim university students until the Musalmans of Eastern Bengal had a university nearer to their doors, in the guidance of which they could have a voice (there were then only six Musalmans in the Calcutta University Senate) and in which there might perhaps be a Faculty of Islamic Studies. The question of the Dacca University is dealt with in Chapter XXXIII of our report.

65. A number of Muslim witnesses complain that neither the registered graduates nor the faculties of the Calcutta University have ever yet elected a Musalman to be a Fellow. Others, while not exonerating these electorates from blame for the way in which they have exercised their suffrages, recognise the fact that 80 per cent. of the Ordinary Fellows of the University are nominated by the Chancellor and therefore complain that this right of nomination has not been fairly exercised. Maulvi Abdul Karim, for example, writes :—

" The reservation by the Chancellor of the power of nominating so many as four-fifths of the fellows, perhaps with a view to preserve the necessary equilibrium between the different communities interested in the University, should have secured the representation of the different communities on the different bodies of the University in proportion to their numerical strength and communal importance. Even if allowance were made for difference in educational advancement, their (*i.e.*, the Musalmans) representation should, on no account, have been so absurdly disproportionate, as it is at present. That an overwhelming majority of even the nominated fellows

should have come from one particular community is regarded as a grievance that calls for immediate redress. There is no fixed principle according to which selection is made by Government. It does not seem to have been always based on academic attainments."[1]

The Maulvi, who contends that one-third of the Senate at least should be Muslim, will not hear of the suggestion that suitable Musalmans are not easy to find :—

"If any one thinks that such a number of competent Musalmans in Bengal and Assam would not be forthcoming, he is not, I am afraid, fully aware of the progress the community has lately made in education."[1]

66. The majority of our Muslim witnesses do not hesitate to attribute to this lack of Muslim representation in the University (and on the governing bodies of the several colleges) not only the inadequate proportion of the Musalmans among students of the University but also the continuance of conditions which are alleged by Musalmans to be prejudicial to the interests of Muslim students. Most of these grievances are referred to in the course of this chapter ; we summarise them below :—

(*a*) the lack of adequate provision for instruction in Persian and Arabic,

(*b*) the difficulty experienced by Muslim students in obtaining admission into colleges,

(*c*) the lack of hostel accommodation for Muslim students,

(*d*) the encouragement by the University of a Sanskritised Bengali, which is difficult for Musalmans to acquire,

(*e*) the use by the University of books which are either uncongenial to Musalmans as being steeped in Hindu religion and tradition, or even positively objectionable to them, because they contain statements offensive to Muslim sentiment. Elphinstone's History of India is cited as a case in point,

(*f*) the requirement that each candidate should write his name, instead of giving a number, on the answer books shown up at university examinations. (It is suggested that this practice operates to the prejudice of Muslim candidates),[2] and

(*g*) the delay in the issue by the University of certain Arabic and Persian text-books.

---

[1] Question 22.

[2] Chapters XVII and XL.

Stress is also laid on the necessity for securing for the Muslim community 'its fair share' in the appointment of university examiners. We were informed by Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury that out of 895 examiners appointed by the Calcutta University in 1917 in subjects other than Urdu, Persian or Arabic, nine only were Musalmans. There were 44 examiners in that year in Urdu, Persian and Arabic.[1]

67. Some of the witnesses go so far as to charge the Calcutta University with indifference to Muslim representations. This view is emphasised in a note[2] submitted to the Commission by Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury—a note giving expression to the views of those Muslim leaders of Bengal whom the Nawab had sounded.

68. Some of the leading Musalmans contend that the jurisdiction of the Calcutta University should be curtailed.

The most carefully elaborated view on the subject from the Muslim stand point is to be found in the note from the Musalmans of Calcutta :—

"Apart from any consideration of sectarian and separate interests, it is obvious that a university, such as we have in Calcutta, cannot possibly meet the educational requirements of 45½ millions of people. It is not possible for a single university to exercise efficient control over 62 colleges and about 800 high schools scattered all over the Presidency and to satisfactorily discharge the duties and responsibilities of maintaining discipline among more than 20,000 students in colleges and about 2 lakhs and 20,000 students in schools. Nor is it possible for a single university to satisfy the legitimate needs and aspirations of such a large number of people, considering the fact that centralisation of authority, as we have in Calcutta, means the over-concentration of the educational efforts of the Presidency at a single place and the under-estimation of the value and possibilities of the development of other places as centres of education."[3]

69. The questions raised in this note are fully discussed in Chapter XXXV of our report. Here it is only necessary to say that we hope to see a general development of stronger centres of intellectual life in the various parts of the mufassal, Dacca being from the first chosen as the seat of a university. But Calcutta must always enjoy prominence in the educational life of the Presidency, because it is the focus of railway and other communica-

[1] Chapters XVII and XL.

[2] Question 4.

[3] General Memoranda, page 209.

tions, the headquarters of Government, the centre of intellectual activity in Bengal. Any board or public authority dealing with education in the Presidency would find Calcutta the most convenient place for its regular meetings. There is no other place in Bengal so convenient for the purpose. What has to be devised therefore for higher education in the mufassal is a method of administration which, without giving Calcutta a monopoly of influence in its direction, will avail itself of the intellectual resources of the metropolis, and take advantage of its experience. The central geographical position of Calcutta must be recognised and put to advantageous use. What has to be avoided is on the one hand over-concentration and disregard on the other hand of the local views and needs of the various Muslim and Hindu communities of the mufassal.

70. We addressed the following question[1] to our correspondents :—

" To what extent do you consider that the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered :—

(*a*) in the government of the University,
(*b*) in its courses of study,
(*c*) in its residential and other arrangements ?"

71. With few exceptions all our correspondents agree that in the matter of residential arrangements for students, the special needs of the various communities should be considered. Mr. Sharp says that " it is important that Musalmans should have their own hostels (to a considerable extent they now possess them) supervised by Muhammadan professors, and with arrangements for religious observance, which is much prized by this community." Rai Brojendra Kishore Roy Chaudhury writes that " the Hindu and Muhammadan students ought to be placed in separate hostels built in entirely separate compounds with entirely separate arrangements regarding religious education."[1] The staff of the Murarichand College, Sylhet, also recommend separate residential and messing arrangements for separate religious denominations.[1] Khan Bahadur Aminul Islam and Mr. Harley in their joint memorandum recommend that—

" as far as possible separate hostels for Musalmans and Hindus should be constructed and, where this is not feasible owing to the small number of members of either community, they should have separate accommodation in the

[1] Question 22.

same house, with independent messing arrangements. Seats should be reserved for Muhammadan students in colleges and hostels according to the population of the division. Hostel accommodation should be provided for Muhammadan M. A. and law students."[1]

72. Some of our correspondents, Hindus, Muslims and British alike recognise the exigencies of the present situation but feel that an attempt should be made to provide mixed hostels for Hindus and Musalmans with separate feeding arrangements only. Maulvi Ahsanullah's view is that—

"Hindu and Muhammadan boarders should, as far as possible, be accommodated in the same place, separate arrangements being made for cooking and other purposes. Combined hostels will be welcomed both from the scholastic and the economic point of view. They will greatly facilitate the growth of an intimate brotherhood among the students of different creeds and will permit of an organised tutorial system."[1]

The Rev. W. E. S. Holland thinks that "students of all castes and religions can reside together in adjacent rooms and all that is needed is separate arrangements for food." No reference is made by these witnesses to the difficulty of religious instruction. It is suggested on the other hand that the provision of common hostels for students of different faiths is only feasible if religious instruction, and possibly religious observances, are excluded from hostels. This question is discussed in Chapters XIX and XXXIX.

73. None of our correspondents have advocated any distinction being made as between community and community in the matter of purely secular instruction but some are of opinion that subjects representing communal traditions and scriptural languages should be included as alternative subjects in the university courses of study. Mr. Panchanandas Mukherji, Professor of Political Economy and Political Philosophy, Presidency College and a lecturer of Calcutta University, says that "as regards courses of study, the needs and interests of particular communities should be consulted with reference to the study of the second languages and the vernacular."[1] Dr. Pramathanath Banerjea, Lecturer in Economics and Political Philosophy, Calcutta University, while disagreeing with communal representation in the government of universities favours the idea of the adjustment of the courses of study to the needs of particular communities.[1] Mr. Langley of Dacca says that "courses of studies should be designed to meet the needs of the

[1] Question 22.

various communities, but narrow sectarianism in the selection of subjects should be discouraged."[1]

74. Khan Sahib Mohammad Yusuf, Head Master, Calcutta Madrassah, says " it is a universal complaint among Muhammadans that religious instruction has not been recognised as part of the curriculum."[1] Shams-ul-Ulama Abu Nasr Waheed says " an Islamic course of studies, under a faculty of Islamic studies, combined with English, leading to the university degrees, should be provided. Every college should make provision for the teaching of Arabic, Persian and Urdu. The University should make provision for the study of the history of Islamic civilisation beginning from the intermediate stage."[1] This question will be discussed in Chapter XVI. Mr. M. A. N. Hydari thinks that " such subjects as Islamic history and such languages as Persian, Arabic and Urdu should have a due place in the framing of the university courses of study."[1]

75. The witnesses who do not think that the needs of particular communities should be specially considered are either opposed to this consideration on principle or because they hold that any further special consideration is unnecessary. Mr. Surendra Nath Roy does not think that " particular communities have any real grievance either in the courses of studies or in the residential and other arrangements of the Calcutta University."

76. The difference of opinion among our witnesses is more marked in the matter of communal representation in the government of universities. About 55 of our Hindu witnesses object to such communal representation, while 33 are in favour.

77. Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee's view is—

" within the sacred precincts of the temple of learning all votaries should receive equal treatment, and none should claim any special favour."[1]

Mr. P. Basu, Professor of Economics, Holkar College, Indore, says :—

" As a general principle I consider special representation of any community as highly mischievous. In university matters this is more so. But as the needs of different communities differ much with regard to certain aspects of university life, to that extent specially competent persons for that purpose should be asked to give advice."[1]

[1] Question 22.

78. Mr. Sasi Sekhar Banerjee, the Officiating Principal of the Krishnath College, Berhampur, says :—

"The University being the centre of learning should be free from party considerations. There should not be any party government or communal representation in the University, but on its government only the best and most capable men should be enlisted, without any reference to nationality, so long as they will be able to serve the best interests of Government, of colleges and of learning."[1]

79. Dr. M. N. Banerjee, the Principal of the Belgachia Medical College, states unhesitatingly that the less we hear of communal interests in the University, the better. "The University is the only place where all races, creeds, and nationalities meet on common ground."[1] The Bengal Landholders Association have expressed themselves as being decidedly against the introduction of the 'communal' question in matters of university government and university education.[1] Sir R. G. Bhandarkar does not think that the centrifugal forces, which are so powerful in Indian society notwithstanding the contact of India with western civilisation for nearly two hundred years, should be further strengthened by the University, and in his judgment therefore "the needs and interests of particular communities should not be taken into consideration in the government of the University and in its courses of study. These should be arranged to meet the needs and interests of Indians, and Indians only."[1]

80. Rai Yatindra Nath Choudhury of Barnagore would oppose any communal representation in the governing body of the University. In his view "what is wanted is good men, and not men selected in a haphazard way from any community, because they belong to it." He admits, however, that in the department of oriental studies of the University and in the department of Indian history and antiquity there should be a certain percentage of men from the different communities, so that adequate consideration may be given to the needs and interests of each.[1] Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta, Vice-Principal of the Dacca Law College, records the view that "to look upon education from the point of view of sectional interests is a pernicious habit and should not be encouraged." He suggests that questions in which the interests of Musalmans go against those of others "arise in

[1] Question 22.

the Senate once in fifty years or more." "For the sake of these rare occasions, it would be absurd permanently to weaken the Senate, by bringing in members who are there, not by virtue of their academic qualifications, but because they are supposed to look after the interests of a community."[1]

81. The view of the Indian Association is that in the government of the University and in its courses of study the needs and interests of particular communities should not be considered.[1] This is also the view of Maharajah Sir Manindra Chandra Nandy of Kasimbazar, of Dr. Tej Bahadur Sapru, of Sir Nilratan Sircar and of the Rev. Garfield Williams. Mr. R. P. Paranjpye of the Fergusson College, Poona, deprecates the introduction of any communal considerations whatever into a university. He writes :—

"I am strongly of opinion that no communal considerations should be introduced in the government of the University. The Senate and Syndicate should consist of the best men. As regards courses of study, it is natural that some subjects may specially appeal to some special community, *e.g.*, Persian and Arabic to Muhammadans, Sanskrit to Hindus, Avesta and Pahlavi to Parsis, Pali to Buddhists, etc. The Senate, or at least the boards of study, should contain representatives of all the subjects which the University offers to teach and the University should aim at teaching all the subjects for which there is a demand. It should so arrange its courses that they are not too narrowly sectarian. Thus I would deprecate a course of Sanskrit for Jains in which no books but those by Jain authors are prescribed. Every student of Sanskrit should have some knowledge of the literature contained in Sanskrit as a whole before specialising in one particular branch.

In the matter of separate institutions for different communities I deprecate the foundation of communal universities or even colleges. I am willing to allow only separate hostels at the most, but I would prefer a hostel for all classes, the messes only being distinct for different classes. In this way all classes of young men will have ample opportunities of coming together and will begin to feel unconsciously that they are Indians first and foremost and not members of their separate little communities only. This is the impression that I want them to take from their education and not merely the prescribed amount of book-learning in various subjects."[1]

82. Mr. K. Zachariah, Professor of History at the Presidency College, Calcutta, is himself a member of a small community, the Syrian Christian community of the Malabar Coast. His view is that communal representation tends "to create factions and cause questions to be decided not on their intrinsic merit, but on party grounds;" that it also inclines to keeping the communities so

[1] Question 22.

represented " in a continued state of tutelage." " There is nothing," he observes, " so invigorating and healthy as having to stand up and fight without special favour."[1]

83. Mr. Saratlal Biswas, Assistant Professor of Geology, Calcutta University, holds an intermediate position. He is in favour of Indian and provincial representation but not in favour of communal representation. He says :—" The government of the University, as well as its teaching departments, should be composed, as far as possible, of Indians, and preference should always be given to the people of Bengal."[1]

84. Turning to the representative views of those Hindu witnesses who are in favour of communal representation, Kumar Manindra Chandra Sinha of the Paikpara Raj writes—

" every effort should be given to secure adequate representation for the interests of particular communities, such as the Muhammadan and the domiciled Anglo-Indian, and every attempt should be made to include representatives of such communities in the deliberations of the University. This will help a cosmopolitan view being taken of problems affecting the University."[1]

Mr. P. N. Nag, the Head Master of the United Free Church Mission School, Chinsurah, says that " the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered according to their educational and numerical strength (*a*) in the government of the University and (*b*) in its courses of study."[1]

85. Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur would, in arranging for communal representation, not fix the proportion according to numerical strength but according to the number of students who receive education.[1] Mr. Jogendra Nath Hazra, the Principal of the Midnapore College, is not in favour of fixing any proportion. His view is that " the Muhammadans and the depressed classes should have their representatives in sufficient numbers on the governing bodies of the University to look after their interests."[1]

86. Rai Sahib Nritya Gopal Chaki, a pleader of Pabna, recommends separate electorates of Musalmans and of pandits from recognised *tôls* for the purpose of electing members to the Senate.[1] Mr. N. C. Bardaloi of Gauhati thinks that " the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered regarding the control and management of the University.

[1] Question 22.

There should be enough non-official members representing different communities and people."[1]

87. The opinions of our British witnesses on communal representation are practically balanced, nine on either side. The majority of those who oppose communal representation are in favour of communal colleges and even of communal universities. Mr. Archbold sees "great danger of weakening communities by giving them privileges."[1] The Rev. Garfield Williams is in favour of communal representation in the government of colleges but not in the government of universities.[1]

88. The view of Mr. R. N. Gilchrist, Principal of the Krishnagar College, is that it is impossible to secure the fair representation of sectarian interests in a centralised university like Calcutta. He continues :—

"On general principles I object to the representation of interests of this kind, as such, in a university. The present Government policy regarding Moslems is an example in point. In the Education Department the favouring of sections means the acceptance of lower qualifications than competition in the open market would give. Political reasons, however, may demand such a procedure, and they will demand separate representation. A glance at the many memorials on university representation from Muhammadans in Bengal will show how far the demands made are incapable of fulfilment simply because of a lack of qualified men. By local universities, however, fair representation of sectional interests is far more possible."[1]

89. Mr. S. G. Dunn of the Muir College, Allahabad, considers that the needs of particular communities should be met by the establishment of special universities, such as the Hindu University at Benares, or the proposed University of Islam at Aligarh. He considers that such universities should be financed and in every way controlled by the communities which demand their establishment, and that public funds should not be used for them at all. His view is that, apart from these communal or sectarian universities, the needs and interests of particular communities should not be specially considered in the government or academic organisation of the universities—"a university in which such needs and interests are considered is a contradiction in terms."[1] Mr. Mark Hunter, formerly Professor of English in the Presidency College, Madras, and now the Director of Public Instruction in Burma,

[1] Question 22.

regards it as desirable that the special needs and interests of particular communities should not be lost sight of, but he holds that—

"it is not to the interests of the University as a whole that persons academically considered of little or no significance should be given place and influence in the University simply as representing this or that community, to the exclusion of men of high academic qualification who are likely to be of real service in university work."[1]

90. Turning to those who are in favour of communal representation, Mr. H. Sharp writes :—

"The consideration of the needs and interests of particular classes is of great importance. Among such communities in Bengal would be reckoned the Musalmans (who though numerically just over half the population, form a minority among those who seek higher education), the Buddhists and the depressed classes. The Musalmans require larger representation on the governing bodies. This can best be arranged by the establishment of local universities at centres of Muhammadan population like Dacca and Chittagong and by the devolution of examinations."[1]

91. Mr. W. C. Wordsworth, Officiating Director of Public Instruction, Bengal, writes :—

"I consider that (*a*) the Muhammadan community, (*b*) those engaged in European education, (*c*) those engaged or interested in women's education, should have their needs and interests specially considered in the government of the University, in its courses of study, in its residential and other arrangements. It is advisable that efforts should be made to interest the non-official and non-educational community, both Indian and European, in the affairs of the University. Of recent years the University's interpretation of the needs of the public it serves has been mainly inspired by one dominant personality, with much resultant unrest. A more catholic Government would give wider satisfaction and disarm much hostility. A more catholic constitution of the Senate might be accompanied by the reservation to Government of the right of nominating two members of the Syndicate; this could be used to nominate, *e.g.*, a Muhammadan, when, as is usual, neither the Faculties nor the Senate elect one."[1]

92. Mr. J. R. Cunningham, the Director of Public Instruction, Assam, thinks that Musalmans and others should be adequately represented in the government of the University.[1] Mr. Langley says that "each community should be fairly represented, because each subscribes to the funds whereby the University is supported. By fair representation also the interests of various communities will be maintained."

93. Out of 38 Muslim witnesses who answered Question 22, Sir Ali Imam is definitely opposed to communal representation;

[1] Question 22.

Mr. Altaf Ali while agreeing with the views expressed by the deputation of Musalmans of Calcutta, does not favour special Muslim representation in connexion with the Calcutta University because of the benefits which the Dacca University is expected to confer on his community; all the other Muslim correspondents, besides the oral witnesses and Muslim deputations, to whom reference has already been made, urge the desirability of Muslim representation on the governing bodies of the University.

94. Sir Ali Imam's view is :—

" Except in residential arrangements, and in matters of food and religious discipline, no special arrangement is needed for any particular community. The highest branch of education should be open to all communities alike, and in my opinion the endeavour of the University should be to discourage sectarianism and not to emphasise them. In matters of study the needs of all the communities are very much alike, and the universities cannot regulate them with a view to the encouragement of the education of any particular community."[1]

95. Turning to Muslim correspondents in favour of Muslim representation, Mr. Z. R. Zahid Suhrawardy says :—

" The Muhammadan community, backward as it is in education, should receive special consideration, and for this purpose the representatives in the Senate should be increased so as to secure at least one-third of the number of Senators from the members of that community. On the Syndicate there should be the same proportion. Besides, every institution should have a few Muhammadan professors in the general line and not for Arabic and Persian only as at present."[1]

Maulvi Mohomed Habibur Rahman Khan, the Secretary of the All-India Muhammadan Educational Conference, writes that " the various communities should be adequately represented on the various executive and academic committees of the University. The proportion of the representatives of the Muslim community, considering its number and existing educational condition, should be 40 per cent."[1]

96. Khan Bahadur Mohammad Ismail, Vice-Chairman, District Board, Mymensingh, would divide the seats on the university bodies which are to be held by Indians equally between the Hindus and Musalmans.

" The needs and interests of the Muslim community should be safeguarded by adequate representation in the Senate as well as in the Syndicate. In the Senate besides the European members of the teaching profession, the number of

[1] Question 22.

seats should be equally divided between the Hindus and Muhammadans. The same proportion should be observed in the Syndicate also. The office of the Vice-Chancellor should be filled by a Hindu, European and Muhammadan in rotation."[1]

97. Mr. M. A. N. Hydari writes :—

"I am strongly of opinion that in the highest interests of university life, even from its purely academic side, it is necessary that the needs and interests of particular communities like the Muhammadan community should be specially considered in the government of the University, its courses of study and its residential and other arrangements."[1]

Mr. Wahed Hossain, the Secretary of the Bengal Provincial Educational Conference, says :—

"The Indian universities are intended for all races and communities inhabiting India, and they preside over the higher education of the children of all classes and denominations. Among the Indian races, the Hindu and the Muslim form an important section of the educated class as a whole. Naturally, the educated men who form these two communities are taking a keen interest in, and desire to associate themselves with, the affairs of the universities. But as a matter of fact, the Muslim element has hardly been represented in the several bodies which preside over the destiny of the Indian universities. They are almost entirely in the hands of one community only."[1]

98. Maulvi Abdullah Abu Sayied writes :—

"Rightly or wrongly there is a strong feeling amongst Muhammadans that though they are numerically superior to other communities in Bengal, and are making every effort to advance in education, very little regard is paid to their requirements in the University."[1]

99. Mr. Justice Abdur Rahim writes :—

"Speaking for the Muhammadans it is extremely important that they should be adequately represented in the government of the University, including the Senate, the Syndicate, the Board of Studies and the examining board, and also on the governing bodies of hostels, messes and lodgings. .... As for the courses of study, I would recommend that Islamic history be recognised at least as an optional subject."[1]

100. Taking the whole range of the recorded opinions it appears that of our correspondents of all nationalities who sent written answers to the question, 65 are against and 78 are in favour of communal representation in the government of the University.

IX.—Some remarks in conclusion.

101. We have thought it wise to set out the problem involved in the education of the Musalmans of Bengal, neither depreciating

[1] Question 22.

its difficulties nor seeking to conceal the existence of interests and views which are on the surface contending.

102. We desire at this point to draw a distinction in regard to the question of communal representation. In matters of educational administration, as in other branches of administration. communal representation may in the present conditions of India be necessary and for certain purposes we have advocated it. But we are convinced that in making appointments to the principal teaching posts of a university it would be fatal to depart from the principle that the best qualified man should be appointed without reference to his race or religion. The university which departs from this principle will not make the contribution which it could and should make towards the solution of those vexed and perplexing problems of national life of which the subject matter of this chapter is one.

103. The recommendations which we have decided to make will be found in the later chapters of our report. We think that a satisfactory solution of the difficulties is not unattainable. It may be found—we hope it will be found—partly in the establishment of Muslim colleges, halls of residence and hostels in which the tone of thought will be congenial to Musalmans and their way of life and worship observed; partly by endeavouring to ensure that, where there are considerable groups of Muslim students in any college, their tutorial and social needs should be provided for; partly through a reconstruction of the university which should welcome the erudition of Muslim teachers and other Islamic scholars, chosen for their eminent learning not from Bengal only but out of the whole Islamic world, and should furnish them with opportunities of teaching and research; but chiefly through the growth of a conviction that in the highest education of the Presidency Musalmans and Hindus should co-operate, each considerately respectful of the other's convictions and ready to preserve communal traditions within the wider framework of the university's corporate life.

CHAPTER VII.

The Education of Backward Classes.

1. The Education Commission of 1882 devoted special attention to the education of certain special classes of the Indian community. Among those special classes the Commission included aboriginal tribes and low castes. Their reason was "the wide sympathy which their backward condition and slender opportunities had excited."[1] To-day the problem is one of vital importance. The aboriginal tribes and low castes still send very few students to the University, but ambition is beginning to stir this long-voiceless mass to a definite and persistent effort to educate its children to rise in the world. Conversely there are signs of an awakening of the more advanced sections of Bengali society to the claims of the depressed and the more primitive classes. The Bengal official educational reports testify to the gradual disappearance of the prejudice, once universal among the higher Hindu castes, to their children sitting in school side by side with low caste pupils. We read in the recent Quinquennial Review of Education in Bengal of a Bengal Social Service League and of a society for the improvement of the backward classes of Bengal and Assam[2] and we have referred elsewhere to the work done by the students of St. Paul's Cathedral Mission College, Calcutta, among the low caste inhabitants of a neighbouring *busti*.[3]

2. We cannot do more than allude in passing to this aspect of the problem of the future of Bengal, and indeed of India, but for the better understanding of this phase of that momentous question, we reproduce below from the Fifth Quinqueninal Review of the Progress of Education in Bengal to which we have just referred, a list of depressed classes of the Presidency with an estimate, based on the figures collected for the 1911 census, of the

[1] Report of the Indian Education Commission of 1882, Chapter IX, para. 553.

[2] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17, Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), Chapter XI, para. 610.

[3] The term *busti* signifies a collection of huts.

numerical strength of each. The Educational Commissioner with the Government of India has lately attempted to define three classes of people as falling within the category of depressed classes, *viz.*:—(*a*) the depressed classes proper, *i.e.*, untouchables, (*b*) aboriginal and hill tribes, and (*c*) criminal tribes.

(*a*) Depressed classes proper :—

Caste or tribe—	Number.
Bagdi	1,015,738
Bauri	313,654
Bhuinmali	91,973
Bhuiya	69,044
Bhumij	90,282
Chamar	136,533
Dhoba	228,052
Dom	173,991
Dosadh	45,863
Hari	173,706
Kaora	112,281
Kora	46,497
Mal	108,163
Muchi	455,236
Munda	67,252
Namasudras	1,908,728
Oraon	165,337
Pod	536,568
Santhal	669,420
Sunri	119,325
Tiyar	215,270

(*b*) Aboriginal and hill tribes :—

Chakmas	54,362
Garos	42,728
Hadis	26,212
Hajangs	25,016
Koches	46,619
Tiparas	35,950

(*c*) Criminal tribes :—

Bediyas	8,503
Gains	380
Kaoras (24-Paraganas)	64,483
Lodhas	7,403[1]

The list above is arranged in accordance with the classification of the Educational Commissioner and it excludes certain

[1] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17. Fifth Quinquennial Review by W W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), Chapter XI, para. 608.

peoples who, though they cannot be classed as depressed classes, are not Bengali Hindus or Bengali Musalmans, *e.g.*, Nepalees, the Bhutias and the Lepchas of the Darjeeling hills, the Meches of the Duars, and the Maghs, etc. The education of these peoples presents a special problem which is not altogether dissimilar from the problem of the education of the depressed classes proper, though it is not by any means identical with it. These peoples are not taken into account in the figures which are quoted in paragraph 4 below.[1]

3. The principal home of the Namasudras is in the Dacca, Mymensingh and Faridpur districts of the Dacca division. Santhals live in considerable numbers in the Bankura, Birbhum and Midnapore districts of the Burdwan division. They are also found in the Dinajpur district of the Rajshahi division. The Garos, Hadis, Hajangs and Koches, who belong to the Bengal Presidency, inhabit the foot of the Garo Hills in the Mymensingh district. Chakmas, Tiparas and Maghs are to be found mainly in the Chittagong hill tracts and in the Cox's Bazar sub-division of the Chittagong district. The Darjeeling hills are peopled by Nepalees, Bhutias, Lepchas and Tibetans, while the tea gardens of the Duars in the Rajshahi district are worked by coolies of many different races, chief among which are the Oraons, the Kols and the Mundas, whose home is in Chota Nagpur.

4. According to the latest official returns there were, on the 31st March 1917, actually under instruction in Bengal 77,054 boys and 8,973 girls of the depressed and other backward classes. Of these 194 boys were in university colleges : 2,022 boys were in the high stage of instruction, 2,684 boys and 23 girls were in the middle stage ; and 70,861 boys and 8,908 girls were in the primary stage. The remainder, *viz.*, 1,293 boys and 42 girls were in special and indigenous schools.[2] One point is immediately suggested by these figures, namely, the small proportion of pupils in special and indigenous schools. The Indian Education Commission of 1882 recommended that the principle laid down by the Court of Directors of the East India Company in their despatch of 1854 and again in their letter to the Government of

[1] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17. Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), Chapter XI, para. 608.

[2] *Ibid.*, para. 611.

India of the 20th May, 1857, and repeated by the Secretary of State in 1863, *viz.*, "that no boy be refused admission to a Government college or school on the ground of caste" be reaffirmed, and be applied "with caution to every institution, not reserved for special races, which is wholly maintained at the cost of public funds, whether provincial, municipal or local." At the same time the Commission recommended "that the establishment of special schools or classes for children of low castes be liberally encouraged in places where there are a sufficient number of such children to form separate schools or classes, and where the schools already maintained from public funds do not sufficiently provide for their education."[1]

5. One of the most remarkable features of the social life of Bengal during the last 50 years has been the sustained effort made by certain sections of the lower castes, and, particularly the Namasudras, to rise in the social scale. Towards the total 86,027, which represents the pupils of the depressed classes under instruction, the Namasudra community contributed no less than 41,105—35,932 boys and 5,173 girls. One hundred Namasudra boys were reading in university colleges; 1,489 boys were in the high stage of school instruction, and 1,690 boys in the middle stage. In the course of the last few years special hostels for Namasudra students have been established at Dacca, Faridpur and Barisal; Dr. Mead of the Australian Baptist Mission has organised a high school for Namasudras at Orakandi in the *bhil* tract of the Faridpur district. The Namasudras themselves have started associations in various centres and are making strenuous efforts to spread education among their community. They have recently protested to Government against being classified with the depressed classes. They consider that this classification is a serious set-back to their social advancement.

6. There has been a remarkable increase in the demand for English education among the peoples of the Darjeeling hills. The Nepalees are taking the lead, but the Bhutias and Lepchas are not lagging far behind. This is largely due to the admirable educational work which is being done by the Church of Scotland Mission from its centre at Kalimpong. The present Deputy Inspector of

[1] Report of the Indian Education Commission of 1882, Chapter IX, para. 591.

Schools in the Darjeeling district is a Lepcha, and Kumar Tobgye of Bhutan, who was himself educated at St. Paul's School, Darjeeling, has a flourishing school at his Jong at Ha in Bhutan. The Maharaja of Bhutan has a similar school at Pumthang in Bhutan. The Ha School is moved every winter to Kalimpong, so that the boys may come under the influence of Dr. Sutherland and the other missionaries of the Church of Scotland Mission and see how a sub-division of British India is worked. We make suggestions elsewhere for the teaching of the language and literature of Tibet at the Calcutta University

7. The Rev. Hedley Sutton of the Australian Baptist Mission at Mymensingh told us that the Garos were beginning to come forward for secondary education and that a few of their most promising boys were looking forward to a university course. The Fifth Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in Bengal states that, on the 31st March, 1917, 1,780 pupils of the Garos and other primitive races, which inhabit the foot of the Garo Hills, were under instruction and that of these 134 were in secondary schools.[1]

8. Government maintains a high school at Rangamati in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, and attached to this high school there is a special teachers' training class for Chakmas and Tiparas. Free education is provided for the hill boys and girls of the Chittagong Hill Tracts and for the Arakanese Maghs of the Cox's Bazar sub-division. There is a hostel attached to the Rangamati High School at which 50 hill boys are boarded free. Government has also recently provided a special hostel in connexion with the Rangpur Zilla School for boys of the Rajbanshi community. Special scholarships are also provided by Government for children of backward classes.

9. But the way has not yet become altogether smooth for the aspiring student who comes from the backward classes. Students of such communities as the Namasudra find it difficult to get accommodation in Calcutta. The late Vice-Chancellor of the University of Calcutta recently brought a resolution before the Bengal Council the object of which was to obtain a grant from Government for the construction of a special hostel for the

[1] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17, Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), Chapter XI, para. 614.

students of these classes. In the course of the debate Dr. (now Sir) Deva Prasad Sarbadhikari told the Council that, in order to obtain admission to a hostel, a Namasudra had been known to assume a Kayastha name and to pose as a member of that caste. We hear that the Government of Bengal has recently made a special grant to the Calcutta University, on the strength of which some special messes are now being provided in Calcutta for students belonging to the Namasudra and other communities who are outside the Hindu caste system.

10. The Dacca University Committee remarked that convenient arrangements could not be made to receive Namasudras and others of lower castes in the general hostels and that it was to be feared that this general difficulty sometimes stood in the way of their receiving university education. The Committee therefore proposed that an extra hostel should be attached to the Dacca College and that it should be used for the accommodation of a special caste or castes such as the Namasudras.[1]

11. It is important that the new university and other educational authorities should give careful consideration to the needs and interests of the now backward classes, under which term we include the aboriginal peoples. We shall therefore suggest in later chapters of this report that :—

(*i*) the proposed new central authority for secondary and intermediate education should appoint a standing committee to advise it on questions affecting the educational welfare of these sections of the community[2] ;

(*ii*) in the future developments of secondary and intermediate education[3] contemplated in this report, the needs of the now backward classes for hostel accommodation should be met[4] ;

(*iii*) in Calcutta, and so far as may be found necessary elsewhere, intercollegiate hostels should be established in order to meet their requirements[5] ;

---

[1] Dacca University Committee's Report, Chapter XIII, page 72, para. 6 (Calcutta, 1912).

[2] Chapter XXXI, para. 27.

[3] Chapter XXXI, paras. 31-47, also Chapter XXXII.

[4] Chapter XXXIX, paras 24 and 26.

[5] *Ibid.*, para. 12.

(*iv*) in the University of Dacca a hostel should be provided for special castes such as the Namasudras who might otherwise find a difficulty in obtaining university education.[1]

We desire that the new opportunities, including those of secondary and university education and of preparation for the medical and teaching professions and for industrial and commercial careers, should be open effectively to all students of ability and promise.

[1] Chapter XXXIII, para. 158.

CHAPTER VIII.

The High Schools as the Foundations of the University.

I.

1. Except in the United States of America, in Canada and perhaps in Japan, we find nothing comparable to the eagerness for secondary education now shown in certain districts of India. During the five years 1912-17 secondary schools of all grades in Bengal increased by 19 per cent., and the number of pupils in them by 33 per cent.[1] Taking the case of boys alone (more than thirty-three times as many boys as girls were receiving education in secondary schools in 1917) the numbers of high schools and of pupils in them have each increased by about one-third in the course of the quinquennium. The general position is that in Bengal the number of boys and girls receiving secondary education is about nine per thousand of the population.

2. This proportion is about three per thousand less than that which was estimated to be true of England in 1895. But in England the statistics at that time were very incomplete and during the last twenty years the number of pupils receiving secondary education has largely increased. It cannot be said therefore that the percentage of the population attending secondary schools in Bengal is in itself exceptionally large. But, as compared with western standards, it includes a very small number of girls and is wholly disproportionate to the number of pupils receiving elementary education. In Bengal the secondary schools bear part of the work which in England falls upon the primary schools.

---

[1]

	Year.	
	1912.	1917.
Number of secondary schools	2,224	2,649
Number of boys and girls in secondary schools	300,319	399,682

Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17, pages 29-30.

On the other hand, much that is done by higher secondary schools in England is done in Bengal by colleges associated with the University.

3. In the West, the desire for increased facilities for secondary education draws its strength from a belief that, under the stress of modern life, the alertness of mind which a good education may engender, and the steadiness which it may impart both to judgment and character, are of increasing value alike to the individual and to the community. The economic and social conditions of to-day are liable, by reason of forces which are world-wide in their range of operation, to unforeseen fluctuation and change. They offer therefore new opportunities to resourceful initiative and attach heavy disqualification to ignorance and unpreparedness. For this reason the whole nation is concerned in so improving its educational equipment from the primary school to the university as to increase the number of trained minds and vigorous personalities at its command.

4. The individual also feels the need and advantage of better education. As industry and commerce extend, and as the functions of public administration grow more complex, a young man has a wider choice of careers. As a rule, however, he needs a good education in order to take advantage of the choice. His choice will be wiser if he has learnt at school and college what he is fitted for and what career he prefers. Thus, the widening of opportunities leads to a desire for better colleges and schools. But, as schools and colleges improve, it becomes possible to exact a higher standard for admission to the professions and the public service. There are more candidates and keener competition. In general, the boy who from the first has had the better training stands the better chance. Therefore a far-seeing parent wants a better education for his children. The demand grows for schools which give a good education at a low fee.

5. But, though private individuals profit by having such a school within reach, the advantage is not only theirs. The community gains from the average standard of training being raised. That a clever boy should have a better chance of coming to the front may be a special advantage to the boy himself and to his family, but it is also an advantage to the whole community, which gains by opening careers to talent. What however the community has to insist upon is something which the individual

boy may not directly profit from, namely, the raising of the general level of education among the people at large. This may in some respects lessen the clever boy's chance of getting exceptional advantage. But in the long run his abilities will be of more service to the State if exceptional talent is backed up by a higher standard of education in the community as a whole. Such higher standard however can only be secured by collective action. It is not enough to encourage exceptional minds, while neglecting improvements in the training of average minds. This is why the new movement in education concerns both private individuals and the State. It has a selective tendency but also a collective aim. Those who guide it have to keep in mind the needs of the exceptional boy and of the average boy. The exceptional boy must not be sacrificed for the sake of the average: the average boy must not be neglected through care being concentrated on the boy who is exceptional. This is the crucial difficulty in education when organised in the public interest upon a national scale. The difficulty can only be met by staffing the schools with teachers who can discriminate between the needs of the two types of boy and are competent to adapt their teaching to the requirements of each.

6. In Bengal the rising tide of interest in educational questions is partly due to this general movement, which is not local to the Presidency or even to India and affects nearly the whole world. But here special circumstances hem it into a narrow channel. In India there is a more limited choice of careers than in countries where industrial and commercial activities are more developed, and higher education is by social custom more strictly confined than in the West to certain social groups. Those groups in Bengal feel an economic pressure which grows more severe. Upon success in certain examinations the careers of their sons depend. Hence there is a rush to the schools which have the privilege of presenting candidates for the matriculation examination. This examination is the door through which all must pass before they can qualify themselves for a degree. And the degree has a pecuniary value as well as an educational significance. Hence comes the pressure upon the recognised secondary schools. But (except in a few cases) the schools think only of the matriculation. They make it, and it alone, their aim. They are driven to do so because the boys and their parents feel that, in the present conditions of life in Bengal, success in passing this examination is the one essential

reason for going through the high school course. Thus the aim of the schools is more and more narrowly fixed upon an examination. The examination takes account only of a part of what a secondary school should teach. The schools are so badly staffed that they fail to make the best use even of the course of preparation for this test, and fail even more completely in providing the rest of the liberal education which a school ought to give. The rush to the schools over-crowds their classes and makes their teaching even more inadequate. But every year the pressure grows greater, and the schools are forced by it more deeply into the rut of examination routine. Thus an educational movement, which has in it many elements of generous purpose and great possibilities of public advantage, runs in a wrong channel and fails to fertilise the intellectual life of the country.[1]

7. In Bengal it is not only more education that is called for by the needs of the time but (and still more urgently) a new spirit and a new outlook in education. And this new spirit and new outlook are needed in schools and university alike. The future well-being and progress of the Indian universities, their escape from the undue pressure of examinations and from the bad tradition which fetters their intellectual life, depend in a great degree upon their being supplied with students who have received a much more intelligent and invigorating preparation at school. Conversely the schools (if the salaries of the teaching profession are improved) will draw from the reformed universities a larger supply of teachers qualified to bring a new spirit into school work and to give life and meaning to those humane and scientific studies which are indispensable to a liberal education. The fortunes of these two great factors in national education are interdependent. The one cannot long flourish if the other flags.

8. "We cannot expect to have good colleges without good schools," said Lord Curzon to the Educational Conference at Simla in 1905. The evidence which we have received applies this judgment to Bengal. "The root of the matter lies in the reform of secondary education," are the words of Dr. Brajendranath Seal.[2] Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee speaks of the improvements in primary and secondary education which are the necessary

[1] Chapter IX, paras. 37-43.

[2] Oral evidence.

"groundwork for improvement in the superstructure of university education."[1] Mr. J. N. Gupta, District Magistrate, Rangpur, holds that "no scheme for improving the standards and methods of university education will be complete and effective without a simultaneous reform in school education at all the different stages."[2] And Mr. Garfield Williams, though we do not understand him to mean that all the reforms which he enumerates must be attempted simultaneously, writes that "secondary education depends on primary education, and university education upon both. No reform of the universities can be undertaken with any hope of success while the secondary schools remain as they are."[3]

II.

9. In our journey through Bengal in the cold weather of 1917-18, we found almost everywhere a demand, often an eager demand, for more high school education. Our experience confirms the statement made to us by Mr. Surendra Mohan Sen Gupta that "there is a very great craving for education in Bengal at the present time."[4] At Bankura, for example, in Western Bengal,[5] an influential deputation informed us that the middle classes in that neighbourhood are sending more boys to high schools and that the families in humbler station are becoming more ambitious for the education of their sons. Parents, they told us, make great sacrifices for education. The boys themselves are eager for it and, knowing the risks and difficulties, readily take their chance of winning at the end of their school and college course a position commensurate with the time, toil and expense involved in a prolonged course of training. At Dacca the strength of the current now pressing towards high school education is at once felt by those who visit the schools or meet representatives of the district in conference. Mr. Gopal Chandra Sarkar, one of the second inspectors of schools of the Dacca division, speaking

[1] Additional memorandum submitted at the time of his oral evidence; General Memoranda, page 384.

[2] General Memoranda, page 424.

[3] *Ibid.*, page 455.

[4] *Ibid.*, page 375.

[5] We use the expressions 'Western Bengal' to designate the Presidency and Burdwan divisions; 'Eastern Bengal' to designate the other three divisions—Dacca, Rajshahi and Chittagong.

from matured experience and intimate knowledge of local conditions, gave us a vivid impression of the demand for high school training but a discouraging account of the work which the schools are now able to achieve. He thought that there were fewer good high schools and more bad high schools than in former days. It was at Dacca also that another witness, feeling strongly the intensity of the desire for high school and college training, went so far as to urge, though with doubtful cogency, that "bad education is better than no education." He was on much less assailable ground when he contended that it would be an error to restrict in any way the range of educational opportunity. At Mymensingh, the volume of Muslim demand for high school education on modern lines strikes the visitor with force. An experienced head master gave us a pathetic account of the state of some of these Muslim boys who come from the outlying country districts, very poor and ignorant, anxious to get education and belated in finding access to it. Rai Bahadur Nisi Kanta Ghosh, who served as Chairman of the Municipal Council of Mymensingh from 1909-15, is strongly of opinion that the existing provision of high schools is seriously inadequate to the needs of the populous districts in that neighbourhood. The Rev. Hedley Sutton of the Australian Baptist Mission gave us at Mymensingh a graphic account of the flood of boys which pours into the town from the rural districts in order to get high school education, and of the dangerous temptations to which these lads are exposed in the unsuitable lodgings which are all that they can afford. He also drew our attention to another tributary stream which is beginning to swell the torrent. The Garos, an indigenous race to which his mission devotes special care, are already touched by ambitions for high school education. One boy of this race is now at the college at Serampore. The Garo boys who are being trained at the high schools will probably be employed as teachers in their own community or will obtain Government appointments in the police or in other branches of the public service. At Barisal a well-informed witness told us that there is need for an intermediate college in order to meet the demand now manifest among Musalmans as well as Hindus. All over Eastern Bengal Muslim boys are showing an increased eagerness for high school training, and Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hemayetuddin Ahmed, after reminding us

of the aversion from a modern education which is still felt by many Musalmans, urged the necessity for more schools and hostels to meet their requirements.

10. In many cases wealthy persons build a new school for their neighbourhood when they wish to further its interests or to commemorate the connexion of their family with the district. The favour with which this form of generosity is regarded shows how strongly Bengal believes in the value of education.

High schools in villages have, as a rule, grown out of middle, or even out of primary, schools. The establishment and development of these high schools have generally been the work of zamindars or of other persons of local importance. Thus the schools are connected with certain families, whose names they frequently bear. One instance of this kind of generosity and public spirit may be cited here. In the Hooghly district some of our number visited the village of Itachuna (near Khanyan station, E. I. R.). Rai Bejoy Narayan Kundu Bahadur is the holder of the zamindari; during his father's lifetime, he took to industrial work, and won considerable success as a railway contractor. When he succeeded to the zamindari, he retired from business with a fortune, and resolved to devote himself to the development of the estate. He has made an admirable system of roads. He has drained the land, filled up many small tanks and substituted several large and well-built tanks in their place. He has in this way raised the level of the village. He has built a large house for himself in the centre of his village and has instituted a model farm for the guidance of the cultivators, wherein he said that his chief difficulty was the absence of a trained expert to conduct experimental work, and finally he has provided a village hospital, well-equipped, and a good school covering all grades from the primary to the matriculation. The lower classes are open without fee to all village boys. The fees for the upper classes are small but graded.

But there is another side to the picture. Quarrels between zamindars are common in Bengal, especially between different branches of the same family. The schools thus become a cause of friction. In some cases, schools are alleged to have been established for the sole reason of ruining rival institutions. Teachers and pupils are said sometimes to be bribed to leave one school and to go to another. Law suits are started in the course of such

controversies, and, in the interests of a school which they support, landlords are charged with using terrorism towards their tenants. In the Chittagong division several schools have been burnt down during the last few years. No one has been convicted, but the circumstances pointed in most cases to incendiarism. The divisional inspector of schools recently issued a circular urging all school authorities to insure their buildings. Many have done so, and the practice of incendiarism has almost ceased.

11. At Daulatpur, which may strike an English visitor as being a Hindu counterpart of Lancing College, we met three important deputations representing the neighbouring town of Khulna. They gave expression to Hindu and Muslim opinion alike. Both communities desire an increase of facilities for high school and intermediate education. Those who spoke on behalf of the People's Association of Khulna told us that the pressure for more high schools comes not only from the middle and upper middle classes but from the cultivators, some of whom wish to raise the social status of their families by giving higher education to some of their sons. These more up-looking members of the cultivating class have ambitions towards a less humble station. They wish, we were told, their sons to win a position which would entitle them to more respect. Again, some of the cultivators think (with whatever little foundation for their hopes) that their sons may do better financially as professional men than if they remain on the land. Such are some of the new social and economic motives which are stimulating the educational awakening in this part of Bengal.

12. At Berhampur, in the more central region of the province, Rai Boikunt Nath Sen Bahadur, the Government Pleader and first unofficial chairman of the District Board of Murshidabad, spoke to us of the rush towards high school and college and urged that the education which the boys should receive ought to give more opportunities of scientific preparation for agriculture. The schools, he maintained, were overcrowded by boys whose one idea was to get into Government service or the law. A throng of boys of mediocre ability were spoiling the schools for the cleverer pupils, who in their turn were encouraged to make parrots of themselves by the current methods of preparation for examinations. Another experienced resident at Berhampur spoke with

concern of the headlong rush towards a too narrow type of higher education.

13. At Rangpur, the centre of a wide agricultural district, Mr. Aftabuddin Ahmed, Officiating Deputy District Inspector of Schools, reported to us a rapid increase in the demand for high school education in that part of Bengal both among Hindus and Musalmans. The desire for higher education is, there also, touching the cultivator class. Many parents in that class wish their sons to rise to a higher social position, and the key is in the high schools. But there are more strictly economic reasons for these new aspirations. A cultivator with a number of sons sends one of them to the high school with the hope of his going on to college and entering a profession. This boy is not wanted on his father's land. The holding is not large enough to support him as well as his brothers. But, if he goes to the high school (the witness told us), the boy is lost to the land. Other opportunities of doing well in an agricultural calling, apart from working on his father's land, might have offered themselves to him. No doubt, in his professional or official career, his early rural experience may be of some assistance to him. But the direct use of that experience is denied by clerical duties. And thus the agricultural districts are being drained of some of the abilities which, if turned towards an industrialised and more scientific farming, might have been more productive. The witness therefore urged that the courses of training in high schools, and still more in the intermediate stage beyond, should be made more scientific and practical, in order that high school education should no longer be a channel drawing the brighter boys away from rural avocations which need scientific development at the hands of young men of superior training and wide outlook. A similar view of the value of the service which a more scientific and practical kind of education might confer upon the agricultural districts near Rangpur was urged upon us by a deputation of Muslim representatives and by the District Magistrate (Mr. J. N. Gupta) himself. The latter speaks with exceptional authority, if only from the experience he has gained in his efforts to develope and guide the education of his district.

14. In spite of the difficulties caused by social conditions, the ideas of parents with regard to the education of their daughters seem to have been unconsciously affected by the increasing regard

which they are giving to the educational interests of their boys. If a man makes great sacrifices on behalf of his sons' education, he has at any rate to explain to his conscience why (if further sacrifice is at all possible) he refuses to make it on behalf of his daughters' education also. In some cases the girls themselves press the point on their father's attention. We were not surprised therefore to find in different parts of Bengal some indications that, ere very long, the higher education of girls may become numerically a more considerable problem than it is to-day. Sister Mary Victoria of the Clewer Sisterhood, the Principal of the Diocesan College, told us that "the demand for opportunities of professional and liberal education has increased among girls somewhat rapidly in recent years."[1] At Dacca, Sister Rhoda of the Oxford Sisters' Mission, speaking with deep sympathy of the self-effacement and unselfishness of Hindu women, and realising that modern westernised education is full of ideas and influences dissonant with some of the older Hindu traditions of the home, foresaw a growth of the desire for a kind of education which would not jeopardise the Hindu ideal of womanly self-abnegation, but at the same time would impart to the girls (along with much else that is valuable and in accord with the needs of the age) a knowledge of hygiene, of first-aid, of sick-nursing, of the care of babies and of little children, and of dietary laws.

15. Miss Irons, Inspectress of Schools, who spoke with a wide-ranging knowledge of present conditions in the immense district under her care, told us at Dacca that in Eastern Bengal there is a considerable increase in the demand for girls' education but not a rapid increase. The education as usually given might, she thought, to some extent detach girls from home sympathies but this was partly the result of the examination-craze. The problem of how to devise the right education for Indian girls is very difficult, but not in her judgment beyond solution, especially as it is still numerically small. The Secretary of the Hindu Girls' School at Barisal and Miss L. Sorabji, Principal of the Eden High School at Dacca, confirmed the view that greater facilities are needed for the secondary education of girls in Eastern Bengal.

[1] Oral evidence, printed at end of answers to Question 23.

III.

16. In the course of our inquiry we took every opportunity of conferring with school masters and of visiting high schools in the different districts of the Presidency, as it would have been impossible for us without such conferences and personal inspection (especially of the work of the matriculation classes) to deal, as we have been requested to do, with the question of a school final examination and to discharge that part of our reference which is concerned with the qualifications to be demanded of students on their admission to the University.

17. The views which were expressed at a conference at Berhampur by five head masters of high schools in that district give in a succinct form opinions which, save on one point, we found to be prevalent among experienced and thoughtful teachers throughout Bengal. The point in regard to which we found opinion divided (not only in the Berhampur deputation itself, but also in some other places) is the degree to which the vernacular should be made the medium of instruction in the high schools. To this question we return on a later page.[1] Apart from this, the views of the Berhampur deputation may be taken as typical of those which were submitted to us at many other centres.[2]

18. The head masters desired that the school curriculum should be enriched by the addition of two compulsory subjects—history and geography. Four members of the deputation urged that the school course should include, besides geography, specific teaching of other branches of science but that these should not be obligatory for the matriculation examination. Our witnesses felt that the results of present methods of teaching English are unsatisfactory, especially in view of the amount of time given to the subject. English they deemed to be absolutely indispensable to higher education in modern India. But not less indispensable in their judgment is a more systematic and scientific training in the use

[1] Chapter XVIII, paras. 76-99.

[2] Other conferences, at which valuable information about the relations between the high schools and the University was furnished to the Commission or to some of its members, were held at Bankura, Barisal, Burdwan, Comilla, Chittagong, Dacca, Hooghly, Malda, Mymemsingh, Rajshahi and Rangpur. We had the further opportunity of comparing conditions in Bengal with those in other provinces by conferences with experienced head masters and teachers in Allahabad, Madras and elsewhere.

of the vernacular. They held that teachers and boys alike would gain from using the vernacular as the chief (though not the only) medium of instruction.

19. Furthermore, the head masters emphasised the fact that the classes are at present too large and should be reduced in every case to thirty (as is already prescribed with regard to the lowest classes), the maximum of fifty now fixed for the two higher classes by the University regulations being the subject of special animadversion.[1] And they deplored the quite inadequate salaries now paid to assistant masters, who can hardly live on their stipends unless they obtain outside work, which usually takes the form of private tuition. Thus, in the judgment of these experienced head masters, the curriculum and staffing alike fall far short of the needs of the boys who are receiving secondary education in Bengal. Yet, though the schools are thus inadequate, the number of their pupils is increasing, in some cases rapidly, and the strain upon the capacity and resourcefulness of the teachers becomes heavier year by year.

20. At the time when Bengal is more than ever eager for higher education, and when the economic needs and intellectual aspirations of the Presidency call for the best that schools can give to the élite of the younger generation, the training which they offer not only fails as a rule to provide for modern requirements in point of scientific and other knowledge but is actually deteriorating in quality through the growing use of 'keys' and the practice of private tuition out of school hours. For as many as nine or ten hours a day the boys are in the class-room or at their books at home or are being privately coached. But, long as these hours are, far too long for the boys of that age, the time is not well spent. The boys' minds are not kept on the alert. There is too little mental gymnastic. The methods of teaching do not force the boys to think for themselves. And the excessive use of (a sometimes slipshod) English as the medium of instruction, though the process gives some of the pupils no mastery of the language, blunts the edge of what is taught and deadens the learner's mind. The educational hopes of Bengal are thus being foiled. Waste of time, waste of effort, and even waste of money (in spite of the

[1] Calcutta University Regulations, Chapter XXII, 5 (*b*) (i), (ii) and (iii).

starveling stipends paid to the teachers and in spite of all the other parsimonies practised by most governing bodies) is the verdict which the observer must regretfully pass upon the present work of the typical high schools of Bengal—all the more regretfully because he feels that the aptitudes of the boys deserve, and the economic necessities of the province demand, the most stimulating, practical and effective secondary education which skilfully trained teachers can give and the resources of the community afford.

21. The contrast between what parents hope to get from their sacrifices on behalf of their sons' education and what (in spite of the earnest efforts of head masters and of many of the teachers) the boys actually receive, is tragic. A vast population is turning, and rightly turning, its gaze towards the schools with a sanguine hope that from them the younger generation will derive that power of bearing responsibility which a good education is able to impart. These hopes, so far from being discouraged or allowed to grow dim, deserve to be met by the provision of better teaching, and by those other reforms for which experienced and thoughtful opinion seems to be prepared. It is on the weakness—and more than on the weakness, on the deadening ineffectiveness and intellectual sleepiness—of the high schools that the critic would lay his finger if asked to point to the capital defect in the higher education of Bengal.

22. A young Bengali civilian, Mr. B. K. Basu, was deputed in 1915 to make a special survey of the secondary schools in the Dacca district. In the course of his report he gave a just and sympathetic account of the present situation.

"People say we are discontented with our condition. We want to better ourselves. How are we to proceed in order to do so? The answer given in such cases is most often 'education.' If the answerer is further questioned as to what he actually means by education and what exactly he thinks education will do, he will probably have no clear answer to give. But it is not enough merely to have proved dialectically his want of clearness. For the vagueness of his mental condition is an important fact connected with human nature. Our longings are essentially vague, our hopes also are vague; our vision of the goal that we are going to attain also necessarily vague, but still one is persuaded that progress of any sort is attained thus and by no other means.....

Thus a 'clear prevision of ends' is not necessary for progress. What is wanted is discontent, but it must be discontent 'shot with the colours of

hope'—and I like to believe that both these conditions are realised in the desire for education that is evident in the Dacca Division.

Here also people have realised that their life is too narrow, too cramped, too self-centred, too sordid and too poor. They want better things and they go to school. Eventually perhaps most of those who have been to school find themselves the poorer for it and the rest become clerks or pleaders. But this does not damp their ardour. They have the faith that things will somehow be righted, that the path lies through this door and through no other.

A faith like this carries with it its own justification and I cannot proceed with my report without recording not only my regard for, but my entire faith in, such a faith."[1]

23. The spirit and scope of the secondary education which would justify the faith described by Mr. Basu in his report, are admirably defined in one of the answers of Mr. Ramananda Chatterjee to our questionnaire[2]:—

"In schools recognised by the Calcutta University, science generally speaking is not taught....For successful scientific training and work in youth and mature manhood, the scientific habit of mind has to be developed and strengthened in childhood, and the senses trained for the purpose of accurate observation. Manual dexterity and manipulative skill for the performance of experiments, and the devising of means, contrivances and methods, have also to be developed and increased by manual training in childhood. In schools, therefore, the teaching of science, nature study and manual training are required. It is not the quantity of scientific information imparted which matters. What is all important is the rousing and keeping alive of the thirst for investigation, the creation of the true scientific spirit.

As regards language and literature these are taught more from the grammarian's and lexicographer's point of view than to enable children in after-life to use a language for literary and business purposes. From early life children should be induced and encouraged to describe what they perceive, do and feel. They can be made to appreciate literature very early—though, of course, not analytically.

History and geography should be taught in connexion with each other. They should both be compulsory subjects of study and examination in high schools preparing for the matriculation examination. Old history should be made living by using contemporary history to illustrate and elucidate it. Contemporary events in India and foreign lands should be made the means of teaching geography.....The starting point in the teaching of geography should be the village or town where the school is situated. Any true historical incident, however trivial, or even some traditional or legendary story connected with the place, should be made the means of inter-linking the teaching of history and geography. Pilgrimages should be undertaken

[1] Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13—1916-17. Fifth Quinquennial Review by W. W. Hornell (Calcutta, 1918), page 98

[2] Question 1.

to well-known historical places, and the historical incidents connected therewith narrated there. History should be acted in class by the children impersonating historical characters—taking care to choose such countries, periods and occurrences as would not foment racial or sectarian hatred or jealousy."

24. The reaction of intellectual training upon moral character is a matter of fundamental importance in the psychology of education. Quickened by good teaching to observe accurately, to imagine frankly, and to reason logically, the mind is led inevitably to reflect on problems of conduct, to ask the reason for ethical judgments and to notice the shades of distinction between right and wrong. Roused to alert activity by a teacher whose mind is active and alert (and, especially in the non-specialised stage of education, very different aspects of knowledge may be touched upon in a single lesson) a child's mental powers are awakened so effectually that he becomes sensitive to the impression of many orders of fact.

