The Year's Work in English Studies

VOLUME XXXVI · 1955

Edited by

BEATRICE WHITE
D.Lit., F S A ,F R Hist.S , F.R S.L

Published for
THE ENGLISH ASSOCIATION
by the
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
LONDON
1957

UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY
OU_172859
UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY

OUP—552—7-7-66—10,000

OSMANIA UNIVERSITY LIBRARY

Call No. Accession No.

Author

Title

This book should be returned on or before the date last marked below.

THE YEAR'S WORK IN ENGLISH STUDIES

VOLUME XXXVI

1955

EDITED BY
BEATRICE WHITE
D LIT, F S A, F R HIST S. F R S L.

Published for
THE ENGLISH ASSOCIATION
by
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
LONDON
1957

Oxford University Press, Amen House, London E C 4

GLASGOW NEW YORK TORONTO MELBOURNE WELLINGTON
BOMBAY CALCUTTA MADRAS KARACHI KUALA LUMPUR
CAPE TOWN IBADAN NAIROBI ACCRA

PRINTED IN GREAT BRITAIN

PREFACE

THE *Year's Work in English Studies* welcomes two new contributors, Dr Randolph Quirk, who provides the chapter on *Linguistics*, and Dr George Thomas, who succeeds a valuable supporter, Dr W Armstrong, prevented by pressure of work from continuing the chapter on the *Renaissance*

For the first time in its history the *Year's Work* has been edited in America The chapter on *Bibliographica* was not received in time for publication, and the editor has, reluctantly, to allow the present volume to appear without it

Book prices are stated wherever possible

BEATRICE WHITE,
Connecticut College,
New London, Conn

1957

ABBREVIATIONS

AL	American Literature
AQ	American Quarterly
AS	American Speech
Ang	Anglia
A	Archiv fur das Studium der Neueren Sprachen
A Ling	Archivum Linguisticum
BC	The Book Collector
BJRL	Bulletin of the John Rylands Library
BM	British Museum
BMQ	British Museum Quarterly
CL	Comparative Literature
DUJ	Durham University Journal
E E T S	Early English Text Society
EC	Essays in Criticism
EGS	English and Germanic Studies
EJ	English Journal
ELH	Journal of English Literary History
ES	English Studies
E & S	Essays and Studies
Ea	Études anglaises
HLB	Harvard Library Bulletin
HLQ	Huntington Library Quarterly
JEGP	Journal of English and Germanic Philology
JHI	Journal of the History of Ideas
JWCI	Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes
L	Language
MÆ	Medium Ævum
MLN	Modern Language Notes
MLQ	Modern Language Quarterly
MLR	Modern Language Review
MP	Modern Philology
N	Neophilologus
NM	Neuphilologische Mitteilungen
NEQ	New England Quarterly
NCF	Nineteenth Century Fiction
NQ	Notes and Queries
PQ	Philological Quarterly
PBSA	Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America
PBA	Proceedings of the British Academy
PMLA	Publications of the Modern Language Association of America
RN	Renaissance News
RES	Review of English Studies
R S L	Royal Society of Literature
Sh J	Shakespeare Jahrbuch
SNL	Shakespeare Newsletter
Sh Q	Shakespeare Quarterly

ABBREVIATIONS

Sh S	Shakespeare Survey
S T C	Short Title Catalogue
S	Speculum
SN	Studia Neophilologica
SB	Studies in Bibliography
SE	Studies in English
SP	Studies in Philology
TLS	Times Literary Supplement
TPS	Transactions of the Philological Society
UTQ	University of Toronto Quarterly
YDS	Transactions of the Yorkshire Dialect Society
YW	The Year's Work in English Studies

CONTENTS

I LITERARY HISTORY AND CRITICISM GENERAL WORKS 9

By T S DORSCH, M A , Lecturer in English Literature in the University of London (Westfield College)

II LINGUISTICS 27

By RANDOLPH QUIRK, M A , PH D , Reader in English in the University of Durham

III ENGLISH LANGUAGE 44

By R M WILSON, M A , Professor of English Language in the University of Sheffield

IV OLD ENGLISH LITERATURE 56

By R M WILSON

V MIDDLE ENGLISH, EXCLUDING CHAUCER 65

By B J TIMMER, PH D , Reader in English Language in the University of London (Queen Mary College)

VI MIDDLE ENGLISH CHAUCER 76

By JOYCE BAZIRE, M A , Lecturer in English Language in the University of Liverpool

VII THE RENAISSANCE 89

By R GEORGE THOMAS, M A , PH D , Senior Lecturer in English Language and Literature in the University College of South Wales and Monmouthshire, Cardiff

VIII SHAKESPEARE 99

By T S DORSCH

IX. LATER ELIZABETHAN AND EARLY STUART DRAMA 124

By ARTHUR BROWN, M A , Reader in English in the University of London (University College)

X LATER TUDOR PERIOD, EXCLUDING DRAMA 138

By ARNOLD DAVENPORT, M A , Andrew Cecil Bradley Senior Lecturer in English in the University of Liverpool

XI EARLIER STUART AND THE COMMONWEALTH PERIOD, EXCLUDING DRAMA 149

By ARNOLD DAVENPORT

XII RESTORATION PERIOD 166
By V DE SOLA PINTO, M A, D PHIL, F R S L, Professor of English Literature in the University of Nottingham

XIII THE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY 176
By EDITH J MORLEY, O B E, M A, F R S L, Emeritus Professor of English Language in the University of Reading

XIV. THE NINETEENTH CENTURY 190
(a) BOOKS, by GEOFFREY BULLOUGH, M A, F R S L, Professor of English Language and Literature in the University of London (King's College)
(b) PERIODICALS, by P M YARKER, M A, Lecturer in English Literature in the University of London (King's College) 205

XV THE TWENTIETH CENTURY 218
By MARJORIE THOMPSON, M A, Lecturer in English Literature in the University of London (Queen Mary College)

XVI AMERICAN LITERATURE 227
By MARCUS CUNLIFFE, M A, Senior Lecturer in American Studies in the University of Manchester

INDEXES
I AUTHORS 243
II AUTHORS TREATED 250
By P M YARKER
III SUBJECTS TREATED 252

I. LITERARY HISTORY AND CRITICISM: GENERAL WORKS

By T S DORSCH

1 *Reference-Works and Histories of Literature*

THE *Dictionary of World Literary Terms*,[1] edited by Joseph T Shipley, appears for the first time in England in a revised edition in which articles on non-literary subjects—dance, puppetry, and the like—have been omitted, and some new material supplied in their place The articles are presented alphabetically, from 'absey' to 'zeugma', and vary in length from a few lines to twenty pages or so Within its stated limits ('Criticism—Forms—Techniques'), the volume appears to be remarkably complete, and may be confidently consulted by anyone who finds his reading slowed down by such terms as 'gair cyrch', or 'exargasia', or 'synexeugmenon' Indeed, it should prove a useful reference-work not only for its clear definitions of all the terms of criticism, prosody, rhetoric, and other technical studies that come within its range, but also for its more general articles on such topics as pastoral, folk-tale, or symbolism

The second volume of the Penguin Guide to English Literature[2] is given more detailed treatment in Chapters VII and VIII Following much the same plan as the earlier volume, except that no anthology is provided, it opens with two essays by L G Salingar on the social setting and the Elizabethan literary renaissance Derek Traversi, J C Maxwell, L C Knights, and Kenneth Muir contribute essays on Shakespeare, which are noticed in Chapter VIII Among Shakespeare's contemporaries in the drama who are discussed at some length are Marlowe, Jonson, Chapman, Tourneur, and Middleton, and others figure in general essays on the comedy and tragedy of the period Other articles and their contributors are as follows *Elizabethan Light Reading*, by Ian Watt, *Two Elizabethan Poets Daniel and Ralegh*, by Peter Ure, *The Elizabethan Stage and Acting*, by Bertram Joseph, *Bacon and the Advancement of Learning*, by Theodore Redpath, and *Words and Music in Elizabethan England*, by Wilfrid Mellers Margaret Tubb provides a useful reading-list and short biographical notes The volume as a whole is much more satisfactory than its predecessor, at any rate as criticism, in that the ground is covered more fully and the articles are more scholarly

The final volume of A C Ward's *Illustrated History of English Literature*[3] opens with Blake and brings the story down to modern times Ward seems more thoroughly at home with the Romantics and Victorians than with the writers of earlier periods that he dealt with in the first two volumes, and communicates to the reader his enjoyment in writing about them The minor figures receive generous and balanced treatment, and the inclusiveness of his choice to some extent

[1] *Dictionary of World Literary Terms Criticism—Forms—Techniques*, ed by Joseph T Shipley Allen & Unwin pp xiii+453 30*s*

[2] *The Age of Shakespeare Volume 2 of Guide to English Literature*, ed by Boris Ford Penguin Books pp 480 5*s*

[3] *Illustrated History of English Literature Volume Three Blake to Bernard Shaw*, by A C Ward. Longmans pp xi+325 25*s*

compensates a certain one-sidedness in his approach to a few of the major authors, Wordsworth, for instance As in the earlier volumes, the illustrations have been admirably selected by Elizabeth Williams

A new edition of Edward Albert's *History of English Literature*[4] has come out, revised and brought up to date by J A Stone, with some assistance from Kenneth Cameron This is a handy and on the whole reliable outline history, perhaps suited rather to the needs of sixth forms than of more advanced students

Thomas Parry's history of Welsh literature from its beginnings in the sixth century until 1900 was published in Welsh in 1944 With some slight revision by the author, it now appears in an English translation[5] by Sir H Idris Bell For the benefit of 'foreigners' the translator has inserted footnotes on technical terms and Welsh names and allusions, and some appendixes chiefly devoted to poetic forms and metrical structures Bell has also contributed a long and interesting chapter on the remarkable Welsh literary renaissance of the present century

The fourth volume of Allardyce Nicoll's *History of English Drama*,[6] covering the first half of the nineteenth century, is fully noticed in Chapter XIV, and can receive only a passing mention here Like the previous volumes, it contains chapters on the theatres and the dramatic conditions of the age as well as on the drama itself More than half the volume is devoted to a valuable handlist of plays

John Gassner's *Masters of the Drama*,[7] first published in 1940, has been revised and much enlarged for a new edition, and now includes a comprehensive chapter on 'the post World War II drama' The work is a study of 'the drama from primitive times to the half-way mark of the present century' —from Aeschylus to Arthur Miller, and virtually every considerable playwright, of the Eastern as well as the Western world, receives some treatment, and often extended and detailed treatment

From William Smith Clark comes a work on the early Irish stage[8] which traces the development of the theatrical art in Ireland from the primitive staging of the early folk and Biblical plays to the comparative sophistication of the Dublin theatres at the beginning of the eighteenth century It is especially interesting, and detailed, on the work of the Smock Alley Theatre in the first two decades of that century, when it was under the management of an outstanding actor and director, Joseph Ashbury Clark describes playhouse methods and customs as they grew and changed with the years, and tells many anecdotes about actors and performances, and he provides an excellent bibliography, and some useful appendixes which list the plays acted in the Dublin theatres between 1637 and 1720, and the leading actors and actresses of the same period

An excellent history of Scottish poetry[9] has appeared under the editorship of James Kinsley It takes the form of ten essays, by different

[4] *A History of English Literature*, by Edward Albert Third edition, revised by J A Stone Harrap pp 624 10*s* 6*d*

[5] *A History of Welsh Literature*, by Thomas Parry Transl from the Welsh by H Idris Bell O U P pp xii+534 50*s*

[6] *A History of English Drama, 1660–1900 Vol IV Early Nineteenth Century Drama, 1800–1850*, by Allardyce Nicoll C U P pp x+668 55*s*

[7] *Masters of the Drama*, by John Gassner (Revised and Enlarged Edition) New York Dover Publications London Mayflower, 1954 pp xxi+890 $5 95 48*s*

[8] *The Early Irish Stage The Beginnings to 1720*, by William Smith Clark O U P pp xi+227 30*s*

[9] *Scottish Poetry A Critical Survey*, ed by James Kinsley Cassell pp ix+330 30*s*

authors, which carry the story through from the medieval makers to the poets of today The earlier periods, embracing the medieval and Renaissance poets and including the Ballads, are treated in a particularly interesting manner, by Kinsley himself, Agnes Mure Mackenzie, and Sir James Fergusson To say this is not to imply any deficiency in the later essays, the preference may be partly due to a common English partiality for the Scottish 'Chaucerians' and the Ballads even when the later poets, apart from Burns and perhaps Allan Ramsey, do not rouse any enthusiasm Indeed, the volume as a whole makes very good reading, as well as being comprehensive and thoroughgoing as criticism

2 *General Criticism and Collections of Critical Essays*

In *The Fire and the Fountain*[10] John Press makes an interesting study of the 'poetic process', the germination and growth of a poem in the poet's mind Examining the utterances of many poets who have spoken of some form of *inspiration* as the starting-point for their poems—a divine gift, a fire, a fine madness, and the like—he finds it 'clear that inspiration plays a part in the creation of poetry', and tries to establish the nature of poetic inspiration He goes on to speak of the characteristics which mark a man as a true poet, prime among which he places a high degree both of organic and of animal sensibility, or sensuality In later chapters he aims at showing 'how the poet's sensibility is controlled by the shaping spirit of imagination, and how, by his mastery of language, the conflicting emotions, ideas, memories, and sense impressions that are the elements of poetry are finally resolved and reconciled in the imaginative order of the completed poem' To this end he discusses the various stimuli (and stimulants) which various poets have regarded as aids to composition, the analogy between music and poetry, the relative power of the sound and the associations of words, and the nature of poetic imagery, and after a short excursus on the fallacious methods of the Marxist literary critics, he speaks of the means by which the poet 'imposes a formal pattern upon the rhythms and images that surge through his mind' With the help of copious illustration and analysis, Press avoids the pitfalls of an abstract and merely theoretical approach, and though some of his conclusions are hard to accept, his work is valuable in that it compels us to re-examine many of our own beliefs about the nature of poetry

Though its findings are based chiefly upon the work of modern French poets, *The Situation of Poetry*,[11] which consists of four essays by Jacques and Raissa Maritain, will probably, like Press's book, appeal to anyone who is interested in the processes of poetic creation In the first essay Raissa Maritain draws a distinction between the *poetic sense*, which is what gives poetry 'a substantial signification, an ontological sense', and *logical sense*, which, though it seems to be extrinsic to poetry as such, always to some degree accompanies the poetic work She goes on, in this and the next essay, to illustrate ways in which intelligibility is made to predominate over potential obscurity of various types, and to discuss the relationship between poetry and the intangible experiences which are often classified as magic or mystical experiences The last two essays are by Jacques Maritain In

[10] *The Fire and the Fountain An Essay on Poetry*, by John Press O U P pp ix+ 256 25*s*

[11] *The Situation of Poetry Four Essays on the Relations between Poetry, Mysticism, Magic, and Knowledge*, by Jacques and Raissa Maritain New York Philosophical Library pp x+85 $2 75

the former he concludes that poetry is 'knowledge, incomparably knowledge-experience and knowledge-emotion, existential knowledge, knowledge which is the germ of a work (and which does not know itself, and which is not *for* knowing)' In the final essay, considering the 'poetic experience', he sets out to show that 'what is *most immediate* in it is the experience of the things of the world but what is *most principal* is the experiencing of the subject—because it is in a knowledge of the self, however obscure, that that productive vitality is actuated in which emotion becomes intentional and sees'

The Burning Fountain,[12] by Philip Wheelwright, is a penetrating analysis of 'the nature of expressive language, more specifically, the semantic characteristics which enable the language of religion and myth and poetry, at their best, to speak in a way that truly "mounts to the dwelling-place of the gods", and testifies to the reality of that dwelling' This is necessarily a somewhat abstract topic, but Wheelwright defines his terms with great clarity and with abundant illustration, and avoids the pitfalls of facile generalization His sections on the nature, and types, of metaphor and of the poetic imagination, and on the image-patterns of Shakespeare, are especially stimulating In defining various kinds of symbolic language and symbolic pattern, Wheelwright ranges widely over the fields of ancient myth and ritual, and draws his examples from several literatures Two chapters are devoted to thematic patterns in the *Oedipus Tyrannus* of Sophocles and the *Oresteia* of Aeschylus, and the book ends with a study of symbolic meanings in Eliot's *Waste Land* and *Four Quartets*

'There have been enough studies of symbolist poets and symbolist poetry to make another unnecessary, but although the symbolist novel is one of the outstanding forms of our time, it has received comparatively little notice' These words are taken from *The Literary Symbol*,[13] by William York Tindall, and in his attempt to determine the function and effect of the symbol in literary creation, Tindall deals for the most part with modern novels 'The literary symbol,' he says, 'an analogy for something unstated, consists of an articulation of verbal elements that, going beyond reference and the limits of discourse, embodies and offers a complex of feeling and thought Not necessarily an image, this analogical embodiment may also be a rhythm, a juxtaposition, an action, a proposition, a structure, or a poem' He explains and develops this definition, and differentiates other kinds of analogy, such as those represented by metaphor and allegory Symbol, as we know it today, he sees emerging in the romantic period, and he illustrates its use in the Victorian novel, in the 'London Particular' of *Bleak House*, for example, or the desolate heath in *The Return of the Native* The greater part of the book, however, is devoted to more recent novelists, and Tindall offers some perceptive analyses of the symbolism that is so important in the writings of, among others, Joyce, Proust, Kafka, Virginia Woolf, and Henry Green

Much of Hans Meyerhoff's *Time in Literature*[14] consists of philosophical speculation on the nature of time which has little direct bearing on literary activity However, there are senses in which literature is a 'temporal art',

[12] *The Burning Fountain A Study in the Language of Symbolism*, by Philip Wheelwright Indiana U P pp ix+406 $6

[13] *The Literary Symbol*, by William York Tindall Columbia U P and O U P pp ix+278 36*s*

[14] *Time in Literature*, by Hans Meyerhoff Univ of California Press and C U P pp xiv+160 26*s*

for, in the words of Thomas Mann, 'time is the medium of narration, as it is the medium of life' Moreover, if art is to hold up a mirror to human nature, and if in modern times man has become increasingly conscious of 'the pervasive and precarious nature of time', as Meyerhoff contends, this consciousness is bound to be increasingly reflected in literary works Meyerhoff sees it most clearly and effectively reflected in such developments as the stream of consciousness technique, the interior monologue, the application of ancient myths to modern situations, and the not uncommon preoccupation of writers with sleep, dreams, and fantasies Among the authors from whom Meyerhoff illustrates his study are Proust, Joyce, Virginia Woolf, and Scott Fitzgerald, and though his analyses are necessarily, and designedly, limited in scope, they add to our understanding of the intentions of these authors and the form of their works

W B Stanford's *The Ulysses Theme*[15] is an attempt to account for the different ways in which Ulysses has, since Homer first presented him, been re-created as a literary figure After a detailed study of Homer's Ulysses, Stanford shows a process of denigration at work in the writings of later Greek authors, and illustrates the various attitudes towards him displayed by Virgil, Ovid, Seneca, Statius, and other Roman poets The late medieval and Renaissance treatment was strongly coloured by the 'anti-Ulyssean' spirit of Benoît de Sainte Maure's *Roman de Troie* (*c* 1160), though 'in the later part of that period, the revival of interest in Greek studies removed the accumulated load of Latin and Frankish odium from Ulysses' Stanford shows how successfully Shakespeare achieved a balance between the two traditions In the later chapters he analyses many modern European versions of the Ulysses myth, of greatest relevance and interest to students of English literature are his discussions of the versions of Tennyson and James Joyce

The publication of *On Modern Literature*,[16] a new collection of critical studies by W P Ker, is something of an event The papers here brought together by Terence Spencer and James Sutherland, who also provide an introductory appraisal of Ker as a critic, were selected partly from unpublished manuscripts, and partly from verbatim reports of lectures which Ker delivered at University College, London, and which he presumably intended to revise for the press The first half of the volume is devoted to writers of the seventeenth, eighteenth, and nineteenth centuries, and Ker shows himself as much at home with Butler as with Wordsworth, with Dryden as with Keats, with Burke and Burns as with Trollope One does not have to be reminded of *Epic and Romance*, *The Dark Ages*, and *English Literature Medieval* to discover the breadth of his reading, it is continually revealed in his judgements and his analogies, and his constant awareness of tradition and background adds both depth and interest to his criticism His range and versatility are shown again when, in the later papers, he discourses upon more general topics, such as changing conventions in criticism, or the nature of comedy Whatever his subject, he is always extremely readable 'His aim was to talk pleasantly and instructively about literature As a man

[15] *The Ulysses Theme A Study in the Adaptability of a Traditional Hero*, by W B Stanford Blackwell, 1954 pp. x+292 31*s* 6*d*

[16] *On Modern Literature Lectures and Addresses by W P Ker*, ed by Terence Spencer and James Sutherland O U P pp xviii+282 35*s*

and a scholar he was far from being indifferent or neutral, but he rarely allowed his feelings to impair the steadiness of his vision '

Nineteen former students have contributed to a *Festschrift*[17] published as a tribute to Walter Clyde Curry upon his retirement after forty years in the English department of Vanderbilt University, the last twelve years as its head Hardin Craig provides a Foreword on Curry's work in English scholarship, and John W Stevenson a Bibliography of his published writings Six essays on Chaucer and his followers, five on Shakespeare, and five on Milton, are noticed in the relevant chapters of the present volume In addition, Eva Touster discusses some phonological aspects of the metre of *Beowulf*, Rayburn S Moore writes on Jonson's use of the courtly love convention in *The New Inn*, and Kelsie B Harder sets out to show that Nashe was more critical of Spenser than some of his eulogistic comments might suggest

The essays which C M Bowra has gathered together under the title *Inspiration and Poetry*[18] are shown in the introductory chapter to be related to a common theme, the nature of poetic inspiration Bowra subscribes to the dictum of Socrates, that 'all good poets . compose their beautiful poems not by art, but because they are inspired and possessed' Only by accepting the existence of some form of inspiration in its genesis can we account for the unusual power that we feel in great poetry Bowra discusses 'the kind of exaltation which the poet himself has known in his hours of vision and enraptured creation', and which he can re-create in the mind of his reader Bowra's own sensitivity to the finer shades of poetic expression is revealed in the chapters he devotes to the odes of Horace, and to a variety of more recent European poets Of particular relevance to the student of English literature are his chapters on the tragic spirit of *Samson Agonistes*, the artistry of Walter Pater, and the lyrical poetry of Thomas Hardy

Few scholars of recent years have shown a wider and deeper appreciation of nineteenth-century literature than Humphry House, and *All in Due Time*,[19] a collection of his essays, reviews, and broadcast talks, will be welcomed by students of this period The same insight as went into House's own book on Coleridge may be seen in his reviews of other works on the poet, and a series of talks and essays on Dickens illustrates the detailed thoroughness and balanced good sense of his approach to an author on whom he had become a leading authority at the time of his death Whether he is writing on Shelley or Hopkins, the psychological problems of the Victorians or Pre-Raphaelite poetry, he has something fresh to say, and an individual way of saying it Some essays on non-literary topics show that his interests were not narrow, and are in their own way equally rewarding to read

Poetry and the Age,[20] by Randall Jarrell, is an admirable introduction to modern American poetry, on which Jarrell, himself a poet as well as a critic, is excellently qualified to write The poets with whom he particularly concerns himself are Robert Frost, John Ransom, Wallace Stevens, Marianne Moore, and William Carlos Williams He writes with both sensitivity and wit, and readers, on this side of the Atlantic especially, will be

[17] *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry* Vanderbilt U P pp 298 $5

[18] *Inspiration and Poetry*, by C M Bowra Macmillan pp vii+266 21*s*

[19] *All in Due Time* The Collected Essays and Broadcast Talks of Humphry House Hart-Davis pp 306 15*s*

[20] *Poetry and the Age*, by Randall Jarrell Faber pp 240 18*s*

grateful not only for his analyses, but also for the generous quotation with which he illustrates what recent American poets have been doing See Chapter XVI

In the introduction to his new volume of essays, *The Making of a Poem*,[21] Stephen Spender apologizes for 'writing about literature in an unacademic way' The apology is unnecessary What gives a special interest and value to his criticism is precisely his insistence on questioning certain assumptions of many academic critics that we are living in an age of values in decline, that the tradition has disappeared from life, that life itself has become devitalized' The present volume takes its title from an essay in which Spender illustrates from one of his notebooks how a poet 'has to adapt himself, more or less consciously, to the demands of his vocation', and most of the other essays are in some sense variations on this theme—when, for example, he discusses nineteenth-century poetry in relation to the 'Romantic Gold Standard', or shows Auden and Dylan Thomas developing new techniques in order to extend the range of what they can say in poetry Much of the book is devoted to poets and novelists of recent times, the Georgians, Housman, Wallace Stevens, James Joyce, and Virginia Woolf, and Spender shows a sensitive awareness both of influences from the past and of the special predicaments by which the modern writer is confronted, or feels himself to be confronted Spender is a stimulating writer, his judgements are often brilliant, and never ill-considered

Two volumes of essays by D H Lawrence have appeared In *D H Lawrence Selected Literary Criticism*[22] Anthony Beal has collected from several works, not all of which are easy to come by, the most important critical writings of Lawrence These include 'Pornography and Obscenity', the brilliant essay on John Galsworthy, and a good part of the 'Study of Thomas Hardy' Of considerable interest, too, are the reviews and the extracts from letters in which Lawrence makes perceptive and often pungent comments on contemporary writers, among them the Georgian poets About 200 pages are devoted to the works of Continental and American authors *Sex, Literature and Censorship*[23] consists of about a dozen essays in which Lawrence, writing in his later years, attacked what he regarded as the false morality of the censors and the reading public There is some overlapping with the previous volume Among the additions are 'A Propos of Lady Chatterley's Lover' and 'Cocksure Women and Hensure Men', and the 'Introduction to his Paintings' is given in full There are reproductions of four of Lawrence's paintings In two interesting prefatory essays Harry T Moore and H F Rubinstein discuss Lawrence's attitude towards the 'censor morons' and his brushes with the law

The tone of John Cowper Powys's *Visions and Revisions*[24] is suggested by its sub-title, 'A Book of Literary Devotions' The volume is made up of essays on writers—and one painter, El Greco—who still give the author in his old age the same degree of pleasure that he experienced on making their acquaintance forty years ago In each of his subjects he finds a central quality of genius which 'comes out clear into

[21] *The Making of a Poem*, by Stephen Spender Hamish Hamilton pp 192 15*s*

[22] *D H Lawrence Selected Literary Criticism*, ed by Anthony Beal Heinemann pp xii+435 21*s*

[23] *Sex, Literature and Censorship Essays by D H Lawrence*, ed by Harry T Moore Heinemann pp vii+269 15*s*

[24] *Visions and Revisions· A Book of Literary Devotions*, by John Cowper Powys. Macdonald. pp 221 15*s*

the open, unspeakable and inexplicable, and strikes us dumb' the 'clairvoyant ubiquity' of Pater's imagination, the 'rich, quivering, tormented Sensuality' of Keats, the 'high, patient, unwearied seriousness' of Goethe, the 'familiar sorcery' of Dickens Entirely unpedantic in his approach to the writers of his choice, Powys writes of them with deep understanding, and whether his hero for the moment be Shakespeare, or Rabelais, or Lamb, or Hardy, or Whitman, he communicates the peculiar quality of the delight which each has in his own way given him

3 *Studies of Particular Genres*

The seven lectures brought together in *Tragic Themes in Western Literature*[25] were delivered at Yale as a series in 1951 and 1952 The works discussed extend in time from Sophocles to T S Eliot, but a reading of the volume as a whole has the effect, among other things, of stressing the timelessness of great literature and 'the ultimate oneness of man', as Cleanth Brooks expresses it in his introduction In the first lecture, for example, Bernard Knox sees Sophocles' Oedipus not only as the greatest creation of a great poet, 'he is also one of the long series of tragic protagonists who stand as symbols of human aspiration and despair before the characteristic dilemmas of Western civilization—the problem of man's true stature, his proper place in the universe' Maynard Mack's theme is the world of *Hamlet*—a world of mystery, of questions and riddles—and the dilemmas to be resolved in this world by the Prince of Denmark Chauncey B Tinker shows how Milton eliminated or refined the repulsive features of the Samson story, gave tragic grandeur to its characters, and composed a heroic poem in which everything is in keeping with the spirit of Athenian tragedy Characterizing Racine as 'the true father of the modern theatre', Henri Peyre analyses *Phèdre* to demonstrate that this play owes its greatness 'to qualities of its own and not to Racine's fidelity to his Greek predecessor or to any Greek ideal' Although at first glance, says Richard B Sewall, the bewildering, discordant world of the Karamazovs appears not to be a tragic world, such new truth as the brothers find 'is "tragic" truth—that is, fragmentary, tentative, and precarious But truth nonetheless—a gain and a promise, as at the end of all true tragedy, for the human spirit' Konstantin Reichardt discusses *The Wild Duck, Rosmersholm, The Master Builder,* and *When We Dead Awaken* as 'tragedies of idealism' 'Can a saint's play ever be truly tragic?' This is the question which Louis L Martz sets out to answer by an analysis of Shaw's *Saint Joan* and Eliot's *Murder in the Cathedral,* and his conclusion is that it is possible 'to find some place, within the spacious area of tragedy', for these two plays

Six of the papers delivered at the 1953 and 1954 conferences of the English Institute have been published, with an introductory essay by W K Wimsatt, Jr, in a volume entitled *English Stage Comedy*[26] Wimsatt's essay is a discussion of the various ways in which laughter has been defined or accounted for in critical writings from Aristotle to the present day C L Barber's paper on Shakespeare's *Henry IV* and Bernard Knox's on *The Tempest* are noticed in Chapter VIII Ray L Heffner, Jr, argues that the essential unity of Ben Jon-

[25] *Tragic Themes in Western Literature,* ed with an Introduction by Cleanth Brooks Yale U P and O U P pp v+178 22*s*

[26] *English Stage Comedy,* ed by W K Wimsatt, Jr (English Institute Essays, 1954) Columbia U P and O U P pp x+182 28*s*

son's comedy is thematic 'In each of his major plays he explores an idea or a cluster of related ideas through a variety of characters and actions' In *The Silent Woman*, for example, 'noise and the hatred of noise take on the proportion of symbols as they are given ever-widening meanings by the various particulars of social satire' In *Bartholomew Fair* the emphasis is on 'the narrow range of motives that actually govern men's actions, in contrast to the wide variety of warrants which they pretend to have' Marvin Mudrick's *Restoration Comedy and Later* is a study of changing conventions in the comedy of manners between Jonson and Oscar Wilde in which the practice of the playwrights is related to the demands of the audiences for whom they wrote, it is illustrated by analyses of *The Country Wife, The Way of the World, The Rivals,* and *The Importance of Being Earnest* Katherine Haynes Gatch shows that in his later plays Shaw 'was not unresponsive to the compulsions upon the artist to find new modes for our time', as her illustrations make clear, 'the ironic relationship between the magnitude of the themes and the triviality of the treatment is calculated' William Arrowsmith discusses *The Cocktail Party* and *The Confidential Clerk* to support his thesis that the comedies of T S Eliot, like their Euripidean models, present a 'double reality', the final convergence of which 'is foreshadowed in detail in the isolated transfigurations of the plays'

Marvin T Herrick's work on Tragicomedy[27] is a comprehensive study of the classical origins of tragicomedy and of its development in modern European drama The term was first used by Plautus in relation to his *Amphitryon*, but as Herrick points out, the genre goes back to the Greek dramatists It may be seen in some of the plays of Euripides, in the *Alcestis*, for example, which uses the conventional heroic characters of tragedy, but has a happy ending and some comic elements, and in the satyric drama, like the *Cyclops*, which again has heroic figures, but burlesque action Herrick goes on to speak about the influence of the 'Christian Terence' in medieval times, and the theory and practice of tragicomedy in the Renaissance, from Cinthio onwards Further chapters deal with pastoral tragicomedy in Italy, France, and England down to the early seventeenth century, and the later sections discuss tragicomedy in France from Garnier to Corneille, and in England from Greene to Dryden Most of the work consists of analyses of plays, but Herrick also marks out clear lines of influence and development

Walter Allen's *The Novel Today*[28] is an outline survey of the post-war novel which gives short appraisals of selected works by such novelists as Anthony Powell, C P Snow, L P Hartley, J D Scott, P H Newby, Angus Wilson, John Wain, and Kingsley Amis

In *Appraising a Play*,[29] one of the Practical Stage Handbooks, Harold Downs shows that certain kinds of knowledge are necessary for the full understanding and appreciation of a play, and goes on to speak about dramatic and theatrical conventions He also describes briefly what happens behind the scenes in a theatre, and provides a useful glossary of 'the language of the theatre'

In a pleasant volume entitled *The*

[27] *Tragicomedy Its Origin and Development in Italy, France, and England*, by Marvin T Herrick Univ of Illinois Press pp vii+331 $4

[28] *The Novel Today*, by Walter Allen Longmans, for the British Council and the National Book League pp 36 2*s*

[29] *Appraising a Play*, by Harold Downs (Practical Stage Handbooks) Herbert Jenkins pp 96 5*s*

Rural Muse[30] Rayner Unwin explores comparatively untrodden by-ways in his search for poets who, from obscure and humble beginnings in unlettered rustic homes, have in their day won a certain renown in the literary world He opens with a chapter on Thomson, not because Thomson by his background belongs to the type, but because of the powerful influence he exerted on the genuine 'peasant poets' In the succeeding chapters he gives biographical and critical studies of Stephen Duck the thresher poet, Robert Bloomfield the 'Farmer's Boy', John Clare, Josiah Relph and his greater successor in dialect poetry, William Barnes, and Alfred Williams Crabbe is also included for his picture of village life There is an entertaining chapter on the flock of eighteenth-century 'artisan poets', Robert Dodsley, Robert Tatersal, James Woodhouse, William Falconer, James Frederick Bryant, and Ann Yearsley, the milk-woman of Bristol

In his 1955 Presidential Address to the English Association,[31] the Dean of St Paul's sets out to assess 'the importance of philosophical writing in the general picture of English Literature' Confining himself strictly to their literary qualities, he pays special attention to Locke, Berkeley, and Hume, in each of whom he finds much to admire, the humanity of Locke, the easy and graceful style of Berkeley, the lucidity of Hume He finds a place also for Hooker, Hobbes, and Butler in his survey, and touches on Coleridge and Carlyle as writers on the fringe of the subject

A Lytton Sells begins his study of 'animal poetry'[32] with the steeds of Achilles which wept when Patroclus was slain by Hector From Homer he goes on to discuss descriptions of birds and beasts in the Greek playwrights and epigrammatists, and in the Roman poets, notably Virgil, Catullus, and Martial Passing on to modern times, he scours the poetry of France and England down to the early years of this century for relevant material, dilating on periods when it is abundant, such as that of the Pléiade in France and those of Shakespeare and of the Romantics in England A bald description of the contents of the volume might give the impression that it is merely a laborious catalogue Two things prevent Sell's work from being tedious, and give it some value as literary criticism First, he has quoted generously, and thus provided something of the interest of an anthology, and secondly, he has brought out many relationships and correspondences in the handling of common themes by different poets, tracing the influence of Catullus's *Passer mortuus est*, for instance, in several poems of later ages He finds room, too, for pleasant anecdotes, such as the following, from Aubrey 'W Laud, A B Cant, was a great lover of Catts He was presented with some Cyprus-catts, i e our Tabby-catts about 1637, or 1638 I doe well remember that the common English Catt was white with some blewish piednesse sc a galli-pot blew The race or breed of them are now almost lost'

Poetry is often misunderstood, says James K Baxter in *The Fire and the Anvil*,[33] because the reader or critic does not know what makes poetry He goes on to suggest 'some possible criteria by which a good poem may

[30] *The Rural Muse Studies in the Peasant Poetry of England*, by Rayner Unwin Allen & Unwin pp 202 15*s*

[31] *The British Philosopher as Writer*, by the Very Rev W R Matthews The English Association pp 14 5*s*

[32] *Animal Poetry in French and English Literature & the Greek Tradition*, by A Lytton Sells Indiana U P pp xxxiv+329 $5

[33] *The Fire and the Anvil Notes on Modern Poetry*, by James K Baxter New Zealand U P and C U P pp 78 7*s* 6*d*

be judged' metaphorical exactitude, clarity, formal structure, vigour, 'glamour or incandescence', and significance With illustrations drawn from some contemporary poets, he examines the processes of poetic composition, and then turns to the subject of symbolism in New Zealand poetry

In *British Autobiographies*[34] William Matthews lists more than 6,000 works of an autobiographical nature with brief notes on the subjects to which they principally refer—the law, soldiering, literature, travel, hunting, and the like He treats only authors who are British by birth or adoption The volume will be useful for research workers or for anyone seeking knowledge of British life and customs It is well indexed

Bookmen's Bedlam,[35] by Walter Hart Blumenthal, is a scrap-book of literary and bibliographical curiosities Blumenthal describes some famous midget volumes, and some giants, like Charles II's atlas in the British Museum, and he devotes chapters to such oddities as volumes bound in human skin, and books produced in strange circumstances, like the remarkable *Aurora Australis*, which was printed and bound at the headquarters of the British South Polar Expedition of 1908 Although it is not as lively as one feels it might have been, this work will nevertheless be read with enjoyment by those who are interested in the oddities of the book world

4 *Autobiographies*

Several autobiographical or quasi-autobiographical works of the year are of special interest for the light they throw upon the backgrounds of well-known writers or the glimpses they give of the modern world of letters Richard Church's *Over the Bridge*[36] is a sensitive re-creation of his childhood and school-days, at first in the back streets of Battersea and later in the comparatively rural surroundings of Dulwich Church describes how his mind and imagination were nurtured, under the stimulus of his elder brother's shining talents, by the pageantry and diversity of London life, until he was old enough to find the books and music that were to prove such important formative influences on his work as a poet The book is an enthralling account of the triumph of the poetic imagination over the most unpromising environment and circumstances, a vivid evocation, for the reader as for the poet himself, of 'the very voice of the past'

Just as interesting is the portrayal of a very different kind of background in *The Flowers of the Forest*,[37] the second instalment of David Garnett's autobiography This covers the years of the First World War Apart from what it tells us about Garnett himself and his early work as a writer, it is valuable for its portraits of his friends among the writers and artists of the day These include Virginia and Leonard Woolf, Roger Fry, D H Lawrence, Clive and Vanessa Bell, Maynard Keynes, and Lytton Strachey, all of whom are shown in their private lives rather than as public figures, so that we learn much about their relationships with one another and their opinion of and effect on one another's work Garnett writes with gaiety and

[34] *British Autobiographies An Annotated Bibliography of British Autobiographies Published or Written before 1951*, compiled by William Matthews Univ of California Press and C U P pp xiv+376 37*s* 6*d*

[35] *Bookmen's Bedlam An Olio of Literary Oddities*, by Walter Hart Blumenthal Rutgers U P and Mark Paterson & Co pp xiii+273 $5 36*s*

[36] *Over the Bridge An Essay in Autobiography*, by Richard Church Heinemann pp vii+231 18*s*

[37] *The Flowers of the Forest Being Volume Two of the Golden Echo*, by David Garnett Chatto & Windus pp xii+252 21*s*

vigour, and with complete candour, and his book makes excellent reading

John Lehmann's life, too, has brought him in contact with many of the leading writers of the last generation or two, and he has the ability to bring them to life as he talks about them His autobiography, *The Whispering Gallery*,[38] is for the most part an account of the career of writing and publishing for which he was so admirably prepared by his upbringing in the stimulating company of his versatile father and his gifted sisters, Rosamond and Beatrix Perhaps the most absorbing sections of the book are those in which he describes his work with Leonard and Virginia Woolf in the Hogarth Press, and the birth and growth of his magazine, *New Writing* His reminiscences of his literary friends are of great interest, as are also some letters of Virginia Woolf which he publishes for the first time

The Mint[39] is the journal which T E Lawrence kept as a recruit, and later an aircraftsman, in the R A F shortly after his return from service in the First World War It is a vivid description of the 'man-crushing, humiliating slavery', as he saw it, of his life at the Depot, and of the contentment that he later found in his work with aircraft at Cranwell It is of particular interest for what it tells of his state of mind during the writing and revision of *The Seven Pillars of Wisdom* A volume of Lawrence's letters to members of his family has also appeared [40] He took great trouble with his letters, and the greater number of these are detailed accounts of the travels in the Middle East and the reading that fitted him for his wartime work with the Arabs A certain number belong to the war years, and though they are necessarily discreet, they help to fill in the background of the events that form the subject of *The Seven Pillars*

Lark Rise to Candleford,[41] Flora Thompson's absorbing picture of life in a small Oxfordshire hamlet in the 1870's and 1880's, is not a new book, its three parts were published between 1939 and 1944 However, it is worth recording that this treasury of the rustic lore of Victorian days has now been made available as a single volume in the World's Classics series

5 *Annual Publications*

Of items relevant to the present volume in the 1955 *Proceedings of the British Academy*,[42] Helen Gardner's Shakespeare Lecture, *The Noble Moor*, is noticed in Chapter VIII Geoffrey Bullough's Warton Lecture on English Poetry is entitled *Changing Views of the Mind in English Poetry* This is an illuminating study of poets from the Elizabethan age until today who have discussed or reflected in their poetry distinctive outlooks on the human mind current in their day It is particularly interesting on poets like Donne and Pope and Akenside who have consciously explored the operations and potentialities of the mind and related them to contemporary psychological theory. In his Chatterton Lecture on an English Poet, Lionel Butler gives a biographical sketch of E H W Meyerstein, and an appraisal of his work, especially his *Life of Chatterton* and his poems

[38] *The Whispering Gallery Autobiography I*, by John Lehmann Longmans pp ix+342 24*s*

[39] *T E Lawrence The Mint A Day-book of the R A F Depot between August and December, 1922, with Later Notes*, by 352087 A/c Ross Cape pp 206 17*s* 6*d*

[40] *The Home Letters of T E Lawrence and His Brothers* (Edited by M R Lawrence) Blackwell, 1954 pp xvi+731 30*s*

[41] *Lark Rise to Candleford* A Trilogy by Flora Thompson (The World's Classics) O U P pp xvi+616 8*s* 6*d*

[42] *Proceedings of the British Academy Vol XLI, 1955* O U P, 1956 pp xii+388 63*s*

Some of the articles in *Essays and Studies*[43] are noticed in later chapters, and the volume may be dealt with very briefly here It opens with a lively discussion by John Crow of some of the problems which confront the editor and emender of English texts P M Yarker contributes a study of W H Mallock's *The New Paul and Virginia*, and G N Garmonsway writes on the life and work of the early nineteenth-century Anglo-Saxon scholar, Anna Gurney (see Chapter IV) John Lawlor presents his subject, *Radical Satire and the Realistic Novel*, chiefly in relation to Swift C B Cox shows how Henry James's attitudes towards stoicism influenced his treatment of themes and characters A E Dyson offers an interpretation of *Comus*

In *English Miscellany*,[44] now in its sixth year, Michael Lloyd discusses the hostile attitude towards Italy displayed by Hawthorne in his famous portrait of Rome, *Transformation*, and by Ruskin in *The Stones of Venice* Oliver Evans reveals something of Dylan Thomas's methods of composition in an examination of his work-sheets for 'Do not go gentle into that good night' Siegfried Korninger analyses the comic devices and comic effects in John Smith's *Scarronides* Several articles in Italian are also relevant to this chapter Elio Chinol writes on Book IX of *Paradise Lost*, Augusto Guidi on Milton and Hopkins, Sara Poli on Charlotte Bronte, and Nemi D'Agostino on Ezra Pound

The *Dissertation Abstracts*[45] published monthly by the University of Michigan have not previously been noticed in *YW* These provide digests of doctoral theses in all subjects which have been presented in some sixty American universities, and which may be purchased in microform

6 *Anthologies*

An old friend returns with the republication of *The Week-End Book*,[46] which has, however, been thoroughly revised All the features of the original edition have been retained, though some sections have been curtailed and others expanded There are six new sections, which include 'Late Poems' (an anthology of contemporary poetry), and four devoted to the countryside

Hugh Kingsmill's collection,[47] which ranges from Chaucer to the early years of this century, contains little that is off the beaten track, but it is a pleasant anthology and will give pleasure to many readers

John Baillie's excellent *Diary of Readings*[48] provides for each day of the year a passage calculated 'to engage serious thought' The passages, each a page long, and mostly in prose, are all of a religious or moral nature, and are chosen from authors ranging from St Augustine to modern times

The sixth volume of the World's Classics anthology of English verse is a selection of *Modern Verse*[49] edited

[43] *Essays and Studies, 1955*, N S , vol VIII Collected for the English Association by D M Low Murray pp v+114 10*s* 6*d*

[44] *English Miscellany A Symposium of History, Literature and the Arts* No 6 Ed by Mario Praz Rome Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura (for the British Council) pp 257 Price not supplied

[45] *Dissertation Abstracts A Guide to Dissertations and Monographs Available in Microform*, vol XV, nos 1–12 Ann Arbor, Michigan pp 72+2742 $10 50 annually, or $1 50 each monthly part

[46] *The Week-End Book*, ed by Francis Meynell Nonesuch Press pp x+580 15*s*

[47] *The High Hill of the Muses*, by Hugh Kingsmill Eyre & Spottiswoode pp 639 25*s*

[48] *A Diary of Readings Being an Anthology of Pages Suited to Engage Serious Thought, One for Every Day of the Year, Gathered from the Wisdom of Many Centuries*, by John Baillie O U P pp x+385 15*s*

[49] *Modern Verse, 1900–1950* Chosen by Phyllis M Jones (The World's Classics) O U P pp xxiii+294 6*s*

by Phyllis M Jones This second edition has been enlarged to include some sixty poems by poets whose work became known between 1940 and 1950 Though not very adventurous in its choice, it is a good representative selection from the better-known poets of the first half of this century, and it has the usual virtues of the World's Classics series, clear print on good white paper, pleasant, simple binding, and compactness

To celebrate its centenary as a publishing house, the firm of Chatto and Windus has produced an excellent selection[50] from works for which it has been responsible In the introduction Oliver Warner gives an interesting 'brief account of the firm's origin, history and development' over the last hundred years Three works are given complete *Huckleberry Finn, Crome Yellow,* and Par Lagerkvist's *Barabbas* Seventy other well-known Chatto authors are represented These include Swinburne, Robert Louis Stevenson, Wilkie Collins, Trollope, Conan Doyle, Hardy, Proust, Stendhal, Lytton Strachey, and Norman Douglas, not to mention many living authors who are equally well thought of This volume provides much good reading, and is excellent value for a guinea

Alice Venezky Griffin's anthology of plays, *Living Theatre*,[51] is described in the preface as 'an approach to modern American drama by way of the stage classics of other countries' It presents fifteen plays, in chronological order, from the *Oresteia* of Aeschylus to *The Madwoman of Chaillot* by Giraudoux, three are by American playwrights, the remainder European They are arranged in sections with short introductory essays Under 'The Tragedy of Fate', for example, appear *Romeo and Juliet* and Maxwell Anderson's *Winterset*, under 'Satiric Comedy' *The Misanthrope* of Molière, under 'Realism' *Maria Magdalena* by Friedrich Hebbel and *Street Scene* by Elmer Rice

Iona and Peter Opie have followed up their learned *Dictionary of Nursery Rhymes* with an excellent anthology[52] containing some 800 nursery rhymes and ditties As might have been expected of an 'Oxford Book' it is most attractively produced, and embellished with 600 illustrations, the majority taken from chapbooks and toybooks of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, and the rest by Joan Hassall The volume is in all respects admirable, and deserves a warm welcome

7 *Translations*

Ronald Knox's splendid translation of the Bible has been available for several years, but only in three volumes published separately, the New Testament in 1944, and the Old Testament in 1949 and 1950 In a revised version it is now printed as a single compact volume,[53] with clear black print on good India paper Readers who are not too firmly wedded to the language and rhythms of the Authorized Version will find this a highly satisfactory form in which to read the Scriptures, style and paragraphing combine to produce a narrative which flows smoothly and often mellifluously, and a clarity that is sometimes wanting in earlier versions

It is nearly a quarter of a century since 'T E Lawrence published his

[50] *A Century of Writers, 1855–1955 A Centenary Volume*, chosen by D M Low and others, with an Introduction by Oliver Warner Chatto & Windus pp 736 21*s*

[51] *Living Theatre An Anthology of Great Plays*, ed by Alice Venezky Griffin New York Twayne, 1953 pp 510 $6

[52] *The Oxford Nursery Rhyme Book* Assembled by Iona and Peter Opie O U P pp xiv+224 21*s*

[53] *The Holy Bible A Translation from the Latin Vulgate in the Light of the Hebrew and Greek Originals*, by Ronald Knox Burns & Oates pp xi+1201 35*s*

translation of the *Odyssey*, which is so well known as not to require appraisal here However, its appearance as a World's Classic[54] is welcome—and timely, in view of the recent renewal of interest in Lawrence—and certainly deserves mention

Since the *Odyssey* has been taken as a model by so many later writers of epic, Denys Page's interesting study of its integrity[55] may reasonably find a place in this chapter From awkwardnesses and anomalies in the structure and the style, Page demonstrates that the poem is a composite work in different parts of which the language and conventions of different periods can be discerned He considers it 'beyond question' that the *Odyssey* and the *Iliad* were composed by different poets, the Odyssean poet did not even know the *Iliad* The poems are not, 'in any ordinary sense of the word, original compositions, substantially the work of any one person' It is likely that 'a more or less standard text of the two poems' was put together at Athens in the sixth century B C , and that this was re-edited in the Alexandrian era to produce the poems we know

In his Andrew Lang Lecture for 1955[56] Sir Maurice Bowra reinforces some of Page's points He discusses the Homeric poems in the light of the recent decipherment of the Mycenaean texts written in Linear Script B and the reappearance of writing in Greece in the eighth century B C , and in relation to their oral technique and the layers of tradition embedded in them He concludes that their material 'comes from a long period of years and a variety of social conditions'

Richmond Lattimore has in recent years made or sponsored many translations from the Greek poets and playwrights A volume of Euripidean plays[57] to which he has contributed a short critical introduction contains his translation of *Alcestis*, together with *Medea, The Heracleidae,* and *Hippolytus*, translated respectively by Rex Warner, Ralph Gladstone, and David Greene It is scarcely fair to treat these four versions together, but since lack of space precludes detailed consideration, it might be said as a generalization that all four reproduce with some success the spirit of the episodic sections of the plays, but are rather less satisfactory in the choric sections, where flat or colloquial phrases at time offend the ear However, the volume may be recommended to the reader who has no Greek

Students of Euripides will find Gilbert Norwood's *Essays on Euripidean Drama*[58] of considerable interest In the opening essay Norwood illustrates qualities in Euripides which mark him out not only as a magnificent dramatist, but also, unlike Aeschylus, as 'a man of the theatre' Two essays are devoted to the *Bacchae* and *Hippolytus* Finally, Norwood's study of the *Supplices* persuades him that this play is 'a collection of portions torn from two dramas, one composed by Euripides, the other by a much later poet'

A lively translation of the *Lysistrata* of Aristophanes[59] comes from Dudley

[54] *The Odyssey of Homer*, translated from the Greek by T E Shaw (Lawrence of Arabia) (The World's Classics) O U P pp xvii+442 6*s*

[55] *The Homeric Odyssey The Mary Flexner Lectures delivered at Bryn Mawr College, Pennsylvania*, by Denys Page O U P pp vii+186 21*s*

[56] *Homer and His Forerunners*, by Sir Maurice Bowra (The Andrew Lang Lecture, 1955) Edinburgh Nelson pp ii+41 6*s*

[57] *Euripides 'Alcestis', translated by Richmond Lattimore 'Medea', translated by Rex Warner 'The Heracleidae', translated by Ralph Gladstone 'Hippolytus', translated by David Greene* Chicago U P and C U P pp ix+221 $3 50 28*s*

[58] *Essays on Euripidean Drama*, by Gilbert Norwood Univ of California Press and C U P pp ix+197 42*s*

[59] *Aristophanes Lysistrata* An English

Fitts In the episodes Fitts uses a free five-stress line, in the lyrical parts he has employed any trick of sound or metre that will help him to bring out the feeling of the original His choice of language preserves much of the 'sparkle and sophistication' that we associate with Aristophanes, and his version deserves to become known.

Denys Page has, in his *Sappho and Alcaeus*,[60] written an important and highly interesting book All the longer and more significant passages of the two poets and many short fragments are reproduced with translations and detailed commentary, and there are some excellent chapters of general criticism in which, among other things, Page sets out to strike a just balance between the obloquy which has from ancient times gathered round Sappho's name and the sentimental estimates of her character which have recently been the fashion

Page's translations are in prose In his volume of *Greek Lyrics*[61] Richmond Lattimore offers verse translations of about ninety passages from twenty poets in which he attempts 'close approximations of the original meter' As translation his versions are accurate, and he often achieves fine poetry, but it is questionable whether the attempt to preserve the Greek metres is worth while On the whole he is happiest with stanza forms like the Sapphic and Alcaic, his elegiac couplets rarely have an English ring, and are sometimes marred by very weak prepositional endings

P M Pope's renderings of the *Anacreonta*,[62] together with four poems attributed to Anacreon himself and some 'epitaphs' on him from the *Greek Anthology*, run easily and have the necessary lightness of touch, they provide pleasant browsing

A translation of Plato's *Republic*,[63] by H D P Lee, with a sensible biographical and critical introduction, is a welcome newcomer to the Penguin Classics Lee has succeeded very well in catching the tone of dignified conversation that is characteristic of the Platonic dialogues, and in finding modern equivalents for the moral and abstract terms, and his translation is admirably adapted to the needs of the twentieth-century reader

Plato's *Phaedo* has appeared in an excellent translation[64] by R Hackforth, accompanied by a detailed footnote commentary and an introduction on the nature and significance of the dialogue A second translation of the *Phaedo*, by R S Bluck (Routledge & Kegan Paul), was not available when this chapter was prepared

Another notable addition to the Penguin Classics is J A K Thomson's *Ethics of Aristotle*[65] As might be expected of Thomson, the translation is first-rate, and the running analysis is an aid to understanding which will be appreciated Thomson also provides some useful discussion of Aristotle and of the *Ethics*

Roman literature has not been so well served this year as Greek, but two translations of Ovid's *Metamorphoses*[66] call for comment A E Watts

Version by Dudley Fitts Faber pp xv+132 12*s* 6*d*

[60] *Sappho and Alcaeus An Introduction to the Study of Ancient Lesbian Poetry*, by Denys Page O U P pp ix+340 42*s*

[61] *Greek Lyrics, Translated into Close Approximations of the Original Meter*, by Richmond Lattimore Chicago U P and C U P pp vii+52 17*s*

[62] *The Anacreonta*, translated into English by P M Pope Bowes & Bowes pp viii+48 10*s* 6*d*

[63] *Plato The Republic*, translated with an Introduction by H D P Lee Penguin Books pp 405 3*s* 6*d*

[64] *Plato's Phaedo*, translated with Introduction and Commentary by R Hackforth C U P pp x+200 21*s*

[65] *The Ethics of Aristotle*, translated by J A K Thomson Penguin Books pp 320 2*s* 6*d*

[66] *The Metamorphoses of Ovid* An English Version by A E Watts, with the

has chosen the heroic couplet on the grounds that it remains the best English equivalent to the Latin hexameter, and he has justified his choice by the ease and general felicity of his rendering Mary M Innes, writing for the Penguin Classics, has aimed at a version 'which, while remaining faithful to the text, offers pleasant and easy reading, even to the non-classicist' She has succeeded in both parts of this aim

Ovid has been the subject also of a fine biographical and critical study[67] by L P Wilkinson Each of the works receives a chapter, and Wilkinson is particularly comprehensive and thorough in his treatment of the *Metamorphoses* The last two chapters, on the influence of Ovid in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance, will be of special interest to students of English literature

L A and R W L Wilding have produced an excellent anthology[68] of nearly 150 passages from Greek and Roman literature, ranging in time from Homer to Claudian, and varying in length from a three-page extract from Plato's *Republic* to Simonides' famous epigram on the Spartan dead at Thermopylae In spite of modest disclaimers on the part of the translators, their versions are for the most part happy in style, and should give as much pleasure to non-classical readers as to those who know the originals *Voices from the Past*, a volume of translations edited by James and Janet Maclean Todd (Phoenix House), has not been available for notice

Etchings of Pablo Picasso Univ of California Press and C U P pp xvi+397 37*s* 6*d*

The 'Metamorphoses' of Ovid, translated with an Introduction by Mary M Innes Penguin Books pp 394 3*s* 6*d*

[67] *Ovid Recalled*, by L P Wilkinson C U P pp xviii+484 37*s* 6*d*

[68] *A Classical Anthology A Selection from the Greek and Roman Literatures with Translations*, by L A Wilding and R W L Wilding Faber pp 331 18*s*

Robert Graves's *The Greek Myths*,[69] in which the stories of the Greek gods and heroes are retold in two volumes designed as a companion to the Penguin Classics, makes good reading and is very useful for reference The work is more than merely a readable retelling of the myths, variants are recorded, and if possible reconciled, and each myth is accompanied by a commentary which interprets it 'in the light of today's archaeological and anthropological knowledge' Full references to the classical sources are provided, and there are good indexes

The *Confessions* and *Enchiridion* of St Augustine[70] have been published in an excellent new translation by Albert C Outler, who in his introduction appraises the character and writings of St Augustine

Two new translations of Dante have appeared The *Purgatory*,[71] rendered in *terza rima* by Dorothy L Sayers, has the same vigour and freshness as her earlier *Hell*, and is similarly accompanied by a helpful commentary and a scholarly critical introduction It is some years since Geoffrey L Bickersteth published his translation of the *Paradiso* It is now printed with the *Inferno* and the *Purgatorio* in a single volume [72] Bickersteth also retains the 'triple rhyme' of the original, and though his version has not quite the contemporary ring that Miss Sayers imparts to hers, it is neverthe-

[69] *The Greek Myths*, by Robert Graves Penguin Books 2 vols Vol 1, pp 370, Vol 2, pp 412 Each vol 3*s* 6*d*

[70] *Augustine Confessions and Enchiridion*, newly translated and edited by Albert C Outler S C M Press pp 423 35*s*

[71] *The Comedy of Dante Alighieri the Florentine Cantica II Purgatory*, translated by Dorothy L Sayers Penguin Books pp 390 3*s* 6*d*

[72] *The Divine Comedy of Dante Alighieri*, translated from the Italian into English triple rhyme by Geoffrey L Bickersteth Aberdeen U P pp xv+395 25*s*

less both dignified and beautiful, and may be recommended

J M Cohen's *Rabelais*[73] is a happy translation with plenty of life It would be difficult to replace Urquhart and Motteux in the affections of some readers, but this version will probably win many new admirers for Rabelais

[73] *The Histories of Gargantua and Pantagruel, by François Rabelais*, translated with an Introduction by J M Cohen Penguin Books pp 712 5*s*

II. LINGUISTICS

By RANDOLPH QUIRK

IT is not the province of the *YW* to present a complete survey of the year's work in general linguistics, yet it has been felt desirable that readers should be provided with a guide to the points at which this rapidly developing field (extending from experimental phonetics to the study of meaning and style) impinges most obviously upon their work It is the purpose of this chapter, therefore, to draw attention briefly to publications on the principles, methods, and facts of language study which have relevance for the study of English, but which are not so primarily concerned with English as to invite notice elsewhere in the volume

Handbooks which purport to give a general introduction to modern linguistic science are by no means rare there has been quite a crop of such books in several languages since the war What is rare is to find anything that is much more than a thinning-down of Bloomfield, with (at best) a shaky superstructure of European and post-Bloomfield ideas H A Gleason,[1] however, has produced a book which is genuinely up to date and genuinely capable of introducing students to the whole range of the better-known or more exploited areas of linguistics phonetics and phonemics, morphology, syntax, linguistic change and comparative philology, linguistic geography, and the newer fields of graphemics and communication Here is a linguistic encyclopedia which one can recommend with enthusiasm The *Introduction* is an American book, and American work in linguistics over the past few decades has been both distinguished and prolific, so it is not perhaps surprising that this is what occupies almost all of Gleason's attention Nevertheless (if it is not ungracious to ask for something still better), it may be hoped that a second edition will bring more fully into the picture the glossematic, prosodic, and other work which occupies many linguists to the east of the Atlantic The relatively thin treatment of syntax, incidentally, is a glaring reminder of what little advance has been made in this field since the advent of the structural approach The accompanying *Workbook* provides admirable graded problems in applied linguistics, both as regards English and other (including non-Indo-European) languages

If Gleason does not help us much with glossematics, this is all the more reason to welcome B Siertsema's analysis and criticism of this predominantly Danish approach,[2] which is as yet all too little known and studied outside the circle of its devotees Miss Siertsema writes clearly on a most difficult subject, and her book will undoubtedly be of value in sketching the history of Hjelmslev's views and in attempting to synthesize the contributions of many scholars in the last decade It is not recommended for beginners in glossematics, but rather as an informed guide to F J Whitfield's translation (Baltimore, 1953) of Hjelmslev's *Omkring Sprogteoriens*

[1] *An Introduction to Descriptive Linguistics*, by H A Gleason New York Henry Holt pp ix+389 $3 25 *Workbook in Descriptive Linguistics*, by H A Gleason New York Henry Holt pp 88 (offset) $3 25

[2] *A Study of Glossematics Critical Survey of its Fundamental Concepts*, by B Siertsema The Hague Nijhoff pp xi+240 15 gld

Grundlæggelse, and part of its attraction to the uncommitted reader is that the author herself is not a glossematician This is not without its drawbacks, on the other hand, since it is clear—from the author's own admissions, for instance—that she is at a loss to understand glossematic theory at some points In this connexion, brief mention may be made of a book (though it appeared in 1954) by H Spang-Hannsen,[3] which also contributes to our knowledge of glossematics and which is written from the glossematic viewpoint The author concludes that since linguistics is in advance of psychology as regards sign-analysis, we should not depend upon psychology as a basis for linguistic description, and that 'an immanent view of the nature of the language sign is the most promising hypothesis'

The appearance after only four years of a second impression of *Methods in Structural Linguistics*[4] indicates the wide interest that Harris's work has aroused among linguists everywhere In the case of a very different guide to language study, by M Schlauch,[5] reappearance is accompanied by a somewhat misleading change of title It is good to note that this charming and useful students' book is again available, having first appeared (as *The Gift of Tongues*) in 1942, but many will be disappointed that the 'corrected re-issue' embodies so little internal change and modernization Despite the gay exterior which suggests a new book, the references within still stop at 1940 and the publisher has not bothered even to change or obliterate the old running-title

In *Structural Linguistics* (*TPS*), J R Firth discusses in his characteristic allusive style the relation between his own view of language and that of other groups engaged in language study, notably the American structuralists and the Danish glossematic group, with side-glances at Jakobson and Martinet, and revealing backward glimpses of Trubetzkoy, de Saussure, and Sweet 'There is need to recognise indeterminacy', we agree, and there are facts that cannot 'be put into words', but it remains a matter for regret that Firth's polysystemic approach to language has not yet been fully and explicitly formulated, for it is clear, from what has appeared under its impact so far, that it has much to offer us

One of the most important contributions to the linguistics of English takes the form of a 34-page review in *Language* by J Sledd of *An Outline of English Structure* (G L Trager and H L Smith) and *The Structure of English* (C C Fries) It is in fact more than a review of these books, it is a review of a generation of new linguistic studies and their relation to English Language as studied in the universities of English-speaking countries to which should be added the incidental provision of a unique bibliography of relevant publications If Sledd has not yet convinced the present writer that juncture and stress are uniformly discriminating in all contexts in English, his full discussion of these and other matters arising from the work of Trager and Smith and of Fries provides us with a most penetrating and urbanely written assessment of structural linguistics as applied to the analysis of English

Fries's analysis is taken a stage farther by P Roberts in *Fries's Group D*

[3] *Recent Theories on the Nature of the Language Sign*, by H Spang-Hannsen (Travaux du Cercle Linguistique de Copenhague) Copenhagen Nordisk Sprog- og Kulturforlag pp 142 Dan Kr 20

[4] *Methods in Structural Linguistics*, by Z S Harris C U P pp xv+384 56*s* 6*d*

[5] *The Gift of Language*, by M Schlauch New York Dover Publications pp ix+342 $1 75

(*L*) (see Chapter III), and for those interested in following up the system expounded in *An Outline of English Structure*, note should be taken of Trager's application of it to *French Morphology Verb Inflection* (*L*)

F Mikus's 44-page article, *Jan v Rozwadowski et le structuralisme syntagmatique* (*Lingua*), is the first instalment of a study to be completed shortly It comprises an essay in the history of structural linguistics in presenting the *Wortbildung und Wortbedeutung* of Rozwadowski as a precursor of structuralism, at the same time, the author uses the occasion to make a further advance in the statement of his own syntagmatic theory as regards the morphology and semantics of nouns

The Louvain periodical *Orbis*, while primarily concerned with dialectology, is rapidly becoming one of the major organs of linguistic studies as a whole Two contributions to this year's volume may be mentioned at this point V Honsa presents a very full summary of the state of *Linguistic Studies at the University of Michigan*, and J Vendryes a fitting survey, on the occasion of its ninetieth anniversary, of *La Société de Linguistique de Paris* Despite its name, the Society at first embraced pretty well all ethnology, but after 1876 it narrowed itself resolutely to 'l'étude des langues et l'histoire du langage' From 1882, when de Saussure came to Paris, this scholar began to have a profound influence on the Society, reinforcing that of Bréal and Meillet Though this essay is inevitably biographical to a large extent, it is highly informative on the development of linguistics as conceived today

There are several contributions to the practical application of modern linguistics As a result of a seminar organized by Unesco in Ceylon in 1953 comes a collection of studies on *The Teaching of Modern Languages*,[6] which draws together the views expressed in the seminar by P Gurrey, E V Gatenby, P Féraud, and others Of most interest is the chapter on Methodology, but of note also are those on Audio-Visual Aids, Psychological Aspects, Training of Language Teachers, and Textbooks, the chapter on the use of radio and television includes an interesting report on the English by Radio programme of the B B C

Among the material in this year's volume of *Language Learning* is an article by the late L Bloomfield on *Linguistics and Reading*, originally published in the *Elementary English Review*, vol xix Yao Shen argues cogently that *Phonemic Charts Alone are not Enough* in the teaching of English as a foreign language, and that we need also a comparison of the phonological structures of English and the pupil's language, in *The Classroom Door* she presses the corresponding case for morphology and syntax In *American Linguistics and the Teaching of English* (which appears also in *Revue des langues vivantes*), C C Fries makes a very useful survey of the distinctive features of American structural linguistics, with an account of its application to teaching and with a brief bibliography R Lado discusses *Patterns of Difficulty in Vocabulary*, and R S Meyerstein examines positional and situational indications of meaning in *Meaning Determinations Objectives and Procedures*

The British Council periodical *English Language Teaching* contains the third of W F Mackey's series on *What to look for in a Method*, this time dealing with presentation, having previously tackled selection and grading

[6] *The Teaching of Modern Languages* Paris Unesco, New York Columbia U P pp 295 14*s* 6*d* $2 50

If in teaching we are making some progress in assimilating and applying the results of linguistic research, A Martinet doubts whether the same can be said for dialectology. In his article *Dialect* (*Romance Philology*), he regrets the small influence of structuralism upon dialectologists and seeks to set up linguistic and sociological criteria that can mark off 'dialects' from 'languages', a sounder terminology would be a step towards more scientific study An exemplary demonstration of rigorous method appears in the monograph by G N Putnam and E M O'Hern,[7] which is an experiment in joint linguistic and sociological research to test the hypothesis that 'speech serves as a mark of social class' The dialect selected was ideal for the purpose in being that of a depressed and remarkably isolated Negro community embedded in Washington, D C Having studied and described the dialect, the investigators had twelve people of varying status (but including three from the community in question) record a retelling of an Æsop fable The recordings were then played to some seventy assessors who, from the speaking alone (that is, without reference to other indicators of status such as dress), proceeded to rate the social status of the speakers The result was a clear demonstration of the hypothesis Another rigorous essay is W S Avis's *'Crocus Bag' A Problem in Areal Linguistics* (*AS*), in which we are shown how linguistic geography can complement etymological and historical studies (see Chapter III) *The Phonological Divisions of Belgo-Romance* by E B Atwood (*Orbis*) is also important for modern methods in linguistic geography, the author discusses the principles on which one can use 'bundles' of isoglosses (which are themselves only a selective sample of phonological features) to determine dialect boundaries A. Dauzat reviews *La Méthode des nouveaux atlas linguistiques de France* (*Orbis*), in which a questionnaire based on that of Gilliéron is being used A Watkins discusses the *Linguistic Atlas of Welsh Dialect* (*Orbis*) which is being urgently organized in Aberystwyth If far from being on the point of extinction, Welsh dialects face the serious levelling pressure of the standard Welsh language (as used, for example, by the B B C) The Linguistic Survey of Scotland takes account of the Isle of Man because Manx 'may be regarded as an early offshoot' of Scottish Gaelic K H Jackson's study of Manx[8] (achieved at the eleventh hour) is of interest not only to Celticists but also to students of the English dialects influenced by 'substratum' Manx and to linguists generally who are interested in the state of a language which is approaching extinction as a naturally learnt medium

In *Das Wortgeographische Prinzip in den deutschen Mundartwörterbuchern* (*Orbis*), D Berthold examines the somewhat uneasy relations existing between those dialect studies which cling to the dictionary approach and those committed to the newer 'linguistic geography' Readers interested in the principles of place-name study may wish to note E Dickenmann's long article, *Aufgaben und Methoden der russischen Ortnamenforschung*, which appears (in two parts) in *Beitrage zur Namenforschung* In *Acta Linguistica* (Budapest), L Hegedűs's article *Experimental Phonetics in the Service of the Linguistic Atlas* is of great interest for its historical sketch

[7] *The Status Significance of an Isolated Urban Dialect*, by G N Putnam and E M O'Hern Washington, D C Catholic University of America Press pp v+32 50 cents

[8] *Contributions to the Study of Manx Phonology*, by K H Jackson (University of Edinburgh Linguistic Survey of Scotland Monographs 2) Edinburgh Nelson pp x+149 15*s*

of mechanical aids in dialect work and for what we learn of the methods of the Hungarian survey, especially in connexion with the use of instruments in the analysis of segmental and supra-segmental features

As to the study of sounds in general, the year is notable for the appearance of a second, corrected and expanded, edition of *Preliminaries to Speech Analysis*,[9] and for the publication by C F Hockett of *A Manual of Phonology*,[10] which had not, however, come to hand at the time of writing In *Frequency of Consonant Clusters* (*L*), S Saporta is concerned that statements about the existence or non-existence of a feature in a language are inadequate and that relative frequency is of the utmost importance Consonants are put on a scale indicating their degrees of mutual distinctiveness (according to the system in *Preliminaries to Speech Analysis*), and the frequency of English clusters is then compared with the degree of distinctiveness The data (admittedly based on an inadequate sample) suggest that the frequency of clusters is related to a compromise between speaker's effort and listener's ease clusters extremely similar and extremely different are the rarest Contrary to the widespread view that, in English, stress for the most part conditions intonation, D L Bolinger, in *Intersections of Stress and Intonation* (*Word*), argues that 'under certain conditions it is the intonation that conditions an allophonic change in **the stress'.**

In his important article *On the Phonetic and Phonemic Problems of the Southern English WH-Sounds* in *Zeitschrift fur Phonetik und allgemeine Sprachwissenschaft*, J Vachek examines the phonetic development of words like *who, whole, whore,* and reaches significant conclusions both for the history of English and for linguistics itself—especially in his argument that there need be no antipathy between diachronic and synchronic studies In *Orbis* M Durand resumes a discussion from the previous volume and explores briefly the complexities of *La Notion de syllabe* Both in *English Language Teaching (The Length Mark in Phonetic Transcription)* and in *Maître Phonétique (Transcription of English)*, L A Hill argues that the length mark draws unjustifiable attention to differences of length in English vowels whereas it is the qualitative difference that is worthier of attention, he thus prefers [fit], [fit] to [fit], [fi t] Some phonetic problems in American English are considered in the light of experimental phonetics by W Ruth, *Miscellanea Phonetica* [11] Other phonetic studies, by H Pilch, M D Berger, and A A Hill, are dealt with in Chapter III

Turning to more complex units than the phoneme, we have Z S Harris, in *From Phoneme to Morpheme* (*L*), presenting a procedure which may well (especially in marginal cases) turn out to have great importance it is one which provides a method of morpheme segmentation based solely on a comparison of phonemic sequences and without reference to the common distributional and semantic procedures J Erben, *Prinzipielles zur Syntaxforschung* in *Beitrage zur Geschichte der deutschen Sprache und Literatur* (Halle), regrets that, whereas in

[9] *Preliminaries to Speech Analysis*, by R Jakobson, M Fant, and M Halle Cambridge, Mass Massachusetts Institute of Technology pp viii+58 (offset) $1

[10] *A Manual of Phonology*, by C F Hockett (Indiana University Publications in Anthropology and Linguistics) Baltimore Waverly Press pp v+246

[11] In *Anglo-Americana* (Festschrift zum 70 Geburtstag von L Hibler-Lebmannsport), ed by K Brunner (Wiener Beitrage zur englischen Philologie 62) Vienna and Stuttgart Braumuller pp xii+184 DM 16 80

phonological research a new system has been built up, in syntax we are still for the most part working with the old framework of classical categories, with their philosophical and logical bases After examining the standpoints of two modern German grammarians, H Becker and H Glinz, Erben gives an exposition of the system he himself evolved in his study of Luther This distinguishes a 'formal structure' from a 'functional or inner structure' Under the first we treat main and subordinate clauses and the organization of words within the clauses, as well as the organization of the clauses in relation to each other Under the second (to which it is hard to give proper or critical attention in this space), we have analysis of function (syntactic function of word-classes, word-clusters, clauses, &c), functions and their vehicles ('Trager'), and the relation between the functions All in all, it is an interesting scheme, developed from the traditional analysis and largely independent of modern approaches to syntax By contrast, S Chatman (see Chapter III) pursues the attempt to develop a structuralist method of handling syntax, following up the ideas of Z S Harris, and for a further example of methods involving morphemics and immediate constituents reference should be made to E H Jorden's dissertation [12] C F Hockett, *Attribution and Apposition* (*AS*), discusses an issue in the description of syntactical structure, which was raised recently in *American Speech* by D W Lee and E Haugen, involving criteria for distinguishing between words in apposition and word-groups in which one word is an attribute of another In *A Note on Bloomfield's Limiting Adjectives* (*ES*) H Frei makes a negative criticism of Bloomfield's classification as involving circular argument and promises a constructive suggestion in the forthcoming Roman Jakobson *Festschrift* (see Chapter III)

The syntax of the verb receives a good deal of attention *A Reconsideration of the Problem of Time, Tense, and Aspect in Modern English* (*ES*) by B M Charleston is of interest to linguists generally in exploring a difficult area in linguistic expression where form and function present considerable difficulties, a situation made no easier by the fact that in English 'aspect' is something of a portmanteau category (see Chapter III) Discussion can be very much more precise in German (as we see in E Hofmann's *Zu Aspekt und Aktionsart*),[13] where a valuable distinction is possible English terminology is lamented by F T Visser, who objects to *The Terms 'Subjunctive' and 'Indicative'* (*ES*) as applied to English, and proposes 'modally marked' and 'modally zero' (see Chapter III) T B W Reid's article *On the Analysis of the Tense-System of French* (*Revue de linguistique romane*) is likewise concerned with descriptive terminology as well as with the problem of form and function in 'tense' Further investigations of tense which have a general interest are *Les Temps du Français* by K. Togeby (*Lingua*), and, with reference to Afrikaans, *Absolute and Relative Tenses* (*Lingua*)

In an important article in *Časopis pro moderní filologii* (with a summary in English), J Firbas explores the relationship between English syntax, the pauses of actual speech and conventional punctuation, following up earlier articles in which he has made progress towards a linguistic interpre-

[12] *The Syntax of Modern Colloquial Japanese*, by E H Jorden (Language Dissertation 52) Baltimore Waverly Press pp v+135 $2 25

[13] In *Corolla Linguistica* (Festschrift Ferdinand Sommer), ed by H Krahe Wiesbaden Harrassowitz pp viii+254

tation of the English punctuation system In the same periodical, and also on the relationship between spoken and written English (but without a summary in English), J Vachek traces the rise of the conventional form of written English and the morphemic development of our orthography (which groups *walked* with *ended*, but distinguishes *foul* and *fowl*) Another impressive contribution from Vachek this year appears in *Sborník Praci Filosofické Fakulty* of Brno entitled *Some Thoughts on the So-Called Complex Condensation in Modern English* This compares the characteristically nominal structure of English with the equally characteristically verbal structure of Czech, with reference to 'complex condensation' (Mathesius's term), as exemplified in '*barking* dogs rarely bite', the Czech equivalent of which is translated as 'a dog *that barks* does not bite'

The regrettably unrevised English in *A Statistical Research of Spoken Language* does not obscure some interesting features in this article on Dutch by L Kaiser in *Orbis* But while one welcomes procedures for investigating spoken languages, the present study is somewhat disappointing in that the features selected for counting and comparison are unsatisfactory and lacking in significance H Koziol, *Wortwiederholung nach Einschuben* (*Die Neueren Sprachen*), assembles English instances of an important feature of colloquial syntactical structure which is prominently reflected in literary monuments also the type of resumption after an interruption which demonstrates the cohesiveness of certain elements, particularly subject and verb, but also verb and object or complement, and antecedent and relative pronoun Lack of space forbids mention of several other contributions in *Die Neueren Sprachen* (notably those by G Kirchner, R Majut, H Müllerschotte, W Schmidt-Hidding, and R Thielke) which have importance for both English grammar and linguistics more widely

There are several works on the history or prehistory of language In *The Psychogenetic Foundation of Language* (*Lingua*) G Révész expounds his 'contact' theory of the origin of language, in which three types of contact (instinctive, emotional, and mental) are postulated, correlating with three 'stadial' concepts (cry, call, and word) and three functional ones (imperative, indicative, and interrogative) W P Lehmann, in *The Proto-Indo-European Resonants in Germanic* (*L*), contributes to Germanic philology by adducing junctural phenomena to explain some difficulties (for example, the Gothic *-eis/-jis* variation) with regard to the semivowels, liquids, and nasals This theme is taken up in a short note by W Winter, *Juncture in Proto-Germanic Some Deliberations* (*L*), who differs from Lehmann on some points and who advances a junctural theory in connexion with Verner's Law which would take us farther than Verner did with his postulation only of accentual difference

Following H Krahe's comprehensive survey in 1954 of the old philological problems such as the 'Urheimat' of the 'Indogermanische Sprachenfamilie',[14] we need not be surprised at the outburst of interest in the character and development of Indo-European O Hofler contributes two instalments of an authoritative study, *Stammbaumtheorie, Wellentheorie, Entfaltungstheorie* in the Tubingen *Beitrage zur Geschichte der deutschen Sprache und Literatur*, surveying the chief theories from the time of Schmidt and Schleicher of the way in which

[14] *Sprache und Vorzeit*, by H Krahe Heidelberg Quelle & Meyer pp 180 DM 5 80

the Indo-European languages spread While seeing no essential discrepancy between the 'family-tree' theory and the 'wave' theory, J W Marchand in *Was there ever a Uniform Proto-Indo-European?* (*Orbis*) argues that the assumption of a uniform starting-point, as in the family-tree theory, is a necessary basis for scientific comparative linguistics V Pisani, *A Schleicher und einige Richtungen der heutigen Sprachwissenschaft* (*Lingua*), sees modern linguistics since de Saussure as developing directly, though with some obvious modifications, from Schleicher and his successors in the great period of German comparative philology Schleicher's view of language as a natural organism was of a piece with the family-tree theory of language relationships, and this in turn stimulated the exact sound-laws and reconstructions, and so contributed to the development of a rigorous scientific attitude of language study A similar note is struck in *Neogrammarians and Sound-Laws* by E Pulgram (*Orbis*), who counters the modern sneers at the neogrammarians by showing that their concept of 'sound-laws' was scientific and that we have been building ever since upon their foundation

Sanskrit is valued not only for its own sake but as the soundest basis for the comparative grammar of Indo-European languages, and also indeed (by reason of Pāṇini and others) for the evolution of grammatical study itself The new book by T Burrow[15] embraces all these aspects, and is the more to be welcomed in that it is written in a deceptively homely style which makes it attractive and informative even for those who have not previously studied Sanskrit Only a competent Sanskrit scholar could offer a detailed critical commentary, and for such an attempt readers are referred to the 21-page review by P Thieme in *Language* xxxi 428 ff

Zipf's 'principle of least effort', says A Martinet,[16] applies to linguistic as much as to other human behaviour 'L'évolution linguistique en général peut être conçue comme régie par l'antinomie permanente des besoins communicatifs et expressifs de l'homme et de sa tendance à réduire au minimum son activité mentale et physique' (p 94) We have seen something of this theme in Saporta's article reported above and the argument is well pursued here Martinet's book is valuable for its theoretical statements (on function, structure, prosody), and it is amply illustrated, largely from Romance, Celtic, and Slavic languages but with a lengthy discussion of the English 'Great Vowel Shift' (where it is odd, however, to find Jespersen treated as the authority on the history of English sounds) On the other hand there is some danger of exaggerating economy and of forgetting that fashion too is a powerful factor in linguistic change—sometimes indeed militating against economy, as one can see in the increasing use by British restaurateurs of the term 'French fried potatoes' for what they once designated 'chips' The dictates of fashion have been shown by historical linguists to have had a hand in changing English sounds, and even after Martinet's learned and persuasive arguments it remains true that economy can be much more readily seen in a language's allophonic variations than in its phonemic development

A number of other contributors to historical linguistics must be treated briefly Glottochronology, based on

[15] *The Sanskrit Language*, by T Burrow (The Great Languages series) Faber & Faber pp vii+426 55*s*

[16] *Économie des changements phonétiques*, by A Martinet (Bibliotheca Romanica 10) Berne Francke pp 396 Sw Fr 26

the assumption that languages for the most part change at a uniform rate, is given a good deal of attention in the April number of the *International Journal of American Linguistics*, with articles by A L Kroeber, D Taylor and I Rouse, G H Fairbanks, S C Gudschinsky, and M Swadesh himself, the pioneer and leading light in this branch of linguistic theory Historical linguists concerned with the problem of investigating the phonology of past states of a language through study of the written remains will greatly profit from the procedure and analysis presented by C A Robson in *Literary Language, Spoken Dialect, and the Phonological Problem in Old French* (*TPS*), the relevance for Old and Middle English studies is obvious H B Garey's work on Old French[17] is also of interest to linguists generally It introduces 'a technique for analysing the temporal meanings of utterances at the descriptive, synchronic level' and correlates 'these meanings with grammatical categories', so discovering the system of temporal meanings that a language possesses The author's starting-point is Reichenbach's *Elements of Symbolic Logic*, and he has taken full account of recent sign and linguistic theories

Although primarily concerned with problems and disputes in Romance philology, Y Malkiel's discussion of *Etymology and Historical Grammar* (*Romance Philology*) is of wider interest in showing the inevitability of differences in perspective between the grammarian (interested in mass and pattern) and the etymologist (concerned with the single item and its individuality) It is nevertheless essential for results in both fields that there should be co-operation and exchange

[17] *The Historical Development of Tenses from Late Latin to Old French*, by H B Garey. (Language Dissertation 51) Baltimore Waverly Press pp 107 $2 25

There are two studies of English influence upon German vocabulary. P F Ganz, in *Seventeenth-Century English Loan-Words in German* (*JEGP*), discusses seventeen examples of English lexical influence as a welcome contribution to the study of English impact upon 'the cultural climate in Germany', while E Erametsa devotes a monograph[18] to the hyperbolic and intensifying expressions characteristic of the eighteenth-century literature of sentiment Erametsa examines early German translations of Fielding, Richardson, Smollett, Sterne, and others, and notices the significant appearance of plural abstract nouns, agent nouns in *-er*, compounds with *selbst-*, *uber-*, *un-*, and especially *halb-* and *ganz-* There are noteworthy translation-loans (as *Leidens-bruder* for 'fellow-sufferer') and semantic loans (as *Politur* for 'polish' in the sense of 'refinement'), and the author has produced a study of great interest in illustrating the directions and terms of semantic influence

Among the notable events in lexicography must be mentioned the publication of Carnoy's etymological dictionary,[19] which, however, the present writer has been unable to see, and the ninth fascicle (N–R) of Pokorny's [20] This dictionary, which started to appear in 1951, is far from being just a new edition of Walde-Pokorny, which took account of scholarship only to 1923, and in which Walde's views were reproduced for the most part unaltered Pokorny is now writing in the light of scholarship as

[18] *Englische Lehnpragungen in der deutschen Empfindsamkeit des 18 Jahrhunderts*, by E Erametsa Helsinki Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia pp 136

[19] *Dictionnaire étymologique du proto-indo-européen*, by A Carnoy Louvain Publications Universitaires pp xii+224

[20] *Indogermanisches etymologisches Worterbuch*, by J Pokorny (Neunte Lieferung) Bern Francke pp 96 Sw Fr 12

recent as 1947, including that on Tokharian and Hittite, and—what is superficially more striking—presents his material in an ordinary alphabetic arrangement These features, together with other improvements and corrections, guarantee the acceptance of the new dictionary as a fundamental reference book

Other works of lexicographical interest are P Zumthor's article on *Évolution et structure du Franzosisches etymologisches Worterbuch* and H Wanner's on *Das Schweizerdeutsche Worterbuch*, both in *Orbis* H Kupper's dictionary of colloquial German[21] contains a 20-page essay on the subject and is interesting too in being something of a bilingual dictionary Part II (60 pp) is an alphabetical list of Standard German words, giving the corresponding colloquialisms (thus in Part I, *Heldenfett* 'Marmelade', in Part II, *Marmelade* 'Heldenfett')

H Koziol presents two short studies on word-formation In *Forderung und Hemmung analoger Wortbildungen im Englischen* (in *Anglo-Americana* see note 11) he considers the operation of emotive factors in English word-formation, and in *Zur Aufnahme von Wortneubildungen im Englischen* (*Orbis*) he discusses the way in which new formations spread and are received Again with reference to English, *Synchronic Analysis and Word-Formation* by H Marchand in *Cahiers Ferdinand de Saussure* is a criticism of the continuing tendency to ill-organized and unsystematic work in this important aspect of morphology

Linguists interested in the phenomenon of taboo will find useful material in W B Lockwood's *Word Taboo in the Language of the Faroese Fishermen* (*TPS*), which deals with the suppression at sea of the ordinary names for common objects until some time in the nineteenth century

One of the phenomena of scholarship in recent years has been the increasing interest of philosophers in language and of linguists in philosophy, a desire indeed to see a synthesis centred upon communication The theme of *Der Mensch und Sein Wort*[22] is 'linguistic expression as a guide to personality', and the book will be of interest to the linguist and psychologist alike (and—one may add—to the literary critic), though it is written with far more familiarity with psychological research than linguistic, and with work published in German than in other languages The relation between mental processes and linguistic events is the concern too of J Horzelski in his *Remarks on the Psychology of Language* (*Philosophy*), which in distinguishing between sign-systems (animal) and symbol-systems (human) as different processes and not merely 'different features of the same process', makes an interesting approach to semantics E H Lenneberg, *A Note on Cassirer's Philosophy* (*Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*), examines the changes that took place in Cassirer's treatment of language between *Die Philosophie der symbolischen Formen* (1923–9) and *An Essay on Man* (1944), by which time 'he had by and large abandoned the view that every language represents a specific *modus cogitandi*', concluding instead that human speech itself (not individual languages) constitutes the medium 'essential for the full realisation of knowledge'

There have been many visions in recent years of an integration of the social sciences, from the now much-publicized theories of B L Whorf to

[21] *Worterbuch der deutschen Umgangssprache*, by H Kupper Hamburg Claassen pp 421

[22] *Der Mensch und Sein Wort*, by A Schlismann Innsbruck Verlag Felizian Rauch pp 180

the appearance in 1954 of Tschirch's grouping of 'world-picture', thought-structure, and speech as basic problems in linguistics[23] J R Firth, too, has long insisted that a person's language habits cannot be separated from the rest of his activity and the social and material context in which he is placed No one, however, before K L Pike[24] has dared to do much more than indicate the lines along which such integrated study may take place Pike, one of the most strikingly original of present-day linguists, has formulated a structural theory of the entire range of human behaviour, seen in terms of 'behavioremes' whose structure is of three modes—feature, distribution, and manifestation It is perhaps odd to find linguistic analysis used as the model for an analysis of human behaviour in view of the rather obtrusive fact that structural linguistics has made so little progress yet in tackling the higher units within its own domain If there is room to doubt that the phoneme and morpheme have exact analogues at the syntactic and semantic level, still more scepticism is likely as to whether the activity that is even further removed from the phonemic system can be seen in terms of an extrapolation from it Nevertheless the parts published so far of Pike's scheme (Part I appeared in 1954) constitute something of a trial run or a preview, and it is too soon to pass judgement, we await his further work in this field with more than usual interest

Philosophy and Language (*Philosophical Quarterly*), by A G N Flew, is to be welcomed as a useful guide for linguists to the views of the language-minded philosophers from the time of the Wittgenstein dictum (1921), 'All philosophy is "Critique of Language"' An exponent of the 'linguistic approach to philosophy', Flew argues that ordinary language can solve philosophical paradoxes by the 'Argument of the Paradigm Case' (language usage assembled somewhat in the manner of the citation dictionary) This approach has much in common with the general trend in language study of the past century, but among philosophers there is still room for sturdy counter-attack as to whether it serves a proper philosophical purpose —as we see in W F R Hardie's article *Ordinary Language and Perception* (*Philosophical Quarterly*), which also has considerable interest for language students Both sides in the dispute might do well to consider the view, being debated among linguists, of language as a grid interposed between speakers and reality, a grid which provides them with their segmentation of reality, partly a misconception, partly a convenient abstraction, partly arbitrary and partly realistic Like Flew and Hardie, K W Rankin in *Linguistic Analysis and the Justification of Induction* (*Philosophical Quarterly*) explores the question of whether 'linguistic analysis' (in the philosophers' sense) will provide the treatment for the 'kind of mental cramp' which is one way of regarding philosophical problems

In *Linguistique et Psychologie* (*Orbis*) R Husson and G L Meinsma argue that linguistics can get nowhere without taking account of psychophysiological factors, not merely because students in the disciplines concerned need to consult and exchange results, but because they are in fact working on the same problem As though to demonstrate this, T Thass-Thienemann contributes 'a study in

[23] *Weltbild, Denkform und Sprachgestalt*, by F Tschirch Berlin Herbert Renner pp 104 DM 6 80

[24] *Language in Relation to a Unified Theory of the Structure of Human Behavior* (Part II), by K L Pike Glendale, Calif Summer Institute of Linguistics pp v+85 (lithoprinted)

the psychoanalysis of language', *Left-Handed Writing* (*Psycho-Analytic Review*), which considers a class of words that have beside their lexical meaning a 'repressed latent meaning', since they can be shown to be originally images reflecting 'fantasies which are forgotten, repressed and repudiated by the speech community' Symbolism, from phonetic to semantic, was the field explored by a Clark University conference, eight papers from which have been edited by H Werner [25] The authors are linguists, psychologists, critics, and philosophers, and the topics are correspondingly varied, likely to be of most interest to readers of *YW* are the papers by Susanne Langer and H Sperber, but the collection as a whole is disappointing

N Chomsky, in *Logical Syntax and Semantics their Linguistic Relevance* (*L*), replies to Y Bar-Hillel's claim (made in the previous volume of *L*) that Carnap's logical syntax is 'formal' and therefore adaptable to structural linguistics Chomsky objects to this use of 'formal' the difference between *John saw Mary* and *Mary was seen by John* is no more usefully described as 'active and passive' than as 'three words longer'—both are equally 'formal' He points out too that semantics offers no way of determining synonymy, and so neither logical syntax nor semantics seems to Chomsky to offer any present help to the structuralist Also concerned with Carnap's logical syntax is E Koschmieder, who asks *Ist das Symbolsystem der Logistik eine Sprache?* (*Munchen Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft*) and replies that it is not, but rather a notation F W Harwood's article, *Axiomatic Syntax the Construction and Evaluation of a Syntactic Calculus* (*L*), would be open to Chomsky's and Koschmieder's objections that mathematics, logic, and artificial languages are imperfect analogies to any natural language Moreover, attractive as Harwood's scheme is, one would wish to see it applied to the complexities of actual syntactic sequences in order to gauge its usefulness In *Le Classement logique des oppositions* (*Word*) J Cantineau takes up Trubetzkoy's chapter on the subject, and argues forcefully that the methods of symbolic logic can be usefully applied to the notion of linguistic oppositions P Diderichsen,[26] too, wants to bring linguistics and logic together, saying that while they are autonomous studies, they have a common frontier area in semantics which demands that there should be co-operation in method, terminology, and viewpoint

H Straumann, *Between Literary Criticism and Semantics* (*ES*), surveys the common ground between literary critics, philosophers, and students of language, and indeed the increasing exploration of links between criticism and linguistics is one of the most welcome products of the present quest for 'synthesis' [27] P L Garvin has made available several essays, dating from the late twenties, by members of the Prague structuralist school[28] who explored the systematic linguistic features present in various styles of writing, and who (especially in the

[25] *On Expressive Language*, ed by H Werner (Clark University Monographs in Psychology and Related Disciplines) Worcester, Mass Clark U P pp 81

[26] *Semantiske Problemer i Logik og Lingvistik*, by P Diderichsen Copenhagen Munksgaard pp 30 Dan Kr 2 50

[27] *Speculative Instruments*, by I A Richards, is considered elsewhere Mention should also be made of a 1954 book, *Untersuchungen zur Onomatopoie*, 1 Teil *Die Sprachpsychologischen Versuche*, by H Wissemann Heidelberg Winter pp 241

[28] *A Prague School Reader on Esthetics, Literary Structure, and Style*, trans and ed by P L Garvin Washington, D C Washington Linguistic Club pp iv+186 (mimeographed)

case of Jan Mukařovský) achieved results which it is a pleasure to study in this English version Following up his attempt in 1953 with a lyric from *The Princess*, A A Hill offers *An Analysis of 'The Windhover' an Experiment in Structural Method* (*PMLA*), which is the application to literary analysis of the structuralism of Trager and Smith Hill adduces a pattern and a structure for the poem (though mostly, one feels, after he leaves linguistics behind), and one hopes for further essays from him of this kind, since they promise to demonstrate a most happy co-operation between linguistics and criticism *Poetry, Language, and Communication* (*Philosophy*) is a reply by O M Meidner to M Mayo's article of the same title in the previous volume and condemns Mayo's view of poetry as obscurantist, involving belief in individual responses to words, so tending to deny the possibility of a poet's communicating Meidner reasserts the view that poetry has a public, describable meaning along the semantic, the syntactic, and above all the pragmatic 'dimensions' (the latter terms in Charles Morris's sense) In an article in *N* P Guiraud presents a convenient outline of *Stylistiques.*

The importance to semantics of the 'real character' movement was demonstrated long ago in *The Meaning of Meaning* In an article on *Comenius and the Real Character in England* (*PMLA*) B DeMott traces the influence of Comenius upon the seventeenth-century English movement for the reform of language, and argues that the movement was impelled by ecclesiastical problems as well as by the growing scientific interest in language and meaning E Lecky has to some extent the same theme in *Words and Things* (*Etc*), where he examines the evidence in English writings from the early seventeenth century for awareness of the need to distinguish between symbols and what is symbolized The increasingly sophisticated attitude to language is also reflected in the article by G E Noyes, *The Critical Reception of Johnson's 'Dictionary' in the latter 18th century* (*MP*), where the author assembles numerous comments which reflect interesting views on etymology and lexicology, Monboddo, for instance, was disappointed that Johnson had not distinguished figurative from literal meaning

There are several studies in semantics itself O Funke, *Zum Problem des Bedeutungswandel* (in *Anglo-Americana* see note 11), makes some interesting notes on semantic change in what is, practically speaking, a review of two recent works, Kronasser's *Handbuch der Semasiologie* and Ullmann's *Principles of Semantics* R Dettering's *What Phonetic Writing did to Meaning* (*Etc*) examines the attitude of the analytic philosophers to language and meaning, and argues that while in speech words only 'acquire their significance retroactively', from the 'completed sentence', the Western system of (roughly) phonemic writing has introduced a tendency to overemphasize the meaning of individual words and so to create fictional entities, hence, he thinks, empirical philosophy A Sieberer's *Vom Gefuhlswert der Worter* (*Die Sprache*) is the concluding part of an essay in general semantics, and mention should be made too of the study by L Weisgerber, *Der Begriff des Wortes* in *Corolla Linguistica* (see note 13), and of J Xenaxis's examination of meaning as regards proper as opposed to common nouns, *The Logic of Proper Names* (*Methodos*) A W Read summarizes the use of *The Term 'Meaning' in Linguistics*,[29] and shows reason

[29] In *Report of the 6th Annual Round Table Meeting on Linguistics and Language*

why the word should not be used as though to connote an entity, but, renouncing the dualism of form and meaning, treated more in accordance with Firth's definition, 'a complex of contextual relations'

Even those who resent the slick familiarity with which S Chase beguiles his readers must concede that he is an able popularizer of linguistics and allied subjects Certainly his recent book,[30] which is to some extent a rewriting and modernization of *The Tyranny of Words* (1938), contains a good deal of information useful to the general public—and even the student—on linguistics, semantics, and cybernetics Its defects are in part those common to most popularizations but in part they are peculiar to Chase himself Although he must be given credit for having consulted 'experts' freely, he inevitably gives only a superficial and light-hearted account of the subjects treated, and so a misleading impression that their procedures are elementary and their results virtually complete Moreover, despite faint disclaimers, he still appears to believe in some of the extravagant claims, made in the name of 'general semantics', to provide quick panaceas for all communication problems

La Sémantique[31] is the second volume that P Guiraud has contributed to the lively *Que Sais-Je?* series (*La Stylistique* appeared in 1954) Though semantics is a psychological, logical, and linguistic problem, it is only with its latter aspect that this book is concerned Guiraud very properly protests that the subject is too often treated as though its sole function were to elucidate *change* of meaning, and with a quick but commendably thorough survey of the main semanticists from Bréal and de Saussure to Sperber and Ullmann, he proceeds to expound structural, descriptive, and field semantics The material is illustrated by a score of excellent diagrams and tables

The quest for a synthesis already referred to has resulted in the formation of a Communication Research Centre at University College, London, the first printed product of which—a collection of essays—has now appeared [32] A J Ayer makes a counterblast to oversanguine general semanticists in stressing that linguistic analysis and semantics, important as they are, cannot themselves provide the solution to philosophical and extra-philosophical problems, though they can direct us to see the problems more clearly J B S Haldane discusses communication in biology, particularly between members of the same species (for instance, bees), but also between members of different species (for instance, flowers to insects, and wasps—with their stripes—to all of us) C Cherry links telecommunication theory with human linguistic behaviour as seen through Charles Morris's tripartite analysis, syntactics, semantics, and pragmatics Sir G Vickers gives a sobering and challenging survey of the resources and problems of communication in industry. J Z Young shows the need for the study and use of new analogies if progress in biological research is to be maintained, since the terminology at present available creates restrictive patterns of thought R Wittkower discusses the investigation of function

Teaching, ed by R H Weinstein (Georgetown University Monograph Series on Languages and Linguistics 8) Washington, D C Georgetown U P pp vi+195

[30] *Power of Words*, by S Chase London Phoenix House pp xii+308. 18*s*

[31] *La Sémantique*, by P Guiraud (Que Sais-Je? 655) Paris Presses Universitaires de France pp 118

[32] *Studies in Communication*, by A J Ayer and others, with an Introduction by B I Evans Secker & Warburg pp vii+182 21*s* See Chapter III, n 21

and meaning in the visual arts, and T B L Webster examines (especially with reference to the semantic development of *psyche*) the ways in which a precise terminology and style were evolved in Ancient Greece to express the new world-view that was formulated D B Fry surveys recent results in the language laboratory, including interesting experiments with 'auditory feed-back', and the present state of research on the speech synthesizer

In *An Oral Communication Model* (*L*) G E Peterson attempts to correlate work in communication theory with that in the motor (physiological) and acoustic (perceptual) aspects of speech This is a very tall order and it is no discredit to Peterson that he scarcely gets beyond some synthesizing generalities He demonstrates that the communication event must be described both physiologically and acoustically, and that hypotheses about stimulus-response interaction should be based upon the study of actual (natural) speech exchange R L Birdwhistell, *Background to Kinesics* (*Etc*), marshalls the ways in which language is accompanied, assisted, or replaced by facial expression, gestures, posture, and the like, and suggests how they may be systematically studied The need for such study is reinforced in the article on *Gesture* (*English Language Teaching*) by D Abercrombie, who deplores the common assumptions that gesture is an unimportant accompaniment of speech and that it is virtually the same in all language communities He goes on to outline the types of gesture used by English-speakers, giving numerous bibliographical references, the historical ones being particularly useful The magic word 'communication' as used by D V Smith[33] has little relevance to the scientific study of language, and though she has some interesting pages on language and English grammar, her book is concerned chiefly with elementary-school education

One of the liveliest communication problems is translation, and there are several contributions to note, among them J Wirl's interesting remarks, *Erwagungen zum Problem des Übersetzens* (in *Anglo-Americana* see note 11), and E Koschmieder's treatment of *Das Problem der Übersetzung* (in *Corolla Linguistica* see note 13) But Y Bar-Hillel strikes the note of predominant interest today when he asks *Can Translation be Mechanised?* (*Methodos*) Although written two years before publication (and a year is liable to be a long time in the age of cybernetics), his review of the linguistic problems involved has not been seriously outdated by events in the meantime, though his suggestions for mechanized translation involve a much heavier reliance upon 'post-editing' than experts at present feel they need to assume A Kaplan's outline of *An Experimental Study of Ambiguity and Context* (*Mechanical Translation*), though a reprint of a 1950 article, is still less in danger of being regarded as out of date since it is not concerned with mechanical developments themselves His interesting experiments reveal that an adequate contextual guide to the identification of meaning consists of the word preceding and the word following the one to be translated, with the possibility of extending this a further unit each way in case of continuing ambiguity Revising a paper of 1952, E Reifler describes procedures for the *Mechanical Determination of the Constituents of German Substantive Compounds* (*Mechanical*

[33] *Communication the Miracle of Shared Living*, by D V Smith London and New York Macmillan pp x+105 17*s* 6*d* $2 50

Translation) which would make it possible to keep down the size of the mechanical memory and still permit analysis and translation of compounds, including *ad hoc* ones In *Sentence for Sentence Translation* (*Mechanical Translation*) V H Yngve discusses the problem of getting a machine to analyse the input into structural units This seems possible by taking word-sequences and the whole context into account and allowing for an analysis of words into classes—not the eight traditional parts of speech but some hundreds of functionally different types Given such an analysis, says Yngve, the output side of the translation process would be relatively simple

A collection of essays on this subject, of uneven quality and dating from 1949, has been edited by W N Locke and A D Booth [34] The first essay is a general one on translation by W Weaver The next three (by R H Richens and A D Booth, A G Oettinger, and K E Harper respectively) explore the possibilities of ignoring syntax and of providing word-for-word translations, glossing each word according to its leading meanings This has the attraction of being technically easy, but despite confident assertions by the authors the present writer finds the resultant 'translations' practically incomprehensible W E Bull, C Africa, and D Teichroew present a paper on 'problems of the word', interesting enough but vitiated by repeated confusion of sound and spelling, and the misleading use of 'phoneme' for what is normally called a 'letter' They rightly emphasize the danger of concluding from word-frequency lists that because a few hundred words may occupy 80 per cent of a given book these few hundred enable us to say all we want it is the far more complex 20 per cent which does the heaviest semantic work W N Locke's essay on 'speech output' is in many ways the least satisfactory in the book, not only are we offered a series of untested hypotheses, but, in view of recent work by C C Fries and others, it is disturbing to find stated as a fact that 'Paragraphs, sentences, clauses, quoted portions etc ' in speech can be distinguished 'on the basis of the length of pauses preceding or following them' The seventh contribution is a useful factual list by A D Booth of the 'storage devices' available at the time of writing L E Dostert reports on the much publicized 'Georgetown-IBM experiment' in which some actual translation was performed mechanically in 1954, though with a drastically reduced vocabulary of some 250 words It might have helped if Dostert had presented also the Russian text involved and the resultant translation, and he ought to have pointed out that the Russian sentences translated were in fact known beforehand to the man who programmed the machine (as Bar-Hillel tells us in his article in *Methodos* noticed above)

Most practical students of machine translation have assumed either an incomplete translation (as Oettinger and others in this volume) or an editing of the text before or after translation An extreme example is Weaver's suggestion on p 23 of a 'descent from the Tower' through the use of an artificial common 'language' susceptible to machine handling S C Dodd's 'Model English' is an attempt to devise a kind of regularized grammar that could easily be learnt and easily subjected to mechanical analysis, and just to show how practicable it all is, Dodd's paper 'did be writed entirely in Model English' By contrast, E

[34] *Machine Translation of Languages*, ed by W N Locke and A D Booth New York Wiley, London Chapman & Hall pp xii+243 48*s*

Reifler and V H Yngve resolutely attempt in their essays to devise methods which avoid editing of any kind and which nevertheless may produce complete translation These two papers, on the mechanical determination of meaning and the problem of multiple meaning respectively, are among the most promising in the volume and linguistically the most mature, though there is a good deal that is thought-provoking too in the paper on logical concepts for syntax by L and A Wundheiler It is not easy to see, interesting though they are, what contribution to machine translation is made by Y Bar-Hillel's article on idioms, or (except negatively) by J W Perry's on the problem of practical development

III ENGLISH LANGUAGE

By R M WILSON

IN his book on Latin loans in Old English H Gneuss is concerned mainly with those coined after the pattern of Latin words [1] Introductory chapters deal with the general theory of borrowing, and the possible forms of the resulting words, but the greater part of the book consists of a detailed investigation of such loans in the gloss to the *Vespasian Psalter*, arranged under various general headings Three lists follow, one of the loan words, another of words whose formation has possibly been influenced by Latin, and a third of words showing possible semantic influence This is an excellent piece of work, particularly important to the lexicographer and the student of Old English, but also with much of interest in it for those interested in more general linguistic problems In an article on *'Neorxna wang' und 'Iða vǫllr'* (*A*) W Krogmann shows that this is essentially a pagan phrase which has been given a Christian meaning, and that, like *eorþan modor* and *Brosinga mene*, it is to be regarded as expressing a single concept But such a bare summary fails to do justice to the many points of interest touched upon and illuminated by the author of this article H R Loyn, *'Gesiths' and 'Thegns' in Anglo-Saxon England from the Seventh to the Tenth Century* (*English Historical Review*), examines the evidence in an attempt to define the meanings of the two terms at various points during the period

W H Bennett deals with *The Southern English Development of Germanic initial /f, s, þ/* (*L*) He suggests a connexion between the voicing in southern English and a similar one in Old Low Franconian Saxons and Jutes probably came to England from the Low Franconian area, and it may be that the first Germanic settlers in southern England already used the initial voiced spirants The argument as to whether *ea, eo, io*, represented vowels or diphthongs in Old English continues In *The Old English Short Digraphs Some Considerations* (*L*) R P Stockwell and C W Barritt reply to an earlier article by S M Kuhn and R Quirk The latter respond with *The Old English Digraphs A Reply* (*L*), and are in turn answered in an appendix to the first article Some grounds for agreement emerge, but on the whole the parties maintain their respective positions

Two new parts of the *Middle English Dictionary* complete the letter F [2] They contain a number of important articles, and if occasional controversial details remain, this is perhaps inevitable In the first part, the variant *feld* for *fold n I*, is probably scribal, while the single example of *flote* 'stream, river' seems an obvious error for *flode* The usual meaning 'to seize, capture' fits the examples under *fongen* 10 better than 'to attack, molest', and *folken* 'to marshal troops' has probably been influenced by *fylcian* In the second part, *forwall* seems to be a variant of *forfall*, *forthkald* (Rolle *Psalter* 77/64) is rather 'reviled', *forþemed* is an obvious error for *foryemed*, *forth-gangen* is a doubtful

[1] *Lehnbildungen und Lehnbedeutungen im Altenglischen*, by H Gneuss Berlin Schmidt pp viii+184

[2] *Middle English Dictionary Parts F 3 and 4*, by H Kurath and S M Kuhn Univ of Michigan Press and O U P pp 629–952 21*s* each part

compound, *fugel* (*Gen & Ex* 221) rather 'bird' in general than 'domesticated fowl', *fox* (*Best* 351) 'trickery' rather than 'crafty man' But these are minor points, and in comparison with the mass of excellently organized material in the *Dictionary* it is remarkable how few of them there are *Three Suggested Emendations of the 'Middle English Dictionary'* (*ES*) come from F Th Visser, who gives earlier examples of the use of *ensercher* and *fairneshed*, and points out that *faynes* (*Ipomedon*) is the verb and not the noun

H Pilch, in *Der Untergang des praverbs ge- im Englischen* (*Ang*), deals with the gradual loss of this prefix Verbs with an *i-* prefix in Middle English are listed, and the position is examined in various texts I A Gordon, *The 'Owl and the Nightingale' 258 The Semantic Development of 'Spell' (= 'rest')* (*MLN*), traces the development in meaning of OE *spala* from 'a substitute' to 'a period of rest—from labour, grief, annoyance, &c ' This last sense appears in late eighteenth-century English dialects, is found in present Australian, New Zealand, and American English, and is the sense that best fits this passage B Foster, *'Spell' (= 'Rest') An English Survival* (*MLN*), shows that the meaning is still found in the Durham dialect In *Middle English 'wery forwandred' A Rejoinder* (*ES*) M L Samuels points out that the development of such phrases is complex, and to determine which factor is uppermost in each individual case may be impossible Here, the evidence suggests a construction of *wery* with the past participle as the more important source T F Mustanoja notes that all the instances of *Middle English 'wery of wandred'* (*NM*) occur in conjunction with the adjective *wery*, and suggests that the general scarcity of the *of* variant in comparison with *for* is due to the greater causal force of the latter But in *'Troilus and Criseyde', IV, 607 'Of fered'* (*NM*) the same author shows that *of fered* is a combination of *of* plus a past participle, and not a past participle in which *of* is merely a verbal prefix, and this indicates that there were in Middle English instances of the type without *wery* In *wery of wandred* the preposition is probably not to be taken simply as an equivalent of the Old English genitive case governed by *wery*, but may represent a fusion of two constructions, *wery of* and *of wandred* (see Chapter VI) B Sundby, *A Note on Middle English 'sley(e)' (< Old English 'slege')* (*SN*), gives examples of *atte sleye* used in personal names in the sense 'at the sheep pasture' A J Bliss, *Quantity in Old French and Middle English* (*ALing*), surveys the work which has been done on the subject, and indicates some of the problems still to be solved

In his article on *The Hymn to the Virgin* (*Cymmrodorian Society's Publications*) E J Dobson deals with a poem of considerable interest because of the evidence which it provides for the contemporary pronunciation of English It is written in fifteenth-century English, but with Welsh spelling and in Welsh metre The extant texts of the *Hymn* are described in detail, their complicated affiliations discussed, and it is concluded that the extant manuscripts preserve more or less correctly the original forms The question of which are the original spellings and which are scribal is then discussed in detail, along with the evidence they provide for the pronunciation of contemporary English It is shown that much detailed information can be deduced from them, and that, most significant of all, by the time the poem was composed the first stage of the modern English 'vowel shift' was already completed An

edited text of the *Hymn* is then given, followed by a detailed list of variant readings, and useful textual notes The same author, in *Early Modern Standard English* (*TPS*), points out that there are some indications of a recognized standard of spoken as well as of written English during the fifteenth century In the sixteenth this standard is explicitly recognized and defined by grammarians, and more precise definitions are found in the seventeenth century This standard was the speech of London, and especially that of the highest social classes and of administration, though more limited in extent than it is today Moreover, a much greater variety of pronunciation was permitted, and sometimes the standard language ended by accepting, at first as permissible variants and finally as the norm, what had once been alien to it Dobson then outlines the salient features of educated pronunciation in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, and discusses the various sources for our knowledge, concluding that the best are the works of those English grammarians, spelling-reformers, &c , of whose lives and circumstances something is known K Brunner examines the *Expanded Verbal Forms in Early Modern English* (*ES*), and concludes that in all cases they are to be explained as describing action or event, and as placing it in the centre of interest An edition of the works of John Hart includes a hitherto unpublished work, printed from what is probably an autograph manuscript, and reprints of *An Orthographie* (1569) and *A Methode* (1570)[3] The introduction contains what is known of Hart's life, and gives a description of the manuscript of the first work and of the surviving printed copies of the others A second part will deal with the phonology, and the whole, when complete, will make a valuable addition to our knowledge of early modern English F Bergstrom, in *John Kirkby (1746) on English Pronunciation* (*SN*), gives an account of John Kirkby, a native of Cumberland and author of *A New English Grammar* The sources of this are discussed, and it is pointed out that Kirkby seems to render the contemporary standard pronunciation with some obvious Cumbrian traits Only the first six chapters of the *Grammar* deal with the sounds of English, the first of these is reprinted in full, and all are then examined in detail for the evidence they afford on contemporary pronunciation

A volume of essays by two of the foremost authorities on the subject worthily commemorates the bicentenary of the publication of Johnson's *Dictionary*[4] The first essay, on *Johnson's 'Dictionary' and Lexicographical Tradition I*, is reprinted from *MP* (see *YW* xxxiv 30) The second contains a careful reconstruction of the composition and publication of *The Plan of a Dictionary*, and affords an excellent opportunity of examining Johnson's methods of composing and revising The third deals with the relationship between Johnson and Chesterfield, and comes to the conclusion that Johnson's account gives a reasonably correct version The next is concerned with early editions of the *Dictionary*, and shows that while the fourth is the best printed authority for Johnson's considered judgements, there are also extant two sets of proofs incorporating numerous changes which never appeared in the text, and which it is almost unthinkable that Johnson himself would have suppressed The fifth deals with the

[3] *John Hart's Works on English Orthography and Pronunciation (1551, 1569, 1570)*, Part I, by B Danielsson Stockholm Studies in English V Stockholm Almqvist & Wiksell pp 338 Kr 38

[4] *Dr Johnson's Dictionary*, by J H Sledd and G J Kolb Univ of Chicago Press and C U P pp viii+256 37*s* 6*d*

reception and criticism of the *Dictionary* The skill of the preliminary advertising is pointed out, and its use by continental lexicographers as well as in England and America is described But such a short notice of the principal topics treated in the book inevitably fails to do justice to its interest, as also to the light which it throws on lexicography in general and on Johnson's achievement in particular Two more examples of *Self-Quotation in Johnson's 'Dictionary'* (*NQ*) are pointed out by W R Keast

An excellent general book on dictionaries comes from J R Hulbert[5] He begins by discussing the questions of what dictionaries are and what they are intended for A brief account is given of the origin and development of English dictionaries, and Hulbert then goes on to describe the actual making of a dictionary, and the various problems which have to be faced by the editor, giving also some account of the different specialized dictionaries The final chapter deals with the use of a dictionary, its authority, and the types of dictionary available to the modern user This is a lucid, interesting, and excellently written book, and one which is remarkably comprehensive considering its brevity It is difficult to imagine a better general account of the subject

J T Shipley has compiled a dictionary of words and senses no longer in use[6] The period covered is from the eighth to the nineteenth century, but little is included that is earlier than the fifteenth It deals with, (i) words likely to be met with in literary reading, e g in Chaucer, Spenser, Shakespeare, &c , (ii) words dealing with the early history, (iii) words with some special interest From these sources the editor has collected a large number of words, and he deals with them capably The Old and Middle English etymologies are not always trustworthy, but on the whole it is a competent piece of work, and the general reader may well find it useful *A Dictionary of New Words* by M Reifer[7] includes also the new senses acquired by old words It is as comprehensive as could reasonably be expected, etymologies are rarely included, but the definitions are lucid, and the whole makes interesting reading The fact that W Freeman's *Dictionary of English Slang*[8] includes some words which are good standard English, others which are colloquial, and still others which are dialectal, emphasizes the difficulty of distinguishing between the various levels of usage A mass of material is included, with clear and concise definitions, occasional indications of the type of slang, and more rarely with a note on the origin of the particular phrase A good collection of over a thousand idiomatic phrases comes from V H Collins[9] Only those are given which are in common use, and single and compound words, similes, and proverbs are not included A list of the idioms is first given, and they are then dealt with in that order Each is defined, and when possible explained, sometimes with an illustrative sentence and with some indication of the date of its first appearance The execution is excellent, and the book should prove most useful, especially to the non-native speaker In

[5] *Dictionaries British and American*, by J R Hulbert Deutsch pp 107 9*s* 6*d*

[6] *Dictionary of Early English*, by J T Shipley New York Philosophical Library pp xiii+753 $10

[7] *Dictionary of New Words*, by M Reifer New York Philosophical Library pp ix+236 $6

[8] *A Concise Dictionary of English Slang* by W Freeman English Universities Press pp 268 8*s* 6*d*

[9] *A Book of English Idioms*, by V H Collins Longmans pp 258 10*s* 6*d*

Why You Say It[10] W B Garrison deals, under various general headings, with some 700 interesting words and phrases The book is accurate, reasonably up to date, reads well, and is a good deal better than most such compilations The author knows and uses the standard authorities, and seems completely at home with his subject A more elementary book on vocabulary by A F Crowley[11] suggests ways in which the child may find interest in acquiring a wider knowledge of words It necessarily includes much of the material common to such works, but is well done, accurate, and avoids the too common fault of writing down to the reader *Words and their Ways* by E H Sloane[12] is an interesting experiment, intended to be at one and the same time an introduction to language and to philosophy Words are introduced and explained in terms of their origins, and also used to familiarize the reader with the fundamental scientific, philosophical, and religious problems that their use has given rise to Linguistically it is accurate enough, but it may be doubted whether the experiment really succeeds Finally, a large and interesting collection of proverbs comes from D Kin[13] although, despite the title, by no means all of them are peculiar to America They are arranged under various general headings, each section containing from one to twenty or more proverbs On the whole the arrangement is reasonably adequate, but there is no index, and it is not always easy to discover any particular proverb, since the connexion between the proverb and the heading under which it appears is sometimes not immediately obvious.

Various elementary grammars of the language have appeared [14] That by A Hossack is of the traditional prescriptive type, teaching a kind of English which the child will never hear spoken and rarely find written The only difference from other such grammars 'lies in its building up an essay approach based on, and in correlation with, grammatical principles' In the second the main stress is on the exercises The usual system is to describe briefly some particular point, e g agreement of subject and verb, and then to give a number of exercises on it The last two books are particularly full and comprehensive, chapters on formal grammar being interspersed with others containing more general information, e g on the use of dictionaries The result is that in addition to the essentials of grammar they include also a vast amount of useful information on related subjects Both are excellent prescriptive grammars, based on the language as it is and not as it ought to be The last is particularly noteworthy for the use made of diagrams and illustrations, and the careful attention given to the layout Both include numerous exercises, and the very full index of the former makes it easy to use as a reference book Two other grammars are intended for foreign students who already have a useful knowledge of the

[10] *Why You Say It*, by W B Garrison Nashville Abingdon Press pp 448 $3 95

[11] *Magic in Words*, by A F Crowley New York Exposition Press pp 81 $3

[12] *Words and their Ways*, by E H Sloane Bay Ridge, Maryland The Owl Press pp iv+108 $1

[13] *Dictionary of American Proverbs*, by D Kin New York Philosophical Library pp 290 $6

[14] *Grammar in Action*, by A Hossack Dent pp vii+182 3*s* 9*d*

English Essentials, by H B Nelson Ames, Iowa Littlefield, Adams & Co pp viii+206 $1 25

The Perrin-Smith Handbook of Current English, by P G Perrin and G H Smith New York Scott, Foresman & Co pp xxiv+591 $2 50

Essentials of Modern English, by T C Pollock, M C Sheridan, D Williams, and L B Anker New York and London The Macmillan Company pp xiii+445 21*s* 9*d*

language [15] The first deals more particularly with idiomatic usage, but contains also a useful chapter on writing letters The grammatical terms used are defined in an appendix and a number of exercises are included It is a good practical book, but too often gives the impression of a deliberate writing down to the reader The second book is by one who has had much experience in the teaching of English as a foreign language He discusses the speaking, reading, and writing of the language, along with some general educational theory Useful compositions and exercises are suggested, and all engaged in teaching English to non-native speakers will find it most valuable

G H Vallins, in his latest book,[16] begins by explaining the simpler rules of grammatical construction, and passes on to some of the more difficult and controversial points of usage The book is written in the form of question and answer, and this makes for brevity and directness But the answers often include discussions of other points relevant to the particular question, and may extend to some pages of explanation and comment, with the result that the ground covered is far wider than might have been expected This is a wise and helpful book by one who is not afraid to disagree with the rules of prescriptive grammar when usage seems to demand it A reissue of the same author's book on *Better English*[17] (*YW* xxxiv 33) contains an additional chapter on the different levels of English, and a useful selection of books for further reading

L Oliphant[18] corrects some common errors in written English He deals with the use of words, the construction of sentences and paragraphs, grammar, punctuation, and essay writing The book contains much sound and sensible advice, though on occasion too much influenced by traditional grammar E Lambert[19] is mainly concerned with the vocabulary In Part I he deals briefly with the question of what language is, and with the various kinds of English In Part II he describes the growth of the vocabulary, and the ways in which words change in form and meaning Then follows a brief account of personal and place-names, with particular reference to America Part III deals with technical terms, slang, the development of writing and of a fixed spelling, with a final chapter on correctness in language The only criticism that might be made of this accurate and well-planned book is an occasional tendency to write down to the reader Here, too, mention might be made of the publications of the English Speaking Board [20] Its advisory council contains people eminent in many fields of education, but the presence of a linguist might have prevented such claims as that English 'for wealth of vocabulary, variety of intonation, and beauty of sound has no equal in the world' Articles of general interest in the first number include J Coatman on *The Spoken Word on the Air*, S L Baxter on *Spoken English in Schools*, and articles for and against spelling reform by M Harrison and G Johnson respectively, in

[15] *Idiomatic English*, by K Box Pitman pp xi+155 8*s* 6*d*
Teaching English as a Foreign Language, by P Gurrey Longmans pp iii+200 12*s* 6*d*

[16] *Perfect Your English*, by G H Vallins Ward, Lock & Co pp 144 8*s* 6*d*

[17] *Better English*, by G H Vallins Deutsch pp 239 15*s*

[18] *English Observed*, by L Oliphant Odhams Press Ltd pp 128

[19] *Our Language*, by E Lambert New York Lothrop, Lee & Shepard Co pp x+181 $3

[20] *English Speech, Volumes 1 and 2* The 1954, 1955 Year Books of the English Speaking Board Liverpool Bluecoat Chambers pp 64, 64 5*s* each

which well-worn arguments are reproduced with apparently no inkling of the real case for or against Volume 2 contains articles on *Public School Speech*, and *Speech in Broadcasting*, by B Harvey and H M Lockhart respectively

In an interesting and important discussion on *Colloquial English and Communication*[21] R Quirk deals with some of the differences between the written and the spoken language, illustrated from English He gives examples of surreptitiously recorded conversations, and points out that although when read the untidiness and confusion are startling, nothing out of the way is noticed when they are heard It is clear that the structures of written and spoken English are so dissimilar that not even the basic analysis that has been evolved to describe written English can be applied in descriptions of spoken English—a conclusion of some importance when considering the oral transmission of written originals Much that is apparently useless and meaningless in the written language may have both function and significance in the spoken language It may help in the transmission of ideas and information, or its importance may lie in the emotive factor—the establishment of a relationship fostering willingness to receive on the part of the hearer Certainly, before any attempt is made to tidy up spoken English, more careful analysis of it is needed lest some of the items dismissed as useless may, with further knowledge, turn out to have their own importance and significance F Behre[22] has investigated the use of *should* in, (1) *that*-clauses dependent on a verb or an equivalent expression, (2) with a sense and function different from the sense and function of *should* in independent senses, and (3) with the quality of being syntactically interchangeable with the indicative The result is not easy reading, but it adds a good deal to our knowledge of the development of modern English syntax G Kirchner[23] deals with the use of adverbs as intensitives The greater part of his work is taken up with a list of such adverbs, each entry including a note of its use, along with illustrative quotations Then come other classified lists of adverbs or adverbial phrases of degree, along with some account of other means by which the same effect can be produced In *The Terms 'Subjunctive' and 'Indicative'* (*ES*) F Th Visser objects to the automatic application of the terminological system of one language to another, and points out that linguistic descriptions should be based on either form or function, and not on both simultaneously He suggests that the real difference is that in the one case the very form shows that we are concerned with non-fact, whereas the other gives no indication at all of fact or non-fact Consequently, he suggests the terms Modally Marked Form (subj) and Modally Non-marked or Modally Zero Form (indic) B M Charleston, in *A Reconsideration of the Problem of Time, Tense, and Aspect in Modern English* (*ES*), indicates some of the factors that tend to complicate the problem of tenses and aspects in modern English, and surveys briefly the concepts of time, tense, and aspect He separates out the fundamentals of the system from the accidentals—those functions which the tenses and aspects have gradually acquired and which form variations on the fundamental systems—and

[21] In *Studies in Communication*, pp 169–82 See Chapter II, n 32

[22] *Meditative-Polemic 'Should' in Modern English 'That'-Clauses*, by F Behre Gothenberg Studies in English IV Stockholm Almqvist & Wiksell pp 183 Kr 15

[23] *Gradadverbien im heutigen Englisch*, by G Kirchner Halle Niemeyer pp 126 DM 8 80

concludes that the difference between the uses of the unexpanded and the expanded forms has become very elusive In many cases the difference is not factual but emotional, the unexpanded forms tend to be used to express a statement of fact, or to make a generalization, while the expanded form describes an action in progress, or expresses a transitory state, or adds to a statement an emotional, descriptive, or an actualizing and vivifying element (see Chapter II)

H Frei, *A Note on Bloomfield's Limiting Adjectives* (*ES*), disagrees with Bloomfield's definition and classification of such adjectives, and believes that there is room for other devices which would not demand different schemes for every language, or discard the fundamental correspondence significant-significate postulated by de Saussure Fries, in his study of modern English, had differentiated a small group of intensifiers, patterning like *very*, from his ordinary Class 4 words (adverbs) (see Chapter II) P Roberts, *Fries's Group D* (*L*), feels that the distinction is not clear, and concludes that whereas in English there is a group of function words, patterning like *very* and with definite members, there is also a word-class with two subdivisions illustrated by *awfully* and *quietly* with an indeterminate list of members in each subgroup S Chatman, *Immediate Constituents and Expansion Analysis* (*Word*), discusses the methods and results obtained by this type of analysis, finds them unsatisfactory, and suggests a slightly different procedure In *Number Concord with 'What'-Clauses* (*AS*) F Christensen investigates a number of such clauses and concludes that, (1) plural *what* regularly selects a plural verb in the main clause, but singular or undetermined *what* does not regularly select a singular verb, (2) a plural form in the predicate complement position controls the copula more often than does the noun clause in the subject position C F Hockett, *Attribution and Apposition* (*AS*), suggests reasons why, in dealing with apposition, the suggested terms 'modifier' and 'head' are inappropriate, and G J Visser, *Celtic Influence in English* (*N*), comments on the phraseological and syntactical similarities of English and Celtic He indicates correspondences noted by previous scholars, and discusses more particularly the prepositional object with infinitive construction, and the use of *go* as a copula In both cases the use in Welsh far antedates that in English In *Direct Transitivation* (*ES*) G Kirchner shows that the transitive use of intransitive verbs is common in Shakespeare, and that many verbs allowing this construction were in use before his time A A Hill, *Consonant Assimilation and Juncture in English A Hypothesis* (*L*), discusses the systematic assimilation of the second element to the first as found in the grammatical endings of nouns and verbs V E Gibbens, *Shifts in Gender and Meaning of Nouns designating the Sexes* (*AS*), points out that the shift is usually from masculine to feminine, and that a fairly common pattern is for nouns referring unfavourably to men to develop a more specific unfavourable meaning when applied to women only An interesting lecture on grammatical gender in modern English comes from P A Erades,[24] and note should also be made of the symposium *Points of Modern English Syntax* conducted by the same author in *ES*

In *The Intonation of Tag Questions in English* (*ES*) J D O'Connor is mainly interested in the patterns of pitch used in combinations of state-

[24] *De 'Genusverschijnselen' in Het Engels*, by P A Erades Groningen-Djakarta Noordhoff pp 23 Fl 1 25

ment or imperative with a tag question He concludes that there is, for each possibility of falling and rising tone in either part, a pattern which conjoins the two, a pattern, moreover, which is definable within rather narrow limits, and whose pitch relations remain constant through extreme variations of range and key M D Berger, *Vowel Distribution and Accentual Prominence in Modern English* (*Word*), points out the general lack of agreement on the terminology, concepts, and methodology to be used in the description of the modern English stress system He analyses the distribution of English vowels within words, and some longer utterances, and concludes that a full range of vowel oppositions can occur in 'prominent' syllables, whereas in 'parasitic' syllables only a limited number of oppositions may occur It is suggested that the term *stress* be reserved for force of utterance, and that prominences of all kinds, including stress, be subsumed under the heading *accent*

In his *Orientalisches Wortgut im Englischen* (*A*) H Marcus deals with over 400 words Most of the article is taken up with a list of them, along with the meaning, etymology, and earliest recorded occurrence in English A following table shows that the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries were those during which the greatest number of such words entered the language The different types of these words and their sources are then analysed, thus concluding a valuable article which contains a mass of useful information H Marchand, *Notes on Nominal Compounds in Present-Day English* (*Word*), points out that the determinant generally precedes the determinatum, as in *rainbow*, but that in some types, e g *pickpocket*, the determinatum lies outside the combination, and a similar concept underlies such compounds as *householder* The various definitions of a compound are discussed, and it is concluded that to be a compound a combination must be morphologically isolated from a parallel syntactic group Marchand concludes with a general discussion of stress in compounds, and of the different degrees of phonemic stress

A number of articles on single words have appeared H M Flasdieck's important article on *Pall Mall* (*YW* xxxv 33) is now available separately [25] Kemp Malone, *On the Etymology of 'Filch'* (*MLN*), would derive it from OE *gefylce*, which acquired the sense 'gang of men, pack of hounds', and gave rise to a verb with a similar sense In time the noun went out of use and the verb, left in isolation, lost its restriction to collective action and became applicable to attacks by one man or beast This gave rise to the meaning 'to snatch, take as booty', from which the modern sense is derived In *'Hips' A Geographical Contribution to the 'She' Puzzle* (*ES*) E Dieth plots on a map the words used in the six northern counties for 'hips' He suggests that the change of OE *heo-* to *sho-* shown in *shoops* may be due to Scandinavian influence, gives examples of the change in place-names, and suggests that a similar one has taken place in the development of OE *hēo* to *sho* It has not been possible to see J Vachek's *Notes on the Phonological Development of the NE Pronoun 'She'* (*Sborník Prací Filosofické Fakulty Brněnské University*) D B Sands, *A New Approach to the Etymology of English 'Keelson'* (*NQ*), points out that continental cognates show that it is made up of words containing *keel* and *swine*, and suggests the kind of symbolism responsible for such a word P W F Brown believes that the phrase *On the Nail* (*NQ*) origin-

[25] *Pall Mall Beitrage zur Etymologie und Quantitatstheorie*, by H M Flasdieck Tubingen Niemeyer pp 129–383 DM 28

ally had to do with *ale*, and that *nail* is due to a misdivision of syllables R A Fowkes, *A Celtic Side Light on 'To save Face'* (*Word*), gives examples of the locution in Celtic languages, and suggests that it may have had a fairly universal currency In *The Etymology of 'shy', 'to throw'* (*L*) H Sperber provides evidence to suggest that it is derived from *shy* 'to take a sudden fright' through the expression *shy cock* J T Krumpelmann, in *Spoon = Loffel* (*A*), shows that *spoon* in the nineteenth-century sense 'foolish person, simpleton' is due to the influence of German *Loffel* This was the current German word for 'spoon', but for centuries it had also been used in the sense 'fool' L L Seale, *A Note on Coinages* (*AS*), gives examples of words reduced to initial letters, and suggests the term *eusystolism* for them, while S V Baum, *From AWOL to VEEP The Growth and Specialization of the Acronym* (*AS*), deals with the development of initial words, and the transition to the acronym composed of truncated words

Corrections to *OED* and to other dictionaries continue to appear In *Canadian Fish-Names in 'OED' and 'DAE'* (*NQ*) B W A Massey deals with *Ouananiche, Sucker,* and *Inconnu*, and J T Krumpelmann, in *Americanisms in Poinsett's 'Notes on Mexico'* (*AS*), lists a number of words which have earlier datings than those in *DAE* G W Hallam, *Source of the Word 'Agnostic'* (*MLN*), gives evidence to support R H Hutton's account of the origin of the word, while R A Biswanger, Jr, notes *Several Words First Employed in D'Urfey's 'The Richmond Heiress'* (*MLN*) which are not given in *OED* or which can be antedated Further examples of words or meanings earlier than the first quotation in *OED* are given by M D W Jeffreys, *The Oxford English Dictionary* (*NQ*), G W Hallam, *A Note on the O E D* (*NQ*), G Cross, *Some Notes on the Vocabulary of John Marston* (*NQ*), R E Tyner, *The Vocabulary of Francis Quarles* (*NQ*), and T L Crowell, *Predating 'Have to', 'Must'* (*AS*) In addition J M Steadman, *The OED Definition of 'Flail'* (*NQ*), points out that in Fletcher's *The Purple Island* the word is used metaphorically, not literally, J M Morse, *Chaucer A Meaning of 'Philosophye'* (*NQ*), suggests the meaning 'philosophers' as *Prologue* 295, and I Feuerlicht, *A New Look at the Iron Curtain* (*AS*), shows that the term was originally used of the fire-curtain at a theatre, and is first found in international politics in 1923

The only article dealing with place-names is a general one on *New England Origins of Western Reserve Place-Names* (*AS*) in which D Lindsey traces the history of the settlement of this part of Ohio, and shows that the settlers were deeply influenced by their New England origins

The latest part of the *Dictionary of the Older Scottish Tongue*[26] contains no long articles on individual words, but includes the numerous words in *in-*, many of which are comparatively rare The result is that more words are dealt with than is usually the case, and this part is even more indispensable than usual for the student of medieval Scottish From L F Casson[27] comes an interesting article on the dialect of Jeremiah Goldswain, born in 1801 in Bucks, of probably illiterate parents, who arrived in 1820 as a settler in the Albany district of the Cape His *Chronicle*, though of little literary

[26] *A Dictionary of the Older Scottish Tongue, Part XVI, Indentourly–Judas Crois*, by Sir William A Craigie O U P pp 241–360 50*s*

[27] *The Dialect of Jeremiah Goldswain, Albany Settler*, by L F Casson University of Cape Town Lecture Series No 7 O U.P pp 43 6*s*

value, is important linguistically because of the numerous misspellings, some of which give useful indications of his pronunciation The evidence is carefully analysed by Casson, who finds striking resemblances between the pronunciation of Goldswain and that of the seventeenth-century Verneys But it seems likely that the fact that both were from Bucks is of little significance, and in fact Goldswain's speech reflects the characteristics of his social betters of nearly 200 years before Mention should also be made of the important list of dialectal words contained in G Williams, *Dry-Stone Walling in South-Westmorland The Craft and its Terminology* (*YDS*)