25. Aptitude for observing things (though not equally strong in different minds and in every case individualised by natural bent) is latent in all human beings whose physical equipment is normal, and may, especially in early years, be highly developed under skilful guidance and trained to discriminating use. But this state of awareness, these powers of reflexion and of selection, which are indispensable to vigour of intellectual life, apply themselves not only to purely intellectual things, but also and the more quickly under the infection of an adult mind which is alive to these aspects of experience, to things æsthetic and moral. For it is an awareness of heart as well as of mind, a discipline of the will as well as of the reason, that are needed for the development of a character which is at once intelligent, sympathetic and firm. Hence it follows that, the more energetic the intellectual activities of a school, the more care should be taken to secure its moral soundness. With this end in view, the pupils should be given the steadying experience of strict though cheerful discipline. Further, they should receive ethical training through the suitable, though sometimes onerous, responsibilities of corporate school life. But they need also some degree of precise guidance in perceiving the shades of distinction between right and wrong and in apprehending the deeper sanctions of upright conduct. Along with this many-sided training (which, under watchful but sympathetic supervision,

should be so devised as to wear as far as possible the aspect of self-training) the bodily powers of the pupil should be carefully tended and developed, because a healthy physique is favourable both to mental activity and to moral self-control.

26. It is with reference to these aspects of the problem of secondary education in Bengal that Mr. Panchanandas Mukherji of Presidency College urges in his evidence that not only intellectual fitness but physical fitness are important in preparation for the university and, as he would doubtless add, also for the non-academic careers for which boys may be prepared in secondary schools. He writes as follows[1] :—

"Every school must have its physical director, and physical training must be compulsory for every student. Manual practical training of a useful character should form part of the school curriculum.....Above everything else, the moral tone of our schools should be raised. They should be not only coaching institutions for the matriculation examination; they should be also the medium for man-making and character-forming. I had my early school education in a school then known as the Arya Mission Institution; there we had daily prayers just before the commencement of the work of the school; we had daily religious discourses delivered by pious teachers; we saw on all sides Sanskrit and Bengali religious sayings and mottoes; in short, there was a moral atmosphere about the school which had an unconscious, but real and powerful, effect on our character. Such an atmosphere must be created in every school. The system of school education must be considerably improved on the above lines, if there is to be a real reform of our university education. The root of the problem of higher education in Bengal lies in the schools, which must, therefore, be manned by really efficient men with good pay and prospects."

IV.

27. "The Indian student, like any other student," writes Mr. Justice Abdur Rahim,[2]

"starts with considerable genuine intellectual curiosity, as anyone who really knows Indian children must admit. It is true at the same time that this curiosity is, in many cases, gradually killed in the schools and the colleges. The responsibility lies entirely with the system and with the teachers. There are very few teachers who think it their business to understand the student, to help in the opening of his mind, and to encourage its expansion."

"On present lines," writes Mr. Patrick Geddes, "we inhibit and spoil more minds than we educate."[3]

---

[1] Question 8.

[2] Question 16.

[3] Question 13.

28. But, though we feel the force of these strictures, we wish to express our sympathy with those teachers (and they form the overwhelming majority of their profession) who have to work under conditions highly adverse to elasticity of mind, to self-culture and to a cheerful contentment with their professional prospects and situation. Few of them have had any professional training for their duties. Good libraries are rarely within their reach. Many are burdened with out-of-school duties in the private tuition by which they eke out their incomes. Their difficulties in school are increased by the mixing up in many of the classes of the schools of older and backward youths with boys more advanced for their years. Mr. Jogendranath Bhattacharya deplores the lack of a sufficient number of trained and qualified teachers who can be employed in the lower classes of the high schools—and it must be remembered that in the lower classes of a secondary school the work done, whether well or ill, is of high importance to many a boy's future development of mind and habits. Even of the teachers in Government schools he writes in a report which was presented to us :—

"Their pay and prospects have not been commensurate with their responsibilities. This is to a certain extent inseparable from the accidents of the arrangements under which a mass of heterogeneous appointments with varying degrees of responsibilities have been grouped in a graded service."

29. "Under the existing system," writes Mr. Panchanan Sinha, Principal of the South Suburban College, Calcutta, "teachers are looked upon as the 'rejects' of all the other professions, and teaching to many is only a temporary expedient."[1] With many others of our witnesses and correspondents, Mr. Nritya Lal Mookerji, Principal of the Broja Mohan College, Barisal, points to what is doubtless the chief, though not the only, cause of this condition of affairs.

"The teaching line is so ill-paid that it has become the refuge of failures from all other lines. Proper methods will be useless without the right men as teachers. The status of the teacher has got to be improved, and better salaries, with a liberal system of provident funds, should be provided not only in all schools, secondary or primary, but also in colleges. To obtain the desirable class of men who will turn out better work, it is necessary to make the line attractive by raising salaries and allowing scope for greater freedom in such matters as the selection of text-books, the methods of examination, etc."[2]

---

[1] Question 16.

[2] General Memoranda, page 321.

30. On this subject, Dr. Brajendranath Seal makes some interesting observations,[1] which though referring expressly to the ancient Hindu schools, would apply also in many respects to the older traditions of Muslim education.

"The teaching profession (or service) is an underpaid one all the world over. In the East, till recently, and of old in the West, the teachers gained in veneration what they lost in social affluence or ease. India did something more, in making 'Poverty with Learning' the acmé of social respectability. .....In Hindu India (ancient and mediæval), the State (or the nobility) provided, through the *Chatuspatis*, *Ashramas*, and *Vihàras*, for the higher branches of learning and arts. To this was added the communal provision in the villages and towns for what may be called a primary practical education through grants of *Vrittis* in the Mahajani schools, which were the secular successors of the old village schools in Buddhist India conducted by monastic brotherhoods. The net educational result was a free and very widespread system of higher and secondary as well as of primary education, for a parallel to which, in the Middle Ages or earlier, we must go farther East, in fact to China, Burma and other Buddhist countries. As the Hindu social system was based on a compulsory, and practically free, secondary or higher education for the *Dvijas* or twice-born classes (not necessarily priests or monks) irrespective of wealth or social position, learning became to the poor *Dvija* his portion in life. All this is now changed, and we must build up a new (and a better) system, though carefully drawing what lessons we can from the traditions of our past. To appeal to the old Indian *Adhyapaka's* (teacher's) virtue of self-denial in a modern organisation, or to seek to revive the *Gurukula* (or *Gurugriha*), would be a futile anachronism. We must provide for the teacher's respectability in the current measure of value (pay) and secure for him an assured subsistence adequate to his efficient functioning and with due regard also to that ideal of complete living, of vital breadth and expansion as well as of vital intensity and a free personality, which is the very breath of modern culture, and which we must not deny to the purveyors of that culture any more than to other labourers worthy of their hire in the communal or social organisation."

But, as Matthew Arnold once wrote, "In order to carry on the war with ignorance, it is necessary to have the sinews of war."

V.

31. We shall now recount the impressions which, whether singly or in groups, we have formed of some of the schools preparing or intending to prepare boys for the matriculation examination of the Calcutta University. Further reference to the work which is being done in the high schools for girls we reserve for the

[1] General Memoranda, page 371.

later chapter in which this aspect of the educational problem is discussed.

First, we shall describe as being in point of structure typical, the organisation of a well-conducted and popular high school in Calcutta which is doing highly creditable work on conventional lines.[1] After this, we shall speak of two other high schools in Calcutta which have more distinctive marks of originality, and of one of those high schools in the mufassal which are endeavouring to engage more closely the interest of the parents in the school-life of their sons. To complete this review of what representative secondary schools of different types are achieving under present conditions we shall give our impressions of what is called a 'B' class in which the work is largely practical and does not lead up to the University matriculation examination, and a description of a successful attempt to introduce physical science into the course of study of a high school at Bhowanipur.

Second, we shall record our impressions of some high schools, both in Calcutta and in the mufassal, in which the conditions of work are so bad as to call urgently for drastic reform in a system which allows such institutions to receive recognition.

Third, we shall describe two schools, which, in different ways and for different reasons, are of outstanding interest and show what possibilities of exceptional excellence lie in the secondary education of Bengal.

V(*a*).

32. The Oriental Seminary, a large and carefully organised high school housed in extensive buildings in Calcutta, might be taken as a type of the schools which give secondary education upon accepted lines to great numbers of boys. But in order to give an account of the organisation and work of a school of this kind, we

[1] In this high school, as in most others in India, each class is treated as the unit for collective instruction in all the subjects of the course assigned to it. The effects of this system in restricting the opportunity which can be given to individual boys to take more advanced work in subjects for which they show special aptitude, are discussed in paras. 35-37 below.

shall describe only one institution, choosing for this purpose the South Suburban School at Bhowanipur, Calcutta.

33. This school gives instruction in two buildings to twelve hundred boys. Their ages range from seven to twenty. Between seven and eight is the usual age at which boys enter the school. Nearly all of them live in Calcutta, and in the vicinity of the school buildings. The authorities have to refuse many applications for admission, as the school is popular and has a large connexion among families in prosperous circumstances. The governing body therefore has no reason to concern itself with the conditions under which its pupils live. The South Suburban is organised in nine classes. In the four lowest of these classes the maximum number of boys in accordance with the University regulations, is thirty. The middle three classes (the lowest of these three being the critical point in the progress of the average boy) have a maximum of forty. But, again in compliance with the regulations of the University, the two highest classes each contain as many as fifty boys. Because of the large numbers which have to be dealt with, the classes are duplicated or triplicated in parallel divisions at each of the ascending tiers in the structure of the school. Up to the third class from the top, there is a uniform course of study for every boy in each of the successive classes or groups of parallel classes. But in the third class from the top each pupil, while taking the common core of obligatory subjects—(vernacular, Sanskrit, English and elementary mathematics),[1] has to choose two other subjects out of five optional alternatives. His choice lies between history, geography, mechanics, additional Sanskrit[2] and additional mathematics. In this school, history and additional Sanskrit are the optional subjects which are most commonly taken; geography is the next in popularity; additional mathematics is less frequently chosen; mechanics only by a few.

34. The whole class is taken as a unit in all the subjects of its assigned (or, in the three higher classes, of its chosen) course. Within each class there is no sub-division into 'sets' for different

[1] These are the obligatory subjects as taken in the school. The Calcutta University Regulations (Chapter XXX) allow a wide latitude of choice both under the head of languages and under that of vernaculars.

[2] The Calcutta University Regulations (Chapter XXX) allow alternatives to Sanskrit.

subjects; no redistribution of the boys according to their proficiency in this or that branch of study. The same boys learn together vernacular, Sanskrit, English and elementary mathematics, as well as in six of the lower classes history and geography, and in the three highest classes the two optional subjects chosen. When a boy has made his choice among the five alternatives, he is put into a class consisting entirely of boys who have fixed upon the same selection.

35. This treatment of each class, as the unit of collective instruction in all the subjects of the course assigned to it, is characteristic of high schools (and also of many other schools) in modern India. It is in this respect that their internal organisation differs from that which has been normal in most of the great public schools in England for the last seventy years and has now become customary in other English secondary schools. In the latter, within each main 'block' of three or four classes (or 'forms') in the vertical structure of the school, the boys are reclassified and redistributed for each group of the various subjects (modern foreign languages, mathematics, natural science) which lie outside the main trunk line of the curriculum. This difference between the modern English secondary schools and those of Bengal is of crucial importance. The modern Indian practice is like the German. It is unfavourable to individuality, but (if skilfully applied by trained teachers) it achieves a high level of average efficiency.

36. The older English method, as employed in the period anterior to the great reform of higher secondary schools which began gradually in England at the end of the eighteenth century, was to treat the whole class as a unit for all subjects, except for those subjects which were taught to individual boys by private tutors out of school hours, this being, at Eton especially, an important exception. The new and more individualising method came into English higher secondary education during the second phase of the industrial revolution, and the change reflects the regard for individual effort which was common to much of English thought at the time. On the other hand, the older German method of higher school education, as practised in the great boarding schools which were famous at the end of the eighteenth century, was to group the boys, according to their respective attainments in subjects lying outside the main course of

study, in a variety of sub-classes independent of the chief hierarchy of classes in the school. It was in the years 1809-25, at the time of the reconstruction of Prussian secondary education when Wilhelm von Humboldt, and his coadjutors or successors, Schleiermacher, Nicolovius and Süvern, reorganised the day-school system and raised it to a high level of intellectual and administrative efficiency, that the new method of treating the whole class as a unit for instruction in all the subjects of the curriculum was adopted and gradually became general. The change was connected with that phase of German (and especially of Prussian) activity which emphasised the importance of securing a high average level of intellectual competence and was unfavourable to any recognition of individual idiosyncrasies and aptitudes, if made at the cost of lowering the general average of merit or of avoidable expense in organisation.

37. In her modern phase of higher secondary education, India has followed the German plan, but unfortunately without the accompaniment of trained skill in teaching, which has redeemed the German method from some (though by no means from all) of its defects. Historical documents show no reason for thinking that the adoption of this plan in Bengal was due to any desire to arrive at the results which were congenial to the German organisers. The system of treating the class as a unit for all subjects of instruction was probably carried over, without any deliberate purpose but by a natural transition, from the practice of the elementary schools both of India and the West. Yet it is not unlikely that the organisers of the new system of secondary education in Bengal felt the collective education of groups of boys to be more necessary than careful regard for varieties of individual aptitude. And the collective method of keeping each whole class together for all subjects in the course of study is more economical than one which attempts to combine with its advantages those secured by a more individualising system.

38. A boy, if he enters the South Suburban School at seven or eight years of age, is put in the lowest class. For that class, and for those immediately above it, the course of instruction comprises vernacular, English, Sanskrit, mathematics, history and geography. One teacher gives to the boys in each of the lower classes their instruction in all these subjects. With such delays as the boy's

immaturity may render necessary or his backwardness require, the promotion is from class to class at annual intervals. The school year is from January to December. In the lower part of the school the class and its master sometimes move up together, but usually the class on its promotion comes under a fresh teacher. In the four higher classes in the school different masters teach the different subjects to the class, except that one teaches all the English subjects, *viz.*, the English language, history and geography. The critical stage is reached in class IV which is the fifth class from the bottom. This is the point in the school at which the boys need the most careful handling. It will be noticed that it corresponds to the period in life when most of the boys are experiencing a great physical change.

39. Each day's work in school includes five lesson-periods, and lasts from 10-30 A.M. till 4 P.M. with half an hour's break. Thus, with half an hour's interval, the boys are in class for five whole hours on end. On Saturday which is a half-holiday, the lesson-periods are confined to three. The head master, who has been a teacher for more than twenty years and has held his present office for twelve, thinks that in the lower classes three hours a day of class work would be enough for the boys, and in the higher classes four. The long hours during which a school boy is expected in Bengal to pore over his books or to sit in class strike the observer as uneconomical of time and likely to encourage dilatory habits of work. The hours of home-work are protracted. Many of the boys have private tutors who visit them, early or late, at home. Before an important examination, a boy will work ten hours a day—five of them at school (if he is actually attending school at the time), two hours in the morning before school begins and three hours in the evening when school is over. There are twelve weeks of holiday in the year (in May and June, six weeks; at the Puja holiday in October, four weeks; at Christmas, a fortnight), and in addition to this (and exclusive of Sundays) there are forty days on which, for reasons of public holiday or ceremonial observance, the school is closed. Matriculation candidates have an important test-examination at school in December, and at the same time the annual school examination is held for all the boys. It is spread over twenty-five days but no pupil has papers on every day. While the examination is going

on, class teaching is suspended. In the lowest forms, the examination is oral. In the higher, a boy has from four papers upwards. We had an opportunity of scrutinising a large number of the scripts and found that the average level of the work was satisfactory, some of the papers being excellently done. A report of each boy's work is sent to his parents five times a year.

40. The following table shows the distribution of lesson hours weekly in each class named. The arrangements in lower classes are, with modifications, the same.

Subject of instruction.	Class IV.	Class III.	Class II.	Class I (matriculation class).
Vernacular	3	2	2	2
English	6	8 (+1)	8 (+1)	8 (+1 or more)
Sanskrit	5	3	3	3
Mathematics	5 (or 6)	6	6	6
History (taught in English)	3	3*	3*	3*
Geography (taught in English)	2	3*	3*	3*
Additional Sanskrit	..	3*	3*	3*
Additional mathematics	..	3*	3*	3*
Mechanics	..	3*	3*	3*
Total number of hours in class weekly	24 (or 25)	26	26	26 (or more)

Each boy takes two of the five subjects marked with an asterisk.

The whole of the class, in which he is placed according to his choice of optional subjects, takes the same course.

41. The amount of time assigned to the vernacular in the course of instruction is small as compared with that given in schools in the West to the mother-tongue. It is to be regretted that there is not more systematic teaching of Bengali. The boys talk it at home. They talk it among themselves. The head master and one of his colleagues told us that most of the boys think in vernacular, even when they are listening to lessons in English. And the head master gave us an interesting result of his long observation. The boys who are put straight into class IV on entering this school from middle English schools, in which they have received nearly all their teaching through the vernacular, do better in mathematics, and in all other subjects except one, than the boys who have been through the lower classes of the South Suburban School in which almost all the teaching is in English. They are quicker in intelligence. They use their minds more. The one subject in which they are backward is English.

In this they do not catch up the boys who have been for some time in this school. The reason, the head master says, is that the boys from the middle English schools have had no careful training in English before they come. "They have simply been thrown into the pond to swim as best they could." They have been left to get what they could from hearing English used as a medium of expression. Of sound grammatical or phonetic training they have had none. And, conversely, the head master feels that in his own school the teaching of the vernacular might and should be improved.

42. In this well-known school, a school whose good repute draws to it many of the clever boys from the intellectual families of Calcutta, no science is taught, except mechanics. There are no laboratories. There is physical drill but no medical examination of the boys, nor is any record kept of their physical development. No attempt is made to organise the corporate life of the school. There is not a hall in which all the boys can be gathered together to hear an address or for any common purpose. Of definite moral instruction there is none; nor is there (nor, perhaps, under present conditions could there be) any religious teaching.

43. Two high schools in Calcutta bear the name of Mitra, in honour of their founder Biswesara Mitra, a devoted friend of education. They are sister schools under one management, the main institution in Harrison Road, the other in Bhowanipur. In the first and older of the two, hampered by accommodation which according to modern standards is inadequate, there were at the time of our visit 534 boys. The fee is Rs. 4 a month. In this school the maximum number of boys in any class is about 24. The keynote of its work is individual attention to the intellectual progress of each boy. The care bestowed upon backward boys, by means of re-classification and of separate teaching, is noticeable and praiseworthy. The head master takes pains to keep himself in close communication with the parents and guardians of his pupils. When a boy is doing badly at school for want of care at home, the head master invites by letter the parent or guardian to confer with him as to the treatment of the case.

44. Meetings of the class teachers are held to discuss the work of the boys. Careful arrangements are also made for the holiday tasks set to the pupils. The head master in a special letter

invites the co-operation of the parents and guardians in getting the boys to do their holiday tasks steadily and not in a feverish hurry at the last moment.

45. In this school, English is pronounced well. In a class for little boys English is taught by the direct method, and on the whole with good results. The course of study in the school has just been remodelled; manual training, drawing, and nature study have been introduced; the hours of teaching are four a day, with one half-hour's break. There are no organised school games. Some of the parents feel an objection to singing, which therefore cannot be introduced into the curriculum. There is no school hall in which the boys can all be assembled. The building is in a noisy thoroughfare, and the school has no play-ground.

46. The buildings and situation of the sister school in Bhowanipur are superior. In this school there were at the time of our visit 403 boys. The classes (nine in vertical succession but duplicated or triplicated by parallel sections) are all small, none containing more than thirty boys. Each lesson-period is forty minutes. In this school, which like its sister is under the management of a head master who inspires his colleagues with educational enthusiasm, the study and use of the vernacular are systematically encouraged. The course is so arranged that a boy who has gone through the whole school has acquired in his general reading an acquaintance with the outlines of European history. There is moral instruction, but no religious teaching. From time to time the head master addresses the whole school in the open air in the adjoining play-ground. The school is animated by an admirable spirit. A visit to it inspires strong hopes for the future improvement of secondary education in Calcutta.

47. An effort is being made at the Zilla School, Bankura, as in several other schools in the Presidency, to secure closer co-operation between parents and teachers. In this school, there were at the time of our visit 242 boys, 13 of them being Musalmans. With the exception of a few boys boarding in the hostel attached to the school, the pupils live with their parents or guardians. For purposes of school discipline, the town has been divided into quarters, the boys living in each ward or district being placed by the head master under the supervision of one of the teachers on the staff. It is the duty of this teacher to see the father or guardian

of every pupil in his district at least once a month and to report to the head master if there is anything unsatisfactory in the boy's health, conduct or progress. In this school, the working hours of which are five-and-a-half a day, there are compulsory school games in the afternoon for most of the boys.

48. In a few high schools in Bengal there are special classes, planned to give some manual and other practical training in preparation for the calling of an engineer. These classes are parallel to the matriculation class and the boys in them are not eligible as candidates for the University matriculation examination. Each is a 'modern side' leading direct to a practical career and not to the University. We took the opportunity of seeing one of these classes, which go by the name of 'B classes,' at work at the Zilla School, Rangpur. At the time of our visit the boys were attending a lesson at the adjoining Technical School. Two classes were at work, senior and junior, and there were six boys in each class. Two were between 16 and 17 years of age; one between 17 and 18; seven between 18 and 19; two between 19 and 20. Their manual work and laboratory work in physics and chemistry are done at the Technical School; the rest of their teaching they receive at the high school. The school hours are from five to six a day. Home work takes about two hours. The school hours are from 7—10-30 A.M. and from noon to 3-30. We had a conversation with all the boys in the class and put a number of questions to them. We found that everyone of them had taken the course at his own wish and not in deference to any pressure from his parents. One of the boys intends to settle in America as soon as he gets his certificate from the examining board, and thought, very wisely, that a practical training would help him in the New World. All the boys intended to become engineers or to enter business. The former regretted that they would not be able to enter the higher classes in engineering but would be limited to the apprentice classes. Nine of the boys were quite definite in their plans and knew exactly what they intended to do—five intending to open engineering workshops in towns. Eleven out of the twelve do manual work for pleasure at home. All had been up to the experimental dairy farm at Rangpur to see its work. Half of them were evidently fond of reading and their favourite books were well chosen. We were struck by the intelligence of the

boys and by the definiteness of their plans for their future careers. There are some signs that, given recognition in the form of a certificate which will enjoy as much public esteem as the University matriculation certificate, education of this type (liberal but not exclusively literary) may become much more popular in Bengal. But at present the B classes have failed to find public favour. They were started in Bengal in the year 1900. During the five years 1912-17 half of the ten classes which were at work at the beginning of the quinquennium have been closed for want of adequate support. "Any bifurcation of studies will fail, so long as the matriculation examination dominates the secondary school curriculum. No boy will go into a B class if in his parents' or his own estimation he has any chance of passing the matriculation examination." These words in the recently issued Fifth Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in Bengal[1] recall a statement made in 1886 by Mr. Tawney, then officiating as Director of Public Instruction in Bengal, that "the only way to make technical education really popular is to induce the Calcutta University to take it up."[2]

49. For more than a century what is now known as the Hindu School has been celebrated among the educational institutions of Calcutta. In its historic buildings the school still commands the loyal regard of many well-known Indian families in Calcutta. The number of carriages waiting at the gates for the end of school-hours shows from what well-to-do homes many of the boys are drawn. It is the more regrettable therefore that the salaries paid to the majority of the staff of teachers should be so low. It is also desirable that the course of study in the school should be modernised and enriched. The boys, who deserve the best education which can be provided for them, receive no training (except a little drawing) in the use of the hands. And, except mechanics, there is no teaching of physical science.

50. Yet within four miles of the Hindu School may be seen proof of the value of science teaching in the education of Indian boys. At the high school which is attached to the London Mis-

[1] Page 78.

[2] *Review of Education in India, with special reference to the Report of the Education Commission* by Sir Alfred Croft, Director of Public Instruction, Bengal (Calcutta, 1888), page 181.

sionary Society's Institution at Bhowanipur in the southern suburbs of Calcutta,[1] we had an opportunity of inspecting the teaching of science given by the head master, Mr. C. Headland, a former student of the Royal College of Science and a holder of the Teacher's Diploma of the University of Birmingham. He begins with nature study in the lower classes. From twelve to fifteen years of age the boys learn physical geography, physical measurements, physics, chemistry and mechanics. Mr. Headland lays great stress on practical work in science but uses no text-books. He finds the pupils responsive to science teaching. But all scientific subjects (except physical geography and mechanics) are dropped in the year before matriculation. The reason for this is that physics and chemistry are not allowed to be taken in that examination and therefore the parents wish their boys to devote their time to subjects which will be of direct assistance to them in passing it.

V(*b*).

51. We now turn to the darker side of the present situation.

The following account of a visit paid by some of our number to a high school in Calcutta shows how bad are the conditions under which the work of some of the secondary schools is done.

"The school occupies less than one-quarter of two stories of a quadrangular house. It is approached by a very dirty and dilapidated staircase, the corridors are in such disrepair that one must be careful of one's steps, and the dreary dinginess of the rooms can scarcely be exaggerated. On the lower floor are four narrow class-rooms round a dark little office and library; on the floor above, five rooms have been made immediately under the slates, in two cases by the simple device of putting up movable screens of dirty patched sack-cloth. The largest room might perhaps seat twenty-four; it is used for a class of fifty, who cannot possibly be accommodated with seats. The smaller rooms should at the most hold a dozen; they are used for classes of twenty to forty.

We did not see the school at work. Two classes were undergoing a test; and, to make room for them (or for another reason), all the other classes had been dismissed for the day. We were therefore unable to judge of the quality of the teaching. But there was a notable absence of all teaching appliances, such as maps, blackboards, etc.

For Rs. 322, a staff of 14 masters is maintained, including the head master himself and two of his brothers. The head master draws Rs. 60, the two brothers Rs. 20 apiece. The second master draws Rs. 33; his qualification

[1] The college was closed in March 1918, but the school will continue its work.

is that he is a plucked B.A. One master, a law student reading for his degree, draws Rs. 30 ; another a law student, draws Rs. 25 ; three others draw Rs. 20 and three Rs. 15. Of the teachers on Rs. 15, one has been on the staff since 1886, and another has served for 11 years. When asked how these miserable salaries were supplemented, the head master replied that some of the teachers did tutorial work, and that ' five or six ' of them (he did not seem to know which) lived in the hostel. Asked whether they received free board in the hostel, he replied that they were required to pay Rs. 16 per mensem. How the payment of Rs. 16 could be regarded as a supplement to a salary of Rs. 15 he did not explain, but it seems reasonable to suppose that the forty-five boys from the mufassal find it necessary to pay extra tuition fees to make up for the deficiencies of the school.

We next visited the hostel which houses these ' 5 or 6 ' masters and these forty-five boys. It consists of two fair-sized rooms at the top of an old rather broken-down house, together with several small cells opening off the main rooms. Here we found a row of strips of matting at right angles to the wall, all round each room ; at the head of each strip of matting a rolled up blanket ; and seated on each blanket, with his back to the wall, a boy ; all of them absolutely idle, without books or any other resources, staring before them. It is, of course, impossible that they can always sit here ; when they are not in the dirty and cramped class-rooms, their only refuge must be the street. They cannot work here. There is no kind of safeguard against the invasion of the evilest influences. Imagination fails to picture what they do in the rains, or in the hot weather.

Last year, from this seat of learning, 15 boys took the matriculation examination out of a class of 25 ; 9 passed, and 3 obtained a first division. We asked the head master what happens to those who are not sent up, or who fail. He did not know.

This institution for ' affording to mufassal boys the advantages of a Calcutta education ' is recognised by the University of Calcutta as a suitable place in which to obtain preparation for admission to the University. "

52. In 1917, the state of some of the Calcutta secondary schools was investigated by Mr. M. P. West on behalf of the Department of Public Instruction. In January 1918 he wrote as follows in a letter accompanying a report on nineteen of the schools :—

" There are in Calcutta a large number of educational institutions which are run chiefly or solely for profit as business ventures, making monthly profits of anything from Rs. 400 to Rs. 500 per month. They are schools which, were they managed as public institutions, might with their available funds provide a good education, but proprietorship saps all funds above that sum which must be expended for the bare conduct of the school. Owing to the present large and ignorant demand for education of any kind however bad, the proprietors are able to manage their schools at the lowest limit of efficiency without fear of loss of boys. Such parts of education as are most necessary but not understood by the parents, as for example, good discipline, social life, good physical conditions, a reasonable standard of

work in the classes, not being demanded, are not supplied. The schools rely for their popularity most of all upon their freedom in granting to the parents concessions and exceptions which a self-respecting institution would refuse."[1]

53. In a private secondary school in a mufassal town we found some of the conditions very undesirable. At the time of our visit two classes of boys were being taught in a stable in the back premises of the school. Another class was sitting in a dark ill-ventilated outhouse.

54. In many secondary schools in Bengal the buildings and sanitary arrangements are unfavourable to health. Dr. C. P. Segard, Adviser in Physical Education to the Department of Public Instruction, Bengal, reported to us in his oral evidence[2] that "the present condition of schools in Bengal is exceedingly bad with regard to hygiene and sanitation. The class room is dirty, the floor is seldom or never washed, and the desks and benches, windows and walls are filthy. Light and ventilation are given scant, if any, consideration." And Mr. W. C. Wordsworth, Officiating Director of Public Instruction, gave similar testimony. He writes[3]—

"I have been into a school class-room so dark, with no pretence at a window, that for some moments I was not aware of the little boys in it. They sat there without teachers, book, or paper, the head master explaining that these were useless in a room where they could not read. To a suggestion that they might do their work in the shade of the trees in the school compound, he replied that their parents would be dissatisfied if the boys were not in school.... This is an extreme case; but few teachers are alive to the necessity of good light, ventilation, proper arrangement of desks, etc. Hygiene is taught in the middle classes. I have known it taught in rooms intolerably stuffy."

55. The warmest advocate of economy and the most zealous upholder of traditions of simplicity would flinch from justifying some of the school class-rooms which we have seen. They are bad for the health of boys, injurious to their eyesight and incompatible with satisfactory methods of teaching and discipline. In education, there will always be need for the zeal and independent effort of private teachers and for the enterprise of private schools. But, except where there are large endowments or where high fees

[1] Fifth Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17 (Calcutta, 1918), page 41.

[2] General Memoranda, page 162.

[3] Question 18.

can be charged, secondary education cannot be provided adequately, or be maintained in due efficiency, without large subsidies from the public purse.

56. In this branch of education, the sphere of private effort must inevitably suffer contraction. The crucial question is how to find the right synthesis between private effort and public. In the meantime, as in England at the time of Dickens, the arguments of those who deem private effort of a worthy kind to be indispensable to the vigorous growth of national education, are weakened and discredited by the action of those whose enterprise is less educational than commercial, who make profit from purveying instruction which does not educate, and provide it under conditions which are hurtful to health.

V(*c*).

57. We are now able again to turn to a brighter side of the picture and to dwell upon the work of two schools of exceptional interest which (if such influence as theirs should extend widely through the Presidency) would encourage sanguine hopes for the future of secondary education in Bengal.

58. The school founded by Sir Rabindranath Tagore at Bolpur in the western part of the Presidency is widely famous both in India and in the West. It is a boarding school for boys; situated on a rolling upland in open country, and combining, in its course of training and methods of discipline, Indian tradition with ideas from the West. With regard to the general work of the school it must suffice to say that it is no small privilege for boys to receive lessons in their vernacular from one of the most accomplished and celebrated writers of the age. No one who has seen the poet, sitting bare-headed in a long robe in the open veranda of a low-roofed house—the wide hedgeless fields stretching to the distant horizon beyond—with a class of little boys, each on his carpet, in a circle before him on the ground, can ever forget the impression, or be insensible to the service which Sir Rabindranath Tagore renders to his country by offering to the younger generation the best that he has to give.

59. It is Sir Rabindranath's strong conviction that, while English should be skilfully and thoroughly taught as a second language, the chief medium of instruction in schools (and even

in colleges up to the stage of the university degree) should be the mother tongue. He has four reasons for this belief; first, because it is through his mother tongue that every man learns the deepest lessons of life; second, because some of those pupils who have a just claim to higher education cannot master the English language; third, because many of those who do acquire English fail to achieve true proficiency in it and yet, in the attempt to learn a language so difficult to a Bengali, spend too large a part of the energy which is indispensable to the growth of the power of independent thought and observation; and, fourth, because a training conducted chiefly through the mother tongue would lighten the load of education for girls, whose deeper culture is of high importance to India. He holds that the essential things in the culture of the West should be conveyed to the whole Bengali people by means of a widely diffused education, but that this can only be done through a wider use of the vernacular in schools. Education should aim at developing the characteristic gifts of the people, especially its love of recited poetry and of the spoken tale, its talent for music, its (too neglected) aptitude for expression through the work of the hand, its powers of imagination, its quickness of emotional response. At the same time, education should endeavour to correct the defects of the national temperament, to supply what is wanting in it, to fortify what is weak, and not least to give training in the habit of steady co-operation with others, in the alert use of opportunities for social betterment, in the practice of methods of organisation for the collective good. For these reasons, in his own school at Bolpur he gives the central place to studies which can best be pursued in the mother tongue; makes full educational use of music ("music is in the air here, though at first the boys did not care for it") and of dramatic representation ('boys are wonderful actors'), of imagination in narrative and of manual work; of social service among less fortunate neighbours and of responsible self-government in the life of the school-community itself. For the achievement of these aims he feels that, if the right place is found for it, there is strong need for British influence in Indian education. And he speaks with gratitude of the help which he has had from English teachers in his own school, but he would refuse such help at all costs, as being educationally harmful, where lack of sympathy prevented a true human relation between the English teacher and his Bengali pupils.

60. At Bolpur there are 160 boys, ranging in age from six to over sixteen years. The staff consists of twenty-two masters, or one to every eight boys. In all but the two highest classes of the school, the greater part of the teaching—three-quarters of the whole—is given through the vernacular. The boys all learn history, geography and natural science during the greater part of their school course. The younger boys have regular class teaching in music and in drawing. Sir Rabindranath has found it necessary to form at the top of the school two classes, each of one year, preparatory to the university matriculation. It is in the higher of these two classes that the anxiety of the boys begins. They feel that they are face to face with a serious thing in their lives. For most of them their future career will depend on their passing the examination. But the course of study in the classes below these two upper classes represents more fully Sir Rabindranath Tagore's ideal in education.

61. The following table shows the arrangement of the work in the class just below the stage at which the boys begin their preparation for the university matriculation examination.

Bolpur School.—Class below the two preparatory for matriculation.

Number of pupils in the class	16 (one being a girl).
Average age	14 years.
Length of each lesson-period	45 (or 40) minutes.

	Lesson-periods per week.
Mother tongue (Bengali)	6
English	12
* Sanskrit	6
* Mathematics	12
* History	3
* Geography	3
* Natural science	6
Aggregate for the week or 5¼ hours a day.	48

* These subjects, as well as the vernacular, are taught through Bengali.

In this class there are generally no out-of-school tasks set, all the work being done in class.

In addition, there is for all the younger boys—

Music . . . . . three periods a week.
Drawing . . . . . three periods a week.

62. In the classes above this, the boys drop natural science and geography in view of the special requirements of the university matriculation examination. At this stage, there are no compulsory drawing or music lessons. The time given to mathematics and Sanskrit is greatly increased. And there are tasks to be done out of class hours.

Bolpur School.	*Preparatory class.*	*Matriculation class.*
Subject.	Number of boys in the class . . 16 Average age about 15	Number of boys in the class . . 17 Average age about 16
	Number of lesson-periods per week.	Number of lesson-periods per week.
Mother tongue . . .	6	6
English	12	12
Sanskrit	9 (or, for additional Sanskrit 12).	9
Mathematics	12	12 (or, for additional mathematics, 18).
History	6	6
Weekly aggregate of lesson-periods.	45 (or 48)	45 (or 51)

The first four subjects in this list are compulsory for all the boys in the class.

Most of the boys take 'additional mathematics' and history as their other subjects for the matriculation examination. Others take history and additional Sanskrit or additional mathematics and Sanskrit.

Each lesson-period is 45 (or 40) minutes. Natural science and geography are dropped at this stage. In these classes there are no compulsory drawing or (compulsory) music lessons.

Private tasks are done out of class.

63. Four members of the staff of Bolpur school—Mr. Jagadananda Roy (Mathematics), Mr. Santosh C. Majumdar (Natural Science), Mr. Promoda Ranjan Ghosh (English) and Mr. Nepal Chandra Roy (History) favoured us with the following expression

of their views on points immediately affecting the connexion between high schools and the University. In these views, Sir Rabindranath Tagore concurs—

(*a*) Geography, and Indian (with an outline of English) history should be compulsory subjects in the matriculation examination.

(*b*) A little mensuration should be introduced into the paper in geometry and, if possible, a little surveying as giving practical application to the subject.

(*c*) It is desirable that every boy should learn some natural science at school. But the examination test would not be the surest guarantee that his interest in science had been intelligently cultivated and trained. And it would be impossible for most schools to provide expensive laboratories, apparatus and materials. If, however, (so far as those branches of science are concerned) a general elementary training in physics and chemistry was all that would be required, this instruction could be given with simple apparatus in two lesson-periods a week. A certificate of the boy's having received this instruction might be required from his school authorities as a condition preliminary to his being allowed to enter for the matriculation examination. Moreover, for the compulsory paper in geography some study of scientific matters should be required.

(*d*) The boys from Bolpur are entered for the university matriculation examination as 'private students'. Sir Rabindranath Tagore and the members of his staff feel that it is important that this right should be retained. Bolpur School, wishing to work out its own methods, has not applied to the University for recognition.

64. The staff would like it to be possible for boys to take direct from Bolpur School the intermediate arts examination and (if good laboratories could be secured) the intermediate science examination. Work carried up to the intermediate stage would, in their opinion, complete the course appropriate to such a school.

65. Another school of outstanding interest is the Boys' Own Home in the North of Calcutta.[1] To this school some of our number paid visits of which they were able to give no previous notice. They heard teaching of extraordinary merit, and were especially impressed by the way in which the boys had been trained to use their minds and by the excellence of their spoken English. The lessons, in conducting which our colleagues were allowed to take part, showed that the boys are being skilfully and sympathetically trained to observe, to reason and accurately to express themselves.

66. At the time of the visits paid to this school, there were 58 boys on its rolls. The ages of the fifteen boys in the highest class ranged from eleven to fifteen years, none being yet old enough to take the university matriculation examination. Most of them had been in the school for three years or more, two for a shorter time, nine for four years and upwards. The ordinary tuition fee is rupees 10 per mensem, though a few boys pay more and nearly one-third of the boys pay less than this fee. The parents and guardians are mostly professional men or are employed in Government or other responsible service. All of the boys in the highest class speak Bengali habitually at home, the great majority nothing but Bengali, but four of them sometimes English as well. The classes are small and (excluding the drawing master and seven pupil teachers) there is one teacher to every 20 boys. The head master (or as he prefers to be styled the superintendent) Mr. Rewachand Animananda, himself takes the chief part in the instruction. No boy over ten years or under five years of age is admitted to the school. It is expected that every boy should stay at the school till he is sixteen. One of the conditions for admission to the school, and of remaining at it, is that the boy shall receive no private tuition from a master visiting him in his home. The grounds for this prohibition are two. The boys pass the whole day at school and their daily routine is so arranged that they get time during the day not only for lessons in class but for private study also. Secondly, the head master is anxious that his pupils should not, while under his care, come under the (perhaps very different) methods of teachers who are not connected with the

[1] 47-A, Durga Charan Mitter Street.

school and are therefore unacquainted with the principles of its work.

67. The aims and ideals of the Boys' Own Home are thus defined by Mr. Animananda.[1]

"Our institution follows a novel scheme of education. As its name implies it is a home rather than a school. It aims at becoming a seat of the boys' moral and intellectual parenthood. The work of bringing up the boys is divided between the parents and the superintendent of the 'Home.' The former look especially to their *physical*, and the latter to their *moral* and *mental*, nourishment. The superintendent stands as a guardian to the boys committed to his care, and undertakes to do for the parents what the latter, on account of the absorbing attention given to their profession, cannot do themselves. It is the superintendent, the boy's guardian, who when necessary employs tried assistants to help him. The superintendent is their guardian and private tutor. Consequently, the parents are not required to keep any other private tutor for their children. All that they have to do is to see that the 'Home' rules made for building up the boys' character are conscientiously carried out, that the boys come to the 'Home' regularly and punctually, are fed, clothed, and sent to bed according to the laws of hygiene, and that they do not mix with undesirable associates."

68. Mr. Animananda gives the following further description of his methods of work :—

"The 'Home' is also distinguished from a school in having no classes and no annual promotions. As in the parental home presided over by an affectionate parent each child is individually attended to, and receives the nourishment proper to his growth, so the boys of the 'Home' do not disappear in classes, but are grouped in twos, threes, sixes or tens according to their mental equipment. Moreover, these groups are perfectly elastic, so that in the course of the day, boys of different groups are grouped together afresh for studying different subjects. In this way, the advantages of the class system are not lost, while its defects are partly, if not altogether, eliminated.

The institution also differs from a school in having a department for pupil teachers. These are generally chosen from among the pupils of the 'Home.' When it is seen that a pupil is obedient, is trying to fight against his selfish impulses and takes pleasure in serving his younger brothers, he is appointed a pupil teacher. He is under the constant guidance of the superintendent, and receives almost every day demonstration lessons which initiate him into the art of teaching."

69. He adds :—

"One great aim of all true education is to do away with the help of the teacher. The system of pupil teachers adopted in the 'Home' is calculated

[1] In the following extract we have not included the statement of the ethical and spiritual principles upon which the work of the school is based. An exposition of these principles, to which Mr. Animananda rightly attaches supreme importance, will be found in the prospectus of the school.

largely to serve this purpose. To teach others the pupil teacher is forced to think and make the thing he teaches clear to himself. He has to collect proper information from books and also to seek the assistance of experienced teachers. Moreover, he must needs control his conduct or he cannot govern others. Do not all these things help one to learn how to learn and to dispense with the help of the teacher? Thus the 'Home' while realising one of the greatest ends of education, at the same time preserves the distinguishing characteristic of a home in having for teachers those who have been brought up in the 'Home' and who stand as elder brothers to the pupils proper of the 'Home.'

That the institution is a home is also apparent from the fact that boys over 10 are not taken. They must be born, so to say, to be its children. Grown-up boys who have been brought up in a different atmosphere do not take so kindly to the 'Home' as little boys do; for their ways and habits have been largely formed and they find it painful to depart from these into new channels."

70. The subjects taught in the school are English, Bengali, Sanskrit, mathematics, history and geography, drawing and music, handwriting, elementary science, elementary logic and teaching. The school day begins at 6-30 A.M. in summer and at 7 in winter. Breakfast is at 9-30. Lessons begin again at 12-30. There is a half-hour's recess at 2-30, but five minutes are allowed for recreation at the end of each half hour through the working day. The teaching ends at 4. Then games begin and go on till sunset when the boys are free to go home. Every Saturday there is a competition in the subjects of study in the school, and on the following Monday a weekly report is given in respect of the character of each boy's work. Good conduct receives a special token.

71. Character training (including special attention to the training of the will) is the fundamental object of the school. By means of discipline and of direct instruction, but still more by the pervasive influences of its corporate life, it seeks to inculcate "the fear and love of God; to uphold all lawful authority, human and divine; to uphold the dignity of manual labour; and to train the boys in such a way that in time they may do without the help of the teacher."

72. To physical exercises and school games, and also to manual labour, as integral parts of education, Mr. Animananda attaches great importance. At the Boys' Own Home, though the pupils are drawn from families in well-to-do circumstances, the boys themselves keep the school-house neat, tidy and in order; it is they who sweep the rooms, whitewash the walls, cement the

broken patches of the floor, varnish the tables, paint the blackboards, buy in the market the food and whatever else may be needed, look after the kitchen and cook, and so far as possible, do the repairs of things broken or damaged in daily use for work or games. "That manual training formed part and parcel of education in ancient India, who can deny?" writes Mr. Animananda. "What a pity that we should have so far wandered from the heritage of the past as to look upon manual labour as something dishonourable and below our dignity." When the school began, this feature of its work met with some opposition on the part of the parents. But this soon subsided and now no boy is admitted unless his parents are willing for him to have manual training. For proficiency in it, and especially in cooking, a medal is given annually. Among the competitors are some of the boys who are distinguished in the school for their intellectual power and whose home circumstances are not the least affluent.

73. But the intelligent exercise of the mind, though by no means solely determinative of action, is indispensable to right motive and to enlightened conduct. Therefore to the training of the powers of the mind a great part of the time of a school is given. This important side of the work which the Boys' Own Home endeavours to achieve, and its dependence upon the co-operation of home with school, are thus described by Mr. Animananda.

"The method of teaching followed in the 'Home' is slow, concrete, and scientific. The boys proceed from the simple to the complex, from the known to the unknown, from the concrete to the abstract, from the observation of individual facts to generalisation. The aim kept in view throughout is to train the senses, to exercise the various faculties, so that the boys' powers may develope day by day, and they may be able to acquire knowledge by themselves, without the teacher's assistance. It is with this end in view, that the boys may learn to read the book of nature and find out by themselves the marvels surrounding them that they are occasionally taken to the Botanical Gardens, the Museum, and the Zoo. This is why, instead of getting by heart the multiplication tables, they are asked to make a number of simple experiments to construct the tables for themselves; this is the reason why, instead of learning from a book the number of cubic centimetres in a cubic inch, they make with their own hands an inch cube, and a centimetre cube of clay, soap, flour and like materials, and next see how many centimetre cubes can be made out of an inch cube. It is because the 'Home' desires to initiate the boys in self-teaching, that the boys are taught to find out the meanings of words they do not know

from the dictionary; that no text-book in geography is put into their hands; that they gather all the useful items of information from an atlas. This method is undoubtedly slow, but it pays in the long run. The boys may not be able to finish a large number of books during the year, but they will *master* the one book or part of it that they do finish; so that when asked to explain an unseen passage, they will not, like the boys who merely exercise the memory, shrink from the attempt, but will boldly read the passage, ask the meaning of the word or words they may not know, then tell us the meaning of the whole. Nor is this all. The method is calculated to create a thirst for knowledge, an interest in the world about us. It makes boys patiently observe the phenomena surrounding them, find out the hidden truths of nature in spite of repeated failures, and then honestly record them. It is this slow, laborious method that produces honest workers, diligent students and passionate lovers of knowledge.

In order, however, that the method may succeed as it should, the guardians must actively, whole-heartedly co-operate with the teachers. They must get their boys materials for their reading and writing immediately they require them; so that they get no occasion of idling away their time. They must see to it that the boys are sent to the 'Home' every day or they will not get on. A loving mother may prepare daily nourishing dishes for her child, but, if he is seen at the table for only three days during the week and goes without food for the remaining four days, will he grow strong? In the same way, a teacher may take pains to prepare a lesson for his boys, but if they are not present, if they do not receive the intellectual food prepared for them, they cannot prosper. We must also make it a point to send the boys to the 'Home' at the proper hour; for want of punctuality is only a form of irregularity. An irregular boy deprives himself of teaching for days, and an unpunctual boy for minutes. And just as a person taking no physical exercise may lose all appetite for food, so these may grow idle and lose all interest in their studies. There is yet another aspect of this point which needs serious attention. Whenever a boy is absent or late without an uncontrollable cause, he violates the 'Home' rules. In other words, he does not do what the teachers want him to do, he disobeys them. And disobedience is disobedience. To-day a boy disobeys by coming late, to-morrow he will do so by neglecting his lessons, the day after, by mixing with undesirable companions. And then good bye to all study. So we see that, in order that the teachers may succeed in their work, the parents must do their share; they must see that each and every 'Home' rule is faithfully observed."

VI.

74. Mr. Animananda's veto on the parents employing private tutors for the boys attending his school is significant. All over Bengal we found that the practice is growing beyond bounds. At Barisal, for instance, a witness told us that he has nine sons and nephews at the Zilla School. Their ages range from nine to sixteen years. They work at their books for ten or eleven hours a day. He has to employ four tutors to help them in

their studies at home. In many other places we received complaints of the present system, which is a tax, and an increasing tax, upon the income of the parents who conform to it. It was recently discovered that the educational charges incurred on behalf of a boy under the Court of Wards who was attending a high school in Calcutta were Rupees 5 a month for school fees and Rupees 110 paid to members of the school staff for private tuition. From the lips of one high school master (and his account was confirmed by that given by many others) we heard that on account of the smallness of his salary he is obliged to give private tuition for two hours before beginning his day's work in school (which occupies him almost without a break from 10-30 till 4) and then, after the school is closed for the day, to give for yet another two hours private tuition to other pupils. This leaves no time for the preparation of school lessons or for private study. The practice of private tuition is inseparably connected with the low stipends paid to the secondary school masters. Without giving private lessons out of school hours the teacher cannot live. The effects upon him and upon class teaching in the schools are bad. The teachers are overworked ("our teachers are, many of them, working themselves to death," said one experienced witness) and have no leisure in which adequately to prepare themselves for giving lessons in school. The spring of their energies is loaded too heavily by long hours of tuition. So far as we can judge from what we have seen, in the great majority of secondary schools in the Presidency there is little class teaching which deserves praise. The result is that, long as they are, the hours spent in class do not give the boys the systematic instruction which they need; and, for fear of failure at the examinations, recourse is had to private coaching to make up for what the school does badly and might do well. Thus one evil tends to increase the other. The school master is often overworked, impaired in self-respect, habituated to an ineffective way of teaching, but compelled by poverty to eke out his income by private tuition. The boy is at his books for too many hours in the day; is given so much individual coaching that he fails to get into right habits of independent work; and falls into a way of drowsing through the hours in class instead of being kept briskly at attention by good teaching. It would be wiser to spend more upon the salaries of secondary school teachers and on their professional training than to put up

with the present wasteful expenditure on private tuition.[1] Within limits and in exceptional cases, private coaching in the morning or evening is unobjectionable. But in Bengal the practice has reached a height which makes it a serious evil. In some cases its indirect results are to discourage improvements in class teaching and to impair school discipline. A teacher whose salary is inadequate for his support can hardly be blamed for remembering that, if boys were taught so thoroughly in class that they would not feel the need for being coached privately out of school hours, an indispensable part of his present income would shrink or disappear. And a teacher may feel indisposed to be severe in class with boys who are his private pupils out of school and whose private tuition fees are an indispensable addition to his income.

VII.

75. In several of the answers which were written in reply to our questionnaire, there are signs of uneasiness of mind at an even more serious defect in most of the secondary schools of Bengal. The schools, it is felt (and the criticism is extended to the colleges), fail in the formation of character. Put more explicitly, this criticism charges the schools with failure to convey to a boy's mind a clear apprehension of an ideal of duty. Pressed further home, the charge amounts to more even than this : it implies that the schools have no spiritual life which touches a boy's inner nature, no corporate unity which appeals to and can sustain his affectionate loyalty, no moral or intellectual flame which may kindle his emotions. It must be acknowledged that in these respects, the work of the schools as a whole is bleak and barren. There are indeed admirable exceptions ; but these, while encouraging hopes for the future, throw into darker contrast the shortcomings of the rest. The boys work assiduously—often too assiduously. School hours are long—generally too long. The schools are pre-occupied with purveying certain kinds of knowledge—but within too narrow a range; the boys with learning what will get them through an examination, itself too narrow a test. Secondary education in Bengal is preparing candidates, not making men. It teaches subjects, but offers no synthesis of knowledge, communicates no nucleus of unify-

[1] Fifth Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in Bengal, 1912-13 to 1916-17, page 35.

ing thought. It is dull not so much because it is poor in material resources as because it is poor in ideas.

76. But, before he decides to throw the whole of the blame for these defects either on the teachers or on the administrative authorities, the observer will do well to weigh certain considerations which are not unlikely to temper the severity of his judgment and at the same time to strengthen his confidence in the possibility of reform. He will remember that in other parts of the world, and not least in England, schools and colleges suffer to some extent from this same lack of an inspiring unity in their intellectual aim. The mass of new knowledge which now claims a place in schemes of education has not yet found a synthesis. It has not yet been unified intellectually. Still less has it been co-ordinated with spiritual belief. And this dislocation between different departments of the intellectual life and their mal-adjustment to emotional and æsthetic experience result in a lack of those simple, authoritative generalisations which compel acceptance, touch every side of human experience and are the groundwork of definite teaching in primary and secondary schools. Towards some new synthesis, readily translatable into a code of moral principles and of conduct, human thought may be moving. But such a synthesis has not yet been reached, still less has any attempt at it won general acceptance or been filtered into a form available for use in the earlier stages of education. In those stages however it is especially needed by the teacher because it is then that he is giving to his pupils their introduction to study. And it is then also that it is needed by the learner in order that he may gain—through the imagination and emotions as well as through conscious reasoning—a sense of the fundamental unity and significance of what he learns.

77 The deepest need now experienced in the secondary education of Bengal affects not India alone but the whole world. Elsewhere, however, an ancient spiritual tradition, interwoven with the work and teaching of the schools, continues to supply something which serves, however imperfectly and not without challenge, as a basis of moral unity in education. Even there, however, it does not cover the whole field of school work. Much of the intellectual side of education is untouched by it. But the spiritual and moral tradition holds so firm a place in school life and in school practice, and has such influence over conduct, that the lack of intellectual unity is less clearly perceived and the forces which form character continue

strong, though they are weak in grappling with many of the problems which challenge us in the tasks of modern life.

78. But in India, western education is an exotic. However warmly welcomed by many of those who receive it, it remains an exotic. And it was first transplanted to India at a time when but little thought had been given to those conditions of school life (apart from what was expected to result from lessons in the Bible and from sermons) which impart and strengthen a sense of personal duty and give definition and warmth to the feeling of obligation. It seems to have been taken for granted that the course of instruction would carry along with it into schools in India that tradition of moral unity which is the most powerful agent in the formation of character. But, in order to avoid doing violence to any form of religious conviction, the British Government felt it right to allow no religious teaching to be given in the schools under its direct control in India. These schools, from which religious instruction is thus excluded in accordance with a scrupulously observed neutrality, have served to a large extent as the models copied by the Indian founders of other schools. Hence secondary education in India, apart from that which is definitely religious in atmosphere and in principle, has to rely upon the intellectual materials of its secular studies for what may give firmness to moral principle and may kindle an ideal of duty.

79. Much indeed has been found in those materials which gives inspiration and guidance. Thousands of boys have felt what an Indian scholar, speaking of the moral education imparted incidentally by western studies, called "the strengthening which comes from the emotions and the will being worked upon by the histories of great movements, the lives of great men, and the songs of great poets."[1] But in so far as the lack of a synthesis in modern thought makes itself felt, either consciously through criticism or unconsciously through discord in moral guidance, Indian secondary education feels the stress of the difficulty in an acute form, because it has to rely for ethical as well as for intellectual discipline upon that body of knowledge which itself suffers from inner divisions and has not yet been integrated with the older forms of worship and belief.

[1] Mr. (afterwards Mr. Justice) Kashinath Trimbak Telang's minute annexed to the Report of the Indian Education Commission, 1882, page 611.

80. If, however, the power and effective influence of education depended on there being no flaw in the consistency of its intellectual materials and no rift or logical discontinuity between its sanctions of conduct and any of the presuppositions of its critical thought, secondary schools and universities could never have flourished, because at no time has philosophy attained a synthesis in which all minds have found satisfaction and rest. It is only in some group of schools confined to one section of the community (like the schools of Port Royal or those in which Comenius worked) or more rarely (as in the case of Neo-Hellenism in Germany) when an educational movement has expressed the transient unity of some dominant school of thought, that intellectual studies have been worked even into a semblance of unity or focussed with an attempt at consistency upon a theory of conduct. In schools which serve a whole nation there can only be approximate unity in intellectual outlook; at all times the process of mental and ethical readjustment is going on; it is when experience and discovery have for the time far outdistanced generalisation that the tension between thought and action is extreme. In the school-community, however, if its various activities are encouraged and recognised, there is a steadying force which gives moral unity to the whole and blends diverse temperaments into the texture of corporate life. But a way of escape must be left for those who are in fundamental opposition to the concordat on which such a public school community rests, and freedom should be given to them (subject to the needs of public safety) to find a place in some more congenial combination of their own. Thus liberty for private effort, alongside of the normal type of school publicly organised, strengthens national education by distributing energies which need different channels of expression and are most economically used in the public interest through diversity of schools.

81. This freedom to private initiative is given in Bengal. And it is through a fuller development of the corporate life of each school community that effective kinds of moral education and training will be found possible and, even in present circumstances, not difficult to attain. But in Bengal a school is thought of too narrowly as a place of instruction. Its possibilities as a society are overlooked. Saying and hearing lessons are only one way of making use of the opportunity which is given for training and education by bringing together, day by day and for hours at

a time, scores or hundreds of boys. They ought to learn how to work together for common ends, not only how by individual industry to achieve personal success. In any school the materials for an active and largely self-governing society lie ready to hand. There are the makings of a community in it. And through membership of a community, through bearing part in its duties and pleasures, through learning how to obey and how to govern in it, a boy learns lessons which he needs not less than those which he gets by being punctual in class and diligent with his books at home. At school he ought to feel himself not a mere unit who has to learn things at an appointed time and place; not simply one of a multitude of similar units receiving instruction from his teachers; but a member of a community, responsible for service to it, an active participant in its various occupations, attached to it by a network of interests and responsibilities. It cannot be said that this side of education is impracticable in India. To give one example alone, it is highly developed at Bolpur. Experience has shown that it can be realised not in boarding schools only but in day schools also. For example, the idea of the school community has been highly developed in the Boys' Own Home. The obstacle does not lie in the social conditions of India, though these forbid any literal imitation of European or American models, but in a state of mind, in a too limited conception of what a school may do and be, in a preoccupation with the purely didactic side of school life, in a failure to realise that not the least important kind of education, intellectual and moral alike, lies in the busy, ordered freedom of a school community, which is entrusted with responsibilities and allowed under guidance and supervision to gain its own experience of liberty, obedience and command.

82. This view of education does not detract from the value of the personality of the teacher. On the contrary, it puts the teacher into a relationship with his pupils in which what he is becomes at least as important as what he knows. But, in the life of a school community which is both disciplined and free, the teacher finds that all his knowledge comes under requisition, and that he has to give more, not less, of his thought and time to his pupils, becoming himself happier, more active-minded and more resourceful. The life of the school, running freely through many channels, invigorates him and keeps him

young through comradeship with the young. No teacher can forego routine. But the corrective of routine is taking part in a many-sided life.

83. Again, the view which attaches great importance in education to the activities of a school community perceives also a fuller significance in what school should set its masters to teach and its pupils to learn. It does not underrate the importance of direct teaching on points of duty and morals, whether such teaching be incidental and occasional or (in right hands and on suitable opportunities) more systematised and elaborate.[1] But it sees that indirect methods of moral education are much more numerous, less likely to arouse contrariant feelings and, though less obvious, more fruitful. A school is fundamentally two things, a place of authoritative instruction and a community in which may be learnt by way of practice and preparation many of the duties and activities of life. In both of these aspects a school can form character, and it has no higher function. And through its course of studies, to some boys even more than through its corporate life, it can impart the essentials of moral, as well as of intellectual, training. The two are inseparable. The intellectual factor in conduct is at least as important as the emotional. But, in order that the intellectual factor may have full weight in moral education, the course of study should not only train the mind in concentration of thought, in accuracy of observation and recollection, in precision of reasoning, and in the power of selecting and sifting opposite facts, but should also furnish it with ideas, kindle its admiration, make it acquainted with noble examples, arouse and train the love of beauty. Thus the question of curriculum becomes more crucial than when it is regarded simply from the point of view of what the rules of an examination require. And, under the influence of this wider view of education, teachers and parents alike begin to feel the need for a course of study which can touch every side of a boy's nature, give scope to all his natural gifts, stimulate him to many kinds of expression, and impart to him a high purpose in life. Literature, history, mathematics and natural science each demand a place in

[1] The argument for moral instruction as one factor in education is ably stated in Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee's *The Education Problem in India* (Calcutta, Lahiri & Co., 1914), page 103.

such a course and, in addition to these, physical exercises and music, drawing and other forms of manual skill.[1]

VIII.