The *Concise Dictionary of American Grammar and Usage*[28] is rather a curious mixture It includes new words, words commonly misused, and others with several meanings In each case the meaning is given, the pronunciation when in doubt, and the level of usage Interspersed are general grammatical articles on such subjects as Absolute Constructions, Negatives, Punctuation, along with others on the Art of Reading, Phonetics, &c The book contains much useful advice and information, but some of the omissions and inclusions are rather difficult to account for H Pilch, in *The Rise of the American English Vowel Pattern* (*Word*), compares Noah Webster's vowel pattern with that of Shakespeare as given by Kokeritz He then describes the development of American English to the present day, and concludes that British English has changed much less in its vowel pattern, many of the differences between the two being due to the generalization of different variants A careful analysis of Noah Webster's pronunciation comes from Karl-Erik Lindblad[29] He deals only with the sounds derived from the Middle English simple vowels, diphthongs being included only when they have fallen together with the vowels The evidence for the pronunciation of each vowel is carefully analysed, with particular attention to the various combinative developments, and Webster's pronunciation is then compared with that of modern New England A mass of useful information has been gathered together, but Lindblad contents himself with presenting the material and refrains from drawing any conclusions D S Berkeley notes that *The Past Tense of 'Fit'* (*AS*) appears as *fit* in spoken and occasionally in written American

A number of articles on American dialects has appeared G E Bigelow provides *More Evidence of Early Loss of (r) in Eastern American Speech* (*AS*) from the rhymes of R T Payne, a late eighteenth-century New England poet F G Cassidy suggests that *The Source of 'Shats'* (*AS*) is the word *chat* 'catkin, twig', while W S Avis, *'Crocus Bag' A Problem in Areal Linguistics* (*AS*), investigates the distribution of the phrase, and suggests that *OED* correctly relates the first element to *crocus* 'saffron' (see Chapter II) E R Williams, *'Pair of Beads' in America* (*AS*), shows that the Chaucerian meaning of the phrase, 'set of beads, necklace', survives in contemporary American dialects, and F C Watkins, *A Note on Melville's 'Three Twin Sons'* (*AS*), notes that the phrase is used with the meaning 'triplets', a sense hitherto unnoticed by lexicographers J Lyman shows that both *Chantey and Limey* (*AS*) are American words, and provides earlier

[28] *Concise Dictionary of American Grammar and Usage*, by R C Whitford and J R Foster New York Philosophical Library pp viii+168 $4 50

[29] *Noah Webster's Pronunciation and Modern New England Speech*, by Karl-Erik Lindblad Essays and Studies on American Language and Literature XI Uppsala Almqvist & Wicksell pp 90 $2

examples than appear in OED, while in *Two Curious Words* (*AS*) Louise Pound deals with *carlacue* and *forfarrow* G C Cummings, *The Language of Horse Racing* (*AS*), defines the terms used in the sport, and D Shulman, *Spanish Words in American English* (*AS*), lists over sixty such words with illustrative quotations In *Publication of the American Dialect Society Number 23* K B Harder deals with *The Vocabulary of Marble Playing*, and R I McDavid with *The Position of the Charleston Dialect* In *Publication Number 24* D W Maurer, *Whiz Mob*, deals with the language and social structure of a criminal society The sub-title, *A Correlation of the Technical Argot of Pick-pockets with their Behavior Pattern*, describes adequately enough the purpose and method of the work Much valuable information on the argot appears, but it is surprising to find no index of the words mentioned and defined Other articles on American dialects include K B Harder, *Musseling Terms from Tennessee* (*AS*), M W Frazier, *Truck Drivers' Language* (*AS*), W Randal, *Edward Eggleston on Dialect* (*AS*), W L McAtee, *Bird Names with Animal or Plant Components* (*AS*), and W White, *Wayne University Slang* (*AS*)

IV. OLD ENGLISH LITERATURE

By R M WILSON

THE appearance of Miss Whitelock's volume of *English Historical Documents*[1] helped to make this a notable year in Anglo-Saxon studies The introduction contains an excellent account of Anglo-Saxon England by one pre-eminently qualified to make use of all the available sources, and particularly successful in showing how the different types of evidence can throw light on one another The width of knowledge shown is as remarkable as the unostentatious ease with which it is used Throughout the book the author contrives to pack an amazing amount into a comparatively small space, while still retaining the interest of the reader The extracts themselves, arranged under Secular Narrative, Charters and Laws, and Ecclesiastical Sources, form an excellently proportioned book, each section and extract being prefaced by a brief but valuable introduction and bibliography Occasionally Miss Whitelock has made use of earlier translations, but most of them are her own renderings into clear and idiomatic English The translation of the *Chronicle* is particularly useful, and here the existence of the different versions has set the translator a difficult problem which has been successfully solved The second part is interesting because of the glimpses of the everyday life of the times, while the third includes translations of many of the private letters of the period It should be emphasized, however, that the book is very much more than a volume of excellent translations, it contains much original work, and no one dealing with any aspect of Anglo-Saxon England can afford to neglect it

Between 1925 and 1931 Sir Cyril Fox published various articles describing the results of his work on Offa's Dyke Under the auspices of the British Academy these have now been issued in a single definitive volume, which includes also a chapter on Wat's Dyke and a general summing up of the Mercian achievement[2] The importance of Sir Cyril Fox's work has long been evident, and it is now available in a spacious and handsome format, profusely illustrated with excellent maps, photographs, and diagrams Particularly interesting is the suggestion that the construction of the Dyke may be not unconnected with the reference in *Widsith* to the Offa who 'drew the boundary against the Myrgingas at Fifeldor', and that Offa of Mercia 'consciously designed and lived his own saga, based on his great forebear's achievement' Possibly significant, too, is the fact that Wat's Dyke seems to preserve the name of Wade, a hero associated in legend with Offa On a more limited subject, H P R Finberg provides an excellent example of the fruitfulness of a detailed examination of all the available evidence dealing with a single parish[3] The sub-title, *A Study in Continuity*, indicates the result of such an investigation, in which Finberg shows not

[1] *English Historical Documents Vol I, c 500–1042*, ed by Dorothy Whitelock Eyre & Spottiswoode pp xxiv+867 80*s*

[2] *Offa's Dyke A Field Survey of the Western Frontier-Works of Mercia in the Seventh and Eighth Centuries A D*, by Sir Cyril Fox Published for the British Academy by O U P pp xxvii+317 63*s*

[3] *Roman and Saxon Withington*, by H P R Finberg University College of Leicester Department of English Local History, Occasional Papers No 8 pp 40 6*s*

only 'the persistence with which Old English usages were maintained during and after the Norman Conquest', but also brings out the fact that there was probably similar continuity between Roman and Saxon times The importance of this paper is out of all proportion to its length

A new translation of Bede has appeared in the Penguin Classics[4] The purpose of the translator is 'to offer a new and readable version in modern English', and in this he has been remarkably successful The introduction gives an account of Bede's life and work, indicates the particular merits of the *Ecclesiastical History*, and describes the condition of the English church during the seventh century From Dom Thomas Symons comes an edition of the *Regularis Concordia*[5] The introduction contains an excellent account of the monastic revival of the tenth century, followed by a description of monastic life and organization according to the prescription of the *Concordia* Few of the sources of the work can be traced, but it has obviously been put together by a process of selection, adaptation, alteration, and blending, in the main following Lotharingian rather than Cluniac usage The text, indispensable for our knowledge of Anglo-Saxon monasticism, is accompanied by an admirable translation and valuable notes, the whole making a notable addition to the excellent series of medieval classics

The end of the Anglo-Saxon period is dealt with by Professor Barlow,[6] who shows a detailed knowledge of original and secondary sources He does not confine himself to political and constitutional history, but treats also of social history, art, architecture, and literature The whole book is a valuable account of a difficult and complicated period, and shows clearly, not only the new influences due to the Conquest, but also the vitality of the old traditions T J Oleson, in his careful and scholarly treatment of the Witenagemot in the reign of the Confessor,[7] analyses carefully the available evidence, more particularly that provided by the *Chronicle* and the extant charters He concludes that the Witenagemot constantly changed in size and character, and is to be considered as a mere court council The word itself had no technical meaning, other than as describing a meeting of such counsellors as happened to be at a given time with the king, or who were summoned by him on a particular occasion

Students of Anglo-Saxon art are perhaps too apt to view it in isolation Particularly welcome, therefore, is a splendidly produced and authoritative work in which Lawrence Stone gives a brilliant account of English sculpture from the seventh to the middle of the sixteenth century[8] The pre-Conquest period is divided into the Northumbrian Renaissance, the Carolingian Revival and Mercian Rococo, and Anglo-Danish Art and the Apogee of Wessex Whenever possible gaps in the extant remains are filled in from other sources, and the author skilfully disentangles the many difficult problems involved Even more important

[4] *Bede A History of the English Church and People*, trans and with an Introduction by Leo Sherley-Price Harmondsworth, Middlesex Penguin Classics pp 341 3*s* 6*d*

[5] *Regularis Concordia*, ed by Thomas Symons Edinburgh Nelson pp lix+77 20*s*

[6] *The Feudal Kingdom of England 1042–1216*, by F Barlow Longmans pp xii+465 25*s*

[7] *The Witenagemot in the Reign of Edward the Confessor*, by T J Oleson University of Toronto Press and O U P pp x+187 30*s*

[8] *Sculpture in Britain The Middle Ages* by Lawrence Stone Harmondsworth, Middlesex Penguin Books pp xxi+297 45*s*

is the section on Romanesque Sculpture in which he shows the entrance of new ideas and models, and emphasizes the continuity of the native traditions In the later period the various developments are excellently described in lucid prose by a master of the whole complex field The book, with its 200 excellent plates, is an achievement on which author and publisher alike are to be congratulated

It was an excellent idea to reprint, on the centenary of his birth, W P Ker's classical work on the literature of the Dark Ages,[9] marked as it is by width of scholarship and acute criticism No attempt has been made to bring it up to date, and this was perhaps wise, since it would have spoiled the particular flavour of Ker's own work The Provost of University College contributes a foreword in which he pays tribute to the author and to his work

A second edition of Professor H M Chadwick's book on *The Study of Anglo-Saxon* has appeared[10] Few students would agree with all of the author's highly individualistic views, and although he makes some good points he never seems to suspect that a knowledge of the language and literature may be necessary and useful to other than the specialist Mrs Chadwick adds a chapter on The Expansion of Anglo-Saxon Studies in which, after reviewing with unjustified optimism the results of the change in syllabus at Cambridge, she advocates the claims of Celtic and Scandinavian languages and literatures New appendixes include various bibliographies and a useful list of some important Anglo-Saxon churches

A third, revised edition of M Lehnert's useful *Altenglisches Elementarbuch* has appeared, as also an admirable introduction to Old English by G L Brook, and an excellent grammar for more advanced students by R Quirk and C L Wrenn[11] Brook begins with a reasoned account of the value of a knowledge of Old English, and then deals with spelling, pronunciation, phonology, accidence, and syntax The texts include the *Preface* to the *Pastoral Care*, the beginning of the English version of Bede, and extracts from the *Gospels*, *Apollonius of Tyre*, and Ælfric's *Colloquy*, with excellent notes and a glossary Quirk and Wrenn do not include texts, but have rather more detail elsewhere The essential paradigms are indicated by the use of bold-face type, and the syntax, treated in considerable detail, is by far the best account of the subject that has yet appeared This is an excellent grammar of Old English, well planned, lucid, up to date, and with a surprising amount of information in a relatively small space The authors are perhaps too ready to change the traditional nomenclature Many of their changes are no doubt long overdue, but some seem rather unnecessary

A selection of extracts from Old English literature by M Lehnert[12] necessarily includes much that is common to such anthologies The first part is devoted to poetry, the second to prose, and each extract is preceded by a brief introduction and followed by a select bibliography The texts are

[9] *The Dark Ages*, by W P Ker Edinburgh Nelson pp xviii+361 15*s*

[10] *The Study of Anglo-Saxon*, by H M Chadwick Second edn revised and enlarged by N K Chadwick Cambridge Heffer pp xvii+99 6*s*

[11] *Altenglisches Elementarbuch*, by M Lehnert Berlin de Gruyter Sammlung Goschen, Band 1125 pp 178 DM 2 40

An Introduction to Old English, by G L Brook Manchester U P pp xi+138 10*s* 6*d*

An Old English Grammar, by R Quirk and C L Wrenn Methuen pp x+166 9*s* 6*d*

[12] *Poetry and Prose of the Anglo-Saxons*, by M Lehnert Berlin Deutscher Verlag der Wissenschaften pp xv+173 29*s* 6*d*

taken from the standard editions, and translations of the poetic passages are given The general bibliography has some omissions and one or two strange inclusions The introduction contains a brief but adequate account of the manuscripts containing Old English poetry, but the suggested connexion between Cardinal Guala and the *Vercelli Book* now appears unlikely On the whole, however, this is a useful and well-planned anthology whose value will be increased by the appearance of a promised second volume containing an etymological glossary

General articles on the poetry include F P Magoun, Jr, *Abbreviated Titles for the Poems of the Anglo-Saxon Poetic Corpus* (*Ea*) Two lists are drawn up, one for Grein's *Sprachschatz*, and a second for the Krapp-Dobbie *Anglo-Saxon Poetic Records* The same author, in *The Theme of the Beasts of Battle in Anglo-Saxon Poetry* (*NM*), goes on from the use of the formula in the production of Old English poetry to the use of the theme To be identified as such a theme, like a formula, must occur more than once, and one that occurs in nine poems is the mention of the wolf, eagle, and raven as beasts attendant on a scene of carnage The various passages in which this theme appears are given, and a following chart shows, passage by passage and verse by verse, parallels to the formulas and formulaic systems which appear in these passages Similarly, S B Greenfield, in *The Formulaic Expression of the Theme of 'Exile' in Anglo-Saxon Poetry* (*S*), attempts to establish the dimensions for the theme of exile He notes various typical exile images, analyses them, and considers each aspect in turn, concluding with a description of the exile imagery in the *Wanderer* and the *Seafarer*

Probably the most important article on *Beowulf* is one by J C van Meurs on *'Beowulf' and Literary Criticism* (*N*) He shows that various objections may be raised against a theory which assigns a perfect structural and artistic unity to the poem, and that the acceptance of such a theory may lead to exaggerated praise and over-subtle analysis Tolkien, for example, assumes a knowledge of pre-Christian mythology which we do not possess, and evades rather than answers criticisms of the structure made by other scholars It is doubtful whether a true estimate of the poet's intention and of the structure of the poem can be attained when these are viewed in the light of modern critical standards, and an analysis of *Beowulf* in terms of modern views on poetics which ignores its origin and setting leaves us with just as false a picture as did the old 'patchwork' theories Van Meurs suggests that Bonjour's study of the digressions takes too little account of the historical setting of a particular work of art, and too much of the universality of art He concludes that we have still much to learn from the work of earlier scholars, and that Tolkien's article, while of outstanding importance, should be considered as a first contribution to the study of *Beowulf*, and not as the ultimate truth G J Engelhardt, *'Beowulf' A Study in Dilation* (*PMLA*), points out that the creation of an epic in Old English involved the author in a task for which there was no precedent in the native tradition, which knew only the heroic lay The problem of the classical writer of epic was to confine his poem within the bounds of unity, whereas the task of the *Beowulf* poet was one of extension Engelhardt points out the methods by which the rhetoricians achieved this, and goes through the action of *Beowulf* showing how these have been used to effect the necessary amplitude In *Beowulf's Three Great Fights* (*RES*) H L. Rogers suggests that the

poet may have had access to some sort of archetype, not necessarily oral, in which the story of the hero's adventures in Denmark was already joined to that of his fight with the dragon As evidence, he points to the varying use of the word *mægen* which, in the earlier part of the poem, has a distinctly Christian flavour In the first fight Beowulf trusts in his *mægen* and in God, and wins In the second, the air of the folk-tale is stronger, Beowulf is more of a Germanic hero and less of a Christian knight, with the result that he has more difficulty in vanquishing a weaker adversary In the dragon episode there are inconsistencies due to the fact that the poet did not rework his material thoroughly enough at this point He was tiring of his task, and becoming aware that what he had done earlier with Grendel and his mother could not be done with the dragon Eva K Touster, *Metrical Variation as a Poetic Device in 'Beowulf'* (*Ang*), believes that existing systems of scansion, though valuable in emphasizing particular elements of the verse, neglect or actually obscure the relationship of metrical form to total structure She suggests that it is better to read the poem according to a simple scansion in which the verses are divided into those with two primary stresses and those with three The former are classified as level, level-descending, descending-ascending, &c, according to the arrangement of stressed and unstressed syllables, while the latter are combinations of these The three-beat line is more highly concentrated in the 'larger rhetorical patterns' of Part I, and in Part II there is a noticeable tendency towards haphazard use of the heavily stressed verses Some passages are examined in detail, and it is concluded that the author, although particularly sensitive to the interplay of language and metre, does not sustain the high degree of technical skill throughout the poem This is particularly noticeable in the third part, and suggests that the dragon episode was a separate poem, composed by the same author, and designed to serve as a sequel or to complete the development of the earlier theme in a narrative newly conceived in epic proportions In *'Beowulf' and the Liturgy* (*JEGP*) A Cabaniss points out that in the account of Beowulf's fight with Grendel's mother there is a strong central reminiscence of the Harrowing of Hell which widens to include recollections of the deluge and then of creation A similar complex of ideas is to be found in the rites associated with Christian baptism, and it would seem that the middle section of *Beowulf* is heavily laden with a complex of ideas which presuppose familiarity with the baptismal liturgy R L Reynolds, *An Echo of 'Beowulf' in Athelstan's Charters of 931–933 A D?* (*MÆ*), finds in the proems to this series of charters reminiscences of *Beowulf's* edifying and moral message He points out that in the charter which mentions *Grendeles mere* and *Beowan*, the gift went to Athelstan's faithful thegn Wulfgar, who bore the name of Hrothgar's faithful thegn and herald It may be that either Athelstan or the writer of the charters was a Beowulfian enthusiast, and was being playful when naming minor features of landscape in a gift from the English king to his faithful Wulfgar

A Bonjour, in *On Sea Images in 'Beowulf'* (*JEGP*), examines two pairs of parallel sea terms, *hronrād-swanrād, ganotes bæð—yðgewinn*, and submits reasons which may have prompted the poet to use them discriminately *Hronrād*, by its reference to the whale, indicates how mighty Scyld had become, while *swanrād* is particularly apt in view of the following comparison of the ship with a bird Similarly,

ganotes bæð suggests the sea as a unifying element between friendly nations, while *yðgewinn* is deliberately chosen because the furious pounding of the waves against the rocks is a symbol of seething strife R C Sutherland, in *The Meaning of 'eorlscipe' in 'Beowulf'* (*PMLA*), suggests that in combination with *æfnan* the word refers to formal ceremonial or official acts This meaning comes partly from the Germanic conception of the responsibilities of a thane to a king and of the king to his people, and partly from classical sources In *'Beowulf' 219 'ymb an tid'* (*MLR*) R W Burchfield would read *ymban tid*, taking *ymban* as a by-form of *ymbe*, and translating, 'after the space of a second day' A E DuBois, *'Stod on Staþole'* (*MLQ*), provides evidence to suggest that *staþole* could refer to the floor of the hall, and that Hrothgar and Unferth were inside Heorot when they viewed Grendel's arm *An Addendum* by D D Griffith adds further support to such an interpretation In *'Hafelan Hydan', 'Beowulf', ll 446, 1372* (*MLN*) DuBois suggests that the true meaning of the phrase is 'to close the eyes in death' J C Pope, *'Beowulf' 3150–3151 Queen Hygd and the Word 'Geomeowle'* (*MLN*), points out that at 3150b the manuscript reads *giatisc meowle*, and he suggests that the following line, much of which is now illegible, might have read *Wedercwēn āwræc, wundenheorde* This would fit in particularly well with the suggestion of Hygd as the chief mourner at Beowulf's funeral He then discusses the word *iomeowlan* 2931a, and shows that its meaning is 'woman of old', rather than 'old woman' The remaining heroic poetry is represented by an article on *Eadhild, duchesse de la 'Francia' et Ealhhild, patronne du Scop de 'Widsith'* (*Le Moyen Âge*) in which R L Reynolds suggests the identification of Widsith's patroness with the Princess Eadhild who married Duke Hugh in 926

R W V Elliott continues his valuable studies of the runes in Old English poems with an article on *The Runes in 'The Husband's Message'* (*JEGP*) He discusses the question of where exactly the poem begins, and concludes that the seventeen lines of the so-called *Riddle 60* are an integral part of the poem As they stand, the runes do not spell any known Old English word, and even if rearranged no satisfactory solution can be obtained, so that presumably each rune is to be given its name These five runes are probably the actual message supposed to have been carved on the wood and sent to the wife, and they have some such sense as, 'Follow the sun's path across the sea to find joy with the man who is waiting for you' Finally the question of how the runes are fitted into the texture of the verse is considered The first word of line 60 is read as *gecyre*, and the last five lines rendered as 'I turn (into words) all together the runes S and R, joined (into one word), EA, W, and D (or M), to declare upon oath that he (your husband) was there, and that he would, while he lived, carry out the solemn agreement of which you two often spoke in days gone by'

A useful edition of *Juliana* comes from Miss R Woolf [13] In her examination of the dialect she perhaps accepts too readily some of the statements in the grammars, but her discussions of the date, author, and runic signature are excellent, showing a full knowledge of the relevant literature and a mature judgement The sources are described, and an excellent account of the style of the poem, which she takes to be the last of the works of Cynewulf, is given The textual notes

[13] *Juliana*, ed by Rosemary Woolf Methuen pp ix+90 8*s* 6*d*.

are illuminating and helpful, the glossary good, while an appendix discusses judiciously some of the words whose meaning is doubtful The same author deals also with *The Lost Opening to the 'Judith'* (*MLR*) Modern scholars, largely on the basis of the numbering of the sections, have assumed that the extant 350 lines represent only a small part of the original Miss Woolf shows that the numbering of the sections has no necessary reference to a single poem, nor is it necessary to assume that the Old English poet must have intended to versify the whole of the apocryphal book Moreover, references in the later chapters to personages previously introduced have been omitted by the poet, and on the whole it seems probable that all that is missing are a few lines giving details of Judith and describing her motive for visiting the camp of Holofernes In *Notes on Old English Texts* (*N*) J E Cross deals with, (1) *symble fȳr oððe gar, Genesis* 316 He notes similar phrases elsewhere, and suggests that it makes up a formula and is best translated into modern English by 'always fire or sword' (2) *eorcanstān*, Ruin 37b As a compound the word is simply another expression of 'wealth', but in the ambiguity of its elements it may herald the city of stone of the following half-line (3) *on syndrigum gebedum*, Ælfric, *Lives of Saints* II 132/115, is clearly meant to reflect the sense of the original *in orationibus perstiterit* This suggests that *syndrig* may have developed the sense 'many'

On the minor verse, F P Magoun, Jr, in *Bede's Story of Cædman The Case History of an Anglo-Saxon Oral Singer* (*S*), shows that over 80 per cent of the *Hymn* is composed of traditional formulas, many of them of a decidedly Christian character unlikely to have been invented by Cædman, and suggesting the previous existence of a Christian poetry Bede's story, therefore, tells us nothing about the birth of Anglo-Saxon poetry of any kind, not even of Christian narrative verse What Bede does give is the case-history of an oral singer living in an oral community In *'Rivos cruoris torridi' in 'Charms to Staunch Bleeding'* (*ES*) L Forster points out that this passage is in fact stanza 17 of the *Hymnus de Vita Christi* of Sedulius

In prose the outstanding event of the year was the appearance of a facsimile of *Bald's Leechbook* [14] The introduction gives an account of the manuscript and its history, and an excellent analysis of the handwriting which will be of great value to all students of Anglo-Saxon palaeography R Quirk provides a short appendix on the language, in which he suggests that its features are consistent with the West Saxon dialect of *c* 950, with some forms suggesting an archetype of perhaps fifty years earlier F P Magoun, Jr, in *Orwell Haven in the 'Anglo-Saxon Chronicle'?* (*MLR*) suggests that the *Arwe* of the annal for 1016 refers to Orwell Haven rather than to the Orwell estuary K Jost, *The Legal Maxim in Ælfric's 'Homilies'* (*ES*), notes a passage in Ælfric in which a legal maxim, borrowed from Latin, is given a theological application No source has hitherto been found for this, and it may well be original with Ælfric In another of Ælfric's *Homilies* occurs the word *hlædfæt* 'bucket' which has been borrowed into Welsh with the sense 'ladle' In *OE Hlædfæt—Welsh Lletwad* (*RES*) Winifred M Temple traces the change in meaning in the Welsh word, accounts for its form, and shows that its use in Ælfric suggests that he relied on an Old Latin text of the Bible In a

[14] *Early English Manuscripts in Facsimile Bald's Leechbook*, ed by C E Wright Rosenkilde og Bagger and Allen & Unwin pp 32+127 £24 3*s*

previous article Miss Whitelock had shown that there was good reason to assume the hand of Wulfstan in Cnut's Laws, and that the text in C C C C MS 201 represents one between VI Ethelred and the Laws of Cnut These conclusions were rejected by Jost, and now, in a cogent and closely reasoned article on *Wulfstan's Authorship of Cnut's Laws* (*English Historical Review*), Miss Whitelock disposes in detail of these objections and restates her position M Forster, in *A New Version of the 'Apocalypse of Thomas' in Old English* (*Ang*), prints the version in C C C C MS 41, preceding it by a general discussion of this type of literature in Old English, and a consideration of the relationship of the different manuscripts The Latin text follows, and the article concludes with remarks on the dialect of the Old English version In the main it is late West Saxon, but with a curious mixture of Anglian and perhaps also Kentish forms Betty Hill, in *Notes on Five Difficult Glosses to the 'Lindisfarne Gospels'* (*MLR*), shows that the actual position of the word in the manuscript often clears up the difficulty, while J J Campbell, in *The 'Harley Glossary' and 'Saxon Patois'* (*PQ*), points out that such glosses copy considerably from one another The mixture of forms appearing in this text is such as would arise more naturally from copying than from the assumption of a separate sub-dialect within West Saxon

An excellent book on the solemn charters of the Anglo-Saxon kings comes from Sir Frank Stenton [15] In the first chapter he deals with the history of charter scholarship, the means of ascertaining their authenticity, and the value of their evidence The second chapter is concerned with the development of the charter, first, with the changes in form characteristic of the different periods, and the origin and use of English in such documents, second, with changes in substance, eventually leading to a greater precision, and closing with a discussion of the difference between *lænland* and *bocland* In the third chapter the author traces the development of bureaucratic influence which resulted in the charters becoming less informative but much more numerous This alone makes them important for general history, especially for the light which they throw on the distribution pattern of the general settlements In Ethelred's charters there is a tendency to enlarge on the history of the property concerned, but this disappears in Cnut's reign, and thereafter they never vary much from the norm Such solemn charters become rare towards the end of the period, and are effectively replaced by the writ This is a remarkably useful and informative book which at the same time makes most interesting reading

The section in vol vi of Shetelig's *Viking Antiquities of Great Britain and Ireland* which deals with the runic inscriptions has now been published separately [16] In it M Olsen discusses the various types of runic alphabet in use during the Viking period, and deals in detail with the surviving inscriptions Each entry contains a brief bibliography, a careful examination and discussion of the inscription, a transcription, a version in Old Icelandic, and a translation and commentary, the last often in considerable detail, while most of the inscriptions are illustrated by excellent photographs or sketches The language of the Manx inscriptions is examined,

[15] *The Latin Charters of the Anglo-Saxon Period*, by F M Stenton O U P pp vii+ 103 10*s* 6*d*

[16] *Runic Inscriptions in Great Britain, Ireland and the Isle of Man*, by M Olsen Bergen John Grieg pp 153–233

and some account given of the personal names found in them This is a book which will prove invaluable to runologists, and in which all students of the period will find much of interest

Two articles deal with the history of Anglo-Saxon scholarship W B Gardner, in *George Hickes and his 'Thesaurus'* (*NQ*), shows that work on the *Thesaurus* was being undertaken in 1696, and that Hickes's interest in the subject dates back at least to 1683 when he was made Dean of Worcester In the second, G .N Garmonsway deals with *Anna Gurney Learned Saxonist* (*E & S*) He gives an account of the life of the lady who is best known for her translation of the *Chronicle* into modern English, and discusses her interest in and contribution to Old English studies

V. MIDDLE ENGLISH, EXCLUDING CHAUCER

By B J TIMMER

THE interesting problem of the Leges Molmutinae is examined by H Pahler in *Die 'Leges Molmutinae', ein Beitrag zum Problem der historischen Wahrheit und politischen Absicht bei Geoffrey of Monmouth (Ang)* The Leges are mentioned by Geoffrey in his *Historia Regum Britanniae* (Bks II, ch 17, and III, ch 5), where he says that Gildas translated them *de Britannico in Latinum*, and Alfred *de Latino in Anglicum sermonem* Pahler's aim is to find out whether they are a fiction He shows that Dyvynwal Moelmud is mentioned in connexion with Howel Dda in a Welsh work of the eleventh or the beginning of the twelfth century Howel Dda is the instigator of the 'Leges Wallicae' Pahler suggests that Geoffrey ascribed the then well-known collection of laws to a Celtic ruler of about 400 B C and the statement that Alfred translated the work would only add to the credibility of the ascription As to Geoffrey's purpose in doing this, Pahler suggests that Geoffrey may well have wanted to draw a parallel between the Celtic and the Roman empire which like other important nations also had an early great legislator

One of the most outstanding publications of the year in the field of this chapter is *The Proverbs of Alfred* by O Arngart[1] In 1942 Arngart published a detailed study of the texts of the *Proverbs* (modestly not mentioned in the bibliography of the present work) He now presents a comprehensive edition of the texts which are printed in parallel columns For practical reasons Arngart has taken the Trinity text as the basis, as this is the longest and the most complete version which has most probably retained the original arrangement of the sections In the introduction he deals first with the Content and Background Here one misses a discussion of the wider Germanic background, the gnomic sayings, gnomic poetry, and the *Hávamál* In the section dealing with the Manuscripts and the transcripts a careful description of each Manuscript and of its history is given After dealing with the relationship of the texts and the length and arrangement Arngart discusses the date and the localization of the original He favours the middle of the twelfth century as the most likely date and, on internal evidence, Sussex, probably East Sussex, as the home of the original From there the Proverbs moved westwards, leaving traces in the *Annals of Winchester* and were committed to writing more than a hundred years later in their final revised form in the Jesus MS , perhaps at Worcester The tradition was also transmitted to the East Midlands, where the original Proverbs were amalgamated with a version of 'A Father's Advice to his Son' and thus copied in the Cotton MS In this form they moved westwards, Trinity MS , probably a West Midland transcript of an East Midland recension of the text This is a very careful edition with critical apparatus, and the Jesus text is given separately in its original arrangement The explanatory

[1] *The Proverbs of Alfred*, by O Arngart II The Texts Edited with Introduction, Notes and Glossary (Skrifter utgivna av Kungl Humanistika Vetenskapssamfundet i Lund XXXII II) 1955 G'eerup, Lund pp viii+269 Sw Kr 25

notes give good guidance for the understanding of the text There is a full survey of the phonology and grammar, as also a section on Metre which, however, seems to try to fit the lines too rigidly into the Sievers types of Old English metre, which seems to serve little purpose After the bibliography there is a full glossary and at the end specimen pages of the various manuscripts are given There is a misprint on p 222, l 4 from above, for T 230 read T 320 On p 182, in the note to l 444, Arngart remarks that the synaesthetic connotation of 'cold', viz evil, does not otherwise occur in English, but see Gordon's note to l 91 of the *Battle of Maldon* Arngart is to be congratulated on having edited a difficult text in such an admirable way

The late Miss Dorothy Everett's *Essays on Middle English Literature*[2] consists partly of reprints and partly of posthumous work (see Chapter VI) The essay entitled *A Characterization of the English Medieval Romances* appeared in volume xv of *E & S* The other essays relevant to this chapter were originally written for the Oxford History of English Literature for which Miss Everett was due to write the volume on Middle English Literature Before Chaucer In *Lagamon and the Earliest Middle English Alliterative Verse*, starting from the first century after the Norman Conquest, Miss Everett first discusses some of the early pieces, such as the *Charm against a Wen, the Grave*, and the so-called *First Worcester Fragment* She then passes on to deal with two kinds of verse 'classical' and 'popular' whose likenesses and differences 'are important for the understanding of Middle English alliterative verse' Her discussion of Lagamon's *Brut* shows admirably how much Lagamon is rooted in the tradition of the earlier poetry Three essays have been taken together under the general title of *The Alliterative Revival* In the first of these, *The Alliterative Morte Arthure and Other Poems*, Miss Everett deals with the sudden outburst (or so it seems to us now) of alliterative verse in the fourteenth century and she shows in which respects this verse differs from the older tradition This essay gives an excellent survey of alliterative verse from *Winner and Waster* down to *Morte Arthure* The other two essays deal with the *Gawain* poet Of these the one on *Pearl* is especially noteworthy Miss Everett finds that the *Pearl* stands much farther apart from other Middle English writings than *Gawain* in some respects it is nearer to *Lycidas* To her the human emotion manifested in the *Pearl* is its driving force and its motive Particularly interesting is her discussion of the parallelism with Dante's *Divina Commedia* and she concludes that the poem can have no definite label of elegy or allegory attached to it These essays give throughout evidence of Miss Everett's wide knowledge and deep love of Middle English literature It is indeed a delight to wander with her through the field and to be shown points of special interest and beauty by one who was so eminently equipped to write a history of the literature of the period

In *A Note on the Demon Queen Eleanor* (*MLN*) R L Chapman points out that in the thirteenth-century Romance *Richard Coeur de Lion*, the hero's mother is represented as a demon or fairy mistress of the widespread 'swan-maiden' type Though supernatural parents are not rare in Romances, it is rare that the historical parent of a recent historical monarch is represented as a demon When *Richard Coeur de Lion* was written Eleanor of Aquitaine had been dead

[2] *Essays on Middle English Literature*, by Dorothy Everett O U P pp xi+179 18*s*

fifty years and her memory had presumably not perished The English versifier will have assumed that his readers would identify Richard's mother with Eleanor Chapman suggests that the author was relating, from his French source, a legend which had become attached to Eleanor during the years immediately after her death in 1204

The problem of the interpretation of *Pearl* continues to engage students of this beautiful but elusive poem The aim of Milton R Stern's article *An Approach to 'Pearl'* (*JEGP*) is to recall attention to two conventions the multiple levels of meaning in traditional Scriptural exegesis according to the four senses, and the gemological meanings found in the lapidary tradition According to Stern the meaning of *Pearl* lies largely in the third or moral sense, so the loss of Pearl is synonymous with the loss of happiness 'The fundamental tension becomes an opposition of the meanings of earth and Pearl ' John Conley finds a different solution in *'Pearl' and a Lost Tradition* (*JEGP*) After a useful survey of previous opinions Conley lays down six principles to be applied to a consideration of the meaning of the poem To Conley *Pearl* is a Consolatio and he finds the poem analogous in themes, situation, and treatment to Boethius's *De Consolatione Philosophiae* so much revered at the time It is a poem on lost happiness, but happiness which was an 'imperfect good, a false happiness' The action of the poem is implicit in ll 743–4 Through grace the imperfect good is renounced for the perfect good, *Summum Bonum* Charles Moorman finds the key to the problem in the narrator In *The Role of the Narrator in 'Pearl'* (*MP*) he states that the mind of the narrator is the real subject under consideration This approach forces the reader to regard the action of the poem within the implied dramatic framework which the poet provides, and to fit into that framework all the details introduced by the poet In the first section of the poem the narrator's grief-stricken statements reflect personal sorrow, but also the paradoxical nature of the universe in which the decay of the body contributes to the beauty of nature This questioning of the dual nature of things occupies the poet throughout the dual nature of heavenly justice It is this struggle for understanding which gives the poem its permanence and its enduring appeal This view is worked out by the author in his description of the progress of the argument of the poem His conclusion is that, as in most elegies, the theme of *Pearl* is the acceptance, through suffering and revelation, of death as a part of the universal plan The parts of the dream-vision become the stages of redemption The narrator, through a series of trials, learns to accept his place among the living One wonders if the author, while looking for 'the quickest way to come to the heart of the poem', does not paradoxically wander too far away into the mental attitude of a later age A solution well within the religious field is offered by Miss Marie Padgett Hamilton in *The Meaning of the Middle English 'Pearl'* (*PMLA*), in which she attempts to answer two questions What is typified by the jewel and the jewel-maiden? and What is the symbolic import of the story? Starting from the identity of the two jewels, the pearl found by the dreamer in his vision and the one he had grieved for, Miss Hamilton arrives at the conclusion, previously offered by Sister Mary V Hillman, that Pearl is the Soul, but the *Pearl* poet used a double metaphor for the soul as both jewel and Bride of Christ In dealing with the second question, the symbolic import of the story, Miss

Hamilton points out that at the centre of her defence of her rank as a queen in God's Kingdom Pearl gives a résumé of the Fall and the Redemption (ll 637–60) In this passage Miss Hamilton finds the answer to her second question the whole of *Pearl* is a finely wrought elaboration of this theme It would seem that Miss Everett's view of human emotion as the driving force combined with some such religious view as offered by Miss Hamilton may well be as near the truth as one will ever get

In *Word-Play in 'Pearl'* (*MLN*) H R Rupp finds an apparently unnoticed example of the poet's use of the technique of double meaning in ll 277–8, where Rupp suggests that *geste* may have the meaning of *'guest'* as well as of *'story'* A crux in *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* is dealt with by Miss Cecily Clark in *The Green Knight Shoeless A Reconsideration* (*RES*) She re-examines the case for interpreting *scholes* at l 160 as the adjective 'shoeless' On the assumption that the author of *Gawain* often switches in his descriptions from one part of speech to another it is maintained that syntactically *scholes* may be an adjective Only one example, however, is given of the switch from noun to adjective Next the question is asked whether it is in accordance with what we know about fourteenth-century dress From illustrations in English and French manuscripts and from a passage in a twelfth-century Spanish poem it is shown that dandies at the time might go riding in hose alone It seems indeed possible that the meaning 'shoeless' is right in this passage In *The Predicament of Gawain* (*MLQ*) George J Engelhardt considers the exceptional predicament which befell Gawain in the adventure which ended at the Green Chapel Such an exceptional predicament is just right for one who is the perfect knight by universal repute, whose perfection lay in valour, piety, and courtesy The author discusses various aspects of this predicament, how Gawain escaped unslain with his honour unscathed, his meeting with the fairest of chatelaines, his rejection of the love of another man's wife, and some other dilemmas which Gawain had to face The author then shows how from the supreme predicament emerges not only the moral of the poem, but its suspense, humour, irony, and its delight The Gawain poet's technique is the subject of an interesting study, *Rhetorical 'Descriptio' in Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* (*MLR*) by Derek A Pearsall The aim is to illuminate the poetic technique by examining the relationship between the poet's use of description and the observations and precepts of the Rhetoricians concerning description in poetry Certain kinds of description as exampled in Matthew of Vendôme, who considered description the supreme object of poetry, are found in *Gawain* There is the description of the Green Knight and his horse, based fundamentally on the same artistic principle as that of Vendôme *Descriptio feminae pulchritudinis*, the most popular type of literary portrait, is replaced in *Gawain* by the description by contrast of the lady and the *auncian* (ll 950–69) Matthew's *descriptio quattuor temporum anni*, typical of a long tradition in the Middle Ages, is fully observed in *Gawain*, where all four seasons are described (ll 500–33) The description of landscape is represented by the wild scenery in *Gawain* It is not a question of the poet's fondness for wild scenery, but it is 'functional in the strict rhetorical sense' The author finds a certain relationship between rhetorical precept and the stylistic practice of the Gawain poet and suggests that an examination of the influence of rheto-

rical theory on medieval poetry 'would precipitate a revolution in the critical approach to that poetry' Difficulties of interpretation and etymologies of words are discussed by C A Luttrell in *The Gawain Group Cruxes, Etymologies, Interpretations* (*N*) The words dealt with are *bale, bele, carye, raged, rout, scarre, skyly, skwe, sour,* and *wawe* In most cases Luttrell has something interesting to offer

Two articles have appeared on *Piers Plowman* Miss E Suddaby writes on *The Poem 'Piers Plowman'* (*JEGP*) She discusses certain aspects of style and the poem's angle of observation If not much emerges that will contribute towards a better appreciation of the poem as such, one should remember that it is not really a subject that can be dealt with in a few pages There certainly seems little point in offering such truisms as the following 'in form, in theme, in detail it is completely of its age' (p 100) and 'For the things that mattered most to Langland are the things that matter still ' (p 103) From Germany comes a study entitled *William Langland's 'Piers Plowman' im Lichte der mittelalterlichen Philosophie und Theologie* (*Ang*) by Willi Erzgraber, who takes the poem as a whole in a broad survey of influences behind Langland's thinking As the author remarks himself, he has refrained from finding out what the relationship of the poetry is to the philosophical-theological element After a survey of previous work on these lines from 1895 till 1951 Erzgraber gives the results of a study of his based on the C-text, which was finished in 1954 (but not yet published), in which on the strength of textual analysis the question of Langland's relation to the great philosophical and theological movements of his time was treated Again basing his findings on the C-text the author finds traces of the thinking of Thomas Aquinas, Augustine, Franciscus of Assisi, Duns Scotus, but, unlike Talbot Donaldson, no influence of Anselm of Canterbury Nor does he see any connexion between Walter Hilton and Langland He finally deals with the question whether Langland was an adherent of Wycliff and concludes that the difference between them was too great Wycliff attacked the entire medieval church on its foundation, Langland never demanded a revolutionary change of the outer forms of religious life Doubts arise whether this is a profitable approach Surely similarities of thought do not necessarily point to direct influence and if these influences are not meant to be direct how can one trace them as influences at a time when so much was in the air?

An attempt to vindicate the quality of the poem of *Sir Degaré* against its critics—latterly Smithers in *MÆ* xxii, 1953—is made by William C Stokoe, Jr , in his study *The Double Problem of 'Sir Degaré'* (*PMLA*) He finds that the nine texts of this poem preserve two quite different versions of the story A comparison of these versions shows that the Auchinleck MS and what remains of the Cambridge MS can be placed against the other versions and differ from these in respect of diction, narrative skill, and in the complete removal of the supernatural background On the basis of these differences Stokoe argues that the redactor of *Sir Degaré*, i e of the work on which the other manuscripts and early editions are based, deserves to be called a medieval hackwriter and that we have here to do with two different versions and not simply with a corrupt textual tradition The changes made by the English redactor explain many of the inconsistencies that have been charged to the author

The E E T S 's volume of the year for the period covered in this chapter

is *Deonise Hid Diuinite* by Phyllis Hodgson [3] This edition is a complement to the same editor's edition of *The Cloud of Unknowing* for the E E T S in 1944 and consists of five short treatises found together in two of the most important manuscripts of the *Cloud* and often attributed to the same anonymous fourteenth-century writer In the introduction Miss Hodgson describes the manuscripts, deals with their relationship, justifies the choice of the basic text, and gives a survey of the language After that she discusses at length the relationship of the five treatises in subject-matter and in style and also the translations and their sources Her investigation leads to the conclusion that there is no evidence 'to invalidate the hypothesis that single authorship can be assumed for these treatises and the *Cloud*, but on the contrary much to commend it' After the text of the five treatises Miss Hodgson gives in an appendix the text of *De Mystica Theologia* In a second appendix the text of *A Ladder of Foure Ronges* is printed, but here there is no question of common authorship There are excellent Notes and a Glossary The problem of the Hilton canon is dealt with by Miss Hodgson in *Walter Hilton and the 'Cloud of Unknowing' A Problem of Authorship Reconsidered* (*MLR*) Taking the *Cloud* together with the six treatises likely to have been written by the same author (including the five treatises just mentioned) on the one hand, and on the other the *Scale of Perfection* together with five other treatises ascribed to Hilton, Miss Hodgson retests the internal evidence beginning with the descriptions of the unitive prayer of contemplation She shows convincingly that the resemblances in these descriptions in the two groups of texts are not so striking as is sometimes thought The Scriptural passages are next examined and it is found that the correspondences can be explained as borrowings from the common background Some distinctive turns of thought and also the use of imagery drawn from the common medieval stock show important differences in the two groups of texts After examining the style Miss Hodgson arrives at the conclusion that separate authorship of the two groups is to be assumed, because of fundamental differences between Hilton and the author of the *Cloud* group

Two articles on Gower show up his unoriginality In *Gower's 'Vox Clamantis' and the 'Speculum Stultorum'* (*MLN*) R R Raymo shows how freely Gower plundered the *Speculum Stultorum*, a twelfth-century beast epic by Nigel de Longchamps, whose vogue reached its height in England between 1350 and 1450 Raymo gives a list of Gower's verbatim or nearly verbatim borrowings from the *Speculum* Another source of Gower's borrowings is discussed by Paul E Beichner, C S C, in *Gower's Use of 'Aurora' in 'Vox Clamantis'* (*S*) who examines Gower's use of the late twelfth-century *Aurora* or *Biblia Versificata* of Peter Riga, which is not yet printed He first points out that Gower used a manuscript similar to MS Latin CCC XXV of Merton College, i e a manuscript of the first or unexpanded version of the *Aurora* Beichner then shows what the types of borrowed matter are and how some passages were put together or changed In an appendix he gives a Table of Lines in *Vox Clamantis* taken from the *Aurora*

In *The Latin Text of Purvey's Psalter* (*MÆ*) Henry Hargreaves sets himself the task of discovering what

[3] *Deonise Hid Diuinite and Other Treatises on Contemplative Prayer Related to The Cloud of Unknowing*, by Phyllis Hodgson E E T S, Original Series, No 231 1955 (for 1949) pp lvii+158 30*s*

Latin text Purvey used when he set out to revise the earlier translation of the Bible made by Hereford and others of the Wycliffite circle First Hargreaves compares Purvey's translation with Hereford's so as to establish what the Latin text was which Purvey regarded as true For this comparison he uses the Psalter His List A gives places where Hereford translated an incorrect Latin reading and Purvey preferred a correct one List B gives examples of places where the Latin reading at the basis of Hereford's translation is correcter than that at the basis of Purvey's List C contains a number of incorrect readings common to both Hereford's and Purvey's versions The examples in lists A and B are corrections in Purvey's view and a close examination of them shows the commentary of Nicholas of Lyra to be the source The author then deals with two questions Is there an obvious source for Purvey's corrections that have no justification in Lyra? The answer is negative Are there any places where Purvey's reading conflicts with Lyra? Here Hargreaves finds two places where Purvey's translation shows his Latin text to have been different from Lyra's The general conclusion of this very well-thought-out and well-presented study is that Purvey in his revision of the Latin text used by Hereford relied heavily but not exclusively on Lyra's commentary

Three notes suggesting plausible emendations in *The King of Tars* are published by A J Bliss in *Notes on 'The King of Tars'* (*NQ*) (see Chapter VII)

Certain phrases and figurative expressions used by Lydgate in praise of the Virgin Mary are shown by Miss I Hyde in *Lydgate's 'Halff Chongyd Latyne' an Illustration* (*MLN*) to be not original to him but drawn from the common stock of such expressions, most of them deriving ultimately from the liturgy and patristic commentary Aureate phrases occurring at the beginning (stanzas 4–10) of Lydgate's *Ballade at the Reverence of Our Lady* derive from a passage of a dozen lines from the *Anticlaudianus* of Alanus de Insulis

Some of Lydgate's verses not hitherto used by editors or commentators are discussed by J B Trapp in *Verses by Lydgate at Long Melford* (*RES*) These verses are painted in the Clopton Chapel of the Church of the Holy Trinity at Long Melford in Suffolk, six from *The Lamentation of Mary Magdalen* and twenty-six from *The Testament of John Lydgate* They form a fragmentary fifteenth-century text of two of Lydgate's poems, a reflection of his reputation fifty years after his death They seem to have been painted during the latter half of the fifteenth century, for the church was rebuilt between 1445 and 1496 Trapp suggests that they were painted to the order of a member of the Clopton family, probably John Clopton (1423–96) The text was modified to fit the use to which it was put and Trapp finds it tempting to conjecture that MS Harleian 2255 was used He gives a full transcript of the text These paintings are 'a further small but perhaps useful testimony to the contemporary or near-contemporary reputation of Lydgate, particularly as a versifier for occasions public and private, secular and ecclesiastic'

Unnoticed verses incorporated in John Mirk's *Festial* are given by Mary Long in *Undetected Verse in Mirk's 'Festial'* (*MLN*) She gives specimens of these verses which occur at the beginning or at the end of a sermon, often as a prayer Outstanding among them is a unique verse dialogue in Sermon 53, which is the only one in medieval English verse that is based on the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin

In *Nicholas Love—a Fifteenth Century Translator* (*RES*) Elizabeth Zeeman deals with Nicholas Love, Prior of the Carthusian House of Mount Grace in Yorkshire, translator of the pseudo-Bonaventuran *Meditationes Vitae Christi*, which he called *The Mirror of the Blessed Life of Jesu Christ*, one of the most popular books of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries It contains some of the finest English prose of any time and is of importance for showing the contribution made by medieval translators to the general development of English prose style Miss Zeeman discusses the name of the author, whose dialect was probably a variety of that spoken in the North-east Midlands She gives further information about his life and about his reading in English devotional works The first two editions of this work were printed by Caxton and seven more followed before 1530 Sir Thomas More recommended it together with Hilton's *Scale of Perfection* and the *Imitation of Christ* The relation of the *Mirror* to its original and its style are discussed, and finally there is a valuable discussion of the *Mirror* as part of the tradition of vernacular prose writing from King Alfred onwards

In *Two Notes on Henryson's 'Testament of Cresseid'* (*JEGP*) C Elliott defends the reading *Esperus* in Charteris's edition of Henryson's poems and deals with Charteris's reading *Philologie* on fol 4b of the manuscript

Again, as in 1954, a considerable body of anonymous Middle English verse was published for the first time in various articles R H Bowers prints some in *A Middle English 'Rake's Progress' Poem* (*MLN*) These verses are preserved in an apograph fair copy in MS Harley 7578, fol 16 They are rather coarse but show a saving sense of humour and pose some minor problems in Middle English lexicography R H Robbins publishes a poem on Philip of Burgundy in *A Middle English Diatribe against Philip of Burgundy* (*N*) The manuscript is in the English College at Rome and it is a major Lydgate anthology with shorter poems all duplicating existing texts except the *Diatribe* which is a poem of scorn of Philip's retreat from the siege of Calais in 1436 After a full description of the manuscript Robbins deals with the historical background clarifying some of the allusions in the poem It must have been written very shortly after Philip's retreat in 1436 He then gives the text and places the poem against the wider background of the tradition of personal abuse, which was well established in Middle English verse from the thirteenth century onwards In the last section he shows how these poems illustrate the mutual interaction between verse and prose accounts of historical events and he gives an account of how the medieval chronicles and such poems as the *Diatribe* lay the basis for that general stock of knowledge which ultimately leads to the historical drama of the Elizabethan era John L Cutler adds a new one to the small list of acrostics in *A Middle English Acrostic* (*MLN*) It is no 2136 of the Brown-Robbins *Index* called by Carleton Brown 'A Mirror for Young Ladies at their Toilet' and it is remarkable for its combination of an extremely exacting acrostic with an equally exacting pattern of end-rhyme R H Bowers publishes *A Middle English Poem on the Seven Gifts of the Holy Ghost* (*MLN*), a hitherto unpublished rendering of the figura of the Seven Gifts of the Holy Ghost, which is preserved in a Cambridge University Library manuscript In the same periodical (*MLN*) R H Robbins writes *On Dating A Middle English Moral Poem* It is often difficult to assign any

close date of composition to a group of poems dealing with the abuses of the age, because they derive from a common source, a list in a Latin tract which came into Middle English verse at the end of the thirteenth or the beginning of the fourteenth century, and consequently the content of these pieces is very much alike But in the case of a moral series in MS Digby 102 Robbins is able to show how one piece deals with charges publicly discussed in Parliament in 1410 One piece, however, no 884 of the *Index*, a typical catalogue of corrupt practices, can be pinned down on internal and external evidence to the year 1456 Two hitherto unprinted poems are published by R H Robbins in two articles in *NM* in the first, *God Amende Wykkyd Counsell (1464)*, Robbins prints a political-historical poem in the Bodleian Library, which gives a popular view of Henry VI This poem comes at the end of a literary tradition and is conventional In the second article in the same periodical (*NM*) Robbins prints *An Epitaph for Duke Humphrey (1447)*, once erroneously attributed to Lydgate Robbins discusses the epitaph type of poetry in Middle English R H Bowers suggests a new title for no 3375 of the *Index* in *When Cuckow Time Cometh Oft So Soon, A Middle English Animal Prophecy* (*Ang*) Although the manuscript was written about the time of Henry VIII, the poem here printed for the first time belongs to the fifteenth century It forms part of the literary genre of the political prophecy In the same volume P J Frankis deals with two fifteenth-century lyrics not mentioned in the *Index* in *Some Late Middle English Lyrics in the Bodleian Library* (*Ang*) The text of the two poems is given together with an unnoticed fragment, perhaps a carol, which must be the earliest known version of a popular sixteenth-century song *Go from my window* He also discusses some hitherto overlooked literary relationships of MS Rawlinson C 815 In *Three Middle English Poems on the Apostles' Creed* (*PMLA*) R H Bowers publishes for the first time three poems on 'How the Apostles made the Creed' from three manuscripts in the British Museum Two of these poems are of minor interest, but the third shows considerable skill and is written in rhyming stanzas but with alliteration and internal assonance, representing the process of gradual triumph of rhyme over alliteration The same author gives the first printed text of *A Middle English mnemonic poem on usury* (*Med Stud*) It is an anonymous versified attack on usury, the practice of which in the later Middle Ages created a tremendous social problem to conscientious English clerics The author of this poem was presumably a Yorkshire man or a Scot Bowers also gives the first printed text of a fifteenth-century prose version from MS Harley 45, which belongs to the same literary tradition as the anonymous prose treatise *Jacob's Well* (edited by Brandeis for the E E T S in 1900), a religious encyclopedia in the form of sermons of the first half of the fifteenth century

In 1923 Dr Kalén edited the first 500 stanzas of a metrical paraphrase of the Old Testament A further 302 stanzas have now been edited, thus bringing the story up to the conclusion of the poem's Second Book of Kings, by Urban Ohlander in *A Middle English Metrical Paraphrase of the Old Testament*[4] In a short introduction Dr Ohlander briefly sum-

[4] *A Middle English Metrical Paraphrase of the Old Testament II* (Gothenburg Studies in English V), by Urban Ohlander Stockholm Almqvist & Wiksell pp 112 Sw Kr 12

VI. MIDDLE ENGLISH: CHAUCER

By JOYCE BAZIRE

1 *General*

DUDLEY D GRIFFITH'S *Bibliography of Chaucer 1908–1953*[1] includes the contents of the author's previous volume dealing with the years 1908–24 While this is a useful work of reference in many respects, it is unfortunately marred by certain inaccuracies

The collection, *Essays on Middle English Literature*,[2] comprises seven essays by Dorothy Everett which have been edited with care by Patricia Kean (see Chapter V) 'Chaucer's Good Ear' and 'Some Reflections on Chaucer's "Art Poetical"' have already appeared elsewhere (see *YW* XXVIII 71 and XXXIII 49), the other two concerned with Chaucer, 'Chaucer's Love Visions, with Particular Reference to the *Parlement of Foules*' and '*Troilus and Criseyde*', were originally delivered as lectures and show evidence of this in style, though it is by no means unpleasing

The first part of the former essay Miss Everett devotes to the Love Vision as a type of composition, and she then studies the *Parlement of Foules* particularly This, she asserts, must be considered as a whole, it is no good regarding—as some critics have done—everything previous to the debate of the inferior birds as merely introductory Only by taking a comprehensive view can one appreciate that nothing in the poem is likely to have been unconsidered, from the very beginning the theme of false versus true felicity may be traced When she has shown how the various parts of the poem fit together, Miss Everett proffers her conclusion, that the poem is 'delicately ironical fantasy on the theme of love and not merely of Courtly Love presented through a series of contrasts, variously achieved', and though the contrast is drawn between Courtly and Natural Love, the former is never ridiculed

The essay on *Troilus and Criseyde* is concerned with a comparison, sometimes carefully detailed, sometimes more general, of Chaucer's work with that of Boccaccio, and this leads Miss Everett on to consider the effect that Chaucer's alterations have had on the characters of the protagonists The 'private' tragedy of *Il Filostrato* has by many means been developed to give infinite variety and a story which is in relation with issues that face all mankind Finally Miss Everett shows how the whole treatment of 'this theme of the failure of human love in its most ideal form' moves inevitably towards the sentiments expressed in the *Epilogue*

[Review A C Cawley, *MLR* li (1956), 91–92]

Sister Mary Raynelda, Makarewicz divides her book, *The Patristic Influence on Chaucer*[3] (which was received late), into three sections, each of which deals with a different theme for which Chaucer utilized his knowledge of theological doctrine, derived 'through the patristic tradition in the Middle Ages'

[1] *Bibliography of Chaucer 1908–1953*, by Dudley D Griffith Washington U P pp xviii+398 $5

[2] *Essays on Middle English Literature*, by Dorothy Everett, ed Patricia Kean O U P pp xi+179 18*s*

[3] *The Patristic Influence on Chaucer*, by Sister Mary Raynelda, Makarewicz The Catholic University of America Press 1953 pp xi+244 $2 75

In the first chapter, which is concerned with the idea of 'Virginity versus Marriage', the utterances of the Wife of Bath play no small part Echoes of her unwitting admission, which is supported by patristic teaching, that virginity is really the highest state, are found in some of the other tales A further influence (discussed in Chapter II) is revealed in the implication which lies behind many tales within and without the 'Marriage Group', as well as in Chaucer's other poems, that unless marriage is ordered by the laws of God, unless *charitas* and not *cupiditas* is its mainspring, misery will result, and in the light of this Chaucer modifies the conception of courtly love, making love and marriage compatible As a development of these thoughts, the renunciation of earthly love for divine love in the *Epilogue* of *Troilus and Criseyde* is quite appropriate

Chaucer's final debt to the Fathers is shown by his treatment of Vices and Virtues, whether they are conceived as abstractions, as in the *Parson's Tale*, as persons, such as, on the one hand, the Wife of Bath or the Pardoner, or, on the other, Griselda, or whether they are found in *exempla*, such as those of the Pardoner

Sister Mary Raynelda suggests finally that the value of such a study is that added meaning is given to some of Chaucer's works, that certain 'problems' may be resolved (here she cites the *Epilogue* to *Troilus and Criseyde*), and that further evidence is provided of Chaucer's skill, sometimes he has used material as though the copy lay beside him as he wrote, sometimes he has selected, sometimes paraphrased, but every part is blended into an artistic whole

In *The Golden Mirror*[4] Claes Schaar investigates another aspect of Chaucer's artistic method He attempts to determine the affinities or the differences between the descriptive technique employed by Chaucer and that employed by his contemporaries and his predecessors, who, it may be assumed, exercised an influence on him

The examination is conducted with reference to three separate categories emotions, portraits, and landscapes The description of emotions may be achieved in three ways—as inward feelings only, as outward expressions, such as tears, or with a combination of these two In the case of the portraits nine types of description are distinguished, though they are not always found in their pure forms, but often in combination The last division deals with four types of description of landscape The purpose in comparing these passages with source or analogue is to attempt to ascertain how much may be Chaucer's own contribution to the development of the literary technique

In all three categories the type of description used is related to the structure of the sentence with a view to discovering whether stylistic characteristics mark off the different types in a similar manner In order to relate Chaucer's work to his background it has been necessary to examine not only those writings from which he obviously derived inspiration, such as *Il Filostrato* in the case of *Troilus and Criseyde*, but those others which appear to have been popular in his time, there is every likelihood that he came in contact with some of these, though with regard to the rest there may be less probability

The examination itself is undertaken with great thoroughness and a considerable length, but it is bound

[4] *The Golden Mirror* Studies in Chaucer's Descriptive Technique and its Literary Background (Skrifter utgivna av Kungl Humanistika Vetenskapssamfundet i Lund LIV), by Claes Schaar Lund C W K Gleerup pp VIII+526+16 Sw Kr 50

to be of specialized interest Although in his final chapter Schaar draws together the results, his conclusions cannot be adequately summarized as the range they cover is so wide

Fernand Mossé devotes most of his article, *Chaucer et le 'metier' de l'ecrivain* (*Ea*, 1954), to commenting on certain points made either by Dorothy Everett (*Some Reflections on Chaucer's 'Art Poetical'* [*YW* xxxiii 49]) or by G H Gerould (*Chaucerian Essays* [*YW* xxxiii 50–52]) He believes that the rhetorical devices used by Chaucer were not necessarily employed with conscious purpose, but came to be in most cases spontaneous effects as a result of his 'training' Gerould's assertion that tragedy is mingled with pathos is not echoed by Mossé, and when Mossé claims that to a considerable extent the saints' names used as expletives (especially the much discussed *Ronyon* and *Madrian*) are determined by rhyme, he again disagrees with Gerould

William A Madden's purpose in *Chaucer's Retraction and Mediaeval Canons of Seemliness* (*Mediaeval Studies*) is to establish the development of Chaucer's feeling which resulted in his 'apologies', more particularly the *Epilogue* to *Troilus and Criseyde* and the *Retraction* To this end he examines the attitudes of Chaucer's age and audience to the social standard of 'seemliness' The differing social groups among the pilgrims react to this standard in various respects, such as in the type of story they tell But Madden finds for his purpose that 'by far the most interesting, crucial, and revealing theme of the *Canterbury Tales*' lies in the concept of marriage The subject might be treated in 'farcical, comical or pornographic' way, or ideally from the ecclesiastical or courtly-love point of view, and, in the treatment in the *Canterbury Tales* by various speakers, a gap appears between what is 'seemly' and what is morally acceptable

This leads on to a consideration of Chaucer in his three roles the pilgrim, the poet reading his work, and the Chaucer of the apologies Two sides of the real Chaucer are implied—one a courtly-romancer and one a prudent philosopher—and these are reflected in the two tales he assigns to himself In his apology in the *Prologue* to the *Miller's Tale* Chaucer is clearly uneasy at the relation between the concepts of what is seemly and what is moral, and it is this uneasiness that leads eventually to sincere pronouncements in both *Epilogue* and *Retraction* Further, it should be noted that beneath the *Canterbury Tales* there lies 'Chaucer's deep concern for answers to the social ills he saw about him'

The fullest section of D S Brewer's article, *The Ideal of Feminine Beauty in Medieval Literature, especially 'Harley Lyrics', Chaucer, and some Elizabethans* (*MLR*) is devoted to Chaucer's methods of representing the beauty of his heroines, determining to what extent the descriptions follow the conventional terms these are indicated in the first section with examples drawn from the works of writers of many medieval periods and countries, and, in the second section, traced in the *Harley Lyrics* In the case of Criseyde and Emily, Chaucer does not follow his sources, and is effective in his means of description mainly because tradition is used to imply what is not expressed Then the humour of the description of Alison in the *Miller's Tale* can be fully realized 'in the light of the tradition which it employs, and subtly inverts' Brewer also discusses Duchess Blanche, and, in less detail, some of the other female characters Then, in a brief final section, he glances at

Elizabethan heroines, particularly those of Shakespeare (see Chapter V)

Chaucer's Mediaeval World Outside of Great Britain (*Mediaeval Studies*) completes the series of three studies in which Francis P Magoun, Jr , has surveyed the geographical and ethnic names found in Chaucer's works A similar arrangement has been followed in all three, and in this last some cross-references are given to earlier entries to avoid repetition of material Etymologies are provided and also references to other sources of information

Although little in it deals specifically with Chaucer, Barnet Kottler's article, *The Vulgate Tradition of the 'Consolatio Philosophiae' in the Fourteenth Century* (*Mediaeval Studies*), is not without interest for Chaucer students

2 '*Canterbury Tales*'

R M Lumiansky's *Of Sondry Folk*[5] represents in some measure a gathering together of much that has been written elsewhere on the *Canterbury Tales*, together with Lumiansky's criticism of it and evaluation of its worth In analysing the performance of each pilgrim Lumiansky demonstrates the techniques used by Chaucer, and he stresses that although from one point of view stories and tellers exist as separate entities, their full value can be discovered only when they are taken as complementary Three stages of dramatic development are represented the simple suiting of tale and teller, as in the case of the Squire, an addition to this by means of external motivation, as in the case of the Summoner and the Friar, whose professional antagonism is played upon to the full, a further addition—internal motivation—produces the dramatic revelation by his story of the real character of the pilgrim, as in the *Merchant's Tale* The scene for the dramas is of course set by the *Prologue* and maintained in the *Links*

It has not been unanimously agreed that every tale was written at the time when Chaucer was engaged upon the general composition of the *Canterbury Tales*, or that every one was originally written specifically for the pilgrim to whom it is now attached, but Lumiansky brings forward arguments to counter those that have been previously raised against the likelihood of 'contemporaneous' composition, and is ready to consider that practically all were written for the present pilgrim, in the case of the *Shipman's Tale* (which he allows to have been originally written for the Wife of Bath) he notes the features which make it suitable for the later teller

Some of the stories which are relatively simple can be dismissed quickly, but others demand considerable analysis, this is naturally not exhaustive since Lumiansky's concern is with one aspect only, but it is carefully worked out, with interesting comments, even if all of them will not find general acceptance

The book itself is well set up, but the drawings are an unfortunate inclusion

[Reviews William W Lawrence, *S* xxxi (1956), 179–82
Basil Cottle, *JEGP* lv (1956), 292–3
Howard R Patch, *MLN* lxxi (1956), 299–301]

In dealing with *The Unity of the Canterbury Tales*[6] Ralph Baldwin concerns himself principally with the beginning and the end The middle of the pilgrimage may be incomplete, the final order of the tales a matter of

[5] *Of Sondry Folk The Dramatic Principle in the Canterbury Tales*, by R M Lumiansky Austin Texas U P pp xiv+270 $5

[6] *The Unity of the Canterbury Tales* (*Anglistica* V), by Ralph Baldwin Copenhagen Rosenkilde og Bagger pp 112 Dan Kr 14 50

some debate, but the beginning and the end have been carefully designed and fit in with the conception of the pilgrimage to Canterbury as the earthly parallel of the pilgrimage through life of every human being The opening *reverdie* (upon which Baldwin dwells at some length) is linked with thoughts of regeneration and redemption, Chaucer being unique, Baldwin claims, in using this theme, which recurred so often in medieval writings, as the 'groundsong' for a pilgrimage

Baldwin examines in some detail the *Prologue* and the means by which Chaucer depicts his pilgrims—by description of character, physical appearance, rank, and dress, though the second means is little used—and how far he is in line with general practice in this matter Emphasis is laid on Chaucer's skill here in creating the illusion of a pilgrimage although the travellers have not yet set out The Host, who is inspired by a worldly motive to undertake the journey, is described separately, and then promptly takes over the dominating role from Chaucer the Pilgrim who thereupon disappears into the company

By his dual role of Pilgrim and Poet Chaucer achieves 'dual distance', in the former a greater vraisemblance and warmth, and in the latter omniscience impossible to the Pilgrim The frame and the stories, which in a sense play the part of the pilgrims' conversation, are closely bound together and must be regarded as one artistic whole

Baldwin suggests that a careful consideration of the final section of the *Canterbury Tales* produces the impression that a design lies behind it, the Parson was discouraged earlier from telling a tale, and who but he would be fit to point the pilgrims finally to their goal? As the excellent Knight began the series, so the excellent Parson concludes it, and draws the whole together as 'a commentary on the action' His text is a call to repentance, and every pilgrim must recognize his own particular sin as the Parson lists the Seven Deadly Sins, after he has reminded them of the need for Penitence and incited them to Penance And Chaucer the Poet is likewise moved by his words, so that the *Retraction* is seen as no mere appendage, but an integral part of the theme, a natural development

[Review Claes Schaar, *SN* xxviii (1956), 50–52]

In his article, *The 'Canterbury Tales' Early Manuscripts and Relative Popularity* (*JEGP*), Charles A Owen, Jr , expresses himself as in disagreement with Mrs Dempster's theory (propounded in *On the Significance of Hengwrt's Change of Ink in the 'Merchant's Tale'* [*MLN* lxiii (1948), 325–30]) of the simultaneous copying after Chaucer's death of single tales and single blocks of tales to serve as exemplars for use later in the production of manuscripts for readers Owen is unable to reconcile the evidence of the Hengwrt manuscript with this theory since he is sure that if the scribe had had access to accumulated exemplars, his first interest would have been to collect and arrange a complete set, whereas he seems to have had great difficulty in coming by some of the links and tales

Owen suggests that after Chaucer's death the manuscripts were scattered, and when someone first became interested in a complete collection of all Chaucer had written, the means for forming it were not available The nearly complete text of the Hengwrt manuscript revealed the importance of the frame, so, when the scribe came to write Ellesmere, the arrangement of tales was improved, but the text is not as accurate since the scribe, who at this later date had a choice of manu-

scripts, chose for clearness, not closeness to the original

The question is then posed—which was satisfactorily answered on Mrs Dempster's theory—of whether or not the 'disjunction', indicated by the change of ink in Hengwrt and by the breaking off in the *c* manuscripts, can be accounted for in the light of this new theory Owen compares the reconstruction suggested for the development of Block A, in which there was a probable loss of three quires of eight leaves, each with 580 lines to the quire, from the *c* exemplar The change of ink and the breaking off are at line 2318 (two lines short of four times 580), which suggests that the fourth quire of Fragment E ended at 2318 in Chaucer's text and at least two copies made from it From this other conclusions may be derived about copies of E and their connexions Owen acknowledges that his theory must depend on certain premisses, the most unlikely of which would normally be the use of two incomplete texts as exemplars for reading copies of the *Merchant's Tale*, but which is precisely what has happened in the case of Hengwrt and the *c* texts

If Owen's theory is allowed, then, he points out, some conclusions as to the relative popularity of individual tales may be inferred, for the greater the number of textual traditions, the more the probable popularity, though he admits that other factors, such as time of composition, are not without significance In the later manuscript 'anthologies' it is the more 'respectable' tales, such as the *Clerk's Tale*, that appear most frequently

In his other article, *Morality as a Comic Motif in the 'Canterbury Tales'* (*College English*), Owen introduces with an examination of what is now the *Shipman's Tale*—Chaucer's first 'fabliau' tale—his theory of the two artistic devices by which Chaucer achieved his effects in the *Canterbury Tales*, devices which he describes as 'double exposure through use of a narrator and the epitomizing of a moral position through the unifying concept or image', which 'imply the contrast between surface respectability and corrupt motive which is the keenest source of the comedy' In the portraits of the *Prologue* each pilgrim 'is presented in the comic perspective of an uncritical acceptance and enthusiasm' through which vices and virtues are laid bare equally easily Character is further displayed in an occasional physical detail, the Summoner's 'whelkes' or the Squire's 'embroidery' The pilgrims expose themselves also in their judgements of others and in the images they use in their tales, e g January's blindness in the *Merchant's Tale* Finally Owen deals with the effectiveness of the *Clerk's Tale* in the moral scheme

Pulpit Rhetoric in Three Canterbury Tales (*MLN*), by Charles E Shain, is an examination of the tales of the Merchant, Summoner (with particular reference to the Friar in his story), and Pardoner (whose tale, it has elsewhere been both asserted and denied, is in accordance with regular sermon structure) The Pardoner has collected and combined 'congenial bits from all the preaching he has heard' and used these to obtain his desired emotional impact, the Summoner's Friar achieves his effects principally by his weight of rhetorical devices, the preaching methods employed in the *Merchant's Tale* are attributed to the tale's probable earlier assignation to a cleric All these show how Chaucer had concentrated, not on the 'rules' of preaching, but on the preacher's intents and on how the desired effects on the hearer might be obtained

After examining in detail the two encounters of the Cook and the Host,

R M Lumiansky in *Chaucer's Cook-Host Relationship* (*Mediaeval Studies*) rejects the suggestion that Chaucer meant to cancel the Cook's *Prologue* and *Tale* He prefers to regard them as 'a single dramatic antagonism' which involves three businessmen (the third being the Manciple) 'who are very touchy about certain details of their operations'

In the *Miller's Tale* and the *Reeve's Tale*, maintains Gardiner Stillwell (*The Language of Love in Chaucer's Miller's and Reeve's Tales and in the Old French Fabliaux* [*JEGP*]), Chaucer has increased the humour of the pieces by the use of elegant or would-be-elegant diction which contrasts forcibly with the crudeness of the situation or character He points out that such a feature was well established in fabliau-literature before Chaucer's time, and provides examples from Old French tales to illustrate his argument

Both the pilgrim-miller and the miller in the *Reeve's Tale* embody certain characteristics popularly attributed to millers as a class, even if they both have in addition individualizing traits Although a number of the sources which George Fenwick Jones cites in support of this claim in *Chaucer and the Medieval Miller* (*MLQ*) are distant from Chaucer in time and space, and some originate in fifteenth-century Germany, Jones maintains that they indicate a common tradition and attitude to the miller-class

Edgar Hill Duncan notes in 'Narrator's Point of View in the Portrait-sketches, Prologue to the *Canterbury Tales*' (in *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry*[7]) how the Narrator shifts from 'a strictly limited point of view of personal observation and deduction therefrom to one of omniscience', and examines the first four portraits of the *Prologue* in detail to show how this is done Chaucer took the device from Lorris's *Roman de la Rose*, but adapted it to make it his own, extending it in the case of such pilgrims as the Monk, Friar, and Pardoner, where his apparent omniscience seems to be based on conversations he had with these pilgrims Variety in portrayal is the result of this practice, for Chaucer switches easily from one type to another, in one portrait following mainly one method, in another a different type All Duncan's divisions may not meet with unanimous agreement, perhaps what was learnt in conversation played a greater part than he allows, e g in the first four portraits

F P Magoun, Jr , writing on '*Canterbury Tales*' *A 11* (*MLN*), remarks on the difference in meaning when the *n* of *nature* is capitalized, he prefers it thus

Katherine T Emerson mentions *A Chaucer Borrowing in 'Kristin Lavransdatter'* (*NQ*), which is taken from the description of the Prioress (A [I], 128–35)

From various medieval sources Morton W Bloomfield assembles passages which help to indicate *The Magic of 'In Principio'* (*MLN*) and to support his assertion that when the Friar was given an offering, it was a return for his clearing the air of malignant spirits by his *In Principio*

The existence of Hubert, the kite in the Old French poems of the 'Renart' tradition, a cleric-confessor of dubious reputation, leads Charles Muscatine in *The Name of Chaucer's Friar* (*MLN*) to attribute Chaucer's choice of a name to memories of this By its implication the name would then round off the description of the Friar, instead of being contained in a line, the significance of which is otherwise difficult to determine.