84. But such an education—wide and yet exact, adapted to individual aptitudes but also watchful of national needs, liberal as a preparation for life but also specific in its preparation both for the University and for immediate entrance upon other careers—can only be attained by the joint action of parents, of school authorities and of the University. There must be a demand for it and a readiness to make it available. Of such a movement in public opinion some signs may already be seen in Bengal. Several schools, some of them described in this chapter, have set themselves to the work of providing a wider and more stimulating education. Others have gone further than this and have made use, in different ways, of the activities of corporate life. The growing popularity of the Boy Scout movement in Calcutta, the keenness with which boys welcome a scout's training, the devotion of many of the scoutmasters, show the new trend of educational ideas. Not less significant is the dissatisfaction with the present state of secondary education—a dissatisfaction which is not contradicted by the increasing eagerness of parents to send their sons to secondary schools or by their readiness to take advantage of what is already offered, however imperfectly it may furnish what they hope their boys may gain. This dissatisfaction, which shows itself in the great majority of the answers to our questionnaire, is expressed trenchantly by Mr. Meghnad Saha, Lecturer at the University College of Science. He writes :—

"Up to this time, we have taken a rather narrow view of the aims and usefulness of secondary schools. We are accustomed to look upon them merely as preparatory institutions whose chief function is to prepare students for admission into the University....to pump into their minds a working knowledge of English, a little knowledge of a classical language and vernacular.... We should look upon the secondary schools from a changed angle of vision.....In our country education reaches the people through a narrow slit—a certain minimum of efficiency in the use of English."[2]

85. This and other passages in Mr. Meghnad Saha's reply call attention to the relatively large (and, as he thinks, excessive)

[1] The subject discussed in these pages is more fully dealt with in *Moral Instruction and Training in Schools: Report of an International Inquiry* (Longmans Green & Co., London, 1909, 2 volumes).

[2] Question 13.

place which linguistic studies hold in the present curriculum of the secondary schools of Bengal. Like many other of our witnesses, including Sir Rabindranath Tagore, he wants English to be better taught, and thinks that by improved methods better results could be secured in a shorter time, but urgently pleads for a larger use of the vernacular as one of the media of instruction in secondary schools. This is one of the most important questions affecting the future of education in India. It is discussed elsewhere in our report.[1] But the matter is so intimately connected with the hope of improvement in the secondary schools that a brief reference to it cannot be omitted from this chapter. Linguistic studies are essential to education. In secondary schools and in higher education generally in India, English is indispensable. But the mother tongue is of primary importance.

86. By means of languages learnt at school or later, an educated man or woman should hold at least the chief keys to the world's culture. In his hand should be the passport which will admit him, through words written and spoken, to the society of thinkers and writers, dead or living, near at hand or far off. For the scholar of the middle ages in Europe the master-key was Latin. For the man of affairs in Europe in the eighteenth century the master-key was French. For the educated Indian of to-day the master-key is English. English, then, is indispensable to the higher education of India at this time. It cannot be foregone. The instinct of the people is right. It is not merely that for the Indian student English is an instrument of livelihood. It is more than that. It is a pathway leading into a wider intellectual life.

87. But, on the other hand, the mother tongue is of primary importance. The mother tongue is the true vehicle of mother wit. Another medium of speech may bring with it, as English brings with it, a current of new ideas. But the mother tongue is one with the air in which a man is born. It is through the vernacular (refined, though not weakened, by scholarship and taste) that the new conceptions of the mind should press their way to birth in speech. This is almost universally true, except in cases so rare (like that of Joseph Conrad) as to emphasise the general rule. A man's native speech is almost like his shadow, inseparable from his personality. In our way of speech we must each, as the old

[1] Chapters XVIII and XLI.

saying runs, drink water out of our own cistern. For each one of us is a member of a community. We share its energy and its instincts; its memories, however dim, of old and far off things. And it is through our vernacular, through our folk-speech, whether actually uttered or harboured in our unspoken thoughts, that most of us attain to the characteristic expression of our nature and of what our nature allows us to be or to discern.[1] Through its mother tongue the infant first learns to name the things it sees or feels or tastes or hears, as well as the ties of kindred and the colours of good and evil. It is the mother tongue which gives to the adult mind the relief and illumination of utterance, as it clutches after the aid of words when new ideas or judgments spring from the wordless recesses of thought or feeling under the stimulus of physical experience or of emotion. Hence in all education, the primary place should be given to training in the exact and free use of the mother tongue.

88. We have now reviewed in the light of written evidence and of the results of personal inspection the present state of secondary education in Bengal. The high schools are the feeders of the colleges. It is their chief function, one of the most important in the State, to give the best possible preparation to those who intend to proceed to the University. But this is not their only function. Like secondary schools elsewhere they are attended by large numbers of boys who have no special fitness for an academic training and who leave school without qualifying themselves for admission to it. In 1917 out of every three candidates who entered for the university matriculation examination, only two passed. Out of those who succeeded in passing it in 1915, little more than half presented themselves two years later for the intermediate. These facts show that a considerable proportion of the boys in secondary schools should not be regarded exclusively as being on the road to a university training. Yet the high schools in Bengal are too narrowly concerned with preparing boys for matriculation. That is the goal up to which their teaching (with hardly an exception) is designed to lead. That is the test by which they are willing that

[1] For some people the channel of most expressive utterance is through craftsmanship, through the graphic or plastic arts, through music or rhythm of movement, but in any case the creative and original power of the mind fails of full achievement unless there be mastery over the technique of its most powerful and intimate form of self-expression.

their work should be judged. The importance of furnishing the University with students intelligently trained and well prepared no one would gainsay. But this is not the only purpose which the secondary schools have to serve in a modern State. There arise therefore two questions: first, what are the requirements of the university matriculation examination and what influence do these requirements exert upon the schools; secondly, is the recognition of schools by the University an adequate guarantee of excellence in secondary education and of its being adapted to the needs of all who now seek its advantages? These questions are discussed in the two following chapters.

CHAPTER IX.

The University Matriculation Examination. Its Requirements, Standard and Influence upon the Schools.

I.

1. The matriculation examination of the University of Calcutta is the largest of its kind in the world. No other university examination in India approaches it in magnitude. In 1918, the number of candidates was 16,088, or more than twice as many as entered for the London University matriculation in the year of its most extensive range. The Calcutta examination draws its candidates from Bengal, Assam and Burma[1] and from the adjacent Native States. Within its territorial limits is an area of 376,400 square miles. It examines pupils from 854 high schools, nearly half (49 per cent.) of all the high schools in British India.[2] Its influence upon secondary education is far-reaching and direct. The methods and outlook of the schools depend in great measure upon the requirements of the University; the University in its turn is dependent upon the materials supplied to it by the schools. The course of school training as prescribed or encouraged by the rules of the matriculation examination and by public opinion, determines the intellectual standard at which the colleges can begin and continue their work.

2. The present arrangements of the examination are as follows. It is held once a year and is conducted by printed papers only, the same papers being used at every centre at which the examination is held.[3] Qualified candidates of both sexes are admissible. Ordinarily, only students who have been educated for at least one year previous to the examination at a school recognised by the University for such purpose are admitted to the examination. Every

[1] Mr. S. W. Cocks, of the Department of Public Instruction in Burma, writes in answer to Question 8 that "after March 1918 schools in Burma will cease to present pupils for the Calcutta matriculation examination."

[2] *Statistics of British India, 1916-17*, Vol. V, Education (Calcutta, 1918), pages xi and 208; and Mr. G. Findlay Shirras, General Memoranda, page 115.

[3] There were 48 centres in 1918.

candidate sent up by a recognised school is required to produce a certificate (*a*) of good conduct, (*b*) of diligent and regular study, (*c*) of having satisfactorily passed periodical school examinations and other tests, (*d*) of probability of passing the examination. Private candidates, who have not attended any school for at least one year previous to the examination, are admitted to it, provided that (*a*) they have passed a preliminary test held for such purpose by a Government Inspector of Schools or under his orders, and (*b*) satisfactory evidence is adduced before the Inspector that the candidate has prosecuted a regular course of study, and has been subject to proper discipline. No one is admitted to the matriculation examination, unless he has completed the age of sixteen years on the first day of the month in which he appears at the examination.

3. In 1917, the percentage of successful candidates was 72·7. The names of those who pass are published in three divisions. Of the 11,131 candidates who succeeded in passing the examination in 1917, 5,790 were placed in the first division, 4,699 in the second and 642 in the third.

4. The following table[1] shows the figures for the examination as a whole in each of the seven years 1912—1918.

Year.	Number of candidates.	Number of Passes			Total of passes.	Percentage of passes.
		Division I.	Division II.	Division III.		
1912 . . .	8,761	2,862	2,361	394	5,617	64·1
1913 . . .	9,370	4,436	2,196	230	6,872	73·2
1914 . .	11,289	2,949	3,149	657	6,755	59·8
1915 . . .	12,457	3,653	3,279	554	7,486	60·1
1916 . . .	14,058	4,326	3,342	494	8,162	58·0
1917[2] . . .	15,876	5,790	4,699	642	11,131	70·1
1918[3] . . .	14,675	5,034	3,171	406	8,611	58·7

[1] Taken (except for 1918) from *Statistics of British India: Education*, 1916-17 (Calcutta, 1918), page 208. From other sources we have received somewhat different figures, but the variation is not great enough to affect our conclusions.

[2] In this year the examination was cancelled twice and the candidates had therefore a longer time than usual for preparation.

[3] In this year candidates from Bihar and Orissa were examined by the Patna University.

5. The high schools of Bengal supply about three quarters of the candidates for the Calcutta University matriculation. From these schools more than eleven thousand candidates entered in 1917, and about three out of four were successful. The percentage of passes won by candidates from schools in Bengal has been since 1914 a little higher than the general percentage of passes in the examination. In 1916, the number of candidates entering from schools in Bengal was 10,378. Of these, 6,208 (or 60·2 per cent.) were successful. In 1917, the corresponding figures were 11,661, and 8,497 (or 73·1 per cent.).

6. The aim of the examination is to serve as "a general test of fitness for a course of university studies."

With this end in view, the examination comprises six subjects.[1] Four of these are obligatory on all candidates, namely:—

(1) English (two papers).

(2) Mathematics (one paper).

(3) One language taken from a list which comprises—

Sanskrit, Pali, Arabic, Persian, Hebrew, classical Armenian, classical Tibetan, Greek, Latin, and for women candidates certain other languages (one paper).

(4) Composition in a vernacular language—

(*a*) the list including Bengali, Hindi, Uriya, Assamese, Urdu, Burmese, Modern Armenian, Modern Tibetan and Khasi;

(*b*) a candidate, whose vernacular is not included in this list, is allowed to take an alternative paper in English composition, French or German (one paper).

The two remaining papers (5) and (6) are chosen by the candidate from among the following:—

(*i*) Additional mathematics (one paper).

(*ii*) An additional paper in the classical language taken (one paper).

(*iii*) History of India, including a short account of the Administration of British India and of the progress of India under British rule (one paper).

[1] Calcutta University Regulations, Chapter XXX.

(*iv*) Outlines of general geography, including the elements of mathematical and physical geography with the geography of India in fuller detail (one paper).

(*v*) Elementary mechanics (one paper).

Candidates who take up (*iii*) are permitted to submit their answers in that subject in one of the following languages :—English, Bengali, Hindi, Uriya, Assamese, Urdu, or Modern Armenian.

Candidates who are certified to belong to the Hill Tribes or other aboriginal races of Assam are allowed the choice of the following combination of subjects :—

(1) English.
(2) Mathematics.
(3) Composition in a vernacular language or the alternative paper in English composition, French or German as specified above.
(4) History.
(5) Geography.
(6) Mechanics or additional mathematics.

Each paper in the examination is of three hours and the maximum of marks which a candidate can obtain in it is one hundred.

7. The university regulations prescribe that the matriculation examination in English shall be a test (*a*) of ability to write clear, simple and correct English, (*b*) of intelligent comprehension of plain modern English on familiar subjects. A small selection of books is recommended, as showing the standard up to which students will be expected to have read. The examiners may or may not, at their option, set passages from such books. The first paper in English includes passages in one of the following vernaculars for translation into English :—

Bengali, Hindi, Uriya, Urdu, Burmese, Modern Armenian, Modern Tibetan, Parbatia, Assamese, Khasi, Tamil, Gujrathi, French, Telugu, Malayalam, Marathi, Garo, and Lushai.

II.

8. The matriculation examination in its present form is far from enjoying general approval. Eleven out of every twelve of our witnesses who deal with this point express dissatisfaction with it as a test of fitness for entering the University.

9. In answer to our Question 8 "Are you satisfied with the present conditions of admission to the University of Calcutta ?"

we received 242 answers.[1] The number of replies which approve the present arrangements is 20: the number signifying dissatisfaction with them upon various grounds is 222. Among the latter are 158 which criticise the matriculation examination on the specific ground that it is not exacting enough in the standard or range of knowledge which it requires. The correspondents who criticise the present standard of the matriculation are representative of Hindu and Muslim opinion, and include members of the Legislative Council and of the public services, lawyers and medical men, principals of colleges and head masters of schools, women with experience in the education of girls and the spokesmen of associations formed for the furtherance of civic interests.[2]

10. Among the very limited number of our witnesses who declare themselves satisfied with the present conditions of admission to the University of Calcutta, there are some influential names. Among them are Mr. Panchanan Sinha, Principal of the South Suburban College, Bhowanipur, who thinks "the present conditions on the whole fairly satisfactory;"[3] Mahamahopadhyaya Dr. Satis Chandra Vidyabhusana, Principal of the Sanskrit College, Calcutta; Mr. Kokileswar Sastri, Vidyaratna, Professor of Vedanta and Upanishads in the University of Calcutta; Dr. Abdurrahman, Educational Adviser to Her Highness the Begum of Bhopal, who writes that the "average under-graduate of the Calcutta University compares favourably with the average under-graduate of any other Indian university;"[3] Mr. Surya Kumar Sen, Head Master of Patiya High School, Chittagong; two members of the Bengal Legislative Council, Rai Sri Nath Roy Bahadur, and Mr. Surendra Nath Roy; and the North Bengal Zamindars' Association, Rangpur, which replies. "The existing system will do."[3]

---

[1] Most of the answers are from individual correspondents, either resident in Bengal or in the area served by the University of Calcutta. Among those who write from other parts of India several have had close personal connexion with higher education in the Presidency. Besides the individual replies, four record the joint opinions of staffs of college teachers. All of these criticise the present requirements of the examination.

[2] Further evidence upon the Calcutta University matriculation examination, and upon the issues raised by various proposals for change in its scope and management, will be found in many of the general memoranda, and in answers to Questions 1, 2, 9, 10, 11 and 13.

[3] Question 8.

11. Adverse criticism, however, is general and even more widely representative. It will be convenient to quote typical expressions of opinion from different categories of experienced witnesses.

12. The first place should be given to the evidence from the colleges, as they receive most of the successful candidates after matriculation and are therefore best able to judge their fitness for university courses. Mr. J. R. Barrow, Officiating Principal of Presidency College, reports :—

" the opinion is very generally held by members of the Presidency College staff that the matriculation examination is too easy." He adds that he agrees with this opinion. " Success in the examination does not mean what it ought to mean, that the matriculate is fit to begin the course of study laid down by the University."[1]

The Senatus of the Scottish Churches College, Calcutta, speak of—

" The waste of energy in the classes in dealing with students who have no real capacity for college education."[2]

The Rev. Father Crohan, Rector of St. Xavier's College, Calcutta, speaks of " the fault in admitting to the University a large percentage of students who are quite unable to secure the advantages which it offers."[2] The Vice-Principal of Vidyasagar College and the Principal of Central College, Calcutta, are dissatisfied with the standard of qualification which the examination attests. Mr. G. C. Bose, Principal, Bangabasi College, Calcutta, reports that " the equipment with which the matriculates enter the University does not enable them to profit by university teaching."[1] The Principal and staff of Serampore College write that the " outcome of the matriculation examination in too many cases is a type of boy very ill-prepared for all that is involved in university study."[2]

13. From the Dacca Madrassah, Shams-ul-Ulama Abu Nasr Waheed writes that it is " a general complaint that the matriculates of the Calcutta University are not by their age and equipment adequately fitted to take full advantage of college teaching."[1] The same view is taken by Mr. F. C. Turner, who is now Principal of Dacca College but at the time of answering our question was Assistant Director of Public Instruction, Bengal.

" I am convinced," he writes, " that under the existing system a very large number of students are admitted to the University of Calcutta who are not properly equipped to commence university studies. This fact is proved by the number of students who drop out of the colleges and discontinue

[1] Question 8.

[2] Question 1.

their studies during the first year. In one year at Chittagong College over 30 per cent. of the students in the first year class left without transfer certificates. Students find that the university course is beyond their powers."[1]

Rai Lalitmohan Chatterjee Bahadur, Principal of Jagannath College, Dacca, writes that when the students who have passed the matriculation examination—

"come up to the first year class it is found that.....they have not been trained to think in a clear and orderly manner, and only know how to 'cram,' and get little benefit from the lectures in the class,.....and that they lack information in many things indispensable to an intelligent following of the college courses."[1]

Rai Kumudini Kanta Banerjee Bahadur, Principal of Rajshahi College, writes :—

"The standard of matriculation should be considerably raised. A sound general education is absolutely essential for university study. The present standard of admission is too low.....The matriculate should have acquired the power of accurate expression and orderly thought."[1]

Mr. Radhikanath Bose, Principal of Edward College, Pabna, writes that—

"the large majority of our present day matriculates find it difficult to follow the lectures delivered in the college classes."[2]

From another standpoint, the Principal and six members of the staff of the Civil Engineering College, Sibpur,[3] concur in these unfavourable comments on the present arrangements. "The matriculation examination as conducted on its present narrow lines is an unsuitable test for admission to an engineering college or to a technical school."

14. The majority of the head masters of secondary schools who have communicated their views to us are dissatisfied with the matriculation examination as a test of fitness for university studies. Mr. Harakanta Bose,[1] Head Master of the Hare School, Calcutta,

---

[1] Question 8.

[2] Question 11.

[3] General Memoranda, page 28. Unfavourable reports of the matriculation examination as attesting fitness for entrance upon university studies come also from the Principals of Chittagong College; of Victoria College, Comilla; of Ananda Mohan College, Mymensingh; of Midnapur and Krishnagar Colleges; of Murarichand College, Sylhet, and of Cotton College, Gauhati; of Rangoon College and of Victoria College, Cooch Behar; of Victoria College, Narail; of St. Andrew's College, Gorakhpur; of the Earle Law College, Gauhati, and by the Vice-Principal of the Law College, Dacca. Their judgment is supported, from the point of view of those engaged in the education of girls, by the Principals of Bethune College, and of the Eden High School, Dacca. The references are in each case to answers to Question 8.

writes that "the intellectual equipment of students seeking admission into the University, is, in the majority of cases, quite inadequate." Mr. Haridas Goswamy,[1] Head Master of the East Indian Railway School, Asansol, writes :—

"At present nearly all students who matriculate flock to the University without consideration of their individual bent, or their special talents or their fitness for university training or of their future career in life..... The majority of these students are, by their school training or by their own nature or the circumstances of their lives, unfit to receive the university training. There is thus a waste in education."

Mr. Satish Chandra Sen,[1] Head Master of the Hindu School, Calcutta, writes "The present conditions of admission to the University of Calcutta are not satisfactory. Students going up for university education should have a broader grounding." Kazi Imdadul Huque,[1] Head Master of the Calcutta Training School, writes :—

"The matriculation standard ought to be raised. At present matriculates are very deficient in their knowledge of English, and also of general subjects, so that, in most cases, their attainments do not prove to be adequate for the reception of college education."[2]

Mr. Karuna Kanta Das Gupta, Head Master of the Collegiate School, Gauhati, writes :—

"The standard of knowledge demanded of a matriculation candidate seems to be lower than it was ten years ago. ..... The number of passes in the first division is disproportionately larger than it was before. Candidates seem to know less, yet pass in a higher division."[3]

15. Officers of the Department of Public Instruction, Bengal, criticise the standard of the matriculation examination in terms similar to those used by head masters of schools and principals of colleges. Mr. W. C. Wordsworth, Officiating Director of Public Instruction, says that "success in the matriculation examination does not guarantee fitness for university study."[1] The same opinion is expressed by Mr. J. W. Gunn, Assistant Director of Public Instruction : "The standards are far too low.....Much elementary

[1] Question 8.

[2] Question 8. Opinions which support these criticisms are also expressed by Mr. Jogendranath Bhattacharya, Head Master, Hooghly Collegiate School, Chinsura; Mr. Ravaneswar Banerjee, Head Master, Hooghly Branch School, Chinsura; Mr. Bhuban Mohan Chaudhuri, Head Master, Zilla School, Pabna; Mr. Umes Chandra Haldar, Head Master, Zilla School, Rangpur; Mr. Har Mohun De, Head Master, Mymensingh Zilla School; and Mr. C. H. Mazumdar, Head Master, Mrityunjoy School, Mymensingh.

[3] Question 9.

work has to be done in colleges, which, in England.....would be done in the schools."[1] Mr. Kalipada Sarkar, Assistant Inspector of Schools, Chittagong Division, suggests a rearrangement of the examinations which would "ensure a greater general proficiency on the part of candidates for admission to the University."[1] Maulvi Tassadduq Ahmed, Assistant Inspector of Schools for Muhammadan Education, Burdwan Division, writes :—

"The matriculation standard has been lowered unconscionably..... The general training that a boy receives at school is not sufficient equipment for him to reap the full benefit of a university education. In fact, in the beginning of his university career, and even for some time afterwards, he has no other alternative than to burden his memory with things which he cannot fully grasp."[1]

Dissatisfaction with the present standards and scope of the matriculation examination is expressed also by Mr. T. O. D. Dunn, Inspector of Schools for the Presidency Division, Mr. M. P. West and Miss M. V. Irons.

16. Disapproval of the present standard of matriculation to the University is not confined to those engaged, whether as teachers or administrators, in educational work in colleges and schools but is shared by some public associations and by men holding important positions in the liberal professions and in public life. The Bengal Landholders' Association,[1] the Marwari Community[2] and the People's Association, Khulna,[1] all recommend that the standard should be stiffened materially. Raja Pramada Nath Ray[1] of Dighapatia thinks that—

"the present conditions of admission to the University of Calcutta ..... do not qualify the students to follow the university training with facility. The matriculation standard should be considerably raised, but not beyond the means and resources of the existing matriculation schools."

Rai Rajendra Chandra Sastri Bahadur[1] urges that—

"the matriculation test should be made stiffer and the examination, specially in English, more searching than it is now. There has been of late a distinct fall in the standard of the examination and the number of 'passes' has in consequence gone up, with the result that boys with a very indifferent knowledge of English secure admission to colleges."

Sir Nilratan Sircar[1] is "not satisfied with the present matriculation examination" and thinks that some additional subjects,

[1] Question 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 16.

including elementary physics and chemistry, should be made compulsory in it. Mr. Altaf Ali[1] thinks "the present matriculation standard very low.....and that the ease with which an average student gets through his matriculation has a deteriorating effect upon him." Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee[1] proposes important additions to the compulsory subjects. Mr Kamini Kumar Chanda,[1] member of the Imperial Legislative Council, thinks that the "student should be better grounded before admission to the University." Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury[1] thinks that "the matriculation course should be so framed that those who pass it should be able to derive solid benefit from a university course." In the judgment of Justice Sir Ali Imam[1] "it is certainly easier to pass the matriculation than the old entrance examination. At the same time, the student is much less prepared to take up a university course than he was in the old days."

III.

17. We now turn to the more detailed criticisms made by our correspondents. Much of the evidence which we have received relates to the low standard of attainment which at present is sufficient to secure a pass in three of the obligatory subjects—mathematics, vernacular and English.

18. With regard to mathematics in the matriculation, Mr. Raj Mohan Sen of Rajshahi College takes a not discouraging view. He writes :[1]—

"It seems to be the general opinion among the teachers of colleges that the present standard of the matriculation examination is too low to enable the students to follow the university course just after passing that examination. But, speaking for myself as a teacher of mathematics, I wish to say that I do not find particular difficulties in this respect, since I take the students as I find them, and begin where they ended their mathematical studies at school. I should, of course, be glad if they came better prepared, for in that case, it would be possible for me to begin a little higher work with them at once."

19. Dr. Brajendranath Seal writes[2] :—

"A source of stumbling is the easy general paper in arithmetic, algebra and geometry, at the matriculation. In recognition of a broad distinction between two classes of students, the linguistically minded and the mathematically (or the realistically) minded, the new regulations of 1906 provided

[1] Question 8.

[2] Question 15. See also answer of Mr. Bhuban Mohan Chaudhuri to Question 10.

for higher optional courses in mathematics and classics, in addition to a compulsory minimum in each : a case of incipient or rudimentary and, as it should be at this stage, very limited bifurcation, essentially sound in principle, adapting our examination scheme to the natural distribution of mental aptitudes and interests and reducing harmful mental pressure, malnutrition of the brain and the wastage of failure. Unfortunately the compulsory minimum in mathematics has been fixed too low by the paper-setters but, even as it is, it is not inadequate to the needs of studies in the university in English literature, or a classical language, or history. The real trouble began with the mal-administration in some of our colleges ; they allowed intermediate mathematics and physics to be taken up by those students who had no additional mathematics before."

20. The Rev. Father Crohan and staff of St. Xavier's College, Calcutta,[1] recommend that the standard in mathematics should be raised. Mr. F. C. Turner writes[1] :—

"In mathematics, the paper has recently been very badly set. Alternatives are set to almost every question so that candidates who find any particular detail of the subject difficult (*e.g.*, square root or Euclid I,47) can pass it over altogether in the confidence that they will not be required to show knowledge of it in the examination. The mechanical side of the work is also neglected. I am aware that in England a few years ago far too much attention was paid to complicated fractions in arithmetic and algebra and to questions in arithmetic involving merely mechanical accuracy, and I do not suggest that boys in Indian schools should be subjected to a large amount of meaningless toil, but they should, at least, be trained to manipulate with ease and accuracy such expressions as constantly occur in more advanced mathematics, and it cannot be denied that, under present circumstances, unless more complicated questions are set in the matriculation examination, they will not be given this training in the schools."

21. Mr. F. W. Südmersen, Principal, Cotton College, Gauhati,[1] recommends that the standard required to be reached in mathematics should be raised. "At present," he writes, "it is possible for a pupil to pass in mathematics by correctly working out the first four rules in arithmetic, supplementing this by a few propositions in Euclid."

22. We have found that in some of the weak schools the teaching of mathematics does not attempt to cover the whole matriculation course in this subject. Sometimes algebra is omitted altogether, sometimes even geometry. In the best schools the matriculation standard is reached two years before the examination is taken. The average marks of the candidates in

[1] Question 8.

compulsory mathematics in the matriculation examination of 1917 were 62, or 12 marks above the minimum required for passing in the first division, and 32 marks above the minimum prescribed for the examination.

23. The question of the standard which should be fixed as the minimum to be reached in mathematics by all candidates, boys and girls, in a general examination which can be taken from secondary schools at about 16 years of age is not easy to determine. On the one hand, if the subject is intelligently taught, the educational value of mathematics is high. Examination in arithmetic, algebra and geometry tests a candidate's accuracy, reasoning power and clearness of mind. If the teaching is good and the examination wisely conducted, the subject lends itself less easily than many others to cramming. And an exacting standard in an examination which makes mathematics a compulsory subject for all candidates compels the schools to give much attention to it and to provide competent mathematical teaching.

24. On the other hand, minds vary widely in their aptitude for mathematics, and in this subject a small number of otherwise very able pupils (generally because they have been badly taught in the elementary stage) fall below the standard which is easily reached by their contemporaries. The wider the range of compulsory subjects in an examination, the more care should be taken to avoid putting the physical strain which a high all-round standard may impose upon some otherwise promising candidates, and particularly upon some girls. But the number of compulsory subjects in the Calcutta matriculation is not large. All of those subjects, except mathematics, are linguistic. In the present conditions, therefore, the standard in mathematics is low and not calculated either to keep mathematical teaching in the schools at a proper level of excellence or to require the candidates to give enough attention to all the elementary branches of the subject.

25. *Vernacular.*—Several correspondents think that the standard in the examinations in the vernacular should be raised. For example, Mr. Hem Chandra Das Gupta[1] of Presidency College writes: "Proficiency in vernacular should be tested not merely by

[1] Question 8.

setting questions on composition, but text-books should be prescribed and questions set on those tests."[1]

The Rev. Otto Stursberg, Principal of the London Missionary Society's High School at Berhampur, finds that "Bengali boys have comparatively little facility in writing Bengali, probably because they read very few good books in the vernacular." Rai Sahib Bidhubhusan Goswami, Professor at Dacca College, and Rai Lalitmohan Chatterjee Bahadur, Principal of Jagannath College, Dacca, spoke in their oral evidence of the teaching of Bengali in the schools as inadequate and unsatisfactory.[2] Mr. Akshay Kumar Maitra, Director of the Varendra Research Society, laid great stress on the need for a thorough study of Bengali in the schools.

26. Mr. Jogendra Nath Hazra[3] of Midnapore College brings out clearly one unhappy result of this neglect :—

"One cause of the students' deficiency on entering the University is the defective training which they have received in the vernacular.

The vernacular is never seriously taught or studied except in the lowest classes before boys begin to study English. This neglect of the vernacular produces a serious defect in the training of a boy. He continues to think and speak ordinarily in his vernacular, in which he has not been taught to express himself accurately and systematically. As what we write or speak in English is a mere translation of our thoughts in vernacular, we fail to express ourselves in English very clearly and in good order unless this habit is acquired early in the vernacular."

27. *English.*—It is of the standard required for passing in English that complaints are most general and criticism most severe. To our question 11, which asked whether on entering the University students have an adequate command of English, 36 correspondents reply in the affirmative and 168 in the negative. Mr. J. M. Bose of Presidency College estimates that "about 20 per

[1] More attention to vernacular literature in the examination is also urged by Mr. Umacharan Banerji of Burdwan, Mr. Charu Chandra Biswas, Professor, University Law College, and Mr. Birendra Kumar Datta of Mymensingh, in answer to Question 11, and by Mr. Umes Chandra Haldar, Head Master of the Zilla School, Rangpur, and Kazi Imdadul Huque, Head Master of the Calcutta Training School, in answers to Question 8.

[2] A higher standard in Bengali is also desired by Mr. Bhuban Mohan Chaudhuri, Head Master of the Zilla School, Pabna, and Mr. Rajendranath Vidyabhusan in answer to Question 10 and by Mahamahopadhyaya Pramathanath Tarkabhushana, Professor, Sanskrit College, Calcutta, and Mr. M. P. West in answer to Question 11.

[3] Question 8.

cent. of the students in mufassal colleges give up their studies owing to their inability to follow the lectures in English."[1] Mr. Karuna Kanta Das Gupta, Head Master of the Collegiate School, Gauhati, writes: "It is said that only a little above 60 per cent. of the matriculates, on their entrance to the University, are found to be well equipped in English."[1] Another school master, Mr. Bimalananda Sen, Head Master of Noakhila P. N. High School, Chandanbaisa, near Bogra, thinks that only in about 50 per cent. of the cases, students have an adequate command of English on their entrance to the University. Mr. Radhikanath Bose, Principal, Edward College, Pabna, writes[1]:—

"During my ten years' experience as a teacher of English in the intermediate college classes, I have come across very few students entering the University with an adequate command of English. The large majority of our present day matriculates find it difficult to follow the lectures and..... cannot express their ideas freely in English when required to do so."

From Chittagong, Mr. Purnachandra Kundu,[2] Officiating Principal of the college, writes:—

"From my experience of students who just enter colleges, I find that they are so very deficient in English that it is impossible to reason how they have got through the present matriculation test in English, even if the examination had been conducted with reasonable leniency."

Mr. Akshaykumar Sarkar,[2] Professor of History at the same college, says that—

"as teacher and examiner I have known many students passing the matriculation and I.A. examinations without being able to write four or five simple sentences in correct English."

Mr. Wahed Hossain,[2] Secretary of the Bengal Presidency Muhammadan Association, writes:—

"Most of the students leave high schools before they are fit for entering upon a university career. Their knowledge of English remains so defective that they can hardly follow college lectures with profit. . . . . This is school work which should have been done in the secondary stage of their education."

The Rev. W. H. G. Holmes, Superintendent of the Oxford Mission Hostel in Calcutta, writes[1]—

"I have to interview hundreds of students who have just passed the matriculation examination. Bad as my Bengali is, they understand it better than they understand my English. They cannot possibly follow lectures given in English, and the dictation and learn-by-heart method is indispensable."

---

[1] Question 11.

[2] Question 8.

28. The Senatus of the Scottish Churches College, Calcutta, take a rather more hopeful view.

"The first year classes in our college," they write,[1] "contain large numbers of students who have heard no English, properly read, and comparatively little of it spoken in any fashion. For weeks in these classes they have to struggle both with the subject matter and with the English medium, and this too in spite of the pains taken to make things clear. Students of real ability soon overcome these difficulties."

29. The defect, however, in many cases remains. It is with a view to remedying it that Sir Rash Behary Ghose[3] "would require a better knowledge of English in matriculation candidates;" that Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee[2] complains of encouragement being given to a wrong method of teaching English up to the matriculation stage; and that Dr. Kedarnath Das[3] of the Campbell Medical School presses for a higher standard in the matriculation, for a stiffening of the standard of marking the papers in English and for improvements in the teaching of English in school.

30. The low standard of school work drags down the level of the matriculation. "During the last twenty years," writes Mr. Promode Chandra Dutta[4] of Sylhet, "I have found that our students' command of English is not adequate. There seems to be no ground for thinking that matters have gone from bad to worse in recent years." On the other hand, Maulvi Mohammad Irfan of Dacca College thinks "that the students do not have as adequate a command of English at present as they had before."[4] Whichever view be correct, the evil can be remedied. But as things are, Dr. D. N. Mallik of Presidency College may well complain that—

"the present system involves a tremendous wastage of energy. A boy often leaves school practically ignorant of English, although he has had English taught him for eight years. He is not so dull as all that—none of our boys are—and yet that is the result."[3]

31. Some of our evidence suggests that the standard of teaching English is higher in parts of Madras Presidency than in most of the schools in Bengal. Mr. Justice Abdur Rahim[4] writes that in Madras students have generally an adequate command of English when

[1] Question 1.

[2] Question 1.—Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee's view that "a foreign language can be learnt correctly only by close and thorough reading of a few well-chosen books and a text-book on grammar at the early stages of the student's progress" is shared by several correspondents.

[3] Question 8.

[4] Question 11.

cent. of the students in mufassal colleges give up their studies owing to their inability to follow the lectures in English."[1] Mr. Karuna Kanta Das Gupta, Head Master of the Collegiate School, Gauhati, writes: "It is said that only a little above 60 per cent. of the matriculates, on their entrance to the University, are found to be well equipped in English."[1] Another school master, Mr. Bimalananda Sen, Head Master of Noakhila P. N. High School, Chandanbaisa, near Bogra, thinks that only in about 50 per cent. of the cases, students have an adequate command of English on their entrance to the University. Mr. Radhikanath Bose, Principal, Edward College, Pabna, writes[1]:—

"During my ten years' experience as a teacher of English in the intermediate college classes, I have come across very few students entering the University with an adequate command of English. The large majority of our present day matriculates find it difficult to follow the lectures and..... cannot express their ideas freely in English when required to do so."

From Chittagong, Mr. Purnachandra Kundu,[2] Officiating Principal of the college, writes:—

"From my experience of students who just enter colleges, I find that they are so very deficient in English that it is impossible to reason how they have got through the present matriculation test in English, even if the examination had been conducted with reasonable leniency."

Mr. Akshaykumar Sarkar,[2] Professor of History at the same college, says that—

"as teacher and examiner I have known many students passing the matriculation and I.A. examinations without being able to write four or five simple sentences in correct English."

Mr. Wahed Hossain,[2] Secretary of the Bengal Presidency Muhammadan Association, writes:—

"Most of the students leave high schools before they are fit for entering upon a university career. Their knowledge of English remains so defective that they can hardly follow college lectures with profit. . . . . This is school work which should have been done in the secondary stage of their education."

The Rev. W. H. G. Holmes, Superintendent of the Oxford Mission Hostel in Calcutta, writes[1]—

"I have to interview hundreds of students who have just passed the matriculation examination. Bad as my Bengali is, they understand it better than they understand my English. They cannot possibly follow lectures given in English, and the dictation and learn-by-heart method is indispensable."

---

[1] Question 11.

[2] Question 8.

28. The Senatus of the Scottish Churches College, Calcutta, take a rather more hopeful view.

"The first year classes in our college," they write,[1] "contain large numbers of students who have heard no English, properly read, and comparatively little of it spoken in any fashion. For weeks in these classes they have to struggle both with the subject matter and with the English medium, and this too in spite of the pains taken to make things clear. Students of real ability soon overcome these difficulties."

29. The defect, however, in many cases remains. It is with a view to remedying it that Sir Rash Behary Ghose[3] "would require a better knowledge of English in matriculation candidates;" that Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee[2] complains of encouragement being given to a wrong method of teaching English up to the matriculation stage; and that Dr. Kedarnath Das[3] of the Campbell Medical School presses for a higher standard in the matriculation, for a stiffening of the standard of marking the papers in English and for improvements in the teaching of English in school.

30. The low standard of school work drags down the level of the matriculation. "During the last twenty years," writes Mr. Promode Chandra Dutta[4] of Sylhet, "I have found that our students' command of English is not adequate. There seems to be no ground for thinking that matters have gone from bad to worse in recent years." On the other hand, Maulvi Mohammad Irfan of Dacca College thinks "that the students do not have as adequate a command of English at present as they had before."[4] Whichever view be correct, the evil can be remedied. But as things are, Dr. D. N. Mallik of Presidency College may well complain that—

"the present system involves a tremendous wastage of energy. A boy often leaves school practically ignorant of English, although he has had English taught him for eight years. He is not so dull as all that—none of our boys are—and yet that is the result."[3]

31. Some of our evidence suggests that the standard of teaching English is higher in parts of Madras Presidency than in most of the schools in Bengal. Mr. Justice Abdur Rahim[4] writes that in Madras students have generally an adequate command of English when

[1] Question 1.

[2] Question 1.—Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee's view that "a foreign language can be learnt correctly only by close and thorough reading of a few well-chosen books and a text-book on grammar at the early stages of the student's progress" is shared by several correspondents.

[3] Question 8.

[4] Question 11.

they enter the University. Mr. Mark Hunter[1], till recently Professor of English in Madras and now Director of Public Instruction, Burma, is of the same opinion.

32. But complaints about the defective English of many students after matriculation are by no means confined to Bengal. We have received them from correspondents in Bombay, Poona Nagpur, Delhi, Lucknow, Allahabad, Agra, Lahore, Peshawar, Indore and Mandalay[2] and from Sir P. S. Sivaswasmy Aiyer,[1] till recently Vice-Chancellor of the Madras University, with reference to Madras. We ourselves were especially impressed by the results of the teaching of English in two of the secondary schools which we visited. One of these schools is in Madras; the other in Calcutta.

33. But, taken as a whole, the evidence from Bengal shows incontestably that the work of the colleges is clogged by the ignorance and immaturity of many who matriculate. Their ignorance is noticeable in many of the subjects which are indispensable to a liberal education through whatever medium that education may be given. But in regard to the use and full understanding of the English language the inadequate attainments of a large number of those admitted to college are conspicuous and embarrassing. English is the medium of university education in India, and, unless a boy knows English well when he enters college, he cannot follow the teaching which is offered to him. Having in view the special need which these conditions of university education in India impose, four out of every five of our witnesses hold that a great number of university students in Bengal do not possess on entering the college the command of English which they require. In English at any rate, whatever may be true of the other subjects in which every candidate is required to pass, success in the matriculation examination does not necessarily guarantee fitness for entering the University. In this respect, if in no other, the title of the examination has become a misnomer. Not all of those who pass it are fit for university studies or rightly regarded as ready to matriculate.

---

[1] Question 11.

[2] See answers to Question 11 from Mr. J. G. Covernton, Mr. D. K. Karve (Sir R. Bhandarkar takes a more favourable view), Dr. H. N. Allen, Mr. A. I. Mayhew, Mr. S. K. Rudra, Mr. M. B. Cameron, Mr. A. C. Chatterjee, Mr. S. G. Dunn, Mr. T. Cuthbertson Jones, Mr. Mian Muhammad Fazli Husain, Mr. C. E. W. Jones, Mr. W. Owston Smith and Mr. Taw Sein Ko.

34. But the difficulties of the present situation cannot be brushed aside by a statement that, as this examination does not invariably or sufficiently attest fitness to enter college, the remedy lies in so raising its standard that only those who are in all respects ready for university studies may hope to pass it. Many of our correspondents feel that, by insensible degrees and in response to public needs, the Calcutta matriculation examination has taken upon itself a second function unlike that for which it was originally designed, and that it now serves not only as a test of fitness for the University but as a general examination for secondary schools. The standard of attainment, it is urged, which may well be required for the first of these purposes is not necessarily the most suitable for the second. Not every pupil in a secondary school means to go on to college. From a boy who means to earn his living directly he leaves school you need not exact the same kind of facility in writing English or in understanding the vocabulary of the college lecture room as from the boy or girl who means to go on from school to a university career. In each case a minimum must be enforced. But what will be sufficient for the needs of one pupil will be inadequate to the needs of the other.

35. Having in mind this diversity of need, Mr. Justice T. V. Seshagiri Iyer of Madras writes in his answer to Question 11.

"Too much importance is being attached to the study of English...A high degree of proficiency in English is needed for two professions, law and teaching. But, for general diffusion of knowledge, which the country stands greatly in need of, the requirement of a high degree of proficiency in English is unnecessary and uncalled for."

Even within the University itself there are different degrees of need for the knowledge of English. "It must be open to students to specialise in English," Mr. Seshagiri Iyer continues, "but this must be left to their option." In studying science at the University, for example, an undergraduate needs great facility in English, but the English which he requires is not quite of the same kind as that necessary for admission to an advanced course on English literature.

36. We return in a later section of this chapter to the true function of what is now known as the matriculation examination. At this point, it will suffice to sum up the conclusions which may be drawn from the evidence already cited. The Calcutta matriculation examination in its present form does not distinguish sufficiently

(or enable college authorities to distinguish) between exceptional and average merit among the successful candidates. It allows a very considerable number of ill-educated candidates to pass. The standard of its test in English makes no discrimination between the needs of those who intend to enter the University and of those who do not. The colleges suffer from having to deal in their intermediate classes with a large number of boys who are immature for university work and do not know enough English to follow the lectures with understanding or to express themselves fully and accurately in what they write. From the point of view of the University there is urgent need for reform in the methods, and for changes in the outlook, of the secondary schools. And at the intermediate stage most boys need a kind of training and of guidance which at present the secondary schools cannot give them and the colleges are not organised to provide.

IV.

37. It would be misleading and unjust to say that the wish to pass examinations and to get a degree is the chief cause of the desire for western education which is spreading rapidly in Bengal. Western thought and science have something to give which is indispensable to social change in India, to her political unity and to the extraction of greater wealth from the resources of her soil. This fact, dimly apprehended by the multitude and pregnant with change of which no one can predict the course or issue, is one of the most significant factors in the instinctive movement of so considerable a part of the population towards the high schools and the University. Were we to consider individual cases alone we might draw a very different conclusion and find a supposed self-interest to be the chief, or at any rate the most fully realised, cause of this hunger for higher education. But in great drifts of opinion individuals act under the impulse of the momentum which stirs the mass. Beneath the motive which the individual may assign for his own action there lies a deeper cause, often masked by an illusion of self-regard, which constrains him, though he may be only half-conscious of its pressure, to move in the direction determined by the aims and sentiments of the people to which he belongs.

38. But, though the educational movement draws its strength from forces which affect the whole community, and not the instructed classes or the University alone, the matriculation examination

is the mainspring of the existing machinery of secondary education in Bengal. What the rules of the matriculation prescribe the high schools endeavour to perform. To pass their boys through the examination has become their dominant aim. The pressure which forces them to concentrate upon this narrow purpose is great. It comes from the parents and even from the boys themselves. The members of school committees are sensitive to it. The teachers, though many of them are well aware of the injury done to education, are compelled to succumb.

39. Thus, a perverted and uninspiring view of higher education has become general. The schools are cramped by it. At the very time when the instinct of the people is turning its hopes towards education, the work actually done in the schools is suffering from a blight which spreads so quickly as to threaten public and private hopes with disappointment. The desire for education, though it springs from needs which good schools alone can satisfy, is perverted into a demand for what a school must deteriorate in consenting to give. But the pressure is irresistible, and the schools in yielding to it are spoiled. Nor is this the whole of the loss. The profession of teaching becomes less and less attractive to able and generous minds because, as the generally accepted view of education grows meaner and narrower, a teacher has the less opportunity of realising in his work the purpose which alone lifts his calling from a despised trade to one of the noblest of professions.

40. Why have so many of the secondary schools in Bengal been led to concentrate their efforts narrowly upon getting their pupils through the matriculation examination? What has induced among teachers, parents and school committees in the Presidency a habit of mind so repressive of vital force in education, and that at a time when the strongest tendencies in the West encourage a liberal view of the work of secondary schools? The explanation is found in the very limited range of careers open to educated young Indians, in the value of a knowledge of English to those who enter such careers, and in the disproportionate degree of importance which is consequently attached to recognised certificates of literary attainment.

41. In an Indian boy's career, success or failure in the matriculation is, so far as it goes, decisive. The boy knows how much depends upon his getting a matriculation certificate, the first coupon in the

book of tickets which will alone admit him to the coveted callings in life. His parents and guardians realise, and make him understand, that unless he passes this examination, all the more honoured occupations will be for ever closed to him. Family interests will be injured by his failure. His own social position will be clouded by it. To the end of his days, he will be no more than a 'failed matriculate' and, unless the wealth of his family secures other openings for him, will have to be content with the humble occupation to which alone a failed matriculate can aspire. Can we wonder therefore at the place which the matriculation takes in his and his parents' thoughts?

42. In the life of an English or American school boy there is no test upon which so much turns, no examination to fail in which brings such irretrievable disaster. An active business career, a life of adventure abroad, the army, the sea, are all for one reason or another less open to the Bengali boy than to a boy in the West. They may not be so firmly closed to him as he imagines. What restricts his choice is in some degree an inhibition of mind. His preoccupation with university certificates is partly self-imposed, in a still greater degree the result of a social tradition. Matriculation is the key which unlocks the door to all the callings attractive to the respectable classes in Bengal. And at that door the crowd grows larger every year.

43. Our witnesses agree that, under existing conditions, the matriculation examination dominates unduly the secondary schools in Bengal and exerts an unintended degree of influence in determining both what shall be done in them and what left undone. The unhappy effects of this influence upon the educational system as a whole will be more fully dealt with in a later chapter.[1] But it is at its worst in the schools. "The percentage of passes tests the success or otherwise of a school," says Mr. Karuna Kanta Das Gupta.[2]

"Pupils at present look upon their school or college life as nothing but a preparation for university examinations," writes Mr. Jogendranath Bhattacharya,[2] "their horizon is circumscribed as they have no higher aim than to pass examinations. When a certificate is the chief end and aim, any subject that does not lend itself to the test becomes neglected. This oppressive system has also affected the method of instruction. Teachers are only too careful to teach those things that will be set at the final examination,

[1] Chapter XVII.

[2] Question 9.

The number of passes being the goal, the spirit of inquiry in the pupil is smothered, cram lessons and 'keys' receive encouragement."

"Teaching is being unduly subordinated to examination," writes Mr. Akshaykumar Sarkar of Chittagong, "the teacher's success depends upon the number of students he has made to pass. Some school authorities have taken teachers to task for failing to pass a high percentage of students. Students themselves say that they come not to learn but to pass the examination. Teachers also give way to this view very often. The guardians of students generally endorse the view."[1]

"The very large majority of the schools I have seen in East Bengal," writes Mr. J. W. Gunn, "are cram establishments pure and simple, where everything is subordinated to the immediate requirements of the matriculation examination."[1]

V.

44. As the matriculation exerts so great an influence upon the secondary schools and virtually fixes their curriculum, a large number of our correspondents urge that the number of compulsory subjects in the examination should be increased.

"The present curriculum of secondary schools," writes Dr. Jajneswar Ghosh, Principal of Ananda Mohan College, Mymensingh, "has been designed with a view to prepare students for a collegiate education. But a broad general culture is more important for the majority of the boys than a specialised training for advanced work in future.... I would therefore recommend the inclusion of geography, history and a physical science among the compulsory subjects for the matriculation examination."[2]

Dr. Brajendranath Seal also urges that the elements of physics, chemistry, geography, and history (of England and of India) should be made compulsory.[2] He writes that "taken all in all, the matriculation examination is a fairly good test, except that the blunder of having no compulsory geography and history and no science as examination subjects urgently demands rectification in any scheme of modern education."[3]

45. From another standpoint, a widening of the course of study in the secondary schools is urged by Mr. Meghnad Saha, Lecturer at the University College of Science, Calcutta. He suggests that the high schools in Bengal are—

"fairly well distributed all over the country and are easily accessible to the masses of the population. These schools can easily be used for the

[1] Question 9.
[2] Question 13.
[3] Question 8.

cultural education of the people up to the age of sixteen, so that on leaving school the student may carry with him a sufficient stock of knowledge to enable him to become a useful and intelligent citizen of the Empire." He recommends therefore that "the teaching of history (both Indian and European), geography, elements of physics, chemistry, hygiene, the modern political history of the country, and a little physiology and physical geography should be seriously undertaken in these institutions, besides vernacular, mathematics, English and a classical language."[1]

46. Mr. H. Sharp, Educational Commissioner with the Government of India, writes equally strongly upon this subject.

"The course set for the matriculation," he says, "omits, or makes optional, certain subjects which should figure in a secondary school. This omission does not, of course, mean that the subjects in question are not taught in the lower stages (some of them naturally are), or even that they cannot be taught in the high classes synchronously with those specifically taken for the matriculation. But a subject which is not an examination subject does not receive much attention..... Theoretically a boy may enter upon university courses, totally ignorant of history and geography, since these are optional subjects. In practice he would always know something about them. But his knowledge, if he does not take up these subjects as optional, will be inadequate, since he will have studied them but slightly or not at all, during the preceding two or three years. He is almost certain to be wholly ignorant of science. No provision is made at the matriculation save for elementary mechanics as an optional; and most schools are unequipped for any sort of science teaching. The examination does not provide for drawing and manual training and, in my experience, these are taught quite inadequately, if at all, in lower classes in secondary schools. Hygiene does not form an examination subject and is probably very little taught."[1]

47. Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee[2] suggests that—

"the rules allowing a multiplicity of options in the selection of subjects should be abolished and that the subjects of examination should be—(1) English prose and poetry—text-books. (2) The candidate's vernacular with elementary knowledge of its kindred classical language. (3) Mathematics, including arithmetic (the whole), algebra up to quadratic equations and the progressions, and plane geometry up to properties of similar triangles. (4) Elementary histories of England and India and general geography. (5) Elements of physics and chemistry. There should be two papers in each subject..... This scheme of subjects, with syllabuses modest and embracing only the broad points of each subject, will afford a common basis of general culture for all students, whatever subsequent careers they may choose. An agriculturist will be none the worse for the little classics he may learn, nor a literary scholar for his little physics and chemistry."

48. Mr. Haridas Bhattacharyya[2] sums up his view in the words "The matriculation course should be remodelled so as to provide

[1] Question 13.
[2] Question 8.

an all-round general training, and optional subjects should be as few as possible." Rai Lalitmohan Chatterjee Bahadur[1] recommends that—

"more compulsory subjects should be prescribed (including general geography, history of England and elementary general science); no optional questions should be set; the minimum pass mark should be raised; in examining papers a less rigid method should be followed, and importance should chiefly be attached to clearness of thought and expression."

49. The addition of both geography and history to the compulsory subjects in the matriculation examination is urged by a very large number of our correspondents[2] and by almost all the teachers whom we consulted during our enquiry in Bengal. The general ignorance of geography was the subject of unfavourable comment not on the part of teachers only but of many employers and administrative officers. For example, Mr. G. R. Clarke, Postmaster-General, Bengal and Assam Circle, spoke of the embarrassment caused to the Post Office by the defective knowledge of ordinary geographical facts. Mr. K. Zachariah[3] complained of the importance of geographical teaching in its relation to history: "I know from experience the bitter futility of trying to make English history intelligible to students who have the vaguest ideas about the situation of London or Paris or Dublin and who do not know that the Severn is a river and the Pennines a mountain range." Mr. Rajanikanta Guha expresses the general opinion when he writes that it should not be possible for a student to finish his university education in ignorance of the history of his own country and of Great Britain.[3] Khan Bahadur Maulvi Ahsanullah, Additional Inspector of Schools, Presidency Division, advises the correlation of geography and history in the matriculation course.[3] The People's Association, Khulna,[1] speak of history and geography as "essential in any education which can be called liberal in any sense of the term." Mr. Radhikanath Bose says that he has "experienced not a little difficulty in teaching works of English literature to students of the intermediate classes who have absolutely no idea of English history and are unacquainted with the com-

[1] Question 8.

[2] The inclusion of geography is urged by sixty-five in answer to Question 8 and by fifty in answer to Question 13. The inclusion of history is urged by fifty-two correspondents in answer to Question 8 and thirty-six in answer to Question 13.

[3] Question 13.

monest geographical names."[1] Mr. P. K. Chatterjee of Carmichael College, Rangpur, writes that "it is extremely difficult to teach economics to students who have no knowledge of history and geography."[1] The Marwari Community[2] of Calcutta ask that both history and geography may be included in the matriculation for a commercial course. Mr. Sushil Kumar De[3] and the staff of Serampore College[3] mention cases of grotesque ignorance of elementary geography and history.

50. The inclusion of elementary science (especially hygiene) among the compulsory subjects of the matriculation course is advised in one hundred and forty-one of the answers from our correspondents.[4] Five of them are collective answers from members of college staffs or associations. "The teaching of some science in the schools is of vital importance," writes Mr. Ramananda Chatterjee.[1] Writing from another province, Dr. Wali Mohammad,[1] Professor of Physics at the M. A. O. College, Aligarh, says :—

"It is regrettable to find that there is practically no science teaching whatever in the schools in Bengal. One of the optional subjects for the matriculation examination is mechanics, but very few candidates offer this subject..... It is a pity that the advantages of teaching science and scientific methods are not fully appreciated. I have often acted as an examiner in science for the school leaving certificate examination of the U. P. and I am convinced of the beneficial results which the study of science and the accompanying practical work in the laboratory have on young boys in developing their powers of observation, in teaching them method and system, in inculcating habits of accurate thought and accurate expression and in stimulating their imagination."

51. Apart from object-lessons and a little hygiene in the lower classes no science is taught in the secondary schools except mechanics, which may be taken for matriculation, but is not always well-taught. The view expressed by many of our witnesses is that the high school course should give a general introduction to science and should include the elements of physics and chemistry.

52. Mr. Wordsworth[1] agrees that general elementary science should be included in the school curriculum. But, writing under

[1] Question 13.

[2] General Memoranda, page 16.

[3] Question 8.

[4] Twenty-four in answer to Question 8 and one hundred and seventeen in answer to Question 13.

the weight of administrative responsibility for the progress of education in Bengal, he points out that three difficulties will have to be overcome before the teaching of science can be effectively introduced. First, science teachers for schools are not at present available in sufficient numbers: second, practical training in the laboratory must be insisted upon or the teaching of science will tend to take the form of book-work alone; third, the expense of school laboratories and their equipment will have to be met.

53. Other witnesses realise the magnitude of these difficulties. The first, *i.e.*, the lack of trained teachers, can be remedied, but only on two conditions, *viz.*, (1) that, as the Rammohun Library Conference[1] and other witnesses point out, an earnest effort is made to improve the status of the teaching profession (perhaps the worst in this country in the matter of pay and prospects), and to place the teachers above want, and (2) that, when the teaching profession has been made sufficiently attractive to secure a large number of recruits of ability, a course of professional training should be insisted upon as a qualification for appointment to the staff of a secondary school. "A radical change in the methods of teaching is necessary," writes Dr. D. N. Mallik.[2]

54. With regard to the second difficulty (the need for insistence upon laboratory work) Mr. M. P. West[3] has some useful suggestions. "Science teaching in a good laboratory," he writes, "is not possible. But all the better schools could give a very simple course in botany and zoology, or very elementary physics, or physiology, or astronomy. All these are possible." This view is taken by another witness who writes with full knowledge of what the schools can do—Mr. P. N. Nag,[3] Head Master of the U. F. C. Mission High School, Chinsura. It is confirmed by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur,[3] of the Bengal Legislative Council.

55. Dr. Brajendranath Seal[4] has an interesting note upon the third difficulty, *viz.*, the cost of equipment.

"Elementary science in our schools also ought not to be impossible. I would submit that we have gone the wrong way in proceeding about this business of science teaching. We have made too much of expensive equipment—of work tables and room space on too lavish a scale for the needs of elementary science. For the matriculation, elementary practical lessons in biology could

[1] General Memoranda, page 439.

[2] Question 8.

[3] Question 13.

[4] General Memoranda, page 373.

be given at a small cost, and after the initial outlay, the recurring cost would be small. The same is true, in great measure, of elementary chemistry. The entire (recurrent) cost could be met by raising the school fees by a small fraction. For modest beginnings the initial cost would be defrayed by the same private liberality which keeps going the larger part of the machinery of secondary-high school) instruction in this province, and this may be eked out by *pro rata* departmental grants."

VI.

56. But it is not history, geography and elementary science alone that many of our correspondents regard as necessary additions to the high school course, both in its earlier stages and in the years immediately preceding matriculation. Dr. Brajendranath Seal, Mr. Gauranganath Banerjee, Dr. Gilbert Walker and Mr. Sharp[1] think that there should be manual training in the high school course. They represent a body of opinion already considerable in Bengal and likely to grow stronger.

57. Their view is supported by two forces in modern educational thought. The first is a conviction that the older tradition of secondary education is too exclusively bookish and therefore neglectful of many forms of activity through which the power of expression may be exercised and trained. This belief, urged by Professor John Dewey and other educational writers in the West, is reflected in the answer of Mr. Haridas Goswamy,[1] who writes that " the existing curricula of schools do not adequately recognise the fact that the child is a supremely active being who grows best by being allowed to work. Manual training should therefore find a place in the school curriculum."

58. The other argument which supports the claims of manual training rests upon the need of Bengal for a large number of intelligent and well educated young men who will throw themselves with vigour into practical and constructive work in industry. The present temper and habit of higher education, it is felt, give no encouragement to the kind of ability which is valuable in the profession of a mechanical or electrical engineer. Many boys who, in other educational surroundings, would discover that their interests lie in the direction of practical and constructive occupations are prevented from finding their true line and in some cases become the misfits of the other callings for which the schools at present prepare their pupils without regard to different kinds of

[1] Question 13.

ability and to the economic needs of the time. If systematic and intelligently varied courses of manual training had a more prominent and honoured place in the high schools, there would (it is thought) be a gradual lessening of the aversion from work with the hands which, from the point of view of its industrial prosperity, is one of the banes of Bengal.