[7] *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry* (Vanderbilt Studies in the Humanities, II) Vanderbilt U P , 1954 pp 298 $5

J Mitchell Morse's note, *Chaucer A Meaning of 'Philosophye'* (*NQ*), is concerned with the *General Prologue* 295

Peter Lisca, discussing *Chaucer's Guildsmen and Their Cook* (*MLN*), would explain the guildsmen's ability to afford a cook so obviously high class in his accomplishments (a point that has not passed without previous comment) by the fact that his personal characteristics and mormal had caused his dismissal from a better post, and he draws some parallels with the character and fate of the apprentice in the *Cook's Tale* The service of such a person is then 'a final deft stroke of Chaucer's satiric genius'

In *Chaucer's Shipman and the Integrity of his Cargo* (*MLR*) Mortimer J Donovan quotes certain articles from the Laws of Oleron (preserved with the *Black Book* of the Admiralty) which list the duties of the Shipman when in charge of wines, and also mention the voluntary gratuity of wine which might be given in recompense for his labours He suggests that the Shipman's pilfering was either because he found the gratuity insufficient, or because the merchant early realized that *courtoisie* would be wasted on him

Robert A Pratt seems to have read more than may be justified into the correspondences that he notes in *Chaucer and the Holy Cross of Bromholm* (*MLN*) between the needs of Symkyn's wife in her invocation to that piece of the Cross and the miraculous properties attributed to it by Roger of Wendover

Only the last part of F M Salter's article (originally his Presidential Address), *The Tragic Figure of the Wyf of Bath* (*Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada*, 1954) deals specifically with the title-subject Salter approaches it by observing how Chaucer was 'deeply preoccupied with moral questions' (many of the *Tales* as well as the *Retraction* show this), and was in a very skilful way a reformer, unless due emphasis is allowed to the 'moral' part of the *Wife of Bath's Tale*, the disquisition on *gentillesse* which works a transformation in the rapist, it is not obvious how such a person can merit a reward Chaucer's attitude to January adds poignancy to the figure of the Wife who had had three such husbands, and whose married life seemed to have held so little real happiness

William W Main notes in *Chaucer's 'The Merchant's Tale, 2257–61'* (*Explicator*) that by *lechour* (l 2257) two meanings may be intended 'lecher', and 'healer' since Damyan 'heals' January's blindness

Most editors have taken *CT* F (V), 1541–4 as a continuation of Aurelius's speech to Dorigen, but F P Magoun, Jr, suggests in *'Canterbury Tales', F 1541–44* (*MLN*) that they belong rather to the Franklin himself

Edd Winfield Parks makes a fairly detailed comparison of 'Hayne's Adaptation of Chaucer's Franklin's Tale' (in *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry*) and the original

Robert P Miller's detailed article, *Chaucer's Pardoner, the Scriptural Eunuch, and the Pardoner's Tale* (*S*), represents a survey of the way in which Chaucer has made use of Scriptural imagery 'to illuminate quite precisely the nature' of the Pardoner and 'the "moralite" of his sermon', such being in Miller's opinion a subject not usually pursued in scholarly criticism In discussing the Pardoner's eunuchry Miller distinguishes, following scriptural and patristic example, three types of eunuch natural, and spiritual which is divided into two, *eunuchus Dei*, who cuts himself off from evil deeds, and *eunuchus non Dei*, who cuts himself off from good and is fruitful in evil works, and this last is

the type found in Chaucer's Pardoner He it is who, a 'perverted, or perverse, churchman', has not cut himself off from *vetus homo*, but glories rather in his sin, and upon this basis Chaucer develops his character, with his desire for the multiplication of earthly goods, while sterile in spiritual multiplication

Miller then turns to the *Tale*, more particularly to the *exemplum*, which he examines in the light of his remarks about the Pardoner, and he proves the close connexion between tale and teller Death is of significance in the *Tale*, death both physical and spiritual, it is the literal result of each aspect of *cupiditas* (the Pardoner's own driving force) in the story, but spiritual death is found by following the advice of the old man (= *vetus homo*) and rejecting that of the lad (= *novus homo*) Miller finally shows how he thinks the Pardoner and his *Tale* fit into the scheme of the Pilgrimage

Theodore A Stroud summarizes an example, found in *The American Magazine*, of *Chaucer's 'Shipman's Tale' in Modern Dress* (*College English*), and shows that the two versions are similar though not strictly parallel

The three tales, those of the Parson, the Second Nun, and the Prioress, all sound 'the same note of world rejection, suffering and self-sacrifice in the interest of the eternal' asserts J C Wenk writing *On the Sources of 'The Prioress's Tale'* (*Mediaeval Studies*), but in his opinion the third tale has not been fully understood In all three cases the imagery is derived from sources associated with the Church Taking the note to l 627 in Robinson's edition (p 841) as the starting-point, Wenk shows how much of the imagery of the tale has connexions with the liturgy for the Feast of the Holy Innocents, and suggests that it was this liturgy that first inspired Chaucer to use this particular tale In his final paragraphs Wenk deals with the death of the *clergeoun*, interpreting the *greyn* as a symbol of the 'worthlessness of earthly existence as compared to eternal existence with God'

When he stated in *The Unity of Chaucer's Manciple Fragment* (*MLN*) that generally if any attention at all has been directed to this piece, only the *Prologue* has been praised, Morton Donner could not have read recent articles (see *YW* xxxiv 63 and xxxv 63) He points out two means whereby the *Prologue* and *Tale* are linked in accepted Chaucerian manner, viz the Manciple's apology for his crude speech (205 ff), which recalls the Host's excusing the Cook from telling a tale in case he offended the company by his language when drunk, and the illustration in the *Tale* of the theme suggested in the *Prologue* by the Manciple's dealings with the Cook that one should not be 'too outspoken in castigating another's faults'

3 *'Troilus and Criseyde'*

Adriaan J Barnouw's translation into Dutch, *Troilus en Criseyde*,[8] is prefaced by a brief introduction dealing with the development of the Troilus story and Chaucer's adaptation of it, particularly the version he found in Boccaccio, together with a brief mention of its later fate, and some remarks on the practice of courtly love Barnouw also explains his reasons for translating the work not only into verse, but even into the same rhyming metre as Chaucer used Obviously such limitations have produced difficulties, and it has not always been possible to give close renderings, but the success of the translation may be judged by R W Zandvoort's review

[8] *Troilus en Criseyde*, trans Adriaan J Barnouw Haarlem H D Tjeenk Willink & Zoon pp xvi+304 12 50 guilders

(*ES* xxxvii [1956], 192–3) The five pages of notes are concerned mainly with explanations of the significance of some of the references

Eugene E Slaughter's article, 'Love and Grace in Chaucer's *Troilus*' (in *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry*), is concerned with the operation of grace in the Christian religion (a long account of this is given, drawn from St Thomas Aquinas) and in the religion of Love It is through sanctifying grace that Troilus is converted to the religion of Love, and by grace is Criseyde also 'converted' to love Troilus, in contrast to her loving of Diomede, which is determined by practical considerations Mingled with the Christian conception of grace and merit is the feudal notion of reward—reward which is the favour of Love and the lady This imitation of grace and 'its associated notions contributes much to the extenuation of earthly love in *Troilus*', and, in Slaughter's opinion, the prologue is the best approach to the poem for it is there that 'Chaucer presents earthly love as though it were reconciled to God'

After a brief examination of the characters of Troilus and Criseyde, John V Hagopian, in *Chaucer as a Psychologist in 'Troilus and Criseyde'* (*Literature and Psychology*), explains the way in which he thinks such characters make credible the scene in which the decision is taken for Criseyde to go to the Grecian camp He regards Criseyde as a 'mature, sophisticated, strong-willed, skeptical young woman, motivated by a strong concern for her own well-being and security', able to dominate Troilus whose weak will cannot be excused by the code of courtly love, and who may have been 'the victim of an Oedipal tie to his mother'

Howard R Patch, writing *Two Notes on Chaucer's 'Troilus'* (*MLN*), finds possible sources in *Il Filostrato* for two passages in *Troilus and Criseyde* (II 1735–6 and V 638–41) which have been the subject of previous comment

In all but two manuscripts of *Troilus and Criseyde* there occurs a summary of the *Thebaid* in twelve Latin hexameters which is found with Cassandra's summary of the last eleven books in Chaucer's version F P Magoun, Jr, in *Chaucer's Summary of Statius' Thebaid II–XII* (*Traditio*), provides the Latin text and also a series of eleven 12-line arguments which cover the last eleven books After listing in what respects Chaucer's version agrees with the two Latin versions, Magoun is of the opinion that Chaucer used the short version more for the later books, the longer for the earlier, and he also notes that the details of Books VIII and X suggest that here Chaucer drew directly on Statius's poem

Tauno F Mustanoja uses his conclusion reached in *Middle English 'Wery of Wandred'* (see Chapter III) to support his claim made in a later article, *'Troilus and Criseyde', IV, 607* (*NM*), that *of fered* (*TC* IV 607) represents a preposition plus a past participle, meaning 'because of being frightened', and not a past participle in which *of* is merely the verbal prefix

4 *Other Works*

Macdonald Emslie's article, *Codes of Love and Class Distinctions* (*EC*), serves as a starting-point for a discussion in 'The Critical Forum' In it he maintains that the *Parlement of Foules* shows primarily how, although its artificial world sometimes overlaps the 'natural' world, the practice of courtly love is bound up with class distinction, this aspect is emphasized particularly in the debate where it is deemed appropriate only for the eagles, though some of the lower birds are not without an appreciation of its tenets.

Emslie contends that Nature allows the practice of courtly love only with reluctance, but Chaucer, by leaving the formel undecided, remains uncommitted

In *Natural Love in 'The Parlement of Foules'* Cecily Clark questions Emslie's interpretation of ll 407–10, that 'the female has no right to refuse her lover', the two major charges that D S Brewer levels against Emslie are that he has misinterpreted Nature's attitude to the love-affair of the courtly eagles, and that he entertains a mistaken conception of courtly love in Chaucer's poetry, particularly where he would distinguish it as giving the initiative and choice in love to the lady, as opposed to 'natural' love where the male is master Emslie makes reply to the criticisms, but the viewpoints diverge so much that resolution seems unlikely

In the main outlines of his study, *An Interpretation of Chaucer's 'Parlement of Foules'* (*S*), Charles O McDonald does not profess to be following a new line, but he maintains that one's judgement of the unity and value of the poem may be affected by an examination of details, and in his case this is concerned with the love theme the development of which he traces through the poem The changes Chaucer has made in adapting the scene in the garden from Boccaccio's *Teseida* are all directed towards pointing the contrast between 'love according to Nature, which promises ever-green joy, and love of a more courtly kind which leads to barren sorrow and despair' Though elements of the French *demande d'amours* are present with the tercels, the claims are shattered by the 'plain practical realism' of the lesser breeds, and McDonald sees in the solution proposed by the formel an irrelevance more irrelevant than the debate which it crowns Nature is the predominantly unifying element that holds together the two parts of the poem—the description of the garden and the debate—and her depth of character, McDonald asserts, has made the rest of the poem acceptable throughout the ages

Unless we attempt to read the *Parlement of Foules* through the eyes of the medieval audience for whom it was written, we are unlikely to appreciate its real significance Such is the opinion of Dorothy Bethurum in 'The Center of the *Parlement of Foules*' (in *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry*) One must realize that the poets of the Middle Ages took love seriously The Garden of Love is the very centre of the poem—its geographical and also its psychological setting—a garden peopled by the attributes of the experience of love, and it is in the imagination of the reader that the people must be made to move Against this background is held the debate in which the elaborate human conventions are ascribed to the birds whose demands would by nature be straightforward

David Ruffin notes the reminiscences of the earlier poem in the later in his 'Browning's *Childe Roland* and Chaucer's *House of Fame*' (in *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry*)

In *Gerard Legh, Herald* (*NQ*) R J Schoeck attempts to determine the validity of the testimony of Legh concerning Chaucer and the Inner Temple (see *YW* xxxv 65) H Stanford London follows this point up later in *NQ*

Donald C Baker puts forward in *The Dreamer again in 'The Book of the Duchess'* (*PMLA*) an explanation for the apparent inconsistency in the *Book of the Duchess* when the Dreamer, who has overheard the Black Knight speak of his loss, apparently later knows nothing of it He suggests that the Knight's 'high style' has confused the Dreamer, and he is

so carried away by the beauty of the lady and by the wonderful love, that the fact of her death is eclipsed for him

The edition of *The Equatorie of the Planetis*[9] by Derek J Price, with a linguistic analysis by R M. Wilson, has been awaited with great eagerness by Chaucer students, nor will they find in it occasion for disappointment They will turn most readily to two chapters, one dealing with the language of the manuscript, and the other with the ascription to Chaucer, since for the layman some of the scientific material (the Astronomical Tables, Ptolemaic Planetary System, and History of the Planetary Equatorium) will naturally prove difficult Wilson has been responsible for the Linguistic Analysis, Glossary, and the section on Punctuation, and Price for the remainder, apart from the translation of the text, which is a product of collaboration

Every page of the manuscript containing the English text is reproduced in facsimile, with a transcription on the facing page, together with a selection from the Tables and other items of importance This is followed by an annotated translation which is not literal, but rendered in a form more intelligible to the layman The Tables themselves are dealt with briefly, but the more important 'notes, comments and fragments of texts' found in them receive greater attention since they may represent original work The History of the Planetary Equatorium describes instruments made both previous to and later than Chaucer, and thus the one described in the *Equatorie* can be set in its place

In the Linguistic Analysis Wilson gives a detailed account of vocabulary, phonology, and accidence, and, summarizing the evidence, suggests that the consistency of language and spelling, as well as the appearance of the manuscript with its numerous erasures, underlinings, &c , indicates that the manuscript 'is in fact most probably a holograph'. He next compares the language with that of the best manuscripts of the *Canterbury Tales* and also, more significantly, with that of the *Astrolabe* His conclusion is that there is nothing in language or style definitely against Chaucer's authorship, and on the contrary there are certain facts which, taken together, 'offer some support to such a theory' Price is equally cautious in his conclusion in the chapter on the ascription to Chaucer He holds that the whole text and the first set of Tables, with the corrections, is the work of one writer, who is unlikely to have been a scribe, and he finds nothing to show that the text was used between 1400 and 1461, by which date the Tables would have been out of date Simon Bredon, to whom the work was ascribed in a fly-leaf note of *c* 1600, was not the author, though a connexion with some unknown work of his cannot be ruled out, but there are indications of a connexion with the *Astrolabe* The 'radix chaucer' note (f 5^{v}) would seem to imply the ascription of the *Equatorie* to that writer The handwriting, particularly of 'chaucer' (the only common word), is compared with that of a document, no L 56 in file E 207/6/2 amongst the Exchequer (K R) Bills in the Public Records Office, which may have been written by Chaucer himself By means of a slip of transparent paper stuck on the page, the *Equatorie* 'chaucer' is superimposed on that of the Public Records Office document to show the resemblance Although this cannot be taken as conclusive evidence, it is of considerable importance The section ends with remarks

[9] *The Equatorie of the Planetis*, ed Derek J Price, with a linguistic analysis by R M Wilson C U P pp xvi+214 52*s* 6*d*

on the suggested parent-text of the *Equatorie*

This edition supplies the facts plus certain observations which indicate the direction of the evidence The editors have engaged in a searching examination, but have been rightly cautious in their conclusions As it is pointed out (p 149), the issue may be radically affected in the future by further discoveries or by the solving of problems, such as that of how the manuscript came to Peterhouse, but as the matter now stands, though it would not be right to state conclusively that Chaucer was the author, yet the cumulative effect of the evidence is such that a different conclusion is hard to visualize

[Reviews Curt A Zimansky, *MLN* lxxi (1956), 70–76

Robert W Ackerman, *PQ* xxxv (1956), 220–3]

VII. THE RENAISSANCE

By R GEORGE THOMAS

THE emphasis of works published this year has fallen on 'background' studies Scholars seem as disinclined as ever to define the term 'renaissance' for general consumption there are still many agnostics, but most writers included in this survey adopt the term for its convenience while reserving the right of defining the limits of its operation in time and place Fortunately, confusion in the use of terms has not hampered the study of the change in ideas which gradually spread across Europe between 1400 and 1600 nor has it interrupted a reassessment of Tudor England from three contrasting points of view In these two specifically non-literary fields must lie the interest of Renaissance studies for 1955

1 *General Studies*

The Renaissance Philosophy of Man[1] illustrates the benefits of academic lease-lend whereby English students gain from the adventurousness of American academic publishing This reprinted volume regards the Renaissance as extending from the middle of the fourteenth century to the end of the sixteenth and seeks to show that the culmination of medieval philosophy in Thomas Aquinas was not followed by 'a period of complete decay and disintegration' It deals exclusively with the Italian Renaissance—the vitality of contemporary Italian scholarship covering this period is frequently stressed this year—in its three chief manifestations of Humanism, Platonism, and Aristotelianism Selected texts, translated with excellent introductions, are printed from the works of Francesco Petrarca, Lorenzo Valla (*Dialogue on Free Will*), Marsilio Ficino (*Five Questions Concerning the Mind*), Giovanni Pico (*On the Dignity of Man*), and Pietro Pomponazzi, together with a brief essay (*Fabula de homine*) by the Spanish humanist Juan Luis Vives Almost two-thirds of the book is shared between Petrarca (principally, *On his own ignorance and that of others*) and Pomponazzi (*On Immortality*) These two sections together should make the English student more conscious of the contemporary reassessment of the part played by Aristotelianism in the Italian Renaissance and of the solvent of Platonic ideas acting upon the entrenched academic position of Averroes For the present writer the whole volume abounds with seminal ideas which demand fresh study and seem to illuminate at many points the thinking of Chaucer and Spenser In particular it shows how rational processes and firm faith can come together despite apparent contradictions—a very necessary aid for any modern student's understanding of the late-maturing Renaissance influence on English thought and literature Three major themes link the independent texts assembled here a contempt for medieval philosophy and science which is paralleled by an emphasis on ancient literature and thought, an overriding concern with the conception of immortality, and a recognition of the nature of man and human dignity which, admittedly, produced a powerful late sixteenth-century reaction These selections seem to substantiate the claim of the

[1] *The Renaissance Philosophy of Man*, ed Ernst Cassirer, Paul Oskar Kristeller, and John Herman Randall, Jr Chicago U P and C U P pp viii+405 37*s* 6*d*

general editors that by their own ideas these five thinkers made a significant contribution to Western literature and philosophy the bibliography and, above all, the generous sprinkle of notes give the would-be specialist ample means of assessing their influence for himself

Our understanding of the all-pervasive effect of classical studies on English writers has been clarified and deepened by *Classical Myth and Legend in Renaissance Dictionaries*[2] Starnes and Talbert, who have made a study of such works with an eye for the classical erudition of Spenser, Shakespeare, Jonson, T Heywood, and Milton, show how 'extensively ancient mythology, biography, and legend were epitomized in Renaissance reference books, especially in Latin proper-name dictionaries and in Latin-English dictionaries' Modestly presented, their thorough performance makes it much easier to glimpse the shared knowledge of Elizabethan readers and authors and fills in our knowledge of Tudor educational methods The appendix (on *The Fates*) is a kind of 'rider' showing how the 'theorem', which is the book proper, can be applied to a particular theme occurring in many authors The lion's share of the study is properly given to Milton, but minor writers like Pettie, Gascoigne, John Grange, are not neglected For once the claim of the blurb—'an indispensable tool'—is justified

Now this overt Renaissance concern with the rediscovery of the Western past was pre-eminently a literary one and because of this restriction of interest George Sarton[3] takes it to task 'The main peculiarity of the Renaissance was its negative orientation, its creative activities concerned the past' His book presents three lectures on *Medicine, Natural History,* and *Mathematics and Astronomy* The method adopted is to present a series of themes under the guise of studying important authors from antiquity and the Middle Ages and to show how sources for their study and knowledge of their significant works became available and were utilized in the selected period Bolstered as they are by detailed and frequently lively notes, the first impression made by the separate lectures is one of bewilderment However, the threads are firmly held together, specially selected topics receive ample treatment, and a typical Renaissance figure like Conrad Gesner is so handled that his career throws light on the whole period and on the book's main thesis This latter is reserved specifically for the *Epilogue* where Sarton develops his theme that modern humanists fail to perceive that Renaissance concentration of attention on Greece and Rome, 'a pretty small part of the world', was narrowing and lopsided and that compared, say, with the Oriental renaissance of the eighteenth century the 'Renaissance was a period of isolation'

In part, this contention is supported by Miss C Doris Hellman who contributes a first survey of Renaissance Science to *RN*[4] Derived from a speech delivered in 1953, it defines the period as roughly 1450–1600, asserts that 'the transition in science *was* there' with an 'emphasis on the questioning of authority and ultimately on experiment', and maintains that, since the Humanists had little respect for Science, 'early Renaissance science owes much to the empirical know-

[2] *Classical Myth and Legend in Renaissance Dictionaries*, by DeWitt T Starnes and Ernest William Talbert N Carolina U P and O U P pp x+517 $7 50 60*s*

[3] *The Appreciation of Ancient and Medieval Science During the Renaissance (1450–1600)*, by George Sarton Pennsylvania U P and O U P pp xviii+234 40*s*

[4] *Science in the Renaissance A Survey*

ledge of craftsmen' Miss Hellman deals boldly and briefly with a large number of well-known names and is particularly informative on chemistry, botany, and anatomy Yet the necessary 'survey approach' adopted by both these historians of science suggests that this field of study needs wider cultivation if we are to understand aright our contemporary confused and divided approach to this cardinal period in the development of modern Western thought

This confusion of approach to the idea of a Renaissance is the subject of a judicial summing up by Herbert Weisinger in *The Attack on the Renaissance in Theology Today* (*Studies in the Renaissance II*) [5] He discusses the startlingly unanimous attack by all the major Western faiths because they seem to attribute the crisis of faith today to the Renaissance His wise suggestion that we should continue to expose errors of fact in the wilder assertions of the controversialists, even if, like some of its defenders, we cannot exhibit convincingly that the Renaissance also demonstrates Christian virtues in action, leads on to the conclusion that at least 'the Renaissance' should be accepted without bias or rancour as an historical phenomenon

The English reader, particularly the student of Marlowe, tends to regard Machiavelli as an exemplifier of typical Renaissance political thought Now Garrett Mattingly, already a skilled interpreter of sixteenth-century England and Europe, handles[6] a mass of detail with justice and clarity in order to give us a necessary understanding of the evolution of European diplomacy from its origins in the difficulties imposed upon Italian states after the struggle between the two heads of Christendom had cleared the way for the experiment of the first omnicompetent amoral sovereign states His overt interest is in ambassadorial procedure, in the duties of a resident ambassador, in the conception of the *Perfect Ambassador*, in Embassy routine, and finally in the growth of the concept of 'Law Among Nations' This rather specialized subject unexpectedly reopens all the fascinating questions which surround the conception of 'the Renaissance' the effect on politics of the declining Christian consciousness of being Roman, the widespread influence on Europe of ambassadors trained in Italy and Italian methods, the tardy adoption in England of these new procedures, the attraction of the ill-rewarded Ambassador's 'game of policy making' for men of outstanding integrity and literary ability Even the discussion of the doctrine of diplomatic immunity—influenced perhaps by the establishment of embassy chapels (*cuius regio eius religio*)—illuminates this writer's skill in using detailed information to illustrate larger issues Against this vast canvas the teachings of Machiavelli are sharply and intelligibly focused this 'embittered pamphlet [*The Prince*] of a solitary man of genius' has been too widely accepted as a picture of a society which had lost its sense of the moral foundation of political action without realizing that although the Italians were the first Europeans to invent truly temporal states they knew, too, that 'all temporal power is only temporary power'.

A similar evolutionary approach to Renaissance political thinking is adopted by W T Jones [7] The relevant sec-

[5] *Studies in the Renaissance* Vol II, ed M A Shaaber (The Renaissance Society of America) New York, 1955

[6] *Renaissance Diplomacy*, by Garrett Mattingly London Cape pp 323 25*s*

[7] *Masters of Political Thought*, ed Edward McChesney Sait, Vol II *Machiavelli to Bentham*, by W T Jones London Harrap pp 388 15*s*

tions of his book, those which deal with Machiavelli, Jean Bodin, and Thomas Hobbes, contrive to mingle selections from their works with interpretative comment in order to show that more than anything else the writings of all three reflect their 'sensitivity to the economic and social changes consequent upon the emergence of the national territorial state' Perhaps these writers saw too simply the necessity for supreme, absolutely powerful rulers but they were not blind to the problems involved once the cocoon of medieval unified thinking had been abandoned Their attempt to effect a reconciliation between the existence of a natural and a moral order, both governing human society, has a poignant relevance, so Jones believes, for our own day In particular, the chapter on Hobbes emerges as at once a negative lesson for modern political theory and an exemplification of one strand inherent in Renaissance thought from its beginning, the deep interest in man as a creature of dignity explicable in terms of the natural order alone

A reprint of Herbert Butterfield's scarce book[8] on Machiavelli is therefore doubly welcome this year The first three sections of this fifteen-year-old book (*The Foundations, Machiavelli and the Renaissance, The Machiavellism of Machiavelli*) have still much to contribute to the contemporary discussion Easily and freshly he asserts that men of the Renaissance believed in a closed culture and that when Machiavelli appears to be drawing examples inductively from the contemporary world he is merely making deductions from classical ideals about human nature Then, more boldly, the Master of Peterhouse develops his theme that the doctrinaire author of *The Prince* was 'a student, a writer defective in his contacts with the actual world' On the whole this is a stimulating book which forces the reader to think again about Machiavellism and to see many so-called Renaissance doctrines through classical ideas[9]

2 *Historical Studies*

No common reader of Shakespeare's *Richard III* is unaware of the shadow of Machiavellism, loosely defined, hovering around his crooked form and bloody career For this effective dramatic apotheosis of one Tudor myth has coloured the general reader's knowledge of the last war of the Roses And has not the powerful advocacy of Thomas More preceded and confirmed the veracity of Shakespeare's portrait? Murray Kendall's ample study[10] of Richard and the myth clarifies the whole problem by presenting us with a full-scale biography which ignores unreliable Tudor tradition and relies on 'source material contemporary with Richard's day', including Dominic Mancini's *Usurpation of Richard III* The literary student should first turn to the appendixes on *Who Killed the Princes?* and *Richard's Reputation*, but the whole book can be read as a companion piece to fifteenth-century English literature There is a golden assessment of Edward IV's early achievement and much incidental description of early English Renaissance figures like Anthony Woodville and John Tiptoft The Paston Letters and the Howard Papers are used to good effect and, despite the author's tendency to rely too boldly on clear-cut psychological principles, the ultimate picture of the man and his age is credibly and excitingly drawn This biography has

[8] *The Statecraft of Machiavelli*, by H Butterfield London Bell pp 167 8*s* 6*d*

[9] Cf the reviews listed at the end of this chapter

[10] *Richard the Third*, by Paul Murray Kendall London Allen & Unwin pp 514 30*s*

a sustained zest which carries over into the epilogue where Kendall links the reputation of Henry VII with nineteenth-century love of commercial, material success and twentieth-century respect for shrewd company managers

Three English professional historians of distinction have also contributed full-scale studies of the Tudor age James A Williamson has written a clearly unfolding chronological history[11] (from 1485 to 1603) whose particular interest and sparkle is reserved for his account of the maritime expansion of Tudor England The easily flowing narrative style has a deceptive ease and the book abounds in, indeed relies on, good pen portraits of the principal actors, royal and otherwise, he is perhaps unfair to Cranmer and too forthright on Mary Queen of Scots The present writer is grateful for Chapters I ('England in 1485'), VIII ('One Body Politic'), and XIX ('The Closing Years') Nearly half the volume is devoted to Elizabeth and the social commentary is woven into the narrative with much skill, but of purely literary history there is none For this work, as the 'Notes on Books' shows, is primarily a political and economic history

A L Rowse claims (p 398) that his book[12] 'can only proceed representatively' and herein lies its charm and usefulness The book has a triple source of strength First, the admirable use of quotations and of biographies to illustrate the main themes gives the reader a vivid continuing sense of reliable contemporary corroboration of the age he has come to know from Elizabethan writers themselves Secondly, the narrative of discovery and of the growth of land and sea power is used to interpret the momentum of national confidence, power, and sense of statehood from the early years of Elizabeth to the glorious climax of the eighties, and yet this elation is justly balanced by the presentation of evidence for the war-weariness of the last decade of her reign Thirdly, and almost incidentally, careful treatment of war, at sea, on the Continent, and in Ireland, gives new insight into the more normal literary-history book pictures of Spenser, Raleigh, Sidney, and Shakespeare Rowse emerges as a consistent champion of the Queen's policies in most things, a man who steadily refuses to be over-attracted by the magnetism and reputation of the great Elizabethans when their advice clashed with hers Moreover he is, by inference, a champion of the shape then given to the English nation and English society The wisdom as well as the detailed, seminal scholarship and grace of style of this book marks it out for special study by the literary student

Only a professional historian can do justice to G R Elton's original and closely packed study[13] of the emergence of self-conscious and highly competent government in Tudor times For so much of the book's finely spun argument is webbed around his own research into the character of Thomas Cromwell and the whole structure of government in England from Richard II to Henry VIII He demonstrates the emergence—consciously aided by Cromwell—of a national sovereign state into so much that is now readily accepted as part of the English tradition only because of the Tudor settle-

[11] *The Tudor Age*, by James A Williamson (*A History of England in Nine Volumes*) London Longmans pp xxiv+448 25*s*

[12] *The Expansion of Elizabethan England*, by A L Rowse London Macmillan pp xiv+450 30*s*

[13] *England under the Tudors*, by G R Elton (*A History of England in Eight Volumes*) London Methuen pp xii+504 25*s*

ment. Like his fellow-historians he dates the complete emergence of this national consciousness and the development of new ways of regarding English nationhood as phenomena which matured late in Elizabethan times To the present writer it seems as if he achieves, too, the almost impossible task of assessing the Divorce, its causes and consequences, with liberal impartiality The literary student will gain considerable stimulation from Chapters I ('The Tudor Problem'), V ('The King's Great Matter'), X ('The Elizabethan Settlement 1558–68'), and XIV and XV (on 'Conservatism' and 'Renaissance' as aspects of the 'Structure of the Age') Above all, Elton's nice sense of the differing generations and their changing sense of values will help considerably to clarify some of the darkness which still surrounds English literature in the sixteenth century [14]

A formidable footnote to these wide-sweeping surveys is added by William Croft Dickinson's edition of *John Knox's History of The Reformation in Scotland* [15] The editor sets out to steer between the Scylla of a thoroughly scholarly edition like Laing's and the Charybdis of more recent 'popular' editions by drawing on Laing's transcript and yet modernizing the spelling which latter practice, Dickinson maintains, accords well with Knox's English diction and style The introduction also gives a good, acceptable account of the 'Movement', the 'Man', and the 'Book' Its chief interest for us is the insight given at close quarters into one strand of English Tudor thinking, an interest which is enhanced by the appendixes, particularly the *Confession of Faith*, the *Form and Order of the Election of Superintendents, Elders and Deacons*, and the *Book of Discipline*. From these three much may be learned by inference about the development of the English Puritan temper The book ends with a short glossary

3 *Literature*

Pride of place must go to Maurice Evans's contribution to Hutchinson's University Library[16] of a well-written and neatly proportioned book which covers with ease some of the ground already tilled by C S Lewis By making a rigorous yet catholic selection of the sixteenth-century verse to be discussed—Shakespeare's poetry is excluded from this volume—the author leaves room for abundant quotation and yet fulfils the aim of this series—to be generally informative—without falling into the ugly trap of substituting a series of potted disconnected studies for a genuine attempt at writing a connected literary history Most useful are Chapters I ('Crosscurrents'), VI ('Shorter Forms of Elizabethan Poetry'), VIII ('Faerie Queene'), and IX ('Donne and the Elizabethans') Chapter VIII is a significant contribution to any modern reader's understanding of Spenser's epic, excelling in its discussion of the ethical nature of the poem as shown in its treatment of the passions related to sex His presentation of Donne as 'an Elizabethan who was undermining Elizabethan poetic conventions from within' is a consistently argued case for placing Donne once more into the contemporary context from which the critics of the 1920's so violently wrenched him Apart from its apposite use of significant quotations, skilfully whetting the novice's appetite for lesser-

[14] See reviews listed at the end of this chapter

[15] *John Knox's History of The Reformation in Scotland*, ed William Croft Dickinson London Nelson 2 vols pp cix+ 374 84*s*

[16] *English Poetry In The Sixteenth Century*, by Maurice Evans (*University Library Series*) London Hutchinson pp 184 8*s* 6*d*

known Elizabethan poetry, Evans's book displays qualities excellent in any introductory survey it devotes sufficient space to an adequate discussion of basic background ideas, it constantly relates the poets and their poetry to the society which produced them, and, finally, it does not relegate discussion of changes in poetic theory and practice to the margins but lets them assume the importance they had for sixteenth-century writers In other words, except on one topic, Evans does not confuse the needs of the research student with those of the general reader Throughout the book, however, various asides on satiric methods and achievement add up to a special thesis on early satire which is capable of profitable expansion

Wylie Sypher's book,[17] in a popular American series, is much more ambitious in aim, method, and scope Beginning with an idea from Kant's *Critique of Judgement* he looks for 'analogies of form' within the various arts of the Renaissance without insisting that the sequence of four styles termed 'renaissance', 'mannerist', 'baroque', and 'late baroque' can be rigidly applied everywhere in Europe Within the terms of reference of this chapter, Sypher's discussion of 'mannerism' has the most valuable contribution to make to literary thinking he believes that the constant revision by art critics of the meaning and implications of the mannerist style offers us another chance of assessing the so-called 'dissociations' of metaphysical poetry and Jacobean drama The weakness of this whole stimulating book, inherent in any attempt to deal with four arts at once, is the tendency to resort to a jig-saw method of presentation There is, for instance, a valuable separate study of Donne's life and poetry scattered throughout the whole discussion of 'mannerism' And what can the purely literary student make of the statements that follow 'Spenser and Botticelli have the same virginal and studied grace, the same cursive energy', 'the logic of renaissance techniques caused these transformations, through which there was always an escape from the algebra of the *costruzione legittima*'? The present writer must not 'hint a fault' ungraciously, though, in a refreshing study which may well suggest to our many dormant literary historians a better way of interpreting sixteenth-century literature than the mere reliance on the standard picture of a dark firmament lit up by infrequent explosions of supernova

Any such historian will be grateful to William Nelson's edition[18] of Barclay's *Life of St George* because it shows in action the process of popularizing 'the fruits of the "new learning"' for unlearned Englishmen This reprint of the unique copy of Pynson's edition of the *Life* contains the Latin text of Mantuan's *Georgius* of which it is a translation The introduction indicates Barclay's 'heightening of the moral import of Mantuan's tale' and his obvious dislike for that humanist's addiction to 'vain fables' of pagan antiquity In an appendix Nelson prints Caxton's translation of the story of St George as it appeared in the *Legenda Aurea* two years before Barclay's *Life* was printed in 1515(?) The editor rightly makes no extravagant claims for the poem—'Few passages rise above the pedestrian level'—but he emphasizes the significance of Barclay's choice of a humanistic source for his poem in preference to

[17] *Four Stages of Renaissance Style*, by Wylie Sypher (*Anchor Books Original*) New York Doubleday pp viii+312 $1 25

[18] *The Life of St George by Alexander Barclay*, ed William Nelson (E E T S, Original Series, No 230), 1955 (for 1948) pp xxvi+120 28*s*

any medieval life of the patron saint Probably lack of space, or familiarity with the period, prevented him from expanding the importance of St George's speech on 'order in the Commonwealth'—not found in the Latin text—as a key to much sixteenth-century thinking, for Barclay's low-pitched aim and thoroughly ordinary mind make him doubly representative of his day

The value of an adequate knowledge of accepted Renaissance thinking as an aid to the true assessment of a text is neatly demonstrated by Joseph T McCullen in *Dr Faustus and Renaissance Learning* (*MLR*) He questions the validity of treating Marlowe as a subjective dramatist, bases Faustus's tragedy on his limited and defective knowledge, due mainly to the sin of sloth, the 'source of his defective knowledge and his despair' He concludes a closely reasoned argument with the opinion 'that it is as reasonable to consider *Doctor Faustus* a moral play as to conclude that it is largely a drama of revolt' The strength of his case lies in its documented appeal to the contemporary knowledge of the play's first spectators

In similar fashion Arthur B Ferguson stresses (*Studies in the Renaissance II*)[19] the preoccupation of the author (?) of *Mum and the Sothsegger* with the general problem of truth-telling in public life and suggests that historians should welcome the poem as a useful and refreshingly original guide to the part played by men of letters and preachers in supplying extra-parliamentary informed counsel during the reign of Henry IV Although Ferguson tends to drag important issues into the conclusion of his well-documented argument, he certainly makes it possible to understand writers like Gower and Langland against a credible and contemporary literary-social background

In *Philosophy of Life and Prose Style in Thomas More's 'Richard III' and Francis Bacon's 'Henry VIII'* (*PMLA*) Sister Mary Faith Schuster subjects both writers to a rigorous analysis Her thesis, that there is a 'positive relationship between style and "philosophy of life"', suggests a closed system of thinking, but it is argued with considerable dexterity and an admirable use of quotation After much patient demonstration she shows that each author reveals a threefold sense of decorum appropriateness to subject-matter, to his own view of life, and to his beliefs concerning the proper style for teaching their views She believes that More is followed by Dr Johnson and Newman, Bacon by Donne and Browne Although the present writer finds himself in disagreement with many of her critical interpretations—for instance, insufficient allowance is made for the shared advocate's method of both writers—the method of approach here adopted could be profitably extended

Another approach is suggested by Thomas Wheeler in *Sir Francis Bacon's Concept of the Historian's Task* (*Renaissance Papers*) with its conclusion that his *Henry VII* 'presents a historical account noteworthy for its artistic use of imagination and reason' And in the same volume of studies, Linton C Stevens's study of *Humanistic Education and the Hierarchy of Values in the Renaissance* makes it quite clear that no final assessment of Tudor historians is complete until due weight is accorded to the excessive Renaissance claims for the mysterious ennobling powers attributed to the study of rhetoric 'There is a belief in the educative power of language *per se*, a belief in the possibility of a renewal of life through the rejuvenescence of lan-

[19] See note 5

guage, a belief that the restoration of the original purity and nobility to language can purify and ennoble the character of man ' A third noteworthy article in this volume of papers is *The Teachings of Classical Puritanism on Conjugal Love* by Ronald Mushat Frye The present writer finds it impossible to do justice by summary to the importance of this paper for the student of Spenser and Milton except to quote its conclusion that 'classical Puritan teachings treated physical love as good and pure in itself, no matter how ardent it might be, while repudiating lust, with lust defined as immoderate, unstable affection and as degrading idolatry' It is as well to be reminded—a reminder no medievalist needs—that the education of England in a more liberal view of married love in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries was due in a large part to the work of that party within English Protestantism which is called Puritan

The 'New Learning' A Semantic Note by Allan G Chester (*Studies in the Renaissance II*)[20] politely shows that R W Chambers's attempt in his *Thomas More* to set the record straight by suggesting that '*new learning* first meant revival of Greek learning and later came to mean also the doctrines of the Protestant Reformation' seems to be 'an ingenious piece of fiction' Chester says there is not a single use of the term for the revival of classical learning and that the earliest evidence for its use, in the late 1520's and 1530's, always relates to Lutheranism No distinctive *English* term was used for the Latin *litterae humaniores* or *litterae bonae*, and although Dr Johnson used 'New Learning' in this sense in 1761 his example was not followed the now general usage by literary scholars is attributed by Chester to Seebohm's *The Oxford Reformers* (1867) and J R Green's *Short History* (1874)

4 *Miscellaneous*

Iconography on the Nature and Inspiration of Poetry in Renaissance Emblem Literature (*PMLA*) by Robert J Clements deals with the symbols and attributes with which Renaissance thought clothed poetry and poets and also discusses how the 'emblemata' treated symbols of inspiration Clements finds in the *Emblemata* (Amsterdam 1618) of Florentius Schoonhovius a splendid enunciation of the canons of seventeenth-century neoclassicism and concludes that, despite the symbols used in such works, the passages which accompanied the images 'show a cautious realization that genius is generally the joint product of art and nature' This is a useful negative conclusion for students interested in dating the rise of the idea of original genius (see Chapter X)

Three contributions from *NQ* fall within this chapter D S Brewer seeks to show, in *Lucretius and Bacon on Death*, that a famous Baconian sentence is derived from *De Rerum Natura*, A J Bliss contributes *Notes on 'The King of Tars'* (II 550–5 and 1117–22) (see Chapter V), and Henry J Webb provides material for a closer understanding of recruiting theory and practice by his factual article on *Classical Histories and Elizabethan Soldiers*

Diamante III is devoted to a short study of *Sir Thomas More in New Spain* by Silvio Zavala who seeks to uncover 'a network of links between the thought of the European Renaissance and Spanish colonial endeavour in the New World' by concentrating on the influence of *Utopia* on the ordinances of Don Vasco de Quiroga in Mexico

Attention must be drawn to the following reviews in *RN* Douglas Bush

[20] See note 5

on *The Classical Heritage and its Beneficiaries* by R R Bolgar (p 14), Leicester Bradner on *English Literature in the Sixteenth Century, excluding Drama* by C S Lewis (p 19), E Harris Harbison on *The Reformation Era 1500–1650* by Harold J Grimm (p 27), Myron P Gilmore on *History of Humanism* by G Toffanin (translated by Elio Gianturco) (p 140), Alfred Harbage on *Rasser of Alsace* by L A Triebel (p 154), Vincenzo Cioffari on *Humanistic and Political Literature in Florence and Venice at the beginning of the Quattrocento* by Hans Baron (p 203), Beatrice K Ingalls on *George Sandys, Poet-Adventurer* by Richard Beale David (p 206), Serge Hughes on *Medioevo e Rinascimento* by Eugenio Garin (p 211)

The curious reader will look at William Myer's essay on *Syphilis and the Poetic Imagination Jean Lemaire and Girolamo Fracastoro* (*Renaissance Papers*), the recondite researcher will need to read Karl H Dannenfeldt on *The Renaissance Humanists and the Knowledge of Arabic* (*Studies in the Renaissance II*), while the solver of biographical puzzles will thank R J Schoeck for his note (*MLR*) on *'Nosce Teipsum' and the two John Davies*

VIII. SHAKESPEARE

By T S DORSCH

1 *Editions*

FIRST place must be given to the New Variorum *Richard II*,[1] edited by Matthew W Black This is a worthy newcomer to the series, and will receive a warm welcome from Shakespearian scholars The only serious reservation likely to be made will concern the choice of copy-text Black has elected to print the text of the Folio on the grounds that it includes the deposition scene, which is omitted from the first three Quartos While he agrees with the generally accepted view that Quarto 1 is a good text, probably set up from Shakespeare's foul papers, he disregards the case that might have been made for using it as his basic text However, having decided for the Folio, he has been very thorough in his collation of the Quartos and edited texts, though it could have been wished that he had found more room for discussion of variant readings He is to be applauded for his innovation in marking the first lines of Folio columns and Quarto 1 pages Since he has been pressed for space, he has in his annotations wisely concentrated on the elucidation of meaning, his linguistic glosses are full and helpful Apart from some sketchiness in his treatment of the early texts, the appendixes are first-rate On such topics as the date of composition and the dramatic time he is clear, concise, and balanced, he has been generous with his extracts from the multiple sources of the play, and his passages from works of criticism are judiciously chosen

The Histories in the text of Peter Alexander's *Tudor Shakespeare* are now published in a separate volume[2] The text has been corrected in some places, particularly in *Richard III*, because Alexander, as he explains, had occasionally in the original edition failed to give effect to the general principles that guided him in his treatment of the Quarto and Folio versions The volume contains Alexander's excellent introductory material to the Histories generally and individually, and a glossary The General Introduction to the complete works appeared last year in the volume of the Comedies (*YW* xxxv 80)

Three plays have been added to the revised Arden series John Russell Brown's *Merchant of Venice*[3] is an excellent edition Brown gives a very clear exposition of what has so far been established, by himself and others, about the textual history of the play, he argues that the copy for Quarto 1, the substantive text, must have been a fair copy of foul papers, possibly made by Shakespeare himself *The Merchant of Venice* can be only approximately dated, a judicious summing-up of the evidence yields no more definite conclusion than that it was composed 'after 30 July 1596 and before 22 July 1598' Brown gives a sensible critical introduction, and his annotations are full and scholarly, some of the most interesting being those in which he discusses textual corruption or obscurity In his appen-

[1] *The Life and Death of King Richard the Second*, ed by Matthew W Black (New Variorum Shakespeare) Lippincott pp xxxi+655 $17 50 £7

[2] *Histories William Shakespeare*, ed by Peter Alexander Collins pp 704 7*s*

[3] *The Merchant of Venice*, ed by John Russell Brown (The Arden Shakespeare) Methuen and Harvard U P pp lviii+174 18*s* $3 25

dixes he provides a new translation of the story of Giannetto from *Il Pecorone*, and other possible sources are reprinted or epitomized

In his *Cymbeline*[4] J M Nosworthy follows the Folio text 'as closely as modern conventions will allow', even retaining the distinctive punctuation of the Folio except where it would be likely to mislead a modern reader His conservative treatment is justified by the general tidiness of the copy-text, to account for the satisfactory condition of this text, Nosworthy accepts a privately communicated suggestion from Dr Alice Walker that it was printed from 'a scribe's transcript of difficult foul papers which had preceded the prompt book' He discusses the possible sources in some detail, emphasizing the importance of two which he thinks have not received sufficient attention, the prose pamphlet *Frederyke of Jennen* (of which a welcome reprint appears as an appendix), and *The Rare Triumphs of Love and Fortune* Any attempt at dating *Cymbeline* 'must necessarily be approximate and impressionistic', and Nosworthy will venture nothing more precise than some date 'within the range 1606–11', with 1608 or 1609 as the most probable year Against the various theories of divided authorship he argues cogently that the play is Shakespearian in conception and execution The critical sections of the introduction and the annotations are sensible and businesslike

The new Arden *Julius Caesar*[5] has been prepared by T S Dorsch Believing that the compositors of the First Folio were here working from exceptionally tidy copy, Dorsch has presented an essentially conservative treatment of their text He suggests 1599 as the most probable year for the play's composition and first performance A section of the introduction discusses Shakespeare's sources and his treatment of them, including his indebtedness to the *Caius Julius Caesar* added to *A Mirror for Magistrates* in 1587, but discounting the alleged influence of the anonymous *Caesar's Revenge* Dorsch deals briefly but firmly with suggestions by Fleay, Robertson, and others that the play is not entirely Shakespeare's, quite properly emphasizing the testimony of Shakespeare's contemporaries on the subject and concluding with Chambers that 'these conflicting theories of the disintegrators may perhaps be left to cancel each other out' The introduction includes a detailed study of the characters of Caesar, Brutus, Cassius, and Antony, in which the first and last are defended against some of the unfavourable verdicts now almost traditionally passed upon them There is a useful section (kept, one notes with gratitude, within reasonable bounds) on the language and imagery of the play The appendixes include the appropriate passages from North's *Plutarch*, and the original German version of the extract from Thomas Platter's account of his visit to England in which he refers to his having seen a tragedy on the subject of Julius Caesar in September 1599 This is a sane and well-balanced edition [A B]

The publication of *Romeo and Juliet*[6] brings the New Cambridge Shakespeare to its twenty-ninth volume, and with 'the Psalmist's warning to septuagenarians' in mind, Dr Dover Wilson has for this play invited the collaboration of George Ian Duthie Duthie is responsible for the introduction, which deals concisely

[4] *Cymbeline*, ed by J M Nosworthy (The Arden Shakespeare) Methuen and Harvard U P pp lxxxiv+224 18*s* $3 85

[5] *Julius Caesar*, ed by T S Dorsch (The Arden Shakespeare) Methuen and Harvard U P pp lxxiv+166 15*s* $3 25

[6] *Romeo and Juliet* ed by John Dover Wilson and George Ian Duthie (The New Shakespeare) C U P pp liii+249 15*s*

and competently with sources and date of composition and provides some excellent criticism, and C B Young for a long and interesting stage history, Wilson and Duthie have worked together on the text, the note on the copy, the annotations, and the glossary, and where they have not been able to agree they have followed the sensible procedure of signing independent notes This edition is one of the most valuable of the series The annotations and glosses are very helpful with regard both to the meaning and the interpretation of words and passages The section most likely to provoke controversy is the note on the copy In the determination of the text of *Romeo and Juliet* the important question is the relationship of Quarto 2 to the 'bad' Quarto 1, in discussing this question the editors are unconvincing in their argument that Quarto 2 'was printed entirely from a copy of Q 1, corrected and added to by a scribe who had collated it with the MS' This and other controversial points are taken up in an authoritative review in *Sh Q* by Richard Hosley

Three further plays have been added to the revised edition of the *Yale Shakespeare* As in previous volumes in this series, glosses and notes, though adequate, are used as sparingly as possible, and problems relating to the text, the date, and the sources are discussed briefly in appendixes In his admirably conservative edition of *The Tempest*,[7] David Horne argues that the play was set from playhouse prompt copy, and rejects the view that Act I, as we have it, represents a cut version His discussion of the date of composition and the sources is clear and balanced, and he gives good grounds for not accepting the play as 'a conscious farewell to a career' The textual problems of *Henry V* are more complex R J Dorius[7] believes that the substantive Folio text was 'probably taken from a manuscript in Shakespeare's hand [his 'foul' papers], from a scribal copy of such a manuscript, or possibly from both' In a cautious survey of the evidence for and against a major revision of the play on Shakespeare's part, Dorius, while admitting that some revision may have taken place, points out that there is no clear indication that Falstaff originally figured in the comic scenes In his *Antony and Cleopatra*[7] Peter G Phialas dispenses with formal act and scene division on the reasonable enough grounds that it is 'scarcely admissible in a play where fluidity of scene and smoothness of action are of first importance' For convenience of reference, however, he supplies the traditional divisions at the top of the pages In the belief that Shakespeare was in this play 'concerned far more with rhythm and pause than with metrical consistency', he adheres more closely than is customary to the lineation of the Folio

To the *Penguin Shakespeare*, the editorial methods of which are now well known, G B Harrison has added *The Comedy of Errors*[8] and *All's Well that Ends Well* [8]

In its *Othello*[9] the Folio Society has once again produced a volume which it is a pleasure to open The text is that of M R Ridley's *New Temple Shakespeare*, and there is a short introduc-

[7] *The Tempest*, ed by David Horne pp viii+105 *The Life of Henry the Fifth*, ed by R J Dorius pp x+166 *The Tragedy of Antony and Cleopatra*, ed by Peter G Phialas pp xi+171 (The Yale Shakespeare) Yale U P and O U P Each vol $1 50 12*s*

[8] *The Comedy of Errors* pp 96 *All's Well that Ends Well* pp 139 Ed by G B Harrison (The Penguin Shakespeare) Penguin Books Each vol 2*s* 6*d*

[9] *Othello*, by William Shakespeare, with an Introduction by Ivor Brown and Designs by Tanya Moiseiwitsch The Folio Society pp 136 18*s*

tion by Ivor Brown and a series of very decorative designs by Tanya Moiseiwitsch

About a dozen different languages are represented in the many translations, whether of single plays or groups of plays, that are listed in the *Sh Q* Bibliography for 1955 (see note 25) This Bibliography also names some editions not noticed here

2 *Bibliographical and Textual Studies*

The most important bibliographical work on Shakespeare in 1955, and one of the most important that have appeared in recent years, is *The Shakespeare First Folio*,[10] by W W Greg Since it is fully noticed in Chapter XVII, it will be sufficient here to indicate its scope Greg modestly states that he is not putting forward original views, but is only marshalling the evidence on which the generally held theories about the production of the Folio are based, however, it should not be forgotten that much of this evidence has come out of his own researches The initiative for the publication of the Folio probably came from Shakespeare's fellow-players, and Greg discusses the reasons which may have prompted them to entrust the work to Jaggard, with whom their relations cannot always have been cordial In further sections he deals with such matters as the nature of Elizabethan copyright, the ownership of Shakespearian copies and editions before 1623, the editing of the Folio, and the various states in which the copy for individual plays could reach the printers There follows a careful consideration of the copy for each play in the canon, and the final chapter is devoted to the actual printing and proof-reading and the standard of accuracy attained.

[10] *The Shakespeare First Folio Its Bibliographical and Textual History*, by W W Greg O U P pp xvi+496 42*s* $6 75

In three lectures[11] delivered in 1954 as Rosenbach Fellow in Bibliography at the University of Pennsylvania, Fredson Bowers speaks about the 'biblio-textual' problems confronting the editor of an Elizabethan dramatic text The first step is to determine the nature of the copy from which the printer worked, and Bowers lists thirteen 'major classes' of copy from which plays may at times have been printed In the second lecture he shows, with numerous examples, what light may be thrown on the transmission of the text from the lost manuscript to the printed work by a study of Elizabethan printing processes, and in the third he outlines the principles on which a modern critical edition should be prepared He foresees that it will be many years before it will be possible to produce a text of Shakespeare 'that in the most minute detail is as close as mortal man can come to the original truth'. Bowers has himself done much to develop the critical and bibliographical techniques which may lead to such a text, and this new clarification of his methods will be found useful by all Elizabethan textual scholars

Leo Kirschbaum's *Shakespeare and the Stationers*,[12] like Greg's volume, which covers some of the same ground, is noticed in Chapter XVII, and may therefore be dismissed briefly here It is a thoroughgoing study of the 'stolen' Shakespeare Quartos, the work and methods of the Stationers' Company, the circumstances of surreptitious publication in Shakespeare's day, and the relations between Shakespeare's fellows and the stationers

Several articles in *SB* are relevant

[11] *On Editing Shakespeare and the Elizabethan Dramatists*, by Fredson Bowers Univ of Pennsylvania Library, for the Rosenbach Foundation pp vii+131 $3 50 21*s*

[12] *Shakespeare and the Stationers*, by Leo Kirschbaum Ohio State U P pp x+421

to this chapter Philip Williams, Jr, examines some of 'the implications of compositor analysis and related bibliographical techniques' for the textual study of Shakespeare, with special reference to the Histories which in the Folio were set from manuscript rather than printed copy At the end of the article he draws attention to deficiencies in the methods of compositor-determination so far devised, and points out that an analysis of the press work of the Folio is urgently needed Arthur Brown's subject is editorial problems in 'semi-popular editions' of Shakespeare like the *Arden*, the *Yale*, and the *New Cambridge* series, and such one-volume editions as those of Alexander and Sisson Among questions he discusses are the amount of bibliographical and textual material such an edition should include, the extent to which it should modernize the copy-texts, and the nature of the annotations it should provide, and he emphasizes the dangers of trying to appeal at the same time to elementary and advanced students Paul L Cantrell and George Walton Williams consider the difficulties involved in differentiating the work of Roberts's two compositors, X and Y, in Quarto 2 of *Titus Andronicus* Since this text was set up from Danter's 1594 Quarto, the task is more complex than it is in Roberts's Quartos of *Hamlet* and *The Merchant of Venice*, which were printed from manuscript Cantrell and Williams do much to clear the ground in their paper, but point out that more research on the compositorial habits of X and Y is needed before they can be identified with any certainty In the first of two articles on *The Textual Relation of Q 2 to Q 1 Hamlet*, Fredson Bowers by careful collation establishes evidence, not for sporadic consultation of Quarto 1 in the setting up of Act I of Quarto 2, as has been maintained, but of 'a relatively constant and steady influence on Q 2 from Q 1', he rejects the hypothesis that an example of Quarto 1 annotated in Act I was used as copy In a brief note at the end of the volume, Bowers supplies corrections to his article, *The Printing of 'Hamlet' Q 2*, in *SB* vii (*YW* xxxv 83) Andrew S Cairncross argues that the Folio text of *Henry V* is not independent of the Quartos, as has hitherto been accepted, but was printed from often heavily corrected copies of Quartos 2 and 3, two copies being required because at times 'correction of Q 3—the main copy or basis—proved to be so heavy or complicated that some technique requiring the independent use of both sides of a quarto leaf . was desirable' Alice Walker uses the Folio text of *Henry V* to illustrate 'how compositor analysis contributes towards the solution of editorial problems in Shakespeare'.

In an article in *Sh Q* Charlton Hinman shows that, 'independently of both the number of compositors and the number of skeletons employed, the First Folio was set throughout, not by successive pages, but by *formes*' Many irregularities resulted from inaccurate estimates of page-lengths in the copy, some of them affecting the wording of passages Different compositors solved in different ways the problems of fitting copy that had been cast off exactly to the Folio page, and their habits should be studied in the light of this knowledge

Also in *Sh Q*, Fredson Bowers reconsiders the editorial principles outlined in McKerrow's *Prolegomena for the Oxford Shakespeare*, and finds them out of date in many respects; one reason for this is the great advance made in scientific bibliographical techniques

K B Danks (*NQ*) questions the

validity of the theory, propounded by Pollard and accepted by most later textual scholars, which associates 'bad' Quartos with the 'stolne and surreptitious copies' of which Heminge and Condell speak He thinks it likely that this phrase refers specifically to the Pavier-Jaggard Quartos of 1619

In an interesting article in *JEGP* G Blakemore Evans discusses the 'Dering MS ' of *Henry IV*, in which 'it appears that the first page not only bears revisions in the hand of Sir Edward Dering, but is copied as a whole by Sir Edward Dering' Evans suggests that Dering himself was responsible for the telescoping of the two plays, having begun to transcribe his version, he went on to mark changes in a Quarto, and left the copying to a scribe, whose work he revised It is likely that the manuscript was written not earlier than 1622

In *Sh Q* M A Shaaber examines the arguments put forward by Alice Walker in *Textual Problems of the First Folio* (*YW* xxxiv 113) that the Folio text of *2 Henry IV* was printed from a copy of the 1600 Quarto which had been collated with an authoritative manuscript He reaffirms his own view that the Folio text was printed from a manuscript

The fairly generally held belief that the Folio text of *Richard III*, apart from two passages derived from the Third Quarto, was printed from a corrected exemplum of the Sixth Quarto, is challenged in a monograph[13] by J K Walton Walton's re-examination of the variants in the texts leads him to think that the Folio text was printed throughout from the Third Quarto Attempting to account for the comparative fewness of Quarto-Folio variants in the passages usually recognized as having been set up from the Third Quarto, he rejects the theory that the collator of the Folio copy was compelled to supply deficiencies in his manuscript from a copy of this Quarto, he puts the inconsistency down to the collator's failure 'to make in his quarto corrections which an intact manuscript required him to make' He believes that comparable anomalies in the texts of *King Lear* are similarly due to the 'varying efficiency' of a collator

In the second of his series of articles in *Sh S*, *The New Way with Shakespeare's Texts*, J Dover Wilson illustrates the new bibliographical methods by showing how he and G I Duthie set about preparing the text of *Romeo and Juliet* for the *N C S* edition This article should be read as a complement to the note on the copy in that edition (see note 6)

Andrew S Cairncross argues (*RES*) that both Quartos of *King Lear*, after correction from an authoritative manuscript, were used as copy for the Folio text

3 *Biographical Studies*

In 1920 J T Looney put forward his theory that the author of Shakespeare's plays was Edward de Vere, 17th Earl of Oxford From H Amphlett, an enthusiastic disciple of Looney, comes a new attempt[14] to identify Oxford as the author of the plays

Even more ludicrous is Calvin Hoffmann's bid[15] to prove that Marlowe wrote Shakespeare's plays, as well as *The Spanish Tragedy* and several anonymous plays including *Edward*

[13] *The Copy for the Folio Text of 'Richard III', with a Note on the Copy for the Folio Text of 'King Lear'*, by J K Walton Auckland Univ College pp 164 20*s*

[14] *Who was Shakespeare? A New Enquiry*, by H Amphlett, with an Introduction by Christmas Humphreys Heinemann pp xx+218 21*s*

[15] *The Murder of the Man who was Shakespeare*, by Calvin Hoffmann New York Messner pp xx+232 $3 95 (*The Man who was Shakespeare* London Parrish pp 256 15*s*)

III and *Locrine* His book has received a great deal more publicity than it deserves Among many reviews that have drawn attention to some of its more glaring absurdities are those of R A Foakes in *Sh Q* (1956), and of an anonymous reviewer in *TLS* (27 Jan 1956)

H A Shield (*NQ*) provides notes on the five people who were associated with Shakespeare in his litigation in 1615 over his Blackfriars property Also in *NQ*, Shield traces the background of Humphrey Fludd, stepfather of Stephen Bellot, the complainant in the Bellot-Mountjoy suit in which Shakespeare was called as a witness Fludd had been 'one of the French King's trumpeters', and Shield thinks it possible that he provided Shakespeare with the material about the court of Navarre which plays so large a part in *Love's Labour's Lost* A further note in *NQ*, from K B Danks, supplies information about Simon Hunt and Thomas Jenkins, who may have been Shakespeare's schoolmasters

Alan Keen (*TLS*) claims to have identified, and linked with Shakespeare, the 'Foke (or Fulke) and Thomas Gyllome' who are mentioned in the will of Alexander Houghton of Lea, Lancashire

In *Guessing About the Youthful Shakespeare* (*U of Texas Stud in Eng*) Robert Adger Law exposes fallacies in three recent volumes largely devoted to Shakespeare's early career Feuillerat's *The Composition of Shakespeare's Plays*, Keen and Lubbock's *The Annotator*, and Everitt's *The Young Shakespeare* (*YW* xxxiv 113, xxxv 84) Books of this nature may well bring the work of more discreet scholars into disrepute, and Law makes a timely plea for 'the exercise of more sanity in scholarship'

An article in *TLS* brings forward evidence that Richard Fenton was himself the author of the so-called Shakespearian fragments in his *Tour in Quest of Genealogy* (see *YW* xxxv 85)

4 *General Works*

Percy Simpson's *Studies in Elizabethan Drama*,[16] more fully noticed in Chapter IX, contains some material that is relevant in this section A long essay on 'Shakespeare's Use of Latin Authors' forms a useful complement to J A K Thomson's *Shakespeare and the Classics* (1951) Simpson is especially detailed in what he says about Shakespeare's knowledge of Plautus, Ovid, and Seneca, but other Latin authors are also well represented in his impressive list of classical references and echoes In 'Shakespeare's Versification' he analyses many passages in the plays to illustrate Shakespeare's growing skill in the use of dramatic poetry In a further paper Simpson draws attention to a parallel between Puck's reference to 'a headless bear' (*Midsummer Night's Dream*, III 1 99) and the prodigies described in *The Miracle of Miracles*, a pamphlet published by John Trundle in 1613 The volume also includes Simpson's British Academy Shakespeare Lecture of 1935, 'The Theme of Revenge in Elizabethan Tragedy'

John Middleton Murry's *Shakespeare*,[17] first published in 1936, has been reprinted, it contains a new preface, in which Murry expresses dissatisfaction with the approach of some recent critics of Shakespeare, and modifies his earlier treatment of *King Lear*

Several essays in the second volume of the *Penguin Guide to English*

[16] *Studies in Elizabethan Drama*, by Percy Simpson O U P pp ix+265 25*s* $4

[17] *Shakespeare*, by John Middleton Murry Cape, 1954 pp xxi+438 18*s*

Literature[18] are on various aspects of Shakespeare Writing on Shakespeare's early work up to the *Henry IV* plays, Derek Traversi describes this period as 'marked rather by a steady improvement in technical mastery than by any sudden manifestation of genius', though in Falstaff we see 'the individual expression of a great and perfectly serious artist' This essay also contains some sensible criticism of the *Sonnets* J C Maxwell's subject is the 'middle plays', including the mature and the 'problem' comedies, and *Caesar, Hamlet,* and *Othello* In these plays Shakespeare was deeply concerned with technical experiment and innovation, and they show his psychological and moral maturity L C Knights's treatment of the 'great' tragedies, *Lear, Macbeth, Antony and Cleopatra,* and *Coriolanus,* is balanced and stimulating, he is excellent on the poetry of these plays, and conveys something of the meaning and effect of each In his essay on the last plays, Traversi pays special attention to the symbolism, but he also brings out their dramatic and poetic qualities Kenneth Muir contributes a useful survey of 'changing interpretations of Shakespeare' from the seventeenth century to the present day

A chapter in A Lytton Sells's *The Italian Influence in English Poetry*[19] (fully noticed in Chapter X) is devoted to Shakespeare Sells finds little to suggest that Shakespeare was directly influenced by Italian poets in his *Sonnets* The narrative poems, however, often seem to parallel themes treated by Italian painters, and from the fondness that Shakespeare shows for Venice as the scene of his plays, Sells is inclined to accept the belief that he had visited Italy, perhaps with the Earl of Southampton (see Chapter X)

In *The Slave of Life*[20] M D H Parker sets Shakespeare's handling of his 'recurring *motif* of charity and forgiveness and a mercy quite unlike the dehydrated clemency of Seneca' beside the pronouncements of ancient philosophers and early Christian theologians Her detailed study of the plays shows how far 'Shakespeare and the Prayer Book had not only a common language but a common interest —the same inscrutable economy of good and evil, focussed in suffering and death' Already in the early plays the religious imagery is more marked than in any of Shakespeare's dramatic contemporaries, and in the later 'essays in redemption', such as *Measure for Measure, All's Well,* and *Lear,* Christian doctrines are seen to be fundamental to the treatment of the themes Miss Parker's method of approach is perhaps most rewarding when it is applied to the so-called 'problem' plays, *Measure for Measure* and *Troilus and Cressida,* it is based on her belief that the dramatic problems of the Elizabethans, 'which are inescapably the problems of justice', cannot be fully understood without an understanding of 'the Graeco-Jewish-Christian civilization in which they were born' In an appendix Miss Parker takes up the question whether Shakespeare was a Catholic recusant From arguments that do not carry much conviction she concludes 'It would appear that Shakespeare was indeed a Papist in sympathy and doctrine, but whether he was a recusant or not we shall probably never know for certain '

Ernest Marshall Howse's *Spiritual*

[18] *The Age of Shakespeare Volume 2 of a Guide to English Literature,* ed by Boris Ford Penguin Books pp 480 5*s*

[19] *The Italian Influence in English Poetry, from Chaucer to Southwell,* by A Lytton Sells Allen & Unwin pp 346 30*s* $6 75

[20] *The Slave of Life A Study of Shakespeare and the Idea of Justice,* by M D H Parker Chatto & Windus New York The Macmillan Co pp 264 18*s* $3 75

Values in Shakespeare[21] is a much slighter work Howse's object is to bring out in Shakespeare's plays 'the inexorable working of a universe of moral law' To this end he analyses the four major tragedies, and *Richard III, Julius Caesar, The Merchant of Venice,* and *The Tempest,* drawing from each some evidence of Shakespeare's concern with the spiritual problems of the Christian life He claims three assumptions as being fundamental to Shakespeare's moral outlook 'that individuals matter', 'that individuals are responsible', and that 'individuals, free and responsible, are living in a moral order' Howse's comments are rarely profound, and his views on the relationship of the plays to Shakespeare's life are out of date, but his work is not without some value as a fresh approach to the moral philosophy of Shakespeare

In *Shakespeare's Use of Music*[22] John H Long considers the use of music, both instrumental and vocal, 'as a dramatic device' in seven of Shakespeare's early comedies In the first two chapters he shows the importance attached to songs in Elizabethan drama, and describes the musical instruments that might be used in the theatres No instrumental scores written for the stage before 1600 have yet been found, but much is known about the instrumental music of the period, and contemporary settings for many of Shakespeare's songs have survived In his studies of the individual plays Long discusses almost every episode in which the performance of music is required, and the nature of the music called for, and shows the dramatic value of music at these points Wherever possible he has supplied scores from Elizabethan song-books, and where these are wanting he has found appropriate alternatives His book will be of interest to students of music as well as students of Shakespeare

In *Shakespeare and the Lonely Dragon* (*UTQ*) Millar MacLure applauds the dramatic sense with which Shakespeare pictured the 'division between the private and the public consciousness' of the 'hero in a political situation' In terms of this conflict he accounts for the political failure of Achilles, Coriolanus, and Antony Ludwig Borinski (*Sh J*) offers an interesting study of the qualities habitually associated with the Soldier and the Politician in Elizabethan drama, and shows what dramatic capital Shakespeare makes of the antithesis between the two types Almost to the end of his career Shakespeare showed a fondness for staging battles, yet commentators, says Paul A Jorgensen (*PMLA*), have failed to look for the aspect of warfare that steadily interested him and his audience The 'common factor in Shakespeare's interpretation of warfare that can be called deliberate', says Jorgensen, seems to be his 'habit of giving an army two generals rather than one, and making dissension between those generals a primary focus for his dramatic commentary on the battle' Almost always one of the generals is impetuous, and usually young, the other 'astute and crafty, and usually mature', and much is made of this contrast in character

Analogical Probability in Shakespeare's Plays is the title of an article (*Sh Q*) in which Paul A Aldus examines scenes in *Julius Caesar, Henry IV,* and *Antony and Cleopatra* which serve the 'function of establishing probability for later important actions

[21] *Spiritual Values in Shakespeare,* by Ernest Marshall Howse New York Abingdon Press pp 158 $2 50

[22] *Shakespeare's Use of Music A Study of the Music and Its Performance in the Original Production of Seven Comedies,* by John H Long Univ of Florida Press pp xv+213 $5 50

or sequences of actions, or of producing significant retrospects' These analogues deserve careful study, for they can throw new light on the meaning of plays, 'especially those that have continued to be problems in understanding' In *The Celestial Plane in Shakespeare* (*Sh S*), Roy Walker discusses studies that have been made of Shakespeare's astronomical lore, and goes on to show how 'the celestial plane' is in the plays engaged in terrestrial affairs mainly by means of 'star-torch-eye' imagery In *Dangerous Sea and Unvalued Jewels* (*English*) E C Pettet illustrates from Shakespeare both the 'Elizabethan sense of the treacherous hostility of the sea', and Shakespeare's imaginative notion of the sea 'as a great storehouse of jewels'

In spite of evidence to the contrary, C A Greer (*NQ*) is sceptical about suggestions that Shakespeare took the trouble to read alternative versions of stories he intended to dramatize For most of the plays, Greer thinks, he worked from earlier plays In *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry* (see Chapter I, note 17), Bain Tate Stewart refers to several plays by Shakespeare and his contemporaries to support his contention that 'the dream is superior to the dumb show as a conventional foreshadowing device' In the same volume Denver Ewing Baughan writes on Shakespeare's attitude towards travel

The annual and quarterly publications have still to be mentioned The articles in *Shakespeare Survey*[23] are for the most part devoted to aspects of the comedies, they are noticed individually in other parts of this chapter The volume contains the customary notes on Shakespearian study and production both at home and overseas, and a survey of the 1954 contributions to Shakespearian scholarship in which critical writings are reviewed by Clifford Leech, works on Shakespeare's life, times, and stage by I A Shapiro, and textual studies by James G McManaway

The various articles in *Shakespeare Jahrbuch*[24] are likewise treated in the appropriate sections of this chapter The rest of the volume is taken up by a bibliography of recent editions and studies, the usual sections devoted to reviews of books and productions, and some longer accounts of post-war production in various regions of Germany and Austria

Shakespeare Quarterly[25] preserves its regular features, articles, short notes, and reviews of books and productions Of special value are the excellent annotated bibliography for 1954 and a survey of Shakespeare scholarship in 1954 by William T Hastings, both in the Spring issue

The Shakespeare Newsletter,[26] which appears six times a year, prints a few original articles Its main function, however, is to provide digests of articles and unpublished lectures, notices of books and productions, and abstracts of theses

This is perhaps the place to mention a little *Shakespearean Manual*[27] which gives some 2,000 quotations, well indexed, and lists the characters and places of the plays The list of charac-

[23] *Shakespeare Survey An Annual Survey of Shakespearian Study & Production, No 8*, ed by Allardyce Nicoll C U P pp viii+172 18*s* $3 75

[24] *Shakespeare Jahrbuch*, herausgegeben im Auftrage der Deutschen Shakespeare-Gesellschaft von Hermann Heuer, unter Mitwirkung von Wolfgang Clemen und Rudolf Stamm Bd 91 Heidelberg Quelle & Meyer pp 441 DM 28

[25] *Shakespeare Quarterly*, published by the Shakespeare Association of America

[26] *The Shakespeare Newsletter*, ed by Louis Marder, Kent State Univ , Kent, Ohio (London Wm Dawson & Sons)

[27] *Shakespearean Manual of Quotations, Characters, Scenes and Plays* (Vest Pocket Library) Baltimore Ottenheimer pp 224

ters is very complete, including those who are merely referred to, like Jane Smile and Veroles ('the French knight that cowers i' the hams'), and sportive variants like Yedward The volume will have some value for reference

5 *Style and Language*

In *Shakespeare's Comic Prose* (*Sh S*) Ludwig Borinski speaks first of the general characteristics of this prose, its concreteness, its metaphorical quality, its richness in association, its generally slow tempo, and its 'profusion of architectural figures' He goes on to consider the prose of the comedies under the headings of naturalistic prose, low-comedy prose, the Clown, prose of the court, and prose of the town He finds Shakespeare's prose 'full of the quaint irregularity of the late Renaissance', 'in its profusion of inventive detail it is original rather than perfectly shaped'

With a reminder that Shakespeare was acted in daylight and with no scenery and few properties, Anton Muller-Bellinghausen (*Sh J*) illustrates from several plays some of the methods of 'spoken-decoration' and 'word-scenery' with which Shakespeare indicated locality, time, and 'business' in the speech of his characters Arthur Gerstner-Hirzel develops a similar theme, also in *Sh J* Shakespeare uses a minimum of formal stage-directions, but 'quite naturally implies stage-directions in the text of his plays', telling the actor or reader all he may want to know about the stage-business

In *ES* Rudolf Stamm offers a careful critique of Richard Flatter's translation of *Hamlet*, which he compares with that of Schlegel He finds that in this, as in other plays, Flatter has provided 'a remarkably lucid and actable version of Shakespeare without sacrificing too much of what must remain difficult and mysterious about his masterpieces'

In an article in *RES* Hilda Hulme demonstrates, with several examples from Shakespeare, that 'for the interpretation of such forms of our earlier literature as are composed primarily in the spoken language, the evidence of *O E D* may be supplemented both from without, from unsearched sources of regional English, and from within, through an awareness that the written record may give only a faint indication of strongly rooted spoken usage'

Moody E Prior (*Sh Q*) questions the validity of the imagery-tests by which K Wentersdorf sought to establish Shakespeare's authorship of the whole of *The Taming of the Shrew* in an article in *Sh Q*, 1954 (*YW* xxxv 93)

6 *Works on Individual Plays and Poems*

In this section the plays are treated in the order of the First Folio

In *Sh S* John Russell Brown provides an excellent survey of work done on the interpretation of Shakespeare's comedies, including the 'problem' comedies but not the last plays, in the first half of this century In this period he finds 'no clear line of development in the study of the early comedies' in particular, and the few outstanding books have been concerned either with individual plays or with specialized aspects of comedy

A full notice of M C Bradbrook's *The Growth and Structure of Elizabethan Comedy*[28] will be found in Chapter IX In the middle sections of the book Miss Bradbrook shows how Shakespeare assimilated and remoulded the themes and conventions

[28] *The Growth and Structure of Elizabethan Comedy*, by M C Bradbrook Chatto & Windus pp ix+246 18*s*

of his predecessors 'While keeping to the old principle that comedy portrays characters, he profoundly modified it by deepening and strengthening each separate character, developing the relations between different characters, until the characters *became* the plot' With some analysis of individual plays she illustrates Shakespeare's methods of articulating his plots, and his use of established comic devices, especially disguise She writes well about the differences between the Shakespearian and the Jonsonian types of comedy The book ends with some discussion of the last plays

In *Sh J* Walther Fischer sets out to show how Shakespeare's attitude to mercy, forgiveness, and kindred themes acquires a new graciousness in the late 'romances', he now views error and wrongdoing with the sympathy and understanding of a man who has profited from his experience of life, and his outlook is illustrated by the terms in which he allows evil to be requited with good 'Pardon's the word to all', 'The rarer action is In virtue than in vengeance'

In a paper printed in *English Stage Comedy* (see Chapter I, note 26), Bernard Knox claims that *The Tempest* observes many of the conventions of Roman comedy, though they have been given a romanticized setting In its essentials the plot follows a pattern of intrigue that would be familiar to readers of Plautus, and most of the characters are versions of stock Plautine types, Prospero, for instance, 'is master (and incidentally an irritable old man with a marriageable daughter) and Ariel and Caliban are slaves' Czech translations and adaptations of *The Tempest*, which include an opera and a puppet-play, are described by O F Babler (*NQ*)

Normally Shakespeare uses the term 'Ethiopian' only in 'its vaguest and least definite sense of *black*', says John W. Draper (*Ang*) However, the context in which he uses it in *The Merry Wives*, II iii 28, suggests that he had heard of Francisco Alvarez's *Ho Preste Joam das Índias* (1540), the first modern book on Ethiopia, though it is unlikely that he knew the book itself

Nevill Coghill (*Sh S*) finds nothing to support a cynical and pessimistic interpretation of *Measure for Measure* except 'a romantic assertion of private moral or sentimental attitudes' and the fact that the play falls within the so-called 'Tragic Period'. Starting from the medieval formula for comedy, 'Est autem comoedia poesis, exordium triste, laeto fine commutans', he shows why 'a religious basis for the design of this particular play is inevitable, the reason is that the subject-matter is sin' After all the unhappiness in 'a world bursting with sin and misery', Shakespeare concludes the play in a comic and forgiving mood D S Brewer (*NQ*) glosses some difficult lines (I i 3–9) in the Duke's opening speech in this play

Two cruxes in *Love's Labour's Lost* receive attention in *NQ* E G Allen would like the line 'With men like men of inconstancy' (IV iii 177, Q text) to read 'With men of like inconstancy' For the famous 'school of night' (IV iii 255) I A Shapiro thinks it possible that Shakespeare wrote '*style* of night', a compositor could easily have misread 'stile' as 'scole', or 'style' as 'schole', and Shapiro feels that the change to 'style' would improve the sound as well as the sense of the passage

Two articles on *A Midsummer Night's Dream* come from Ernest Schanzer In *UTQ* he disposes of some of the misconceptions commonly held with regard to Shakespeare's fairies, especially those of *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, and goes on to speak of the importance of the moon in this

play, and of the way in which Titania is to some extent merged with the moon by her identification with the goddess Diana In *NQ* he claims that the comment at the end of the Pyramus and Thisbe play, 'No, I assure you, the wall is down that parted their fathers' (v 1 347), refers to a reconciliation between the parents of the lovers This interpretation would increase the likelihood, first suggested by S B Hemingway in 1911, that in this playlet Shakespeare is burlesquing his tragic treatment of a similar story in *Romeo and Juliet*, and hence that the composition of *A Midsummer Night's Dream* followed that of *Romeo and Juliet*, probably in or close to the year 1595 Wm A Nitze (*MLR*) sees some possible Platonic influence in the passage on the lunatic, the lover, and the poet (v 1 4–17)

Writing on the source of *As You Like It*, in *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry* (see Chapter I, note 17), Ruth Cates Baird outlines Shakespeare's deviations from the plot of Lodge's *Rosalynde*, by means of which he condenses the story, tempers its violence, and gives unity to its atmosphere and variety and richness to its characters *As You Like It* is also the subject of a paper by Harold Jenkins printed in *Sh S* 'What Shakespeare characteristically does in his comedy', says Jenkins, 'is to set together the contrasting elements in human nature and leave them by their juxtaposition or interaction to comment on one another ' The comic value of *As You Like It* to a large degree depends upon 'piquant but seemingly casual juxtapositions', and Rosalind 'gathers up into herself many of its roles and many of its meanings' John Shaw (*Sh Q*) examines the plot and characterization of the play in the light of his belief that 'behind the gay romancing of the characters there is a basic philosophic strife between Fortune and Nature that would be obvious to the Renaissance'

Accepting the 'orthodox' theory that *A Shrew* and *The Shrew* have 'the same fundamental authorship', K B Danks argues (*NQ*) that the correct title should be *The Taming of A Shrew*.

In *The Comedy of Generation* (*EC*) John Arthos describes *All's Well* as a play 'about the confounding of love, in parents and in lovers' Part of the meaning that is being developed is, 'through the comparison of the failures, that the most generous love of parents can seem as cruelly possessive to the child as the unwanted love of a maiden, and that both work alone and in the dark The comparison all but becomes a theme '

Seeking a dramatic pattern in *Twelfth Night*, Milton Crane (*Sh Q*) sees it as a play in which Shakespeare began with a theme of classical comedy, the progress from self-deception to self-recognition, and 'proceeded to devise a series of variations in this fundamental action, variations that departed more and more from comedy in their effects though not in their methods' Shakespeare's indebtedness to *Riche his Farewell to Militarie Profession* in the composition of *Twelfth Night*, especially to the story of Apolonius and Silla, has long been recognized Kenneth Muir draws attention (*NQ*) to a passage on dancing in the epistle dedicatory which he thinks may have contributed to the picture we get of Sir Andrew in I iii In *TLS* L G Salingar suggests that his encounter with the words *Massiliensis* and *Hilurios* in his reading of the *Menaechmi* may have caused Shakespeare to use 'Messaline' as a place-name in connexion with Illyria Sydney Race (*NQ*) challenges many of the deductions made by Leslie Hotson in *The First Night of 'Twelfth Night'*, and

decides that 'the very thing the book sets out to prove has not been proved' Margaret Dean-Smith (*TLS*) agrees with what W W Greg said in an earlier letter in *TLS* (*YW* xxxv 103) about Hotson's error in describing *Twelfth Night* as a leap-year play, since there was no 29 February in 1600–1 Further letters in this dispute on the first performance of the play come from Greg, Hotson, Carslyn Merion, and J W Lever

It is at best only half the truth, says J A Bryant, Jr (*Sewanee Rev*), to describe *The Winter's Tale* as 'a kind of tragicomedy, more or less after the manner of Beaumont and Fletcher' It is more satisfactory to regard the play as a parable of sin and redemption in which Hermione serves as a symbol for divine grace But even more interesting than a correspondence between Hermione and divine grace, says Bryant, is her 'correspondence to the incarnation of divine grace, Jesus Christ' With this interpretation, he claims, the fable takes on 'a unified action and meaning' Almost all recent writers have treated Greene's *Pandosto* as the only source of *The Winter's Tale* In an article in *PQ* E A J Honigmann shows, with parallels, that Shakespeare probably made use of two other works in writing the play Francis Sabie's *The Fisshermans Tale* and its sequel *Flora's Fortune*, both published in 1595, and *Amadis de Gaule* He was also influenced by the Proserpine legend, and Honigmann names several versions of this legend which Shakespeare may have known In *Sh J* Ernst Kunstler traces Shakespeare's belief that Bohemia had a sea-coast (III iii) to the description of the land given in the *Gnomologie* of Aeneas Sylvius Piccolomini, or derivatives of this description

Theodor Spira's subject in an article in *Sh J* is the relationship between Shakespeare's presentation of history and medieval conceptions of political order and world-order Laurence Michel and Cecil C Seronsy also discuss (*SP*) Shakespeare's attitude towards historical material, with special reference to *Richard II*, *Henry IV*, and *Antony and Cleopatra* They regard Daniel as an important influence on his work as an historical dramatist

P J Francis (*NQ*) quotes a parallel to the famous closing lines of *King John* from Andrew Borde's *The Introduction of Knowledge* (1548) This and other parallels noted by editors suggest that Shakespeare was repeating a well-known 'patriotic slogan' which had been in use for some decades In a note on v ii 103–4 and a parallel passage in *The Troublesome Reign*, Ernest Schanzer points out (*NQ*) that there is no indication in *The Troublesome Reign* that Lewis sailed up the Thames, as editors have assumed

In a comparison of *Richard III* and *Richard II* (*PMLA*) Travis Bogard asserts that if Shakespeare had in writing *Richard II* contented himself with the techniques of *Richard III*, and had checked his impulse to explore and experiment, he might have written a better play, but 'the great tragedies would have been at a farther remove' For with 'the sudden surprising experimentation of *Richard II*' he began to move 'in a way that none of the Jacobeans followed', and 'first became himself' Having defined some of the types of symbolism associated with mirrors in the Renaissance, Peter Ure (*PQ*) designates the mirror episode in *Richard II* as 'the point where Richard turns within himself and is forced to drink the full measure of his grief' Shakespeare's handling of the episode ensures 'that we remain aware of the associations of the mirror with Vanity and the vain, because it *is* a

lattering glass, with Wisdom and the wise because of the part played by its truth-telling in the development and modification of Richard's own character' William C McAvoy (*JEGP*) analyses John of Gaunt's famous speech in praise of England (II i 40–56) to show how closely it follows the directions for the proper method of praising any person, place, or thing' given in the *Progymnasmata* of Aphthonius K B Danks gives reasons (*NQ*) for not agreeing with most authorities on the text of *Richard II* that the deposition scene in the Fourth Quarto is 'piratical'

In a paper published in *English Stage Comedy* (see Chapter I, note 26) C L Barber describes Falstaff as a figure in whom Shakespeare 'fused two main saturnalian traditions the clowning customary on the stage, and the folly customary on holiday' From being a lord of misrule, he finally becomes a scapegoat 'The heritage of ritual gives universality and depth' to his presentation C A Greer (*NQ*) joins the ranks of those who find Falstaff 'a genuine coward' *Henry IV* is also Rudolph Fiehler's subject In *How Oldcastle Became Falstaff* (*MLQ*) he outlines the early eighteenth-century controversy about the substitution of the names, describes the career of the historical Oldcastle, and shows how Shakespeare's Falstaff combines the parts of Oldcastle and Dericke in *The Famous Victories* Since Shakespeare was writing plays on the career of Prince Henry up to the time of Agincourt, Fiehler suggests, he may have thought it 'expedient to replace Oldcastle with some other historical figure who had actually been at Agincourt'

Attempting to explain the inconsistency in the use of the name Montague in *3 Henry VI*, Andrew S Cairncross (*MLR*) adds evidence to support Tucker Brooke's view that at I i 209 Montague took over the part of Faulconbridge who is mentioned in the same scene

Robert James Fusillo (*Sh Q*) speaks of the difficulty of staging the tent scenes in *Richard III* on the stage of an Elizabethan theatre He suggests that a different door was used 'for each locale or *domus*, and each scene was localized by the door the actors came through or approached' To explain how his marrying the Lady Anne could help Richard of Gloucester in his 'secret close intent' of becoming king, Norman Nathan (*NQ*) suggests that he wanted to bring about this marriage because Anne 'was (in the play, if not in fact) the widow of the rightful inheritor to the throne, the son of Henry VI In the eyes of the religious, Richard's marriage to Anne could make him appear to be the proper heir to the kingship since Edward IV and his children are not descendants of Henry VI ' The dreams of Clarence, Richard III, and Lady Macbeth, says Aerol Arnold (*Sh Q*), are different from the generality of dreams in both classical and Elizabethan literature They are normal in that they foreshadow the future, but unusual in that they serve also, 'and perhaps more importantly, to recapitulate the past action of the play' Howard Parsons suggests (*NQ*) that I i 13 should read 'To the lascivious *pleading* of a lute', and less reasonably that I i 15 should be 'Nor made to court an *amorist's* looking-glass' In another issue of *NQ* Parsons proposes emendations at I ii 75 and I ii 117, and provides a gloss on I iii 289

In *Nature in Shakespearian Tragedy*[29] Robert Speaight has brought together half a dozen papers most of which have been previously published

[29] *Nature in Shakespearian Tragedy*, by Robert Speaight Hollis & Carter New York Macmillan Co pp viii+179 15*s* $3

(see *YW* xxxiv 126, 141, xxxv 98) By 'nature', Speaight says, he means 'everything that is *given* to man, whether it be a tendency of his moral personality, or that knowledge which we acquire from our study of the elements or from the normal workings of society', and it is in the light of this rather inclusive definition that he sets out to show what happens when nature is violated in the world of Shakespeare's mature plays There came a time, he says, 'when Shakespeare became fascinated by the failure of the natural man, and the falsity of the natural woman It was the tragic moment, because, where comedy brings shape out of chaos and agreement out of conflict, tragedy is the catalyst of discord' The plays in which he analyses the 'discord and discrepancy between man and nature' are *Hamlet, Macbeth, Othello, Lear, Antony and Cleopatra,* and *The Tempest* His insistence on attaching strong significance to the word 'nature' every time it occurs in the plays leads to some strained interpretations, especially in *Hamlet,* his specialized approach is most satisfactory when he speaks of *Macbeth* and *Lear* However, it is when he draws on his experience as an actor that he makes perhaps his most helpful contributions to the understanding of the tragedies

Ludwig Borinski's object, in *Die tragische Periode der englischen Literatur* (*Die neueren Sprachen*), is to demonstrate that Shakespeare's 'tragic period' was not primarily the outcome of personal experiences, but was in keeping with the dominant mood of much that was written by other poets, including Jonson and Donne, between about 1600 and 1610

Kenneth Muir (*Sh S*) considers some of the varied interpretations of which *Troilus and Cressida* is susceptible From one point of view it is an exposure of the 'false glamour' of sex and war, from another it is a dramatic statement of the power of Time as a devourer of innocence and a bloody tyrant, from yet another it shows how 'the world and the flesh make the best the victims of the worst' The fusing of these themes demanded extraordinary dramatic ability on Shakespeare's part In *NQ* Muir finds further parallels between *Troilus and Cressida* and Greene's *Euphues his Censure to Philautus* to add to those which have been previously noticed *Opinion, Truth and Value* is the title of an article (*EC*) in which Frank Kermode disputes some of the points put forward by Mrs Nowottny in writing about *Troilus and Cressida* in *EC* in 1954 (*YW* xxxv 97)

I R Browning (*EC*) takes exception to D J Enright's description of *Coriolanus* as a political debate (*EC,* 1954) He himself sees it as a tragedy Coriolanus's tragedy arises partly from the conflict within him of the military hero and 'the "mother's boy", the "boy of Teares"' Shakespeare 'shows us that a man outwardly a stranger to tenderness can fall a victim to it' In the *Univ of Kansas City Rev* Leonard F Dean discusses the 'neglected patterns of language and mimetic action' in *Coriolanus*

Paul E Bennett shows (*NQ*) that editors are mistaken in using a supposed allusion to Titus Andronicus in *A Knack to Know a Knave* (performed in June 1592) as evidence in dating Shakespeare's *Titus Andronicus* It is obviously not Titus Andronicus who is here referred to, but Titus Vespasianus (see Chapter IX)

S G Culliford suggests (*NQ*) that the reading of Quarto 1 of *Romeo and Juliet* at II i 38, 'An open *Et cætera,* thou a poprin Peare', may be supported by palaeographical evidence deduced from the Quarto 2 version of the line In an attempt to

explain the crux at III ii 6, 'runaways eyes' (Q 2 'runnawayes'), Tauno F Mustanoja claims (*NM*) that this phrase and 'children's eyes' in Sonnet IX 'are parallel expressions, objective genitives used for "eyes spying for runaways" and "eyes looking at children"'

The discussion and rivalry of the poet and the painter in *Timon of Athens*, says W M Merchant (*Sh Q*), have a closer organic relation with the meaning of the play as a whole than is always allowed Through them Shakespeare is exploring 'the competence with which painting and poetry render "appearance" as a revelation of "reality"', and the antithesis between appearance and reality is one of the major themes of the play

Joan Rees re-examines (*MLR*) the question whether Shakespeare was in the composition of *Julius Caesar* influenced by Kyd's version of Garnier's *Cornélie* She concludes 'Kyd's *Cornelia* may in fact give us a glimpse of the process by which *Julius Caesar* took shape in Shakespeare's mind and help us to understand the better what sort of a play Shakespeare's is' In *Cornelia*, she asserts, 'he found Caesar's "strut" and his nobility side by side', he found also some of the qualities that he gave to Brutus, including his deep love for Caesar In *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry* (see Chapter I, note 17), Bernard R Breyer makes an interesting attempt to relate Caesar's character to the sixteenth-century conception of the tyrant, drawing his illustrations mainly from Erasmus's *Institutio Principis Christiani* He also contends that we shall not understand Brutus unless we judge him from a psychological rather than a logical viewpoint Two articles on *Julius Caesar* are from the pen of Ernest Schanzer To account for widely differing responses to the play, Schanzer suggests (*Sh Q*) that Shakespeare, himself familiar with varied interpretations of the characters of Caesar and the conspirators, deliberately put a twofold problem before his audience, and left them to form their own conclusions 'There is the psychological problem of the nature of the real Caesar, and hinging upon it there is the ethical problem of the moral defensibility of the murder' In *ELH* Schanzer dilates on the role of Brutus as the tragic hero of *Julius Caesar*, and declares that an understanding of Brutus's tragedy is necessary if we are to understand why Shakespeare depicted Caesar as he did

Macbeth is the subject of several articles and notes In *RN* Roland Mushat Frye develops the view that Lady Macbeth's usurpation of domestic authority in defiance of divine ordinance would have added to her dramatic interest for a contemporary audience Moreover, while she 'unsexed' herself, Macbeth 'profaned his sex by submission to her', and the audience would have seen deliberate irony in 'Macbeth's ineffective protests of allegiance to "all that may become a man" and in his lady's taunting "so much more the man"' In *NQ* Frye declares that the 'Out, out, brief candle' speech would have held a profound significance for Jacobean playgoers, a significance which is illuminated by comparison with passages from the Bible and from contemporary theologians Part of the audience would perhaps have interpreted the speech as Macbeth's denial of a future life But parallels from other writers and from the Scriptures suggest another interpretation as well 'that trust in this life and in this world is ultimately but trust in a candle and in a shadow' In an article in *MLQ* Robert J Boyle makes a full analysis of the imagery in the passage beginning, 'And pity, like a naked new-born

babe' (I vii 21–28), and shows how 'it fits into the pattern of unnatural images which occur throughout the play'

Though the three hags in *Macbeth* retain much of the stature of 'the weird sisters, that is the goddesses of destinie' described by Holinshed, says Robert R Reed, Jr (*NQ*), they are 'fundamentally naturalized Elizabethan witches' In their qualities and their actions they conform at all points to the Elizabethan concept of the witch Also in *NQ*, Kenneth Muir finds parallels which strengthen the case for believing that Shakespeare may have taken details in *Macbeth* from Buchanan's *Rerum Scoticarum Historia* and Leslie's *De Origine, Moribus, et Rebus Scotorum* William B Bache (*Sh Q*) gives reasons for believing that Shakespeare used Deloney's story of the murder of Old Cole in *Thomas of Reading* to modify and fill out the material he took from Holinshed in writing *Macbeth* That the works of James I are also part of the background of *Macbeth* is the thesis of Jane H Jack (*ELH*) Shakespeare found the story in Holinshed, 'in the works of James, and in the books of the Bible to which James constantly refers, he found many suggestions which helped him to turn this tale into a tragedy of extraordinary economy and unity' The works to which Miss Jack refers are *Basilikon Doron, Daemonologie,* and a hitherto overlooked sermon of King James, *A Fruitfull Meditation*, published in 1603 Paul N Siegel (*NQ*) draws several parallels between themes and characters in *Macbeth* and in Bible story Holger Nørgaard (*RES*) supplements the arguments for accepting the second scene of *Macbeth* as Shakespeare's work by drawing attention to a passage in Daniel's *Cleopatra* which appears to have influenced the opening lines of the Captain's first speech Shakespeare had presumably been reading this work in preparation for *Antony and Cleopatra* K B Danks (*NQ*) will not admit the possibility that there may be a topical allusion in the Porter's use of the words 'equivocate' and 'equivocator' at the beginning of II iii

Hamlet, too, comes in for a good deal of comment Peter Alexander's excellent *Hamlet, Father and Son*[30] is more than just a study of *Hamlet* In a lively discussion of the doctrine of *hamartia*, Alexander shows that both Aristotle in what he says of the Attic dramatists, and Bradley in what he says of Shakespeare, 'although they do offer us an interpretation of tragedy based on such a doctrine, yet add such qualifications that we might insist that they provide at the same time its refutation Indeed the variety of experience on which the whole effect of tragedy depends—*catharsis* to use Aristotle's term—does not rest on the faults but on the virtues of men ' We must therefore reject interpretations of *Hamlet* based, like that of Sir Laurence Olivier in his film version, on the belief that Hamlet's tragedy was caused by 'some vicious mole of nature' in himself Alexander effectively counters the arguments of commentators who have seen discrepancies between plot and character in the play, and contradictions in the character of its hero, and develops a picture of Hamlet as 'Shakespeare's ideal man' Quite apart from what it tells us about *Hamlet*—and that is a great deal—this book is an important contribution to the study of Shakespearian tragedy

Fredson Bowers (*PMLA*) sees in the lines spoken over the dead body of Polonius (III iv 172–7) 'the clearest

[30] *Hamlet, Father and Son* (The Lord Northcliffe Lectures, University College, London, 1953), by Peter Alexander O U P pp viii+189 15*s* $2 40

analysis Hamlet makes of his predicament' Though Hamlet repents his shedding of innocent blood, he recognizes that his repentance cannot wash the blood from his hands, and that he must accept the inevitable penalty for bloodshed He now sees himself both as a 'scourge' and as a 'minister' As a damned man selected to be the instrument of God's vengeance he is a scourge, and the Elizabethan audience would understand his use of the word, as 'God's agent to punish the specific criminal, Claudius', he is a minister Noting parallels in situation and diction between *Hamlet* and *The Faerie Queene*, Abbie Findlay Potts suggests (*Sh Q*) that several passages in Spenser's poem furnish a 'commentary on the ethical and dramatic cruxes in the text of the second quarto' of *Hamlet* If Hamlet is 'found advancing in a fashion not more desultory than that of Gloriana's Knights toward an understanding of temperance and justice, and thereafter toward the deed it befits him to do, the drama is single and clear' In *PMLA* Robert H West joins the controversy whether the Ghost in *Hamlet* is to be regarded as a visitant from 'some paganesque purgatory', as R W Battenhouse argued in 1951, or as a 'Catholic ghost come to demand revenge', as I J Semper claims West himself takes the view that Shakespeare may have deliberately mixed the evidence 'for the sake of dramatic impact and of a kind of philosophical reserve from which he seems often to draw some of his impact' Claire McGlinchee (*Sh Q*) adds to the possible sources of Polonius's precepts to Laertes a similar speech of the Elder Knowell in Jonson's *Every Man in his Humour*

In the 'dram of eale' passage at *Hamlet*, I iv 36–38, Glen O Allen (*NQ*) thinks it 'perhaps not too much to suppose that "eale" was intended by Shakespeare as a bonafide noun meaning affliction or ailment' For 'of a doubt' he suggests the reading 'oft adduce' J Copley (*NQ*) supplies a gloss on 'They say the owle was a Baker's Daughter' He sees the owl not only as a bird associated with foreboding and death, but also as a symbol of Ophelia's father, 'the worldly-wise one who could put the worst interpretation on Hamlet's conduct towards her' Furthermore, from the tradition which gives birds a place in the rites of St Valentine's Day, 'the owl is connected in Ophelia's distempered mind with the choosing of a partner—and the omens are evil' Also in *NQ* Wallace A Bacon disputes Alfred Harbage's interpretation of Hamlet's phrase 'quintessence of dust' as meaning 'the precious distillation of the spirit permeating all matter' Sara Ruth Watson maintains (*NQ*) that the '*Mousetrap*', since it was being performed before a royal audience, would have been acted in the centre of the apron stage of the Globe theatre, and in other respects would have been staged as Leslie Hotson believes *Twelfth Night* to have been staged on its 'first night' In that case Claudius could not have failed to see and understand the dumb-show In *Sh Q* Macdonald Emslie writes on Pepys's interest in dramatic recitative, and prints the recitative setting that Cesare Morelli, Pepys's 'domestic musician', provided for Hamlet's 'To be, or not to be' soliloquy, as he had heard Betterton deliver it several times in the course of performances

The *De Consolatione Philosophiae* was still influential in Elizabethan times, and Paul N Siegel (*Sh Q*) sees reflected in *King Lear* the Boethian doctrine of the value of adversity 'The suffering of Gloucester and Lear is more than punishment, it is a purgatory which burns away their previous selfishness Adversity brings for the good the miracle of love'

Kenneth Muir (*NQ*) draws attention to an account of Gogmagog in Holinshed which has been overlooked as a possible influence on Edgar's description (IV vi) of the fiend with eyes like two full moons E M M. Taylor (*Sh Q*) thinks that Lear's allusions to Poor Tom as 'this philosopher', 'this same learned Theban', and the like, may have reference to the Cynic philosophy

'*Othello* is not a study in pride, egoism or self-deception', says Helen Gardner in her British Academy Shakespeare Lecture, *The Noble Moor* (see Chapter I, note 42), 'its subject is sexual jealousy, loss of faith in a form which involves the whole personality at the profound point where body meets spirit' Miss Gardner cannot agree with those who find this 'most beautiful play' lacking in meaning She sees above all the nobility and the heroic virtue of the Moor However, the significance of *Othello*, she believes, 'is not to be found in the hero's nobility alone, in his capacity to know ecstasy, in his vision of the world, and in the terrible act to which he is driven by his anguish at the loss of that vision It lies also in the fact that the vision was true'

Behind *Othello*, according to Irving Ribner (*Tulane Stud in Eng*), lies the basically simple traditional philosophy that any man, however noble, could be seduced by the forces of evil which surround all men Having succumbed, however, he could recover from his delusion and, after a period of penance, could triumph over evil and attain salvation Ribner contends that, having 'this traditional world view to express', Shakespeare used the dramatic pattern 'traditionally used to express that philosophy, that of the morality play' Theodore C Hoepfner's thesis in *Iago's Nationality* (*NQ*) is that Shakespeare changed the Spanish Iago of his source into a Venetian because it was a necessary part of Othello's deception that he should put trust in Iago's intimate knowledge of Venetian women and Venetian morality In *Sh Q* Marvin Rosenberg defends Iago against two charges often levelled against him first, that he was 'a decent man who injured others only after he was provoked to do so', secondly, that he was 'a creature of subhuman evil, malignant without any motivation' Rosenberg puts forward the novel view that Iago is intended, from many of his utterances, to be seen as the 'ulcer type' Also in *Sh Q*, T S Dorsch argues for the retention of the Folio 'trace' at II i 315, 'If this poore Trash of Venice, whom I trace For his quicke hunting'

In her reading of *Antony and Cleopatra* in terms of Christian morality (*Sh Q*), Dolora G Cunningham sets out to show that the action of the play is 'built on the opposition between the "pagan" concept of irrational sensuality and the central Christian concept of the reasonable soul, which embraces the noble Roman qualities by which Enobarbus and the soldiers measure Antony' Cleopatra's increasing nobility at the end of the play must be seen as an attempt 'to prepare for death by means of Christian repentance' David S Berkeley (*College Eng*) thinks that critics are too kind to Antony, who deceived his friends and deliberately gave Cleopatra ambiguous and dangerous advice At IV vii 6–10, Norman Nathan (*NQ*) regards Scarus's reference to his wound 'that was like a T, But now 'tis made an H', and his remark that he has 'room for six scotches more', as a jest by which Scarus implies that he has the nine lives of a cat.

Doubts have been cast on the authenticity of many passages in *Cymbeline*. Finding parallels and stylistic resemblances to these disputed

passages elsewhere in Shakespeare, J. M. Nosworthy (*Sh S*) concludes that 'there may yet be more profit in seeking for Shakespeare in that which purports to be his than in following Greene, Peele, Chapman, Wilkins, Middleton or Fletcher into the shadows'

In *RES* P Goolden compares the form of Antiochus's riddle in *Pericles* (I i) with the form in which Gower presents it Gower, he suggests, correctly translated a corrupt version of the riddle which he found in a poor manuscript of the *Historia Apollonii Regis Tyri*, and which he perhaps did not understand In *Pericles* Shakespeare (or Wilkins) reshaped the clues to make them comprehensible, his version is 'mercifully easier', and serves its purpose perfectly well in its dramatic context

In an interesting study of *Sir Thomas More* (*RES*) J M Nosworthy makes three main contentions, supported chiefly by the cumulative evidence of language and style first, that Munday, Chettle, and Dekker wrote the play in about 1600, secondly, that Shakespeare wrote his section of Addition II round about 1601–2, thirdly, that he was the author also of Addition III, which he wrote at the same time Nosworthy believes that Shakespeare made his contributions, not 'for a specific, semi-political purpose', but rather 'to give shape and dramatic urgency to a piece not without quality but desperately pedestrian in parts' I A Shapiro has different notions about the date of *Sir Thomas More* In *The Significance of a Date* (*Sh S*) he shows that the date on the manuscript of Munday's *John a Kent* is 1590, and not 1596, as it has hitherto been read If the 'experts' are right about the sequence of this manuscript and that of *Sir Thomas More* and the interval between them, 'those who believe that Shakespeare joined in the revision of *Sir Thomas More* may have to consider more seriously the suggestion that the revision occurred about 1593, when Lord Strange's Men, who then included Shakespeare, were temporarily associated with the Admiral's company' Moreover, some of our assumptions about the development of drama in the 1580's may have to be modified

In *The Mutual Flame*,[31] in which he applies his now familiar critical methods to the *Sonnets* and *The Phoenix and the Turtle*, G Wilson Knight has, as usual, much that is fresh and valuable to offer in the way of interpretative criticism, as usual, too, his approach is at times a little mystifying In his opening chapter Knight judiciously sums up the conflicting theories that have been put forward about the dating, the order, and the 'characters' of the *Sonnets* In the following chapter, 'The Integration Pattern', he demonstrates the importance of the contrast between the poet's love for the fair youth and lust for the dark lady, it is difficult not to feel, however, that he could have made his points more simply and just as profitably without constant reference to the 'two root principles of Nietzsche's *Birth of Tragedy*, the Dionysian and the Apollonian' In treating the symbolism and the great issues of Time, Death, and Eternity, he gives some penetrating analyses of the thought and language of individual sonnets, he is less convincing when he tries to relate the theme of the Sonnets, which he describes in rather unsatisfactory terms as 'a progress through the bisexual adoration and integration to an eternal insight, or intuition', to its 'expansion' in the plays. The criticism of *The*

[31] *The Mutual Flame On Shakespeare's 'Sonnets' and 'The Phoenix and the Turtle'*, by G Wilson Knight Methuen New York Macmillan Co pp xi+233 18*s* $3 75

Phoenix and the Turtle is excellent, especially in the way in which it relates the Phoenix symbol to the plays, the other poems of *Love's Martyr*, which he also discusses, are less helpfully dealt with

In line 6 of Sonnet CXLII, says T Walter Herbert (*Explicator*), the phrase 'scarlet ornaments' means 'scarlet attire such as was appropriate to a person of official dignity and moral authority' With this interpretation 'we may restore to clarity an excellent but often abused sonnet' L P Wilkinson (*TLS*) draws attention to the influence of Horace's Epode XI on Sonnet CIV Howard Parsons (*NQ*) wishes to emend the second line in Sonnet CXLVI to read, '*Lured by those* rebel powers that thee *sway*'

A Alvarez suggests (*Mandrake*) that there are four ways of reading *The Phoenix and the Turtle* first, 'to treat the poem as a wittily complicated effusion which reworks the well-nigh exhausted conceit of the two lovers making one flesh', secondly, 'to interpret it exclusively through its religious symbolism', thirdly, to take it 'as a copy-book example of technique', and fourthly, to read it as a philosophical, 'metaphysical' poem In 'a total reading of the poem these four ways of approach merge and clarify each other' Drawing on parallels elsewhere in Shakespeare, Ronald Bates (*Sh Q*) discusses the birds referred to in *The Phoenix and the Turtle*, and identifies the 'bird of loudest lay' with the cock He finds in the poem resemblances to some of the plays, such as *Hamlet*, and describes it as 'almost a tragedy —in the form of a posy of a ring' In a later issue of *Sh Q* M C Bradbrook disputes several of Bates's judgements

7 *Theatre and Actors*

In an article in *Sh J* Bertram Joseph reaffirms his belief that, 'if we are to appreciate Elizabethan drama as an art, we can only do so completely in terms of its own theatre' While not insisting on a pedantic reproduction of the Elizabethan theatre, as far as we know the details of its construction, he suggests that Shakespeare's plays are made more effective in the theatre by the use of the conventional rhetorical gestures described in the *Chirologia* and *Chironomia* of John Bulwer He supports his thesis by an account of Mermaid Theatre productions of *Macbeth* in 1952 and 1953 in which this technique of 'suiting the action to the word' was adopted

Also in *Sh J* Ronald Watkins shows dissatisfaction with productions in which emphasis is laid on 'some novelty of characterization, a mannerism, a subtlety of make-up, some ingenious trick of stage machinery', and other devices which distract attention from the spoken word The all-important task of the Shakespearian actor is 'to interpret the detail of the poetical score by voice and gesture and expression and mime' Alfred Harbage (*Sh J*) is likewise concerned about modern methods of producing Shakespeare With a reminder that the 'non-writing, non-acting' producer of the present day had no counterpart in Elizabethan England, he deplores the recent tendency of producers to impose novel or 'popularizing' interpretations of Shakespeare's plays on their productions, often, it would seem, for the sake of the novelty itself 'Presumably when there were no producers', he says, ' the plays of Shakespeare were persuasive and vital in their own right, as well as self-interpretive To the extent that they seem to us still so we must either shun the theatre or be encumbered with well-meant assistance '

In *Sh S* Sir Barry Jackson discusses nineteenth-century methods of staging Shakespeare's comedies, and goes on to speak of productions he has seen or

been associated with in the course of some sixty years In *Of Stake and Stage* (*Sh S*) John Brıley comments on two documents which give evidence of Edward Alleyn's activities as one of the 'Masters of the Royal Game of Bears, Bulls, and Mastiff Dogs' At the Hope Theatre bear-baiting alternated with stage-plays

Two biographical works are of some interest C B Purdom gives a critical account[32] of Harley Granville Barker's career as actor, producer, playwright, and Shakespearian scholar The book is well documented, and reproduces many letters, especially letters to and from Bernard Shaw and Gilbert Murray Purdom is particularly interested in Barker's work as an actor and a producer, and analyses many productions in which he appeared or for which he was responsible, in this connexion it is surprising to find so little reference to William Poel and his influence on Barker Purdom's judgements appear to be coloured at times by his evident admiration for Barker's first wife, Lillah McCarthy, and his equally evident dislike of his second wife, Helen Huntington, but the book contains much valuable information about the theatre in the early decades of this century

Of some interest too is the autobiography of Donald Wolfit,[33] who has done so much to make Shakespeare a 'popular draw' Wolfit gives a spirited account of the tough apprenticeship of a Shakespearian actor in the twenties and thirties, and speaks appreciatively of the guidance and encouragement that he himself received from older actors and producers, notably William Poel However, he says disappointingly little about the famous productions with which he has been associated

'His creations were all his own, and they were all Irvings', said Bernard Shaw of the acting of Henry Irving In *Sh Q* E J West cites the opinions of many people who saw Irving in Shakespearian parts His conclusion is that 'Irving could not or would not even attempt real interpretation, he preferred or he was forced into using Shakespeare's roles as mere raw material from which to design his own fantastic and eccentric creations' In *Theatre Notebook* Arthur Colby Sprague gives an interesting description, based on prompt-books, of the way in which the most famous of American Falstaffs, James Hackett, interpreted the part

For a quarter of a century Guy Boas has been producing Shakespeare with great success at the Sloane School, Chelsea In *Shakespeare and the Young Actor*[34] he describes the productions for which he has been responsible in this period, and adds some useful chapters on methods of training and staging with boy actors

Four transatlantic Shakespeare festivals of 1955 are described in the Autumn issue of *Sh Q* Arnold Edinborough attributes the continuing success of the Shakespeare seasons at Stratford, Ontario, to the 'team of Moiseiwitsch and Guthrie as designer and director respectively', and goes on to review the 1955 plays, *Julius Caesar* and *The Merchant of Venice* Alice Griffin deals with the inaugural season of the new American Shakespeare Festival Theatre and Academy at Stratford, Connecticut, and the plays offered, *Julius Caesar* and *The Tempest* The oldest permanent Shakespeare repertory theatre in the western hemisphere, at Ashland,

[32] *Harley Granville Barker Man of the Theatre, Dramatist and Scholar*, by C B Purdom Rockliff pp xiv+322 30*s*

[33] *First Interval The Autobiography of Donald Wolfit* Odhams Press pp 256 16*s*

[34] *Shakespeare and the Young Actor A Guide to Production*, by Guy Boas Rockliff pp xi+126 16*s*

Oregon, celebrated its twentieth anniversary with *A Midsummer Night's Dream, Macbeth, Timon,* and *3 Henry VI*, these plays are noticed by Horace W Robinson, who also outlines the history of the theatre Omar Renney discusses the productions of seven of the plays at Antioch, Ohio

Several articles in *Sh S* are devoted to productions Tyrone Guthrie describes the principles on which the plays were staged at the first Shakespearian Festival at Stratford, Ontario Richard David reviews English productions during the winter of 1953–4, with special reference to *All's Well* at the Old Vic and *A Midsummer Night's Dream* at Stratford Ngaio Marsh writes about a production of *Twelfth Night* with which she toured in the Antipodes, and in which emphasis was laid on bringing out the 'Illyrian' quality of the play

In *Sh Q* Arthur Colby Sprague reviews productions on the New York stage in the 1954–5 season, and Alan S Downer some productions in London and at Stratford

Many other articles on Shakespearian productions on stage, cinema, television, and radio are listed in the *Sh Q* bibliography

8 *Shakespearian Criticism Echoes and Allusions*

In a paper in *Sh J, On Atomizing Shakspere*, T W Baldwin expresses the fear that modern critical techniques may come to obscure rather than clarify our understanding of Shakespeare 'Critical instruments we shall do well to manufacture and use But as we bring these various critical instruments to bear upon Shakspere there is a danger that our expertness with some particular instrument may shift our interest to the instrument itself and away from Shakspere ' In reviewing recent trends in dramatic criticism, particularly Shakespearian criticism, Rudolf Stamm, also in *Sh J*, welcomes the now well-established practice of discussing plays not merely as literary material, but as stage material

L C Knights (*Sewanee Rev*) shows, by reference to such works as Virgil K Whitaker's *Shakespeare's Use of Learning*, 'how the historical approach, pursued as a means of interpretation, tends, by the very nature of its undertaking, to obscure as well as to elucidate Shakespeare's plays'. Such historical study as we find necessary should be 'predominantly the study of the varying forms—the varying apprehensions—of the great perennial truths' In *SNL* Whitaker defends the methods of historical scholarship on the grounds that they can give the reader 'new insights into how Shakespeare went about writing a play'

Jean Jacquot (*Ea*) surveys the contributions of several critics to the interpretation of Shakespeare, paying special attention to the work of Willard Farnham In *Sh Q* Herbert Weisinger exposes weaknesses and excesses to be found in some of the recent methods of interpreting the tragedies Though Bradley's criticism leaves much to be desired, Weisinger finds his treatment of the plays more fruitful than that of most of the 'new' critics

In *Essays in Honor of Walter Clyde Curry* (see Chapter I, note 17) Jeffrey Fleece examines Leigh Hunt's Shakespearian criticism As a whole it is remarkably level-headed, and its chief merit is that Hunt's 'most important acquaintance with Shakespeare was obtained in the theatre' In *The Month* Christopher Devlin discusses the ways in which Robert Speaight, M D H Parker, and G Wilson Knight have treated the subject of 'Grace and Nature in Shakespeare'.

Schiller's versions of *Macbeth* and *Othello* are the subject of an article

by Hans Heinrich Borcherdt in *Sh J* In the same volume Wilhelm Dobbek assesses the importance of Herder's role in the 'Shakespeare-Renaissance' of eighteenth-century Germany.

John M Aden (*NQ*) draws attention to a possible Shakespearian echo in Dryden's elegy *Upon the Death of the Lord Hastings*, and Raymond A Biswanger, Jr (*NQ*), to several echoes in D'Urfey's comedy of 1693, *The Richmond Heiress*. Correspondences between *Antony and Cleopatra* and the Argument to Daniel's *Letter from Octavia* have been noted in the past Holger Nørgaard (*NQ*) points out another such correspondence in the *Letter* itself Ernest Sirluck (*MP*) lists and discusses many hitherto unreported allusions to Shakespeare and Jonson in the pamphlet literature of the Civil War

Ernest Schanzer (*NQ*) finds parallels between stanzas of *The Ancient Mariner* and passages in *Julius Caesar* and *The Tempest* These parallels are not mentioned in Lowes's *The Road to Xanadu*, and Lowes has failed to realize that *The Tempest* is 'the most striking and important of all the purely literary influences on *The Ancient Mariner*' William B Bache (*NQ*) believes that similarities which he has observed in *Othello* and Conrad's *Chance* are not fortuitous *Othello*, he says, 'hovers over the novel, echoing the action, establishing the design, and ironically directing the theme'

There have been renewed attempts recently to explain an allusion to a purloiner of Greene's plumes in Sonnet IX of *Greenes Funeralls* (1594) as an animadversion upon Shakespeare Warren B Austin (*Sh Q*) shows the probability that the lines are an attack on Gabriel Harvey.

IX LATER ELIZABETHAN AND EARLY STUART DRAMA

By ARTHUR BROWN

MISS M C BRADBROOK needs no introduction to the student of Elizabethan Drama (see Chapter VIII), and she places him still further in her debt this year with her book on Elizabethan Comedy [1] She points out that in general Comedy has received comparatively little attention from the critics, and that the story of its growth and development is not quite so clear as those of tragedy and history Accordingly she sets out 'to trace the evolution and the interaction' of the two comic forms which culminate in Shakespeare and Jonson respectively The story is indeed a complex one, but we are led firmly and surely through all its ramifications 'Drama is the co-operative creation of author, actors and audience', says Miss Bradbrook, and we are never in any danger of losing sight of the less tangible links in the chain The union between popular and learned traditions in the drama is clearly worked out, and the break-up of this union, the 'triumph of art' resulting from the overwhelming influence of Jonson, the various aspects of the War of the Theatres, are all well illustrated Concise and useful sketches of some of the major dramatists involved in the story—Dekker, Heywood, Marston, Middleton, Day, Chapman, Fletcher—prevent the book from becoming too theoretical A chronological table of plays forms a valuable appendix, and the notes provide an ample commentary on the text It is unfortunate that a number of errors have crept into quotations from plays, but these will no doubt be purged in later editions

Dr Percy Simpson has collected together a number of his essays which have previously appeared in print, added two new ones to them, and produced a book full of variety and interest (see Chapter VIII) [2] The articles on Shakespeare's Use of Latin Versification, on Shakespeare's Versification (intended for the general reader rather than for the specialist), and on the 'Headless Bear' in Shakespeare and Burton are not strictly the concern of this chapter Then follows an article on Marlowe's *Dr Faustus*, in some respects outdated, as Dr Simpson himself seems to admit in a footnote, by Sir Walter Greg's more recent studies of the texts of the play, but nevertheless full of sound sense, one is grateful that the author 'thought it best to let it stand as written' Probably no one is better qualified to write on Ben Jonson than Dr Simpson, and an essay from him on Jonson's art is sure of eager attention A short but interesting essay follows on Charles I as a dramatic critic, based on notes made by the king in a volume of nine Beaumont and Fletcher plays which once belonged to him, and which is now in the Malone collection of the Bodleian Library The next essay is on the theme of revenge in Elizabethan Tragedy, and the last, a new one, on the Official Control of Tudor and Stuart Printing This last contains a judicious survey of the many aspects of the problem, and a valuable appen-

[1] *The Growth and Structure of Elizabethan Comedy*, by M C Bradbrook Chatto & Windus pp ix+246 18*s*

[2] *Studies in Elizabethan Drama*, by Percy Simpson The Clarendon Press pp 265 25*s*

dix which attempts to give a record of piracy between the years 1550 and 1640, material for this has been taken from existing printed records of the Stationers' Company, and Dr Simpson has also been allowed to see the proofs of Register C, hitherto unavailable, which is being prepared for press by Professor W A Jackson and is to be published by the Bibliographical Society It is good to have such a volume of essays from so distinguished a scholar

From Brussels comes a general survey, in French, of the Elizabethan theatre [3] Romain Sanvic, the author, makes no claim to originality in this work 'Notre dessein n'est pas de faire des découvertes mais de tenir compte de celles qui ont été faites avant nous ' Chapters discuss Shakespeare's predecessors, Shakespeare himself, 'Les émules de Shakespeare', who include Chapman, Jonson, Marston, Dekker, and Heywood, and who are not to be confused with 'Les successeurs de Shakespeare', Webster, Tourneur, Middleton, Beaumont, Fletcher, Massinger, and Ford It is not altogether clear what kind of audience Sanvic had in mind for his book, but surely no intelligent reader of Elizabethan drama, whatever his native language, needs to have the titles of the plays and the quotations from them translated into that language, as they are translated here into French, 'Demain, et puis demain et puis encore demain' falls strangely on the ear and does little justice to the original

To the series of Jesuit Studies from Loyola University has been added a book on Deception in Elizabethan Comedy by John V Curry, S J [4] On the very first page Father Curry makes clear his basic assumption, that 'if there was anything the Elizabethans loved to see on the stage, it was a play which gave them plenty of tricks, devices, and mad hieroglyphics' Whether these tricks and stratagems were purely comic in intention or had some more sinister motive was beside the point Father Curry has carried out a systematic examination of a very considerable number of plays between 1553 and 1616, and has considered the deliberate use of deception from several aspects He deals with the agents of deception and the objectives which they seek, ranging from the simple mischief-makers to the rogues and revengers, the victims of deception, whether the principals or the duped accomplices of the agents, the occasions on which a stratagem misfires and the deceiver falls into his own trap, the methods of carrying out the intended deception, and the way in which deception appealed to the audience Father Curry finds in all these aspects considerably more variety than is generally supposed to exist, there is no recognizable 'type' of the deceiver Although at times one feels that the author shows an excess of zeal for classification, the book is interesting, entertaining, and valuable

Professor Wolfgang Clemen's contributions to Shakespearian and other Elizabethan studies are well known, and it is pleasant to be able to welcome another book from him, concerned for the most part with Shakespeare's predecessors in the drama [5] Clemen approaches his subject through a detailed and well-documented examination of dramatic speech, its style and its structure, and its relation to plot and characterization The first section of the book deals with the

[3] *Le Théâtre élisabethain*, by Romain Sanvic Brussels Office de Publicité, S A , Éditeurs pp 136

[4] *Deception in Elizabethan Comedy*, by John V Curry, S J Chicago Loyola U P pp ix+197 $3 50

[5] *Die Tragodie vor Shakespeare Ihre Entwicklung im Spiegel der dramatischen Rede*, by Wolfgang Clemen Heidelberg Quelle und Meyer pp 270 DM 15

theory and practice of dramatic speech in ancient and Renaissance times and usefully collects together a wide range of material The second section really gets down to business, with an analysis of individual plays, extending from the academic drama, and including the more popular dramatic traditions, and Kyd, Marlowe, Peele, and Greene, and some of the anonymous plays of the period At the core of each analysis is the relationship between dramatic speech and the other elements in the play, and Clemen traces the line of development from a situation in which speech is practically unrelated to the other elements, to one in which it becomes fully integrated with plot, character, and situation It is interesting to note, in view of what has already been said by Miss Bradbrook about the coalescing of popular and learned comic traditions in Shakespeare, that Clemen finds a similar process taking place in tragedy In the third section of the book he deals with one form of dramatic speech in particular, the conventional tragic lament, and although so vast a subject necessarily suffers a little from its compressed treatment here Clemen has some valuable things to say A good English translation of this book would ensure that it reached a wider public in this country, and there is no doubt that it should

In 1933 an edition of Marlowe's *Edward II*, edited by H B Charlton and R D Waller, was published by Methuen as part of the series *The Works and Life of Christopher Marlowe* under the general editorship of R H Case A second edition of *Edward II* now appears, with revisions by F N Lees [6] The text presented is that of the original editors, and the original introduction, apparatus, and bibliography are retained with necessary corrections. The reviser's material appears at the end of the volume, divided into the same sections as the original material, and asterisks have been used to mark the points in the original material at which reference to the new material is suggested In general it seems that the original edition has stood up well to the passage of time, and the current surge of interest in Marlowe makes its reappearance in this form welcome

'I may possibly be taken to task', says Dr Schoenbaum modestly in the preface to his book on Middleton,[7] 'for writing at length on two anonymous plays which have in the past been attributed to Middleton but by no means universally accepted as his work ' He could well have omitted *possibly*, the two plays in question being *The Revenger's Tragedy* and *The Second Maiden's Tragedy* The attribution of these two plays to Middleton is, of course, only part of the book, although one suspects that to Schoenbaum it is perhaps the most important part, an entire chapter is devoted to the authorship problem in each play and, lacking much in the way of external evidence, Schoenbaum lays great stress on various kinds of internal evidence, 'on an examination of diction, metrics, imagery, parallels of thought and expression, and other stylistic peculiarities', although, as he admits, such investigations have been attacked as untrustworthy Certainly he has made a valiant effort to amass evidence and to present it forcibly, and if his arguments lack conviction, if one feels at times that enthusiasm has overcome discretion, it is good that these matters should have been ventilated The rest of the book deals,

[6] *Edward II*, edited by H B Charlton and R D Waller Second edition revised by F N Lees Methuen pp ix+244 18*s*

[7] *Middleton's Tragedies A Critical Study*, by Samuel Schoenbaum New York Columbia U P and O U P pp ix+275 $4 50 36*s*

as its sub-title suggests, with a critical assessment of Middleton's tragedies—an analysis of sources, a study of characterization and of Middleton's 'ironic method, which is an expression of the dramatist's morality and the most striking single feature of his work' It is of interest to know that Schoenbaum plans further work on Middleton and also on the use and validity of internal evidence in settling questions of authorship

The first volume of Dekker's plays, edited by Professor Fredson Bowers, was noted in *YW* xxxiv 158 and 313 The second volume has now appeared[8] and contains both parts of *The Honest Whore, The Magnificent Entertainment, Westward Ho, Northward Ho,* and *The Whore of Babylon* Bowers explains that the procedures and conventions used in this volume are the same as those explained in his introduction to volume I, with one extension of editorial method required to deal with those plays which have more than one stage of press-correction An important review of the volume, by Sir Walter Greg, appears in *RES* (July 1956) The project which Bowers has undertaken is an arduous but worthy one, for which he deserves the gratitude and the good wishes of all who are concerned with the Elizabethan drama

Last year a French scholar produced a detailed examination of the work of Ford, this year another French scholar, Dr A J Axelrad, presents us with a similar study of Marston[9] Very little is omitted in this thoroughgoing survey of the man and his work, a biography, a study of the poems, an analysis of each of the plays, a consideration of the influences on Marston of Seneca, Montaigne, and Lucan, an examination of his dramatic technique, a classification of character-types and a discussion of each of them, a study of his language and style, and a psychological sketch of Marston himself Appendixes include contemporary documents relevant to the dramatist, and a note on his borrowings from *The Spanish Tragedy* So much detail defies summary, the book is one to be read with care and does valuable service to its subject The review by Professor Leech (*RES*, July 1956) should also be noted

'The tragic vision of John Webster —that knowledge of human suffering which found its expressive form in his twin tragedies, *The White Devil* and *The Duchess of Malfi*' is the subject of a book by Travis Bogard[10] He is dissatisfied with the general critical opinion that Webster may be viewed as an imitator of Shakespeare, and contends that in his dramaturgy he is 'closer to the didactic manner of George Chapman and the satiric style of John Marston' Two chapters of the book are devoted to these parallels and the evidence which Bogard adduces is illuminating Webster's tragic characters are studied in detail, and the conclusion offered that Webster's greatness lies in the fact that although he saw the world with both pity and contempt, 'he remained faithful to his vision by blending two almost incompatible genres, tragedy and satire'

H J Oliver's book on Ford[11] is intended to be primarily a critical assessment of the dramatist's work Ford is considered first in relation to his age, and Oliver insists that to read his plays in isolation is to examine a

[8] *The Dramatic Works of Thomas Dekker*, edited by Fredson Bowers Volume II C U P pp vii+592 40*s*

[9] *Un Malcontent Elizabéthain John Marston (1576–1634)*, by A J Axelrad Paris Didier pp 351 1,500 fr

[10] *The Tragic Satire of John Webster*, by Travis Bogard Univ of California Press and C U P pp xii+158 26*s*

[11] *The Problem of John Ford*, by H J Oliver Melbourne U P and C U P pp vii+146 25*s*

conclusion without a beginning, he sees him coming at the end of a very long and unbroken dramatic tradition of which he himself had excellent knowledge, and a similar knowledge of which he assumed in at least the better part of his audience There are differences, of course, between the age of Shakespeare and that of Ford, but Oliver feels that it is a mistake to exaggerate them He examines Ford's non-dramatic work first, and claims that we can deduce from it 'how purely dramatic Ford's genius was' The plays written in collaboration are discussed next, then Ford's own plays, and finally Oliver has a chapter in which he attempts to sum up Ford's achievement Unfortunately the nature of the problem mentioned in the title does not appear to emerge clearly

The Malone Society continues to publish scholarly editions and reprints of Elizabethan plays This year it has issued two volumes to its members, the first, *Dick of Devonshire*, edited from British Museum MS Egerton 1994 by J G and M R McManaway, the second, *July and Julian*, edited from MS 448 16 in the Folger Shakespeare Library by Dr Giles Dawson Both volumes present extremely accurate texts and authoritative discussions of the manuscripts, questions of dating, authorship, and so forth In the case of the former play it is of interest to notice that its editors favour Davenport out of a number of contenders for the authorship These are welcome additions to the Society's series

W A Armstrong writes on *The authorship and political meaning of 'Cambises'* (*ES*) He supports the view that the author is Thomas Preston, the distinguished scholar of King's College, Cambridge The style of the play does not really conflict with this identification, and its theme, the manifestation of 'the frutes of tyranny', links up with that of two of Preston's ballads There is evidence that Preston was 'a polemical writer who propagated a consistent body of doctrine concerning kingship, tyranny and the duties of subjects', and Armstrong shows how the play illustrates loyal Anglican doctrines on these matters, these give the play an ethical and polemical interest which was probably more apparent in the sixteenth century than it is now

Writing on *Moral Allegory in Lyly's 'Love's Metamorphosis'* (*SP*), P E Parnell suggests that Lyly's use of allegory is playful rather than consistent, and that to appreciate the plays, in particular the one under discussion, one must read them with 'an unpedantic and slightly wayward imagination' In both his political and his moral allegory there is a delicate fusing of the abstract and the individual, which may seem at times to 'come perilously close to ambiguity' Parnell studies the character antitheses and parallelisms in *Love's Metamorphosis* in considerable detail, and shows how there emerges a fundamental contrast between Insensitivity and Responsiveness to Love, both in varying degrees He claims that the play is 'an astonishingly sane and modern discussion of a perennially interesting topic', with subtlety and distinction of thought breaking through the allegorical machinery

D J Ashe examines *The text of Peele's 'Edward I'* (*SB*) and maintains that Kirschbaum was wrong to identify the 1593 text as a memorially reconstructed one She advances the alternative theory that it represents 'a radical and somewhat unskilful stage revision of a Peele manuscript' Evidence that the author's manuscript was involved in this revision appears she claims, in the subscription at the end of the play ('Yours By George Peele' etc), in the phraseology of the

stage directions, and in the varying designations for the same characters in different portions of the play She believes that the historical sections of the play are in the main Peele's, although severe cutting has taken place, that the musical-farcical scenes probably originated with Peele, although additions have been made, and that the scenes in which Elinor is most vilified were later additions The abridgements were probably made to accommodate the additions, and the general intention of these non-authorial revisions 'must have been to offer *Edward I* as a stronger competitor of currently popular plays'

An article on *The Topicality of 'The Misfortunes of Arthur'* by W A Armstrong (*NQ*) questions a previous interpretation of the play (by E H Waller, *JEGP*, 1925) which identified Arthur with James VI of Scotland and Mordred with the younger Bothwell, and suggests that it is more appropriate to associate Arthur with Elizabeth and Mordred with Mary Queen of Scots Armstrong points out passages which to an audience of 1588 would recall the Babington conspiracy two years earlier in which Mary was implicated He suggests that Arthur's reluctance to do battle with Mordred (which Hughes did not find in his source) reflects Elizabeth's reluctance to execute Mary despite the pressure of her advisers He shows how Hughes also introduced into his plot (in spite of the fact that it was at variance with the Senecan fatalism already there) some elements of the Tudor myth that the Tudors were the direct descendants of Brut and King Arthur

In an article on *'La Tragédie espagnole' de Thomas Kyd et 'Le Cœur brisé' de John Ford* (*Ea*) Felix Carrère argues that a comparison of the two plays reveals a surprising number of parallels in plot, situation, and construction which cannot be the result of mere coincidence At the same time there are significant differences in language and in the dramatists' attitudes to, and treatments of, the various situations

Irving Ribner writes on *Greene's attack on Marlowe some light on 'Alphonsus' and 'Selimus'* (*SP*) He deals with the question why Greene, after slavishly imitating *Tamburlaine* in his *Alphonsus of Arragon*, should have attacked Marlowe's play in his *Perimedes the Blacksmith*, yet imitated it again in his own *Tragical Reign of Selimus* He attempts to explain the apparent inconsistency by suggesting that Greene was taking advantage of the obviously popular elements in *Tamburlaine*, but was in fact imitating only its external qualities, and that his own two plays were intended to be an answer to the philosophy of history and the theory of kingship, alien to orthodox Tudor thought, which Marlowe had advanced in *Tamburlaine* Amurack, for example, is an attempt to portray Marlowe's ideal in its true light, that of an unchristian tyrant, while Alphonsus is exalted as the opposing Christian ideal, while in *Selimus* we have 'a systematic portrait of an inhuman tyrant offered as an example of what must result when Marlowe's ideal of kingship prevails'

The comic scenes in Marlowe's *Dr Faustus* have always been a problem In *The Comic Synthesis in 'Doctor Faustus'* (*ELH*) Robert Ornstein suggests that 'there is more than one level of comedy in the play—that the slapstick scenes which tickled groundling fancies unite with the seemingly fragmented main action to form a subtly ironic tragic design' Marlowe was an imperfect but brilliant innovator in the Elizabethan dramatic practice of making the clowns a *significant* contrast to the tragic hero The intention

of the comedy in this play is both didactic and comic, clarifying our perception of the moral values involved The measure of Faustus's tragic fall is the increasing disparity between his aspirations and his achievements, and the tragedy and the comedy approach each other until 'the difference between hero and clown is one of degree, not kind'

Writing on *Marlowe's 'Edward II' and the Tudor History Play* (*ELH*), Irving Ribner examines this play from the point of view of the Tudor History Play which embodied a conscious philosophy of history, and felt itself free to adapt historical material for contemporary political purposes He finds that the play is not only a carefully constructed tragedy, but also that it does embody a conscious philosophy of history, it shows a movement away from the attitude portrayed in *Tamburlaine* in that it portrays, in Edward and Mortimer, the impossibility of the divorce of public from private virtue, it touches on the nature of kingship and the fact that an absolute monarch must rule justly, on the necessity for the king to have good counsellors, on the importance of the king's relations with his nobles and commoners, on the horrors of a divided kingdom, and on one or two other political issues, all of which were of the greatest importance in Elizabethan England

Waldo F McNeir discusses *The Date of 'A Looking Glass for London'* (*NQ*) He links the play in theme and temper with a number of the moral pamphlets which Greene began to turn out in 1590, and suggests that it was probably written in the latter part of 1589 or the early part of 1590

In *'Arden of Feversham'—An Early Reference* (*NQ*) Glenn H Blayney quotes an early printed reference to the murder which forms the subject of this play in an edition of the *Breviat Chronicle*, printed probably in 1551 or 1552.