59. Drawing is a necessary adjunct to manual training, but the importance of encouraging it as a factor in liberal education is urged by many correspondents from another point of view. "Æsthetic education is totally neglected in the schools," writes Mr. Haridas Bhattacharyya.[1] "The imaginative side of a student's mind must be kept alive," is Dr. Gilbert Walker's[1] comment on the situation as it affects schools and university alike, "or he will do no research of any value." Drawing and music should be included in the school curricula, he adds, and his view is supported by Kazi Imdadul Huque and Mr. Manmathanath Ray.[1] The need for more attention to music is touched upon by Dr. Prabhu Dutt Shastri and Mr. Vredenburg.[1]

60. That the schools should give instruction in religion and ethics is advised by many correspondents who regard the present form of high school education as deficient in some of the elements indispensable to the building up of character. Among the witnesses who give expression to this view are Mr. Rebati Raman Dutt, Maulvi Mohammad Irfan, Mr. Pran Hari Sen and Mr. Upendra Nath Banerjee.[2]

61. The importance of more systematic physical training in the high schools is dwelt upon by many witnesses, and Maulvi Khabiruddin Ahmed, Mr. Rames Chandra Ray and Rai Boikunt Nath Sen Bahadur[3] suggest that there should be a test of physical fitness before admission to the matriculation for the University.

62. It is true that drawing and religious knowledge can in some degree be tested by an examination, even when conducted upon a huge scale by a distant authority. But the results of manual training and of physical education require another kind of appraisement. In fact, the more importance that we attach to a wide range of activities in school life, the less inclined are

---

[1] Question 13.
[2] Questions 13 and 2.
[3] Question 8.

we to regard the machinery of written examination as in itself an adequate test either of the work which the schools are doing or of the general attainments of individual pupils. The modern view of a liberal education is making the vast collective examination look clumsy and old-fashioned.

63. For these reasons many of our witnesses, in their dissatisfaction with the present scope and results of high school training, find themselves led to recommend something much more drastic than additions to the list of compulsory subjects in the matriculation. They feel that the responsibility for declaring candidates fit to receive certificates must be thrown in some measure upon the schools themselves. This view is taken by Mr. M. A. N. Hydari,[1] of Hyderabad. He suggests for Bengal a scheme analogous to that adapted for the Osmania University, of which he is one of the founders.

In that case, the compulsory subjects for the matriculation are four :—

(*i*) English (consisting of two papers) *viz.*—

(*a*) Seen. From one prescribed book of prose and one prescribed book of poetry.

(*b*) Unseen. Consisting of an essay in English and translation into English from Urdu, Telugu, Marathi or Tamil.

(*ii*) History of England and India.

(*iii*) Geography of the World with special reference to India.

(*iv*) Mathematics, including elementary mensuration.

Besides these, each candidate must offer one of the following languages —Arabic, Sanskrit, Persian, Telugu, Marathi, Kanarese, Tamil. But, in addition to this, he has to produce a certificate, given by a high school recognised by the Osmania University, of having satisfactorily completed a course in the following subjects :—

(1) Urdu.

(2) Natural Science (as prescribed by the Hyderabad school-leaving certificate board).

(3) Muslim Theology or Hindu Ethics.

(4) Drawing.

(5) Physical training.

Thus, it is intended that a wide secondary education should be guaranteed but that the university matriculation should be limited to an examination in those subjects for which written papers are in themselves an adequate test.

[1] Question 8.

64. Many of our correspondents recommend the adoption of similar arrangements in Bengal.

"The only way to put a stop to the present evil system (of cram) is to give due weight to the written record of the pupils," writes Mr. Jogendranath Bhattacharya,[1] Head Master of the Hooghly Collegiate School, Chinsura. "This will make the tutorial work in the school or in the college more thorough. The boys at the same time will be more systematic and regular in their work. ..... Marks will be assigned to their written work which will count towards the final pass."

Dr. D. N. Mallik,[1] for example, suggests that schools should "be left to test the work in certain subjects and the result may be included in the certificates for admission to colleges." Among the subjects which he would thus deal with are drawing, practical work and, in some cases, history and geography. Mr. Umes Chandra Haldar[1] proposes that—

"for such specific courses as medicine, law, engineering, agriculture and commerce, a school leaving certificate, granted by the head of the institution in which the student has last read may be considered to be of the same value as a matriculation certificate."

Mr. Umacharan Banerji[2] recommends that "due cognisance should be taken of students' work, as tested by periodical class exercises and examinations, and their qualifications in respect of physical exercises and moral capacity duly considered." Mr. Chinta Haran Chakravarti[2] proposes that—

"in every examination certain marks.....should be allotted to the candidate's actual work in school..... The head master should, in consideration of the candidate's daily work, progress in studies and general behaviour in and outside the school, give him what marks he may deserve. No candidate should pass the examination unless he secures the minimum pass marks in this personal estimate of his work."

This, in Mr. Patrick Geddes' words, would supplement examination by estimation.[2] Twenty-three of our correspondents[3] incline to a modification of the present system by giving recognition to work done at school and certified by the head master. One of them, Mr. Mathura Kanta Nandi, suggests that the record of school work, though required to be sent in all cases along with the fee for matriculation, should be taken into account only in deciding doubtful cases when the candidate is on the line between success and failure.[2]

[1] Question 9.
[2] Question 10.
[3] Questions 9, 10 and 13.

65. But several witnesses, after considering the possibility of taking school-records into account for purposes of the matriculation examination, feel obliged to reject the plan. Rai Kumudini Kanta Banerjee Bahadur,[1] Principal of Rajshahi College, writes that "the teacher's certificate might take the place of examination in certain subjects such as practical physics, chemistry, botany, etc., if confidence be had in the teacher." He feels that there should be such confidence, but adds that it does not at present exist. Rai Mon Mohan Chakravarti Bahadur,[1] writes—

"the relaxation of the examination rules depends largely on the view taken of the teachers. In the English public schools, the principal is thoroughly relied upon as a rule, and any examination under his supervision is beyond cavil. In Bengal head masters of matriculation schools, Government or otherwise, have not yet attained that trustworthy status. In consequence the final school examination, if established, will be looked at with distrust."

Sir P. S. Sivaswamy Aiyer,[2] judging from his experience in Madras, writes that—

"the adjustment of examinations to the courses given by individual teachers presents insuperable difficulties and is unworkable. The experience of high schools with regard to subjects of teaching which are not included in a public examination induces diffidence as to the value of the remedy..... Head masters do not possess the firmness of decision required for the refusal of promotion to students who neglect subjects in which there is no public examination. This has specially been the case with regard to geography and Indian history."

Mr. F. C. Turner[1] thinks that "any relaxation under present conditions would lead to chaos." Kumar Manindra Chandra Sinha[3] of Paikpara Raj takes objection on another ground. "Many improvements may be suggested," he writes, "but they all involve enhanced expenditure." The same view is taken by Khan Bahadur Mohammad Ismail,[1] Vice-Chairman of the District Board, Mymensingh, who remarks that—

"unless we are prepared to spend more liberally on education, we cannot expect to get any satisfactory results by abolishing the present examination system. As the country cannot afford to pay more, I would not dare suggest any alteration in the existing system of examination."

66. For these and other reasons, the great majority of our correspondents evidently think that, in its main outlines, the present structure of the matriculation examination should be

[1] Question 9.

[2] *Ibid*, see also the answer to Question 9 from Mr. H. Sharp.

[3] Question 10.

retained. "It is very important," writes the Rev. A. B. Johnston[1] of St. Paul's Cathedral College, Calcutta, "to preserve the impersonality of the examinations and avoid the possibility, or the charge, of favouritism or undue influence."

VII.

67. But many suggestions are made for the improvement of the system. One witness, Dr. Prabhu Dutt Shastri,[2] proposes that the University should institute an oral test in English reading and conversation as part of the matriculation, but does not discuss the administrative difficulties of such a plan or indicate whether he would have the oral test compulsory on all candidates. Mr. Haridas Bhattacharyya[2] would abolish the 'test examination' except in the case of candidates who failed to show good weekly or monthly records 'of their work at school.' For these he would keep the 'test examination' as a second chance of being admitted to the matriculation. The Rev. Garfield Williams[2] would abolish 'preparation leave' before examinations, as the practice sets a premium on cramming. Mr. Govinda Chandra Bhowal[2] of Dacca would alter the time of year at which the matriculation examination is held but does not suggest a more convenient alternative. Mr. Pashupatinath Shastri[2] recommends that the matriculation examination should be held twice a year. "If any student fails to take the first chance, he should not have to lose one full year."

68. Changes in the method of marking the written papers are proposed by several witnesses, including Dr. Pramathanath Banerjea[2] who suggests that if a candidate gets very high marks in one subject, failure in others should not disqualify him for a pass. Another form of this suggestion is that made by Mr. Muraly Dhar Banerjee[2] and others that a candidate who has to take the examination a second time should be excused from being examined in the subjects in which he passed at the first attempt. Mr. Ramananda Chatterjee[3] puts the proposals in specific terms. "If any student fails in any subject, or in the aggregate, in the matriculation, but secures, say, 50 per cent. of the maximum marks in any subject, he should not be required to undergo an examination in this latter subject again." These and other criticisms of the

[1] Question 9.
[2] Question 10.
[3] Question 8.

existing methods of examination will be more fully dealt with in Chapter XVII; but the number and force of the criticisms show that dissatisfaction with the present system is deep and widespread.

69. One witness, Mr. Upendra Nath Banerjee,[1] thinks that in the matriculation examination the number of alternative questions should be increased. But a far larger number, including Rai Rajendra Chandra Sastri Bahadur, Mr. Benoy Kumar Sen and Mr. J. R. Banerjea[1] deprecate the present practice of setting alternative questions, one difficult, the other easier. Mr. J. R. Banerjea writes—

"most students choose the easier alternatives, and so it turns out that, though a paper may contain problems which are a real test of ability and intelligence, many of them may be avoided and yet a student, by choosing the easy alternatives, may get high marks."

Touching on a matter of organisation many Muslim witnesses[2] wish the candidates to be registered by roll-numbers and not by their names. Finally, there is a widespread feeling that experienced high school teachers should regularly be appointed to set papers for, and examine in, the matriculation. The desirability of thus keeping the examination more closely in touch with the work of the schools is urged by Mr. Mathura Kanta Nandi, Head Master of the Zilla School, Bankura, by Mr. Satish Chandra Sen, Head Master of the Hindu School, Calcutta, and by Mr. Haridas Bhattacharyya,[1] the last-named suggesting also that some of the examinerships should be given to qualified women.

70. Many of our correspondents are of opinion that the standard of marking in the matriculation examination should be made stiffer. There are also several suggestions for a change in the present method of classification of successful candidates. Mr. A. H. Harley,[3] Principal of the Calcutta Madrassah, thinks that—

"it would undoubtedly be to the great advantage of the University if the triple division of passes were abolished and only one grade of pass were recognised. The number of students passing in the second and third divisions is comparatively small and it would be better if the third division at least were done away with, and the minimum pass marks raised to 40 per cent. and that of the first division to 60 per cent."

The Rev. A. B. Johnston[3] thinks that—

"the present style of matriculation examination would do fairly well as a test if the pass standard were 50 per cent. of the total possible marks.

[1] Question 10.

[2] Including Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury, Question 10.

[3] Question 8.

Second and third divisioners ought to wait another year before entering the University. A pass standard of 40 per cent. in each subject and 50 per cent. on the total would be fairly effective in eliminating the unfit. For first class, 60 per cent. or 65 per cent. ought to be the standard."

The Rev. Father F. Crohan and staff of St. Xavier's College[1] write that—

"a good change might be a sub-division of the matriculation passes, one section being considered fit for higher studies, the other receiving merely a certificate of pass. The examination papers might thus consist of two parts, and such candidates as satisfy in Part I only might be awarded a certificate of pass, while those that satisfy in Parts I and II might be allowed to join the University. This would help to keep from the colleges many students quite unfit for higher studies."

71. The general view taken (however regretfully) by the majority of our correspondents is that in present circumstances the matriculation examination, with material changes in the method of setting and marking the papers, should continue to take the form of a written test imposed simultaneously and with identical papers upon all the candidates. This view is in many respects in accordance with the proposals made to the University in 1917 by what was known as the Committee of Sixteen. That Committee's report, as modified by the Faculties of Arts and Science, recommended the following scheme.

(*1*) *Compulsory subjects.*

1. English, including a general knowledge of the outlines of English history.
2. Mathematics.
3. History of India, including a short account of the progress of India under British rule.
4. General geography.
5. A vernacular language.
6. A classical language.

(*2*) *Optional subjects.*

(One of the following to be allowed to be taken)—

(*a*) Elementary physics and chemistry.
(*b*) Additional mathematics.
(*c*) Additional paper on the classical language taken as (6) above.
(*d*) French.
(*e*) German.
(*f*) Botany.
(*g*) Drawing.

A candidate, taking an optional subject, would be entitled to credit for marks gained in it, but only if he attained the pass standard in the compulsory

[1] Question 8.

subjects. One paper was proposed to be set in each subject, except in English, in which there would be two papers.

72. The weight of the evidence which we have received is in favour of four material changes in the scheme of the Committee of Sixteen. The great majority of our correspondents would prefer (1) that the English papers should be much more exacting than is now the case and than the Committee seem to have felt it necessary to propose: (2) that English history should have a more distinctive place in the examination: (3) that the scope of the papers in mathematics should be more precisely defined and the standard made more exacting than at present: and (4) that elementary science should be required for the matriculation.

VIII.

73. In our questionnaire we asked our correspondents to inform us whether they thought that the matriculation examination should be conducted in English in all subjects, except of course in the paper on vernacular. The present rule is that the answers shall be written in English, except in the case of the papers on the vernacular and (if the candidate prefers) on 'the History of India, including a short account of the Administration of British India and of the progress of India under British Rule.' Our question elicited nearly three hundred replies. These show that opinion on the subject is nearly equally divided, but with an inclination towards the whole of the matriculation (except the papers on English) being conducted in the vernacular. The number of answers in favour of the existing arrangement is 123. The number of answers recommending that the matriculation should be conducted in the vernacular is 171. The following representative replies show the arguments which have weight on the two sides of the case.

74. On the one hand, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Ahsanullah,[1] Additional Inspector of Schools, Presidency Division, writes:—

"The examination in all the papers should be conducted through the medium of English. The option to answer questions on history in Bengali has taken away from a large number of boys the stimulus to the regular study of history as a subject of the school course. Boys that choose to read history in Bengali are left to themselves, with the result that they miss a good opportunity of acquainting themselves with the history and traditions

[1] Question 11.

of their ancestors. What is worse, such choice retards greatly the progress of the boys in English, a thorough knowledge of which should be the goal of education. If anything has contributed to the acquisition of useful knowledge, it is English..... It trains the faculties. It widens the outlook. It cultivates the mind. It strengthens the character. It teaches the pupil his duty to himself, the community and the State. In short, it makes an honest, capable and healthy man of him. It deserves, therefore, to be the principal subject of instruction and the only medium of examination."

75. The same opinion is expressed by Mr. W. E. Griffith[1] (Inspector of Schools, Burdwan Division), who writes:—

" .....The English language is in general use among the educated classes of India, and every year sees it spoken still more widely. Indian parents everywhere desire their children to learn English. Even amongst the guardians of children who attend primary schools the same desire is shown; and often the inclusion or exclusion of English decides the success or failure of a school. The guardians feel that, unless their children have a knowledge of English, they cannot gain the position in life which otherwise they might obtain. A much wider knowledge can be obtained from books written in English than from books written in Bengali. If books written in Bengali were substituted for those written in English, general educational progress would be far slower even than it is at present. Again, the English language to the Bengali boy is not on the same footing as Latin to the English boy. English is a living language, and the Bengali boy hears it spoken wherever he goes..... It may be objected that the average student will think more clearly in his own language and, therefore, thus become a better educated man. I do not think that this would be the case if the schools were staffed with properly qualified teachers..... I think that the matriculation examination in all subjects should be conducted in English. I would again say that I do not consider English to be the real difficulty; it is the lack of properly qualified teachers."

76. The opposite view is taken by Mr. B. C. Bose[1] of Presidency College:—

".....Free option should be allowed to the students to use their native tongue in answering the questions at examinations. Otherwise, they have to labour under a twofold difficulty—the abstruseness of the subject-matter and the strangeness of the language..... The difficulty of the language is found by a great many to be no less a stumbling block than the hardness of the matter itself.

Such a course would, besides reducing the strain to which they are subjected during their career, enable the large majority of students to get up subjects like history or the sciences with more real thoroughness than is otherwise possible for them. A language is the solvent of ideas; and the more congenial the language in which the ideas are dissolved, the more easy and perfect is the work of assimilation. The mother tongue is to every one unquestionably the best in this respect.

---

[1] Question 11.

Besides, if the vernacular is adopted as the vehicle of thought among the alumni of the University, it will have a most beneficial effect upon the country at large as well. For, when they go back to their respective societies, these educated youths will (if their ideas have been formed and developed chiefly in the vernacular) spread their own culture easily and naturally among those who did not come within the direct influence of the University. They will thus become far more effective centres of wide dissemination of knowledge (so much to be desired by a university) than the adoption of a foreign tongue could possibly make them.

While advocating the vernacular, I am strongly of opinion that English should always be a compulsory and highly important subject of study for all students..... The training now given in English before matriculation does not appear satisfactory. A greater familiarity with the language and facility in using it for everyday requirement should be insisted upon.

No pains can be spared to have thoroughly efficient teachers in this subject..... Higher salaries, if necessary, should be freely offered to get the services of such men."

77. Mr. Khabiruddin Ahmad,[1] Second Inspector of Schools, Burdwan Division, records a similar opinion :—

"The teachers and the taught prefer to speak in Bengali in and out of school and consequently students cannot speak with fluency, and cannot express their ideas in correct and grammatical English. This foreign language is generally taught in secondary schools by incompetent teachers whose knowledge is always meagre and insufficient.

Secondary schools should, from the very beginning, try to prepare students for trade, industry and commerce as well as for State service. Those students who show their intelligence for high literary pursuits and whose parents are quite in a position to bear the cost of university education should alone venture to satisfy their ambition by entering it ; others should receive practical training on modern lines.

Taking this point into consideration, the medium of instruction in secondary schools should be vernacular for those students who cannot afford to proceed further than the matriculation examination. This examination should be made complete in itself..... The matriculation examination should not be conducted in English in all subjects. Subjects like history, science, geography and geometry as well as arithmetic might be examined either in English or Bengali."

78. Mr. Surendranath Das Gupta,[1] of Chittagong College, writes :—

"In schools all subjects except English should be taught in the vernacular and, if possible, examinations should also be conducted in Bengali..... There should be a thorough training of boys in English by employing the most well-trained teachers with good pronunciation to teach English from the lowest classes. The main defect of the schools is that the teaching of English is entrusted to the care of the worst hands, and as a result of that they learn very little when they come to the higher classes and are placed under the charge of comparatively better teachers.

[1] Question 11.

The object of university education in the country is not to facilitate the manufacture of good clerks, deputy magistrates or even pleaders, but to raise the general elevation of the thought of the country to such an extent that our countrymen (*a*) may in future be able to help the advancement of knowledge by original contribution in every department of thought and (*b*) may share in large masses the heritage of the progress of the world....."

79. The question as to the true aims of higher secondary education in Bengal, which is put by Mr. Surendranath Das Gupta in the passage quoted above, goes to the heart of the matter. A clear answer to it throws light upon many difficult problems which have arisen in connexion with the matriculation examination and the course of school study leading up to admission to the University. Mr. Das Gupta argues in effect that the high schools should have a triple aim, *viz.*, (1) to prepare the intellectual *élite* who may be regarded as capable of doing advanced work, creative or critical, and ultimately of contributing in a signal degree to knowledge and culture; (2) to give the most suitable preparatory training to those pupils who will enter the liberal professions and the Public Service and who, though not likely to make contributions to science or literature, are well qualified for honourable careers as professional men or as Government servants; (3) to provide, in the form and through the linguistic media best adapted to their abilities and future needs in life, a liberal and practical training for those pupils who will find employment in business, industry or agriculture, whether immediately after leaving school or after going through the whole or part of a course at the University.

80. For each of these three groups of pupils a liberal education is desirable, though not one which extends over an equal period of time. For each, a knowledge of English is, if not actually necessary, at least highly desirable, though in different degrees. And for each, every high school should be prepared to cater, though necessarily in very different measure, and also with very different emphasis upon the several branches of study.

In the schools as now organised there is a delusive uniformity of aim both in the course of study and in the intention of the pupils with regard to their own careers. The curriculum of the upper classes is framed, however ineffectively in its result, upon the assumption that all the boys are going on to the University. The majority of the boys vaguely hope that they may find employment

in the Government service. Yet the school authorities are aware that not more than half of their boys will as a rule go forward to the University. The uniformity of the school curriculum, pointing towards the University alone, encourages the boys to remain satisfied with an aim which only a few of them can achieve. The too uniform ambition of the boys seems to warrant the schools in keeping their course of study monotonously and narrowly academic.

82. In the course of our inquiry we asked the boys in the higher classes of a considerable number of schools to what career in life they were looking forward.[1] The following are examples of the answers to our question.

COLLEGIATE SCHOOL. R....

Matriculation class. 34 boys present.

Number of boys wishing to enter Government service . .	22
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, the medical profession .	3
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, the legal profession . .	3
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, take up a business career . .	5
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, become engineers . . .	1

B. ACADEMY. R....

Matriculation class. 28 boys present.

Number of boys wishing to enter Government service . .	20
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, the medical profession .	3
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, the legal profession .	1
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, take up a business career . .	2
,, ,, ,, ,, ,, become teachers . . .	1
,, ,, ,, intending to manage the family estate . .	1

83. Summarising the answers which were given by nearly 300 boys in the matriculation classes in ten schools in various places, we find that 33·8 per cent. wished to enter Government service; 18·6 per cent. to become doctors; 12·8 per cent. to enter the legal profession; 10·8 per cent. to adopt a business career; 6·1 per cent. to become engineers; 4·7 per cent. to become teachers; and 2·4 per cent. to follow a calling connected with the land. The remainder (10·8 per cent.) were uncertain.

So little do the schools attempt in the way of providing differentiated courses, that the boys drift with the stream and vaguely hope that with luck a Government appointment may fall

[1] Chapter XXVIII, paras. 117-150.

to them in due time. Thus the apparently purposeful course of study in the schools (which looks to the matriculation alone, neither to either side of it nor beyond) and the apparently settled choice of the boys with regard to their future careers (a choice which all concerned know is in many cases incapable of being realised) conceal an underlying vagueness of purpose and mask under an appearance of definite intention an uncertainty of aim.

84. This vagueness of aim is recognised and deplored by some of our correspondents. Thus Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri[1] writes :—

"Training depends upon what one is being trained for, but the existing system is without an ideal or a definite ultimate aim. The country wants education to enable the people to stand on their own legs in every respect, ...to develope their work-power and character-power, to give them all-round strength. A system originally meant for obtaining efficient clerks and now to a limited extent for vocational work, is failing to meet the progressive needs of our people."

"The educational system," writes Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta,[1] Vice-Principal of the Law College, Dacca, "has no reference to our social and economic ends..... Nowhere in our educational system.....is there any attempt to increase the efficiency of the man for the particular end he has proposed to himself. The result is that the mere passing of the examination, and perhaps so qualifying oneself for Government or private service, for which a university qualification is a *sine qua non*, becomes the end of education. This aimlessness of education is reflected in the wonderful combinations of subjects which are offered by candidates for examination—subjects which have no possible relation with one another..... To remedy this defect, I think it would be necessary to diversify the courses and adapt them with special reference to particular careers—the career of a scholar being only one of these."

85. In the course of our inquiry we found in two secondary schools groups of the boys who were for the most part looking forward to a business career and not to Government service. One was Pachaiyappa's Collegiate School, Madras, where in one of the sections of the Fourth Form out of 19 boys, 16 said that they meant to become business men, 2 that they hoped to become doctors, and 1 that he intended to go into the law. Not a single boy in the class aimed at entering Government service. The other was the Marwari High School in Calcutta where the boys were practically all going into business. It is with reference to this school that the Marwari Community write[2] that "there is a need for a sound system of commercial education, both advanced and

[1] Question 1.

[2] General Memorandum, page 16.

elementary ..... In the absence of a real beginning of practical commercial training at school, many students are made to give up their studies, for their guardians do not consider the present literary curriculum as suitable to their needs."

86. The need for reorganising the high school course and the examinations which test it has impressed itself strongly upon many of our correspondents. Some of the most thoughtful and experienced among them advocate, in various forms, a project the main features of which are that two definite stages of secondary education should be recognised, one which would end at about the age of 16 and would be tested by an examination corresponding to the present matriculation; the other extending to about the age 18, and tested by an examination roughly corresponding in standard to the present intermediate, though wider in its range. The second examination would in these schemes qualify for entrance to the University. These proposals are of the greatest interest and importance; but since they bear very directly upon the intermediate stage of the present university course, we postpone consideration of them to Chapters XXXI and XXXII which will deal with that subject. Here we content ourselves with a general reference to the interesting discussions of this subject communicated by Mr. Atul Chandra Sen,[1] Mr. J. C. Coyajee,[2] Mr. P. C. Mahalanobis,[3] and Mr. C. W. Peake,[4] who have dealt with the theme most fully.

87. The fundamental difficulty of reconciling the two distinct purposes which the matriculation examination now has to serve is well put by Mr. C. J. Hamilton,[5] a quotation from whose memorandum may close this section :—

"If the nature of the present matriculation examination be considered, it will at once be seen that it serves two purposes which are quite distinct from each other. On the one hand, the matriculation examination serves to mark the successful completion of the school education. On the other hand it serves as the entrance test imposed upon those anxious to pursue a course of university study..... These two purposes are very different and from the nature of the case cannot properly be fulfilled by the same kind of examination..... The character of the school final examination should

[1] General Memoranda, page 373.
[2] *Ibid*, page 415.
[3] *Ibid*, page 427.
[4] *Ibid*, page 322.
[5] *Ibid*, page 111.

be so conducted as to mark the satisfactory completion of the normal school course by the normal scholar who has reasonably benefited by his opportunities. Of course the examination may also differentiate between those of normal and those of higher ability. The standard, however, must be determined by the intellectual attainment of the typical scholar..... It is not desirable unduly to restrain the number of pupils in order to improve the standard of examination. On the other hand, the entrance examination imposed by a university ought not to be regarded as an end in itself, but as a means to ensure that those who are admitted as undergraduates possess both the necessary general education and the necessary ability to afford a reasonable prospect that the university course will be completed with success. The standard of attainment imposed by this test should be considerably higher than that reached by the normal scholar who completes the school course."

IX.

88. The proposal that the present matriculation should be converted into a high school examination (the entrance test for admission to the University following two years later at what is now known as the intermediate stage) has the incidental advantage of removing all the most serious objections to a lowering of the present age-limits. Under the existing regulations a candidate for the matriculation must have completed the age of sixteen years on the first day of the month in which he appears for the examination. Twenty-four of our correspondents urge that this age-limit should be abolished or modified. The question has been under discussion for a long time and the effects of the working of the present rule are best understood in the light of past events.

89. When the University of Calcutta was founded in 1857, an age-limit for the admission of candidates to the matriculation examination (or, as it was then called, the entrance examination) was prescribed. Candidates aged 15 years and 9 months were admitted, but in practice any candidate was allowed admission during his sixteenth year. This rule remained in force from 1858 to 1879. In 1880 the age-limit was abrogated, and for nearly thirty years there was no restriction as to the age of admission to the matriculation examination.

90. The Indian Universities Commission considered the question in 1902. They hesitated before coming to a decision. In their report they observed that " there is much to be said in favour of fixing the age at 16, and some of us would have preferred this limit, were it not for certain difficulties of detail."[1] But they

[1] Indian Universities Commission Report, page 46.

actually recommended that "a candidate should be required to have completed his fifteenth year at the date on which he appears at the examination."[1] After the publication of the Commission's report there was much discussion of the subject. Amongst those responsible for introducing legislation with regard to the Universities the prevailing opinion was that the minimum age of matriculation should be 16. But the Indian Universities Act 1904 does not itself prescribe any age-limit. It included, however, among the matters which may be fixed by regulations, "the conditions to be complied with by candidates for matriculation."[2] The Regulations of the University of Calcutta, framed in 1906 under the provisions of the Act, require the candidate to "have completed the age of sixteen years on the first day of the month in which he appears at the examination."[3] In the resolution of the Government of India (August 11th, 1906), which is prefixed to the regulations, it is observed "now that the age for matriculation has been raised to 16, candidates will be on an average about a year older when they come up for matriculation than has hitherto been the case."[4] The new regulations came into force in 1910.

91. The reason for re-introducing an age-limit was that, during the period of its abrogation, the number of candidates under 15 years of age had increased, and there was evidence that the education of a considerable number of boys had been hurried and forced on with a view to their being sent forward to the university course, although not yet mature for it.[5]

92. The complete abrogation of the age-limit as fixed by the regulations of 1906 was proposed on November 21st, 1914, in the Senate of Calcutta University by Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee, but the motion was lost by a large majority. Another proposal, also made by Sir Gooroo Dass, "that a candidate should be required to have completed the age of 15 years on the first day of the month in which he appears for the matriculation examination" was rejected by a large majority at a meeting of the Senate on January 9th, 1915. The motion of the University Syndicate that the regula-

---

[1] Indian Universities Commission Report, page 69.

[2] Indian Universities Act, 1904, Section 25 (2) (c).

[3] Calcutta University Regulations, Chapter XXX, Section 3.

[4] *Ibid*, page *xvi*.

[5] Minutes of the Senate of Calcutta University, November 21st, 1914

tions should require "the candidate to have completed the age of 16 on the last day of the year in which he appears for the matriculation examination" was carried by 25 votes to 8.[1]

93. The Senate's proposed amendment to the existing regulations has not up to the present time received the sanction of the Government of India. If approved, it would have allowed a boy born on December 31st to matriculate at the age of 15 years 2 months and to join his college at the age of 15 years 6 months. A boy born on January 1st would not have been able to enter college till he was 16 years 6 months. Under the present regulations, as the matriculation examination is held in March and the college session opens in the following July, no student can enter college before he is 16 years 4 months. His admission must be deferred for another twelve months, if his birthday falls on March 2nd or later in the year.

94. Those members of the Senate who were disinclined to approve any lowering of the present age-limit laid stress upon the immaturity of boys of 16 or less for the conditions of university life. They contended that it is undesirable to shorten the course of school education and that a boy up to the age of 16 or 17 receives in a good secondary school the kind of training and care best adapted to his needs and years. It was also urged that the unhealthy forcing of more forward and promising boys would be likely to follow upon any drastic reduction (and still more probably upon the abrogation) of the age-limit now enforced. But the argument which carried most weight was that the age for admission to the University was already quite low enough. In order that the standards of college work might be raised, the schools should be improved, and (it was contended) the schools were more likely to be improved if the duty of providing suitable teaching for their most promising boys was imposed upon them, instead of relief from the duty being given by a lowering of the age-limit for matriculation and by the transference of these boys, however immature in character, to university studies elsewhere.

95. On the other hand it was pointed out with great force that, as things are, very few high schools in Bengal are in a position to provide suitable and advanced teaching for clever boys who have

[1] Minutes of the Senate of Calcutta University, January 9th, 1915.

already gone through the work which is taken in the highest class. Under present arrangements (and what hope is there, it was asked, of early or general reform ?) those boys who are especially clever and promising are obliged to repeat for a whole year (in some cases for two years) work which they have already done. Could anything be more demoralising ? Can it be wondered at that many of them become listless or idle ? Would it not be better, in present circumstances, for these boys of exceptional and unusually early promise to be promoted to college instead of being held back at school where they get no fresh stimulus and no teaching which puts them on their mettle ? The work of the intermediate classes at college would not be beyond their powers. Intellectually they are at least as well prepared for it as are many of the older boys who leave school at 16 or later. The present rule, it was argued, has not in fact compelled the secondary schools to make proper provision of advanced teaching for the boys who are most advanced. To secure that reform, other means and more funds are necessary. In the meantime, however, injury is being done to the élite of the boys. It was also pointed out that, at the time of the debate, the university regulations in Bombay were exactly what the Calcutta Syndicate proposed,[1] and that in the Punjab and Madras the age-limit was as low as 15.

96. The objections to the existing rule are stated by many of our correspondents. Sir Rash Behary Ghose[2] writes :—

"The rigid rule as to the age-limit now in force should be abolished. There may be an ordinary age-limit fixed for the matriculation, but head masters should be authorised to relax the limit in exceptional cases."

Mr. Charu Chandra Biswas,[2] Professor in the University Law College, Calcutta, writes that "the rigid age-limit...arrests by a sudden jerk the mental development of many intelligent boys." Sir Ali Imam[2] writes :—

"In my circle of friends and acquaintances I find that those who have been able to do anything in life and were connected with the universities,

---

[1] Since that time the new regulations of Bombay University have raised the age of admission to matriculation. A candidate must have completed sixteen years on or before August 1st in the year in which he presents himself for examination. This regulation grants admission to a candidate who is five months younger than is allowed in Calcutta.

[2] Question 8.

passed their entrance examination in the 15th year, or even earlier, with no particular detriment to health..... Some boys develope earlier than others, and the clever boy should not be penalised for the benefit of his less clever compeer."

Mr. Upendra Nath Banerjee[1] writes :—

"The age restriction of sixteen years for matriculation students seems to be rather hard and arbitrary. A man must not be over 25 when he enters Government service ; he may have during his college career serious difficulties to prevent him from passing his university examinations at the expected or fixed time or age. As far as age is concerned, some margin should on this account be always left in his favour, to make allowance for accidents and misfortunes."

97. In order to ascertain the average age of the candidates entering for the Calcutta University matriculation, we have examined the records which show the ages of the candidates admitted to the examination in 1918.[2] We find that the average age of candidates from schools in Bengal was 18 years 4 months. Private candidates and teachers are omitted from this calculation. If they had been included, the average age would have been higher. Among the several divisions of the Presidency the average age of the candidates was lowest in Calcutta (17 years 8 months) and highest in the Dacca Division (18 years 10 months). We have also, for the purpose of this special inquiry, divided the candidates

[1] Question 8.

[2] The following table shows the ages of candidates (excluding private candidates and teachers) admitted to the Calcutta University matriculation examination in 1918.

Age.	Number of candidates who had completed the age mentioned in previous column.
16	2,475
17	2,948
18	2,867
19	2,220
20	1,582
21	942
22	559
23	261
24	108
25 and over.	102

into two groups, Muslim and non-Muslim.[1] The average age of Muslim candidates in the matriculation examination of 1918 was 19 years; that of non-Muslim candidates 18 years 2 months. Thus the question of lowering the present age-limit does not affect the great majority of those who are preparing themselves for the examination. But the candidates who are kept back by the present regulation are pupils who show special promise at an early age, and, though they are relatively few in number, their claims deserve great consideration.

98. We found that a lowering of the present age-limit is generally desired by head masters throughout Bengal. The head master of the South Suburban School, Bhowanipur, thought, with his colleagues, that the limit is right for boys of ordinary ability but objects to it in the case of clever boys. A lad of promise is often kept back for one year, sometimes for two, occasionally even for three. At Mymensingh, Mr. Har Mohan De, Head Master of the Zilla School, told us that seven boys were at that time detained in his matriculation class because they were too young for admission to the examination under the existing rule. Two of these boys would be kept back for two years and, though he had been able to alter the English books for them, they would actually repeat three times over the class work in history, geography, mathematics and Sanskrit. Mr. Heramba Chandra Maitra,[2] Principal of City College, mentions cases of "clever boys having lost their

[1] The average ages of Muslim and non-Muslim candidates admitted to the examination in 1918 from schools in the various divisions of Bengal and in other parts of the area served by Calcutta University are shown in the following table.

Division.	Average age of Muslim candidates.		Average age of non-Muslim candidates.		Average age of the total number of candidates.	
	Years.	Months.	Years.	Months	Years.	Months.
Calcutta	19	1	17	6	17	8
Presidency	19	3	18	5	18	8
Burdwan	18	9	18	4	18	5
Rajshahi	19	3	18	6	18	9
Dacca	19	5	18	7	18	10
Chittagong	19	0	18	4	18	8
Assam and Cooch Behar	18	1	21	6	21	1
Burma	17	6	18	9	18	8

[2] Question 1.

studious habits through remaining idle for a year or two." Mr. J. M. Bose[1] of Presidency College protests against boys being "permitted to waste in this manner two of the most valuable years of their life."

99. If, as many of our correspondents suggest, the present matriculation were converted into a high school examination and admission to the University were gained by success in another examination taken two years later, some of the reasons for maintaining the present age-limit in the case of the first examination would disappear. Furthermore, the age of entrance to the University would be raised approximately to the point recommended by several witnesses. Among the latter are Miss Eleanor McDougall[1] of Madras and Mr. J. N. Gupta,[2] District Magistrate, Rangpur. Mr. Gupta proposes that—

"the secondary school-leaving age should be raised to 18 from the present age limit of 16, and *ipso facto* the standard of the school leaving (*i.e.*, the matriculation) test should be raised for the present to the I. A. standard." His reasons for suggesting this change are that "the education to be imparted in secondary schools should as far as possible be complete in itself" and that there should be "two sides to the training in secondary schools, the one more practical and scientific and the other more literary."

X.

100. The evidence cited in this chapter may be summarised as follows. There is a strong current of opinion in favour of making a new examination at the level of the present intermediate the entrance test for admission to the University and of converting the present matriculation examination into a high school examination designed to test and certify the attainments which, with the help of good teaching, average pupils should possess at about 16 or 17 years of age and exceptional pupils a year or so earlier. If this change were adopted, there would be little, if any, objection to a lowering of the present age-limit of admission to the first-named examination.

There is a very general agreement that the high school examination (or, as it is now called, the matriculation) should cover a wider range of knowledge than the present matriculation test. A large number of correspondents urge that it should include compulsory papers in history, geography and elementary

[1] Question 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 425.

science, in addition to the papers which are obligatory under the regulations now in force.

101. There is a large body of opinion in favour of allowing the candidates to write their answers in their vernacular but on this point our correspondents are almost equally divided, and many of those who are favourable to the use of the vernacular counsel caution and gradual change.

102. The feeling that the standard of the high school examination should be higher than that of the present matriculation, especially in English, is strong and widespread. A less mechanical division of the marks assigned to the several questions, or parts of questions, is recommended, and in place of it a method of marking which would enable examiners to take a more comprehensive view of the intelligence and ability shown in a candidate's paper as a whole. A more sparing use of alternative questions is advocated, and the hope is expressed that the experience of head masters and other teachers (including women teachers) in secondary schools may be utilised on the boards of examiners.

103. If all the subjects which have a just claim to a plan in a liberal course of secondary education were included in the examination, there would be a danger of the test becoming too encyclopædic and a likelihood that its ambitious demands would lead to new developments of cramming and of superficial preparation. The main body of witnesses, therefore, while wishing a many-sided training to be given in the secondary schools, incline towards keeping the high school examination within somewhat restricted lines.

104. The continuance of the present method of written examination is generally desired. However regretfully the view may be expressed, it is felt that, in present circumstances, there is no alternative to a written examination organised upon a large scale and common to all the schools concerned. The prevailing view is that, with some exceptions, the schools would be put in a false position if their conception of a candidate's merit were substituted for the present examination test, or even for part of it. The existing impersonal test is preferred, and many correspondents desire that it should be made even more impersonal by the substitution of roll-numbers for the candidates' own names.

CHAPTER X.

The Recognition of Schools by the University.

1. The Indian Universities Act, 1904, empowers the Senate of each university to make regulations on certain subjects, but requires these regulations to have the sanction of Government, which in the case of the University of Calcutta means the sanction of the Governor-General in Council. Among the matters for which such regulations may provide are "the conditions to be complied with by schools desiring recognition for the purpose of sending up pupils as candidates for the matriculation examination."[1] Accordingly the regulations of the University of Calcutta, which were approved by the Government of India by a resolution of August 11, 1906, provide for the recognition of schools. Two chapters in the regulations are devoted to this subject. Chapter XXII deals with the conditions which, within a specified time, had to be fulfilled by schools already enjoying recognition when the new regulations came into force. Chapter XXI prescribes the conditions upon which recognition may be given to schools not previously possessing the privilege of presenting candidates for matriculation.

2. The resolution of the Government of India (August 11 1906) refers in the following terms to the question of the recognition of schools by the University of Calcutta :—

"Under the regulations now sanctioned the recognition or non-recognition of a school will be the act of the University, and the functions of the Education Department or of the person nominated by the Syndicate to report on the claims of the school to recognition will be limited to placing before the University the information requisite to enable it to exercise its controlling authority. This solution of a question, which is not altogether free from difficulty, is indicated alike by the cordial relations which have existed between the University and the Education Department in the past, by their active co-operation in the supervision of secondary education, and by the existence in Bengal of a large number of private schools which receive no aid from Government, and which therefore are not inspected by the officers of the Education Department. With such schools the University alone is legally competent to deal."

---

[1] Indian Universities Act, 1904, Sections 2 (2) (*b*) and 25 (2) (*o*).

indeed allowed by the regulations of the University. The arts student can choose from a list of eleven subjects—seven of which are scientific; the science student from a list of nine subjects, all scientific. But in practice the range of choice is much more limited. In two of the subjects included in both lists (geography and zoology) no teaching is provided by any men's arts college affiliated to the University; in two more (physiology and geology) only one of the colleges provides teaching; and in yet another subject (botany) only three of the men's colleges provide teaching.[1] In practice, therefore, for the great mass of students, the number of possible subjects, from among which three must be taken, is reduced to six in arts and to four in science. The colleges reduce this range of choice still further: some of them provide teaching only in the minimum number of subjects.

22. The second marked feature of the system is that no guidance seems to be given to the students in the choice of their subjects, with a view either to making the group of subjects coherent and mutually illuminative, or to providing some preliminary training for the students' future career. The regulations of the University afford no indication as to the groups of subjects that can be taken together with most advantage. The chief source of guidance in the students' selection seems to be popular rumour as to the relative easiness of the various subjects in examination. This leads to some most incongruous groupings; a very favourite combination, for example, is Sanskrit, chemistry, and logic. We should return to this subject in a later chapter;[2] for the criticism applies not only to the intermediate classes, but to the whole of the work of the arts colleges. There is, in short, no attempt made, either by the University or by the colleges, to arrange the subjects of study in homogeneous and organically related groups, such as might meet the needs of students aiming at careers of various types. Too widely, both among students and teachers, it seems to be held that the only thing that matters is success in the examination; and that so long as this is achieved, the choice of subjects is of little importance.

23. Yet more important than the absence of clear articulation in the ordinary subjects of academic study is the absence of any

[1] This does not include the Indian Association for the Cultivation of Science.

[2] Chapter XIII, para. 48.

provision for an introduction to vocational training such as is needed by that half of the students who will pass direct into various occupations after the intermediate stage. In other countries the tendency is more and more strong to introduce an element of vocational training, not unduly emphasised, at this stage of a boy's schooling; even where definitely vocational subjects are not introduced, the academic subjects are grouped in such a way as to have a definite bearing in view of the boy's future. The intermediate stage in Bengal should correspond more nearly to the higher secondary stage in some western countries, when, after completing a general education up to the age of 16, an element of specialisation is introduced in the next two years.

24. The intermediate examination has come to be, in practice, the stage at which students pass into a medical course; but no attempt is made to mark off a special group of subjects as particularly suitable for intending medical students. At this stage also many boys pass either into engineering work, or into the College of Engineering; there is no attempt to organise the preliminary studies with a view to this. A large proportion of the teachers in the high schools of Bengal enter the teaching profession immediately after taking the intermediate course; but no attempt is made to arrange the course in such a way as to be helpful to those who are going to take up this work.[1] These are professions already clearly recognised, which attract many candidates. If no provision is made for them, still less is it to be expected that provision can be made at this stage for all the other callings, in commerce, industry, and the humbler spheres of administrative and clerical work, which are to-day crying out for competent recruits, and in many cases need them especially at this sort of stage.

25. But it is when we turn to consider the methods of instruction that the inadequacy of the present system to the needs of boys with the equipment we have described becomes most patent. We have already quoted statements by experienced teachers[2] which show that students in the intermediate classes ought to be "taught

[1] *Cf.* the suggestion of Mr. E. E. Biss (General Memoranda, page 360,) "it would be worth while for the University to provide matriculates who intend to become teachers ...with a special intermediate course in such school subjects as history, geography, mathematics, science, etc."

[2] Paras. 5 and 18.

like schoolboys" and are "incapable of instruction except by school methods." Yet, except in some science laboratories, no attempt is made to employ good school methods in teaching them. The method universally employed, and almost the only method employed, is that of the mass-lecture; and when he has attended his three or four lectures a day, and made what he can of them, the student is for the most part left to his own devices. We shall discuss later[1] the defects of the lecture system now in vogue in Bengal. But in the meanwhile it must be apparent that it is ill-adapted to the needs of boys equipped in the way we have described; boys who 'cannot be left to themselves,' and who need the close supervision and guidance of good class-work. Now good class-work can only be done in classes of reasonable numbers—forty at most.

26. But the intermediate classes are almost invariably far too large. Being regarded as university lectures, they may be swollen to a maximum of 150, and as the intermediate classes are far more crowded than the degree classes, this maximum is quite commonly reached. It is impossible to *teach* a class of 150, or to enlist the co-operation of the students; the lecture is the only possibility. And the tradition of lecturing is so deeply implanted that even when classes are small it is seldom abandoned. Now, however suitable the lecture method of instruction may be for genuine university work—and it has its limitations even there—it is altogether unsuited to the needs of the mass of the students in the intermediate stage. "It is very exceptional", says Mr. F. C. Turner,[2] "for a lecturer to keep himself assured that the class as a whole is following him, or to give any opportunity for the explanation of difficulties that may occur in the course of the lecture. To students who have not had a thorough grounding in English in the schools, and who are not trained to take notes, such work is practically useless; and it is not surprising that students on the whole regard lectures as a handicap prescribed by the University, and turn to the text-books ... as the best method of getting through their examinations."

27. The teaching is at its best in the science subjects, partly because the numbers are smaller, partly because the requirement

[1] Chapter XIII, paras. 50—52.

[2] Question 1.

of practical work gives a different character to the whole of the work and renders possible the informal questioning of the teacher by the pupil. But even in the sciences the work is very far from being satisfactory.[1] In the arts subjects, especially in the most popular subjects, and above all in English, both teachers and students seem to us to be in nearly all cases handicapped, on the one hand by bad traditions of teaching and study, and on the other by conditions of work which make satisfactory results all but hopeless.

28. To discuss in detail the methods pursued in the numerous intermediate classes which we have attended would be out of place, and would, indeed, be an anticipation of the more general treatment of the subject which will be attempted in the next chapter. But something ought to be said on the methods adopted in teaching English; since English is an indispensable part of the equipment of all students, and training in the use of the language is the principal element in the preparation given to them either for their later university work, or for practical life. Almost all the classes which we attended were conducted in one or other of two ways.

29. One type of lecture consisted of a continuous commentary, sentence by sentence, upon the words of some text-book, such as a selection of Addison's Essays, or a bad abridgment of *The Cloister and the Hearth* which omitted all the best parts of the book, or a second-rate summary of the story of the Odyssey. The lecture generally took the form of verbose paraphrase or meticulous annotation. The students followed with a copy of the text-book and a pencil for underlining. We scarcely ever heard a question addressed to a class, or a student challenged to give his own interpretation of a passage. This seems to be the method chiefly used in teaching English. Most of it seemed to us to be waste of time, except for the purpose of familiarising the student with the sound of spoken English. We were appalled by the needless and

[1] It may be permissible to quote here an experience of one of our number. Having learnt, during a visit to the chemical laboratory of a second-grade college, that the first lecture of the intermediate course had just been given, he asked a student, in the presence and with the permission of the professor, if he could repeat the substance of the lecture. The student replied that they had been told that chemistry was an easy subject, which could be acquired by any student who had a sharp memory; and that all they needed to do in order to pass was to attend the lectures regularly, and learn up their notes each day!

responsibilities for the welfare of secondary education in Bengal. Public opinion approved the policy and preferred that the University rather than any other public authority should be armed with the power of inspecting all secondary schools which teach up to the level of matriculation. On paper the power of the University to exact a high standard of excellence in every secondary school within its jurisdiction is complete. Every high school values the right of sending in candidates for the matriculation more than any other privilege which it can possess. That right the University, and the University alone, has the power to give or to withhold. About half of the high schools in Bengal do not come, even in the remotest degree, under the supervision of any other authority. About half of the boys receiving high school education are in schools which, at least for educational purposes, the Government does not claim the right to inspect. In regard to all these schools Government has virtually delegated its educational authority to the University. And in so delegating its powers it has acted in accordance with the general desire of the educated classes.

10. It must be borne in mind however that the powers of the University are far from being as efficacious in practice as they appear to be on paper. When the new regulations were brought into force a great effort was made throughout Bengal to comply with the new conditions which the University was bound in duty, and anxious on educational grounds, to impose. The minutes of the University show how many schools were visited by Government inspectors on its behalf and how much time was given by the Syndicate to the discussion of their needs. The educational reports of the Government attest the progress which was consequently made. But the most desirable improvements in secondary education entail great expense. The private munificence which came to the aid of the schools during the years 1908-12, so far from increasing in proportion to the growing needs of these schools, slackened and ebbed. Government has not been able to offer grants-in-aid to the schools upon the scale which alone would suffice to put the weaker into good order and enable the stronger to advance in efficiency. Still less has it been found possible by a material increase of salaries to attract the necessary number of competent men into the teaching profession or, by drawing the unaided schools into the category of the aided, to carry out the

policy contemplated by the despatch of 1854. The University, although the fees paid by matriculation candidates amounted to Rs. 1,92,960 in 1916-17 and were expected to reach Rs. 2,32,500 in the following year, has far too many other claims upon its income to afford a staff of inspectors of its own, or to be able to contribute towards the cost of improvement in the schools.

11. Consequently, the reform of secondary education has been blocked by lack of funds. The University, which bears the greater part of the responsibility for the efficiency of secondary education in the province, has not at its command the funds required to enable the schools to effect the improvements which it knows to be desirable, and indeed imperative, in the public interest. Its only weapons are good advice, which most of the schools cannot afford to follow; warnings, which the recalcitrant have safely disregarded; and, in the last resort, withdrawal of recognition which would in most cases lead to the closing of the school and thus to the forfeiture of educational facilities by the district concerned.

12. In these circumstances it is not surprising that of late the Syndicate has been reluctant, sometimes perhaps over-reluctant, to accept those of the inspectors' recommendations which would involve considerable demands upon the pecuniary resources of the schools. The vast area from which candidates for its matriculation examination are drawn, the remoteness of many of the schools, and the difficulties of communication make it an impossible task for the University, even with the willingly accorded help of an already over-taxed Department of Public Instruction, to compass, with the thoroughness required by modern methods of school inspection, the duties imposed upon it by its regulations in regard to the periodical inspection of recognised schools and the enforcement of improvements in their work. In fact the University is burdened with responsibilities which it is unable effectively to discharge. Its powers of requiring improvements in secondary schools have become in large measure illusory and in the most serious cases it cannot enforce those powers without making bad worse.

13. It is the still prevailing view that a close connexion between the University and education should be maintained. But with the rapid growth of high schools in Bengal—a growth so rapid as to clog the mechanism of any system of inspection except with the help of much larger funds than are at present available—the plan,

devised in 1904 and zealously put into effect by the University during the more favourable conditions which at first prevailed, has evidently broken down.

III.

14. The secondary schools evidently need a great deal more attention and help than can be given to them under the present arrangements. The answers of our correspondents show how general the dissatisfaction has become. Whether the teaching in the secondary schools is absolutely worse than it was ten or twenty years ago must remain an open question. Some of the witnesses think that, with exceptions,[1] the schools are actually deteriorating: others, that on the whole there has been an improvement.[2] But, relatively to the new needs of the province and to the progressive requirements of the University, the secondary schools have fallen back. More and more is expected of them, and they are not able to come up to expectations.

15. The trend of things in India and elsewhere (*viz.*, the increasing importance of industrial energy, applications of science to agriculture, extension of responsible government, new demands upon municipal and cooperative enterprise, disturbance of the older social traditions) requires alertness and many new developments in national education. The universities have to play a larger part than fell to them in former days. The demand for well-trained men steadily grows, and the universities have to prepare their students not only for a limited number of professions but for new callings which require scientific knowledge and technical preparation. Not least, the needs of the schools for competent teachers have to be met, and this by the universities to a considerable degree. Consequently the outlook of the universities has widened; their courses have become more difficult; and the colleges are rightly more critical of the quality of the material supplied to them by the secondary schools. Defects in the schools, therefore, which might have been disregarded a generation ago are now more conspicuous. And the need for remedying these defects has become more urgent.

16. Added to this is the increasing demand for well educated youths, who will enter industry, commerce or agriculture at the end

[1] *e.g.*, Sir Ali Imam's answer to Question 8.

[2] *e.g.*, Mr. Heramba Chandra Maitra's memorandum (General Memoranda, pages 315-321) and the answer of the Senatus of the Scottish Churches College to Question 1.

of a good secondary school course. The new requirements of an age which is increasingly industrial and scientific in its activities and enterprises converge upon the secondary schools. Both the universities and the public at large expect more from secondary education. What passed muster thirty years ago is now felt to be out of date. This new economic and educational movement touched Western Europe and America a generation back. For various reasons, and chiefly because of its backwardness in industrial developments, India was for a time comparatively unaffected by it. But now India feels it. Consequently, what has been done in the West during the last thirty years has now to be done here. And our evidence shows that the need for doing it is widely and strongly felt. The following quotations prove that, whatever may have served in former days, secondary education in Bengal now requires refitting and reform.

17. Rai Rajendra Chandra Sastri Bahadur [1] writes—

"The schools preparing candidates for the matriculation test are, speaking generally, very indifferently equipped for their work. They are mostly run on commercial principles and, having no independent sources of income, are dependent for their existence on the fees paid by their pupils; they are poorly staffed and are unable, for obvious reasons, to enforce discipline among the boys."

18. Khan Bahadur Maulvi Ahsanullah[1] writes :—

"the conditions which are laid down in the regulations for admission of high schools to the University worked well enough when the number of schools was comparatively small. With a steady expansion of higher education and the development of modern educational ideas, a change in the conditions which regulate such admission is indispensable. Schools are springing up like mushrooms, and it is time that a somewhat higher standard should be demanded from them before recognition ..... There is a large number of proprietary institutions in and outside Calcutta that are run purely on speculative principles. The voice of the proprietor is supreme in the management of such schools. The managing committee is a non-entity and is solely guided by the whims and caprices of the proprietor. Savings are divided not unoften at the cost of the schools. Teachers are appointed and discharged as it suits the convenience of the proprietors. Men of mediocre qualifications on poor remuneration are often employed. As an inevitable result, indiscipline and disorder become the rule."

19. Mr. Jyotibhushan Bhaduri,[1] Professor of Chemistry at Presidency College, writes :—

"University education will fail of its purpose if it is not backed up by a good system of secondary education. No expense should be spared for the improvement of the high schools, a *sine qua non* of university reform.....

[1] Question 8.

Better staffs should be recruited, especially for teaching the lower classes of the schools. There ought to be a progressive scale of pay for all teachers and the minimum pay should be such as to ensure a respectable mode of living."

20. For what is unsatisfactory in the present conditions of admission to the University, Mr Wahed Hossain[1] holds

"the unsatisfactory state of school education to a great extent responsible ..... Our schools sadly want trained teachers, and unless such teachers are made available, the quality of school education will not improve."

Mr. G. C. Bose[2] writes:—

"In secondary schools, an attempt should be made to institute a system of all-round preliminary education, replacing the existing system of coaching with a sole eye to passing the matriculation examination."

21. Mr. Surendra Nath Roy[3] thinks that—

"the secondary schools from which the boys of the University are recruited are neglected both by Government and the University. It is necessary that the secondary schools should have competent teachers and that they should be properly equipped and that particular care should be taken to impart proper teaching in those schools."

22. Mr. Pran Hari Sen[4] speaks of the—

"state of things prevalent in the high English schools situated in the rural areas of Bengal" as "one of the most important and vital educational problems of the present hour." He describes it as "an iron system of education," and feels that the University is not in as close touch with the high schools and their affairs as it could be.

"A young Indian of ability," according to another witness,[5] "wastes seven years of his life in worthless schools."

"The secondary education provided at present in the Indian schools," writes Mr. Abdul Jalil,[6] "is undesirably theoretical rather than practical. It destroys the investigating power of a student, makes cramming his second nature and imparts to him very little general knowledge."[7]

23. Many other witnesses confirm this unfavourable account of the present state of secondary education in Bengal.

---

[1] Question 8.

[2] Question 9.

[3] General Memoranda, page 327.

[4] *Ibid*, page 328.

[5] Note from a member of the staff of Cotton College, Gauhati, quoted in Mr. Südmersen's answer to Question 1.

[6] Question 1.

[7] The shortcomings of the secondary schools are also emphasised by—

Mr. N. C. Bardaloi and Mr. F. C. Turner (Question 1).

Dr. Syamadas Mukhopadhyaya (Question 8).

Mr. Bipin Behari Gupta (Question 2).

Mr. Akshay Kumar Maitra (Question 8) and Dr. Whitehead, Bishop of Madras (Question 1).

"The schools are the root of the whole trouble," writes Mr. J. R. Barrow,[1] Principal of Presidency College :—

"Lack of money spreads like a blight over all their activities ..... The course of study for the Intermediate examination would not be unreasonably difficult if boys had been well-grounded at school. They are not well-grounded ..... The schools as a whole do not do their work and the first thing to be done is to improve them."

24. The Principal and staff of Serampore College[2] write :—

"Facilities for the best preparatory training in well equipped high schools are woefully lacking. Apart from two or three schools, there is no school in Bengal in which advanced work is done on the lines undertaken in the highest forms of English public schools ..... We have no hesitation in expressing the view that by far the larger number of so-called high schools in Bengal are quite unworthy of the name. Their equipment is miserable, their ideals low, the one thing they require of their pupils is ability to reproduce material from text-books and notes that have a direct bearing on the university matriculation examination. In the great majority of cases, there is no effort made to teach their pupils to think ..... The fact is indisputable that as things now are, the examination at the end of the course is the only thing that counts. Training is at a discount, and success in the examination is the be-all and end-all of the system."

25. The Senatus of the Scottish Churches College, Calcutta,[2] write :—

"The high school leading to the matriculation examination is the only avenue to higher education in Bengal. In a very large number of cases these high schools have been begun and carried on through the energy and at the expense of private individuals. The people are determined to have education and are willing to pay for it, and the result is that crowds of boys of very different ability reach the matriculation stage. To bar them out by simply raising the standard will not serve and it cannot be done. The high school system must be so changed that, while the schools are strengthened and the standard of the matriculation examination is raised, there shall be a bifurcation of studies making it possible for the majority of pupils to take up a modern, scientific and practical course such as would give a good general education ..... A bifurcation of this sort has been attempted in Government schools but in too feeble a fashion, and it has not received the support that it is worth and which is absolutely necessary. The standard of teaching in the best high schools, in fact in all, has greatly improved during the past 10 years, but no Bengali parent would allow that his son could profitably stay in even the best of these schools for another year after passing the matriculation examination. His belief is that the school can do no more for him."

26. Mr. C. W. Peake[3] of Presidency College, writes :—

"The success of any proposals for the improvement of the University will depend mainly on the manner in which they cope with the problem of education

[1] Questions 1 and 8.

[2] Question 1.