Although of major interest to Shakespearian scholars, two articles by Paul E Bennett must be noted here because of their connexion with another Elizabethan play, they are *An apparent allusion to 'Titus Andronicus'* and *The word 'Goths' in 'A Knack to Know a Knave'* (*NQ*) (see Chapter VIII) He discusses the theory that the date of *Titus* must be pushed back to 1592 because of the reference in *A Knack* (1592) to Titus and the Goths, a combination unknown outside the play of *Titus* Bennett suggests that the 1594 text of *A Knack*, the only one available, is a very bad quarto, and that it is wrong to assume that anything which appears in it of necessity appeared in the lost 1592 version He suggests further that the reference to Titus in this play is not to Titus Andronicus but to Titus Vespasianus, Roman emperor A D 78–81, that the passage makes sense only when this identification is made, and that the word *Goths* in the same passage was originally and correctly in the 1592 version *Jews* His admittedly conjectural explanation for the appearance of *Goths* for *Jews* is that Derby's men were reconstructing their memorial version of *A Knack* at the same time (i e Dec 1593) as they were concerned, along with Pembroke's and Sussex's actors (for so he interprets the statement on the title-page of *Titus*) in learning their parts for the first performance of *Titus* in January 1594 Thus the association of Titus with Goths would be 'recent and vivid in their minds'

Leo Kirschbaum writes on *The Texts of 'Mucedorus'* (*MLR*) and produces evidence to show that the editions of 1598 and 1606, published by William Jones, were memorial reconstructions, the same passage is found in slightly varying forms in two

different parts of the play, there is 'inanely repetitive dialogue', lengthy stage-directions suggesting lost dialogue, occasional inexplicable stage action, and so on The edition of 1610 introduces certain additions which are 'good', are due to transcription rather than report, and which were written at least five years after 1598 He alleges that the copyright history of the play shows that it represents a bad quarto which was not entered before publication but which certainly established copyright, not merely in the bad quarto but in the play as such This interpretation of the copyright history is challenged by Sir Walter Greg in a letter published in the July number of *MLR*

In *Middleton's early contact with the law* (*SP*) Peter G Phialas gives an account from depositions in the Public Record Office of the lawsuits which followed the remarriage of Middleton's widowed mother to Thomas Harvey in 1586 Middleton was involved in these, and probably gained a good deal of his knowledge of the law and its terms from them The documents also provide evidence that by the winter of 1600/1 at the latest Middleton had chosen the drama as his profession, and had abandoned his studies at Oxford Phialas suggests that he probably began writing for the stage early in 1600 at the latest, despite the fact that he is first reported as writing for Henslowe in May 1602

Inga-Stina Ekeblad contributes *A textual note on 'The Changeling'* (*NQ*), pointing out that the Mermaid edition of the text prints at v iii 153–4

I that am of your blood was taken from you
For your better health

whereas the 1653 edition (and Dyce and Bullen) print correctly 'I am that of your blood ', using a metaphor from cupping

N W Bawcutt, in *'The Changeling' a source for the sub-plot* (*NQ*), suggests that the Antonio–Franciscus–Isabella–Alibius situation may have been an echo of the Lipsalve–Gudgeon–Mistress Purge–Dr Glister situation of Middleton's earlier play *The Family of Love*

In *Two notes on Thomas Heywood* (*MLR*) Arthur Brown points to a parallel between *The Captives* and Thomas Heywood's *Apology for Actors* which seems to strengthen the assumption of his authorship of the play, and uses the single appearance of the unusual spelling *ey* (for 'aye') in the second edition of *The Four Prentises of London* as evidence that Heywood himself had some part in revising the play for that edition

An article by Edward B Partridge, *The Allusiveness of 'Epicoene'* (*ELH*), studies the language of that play and concludes that it is not quite so direct and unequivocal as some critics have believed The word *epicene* itself, for example, has a variety of meanings and shades of meaning, many of which are exemplified in the different characters of the play, and the language they use to describe themselves and one another emphasizes the interest of the play in beings who have the characteristics of both sexes, and its concern with deviations from a norm Jonson's favourite topic of decorum thus enters the picture, and we find the play examining the question, what is natural and normal for the sexes? Partridge claims that the many adaptations of the play which have 'cleaned up' its allusive language have thereby made it a much tamer and less searching one

The Jonsonian Masque as a Literary Form by D Cunningham (*ELH*) complains that the masques have seldom been accorded the dignity of serious literary efforts Yet when they are carefully examined, and Jonson's own comments on his work taken into

account, it becomes clear that he is working in accordance with serious historical and aesthetic principles (of decorum, hierarchical unity, and ethical purpose) which are the principles of most Elizabethan literature

In *Jonson's 'Perseus upon Pegasus'* (*RES*) G B Johnston comments on Jonson's remark about the Earl of Newcastle in *Underwood* liii 'You shew'd like Perseus upon Pegasus' Strictly speaking Perseus should be Bellerophon, but it has been noted that this switch took place in art even in classical times Jonson is not alone among writers to follow suit, being in the company of Boccaccio, Lydgate, Spenser, Thomas Heywood, and Corneille who explained that he was following the painters and avoiding confusion between Perseus and Mercury John D Reeves follows up this point in *Perseus and the Flying Horse in Peele and Heywood* (*RES*), quoting three more examples in Elizabethan writers of Perseus mounted on Pegasus Peele in *Edward I*, and Heywood in *Troia Brittanica* and in his pageant *Londini Artium et Scientiarum Scaturigo* (in addition to his *Silver Age* already noted by Johnston) Both Peele and Heywood depart farther from strictly classical tradition than does Jonson

From a volume of English Institute Essays entitled *English Stage Comedy*, edited by W K Wimsatt, Jr , must be noted one by Ray L Heffner, Jr , *Unifying Symbols in the Comedy of Ben Jonson* Heffner attempts to define the 'unity of inspiration' which Eliot and others have found in Jonson's comedy, and to describe the dramatic devices by which it is expressed He believes that the essential unity is thematic 'In each of his major plays he explores an idea or a cluster of related ideas through a variety of characters and actions And the central expression of the unifying idea is usually not in a fully developed plot but in a fantastic comic conceit, an extravagant exaggeration of human folly, to which all of the more realistically conceived characters and incidents have reference' *The Silent Woman*, for example, is shown to consist not of a single action, but of a number of separable though related actions, initiated and brought to completion at various points in the play, and skilfully arranged to overlap and interlock The essential movement is the exploration of themes implicit in the central comic conceit of a noise-hating man married to a noisy woman, and the noise and the hatred of noise take on the proportion of symbols In *Bartholomew Fair* Jonson is also investigating diverse aspects of a central problem, what 'warrant' men have or pretend to have for their actions, and this is brought into focus by several concrete symbols of legal sanction Heffner suggests that a comparison between Jonson and the Old Comedy of Aristophanes is perhaps more valid than the usual one between him and the New Comedy of Menander, Plautus, and Terence

In *Shakespeare and Jonson among the pamphleteers of the First Civil War some unreported seventeenth century allusions* (*MP*) Ernest Sirluck lists some references to their plays in a number of civil-war pamphlets He suggests that there was no real decline in the frequency of such allusions during the war, but only a change in their character from the predominantly literary to the predominantly political These allusions also seem to presuppose a fairly detailed knowledge of and a genuine popular acquaintance with the plays, not confined to the royalists but also taken for granted by the Puritan pamphleteers

Last year was noted the first of a series of articles by Gustav Cross

entitled *Some notes on the vocabulary of John Marston* (*NQ*) During the present year Cross has published six more instalments of these notes, listing words which Marston uses in a new or unusual way, words which are unrecorded in the *OED* or which appear in his works earlier than the first recorded example in the *OED*

J C Maxwell writes a short note on *The Relation of 'Macbeth' to 'Sophonisba'* (*NQ*) He sees a possible reflection of Jonson's

When our *Romane* Eagles
Haue fann'd the fire with their labouring wings (*Sejanus*)

in Marston's

three hundred saile
Upon whose tops the *Roman* eagles streached
Their large spread winges, which fan'd the evening ayre
To us cold breath (*Sophonisba*)

Other commentators have already seen a parallel between Marston's lines and Shakespeare's

Where the Norweyan Banners flowt the Skie,
And fanne our people cold
(*Macbeth*)

Maxwell suggests that the probable order of borrowing (if such it is) was Marston from Jonson and Shakespeare from Marston

Some rather improbable suggestions come from R G Howarth to account for *Webster's Vincentio Lauriola* (*NQ*) He sees him as an invention of Webster's, but also sees a possible connexion with Vincentio Saviolio the fencing master, to whom Dekker refers in *The Wonderful Year* 'Death's the best fencer in the world Vincentio Saviolio is no body to him' The change of name, says Howarth, may be a misreading by the dramatist of his own or Dekker's hand, or may be a deliberate alteration to avoid reference to a living fellow-Londoner

Webster's 'wanton boyes' form the subject of a note by Inga-Stina Ekeblad (*NQ*) Attention is drawn to the similarity of the lines spoken by the dying Antonio in *The Duchess of Malfi*,

Like wanton Boyes, whose pastime is their care
We follow after bubbles blowne in th'ayre

and the emblem which appears in Whitney's *A Choice of Emblemes* (1586), depicting a crowd of boys running around trying to catch bubbles, the first four lines of the explanatory text read

The little boyes, that strive with all theire mighte,
To catche the belles, or bubbles, as they fall
In vaine they seeke, for why, they vanish righte
Yet still they strive, and are deluded all

The notion is not peculiar to Whitney, and the suggestion is rather that Webster and the emblem writers were drawing on a common allegorical source, the emblematic character of much of Webster's language has been recognized by other scholars

R W Dent, in *Webster's borrowings from Whetstone* (*MLN*), says that *The Duchess of Malfi* is indebted to Whetstone's *Heptameron of Ciuill Discourses* (1582) for adaptable images and sententiae—but nothing more The most extended and least literal of the few borrowings is from Whetstone's initial debate on 'the difference between the Married state and the single lyfe' (sig C3^{v}) which appears in *The Duchess of Malfi* III ii 31, 'O fie upon this single life ', &c

A detailed examination of *The White Devil* and *The Duchess of Malfi* has been carried out by H T. Price to discover the nature of the imagery in these plays, and he publishes his conclusions in *The function of imagery in Webster* (*PMLA*) He emphasizes Webster's use of a double construction 'he gives us figure in action and figure in language, and

these he fuses so intimately as to make the play one entire figure' In *The White Devil*, for example, much of the imagery (of pandarism, poison, infection, corruption, and so on) is vitally linked with the essential theme of the difference between deceptive appearance and bitter reality, the very title is a figure of this kind The article is too detailed to make for easy summary, but the conclusion is worth quoting 'Figure-in-action and figure-in-word reinforce one another Webster repeats his theme tirelessly, spinning innumerable variations with his figures of the magnificent outer show and the inner corruption, of life, fortune, hopes that look so fair and delude us so utterly, of the many bitter, twisted ironies of the difference between appearance and reality' Price suggests that the only possible comparison is with Shakespeare

In view of the theory of authorship of *The Revenger's Tragedy* put forward by Schoenbaum in his book on Middleton, it is interesting to consider the evidence in *A Note on 'The Revenger's Tragedy'* by Inga-Stina Ekeblad (*NQ*) The argument is that the play not only belonged to the King's Men at the time of printing, but was actually written initially for performance at the Globe, since this alone of the Jacobean playhouses was noted for its use of a blazing star as a stage effect—an effect clearly called for by a stage direction in the play in v iii This militates against the theory that the play is to be identified with Middleton's lost *The Viper and her Brood*, which apparently belonged to a private theatre

Robert Ornstein, in a note on *The Atheist's Tragedy* (*NQ*), tries to find some reason behind the apparently clumsy business of D'Amville's knocking out his own brains at the end of the play He thinks that Tourneur may have had in mind (but not necessarily consciously) Thomas Beard's account of Marlowe's death in *The Theatre of God's Judgement*, where the dramatist is said to have 'stabbed his own dagger into his own head' in the course of a brawl Both incidents suggest the sudden and miraculous intervention of divine justice in that the villainous atheist is mortally wounded in the head by his own weapon in his attempt to kill another man There are also parallels of thought in the play which indicate that Tourneur perhaps had *Faustus* in mind when he was writing it

The authorship of *The Revenger's Tragedy* is discussed again by F W Wadsworth (*MLR*), who calls attention to an article by H H Adams (*JEGP*, 1949) showing that the disapproval of private revenge central to *The Atheist's Tragedy* is present in seminal form in the earlier play Wadsworth has reached a similar conclusion independently, and emphasizes that the apparent glorification of private revenge in *The Revenger's Tragedy* and the Christian abhorrence of it in *The Atheist's Tragedy* are not contradictory but complementary attitudes

A source in Boccaccio for the scene in *The Atheist's Tragedy* in which Levidulcia manages the escape of Sebastian and Fresco from her chamber on the arrival of Belforest is rejected by Jackson I Cope in his *Tourneur's 'Atheist's Tragedy' and the jig of 'Singing Simpkin'* (*MLN*) Instead he suggests that Tourneur probably got the idea from this stage jig, which first appeared in translation in *Engelische Comedien und Tragedien* (1620) and appeared in English, with two additional stanzas, in Cox's *Actaeon and Diana* (1656) There is evidence that the jig is much earlier than these dates, and Cope believes that Tourneur's scene is much closer to it than to Boccaccio's version

Massinger's Imagery is the subject of an article by John O Lyons (*Renaissance Papers*), who argues that in four plays Massinger's use of language 'directly *and* metaphorically relates to the narrative or plot in such a way that it forms a parallel comment on the theme of the play' In *The Duke of Milan* Massinger uses the gourmand's language to re-enforce a sermon on lust, in *The Great Duke of Florence* the serious conflict between the innocence of the country and the wickedness of the court is illustrated by imagery of the health of objects of nature in their natural habitat and their demise on removal to unnatural surroundings, in *A New Way to Pay Old Debts* the recurrent imagery is that of war, weapons, and force, while in *The City Madam* the basic imagery involves clothes

Writing on *Thomas Goffe's 'The Courageous Turke'* (*NQ*) John P Cutts describes it as a play which contains what is probably a unique pre-Restoration dramatic situation in that the tragedy of a bride dying on her wedding night is considerably heightened by the use of music Cutts attempts to resolve the confusion which has existed between the unusually detailed stage-direction calling for the song and music, and the actual words of the song, by reference to its text and musical setting in Christ Church MS 87 (dated 1624), printed by Norman Ault in his *Seventeenth Century Lyrics* He adds a note on the musical setting itself, 'which is perfectly in keeping with the tragedy of the situation which it heightens'

John O'Connor, in *William Warner and Ford's 'Perkin Warbeck'* (*NQ*), suggests that the characterization of Katherine and the creation of Daliell, which have been praised as Ford's original additions to material borrowed from historians, may be derived from Warner's *Albion's England* Book VII of the poem stresses Katherine's loyalty to Perkin, and presents her as a beautiful woman beset by suitors both before and after his death, neither of these notions, both in Ford, appears in any of his historical sources Cutts emphasizes, however, that the relationship is confined to the realm of ideas, and that there are no striking verbal parallels between the play and the poem

O'Connor also writes on *A lost play of Perkin Warbeck* (*MLN*) He quotes a passage from Thomas Gainsford's *History of the Earl of Tyrone* (1619), which suggests that Gainsford had seen a play on the subject of Perkin Warbeck of which no trace now apparently exists What is known of Gainsford's movements suggests that he probably saw the play either in the period 1608–10 or 1614–18 Ford may have known this play, and his own may have been influenced by it, this may explain the very high quality of his *Perkin Warbeck* as compared with his other plays, which has frequently been noted by critics

In *A 'lost' manuscript of Lodowick Carlell's 'Arviragus and Philicia'* (*NQ*) James E Ruoff points out that contrary to general belief there are two manuscripts of this play in existence, one in the Rawlinson collection of the Bodleian Library and the other in the archives of Petworth House, Sussex Neither is the author's original, and neither bears the author's signature The former appears to be 'a presentation copy beautifully transcribed with great accuracy by two professional copyists', the latter a manuscript negligently copied, probably by an inexperienced amateur Ruoff thinks that the second came to Petworth either through Algernon Percy, tenth earl of Northumberland, who had connexions with Carlell, or through Percy's sister, Lucy Hay, Countess of Carlisle, to whom Carlell

may have presented it Margaret Toynbee and Sir Gyles Isham, writing in a subsequent number of *NQ*, support Ruoff's theories by showing that in 1653 Lady Carlisle actually stayed with Lodowick Carlell and his wife Joan at the Old Lodge, Petersham

Glenn H Blayney has two notes on Field's play, *A Woman is a Weathercocke* In the first, *Field's parody of a murder play* (*NQ*), he suggests that in writing this play Field perhaps had in mind some of the exaggerated horrors of plays such as *Arden of Feversham*, *A Warning for Fair Women*, and *Miseries of Inforst Marriage*, and that in one scene at least he was deliberately making fun of them In the second note, *Nathan Field and 'The Faerie Queene'* (*NQ*), he points out the similarity of the theme of romantic love in marriage as it appears in Field's play and in the account of Amoret and Sir Scudamour in Book III of Spenser's poem It is not impossible, he thinks, that Field's character of Scudmore was suggested by Spenser's Sir Scudamour

H R Hoppé prints some useful material from the General Archives at Brussels in *English Acting Companies at the Court of Brussels in the Seventeenth Century* (*RES*) He has made use of three account books which give information about the personnel, activities, and amusements of the court of the Archduke Albert from 1612 to 1618 and the court of the Archduke Leopold William of Austria from 1647 to 1652 The accounts provide evidence for the appearance of English acting companies at these courts in 1614 (possibly John Spencer's or John Greene's), in 1617 (almost certainly the group which included John Waters, Henry Griffin, and Robert Archer), in 1648 (likely to have been John Waite's company, although there are other possibilities), and 1650 (John Waite's company)

The Elizabethan Theatre by Professor F. P Wilson (*N*) is a concise and authoritative account of Elizabethan theatres of various kinds, of their locations, of some problems of Elizabethan staging, and contains some notes on audiences and acting He discusses the great nurseries of Elizabethan drama—the court, the public theatres, and the private theatres—and emphasizes how it was necessary for the dramatist to bear in mind the kind of theatre for which he was writing, conditions varied widely from theatre to theatre, and were bound to influence methods of production He discusses too the various theories which have been advanced about Elizabethan theatre construction, refers to documents in the Public Record Office, as yet unpublished, which provide evidence of a kind not so far fully appreciated, and pleads for a suspension of judgement on these matters until this evidence has been thoroughly examined, 'even then', he adds, 'there may be no room for dogmatism' Finally he gives a summary of various accounts of the content and behaviour of the Elizabethan audiences, and of various acting techniques The paper is a model of sane scholarship applied to a subject which has been in danger of getting out of control

Wilson also contributes some notes on *Court Payments for Plays* (*Bodleian Quarterly Record*) He prints from the Accounts of the Treasurer of the Chamber, preserved in the Rawlinson collection of manuscripts at the Bodleian Library, some additions and corrections to the material printed by E K Chambers in *Elizabethan Stage* for the years 1610–11, 1612–13, and 1616–17

In *Some Jacobean and Caroline dramatic lyrics* (*NQ*) John P Cutts welcomes the study of dramatic songs by W R Bowden (*The English Dramatic Lyric 1603–1642*, Yale U P,

1951), but pleads for a more thorough examination of these songs in their original musical settings now that so many of these are coming to light He quotes a few examples to show how the dramatic value of the songs is more fully appreciated when they are studied in this way

X. LATER TUDOR PERIOD, EXCLUDING DRAMA

By ARNOLD DAVENPORT

READERS of *YW* will probably have observed that during the last few years a number of scholars have turned their attention to patrons and patronage in the Elizabethan age This year it is the turn of the Earl of Leicester to be studied as a patron of letters From Eleanor Rosenberg's detailed study[1] it emerges that, if Leicester and his writers can be taken as representative, as they probably can, the nature and purpose of Elizabethan patronage were significantly different from what we have generally assumed them to be In the first place, to base our ideas on the dedications of *belles lettres* and creative literature alone leads to a distorted picture If less exalted publications are included—dictionaries, textbooks, compilations, translations, religious polemic, and the like—patronage begins to appear more like a co-operation of patron and writer in the furthering of a common policy Writers seek a given patron because he shares an interest in the cause they represent, they desire his approval, not only or mainly for protection and financial reward, but for preferment in a régime of which they approve and in which he is influential, and the patron accepts and rewards dedications with an eye on the likely social and political influence of the book, not because he is either vain or disinterestedly concerned to support good writing Although the old tradition that nobles encouraged the arts survived, a new utilitarian purpose had become more important it was incumbent on Elizabeth's noblemen, as governors of the realm, to control and direct public opinion through printed books It is suggested that in some fields the duty of patronage was quasi-officially delegated by the government, as for instance to Leicester in the case of anti-Jesuit propaganda, or to Ralegh in the 'publicity campaign for New World ventures', but usually the system was not deliberately organized A main thesis of the book is that the English Renaissance owes more than has been generally realized to the development of the Tudor organization of the state, and another main point is that patronage was far from being in decay and moribund, though this has often been asserted In fact, it is claimed, Elizabethan patrons 'accomplished no less than a broad popularization of learning', and among them Leicester was one of the most interested and liberal An examination of the books Leicester patronized and of the motives and purposes revealed in the dedications occupies the greater part of this interesting volume, which contains much miscellaneous information not easily available elsewhere, particularly about the more obscure writers who dedicated to Leicester

Although A L Sells's book[2] on the Italian influence on English poetry is a 'general' one (see Chapter VIII) it cannot be omitted here since more than half of it discusses writers we are concerned with There are useful accounts of the Italian denizens and

[1] *Leicester, Patron of Letters*, by Eleanor Rosenberg Columbia U P and O U P pp xx+395 $5 25 42*s*

[2] *The Italian Influence in English Poetry from Chaucer to Southwell*, by A Lytton Sells Allen & Unwin pp 346 30*s*

translators (Florio particularly), a study of Sidney's visit to Italy and of the 'triumph of Petrarch' in his poetry, especially in *Astrophel and Stella*, 'probably the nearest approach we have in English to the work of Petrarch', a substantial chapter on Spenser's debts to Mantuan and Ficino in the *Calender* and the *Hymnes*, to Machiavelli, Trissino, Tasso, and above all Ariosto in *The Faerie Queene* (in which Sells also sees similarities to the great Italian painters of the Renaissance), and to Petrarch and Tasso in the *Amoretti*, a chapter that looks at the Elizabethan sonnet-sequences and another that surveys the Italian influence in songs, madrigals, and occasional verse, a special study of Drayton, who 'never plagiarizes and rarely imitates', but is a true disciple of the Italians in the ideas he celebrates and makes more and more English, a chapter on the relationship between the thought of Fulke Greville and that of Machiavelli, and lastly a discussion of Southwell and his debt, in *St Peters Complaint*, to Tansillo's *Lagrime di S Pietro* Sells joins the increasing number of critics who have recently been urging that Southwell is a much more important poet and influence on poetry than is generally recognized

P Thomson, in an article on *Petrarch and the Elizabethans* (*English*), agrees independently with one of Sells's points After commenting on some of the characteristics of the Petrarchan heroine in Petrarch himself and in the Elizabethan sonneteers, he goes on to suggest that Petrarch's most important influence is not to be found in the conceits and devices borrowed from him, but in the inspiration that the imaginative and emotional qualities of his best poetry gave to good poets throughout Europe

Schwartz's book[3] on the problems of translating the Bible is chiefly concerned with these problems as they affected the great continental translators and Reformers, but it is here mentioned as a very informative contribution to the study of the background of the English translations

A book that has to be mentioned for similar reasons is G Donaldson's study of the Scottish Prayer Book[4] The headings of his chapters indicate the contents The Prayer Book in Scotland before 1600, liturgical revision, 1601–25, the composition of the Prayer Book of 1637 It is argued that the changes in the Prayer Book are not merely Laudian they are serious attempts to 'incorporate existing Scottish usages or preferences and to conciliate Scottish prejudices' The volume also contains a reprint of the 1637 Prayer Book, and collations of it with three manuscript drafts, of which one, a printed English Prayer Book of 1631, revised in manuscript, has recently been found in the library of the Earl of Haddington

To conclude this survey of the thin crop of work on general topics, though indeed it has been a lean year for this chapter all round, we may group together a few short notices In *Classical Histories and Elizabethan Soldiers* (*NQ*) H J Webb notes the conflict of opinion between those who held that the classical literature of warfare was the best school for soldiers and those who, maintaining that experience on the modern battlefield was the only sound training, scorned the Roman and Greek disciplines Material relevant to this chapter and the next will be found in R J Clements's *Iconography on the Nature and Inspiration of Poetry in Renaissance Emblem*

[3] *Principles and Problems of Biblical Translation*, by W Schwartz CUP pp xiv+225 25*s*

[4] *The Making of the Scottish Prayer Book of 1637*, by Gordon Donaldson Edinburgh UP pp xii+364 25*s*

Literature (*PMLA*) (see Chapter VII) Three publications on the confines of literature and history by Anna M Crinò have been received They are, first (in *La Bibliofilia*), *Un altro memoriale inedito di Roberto Ridolfi*, an aftermath of the Ridolfi plot, second, *Trenta lettere inedite di Sir Henry Wotton nell'Archivio di Stato di Firenze* (*Rivista di Letterature Moderne e Comparate*), the letters being in Italian, dated from 1601 to 1607, and of biographical interest, third, *Sir Samuel Morland nei suoi rapporti col Granduca Cosimo III di Toscana* (*English Miscellany*), bearing on Anglo-Italian cultural relations in the seventeenth century

Four facsimile reprints, all published by Scholars' Facsimiles and Reprints, can perhaps be acceptably noticed together in spite of chronology W S Crane introduces the reprint of Henry Peacham's *The Garden of Eloquence*,[5] correctly describing it as 'a dictionary' of rhetorical and grammatical terms and rightly remarking that as an exhaustive survey (nearly 200 figures are defined and illustrated) it is a useful tool for those participating in the current revival of interest in Elizabethan Rhetoric The text consists of the pages of the 1577 edition omitted in the later edition, and the whole of the 1593 edition Crane includes in his introduction a brief biography of Peacham, a short account of earlier English books on rhetoric, and a discussion of Peacham's doctrine, sources, and method E H Miller's edition of Greene's *Ciceronis Amor* (1589) with *A Quip for an Upstart Courtier*[6] is particularly welcome since the *Quip* is a facsimile of the first issue of the first edition (1592), not before now reprinted as a whole, and containing five passages omitted in the second edition and the attacks on the Harvey brothers which in the second issue were cancelled and the pages reset The black-letter type is rather battered, but mostly legible without much difficulty The *Ciceronis Amor* is an example of Greene's floridly written romance and contrasts interestingly with the vivacious realism and the pungent style of the *Quip* Both are valuable additions to our shelves since other editions are not at all easy to come by These two books were published in 1954 but arrived too late to be noticed last year G Kish introduces a facsimile of Arthur Golding's translation of Solinus which was printed, with the title *The Excellent and Pleasant Worke of Julius Solinus Polyhistor*, in 1587[7] The *Collectanea Rerum Memorabilium* has evident defects It is scrappy, it contains a good deal of nonsense, and most of its material is taken second-hand from Pliny But Solinus was, thanks to his love of the marvellous, a popular author, and was accepted as an authority all through our period Golding's prose is as undistinguished as his verse (*pace* some modern admirers) and it is as a useful book of reference, not as a work of art, that this translation will be welcome to Elizabethan scholars Introducing the *Essaies*[8] of Robert Johnson, R H Bowers tentatively suggests that his author was neither the musician bearing that name, nor the archdeacon of Leicester, but the Robert Johnson who was a Fellow of King's

[5] *The Garden of Eloquence*, by Henry Peacham, ed by William S Crane pp 24 +facsimile+4 $7 50 The address of Scholars' Facsimiles is not in English books of reference It is 118 N W 26th Street, Gainesville, Florida

[6] *'Ciceronis Amor' and 'A Quip for an Upstart Courtier'*, by Robert Greene, ed by Edwin Haviland Miller pp 9+facsimiles $6

[7] *The Excellent and Pleasant Worke Collectanea Rerum Memorabilium of Caius Julius Solinus*, tr by Arthur Golding, ed by George Kish pp 6+facsimile $7 50

[8] *Essaies or Rather Imperfect Offers*, by Robert Johnson, ed by Robert Hood Bowers pp 10+facsimile $5

College, Cambridge The *Essaies* were first printed in 1601, but the edition of 1607 is the one reproduced as being better suited to photographic facsimile (We are told by the editor that there are no significant variants in 1601) There were further editions in 1610 and 1638 Bowers points out that Johnson writes serious moral counsels in the Baconian manner, not the familiar essay of the Montaigne tradition There is a neo-stoic temper pervading the essays, but no very profound or original insight, and none of the sixteen pieces in the book rises much above the commonplace in either style or matter, but they are worth reading as expressions of late-Elizabethan thought It is interesting to observe a few Baconisms such as 'There is more certainty in the principles of practise, then in the most necessarie demonstrations, or clearest discourses of reason', or, 'The true Schoole of Warre, is the field, not the Chamber the teacher is vse'

M F Reidy has contributed to the series *Jesuit Studies* a volume[9] on Lancelot Andrewes as a preacher As students of literature we are, naturally, most interested in the excellent chapters on Andrewes's methods and procedures as a writer of sermons and on his qualities as a prose artist, but the book as a whole is of interest and deals with several important topics as the chapter headings will indicate Andrewes on the Church, Redemption, the Supernatural, Morals and Asceticism, Political Theory But though Andrewes dealt with most of the problems of his age, 'defending the doctrinal, the liturgical, and the disciplinary where he saw a need for defence, [he] rather emphasized the moral content and consequences of the doctrine he preached' Reidy thinks highly of Andrewes as a preacher, but finds that habits kept under control in the early sermons developed into faults in the later ones which are sometimes rugged and cramped, 'difficult, tangled, almost tortured' in style

One part of Andrewes's political thought is the subject of a paper called *Lancelot Andrewes and the Nature of Kingship* (*Church Quarterly Review*) by P A Welsby It is argued (agreeing independently with Reidy) against what is often said, that Andrewes was quite as thoroughgoing as any of his brother bishops in upholding the Divine Right, and Welsby finds that 'a lack of moral courage, particularly in any matter connected with royal authority' was one of 'the grave weaknesses of his character' This agrees with Reidy's comment on 'the disgustingly adulatory addresses to James' with which the sermons on Kingship end

Andrewes is also a figure in a curious episode related in William Weston's autobiography which P Caraman, encouraged, no doubt, by the success of his edition of Gerard's autobiography (*YW* xxxii 159), has translated and edited in the same manner[10] The translation, from the Latin original, reads easily and pleasantly, and each chapter is followed by generous notes elucidating the references and giving supplementary information The biography itself is interesting, for Weston, Jesuit, Missionary to England, and mystic, is an interesting personality He is also of literary interest since he was concerned in the exorcisms attacked by

[9] *Bishop Lancelot Andrewes, Jacobean Court Preacher, A Study in Early Seventeenth-Century Religious Thought,* by Maurice F Reidy, S J Loyola U P pp xiii+237 $3 50

[10] *William Weston, The Autobiography of an Elizabethan,* trans and ed by Philip Caraman, with a foreword by Evelyn Waugh Longmans Green pp xxxii+259 21*s*

Harsnet whose book was used by Shakespeare for the devil names in *King Lear*

Still pursuing his researches into the topical references in *The Shepheardes Calender*, P E McLane writes this year on *Spenser's Oak and Briar* (*SP*) The Oak in the February eclogue he takes to be Leicester and the Briar to be the Earl of Oxford, with reference to the positions of these two noblemen in the late summer and early autumn of 1579 He admits that his theory will not accommodate lines 207–13, and that it implies some last-minute work by Spenser before sending the manuscript to the printer The 'morall and generall' theme of the eclogue he takes to be 'the Queen's policy of capricious ingratitude towards elder statesmen, especially such men as Walsingham and Henry Sidney' The theory is interesting, but in view of the other plausible solutions extant, it must be judged 'not proven' McLane also discusses *Spenser's Cuddie* (*JEGP*) and argues that this character in the February, August, and October eclogues is Edward Dyer, and that he is probably the Cuddie of *Colin Clout* as well As McLane admits, the evidence he gives does not prove this identification, but only makes it a possible one

C E Mounts, while accepting Jenkins's view (see *YW* xxxiii 154) that Elizabeth Boyle is the beloved celebrated, suggests that there are still *Two Rosalinds in 'Colin Clouts Come Home Againe'* (*NQ*)—that the passage on the Rosalind of line 940 is a reference to his dead wife Machabyas Childe.

There is not much to record on *The Faerie Queene* R Hoopes's article about Nature and Grace in Spenser's thought (see *YW* xxxv 122) has caused some discussion A S P. Woodhouse contributes to *RES* (pp 284 sqq) *A Rejoinder* to the criticisms Hoopes had made of Woodhouse's theory (see *YW* xxx 144) and adds some criticisms of the theory Hoopes would substitute E Sirluck also joins in (ibid , pp 401 sqq) with objections to Hoopes's interpretation of his views about *F Q* II (for which see *YW* xxxii 163)

It is not easy to convey in a few lines the point of H C Chang's book on Spenser [11] The novelty consists in the line of approach and the quality of the response to *The Faerie Queene* Chang brings to the poem a Chinese mind grounded in Chinese culture and literature, and it is interesting to see Spenser through such a person's eyes He has, moreover, some interesting comparisons to make The book is in two parts The first consists of a translation of a lengthy episode from a Chinese novel The episode represents in allegory the onset of and the struggle with temptation of the senses, and the purpose of the translation is to allow us to compare the mode of allegory used with the kind of allegory we find in *The Faerie Queene*, and in particular with the allegory of Book II Two modes of allegory are involved In one, the incidents of the story actually illustrate the moral conflict, in the other, the conflicting virtues and vices are projected as personifications Both modes are to some extent used in both examples of allegory, but the Chinese relies almost exclusively on illustration and the English on personification Two further chapters of the book discuss, first, the similarities between *The Faerie Queene* and *Arcadia* as examples of a common tradition, and second, the aesthetic effect of 'shadowing forth' real persons, as for example Ralegh in the guise of Timias the Squire The matter of the third discussion is indicated by the title 'Spenser's ideal of Courtesy A Chinese

[11] *Allegory and Courtesy in Spenser A Chinese View*, by H C Chang Edinburgh U P pp x+227 18*s*

View' Here Western Courtesy and Chinese ritual of manners are compared The conclusion may be quoted 'The needs of all men are the same decorous conduct and spontaneous feelings, virtue but also individuality and joy and beauty Courtesy brings delight, ritual makes for reverence While Courtesy seeks yet a moral foundation, Grace [in its aesthetic, not its theological sense] is yet its basis for beautiful self-expression. Ritual, which is rooted in human relationships, is sufficient in itself for the regulation of conduct and even of feelings, but it dispenses with this aesthetic basis to its own impoverishment'

Lyle Glazier has three main points to make in his essay on *The Nature of Spenser's Imagery* (*MLQ*) First, while Spenser is justly praised as a pictorial poet, it is wrong to say, as some critics have done, that he uses a painter's technique in fact there is little painter's use of colour, line, and mass, and many of his effects are of a kind that a painter could not, by the very nature of his medium, employ Secondly, while Spenser can, on occasion, use an image or a metaphor that has a compressed tension and range of significance such as often flashes out of Shakespeare's poetry, that is not his usual way *The Faerie Queene* is almost as bare of local imagery and metaphor as Chaucer's poetry To blame it for this is a critical error, and it is an error that arises because, for whatever reason, our age is unable to admire or even respond to the gradual, cumulative tension that requires the length of *The Faerie Queene* to develop in Hence it is Glazier's third point that the cumulative tension between factual narration and allegorical significance makes the whole body, rather than the local surface, of the poem metaphorical, and that it is the aesthetic tension set up by the large-scale pattern of conflicting good and evil that Spenser aimed at 'Reading *The Faerie Queene* should be like listening to music If you had the notion that every phrase in Bach and Mozart were meant to convey some visual image, you would soon exhaust yourself with your own ingenuity, while the music itself escaped you On the other hand, if you let the music come at you and state its own case, occupying yourself with the sensuous pleasure of melody and the intellectual pleasure of harmony and counterpoint, the music would be yours'

W J B Owen, continuing his researches in the narrative structure of *The Faerie Queene*, argues, in *Narrative Logic and Imitation in 'The Faerie Queene'* (*CL*), that the errors of logic in the narrative are not the result of revisions Spenser was chiefly concerned to produce a poem in the heroic genre and, in imitating the structure and material of *Orlando Furioso*, failed to achieve a logical coherence of incidents comparable to Ariosto's

C Huckabay discusses (*SN*) *The Structure of Book IV of 'The Faerie Queene'* Disagreeing with many scholars who have failed to find any unity of theme or plot in this book, Huckabay deals with it canto by canto and argues that the Friendship celebrated is the Christian, not the secular or pagan virtue, and that in view of this it can be seen that in the first half of the book the emphasis lies upon representatives of the forces inimicable to friendship, although examples of true friendship also occur, and symbols of concord are sprinkled about In the second half of the book the powers favourable to friendship gather strength, and the book culminates in the triumph of concord The structure of the book, he argues, is fundamentally the same as that of Book I, where also the first half shows

Evil in power and the second half shows the approaching strength of Holiness until the contest culminates in Red Cross's destruction of the Dragon

Continuing his statistical investigations of rhyme, Ants Oras contributes to *JEGP* a long and complicated study of *Intensified Rhyme Links in 'The Faerie Queene' An Aspect of Elizabethan Rhymecraft* By 'intensified' rhyme is meant 'phonetic correspondences preceding the last metrically stressed vowel' Spenser, it appears, deliberately employed a subtle and sophisticated technique of rhyming, utilizing for 'gentle gradation and harmony of sound for leisurely balance' such enriched rhymes as *strive drive, swound stownd, beheld befeld*

R M Smith collects some miscellaneous material about crosses in a paper called *Origines Arthurianae The Two Crosses of Spenser's Red Cross Knight* (*JEGP*), but is particularly concerned to suggest that Spenser was influenced by seeing the English soldiers in Ireland wearing two red crosses They were enjoined to do so by a proclamation issued by Sir William Pelham in 1579, which Spenser possibly read The suggestion that Pelham is also the Sir Sergis of *F Q* v 11–12 is supported by citations from some unpublished documents

'Those Two Brethren Giants' (F Q II xi 15) are interpreted (*MLN*) by A Gilbert as the 'two warrior hands' of the body allegorized as a castle

There are two items on Ralegh P Lefranc discusses and edits *Un Inédit de Ralegh sur la Conduite de la Guerre (1596–1597)* (*Ea*) from a Cotton manuscript, somewhat damaged by the fire of 1731 It is not in Ralegh's hand, but his name is subscribed, and Lefranc adduces some striking parallels between passages of this text and Ralegh's other work The date assigned to the composition is between November 1596 and April 1597 It deals with the proper measures to be taken against the anticipated invasion of England by the Spaniards *The Larger Landscape A Study of Certain Images in Ralegh* (*EC*) by Joyce Horner notes how little sea imagery there is in Ralegh's poetry Even in *The Ocean to Cynthia*, the ideas suggested by the title are used hardly at all in the poem Its images are of the earth, of a winter world They are part conventional, part vivid recollections of Devon, but violence breaks through them from time to time and reveals a vaster scene of decay and death It is the poem of a man 'now wasting for want of use, a proud man, who cannot contemplate his fall, yet has to'. Ralegh responded imaginatively to the vast and the powerful forces of nature, but he shows little sign in verse or prose that the ocean particularly struck him as a manifestation of them, it is nature in wide lands, mother Earth, that stirs his feelings

The quatercentenary of Sidney's birth in 1554 appears to have provoked less activity than one might have expected F S Boas's book[12] on him does not address itself to scholars or to specialists and does not profess to offer new facts or radically new interpretations The aim is to share with the general cultivated reader the impression left by Sidney's personality and works on a mind mature in scholarship and mellowed by long familiarity with the Elizabethan age The first six chapters survey the earlier life of Sidney *The Lady of May* is given a brief chapter to itself since Boas thinks it shows sufficient command of dialogue and characterization to make it regrettable that Sidney never attempted more serious dramatic

[12] *Sir Philip Sidney, Representative Elizabethan*, by Frederick S Boas Staples pp 204 15*s*

work Two chapters on *The Defence of Poesie* are concerned first, to point out the profundity and permanent interest of Sidney's theory of poetry, and secondly, to regret the wrongheadedness of his treatment of contemporary drama The eleven chapters on *Arcadia* are mostly taken up with tracing the narrative of the 'old' and then of the revised version of the romance, but Boas also gives his reasons for thinking the old version the better There follow two chapters on *Astrophel and Stella*, indicating, with ample quotation, the themes, moods, and technique of the sequence The final six chapters narrate the later life of Sidney, his death and funeral, and the national grief at his death, and the whole concludes with a summing up in which Boas describes Sidney as a 'representative Elizabethan', combining 'superlative personal magnetism' and genius, and all the more representative for his impulsiveness, that showed itself in some passages of his life, and for such an anomaly as 'the complete detachment of *Astrophel and Stella* from the other Sidney material, documentary or literary'

Reviewing (fairly favourably) John Buxton's book on Sidney (see *YW* xxxv 123) R W Zandvoort gives (*ES*, p 37) some information about Dutch translations of Sidney's works

W H Bond prints, translates from the Latin, and comments on *A Letter of Languet about Sidney* (*HLB*) which has not hitherto been published It is to a certain Dr Glauberg of Frankfort, and among other things it commends Sidney to the Doctor's good offices and authorizes the disbursement of as much money as Sidney may ask for 'out of what you owe me' —a proof, as Bond remarks, of Languet's affection for and trust in Sidney Sidney and Languet are the persons dealt with in an essay called *An Elizabethan Friendship* (*Contemporary Review*, vol 188) by Theodora Roscoe, which tells us no new facts but stresses the genuine warmth of feeling between the two men, which could express itself in gay humour and gentle teasing.

D P Walker's article (in *Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance*) is mentioned here because, as its title states, it hangs on a passage in *Arcadia*, but *Ways of Dealing with Atheists A Background to Pamela's Refutation of Cecropia* is mostly occupied in discussing other statements of the ideas that Sidney puts into Pamela's mouth, and Hooker, Parsons, Lyly, Greene, Nashe, besides numerous foreign authors, come in

In *Sidney and Harington as Opponents of Superstition* (*JEGP*) M S Goldman considers the treatment of soothsayers and astrologers in the *Arcadia* They are contemned because their arts lead to vain attempts to avoid dangers which weak men may not have the courage to face Evidence is cited from Moffet's *Nobilis* that Sidney himself despised astrologers, in spite of his visits to Doctor Dee, and wrote about it severely to persuade his friends to be less credulous Sir John Harington's sceptical attitude towards astrology, witchcraft, and prophecy, it is suggested, may show that Sidney's precept and example were not without effect on at least one younger courtier

James Applegate has a note on *Sidney's Classical Meters* (*MLN*) in which, among other points, he identifies the metres of the quantitative poems

K M Murphy considers the question of *The 109th and 110th Sonnets of 'Astrophel and Stella'* (*PQ*) He points out, not for the first time, that these two sonnets were subjoined to the sequence and numbered as part of it by Grosart, without any authority

whatever. Murphy suggests that Grosart was prompted by the desire to represent Sidney as ending on a suitably Victorian high moral note. But, as Hallet Smith has earlier suggested, the two sonnets do not follow logically after the last of the real sequence, and moreover, one of them is in the Shakespearian form, which Sidney uses nowhere else in the series The conclusion is that though these two sonnets may well be inspired by the relationship with Stella, they are not and were never intended to be parts of *Astrophel and Stella*

Klemens Newels (*Ang*, 72 iv) calls attention to *Eine spanische Übersetzung der 'Defence of Poesie' von Sir Philip Sidney* It is MS 3908 in the Bibliotéca Nacional, apparently of the early seventeenth century, and has not hitherto been recognized as a translation from Sidney

A description of a *Sidney Exhibition* (*Bodleian Library Record*) by John Buxton should be mentioned

Writing on the Stanyhurst famous for his hexametrical translations from the *Aeneid*, H R Hoppé shows, from entries in the Archduke Albert's household accounts preserved in the General Archives at Brussels, that *The Period of Richard Stanyhurst's Chaplaincy to the Archduke Albert* (*Biographical Studies*, Arundel Press, iii 2) began on 29 June 1607 and that he remained in the service of the Archduke and the Infanta Isabella at least until 2 July 1618, shortly after which date he appears to have died

D W Becker points out (*NQ*) *An Error in Hakluyt* Hakluyt in his account of the Crusades confuses Ranulf de Glanville of the twelfth century with Randulph de Blundeville of the thirteenth

The Cause of the Trojan War, According to Peele (*NQ*) was the plight of the Earth, unable to sustain the growing multitude of human beings She was relieved by the gods' encouraging the outbreak of a destructive war The classical authority for this view, J. D Reeves suggests, was Euripides, in *Orestes* and *Helen*

Sarah C. Dodson contributes to *The University of Texas Studies in English* a discussion of *Abraham Fleming, Writer and Editor* Fleming was the editor of Holinshed, but also produced a large number of translations and compilations of various sorts He was not a very good writer, but had some virtues as a scholar

W N King takes issue with Duhamel's conclusion (see *YW* xxix 174) that Lyly uses rhetorical amplification, not to provide probative arguments, but merely to decorate, and that he shows little care for cogent logic The passages on which such a conclusion are based are, King argues in *John Lyly and Elizabethan Rhetoric* (*SP*), indeed weak in logic, but the argument of *Euphues* as a whole demands that they should be logically feeble More generally, King urges that passages of Elizabethan rhetoric should not be analysed in isolation without reference to their setting and their purpose in the work as a whole

Bacon has received little attention Rosalie L Colie writes on *Cornelis Drebbel and Salomon de Caus* (*HLQ*), two scientists, the first Dutch, the second French, who settled in England and engaged in scientific experiments very similar to those Bacon was to describe in his account of Solomon's House in *The New Atlantis* Their work may possibly have suggested some of Bacon's ideas Dorothea Krook discusses (*HLQ*) the influence of Bacon and the transformation of his teaching in the work of *Two Baconians Robert Boyle and Joseph Glanville* Mary F Schuster's essay on *Philosophy of Life and Prose Style in Thomas More's 'Richard III' and Francis Bacon's 'Henry VII'* (*PMLA*)

should be mentioned for its pages on Bacon D S. Brewer suggests in *Lucretius and Bacon on Death* (*NQ*) that Lucretius, III 87 sqq may lie behind the opening sentence of the essay on Death

Discussing *Marlowe's Musaeus* (*JEGP*), T W Baldwin shows that at the beginning of *Hero and Leander* Marlowe is keeping his eye on Musaeus, even using the Greek as well as the standard Latin translation, but he embroiders lavishly, and he gradually becomes more and more independent until he is at last telling the story by himself without referring to his authority

Nashe, too, has been rather neglected this year In the Essays for W C Curry (see p 14 above) K B Harder continues (see *YW* xxxiv 184) his study of the relationship of *Nashe and Spenser* While agreeing with the general view that Nashe frequently eulogizes Spenser, Harder holds that there are traces to show that Nashe did not approve of all things Spenserian, and passages of his work are discussed as revealing some acerbity towards the older poet, or towards his views and loyalties Hans Marcus's essay called *Thomas Nash uber Deutschland* (*Ang*) is an account of Jack Wilton's adventures in Germany, which are retold with generous quotations (in translation) from Nashe's text The relation to historical fact of Nashe's version of events and persons is also discussed.

F P Wilson suggests (*HLQ*) in *Dekker, Segar, and Some Others* that the pamphlet that Richard Venner (in *An Apology*, 1614) claimed, falsely, to have written on the Gunpowder Plot was not, as has been thought, Dekker's *The Double PP* but rather *The Blazon of Papistes* (1587) by William Segar, which Venner had learned about from a description of its contents in Barnabe Riche's *The Honestie of this Age* (1614). Wilson shows, incidentally, that Dekker borrowed from Segar for his own book. Other borrowings by Dekker, in his pamphlets on London life, from earlier rogue literature are listed by E H Miller under the title, *Thomas Dekker Hack Writer* (*NQ*)

J Woodrow Hassell, Jr , contributes to *SP* a study of *An Elizabethan Translation of the Tales of Des Périers 'The Mirrour of Mirth', 1583 and 1592* He discusses the two editions and the relation to the French original (on the whole a 'faithful and ably executed translation'), and suggests the possibility that the author, one 'T D ', may have been Thomas Deloney

There remain to be noticed only a few brief notes on some minor works In *MLN* S K Heninger, Jr , has a note on *The Tempestatis Praesagia in Chapman's 'Eugenia'* (1614) in which he discusses the threatening omens which Chapman elaborates in order to distinguish by ostentatious cleverness and erudition his elegy from the contemporary multitude of others Chapman apparently drew on Theophrastus, Aratus, Virgil, and Pliny for his weather-signs In an essay on *Theory and Practice in English Versions of 'Orlando Furioso'* (*University of Texas Studies in English*) Lucetta J Teagarden has some pages on Sir John Harington's translation W F McNeir collects (*NQ*) *Barnfield's Borrowings from Spenser* in his *Cynthia* (1595) McD Emslie discusses the indecent double meaning in the words of the madrigal *'Shoot Falce Loue I Care Not'* (*Explicator*) in Morley's *First Booke of Balletts to Five Voyces* (1595) In *'Nosce Teipsum' and the two John Davies* (*MLR*) R J Schoeck reprints a Latin poem from *Microcosmos* (1603) which plays on the possible confusion of the two names, and adds brief discussion of Davies of Hereford's connexions with

Oxford and of the possible reason why he signed himself 'of Hereford' F B Williams, Jr , in *Robert Tofte an Oxford Man* (*RES*), gives the evidence that Tofte was in fact a member of that university, and he subjoins a few additional facts to his original paper S L Goldberg studies *The First Part of the Life and raigne of King Henrie the IIII (1599) by Sir John Hayward, 'Politic Historian'* (*RES*) as an early example of history which is more interested in analysing causes, motives, and results than in apportioning moral praise or blame Under the title of *Luke Hutton's Repentance* (*University of Pennsylvania Library Chronicle*) M A Shaaber discusses the known facts—some puzzling—of this Elizabethan criminal's life, deals briefly with *The Black Dog of Newgate* (1596) of which he was the purported author, and discusses at more length a manuscript poem called 'Luke Hutton's Repentance' The manuscript gives no details of Hutton's criminal career, but consists of eighty-four stanzas of general exhortation Judging by the forty-five stanzas Shaaber prints, he is right in saying that the poem has little literary merit Without committing himself, Shaaber tends to the opinion that both *The Black Dog* and the *Repentance* were actually written by Hutton, not by some hack making use of a notorious name He suggests that the manuscript may have been copied from print If this is so, here is another book of which no example appears to have survived

XI EARLIER STUART AND THE COMMONWEALTH PERIOD, EXCLUDING DRAMA

By ARNOLD DAVENPORT

ANY student of seventeenth-century literature is struck, if he pauses to consider the matter, by the extent to which his views and critical assessments are indebted to Coleridge, and when a volume appears that assembles Coleridge's comments on that literature it cannot be treated simply as an item of Romantic criticism it is a contribution of importance to seventeenth-century studies and must receive its separate notice here This volume[1] not only offers us a careful text of well-known material, it gathers together from manuscript and other sources a good deal that will be new to most readers, and indeed some of it is here printed for the first time L I Bredvold supplies an introductory essay on Coleridge's general and particular criticisms of seventeenth-century literature, and Roberta F Brinkley introduces each section of the book Under separate headings are collected Coleridge's comments on the century in general, the philosophers, the divines, science, literary prose, poetry, and drama The collection is impressive in both bulk and quality, and the volume is one that all students will cherish since it enables one to consult Coleridge conveniently instead of having to search through a score of rare and not readily accessible books

A Esch's book[2] on the English religious lyric of the seventeenth century does not set out to be a full, general treatment of the whole subject It concentrates on the four great metaphysical religious poets, Donne, Herbert, Crashaw, and Vaughan, but, again, does not profess to deal with anything more than a few special problems posed by their poetry The book begins with a brief description of the attitude of critics to the metaphysicals from Dryden to the most recent scholars, and proceeds to discuss the poems with special attention to the problems of style that had to be solved by the poets Esch's chief interest is to study the structure and form of the lyrics So, on Donne, he is interested in the *La Corona* cycle, in the sonnet-forms used in the *Holy Sonnets*, and in the structure of such poems as *A Litanie* He finds Herbert making use of a tripartite structure of the kind exemplified in *The Bunch of Grapes, Life, The Quip, The Church-floor* In Crashaw he finds three phases the early work characterized by 'wit' and an epigram-like structure, which reaches its climax in the first version of *The Weeper*, the second phase of ecstatic poetry inspired by the mystics, erotic in imagery and structurally influenced by strophic hymn-forms, reaching its climax in the 'Hymn to St Teresa', and the third phase showing Crashaw interested in deeper philosophical problems and using a tauter poetical structure A special chapter is devoted to Crashaw's translations of Latin hymns, and in an appendix the English and Latin are given side by side (as also are *The Weeper* in its original and revised form) On Vaughan, Esch

[1] *Coleridge on the Seventeenth Century*, ed by Roberta Florence Brinkley, with an Introduction by Louis I Bredvold Duke U P and C U P pp xxxviii+704 $12 50 94*s*

[2] *Englische Religiöse Lyrik des 17 Jahrhunderts*, by Arno Esch Tubingen Max Niemeyer pp xi+225 DM 22 50

discusses chiefly Vaughan's attitude to and use of nature in his poetry, not as something to be described simply for pleasure, but as a store-house of analogies, symbols, and object-lessons

Another work of German scholarship, W Monch's *Das Sonett*, cannot be noticed since the publishers could not provide a copy for *YW*

G Walton's 'studies in tone and sensibility in the seventeenth century'[3] consist of a study of Cowley flanked by four more or less related essays The first essay in the book is on the connotations of the word 'wit' in the seventeenth century, and suggests that John Norris of Bemerton is a figure of some interest in the discussion of this topic since he was near enough to be a part of the tradition of 'wit' yet detached enough to be able to make valuable critical comment on the elusive essence of the concept Walton returns to Norris in the seventh chapter which is a plea for the greater recognition of Norris's interest as a poet A chapter on 'the tone of Ben Jonson's poetry' suggests that he anticipated the Augustans in resting on a social poise, unlike the metaphysicals, whose poise was of a spiritual or intellectual nature The essays on Cowley treat him as a transitional figure having links with the Cavalier poets, being at times a 'precursor of the Augustan age', and standing as the best-known representative of the 'decline of Metaphysical poetry' One essay is devoted to the Pindaric Ode in the century and to Cowley's Pindarics in particular, and another deals with Cowley's 'essays' in verse and prose The remaining essay is on the poetry of Marvell It has already appeared in print in a shorter version

G Watson suggests in *Hobbes and the Metaphysical Conceit* (*JHI*) that the sudden and practically complete death of metaphysical poetry about 1660 was in part the result of Hobbes's influence he objected to the conceit—a metaphor linking two objects alike in one respect but 'markedly dissimilar in all others'—on philosophical grounds, and his influence had repercussions on literary fashions

R M Adams analyses, in *Taste and Bad Taste in Metaphysical Poetry Richard Crashaw and Dylan Thomas* (*Hudson Review*), what sound basis there can be for saying that, for instance, Crashaw's notorious passages are in bad taste Even the 'portable and compendious oceans' of *The Weeper* produce a strong effect on the reader, and Crashaw presumably intended the effect produced 'The feeling is to be coloured by a radical sense of absurdity—even to be derived, by a queer kind of negative emphasis, from the absurdity ' Hence it appears to follow, though Adams does not say it in so many words, that the 'bad taste' resides, not in the conceit, but in the effect produced, and it is labelled 'bad' because the critic morally disapproves of the state of feeling induced in the reader by the poetry

M H Carré in *The New Philosophy and the Divines* (*Church Quarterly Review*) takes farther a point made by P Kocher in his book on science and religion in the Elizabethan period (*YW* xxix 170), namely, that a considerable number of the English practitioners of the new scientific method were clergymen The new philosophy was by no means universally reprobated by the clergy The article also includes discussion of the different views taken about the theological consequences of the new cosmology.

R. W Hepburn follows his article on the doctrine of the decay of nature in the early seventeenth century (see *YW* xxxv. 135) with a sequel on *John Spencer's 'Discourse'* (1663) (*NQ*)

[3] *Metaphysical to Augustan*, by Geoffrey Walton Bowes & Bowes pp xi+160 17*s* 6*d*

which is a later expression of the same doctrine He also writes about an example of the opposite doctrine in *Hakewill The Virility of Nature* (*JHI*) George Hakewill's *Apologie of the Power and Providence of God in the Government of the World* (1627) is a detailed statement of the view that nature is constantly renewed and revitalized The book, it is suggested, has more literary value than has been recognized in its 'complex, near-poetic use of metaphor, imagery and analogy'

In *Giles Fletcher and the Puritans* (*JEGP*) A Holaday, warning against over-simplification of the facts about seventeenth-century religious thought, points out that many positions in theology and social and personal morality which are commonly supposed to be distinctively Puritan were held also by men of other persuasions, such as staunch Anglicans like Fletcher

W Mulder makes a high claim for his subject in *Style and the Man Thomas Adams, Prose Shakespeare of Puritan Divines* (*Harvard Theological Review*) Although he hardly justifies such an exaltation, Mulder's analysis of Adams's style and manner, and the ample quotations he offers, show that Adams was a master of lively and varied prose and deserves a place of honour even among such a distinguished company of prose authors as the Caroline divines

Two books which are only marginal to English studies should nevertheless be mentioned They are, first, a biography by D Nicholas of Sir Edward Nicholas, Secretary of State to Charles I and Charles II, and a man who touched the life of his age at many points,[4] and the second book is a study[5] by A Simpson of the nature and underlying motives of seventeenth-century Puritanism Simpson finds that the driving force was not, as some historians have suggested, of an economic nature, but a strong sense of sin and a dedication to warfare against it

Benjamin Boyce, from whom we already have a study of the 'Character' in England up to 1642 (see *YW* xxviii 171), now continues the story and studies the use made of this literary genre during the years from 1640 to the Restoration[6] The book is in two parts The first discusses the form, technique, and style of the Characters Here it is remarked that of the three main kinds of Character written during the twenty years, the 'subjective Character of an idealized type, the slanted Portrait-Character intended to influence the reader's opinion of a man and his party', and the Overburian Character, it was the last that was commonest, and 'between the opening witty figures and the stinging finale it was forced to accommodate practically all the devices of pamphleteering' Boyce goes on to discuss the actual Characters of the period and to show how they represent varieties of these three types In prose style, some of the Characters show the influence of Martin Marprelate as well as of Overbury These were chiefly anti-Puritan Characters The Puritans tended to write a more composed style, 'less schematic, less Lipsian' than Overbury's Part Two of the book seeks to elucidate the historical setting in which the Characters must be seen if they are to be fully understood Polemical Overburian Characters come close to the characters portrayed in verse satire, and so in a final section

[4] *Mr Secretary Nicholas*, by Donald Nicholas Bodley Head pp 336 25*s*

[5] *Puritanism in Old and New England*, by Alan Simpson Harvard U P and C U P pp ix+126 $3 22*s* 6*d*

[6] *The Polemic Character, 1640–1661*, by Benjamin Boyce Nebraska U P pp xv+160 $2 75

Boyce turns to discuss *Hudibras*, Part One.

For the National Book League[7] V de Sola Pinto has compiled a Readers' Guide to the biographies of seventeenth-century worthies, with brief descriptions of the less well-known worthies, and with some guidance to the standard biographies and to biographical studies of special interest

There is rather less work on Donne than one has come to expect during the last few years A E Malloch points out (*MLN*) a repetition of an idea in *Donne's 'Pseudo-Martyr' and 'Catalogus Librorum Aulicorum'* and argues that it is consistent with the date of 1604 or 1605 for the *Catalogus*

We warmly welcome two further volumes[8] of the fine edition of Donne's Sermons now being published by the University of California What was said of the first two to appear (*YW* xxxiv 189) need not be repeated Volume II contains the sermons written between mid-1618 and early 1620 and therefore includes some of the sermons Donne preached as Divinity Reader to Lincoln's Inn His previous relations with the society are discussed in the introduction, and it is suggested that his sense of personal intimacy with these listeners finds occasional expression in his sermons to them, especially in the earlier ones The explanatory and critical remarks in the introduction are very good In an appendix there is a useful discussion of the Ellesmere manuscript with its eight sermons by Donne In a second appendix there is an earlier version of the *Sermon of Valediction* and we are afforded the opportunity of studying Donne's extensive revisions The volume was prepared for the printer by Potter before his much regretted death The remaining volumes will be completed and seen through the press by Mrs Simpson Volume VII shows Donne at the sustained height of his powers as a preacher It includes the Sermons from early 1626 to the spring of 1627, when Donne was fully at home in the pulpit and expressed himself with richness and flowing ease, comforting his depressed congregation after the terrors of the 1625 plague and urging them to hopefulness and joy—in this he was unlike many preachers of the time who were talking of condign visitations upon the iniquities of the City The volume contains, it is true, some dull sermons, and some bitter attacks on Rome and the Jesuits and on the Puritans, but the main impression is of power and tenderness The introduction, as before, discusses the relevant facts and circumstances of Donne's life during the period covered The long review by J B Leishman (*RES*, pp 417 sqq) of the first two volumes published of this edition contains some important critical suggestions and a list of proposed emendations which are, most of them, likely ones, and P Legouis in his review (*Ea*, pp 342–4), suggests some emendations in the Latin passages, and most of these, too, are certain or probable The review by Legouis (ibid , p 156) of Gransden's book on Donne (see *YW* xxxv 130) is less favourable than the *YW* notice and points out a number of fairly serious errors

There are some notes on Donne's biography in his middle years B W Whitlock, under the title *Ye Curioust Schooler in Cristendom* (*RES*), gives the first complete and accurate transcript of Alleyn's draft letter to Donne, and in discussion shows that it reveals

[7] *Seventeenth-Century Biographies*, by V de S Pinto C U P pp 32 *2s 6d*

[8] *The Sermons of John Donne*, ed by George R Potter and Evelyn M Simpson California U P and C U P Vol II pp xi+466, vol VII pp vii+463 Each vol $7 50 *56s 6d*

the poet in far from flattering light, as something of a snob, and self-centredly uncharitable Whitlock also has an interesting article in *TLS* (pp 548, 564) studying the entries in the Churchwarden's Accounts and the Vestry Minutes of St Dunstan's-in-the-West He elicits from them some glimpses of the activities of *Donne at St Dunstan's* as vicar of the parish John Sparrow discusses (*TLS*) pp 436, 451) a recently discovered collection of *Donne's Books in the Middle Temple* It consists, as far as is at present known, of seventy volumes signed by Donne, none of them very interesting from the literary point of view, but of some interest as indicating the subjects of Donne's studies The present writer contributed a note on *An Early Reference to Donne* (*NQ*) in William Fennor's *Counter's Commonwealth* (1617)

On Donne's poetry, the most extensive piece of work to be noticed is a volume[9] of translations into French by P Legouis The stated purpose of the translations is to help the French reader who knows some English to read Donne in the original Hence exactness of sense rather than literary quality is what is aimed at in the line-for-line translation which is printed facing the English text Donne's double or triple meanings are admittedly untranslatable, and to have indicated all of them in the notes would have swollen the commentary to useless and preposterous bulk Yet these versions, together with the introduction and the notes (all of which the English student will read with profit) should provide invaluable help to French students in schools and universities, and as far as can be judged by one whose command of French is far inferior to Legouis's command of English, the translation, utilitarian though it may profess to be, does not lack elegance But the English student of Donne may be pardoned if he finds the work most interesting for the opportunity it affords of reading Donne and hearing at every point what an eminent scholar, from long and profound study of the poetry, deems to be the primary sense of difficult or ambiguous passages From time to time one feels that the exact phrasing of the French belies the wider spread of meaning in the English, and very occasionally one thinks that a point is missed or mistaken, but on the whole one has to admire the dexterity and precision with which the turns of meaning are conveyed

P Elmen, discussing *John Donne's 'Dark Lantern'* in *A Litanie*, argues (*PBSA*) that the phrase, found in some manuscripts of the poem, is a genuine early reading which Donne altered to 'glasse lanthorne' because, on second thoughts, he wished to avoid the incursion into the poem of the irrelevant memory of Guy Fawkes, with whom dark lanterns were, in the early seventeenth century, closely associated L Sawin has a note (*Explicator*) on the word 'reall' in *Donne's 'The Canonization', 7* The *Unrecorded Reference in a Poem by Donne* (*NQ*) noted by M Novak is the allusion to the late-dancing Masquers in the *Epithalamium*, which refers to the last song in Campion's *Mask* performed at the wedding in question M E Grenander writes (*Explicator*) on *Donne's 'Holy Sonnets', xii* as a poem constructed from a series of paradoxes arising from the concept of 'the great chain of being' W Nelson Francis (*Explicator*) analyses *Donne's 'Goodfriday 1613 Riding Westward'* and finds it 'one of the best religious poems in the language' McD Emslie contributes to *NQ*, under the title *Barclay Squire and Grierson's Donne*, some notes on the musical settings

[9] *Donne Poèmes Choisis*, tr by Pierre Legouis Paris Aubier pp 224 540 fr

supplied by Squire for volume II of Grierson's edition

The interesting jest-book to which B Colgrave called our special attention (*YW* xxxii 173) has now been edited by E A Horsman[10] *Dobsons Drie Bobbes* (1607) is remarkable in that it differs in three ways from the ordinary jest-book It is not merely a collection of disjointed anecdotes, it links one episode to the next, and thus verges on the picaresque novel Secondly, its main characters were real people, who lived in Durham during the second half of the sixteenth century, and Dobson's real life, as far as it can be dimly discerned, to some extent corresponds to the broad outlines of the printed tale Lastly, the author sets his story in an accurate topography, so that one can follow the movements of his characters on the map of Durham and the plan of the Cathedral precincts which the present editor thoughtfully provides Linguistically, too, the book is of interest The style is for the most part in the common, racy prose of its day, apart from some long-winded speeches, but there is a noticeable ingredient of learned, not to say pedantic, diction, and for a few words the editor has been unable to find parallels The glossary will, however, serve most of the needs of any likely reader of the text, though there are some phrases, apparently proverbial, but not in the usual proverb-books, on which one would have liked notes Some of the glosses could be improved Thus, 'eagre' means 'tart, severe' rather than 'angry', and the 'portigan' which Horsman finds mysterious is surely 'partisan' (from Italian, *partegiana*) Since only two copies of the original edition survive, and since the book has never before been reprinted, an edition is welcome, particularly when, like this, it is competently edited and pleasantly printed

In writing the first full-length biography[11] of George Sandys, R B Davies has filled a gap in literary history The bare facts are not very numerous, but Davies elicits their full significance since he is able to see them through a wide and deep knowledge of the historical circumstances He has also added some new facts, as when he reveals that Sandys, as a young man, was married, thanks to the coercive financial arrangements made by his father and his future father-in-law, to a wife with whom he apparently did not get on and from whom he soon separated There are new facts also about Sandys's years in Jamestown, Virginia But the student of literature will probably be more interested in the author of the *Relation* of travels in the Middle East This book was accepted as an authority and used by such men as Milton, but it is also a very interesting work in its own right as a travel book Sandys was also a poet whose translation of Ovid's *Metamorphoses* held its own for two centuries To both these books Davies devotes due space, and he has much that is interesting and informative to say Of special interest to the historian are the six private letters, here printed, which Sandys wrote about the controversy following the massacre of the Jamestown settlers by the Indians Throughout, there is full documentation and a plentiful supply of additional information in footnotes, and the book is written in a pleasant and clear style

Lyle H Kendall, Jr, continues his work on Wither and brings evidence (*NQ*) to prove the authorship of *George Wither's 'What Peace to the*

[10] *Dobsons Drie Bobbes*, ed by E A Horsman O U P pp xxiv+110+2 folding maps 21*s*

[11] *George Sandys, Poet-Adventurer*, by Richard Beale Davies Bodley Head pp 320 30*s*

Wicked' (1646) He also adduces evidence (ibid) going to show *George Wither in Prison* about the year 1625

Of the poets in the Oxford Texts series, Corbett must come near the bottom of the list of merit To read through his collected poems[12] is something of a disappointment He is one of the academic poets of the age, closest in style perhaps to his contemporary King or his junior Cartwright, and nearer to Jonson than to Donne His wit rarely surprises one, though he sometimes attempts a metaphysical conceit, nor has he the mental strength and monumental confidence of Jonson His humour is, like the practical jokes he loved to play, apt to fall heavy-handedly on his subject But he is a true, if minor, poet with a masculine vigour that expresses itself sometimes abruptly as if impatient of grace At his best, however, he has a pleasant litheness of rhythm and texture, and he is likely to be at his best when he has the tune of a popular ballad running in his mind The present edition is welcome the only other modern edition, that of Gilchrist (1807), is practically unobtainable The editors provide a biography —Corbett appears to have been a more than slightly easy-going prelate, and not too amiable a person—and an account of the printed and manuscript authorities for the poems Over ninety manuscripts have been consulted, most of them commonplace books Fortunately, most of the Corbett poems in them have no authority since they are merely copied from the printed editions, and the *apparatus criticus* does not turn out to be as voluminous as the great list of *sigla* led one to fear The Latin poems are not included on the grounds that 'they are uniformly mediocre and sometimes execrable' The explanatory notes are admirable, telling the likely reader of Corbett what he wants to know and judiciously refraining from telling him what any serious student of early seventeenth-century poetry knows already This edition was the subject of a front-page article in *TLS*

The intense activity of last year has been followed by a lull in Herbert studies In a brief essay (in *Revue des Langues Vivantes*) G Wickes discusses *George Herbert's Views on Poetry*, remarking that Herbert was not afraid of equating his poetical and his spiritual inspiration, and found himself most finely used when he became an instrument for God to make poetry with The present writer noted a parallel between *George Herbert and Ovid* (*NQ*) The passages are *Virtue* and *Ars Amatoria*, II 111 sqq

Under the title *Quarles and Hugh of St Victor* (*TLS*) J Hone studies the problem of the origin of the striking sentence, 'the heart is not sufficient for a Kite's dinner, yet the whole world is not sufficient for it', which Quarles ascribes to a *De Anima* by Hugo Hone finds the sentence in a work of that title sometimes ascribed to Hugh of St Victor and thinks Quarles may have read a copy of that work in manuscript in Ussher's library when he was the Archbishop's secretary But John Horden points (ibid, p 285) to *Flores Doctorum* by Thomas Hibernicus as the probable source from which Quarles took the sentence R E Tyner discusses (*NQ*) *The Vocabulary of Francis Quarles* and adds thirty-three new items to the *OED* list of about 200 'first usages' by Quarles

The Meaning of 'The Weeper' by Crashaw is, according to S Manning (*ELH*), to be sought in 'a tradition including the emblems, the Jesuits, the Carmelite mystics, and the devotional

[12] *The Poems of Richard Corbett*, ed by J A W Bennett and H R Trevor-Roper O U P pp lxvi+177 30*s*

lyrists of his own day, plus the extensive patristic and medieval heritage' He therefore goes through the poem and cites authorities in all these fields to support his interpretation The article makes an interesting companion to the one by Adams noticed above

Responding to a request for explication, L Perrine, McD Emslie, and Celeste Turner offer (*Explicator*) interpretations of *Vaughan's 'The Queer'* They agree that the 'Query' asked by the poem is about the source of the divine joy of the mystical experience Each commentator has some interesting points on various details in the poem In *Crashaw and Vaughan* (*NQ*) Mary Ellen Rickey points out some passages in which Vaughan appears to be influenced by Crashaw Carol Gesner suggests in a *Note on Henry Vaughan* (*MLR*) a possible echo from Chaucer in Vaughan's *The importunate Fortune* The resemblance is not compelling

Angela Russell restates (*RES*) the known facts about *The Life of Thomas Traherne* and adds some new ones about his life as rector of Credenhill The record of his ordination which she deals with had already been discussed by K W Salter and H H Margoliouth (see *YW* xxxv 136) Salter this year discusses *Traherne and a Romantic Heresy* (*NQ*) T E Hulme asserted that Romanticism was based on a belief in the infinite potentialities for good of human nature, and he associated this belief with Pelagianism Salter concludes that Traherne is a Romantic in this sense, and shares some of the beliefs of Pelagius

In *Marvell and Politics* (*NQ*) D Davison summarizes the divergent views of recent scholars about what Marvell's political beliefs really were, and he calls attention to the evidence in K H D Haley's *William of Orange and the English Opposition, 1672–4* (1953), that Marvell may have been 'one of the Dutch "fifth column"' In *Marvell and the Cinque Ports* (*TLS*, p 673) E E Duncan-Jones notes that the point of the reference to the Ports in *Upon Appleton House* is that Fairfax had actually been a member of the Council of State in 1650 when the powers of the Warden of the Cinque Ports had been assigned to it, and that he had ceased to attend the Council when he resigned his commission as Lord General Stimulated by recent discussion of *Marvell's 'The Nymph Complaining for the Death of her Faun'* (*Ea*), E H Emerson seeks to interpret the poem as 'embodying Marvell's emotional reaction to the fate of the Church of England in the 1640's' With P Legouis (ibid , p 111) one rebels at the suggestion that Marvell meant Sylvio, the donor of the fawn, to parallel Christ 'Unconstant', 'counterfeit', and 'false' are surely words that inhibit any such association, to say nothing of the implication (ll 53–54) that to be loved by the Church is 'far more better' than to be loved by Christ Equally unfortunate, to at least one reader, are two suggestions by W R Orwen, Jr He thinks that *Marvell's 'Narrow Case'* (*NQ*) in the Horatian Ode meant 'casement', and cites Gardiner's account of Charles's attempt to escape from Carisbrooke through a narrow space in a casement, getting stuck, and having to give up the attempt In the *Ode* Marvell certainly thinks of Charles as an actor on a stage, but not, surely, as an actor in a broad farce Orwen's second suggestion is that *Marvell's 'Bergamot'* (*NQ*) in the same Ode meant, not 'as if all his ambition were to plant his pear tree', but 'as if he were plotting to become King' since the name bergamot means royal pear In D Davison's *Marvell's 'The Definition of Love'* (*RES*) the argument is that while the poem as a

whole makes an impression of originality, many of its images can be shown to have been used by earlier poets, and are, in fact, stock material which will not bear the esoteric and recondite meanings found in them by some recent commentators G T Senn notes some errors in *The Text of Marvell's Poems* (*NQ*) as presented in H Macdonald's edition (see *YW* xxxiii 174)

There is not much to note on the Cavalier poets In *Carew and Jonson* (*SP*) R A Blanchard seeks to indicate, more precisely than the historians of literature commonly have done, the nature of Jonson's influence on Carew He finds it in the genres cultivated, in the firm clarity of thought and style, often in the peculiar tone of feeling, and sometimes it is a matter of the influence of some particularly admired poems of Jonson Elsie Duncan-Jones notes two of *Benlowes's Borrowings from George Herbert* (*RES*)

N Nathan suggests that *Lovelace's 'Flie'* (*NQ*) in the fourth line of *To Lucasta, Going to the Warres* should be understood as 'flee' not as 'fly'

In *Charles Butler and the Bees' Madrigal* (*NQ*) Nan Cooke Carpenter continues to study this early seventeenth-century musician and apiarist, best known perhaps for his *Feminine Monarchie*, 1609 This year she writes about and quotes the *Bees' Madrigal* in the 1634 expanded edition of this book

Eleanor Withington studies *The 'Fugitive Poetry' of Mildmay Fane* (*HLB*) The poems are contained in a manuscript now in the Harvard College Library and some of them have not been printed before They throw light on the biography and the opinions of the author, the second Earl of Westmorland, writer of plays and of *Otia Sacra* (1648) Some extracts from the unprinted poems are included in the article.

The *Notes on Some Poems Attributed to William Strode* (*PQ*) by C F Main discuss four poems in Dobell's edition of Strode, and show that they appeared in several places, in anthologies and song books, thus proving their popularity Four other poems attributed to Strode are shown not to be by him

In the *Church Quarterly Review* is printed an address on *Robert Herrick* delivered by Basil Willey on the occasion of the restoration, in St Margaret's, Westminster, of the mural tablet inscribed with Herrick's epitaph for his niece, Elizabeth This epitaph is discussed by R G Howarth under the title *Herrick's Epitaph on his Niece Elizabeth* (*NQ*), and Howarth also suggests, in *Two Poems by Herrick?* (*NQ*), Herrick's authorship of two fragments in *The English Parnassus* (1657) by Joshua Poole J C Maxwell, however, points out (ibid, p 500) that one of the fragments is the beginning of Act V of Jonson's *Sejanus* Commenting on *Herrick's 'Upon Julia's Clothes'* (*Explicator*) Elizabeth Schneider disagrees with most critics and argues that the subject of the poem is 'in stanza 1, Julia dressed, in stanza 2, Julia undressed' Nat Henry (ibid) cogently disagrees

S A Weiss argues for *Dating Mrs Hutchinson's Translation of Lucretius* (*NQ*) to the 1640's or even the 1650's, not, as has been suggested, to the 1630's

In a note on *Sir John Reresby's Quarrel at Saumur* (*NQ*) Elsie Duncan-Jones suggests that his companion in this *fracas* with a Frenchman was Brome Whorwood, of whom she gives some biographical details The present writer identified (*NQ*) the 'Mr I F' referred to in *Martin Markall*, 1610, as John Healey, who translated Joseph Hall's *Mundus Alter et Idem* In *James Hay and 'The Countess of Montgomerie's Urania'* (*NQ*) J J O'Connor

discusses the passages in the novel (1621) which are based on episodes in the private life of Hay, who later became the Earl of Carlisle. The episodes suggest that Hay was not such a pleasant personality as the usual authorities make out

In succession to his important edition of *Religio Medici* (see *YW* xxxiv 194) J -J Denonain has now produced an *editio minor*,[13] printing the same text but omitting the critical apparatus, and adding an introduction of fifteen pages for the general reader, not for the specialist F L Huntley's researches into the work of Browne produced this year a paper on *The Publication and Immediate Reception of 'Religio Medici'* (*Library Quarterly*) which ought to be mentioned here because it is of more than merely bibliographical interest, especially on Sir Kenelm Digby's attack on *Religio Medici.*

There remain a few miscellaneous notes to record F W Steer prints (*NQ*) from a manuscript in his possession a poem in six stanzas on the courtship of *Charles, Prince of Wales and the Infanta Maria* The poem is hostile to the Spanish marriage C F Main adds (ibid) further notes on *Poems on the 'Spanish Marriage' of Prince Charles* Virginia L Ruland's note on *A Royalist Account of Hugh Peters' Arrest* (*HLQ*) may be mentioned as an addition to the biography by Stearns noticed last year (*YW* xxxv 135) E Sirluck in *The 'Eikon Basilike' An Unreported Item in the Contemporary Authorship Controversy* (*MLN*) adds *The None-Such Charles His Character* (1651) to the bibliography of the controversy J E Ruoff identifies (*NQ*) the Robert Carliell who was *The Author of 'Britain's Glory' (1618)* as the father of Lodowick Carliell the dramatist In *Jeremy Taylor and Hatton's 'Psalter of David'* (*TLS*) R Gathorne-Hardy argues that this book of 1644, although ascribed to Christopher, Lord Hatton, at the time, has properly been ascribed by modern scholars to Taylor, and was 'written entirely, or almost entirely by Taylor'

The study of Milton continues to flourish and there are as usual many works on him to be reported

The 'Men and Books' series is not intended for specialists it aims at giving the general reader a balanced and just account of the writer and his works Of all those that have yet appeared, this one on Milton must have been perhaps the most difficult to write[14] Such controversy as exists about the character and genius of, say, Donne, dwindles into insignificance when compared with the violent and profound divergence of respectable critical opinion about Milton and his mature poems To venture into the conflict, with the task of giving a brief yet rounded and informed account, called for considerable courage Muir has performed his task admirably He is aware of and has understood the divergent points of view, he has no party-axe of criticism to grind, and he does not seek either to be startlingly original or hypercautious in his critical assessments Teachers of literature will welcome the book as one that they can without misgivings put into the hands of their students, but even the more advanced student will find profitable suggestions and ideas in it One interesting feature is that Muir has contrived to quote generously from the prose works and so to some extent to let Milton explain his own biography, character, politics, and religious thought At the same time the reader is thus provided with samples on which to test Muir's inter-

[13] *Religio Medici*, by Sir Thomas Browne, ed by Jean-Jacques Denonain C U P pp xxi+102 8*s* 6*d*

[14] *John Milton*, by Kenneth Muir Longmans Green pp x+196 10*s* 6*d*

esting criticism of Milton's prose style The treatment of *Paradise Lost* and of the different opinions of it now current is itself judicious, and provides a good introduction to the subject, besides being a useful contribution to the discussion Muir's position can perhaps be briefly indicated by his remark that Milton 'bought the grand style at a heavy price' but 'there is no reason to doubt that the price was worth paying'.

In spite of the title, R M Adams's book is really a collection of separate studies [15] The first is an essay on the 'new criticism' of *Comus* and was fully noticed in *YW* xxxiv 203, the second is a criticism of Werblowsky's book on Milton (see *YW* xxxiii 183), the third is a sceptical review of the significant-spelling doctrine of the text of *P L* (part of this appeared as an article noticed in *YW* xxxv 142), the fourth is an attack (noticed in *YW* xxxv 142) on Empson's criticism of *P L* The fifth essay is new It is on Milton's reading, and it destructively criticizes, first, the view that Milton was a deep student of Rabbinical literature, and, second, the tendency to treat any book whatever in the hexameral tradition as a 'source' of Milton's ideas, a tendency that is one of the mistakes that vitiate the lists, drawn up by some scholars, of the books Milton read The last essay considers the various objections that have been put forward in the modern attack on Milton's verse and finds that the trouble arises from the loss by our age of the capacity for the 'high, heroic tone' Adams concludes that much Milton criticism is distorted by the preconceptions of our own age to harmonize with them we falsely colour our picture of Milton But 'Milton's ideas and some of the feelings which go with them cannot be interpreted into modernity, they are dead, as his art is not On the other hand, the fact that Milton's ideas are no longer current does not reduce us to reading him for his organ music Some of the feelings which go with his ideas are dead, but by no means all We may perfectly well read Milton, as we read Lucretius and Dante ' We can, in fact, share the vision of the world as it is perceived by that 'magnanimous man' of whom Milton conceived the image and whom he tried to embody.

R O Evans thinks (*NQ*) that Adams's rejection of the significant-spelling theory is too emphatic, and that *The Proofreading of 'Paradise Lost'* does show signs of unusual care M Y Hughes's *Meditation on Literary Blasphemy* (*Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, xiv 1) contains comment on modern attackers, especially F R Leavis, of Milton, and it is therefore referred to here

Although Milton's name stands in the title and occurs *passim*, H Schultz's book [16] is a general study of the very interesting subject of 'forbidden knowledge' in Christian tradition and in the Renaissance Many answers were given to the questions, 'Is there such a thing as impious curiosity, and, if so, where is the line to be drawn between intellectual inquiry that tends to edification and intellectual inquiry that is vain and sinful in nature?' They were questions that influenced thought in many fields—in theology, in natural science, in metaphysics, in ethics, in education—and one gladly takes up a book dealing with the subject Considerable learning and a great deal of special reading have obviously gone to the making of Schultz's book, and he appears to have a mastery of his subject that one would be happy

[15] *Ikon John Milton and the Modern Critics*, by R M Adams Cornell U P and O U P pp xvii+231 $3 75 30*s*

[16] *Milton and Forbidden Knowledge*, by Howard Schultz P M L A pp vii+309 $5 40*s*

to share But he does not make it easy for us to do so Decorum requires that exposition should be conducted in a style as transparent as possible, but Schultz uses, sometimes clumsily, a highly figured style which unnecessarily holds the reader back Nor, when one has been halted at a difficulty, is one best pleased to find that it is a slip ('Perseus' for 'Persius') or a laxity ('*in extenso*' used as an antithesis to 'small things') or an eccentricity of expression ('the seventeenth-century's marginal credits', i e references to authorities in the margins of seventeenth-century books) Added to this, he is mercilessly allusive in manner Thickly peppered over the text are oblique references of a kind that only a reader as deeply versed as the author could take in his stride one who comes to be instructed is left distracted The devoted student who battles his way through will certainly profit, but it is a great pity that a valuable piece of research should be made so inaccessible

One of the topics often cited in the lists of unprofitable inquiries was discussion of the nature and hierarchies of angels For some years R H West has been publishing results from his investigations into angelology with special reference to Milton, and he now gives us a comprehensive book on the subject [17] The first half of it deals with the main doctrines and disputes of the 'science', and West deserves our gratitude for the diligence with which he has gone about in the rank jungle of seventeenth-century occultism to sketch this guide to the masses of dogma, the currents of thought, and the extensive swamps of credulity Prepared by this study he can approach *Paradise Lost* and make enlightened and enlightening comment on Milton's treatment of the angels He shows that while Milton has no detailed system of angelology and is widely eclectic, his treatment of the subject is not, as some scholars have suggested, merely confused He conforms pretty closely to Protestant angelology But he subordinates angelology to his poetic purposes he is writing an epic, not a treatise, and he does not trouble much about the precise factual 'truth' of the ideas he finds it convenient to use He goes out of his way, however, to be unambiguous and dogmatic about two personal and possibly unique heterodoxies, namely, that angels make physical love to each other and that they can eat and assimilate earthly food He does this, West thinks, to emphasize his general thesis that all created things are material and that matter and all its regular activities are good West writes with commendable lucidity, but one must protest against the howler of using, as he does at least twice, 'hypothecate' where 'hypothesize' is intended West also contributes to the collection of essays in honour of W C Curry (see p 14 above) a paper on *The Terms of Angelic Rank in 'Paradise Lost'* He concludes that Milton does not offer a strict Protestant or a strict Catholic view about the hierarchies of the angelic host What he does show is 'adroitness in using tradition without unduly recognizing authority in it'

In *Milton, Diomede and Amaryllis* (*ELH*) J W Saunders applies to Milton the ideas he has already applied to other poets, especially Spenser (see *YW* xxxiii 152, xxxii 159), about the influence on poets of the audience they envisaged In Milton there was a conflict between the courtly Renaissance poetry (sporting with Amaryllis in the shade) and the hard discipline of devotion to the task of Poet as Milton conceived it (symbolized by the Diomede of *Elegia Septima*) Amaryllis was popular, and attractive to Mil-

[17] *Milton and the Angels*, by Robert H West Georgia U P pp ix+237 $4 50

ton himself, for Diomede there was no audience But Milton decided to take for his audience in prose 'the new aristocracy thrown up by the social revolution' (Parliament and the Assembly), and finally, for both poetry and prose, the fit audience though few of 'the best men of England and Europe', such as those who were later to subscribe for the 1688 edition of *Paradise Lost* Hence, unlike Spenser, as Saunders contends, Milton 'always knew what audience he was addressing, and he was rarely in two minds about the purpose and nature of a poem'

In *Milton and Bacon A Paradox* (*ES*) E L Marilla discusses the fact that Milton often refers admiringly to Bacon, yet he cannot have admired Bacon's philosophy of life Bacon's aim was the acquiring of power over the physical world for the ameliorating of man's material conditions of life, for Milton, 'man is a spiritual being whose basic desires cannot be defined in terms of material comforts' But both men shared the view that intellectual inquiry is worth nothing if not serviceable to man and his needs, and this agreement accounts for Milton's praise (Marilla was no doubt bound to account for this 'paradox' since at first sight it tells against his theory of the Fall and of *Paradise Regain'd* See the article by him noticed below)

By going through a concordance and referring to *OED*, W B Hunter, Jr , studies (in the essays in honour of W C Curry, see p 14 above) *New Words in Milton's English Poems* The lists he draws up support the conclusion that Milton was in fact a notable innovator, that his innovations were not merely anglicizations from Latin, and that a surprising number of them entered into the general vocabulary

H Fletcher suggests that *A Possible Origin of Milton's 'Counterpoint' or Double Rhythm* (*JEGP*) in his English verse was his practising of Latin and Greek verse In his Latin verses he must have been 'aware of a double rhythm, the one built into the verse according to the rules, and the one imposed on the lines by the sound to his ear of the words themselves', and later he produced a similar effect in his English verse It would be interesting to hear the views of an expert prosodist on this, for one wonders if Fletcher's second rhythm can be anything other than the normal conflict of word-accent and *ictus* in the first part of a Latin hexameter

The second volume of the Oxford edition of Milton's poetry appeared this year[18] Helen Darbishire edits *Paradise Regain'd* and *Samson Agonistes* on the same principles as those used for *Paradise Lost* (see *YW* xxxiii 182), and she also edits the minor English poems John Purves introduces and edits the Italian poems, and H W Garrod does the same for the Classical poems (The printer has fouled on a long 's' in *Epitaphium Damonis*, 22) The notes are mainly about textual matters, but there are some dealing with historical and critical points, especially in Purves's commentary (his preliminary note, for instance), and in the notes on *Lycidas* and *Comus* There is no space here for the detailed consideration of the text, which is what would be required in a full review of the edition This volume was the subject of an interesting front-page article in *TLS* called *Milton without the Epic*

W J Grace's *Notes on Robert Burton and John Milton* (*SP*) indicate parallels between *The Anatomy of Melancholy* and *L'Allegro* and *Il Penseroso* They also suggest, on the basis of other parallels, that the

[18] *The Poetical Works of John Milton*, ed by Helen Darbishire Vol II O U P pp xx+375 35*s*

'two-handed engine' in *Lycidas* is the Roman Church, instrument of the Devil, wielding the two engines of hope and fear, ready to strike once, but unable to strike again since its days are numbered Lastly, it is suggested that Burton influenced the description of the Limbo of Vanity in *P L* III and the list of devils in *P L* I

An essay on *Some Seventeenth-Century Latin Poems by English Writers* (*UTQ* xxv 1) by Edmund Blunden includes verse translations from the Latin of Donne, Herbert, and Crashaw, and a particularly interesting version of Milton's *Epitaphium Damonis* in which it is fascinating to hear Milton's voice modulating into the tones of Blunden's and to see his rural pictures becoming suffused with Blundenian pastoralism

Douglas Bush tentatively queries (*HLB*) the traditional explanation of *An Allusion in Milton's 'Elegia tertia'* as referring to Christian of Brunswick and Count Ernest of Mansfield, and equally tentatively suggests a different pair. James I and Maurice, Prince of Orange.

As to the crux in *Lycidas*, one is really tempted to suggest a self-denying ordinance for ten years. *'That Two-Handed Engine' Yet Once More* (*NQ*) by R J Schoeck argues that Milton was drawing on a passage in John of Salisbury's *Polycraticus* in which the righteous use of force by the state, to defend the Church and assail infidelity, among other things, is imaged as 'gladii ancipites in manibus eorum' H Mutschmann's solution for *'That Two-Handed Engine at the Door'* (*NQ*) is the sword to be wielded by the combined Scottish and English Puritan opponents of the Bishops The 'door' is a reference to Acts v 9–10 R. E Hughes's suggestion, in *'That Two-Handed Engine'—Again* (*NQ*), is that it is Puritan zeal, imaged as a two-handed sword, with reference to Psalms cxlix 5–9 There cannot be many two-handed things that have still to be suggested

The important conclusion in Eugene Haun's contribution to the Curry *Festschrift* (see p 14 above), *An Inquiry into the Genre of 'Comus'*, is that there was considerably more music in the Mask than our received text suggests *Comus*, in fact, is one of a number of masques which, while not yet opera, are progressing towards that genre They rely on a complete plot, not a fragmentary plot, they minimize dancing and utilize dramatic music, and they are frequently mythological or allegorical in subject

A E Dyson's valuable essay (*E & S*) on *The Interpretation of 'Comus'* argues the same chief point that Adams upholds (see *YW* xxxiv 203) and urges that the Mask is a good deal simpler than A S P Woodhouse and his followers have suggested There are in the essay also comments on Milton's thought and his technique both in *Comus* and in *Paradise Lost*

Discussing the Trinity MS of *Milton's 'Fairfax' Sonnet* (*NQ*) J T Shawcross suggests that 'their serpent wings' is an unauthorized alteration by a later hand, and that Milton wrote 'her serpent wings' And in line 10, instead of the received 'Warr', he would read 'Warrs' J Milton French's *Comment on 'A Book was Writ of Late . '* (*MLN*) is that Schultz interprets the sense wrongly (see *YW* xxxv. 141) French quotes from *Tetrachordon* to support the view that Milton meant that the age of Sir John Cheke, unlike Milton's age, did *not* hate learning

A translation[19] of *Paradise Lost* into Catalan is perhaps of more moment for Catalan literature than for Eng-

[19] *El Paradis Perdut, Traducció Poètica*, by J M Boix i Selva Barcelona. Editorial Alpha 1953 pp 459

lish, but it is an event that deserves to be recorded, even though tardily. From the way in which it was received, it looks as though the translation may have an influence on contemporary Catalan poetry

In *The Problem of 17th Century Soteriology in Reference to Milton* (*Franciscan Studies*, Nos 1 and 3) A P. Fiore first discusses some influential Reformation views about the nature of the Redemption, and then turns to the passages on the Redemption in *De Doctrina Christiana*, relating what Milton there says to the passages on the same subject in *Paradise Lost* and *Paradise Regain'd*

W Shumaker criticizes (*PMLA*, pp 1185 sqq) Millicent Bell's paper on *The Fallacy of the Fall in 'Paradise Lost'* (see *YW* xxxiv 206), Millicent Bell replies at length, Shumaker adds a long rejoinder, and the discussion closes with a brief surrejoinder by Millicent Bell

R A Durr discusses what he calls *Dramatic Pattern in 'Paradise Lost'* (*Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, xiii, No 4) It is an interesting but not well-written or very lucid article It points to the 'pattern of rise and fall', of death and destruction rhythmically alternating with rebirth and new life Satan is 'neither simple hero nor simple fool but the dramatically realized and necessarily numinous embodiment of the dark movement of the total action of God's providence' This sounds very much like Manichaeism, and Milton could hardly have intended to give this impression

Ernest Schanzer's paper called *Milton's Hell Revisited* (*UTQ*) makes the point that there are two Hells in *Paradise Lost*, the state of mind of the fallen angels, and the geographical place which is the material counterpart of that state of mind It then proceeds to consider the macrocosmic and the microcosmic Hells as mirrors of each other, each exhibiting both a chaos of warring opposites and a perverted order in political and moral structure—spiritual turmoil mirrored in the noise of Hell on the one side and a strict régime, with vestiges of angelic nature, mirrored in music on the other side An interesting paragraph on the devils who 'reason'd high of Providence ' is perhaps more persuasive than Marilla's suggestions on the same passage (*YW* xxxiv 209) The paper ends with a discussion of the symmetrical contrasts of Milton's Heaven and Hell

In *John Collop and the Flames Without Light ('Paradise Lost', I 62–3)* J M Steadman quotes (*NQ*) from Collop's *Catholicon Medici* (1656) to support his view that the idea was a commonplace In *The Voice of the Redeemer in 'Paradise Lost'* (*PMLA*) J H Summers notes that the moving speech of Eve (x 914–36) sounds the note of self-sacrificing love which is one of the main themes of the poem, and in particular it echoes the self-offering speech of Messiah in iii 236–41

To honour W C Curry (see p 14 above) A Z Butler writes on *The Pathetic Fallacy in 'Paradise Lost'* and notes that to make Nature sympathize with human emotions and actions is not, in this poem, merely a poetic device It harmonizes with the fundamental vision of the cosmos in the poem 'a grand continuous hierarchy' in which 'the pathetic fallacy becomes archetypal law', for the disturbances of nature are the direct consequences of the introduction of sin and hence disorder into the world In the same volume Cleanth Brooks has an essay on *Eve's Awakening* in which he relates this episode of *Paradise Lost*, IV, to the first conscious thoughts of Adam and of Sin, and to Lucifer's account of his own origins Citing

St Augustine, Brooks suggests that the Fall was a descent into self-consciousness of a wrong kind, and that Milton is using the myth to explore 'the perennial problem of man'

In *Paradise Regained Observations on its Meaning* (*SN*) E L Marilla applies to the poem the ideas which in a previous work (see *YW* xxxiv. 206) he had concluded were the fundamental moral criteria by which Milton judged the Fall In *Paradise Regain'd* Satan is really tempting Christ, not testing whether he is indeed the Son He is trying to find human weaknesses in the Perfect Man The temptations are not to sin in the ordinary sense Christ is being tempted to accept or to do desirable things for the wrong reasons Christ refuses to be involved even in desirable projects if the real motive to participate were personal interest, and Christ also refuses immediate and particular benefits, however desirable for mankind as a whole, if acceptance meant putting second to them man's more fundamental spiritual needs In so doing, Christ becomes an exemplar to which Man can approximate, and only by thus approximating can Man resist the ever-present and insidious 'pressures which life imposes upon the intellectual and moral integrity of even the best of men' E Cleveland takes the other view and writes a brief note *On the Identity Motive in 'Paradise Regained'* (*MLQ*), supporting the thesis that Satan's chief effort is to discover whether or not Jesus is in fact the Son Dick Taylor, Jr, in *The Storm Scene in 'Paradise Regained'* (*UTQ*) takes a view similar to Marilla's The storm is not an interlude, link, or prologue, or attempt at terrorization, but in itself a 'forceful temptation' of Jesus to take the storm as a sign of the wrath of Heaven because he has not accepted the offer of Power The passage is thus related to the busy concern of the 1660's with signs and portents M Fixler deals with another temptation in *The Unclean Meats of the Mosaic Law and the Banquet Scene in 'Paradise Regained'* (*MLN*), indicating some subtleties of implication in the speeches by which Satan introduces the banquet

A H Sackton's paper (in *The University of Texas Studies in English*, xxxiii) should have been noticed last year It seeks to answer the question of what, precisely, is meant by *Architectonic Structure in 'Paradise Regained'* It is concluded that, though the periodic style of the poem suggests an earlier age, in its large-scale parallels and contrasts the poem displays the symmetry and clarity characteristic of the Restoration

In *Samson's Middle Aristotle and Dr Johnson* (*UTQ*) M E Grenander re-examines the relevant passages of the *Poetics* and argues that *Samson Agonistes* represents an 'action' that has a beginning, middle, and end in necessary or probable sequence, that all the incidents are, either in plot or characterization, also necessary or probable, that Aristotle does not demand that the *representation* of the action should be in the same chronological sequence as the stages of the action itself, and that, like *Oedipus Rex*, *Samson Agonistes* is a play in which a great deal of the chain of 'action' is outside the play and is revealed, inside the play, by narrative

We end with a number of articles of a biographical character D L Clark discusses (*HLQ*) the causes of the quarrel between *John Milton and William Chappell*, his first tutor at Christ's He brings evidence that Chappell acted in College plays, points to passages in which Milton expresses his dislike of such antics by senior clergymen, and conjectures that Chappell may have taken umbrage at some expression of scorn by his pupil Another possible source of friction

may have been Milton's (probable) Calvinism at this period in conflict with Chappell's Arminianism A third possibility is that Milton, at this date, might have quarrelled with his tutor's Ramist leanings in Logic This leads Clark to a discussion of some aspects of Ramism as exemplified in Chappell's writings and of the non-Ramist doctrine that would have been taught to Milton at St Paul's School

G Davies tries to discover exactly what happened to *Milton in 1660* (*HLQ*) His detailed account of the known facts cannot be summarized, but his conjectural conclusion is that a verbal agreement was reached, between Milton's friends in Parliament and the Privy Council and the leaders of the Government, that he should not be seriously punished, that by a misunderstanding the Sergeant at Arms arrested him, and thereupon Milton, however unwillingly, had to sue out his pardon and thus acknowledge the monarchy

M Kelley and S D Atkins study *Milton's Annotations of Aratus* (*PMLA*) in his copy of the 1559 edition, which is now in the B M They suggest that he studied the poem closely at two periods, *c* 1631 and *c* 1641, and his emendations of the corrupt text show him to have been a very respectable textual critic

Discussing Aubrey's account of *Dryden's 'Memorable Visit' to Milton* (*HLQ*) in which Dryden was given permission to 'tag' Milton's verses, M Freedman concludes that Aubrey probably had no personal acquaintance with Milton but may well have heard of the visit in conversation with Dryden Revisions into rhyme of Milton's blank verse is the subject of Ann Grossman's *Milton Trickt and Frounced* (*NQ*) Under the title *Mrs M— and Milton* (*NQ*) G W Whiting quotes from the unidentified poetess's *Progress of Poetry*, a poem printed in the *London Magazine*, 1759, in which she eulogizes Milton G F Sensabaugh discusses the use made by the defence of quotations from *Milton at the Trial of Tom Paine* (*NQ*) And lastly, under the title *Milton le Lutteur* (*Ea*) O Lutaud discusses the history of scholarly interest in Milton's prose, with special attention to the recent revival of interest in it

XII. RESTORATION PERIOD

By V DE SOLA PINTO

IN *England in the Reigns of James II and William III*[1] David Ogg provides a worthy sequel to his admirable and well-known *England in the Reign of Charles II* (see *YW* xv 250) Like its predecessor, this survey is distinguished by the comprehensive sweep of its author's learning, his remarkable power of marshalling and presenting a vast body of material, his easy, unpretentious, almost conversational style, and the shrewdness and penetration of his judgements The book opens with four masterly descriptive chapters providing a fascinating and detailed picture of England, Scotland, and Ireland in the last decades of the seventeenth century The twelve following chapters deal mainly with the political history of the period Chapter XVIII is a study of 'The Beginnings of Parliamentary Sovereignty' and the concluding chapter called 'The Beginnings of the Eighteenth Century' deals mainly with cultural and intellectual affairs. One naturally compares Ogg's history with that of Macaulay He has none of the older historian's hard, metallic brilliance or his power as a painter of great set pieces Yet, to take one example only, his quiet, dignified, factual record of the last days of James II in England is no less effective than Macaulay's vivid, dramatic narrative Like Macaulay, he never loses sight of his own age when writing of the past The sober eloquence of his carefully weighed praise of the Bill of Rights and the Revolution is a wholesome counterblast to what he describes as 'the discredit into which parliamentary institutions have fallen in some quarters, accentuated by assiduous eulogy of the Stuarts' The last chapter will be of particular value to students of literature It is surprising that, although it contains interesting accounts of painting, music, philosophy, journalism, and scholarship, the theatre is hardly mentioned Yet this was the age of Congreve, Vanbrugh, and Farquhar, perhaps the three best writers of comedy in Europe in the period following the death of Molière and certainly the most interesting English working dramatists between Shakespeare and Shaw

The new edition of *The Diary of John Evelyn*[2] can only be described as definitive and monumental The editor, E S de Beer, in his preface states that the preparation of the work has taken him 'rather more than twenty years with some intervals' The result of these labours is a triumph of exact and mature scholarship in which the editor has received the co-operation of a number of distinguished scholars, which he acknowledges generously in his preface Here, for the first time, the full texts of the four manuscripts constituting the *Diary* are printed through the goodwill of the late John Evelyn of Wotton who placed the manuscripts at the disposal of the Delegates of the Clarendon Press some thirty years ago All previous editions were based on the selections from these manuscripts made and rather inaccurately transcribed by William Bray in the early nineteenth century De Beer gives the reader not

[1] *England in the Reigns of James II and William III*, by David Ogg Clarendon Press pp xiv+547 50*s*

[2] *The Diary of John Evelyn now first printed in full from the manuscripts belonging to Mr John Evelyn and ed by E S de Beer* Clarendon Press Six vols £15 15*s*.

only the first complete printed text but also the first accurately transcribed text, retaining the spelling and punctuation of the original manuscripts The first volume is largely occupied by introductory matter, which includes a biography of Evelyn, a study of his character, and a general account of the *Diary* This volume also includes the early part of the *Diary* called *De Vita Propria*, as well as genealogical and bibliographical appendixes Volumes II, III, IV, and V contain the *Kalendarium* or main body of the *Diary* and volume VI a short but valuable appendix on 'Gothic and some other architectural terms', some pages of 'Additions and Corrections', and (occupying the bulk of the volume) a copious and most efficient index, rivalling Wheatley's invaluable index to Pepys's *Diary* The six volumes have been printed and produced in a style altogether worthy of their contents and are a pleasure to read and handle They are illustrated by reproductions of portraits, manuscripts, and topographical pictures The set is not only a most satisfying edition of a classic, it is also a reference work of the highest value for all students of the literature and life of the period

Evelyn's *Diary*, unlike that of Pepys, is not an intimate self-revelation Evelyn, foreseeing the probability of its publication, carefully excluded any references that might reflect on his own character or that of his friends and family However, he left a large body of family correspondence which is now deposited in the Library of Christ Church, Oxford W G Hiscock, deputy librarian of Christ Church, has made full use of this important manuscript material in a book[3] which reveals a much more human Evelyn than the rather self-righteous and highly decorous gentleman of the *Diary*. He has, in his own words, used 'the new material like a broom to sweep away —or at least disturb—the unhealthy surface piety under which Evelyn has been allowed to shelter' Out of this material Hiscock has compiled with great skill a very interesting and readable account of the whole of the Evelyn family circle, which will be of the greatest value to all students of English life in the later seventeenth century

Samuel Pepys was a voluminous correspondent A large number of his letters survive and of these many have been printed Helen Truesdell Heath[4] has done valuable service to students of Pepys and Restoration literature by gathering and editing 188 letters of Pepys and his family circle of which 162 are printed in full for the first time though passages from some of them have appeared before in biographical works The sources of these letters are two volumes in the Rawlinson Collection in the Bodleian Library, the Admiralty volumes in the Pepysian Library at Magdalene, Cambridge, the Cockerell Papers in the National Maritime Museum at Greenwich, and a single manuscript letter in the possession of Mr A Houghton of New York The exact text of these manuscripts, whether in the holograph of the writers or in the hands of secretaries, is reproduced with scrupulous care, the original spelling, punctuation, and even misspellings being retained, though the common seventeenth-century abbreviations are expanded The writers include, besides Samuel himself, his father John Pepys senior, his sister Paulina Jackson, his brother-in-law Balthasar St Michel (Balty), and a number of other relatives and

[3] *John Evelyn and his Family Circle*, by W G Hiscock Routledge and Kegan Paul pp xii+256 25*s*

[4] *The Letters of Samuel Pepys and his Family Circle*, by Helen Truesdell Heath Clarendon Press pp xl+253 35*s*

persons connected with the family This large body of correspondence is of the greatest interest to students of Restoration life, of which it gives a vivid and fascinating picture, and Miss Heath and the Clarendon Press deserve the warmest thanks for making the letters available in this admirably printed and edited book There is an informative and scholarly introduction and the provenance of each letter and certain other explanations are given in footnotes At the end of the volume there is a Calendar of Omitted Papers, some useful genealogies, and an excellent index The frontispiece is a good reproduction of the portrait of Pepys in the National Portrait Gallery and a second illustration is a reproduction of a holograph letter of Samuel to his brother John

The inclusion of a selection from Dryden's poetry in *The Penguin Poets*[5] is to be welcomed The Selection includes representative work of Dryden at all stages of his career from 1667 to 1700 *Absalom and Achitophel* Part I, *Mac Flecknoe, Religio Laici, Theodore and Honoria, A Song for St Cecilia's Day, Alexander's Feast, An Essay of Dramatic Poesy,* the *Preface to the Fables,* and *Aurungzebe,* together with a number of shorter pieces, are printed in full, and extracts are given from several of the other long poems Some readers will regret the absence of the *Ode on the Death of Mrs Killigrew,* and it is surprising that the rather poor lyric, 'Wherever I am and whatever I do' should have been chosen from *The Conquest of Granada* instead of the much finer 'Zambra Dance' The omission of any example of Dryden's verse translations is also to be deplored Still, in spite of these deficiencies, the purchaser gets excellent value for his money in the form of a great deal of Dryden's best verse and prose with a useful short introduction and concise, informative notes

Dryden's work as a translator is so voluminous, remarkable, and influential that it is surprising that no separate monograph on it should have appeared till the year under review, though there are a fair number of articles dealing with different aspects of the subject in learned periodicals and some important unpublished theses William Frost's *Dryden and the Art of Translation* is a gallant and stimulating attempt to fill, at least provisionally, this gap in Dryden scholarship[6] After a brief introduction, Frost, in his second chapter, discusses the theory of translation at some length with interesting illustrations and makes some shrewd criticisms of certain commonly accepted assumptions In the two following chapters he does not attempt a detailed survey of all Dryden's translations, but, to use his own words, picks out 'salient features of his technique, features which recur throughout his work in this field' The book contains acute and suggestive criticisms of many individual passages, but the whole effect is somewhat sketchy and tends to read like a series of vivid and interesting notes for lectures To do the author justice, it must be recorded that he modestly describes his study as 'exploratory' It certainly provides a valuable basis for a more thorough and systematic treatment of this large and fascinating subject

That Dryden's *Essay of Dramatic Poesy* was in some degree indebted to Corneille is a commonplace of literary history and he himself made generous acknowledgement of his debt The usual assumption has been, hitherto,

[5] *Poems and Prose of John Dryden* A Selection by Douglas Grant Penguin Books pp 357 3*s* 6*d*

[6] *Dryden and the Art of Translation,* by William Frost Yale U P and O U P pp lx+97 28*s*

that the sum of Dryden's borrowings from Corneille represents the sum of Corneille's influence on him John M Aden in an article in *RES* entitled *Dryden, Corneille and the 'Essay of Dramatic Poesy'* makes a fresh approach to the problem based on a recognition that what Dryden calls 'the frame and composition of the work' is 'a dialogue sustained by persons of different opinions' He assumes, therefore, that 'Dryden speaks in his own person only as Neander', that the other characters represent the views of persons other than Dryden, and that 'conclusions as to Corneille's influence upon Dryden himself at this stage must take into account not simply the borrowings in the Essay, but the borrower' The article contains a careful analysis of the relevant parts of the *Essay* in the light of the principles laid down in this passage

John M Aden also contributes two notes on Dryden to *NQ* In the first he draws attention to possible echoes of *Hamlet* in Dryden's early poem *Upon the Death of the Lord Hastings*, and suggests that they 'point to evidence of much earlier Shakespearian contact on Dryden's part than hitherto recognized' In the second, entitled *Dryden and Swift*, he discusses possible borrowings by Swift from *The Hind and The Panther* and Dryden's preface to *Troilus and Cressida*

James Kinsley contributes to *RES* a note on *Historical Allusions in 'Absalom and Achitophel'* supplementing the discussion of these allusions by E S de Beer in *RES* vol xvii (1941) (see *YW* xxii 169) Kinsley defends Scott's identification of *Ammon* with Sir John Coventry, maintains the traditional identification of *Balaam* with Theophilus Hastings, seventh Earl of Huntingdon, against De Beer's suggestion that he might be Lord Grey of Wark, is inclined to agree with De Beer that *Caleb* is Arthur Capel, Earl of Essex, identifies *Agag* with Lord Stafford in opposition to the traditional view (upheld by De Beer) that he is Lord Chief Justice Scroggs, and gives new evidence to support the traditional identification of *Issachar* with Thomas Thynne of Longleat All these interpretations are supported by a wealth of quotations from contemporary sources

In a note in *MLN* Baird W Whitlock comments on the allusion to Elijah and Elisha in the last couplets of Dryden's *Mac Flecknoe* He finds Noyes's note (derived from Dr Norman Oswald) unsatisfactory, describing it as 'not only incomplete but misleading' The allusion, according to Whitlock, is not to the dividing of Jordan by Elisha's mantle (2 Kings ii 12–15), but to Elisha's famous words to Elijah 'let a double portion of thy spirit be upon me' (2 Kings ii 9), and to the subsequent ascent of Elijah to heaven in the whirlwind with the fiery chariot and horsemen As Elisha received the mantle from Elijah, so Shadwell, in Dryden's mock heroic, receives Flecknoe's 'drugget robe' with a double portion of his spirit and the whirlwind is replaced by the 'subterranean wind' that bears this garment upward

W P Ker in his edition of Dryden's *Essays* failed to identify the 'eminent French Critic' from whom Dryden quotes certain remarks of Hippocrates (Ker, ii 134)

Samuel Holt Monk in a note contributed to *NQ* shows that the critic in question was André Dacier and that Dryden's quotation came from Dacier's *La Poetique d'Aristote traduite en Français avec remarques* (1692)

An attractive addition to the well-known series *I Grandi Classici Stranieri* published by Sansoni of Florence

is a volume of Italian translations of selected English plays of the Restoration and eighteenth century edited by G Baldini [7] The selection is introduced by a long, well-informed, and thoughtful critical essay by the editor, who is clearly well abreast of the latest English and American scholarship in this field The selection consists of Dryden's *All for Love*, Otway's *The Orphan* and *Venice Preserved*, Congreve's *The Way of the World*, Farquhar's *The Beaux Stratagem*, Gay's *The Beggar's Opera*, Lillo's *The London Merchant*, Goldsmith's *She Stoops to Conquer*, and Sheridan's *The School for Scandal* and *The Critic* There is a scholarly preface to each play dealing with its theatrical and literary history The translations (including those of the verse tragedies of Dryden and Otway) are in prose but the lyrics in *The Beggar's Opera* and the burlesque verse passages in *The Critic* are rendered into Italian verse The translations of *The Way of the World* (*Così va il Mondo*) by Giorgio Melchiori and *The Beaux Stratagem* (*Lo Strattagemma dei Bellimbusti*) by Agostino Lambardi seem particularly lively and effective

It is surprising to learn from Melchiori's preface that his version of *The Way of the World* is the first Italian version of this famous comedy and from Lambardi's preface that *The Beaux Stratagem* is the only English Restoration play which has ever been produced on the Italian stage

A scholarly pamphlet edited for the Society for Theatre Research by Sybil Rosenfeld[8] presents valuable records of the visits of foreign theatrical companies to England in the seventeer and eighteenth centuries The sco of the study is limited to visits foreign performers who came to E land in troupes and to companies tl acted or sang The first chapter de with the seventeenth century starti with the visit of the French compa to England in 1629, the first of its ki since 1495, and ending with the dep ture of the French troupe of t Prince of Orange in 1688 The entr in this chapter are brief and a list works is appended where fuller formation is available The seco chapter deals much more fully w visits of dramatic companies in t eighteenth century and throws a go deal of light on the theatrical a social history of the period The th chapter gives records of forei operatic and singing troupes whi visited England in the eighteenth ce tury

J H Wilson in an interesting arti in *SP* entitled *Rant, Cant and Tone the Restoration Stage* examines soi of the extant evidence concerni Restoration methods of acting Fr the results of a careful search Restoration literature including mc than 400 plays as well as remarks contemporary critics and eighteen century stage historians he argues th 'the Restoration tragedian tended bellow his passion at the top of l lungs, to make love in a kind of whi or cant and to declaim his lines a cadenced, musical tone' The arti cites numerous passages in support this argument Wilson also shows th this 'toning' or cadenced delive aroused a good deal of compla and was often mocked in comedi According to James Kirkman, it w the actor Macklin who brought in new style of tragic reading, wh Colley Cibber, a survival from t Restoration period, still 'toned' l lines in the eighteenth century, ar

[7] *Teatro Inglese della Restaurazione e del Settecento* A cura di Gabriele Baldini Firenze Sansoni pp cxx+889 L 3,500

[8] *Foreign Theatrical Companies in Great Britain in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries*, by Sybil Rosenfeld pp vi+39 The Society for Theatre Research Pamphlet No 4

in a revival of *Papal Tyranny* in 1736, 'displeased all who preferred natural elocution to artificial cadence' The conclusion is that 'Restoration Almanzors and Alexanders bellowed their passion in high-flown rants, whined their love in cadences with a dying fall, chanted (with the possible exception of Betterton) their debates on love and honour, and died in "effaut flat!"'

It is well known that the sub-title of Farquhar's play *The Constant Couple, or a Trip to the Jubilee* refers to the Papal Jubilee of 1700 Richard Morton and William M Peterson, in an article entitled *The Jubilee of 1700 and Farquhar's 'The Constant Couple'* contributed to *NQ*, give a lively and well-documented account of the English reactions to the Jubilee in relation to Farquhar's play They quote a number of relevant passages from contemporary English newspapers and other works, showing that there were many attacks on the celebration and a good deal of mockery This biased attitude is contrasted with that found in the 'candid and unreserved letters' of John Jackson (who was in Rome at the time) to his uncle Samuel Pepys The writers show that Farquhar, too, does not ridicule the Jubilee itself but satirizes the fop Clincher 'who regards it only as a carnival' Farquhar's view, like that of Pepys, seems to have been that a gentleman's accomplishments might be enhanced by a trip to the Jubilee' while 'the travels of a fop could only further reveal his deficiencies in intellect and education'

David S Berkeley's article on *The Penitent Rake in Restoration Comedy* was noticed in *YW* xxxiv 212 The same writer uses somewhat similar material in two articles contributed to *NQ* and entitled *Some Notes on Probability in Restoration Drama* Starting with a discussion of the use of prose and verse in connexion with realism and improbability he goes on to point out that various improbabilities were considered to be justified in plays with foreign settings, but plays with familiar settings in which they occurred were sometimes criticized by audiences and even by players There were 'degrees both in distance and time of the Restoration audiences' consciousness of psychological and historical probability' France, for example, demanded 'a greater degree of both kinds of probability than Sicily' Tragic poets, probably for prudential reasons, avoided English subjects, and praise of the Anglo-Saxons was regarded as 'Whiggish' After the Popish Plot there were a certain number of plays with a party flavour Comedy generally avoided royalty or the peerage Vanbrugh's Lord Foppington is cited as an exception, but Berkeley has overlooked Congreve's Lord and Lady Froth, surely amongst the most fatuous characters in the whole range of the comedy of the period Finally there is a discussion of the effects of costume The magnificent accoutrements of tragic heroes and heroines enabled the audiences to accept all kinds of improbability of action and speech, while in comedy, where the actors and actresses appeared in 'scrupulously accurate' contemporary dress, psychological and historical probability was expected

The mystery of the origin of the writer who called herself Mrs Aphra Behn still eludes her biographers P D Mundy, whose previous article on the subject was noticed in *YW* xxxv 152, points to some more possible clues in a note in *NQ* He draws attention to the curious coincidence (if nothing more) that Thomas Amis of Elmsted had a wife called Aphra, and a daughter Aphra baptized at Elham in 1621 After his death she married a certain Thomas Bean If

Behn was an assumed name, might it not be derived from Bean? Lady Winchilsea stated that Aphra Behn was the daughter of a barber at Wye Richard Arter or Arthur, a barber of Wye, had two sons James Arthur and Richard Arthur, both barbers living at Wye in the 1630's James had four children all of whom died young, but there is no record at Wye of the burial of him or his wife, so it is possible that they moved elsewhere and had a daughter who became Aphra Behn In a query in *NQ* Mundy refers to Aphra Behn's alleged connexion with the spy William Scott and asks for authority for the statement in *DNB* that she was Scott's mistress He also refers to the statement by Harrison Platt, Jr, that she went to Surinam with Scott and asks for opinions on this theory

A F Hamilton in a query in *NQ* points to a possible connexion between the name of Aphra Behn's novel *Orinooko* and that of the river Orinoco He asks if this suggests that she visited Surinam or if the river name was known in seventeenth-century England

Raymond A Biswanger, Jr, contributes to *MLN* a note on *Several Words first employed in D'Urfey's 'The Richmond Heiress'* Among these words apparently employed in print for the first time in *The Richmond Heiress* (1693), it is surprising to find 'Horsepond', the earliest illustration for which in the *NED* is dated 1701

Roger Sharrock in his preface to his short monograph on Bunyan in Hutchinson's University Library[9] states that his aim has been to 'furnish a general introduction to Bunyan's work which incorporates the findings of modern scholarship' and that he has 'tried to do equal justice to his individual spiritual history and his place in the Puritan literary tradition' These aims are admirably fulfilled in this concise, stimulating, well-informed, and eminently readable work Beginning with an excellent account of Puritan England, Sharrock passes to a critical account of his major writings, which is always scholarly but never dry, and combines liveliness and a truly humanistic outlook with an accurate knowledge of Bunyan's work and its historical, religious, and literary background Useful lists of authorities are given at the end of each chapter and there is a valuable guide to further reading at the end of the volume

Louis G Locke has contributed to the well-known *Anglistica* Series a solid and scholarly study of the contribution to English literature of Archbishop Tillotson[10] This book includes a biography of Tillotson, a study of his prose style, and chapters on his 'Literary Reputation in Eighteenth Century Text Books' and his 'Reputation in Eighteenth Century Periodicals' In an appendix Locke reprints an amusing satiric poem on Tillotson from a broadside in the British Museum There is nothing particularly original in this work, it may be described as industrious, honest, and unexciting The writer's range of reading outside his special subject seems sometimes to be inadequate Bacon's influence on the new prose of the later seventeenth century is ignored Indeed Bacon's name only occurs in one unimportant reference, and he appears strangely in the index as 'Lord Francis Bacon' Moreover, on p 118 a passage is cited from a sermon of Tillotson's in which the schoolmen are compared to spiders spinning 'cobwebs out of their own

[9] *John Bunyan*, by Roger Sharrock Hutchinson's University Library pp 167 8*s* 6*d*

[10] *Tillotson a Study in Seventeenth Century Literature*, by Louis G Locke Rosenkilde og Bagger Copenhagen (Anglistica IV) pp 187 Dan Kr 23

bowels' Locke gives this passage as an example of 'homely and unsophisticated observations, perhaps recollected from his youth in a quiet Yorkshire village' and seems unaware of the fact that Tillotson is simply borrowing the image from the famous passage on the schoolmen in Bacon's *Advancement of Learning* Locke's own style is somewhat stilted and misprints are fairly numerous Nevertheless his book contains a great deal of interesting and valuable material It has a good index and a useful bibliography

Urian Oakes was brought to New England by his Puritan parents at an early age and graduated at Harvard in 1649 He returned to England where he became pastor to a Puritan congregation in Hampshire In 1668 he went back to America, was elected pastor of the Congregational Church at Cambridge, Massachusetts, and won great fame as a preacher He was a leading figure in Harvard College in the reign of Charles II and, on the resignation of President Leonard Hare, consented to become president *pro tempore* Finally he accepted the presidency in 1680 and died in the following year His fine sermon, *The Soveraign Efficacy of Divine Providence*, preached in 1677 to the Artillery Company of Cambridge, was published posthumously in 1682 It is now reprinted by the Augustan Reprint Society[11] with a scholarly introduction by Joseph Le Blau Le Blau's exposition of Oakes's theory of primary and secondary causation is a valuable and suggestive contribution to the study of Puritan thought in the seventeenth century

The formal celebration of St Cecilia's Day in England seems to have begun in 1683 and continued practically without interruption till 1703 and at irregular intervals down to the present day The best-known results of the early celebrations are the two famous Odes of Dryden, but, besides these and odes by other poets performed on these occasions, there were other literary products of the St Cecilia cult in the form of sermons preached generally at St Bride's Church, probably because it was the largest consecrated building near Stationers' Hall, where the secular celebrations were held The custom of including a divine service in the St Cecilia's day festival began in 1693, a regular feature of these services was a sermon in praise of music delivered by a distinguished preacher and printed 'at the request of the Stewards' These sermons commonly defended the use of music on scriptural grounds, cited traditional witnesses from biblical and pagan antiquity to attest its power to raise the soul to communion with the divine, and justified its use in religious services against Puritan criticism James E Phillips, Jr, has edited two interesting examples of such sermons[12] for the Augustan Reprint Society with a concise and informative introduction The two sermons are respectively by Sampson Estwick (1696) and Nicholas Brady (1697) They were chosen because they 'present almost all the traditional arguments in favour of music with a minimum amount of duplication and with unusual effectiveness of expression' Both, incidentally, are very attractive and vigorous specimens of late seventeenth-century prose

[11] *Urian Oakes The Soveraign Efficacy of Divine Providence* Augustan Reprint Society Publication Number 53 pp ix+40 Los Angeles William Andrews Clark Memorial Library, University of California

[12] *Two St Cecilia's Day Sermons (1696–1697)* Augustan Reprint Society Publication Number 49 pp viii+53 Los Angeles William Andrews Clark Memorial Library, University of California

Pappity Stampoy is the mysterious name or *nom-de-plume* of the editor of *A Collection of Scotch Proverbs* printed in London in 1663 This rare pamphlet has now been reprinted by the Augustan Reprint Society[13] with an introduction by Archer Taylor, in which he gives a brief history of the early Scottish collections of proverbs, and states that the Pappity Stampoy collection is for the most part derived from David Fergusson's *Scottish Proverbs* published at Edinburgh in 1641 On p i of his introduction Archer states that the first edition of Fergusson's collection was published in 1641 and that a new edition appeared in 1659 On p iii, however, we are told that 'certain variations' in the Pappity Stampoy collection (presumably variations from the 1641 text of Fergusson) 'must have been introduced into one or both of the editions of 1649 and 1659' This is Taylor's first allusion to an edition of Fergusson published in 1649 He admittedly derives most of his information about the Fergusson Collections from Beveridge's edition of *Fergusson's Scottish Proverbs* (Scottish Text Society, 1924) It seems unfortunate that this bibliographical information should be given at second-hand instead of being based on an examination of original texts Another deficiency is the lack of a glossary, which should certainly have been provided for a text of this kind However, these pithy, salty proverbs were well worth reprinting and the collection has a particular historical interest as it was the first of its kind published in London

If Andrew Marvell's lyrical poems are all written before 1660, his political activities belong to the Restoration period Attention may, therefore, be drawn here to an interesting note on *Marvell and Politics* by Dennis Davison in *NQ* Davison draws attention to the discoveries of K H D Haley published in his book *William of Orange and the English Opposition* (O U P, 1953), where it is stated Haley quotes documentary evidence that 'almost conclusively points to Marvell as one of the Dutch "fifth column" operating under the direction of Peter Du Moulin in 1672–4'

George W Whiting contributes to *NQ* an article on *George Hickes and his 'Thesaurus'* in which he criticizes the 'too facile acceptance of the traditions that Hickes's work in Northern philology was due to the influence of White Kennett who tried to 'divert' his mind from 'Politicks' by turning his attention to 'the Saxon and Septentrional Tongues' and that 'after he was deprived of his ecclesiastical rights in 1690 his friends urged Hickes to continue his study on the Northern dialects as a means of taking his mind off his troubles' Whiting shows that Hickes's interest in and study of the septentrional tongues dates back to 1683, when he was made Dean of Worcester by Charles II He published his first work on the subject in 1689 and a letter which Whiting quotes shows that five years later his interest in the subject was unabated Other documents quoted in the article show that he had started work on the *Thesaurus* in 1696

Robert Newcomb contributes to *PMLA* a note on *Poor Richard's Debt to Lord Halifax* in which he discusses the influence of the *Miscellaneous Thoughts and Reflections* of George Savile, Marquis of Halifax, on Benjamin Franklin's *Poor Richard's Almanac* He shows clearly that Franklin's aphorisms are often borrowed from Halifax and quotes thirty-two

[13] *Pappity Stampoy A Collection of Scottish Proverbs* (1663) With an Introduction by Archer Taylor The Augustan Reprint Society Publication Number 52 Los Angeles William Andrews Clark Memorial Library, University of California See p 187, n 30

from *Poor Richard's Almanac* with the aphorisms of Franklin from which they are derived He notes that Franklin could often make 'the abstract aphorism strike home in a proverbial fashion by the addition or substitution of concrete terms or metaphors for the language of the more abstract original' and he considers that 'in almost every instance Franklin's revision is an improvement over the original'

XIII THE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY

By EDITH J MORLEY

IN his study of the meaning of *The Dunciad*[1] Aubrey Williams sets out to show that its relation to the *Aeneid* is much closer than has hitherto been suggested Not only obvious details but also the whole plan of the poem derive from Virgil Pope was not attempting to imitate classical epic in general but to parody one particular epic, the *Aeneid* This accounts for the supposed lack of action of which critics have complained the action of Pope's poem is 'the removal of the empire of Dulness from the City of London to the polite world, Westminster, just as the action of the Aeneid is the removal of the empire of Troy to Latium', the City figuring metaphorically for Troy and the court world for Latium

Similarly, detailed examination shows that the relation with *Paradise Lost* is not merely occasional and allusive *The Dunciad* is also an account of 'a war between good and evil Milton's devils appear in a new context as dunces they carry to conclusion the work of destruction introduced by Satan, the *Dunciad* ends when the "dread Empire" of Chaos is "restored"' The Devil, Sin and Death, along with the whole host of rebel angels are drawn into the action of the *Dunciad* and are made to impart some of their infernality to the dunces' There is much else in this study by Williams to cast new light on Pope's intention and the ways in which it is carried out, e g in the annotations to *The Dunciad Variorum* of 1729 and their 'careful mis-statements of fact' in the manner of the sixteenth-century hoax entitled *Epistolae Obscurorum Virorum*, which was still well known to Pope and his contemporaries

In brief, this study of the meaning of the *Dunciad* forms an indispensable work of reference for all readers who wish to discover its full implications and nature and are not content to enjoy it merely for its merits as a great poem

In his study of *The Major Satires of Alexander Pope*[2] Robert Rogers attempts to discover 'the ethical assumptions on which his satire was based' and 'what sort of ethical achievement' he considered 'possible to man' or whether in his satires he was 'merely venting his spleen upon his enemies' or writing Tory propaganda These and similar questions he tries to answer by detailed examination of *The Dunciad Variorum of 1729*, *The Essay on Man* and the *Ethic Epistles* and *The Imitations of Horace* Finally a discussion of Warburton and the Later Satiric Mode provides perhaps the best chapter in the book Five appendixes include full accounts of the quarrel with Lady Mary and Sporus, and of the Pamphlet Campaigns Concerning Pope, 1728–1744 which runs into twenty pages and names more than 100 items, giving the authorship when known, the date of publication, 'and a digest of information in the imprint'

Since Rogers deals with Pope's career from the period when he started work on *The Dunciad* his biography is of necessity included for his life was part and parcel of his literary

[1] *Pope's 'Dunciad' A Study of its Meaning*, by Aubrey L Williams Methuen pp x+162 18*s*

[2] *The Major Satires of Alexander Pope*, by Robert W Rogers Illinois Studies in Language and Literature, Vol 40 Illinois U P pp xii+164

achievement—even more so than is the case with other writers

The importance of Rogers's work and what gives it indispensable worth to other scholars, lies in the fact that he has collected all the documentary evidence which has any bearing on his subject His industry has been untiring and it has enabled him to let us see in print such things as the various drafts of famous passages in *The Dunciad* and to hear him speak with authority on the relation between Pope's ethical philosophy and that of Bolingbroke

In *Mythopoeic Activity in 'The Rape of the Lock'* (*ELH*) Rebecca P Parkin shows that 'divinity is in varying degrees postulated of almost everything—of Belinda, the Baron, the Scissors, the sparkling Cross, the Lap-Dog, the Petticoat and the Lock, as well as of Love, Fate, Jove, and the Sylphs and Gnomes with all pertaining to them'

In *Pope, The Byzantine Empress, and Walpole's Whore* (*RES*) James M Osborn shows that the famous concluding passage of *The Epilogue to the Satires* was not merely an abstract personification of Vice Triumphant but was aimed at Walpole's second wife and former mistress, Molly Skerrett

Sven Armens trains all the guns of minor American academic criticism on the writings of John Gay[3] in order to prove that he was no mere lighthearted poet but an earnest satirist of the times in which he lived Armens takes himself as well as his subject too seriously and his book with its involved sentences and technical terms makes heavy reading This is a pity for he has something fresh and worth while to say about Gay who is not merely the superficial jester he is sometimes made to appear in histories of literature All the same he was not a profound satirist or moralist and it is nonsense to talk of 'the darkness of Gay's gloom split by rays of laughter' Armens gets things out of proportion by dwelling only on one aspect of Gay's work and that by no means the most important Nor does he strengthen his case by making mistakes about facts, as for instance when he states (pp 190–2) that Gay's *Fables* were influenced by Bolingbroke's *Patriot King* which was not written until six years after his death Nor is this an isolated example of careless mis-statement

Were these faults corrected and the book condensed into an essay in *PMLA* or some such publication, Armens would be more likely to obtain the recognition which, on other grounds, he deserves for his fresh approach to Gay's writings

Thomas Gray has waited long for an adequate biography, but he has not waited in vain R W Ketton-Cremer[4] has now produced one such as he might himself have approved, a book which displays intimate knowledge, appreciation, and understanding of the man and his work As we read the book, we come to see Gray in his surroundings and in his century, a recluse by choice but not too withdrawn from society to make many friends to whom he was closely attached and with whom he corresponded in letters which rank among the best written in that age of great letter-writers, and prove the injustice of the accusation that he 'never spoke out' Whatever the age in which he had lived, Gray would never have published freely or aimed at securing a large audience for that he was too egocentric, too finical, and perhaps too lacking in mental vigour He aimed always at a perfection which was un-

[3] *John Gay Social Critic*, by Sven M Armens Columbia U P and O U P pp viii+262 32*s*

[4] *Thomas Gray A Biography*, by R W Ketton-Cremer C U P pp xiv+310 25*s*

attainable except at rare intervals, nor could he write poetry, as he himself said, unless he felt the spirit move him —and that was never to order by himself or others

Ketton-Cremer had the benefit of Leonard Whibley's manuscripts and notes in writing his biography, but the Life owes to its author the sympathetic interpretation which rejects the solitary figure withdrawn from mankind and from contemporary life Gray is rightly depicted as much more at home in his time and in the world of men than he is often depicted, but nevertheless as one who deliberately preferred a life apart from the hurly-burly of public affairs for which he cared less than for the pursuits of the scholar and the minor interests with which he filled his days.