[3] General Memoranda, page 326.

in its earlier stages..... Any serious effort in the direction of reform..... will confront the province with a serious financial problem ..... Considerable nonrecurring expenditure will be required in order to equip schools with laboratories, etc., before they can be raised to the higher secondary grade..... A largely increased staff ..... and additional class-rooms ..... will also be required. The monetary question has to be faced ..... The problem, though difficult, is not altogether hopeless of solution. If in their proposals for reform the Commission are able to carry the bulk of the educated and wealthy classes of the province with them, it is possible that the present political and social activity might be developed partially at all events, into an intense national effort for the improvement of education in the province, as a necessary preliminary towards the full attainment of political ideals, and an irresistible argument in favour of their concession. History has shown that when a nation is really moved, unexpected sources of income reveal themselves. It is essential, however, first to convince the public regarding the deplorable condition of the majority of our schools and colleges in comparison with those of other countries. As an Inspector of Schools in my early days I often felt that the inefficiency of the schools (bad buildings, ill-paid staff, etc.) was not due invariably to the poverty of the neighbourhood but to the fact that the school was considered quite good enough for its purpose in the opinion of those responsible for its maintenance. Protests on the part of the inspectors were usually attributed to professional cant, and misgivings were easily allayed in the absence of a standard of comparison. If anything can carry conviction to the classes on whom the province depends for private aid, it will be an unreserved expression of opinion both as to the quality of our educational work here and as to the extent to which it is receiving assistance from private sources. I may be over-sanguine as to the prospects of success in an appeal to the public, but I am convinced that no improvement will be effected unless substantial funds are forthcoming and I am doubtful about the ability of Government to provide them with the heavy claims of primary education still to be met."

27. Mr. W. C. Wordsworth[1] writes :—

"The poor education given in schools is a drag on the work done in colleges, just as the poor work done in colleges means inefficient teaching in schools. Few schools owe their origin to anything but the need of preparing boys for the matriculation examination; their work is limited to this, and their only pride is in examination successes. Some schools are organised so efficiently for this purpose as to deserve high praise; but even the best do nothing more, sending their pupils to the University with nothing better than the matriculation equipment..... The present procedure for the recognition of schools is not in my opinion conducive to their best interests. The Department of Education maintains certain schools and aids others. The University, which neither maintains nor aids, has the full control of all school education through the power of recognition. A school requires nothing except permission to present its pupils for the matriculation. For this purpose, it must be inspected and reported on, as a matter of convenience usually by the divisional inspector of schools, who is an officer of the Education Department, not of the Univer-

[1] General Memoranda, page 485.

sity; he is permitted by the Government as a matter of courtesy and convenience to give of his time and energy to this work, which lies outside his regular duties; his travelling expenses are paid by Government. His report and recommendations are considered and forwarded to the University by the Director with his comments. It is usually the case that, of all who consider the school's application, the inspector alone has seen the school: yet it is by no means the rule that his recommendation is accepted, even when wholly endorsed by the Director. Cases are not unknown in which recognition has been granted despite the inspector's and Director's emphatic advice, or in which recognition once granted temporarily on condition of certain improvements being made, has been continued without further reference to the inspector and cases have been recently brought to the notice of the Syndicate where schools, formally deprived of recognition, have still been permitted to present their pupils for the matriculation. The present situation is one that depreciates the value and prestige of the inspector; he is obviously in a difficult position in relation to a school that has managed to secure recognition against his deliberate judgment; and his position is made worse by a practice that has grown up in certain parts of the province, a school after inspection frequently sends a deputation of its committee to Calcutta to canvass the Syndicate and traverse the inspector's report. This practice is not discouraged by all members of the Syndicate and engenders the idea that the position of the University is that of a mediator between the inspectors and the schools ..... The inspectors are consequently impeded in their efforts to improve schools to that minimum of efficiency which the University itself lays down. In part inspectors themselves have been responsible for this position, as reports on schools have frequently been drawn up in language so vague as to furnish neither schools nor University with clear guidance ..... In part an unsatisfactory standard of correspondence by both University and inspectors is responsible. But the chief difficulty is that the regulations of the University are not satisfactory. They demand as conditions of recognition, certain standards of accommodation, light, air, financial stability, etc., which are not defined. Further, the regulations are in practice departed from. They contemplate recognition without qualification; in practice, there has grown up a system of provisional or temporary recognition as a method of nursing schools to efficiency. But as the main reason why a school desires recognition is that it may present its pupils for the matriculation examination, and as this privilege is granted by temporary recognition, and as temporary recognition may be renewed year after year, the promotion of efficiency is not necessarily secured by this means. We thus arrive at the peculiar position that a school which the Syndicate itself considers not fit to prepare pupils for the matriculation is permitted to do so, and schools that know themselves to be below standard apply for provisional recognition."

28. Mr. T. O. D. Dunn,[1] Inspector of Schools for the Presidency Division, writes:—

"The regulations dealing with the recognition of schools by the University have become a dead letter; for the following reasons the most

[1] Question 8

undesirable and most inefficient schools continue to enjoy their connexion with the University :—

(1) The University does not inspect the schools which it recognises. This duty falls to an officer already overburdened with administrative work : and it is extremely difficult to keep reports that have any real value up-to-date.

(2) The unwillingness of the University to enforce its own regulations. ..... The reason for this is two-fold, (*a*) people in India do not like to be unpleasant and to take the final and decisive course. Instead of disaffiliation, or removal of recognition, the offending school is let off with a warning that, unless within such and such a period, improvements have been effected, action will be taken. And so on. (*b*) The regulations are scarcely capable of fulfilment in the spirit and the letter by about 60 per cent. of existing institutions .....

(3) Secondary education has, in many instances, fallen into the hands of designing people who have as much right to be described as educationalists as the classic Squeers."

IV.

29. The defects disclosed in this evidence are, relatively to the present needs of the University and of the province, more serious than would have been the case twenty or thirty years ago. Our witnesses, Indian and European alike, have not dwelt upon the shortcomings in secondary education in a carping or hypercritical spirit, nor have they, we believe, been betrayed into exaggeration of them. Still less would it be just to charge those among them who are university teachers with a disposition to lay upon other shoulders the blame for faults for which they themselves might be held responsible. The discouraging, and more than discouraging, reports of the state of secondary education in the Presidency come from all quarters and from witnesses engaged in many different avocations. Not the least moving among the appeals for reform in the conditions of secondary education come from secondary school masters themselves.[1]

30. And the evidence is far from being confined to criticisms and fault finding. Many of the witnesses suggest reforms which, if energetically and judiciously applied, would quickly improve the present conditions. The chief among these remedial measures are (1) the strengthening of the teaching profession by the offer of higher salaries, and by insistence upon professional training,

[1] See, for example, the memorandum by Mr. Pran Hari Sen, Rector of the Radhanath High English School, Swanagaram, Dacca, General Memoranda, pages 327-331.

at any rate in the case of a certain proportion of new entrants: (2) the provision of funds, partly from public, partly from private sources, upon a scale sufficient to enable the schools to employ competent teachers, to purchase the equipment necessary for instruction in elementary science, geography, manual training, etc., and, where necessary, to improve their premises from the point of view of lighting, air-space and grounds for physical exercise and games: and (3) the giving of judicious guidance to the schools by means of systematic and regular inspection especially with a view to helpful suggestion as to improved methods of teaching and school organisation and to the gradual building up of a tradition of honourable responsibility and of well considered initiative on the part of the head masters and their colleagues. The adoption of such measures, our witnesses believe, would quickly raise to a higher level the fortunes of secondary education in the province and would not only give new life to the University but also, by diffusing a truer idea of what education should aim at and may achieve, impart fresh vigour to social and economic activities throughout Bengal.

31. With this forecast of what might be accomplished, we concur. But, as many of our witnesses are careful to observe, such a re-organisation of secondary education would involve, in the interest both of the high schools and of the University, a remodelling of the intermediate classes which in the words of the Fourth Quinquennial Report[1] on education in India are "in reality a prolongation of the school courses". And, as one important detail of such reconstruction, it would also be necessary to consider afresh the present form of the connexion between the secondary schools and the University.[2]

32. On this point, many of our correspondents have given a full exposition of their views. By far the larger number think it desirable to retain, though not necessarily in its present shape, an intimate relationship between the University and that grade of education from which it draws the successive generations of its undergraduates. A smaller number deem it expedient that the University as such should be relieved of any kind of administrative responsibility for the recognition and inspection of schools. But, as will be seen below, a third and larger group incline towards a

[1] Fourth Quinquennial Review on the Progress of Education in India, by R. Nathan, 1902, page 93.

[2] Chapter III, para. 51.

new solution which may prove so widely acceptable as to allow a settlement of a long standing controversy. We proceed to give a summary of these different, but not wholly discordant, views.

33. "I am opposed," writes Mr. Ramananda Chatterjee,[1] "to any system of school final examination conducted and controlled by the Education Department."

"The University," writes Mr. Sudhansukumar Banerjee.[1] "should be the decisive body to admit the seekers after knowledge into its portals. The school final system, the only other alternative system and an entirely artificial and officialised system, which has been introduced into some provinces like Madras, has already given sufficient indication, by hampering the educational progress of those provinces. It need hardly be said that this system has been rightly condemned by the public opinion of India."

"I would not have the matriculation examination replaced partially or wholly by a school final examination," writes Dr. P. Neogi,[2] "for the reason that a uniform university examination should be held to test the students' knowledge acquired after a ten years' study in schools."

34. Dr. Abdurrahman[1] of Bhopal wishes the school leaving examination (if one is established) to be, like the matriculation, a university examination. He wishes to secure "perfect articulation between school and college education." To cut off school education from organic connexion with the University would be 'the ruin of college education.'

"Whether," he writes, "Government institutes a school-leaving examination, or licenses the schools, or makes the entrance into Government service and the universities dependent upon State examination or adopts some other way to gain control over the schools, it will be pursuing a wrong, injurious and futile policy. ..... If Government will force such an educational policy upon the Calcutta University, it is bound sooner or later to be resented by the Indians in general and by the people of Bengal in particular. It would unpopularise Government and involve it in difficulties which would be of its own creation. The policy will also be futile because, if Government were to persist in it for long, Government schools will become unpopular, and gradually but surely the people will leave Government schools and educate their children in national schools (however weak and bad they may be for a long time at first) which will be 'unrecognised' but independent. If Government is far-seeing enough and well advised it will not dissociate itself from the representatives of the people. It is essential for the success of its own educational policy that it should always carry with itself the considerable body of public opinion."

---

[1] Question 8.

[2] Question 10.

35. It is in reference to the strong feeling which this question arouses that Mr. H. J. Maynard,[1] Vice-Chancellor of the Punjab University, writes :—

"There is reason for caution. Despite the large proportion of nominated fellows, a university is largely an autonomous body. The Senate and the educated and articulate public outside the Senate are very jealous on the subject of this autonomy. The history of the school final examination scheme in the Punjab shows what happens when the educated and articulate public takes alarm over a proposal of which it is suspicious. The very name becomes a sort of anathema. The very mention of it becomes a sort of trumpet call to an organised opposition. People cease to analyse the plan or to exercise reason over the consideration of it. I am reminded of what happened in the United States of America by reason of George III's Stamp Act... There is a danger that too emphatic insistence upon the control of Government over the University, or upon the control of the University over the colleges, or upon the raising of standards, ... or upon the limitation of the number of students, or upon the need of palliating the external examination by reference to the colleges or the teachers, or upon the need of increased expenditure by colleges or by students, will place proposals of university reform in the category of things to which the public will not listen."

With special reference to plans which would substitute certification of a candidate's merit by the school teachers for the impersonal test conducted by an external authority, Mr. Maynard observes that "the Indian parent and the Indian student are very suspicious of anything which looks like a discretionary authority. They fear abuses, caprice, and corrupt favour or influence."

36. Mr. Heramba Chandra Maitra,[2] Principal of City College, Calcutta, defines the University as "an organ of Government created by it for stimulating and controlling higher education" and asks "why cannot necessary reforms be effected through it?" He claims that the nation should have a voice in the organisation and control of secondary education on the grounds that education is a great national concern, the key to employment and a condition of all national advance and prosperity. It is because the University is in his judgment more representative of national experience and feeling than a Government department can be that he protests against a transference of the present responsibilities of the University to a more official body. But the gist of his argument is favourable to entrusting the furtherance

[1] General Memoranda, page 431.

[2] Note on control of schools (originally printed in the *Modern Review*, December 1917), General Memoranda, pages 315-321 and answer to Question 8.

of secondary education to a body which would be fully representative of experienced opinion in Bengal.

37. Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee,[1] who has devoted much thought to this question, arrives at the conclusion that—

"the existing system of having secondary schools under the control of the University and of having the completion of secondary education tested by the matriculation examination should be maintained, with any suitable changes in the matriculation standard that may be deemed necessary and with ample provision for technical education to relieve the University from its present congestion."

He holds that (subject to the ultimate right of the Government to prevent the imparting of such education as may incite to anarchy or disorder) the University should hold in its hands the right of recognising or not recognising secondary schools and of certifying their efficiency after inspection. He bases this contention on nine main arguments. (*a*) The University must itself control the examination attesting fitness for admission to its own courses. (*b*) The number of boys in secondary schools deliberately intending not to enter college if they succeed in passing the matriculation examination is negligible. (*c*) If the number is not negligible, schools are free to provide such non-matriculation courses as may be demanded by the guardians of the pupils. (*d*) A reformed matriculation examination can sufficiently test proficiency in all the subjects necessary to a liberal education up to 16 whether the pupil is going to college or direct from school into practical life. (*e*) For giving guidance to the schools, a joint inspection by members of the University and by Government inspectors of schools is likely to be more efficacious than inspection by the latter alone. (*f*) Two examinations, a school final and matriculation, if maintained alongside of one another, would be costly and embarrassing both to teachers and candidates. (*g*) The University is the body best qualified to determine cases involving conflict of interest between Government schools and schools under private management. (*h*) "The universities are composed of Indian and European members who have co-ordinate authority, while in the Government Education Department Indian members occupy only a subordinate position, so that the control exercised by the

[1] See Question 8 and his *Education Problem in India* (Calcutta, S. K. Lahiri and Co., 1914), pages 31-43. Reference should also be made to his Note of Dissent to the Report of the Indian Universities Commission, 1902 (paras. 31-32 and 33-34).

University is likely to be better adapted to Indian conditions and to be more regardful of Indian requirements than the control of the Education Department."[1] (*i*) "The chief merit of the universities is that their constitution is leavened by a large admixture of the popular element composed not merely of Indians but Anglo-Indians as well, which serves to soften the severity of action of the official element, so that in the end the course of action generally taken is the right middle course lying between the extremes of leniency and stringency. This is the reason why the public in this country are so anxious to have the jurisdiction of the universities extended instead of being curtailed just as (to compare two dissimilar things with a marked point of similitude) the public are anxious for the maintenance in all its integrity of the jurisdiction of the High Courts which with their inherited strong instincts of British justice help to moderate any undue rigour of the Anglo-Indian Executive."[2]

38. Finally, the Rammohun Library Conference,[3] while taking a less favourable view than Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee of the influence of the University upon the educational interests of the country ("The existing system of university education does not as a rule help to develope in graduates the power of independent thinking to the extent that is desired. The ideal of the University has made it inattentive to the industrial and commercial needs of the country") states that "the very first difficulty in the way of finding a remedy for the defects in the present system is the fact that the Government officials do not, and cannot, fully represent the views and interests of the entire community." The Conference therefore recommends that—

"the entire control of education in every stage—elementary, secondary and higher — and of every description—general, technical and commercial—should be placed under one body, mainly composed of persons conversant with educational needs and ideals and representing the various interests of the country. The inspection of schools and colleges, the formulation of curricula, the enforcement of rules and regulations and the allocation of funds should be made by this body."

---

[1] *The Educational Problem in India*, page 39. Circumstances have changed since Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee wrote this passage, which was published in 1914.

[2] *Ibid*, page 39.

[3] General Memoranda, pages 439-442.

Up to this point the Rammohun Library Conference would seem to be indicating as desirable the creation of a body similar to that proposed by other witnesses cited below. But their memorandum proceeds to say that this one representative body—

"may be the University itself, reorganised to suit the expanded scope of its duties and responsibilities. This body should be freed from interference by the Government departments, and the entire State expenditure on education should be placed under its control on the usual conditions of account and audit."

Thus the university organisation which the Rammohun Library Conference has in view is very unlike the University in its present form, and is rather the State in a new aspect than the corporation with much more limited functions to which Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee and other correspondents would continue to assign the duty of attesting the efficiency of secondary education.

39. A second category of witnesses think that the University should be relieved of some or all of its present responsibilities in regard to secondary schools. Mr. Jatindra Chandra Guha[1] of Rajshahi College would abolish the matriculation, replacing it by a college test to which only those who have read up to the highest class in a high school should be admitted. "For those who do not like to come to the University, a school final examination may be instituted by the Education Department of Government."

40. Mr. R. N. Gilchrist,[1] Principal of Krishnagar College, would also have two examinations, one for entrance to the University but of the standard of the present intermediate, the other a school leaving examination approximately at the present matriculation stage. The two, he adds,—

"should ultimately be fused, though the fusion may take many decades." With regard to the school final examination, he says that personally he "prefers a departmental school leaving certificate, the university being left to the next, or university entrance, examination. In so much as the school leaving is a definitely lower stage, *ipso facto* every university entrance candidate will have a school leaving certificate before proceeding to the University entrance examination."

41. Mr. W. C. Wordsworth[2] favours "the removal of all school work from the control of the University; the establishment of a school leaving examination which should be an entrance

[1] Question 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 488.

qualification to the University ; and the acceptance of the principle that the essential qualification for admission to a university is not examination certificates but evidence of a certain standard of intellectual equipment."

42. Mr. J. G. Jennings,[1] Vice-Chancellor of Patna University, thinks that —

"the conditions of admission to Calcutta University have been most unfavourably affected by the control which the University has tried to exert over schools. Its interference has led to a dual control and the schools of this Province (at least before October 1, 1917, when the province acquired its own University) have looked partly to Calcutta University and partly to the Education Department for control and guidance. The effect has been to weaken the control and obscure the guidance. The schools are the worse for the competition between the two authorities. The University apparently has feared that the Department would be too strict, and the Department has certainly thought that the University prevented the proper organisation of the schools. The University should certainly maintain its own matriculation examination, but I doubt whether the standard of that examination will ever be satisfactory so long as the University prevents the Department from authoritatively controlling and organising the schools. The work of a university is outside schools. Its interference with schools, moreover, is based on a pretence since it has no inspecting staff with which to inspect them. Its fears of excessive severity on the part of the Education Department are, I think, misplaced, since neither inspectors nor Directors of Public Instruction nor Government would be satisfied to show annually no increase, or a small increase, in the number of schools and pupils under their charge. But there is no doubt that the Department, if left free, would endeavour by all means in its power to improve the quality of the teaching, discipline and equipment, and so the standard of candidates for admission to the University.

The candidates do not lack intelligence ; they lack teaching, as is evidenced by the prevalence of private tutors for school boys."

43. Finally, in the memorandum written by others besides himself, which the Rev. Garfield Williams[2] submits as giving his general views on educational reconstruction in India, the opinion is expressed that the general course in high schools should be—

"formulated in consultation with Government officials and prominent business men ..... and that the English school leaving examination which terminates the course should be a Government examination and be used by Government for entrance into its own subordinate services. This will result in the general course becoming popular because it leads to definite possibilities of employment. The result will be that only boys who are fitted and determined to go on to a proper academic course in the University will enter the University preparation course and work for the matriculation examination."

---

[1] Question 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 468.

44. The third group of witnesses, the largest of the three, evidently feel that there is substance in some of the points urged by each of the groups whose opinions are cited above. Rai Yatindra Nath Choudhury[1] suggests that the University authorities might act in concert with the Government officers in creating a machinery for inspecting the high schools. Mr. Surendranath Roy[2] proposes that there should be " an Education Board consisting of official and non-official members for the administration of secondary schools." Mr. Atul Chandra Sen[3] would like to put all secondary schools under Councils of Education (of which he would have at least three in Bengal) which would—

" have a very liberal constitution, consisting of members elected by public bodies, some being nominated by Government and the universities. The Mahomedan interest should also be represented. The Councils must be self-governing bodies and not branches of the Education Department. They should frame rules for recognition of schools and lay down conditions of study in them. In short all the work now done by the University for secondary schools may be transferred to these Councils. They will also have their inspecting staff, and the entire control over secondary and high schools may be left to them."

Mr. Rebati Raman Dutt[4] sketches in outline a scheme for District Educational Councils, acting as ' branch organisation of the University ' and charged with the duty of making the initial recommendations for the recognition of new schools. Each Educational Council would consist of the men of influence in the district and the Government inspector and assistant inspector of schools. It would administer Government grants-in-aid for high English schools. Inspectors and assistant inspectors would report all irregularities to this Council.

45. Mr. J. N. Gupta[5] has worked out more elaborately a plan for the greater decentralisation of educational control. He suggests a Central Board of Education for Bengal, representing the Calcutta University, the local Government and the Imperial Government. All institutions for primary, secondary and higher education in the district would " be made over to the control of District Boards. For each Commissioner's division, there should be a local board of

[1] Question 11.
[2] General Memoranda, page 327.
[3] *Ibid*, page 375.
[4] *Ibid*, page 420.
[5] *Ibid*, page 424.

Education. It is of the highest importance to give local bodies power to impose an education tax."

46. Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta[1] proposes " an efficient Board of Education which should replace the Director of Public Instruction and the inspectors and be in direct touch with all branches of secondary education. It should have large powers of initiative."

47. Mr. G. Findlay Shirras[2] would entrust " the granting of the school leaving certificate to a larger body than the present Education Department, and it would have to be a large body which would have behind it the strong support of public opinion."

48. Mr. H. Sharp[1] thinks that—

" a school leaving certificate should be established. The final authority should be Government, but the work should mainly be performed by a board under the chairmanship of the Director of Public Instruction and containing representatives of the universities, of the schools, of various kinds of employers and the whole of the superior inspecting staff. The candidate should be judged on his school record, his examination papers, and his oral test . . . . the examining functions should be delegated to a few subsidiary boards established in the different divisions, subject to some moderation by the central board."

49. Mr. C. E. W. Jones,[1] Director of Public Instruction, North-West Frontier Province, writing with special reference to Bengal, suggests that " a joint Board, consisting of representatives of the University and of the Education Department, should be created for the framing of courses and for the conduct of the examination for admission to the University."

50. The questions of principle and of administrative and educational policy involved in the proposals summarised above will be discussed in a later section of our report. In the meantime it will suffice to say that, in our judgment, the complexity of the interests which are at stake in the planning of various courses of instruction in secondary schools and in the intermediate classes (which are in effect the higher part of secondary education) points towards the establishment of a new authority upon which the experience of all directly concerned should have representation.

---

[1] Question 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 117.

CHAPTER XI.

The Education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians.

I

1. There is throughout India and Burma a separate school system for Europeans and Anglo-Indians, who constitute what is known officially as the Domiciled Community in India. There is also a separate code of regulations for European schools, and this code starts by defining the term 'European' as signifying "any person of European descent, pure or mixed, who retains European habits and modes of life."

2. We recognise the social and political importance of this section of the population of the Bengal Presidency and realise that any system of university or secondary education which ignores its peculiar needs could not be regarded as in any sense complete. We have not visited the representative European secondary schools, but have availed ourselves of the experience of one of our members and we print elsewhere a memorandum by Mr. Hornell entitled "The education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians".[1]

3. In the Bengal Presidency there were on the 31st March 1917, in 79 recognised institutions for the education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians, 9,634 pupils of whom 8,959 were Europeans and Anglo-Indians and 675 were Indians. These institutions included some special schools, *viz.* :—

(*a*) An apprentice night school in Calcutta.
(*b*) A night school for the Bengal Nagpur Railway European and Anglo-Indian apprentices at Khargpur.
(*c*) The Young Women's Christian Association Technical and Commercial Classes, Calcutta.
(*d*) The Government Training Class for women teachers at Kurseong.
(*e*) 16 technical or commercial classes attached to schools.

[1] See the volume of appendices to this report.

The remaining 59 institutions were secondary and elementary schools. The secondary schools are divided into two categories: (*i*) higher secondary, and (*ii*) secondary, while elementary schools are graded either as (*iii*) higher elementary or (*iv*) elementary. The origin and significance of these grades are fully explained in Mr. Hornell's memorandum. All we need state here is that on the 31st March 1917 the number of pupils in higher secondary, secondary, higher elementary and elementary schools were 3,363, 1,032, 3,109 and 1,728 respectively. There were also 94 boys and girls taking supplementary courses in higher elementary schools. The elementary school course comprises an infant stage and six standards. The complete secondary school (the higher secondary school as it is called) is organised in three sections:

(*a*) the preparatory school,
(*b*) the general school,
(*c*) the upper school.

The curriculum followed in the preparatory section of a secondary school is identical with that followed in the infant section and the first four standards of an elementary school. The arrangement of the pupils of European schools, according to grades of instruction, was on the 31st March 1917 as follows:—

Grades of instruction.	Boys.	Girls.	TOTAL.
Supplementary courses in higher elementary schools	45	49	94
Infant classes of elementary and higher elementary schools and standards I to VI . . .	2,334	2,429	4,763
The preparatory section of secondary and higher secondary schools	1,537	1,095	2,632
The general section of secondary and higher secondary schools	989	599	1,588
The upper section of higher secondary schools .	161	88	249
TOTAL .	5,066	4,260	9,326

This total (9,326) is exclusive of 308 pupils in special schools.[1]

[1] Mr. Hornell's memorandum, paras. 8 and 17-21.

4. The European school system is essentially a denominational one, as the table below will show[1]:—

Institutions.	No. of institutions.	No. of pupils.	Percentage of total number of pupils in secondary, primary, and special schools.
Government	5	302	3·13
Jewish	1	131	1·36
Non-Conformist	4	581	6·03
Church of Scotland	2	490	5·09
Roman Catholic	38	5,360	55·64
Church of England	14	1,645	17·07
Undenominational (including Y. M. C. A.)	15	1,125	11·68
TOTAL	79	9,634	100·00

5. The European schools are mainly located in Calcutta and Howrah and in the hill stations of Darjeeling, Kurseong and Kalimpong. The 9,232 pupils who were on the 31st March 1917 in the secondary and elementary schools for Europeans and Anglo-Indians of the Bengal Presidency were distributed locally as follows:—Calcutta and Howrah 6,159; Darjeeling, Kurseong and Kalimpong 1,955; Asansol 329; Dacca 174; Chittagong 176; along the East Indian Railway line 187; along the Eastern Bengal Railway line 75; along the Bengal Nagpur Railway line 177.[2]

6. The cost of the European school system of Bengal for the year 1916-17 was calculated to be Rs. 27,49,996. Towards this amount Provincial revenues contributed Rs. 8,32,150, while municipal grants amounted to Rs. 19,235. The balance was met as follows:—Rs. 10,55,427 from fees, Rs. 1,22,323 from endowments and Rs. 7,20,861 from subscriptions, donations and other sources. There are two general endowments, *viz.*, the Bruce Institution—a fund left by the Misses Bruce, the daughters of an indigo planter, for the education and maintenance of Anglo-Indian girls, and the Doveton Trust, formed from the sale of the property of the Doveton College, the annual income of which amounts to about Rs. 5,500 and is spent on scholarships. The capital of the Bruce Institution is about 10½ *lakhs* and its annual income amounts to

[1] Mr. Hornell's memorandum, para. 27.

[2] *Ibid*, para. 29

about Rs. 37,000.[1] An anonymous donor has recently placed a capital grant of Rs. 10 *lakhs* at the disposal of the Government of Bengal to be spent mainly on the European schools of the Presidency. Some ten years ago the late Mr. Robert Laidlaw of Messrs. Whiteaway Laidlaw and Co., Ltd., placed certain funds at the disposal of trustees to be spent on European schools. These funds which have been added to by subscriptions are administered by an organisation which makes occasional grants to the European schools of Bengal. The Roman Catholic schools do not participate these grants.

7. Mr. W. H. H. Arden Wood, Principal, La Martinière, Calcutta, writes as below on the general question of the education of Europeans and Anglo-Indians:[2]—

"Europeans that are only temporarily resident in India usually send their children to England at an early age; some few may send their children to local schools in India for a few years. Of late years there has been a steady increase in the number of Europeans coming out to India to occupy comparatively subordinate positions in trade and commerce and in industries. Europeans of this class tend to become domiciled and in most cases are compelled by circumstances to educate their children in India.

On the other hand, a small proportion of the more well-to-do domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians send their children at a comparatively early age to England for education, and a larger proportion send their children to England at an age, say, from 14 years onwards, to complete their school education, and to receive technical or professional, or university education.

Since the war began many children who would ordinarily have gone to England are being educated at hill schools and other schools in India.

But the great majority of the children of the domiciled European and Anglo-Indian community receive the whole of their education in India. They are born, brought up, and, with the exception of the few who, by sheer ability and force of character, do exceptionally well, live and die in India.

They are, in fact, natives of India and it seems to me to be in the interests of India to make the best of them that can be made."

8. Mr. Arden Wood deplores the fact that the number of European and Anglo-Indian boys who proceed to a university education from secondary schools in India is not as large as it should be.[2] The Rev. Father F. Crohan of St. Xavier's College, Calcutta, pleads that the needs of the Anglo-Indian community should be studied and their higher education more powerfully encouraged. In spite of the fact that there is attached to St. Xavier's College an important and efficient school, designed to meet the needs of the

[1] Mr. Hornell's memorandum, para. 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 108.

Domiciled Community, ex-pupils of the school are conspicuous by their absence from the rolls of the college.

"As it is," writes the Rector, "the university courses do not fit in with their secondary education. The I.A. and I.Sc. courses overlap with those of Senior Cambridge and the new course of study proposed by Cambridge for the last school class will even overlap the syllabus of the B.A. and B.Sc. This is a cause of much disappointment to many."[1]

9. Mr. Hornell has described at length in his memorandum the history of the curriculum and examinations taken in European schools. He has also mentioned certain institutions affiliated to the Calcutta University, as occasionally preparing European and Anglo-Indian students for the examinations of that University; but he has endorsed the statement repeatedly made in official reports, that collegiate education for Europeans, as a thing apart from the collegiate education of Indians, is practically non-existent. The memorandum discusses the question why Europeans and Anglo-Indians so rarely attempt university courses; and among the causes mentioned is the want of adjustment between the European secondary school courses, which are directed towards the Cambridge local examinations, and the requirements of the University. We may cite the following figures. During 1917 the successful candidates at the examinations of the Calcutta University included only thirty-three European and Anglo-Indian students (20 men and 13 women); only nineteen candidates, thirteen boys and six girls, passed the Calcutta matriculation examination during the quinquennium (1913-17) and in the course of this period 73 European or Anglo-Indian students were successful at the Cambridge higher local examinations.[2]

10. The rules for the final examination of European secondary schools are peculiar to Bengal, where the Cambridge local examinations—which are accepted by Calcutta University as an equivalent for its matriculation and to some extent for its intermediate examination—are the prescribed tests. Class promotion is decided in European schools in Bengal by the school authorities, subject to the control of the Inspector; it is so decided in all schools for Indians, except that the control of the Inspector does not apply to the very large number of high schools, which are neither

[1] Question 22.

[2] Mr. Hornell's memorandum, paras. 39-45.

Government institutions nor aided. The Bengal Code for European schools prescribes an elementary school certificate examination and the present practice of the Education Department is to make obligatory the appearance at this examination of every pupil in the sixth standard of European elementary schools. No such test is imposed in Indian schools.

11. In July 1912 the Government of India held an important conference in Simla on the education of the Domiciled Community. The conference generally deplored the absence of Europeans and Anglo-Indians from university colleges and some of the members advocated separate arrangements being made for the university education of the Domiciled Community. Other members, conspicuous among whom was Mr. Küchler, then Director of Public Instruction in Bengal, held that the provision of separate arrangements was impracticable. The conference finally recommended to Government :—

(*a*) That a separate university arts college should be instituted, either affiliated, if possible, to a western university or self-contained, conferring its own degrees.

(*b*) That, if this be found to be impracticable, there may be added, in connexion with at least one of the training colleges for teachers, arts and science graduate courses both for the advantage of the candidates for the teaching diplomas and also for such other Anglo-Indian students as desire to take advantage of them ; and that the college be affiliated to a recognised university.[1]

12. The discussions which have followed the conference have made it clear that a system of university education for Europeans and Anglo-Indians, divorced on its instructional side from the ordinary university system, is something which is neither desirable nor practicable. If, as our witnesses hope, the University of Calcutta is so developed and strengthened as to take its place among the great centres of learning and higher education in the world, other residents of Bengal, besides those of Indian descent, will wish to avail themselves of its advantages. We hope that this will be equally true of the University of Dacca.

---

[1] Report of the Conference on the Education of the Domiciled Community in India, Simla, July 1912 (Calcutta, 1912), pages 18-21.

II.

13. The education of the European and Anglo-Indian community is a matter of great social and political importance. It is natural and right that those Europeans in India who have always kept in close touch with their native land should, if they can afford to do so, send their children to Europe for secondary and university or technological training. But there is a large and increasing number of families in the Domiciled Community who cannot afford the expense of educating their children in Europe. Their needs should be carefully borne in mind when the system of university and technological education in Bengal is reorganised and improved.

14. The European secondary school system will best be continued upon present lines of organisation; partly with a view to climatic conditions, because boarding schools in the hills are best adapted to the needs of European children in India; partly, because, as some of the younger Europeans leave India before their school education is completed, their secondary education should be more assimilated to English methods than is desirable or possible in high schools for Indian boys and girls; partly also, because European children derive benefit from the corporate life, which the best of the existing schools afford, and from the care which religious bodies devote to this branch of educational work. But the examination tests applied to the European secondary schools of Bengal should be adjusted to the university system of the Presidency and the Universities of Calcutta and Dacca should accord due recognition to the results of these tests. The authority which we shall propose for secondary and intermediate education should take European schools into account, and should accord them appropriate treatment in view of their exceptional position. We shall recommend in a later chapter that one of its members should be chosen with a view to the representation of the educational interests of the Domiciled Community.[1]

15. In the industrial and commercial development of Bengal young men and women of the European Domiciled Community should bear an important part. They should therefore have access to, and be encouraged to avail themselves of, facilities

[1] Chapter XXXI, para. 25.

for university and technological education of the best type.[1] Separate institutions for university and technological training should not be provided for Europeans and Anglo-Indians, because the expense of such provision would be prohibitive, and because it is desirable that, intending as they do to earn their livelihood in India, these younger members of the European Domiciled Community should be brought into association, during the years of their university and technological training, with the young Indians with whom they will afterwards be brought into association in business or in other ways. We believe that the universities and technological institutions, developed on the lines recommended in this report, will meet effectively the needs of the Domiciled Community.[1]

16. But, with this end in view, it is necessary that the European secondary school system in Bengal should be more closely coordinated with the university system. The new authority which we shall propose for secondary and intermediate education[2] will be in a position to review the needs of the European schools and to provide for the more advanced stages of their teaching being equated with that done in the intermediate colleges the establishment of which we shall recommend.[3] We desire to emphasise the importance of making adequate provision in European schools for the teaching of the principal Indian vernaculars in order that the members of the Domiciled Community may take their due share in the future administration of India and in its industrial and commercial development. And, further, though care should be taken not to overload the curriculum or to jeopardise the claims of other studies, the teaching of Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian should not be ignored in European schools. The openings for administrative and commercial careers which are likely to offer themselves in the Middle East make it desirable that the young men of the Domiciled Community should have increased facilities for learning modern oriental languages.

17. The Domiciled European Community should have effective representation upon the governing body of the University of Calcutta

[1] On the 31st March 1917 there were only 506 Europeans and Anglo-Indians in all the professional and technical colleges and schools of the Bengal Presidency. Of these 147 were girls in commercial schools and 129 boys in engineering schools.

[2] Chapter XXXI.

[3] Chapter XXXII.

and we shall recommend that the Court of that University should include representatives of the Bengal Chamber of Commerce and other important public bodies, as well as of associations which may contribute a substantial sum annually to the University or one of its colleges.[1] The experience of the community should also be represented in the Court of the University of Dacca, and for this our recommendations will provide.[2] Suitable residential accommodation should be provided in the university towns for students belonging to the Domiciled Community in order that the new opportunities for university education may be effectively opened to them.

18. Our attention has been drawn to the great work which European and Anglo-Indian women teachers might do in connexion with the education of girls and women in India. Women qualified by training and entering upon the work with sympathy and enthusiasm will find in it careers of great usefulness and of absorbing interest. The example of an increasing number of women of the Domiciled European Community making the teaching of their Indian sisters their lives' work would do much to promote social unity and to further the welfare of India.

---

[1] Chapter XXXVI, paras. 27-29.

[2] Chapter XXXIII, para. 184.

[3] For Calcutta, see Chapter XXXIX, para. 12 : for Dacca, Chapter XXXIII, para. 159.

CHAPTER XII.

The Intermediate Classes and the Second-Grade Colleges.

I.

1. The great majority of boys who have passed the matriculation examination proceed, as a matter of course, to one of the 'arts colleges'[1] of the University in order to enter upon a degree course. In 1914, for example, there were 6,755 successful matriculates, which is only another way of saying that there were 6,755 boys who had reached the accepted goal of a school career. Two years later, in 1916, there were 7,189 candidates for the intermediate examination. Just under 2,000 of these were trying to pass the examination for the second time, and were not counted in the number of the 1914 matriculates. On the other hand, many who had entered on the intermediate course had either dropped out before it was finished,[2] or had been refused permission, by the heads of their colleges, to sit for the examination.[3] More than three-fourths of the successful matriculates thus proceed to the university course, if they can obtain admission to a college.

2. In the opinion of many of our correspondents this flocking of thousands of ill-prepared students into university classes is bad both for many of the students and for the work of the University. "At present nearly all students who matriculate flock to the University," says Mr. Haridas Goswamy, Head Master of the Asansol High School,[4] "without consideration of their individual bent, or their special talents, or their fitness for university training, or of

[1] The term 'arts colleges' is used not only in ordinary speech but in official documents to describe those colleges which provide training for the ordinary degrees in arts and science. It is used in that sense throughout this report.

[2] The number of candidates who thus drop out is, in some colleges, very high: see Mr. F. C. Turner's answer to Question 8.

[3] No candidate may enter for an examination unless his principal testifies that he has a reasonably good chance of passing. The number rejected on these grounds varies widely from college to college, but it is, at the intermediate stage, high in most colleges.

[4] Question 8.

their future life....The majority of these students are....unfit to receive university training." This is a severe judgment, though not more severe than that which has been expressed by other correspondents, and especially by college teachers. But it is not enough merely to condemn a movement on so large a scale, or to propose a ruthless policy of exclusion. These thousands of boys, ill-equipped as they may be for university training, want to be educated. That is a desire which cannot be met by mere denial; and if we would face our problem fairly, we must ask ourselves, first, why these multitudes flock into courses for which they are ill-fitted, and, secondly, how they are treated when they reach the University, and whether the kind of training provided for them meets their needs.

3. Some part of the answer to the first of these questions we have already seen in earlier chapters. One of the reasons why a much higher proportion of boys from secondary schools pass on to university courses in Bengal than in other countries is to be found in the strength of the tradition, among the classes from which the boys of the high schools mainly come, in favour of professional, clerical and administrative careers, to which, even in their lower grades, the university course is, in Bengal, the only avenue. The prejudice in favour of professional and administrative careers must not, however, be exaggerated. There is a growing willingness, even eagerness, to enter commercial and industrial occupations if the chance should offer itself. But the opportunities have hitherto been more limited than they will be in the future. And, what is even more important, the course of study in the schools has hitherto not been so arranged as to encourage the boy to take an interest in these possibilities, or to discover what is the sort of career for which his aptitudes would best fit him, or to afford him the most useful preliminary training for it. Hence boys, even if they may vaguely think that they would like to enter upon a commercial or industrial career, have only the dimmest notions as to the demands of such a career, and the way to set about entering it. One obvious pathway lies before them: that which leads through the University. They tread it, in a multitude of cases, not because they have chosen it, but just because it is the beaten track, and nearly all their class-mates are doing the same thing.

4. But there is a second and perhaps even stronger reason. The school course, which ought to give a 'sound general education,' sufficient to equip a boy for most ordinary modes of life, does not in fact do so. This has been made abundantly clear by the evidence quoted in the foregoing chapters. The high school course does not enable a boy to acquire the kind and degree of knowledge which is indispensable for efficiency in even the more modest careers that require literacy. And because the education given by the schools is bad, the boy must go elsewhere to get what the school ought to have given him. There is practically only one place to which he can go : a college of the University.

5. Thus the colleges of the University find imposed upon them the obligation of making good the deficiencies of the schools. "The boys, as they come at present from schools," says Mr. Raj Mohan Sen,[1] "have to be taught, for a year or more, entirely like school-boys, and not like college students, for they cannot be left to themselves." By common consent, the work of the first two years, up to the intermediate level, is practically school work. "For at least two years," says the Rev. W. E. S. Holland,[2] "our students are incapable of instruction except along school methods. Up to the I. A. it is all really school work....I have always, in writing to recruits for our staff in England, told them to prepare to teach Vth and VIth form English school boys." And Dr. Brajendranath Seal[2] supports this view when he says that "the course of liberal education through which every graduate of this University is intended to pass may be divided into three stages :—the lower school course, with the matriculation as the terminus, the higher school course.....with the intermediate examination at the end, and the university course proper, leading to the B.A. or B.Sc. degree."

6. With about half of their students, the colleges never get beyond the stage of school work. Many students drop out before they reach the end of the intermediate course : "in one year at Chittagong College," says Mr. F. C. Turner,[1] "over 30 per cent. of the students in the first year class left without transfer certificates." Many more drop out after failing to pass the

[1] Question 8.
[2] Question 1.

intermediate examination, in which the failures average more than 50 per cent.; for even the label 'Failed F. A.' is not without its value. Yet others are content with the certificate of literacy represented by success in the intermediate examination, and pass at once into minor Government posts and other positions for which this examination is accepted as sufficient qualification. It seems probable that less than fifty per cent. of the students who enter upon the intermediate course proceed to the B. A. courses.

7. There is probably no other country in the world in which it is the case that so large a proportion of those who enter upon a degree course in a university fail to proceed to its natural conclusion, but stop at a half-way house. This would seem to indicate, in the first place, that the relation between the matriculation and intermediate standards is ill-adjusted; but still more remarkable, it would seem to show that, in the view of the boys and their parents and the public, the first two years of the university course are regarded as forming a distinct stage by themselves, a supplement to the high school course, while the intermediate examination is regarded as a natural stopping-place.

8. And this is, in truth, the fact. Not only do about half of the students who enter upon the university course stop at the intermediate stage. Even those who go further frequently change their colleges at this stage, often passing from the mufassal into Calcutta. Some of the colleges limit their work to this stage. Government itself recognises this outstanding feature of university life in Bengal, by accepting the intermediate examination as the qualification for many minor Government posts, and thus encouraging many students to break off their university studies at this point. Nothing can be plainer than that the university course in Bengal falls into two clearly marked parts, the first of which is essentially a supplement to the insufficient and incomplete high-school course, while the second alone deals with real university work. For this reason we have felt it necessary to devote a special chapter to the intermediate classes, and to those colleges which devote themselves wholly to this grade of work, in spite of the fact that this must involve a certain degree of overlapping with the next chapter, in which we shall endeavour to survey the work of the 'arts colleges' as a whole.

II.

9. Before we proceed to discuss how the young matriculate is dealt with in the intermediate classes, it is necessary to say something in regard to the mental outlook and equipment with which he enters upon the new stage in his career. This has been already discussed from the point of view of the school;[1] but the subject is of such central importance that some repetition must be pardoned.

10. In the second chapter of *Clayhanger* Mr. Arnold Bennett has given a humorous and penetrating analysis of the 'mental furniture' with which his hero left a middle-class English school at the age of 16 to begin a business career. The reader is made to feel that Edwin Clayhanger's equipment for life was far from satisfactory. But it was rich in comparison with that of the average Bengali boy when he enters the University at about the same age.

11. To begin with, he is supposed to have a good working knowledge of English, in which nearly all his university work is to be carried on. But, as we have already seen,[2] his knowledge is in most cases, quite insufficient for the purpose. He cannot "understand the simplest spoken English" says one college teacher;[3] he "cannot with ease understand the text-books," says a second;[4] he often "cannot write four or five simple sentences in correct English," says a third;[5] his "pronunciation is deplorably bad," says a fourth.[6] Since his command of the medium of instruction is so deficient, it is obvious that he must need very special treatment. But this, as we shall see, the methods of organisation and teaching now prevalent in the colleges do not permit.

12. His knowledge of and power to use his mother tongue is also very inadequate.[7] "Students are never taught to write, speak, or think correctly in their mother tongue," says Mr. Sushil Kumar De.[8] This means that our school boy, when he enters university classes, has not acquired the power of accurate and precise expres-

---

[1] Chapter IX.
[2] *Ibid.*, paras. 27-30.
[3] Mr. Walter A. Jenkins; Question 8.
[4] Mr. Jogendra Nath Hazra; Question 8.
[5] Mr. Akshaykumar Sarkar; Question 8.
[6] Dr. Kedarnath Das; Question 8.
[7] Chapter IX, paras. 25-26.
[8] Question 12.

sion in any language ; without which accurate and precise thinking is impossible. This deficiency must necessarily react upon every part of his work. He starts upon his university career gravely handicapped ; and needs, in these first two years, very special help and guidance.

13. Besides English and Bengali, he also possesses some knowledge of a classical tongue : Sanskrit, if he be a Hindu, Arabic or Persian or both, if he be a Musalman. But this knowledge, though it is of real value so far as it goes, is usually no more than a smattering. The classical languages are generally very badly taught in the schools, and the boy has seldom acquired from them that drill in syntax and in the logic of speech and therefore of thought, which sometimes constitutes the invaluable result of a classical training in other countries.

14. He has some knowledge of mathematics, and in many cases this is the soundest part of his equipment, largely because this subject is less dependent than others upon the power of exact expression in words. But we have already seen[1] that there is grave reason for dissatisfaction with the kind and quality of mathematical training which most boys receive at school. The fact that the average mark in mathematics obtained by the whole mass of candidates, successful and unsuccessful, in the matriculation examination of 1917 was no less than 62 *per cent.* is not to be attributed wholly to the mathematical ability of the Bengali people, marked though that ability is. The methods of the examination contributed to produce this remarkable result.

15. Besides languages and mathematics, the student usually has some knowledge of Indian history ; for though this is not a compulsory subject in the matriculation, it is taken by the majority of students. But because he answers the examination paper in English,[2] he usually contents himself with learning a text-book by heart. The result is that, while he knows some facts, he has not been taught to *think* about the history and social organisation even of his own country. And as a rule he knows very little of any other country ; not even of the British Empire, of which he is a citizen.

16. This is, normally, the end of his catalogue of acquisitions, so far, at any rate, as it is formally attested. Of the world outside

[1] Chapter IX, paras. 18-24.

[2] The regulations permit answers in history to be written in the vernacular, but the right is seldom exercised.

India he usually knows very little. He belongs to a home-keeping and untravelled people. It is true that he may (and in a few cases, in good schools, does) take geography, usually as an alternative to history; but this is a rare exception.[1] Nor will he have any subsequent opportunity of rectifying the omission; for no men's college in Bengal offers teaching in geography.[2] As a rule he has received no sort of introduction to the wonderland of science: elementary mechanics, which may be offered as an alternative in the matriculation examination, is seldom taken up, because the schools cannot afford the necessary apparatus. But elementary mechanics is the only scientific subject ever presented. No attempt has been made to interest the boy in the abundant plant and animal life which surrounds him: there seems to be no such eager interest in natural history among Bengali boys as is common among western boys. Even the soil and products of the student's own country, and the potency of the mighty rivers whereby the country lives, are unexplained.

17. Thus in the vast majority of cases our student, when he enters the intermediate class of a college of the University, has done little more than learn, with incredible patience and diligence, masses of dead words in unfamiliar tongues, for reproduction in the examination-room. The natural quickness and alertness of mind, which is part of his racial inheritance, has been dulled. Nor has he had much chance to win for himself, outside the school-room, a more generous view of the world. He has seldom had access to books, either at home, or at school, or in a public library; and under the hateful system which has grown up in recent years, his leisure is filled with dreary tutorial coaching in further preparation for the examination. By some strange alchemy, altogether creditable to him, he often manages to get some vital nutriment out of the arid fare set before him; often, too, he finds an unhealthy stimulus in a premature enthusiasm for politics, based on no sufficient knowledge of men or of the world. Who can pretend that from such a training he can have received an adequate preparation for life, or for that free and independent

[1] The geography studied in the lower classes of the schools is too elementary to count for much.

[2] The only college which provides teaching in geography in Bengal is the Diocesan College for Girls.

criticism which is supposed to go on in a university? The first business of the college, as things are, must be to give him the training which he ought to have received at school.

18. There is, therefore, an almost unanimous consensus among our correspondents that the student at this stage is not ready to profit by the methods appropriate to a university. "The equipment with which the matriculates enter the University," says Mr. G. C. Bose, speaking from a long experience, "does not enable them to profit by university teaching."[1] "This equipment," says Mr. W. C. Wordsworth[2] "does not mean fitness for university studies, and the first two years of college life are a struggle to learn through continued school work what university work and scholarship mean." "In most of the colleges, if not all," says Kumar Manindra Chandra Sinha,[3] "the professors are constantly grumbling that students are not fit to be received for the arts and science courses.....The result is that the teaching in the first arts and science classes is becoming increasingly difficult and disappointing to professors." "The school course has been tacked on to the university course in a most ill-fitting manner", says Maulvi Tassadduq Ahmed. "The one does not naturally lead to the other."[1] And Mr. Charu Chandra Biswas boldly declares that "the time and opportunities of the University should not be wasted in conferring such elementary instruction as can be obtained elsewhere."[1] In theory this is undeniable. But what if the necessary elementary instruction *cannot* be obtained elsewhere? That is the dilemma in which the university system of Bengal has found itself involved. It offers to these ill-prepared boys courses of study which are designed to lead to a degree; it conducts them by the methods of lecture-instruction which are appropriate for higher studies, though even there insufficient. And, as might be expected, half of them fall by the way, without having received the kind of training which they need.

19. Intellectually, then, the boys in the intermediate stage are unripe for association, on anything like equal terms, with the older students who are taking the degree course; and there is something

---

[1] Question 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 485.

[3] *Ibid.*, page 159. See also Dr. Wali Mohammad's memorandum, page 407.

to be said for the view that in other respects also they would profit most if they were treated as schoolboys rather than as university students. Mr. M. P. West, a divisional inspector of schools, reports to us that[1]—

"the students of the intermediate class are still school boys. They are not old enough to be given the freedom of the college, nor old enough for college methods of teaching. Too young to find friends amongst the seniors, they associate with school boys, forming a most undesirable link between college and school. In every school scandal I have had to inquire into in a college town, there is always the inevitable intermediate class boy at the bottom of it. In fact the present divisions of the educational process are psychologically incorrect."

In order to keep these boys under the closer discipline of the school, Mr. West is "in favour of removing the intermediate classes from the University altogether, and attaching them to the high schools." Something of the same feeling, reinforced by the conviction that boys of the tender age of sixteen to eighteen ought if possible to be enabled to pursue their studies at home, or near home, no doubt in part accounts for the frequent advocacy by our correspondents of this device, on which we shall have something to say later.

III.

20. We have next to consider how the intermediate classes of the arts colleges deal with these ill-equipped students, whose secondary school training stands so much in need of improvement and expansion; remembering always that half of them will proceed, after completing the intermediate course, to academic courses in arts or science, or to professional courses in medicine or engineering; while the other half will proceed direct to various avocations. This enquiry embraces two distinct questions: first, the content and character of the courses of instruction offered; and, secondly, the methods of instruction.

21. The first thing which strikes the student of the system is that no allowance whatsoever is made in the scheme of studies for the fact that probably half of the students will not proceed beyond this stage on the road towards a degree. The course of study is planned solely with a view to the degree course to which it is supposed to lead. Apart from English and vernacular composition, which are compulsory on all students, a wide range of choice is

[1] Question 8.

indeed allowed by the regulations of the University. The arts student can choose from a list of eleven subjects—seven of which are scientific; the science student from a list of nine subjects, all scientific. But in practice the range of choice is much more limited. In two of the subjects included in both lists (geography and zoology) no teaching is provided by any men's arts college affiliated to the University; in two more (physiology and geology) only one of the colleges provides teaching; and in yet another subject (botany) only three of the men's colleges provide teaching.[1] In practice, therefore, for the great mass of students, the number of possible subjects, from among which three must be taken, is reduced to six in arts and to four in science. The colleges reduce this range of choice still further: some of them provide teaching only in the minimum number of subjects.

22. The second marked feature of the system is that no guidance seems to be given to the students in the choice of their subjects, with a view either to making the group of subjects coherent and mutually illuminative, or to providing some preliminary training for the students' future career. The regulations of the University afford no indication as to the groups of subjects that can be taken together with most advantage. The chief source of guidance in the students' selection seems to be popular rumour as to the relative easiness of the various subjects in examination. This leads to some most incongruous groupings; a very favourite combination, for example, is Sanskrit, chemistry, and logic. We should return to this subject in a later chapter;[2] for the criticism applies not only to the intermediate classes, but to the whole of the work of the arts colleges. There is, in short, no attempt made, either by the University or by the colleges, to arrange the subjects of study in homogeneous and organically related groups, such as might meet the needs of students aiming at careers of various types. Too widely, both among students and teachers, it seems to be held that the only thing that matters is success in the examination; and that so long as this is achieved, the choice of subjects is of little importance.

23. Yet more important than the absence of clear articulation in the ordinary subjects of academic study is the absence of any

[1] This does not include the Indian Association for the Cultivation of Science.

[2] Chapter XIII, para. 48.

provision for an introduction to vocational training such as is needed by that half of the students who will pass direct into various occupations after the intermediate stage. In other countries the tendency is more and more strong to introduce an element of vocational training, not unduly emphasised, at this stage of a boy's schooling even where definitely vocational subjects are not introduced, the academic subjects are grouped in such a way as to have a definite bearing in view of the boy's future. The intermediate stage in Bengal should correspond more nearly to the higher secondary stage in some western countries, when, after completing a general education up to the age of 16, an element of specialisation is introduced in the next two years.

24. The intermediate examination has come to be, in practice, the stage at which students pass into a medical course; but no attempt is made to mark off a special group of subjects as particularly suitable for intending medical students. At this stage also many boys pass either into engineering work, or into the College of Engineering; there is no attempt to organise the preliminary studies with a view to this. A large proportion of the teachers in the high schools of Bengal enter the teaching profession immediately after taking the intermediate course; but no attempt is made to arrange the course in such a way as to be helpful to those who are going to take up this work.[1] These are professions already clearly recognised, which attract many candidates. If no provision is made for them, still less is it to be expected that provision can be made at this stage for all the other callings, in commerce, industry, and the humbler spheres of administrative and clerical work, which are to-day crying out for competent recruits, and in many cases need them especially at this sort of stage.

25. But it is when we turn to consider the methods of instruction that the inadequacy of the present system to the needs of boys with the equipment we have described becomes most patent. We have already quoted statements by experienced teachers[2] which show that students in the intermediate classes ought to be "taught

[1] *Cf.* the suggestion of Mr. E. E. Biss (General Memoranda, page 360,) "it would be worth while for the University to provide matriculates who intend to become teachers ...with a special intermediate course in such school subjects as history, geography, mathematics, science, etc."

[2] Paras. 5 and 18.

like schoolboys" and are "incapable of instruction except by school methods." Yet, except in some science laboratories, no attempt is made to employ good school methods in teaching them. The method universally employed, and almost the only method employed, is that of the mass-lecture; and when he has attended his three or four lectures a day, and made what he can of them, the student is for the most part left to his own devices. We shall discuss later[1] the defects of the lecture system now in vogue in Bengal. But in the meanwhile it must be apparent that it is ill-adapted to the needs of boys equipped in the way we have described; boys who 'cannot be left to themselves,' and who need the close supervision and guidance of good class-work. Now good class-work can only be done in classes of reasonable numbers—forty at most.

26. But the intermediate classes are almost invariably far too large. Being regarded as university lectures, they may be swollen to a maximum of 150, and as the intermediate classes are far more crowded than the degree classes, this maximum is quite commonly reached. It is impossible to *teach* a class of 150, or to enlist the co-operation of the students; the lecture is the only possibility. And the tradition of lecturing is so deeply implanted that even when classes are small it is seldom abandoned. Now, however suitable the lecture method of instruction may be for genuine university work—and it has its limitations even there—it is altogether unsuited to the needs of the mass of the students in the intermediate stage. "It is very exceptional", says Mr. F. C. Turner,[2] "for a lecturer to keep himself assured that the class as a whole is following him, or to give any opportunity for the explanation of difficulties that may occur in the course of the lecture. To students who have not had a thorough grounding in English in the schools, and who are not trained to take notes, such work is practically useless; and it is not surprising that students on the whole regard lectures as a handicap prescribed by the University, and turn to the text-books ... as the best method of getting through their examinations."

27. The teaching is at its best in the science subjects, partly because the numbers are smaller, partly because the requirement

[1] Chapter XIII, paras. 50—52.

[2] Question 1.

of practical work gives a different character to the whole of the work and renders possible the informal questioning of the teacher by the pupil. But even in the sciences the work is very far from being satisfactory.[1] In the arts subjects, especially in the most popular subjects, and above all in English, both teachers and students seem to us to be in nearly all cases handicapped, on the one hand by bad traditions of teaching and study, and on the other by conditions of work which make satisfactory results all but hopeless.

28. To discuss in detail the methods pursued in the numerous intermediate classes which we have attended would be out of place, and would, indeed, be an anticipation of the more general treatment of the subject which will be attempted in the next chapter. But something ought to be said on the methods adopted in teaching English; since English is an indispensable part of the equipment of all students, and training in the use of the language is the principal element in the preparation given to them either for their later university work, or for practical life. Almost all the classes which we attended were conducted in one or other of two ways.

29. One type of lecture consisted of a continuous commentary, sentence by sentence, upon the words of some text-book, such as a selection of Addison's Essays, or a bad abridgment of *The Cloister and the Hearth* which omitted all the best parts of the book, or a second-rate summary of the story of the Odyssey. The lecture generally took the form of verbose paraphrase or meticulous annotation. The students followed with a copy of the text-book and a pencil for underlining. We scarcely ever heard a question addressed to a class, or a student challenged to give his own interpretation of a passage. This seems to be the method chiefly used in teaching English. Most of it seemed to us to be waste of time, except for the purpose of familiarising the student with the sound of spoken English. We were appalled by the needless and

[1] It may be permissible to quote here an experience of one of our number. Having learnt, during a visit to the chemical laboratory of a second-grade college, that the first lecture of the intermediate course had just been given, he asked a student, in the presence and with the permission of the professor, if he could repeat the substance of the lecture. The student replied that they had been told that chemistry was an easy subject, which could be acquired by any student who had a sharp memory; and that all they needed to do in order to pass was to attend the lectures regularly, and learn up their notes each day!

dreary apparatus of comment devoted often to second-rate books.

30. The second type of lecture consisted in the slow dictation of notes, each phrase being repeated twice or thrice, and the harder words spelt, with a view to the whole being committed to memory for the purposes of the examination. This seemed to be, on the whole, the most popular form of lecture ; certainly it keeps the students busy. But we cannot imagine anything less calculated to stimulate independence of mind, or the habit of intelligent and steady thinking which a university training ought to give. It may be worth while to transcribe a verbatim note of a short passage from one such lecture, delivered to second year students, which was taken down by one of our number : it was read, be it remembered, very slowly from manuscript, with frequent repetitions. " Question No. 2. What are the good effects or blessings of good-nature—full stop. In answer to that—small a in brackets—good nature enlightens our conversation—semi-colon ; small b in brackets—without good-nature society cannot be enjoyed —comma—that means society is not enjoyable—semi-colon ; small c in brackets—politeness or good breeding is regarded as a substitute or remedy for want of good nature." Some students with whom we were trying to talk in a hostel subsequently showed us transcripts of this stuff in their notebooks ; one of them when asked if he understood it, replied that he had not yet had time to learn it. Many words in the notebooks were misspelt ; although the lecturer had paused, for example, to note that two c's were required in the word ' account.'

31. It is by such means that boys, equipped in the way we have analysed, are trained to use their minds, and to employ the English language as a vehicle of speech and thought. We have come across no instance in which systematic instruction in spoken English, by phonetic methods, was given to the students, and very few in which there was well-designed training in composition. Detailed commentary upon text-books, listened to in silence by the students, seemed to be the universal method. We cannot imagine a method less likely to give a ready command of the language ; and our experiences have left us full of wonder at the linguistic faculty which enables the Bengali student, after such a training, to acquire the real mastery of English which he often displays.

IV.

32. The great majority of students in the intermediate stage —in 1917-18 no less than 13,150 out of 14,917—are taught in 'arts colleges' of the types described in the next chapter—colleges which also hold degree classes; in every case but two they form, as we shall see, the majority of the whole student-body in these colleges. They are taught for the most part by the same teachers who take the degree classes; and for that reason it is natural that they should be treated in the same way, by means of mass-lectures: natural also that (as is generally the case) these elementary students should be regarded as the least interesting and important part of the flock, and should receive less attention than their older fellows, though they need more.

33. Moreover (except in Government colleges) the intermediate classes are expected to pay their own way. And in most cases they very nearly do so, in spite of the extremely low fees generally charged;[1] in some cases they even yield a profit, by means of which the B. A. classes are in part supported. We had it in evidence from the principals of mufassal colleges that in many cases they could not carry on their degree work without the surplus yielded by the intermediate classes. This means that the intellectual needs of boys at a very critical period of their training are being starved in order that the institutions to which they resort may maintain the rank of a first-grade college. One such college, which, when it was visited by a delegation from our number, was carrying on only intermediate work, and was not notably efficient in that sphere, had accumulated a considerable balance; on the strength of which it has, since our visit, applied for permission to undertake degree work. The application was granted by the University and by Government.

34. But there are also some colleges which devote themselves wholly to work of this grade. They are known as second-grade colleges; and as they are usually connected closely with the high schools from which they have in every case sprung, it might be expected that these colleges would be able to give to their students a more appropriate kind of training than that which they receive elsewhere. But this is not so. Every one of these colleges carries on its work in precisely the same way as the first-grade colleges,

[1] Usually Rs. 4 to 6 per mensem.

by means of mass lectures; not one of them has endeavoured to adopt the methods of school teaching. And the chief reason for this is, that the very name which they bear suggests to them that the work which they do is of the same type as, though of inferior quality to, that of the first-grade colleges. They therefore strive to approximate their methods as closely as possible to those of the first-grade colleges, and aim at being promoted as early as possible to the higher rank. Consequently the number of second-grade colleges is steadily shrinking. There were nine of them when our enquiry commenced, in November 1917; there were only seven in June 1918.[1]

35. Among all the colleges of this type which we have visited there is only one whose controlling authorities seem to have forsworn these ambitions, and to have forsworn them on grounds of principle. At Burdwan, the late Maharajah erected an excellent college building, one half of the quadrangle of which is occupied by a well organised high school, the other by a second-grade college. It has been often urged upon us that this college ought to be raised to the first-grade, or perhaps even turned into an independent university.[2] But the present Maharajah himself has always resisted this view. He told us in evidence that he was anxious that his college should provide a course of education appropriate to the needs of a rural town, and complete in itself. For that reason, he informed us, he had never been willing that the college should be raised to the first grade, because the work of training graduates should be concentrated in a few more highly developed centres. He would welcome the use of the college for the training of boys for a practical career, but he did not wish to make an additional manufactory of graduates. The Maharajah suggested to us a scheme of educational organisation wherein every village should have its schools; every rural town or district centre should have its higher secondary college or school, wherein boys who wished for a preliminary vocational training only could have their need satisfied, and boys who wished to proceed to a university course could be properly equipped for that purpose; while higher work of a university character should be limited

[1] At present there are 9 second-grade colleges including the two newly established colleges at Faridpur and Khulna.

[2] Question 4.

to a few centres where a genuinely efficient organisation for the purpose could be provided.

36. On such a scheme, the second-grade college would have a very important and useful part to play ; a part quite distinct from, and not less valuable than, that of the degree college. But, with the exception of Burdwan, the existing second-grade colleges are not attracted by this aim. They regard themselves as, and in effect, under existing conditions, they are, only second-rate university institutions. There is now only one men's college of this type in Calcutta : the Central College, which is marked by the total inadequacy of its equipment, and the low salaries which it pays to its teachers, but which yields to its proprietor a handsome annual profit. Outside Calcutta, besides Burdwan, there are second-grade colleges at Uttarpara (which has a lower salary scale than any other college in Bengal, Burma or Assam), at Midnapore, at Pabna, at Narail (in the Jessore district) and at Hetampur (in Birbhum).[1] Among them these colleges accommodate only 1,014 students.[2] There is not one of them which has made any endeavour to meet the special needs of their students by anything beyond the routine provision of lecture instruction. The students avoid these colleges, because they are labelled as second grade. Yet we could not but feel that, for the kind of work required at the intermediate stage, such conditions as we found, for example, at Midnapore, where the college stands in an open, healthy site among playing fields, and with pleasant hostel buildings near at hand, should be incomparably healthier and better for the students than those provided by the crowded Calcutta colleges to which they throng.

37. This somewhat contemptuous view that the second-grade college is a second-rate institution has not always been accepted. A generation ago, the second-grade college, training boys up to the age of 18, was regarded as a natural expansion for schools of the better order ; and the view was held by many that it ought to be recognised as simply the highest grade of school. Thus, in 1882, the Bengal Provincial Committee, under the presidency of Sir Alfred Croft, urged, in its report to the Education Commission of that year,

[1] Two new colleges, Rajendra College at Faridpur, and Bagharhat College at Khulna, were started recently.

[2] This figure does not include the number of students on the rolls of the two new colleges.

that institutions which taught up to the intermediate level should be described as high schools, those which taught only up to the matriculation level as middle schools; and in 1902 the author of the Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in India said that the two years of the intermediate course "may be regarded as the conclusion of the school curriculum,"[1] and the second-grade college (then normally a school to which two intermediate classes had been added) as "the complete Indian school."[2]

38. It was probably the report of the Universities Commission of 1902 which brought about the change. Rightly anxious to draw a clear line of distinction between the University and the school, and feeling that this line was confused or obliterated by the existence of second-grade colleges, which were at that date usually only upper sections of schools, they decided that the line must be drawn firmly just below, instead of just above, the sphere of the second-grade college. They therefore recommended that where (as was often the case) a school and a college were conducted under the same management, they must be housed in distinct buildings and provided with separate staffs. As this left to the second-grade college only a very narrow sphere, they urged that colleges of this type should be encouraged to strive for promotion to the higher rank; and that those "which cannot hope to rise to the first grade ought to revert to the position of high schools."[3] Thus the second-grade college was taught that it was its duty to regard itself as a university institution, to conduct its work according to the methods of a university institution, and to forswear school methods.

39. This decision of the Universities Commission did not pass without protest. Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee recorded a note of dissent[4] on the subject: "that a college should cease to exist," he wrote, "merely because it is a second-grade college with a school attached, is a proposition to which I am unable to assent." When the Government of India asked the opinions of the Provincial Governments on the subject, all except one (the Central Provinces)

[1] Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education in India, 1897-98 to 1901-02, Volume I, page 71.

[2] *Ibid.*, page 94.

[3] Report, page 19.

[4] *Ibid.*, page 79.

replied that the second-grade college was a useful institution which ought to be retained. The Government of Madras took that view with especial clearness. There are under Madras University to-day no less than 29 second-grade colleges; and their existence is felt to have this two-fold advantage, first that boys are able to pursue their studies near their homes at a critical period of their lives, and, secondly, that higher university training can be concentrated in a limited number of centres where more efficient equipment can be provided.

40. When the University of Calcutta carried out a detailed inspection of all its affiliated colleges in 1908, this question was raised by more than one of its inspectors. Thus Mr. J. R. Cunningham in reporting on the second-grade college at Midnapore[1] said that the college classes were—

"in fact already really an essential constituent part of a large and good school. The effort to introduce an artificial separation between the two top classes and the rest of the school is costing the authorities of this institution a very great deal of trouble, and is serving no useful purpose. This is, in fact, a clear case where the college stands to gain everything and lose nothing by a complete and admitted amalgamation with the adjacent school." On the Narail College the same inspector reported that "its only hope of doing sound work on an efficient basis lies in its being allowed to unite forces very definitely and systematically with the large school of which it already does, *de facto* if not *de jure*, constitute the upper storey."[2]

41. In a note appended to the inspection reports of 1908, Dr. P. K. Ray,[3] Inspector of Colleges, argued with great force that something like the second-grade college was necessary to meet the actual needs of Bengal:—

"The high schools," he wrote, "must be regarded as incomplete educational institutions, and as incapable of giving such a training to their pupils as would enable them to enter at once on university study for the career of a literary or a scientific man or the special studies and practical training necessary for a professional or a commercial life ..... Under these circumstances it is desirable that the second-grade colleges ..... should be encouraged and allowed to prepare students who may, after passing the intermediate examination in arts or in science, join the medical, engineering, agricultural or technical institutions of the country, and enter upon a practical training for some learned profession or for some manufacturing or commercial business. If this function of the second-grade colleges is recognised, they become very

[1] University of Calcutta—Reports on Inspection of Mufassal Colleges, Part I, page 99.

[2] *Ibid.*, pages 99 and 123.

[3] *Ibid.*, Part II, pages 71-72.

important institutions in our educational system. If they are properly organised, they would in fact occupy the position of entrance schools in regard to the medical and engineering colleges, and other institutions for professional and technical training. They would become feeders to the various agricultural and technical institutions which the Government is intending to establish throughout the country. ..... If a second-grade college is recognised as a sort of entrance school to the professional or technical institutions of the country, it is immaterial whether it is called a college or a school. If the latter name is preferred, I would suggest that it might be called a 'higher school' to distinguish it from a 'high English school.' ....If the view of a second-grade college suggested in this note is accepted, it follows that it need not be separated from the school out of which it has in almost every case been developed. On the contrary, the college and the school should be allowed to continue as a single institution, and to help one another as parts of the same organisation ....A second-grade college under these conditions would be a very desirable and useful institution."

42. Nothing came of Dr. Ray's recommendation; the second-grade colleges continued to be regarded and treated as incomplete university institutions instead of as complete schools; and their number continued to decrease. But the need for an institution of the kind Dr. Ray described was still felt. At a conference of Directors of Public Instruction held at Delhi in January 1917 it was urged[1] —

"that the recommendation of the Universities Commission that second-grade colleges should be discontinued was a mistake; and this was the general opinion of the directors. Mr. Stone said that in Madras there were a number of such institutions which did useful work, but he pointed out that they were really attached to high schools, and were not separate institutions... The directors were agreed that some kind of institution was required between the present school and the college, which would relieve the congestion in the colleges, and provide a form of instruction suited to the needs of the boys.... Second-grade colleges *qua* colleges were undesirable, but they should be encouraged as schools.....The general conclusion was that the present college course begins too soon, that the school course should be prolonged, and that the intermediate course should, as far as possible, be relegated to schools."

43. The Universities Commission was unquestionably right in desiring to draw a clear line between the school and the University. As the matriculation examination was regarded as marking the close of ordinary school work, and as the intermediate course was universally treated as part of the degree course, it was natural for them to draw the line at the matriculation stage, and therefore to condemn that form of second-grade college which consisted simply of two extra classes at the top of a school, doing what was regarded as university work. But experience shows that boys in

[1] Report of the Conference, page 18.

the intermediate stage need to be taught by the methods of the school, and not by the methods of the University. Hence, in practice, the decision of the Universities Commission has turned out to be a wrong decision; and though it was never embodied in formal legislation, its influence has been unfortunate in many ways. The best and most experienced educational opinion in India now recognises that an institution like the second-grade college of the older pattern, but better, closely linked with a school, and conducted by good school methods, is much needed in India. But this does not detract from the soundness of the doctrine laid down by the Universities Commission that a clear line ought to be drawn between school and university. It only indicates that, misled by the existing practice of all the Indian universities, they drew the line at the wrong point.

V.

44. The standpoint in regard to the relation between the schools and the intermediate courses which has received such strong expression during the last twenty years is not confined to university or administrative officers, such as we have quoted in the last section. There is no one in India who has a longer educational experience than Dr. Mackichan, three times Vice-Chancellor of Bombay University, and himself a member of the Universities Commission of 1902. In giving evidence before the Public Services Commission he said that he had felt for many years that[1]—

"the weak spot in our entire educational system was the high school .... and the reason why educational reform, directed mainly to the universities is so difficult and comparatively so ineffective is that India is not provided with the institutions that are fitted to furnish the necessary foundation of a university system ....He pressed[2] for the extension of the higher educational service into the high schools, because he thought that some of the work now being done in the colleges should be done in the high schools. The men who entered the colleges were immature....The age at which students matriculated in India was sixteen, and when it was considered that they had to obtain all their preparation in a foreign language, it was obvious that they could not be in the position of students entering a university in the West at the age of eighteen. He wished to see in India, what was now to be seen in a Scottish university, namely, students coming to a college at eighteen, after having received a complete education at a high school. For that purpose a different kind of high school was needed in India."

---

[1] Public Services Commission Report, Volume XX, para. 84, 546, page 232

[2] *Ibid.*, para. 84, 558, page 234.

45. Many of our correspondents share the view expressed by Dr. Mackichan. "Secondary schools should give a training complete in itself," say the Bengal Landholders' Association,[1] and they accordingly recommend that the intermediate should in future be the standard of admission to the University; Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri and many other correspondents advocate the same course.[1] "Take out the two years that are now spent at the University for the intermediate course," urges Maulvi Tassadduq Ahmed,[1] "and add them on to the school course." Many of our correspondents seem to contemplate nothing more than a mere transfer of the intermediate classes to the high schools, without reflecting upon the incapacity of most of the high schools to undertake such work; and they think of the intermediate stage solely as a preparation for the university, and give no special consideration to the needs of that half of the intermediate students who will not proceed to the degree, but will pass direct into various occupations.

46. But other correspondents are very conscious of the needs of these students, and desire that a prolonged school course should provide especially for their needs. Thus Mr. Haridas Goswamy[1] "would prolong the school course by two or three years during which the student would receive a more or less specialised training, according to his tastes, talents and activities at the University in the humanities or in science, in commerce or in technology." Shams-ul-Ulama Abu Nasr Waheed[1] holds that—

"it is desirable that the secondary schools, at least those under Government management, should be so developed as to absorb the two intermediate classes. At the end of the present matriculation stage, a bifurcation of courses for two years should take place, one leading to the university, and the other equipping the students with commercial, technical or other knowledge necessary for useful callings or pursuits in life."

47. Yet other correspondents, thinking primarily of the needs of the University, but conscious of the deficiencies of the schools, advocate the establishment of institutions intermediate between the school and the college, but providing specialised courses leading up to various faculties. Thus Sir Nilratan Sircar,[1] after expressing his dissatisfaction with the present matriculation standard, goes on to urge that "between the matriculation stage and collegiate studies there should be an intermediate stage, in which a

[1] Question 8.

student may prepare in the particular groups of subjects which should form the basis of the future courses which he intends to follow." He recommends that there should be a "two years' course for the intermediate classes or colleges," and that "there should be a large variety of courses in the intermediate examination in each institution;" he enumerates no less than sixteen subjects which ought to be provided for, as affording a preparation for various callings.

48. Again, Mr. N. N. Dey, Editor of *The Collegian*, urges[1] that after the high school course (which, he recommends, should be shortened) the student should pass to what he calls "the preliminary university course, *i.e.*, the transition from the wide general education of the school to the specialised education of the higher university courses."

"This course," he goes on, "may be a three years' one, to ensure a thorough training which would include much more than the present intermediate course. A sound knowledge of English literature and the vernacular .... should be compulsory, and all possible subjects, which should be taken in groups, should be included in this course, to make the student thoroughly competent to take up all the different branches of specialised study in arts, science, medicine, engineering, law, commerce, agriculture, technology."

He adds that classes should be limited to 60.

49. But there are other correspondents who, while recognising that the schools in their present condition are not capable of undertaking the kind of work required, recognise also that work of this kind is needed not only by students who are going on to university courses, or even by students who will proceed to technical institutes, but still more by that large class of students who pass at this stage direct into various occupations. Thus Mr. Atul Chandra Sen, Professor of Philosophy at the Ripon College, recommends that the course of secondary education should be divided into two stages, which he calls the secondary school stage and the high school stage. The first would end at about 15, and its course of studies would come up to the present matriculation standard, but would include English, vernacular, chemistry, mathematics, history and geography, and elementary science, including the elements of physics and chemistry, physiology and hygiene. The second, or high school, stage would cover a further period of three years and would come up to the standard of the present intermediate, but

[1] Question 8.

would allow various courses of study in preparation for different callings, as well as for the University. It is at the end of the high school stage, *i.e.*, at 18 years of age or thereabouts, that the student would take either his matriculation examination for the University or his entrance examination for admission into special technological or commercial schools. "Of the high schools as described above," he adds, "there should be at least one at the headquarter station of each district, either as a separate institution or as the higher department of a secondary school."[1]

50. Mr. J. C. Coyajee, Professor of Economics at Presidency College, urges, in an interesting memorandum[2], that the school course should be prolonged by two years; and in oral evidence he added that this higher work should only be undertaken by a limited number of specially organised institutions. In this memorandum[3] he added a number of detailed and most valuable suggestions as to the way in which these courses should be arranged.

"We want," he writes, "a greater variety of high schools, and high schools should be opened for affording instruction in commerce and industry. The matriculation examination should be widened so as to include not only literary subjects as at present, but so as to include examinations in commerce, agriculture and industries. Of course each of these special examinations should include papers on English literature as well as on history and general knowledge. This means that instead of the one portal now open to those who would enter the University there would be four or five portals through which students would enter the University in order to join the various colleges—colleges of arts, agriculture, commerce or engineering. The increased age and tuition would guarantee that the students would be ready for specialised studies as soon as they leave the schools. The matriculation examination, thus improved and strengthened, should be accepted by Government as qualifying for Government service, while the University should undertake to keep the matriculation standard fairly high so as to satisfy not only Government but also other employers of intellectual labour..... Such a matriculation examination will form a distinct educational landmark for another reason. At present our literary education is drawing away far too many boys from parental occupations..... But after the new examinations, or termini of studies, of a practical nature, have been instituted, many of the students will naturally go back to their paternal trades fairly equipped. Thus, school education would tend to strengthen, and not to deplete, the ranks of those engaged in industries and trades. The student who passes at present the matriculation examination is good for nothing in the literal sense of the phrase. He cannot be said to have had a satisfactory grounding on

[1] General Memoranda, page 375.
[2] *Ibid.*, page 416.
[3] *Ibid.*, page 417.

the literary side. He is not fit for employment in Government or commercial offices. He has lost touch with his paternal occupation and has imbibed a distaste for it."

51. On similar lines, though in some respects more detailed, is a suggestion put forward by Mr. Prasanta Chandra Mahalanobis[1] —

"The existing matriculation standard," he writes, "is admittedly too low to provide the sound general education which is the pre-requisite of all university education. In the present unorganised condition of secondary education.....this is inevitable, and a mere stiffening up of the examination would be of no avail; in fact, would be highly injurious to the cause of educational progress in Bengal. A high percentage of failure, where suitable and adequate teaching provisions do not exist, serves merely to increase waste and adds to feelings of discontent and unrest..... The problem..... is that of providing suitable openings for vocational training at the end of the secondary stage..... In Bengal it is necessary and desirable to establish two grades of school examination..... The lower examination, which might be called the school certificate examination, would correspond to the present matriculation examination and would secure admission to the intermediate teaching; the higher, corresponding to the existing intermediate examination, may be called the 'college certificate examination' and would, on passing, secure admission to the University proper."

52. Mr. C. W. Peake,[2] formerly an inspector of schools and professor at Presidency College, makes a similar proposal. He writes :—

"I suggest that the university course should ordinarily be regarded as commencing at the present intermediate stage....and that additional classes should be opened in the Zilla schools and in the large mufassal schools to accommodate students removed from the colleges; in other words that these schools should be raised to higher grade secondary schools, teaching up to a standard roughly equivalent to that of the intermediate standard... . An examination will be required at the present entrance stage which will serve both as a school leaving examination for boys who do not propose continuing their education further, and as a test for promotion to the next grade, that is to the present intermediate stage. [It would also be necessary] to establish an examination, or rather examinations, at the present intermediate stage, to cover the cases of boys leaving for employment and those wishing to enter university classes; the examination would be conducted ....in the second case by the University as a matriculation examination."

53. The Rev. W. E. S. Holland suggests an even more radical scheme of reconstruction. "No university college," he says,[3] "should in future have anything to do with I. A. work;" and he suggests that there should be, after the matriculation, three distinct types of institutions for boys between 16 and 18 :—academies,

[1] Question 8.

[2] General Memoranda, page 324.

[3] Question 5

for those intending to proceed to the University; normal schools, for intending teachers; and commercial, industrial and technical schools. The Rev. Garfield Williams, in the very comprehensive and interesting scheme of educational reorganisation which he has communicated to us,[1] suggests that there should be a new type of institution called district schools, which would include the two top classes of the present high school course, as well as the intermediate course. Mr. Rushbrook Williams urges[2] that a reform of the school system is "a necessary preliminary to university reform," and contends that "such a reform should entail the reduction of many inferior colleges to the grade of pre-university institutions," and "the provision of a sound school education, up to the age of 18 or 19, at the headquarters of every district."

54. It is instructive to observe that one of the Indian universities, and that the youngest—the University of Mysore—has already taken tentative action along the lines suggested by our correspondents. It has organised six of the best high schools in Mysore so that they may be able to take part of the work hitherto included in university courses; and has provided that "no one shall be permitted to present himself for the university entrance examination unless he has studied for a year at one of the collegiate high schools recognised by the University after he has successfully completed his high school course." Though this does not go so far as some of our correspondents recommend, it goes further than any other Indian university has yet gone.

55. We do not here propose to discuss these interesting and varied suggestions; their influence will be seen in later chapters embodying our recommendations. But they show that there is a strong under-current of dissatisfaction with the present system; and that many of the most enlightened leaders of educational progress in Bengal feel that the critical years of the intermediate stage are being largely wasted, especially for those students (half of the total) who will not proceed further. There is a widely held belief that these years ought to be utilised as they are in western lands, for an introduction to vocational training. At the same

[1] General Memoranda, page 466.
[2] Question 1.

time there is considerable difference among our correspondents as to the way in which these changes can be most advantageously effected. Many are content to urge that the intermediate classes should be undertaken by the high schools, not realising that if the schools are only able to produce such results as they deplore at the matriculation stage, they are not likely to be able to undertake the higher work with effect. Others recommend that a few selected schools, especially Government schools, should be chosen to undertake this work. Yet others, like Sir Nilratan Sircar, the Rev. W. E. S. Holland, the Rev. Garfield Williams and Mr. Atul Chandra Sen, seem to contemplate the establishment of special institutions for this purpose, which Sir Nilratan calls 'intermediate colleges,' Mr. Holland 'academies' and Mr. Williams and Mr. Sen 'high schools.' But there is a remarkable consensus of opinion that the work of the intermediate stage ought to be differentiated from university work, and treated in a special way, more nearly approximating to the methods of the school; and that the range of subjects dealt with should be enlarged, so as to afford some training for a variety of callings.

56. One of the greatest benefits promised by the kind of scheme which many of our correspondents advocate is that it would make it possible for boys at the critical age of 16-18 to pursue their studies either at home, or at the least in a district town where reasonably good accommodation could be provided for them without undue expense. Under the existing system, though students and their parents seem generally to prefer a local college at this stage, if possible, the accommodation in the mufassal colleges is in itself so insufficient, and is so largely taken up by degree students, that there is an immense drift of young boys in the intermediate stage into Calcutta, and in a less degree into Dacca. In 1917-18 of the 11,100 students in the arts colleges of Calcutta less than 2,600 come from Calcutta itself, and the adjacent districts; the other 8,500 come from all parts of the Presidency, and especially from Eastern Bengal. About two-thirds of this number are young boys in the intermediate stage, whose needs could quite well be met, and ought to be met, nearer their homes. It is they who, in the main, produce the residential problem which forms so grave a difficulty in Calcutta; and the attempt to provide decent conditions of life for them involves

an immense outlay which might be far more profitably expended in meeting their needs nearer to their homes.

57. Here is, indeed, one of the points at which the present organisation of the intermediate stage of training presents the gravest dangers and difficulties. It is impossible to exaggerate the evils that are likely to result from this drift of boys from country districts, ill-trained and knowing nothing of the world, into the dangerous conditions of life in a great city, where they are lost in the crowd, and where it is impossible to provide for them any adequate supervision. "Students are removed," says Mr. Haridas Bhattacharyya,[1] "from wholesome home atmosphere and healthy country life. To relieve academic congestion in the cities and towns, facilities should be given for study up to the intermediate course nearer home in healthy districts." If institutions which could meet this need during the transitional stage between school and university were available nearer their homes, as Mr. Bhattacharyya and others urge, many hundreds of boys would be saved from temptations which they are ill-prepared to meet. The point is very clearly illustrated in a note which we have received from an able young Indian professor, recording his own experience, not indeed in Calcutta, but in the not dissimilar conditions of Madras.

"In India," he writes, "home ties are strong, and morality is very largely traditional and customary. The dangers are obvious of sending a boy three or four hundred miles away to spend the most formative and dangerous years of his life in an environment he is utterly unaccustomed to. He stays in a hostel or mess, where discipline and supervision are, as a rule, not over-strict. There is very little public opinion to steady him; and no one is near by whom he is ashamed to grieve. The change from the tender but close restraints of home to sudden freedom is apt to be very disturbing, and often throws the boy clean off his balance. He has to face infinitely more temptations than before, whether he will or no; and has far fewer restraining influences. After matriculating at 16, I was tempted to go to Madras, but finally went, rather against my will, to a second-grade college at home. When I went to Madras two years later, I found myself in possession of undreamt of freedom. All my time, except during college hours, was my own. There was no one to see that I worked, no one to give advice, no one to keep me straight. I do not know what might have happened to me, but for a friend such as one meets only once in a life time. In spite of the fact that I was a student of a Christian college, and stayed in a well-managed Christian hostel, after a term at Madras I felt profoundly thankful that I had not left home earlier."

[1] Question 8.

CHAPTER XIII.

THE 'ARTS COLLEGES':[1] THEIR UNDERGRADUATE WORK.

I.—General dissatisfaction with the system.

1. In 1917-18, of the 26,000 students of the Calcutta University, over 22,000 are studying for the degrees of B.A. and B.Sc. in the 36 men's 'arts colleges' of the University,[2] 11 of which are in Calcutta, 20 in the Bengal mufassal, one in Cooch Behar, two in Assam, and two in Burma. The work of these colleges is, therefore, quantitatively by far the most important part of the work of the University, and plays by far the largest part in shaping the life and thought of Bengal. Moreover, the rest of the university's work—post-graduate studies, and professional training in law, medicine, engineering, and teaching—is largely influenced and coloured by the kind of preliminary training given in the arts colleges. These colleges form, in short, the main body of the University; and it is the work which they carry on which men chiefly have in mind when they speak, either in praise or in condemnation, of the university system as a whole.

2. These colleges vary widely in size, in equipment, in their methods of administration, and in the conditions under which they carry on their work. Some of them, especially in Calcutta, rival, in the number of their students, some of the most famous universities of the West;[3] others, like Hetampur, with 80 students, are small and struggling institutions. Some of them are Govern-

[1] The name 'arts colleges,' though strictly speaking a misnomer, since these colleges also provide teaching in science, has long been in common use to describe those colleges which prepare students for degrees in arts or science, but which do not afford professional training. It is here employed for convenience. This chapter does not deal with such post-graduate work as has been done by some of the colleges.

[2] Both first and second-grade colleges are here included. But throughout the chapter (*a*) women's colleges, (*b*) teachers' training colleges, and (*c*) other professional colleges are left out of account.

[3] The Ripon College had in 1917-18, 1,881 students, the Vidyasagar College 1,805, the City College 1,684, the Bangabasi College 1,431. Compare Manchester University with 1,655 students, Aberdeen with 1,024, Dublin with 1,285. Even Oxford had only 3,838 in 1914. These figures are, in each case, for the year before the war.

ment colleges, controlled by the Department of Public Instruction, and staffed by the educational services; others are missionary colleges, supported in part by missionary organisations in the United Kingdom, and staffed in part by missionary teachers; yet others are privately organised and controlled. One college is equipped and staffed on a scale of which some of the minor universities of the West would not be ashamed; this is Presidency College, which is maintained by Government. Other colleges—the minor Government colleges, the mission colleges, and some of the private colleges—are able to draw, in a smaller or greater degree, upon public funds, endowments, or private aid. Yet others—and among these the largest—depend almost wholly upon students' fees for their maintenance. We shall have occasion later to discuss the characteristic merits and defects of these various types. But in the main features of their work all have so much in common that we can safely begin by discussing the system of collegiate education as a whole.

3. Two or more of us have visited all but three of the colleges in Bengal, and also one of the two in Assam; we have studied the reports on their work presented to the University; we have seen this work going on; and we have had many discussions with the teachers, with members of the governing bodies, and with students. But in addition to all this, we have had the advantage of receiving an immense mass of written evidence, in answer to our questionnaire; evidence to which the principal college and university teachers and many of the public men of Bengal, as well as many leading men of other provinces, have contributed; seldom can a commission of enquiry into an educational problem have had a more impressive body of evidence laid before it. Upon this body of evidence we shall largely rely in our analysis of the system; using our own observations (which have themselves been wider than most students of the system can have had the chance of enjoying) as a means of verifying and checking what our correspondents have written.

4. A survey of the extremely full and varied answers to our first two questions will bring out one outstanding fact; that dissatisfaction with the existing system is all but universal, and is in most cases both deep and poignant. Our correspondents vary widely in their diagnosis of the causes of the defects which

they perceive, and in the remedies which they propose. But they are almost all agreed in the conviction that there is something radically wrong, and that the system requires to be drastically amended. Mr. Satyendra Nath Basu,[1] Principal of the Comilla College, stands practically alone when he says that "the existing system of university education, if conscientiously followed, should afford ample opportunity for the best training of the intellect." "If any student obtains a decent training," says Mr. Bipin Behari Gupta[1] of the Ripon College, "it is in spite of the system." "Students attend the University to obtain their degree," says Mr. Mohini Mohan Bhattacharjee,[1] Lecturer in English at the University, "but for inspiration, for enlightenment, for sweetness and light, they look elsewhere." "The present system," says a member of the staff at Gauhati,[2] "is like a soul-destroying machine.....If the young Indian of ability passes through it, he will lose all his soul and half of his reasoning capacity in the process." "Our university system," says the Rev. W. E. S. Holland,[1] late Principal of St. Paul's Cathedral Mission College, "instead of encouraging the love of learning, kills it. And this is the more tragic, because there can be few peoples who have more instinctive bent of gift for intellectual pursuits than the population of Bengal." "The universities of India," says Mr. Hariprosanna Banerjea,[1] Lecturer in Pure Mathematics in the University, "are but factories where a few are manufactured into graduates, and a good many more wrecked in the voyage of their intellectual life. They have created a complete divorce of education from our everyday life and feelings." "This system," says Mr. Jatindra Chandra Guha[1] of the Rajshahi College, "cannot develope the thinking powers of the student. The chaff which is sown into his brain, though it passes in our University for seed-corn, can grow no wheat." "The education that is imparted in the colleges," says Mr. Haridas Goswamy[1] of Asansol, "gives a very narrow outlook to their alumni..... and fails to stimulate any healthy intellectual curiosity in the majority, or to develope the powers of initiative when thrown on their own resources, of accurate observation and independent thinking, and of applying the knowledge gained."

---

[1] Question 1.

[2] Quoted by Mr. F. W. Südmersen in Question 1

5. It is possible that the writers of these passages—all of whom are teachers—may, in their bitterness, have exaggerated; and it is certain that many able men emerge from the system. But when we find some of the ablest university teachers in Bengal expressing themselves in such terms (and the citations might be almost indefinitely multiplied) it is plain that something must be seriously wrong. We have been impressed by the frequency with which our correspondents contrast the present system, greatly to its disadvantage, with the ancient system of the *tôls*. This is the key-note of the deeply felt and charmingly written memorandum which we have received from Mr. Ramendra Sunder Trivedi,[1] Principal of the Ripon College. We cannot do justice to this admirable essay by any brief analysis; the reader should study it for himself. Mr. Trivedi recognises the value and necessity of the western system of education; he says that he is "indebted for what is the most valuable possession of my life to the benefits of western education received under the auspices of my own University"; the old learning in itself has 'no particular charms' for him. But he 'contemplates with sadness' many of the contrasts between the old and the new, and especially the disappearance of the old disinterested love of learning for its own sake, and the beautiful relationship which subsisted between the *guru* and his *chela*. The same note of regret is expressed by other writers, notably by Rai Lalitmohan Chatterjee, Bahadur,[2] Principal of the Jagannath College, Dacca. "The range of teaching in these *tôls* was no doubt very narrow," he writes; "but able teachers, proper guidance of students, freedom of teaching and of study, and leisure existed....The teacher was not only looked up to for his learning, but regarded with religious veneration. He was very independent and proud, but looked upon his pupils as his children. There were no rigid examinations...."

6. The essence of this old system was the intimate relationship of teacher and pupil, which is the essence of all fine systems of education; and it is, in truth, the disappearance of this kind of relationship, and the substitution for it of one which is "most superficial and artificial,"[3] that is felt by many of our corres-

[1] General Memoranda, pages 303-309.

[2] Question 2.

[3] Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea, Professor of Chemistry at the Ripon College, in answer to Question 2.

pondents to be the deepest source of the deficiencies which they deplore. "There is no free intercourse, no community of life, between the teacher and the taught, which is the essential ideal of a college," says Mr. Jogendranath Bhattacharya.[1] Some of our correspondents seem to imagine that this defect is inherent in the western system of education, and that the benefit of the old *guru-chela* relationship can never be recaptured. This is a natural mistake, but it *is* a mistake. In the West, as in ancient India, the great scholar still inspires an almost religious veneration in his disciples; and the best western teachers, like the old *gurus*, "look upon their pupils as their children." It is not the nature of western education in itself, but the mode in which it has been organised in Bengal, which has produced the unhealthy state of things deplored by our correspondents. Bengal is right in desiring to regain what was best in its old system, with such changes as modern conditions render necessary. But it can only do so if it is prepared frankly to face and recognise the defects of the existing system, and to take the necessary means of removing them. The first step must be a frank analysis of the situation.

II.—The weakness of the isolated colleges.

7. One of the primary causes of the inefficiency of the colleges is that each of them is isolated, providing as a rule the whole of the training received by its students. "At present the colleges are isolated," says Mr. Mohini Mohan Bhattacharjee,[1] "and afford an illustration of the weakness of disunion. No college has funds sufficient for the appointment of teachers of reputation, or for building up good libraries."[2] "The harmful segregation of the individual institution affiliated to the University," says Mr. J. C. Nag,[3] "has led to wasteful duplication of work, and unnecessary expenditure of money," and this in a country where the strictest economy is necessary. "These multitudinous college staffs," says Mr. Rushbrook Williams[3] of Allahabad, "all working upon the same lines, are wasteful in effort and inadequate in performance. Specialisation becomes impossible, because the college professor, overburdened by the number of his pupils, and

[1] Question 2.

[2] The condemnation is too sweeping. Several colleges, notably Presidency College, have a not inadequate salary scale, and there are some respectable libraries.

[3] Question 1.

by the necessity of covering the whole range of his subject, has neither the inducement nor the opportunity to undertake higher study." The unwisdom of this segregation is especially notable in Calcutta, where there are many colleges which might co-operate, as do the colleges in Oxford and Cambridge. But "there is no co-operation in lecturing between the different colleges," as Mr. K. Zachariah observes ;[1] and "the result is that the college teacher is heavily overworked ; .... he is left with neither time nor energy for special studies of his own. .... He is like a gramophone that replays the old records."

8. In truth, inter-collegiate co-operation is rendered extremely difficult by the multiplicity of lectures, the vast numbers of students and the consequent difficulty of arranging time-tables. The regulations of the University[2] do indeed allow a student from one college to attend lectures in another college, but only in a subject in which his own college is not affiliated ;[3] co-operation beyond this—and especially co-operation in the main subjects of study—is not provided for. Elsewhere in India, as we have had the opportunity of observing, some attempts at an inter-collegiate organisation of studies have been made. At Madras, the Presidency College and the Christian College combine in the teaching of some honours subjects ; the two colleges at Agra have applied the system with satisfactory results ; and it has been introduced at Lahore. But before any such co-operation could become really effective in Calcutta there must be substantial changes in the whole organisation of the University.

9. In any case, such a system could only affect Calcutta. The numerous colleges which stand alone in the mufassal towns must remain, what all the colleges now are, 'pocket universities,' as one of our correspondents has described them ; incomplete, indeed, because excluded, in practice, from the higher work of a university, and denied the freedom to define their own courses of study, but wholly self-sufficient so far as concerns the training given to their students. This is a vitally important feature of the situation. All these colleges are undertaking to do the whole

[1] Question 1.

[2] Chapter XXVI, Section 8.

[3] The chief use made of this provision is that a number of students take classes in botany at the Indian Association for the Cultivation of Science. They come as a rule from colleges where no teaching is provided in the subject.

work of training their students for university degrees. If they are to do this work adequately, on the scale necessary for modern university teaching, they must have the staff and equipment of universities. Modern university education is a costly thing. The old *gurus* could give their training cheaply, because they needed no equipment, and they almost carried their libraries in their heads. That is no longer possible, however much we may lament it. The modern student must have many teachers, each expert in his subject; he must have access to expensive laboratories, and to large and costly libraries, if he is to do serious work. And it is absurd to suppose that the numerous colleges of Bengal, many of which are wholly dependent upon the low fees paid by the students, can possibly all be equipped on an adequate scale. "The proportion of public money spent on college education is not small," says Mr. J. R. Barrow.[1] "But it is not sufficient to build, equip, and staff so many colleges as now exist if they are to be built, equipped, and staffed to do real college work."

10. Mr. H. Sharp,[2] Educational Commissioner with the Government of India, in his very full and instructive evidence, has given us some useful figures on this point. "In the class of colleges (namely, the unaided) which educates a larger number of students than any other class of colleges .... the average cost of a student *per annum* is" Rs. 48-3-5. The average annual cost of a student at the University of Birmingham is £48 (*i.e.*, Rs. 720), at the University of Liverpool £92 (*i.e.*, Rs. 1,380)." The comparison is, no doubt, to some extent misleading, because these modern British universities maintain very costly scientific and technological departments on a scale which no one would dream of suggesting for all the arts colleges of Bengal. Nevertheless, the disparity is great; the student, even of arts or pure science, annually pays at Birmingham or Liverpool about £20 (Rs. 300) in fees, and this is very far from covering the cost of his education which is largely met not only by Government grants, but by the proceeds of large private benefactions. In Bengal the student of the unaided colleges is expected to pay the whole cost of his education. "It is said," Mr. Sharp goes on, "that the Indian

[1] Question 1. The total annual expenditure of public funds on college education in Bengal by the Government of India and the Government of Bengal amounted to nearly Rs. 12 lakhs in 1916.

[2] Question 2.

student is too poor to pay for a good staff. If this represents a permanent and irremediable defect, then it would be best to face the fact that much of what we now call university education," (*i.e.*, that given in unaided colleges dependent on students' fees), " but which cannot properly be called by that name at all, must for the future be known as something else. For we cannot afford 'to degrade our highest educational ideal'." It is quite certain that the Indian student cannot afford to meet the whole cost of the necessary improvements, and doubtful if he can meet any increased share of it. Indeed, the students of no country pay the whole cost of their university training.

11. Mr. F. C. Turner,[1] Principal of the Dacca College, has given us an estimate of the minimum cost of running an 'arts college' efficiently for 600 students—not on the English model, but on the general basis of existing conditions. Assuming that the main subjects of study are provided for, and that a reasonable proportion of teachers to students is maintained in each subject, and making an extremely moderate estimate for equipment, maintenance, and administrative expenses, he brings out the minimum cost at Rs. 19,000 *per mensem*. If this were to be met by fees alone they would have to be charged at the rate of more than Rs. 30 *per mensem*. " The maximum fee that the average student can pay," Mr. Turner estimates, " is probably about Rs. 10 *per mensem*;" this is, in fact, a far higher fee than the great majority of students actually pay, or, we believe, can afford to pay.[2] But even at this rate, for the very moderate equipment which Mr. Turner describes, " two-thirds of the cost of his education must be found in some other way."

12. It may safely be said that very few non-Government colleges in Bengal reach the minimum described by Mr. Turner; most of them fall far below it, and both teachers and students suffer accordingly. The most important result of the financial weakness of the colleges is its effect upon the salaries and positions of the teachers. With this question, which is fundamental, we shall deal later. But it must also be noted that financial stringency in many cases forbids the colleges to provide adequate accommodation for their work. Some colleges consist of nothing

[1] Question 2.

[2] On students' poverty see the chapter on 'Conditions of student life', Chapter XIX.

but seven or eight lecture rooms ; few have adequate common-room accommodation for students ; we have found only one private college provided with private rooms for the teachers ; and almost everywhere the libraries are hopelessly inadequate.

13. It is plain that the financial weakness which is due to the dependence of most of the colleges upon fees is at the root of the unhappy conditions which our correspondents deplore ; and that, unless drastic changes are somehow made practicable, and large additional funds become available, we must reconcile ourselves to a continuance of the existing evils, and abandon the aspiration after a happier state of things, in which *guru* and *chela* alike might be able to revive the old atmosphere of comradeship in the pursuit of learning.

14. One mode of meeting the difficulty, at any rate in part, is suggested by Mr. Surendranath Das Gupta[1] of Chittagong. "It is economically most unpractical to establish big libraries," he writes —and what is true of libraries is equally true of other elements in university equipment—"except in a few places where higher studies may be centralised.....If libraries were started in a few central places, students for higher training might be grouped together in these places, picked professors, in the habit of making researches, might be chosen from different mufassal centres to be collected there, and ideal conditions might be generated, which would be highly beneficial to students and professors alike." The idea implied in Mr. Das Gupta's suggestion is that serious university teaching can be most economically conducted, and is, indeed, only possible in any real sense, if it is concentrated in a limited number of centres. This is an idea unfamiliar, and at present unpopular, in Bengal ; but it is now accepted in almost every other country.

15. But, despite such economies as might be effected by concentration, it will still be necessary to supplement very largely from other sources the proceeds of students' fees, if the system of collegiate instruction is to be brought into a satisfactory condition. These other sources can only be three. There may be increased expenditure by Government, that is to say, increased subsidies by the taxpayers. Expectations from this source cannot be very high, because, as we have already seen, increased Government

[1] Question 2.

aid is needed for the system of secondary and intermediate education, not to speak of primary education. There is a limit to what the taxpayer can be expected to supply for educational purposes. In the second place, there is the possibility of assistance from ancient endowments, originally established for educational purposes, such as, in other countries, and notably in England, yield a large proportion of the cost of higher education. We have been told in evidence, by Mr. Surendranath Banerjea,[1] that such funds exist on a large scale in Bengal. Whether they can be made available for the great need of to-day it is not for us to say. Finally, there is the possibility of endowment by benefactions from wealthy citizens—a source from which have come all the most fruitful new developments in higher education both in England and in America.

16. In ancient India it was from this last source that the great educational system of the country was, in practice, wholly supported. In the early stages of the growth of western education in India private benefaction also played a great part; the Presidency College owes its foundation to it, and there have been other instances, notably in the Berhampur, Rajshahi, Krishnagar, Midnapore, Burdwan and Chittagong colleges, and, recently, in the establishment of the Rangpur College. When the Commission of 1882 recommended that higher education should be left largely to private enterprise it was in the hope and belief that this traditional readiness to support educational movements would revive and grow in strength. The expectation was, on the whole, disappointed, though there have been striking exceptions, such as that presented by the Kasimbazar Raj. But it was disappointed, as we believe, largely because the dangerous and unhappy notion had been disseminated that higher education could be run so as to pay its way, and on this basis most of the colleges founded since 1882 have been established. We feel sure that when the wealthy men of Bengal realise the fallacy and danger of this belief they will remember the ancient tradition of their race. Nay, why should we think only of wealthy men? In Wales the slate quarrier and the worker on the farm have contributed to endow the national university. Why should not the *bhadralok* of Bengal subscribe, even out of their often narrow means, to the strengthening of the system of education which has already done so much for

[1] General Memoranda, page 492.

them, and can, if it is improved and developed, do so much more for their sons ? We are encouraged to entertain this hope by the great benefactions which have been forthcoming for the development of higher studies in Calcutta from such public-spirited citizens as Sir Rash Behary Ghose, Sir Tarak Nath Palit and the Maharajah of Darbhanga. When it is realised that not only higher and post-graduate studies, but the not less vitally important function of undergraduate training, stands urgently in need of aid, we see grounds for hope that it will be forthcoming, and that Bengal will see to the proper endowment of colleges in which it will be made possible for something like the old *guru-chela* tradition to be revived.

III.—The position of the teachers.

17. The weakness of many of the isolated and self-contained colleges is in nothing more clearly displayed than in the appointment of teachers, and in the conditions imposed upon them. It is obvious that the quality of the work done by any university for its students is more dependent upon the character and abilities of its teachers than upon all other factors combined. There are in all 644 teachers engaged in the work of the men's ' arts colleges ' of Bengal.[1] The conditions under which these teachers have to work, their salaries, and their tenure vary widely according to the type of college by which they are employed ; and it will be convenient to deal separately with the three main types, Government colleges, missionary colleges, and private colleges, whether aided or unaided. There are 179 teachers in the seven Government colleges, teaching 3,830 students, or one teacher to every 21·4 students. There are 98 teachers in the five missionary colleges, teaching 2,701 students, or one teacher to every 27 students. There are 367 teachers in the twenty private colleges, teaching 14,344 students, or one teacher to every 39·08 students.

18. The outstanding feature of the conditions of work in Government colleges is that the teacher, being in Government service, has security of tenure, so long as he does not grossly misconduct himself, a fair rate of pay, and a pension when he reaches the age of retirement. The average of the salaries actually

[1] The statistics in this section leave Assam and Burma out of account, but include Cooch Behar. They also disregard the teachers in women's colleges, these being separately dealt with, and the training colleges in Calcutta and Dacca.

paid to all the teachers in Government arts colleges in 1917-18,[1] excluding the principals, is Rs. 256 *per mensem*,[2] which is just over twice the average salary of the teachers in private colleges. In the two leading colleges, the Presidency College and the Dacca College, the average is considerably higher; Rs. 324 in the Presidency College, Rs. 296 in the Dacca College. These averages amount in the one case to rather more, in the other to slightly less, than £250 *per annum* in English money;[3] and as averages for a whole staff of teachers, from the most senior to the most junior, they compare not unfavourably with the average salaries in a modern English, French, or German university.[4] It is believed by some critics of the Government colleges that the high average of the salaries paid by them is largely due to the high salaries paid to English professors. When we began our enquiry there were only twelve English teachers employed in the seven Government arts colleges for men in Bengal,[5] and their salaries were, generally speaking, very little, if at all, higher than those of their leading Indian colleagues. Three of the Government colleges[6] were, at the time of our enquiry, wholly staffed by Indian teachers.

19. The teachers employed in Government colleges (of whom fourteen out of every fifteen are Indians) thus enjoy much more favourable conditions of work than the teachers in other colleges. Not only do their salaries range much higher; not only do they enjoy a security of tenure which is almost unknown in other colleges; not only can they look forward to a certain pension at the end of their service. They also work in buildings which are generally far more adequate than those of other colleges; they

[1] These figures, and the corresponding figures in later paragraphs, are based upon returns made to us by the colleges.

[2] If the teachers in the Oriental Department of the Sanskrit College be excluded the average is raised to Rs. 265.

[3] Reckoning fifteen rupees to the pound sterling.

[4] It may be noted that in the West young teachers consent to accept very small salaries at the beginning of their careers in order to learn their business and to obtain opportunities of research; if they do not within a few years obtain promotion they commonly pass into other professions. There is very little parallel to this under Indian conditions.

[5] The number was, of course, unusually small owing to the war. But this does not affect the point: the averages computed above included only 12 English teachers.

[6] The Sanskrit, Rajshahi, and Chittagong colleges—two others, Hooghly and Krishnagar, had only one English teacher apiece.

are not called upon to deal with an unreasonably large number of students; they have better laboratories, if they are working at science subjects, and incomparably better libraries, than all but one or two of the non-Government colleges: the library of the Presidency College is one of the three or four best in India.

20. Nevertheless, the Government educational services have been the objects of much criticism; many of our correspondents have written about them with acrimony; and wherever we have gone in Bengal, even in places far from any Government college, we have heard the same complaints. The reason for this dissatisfaction is resentment at the way in which the services are classified, and, in particular, at what is regarded as the invidious distinction drawn between the two higher services, known respectively as the Indian and the Provincial. The members of these two services are called upon to do work of the same type, and, in theory, they are equal; but the Indian Educational Service is paid at a substantially higher rate, and, because of this difference of pay, the Indian Educational Service man is regarded, and is apt to regard himself, as ranking above his colleague in the Provincial Educational Service; though the latter may be, and not infrequently is, a man of longer service, and possibly of greater distinction in scholarship.

21. The original theory of the distinction between the two services was that the more highly paid service was to be recruited in England; and the higher pay was not to represent higher status, but was to form a compensation for exile, for the expense of sending children home to be educated, and for other burdens that increase the cost of living to the Englishman in India. But this logical and defensible theory was in fact made untenable when some Indians educated in England began to be admitted to the Indian Educational Service, while other Indians, not less highly qualified, and often themselves educated in England, had to be content with places in the Provincial Service. In these cases, the distinction had obviously come to be a distinction between a higher and a lower service. And, in fact, it has been so regarded: Government itself admits this when it pays an extra allowance of Rs. 100 *per mensem* to a man in the Provincial Educational Service for 'acting' for a man in the Indian Educational Service. In practice, therefore, whatever the original theory may

have been, the one service is treated as superior to the other; and, not unnaturally, the impression has been created that the distinction is a device for ensuring higher salaries and status to the Englishmen, and for keeping Indian scholars in an inferior position. It is true that the number of men affected is small: there were, as we have already noted, only twelve English teachers in the colleges of Bengal in 1917. But it is not the number that matters. No more unhappy impression could be created than the impression that a distinction is drawn between scholars in the service of a university, even partially, along racial lines. The Public Services Commission has made proposals dealing with this subject. It is not our business here to discuss them: we are concerned only to note the effect of the existing distinction upon the teaching organisation of the Government colleges.

22. The part played by Englishmen in the conduct of the higher education of Bengal has been slowly diminishing for many years past. It is natural that this should happen. But we are inclined to think that the process has taken place with undue rapidity; and if new methods and new subjects of study are to be introduced, some means will have to be devised for increasing the number of teachers trained in western methods. So long as English literature, English history, English political ideas form the main subjects of study, as they do throughout the colleges of Bengal, it is obvious that English teachers must have an important part to play. At a time when Bengal is only beginning to take modern science to her heart, it is plainly to her advantage that she should be able to use the services of men trained in the laboratories of the West. At a time when she is feeling the deficiencies of her educational organisation, and has not yet learnt how to achieve, in her new system, that personal relationship between teacher and taught which was the strength of her old system, it is clear that she can be helped by men who have direct knowledge of the working of the varied systems of the West, and who come from universities in which the personal relation of teacher and pupil is real and strong. It is not only great scholars of established reputation whom Bengal needs to borrow from the West; such men will seldom be persuaded to come to India for more than a short period, and will find it difficult to adapt themselves to the conditions of Indian life if they come. Still more she needs young men, who

will spend the best part of their lives, and make their careers, in her service. There are not too many Englishmen engaged in university work in Bengal, there are too few; only twelve in the seven Government arts colleges; only thirty-two in the five missionary colleges; only one in the twenty-five private colleges.

23. It is obvious that if young English scholars of good standing are to be brought out to India they must be paid more than Indians of equal qualifications would require, and more than they themselves would be content to receive at home, in order to compensate them for exile, to enable them to keep in touch with scholars in their own subjects at home (that being one of the purposes for which they are brought out), and to defray the cost of sending their children home, and of the double establishments which it is often necessary for them to maintain. The salaries now paid are not unduly high; on the contrary, they are (in Calcutta especially, where living is very expensive for Englishmen) too low; it is exceedingly difficult for an Englishman in the Educational Service to marry at a reasonably early stage in his career. In the past the service system, with all its faults, has brought out to India many men of first-rate ability and genuine zeal for their work; if they have seldom acquired very high reputations in the world of learning, that is, in some cases at least, because the conditions under which they, like other teachers in India, have to work are hostile to individual creative production outside the class-room.

24. The service system is still bringing out good men; but undoubtedly it is proving every year less attractive. For the circumstances are such as to take the heart out of the most eager and zealous. We have heard complaints from men who feel that they have been brought out under a misunderstanding. Attracted by the prospect of teaching in a great university, they may find themselves banished to some remote mufassal centre, where they can have no share in the life of the University, where their work is mainly school work, where there are no opportunities for independent study, and little or nothing of that stimulating intellectual society which is the life-blood of a university. They find themselves, in effect, cut off from contact with the learned world in Europe, remote from the great centres

of the studies which they hoped to promote, and with no definite place or standing in the University. They are brought into very delicate relations with the majority of their Indian colleagues, who are alienated by the interpretation commonly put upon the distinction between the two services. Of recent years they even find that they are regarded by their students with a sort of suspicion, not as their intellectual leaders, but as Government agents set to watch over them; and they are deprived of the chance of kindling the interest of their students, and so winning their allegiance, because every inch of the ground they are to cover is marked out for them, and the students, bent simply on the examinations, are apt to resent any departure from examination coaching. With the best will in the world, and even after beginning with a real enthusiasm, they can scarcely avoid losing heart, and sinking to be the mere routine drudges that the conditions tend to make them.

25. Thus the service system of recruitment for college work, so far as it affects English teachers, has been disappointing in its results; not through the fault of the men, not altogether because of the defects of the system itself, but largely owing to the conditions under which it has to be worked, and the atmosphere of sometimes unreasonable criticism which has surrounded it. But, though we recognise that much of this criticism is unfair, it has a real basis of fact. The distinction drawn between the two services is invidious, and sometimes tempts even very junior members of the Indian Educational Service to regard themselves as the superiors of the most senior and distinguished members of the Provincial Educational Service. This makes friendly co-operation between colleagues in the two services often very difficult; and, in a college of all places, friendly co-operation is indispensable. The criticisms of the system which we have heard are not, as a rule, based on any failure to recognise the need for extra remuneration to men who have to exile themselves from their own country when the services of such men are necessary. We have heard many arguments in favour of the view urged by Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee,[1] among others, that the pay given to a teacher should, in all cases, be fixed in relation to the character and importance of the work he has to do, but that special additional pay, fixed

[1] *The Education Problem in India*, page 17.

at such a rate as experience may show to be necessary, should be given to Englishmen or others not domiciled in India "not as part of substantive pay, but as compensation for service in a distant country." We do not here discuss this suggestion, on which we shall have something to say later.

26. A further drawback of the service system, under existing conditions, is that under its rules teachers are liable to be transferred from one college to another, or from teaching to administrative work or inspection, according to the needs of the service. While we cordially recognise that the power of transfer is used in the most considerate way possible, we feel strongly that it often operates to the disadvantage of the institutions concerned. Teachers of a college appointed on this basis cannot but feel that the body corporate to which their loyalty and obedience are due, and with which their interests are entwined, is not the college, but the service; there is some danger that their ambition may come to be, not that of creating a school of learning with which their names will be identified, but that of service promotion. In the hope of remedying this defect of the system the Public Services Commission recommended that the collegiate branch of the educational service should be separated from the administrative branch. While we recognise that the proposed change would constitute a real reform, and may be the best mode of dealing with the difficulty at the moment, we believe that ultimately it will be necessary to make far more fundamental changes in the system.

27. There remains yet another defect of the existing service system in Bengal as a mode of filling teaching posts in the Government colleges with which their terms of reference did not permit the Public Services Commission to deal. The lower posts in the Government colleges are filled by men who are appointed to yet a third service, known as the Subordinate Educational Service, and paid at a considerably lower rate than either the Indian or the Provincial Educational Service. Promotion from the Subordinate to the Provincial service is possible; but even in the case of exceptional men it is often too long delayed, and it is necessarily influenced by considerations affecting the cadre and the claims of other men, with which the merits of the individual have nothing to do. Yet the man in the Subordinate Educational Service

may be as able, and as well qualified, as the man in the Provincial Educational Service. It may have been only the bad luck of there being no vacancy in the cadre of the higher service at the time of his application for an appointment which fixed him in the lower grade. We have come across cases in which an enthusiastic and competent young lecturer has been forced to forsake university work merely because it was only in some other line that he could obtain service promotion. This seems to us an indefensible system in regard to university teaching, however appropriate it may be to the other functions of the educational service. It runs counter to the whole spirit of university work that the subordinate members of the teaching staff should be regarded as inherently and permanently inferior to the more important teachers. Naturally, junior teachers in a university should receive smaller pay and fewer privileges than their seniors, because it may be presumed that they are only learning their business; but in intellectual quality they should be, as far as possible, their equals, and should be treated as equals. In a healthy university system a man nearly always enters the academic career at the bottom, earning promotion, either in his own or in another university, by the work that he does.

28. While, therefore, in some most important respects the conditions of work in the Government colleges are immeasurably better than those in most other colleges, there are also some aspects of the system of recruitment, which tend to minimise these advantages by introducing friction among the members of the college staffs, and rendering difficult that free and friendly co-operation and that common loyalty to the college, which are of the essence of the collegiate organisation of teaching.

29. The second distinctive group of colleges consists of those which are maintained by missionary bodies. In these cases the leading members of the staff are European missionaries, who receive either very modest salaries, or no salaries at all, and are maintained by the parent societies in Europe. The influence which has been exercised by the missionary colleges upon the development of education in Bengal has been of the highest value and importance. No colleges wield a deeper influence over the minds of their students. None have a stronger corporate spirit. The strength of the mission colleges

is very largely due to the fact that they can command the services of a group of men of ability and devotion who have given themselves up for a long term of years specifically to the service of their college, and who, unlike the teachers in the Government colleges, are, for the most part, not liable to be transferred to other spheres of work. The missionary teacher may not always be a man of the highest academic qualifications—though in point of fact some of the ablest teachers in Bengal, and some of those whose influence is, and has been, greatest in university affairs, belong to this class—but for all those aspects of university life which lie outside of, but are by no means less important than, the formal studies of the curricula, the missionary teachers have, as a body, exceptional qualifications. It is they who have laboured, with the greatest earnestness and the most marked success, to cultivate the humaner side of student life, to provide the student with healthy conditions of living, with moral guidance, and with the opportunities for physical training. The influence of the missionary teachers over the minds of their students is, doubtless, further deepened by the fact that they have obviously undertaken their work from no motives of self-interest. Even though they represent a foreign faith, and must be for that reason in some degree suspect, they approach more nearly to the spirit of the old Hindu *guru* than many college teachers in modern Bengal. The value of the contribution made by the missionary teachers to the life of the University can scarcely be overestimated.

30. But the teachers in missionary colleges are not all missionaries; in every case a majority of the staff (in all, 67 out of 98) consists of Indian teachers, most of whom are non-Christians. The rate of pay for these Indian teachers is substantially lower than the rate of pay in the Government colleges. But, in spite of the fact that the principal teachers are missionaries, the average salary paid to Indian members of the staff in the Scottish Churches College (Rs. 144 *per mensem*) and in St. Paul's College (Rs. 143 *per mensem*) is higher than the average of the salaries paid to all members of the staff in five out of the six private colleges in Calcutta. In St. Xavier's College, and in the two missionary colleges in the mufassal, the rate of pay of the Indian members of the staff is below the average rate of pay in the private colleges; but it should be remembered that in the

mission colleges the salaries of the chief teachers are not computed in the average; and if the salaries of the chief teachers were omitted in computing the average salary in other colleges, this average would obviously be much lower. Again, the tenure of Indian teachers is insecure in the missionary colleges, as in the private colleges, the general rule being a month's notice on either side. In response to our enquiries on this head the Scottish Churches College reported that "a proposal to change this, giving longer notice, was opposed by the senior members of the Indian staff. Within the last three years the staff has lost one member by death after forty-three years' service, one by retirement after thirty-four years, and one who became inspector of colleges after twenty-four years." We have, in fact, heard no complaint of unfair dismissals of the Indian teachers in the missionary colleges. It may be added that the Scottish Churches College (which is much the largest and, with one exception, much the oldest of the missionary colleges) has a provident fund for the Indian members of the staff, to which the teachers subscribe 5 per cent. of their income, the college adding an equal amount from its general funds.

31. It is in the private colleges, which mainly or wholly depend upon students' fees, that the conditions of salary, tenure and service are, in general, most unsatisfactory. In the first place, the disproportion between the number of teachers and the number of students is here at its worst. "Colleges cannot afford to employ an adequate number of professors through lack of funds," says Mr. Suniti Kumar Chatterjee,[1] Lecturer in English in the University. "This has brought about the present desperate proportion in the numbers of the teachers and the taught—one professor, in some cases, having to deal with nearly a thousand students in the course of a week." The proportion of teachers to students in the private colleges is, in fact, 1 to 39·08, as compared with 1 to 21·4 in the Government colleges.

32. Even more serious is the inadequate salary scale of the teachers. In the six private colleges of Calcutta (which between them undertake the training of nearly 8,000 students) the average salary of the teachers (excluding the principals) is just under Rs. 140 *per mensem*. This average is raised by the fact

[1] Question 1.

that one college, the Vidyasagar (late Metropolitan Institution) pays on the average Rs. 202; no other private college in Calcutta reaches an average of Rs. 145. Individual salaries range between Rs. 50 and Rs. 500 *per mensem*.[1] In the mufassal the condition of things is yet worse. The average salary paid to all the teachers in the mufassal colleges (excluding the principals) is Rs. 131 *per mensem*. The average in the second-grade colleges is Rs. 99; and one college—Uttarpara—actually shows an average salary of Rs. 54 *per mensem*. The highest salary shown on our returns as being paid to any individual teacher (apart from the principals) in a private mufassal college is Rs. 300, which is actually less than the average salary of all teachers in the Presidency and Dacca Colleges. The one teacher who is paid at this rate is a teacher in the Rangpur College, the youngest of all the mufassal colleges, and the only one which has a good salary scale. At Rangpur no teacher is paid less than Rs. 100 *per mensem*; elsewhere, salaries of Rs. 50 or Rs. 60 or Rs. 75 are exceedingly common. And we are assured that in some private colleges these wretched salaries are often not paid regularly or in full.

33. It is not surprising that many of our correspondents should write with a good deal of bitterness about these conditions. "Private institutions have been allowed to choose their own scale of salaries for teachers," says Dr. Narendranath Sen Gupta,[2] "and they have done so on a principle more becoming a factory than of a college..... They have gone after those who have been willing to serve on a low pay.[3] The result is, that many of the really able scholars have turned away from education." He suggests that the University should fix a scale of salaries. "It does not pay," says Mr. Sharp,[4] "to employ an expensive staff, or invest in costly equipment, when a rival institution can

[1] There are instances of lower salaries—as low as Rs. 25 or Rs. 30. But we assume that, even where this is not stated, such payments are probably for part-time work. It may here be noted that all the figures quoted in regard to salaries are drawn from the returns furnished to us by the colleges themselves, which will be found in Volume XIII.

[2] Question 1.

[3] The following advertisement appeared in the *Bengalee*, January 2, 1919:—"Wanted a professor of chemistry for the — College. Applications, naming the lowest salary that will be accepted, to be sent to the Principal."

[4] General Memoranda, page 443.

manage with much less, and possesses equal privileges of presenting its students at examinations." Consequently, young and quite inexperienced men are commonly appointed; and "much of the deterioration noticeable among the students," as Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea[1] of the Ripon College observes, "might be traced to the pernicious system now in vogue of appointing immature youths to the professors' chairs in our colleges." Except in the Government colleges the teachers seem to be almost always engaged on a monthly tenure; and we have heard of cases in which teachers have been dismissed shortly before the end of the session in order that the management of the college may save the cost of their salaries during the long vacation. "The low remuneration, the uncertainty of the tenure of service, the complete distinction as regard future provision and the present status of professors in many of the colleges, seriously hamper university education," says Mr. Akshaykumar Sarkar.[2] "In private colleges the staff is composed of a motley group of good, bad, and indifferent men, of whom every one is eager to better his lot by shifting himself somewhere else—to Government service or other professions—as soon as opportunity occurs."

34. The most lurid picture of the conditions of service in some of the private colleges is drawn by Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea,[1] Professor of Chemistry at the Ripon College:—

"The salaries obtained by teachers and professors of institutions under private management," he writes, "compare most unfavourably with those offered by the Education Department..... Apart from the question of difference of income, the man, under private management, lives in utter misery, without prospects, without hopes of ameliorating his conditions, unless by a lucky chance elsewhere, or only through obsequiousness; and he has neither a pension nor a provident fund to fall back upon in his infirmity. Nor is this all. No matter how capable he may have proved himself .... his position .... will always be uncertain; any fine morning he may wake up to be served with a notice of discharge; and yet the aggrieved party may not hope to get any redress at the hands of the university authorities. There should exist a substantial control by the University over these so-called 'private' institutions in the matter of dismissal of members of the staff, and official auditors should have authority to examine the actual accounts of such institutions periodically. Often when the time for promotions comes the surplus revenues of such institutions are spirited away by some

[1] Question 2.
[2] Question 1.

wonderful manipulation; and the feelings of the poor and dumb workers, through whose hard labours the surplus came to pass, may easily be imagined."

35. It ought to be added that in nine private colleges, out of twenty-five, there is a provident fund, to which in every case the teacher is required to subscribe one anna in the rupee on his salary, the college adding from its general funds half the amount in the case of six colleges, an equal amount in the case of the Jagannath College, Dacca, and one-fourth of the amount in the case of the Pabna College. Only one of the private colleges in Calcutta—the City College—has as yet instituted a provident fund.[1]

36. It is not surprising that under such conditions the noble and onerous profession of a university teacher should be held in low esteem, in spite of the tradition of honour for such work which is part of the inheritance of Bengal. "The unattractive character of a teacher's position," says Mr. Radhikanath Bose,[2] Principal of the Pabna College, "is the most vital drawback against securing men of first-rate ability for educational work in our country....The best graduates of the University, if they care to accept a professorship in a college, usually make it a stepping-stone to a more lucrative office. No wonder, therefore, that we should notice a lack of earnestness among many of the teachers." In the Government colleges, where there are good pay, security of tenure, and pension rights, conditions are much better. But "even the Government services," as Mr. Akshaykumar Sarkar[2] observes, "do not attract the best graduates..... The social status of a professor is much inferior to that of a pleader, munsiff, deputy magistrate, or even a deputy superintendent of police, not only in the estimation of the general mass, but also of the educated few, and of the administrators of the country." Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta[2] very justly notes that "there are many men of first-rate ability in both the services" (private and Government); and the admirable evidence they have given us bears him out. "But," he goes on, "I think they are there in spite of the system. I think that the salary of professors in private colleges ought to be increased, and the

[1] The other colleges with provident funds are all in the *mufassal*. They are the Krishnath College, Berhampur; the Jagannath College, Dacca; the Hindu Academy, Daulatpur; the Ananda Mohan College, Mymensingh; and the second-grade colleges at Midnapore, Narail, and Pabna.

[2] Question 2.

appointments made for long terms, on a time-scale of promotion."

IV.—The control of the University.

37. In theory, under the system established in 1904, it is the duty of the University to ensure that the teaching work of the colleges is properly organised and conducted. In practice, as we have seen, the University has been unable to secure reasonable conditions of salary and tenure for the teachers, without which it is not reasonable to expect good work. It is equally unable to ensure that the teachers appointed by the colleges are competent men. Nominally it has the power of disaffiliating a college if its staff is insufficient in numbers or quality. In reality it cannot exercise this power. To disaffiliate a college in English because the qualifications of one member of its English staff were inadequate would be to deprive all the students of the college, in all subjects, of the right of presenting themselves for examination; since the student cannot attend lectures in another college in order to make up for the deficiencies of the teaching offered to him in his own college.[1] When the only power which a controlling body possesses is that of annihilation it is, in fact, all but powerless.

38. But if the control of the University has been ineffective in the vitally important function of securing efficient teaching for the students, in other respects it has achieved a dead uniformity of curriculum unknown, we believe, elsewhere in the world, certainly outside India. In other universities it is habitual for professors and others to offer courses not included within the ordinary curriculum; many students attend these and other courses purely for interest and pleasure; and universally there are hundreds of 'occasional' students who attend one or two courses with no idea of undergoing an examination or taking a degree. In order to discover to what extent this free expression of intellectual interests went on in the colleges of the Calcutta University we addressed a series of questions to the heads of all the colleges. The replies show that,

[1] It is true that a student may attend another college in a subject in which his own college is not affiliated. But this could not be done in English, or any of the more popular subjects, because in these subjects the accommodation is already strained. A student may not attend another college than his own for *part* of his work in a subject, and therefore cannot make good the defects of a particular incompetent teacher.

with the exception of certain courses on religious subjects, attendance at which is mostly compulsory, there is not a single class held in any of the colleges which is not required by the printed regulations of the University; not a single student attends courses for any other purpose than preparation for an examination; and, with the exception of a Y.M.C.A. secretary who once attended some English and history lectures at St. Paul's College, not a single person has during the last five years been admitted to any class in an arts college unless he was a candidate for a university examination. Apart from what may be done on a small scale, and in an informal way, by the kindness of individual teachers, there is, and under the existing system there can be, scarcely any variety, or attempt to meet special needs. The colleges are wooden models, turned out to a pattern in accordance with the regulations of the University.

39. Many of our correspondents share our belief that the control of the University is too rigid, and that its general influence over the work of the colleges is unhealthy. In truth, the relation between college and university implied in the existing system, wherein the University does not help or strengthen the colleges, but is a body wholly external to them, merely supervising, examining, and imposing regulations, cannot but be productive of an unhappy uniformity on the one hand, and, on the other, of personal friction with those on whom this uniformity is enforced. We were told in evidence by an experienced Indian principal that in all his many years of service he had only once heard of a spontaneous meeting of college principals, and that was to declare war against the University. Even when a reform is undertaken so great as was implied in the assumption by the University of direct responsibility for teaching in the post-graduate sphere,[1] the unhappy effect of a system which places the University in antithesis and in opposition to the colleges is displayed. Inevitably and rightly the University appointed as its post-graduate teachers the best men it could find, largely the best teachers in the colleges; equally inevitably, these teachers seized the opportunity of escaping from such conditions of work as we have described. The result necessarily

[1] See Chapter XV.

was to weaken still further the teaching strength of the colleges concerned, and to make the other college teachers feel, however unreasonably, that their status had been still further reduced by the formal and practically permanent limitation of the colleges to an inferior sphere of work.

40. One of the respects in which the control of the University, as now constituted, is held to be hostile to healthy development is that it tends to reduce the colleges to a monotonous uniformity, and especially in the mufassal, to prevent their adaptation to the special needs of the districts which they serve. "Local conditions being widely varying," says Mr. Prasanta Chandra Mahalanobis,[1] "our educational institutions must not be standardised on too uniform a plan, and a considerable amount of local variation should be allowed." But the regulations do not encourage such variation; and the result is, as Dr. Kedareswar Acharya[2] points out, that "all colleges affiliated to the existing University have endeavoured to impart instruction according to a stereotyped curriculum without any reference to the special needs of different localities." Dr. Acharya bases on this argument a strong plea for the establishment of a local university for North Bengal at Rajshahi; and, no doubt, something of the same feeling forms part of the motive for the remarkable series of suggestions for the establishment of local universities which we have received.[3] Some of our correspondents, it is true, do not favour the creation of local universities; partly, perhaps, because they have not realised the defect of the existing system which Dr. Acharya feels so strongly; partly because they believe that the colleges are, for the most part, not in a position to use academic autonomy wisely. And, indeed, it is impossible not to recognise that institutions which are organised and conducted in the way we have described, even though they may be providing all the teaching required for the attainment of a university degree, are not likely to use to advantage a suddenly granted freedom.

41. More general is the complaint that, in regard to all colleges, the influence of the system leads to an undue restric-

[1] General Memoranda, page 430.

[2] *Ibid.*, page 411.

[3] No less than 29 places in Bengal have been suggested in answers to Question 4 as suitable cities for universities either immediately or in the future. See Chapter XXXV.

tion of freedom, and tends to reduce the better colleges to the level of the weaker. "The university is the all-important thing in our educational structure," says Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta,[1] "and the colleges nothing, though it is the colleges which are responsible for giving instruction. The University has rules for everything—the subjects to be studied, the number of lectures to be delivered in each subject, the number of lectures which a student must attend, etc. These rules aim at securing a uniformity in the standard of education in the different colleges. The uniformity which is attained is of a mechanical character, but education is undermined by taking away all initiative from the teachers." "Freedom of teaching and of study is at a discount under the existing system," Mr. G. C. Bose complains,[2] "both being imprisoned, as it were, within the stone-walls of prescribed books and mathematically rigid examinations and regulations." "The affiliated colleges, though varying greatly in value," says Mr. Sharp,[3] "are driven towards a groove, and tend to subside into a monotonous mediocrity;" and again, "the standard of examinations is set by the weaker institutions, since it is difficult for the central body to resist the demand that a reasonable percentage of all candidates shall succeed." Mr. Hunter,[1] Principal of the Rangoon Government College, declares that "as long as the system of affiliated colleges forming the University exists, the strength of the University will be to a considerable extent measured by the strength of its weakest affiliated college." Mr. W. C. Wordsworth[4] (until lately Principal of the Presidency College) states that "there is, or appears to be, a tendency in university policy to regard all colleges as of the same degree of untrustworthiness. Certainly it has long been a cardinal belief among the staff of the Presidency College that there is in university policy a tendency to diminish the prestige, importance and efficiency of the college in the interests of easy administration. I may instance recent inspection reports, in which, after a few hours' inspection, the inspectors attacked the carefully considered policy of the

[1] Question 1.
[2] Question 2
[3] General Memoranda, page 443.
[4] *Ibid.*, page 486.

governing body in the matter of numbers and of the combinations of subjects permitted; in one of which also they attacked by name, as not fitted for his position, a gentleman of considerable academic distinction and experience, whom one of the inspectors had himself recommended in the highest terms." The belief which Mr. Wordsworth and his late colleagues entertain may, or may not, be justified. But it is an unhappy state of things, not conducive to good work, when such suspicions can be entertained by a body of able and reasonable men.

42. It is through its system of examinations that the influence of the University is most directly exercised over the colleges and their teaching methods. Instead of being simply a test of the work done by teachers and students, the examination is the goal towards which all their work must be directed. Because the University, which is the higher body, merely conducts examinations, while the college, which is the lower body, carries on the teaching, the student naturally thinks the examination more important than the teaching, and regards the college as existing for the purpose not of training his mind, but of enabling him to pass examinations. And just because the number of candidates is so enormous the examinations tend to be mechanical.

43. The evils of this system are very keenly felt by the teachers.[1] "The ideal which is usually held up before the students," says Mr. Pramathanath Chatterjee,[2] "..... is the passing of certain examinations which have a marketable value. Very few students are actuated by any higher motive than this. No system of education which is dominated so much by public examinations can ever hope to attain to a high level of efficiency." "Success in examinations is the *summum bonum* of the students' life," says Mr. Surendranath Das Gupta.[2] "Guardians of boys also do their best to goad them to concentrate all their energies on examinations." This desolating dominance of examinations, as Mr. K. Zachariah puts it,[2] "poisons the very fountains of learning. 'Arithmetic,' says Plato, 'is an excellent preliminary to philosophic study, if pursued for the love of knowledge, and not in the spirit of a shopkeeper.'..... In Calcutta, not only

[1] This subject will be more fully dealt with in Chapter XVII.

[2] Question 1.

arithmetic, but even divine philosophy itself, is too often pursued in the mercantile spirit."

V.—The methods of instruction.

44. It is under the conditions which we have described that the work of university teaching is carried on in the colleges of Bengal; and if we would understand the actual character of the work done, and appreciate the need for change, we cannot too clearly realise the nature of these conditions. The colleges are, with few exceptions, too poor to be able to supply the equipment necessary for university work: they cannot, for example, maintain good libraries. That is the first disability under which college education has to labour; a deficiency in the essential materials of study.

45. The second disability is that, in the majority of colleges, many, or most, of the teachers are, as we have seen, underpaid, dissatisfied with their lot and eager to change it, without any high ideals of scholarship, and burdened with a load of work too great to be performed as university work should be performed. Many of them, as we well know, having talked with them, are able and devoted men; but even these are, as their evidence shows, often dispirited by the conditions under which they have to work.

46. The third disability is that the teachers are tied hand and foot, on the one hand by the regulations of the University, on the other hand by the exactions of their pupils, whose sole aim, in most cases, is the passing of an examination, and who, therefore, demand not guidance and inspiration, but organised tags and tips such as can be reproduced in the examination room. "Teaching is a game at which both the teacher and the taught must play," says Mr. Dhirendranath Chowdhuri[1] in a sound and pointed aphorism; but the mass of students, whose school training has nearly always been mere examination coaching, do not realise how much they miss in refusing to play their part in this glorious game, and think themselves defrauded unless the teacher does nearly all the work. This is a complaint which we have heard repeatedly in our conversations with teachers, as well

[1] Question 2.

as in the written evidence. There are exceptions among the students as there are among the teachers. But even the exceptional students have to unlearn the habit of cramming; and they have to unlearn it, under the most unfavourable conditions, against every temptation to continue it.

47. Finally, in nearly all colleges the work of teaching is rendered extraordinarily difficult by the unmanageable numbers of the students; and still more by the fact that they enter the colleges ill-trained, while still schoolboys, needing the close discipline and detailed attention which are appropriate to schoolboys, and, except in rare instances, unready for the freedom and responsibility of university work. We have already discussed this problem in the last chapter. But its bearing on the character of the higher work has to be kept in mind. "The mischief of having this school work done in a university college," says a teacher of wide experience[1] "is that the school methods necessary in the first two years dominate the whole subsequent course.[2] At no point is the undergraduate a *student*, *i.e.*, a person who is studying a certain subject under the guidance of his tutor, while attending lectures which will reveal to him the real standards of knowledge. All the time he is a *pupil*, being taught the whole of his subject by his teacher." From this point of view it may fairly be urged that one of the most necessary steps is a severance of the intermediate classes from the higher, and more genuinely university work: a course which has, as we noted in the last chapter, been advocated by many correspondents on quite other grounds.

48. These being the conditions under which college work is carried on we have next to consider its methods. When the student enters a college his first business is to determine the group of subjects he is going to study. The University gives him no guidance; it allows him a wide latitude of choice, but gives no indication as to the best groupings of subjects. If the college helps his choice it is only by limiting it—by offering him only a restricted

---

[1] The Rev. W. E. S. Holland, in answer to Question 1.

[2] If 'school methods' were actually used in the first two years, the situation would not be so bad. Unfortunately, as we have seen (Chapter XII, paras. 25-31), school methods, however necessary, are *not* employed, though school standards have to be adopted.

number of subjects.[1] There is, as a rule, no one to guide his choice, with a view to his natural preferences or the needs of his future career[2] : the principal is far too busy a man to be able to advise every student, and as often as not the clerk in the college office is alone consulted. The result is that, in the majority of cases, the student's sole guide is his idea of the relative easiness of the various subjects ; and we have often been told that the student chooses that college which in his judgment offers the easiest combination of subjects. "Want of co-ordination of studies is the first thing that strikes one," says Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta ;[3] "most amazing combinations of subjects are offered....." Mr. Mohini Mohan Bhattacharjee[3] suggests that "courses in correlated subjects alone should be allowed to be taken up. The choice of the correlated subjects by the students should be subject to the sanction of the professor in charge." But who, one may ask, is the 'professor in charge' ? There is no teacher put in special charge of the individual student ; no one to whom he has a right to go for advice, either when he makes his first choice of subjects, or when he chooses afresh, at the B.A. stage, or when he is wondering whether he might be good enough to read for honours ; no one who can take him in hand, show him how to read, encourage him to go beyond his text-books, advise him as to the wise distribution of his time, and the most profitable methods of work. And if by 'professor in charge' Mr. Bhattacharjee means the head professor of a subject, responsible for the general organisation of teaching in the subject, we have found with amazement that in most colleges no such officers are recognised ;[4] all teachers are on a level, and the distribution of work is either arranged by the principal, who cannot know all subjects, or by a meeting of teachers, after the manner adopted in the Russian army since the Revolution. The student, then, is for the most

---

[1] Thus no men's college provides teaching in geography, though the regulations permit the subject to be taken in the intermediate examination ; and some colleges provide no more than the minimum number of subjects required.

[2] Presidency College has recently tried the experiment of appointing a dean to advise the students. But one man cannot deal adequately with 1,000 students, and the experiment, though a step in the right direction, has not been wholly successful.

[3] Question 1.

[4] "In each college there should be different grades of teachers . . . and one professor in each subject." Dr. Nares Chandra Sen Gupta in answer to Question 2.

part left to himself; he chooses his own subjects; and then all he has to do is to attend the ordained lectures and classes.

49. In all colleges the main means of instruction, and in many colleges practically the sole means of instruction, is the lecture. The University requires that long courses of lectures (at least 160 including periods of class or laboratory-work) shall be given in every subject, and that the student shall attend at least 75 per cent. of the total number as a condition of being admitted to the examination. Classes are limited by regulation to 150, and in rare cases to 200. The reason for this restriction was that before it was introduced there was much disorder in some large classes. The restriction seems to us illogical, except for the purpose of preventing disorder. In some subjects 150 is far too large a number for a single class. In those subjects to which large lectures are appropriate, it may fairly be said that the lecturer who cannot hold the attention of 250 is not likely to hold the attention of 150; and if attention is not secured, the lecture might as well not be given. On the other hand, this regulation leads to an unnecessary duplication of lectures, which may cause a terrible waste of time. We do not wish to undervalue the lecture as a means of education; we share the enthusiasm of Dr. Brajendranath Seal[1] for the really good lecture with "its generous enthusiasms and exaltations, its sense of wide spaces and vistas, its sympathetic resonances and imaginative responses, its interfused and illumined 'mass-consciousness';" though we must confess to having heard few lectures in Bengal, or anywhere else, to which it would not seem a little excessive to apply Dr. Seal's glowing phrases. Here we have to deal with innumerable routine lectures, delivered by lecturers commonly with no great gift for their work, to crowds of compulsory auditors who spend the main part of each day in one lecture-room or another. It is not easy, either for the teacher or the student, to maintain the exalted standard set by Dr. Seal for four or five consecutive hours every day.

50. We have attended lectures, or parts of lectures, in every college which we have visited, and the total number of these discourses which we have heard must be considerably over one hundred. We have heard some good lectures, and two or three which were quite admirable. But, in general, we are bound to

[1] Question 2.

say that we found them dull, perfunctory and lifeless performances. One marked feature was the almost total absence of references to books, other than text-books; we never heard a lecturer recommend his hearers to read a book merely because it was a good book, and apart from examination requirements. Another feature was the general absence of any attempt on the part of the lecturer to enlist the co-operation of his hearers: they were almost always mere recipients, not participators, and teaching was not treated as "a game at which both the teacher and the taught must play." We cannot believe that this is due to any lack of natural alertness in the Bengali student or teacher; the few exceptional cases which we came across showed that this was not so. We heard, on one occasion, a student challenge the validity of a metaphor in *Sohrab and Rustum*, to the disconcertment of his teacher. One of our number having suggested to a teacher of English in a mufassal centre that the students should be given a chance of raising points, he replied that the idea was an entirely novel one, and that he would try it. He wrote later to record the results of his experiments. In the second and fourth year classes (where the students were under the immediate shadow of examinations) there was, he said, 'no time' for such experiments. But in the first and third year classes some interest was shown; and one boy 'stumped' his teacher by asking what Milton meant by making Adam use the phrase 'as in my mother's lap': a phrase which seems to have escaped the attention of more experienced commentators. We have little doubt that very stimulating results might be obtained by the adoption of a different method. But custom is too strong; and we are constrained to say that most of the instruction to which we have listened was arid and unprofitable.

51. We recognise, however, that although we tried to be as inconspicuous as possible, and avoided attending lectures in a body, a certain artificiality was necessarily introduced by our presence in the lecture-rooms: and no fair judgment could be based upon our experience alone. We are, therefore, relieved to find that our dissatisfaction with the methods of instruction pursued in almost all the colleges, and in almost all subjects, is confirmed by the judgment of experienced Indian teachers. We make no apology for quoting at some length the judgments of four of these gentlemen,

Mr. Chandi C. Mitra,[1] Professor of English at the Carmichael College, Rangpur, writes as follows:—

"The existing university system tends to the production not of thinking human beings, but of sponges. It developes in the student a capacity to drink in information, and to store it up till it is squeezed out of him, in a dirtier form, on the day of the examination."

Again, Mr. Purnachandra Kundu,[2] Officiating Principal of the Chittagong College, thus denounces the influence of examinations upon teaching:—

"The system of examination, as at present prevailing, unavoidably favours cramming...Neither the standard nor the type of questions asked in a particular examination varies, and an intelligent student can generally foresee what sort of questions are likely to be set. The highest ingenuity and the best devices are directed towards this end, and they generally succeed. This....accounts for the abnormal sale of notes and model questions,[3] and the high percentage of passes in the university examinations, though most of the passed students do not attain the standard of knowledge supposed to be required by the University....As the primary object of the majority of students is to pass the examinations....they attend the college course simply to keep the percentage of attendance at lectures required by the regulations. They prefer that lecturer who gives systematic notes, and points out 'important' questions. To avoid the risk of unpopularity.... even an able lecturer allows his lectures to degenerate into coaching work. To meet the demands of the vast majority of students, he has to sacrifice the intellectual development of the earnest and sincere students."

Mr. Jatindra Chandra Guha[2] of the Rajshahi College expresses his indignation in lively and humorous terms:—

"The teacher's business is to coach the student in the prescribed text-books. All that he has to do is to get these up thoroughly on his own account, labouring through all their vain pedantries and tedious and useless minutiæ, and to help the student to get them up as best he may, by drudging at the notes and 'answers to probable questions' furnished by himself and the worshipful company of key-makers. The student thus looks upon the teacher only as a live key, or a machine for turning out notes for him, and often thinks he can get better service from the printed keys than from him. Thus the teacher's personality does not touch the student, and the teacher, on his part, does not feel any enthusiasm for his dull, mechanical work of firing off grape-shot of small and petty bits of information at the student,

[1] General Memoranda, page 358

[2] Question 1.

[3] "Nearly every day there arrives at this college (and, I suppose, at others) a packet of advertisements from the sellers of 'keys,' with model questions and answers and all the assistance requisite to pass all the university examinations. The sale of these productions must be enormous," says Mr. J. R. Barrow, in answer to Question 1. We have been at pains to make a collection of these productions. They constitute the most degraded form of academic literature which we have yet encountered.

by which he can make but little impression on his inert and listless mind. This lack of enthusiasm on the one side is reciprocated by a similar lumpishness on the other too; and it is the effort of speaking only that prevents the teacher from sinking into drowsiness, while it is the loudness of his shouting that keeps the student from falling into a somnolent state. If the teacher is temporarily roused to a slight elevation of spirit by the peculiar interest of a subject, and is betrayed into a more than formal discourse upon it, the student regards it as mere waste of time and complains about the shortness of the day's progress with the book-lesson."

Quotations from the evidence of our correspondents might be endlessly multiplied, giving expression to the feeling of helpless anger and scorn inspired in able men and good teachers by the shackles of the system which bind them. But we must be content with one more passage from an excellent analysis by Dr. Jajneswar Ghosh,[1] Principal of the Ananda Mohan College, Mymensingh:—

"Reflection, freedom of thought and the spirit of enquiry are discovered to be unavailing, or, at any rate, not so effective as the power of committing to memory paraphrases, demonstrations and conclusions.....The teacher cannot remedy the evil, which degrades him as much as it does the student. His work is defined by the syllabus, and has to be done with strict regard to the time at his disposal, and the nature of the ordeal for which he prepares the students. He cannot ignore them with impunity, for with those whom he teaches, success in the examination is the first and most important thing, and intellectual culture and the pursuit of truth for its own sake, a bad second. Hence an uneducational method obtains in the colleges, which consists in supplying the student with ready-made solutions, and not in bringing out the latent powers of his mind, and teaching him to see for himself. The evil is aggravated by the fact that the teacher has to lecture, as a rule, to large classes composed of students of widely different aptitudes. Unless he cares to forfeit the attention and confidence of his pupils (and it must be clear that he can gain nothing by losing them) he must try to present within a very limited time the maximum of information in an attractive form and style. He gives them, therefore, no leisure to think, and takes away the incentive to thought, by explaining as lucidly as possible and with a profusion of illustrations the difficult portions of the book or the subject that he teaches. The learners discover, as a consequence, that the enquiry and effort needed for an intellectual mastery over their subjects are supererogatory, or even a sheer waste of precious time. Those who are apt among them pick up the teacher's tricks of speech and turns of expression, and learn to manipulate them for their purposes in the examination. They give the examiner little that is their own....If I am not wrong, it is not the abstruseness of the subjects learnt, but the mode of learning them, the attitude of the mind towards the issues which they raise and the problems which they solve, that should distinguish the university student from the school boy. This right temper is, however, seldom in evidence. And the

[1] Question 1.

re-conceiving of existing knowledge, the focussing of scattered rays of light and the co-ordination of ideas derived from different branches of study, are never attempted. His hands are full, he cannot stop to distinguish between the white light and the coloured, he stores his mind once more with paraphrases, analyses, demonstrations, opinions and theories. He has trained and developed his memory at the expense of every other faculty, and he relies on it alone as a resource of sovereign potency against the ordeal. He crams, and the facility with which he devours subjects and sciences is equalled only by the facility with which he purges his mind of them as soon as the examination is over."

52. If these descriptions are just—and they are substantially borne out by our own observations—the system must be very bad for the students. In truth, the tyranny of compulsory lectures produces a reaction ; the student is bored and inattentive. "From my own experience both as a student and as a teacher," says Mr. Prasanta Chandra Mahalanobis,[1] "I do not think it an exaggeration in any way to state that about three-fourths of the class is never seriously interested in the lecture." "It is not an uncommon experience," says Mr. Walter A. Jenkins,[2] "to enter the lecture-room at 3-35 and find not one but several students who have fallen asleep in the interval between two lectures." The demand of attendance at an excessive number of lectures, Mr. Bimal Chandra Ghoshl assures us, "has encouraged the disgraceful practice of attendance by proxy. This is the student's method of retaliating for bad teaching and compulsory attendance."[3] It is not surprising that one of the reforms most frequently advocated, in the interests of teacher and pupil alike, is a great reduction in the number of lectures. "The University," Mr. Raj Mohan Sen[2] urges, "should rather fix the maximum instead of the minimum number of lectures to be delivered in each subject, lessening the number of lectures now usually delivered at least by one-third." Mr. J. M. Bottomley[2] speaks of the "abolition of the existing tyranny of interminable lectures" as "the most urgent need," next to the establishment of "a more rational system of intercourse between students and lecturers." And Mr. Sushil Kumar De[1] goes so far as to recommend that while the number of attendances for pass students should be greatly reduced, in the case of honours students no requirements should be made at all, it being ensured that the

[1] Question 2.

[2] Question 1.

[3] At one lecture at which one of our number was present in Calcutta 117 students were marked in the register as present, but there were only 107 actually in the room.

student was working under proper direction by means of an organised system of tutorial work. Evidently reaction against the compulsory lecture system has already gone far, among both students and teachers.

53. But the experience thus far obtained of the working of the tutorial system is not very encouraging. The University has urged the establishment of tutorial work as a means of remedying the admitted defects of the lectures. But we have seen tutorial classes at work ; and so far as we have been able to judge, they are in general nothing more than additional coaching classes in preparation for the examination, which invade still further the scanty leisure of teacher and student, and which are carried on—so powerful is the lecture-tradition—simply as miniature lectures. "The present tutorial system," says a young graduate, Mr. Azizul Huque,[1] "is as bad as class-work, as it is invariably the same teaching, except that the class is of a smaller number." Dr. Brajendranath Seal[2] has an interesting passage on this. "The tutor's duty (as distinct from the lecturer's) is to enable the young mind to learn by actual work and study ; to see by personal examination and inspection of work that this is being done, and for this purpose to give general explanations, directions and references. This is tutorial guidance and supervision, and it is attempted in a few colleges. But in many cases the tutorial.... is another business ; it is coaching, it is school-mastering writ large,....spoon-feeding, often with pre-digested food suited to school-children.... In some few colleges B.A. tuition is what it should be, ensuring actual work of the student, with explanation, guidance and supervision ; but there are other cases (how many, I won't say) in which both teachers and students look upon the tutorial hour in the college routine as a harmless necessary fad."

54. But there is a yet wider and more generous interpretation of the relation of the tutor to his pupil than even that which Dr. Seal here advocates—one in which the tutor is not merely the supervisor of the student's work in a particular subject, but also his friend and adviser in regard to the whole of his work, and in regard also to many things that lie outside of the ordinary

[1] Question 1.
[2] Question 2.

discipline of the college. It is through this kind of relationship that the intimacy of teacher and taught, which so many of our correspondents long for, can best be secured. In the present system it is almost wholly lacking. "The human element is crushed out. The college is a barrack of lecture-rooms."[1] Indeed, the mere arrangement of college buildings is hostile to this kind of relationship. With the exception of St. Paul's College in Calcutta, and, in a less degree, the Presidency College, we have found no college where private rooms are provided in which teachers can see their pupils singly or in small groups. The need of this sort of guidance—which need not take up a great deal of time, nor be administered at fixed hours—is strongly felt.

"The age at which our men enter the University," says Maulvi Tassadduq Ahmed[2], "is the most critical age in a man's life. At such an age our boys are thrown together by hundreds, in surroundings which are in most cases unfamiliar and perhaps inhospitable, without any proper guidance, without a helping hand, without a sympathetic friend. The teacher can be all this to them, but unfortunately it is physically impossible for him to attend individually to such a large number of boys as are placed under him."

55. How valuable this tutorial relationship can be made may be illustrated by a note which we have received from a young Indian graduate, who took a course at Oxford, and laments that Indian students cannot enjoy the kind of guidance which he obtained there.

"If you had explained to me ever so much," he writes, "I shouldn't have understood the spirit of the thing before I went to Oxford....I learnt from my tutor at Oxford—not altogether from him, but largely from him, and by seeing what he was rather than by hearing what he said—two or three things which are not in the syllabus, but are worth far more than any amount of mere information. First, a scrupulous regard for the truth as truth, the feeling that one should not be slipshod in seeking or expressing it. Secondly, intellectual sincerity, the readiness to be blown by the wind of Reason into whatever port it pleases, as the *Republic* has it. Thirdly, the supreme value of independent thought and judgment. My tutor was a rather old man, and I even more conceited and foolish than young; and yet the readiness with which he encouraged me to think for myself, the patience and evident willingness to be convinced with which he listened to my theories, the frankness with which he disavowed special knowledge of some subjects, all these made a deeper and, I believe, a more valuable impression on me than many lectures put together. Where does all this come into the academic career of the unfortunate Bengali student?...Give the teacher a chance; give the student a chance. Till now all have sinned and gone

[1] Mr. Holland, in answer to Question 1.

[2] Question 2.

astray... But the college teacher and the student have been more sinned against than sinning."

56. Only one of our correspondents has, we believe, gone beyond mere lamentations at the absence of human relationship between teacher and taught, and has endeavoured to suggest a means whereby not merely additional assistance in the study of the prescribed course, but general friendly guidance and advice, may be made available for the student. This is Rai Bhupatinath Das Bahadur,[1] who writes :—"Some chance of the students coming under the guidance of the teachers may be given by dividing the total number of students into groups, and assigning each group to one of the teachers, who will be called 'tutor' to the particular groups of pupils. The tutor will set apart two or three hours in the week when his pupils may come and consult him not only in matters relating to their studies, but in other matters also, in which they may stand in need of advice from a senior."[2] This is a sound notion, capable of development: it indicates the need for a kind of guidance which is quite as important as formal instruction, but which is at present almost wholly lacking.

VI.—The neglect of the able student.

57. Probably the most serious defect of the present system is that it gives extraordinarily little opportunity to the abler student, who is continually sacrificed to the needs of the mass. "The best intellect is chained down with the lowest," as Mr. Surendranath Das Gupta puts it,[3] "so that most of his time is spent unprofitably; and as a result of this, the instruction imparted in the class becomes dull and uninteresting to him; there comes a deadness over him which retards the zest of his spirit of enquiry."

58. The University provides honours courses for the abler students. But these are only an addition to the pass work in one of the pass subjects. They are treated in the same way. The honours man is required to attend the full tale of pass lectures, and an additional burden on the top of them.[4] Hence instead

[1] Question 2.

[2] This subject is further discussed in Chapter XIX; see also Chapter XXXIV, paras. 53-59.

[3] Question 1.

[4] It may be noted that as his place in the honours list is fixed wholly in view of his performance on the special honours papers, he is encouraged to do no more than is necessary to secure a mere pass on the bulk of his work; with unhappy results.

of being given more leisure to think and read for himself, instead of being trusted to work on his own account under direction, and to cultivate his distinctive powers, he is exposed to a yet more deadening discipline than his fellows. What is more, even such opportunity as this honours system gives is in practice denied to many able students. Unless his college is 'affiliated up to the honours standard' in the subject in which he is interested, a student is not permitted to read for honours. Another college on the other side of the street may provide the very teaching he desires; it may have no more than two or three students in the special honours classes which he needs. But it is impossible for him, except by special arrangement, to join these classes; and special arrangements are scarcely ever made. His own college, though it may not be able to afford the three teachers in a subject required for honours work, may have upon its staff a first-rate man, who would be well able to direct his studies, and might find it an immense relief and refreshment to do so, if only the student were able to get some part of his instruction elsewhere. But the ablest teacher may take no part in honours work in his college unless it provides three teachers in the subject. Such are the results of the self-contained college system, and the rigid regulations of the affiliating university, as they are worked in Bengal.

59. But indeed the honours system as it stands affords but a poor opportunity to the able student. Like the pass courses, the honours course is conceived of more or less mechanically, as a matter of lectures and text-books; it is assumed that the main work must be done by the teacher, and that the student's task is only to receive and absorb. That this is the view entertained in high quarters in the University is very plainly demonstrated by an episode which was brought to our notice. A college had applied for honours affiliation in philosophy. Inspectors were duly deputed by the University to enquire into the fitness of the college for this higher work. One of them bore one of the most respected names in the University. The principal of the college suggested to this gentleman that he should inspect the philosophical library of the college, which happens to be unusually good and well selected. The reply was a refusal. "The fewer the books, the better the students will read," said this guide of youth. "They cannot

understand the books, and they only confuse them." Much better, it would appear, that they should be supplied with dictated dogmatic notes, and learn them by heart.

60. The neglect of the ablest youths in the most critical years of their lives is, indeed, not only the most disheartening, but the most dangerous, feature of the educational life of Bengal. For the fate and fortunes of every people depend upon the opportunities which it affords to its ablest sons, who must be the leaders and guides of the next generation in every field of national activity. If their minds are sterilised, if their intellectual growth is starved and stunted, the nation will as surely suffer as it will if it neglects the material resources which Nature has bestowed upon it. It is almost a truism to say that the progress of every nation depends largely upon the abundance, the character and the training of its exceptionally gifted men. And while a soundly devised educational system will not neglect the training of the ordinary mass of men, any system stands self-condemned which fails to make itself a means of selecting men of promise and of affording to them every possible opportunity of bringing their powers to full fruition, not for their own advantage alone, but for the commonwealth.

61. In Bengal there are but few, if we may judge by our many conversations on the subject, who appreciate the importance of these considerations. Rare indeed are those who will go so far as to say what Mr. Kalipada Sarkar said to those of our number who visited Chittagong : " The motto ought to be ' Good education for the few, and some education for all.' " The almost universal attitude is that the needs of the mass of average students must come first ; and that if this involves disregard of the needs of the élite, even if it involves the sterilising of their powers, the price must be paid. Very many people, while recognising the evils of the existing system, nevertheless defend and uphold it on the express ground that it is devised in the interests of the mass of average youths, who are presumed to be incapable of independent and individual work.

62. In one of the many conferences of college teachers which we have held during our travels about Bengal the following extremely hypothetical question was put to the assembled teachers, who had just been expressing their sense of many of the defects of the

existing system :—"Suppose that the University of Calcutta abandoned all examinations for four years. Suppose that the lecturers, knowing the change, still went on lecturing, and that the students, knowing the change, still attended college, but without having to take any examinations. Would this cause Bengal to revert to intellectual barbarism ? Or would things be better ? Or would they be worse ?" The answer was, that it was a very difficult question ; but all seemed to agree that the change would be good for the few best students, because it would give them freedom of study, but bad for the average students, who are the majority, because if relieved from examination pressure they would do no work. "And which of these interests," the questioner went on, "do you think should be considered the more important ?" The answer came without hesitation : "The interest of the majority. Meet their needs first and then do what you can for the exceptionally good." Now the hypothetical (and quite impracticable) change here suggested would be, so far as teaching and study were concerned, almost a reversion to the old methods of the *tôls*. But the college teachers of Bengal would have none of it.

63. Nor did they, or the many others with whom we have discussed this problem, recognise that when the ablest intellects are stunted and sterilised by a merely mechanical system of training, it is not only the abler youths themselves who suffer, nor even the commonwealth at large. The average students, for whose sake this terrible sacrifice is made, suffer as much as any. For they are deprived of the best thing which university life has to offer to a young man—daily contact with his ablest contemporaries when these are full of intellectual vitality, eagerly pursuing their own special interests, and testing their young strength upon the problems of life and thought. This is an element in the training of a university which not the most admirable lectures or tutorial arrangements can replace. The system now existing in Bengal, which condemns all to the same treadmill of routine task-work, has banished all this ; and by denying opportunities to the élite, has inflicted an irremediable deprivation upon all.

64. The University of Calcutta has recently had under consideration proposals for the institution of honours schools which

should be from the first—after the intermediate or higher school stage—distinct from the pass courses.[1] There is a strong body of opinion favourable to these proposals, which are frequently referred to with approbation by our correspondents. The scheme, if wisely carried out, would afford real opportunities to the abler students. But a difficulty at once emerges. The scheme cannot be made to fit the existing system. No college, with the exception of Presidency, could afford the cost of conducting two distinct parallel courses, one for the few abler students, the other for the mass, or could provide a teaching staff qualified to undertake the new work. Some colleges might, indeed, provide teaching in a single honours school on the new basis, or possibly in two honours schools. But this would mean that the choice of subjects offered to the students would be seriously restricted. And even the strongest college could not, by itself, afford a training as wide in its range, or offer as great a variety of teaching methods, as honours work at its best requires ; though many could provide one or two teachers who could make contributions of real value. The need can only be met by an organised system of co-operation, such as the present organisation of the University forbids. The system of self-contained colleges breaks down when it tries to deal with the vital necessity of giving adequate and varied training to the best men.

VII.—The subjects of study.

65. We have as yet said nothing regarding the subjects of study pursued in the arts colleges of the University. The first thing that strikes an observer accustomed to the wide range of studies provided for in western universities is that, while on paper the University permits selection from a large number of subjects, in practice the great majority of students are limited to a very narrow range. The reason for this is that most of the colleges cannot afford to provide teaching in subjects which are likely to be taken by only a few students ; while, even in Calcutta, where there are many colleges in close proximity, the individual college is in practice precluded from forming a class by drawing stray students from other colleges. Thus no college provides instruction

[1] See the report of the Committee of Sixteen, in the Minutes of Proceedings for 1917.

in any modern European language except English ; that is to say, no Calcutta undergraduate can, in practice, present French or German as a degree subject. More striking, no men's college provides any instruction in geography ; it is not, in these circumstances, surprising that the geographical teaching in the schools should be bad. No college in Bengal (except, for their own professional purposes, the medical colleges) provides any instruction in zoology ; the Calcutta undergraduate is, in practice, precluded from studying the rich animal life of his country. Except in Calcutta, only one college[1] offers teaching in botany ; and there are only two men's arts colleges even in Calcutta whose students are provided with teaching in this subject, so important to an agricultural country.[2] Thus the medical student who wishes to take a degree in science before proceeding to his professional course, is (unless he is a member of one of these colleges) denied any opportunity of working at some of the subjects which would be most useful to him, and a knowledge of which would economise his time later. No college except Presidency provides teaching in geology and physiology ; no student, therefore, can take up either of these subjects unless he can get admission to Presidency College, and is able to pay the higher fees there charged.

66. Thus although the University permits many subjects to be offered, and although in most of these subjects some teaching is offered in one place or another in Calcutta, the great majority of students, even in Calcutta, are in fact limited to a narrow range of choice. Such is the working of the system of self-contained colleges. Its influence is almost equally mischievous even in those subjects which are provided for by nearly all colleges. This is especially noticeable in regard to honours courses, even on the existing unsatisfactory scheme. A student, let us say, is a candidate for honours in history. He has to cover an immense range of ground—a range enormously wider, be it noted in passing, than that covered by the honours courses of British universities, in spite of the fact that the British student commonly devotes his whole time to the subject, while the Calcutta student has to

[1] Krishnath College, Berhampur.

[2] The deficiency is, however, to some extent supplied by the Indian Association for the Cultivation of Science which has been formally affiliated, though the students who attend its lectures all do the bulk of their work in other colleges.

take other subjects concurrently. The result of this is that he must study everything at second-hand, never at any point coming to intimate grips with the methods of criticism appropriate to his subject. That is bad enough. But at least he would gain something if his teachers had that intimate and specialist knowledge of various parts of the field of his studies which he cannot himself hope to attain. This advantage he might hope to enjoy if he could attend the courses of many teachers at different colleges, each dealing with the subject he knew best. But in fact he will have three teachers, that being the minimum number required by the University for the affiliation of a college 'up to honours standard' in any subject; the three teachers will also have to carry on the pass work in history. But even if they be all highly trained scholars—and trained scholars are, in Bengal, rarer in history than in almost any other subject—three men cannot, among them, have a really specialist knowledge of the whole of the vast range to be covered. They may have sufficient knowledge to guide his reading, and in general to 'tutor' him. Each of them may have a really intimate knowledge of some patch of the subject, though this is not very likely. But over the greater part of the ground, it is impossible for them to show him what is the nature of the complex problems with which historical criticism has to deal, and thus to teach him the wholesome lesson of his own ignorance. In other colleges, close at hand, there may be teachers who are strong where they are weak; but the system makes co-operation almost impossible. In the university buildings near by, there will be historical scholars at work with M.A. classes; but their aid cannot be utilised, for a water-tight compartment separates them from the work of the colleges. Thus even in Calcutta, where the available resources are considerable, and even in the subjects which every college undertakes to teach, the most serious and scholarly work is all but prohibited by the system of organisation which makes every college self-contained and self-dependent.

67. The range of studies from which the students have to make their choice is, as a rule, English (compulsory) together with Sanskrit, history, philosophy, mathematics, chemistry and physics; economics is added in the better colleges; physics and occasionally either history or philosophy, are omitted in a few.

Persian and Arabic are provided in some colleges as an alternative to Sanskrit; the omission of these subjects in many colleges is felt as a grievance by Muslim students.[1] It is but rarely that any college goes beyond this list; which may broadly be said to cover the range of all ordinary college education in Bengal. A paper in Bengali (or other vernacular) composition is also prescribed by the University. But there is no systematic study or teaching of Bengali philology and literature in any of the colleges.

68. At the intermediate stage all students, whether arts or science, take English and vernacular composition, with three other subjects. The only difference between the arts and the science student at this stage is that the arts student must take one arts subject besides English, and may take arts subjects exclusively; while, apart from the compulsory subjects, the course of the science student is wholly scientific. In the post-intermediate, or true university, course, which extends over a second period of two years, differentiation is sharper. Only the arts student now takes English and vernacular composition; he also takes two other subjects, one of which must be an arts subject. The science student takes three sciences, usually mathematics, physics and chemistry.

69. Among all these subjects it is our general impression that the sciences and mathematics are the best taught. The physical sciences have the advantage of laboratory work, which gives the student some contact with realities, saves him from complete subjugation to dictated notes and keys, and affords him opportunities of informal discussion with his teachers. Moreover, the size of classes in science subjects is happily limited by the accommodation in the laboratories. Generally speaking the laboratories are not inefficient, though, of course, they vary from college to college; they are neither very good nor very bad.

70. In mathematics the same advantages do not exist; the classes are large, and the lecture-method is universally employed. But both the teaching and the work of the students are probably better than in other subjects, because mathematics is, of all modern studies, that in which Bengalis most frequently excel.

[1] The University provides classes in these subjects, charging a special fee of Rs. 3. It is an example which might be extended.

Nevertheless, even in mathematics we have found evidence that the inattention of the students to the instruction given to them in lectures, and their dependence upon 'keys' or books of solutions, and other aids to memory, is almost as complete as in other subjects. In one large Calcutta college one of our number was impressed by the fact that not a single student, of over 100 who were present at a lecture which he attended, had taken a single note during the first half of the lecture. He asked some of the students why this was so, and got the reply that they followed the lecture perfectly, and would write out their notes when they got home. Being anxious to discover whether such surprising feats of memory could really be practised, he asked all the students present, with the permission of the lecturer, to write out a summary of what they had just heard. Only one of the whole number was able to reproduce correctly even a portion of the lecture; others could not put down even three lines; and in conversation they explained that they trusted to learning their text-books including problems and their solutions.[1]

71. Among the arts subjects we are inclined to think that philosophy is often the best taught, and arouses the keenest interest among the students; we have heard two or three really good philosophical lectures, and one tutorial class in this subject in which some discussion was going on. The subject which is most commonly ill-taught is history; partly because the syllabus of study is far too wide in its range, so that it has to be studied exclusively in rather arid text-books; partly owing to that curious weakness of the Bengali, and indeed of the Indian, mind, in grasping relationships in time, to which we have already referred.[2] The historical method has come to be, during the last hundred years, so vital an element in all serious thought, and the historical point of view is so essential an element in the equipment of the leaders of any society which is to play an effective part in political development, that we feel the deficiency of the historical studies in the university system of Bengal to be a real danger. There is no point at which there is greater need for the importation of a more scientific and liberal method into the teaching,

[1] Chapter XVII.

[2] Chapter V, para. 20.

and no aspect of the training of the educated classes of Bengal which needs more careful attention.

72. We do not propose at this point to say much in regard to the teaching of the eastern classical tongues—Sanskrit, Arabic, Persian and (in the rare instances where it is included in the undergraduate curriculum) Pali. We are informed that Sanskrit is generally regarded as an easy subject, perhaps because of its affinity to Bengali ; though we do not find that in English universities Anglo-Saxon or Latin, or in French universities Old French or Latin, are regarded as 'soft options.' But there seems to be a widespread opinion that the quality of the teaching (though of course it varies from college to college) is not high, especially in Arabic and Persian, and also, though to a less extent, in Sanskrit.[1]

73. We are strongly of opinion that the neglect of the vernacular in the college education of Bengal is one of the greatest defects of the system. In no college is any attempt made at a scientific philological treatment of the language. In no college have we heard of any lectures—even occasional lectures—being given to the students on the literature of the vernacular. We have much sympathy with the criticisms on this omission which are expressed by many correspondents in their answers to Question 12 of our questionnaire. Some of our correspondents seem to hold the view that the only way of rectifying the deficiency is to impose a course of lectures, and an examination, in Bengali language and literature, upon all candidates for the degree of B.A. We do not feel any confidence that this would supply a solution. It is not felt to be desirable in England or France to require from all students a study of English or French literature and philology at the degree stage. Not all students are interested, or capable of doing good work, in either literature or philology ; and the compulsion of attendance at such subjects only reduces the quality of the work done. But we think that the requirement of an essay in Bengali (or other vernacular) might well be made more serious, and might perhaps be reasonably imposed upon science as well as arts students ; while a quite serious and systematic study of Bengali literature, and of the history of the language, would form a very valuable addition to the list of

[1] See Chapter XVI for Oriental Studies.

optional subjects. The mere inclusion of such an element in the curriculum would be good not only for the students who took it up as a degree subject, but for their friends—some of whom might well attend the lectures without presenting the subject for examination.

74. The most important subject in the whole curriculum—for all students at the intermediate stage and for arts students at the university or degree stage—is English ; upon which an extraordinarily high proportion of the total available time is spent. Undoubtedly, in the eyes of many students, to obtain an effective mastery of English is one of the main purposes of the university course ; and the vital importance of the subject is still further emphasised by the fact that English is the medium of instruction. We have given much attention to this very important question, which is more fully discussed[1] in another place and we are constrained to the conclusion that the results are altogether disappointing in view of the time and labour devoted to the subject.

75. On this point we have received a valuable memorandum from Mr. O. F. Jenkins,[2] Secretary and Member of the Board of Examiners (for appointments to Government service). He writes :—

"I have recently had occasion to examine a few candidates for Government employment who had shortly before graduated in the Calcutta University. I was greatly surprised by the weakness of some of these candidates in English, both in vocabulary and in grammar. I think this weakness is explained by a review of the type of question paper set in English from the matriculation examination onwards in the Calcutta University. Such papers might fairly be set to students whose mother tongue is English but seem quite inappropriate for candidates to whom English is a foreign language, with the grammar and vocabulary of which they are still more or less imperfectly acquainted. I do not understand how a student who has not sufficient proficiency in English to write a few original sentences with idiomatic correctness, can be expected to have formed a critical taste in English literature. Therefore the answers which the students give to the numerous questions on literary criticism which appear in the English examinations must be mere echoes of the opinions of others, which have been crammed ' for the occasion. I would suggest that due recognition should be given to the fact that English really is a foreign language to the students . . . A very much smaller space should be allotted to English poetry, and much more prominence given to modern English prose, as written by representative

[1] See Chapters XVIII and XLI.

[2] Question 10.

living authors." Mr. Jenkins also urges that "at any rate in the final undergraduate examinations in all modern languages" (including Arabic and Persian) "a conversational test should be instituted."

76. We recognise with admiration the real mastery of the English language, and the quite remarkable knowledge of English literature, possessed by very many Bengalis; it is strikingly exemplified in the evidence submitted to us. We recognise, also, that this mastery has been, in the main, acquired by means of the study of English prescribed in the university courses. At the same time we feel very strongly the justice of the criticisms made by Mr. Jenkins. It is our deliberate opinion that the courses of study laid down by the University, and the methods adopted almost universally in the colleges for giving effect to the requirements of the University, are ill-devised and inappropriate both in view of the previous training of the students, and in view of their actual needs. A comparison between the English style of the older generation and that of the younger, both in speech and writing, seems to substantiate the view, expressed by many of our correspondents, that there has been a marked deterioration in the quality of the work in this subject in recent years. We are inclined to think that this must largely be attributed in the first place to the enormous increase in the number of students, which has made the work of practical linguistic teaching extremely difficult; and in the second place to the progressive diminution in the number of English teachers and still more in the proportion between them and the number of students. Admirable as is the knowledge of English possessed by many Indian teachers, it must be obvious that nothing can quite compensate for lack of contact with teachers who speak the language as their native tongue. There are 22 arts colleges in Bengal which contain no English teacher, and most of the students in these colleges can, in the ordinary course, scarcely ever hear English spoken by a native.

77. We do not suggest that it is possible or desirable to import so large a number of English teachers as would be necessary in order to reproduce the conditions under which the last generation in Bengal learnt English, or the conditions under which it is studied, even to-day, in the colleges of some other provinces, where students are far fewer, and English teachers more numerous. But it is important to realise that the circumstances under

which the last generation of educated Bengalis acquired their remarkable mastery of English, in small classes under English teachers, have disappeared, never perhaps to be renewed. For this reason, so long as English retains its present predominant position, and especially so long as it continues to be the medium of instruction, as, at the collegiate stage, it must long remain, it is urgently necessary that the methods of teaching it should be re-considered.

78. From the beginning to the end of the course almost the only method adopted seems to be that of detailed and minute study of select passages of English literature. The selections prescribed rarely include any specimens of the terse, idiomatic and flexible English prose of to-day. They are largely drawn from the poetry of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries; and as this poetry is always full of allusions, and draws its abundant metaphors largely from a scenery and a social background which must be unfamiliar to the Indian student, it lends itself to a terrible profusion of annotation; the student is tempted to fix his attention upon unusual phrases and figures, which hinder rather than help him in striving to acquire a working command of the language. "Preparation for university examinations therefore becomes a struggle to get through the prescribed books in the allotted time," as Mr. J. R. Barrow[1] observes, "acquiring, by any means available," (and especially by the use of the ever-present 'keys,' which are more abundant in English than in any other subject), "some knowledge of the bare literal meaning of words and phrases and allusions. To suppose," Mr. Barrow concludes, "that the reading of literature in this manner has any value whatever, is absurd."

79. We have no desire to suggest that the study of the masterpieces of English literature should be banished from the curriculum of the Indian student. But we strongly agree with the contention which Mr. Barrow has worked out in an admirable little book, that the study of a great literature cannot be pursued to the best advantage until the student has acquired a real command of the language in which it is written. We feel that the acquisition of this kind of practical knowledge, since it is not given, and perhaps cannot for a long time to come be

[1] Question 1.

living authors." Mr. Jenkins also urges that "at any rate in the final undergraduate examinations in all modern languages" (including Arabic and Persian) "a conversational test should be instituted."

76. We recognise with admiration the real mastery of the English language, and the quite remarkable knowledge of English literature, possessed by very many Bengalis; it is strikingly exemplified in the evidence submitted to us. We recognise, also, that this mastery has been, in the main, acquired by means of the study of English prescribed in the university courses. At the same time we feel very strongly the justice of the criticisms made by Mr. Jenkins. It is our deliberate opinion that the courses of study laid down by the University, and the methods adopted almost universally in the colleges for giving effect to the requirements of the University, are ill-devised and inappropriate both in view of the previous training of the students, and in view of their actual needs. A comparison between the English style of the older generation and that of the younger, both in speech and writing, seems to substantiate the view, expressed by many of our correspondents, that there has been a marked deterioration in the quality of the work in this subject in recent years. We are inclined to think that this must largely be attributed in the first place to the enormous increase in the number of students, which has made the work of practical linguistic teaching extremely difficult; and in the second place to the progressive diminution in the number of English teachers and still more in the proportion between them and the number of students. Admirable as is the knowledge of English possessed by many Indian teachers, it must be obvious that nothing can quite compensate for lack of contact with teachers who speak the language as their native tongue. There are 22 arts colleges in Bengal which contain no English teacher, and most of the students in these colleges can, in the ordinary course, scarcely ever hear English spoken by a native.

77. We do not suggest that it is possible or desirable to import so large a number of English teachers as would be necessary in order to reproduce the conditions under which the last generation in Bengal learnt English, or the conditions under which it is studied, even to-day, in the colleges of some other provinces, where students are far fewer, and English teachers more numerous. But it is important to realise that the circumstances under

which the last generation of educated Bengalis acquired their remarkable mastery of English, in small classes under English teachers, have disappeared, never perhaps to be renewed. For this reason, so long as English retains its present predominant position, and especially so long as it continues to be the medium of instruction, as, at the collegiate stage, it must long remain, it is urgently necessary that the methods of teaching it should be re-considered.

78. From the beginning to the end of the course almost the only method adopted seems to be that of detailed and minute study of select passages of English literature. The selections prescribed rarely include any specimens of the terse, idiomatic and flexible English prose of to-day. They are largely drawn from the poetry of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries; and as this poetry is always full of allusions, and draws its abundant metaphors largely from a scenery and a social background which must be unfamiliar to the Indian student, it lends itself to a terrible profusion of annotation; the student is tempted to fix his attention upon unusual phrases and figures, which hinder rather than help him in striving to acquire a working command of the language. "Preparation for university examinations therefore becomes a struggle to get through the prescribed books in the allotted time," as Mr. J. R. Barrow[1] observes, "acquiring, by any means available," (and especially by the use of the ever-present 'keys,' which are more abundant in English than in any other subject), "some knowledge of the bare literal meaning of words and phrases and allusions. To suppose," Mr. Barrow concludes, "that the reading of literature in this manner has any value whatever, is absurd."

79. We have no desire to suggest that the study of the masterpieces of English literature should be banished from the curriculum of the Indian student. But we strongly agree with the contention which Mr. Barrow has worked out in an admirable little book, that the study of a great literature cannot be pursued to the best advantage until the student has acquired a real command of the language in which it is written. We feel that the acquisition of this kind of practical knowledge, since it is not given, and perhaps cannot for a long time to come be

[1] Question 1.

are, for example, a well selected small library at St. Paul's Cathedral Mission College, a fair all-round collection (with some marked gaps) at the City College, a sound working library in English literature at the Jagannath College, Dacca, and a moderately good collection of some 10,000 volumes at Rajshahi. Much care has recently been given to the library at Dacca College. But these are exceptions, and in general the libraries are quite inadequate for the needs of the students, and still more for those of the teachers.

84. This is the more important because student and teacher are far more dependent upon libraries for the books they need than is the case in other countries. The students cannot afford to buy books; we have seen their little collections on the shelves at their bed-heads in very numerous hostels, and have very rarely found them to include more than a few text-books and some 'keys'—it is rare indeed to find on a student's shelf any books which are not absolutely required for his class-work. Nor can the underpaid teachers of most of the colleges afford to buy books on any considerable scale. And nowhere, save in Calcutta, are there any public libraries to supply these deficiencies: in many college towns there is not even a bookshop.

85. We do not suggest that an impossible or unreasonable standard in regard to libraries should be set before the colleges. We are inclined to agree with the view expressed by Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee[1] that "in a poor country like this libraries should not be made unnecessarily costly. An ordinary college library should not, like an Imperial library, aim at having all the books on a subject, good, bad and indifferent, but should be content with having only the best books." At the same time it ought to be remembered that, in the mufassal colleges especially, not only the student but the teacher is almost wholly dependent upon the college library. And we do not know of any college library in Bengal which at present, has a right to be 'content' or to believe that it has even 'only the best books' in all the subjects which it teaches.

86. Indeed, we have found it impossible to resist the conviction that in some colleges the library is regarded, not as an essential part of teaching equipment, but merely as a more or less useless conventional accessory. We have seen more than one library the

[1] Question 2.

contents of which seemed to have been bought by the yard from the dealers in order to make a show when the university inspectors, or the members of an inquisitive commission, came round to conduct enquiries.[1] When the library is regarded and treated in this way by the authorities of a college, it is not to be expected that the students will realise its importance: they are already too prone to assume that the text-book and the 'key' are all-sufficient.

87. In most of the colleges which we have visited, we have made a point of inspecting the record of books taken out from the library over a period of two or three months. There is considerable variation between one college and another. In some the library scarcely seems to be used at all; in none is it used very freely: time and again we have noted that the whole body of students of a college, 300 or 400 in number, have only borrowed perhaps 25 books among them in the course of a month. But in all colleges we have noted one surprising and suggestive fact. The fewest books are taken out by students of the second and fourth years, in which the examinations are held. During these years, in nearly all the colleges, practically no books are borrowed save copies of the calendar containing examination papers, and editions of text-books. Is there any other university in the world in which a student uses a library least when he is working hardest? Could there be a more lurid illustration of the deadening influence of the examination system as it has been developed in Bengal? Even in the first and third years the books taken out are very few, and seldom show the development of independent interests outside the formal curriculum. In some places we have observed an ominous fact: the third year borrows fewer books than the first, the fourth than the second. What this suggests is that, as the university course proceeds, the independent intellectual interests of the student diminish.

88. It is plain that one of the greatest needs, in many of the colleges of Bengal, is some means of training the students, and occasionally also the teachers, in the use of a library. Several of our correspondents have emphasised this point. "Students should be taught early how to make legitimate use of a library," says Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee.[2] "There is no provision," says

[1] See footnote to para. 114 below.

[2] Question 2.

Nawab Syed Nawabaly Chaudhury,[1] "to compel the students to use the libraries. There are no special classes for library works. .... The students are left to themselves, and, as is natural under the circumstances, they pick out just a few books here and there aimlessly, without any special reference to the nature of the work they are engaged in." And Mr. Panchanandas Mukherji[1] makes the point still more specifically when he says that "mere *access* to the libraries will not do. Just as the science student's time-table is so arranged that he may devote a considerable part of his time to actual laboratory practice, so the arts student should be compelled to devote a few hours each day to work in the great intellectual laboratory—the library."[2] But there are few colleges, as yet, which have begun to realise the importance of this kind of work: which have worked out, like Cotton College, Gauhati, a careful scheme for supervising students' reading, or which have established, like Presidency College, seminar classes, held among the books, or in which, as in St. Paul's College, teachers meet their students in the library and advise them as to the books they should read.

89. The intellectual deadness which is shown by the failure to make adequate use of even such modest library facilities as exist, shows itself also in a multitude of other ways, and notably in the general weakness of students' clubs and societies in nearly every college. But that is a subject which, along with many other subjects of vital importance—the student's moral and religious training, his physical welfare and the need for greater attention to it, the conditions under which many students live and work —will find a more appropriate place in a later chapter.[3] In the present chapter our concern is with the purely intellectual aspect of the student's training on its academic side.

IX.—The colleges of Calcutta.

90. Having surveyed the general conditions under which the work of the arts colleges has to be carried on, we must next attempt some review of the colleges themselves, and some analysis of their distinctive characteristics, so far as the rigid regulations

[1] Question 2.

[2] This method has been introduced at Madras.

[3] Chapter XIX.

of the University permit these to exist. To describe all the thirty-two arts colleges for men in Bengal in turn, and to record our impressions of them, would only weary the reader. It will be best to take them in groups, and to deal only with the main features of collegiate work.

91. One of the considerations which it will be necessary to hold in view in judging the relative efficiency of colleges is the number of their teachers in relation to the number of their students ; a second is the range of subjects in which they offer tuition ; a third is the salary-rate paid to their teachers. Objection has, indeed, been raised to the basing of any conclusions upon the ratio between the number of teachers and the number of students ;[1] and it must be recognised that the validity of this ratio as a test of efficiency is to some extent affected by the number of subjects over which the teaching staff is distributed, and by the rate of salaries paid to them. To base a judgment upon such a ratio in the case of an institution which offered courses in an immense range of subjects, each taken by only one or two students, might be very misleading.[2] In Bengal, however, no arts college offers teaching in any very wide range of subjects, and most colleges do not cover anything like the range that ought to be dealt with by an institution of university rank. For that reason the test by ratio of teachers to students, though inadequate unless it is supplemented by other tests, is less misleading than it would be elsewhere.

92. If the primary responsibility of a college is regarded as being limited to the provision of the required number of lectures

[1] When, in the year 1918 the South Suburban College applied for an extension of its affiliation up to the degree stage, the Government of India objected that the number of teachers was inadequate in proportion to the number of students. The college replied that " the sufficiency or otherwise of the staff cannot manifestly be determined without reference to subjects ; " and that to strike a proportion without reference to this " is not only a novel but a very misleading test to apply. " The Syndicate of the University in adopting the report of a committee appointed to deal with the question, endorsed this view (2nd August, 1918). " No general rule can be laid down concerning this proportion," the committee reported, " the proportion cannot be considered apart from the number of subjects in which a college is affiliated. "

[2] Thus some of the English universities have a very high ratio of teachers to students— as high, in some cases, as one to five or six— but this is partly accounted for by the fact that they provide teachers in such little-frequented subjects as Egyptology, numismatics social anthropology, parasitology and so forth, which few students attend. At the same time the influence upon the students' mind of belonging to an institution in which great scholars deal with so wide a range of knowledge should not be forgotten,

on the required number of subjects, to enable large classes of students to qualify for admission to examinations, the proportion of teachers to students may reasonably be low. If, on the other hand, the college is expected to afford to the students individual help and tutorial guidance, it will require a large staff however small the range of its subjects. The truth is that the test by proportion of teachers to students is a rough and one sided test. When the proportion is very low, it is a sure proof of inadequacy ; when it is high, other factors must be considered before a judgment is given. If in any college there is only one teacher to every 40 or 50 students, it is safe to assume that no great variety of choice in subjects is offered to the students, that any intimacy of relationship between teachers and students must be almost impossible, and that the work of the college must be, for the most part, limited to a routine of lecture-instruction. But if there is a proportion of one teacher to every 15 or 20 students, it becomes possible for the students to receive individual attention, though not certain that they do receive it ; it is possible also that a greater variety of choice is offered to them. A college with a higher ratio of teachers to students *can* be efficient ; whether it is so or not depends upon other factors. To that extent, and with these limitations, the test of proportion can be fairly applied, and gives useful guidance.

93. The first and most obvious distinction among the colleges is that between the colleges in Calcutta and the colleges in the mufassal. For while the colleges in the mufassal are necessarily isolated, so that nothing can be done to reduce or qualify their self-dependence,[1] the colleges in Calcutta are so placed that it should be possible for them to supplement and assist one another's work, and for their students to make some use of the very great resources of a metropolitan city, its libraries, its State institutes of science, its professional schools. The very conditions of life in Calcutta are so different from the conditions of life in any mufassal town (save, in a minor degree, Dacca) that even under the present system, which has made no attempt to turn these conditions to account in the training of the students, their influence upon the students' intellectual life cannot but be felt, both for good and for ill. The students themselves are conscious of this. It is not only the absence of accommodation in mufassal colleges, but also, and in a

[1] Except in the case of Dacca, of which more presently.

much higher degree, the lure of the great city and its varied interests, and, perhaps we should add, its reputation as one of the healthiest places in Bengal, which brings them flocking in thousands from all parts of Bengal to besiege the doors of the Calcutta colleges.

94. There were, in 1917-18, 10,979 students in the arts colleges of Calcutta. Of these only 2,579 came from Calcutta itself, and only 1,479 from the two adjacent districts of the 24-Parganas and Howrah; 5,957 came from other parts of Bengal,[1] and 964 from other parts of India, including Assam and Burma. The students in the arts colleges of Calcutta formed substantially more than half of the total number of students in all the arts colleges of Bengal; for all the mufassal colleges combined had only 9,488 students. A further contrast between Calcutta and the mufassal is that the proportion of students in the post-intermediate stage is substantially higher in Calcutta than in the mufassal.[2] In Calcutta nearly two-fifths of the total number are following post-intermediate courses, in the mufassal the proportion is substantially under one-third. From this it would appear that many mufassal students, after taking their intermediate courses near their homes, go to Calcutta for their degree work. Nevertheless it appears that nearly 4,000 mufassal boys, coming from distances too great to make daily travel possible, are taking intermediate classes in Calcutta: nearly 4,000 school boys between 16 and 19 years of age are drawn into the huge city to do work of a school character, which they ought to be enabled to do equally well nearer home. Their presence intensifies the already difficult problem of providing reasonably decent conditions of life for the immense floating student population of the city—a problem whose difficulty is not fully realised unless one remembers that in addition to the 10,979 students in arts colleges, 4,695 students in professional colleges and university classes in arts and science have to be provided for.

---

[1] 1,391 from the Presidency division; 1,522 from the Burdwan division (*i. e.*, Bengal west of the Hooghly); 2,105 from the Dacca division; 648 from the Chittagong division; and 382 from the Rajshahi division (Northern Bengal). The total of the contingents from the Dacca and Chittagong divisions, *i.e.*, from Eastern Bengal, amounts to 2,753, or more than from the city of Calcutta itself.

[2] It is, however, higher in Dacca than in Calcutta.

95. Among the eleven colleges in Calcutta which undertake the tuition of these 11,000 students, there are very marked gradations in efficiency and variations in type. The first place, in a class by itself, belongs to Presidency College. It has a more highly paid, a larger, and, taking it as a whole, a much more highly qualified staff, than any other college. It admits just over 1,000 students, though the demand for admission is so great that many hundreds have to be rejected. It provides, on an average, one teacher to every twenty students. Unlike any other college, it devotes itself mainly to post-intermediate, or real university work, the degree students outnumbering the intermediate students by more than two to one.[1] It charges the maximum college fee imposed, not merely in Bengal but in India ;[2] but, besides giving some free places, it grants admission on reduced terms to Muslim students.[3] It has one of the three or four best libraries in India, and its scientific laboratories are well-designed and excellently equipped. It covers a much wider range of studies than any other college ; and before the University undertook the provision of post-graduate courses, it was the only institution in Bengal which gave higher teaching in any wide range of subjects. It has endeavoured to develope a tutorial system, which is, in some subjects, well carried out ; and has organised seminar classes and departmental libraries for some of its honours schools. In short, it is able to give a better training than almost any other college. And this is widely recognised : we have been told on all hands that, other things being equal, a Presidency College student is likely to have the advantage of a student from another college in applying for a post, because the appointing body will assume that he has had a better education.

96. During a hundred years, Presidency College (or its predecessor the Hindu College) has attracted to its class-rooms the sons of the best Bengali families. It therefore has a stronger tradition than almost any other college, and commands a real loyalty among its alumni. A large proportion of its students live in Calcutta, where all the leading families of Bengal tend to

[1] In 1917, 709 degree students against 327 intermediate students.

[2] 12 rupees *per mensem*, *i.e.*, rather under £10 *per annum*, or not more than half the fee charged in most of the modern English universities for a course in arts.

[3] Chapter VI.

much higher degree, the lure of the great city and its varied interests, and, perhaps we should add, its reputation as one of the healthiest places in Bengal, which brings them flocking in thousands from all parts of Bengal to besiege the doors of the Calcutta colleges.

94. There were, in 1917-18, 10,979 students in the arts colleges of Calcutta. Of these only 2,579 came from Calcutta itself, and only 1,479 from the two adjacent districts of the 24-Parganas and Howrah ; 5,957 came from other parts of Bengal,[1] and 964 from other parts of India, including Assam and Burma. The students in the arts colleges of Calcutta formed substantially more than half of the total number of students in all the arts colleges of Bengal ; for all the mufassal colleges combined had only 9,488 students. A further contrast between Calcutta and the mufassal is that the proportion of students in the post-intermediate stage is substantially higher in Calcutta than in the mufassal.[2] In Calcutta nearly two-fifths of the total number are following post-intermediate courses, in the mufassal the proportion is substantially under one-third. From this it would appear that many mufassal students, after taking their intermediate courses near their homes, go to Calcutta for their degree work. Nevertheless it appears that nearly 4,000 mufassal boys, coming from distances too great to make daily travel possible, are taking intermediate classes in Calcutta : nearly 4,000 school boys between 16 and 19 years of age are drawn into the huge city to do work of a school character, which they ought to be enabled to do equally well nearer home. Their presence intensifies the already difficult problem of providing reasonably decent conditions of life for the immense floating student population of the city—a problem whose difficulty is not fully realised unless one remembers that in addition to the 10,979 students in arts colleges, 4,695 students in professional colleges and university classes in arts and science have to be provided for.

---

[1] 1,901 from the Presidency division ; 1,522 from the Burdwan division (*i. e.*, Bengal west of the Hooghly) ; 2,105 from the Dacca division ; 648 from the Chittagong division ; and 582 from the Rajshahi division (Northern Bengal). The total of the contingents from the Dacca and Chittagong divisions, *i.e.*, from Eastern Bengal, amounts to 2,753, or more than from the city of Calcutta itself.

[2] It is, however, higher in Dacca than in Calcutta.

congregate. There seems to be more pride in the college, and more social life among the students, than there is in most other colleges. They have a number of discussion clubs. When we visited the Eden Hindu Hostel (which is divided into five 'wards,' each presided over by a member of the teaching staff) we found that several of the 'wards' maintained manuscript magazines of their own; and we are told that ward-festivals on special occasions are of not uncommon occurrence. Undoubtedly a student of Presidency College can not only get a better and more varied academic training than the students of most other colleges, he can also live a happier and fuller life. He is a member of a society which does not lack corporate spirit; though we regret to have to recognise that this corporate spirit has been weakened in recent years. This has been in part due to the alienation between the students and the English members of the teaching-staff which has been one of the bye-products of the political agitation into which the students have been drawn during the last twenty years

97. Presidency College stands at the very heart of what may be called the 'university quarter' of Calcutta. It has a good site, overlooking the garden of College Square; but its area is far too restricted, and leaves too little room for necessary expansions, or for the provision of residences for some of the members of the staff, which would greatly strengthen the corporate spirit of the college.[1] It is separated only by a side street from the Senate House of the University, and from the huge Darbhanga building, which accommodates the University Library, the Law School and the post-graduate classes. Hard by is the Medical College, with its hospitals; on the north side of College Square the classical facade of the Sanskrit College helps to create an academic atmosphere, and the University Institute (which corresponds to a western students' union) is close at hand. Most of the other colleges are within easy walking distance. By reason of its geographical position, therefore, as well as by its prestige as the premier college of Bengal, and by the strength of its collegiate tradition, Presidency College is destined to play, as it always has played in the past, a leading part in the life of the University; to be, indeed, its centre and heart.

[1] An area behind the college was acquired for this purpose, but may have to be devoted to more purely academic purposes

98. For some years past there has been an unhappy friction between the authorities of Presidency College and the authorities of the University, which was intensified, though not caused, by differences of opinion regarding the recent organisation of post-graduate studies under university management. Some of the leading members of the college are persuaded[1] that the strength and prestige of the college are regarded with jealousy by certain powerful elements in the University, and that there is a desire to diminish them. In so far as these beliefs are justified—and we think they are not wholly without foundation—they are due to many concurrent causes. Presidency College, as a Government institution, represents in a special degree that close tutelage of Government over higher education which some of the leaders of the University are anxious, and believe themselves to be ready, to throw off. Because its teachers (more especially its English teachers) are Government servants, they are apt to be regarded, when they take part in discussions, not as individual voices, but as mere mouthpieces of Government. Disheartened by this state of things, and at the same time feeling that they are precluded by the rigid regulations of the University from giving to their students as good a training as the resources of the college would render possible, some of the leading members of Presidency College have been ready to advocate that the college should be cut off from the University,[2] and should obtain freedom to plan its own courses and to grant its own degrees.

99. But any such proposal forgets the special and peculiar relation in which Presidency College stands, and has always stood, to the University. When the University was founded in 1857, one of the reasons why it was not provided with a teaching organisation of its own was that the generous equipment of Presidency College rendered this unnecessary; that is to say, this well-found and well-staffed college was intended, in some undefined way, to supplement the resources of other colleges; its strength was not meant to be expended for the advantage of its own students alone. The system of self-contained colleges, however, set up in 1857, made any such use of the resources of

[1] See Mr. W. C. Wordsworth's evidence, already quoted, General Memoranda, page 486.

[2] See the evidence of Mr. Wordsworth, Mr. R. N. Gilchrist and others.

its reputation deservedly stands very high. The college provides residential accommodation for 318 of these students in well-organised hostels, and it is one of the features of this college that most of the European members of the staff live either in the compound of the college (thus following the tradition of Duff), or in the actual hostel-buildings. This makes some real social relationship between teachers and students possible ; and there is a stronger corporate spirit in this college than in most others. At the same time we feel that while the staff of the college is strong in comparison with that of most other colleges, the proportion of teachers to students is still too low for the best kind of work, for the achievement of which inter-collegiate co-operation is essential.

103. St. Paul's Cathedral Mission College, maintained by the Church Missionary Society, is unlike any other college in Calcutta in that it has, as a matter of principle, restricted its numbers within the narrow limits within which, in the belief of its promoters, a real collegiate life is possible. In 1917 its students numbered only 238, of whom 139 were actually in residence in the college itself, the remainder being mainly students whose homes were in Calcutta. Rather less than half of them are degree students. The college and its simple and well-planned hostels are built round a spacious grassy court, big enough to give room for football and other games, the like of which no other Calcutta college possesses. All the European members of the staff live within the college enclosure, several of them in the actual hostel buildings ; and a principal object of the college is to reproduce the intimate social life of an Oxford or Cambridge college, with its constant, informal and friendly contact of teachers and pupils. Compulsory games have been introduced, in which all students take part at least thrice a week. One of the most interesting features of the spontaneous activity which goes on in this college is that a number of the students carry on a kind of settlement work in a neighbouring district, with considerable success. We have studied the working of this college with close attention, and consider that it has achieved in a remarkable degree the aim which it sets before itself. In this respect, indeed, it is a model for other colleges in Bengal ; and affords a strong argument in favour of the small college. It has

also endeavoured to develope the tutorial method of instruction, the small size of its classes making the substitution of class-work for formal lectures practicable, while every student also receives individual tuition at frequent intervals. The aim of this system is to make the students work on their own account, instead of waiting to be fed by the teacher ; and though the students have sometimes grumbled at being denied the customary spoon-feeding, they have at any rate not suffered in their examinations, for the examination record of the college is exceptionally high. St. Paul's College is, in short, a model of what a college can be, and can do for its students, on that side of university life which is at present most neglected in Bengal. But a small college cannot possibly provide teaching of the range, variety and quality which university students, or at any rate the abler among them, have a right to expect. Its resources must, on this side, necessarily be supplemented, if the best work is to be done. This some of the principal members of the college strongly feel. They urge inter-collegiate co-operation, supplemented by university teaching.

104. St. Xavier's College, which is unfortunately the furthest removed of all these colleges from the actual centre of the University, devotes itself mainly to scientific work, in which its equipment is quite unusually good. Of its 701 students no less than 581 are in the intermediate stage, 295 of them reading science ; at the degree stage it takes science students only. The contribution which this college can make, and does make, to the life of the University is of very great value : the pity is that the very great and highly trained teaching powers of the Fathers cannot be made available to more than the 120 degree students whom they admit. The main work of the Jesuit Fathers is, indeed, not in the college but in the school which occupies a neighbouring building, and has as high a reputation as any school in Calcutta. The school, being mainly intended for Europeans and Anglo-Indians, does not arrange its classes to suit the matriculation examination, and comparatively few of its well-trained pupils go on to university courses. Devoting themselves mainly to the work of the school, the Fathers have not found it possible to provide residential accommodation for any large number of their college students ; only 60 of the 700 are in residence.

105. In one respect St. Xavier's College is unlike the other missionary colleges; it does not offer religious instruction to its pupils, unless they be of the Roman Catholic faith. In all the other missionary colleges, both in Calcutta and in the mufassal, religious instruction is regarded as an essential part of the course; for these teachers consider that an education which does not include an element of moral and religious training is of little value, and to give such training is the main reason for their maintaining the colleges at all. Attendance at this instruction, which is given daily, is in fact treated as one of the conditions of admission to the college. The Principal of St. Paul's College told us that he always explained this to the students at the time of entrance, and undertook to give them a transfer certificate if they should at any time object to the character of this instruction. In other colleges we were told that attendance was not rigidly insisted upon, and, in two colleges (Serampore and Bankura), that exemptions would be granted if formally asked for. But no difficulty seems to be raised by the students. If difficulties were made on any large scale, we gather that the missionaries, or many of them, would feel grave doubts as to whether they ought to continue to carry on the colleges at all.

106. We should not have been surprised to find that this practically compulsory instruction was resented by some, at least, of the students. But we found no evidence of the existence of such a feeling. On the other hand, after attending the religious instruction at several of the colleges, we came to the conclusion that it played an important part in the training of many of the students. It is the only part of their course which is not dominated by the nightmare of impending examinations. So far as we were able to judge, it is conducted in a spirit entirely devoid of intolerance. Its aim seems generally to be the admirable one of making clear to the student what are the distinctive ideals and beliefs of Christianity, leaving him free to draw his own conclusions. We have in several instances been struck by the display, among the students, of a lively and critical interest, shown by questions and interruptions courteously put forward and courteously dealt with, which is in marked contrast with the apathy generally displayed in most of the routine lectures on examination subjects. As one of the missionaries said to us,

these discourses serve one very useful purpose in relation to the rest of the student's course; he comes to them in a critical frame of mind, and this attitude of criticism tends in some degree to influence also other parts of his work.

107. We are strongly of opinion that the missionary colleges form an element in the educational system of Calcutta and Bengal which is of the highest value, and the withdrawal or weakening of which would be a real impoverishment. There is evidence that this influence might in some cases be withdrawn if the missionary colleges were deprived, by the sudden imposition of a conscience clause, of the opportunity of doing that which, in the judgment of many of them, is the main justification for their undertaking this kind of work—the presentation to all their pupils of a view of what Christianity means.

108. The great majority of the 'arts' students in Calcutta—8,000 out of 11,000 — are educated neither in Government colleges nor in missionary colleges, but in private colleges largely or wholly supported by fees. These colleges are not in receipt of annual Government grants-in-aid; they have, however, accepted capital grants for the provision of buildings and equipment, and the use of large new hostels for the residence of their students. There are six of these colleges in Calcutta. Two of them, when our enquiry began, were second-grade colleges, taking intermediate students only—the Central College at the north end of the city, and the South Suburban College at the extreme south end. The South Suburban College has since been raised to the first-grade, while our report was pending; but all the figures which we have received in regard to it refer exclusively to intermediate work. It is probably because they are limited to this class of work that the average salary paid in these two colleges is lower than that paid in any other Calcutta college—Rs. 105 per mensem at the Central, Rs. 120 per mensem at the South Suburban; figures which are not markedly higher than the average rate of pay in the mufassal second-grade colleges. But one of these two colleges is far from the centre of university activity; the four first-grade colleges are in the university quarter, all within twenty minutes' walk of the Senate Hall and Presidency College. It is with them and their work that we are chiefly concerned.

these discourses serve one very useful purpose in relation to the rest of the student's course; he comes to them in a critical frame of mind, and this attitude of criticism tends in some degree to influence also other parts of his work.

107. We are strongly of opinion that the missionary colleges form an element in the educational system of Calcutta and Bengal which is of the highest value, and the withdrawal or weakening of which would be a real impoverishment. There is evidence that this influence might in some cases be withdrawn if the missionary colleges were deprived, by the sudden imposition of a conscience clause, of the opportunity of doing that which, in the judgment of many of them, is the main justification for their undertaking this kind of work—the presentation to all their pupils of a view of what Christianity means.

108. The great majority of the 'arts' students in Calcutta—8,000 out of 11,000 — are educated neither in Government colleges nor in missionary colleges, but in private colleges largely or wholly supported by fees. These colleges are not in receipt of annual Government grants-in-aid; they have, however, accepted capital grants for the provision of buildings and equipment, and the use of large new hostels for the residence of their students. There are six of these colleges in Calcutta. Two of them, when our enquiry began, were second-grade colleges, taking intermediate students only—the Central College at the north end of the city, and the South Suburban College at the extreme south end. The South Suburban College has since been raised to the first-grade, while our report was pending; but all the figures which we have received in regard to it refer exclusively to intermediate work. It is probably because they are limited to this class of work that the average salary paid in these two colleges is lower than that paid in any other Calcutta college—Rs. 105 per mensem at the Central, Rs. 120 per mensem at the South Suburban; figures which are not markedly higher than the average rate of pay in the mufassal second-grade colleges. But one of these two colleges is far from the centre of university activity; the four first-grade colleges are in the university quarter, all within twenty minutes' walk of the Senate Hall and Presidency College. It is with them and their work that we are chiefly concerned.

109. These four colleges—the Ripon, the Vidyasagar, the City and Bangabasi—very closely resemble one another in the main features of their work; in the huge numbers of students with which they have to deal, and in the wholesale and mechanical way in which they necessarily have to treat them; in the very inadequate proportion between their teachers and their pupils; in the small salaries and the insecure tenure which they offer to most of their teachers; and in the almost total absence of any effective social life among their students.[1] They are, in fact, huge coaching establishments for examinations, wherein the human element in education is inevitably almost non-existent. In one of them (the Vidyasagar College) the system is carried to such a point that the students are actually taken in shifts; when the first shift has received its dose of lectures for the day, it has to be turned out into the streets to make room for the next shift, for at the time of our visit there was no common-room accommodation capable of harbouring such numbers, and the library cannot receive more than about a score of readers at a time, with any comfort.

110. In only one of these colleges do the degree students outnumber the intermediate students. This is the Vidyasagar College, where there were, in 1917, 929 degree students against 876 intermediate students. The explanation is, in part, that this college specialises in the coaching of students who have failed at the degree examination. It is for these students, and for a similar class at the intermediate stage, that the double shift was arranged. The college, in 1917, had on its books no less than 365 failed B.A.'s or B. Sc.'s. Its only rivals, among all the colleges in Bengal, were the Ripon College with 151 and the City College with 133. All these colleges also accept 'failed intermediates' in large numbers—not only their own failures, but those of other colleges. In 1917 there were just over 2,500 'failed intermediates' taking their courses for the second time in all the colleges of Bengal. Just half of them were in the private colleges of Calcutta.[2] In the City and Ripon Colleges the number of inter-

[1] It ought to be noted, however, that the Vidyasagar College gives a good deal of attention to games, so far as the small supply of playing fields permits.

[2] It may be worth while, for purposes of comparison, to note that the Presidency College accepted in 1917 only 64 unsuccessful candidates, intermediate and degree combined, the Scottish Churches College only 99, and St. Paul's College only 11. They were in all cases students of the colleges, not students from other colleges, and they were admitted only because they were regarded as having a good chance of passing.

mediate students is not very much larger than the number of degree students ; in the Bangabasi College intermediate students outnumber degree students by nearly four to one.

111. But the most disturbing feature of the organisation of these colleges is the proportion between the number of teachers and the number of students—a proportion such as to make any adequate attention to the needs of the students impossible. Taking the six private colleges as a whole, with their 8,000 students, we find that the proportion works out at one teacher to 46·9 students. The best of the colleges in this respect is the South Suburban, with one to 33·5 ; the City has one to 44·3, the Bangabasi one to 44·7, the Ripon one to 49·5, the Vidyasagar one to 53·0, and the Central one to 64·2. These figures compare ill indeed with the proportion in St. Paul's College of one to 17, in Presidency College of one to 20, in the Scottish Churches College of one to 35.

112. Another marked feature of these colleges is that they draw the major part of their students from distant parts of Bengal, and especially from Eastern Bengal. A little less than 5,500 of their 8,000 students come from places other than Calcutta and the two adjoining districts. The major part of these students must somehow find accommodation in Calcutta. The colleges provide for 1,525 of them in hostels or attached messes, leaving over 3,900 unprovided for. Here is the main source of the grave problem of students' residence in Calcutta. As the number of mufassal students who come to these colleges for intermediate courses must be not far short of this total,[1] it would seem to follow that the provision of adequate intermediate training at or near the homes of the students would go far to solve the problem.

113. It was in regard to the government of these colleges that the greatest difficulty was felt at the time of the reforms of 1904. Those of them which then existed were, for the most part, private ventures, run in part for profit ; though it is fair to say that the City College, and during the greater part of its history the Vidyasagar College, have been administered purely as public institutions. The Act of 1904, and the university regulations which were based upon it, made a substantial change, by requiring

[1] We have not precise figures on this point, but it is probable that at least 3,000 of the 5,232 intermediate students in these colleges come from the mufassal.

that the property of the colleges should be vested in trustees, that their profits, if any, should be devoted to their own work, and that their affairs should be conducted by a governing body upon which the teachers were to be represented. It appears, however, that the representation of the teachers has, in some of these colleges, been somewhat unreal, especially owing to the influence of their insecure tenure; while the financial provisions of the Act and the regulations have, in certain cases, been honoured in the letter rather than in the spirit. In one case, as he himself reports[1] to us, the principal " in his capacity as proprietor of the college draws any balance available, large or small, and supplies funds wherever necessary for meeting deficits, large or small :" for a number of years there have been no deficits and large profits, and the staff is both inadequate and underpaid. In another case the *quondam* proprietor is paid by the governing body Rs. 500 *per mensem*—a larger salary than is paid to any member of the staff, including the principal — as ' controller of accounts :' the duties of the office do not appear to be exacting. In yet another case the chief proprietors have increased their own salaries as teachers out of all proportion to the salaries paid to their colleagues. In a fourth case the trustees of the college consist of the late proprietor (now principal) with several members of his family and one other ; and the trust-deed is so drawn that the whole of the buildings and other property of the college will become the property of the principal should the college cease working. The profits of this college have been allowed to accumulate to a very substantial sum, though the staff is underpaid and the equipment gravely inadequate ; and a motion was recently made in the governing body that the bulk of the accumulated balance should be used to purchase a building from the principal—a building which might, after he had received payment for it ultimately become his property once again !

114. In regard to actual accommodation and material equipment for the work of teaching, there is considerable difference between the colleges. The Ripon and the City Colleges have recently acquired large new buildings, paid for partly by private subscriptions and partly by Government grants. They are not ill-designed for their purpose; but the purpose which has governed their design is that of providing accommodation for in-

[1] Statement VI, Volume XIII.

numerable lectures to immense classes of students, not that of providing a home for living societies of teachers and pupils. They do not find space for nests of private rooms. They are, in short, 'barracks of lecture-rooms'—a criticism which may, indeed, fairly be applied to most Bengal colleges, not excluding Presidency College. But the other two colleges, the Bangabasi and the Vidyasagar, are housed in totally inadequate buildings, wherein is provided scarcely even the bare minimum for the meetings of huge classes. For the needs of the student when not listening to lectures practically no provision is made. In one of these colleges we were told that in practice the students had to use as their common-room the platforms of Sealdah Station. The library accommodation is especially inadequate ; the City College, indeed, has a respectable library, and the Ripon College a tolerable one,[1] as college libraries in India go ; the South Suburban College also has made a good start. But the libraries of the other colleges—both the rooms and the collection of books—are totally inadequate ; in one college the library occupies a part of a room mainly used as a scientific laboratory, and has seating accommodation for perhaps a dozen students.[2]

115. Under such conditions it would be unreasonable to expect that there should be any real social life among the students, or any intimacy of fellowship between them and their teachers. We recognise that there are among the teachers in these colleges men of real ability sincerely desirous of doing the best for their pupils. They feel acutely the impossibility of achieving anything of much value under existing conditions ; and some of them have expressed their criticism, with pungency and force, in passages which we have already quoted. It would be unfair also to lay the blame wholly upon the colleges. The blame lies partly with the system of university education in Bengal, which almost seems to be worked on the assumption that the passing of examinations is the only

[1] If all the students in the Ripon College were to take out two volumes at the same time, the shelves would be almost emptied.

[2] In one college the Principal received us in the library. We sat on the only eight chairs the room contained ; the books, in a few dilapidated *almirahs*, surrounded us. While the principal discoursed upon the iniquity of prescribing *Romeo and Juliet* to the 'pure and innocent boys' whom he taught, one of our number caught sight of the title of a book on one of the shelves. It was *More Gals' Gossip*, by Pitcher of *The Sporting Times*. It stood between a stray volume of Hodge's *Systematic Theology* and a novel by Mr. W. Le Queux.

thing of value in a university training, and therefore invites the sort of organisation for that end which these colleges provide. But no solution of the university problem can be satisfactory or permanent which does not recognise and satisfy the real needs—and these may be very different from the conscious wants—of the 8,000 students of these colleges.

X.—The Mufassal Colleges.

116. When we pass from Calcutta to the mufassal the outstanding and obvious fact is that there is in all Bengal, with the exception of Dacca, no considerable town, and, with one other possible exception, no independent centre of intellectual life. Therefore every university institution in the mufassal must depend wholly on itself for the atmosphere of cultivation and of intellectual interest which is indispensable for true university work. This means that a fairly exacting standard ought to be applied to any college which claims to afford to its students all the training that ought to be connoted by a university degree. These colleges cannot draw help from one another; their teachers cannot enjoy the stimulating intercourse which is necessary for continued vitality, except within their own limited society; for the material equipment of study, for books, instruments, and the means of investigation, for the journals which every scholar must read, if he is to keep abreast with the progress of his subject, the mufassal colleges must depend wholly upon themselves.

117. It is in the first place obvious that the second-grade colleges, seven in number, cannot be seriously regarded as university institutions. They are doing nothing but school work, and they are very inadequately equipped even for that. Some reference has already been made to them in the last chapter.

118. There remain fourteen colleges in the mufassal of Bengal which are doing degree work. But even in these fourteen there are 5,131 intermediate students against 2,648 degree students. If we subtract the students who are working in the two colleges at Dacca, and in the colleges at Rajshahi and Berhampur, there remain for the other ten colleges only 1,047 degree students, or 100 apiece, as against 2,922 intermediate students, or just under 300 apiece. That is to say that, with the exceptions named, the mufassal colleges have, on an average, three intermediate students

for every degree student. In two cases, Krishnagar and Daulatpur, the intermediate students outnumber the degree students by nearly four to one. It would appear, therefore, that, in the majority of mufassal colleges, the great bulk of the work is higher school work.

119. The degree classes are in these colleges usually small; they are kept going with difficulty, largely, in the case of private colleges, with the aid of the surplus fees from the intermediate classes; and it is not possible to offer to the degree students either the range of subjects which ought to be open to them, or the individual attention which they need. In one Government college in the mufassal we were told that nearly all the students left the college after the intermediate stage, some going direct into various occupations, others passing to bigger colleges either in Calcutta or in the larger mufassal centres, to pursue their degree courses. The degree classes in this college are almost always made up late, and consist mainly of students who have been unable to obtain admission to other colleges. The small degree classes in this and similar colleges are only maintained at considerable expense. Even in private colleges, where the equipment is usually very inadequate, and the staff is paid at a low rate, the degree classes form a drain on the resources of the college; in Government colleges, where the teachers are much more highly paid, the cost is much greater. It is impossible not to feel that it would be more economical, and far more to the interest both of teachers and of students, to expend the available funds, if that were possible, in strengthening the teaching resources for degree work, and providing residential facilities, at selected places.

120. There are three main centres of degree work in the mufassal of Bengal: Dacca, Berhampur and Rajshahi. Of these Dacca stands in a class by itself. The town is an ancient capital, with a long history. It is the second-largest urban centre in Bengal. It is close to Narayangunge, the centre of the great jute industry. It is the capital of the division which produces a larger number of university students than any other. It has two arts colleges, a law college, a rising medical school, an engineering school and a teachers' training college. Dacca College is, next to Presidency College, the best-equipped and best-staffed college in Bengal; it now has some better buildings than Presidency College, bigger hostels, far more extensive playing fields, and indefinite space for

expansion. Jagannath College is one of the two or three best private colleges in all Bengal. Between them they have nearly 2,000 students, of whom 809 are degree students. Dacca, therefore, is obviously the first and the most natural place, outside of Calcutta, in which it should be possible to establish a real teaching university. We say no more of its teaching work here ; because it will have a chapter to itself later.

121. In Berhampur there are no less than 1,203 students, of whom 485 are reading for degrees ; in respect of the number of its students, Berhampur ranks next after Dacca among the mufassal centres. Like Dacca, it is a place of historic interest, close to the eighteenth century Muslim capital of Murshidabad ; and its neighbourhood was once, and is still in some degree, a centre of the silk-trade. But the district is not among the more populous and thriving districts in Bengal ; and it is by no means simply a local demand which the college meets. It draws considerably less than half of its students from its own town and district. Almost every district in Bengal is represented among its student-population. Once a Government college, Berhampur, was transferred in 1887 to the Kasimbazar Raj, and it is to its generosity that it owes its existence and its remarkable growth. It is because the Maharajah has provided teaching in a wide range of subjects—no other college outside of Calcutta teaches botany, for example—and because he has been extremely generous in the provision of residential accommodation and other aid for poor students, that Berhampur draws students from all parts of the country. The cost of the institution to the private purse of the Maharajah is over Rs. 20,000 *per annum*.

122. We desire to recognise in the warmest way the generous public spirit with which the Maharajah has supported this institution. But it must be obvious that no one man, however rich and generous, can support the cost of real university teaching for 1,200 students singlehanded ; and in some respects it cannot be said that the work of this college is very satisfactory. The proportion of teachers to students (one to 32·5), though incomparably better than that which holds in the big private colleges in Calcutta, is still too high. The average salary paid to the teaching staff (Rs. 150 *per mensem*), though distinctly higher than the average for private or mufassal colleges, is not high enough to

retain men of real academic distinction. The *maximum* salary attainable by any teacher in this college other than the principal (Rs. 300 *per mensem*) is, in fact, less than the *average* salary paid to teachers in the Presidency and Dacca Colleges. It would be impossible and unreasonable to expect from the Maharajah greater generosity than he has shown. But the aid which he gives must be greatly supplemented before this college—standing alone as it does, and depending wholly on its own resources—can pretend to provide teaching of a satisfactory university character. We spent a considerable time in studying the conditions of work at the Berhampur College. We felt that in many respects it compared favourably with other colleges which we have visited. But we did not find in any part of its work any distinctive note. It was pursuing, with rather more than the average competence, the ordinary aim of Bengal arts colleges, that of getting as many students as possible through degree examinations. More than this, under the circumstances, it would perhaps have been unreasonable to expect.

123. At Rajshahi there is a Government college, with 779 students, of whom 307 are in the degree stage. Being a Government college, its staff enjoys a reasonable rate of pay. The average salary actually paid is Rs. 212 *per mensem ;* the highest actual salary is Rs. 500, but the teachers have a prospect of increments to a maximum, in the case of the chief teachers, of Rs. 700 ; all, moreover, have the certainty of a pension. As a Government college, also, it is not permitted to accept more than a certain number of students. It has one teacher to every 28 students. This is too low for a self-contained college which has to depend wholly on its own resources, but it is better than the normal rate in private colleges. Rajshahi gives its name to the Rajshahi division,[1] which includes the whole of the vast area of Northern Bengal—the area north of the main Ganges stream. Until 1917 this was the only first-grade college in Northern Bengal, for this region has scarcely yet been touched by the eagerness for higher education which captured first Western and then Eastern Bengal. Its turn is certainly coming.

124. Northern Bengal is in some ways a very distinctive country, and has had a different history from the deltaic region

[1] The actual centre of administration is at Jalpaiguri.

which lies to the south of it : it is significant that the Brahmans of North Bengal do not intermarry with those of the south. This region was the ancient kingdom of Varendra ; by reason of its geographical position it was more intimately affected than the rest of the country by the conquering dynasties which ruled ancient India from Patna. Its soil is therefore richer in historical remains and inscriptions than the southern country. For these reasons there has grown up at Rajshahi an enthusiasm for antiquarian research, represented by the admirable work of the Varendra Research Society[1] with its excellent museum of local antiquities to which we have found no parallel in any other part of Bengal, outside Calcutta. In Rajshahi it was refreshing to find evidence of the existence of genuine intellectual interests quite independent of the business of examination-coaching. We were greatly impressed by the influence of this work upon the teachers of the college, some of whom have taken a distinguished share in it. We seemed to perceive in much of the teaching, not only in history but in several other subjects, a vitality which was lacking elsewhere ; there is in Rajshahi something of the genuine university spirit, though it needs to be fostered and strengthened in many ways. It is no doubt a sense of this which has led so many of our correspondents[2] to advocate the institution of a separate university at Rajshahi, to serve for Northern Bengal, and this is reinforced by the fact that, as has been already noted, the Rajshahi College has been supported by benefaction and by local patriotism to an extent without parallel, until yesterday, in any other part of Bengal.

125. Unfortunately the Rajshahi College suffers from the restricted area of its site, and from the difficulty of finding suitable residential accommodation. It suffers still more from the inadequacy of its communications, and from the fact that it lies on the extreme southern verge of the great area which it has to serve. It is miles from a railway ; and although it has the advantage of river communication, this links it rather with Eastern Bengal on the one hand and Bihar on the other, than with the wide

[1] We are glad to seize this opportunity of noting the work done by Mr. Akshaykumar Maitra, the organiser of this Society. He has rendered real service, not only to learning, but to the intellectual life of his district.

[2] No less than 55 : Rajshahi is named more often than any other place (except of course Dacca) as a possible site for a university.

expanses of Northern Bengal. Moreover, the river is a fickle friend : when we visited the college, the river was eating away the ground at an alarming rate, and threatening to devour the already limited college compound.

126. At a considerable distance to the north of Rajshahi, at a point which is connected by railway communications with all parts of Northern Bengal, a new first-grade college has just been opened (July 1917) in the district of Rangpur. When we visited it, its buildings were unfinished, its first classes were being held in a borrowed building, and its principal had but just taken up his work ; but already it is obvious that Rangpur must take its place in the first rank of mufassal colleges. The new college starts under the most favourable auspices. Mainly through the activity of the Collector of the district, Mr. J. N. Gupta,[1] an initial endowment of no less than four lakhs has been raised by local subscription ; this considerably exceeds the endowments raised at Rajshahi, and far surpasses those locally raised for higher education in any other part of the mufassal. These funds have been devoted to the acquisition of a spacious, open and healthy site, and to the erection of an impressive series of buildings, including hostels for the accommodation of a large number of students. No college in Bengal has yet begun its career in an abode so spacious or so largely-planned. Moreover, the neighbourhood is comparatively healthy, and there are interesting experimental farms close at hand ; this will facilitate the policy of adding agricultural and industrial sides to the work of the college, which is one of the most interesting features of the programme of its governing body. It remains to be seen whether Rajshahi with its traditions, or Rangpur with its excellent material equipment and its convenient communications, will be the more successful in turning itself into the centre of intellectual life which Northern Bengal needs. But the natural comment of the observer is that it will be a pity if the very different characteristics and resources of these two places cannot somehow be conjoined.

127. Among the smaller mufassal colleges there are some which present features of special interest. Serampore, though it has only 240 students, of whom only 80 are in the degree stage, is,

[1] See Mr. Gupta's book *Rangpur To-day*, in which there is an account of the organisation of the college.

next to Presidency College, the oldest college of western education in Bengal. It enshrines the great memory of William Carey, and his colleagues Marshman and Ward. It is in the unique position of possessing a royal charter, granted by the King of Denmark, empowering it to grant degrees,[1] so that it is already a university if it chooses to use its powers. It has a fine and dignified building, beautifully situated on the margin of the great river, and looking across to the lawns and trees of Barrackpore. It has developed the collegiate organisation of its students, and supervises the conditions of their residence, more efficiently than any other college save St. Paul's. It has a theological department which draws Christian students from all parts of India. Its small numbers are due partly to the fact that for a long time it ceased to hold degree classes and has only recently recommenced them, and partly to the fact that it refuses to accept a larger number of students than it can deal with adequately : it has one teacher to every 12·5 students, a proportion higher than that which exists in any other college in Bengal. When we visited Serampore we felt that, in regard to its traditions, its atmosphere, and the relations which seemed to subsist between teachers and students, it had succeeded in capturing, to an extent rare in Bengal, the spirit of university work.

128. At the Victoria College, Cooch Behar, which is maintained by the Maharajah, we heard some of the best lectures which we have heard anywhere in Bengal. The college has had some distinguished teachers in the past, including Mr. de la Fosse and Dr. Brajendranath Seal ; and they have left a good tradition behind them. The buildings of this college, moreover, are of a very attractive simplicity. The college has just over 400 students, of whom only 112 are in the degree stage. Originally founded to satisfy the needs of the State, the college is, in fact, mainly filled with students from various parts of Bengal, nearly every district of which is represented by at least one or two students : less than one-third of the students come from Cooch Behar itself.

129. Another college which created a very favourable impression upon those of our number who visited it was the Wesleyan

[1] By an arrangement embodied in the Serampore College Act, 1918—Bengal Act IV of 1918—these powers are to be used for the conferment of theological degrees, but the college undertakes not to grant other degrees without the consent of Government.

Mission College, Bankura. Planted in a healthy district, in the uplands of the extreme west, it has ample room for games of all sorts ; and we felt that there was an air of vitality and of real zeal for their work among the leading teachers of the college ; we felt also that they had a real interest in the purpose and results of their teaching, and a desire that it should be turned to practical ends. The college can serve, and is serving, a very valuable function in the education of its district, especially as it is in close contact with the neighbouring schools. It has only fourteen teachers, three of them English missionaries; and the average salary paid to its Indian teachers (Rs. 114) is too low to attract men capable of doing the highest work. Its most useful work will probably lie in giving a richer and deeper training, especially in science, to students of the intermediate grade, to which three out of four of its students belong.

130. The two Government colleges in the mufassal of Western Bengal, those of Hooghly and Krishnagar, have many features in common. They are about the same size. They have interesting traditions, being among the oldest colleges in Bengal. They have old libraries, containing some collections of value, but in neither case has the library been adequately kept up to date. Both colleges have the advantage of being in the neighbourhood of comparatively good high schools, a fact which would be of great assistance if the university system permitted colleges of this type to give special attention to the training of teachers. But both have a marked preponderance of students of the intermediate stage ; and both find a difficulty in keeping degree classes going on any adequate scale. It has been urged that this difficulty might be met by increasing the range of affiliation. But the experiment was recently tried, with disappointing results. The number of degree students at Hooghly was in 1917 only 74, and at Krishnagar only 51. The maintenance of degree classes for such small numbers is exceedingly expensive ; and it is impossible under present conditions to offer to the students the range and variety of training which ought to be placed within their reach. It would be still more expensive if the intermediate classes were separately dealt with. Krishnagar College is distinguished by the possession of the most beautiful collegiate building in Bengal, and by the possession of abundant space for playing fields or for expansion. But it stands in one

of the most malarious districts of the country. Hooghly College is housed in an attractive though inadequate building formerly a private house, and it has little room for expansion. Its most interesting feature is its special connexion with the Musalmans of Western Bengal. It was established originally out of the Mohsin Fund; and a madrassah is still conducted in its building. This connexion might well be cultivated and extended.

131. The Hindu Academy at Daulatpur, in the district of Khulna, is in some ways one of the most interesting of the Bengal colleges. For one thing it is, with the exception of Rangpur, the only college in Bengal which has not sprung from a school. For another, it is located, not in a little town, but near a small village, amid trees and meadows, by the side of a tidal river. The main features of this college are two. In the first place, it has attempted, as no other Indian college in Bengal has done, to create a religious atmosphere; it has a Hindu temple in its grounds. In the second place, it has struck out a new line in the matter of students' residence. It is worth while to quote the description of the system printed by Dr. P. K. Ray and Mr. G. C. Bose in their inspection report to the University (1916).

"It is practically a residential college, in which 300 out of a total of 500 students[1] are in residence along with all the professors, including the principal. The residential quarters are in detached blocks .... No block [except one built out of a Government grant] accommodates more than twelve to twenty boarders, so that disturbance in study .... is reduced to a minimum ..... The unpretending little blocks of thatched and tiled huts have the advantage of placing the students in environments from which they have mostly come, and to which perhaps most of them will have to go back after leaving the college. .... The cost of living in the college thus works out to a figure which is well within the means of all excepting the hopelessly indigent."

The merit of this experiment is that it is an attempt to create a real organic community, and a community with a definitely Indian character of its own. At the same time, the idea has not been quite logically carried out: no less than 137 students live with 'guardians;' and it may be doubted whether, in so small a place, so large a proportion of students can be living with *bonâ fide* guardians. Nor did we find any material difference between the type of instruction given in this college, and that given in

[1] In 1917, according to the return made to us by the college, 254 out of 489.

other colleges. Another unfortunate feature is that the average salary paid to the teaching staff is Rs. 89 *per mensem*. This low salary scale—two colleges, both second-grade, sink lower—is not due to poverty; for the college receives a substantial grant from Government, and had a credit balance of Rs. 13,000 in 1915. It may in part, perhaps, be due to religious enthusiasm among the teachers. But it must be difficult for work of a genuine university type to be carried on under such conditions. And, in fact, the Daulatpur Academy is mainly engaged in higher school work: only 99 of its 489 students are in the post-intermediate stage; for the higher work most of them seem to go elsewhere.

132. There remain four colleges in Eastern Bengal, one of which, Comilla, has been promoted to the first-grade since our enquiry commenced. Chittagong is a modest Government college of 328 students, of whom less than one-third are post-intermediate students. It serves the needs of a remote and isolated district, largely different in racial character from the rest of Bengal; and is situated in a town which has hopes of developing into a great port. For these reasons it may in the future become an important centre; but its importance is potential, not actual; and though its staff includes some able men, it cannot at present claim to be seriously regarded as an institution of university rank. The three colleges at Mymensingh, Comilla and Barisal owe their existence to that remarkable demand for collegiate education in Eastern Bengal which has grown to such amazing dimensions during the last twenty years. The best of the three is Mymensingh, the most interesting feature of whose work is the attempt made to organise, outside of the formal classes, discussion groups among the students. But the quality of the work done in these colleges is not such as to call for special notice; it is, especially in Barisal and Comilla, below rather than above the average. The hostel accommodation at Mymensingh, though inadequate in amount, is well organised. But the outstanding feature of all these colleges, including Chittagong, is that they make very inadequate provision for the social needs of the students; and those of us who visited these centres were painfully struck by the morally and physically unhealthy conditions in which many of the students live. These four colleges have, among them, 2,169 students. Less than one-fifth of these live with their parents. The four colleges, taken together, provide accommodation in hostels or attached messes for only 332 of them.

The remainder, about 1,400 in number, live with 'guardians.' What, under these conditions, 'guardianship' means in the majority of cases will be made plain in our chapter on the conditions of student life.[1] It is enough here to say that these conditions are in very many cases not only hostile to anything that can be called real university work, but morally dangerous. There is no part of the university system of Bengal, not even in Calcutta, where the problem of students' residence is more acute than it is in these colleges of Eastern Bengal.

Khulna, Bengal
Rangpur,
a school.
near a sma
tidal river.
the first pla
Bengal has
Hindu temp
out a new lin
while to quote
Ray and Mr. G.
versity (1916).

The terms of our reference do not require us to report colleges of the Calcutta University which lie beyond of the Presidency of Bengal. We have found it im- visit the two colleges at Rangoon, or the Murarichand h serves the Sylhet district of Assam. But some of he great pleasure of a visit to the Cotton College, ch is maintained by the Government of Assam; and ostain from some reference of it. It stands in a situation uty, amid wooded hills, looking out across the broad rahmaputra, which provides easy and cheap communi- whole of the Assamese valley. It is a small college, idents, of whom 249 are post-intermediate, but no hese live in some of the most charming single-storey s which we have anywhere seen. It has an excellent qualified and well-paid : the average salary (excluding pal) being Rs. 296 *per mensem*, and the proportion of ers to students one to fifteen. In its buildings, the frequency of earthquake in this region has dictated a bungalow style which is at once simple and appropriate. It has good science laboratories, and a library which, though not large, is better organised, and better used by the students, than any but two or three of the many which we have visited. It serves the needs of a distinctive population, with a language, a literature and a history of their own which are well worth study; and just behind it lies the fascinating region of the Khasia Hills. We have visited few, if any, colleges during our travels where a student who did not require quite exceptional facilities could spend more healthily or happily the period of his undergraduate course. One of the points which interested us at Gauhati was that the authorities of the

"It is practica
500 students[1] ar
principal. The
[except one
twelve te
to

[1] Chapter XIX.

college were contemplating a quite separate organisation for their intermediate classes, on the ground that students at this stage need special treatment. Small as the college is to-day, we see no reason why, with due encouragement, and under proper supervision, it should not develope into a real centre of culture and learning. And in view of the excellent provision which it makes for the needs of Assamese students, it puzzles us that so many Assamese boys—no less than 564 in 1917—should pass by this college in order to enter the crowded colleges of Calcutta or some of the ill-organised colleges of the Bengal mufassal.

134. We have now surveyed at some length the present condition and work of the arts colleges of Bengal. We have found many things to condemn, above all the system which dominates and shackles them all. But in many colleges, great and small, rich and poor, Government, private or missionary, we have found aspirations and endeavours after a fuller and fairer chance for the crowds of bright boys who pour through their gates. Is it possible to devise a new system which will get rid of the rigidity of the old, which will incorporate, diffuse and extend all the good features that have been worked out, often incompletely, by the hard-pressed teachers of these colleges, which will give them freedom to work out all their ideals, and to develope their distinctive characteristics, and all this without lowering, but rather raising, the intellectual standard of education in Bengal? That is the problem which our survey sets to us; and which we must try to resolve in a later section of our report.

CALCUTTA
SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA
8 HASTINGS STREET

Publications of the Bureau of Education, India.

Quinquennial Reviews.

Progress of Education in India, 1892-93 to 1896-97. Third Quinquennial Review. By J. S. Cotton. R3.

Progress of Education in India, 1897-98 to 1901-02. Fourth Quinquennial Review. By R. Nathan, C.I.E., 2 Vols. R7.

Progress of Education in India, 1902-07. Fifth Quinquennial Review. By H. W. Orange, C.I.E., 2 Vols. R5-8.

Progress of Education in India, 1907-12. Sixth Quinquennial Review. By H. Sharp, C.I.E., Vol. I, R4; Vol. II, R2.

Progress of Education in India, 1912-17. Seventh Quinquennial Review. By H. Sharp, C.S.I., C.I.E., Vol. I, R3-10; Vol. II, R2.

Reports.

Report on the Conference on the Education of the Domiciled Community in India, July 1912. R1.

Report on the enquiry to bring Technical Institutions into closer touch and more practical relations with the Employers of Labour in India. By Lieutenant-Colonel E. H. deV. Atkinson, R.E., and T. S. Dawson. As. 10.

Papers regarding the Educational Conference, Allahabad, February 1911. R1-8.

The Essentials of a University in a Great Centre of Population.

Occasional Reports.

No. 1. Rural Schools in the Central Provinces. By H. Sharp. R1.

No. 2. Vernacular Reading Books in the Bombay Presidency. By J. G. Covernton. (*Out of print.*)

No. 3. The Educational System of Japan. By W. H. Sharp. (*Out of print.*)

No. 4. Furlough Studies By J. Nelson Fraser, H. Sharp and G. W. Kūchler. R2.

No. 5. Training of Secondary Teachers. By H. R. James, H. Sharp and J. Nelson Fraser. As. 8.

No. 6. Educational Buildings in India. R5.

No. 7. Methods of School Inspection in England. By H. G. Wyatt. As. 8.

No. 8. The Training of Teachers. By H. S. Duncan and A. H. Mackenzie. As. 8.

Annual Narratives.

Indian Education in 1913-14. R1-8.

Indian Education in 1914-15. R2.

Indian Education in 1915-16. As. 8.

Indian Education in 1917-18. As. 12.

Bureau of Education Pamphlets.

No. 1. Drawing and Manual Training in Punjab Schools. By J. Y. Buchanan. As. 8.

No. 2. Education of Factory Children in India. As. 6.

No. 3. Extracts from the Report of the Committee appointed by the Prime Minister to enquire into the position of Natural Science in the Educational System of Great Britain. As. 4.

No. 4. Extracts from the Report of the Commissioner of Education, Washington, 1916. regarding Vocational Education. As. 3.

No. 5. Notes on Vernacular Education in Ceylon. By H. Sharp, C.S.I., C.I.E. As. 12.