A paper-bound, well-printed anthology of *Augustan Satirical Poetry*[5] is obviously intended primarily for undergraduate students but may well serve a wider public both in its native Australia and elsewhere It contains 124 examples of various types of satirical poetry, some not more than a couple of lines in length, others, e g *The Vanity of Human Wishes*, complete poems The chief objection to the anthology is that there is nothing to indicate the authorship or whether the lines printed are excerpts or complete poems unless one turns to the notes at the end of the volume, and though these are full and illuminating, they do not say whether the titles given in the text are invented by the editors or those given by the authors Similarly the Index of Poets and Index of First Lines do not compensate for the absence of an Index of Titles Thus to locate a particular poem by Pope it is necessary to look through three lines of 'references to poem numbers' before it can be discovered

A special word of appreciation is due to the introduction which contrives to condense into thirty-nine pages an enormous amount of information, among other things to distinguish Horatian and Juvenalian satire and to discuss the Augustan use of the closed couplet

In *The Times* (29 Sept), Oliver Edwards, in a couple of columns which he calls *In Verdant Meads*, discusses some eighteenth-century lyric poetry and its characteristic patterns of verbal convention and diction often combined with 'an undertone of sincere emotion'.

Lilian Haddakin is the first English critic to devote a whole volume to the discussion of Crabbe's poetry[6] She succeeds in showing his merits as a writer as well as his knowledge of human nature and the sources from which he drew his experience of life and his skill in its portrayal Mrs Haddakin proves him to be not only an excellent story-teller but one whose purpose went beyond mere realistic description She lays stress upon his imaginative use of his facts and of his introduction of telling details, and is emphatic in her negative answer to the question 'Why not in prose?' His everyday scenes and characters are 'not discriminated by any shining or eminent peculiarities' but the commonplace is transcended by the insight which knows how to reveal its universal significance While absorbed in the ordinary, and relying on no 'adventitious aids' and 'stripping away all that is irrelevant', his tales in verse become poetry by reason of 'a power of vision that can penetrate crass surfaces and a power of expression that can convey at once a sense of crude fact and an intimation of pervasive

[5] *Charitable Malice A Choice of Augustan Satirical Poetry*, ed by Leonard Burrows and David Bradley Univ of Western Australia Press pp vi+206 12*s* 6*d*

[6] *The Poetry of Crabbe*, by Lilian Haddakin Chatto & Windus pp 176 12*s* 6*d*

and meaningful process' that 'succeeds in conducting us through the dingy and trivial to the gradually incandescent' He is often careless in workmanship but 'the roughness or mannerisms are no more than incidental shortcomings' He 'achieved what he aimed at the rendering of human character, in action and development', with 'a mastery of forcible spareness of expression' that would not have been possible in prose At his best there are passages that go far beyond mere description whether of man or of his natural surroundings By his tales of painful realities he succeeds in writing poetry that 'lift[s] the mind from the painful realities of actual existence' It was this which he believed should be the effect of poetry such as his, 'poetry without an atmosphere'

Frank Whitehead's *Selections* from Crabbe's Poetry[7] in the Queen's Classics Certificate Books may be recommended as an excellent introduction to that poet for adults as well as young people The editor writes *con amore* and with knowledge of one whom he, perhaps surprisingly, numbers 'among the great poets of the English tradition' But he supports his opinion convincingly and his examples show Crabbe to be 'a master of the art of short-story writing in verse' in tales not so well known as *Peter Grimes* and *The Lover's Journey* 'The notes at the end of the volume supply the background information necessary for a full understanding of the poet's intention and provide questions and comments helpful to the appreciation of the poems as literature ' School textbooks are seldom as stimulating as this, which shows how literature may be 'taught' not only in the school-room

James Barke claims that his edition of Burns's poetry[8] is complete (except for the bawdy poems in *The Merry Muses*), that it contains sixty poems not hitherto published in a collected edition and some of them never before printed, that poems known to be spurious have been omitted, and that special attention has been paid to textual accuracy These claims are sufficiently justified, though no indication of the new poems is given, and praise is also due to the excellence of the printing and layout of the volume and to the marginal glosses and general glossary

But these merits are outweighed by the foolishness of the introduction which, in half a dozen pages, manages to repeat and exaggerate all the banalities of the yearly birthday gatherings Not only are we told that Burns was undernourished and half-starved as a boy, but that he suffered the 'sketchiest of education'—both demonstrably untrue statements In addition we learn that 'He belongs to the company of the supremely great—Beethoven, Shakespeare, Rembrandt', and that 'He is the first poet of common humanity he is the first poet to transcend poetry' —whatever that may signify Such assertions serve no purpose but to alienate sympathy Burns is sufficiently great to merit sane critical appreciation as a man and a poet

In *The Blackened Wall Notes on Blake's 'London' and Eliot's 'The Waste Land'* Helen Watson-Williams compares Blake's poem with a passage in Eliot's (*English*) and concludes that 'It seems more than probable' that the later poet 'is recalling, perhaps unconsciously, the terrifying evocation of an earlier waste land'

[7] *George Crabbe Selections from his Poetry*, ed by Frank Whitehead Chatto & Windus pp 204

[8] *Poems and Songs of Robert Burns A Complete New Edition including over 60 Poems appearing for the First Time in a Collected Edition, of which Some Have Never Before been Published*, ed by James Barke Collins pp 736 7*s* 6*d* and 12*s* 6*d*

In a reprint from the *Journal of the American Oriental Society* (vol 73, no. 4, 1953), Garland H Cannon writes on *Sir William Jones and the 'Sakuntala'*, describing the impression made on him by his first discovery of the great Sanskrit drama and by the account he gave of it in his diary-letters to Earl Spencer in 1787—the earliest references to it in Europe

Cannon also (*College English*) points to Jones's *A Hymn to Ganga* (1785) as a probable source, conscious or unconscious, of Coleridge's *Kubla Khan* Cannon establishes the connexion with Jones from the poet's Notebook and shows the likelihood of his influence on *Kubla Khan* by a detailed comparison of the two poems

G H Healey has collected in a single volume Defoe's complete letters,[9] as far as they can be traced he has fully annotated them and laboriously provided the reader with all possible assistance for their understanding though this has to be gleaned from the footnotes to individual letters and is not gathered together in an introduction relating Defoe to the political background of his time This omission is serious for the correspondence is almost entirely about affairs of state, much the most important and far the greatest proportion consisting of the large number of letters addressed to Harley The originals of these are in the possession of the Duke of Portland and had already appeared in volumes 4 and 5 of the Historical Manuscripts Commission though not in so accessible an edition

Of the total 251 letters printed by Healey, only six are published for the first time, two of them to Defoe, the other four by him 'Chronologically, the letters run from 1703, when Defoe was about 42 years old, to 1730, a few months before his death ' Very few of them are about his private affairs and none refer to his novels or to contemporary men-of-letters His correspondence 'must have been enormous', but of his ordinary everyday personal writing very little has been preserved, nor indeed was this to be expected from the people whom he addressed It is fortunate that Harley was a collector, with 'an instinct for keeping things', and that he employed Defoe as a political agent, especially during the period of the Union with Scotland, 1706–7 Defoe's merits as a letter-writer are those which he displays as a novelist By speaking as a witness of what he is describing and by giving a multitude of trivial details, his pictures convey the same impression of truth as that produced by Hogarth in his paintings If he invents what he asserts, it becomes credible by reason of its unimportance Nothing is too small for notice, e g 'I saw one of the Waggon Drivers Wounded with a stone On the Face which if it had not Glanced On his shoulder First I believe had Certainly Killed him ' But Defoe is forceful in various styles and his letters make a living chapter in history

The last one in the volume, addressed to his son-in-law when he was dying and solitary, is of a different kind and shows him in another aspect, which we should like to know better But though this is not to be, the work done by Healey is something for which his readers have genuine reason to be grateful

Ellen D Oldham writes in the *Boston Public Library Quarterly* on the *Problems of a Defoe Cataloger* As she is employed in its Rare Book Department which possesses the unique Trent collection of Defoe's works, she is well fitted to describe the difficulties encountered by bibliographers in deciding on Defoe's author-

[9] *The Letters of Daniel Defoe*, ed by George Harris Healey O U P pp xxii+ 506 42*s*.

ship of the pamphlets and tracts published during the first twenty-five years of his career—the period dealt with in her article on the 'editions', 'issues', and 'variants' of the texts and the light they throw on 'the workings of eighteenth-century printing and publishing'.

An Early Printed Report on the Apparition of Mrs Veal by Arthur H Scouten (*RES*) describes an account in the *Loyal Post*, Monday, 10 September 1705, of the Apparition to Mrs Bargrave, whereas Defoe's *True Relation* was not published until 5 July 1706 (Cf *YW* xxxv 162 for Rodney Baine's account of current versions of the story) There is no evidence that Defoe had seen the *Loyal Post* when he wrote

As Rae Blanchard says in her introduction, 'The papers of *The Englishman*[10] afford an unusual opportunity to study Richard Steele's Whiggism and his method of conducting a political journal', the first series being an opposition periodical, the second a government organ, and both being issued in months of crisis in 1713–14 and in 1715 respectively In each series Steele wrote as the chief journalist of the Whig party As Dr Blanchard presents the papers, with copious annotation and description, a selection of the advertisements of books and pamphlets printed in the journal, and 'a bibliographical list' and index, the volume contains everything necessary for comprehension of the political conflict reflected in the papers and of Steele's methods and opinions, which are those of a serious thinker and by no means of the type of man depicted by Thackeray in his light-hearted estimate The wheel has come full circle and nowadays it is Addison rather than Steele who is apt to be depreciated Dr Blanchard's latest volume forms, as she intended, 'an acceptable and a helpful addition to the shelf of Steele's writings' which she has provided for all who wish to become acquainted with them and their author as well as with the Whig points of view on such subjects as constitutional monarchy, religious toleration, and parliamentary freedom of debate The various volumes she has published place Dr Blanchard in the front rank of scholarly and successful editors

The twelfth volume of Swift's Prose Works[11] by Herbert Davis for the Shakespeare Head Press edition reaches the standard he has taught us to expect It contains twenty-four tracts, an introduction of thirty-six pages, three appendixes, textual notes, an index, and twenty-two illustrations consisting of facsimiles of title-pages and the like The introduction provides the reader with all he needs to know of the background which impelled Swift to write the tracts These include the *Modest Proposal*—the most terrible of all his ironical writings, and the *Short View of the State of Ireland* in which he presented in more direct language the ills from which the country suffered as a result of English tyranny The concise textual notes add to the value of the volume, which also gains much from strictly chronological arrangement of the tracts—all of them written after Swift's return to Ireland from his last visit to England They present him as a political pamphleteer at the height of his powers

Ricardo Quintana's *Swift, An Introduction*[12] is not to be regarded as a substitute for his *Mind and Art of*

[10] *The Englishman, A Political Journal*, by Richard Steele, ed by Rae Blanchard O U P pp xxii+498 50*s*

[11] *Irish Tracts 1728–1733*, by Jonathan Swift, ed by Herbert Davis Blackwell pp xxviii+358 21*s*

[12] *Swift, An Introduction*, by Ricardo Quintana O U P pp x+204 21*s*

Jonathan Swift (*YW* xvii 216–17), but it exemplifies many of the merits of the longer book and serves as a most useful approach to Swift by its balanced, critical account of his career and of the relation between his ideas and those current in his time Swift of course transcended his age by reason of his genius and 'his power to bring words to bear on events', but with all his individuality, his opinions are closely related to those held by contemporary thinkers whose views he shared on many religious and political questions *A Tale of a Tub* and *Gulliver* are representative of the Augustan convictions which Swift held as well as of his satirical power and of his uncompromising independence of outlook His work must be seen as that of 'a literary artist of the Enlightenment' if it is properly to be estimated for his 'genius was not original but representative' But he was also an outstanding master of irony and of the comic genius whose individual mind shapes and is to be sought in all that it produced

Middleton Murry succeeds in giving a provocative and lively account of Swift[13] and his writings in the few pages at his disposal and though not everyone will subscribe to the justice of his estimate, the pamphlet should serve as a stimulating introduction to the man and his works An adequate bibliography for the purpose is also provided

Walpole's correspondence with Sir Horace Mann[14] extends from 1740 to 1786, from before Pope's death until the appearance of the Kilmarnock Burns, and as the editors rightly claim, had these been the only letters of Walpole to survive, 'his place as a letter-writer would be just what it is' For in them there is presented a fuller picture of the time than is to be found in any other contemporary writer and 'the correspondence with Mann quickens and slows according to the pulse of national affairs' The Yale edition for the first time prints Mann's letters in full and these depict the Florentine society in which he was condemned to play his part as 'a fussy minor diplomat whose main job was to watch the Pretender' but they also give us the portrait of a kindly, generous man, anxious to serve his country faithfully and gradually establishing his position as its worthy and respected representative Walpole's letters have been preserved and are here printed in the revised form in which he prepared them for ultimate publication, for there is no doubt, in spite of his precautions, that this is what he intended Why else have transcribed and amended them with such care? There is no question that he regarded himself as an historian and that he wished 'to write for posterity a full, accurate, and readable account of his own time', making it live again by his eyewitness accounts of 'the customs, fashions, politics, diversions and private history which can be properly transmitted to posterity, only in this manner' Today no one doubts his achievement of his aim or accepts Macaulay's view of Walpole as a trifler The final refutation of that conception is provided by the devoted labours of the editors who are responsible for the Yale Edition, one of the outstanding scholarly enterprises of this age of great editors These three volumes, Nos 17, 18, 19 of the series, fully maintain its reputation by providing an introduction that compresses a great deal of information about Mann

[13] *Swift*, by J Middleton Murry Longmans for The British Council and National Book League Writers and Their Work No 61 pp 44 2*s*

[14] *Horace Walpole's Correspondence with Sir Horace Mann*, ed by W S Lewis, Warren Hunting Smith, and George L Lam Yale U P and O U P 3 vols pp lxviii+506, viii+568, viii+512 £12

into a few pages, and a history of the letters which are themselves fully and excellently annotated This is the first of the three proposed instalments of the Mann correspondence The full index is necessarily kept back until the publication of the third instalment, it would have been helpful had there been a separate index to the three volumes already printed

Nine of the twelve chapters in Irving's book on the *English Letter-Writers*[15] deal, as we should expect, with the eighteenth century, and only one with earlier British correspondents Chapters I and II are entitled Classical Models and French and Continental Practice these, together with the introduction, combine to show the author's purpose He is trying, as he says later, in his study of Walpole and Cowper, 'to extract what there is of theory to be found, to get at their ideas about letter writing, to discover if possible in their letters the essential contribution which each made to the development of the art', that being his sole purpose in the considerable volume which he devotes to the subject The familiar letter was held for centuries to be a genre of prose-writing and it is as such that Irving examines the many and varied kinds of correspondence which have survived and come to his notice The substance and contents of the letters are not in question except incidentally and as part of his main object

The book therefore breaks new ground and deals with a genre which has not previously been studied as a recognized 'kind' of literature in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries One result is to modify hitherto-accepted opinion of individual letter-writers now that they are seen in relation to the practice and attitude of their time

The eighteenth-century novelists dealt with by Walter Allen[16] are Defoe and Fielding and there could be no better introduction to their lives and work than the brief account—some fifty pages in all—that are here devoted to them The book is designed for young people and should find a place in every school library But it is written in a way to appeal to readers of any age for the author's knowledge, understanding use of his facts, and sympathetic insight into the achievement and personality of his protagonists merit the attention of everyman and are both authoritative and absorbing

In *RES* Jean-Claud Sallé finds *A Source of Sterne's Conception of Time (Tristram Shandy)* in No 94 of the *Spectator*, 18 June 1711, rather than in a direct borrowing from Locke's *Essay Concerning Human Understanding*

'Everyman' reprints *Peregrine Pickle*[17] in the larger format with a new introduction by Walter Allen

Georgiana[18] by Lord Bessborough based upon the correspondence of the wife of the fifth Duke of Devonshire, and *Dearest Bess*,[19] *The Life and Times of Lady Elizabeth Foster*, told by Dorothy M Stuart from the records of her journals and correspondence, together give a 'background' picture of society life in aristocratic circles during the eighteenth century The two ladies, one the wife

[15] *The Providence of Wit in the English Letter Writers*, by William Henry Irving Duke U P and C U P pp 382 $7 50 56*s* 6*d*

[16] *Six Great Novelists*, by Walter Allen Hamilton pp 182 10*s* 6*d*

[17] *Peregrine Pickle*, by Tobias Smollett, ed by Walter Allen 2 vols Dent Everyman pp xiv+368, vi+366 7*s* 6*d* each vol

[18] *Georgiana, Extracts from the Correspondence of Georgiana, Duchess of Devonshire*, ed by the Earl of Bessborough Murray pp x+308 25*s*

[19] *Dearest Bess, The Life and Times of Lady Elizabeth Foster*, by Dorothy M Stuart Methuen pp xiv+266 21*s*

of the duke, the other the mistress, subsequently to succeed her as his lawful consort, were bosom friends and lived together with him in an 'amazing triangle', together with their progeny, at Devonshire House and Chatsworth, being received at court in England, France, and elsewhere on the Continent, apparently with no hint of disapproval and many marks of affection The stories are well worth reading and do much to explain the attraction exercised by the two women on those among whom they moved, for their charm is still potent even nowadays when rank no longer excuses such vagaries as distinguished the Devonshire House côterie Moreover, the picture painted makes as vivid and realistic a scene of certain aspects of life as any depicted by Hogarth, and it introduces to us many people of note in history, politics, and letters Had the story been invented instead of being carefully reconstructed from unimpeachable evidence, it would have been dismissed as incredible, but the two narrators give chapter and verse for their facts and for the living Rousseau-ish characters they introduce Students of literature should read both volumes as complementary to *Clarissa* and other eighteenth-century fiction

The editor of *Millenium Hall*[20] describes it as *An Eighteenth-Century Novel* The original title was *A Description of Millenium Hall and the Country Adjacent Together with the Character of the Inhabitants, And such Historical Anecdotes and Reflections, As May excite in the Reader proper Sentiments of Humanity, and lead the Mind to the Love of Virtue,* and though the book is so far in the epistolary form that it begins 'Dear Sir' and ends, after 170 printed pages, 'I am, Sir,' there is no further attempt to conform to the fashion popularized by Richardson in *Pamela* Mrs Scott published her book in 1762, and it purported to be written by 'A Gentleman on his Travels', though this claim is not likely to have deceived its readers since neither the supposed narrator nor any of the male characters bears much resemblance to a living man The women and girls are somewhat nearer to reality and the book is more like a courtesy-book for gentlewomen than a story intended for entertainment and the presentation of life Millenium Hall is a kind of charity school run by five wealthy ladies with advanced views on the education of girls and their training in good works and the care of the aged, and infirm and crippled, 'poor creatures who are rendered miserable from some natural deficiency or redundancy' Walter Crittenden tells us that there are elements of autobiography in Mrs Scott's account of the Utopian life led by the inhabitants of Millenium Hall, that she herself was intimate with Mrs Montagu and others of the Blue-Stockings, and that she and her friend Lady Bab Montagu at one time actually ran a house for poor girls at Batheaston somewhat on the lines of Millenium Hall The book merited resuscitation and the editor is to be commended for the reissue of the text without overloading it with unnecessary critical apparatus

The new format Everyman edition of Mary Wollstonecraft's *Rights of Woman* and John Stuart Mill's *On the Subjection of Women*[21] is a welcome reprint of two landmarks in social history The book is prefaced by Pamela Frankau in a few sensible and witty

[20] *A Description of Millenium Hall,* by Mrs Sarah Scott, ed by Walter M Crittenden New York Bookman Associates pp 200 $4

[21] *'The Rights of Woman' by Mary Wollstonecraft 'On the Subjection of Women' by John Stuart Mill,* ed by Pamela Frankau Dent Everyman 825 pp xii+318 6*s*

pages which form a good introduction to the pamphlets

If it is not quite accurate to say nowadays that 'Everyone thinks of Dr Johnson as an old man', it remains true, despite the Malahide Papers and the untiring labours of Aleyn Lyell Reade, that Boswell's Life provides for most people the Johnson who comes first to mind, while the earlier years of development and struggle are submerged by the later time when he had earned his position as the autocrat of London literary circles and the chief living English man-of-letters

James Clifford has therefore increased our indebtedness to him by his publication of *Young Samuel Johnson*,[22] a readable account of his boyhood and life until 1749, when he was on the threshold of his greatest period, was forty years of age, and had just published *The Vanity of Human Wishes* Here are all the facts carefully put together and interpreted, Lichfield town and its streets, surroundings, and inhabitants are resuscitated and we learn to share in the daily doings of the bookseller's shop, the grammar school, and the gradually widening interests which took the boy from home to Oxford and so by stages into the larger circle where he was gradually to find his footing

Clifford makes use of every scrap of information, new and old, and from it produces a credible picture that without any attempt at psychoanalytic methods, yet succeeds in giving insight into Johnson's mind and depicting his emotional and spiritual complexity as well as the influence of his physical characteristics The book is one for any intelligent reader, but it could have been written only by a scholar familiar with all the facts and competent to transmute them into a coherent whole

To the Men and Books introductions to English men of letters Michael Joyce contributes an excellent account of Dr Johnson[23] which, in a small space, manages to include his life, his writings, his conversation, and his character so that he emerges as a personality with whom we feel we are acquainted Joyce has obviously read the authorities and consulted 'the mass of information at his disposal' but he makes independent use of his material and arrives at his own conclusions These are not always in accord with those of the latest critics and often challenge opposition Many will not agree with his estimate of Johnson as a writer and will put his literary achievement considerably higher than does Joyce But the booklet is intended to serve as an introduction for the novice, and to him it can be recommended as exhilarating reading to put him in the right mood to pursue his study of a man he has already learned to love and admire

Henry Gifford contributes a paper on *The Vanity of Human Wishes* to *RES* in which he compares it with Juvenal's Tenth Satire and shows that Johnson's poem differs radically in imagery, tone, and subject-matter from his original 'The poem is deeply coloured with Johnson's own feeling' and his philosophy of life is 'at once more sombre and more compassionate than Juvenal's'

One hundred and twenty-five copies of E L McAdam's *Dr Johnson and the King's Library*[24] were printed at the Harvard University Printing Office for the Johnsonians' Dinner at the Grolier Club in New York, 30 September 1955, to commemorate the 246th anniversary of Johnson's birth-

[22] *Young Samuel Johnson*, by James L Clifford Heinemann pp xvi+368 30*s*

[23] *Samuel Johnson*, by Michael Joyce Longmans Men and Books pp xii+172 10*s* 6*d*

[24] *Dr Johnson and the King's Library*, by E L McAdam, Jr Harvard U P

day. The pamphlet consists of a facsimile of Johnson's letter to the King's Librarian, Frederick Augusta Barnard, on 28 May 1768 (Dr Chapman's *Letters*, No 206), its reproduction in print, together with a full explanation of certain references not hitherto annotated The letter is of great interest since it contains 'Johnson's fullest statement on book-collecting, and gives remarkable evidence of his prowess as a bibliographer' Johnson was writing to advise Barnard what to seek for the Library on his continental trip for the purchase of books

In *MLR* Arthur Sherbo has *Two Notes on Johnson's Revisions*, the first of his *Adventurer* essays, the second of *Mrs Masters's Poems* In *RES* the same writer describes *A Possible Addition to the Johnson Canon* which he judges by internal evidence to be the work of Johnson It is a review in the *Literary Magazine or Universal Review*, 1756, No V, of *Travels through Germany, Bohemia, Hungary, Switzerland, Italy and Lorrain* by John George Keysler

Each new volume in the Yale Edition of the Boswell papers is anticipated with eagerness and the present addition[25] to the series fulfils expectation of excellent editing though the contents are less exciting than those of the previous volumes (*YW* xxxi 208–10, xxxiii 218–19) Boswell's stay in Holland was over and he had left Geneva and was on his way to Italy, where he had his father's permission to spend four months The story told in the present volume is put together from Boswell's rough notes, diaries, and correspondence and from the book on Corsica he published in 1768 —a hotchpotch of material, which has been laboriously sifted and interpreted by the editors We are left with the feeling that Lord Auchinleck was not far wrong when he complained that his son had 'no business nor settled way of employing time' in the year in question, though, being Boswell, he makes his accounts of his doings amusing Nothing fresh is revealed about his Corsican experiences and his intercourse with Paoli, nor are there any detailed records of his love adventures, since he talks only 'in general' of his 'Turin' (and other) 'deviations' In place of these we are supplied with the letters of Girolama Piccolomini (Moma) after he had left Siena and an account by the editors of Boswell's affair with Rousseau's mistress, Thérèse Le Vasseur The volume ends with the death of Boswell's mother and his return to Scotland in March 1766 The editors are to be congratulated on making so readable and lively a book out of the scattered material at their disposal

Joseph Burke's long-awaited edition of Hogarth's *Analysis of Beauty*,[26] together with the hitherto inaccessible *Autobiographical Notes* in an accurate version, marks a new stage in the appreciation of Hogarth's originality as a thinker about art and also in the history of English aesthetics In his introduction Burke shows that Hogarth's work was his own and not indebted to the collaborators upon whom he has been supposed to depend Even his 'line of beauty' was his own invention and not the result of Italian influence the theory was worked out independently and by 'an evolutionary process' during his development as an artist 'There is nothing to suggest, either in picture or recorded statement, that he had worked out a com-

[25] *Boswell on the Grand Tour Italy, Corsica, and France 1765–1766*, ed by Frank Brady and Frederick A Pottle Heinemann pp xxx+384 25*s*

[26] *The Analysis of Beauty with the Rejected Passages from the Manuscript Drafts and Autobiographical Notes*, by William Hogarth, ed by Joseph Burke O U P pp lxii+244 42*s*

plete theoretical system at the outset of his career' '*The Analysis* stands out as a key document for eighteenth-century art Written by a painter, grounded in the baroque, who yet became the great master of satiric rococo, it throws a sharp light on the stylistic problems of the age' Burke includes The Rejected Passages from the Manuscript Drafts, which he publishes in full, so that we now possess Hogarth's complete writings on aesthetic theory in one volume as well as twelve full-plate illustrations with explanatory notes upon them

The editorial matter is as excellent as the printing and general production of the volume which is everything that can be desired in both contents and appearance

Maldwyn Edwards has produced a second edition of *John Wesley and the Eighteenth Century*[27] first published in 1933 and noticed in *YW* xiv 296

A Sermon before the Sons of the Clergy[28] preached by the Rev Dr Hervey Aston at St Paul's Cathedral in 1745 is attributed to Johnson who admitted that he was the ghost-writer of forty such sermons, some of which he wrote for the price of two guineas apiece This example, composed for his friend Hervey, is on the subject of charity and 'deserves a distinguished place in the literature of pulpit oratory'

Maidwell's *Essay upon the Necessity and Excellency of Education*[29] is a self-interested plea for 'educational realism', the teaching of subjects 'fitted to the natural inclinations and abilities of the students', modern languages, art, mathematics, geography, jurisprudence, and 'physical skills such as fencing and riding' instead of being confined to the classics and 'scholarly education' Maidwell was seeking for endowment of his own school and methods, but his essay is an interesting contribution to the history of educational theory

The *Familiar Letters*[30] of Mrs. Davys are an example of the many works of fiction written in the form of letters which appeared in England between 1660 and 1740 These prove that Richardson was following, not inventing, a new literary fashion, nor was he by any means the first to place 'an emphasis on "sensibility" and the minute analysis of the emotions' Robert Day adds a Bibliography of Epistolary Fiction during the period, which names 186 such works, many published anonymously

Journalism Quarterly (vol 3, no 2) of the University of Minnesota contains an article by Garland A Cannon entitled *Freedom of the Press and Sir William Jones* In this it is shown that the condemnation as a seditious libel of *The Principles of Government*, a pamphlet by Jones, was the direct cause of the introduction of the Fox Libel Act of 1792, and of Pitt's cordial support of the measure to secure the right of freedom of the press

B C Nangle's *Indexes of Contributors and Articles*[31] in the Second Series of the *Monthly Review* continues the valuable work begun in the similar *Indexes* to the First Series

[27] *John Wesley and the Eighteenth Century. A Study of his Social and Political Influence*, by Maldwyn Edwards Epworth Press pp 208 10*s* 6*d*

[28] *A Sermon before the Sons of the Clergy (1745)*, by Hervey Aston, ed by James L Clifford Augustan Reprint Society, No 50 pp xii+28

[29] *An Essay upon the Necessity and Excellency of Education (1705)*, by Lewis Maidwell, ed by J Max Patrick Augustan Reprint Society, No 51 pp vii+48

[30] *Familiar Letters Betwixt a Gentleman and a Lady (1725)*, by Mary Davys, ed by Robert A Day Augustan Reprint Society, No 54 pp xx+44 [Univ of California Subscription 15*s* or $3 a year]

[31] *The Monthly Review Second Series 1790–1815 Indexes of Contributors and Articles*, by Benjamin Christie Nangle O U P pp xx+268 30*s*

published in 1934 but not received for notice in *YW* In his preface to the present volume Nangle rightly points out that the *Indexes* provide 'essential evidence for a history of the periodical' and, one may add, indispensable help to students of literary history of the eighteenth century and of contemporary opinion on the writings of the day The book falls into five sections, a list of Contributors, which includes evidence for the identification of each as a Monthly Reviewer 'and facts concerning his career which establish his qualifications for that role', 'the initials and abbreviations written by Griffiths in the editor's copy of the periodical', 'the evidence for the identity of the contributor' of each article, and 'a cross-index of numbers, referring to the items in subsequent sections and giving a complete list of the reviews assigned by Griffiths to the contributor' Then follows an Index to Main Articles, an Index to Foreign Appendixes, an Index to Monthly Catalogues, and a Table of Years and Volume Numbers There are numerous cross-references and everything possible is provided to make consultation easy The book forms a most useful and indeed indispensable work which will be needed in every reference library It reflects the untiring skill and competence of its compiler.

In his introduction Chester F Chapin describes the scope and intention of his treatment of *Personification in Eighteenth-Century English Poetry*,[32] which he describes as falling into two types, the allegorical or descriptive and the metaphorical, each associated primarily with a particular kind of poetry The first part of his book is 'roughly chronological', dealing with the development of the 'attitudes towards personification', its prevalence in eighteenth-century verse, and 'a critical evaluation of this device in the verse of Collins and Gray' Part Two is chiefly critical and 'begins with a discussion of attitudes towards poetry held in common by Johnson and Pope' who represent a different tradition from that described in the first section since the writers are more nearly concerned with contemporary life But Chapin finds that both types of personification arise from theories then held about the nature and function of 'reason' and 'imagination' in poetry He therefore devotes the opening chapter of his book to a discussion of these eighteenth-century opinions in so far as they affect the use of personification

Finally he arrives at the conclusion that 'the elements of strength and weakness in eighteenth-century personification' are akin to its general strength and weakness, and that the device as used by the major poets is effective in conveying 'a strong sense of the real world'

The book is not, and could not have been, easy reading, for it deals with a difficult critical subject But the author brings to it a wealth of knowledge—his Bibliography of Works Cited runs to nine pages—and the power to use it with judgement and clarity of argument No one has previously attempted to cover his whole field and his work should prevent the loose statements and generalizations about personification to which critics of eighteenth-century poetry have often been too prone

Eighteenth-Century England,[33] the latest 'Complete Background Book' devised and in this case written by Arthur B Allen, for the Rockliff New

[32] *Personification in Eighteenth-Century English Poetry*, by Chester F Chapin Columbia U P and O U P pp x+176 24*s*

[33] *Eighteenth-Century England*, by Arthur B Allen The Rockliff New Project Series Rockliff pp viii+288 16*s*

Project Series, provides the background for the study of the period from the death of Queen Anne to 1800 It is divided into nine sections Great Names 'selected from a wide field', Science and Learning, Exploration, Social Life, Costume, Architecture, Literature, Inventors and Inventions, and Transport, Communications and Commerce All are copiously illustrated by reproductions of contemporary prints and portraits Readers are given guidance for their search for further information and it is everywhere impressed upon them that they must seek for themselves and they are being provided only with signposts on the road to knowledge The book forms a sound contribution to the 'project method' of learning and teaching and should find a place in every school library Nor will it be wanting in interest to older students of eighteenth-century literature who wish to relate what they read to the time in which it was written

To *The Times* of 29 July A Correspondent contributes an article entitled *A Stage of One's Own The English Private Theatre in the Eighteenth Century*, which describes 'the part played by private theatres in the social life' of the age and especially from 1770 to 1810 when the 'craze' for private theatricals was at its height

XIV. THE NINETEENTH CENTURY

(*a*) Books

By GEOFFREY BULLOUGH

1 *Poetry and Poets*

FEWER books than of recent years have come in for this chapter, which, however, scarcely betokens a slackening of interest W M Merchant[1] has published a very large and useful selection of Wordsworth's work arranged largely on chronological lines, though 'without attempting to re-arrange the poems in such collections as *Poems in Two Volumes*, 1807 in the order of their composition' The volume opens with the Autobiographical Memoranda dictated in 1847, then, between poems written in youth and *The Borderers*, comes *A Letter to the Bishop of Llandaff*, all the major criticism is gathered together after the *Lyrical Ballads*, the 1805 *Prelude* is given complete, extracts are printed from *The Convention of Cintra*, the *Essay on Epitaphs*, the Preface and Book I of *The Excursion*, the *Topographical Description of the Country of the Lakes*, with a generous selection of the topographical poems and of other later pieces, and eighteen significant letters (*TLS* 622)

Coleridge is represented by a sensitive study of the relationship between Coleridge and Sara Hutchinson[2] in which George Whalley shows what she was really like and 'what sort of "creative impulse" she had generated in Coleridge' Looking into 'the humbler details of their day-to-day living' he finds that the 'air of nostalgic "romance"' in the early poems inspired by Sara was not shared by her She was honest and good and if she was 'overmastered by the sterner rhythms of life', her mind adjusted itself 'with the sanity of clear-sighted acceptance' The book has four parts first a transcript of the Coleridge poems in Sara's manuscript book with a discussion of their dates, second a biographical summary of the couple's relations from 1799 to 1810, third a discussion of the 'Asra Poems', identifying additional ones, 'and tracing through all these certain threads of dominant imagery', fourth a survey of the general pattern of Coleridge's life during those ten years The 'Asra Poems' themselves appear in an appendix The complicated investigation is conducted with tact, delicacy, and scholarship (*TLS* 238)

The *Keats–Shelley Memorial Bulletin* for 1955[3] contains interesting items including some brief letters showing that in preparing for the burning of Shelley's body Trelawney was helped by the Rev Thomas Hall, 'and that Byron had a part in the preparations for the ceremony on the beach', Sylva Norman prints an affectionate letter to Leigh Hunt from his twenty-year-old son Vincent in which he speaks of the 'masterless dog's sensations that always accompany me when away from home', Edmund Blunden has an interesting article on Mrs Leigh Hunt and the paper silhouettes she cut of Byron and others ('Marianne Hunt and her sister Elizabeth Kent were two notable women', he argues) There are two items on Claire Clairmont copious

[1] *Wordsworth Poetry and Prose*, selected by W M Merchant Hart-Davis pp 883 27*s* 6*d*

[2] *Coleridge and Sarah Hutchinson*, by George Whalley Routledge and Kegan Paul pp xxi+188 21*s*

[3] *Keats–Shelley Memorial Bulletin, Rome*, No VI, ed by Dorothy Hewlett The Keats–Shelley Memorial Association Richmond pp xii+50 7*s* 6*d*

and fascinating extracts by Herbert Huscher from the journal she kept in Russia (long thought lost) with some glimpses of her life there and in Florence, and references to the American (Silsbee) who partly inspired H James's *The Aspern Papers*, and some notes by Marion Kingston, one of which concerns the little affair of the 'chiroplast' which she borrowed from their landlady in 1820 Other items are an account by Ursula Orange of Elise, nursemaid to the Shelleys, and one of Alfred Novello and his family's life in Geneva, written by his great-niece

A valuable collection including 975 books, 46 manuscripts, and 450 letters connected with the Novellos and Cowden Clarkes was given to the Brotherton Library, Leeds, in 1953, and has now been briefly described [4] The printed books were 'the tools of a literary workshop', the letters are rich in material concerning Shelley and Leigh Hunt, and there are three letters from Lamb transcribed by Mary Cowden Clarke (*English*)

J Middleton Murry's *Keats*[5] is a revised edition of the work first published (1930) as *Studies in Keats*, then (1939) as *Studies in Keats, New and Old*, and again (1949) as *The Mystery of Keats* So this is 'the third occasion on which it has been enlarged and drastically revised' The main additions on this occasion consist of two short essays *Keats and Friendship* and *Keats and Claret*, and a much longer one, *Keats and Isabella Jones* In revolt against the suggestion by Robert Gittings (*YW* xxv 185) that Keats wrote the *Bright Star* Sonnet about Isabella Jones and touched it up for Fanny Brawne, Murry criticizes Gittings's argument in some detail, and damagingly Keats had an excellent memory, the sonnet might have been written in 1819, not necessarily with the letters to Tom Keats *before him* Murry also attacks the theory that *The Eve of St Agnes* was written to celebrate the consummation of his passion for Mrs Jones He is amazed that good critics have accepted Gittings's argument, which involves regarding Keats as cynical and unfaithful just when his love for Fanny was growing.

The 'royalty of intellect' which Browning saw in Landor has never been sufficiently realized, and his quarrelsome life, though more studied than his books, has not been hitherto written in full despite Forster's long work (1869) and the excellent book by Malcolm Elwin (1941) In 1954 R H Super[6] produced after nearly twenty years' work a massive volume less than half as long as Forster's but more correct Super has had access to manuscript sources in Britain, the U S A, Italy, and elsewhere which were not available to Elwin, and his transcripts of unpublished materials form a valuable ingredient of his biography There is no complete collection of Landor's letters, and Super has done yeoman service towards a scholarly edition of these by determining the chronology of many of them The long and troubled story is illustrated by many references to the writings, from the early poems influenced by Thomas Warton, which Landor later regretted, through the days when he read the 'stupendous' poetry of Wordsworth, and those when he attacked him, to the last years when 'the grand old ruin of a genius' died poor but contented in Florence (*TLS* 277–8, *MLR* 528–9, *JEGP* 285–7, *MLQ* 274)

In his new edition of *A Browning*

[4] *The Novello–Cowden Clarke Collection* Univ of Leeds pp 19

[5] *Keats*, by John Middleton Murry (4th ed) Cape pp 322 21*s*

[6] *Walter Savage Landor A Biography*, by R H Super New York U P pp xv+ 654 $7 50

Handbook[7] first published in 1935 W C De Vane has made full use of the great quantity of new material made available in the past twenty years, including collections of letters, critical studies, and biographies. The text (considerably enlarged), the footnotes, and bibliography bear witness to the author's determination to keep us abreast of the latest scholarship in a work which has helped several generations of students both by its own contents and by sending them to other critics

A new edition of Matthew Arnold's poems (first published in this collection in 1908) has appeared in the Everyman Library with an introduction by R A Scott-James[8] The editor, while admitting Arnold's fear of passion ('he had been brought up too well, he had been overtrained'), points out that there is 'often something all the more terrible in his quiet, suppressed, almost whispered cry of passion', and after praising *Sohrab* as narrative and *Empedocles* as philosophic poetry, concludes that Arnold 'has the virtues of sweetness, simplicity, directness, the power of appealing to the heart and the head, reasonableness and sanity combined with profound imaginative insight'

In a long, well-documented study G Muller-Schwefe[9] uses the accumulated knowledge about Arnold's life and work to attempt an interpretation in which the poet's own words are used to illuminate his view-point He begins by emphasizing Arnold's interest in language, and especially in poetic language as the expression of the writer's character, his search for a fitting style in his own work Some of Arnold's significant usages are pointed out His subjects were characteristic, he liked both those historical figures who mastered self, and those who were mastered by circumstance In *Merope* he tried to achieve 'the character of fixity' his view of mythology was influenced by his rationalism and knowledge of modern interpretations His personal poetry was most felt when attached to an impersonal theme, even the Marguerite poems reveal his essential solitude Self-conscious to a fault, filled with a sense of responsibility, his ideal was 'To know oneself and the world' Arnold's view of nature differs greatly from Wordsworth's—Nature can be Man's antagonist, or an indifferent environment in which he proves his superiority, yet in the ultimate scheme Man and Nature are linked Arnold's social views are considered in relation to his essential individualism In the end there is a contradiction between Man's aspiration and his limitations The importance for Arnold's poetry of direct experience is shown, he wrote close to the occasion, passing from present to past, from the inner self to the scene around, or vice versa He wrote several poems inspired by pictures, which show the strength of the visible world in his imagination, he saw life symbolically as a river, a dream, a tempestuous sea, and the contrast between storm and calm, mountain and plain, denotes the antithesis native to his mind

In the long introduction to *A Swinburne Anthology*[10] Kenelm Foss 'enters' the lists as champion of a neglected bard in an age when poetry

[7] *A Browning Handbook*, by W Clyde De Vane 2nd ed New York Appleton, London G Bell pp viii+594 45*s*

[8] *Matthew Arnold's Poems* Introduction by R A Scott-James Dent Everyman 334 pp xvi+368 6*s*

[9] *Das personliche Menschenbild Matthew Arnolds in der dichterischen Gestaltung*, von Gerhard Müller-Schwefe (Buchreihe der Anglia, 6 Band) Tübingen Niemeyer pp 292 DM 34

[10] *A Swinburne Anthology Verse, drama, prose, criticism* Selected, with a biographical introduction, by Kenelm Foss Richards Press pp 254 15*s*

has neither rhyme nor reason, sense nor sensibility' He gives a frank, high-spirited sketch of Swinburne's life, and urges 'that the poet's work, with his splendid ear for melody, his passionate intensity, spell-binding vitality, should be gratefully accepted, without looking a gift-horse in the mouth, as a glittering fountain of delight, being often more sound than sense' The anthology, mainly but not entirely chronological, gives a sufficiency of the legendary Swinburne of *Poems and Ballads* fame, but not enough of the Ballades and other metrical experiments There are a few extracts from letters and the sadistic stories, but more might have been given of the critical writings, and there is not enough of the plays to show Swinburne's powers as a dramatist

Margaret Sawtell's study of Christina Rossetti[11] is also written in reaction against 'the chess-like intricacies of modern verse' and out of affection, 'with the express purpose of clearing her name from the accusations of morbidity and self-torture' The author uses the poems side by side with the known biographical facts to show Christina's state of mind at the crises of her life The book stresses throughout her basic preoccupations with 'the subject of a choice between God and man—of the uncertain, unsatisfying results of human passion, of the longing for escape from feeling, to solitude and peace' Not literary ambition but sanctity was her chief desire from the age of eighteen, but her feeling for James Collinson grew after she lost him, first to Catholicism and then (more bitter) to another woman, the story of her religious life is complicated by her feelings for her family, her illness, her social work, and her new love for Charles Cayley, which she denied fulfilment because he was an agnostic Her poetry is one of religious faith crossed by the 'grief of frustration and the pain of unappeasement' in earthly things, but clear with self-knowledge

A selection of the poems[12] makes a pleasant companion-volume to this biography The editor in countering 'the general supposition that Christina Rossetti's poems are wholly preoccupied with penitence and death' begins with love poems, before presenting sixteen about parting and death Then follow groups on 'The Inner Life', 'Christmas and Easter', 'Time and Eternity', 'Nature', and 'Nursery Poems', the whole giving a very satisfactory picture of 'a winged spirit' possessed of 'a sense of humour and a rare pathos', excelling in 'child-like simplicity of phrase', and (one might add) great subtlety of self-analysis expressed with formal beauty and verbal delicacy

In his edition of the poems of Emily Bronte (*YW* xxv 187) C W Hatfield paid tribute to the work of Miss F E Ratchford on the Gondal-Saga which occupied Emily and her sisters intermittently from her eighteenth to her twenty-seventh year Now Miss Ratchford, in *Gondal's Queen*,[13] has woven the poems into a summary of the story, making use of Hatfield's chronological labours and of all the scattered Gondal material which she herself has studied for many years The result will interest all Emily's admirers, and convince some of those who have doubted the value of relating her verse to 'the ramshackle structure and child-

[11] *Christina Rossetti, her Life and Religion*, by Margaret Sawtell Mowbray pp 160 10*s* 6*d*

[12] *Poems of Christina Rossetti*, selected and arranged by Kathleen Jarvis Mowbray pp xii+106 6*s*

[13] *Gondal's Queen A Novel in Verse by Emily Jane Bronte* Arranged, with an Introduction and Notes, by Fannie E Ratchford Austin Univ of Texas Press and Thomas Nelson pp 207 18*s*

ish melodramatic plots' (D Stanford) of the stories For many readers this volume will explain the peculiar discrepancies of tone and allusion in the poems—many of them written months or years after the prose narrative to which they relate, and including personal feelings which often transcend their ostensible reference In her introduction Miss Ratchford traces the course of her detective-work, and states her conviction 'that all of Emily's verse, as we have it, falls within the Gondal context' In attempting to include everything and to make a consistent tale out of an essentially episodic and fluctuating pastime, Miss Ratchford goes too far in speculation But undoubtedly her work proves that Emily Bronte's poetry was shackled by the Ossianic fantasies which largely inspired it and the marvel is that she was able occasionally to rise so high above their melodramatic source After reading this 'novel in verse', *Wuthering Heights* seems even more miraculous (*TLS* 672, *Spectator* 773–4)

G M Hopkins's admirable letters to Robert Bridges and his correspondence with R W Dixon, both first published in 1935, have been reissued in a new impression[14] in which the editor takes note of recent publications which have 'added much of importance to the canon of Hopkins's prose and verse' To aid his readers he adds an appendix giving comparative numbering of the poems in the second (1930) and third (1948) editions where differences occur

It is a far cry from the extreme delicacy of Hopkins's mind to the mind of Rudyard Kipling as he appears in the competent and objective biography by Charles Carrington (see Chapter XV, note 10)[15] Not that Kipling was insensitive, indeed the author shows the effect on him of early separation from his parents, and reveals the mixture of refined feeling and vulgarity in an author who tried to keep his private life apart from his journalism, and who used his brilliant technique in the service of what Desmond MacCarthy called '*everyday* emotions common not rare experiences' To express these in verse Kipling evolved a style including ingredients from Scott, the Ballads, Donne (long before his 'rediscovery'), *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, and music-hall songs The technique of some of the stories is briefly analysed, but the book is mainly a factual account of the externals of Kipling's life No doubt that is how Kipling would have had it, but his personality remains elusive, though this book reveals his essential vigour and extraversion, his many interests, his keen observation, and the mixture in him of cruelty and kindness, narrowness and sympathy, which makes him 'evoke love or hate, or love and hate together, in almost every reader' (*TLS* 697–9, *Sat Rev*, 19 Nov, *Spectator* 770–2, *ES* 88–89, *NS* 677–8)

Those who delight in verse *trivia* will enjoy *The Balliol Rhymes*,[16] in which W G Hiscock has printed fifty-eight humorous rhymes on Oxford men, of the kind introduced in the 1881 broadsheet 'The Masque of B-ll--l' and soon recalled because of objections by the subjects and their friends 'The best known of them—and the most misquoted—is, of course, the rhyme on Jowett, the Master'

[14] *The Letters of Gerard Manley Hopkins to Robert Bridges*, ed by Claude Colleer Abbott O U P pp xlvii+324
The Correspondence of Gerard Manley Hopkins and Richard Watson Dixon, ed by Claude Colleer Abbott O U P pp xxxi+194 The two volumes 50*s*

[15] *Rudyard Kipling, his Life and Work*, by Charles Carrington Macmillan pp xxiii+549 25*s*

[16] *The Balliol Rhymes*, ed by W G Hiscock Oxford Holywell Press pp 35 5*s*.

(which Tennyson disliked but Mark Pattison called 'the truth about the Master of Balliol') But there were other equally pointed lines, e g about H C Beeching. 'I write poems, but one saith / My poems are a form of death', and Sidney L Lee, 'My gown, the wonder of beholders / Hangs like a footnote from my shoulders', and C E Dawkins the Positivist, 'God is nought and M-N is all, / Spell Him with a capital' The editor attributes authorship and gives interesting variants (*TLS* 525)

2 *Novels and Novelists*

A reprint of Jane Austen's *Mansfield Park* (from the 1816 edition further revised) in the new larger format of Everyman's Library has the introduction by R Brimley Johnson [17]

R W Chapman[18] has made an adroit selection from his complete edition of Jane Austen's Letters (*YW* xxxiii 239) including about one-third of them, and giving the numbers as in that edition Annotation has been reduced to a minimum, but is adequate to identify the (often obscure) allusions to persons in the Austen circle There are useful indexes giving details about relations, friends, places, &c As an introduction to the novelist's life, sense of comedy, and immersion in the immediate, this charming book could not be bettered It forms a delightful supplement to the novels

A second edition has also appeared of Dr Chapman's Critical Bibliography[19] of the novelist (first published in 1953), in which, avoiding rivalry with Keynes's great Bibliography (1929), he provides for 'Austenians in general' a list of all the editions of the novels before 1890, but ignores the numerous later reprints (which are textually negligible) He gives a valuable selection of 'Biography and Criticism' chronologically arranged The items are illustrated by brief quotations

Kathleen Tillotson's *Novels of the Eighteen-Forties*,[20] which reached the reviewer too late for inclusion in *YW* 1954, is an important work, in which the author has 'not attempted a survey of all the novels of the forties, but rather of those kinds of novels and contemporary views about novels (assumed or expressed) which contribute to our fuller understanding of the great novels of the period' As she asserts, 'The time has surely come to break up "the Victorian novel" into manageable segments simply by concentrating upon a decade or so at a time' In her long introduction she gives the 'context of time and opinion', in which works of four major novelists —Dickens, Mrs Gaskell, Thackeray, and Charlotte Bronte—are to be considered In the forties the novel 'was in process of becoming the dominant form', it began to be criticized seriously in periodicals Mrs Tillotson describes serial methods of publication, the influence of which was durable and extensive It 'induced a close relation between author and reader', fostering the 'hand to mouth method of composition habitual with both Dickens and Thackeray', which had good as well as bad effects on design and conduct Not so squeamish as in some later Victorian decades, readers in the forties accepted considerable boldness of treatment, and the novelists were not consciously

[17] *Mansfield Park*, by Jane Austen Introduction by R Brimley Johnson Dent Everyman 23 pp xvii+414 6*s*

[18] *Jane Austen Letters 1796–1817*, selected and edited by R W Chapman (World's Classics 549) O U P pp x+226 6*s*

[19] *Jane Austen, A Critical Bibliography*, by R W Chapman (2nd ed) Oxford Clarendon Press pp viii+62 7*s* 6*d*

[20] *Novels of the Eighteen-Forties*, by Kathleen Tillotson O U P , 1954 pp ix+328 21*s*

cramped by convention though they accepted certain reticences and moral obligations Thackeray indeed often gained 'by his half-observance of propriety' The forties enlarged 'the social frontiers observed in fiction' adding the realism of low-life to the mannerisms of the 'silver-fork' school, and indulging in social and political propaganda, with the introduction of new settings There was also a tendency to write novels set in the conditions and manners of a generation or so earlier More and more the novel came to treat of urgent intellectual and religious preoccupations The major eighteenth-century novelists (except Sterne) were important models, and Carlyle was a dominant influence on subject-matter 'After Carlyle the rift between the "prophetic" and the merely entertaining novel widens' Mrs Tillotson analyses four novels to illustrate the forties at their best *Dombey and Son*, 'the earliest example of responsible and successful planning' among Dickens's works, *Mary Barton* which, while being 'directly concerned with a social problem', transcends that kind, *Vanity Fair*, Thackeray's first full-length novel, unexpectedly large in scale, complex in organization, and mature in outlook, the whole enveloped in 'the atmosphere of his personality—not his private, but his artistic personality' which provided the commentary on a spectacle otherwise 'not only morally painful but mentally impoverished', and *Jane Eyre* which, unlike the others, is 'primarily a novel of the inner life, not of man in his social relations; it maps a private world' All these detailed sections are unusually perceptive (*Dublin Mag* xxxi 54–55, *Ea* viii 80–81, *JEGP* liv 438–40, *RES* vi 430–2)

Hard Times in the Oxford Illustrated Dickens[21] has an introduction by Dingle Foot in which he takes a much less favourable view of the novel than F R Leavis (*YW* 1949) who regarded it as a masterpiece Dickens, Foot declares, was 'working in an unfamiliar milieu', he was 'bored and depressed' by his visit to Preston during a strike, and as a result 'presented us with a set of puppets' Dickens was a snob, and he hated the mob, his picture of Stephen Blackpool is unconvincing 'Being essentially a purveyor of melodrama in novel form Dickens is very little concerned with human psychology His genius lay in the description of things seen'

This last opinion seems to be that of William Addison whose introduction to *In the Steps of Charles Dickens*[22] is somewhat defiant of the 'highbrows' who disparage a 'topographical approach to Dickens' 'The outward scene—in particular the streets and alleys of London—were his lifelong study and stimulus' and he was 'perhaps *the* most perceptive of the English humanists and travellers who have described the country as it was in their own generation' Accordingly the author traces Dickens's career, the impressions of his boyhood in Portsmouth, Chatham, and Rochester, his love of London, Mr Pickwick's Kent, the Kent marshes in *Great Expectations* He takes us with Dickens into East Anglia, then to the West Country, and the Midlands, and the north with Nicholas Nickleby, &c, so back to the south, Gad's Hill, and Rochester, 'now pre-eminently the city of Charles Dickens' It makes a pleasant pageant with interesting accounts of places like Bowes (the village centre of the

[21] *Hard Times, For these Times*, by Charles Dickens With four illustrations and an Introduction by Dingle Foot O U P pp xx+299 10*s* 6*d*

[22] *In the Steps of Charles Dickens*, by William Addison Rich and Cowan pp 254 15*s*

'Yorkshire schools') and the inns Dickens and his characters visited There are fifteen excellent illustrations (*TLS* 419)

The first volume of Gordon N Ray's 'comprehensive account of Thackeray's life and writings'[23] takes us to the publication of *Vanity Fair*, and clears up many misconceptions about the character and aims of a writer who has always been misunderstood—partly because no full-length biography has previously been sanctioned by the family Ray's edition of *The Letters and Private Papers* prepared us for this superb piece of exploration in which he sets the novelist firmly into his environment and at the same time shows how his nature deepened under the stress of misfortunes, some of which were the result of his own weaknesses The work is the richer because since the appearance of the *Letters*, the author has found 'more than 700 letters written by Thackeray himself' which 'include nearly the whole of his correspondence with his principal publishers', and two other shorter series 'hardly less absorbing', together with 'some 250 letters written by Mrs Brookfield and her husband' Much of this material will be especially valuable later in the work In the present volume we see the vivid lives and personalities of Thackeray's immediate ancestors, his vicissitudes at Charterhouse ('Slaughter House' as he later called it) and Cambridge—where he learned to apply narrow public-school values to life, his visit to France, where he met an English ex-governess who helped to suggest Becky Sharp, and where he learned to gamble, his visit to Weimar where he shed provinciality, his friendships with Fitzgerald and Harry Matthew (who became Bloundell in *Pendennis*), his introduction to the vices of London, and the loss of his money in 1833, the artist's *vie de bohème* in Paris—a rich experience of the 'world' which made him cynical and disillusioned before marriage. Parenthood and the shock of his wife's insanity, as Mr Ray shows, sweetened his nature, awoke him to a sense of responsibility, and changed the tone of his writing The sardonic celebrator of swindlers becomes more and more sympathetic with their dupes He begins to realize that 'family affection has a positive value in a world of shams and snobbery', and finally in *Vanity Fair* (which is well analysed here) he becomes the morally poised commentator on the worldly spectacle All this is traced with a wealth of quotation, character-sketch, and description of the literary world of the time, so that readers will turn to the book not only to learn about Thackeray but to read about the 'Nabobs', the magazines of the period, the humorists It is a great achievement There are twenty-five illustrations (*TLS* 29, *New Republic*, 7 Nov, *English* 109)

The sweetness of Miss Mitford's nature and her arduous endeavours to support her frail and selfish old father have often been described In *Miss Mitford and Mr Harness*[24] Mrs Duncan-Jones not only records a close friendship but also illuminates some other relations She is helped by new letters from Miss Mitford herself, quotations from William Harness's letters and diaries, letters from Dickens, Newman, John Kenyon, Fanny Kemble, and others A school friend of Byron, William Harness was a strong character with violent views about his contemporaries As Boyle lecturer at Cambridge he publicly

[23] *Thackeray The Uses of Adversity, 1811–1846*, by Gordon N Ray OUP, 1955 pp xiii+537 35*s*

[24] *Miss Mitford and Mr Harness Record of a Friendship*, by C M Duncan-Jones SPCK pp x+118 12*s* 6*d*

attacked Byron's *Cain*, he thought little of Miss Barrett's poetry ('You are all taken in by the sweetness of the authoress' character and appearance'), and when asked to have *Hymns A & M* in his church instead of Tate and Brady's version of the Psalms, 'I would as soon read *Paradise Lost* for the First Lesson!' he exclaimed. (*TLS* 762)

From Poland comes a welcome offprint by Irena Dobrzycka on 'The Conditions of Living of the Working Class in the Social Novels of Charles Kingsley',[25] in which the author puts *Alton Locke* and *Yeast* into their environment of urban and rural exploitation and discontent Conditions in the tailoring trade and among agricultural labourers are illustrated with quotations from contemporary reports and the remarks of observers such as Mayhew and Engels The conclusion is that 'Kingsley's criticism of the working-class movement is biased, his remedy offered to society utterly reactionary', and that the novels show an incongruous mixture of art and preaching He was better in presenting the hard facts of the situation than in his vague and ill-considered remedies

In a biography of Charlotte Bronte, Margaret Crompton[26] handles her subject sympathetically but unsentimentally She is sensible about the relationship with M Heger, suggesting that the girl who went to Brussels 'lonely, frustrated and convinced of her own unattractiveness', probably read too much into Heger's 'flowery courtesy' and genuine interest in a strange, intelligent pupil, and never thought, till she had written 'those intense letters after her return home', that her 'exaggerated intensity' of emotion could be misconstrued. 'It was the tragedy of her life, the bitterest, most mortifying of all her life's experiences' The handling of Branwell's *affaire* with Mrs Robinson is similarly judicious, by then 'Emily had worked out her own philosophy, and the citadel of her inner peace was secure against any shock or stress that life could bring to her' There are no new revelations in the book but the familiar story is well told, and it is good to see Charlotte made the centre of attention 'It was a tragedy of Charlotte's life that few of the people she loved were capable or desirous of the intensity of affection which she herself was anxious to bestow' In the end she died before conflict could develop between her passion for writing and her devotion to her lovable but jealous husband (*NS* 762, *TLS* 778)

A biography as interesting for the light it throws on its times as for its main portrait is Catherine M MacLean's life of 'Mark Rutherford',[27] a solid work based on much unpublished material in possession of the family, and on personal recollections by Hale White's second wife Hale White's expulsion from the New College of the Independent Church and his father's spirited defence of him make stirring reading, the more so because they illustrate a conflict between narrow Fundamentalism and 'the right to think' which had wide implications for religion in England LikeJ S Mill, Hale White was 'converted' by reading Wordsworth and Carlyle, unlike Mill he had to earn his living by drudgery for Chapman the publisher, but the friendship of George Eliot prompted him 'to add to the beati-

[25] Article in *Poznańskie Towarzystwo Przyjaciół Nauk, Wydział Filologiczno-Filozoficzny, Prace Komisji Filologicznej*, Tom XVI, Zeszyt 2 Poznań pp 50 Zl 12

[26] *Passionate Search A Life of Charlotte Bronte*, by Margaret Crompton Cassell pp ix+252 21*s*

[27] *Mark Rutherford A Biography of William Hale White*, by Catherine Macdonald MacLean Macdonald pp xiv+416 25*s*

tudes "Blessed are they who heal us of self-despising"', and later to protest against the *Life* by her husband which removed her 'from the class—the great and noble church, if I may so call it—of the Insurgents, to one more genteel, but certainly not so interesting' When a clerk in Somerset House he began to feel a 'cherishing of pity for the souls of men', when he started in the Admiralty he entered journalism too, as a political correspondent, developing a thorough dislike of Disraeli 'the greatest quack living' Later, for thirty years he had to watch the sufferings—nobly borne—of his wife Harriet, afflicted with progressive paralysis The four novels he wrote during her lifetime are coloured darkly by this (gaining thereby their theme—'Salvation by Crucifixion'), and a belief in God proofed not by formal argument but 'in hints and dreams which are not expressible by human language' His work is not a full 'Confession', but it keeps close to his experience (*TLS* 332, *NS* 273–4, *London Mag* II 84–88, *Quarterly R* 553–4)

Walter Allen's *Six Great Novelists*[28] (cf Chapter XIII) includes essays on Scott, Dickens, Stevenson, and Conrad, which will be useful for younger readers Scott is treated as 'the man who invented history in the modern sense', and his conception of the past is well contrasted with that of his predecessors Modern objections to his technique and attitude are met frankly, and his value as an observer and humorist ('akin to Chaucer') is shown as well as his sense of the historical past behind the individual Dickens's 'vision of the world and its inhabitants is like a child's', which explains his sentimentality as well as his exaggeration and his fun But the development of Dickens's constructive power is also shown Stevenson is a story-teller of action, with the moral values 'of a generous and spirited boy', a master-craftsman who lacks Scott's prodigality of creation but has a peculiar concentration Lastly Conrad, who illustrates in his study of the conscience in *Lord Jim* that the code of the officer and gentleman is not enough when the irrationality of the universe breaks loose Fidelity, humility, are as important as the sense of honour Conrad is the greatest modern novelist 'because of his tragic vision' (*NS* 366, *English* 231–2)

In *The Career of Samuel Butler*[29] S B Harkness gives a chronological record of Butler's own works, of writings about him and of reviews and criticisms in periodicals and newspapers, an alphabetical list (by authors) of criticism (both comprehensive and casual) in other works, a list of books devoted to Butler, and finally one of translations of his works into other languages This valuable material is preceded by an essay on Butler's fame, which began to grow only when Bernard Shaw drew attention to *The Way of All Flesh* Critics were baffled by his elusive personality, his versatility, his eccentricity, and his subtle satirical implications Interest waxed in the twenties after the publication of Festing Jones's *Memoir* 'The *Spectator* preserved a consistently conservative position', 'The *Athenaeum* has given Butler a consistently intelligent criticism', 'The *Times* only coming round to him after his death when his star was safely in the ascendant'. 'The interest of German scholars in unusual Homeric theories' attracted them to some of his writings, French critics were more broadly curious about him The *Memoirs* focused attention on his personality and evoked dislike and

[28] *Six Great Novelists*, by Walter Allen Hamilton pp 182 10*s* 6*d*

[29] *The Career of Samuel Butler (1835–1902) A Bibliography*, by Stanley B Harkness The Bodley Head pp 154 25*s*

denigration as well as new understanding, the opposed attitudes continued until the late thirties

The Everyman selection of Oscar Wilde has been issued in the larger format[30] It includes *The Critic as Artist, The Picture of Dorian Gray, The Soul of Man under Socialism, Lady Windermere's Fan, The Importance of Being Earnest, The Ballad of Reading Gaol*

Vyvyan Holland's *Son of Oscar Wilde*[31] (1954) is a revealing book, giving the story of the effects of Wilde's disgrace on his family and particularly on his two sons The life of Cyril, who discovered the truth earlier than Vyvyan—and 'never smiled again'—was one long attempt to remake the family honour, to prove himself no decadent artist but a man 'I ask nothing b'tter than to end in honourable battle for my King and Country' he wrote, and so he did The less robust Vyvyan found rest in Catholicism, but during adolescence 'I had my father continually as a spectre behind my shoulder', and 'on the whole my life has been one of concealment and repression', but he has written a brave book Valuable appendixes include thirty-three letters from Oscar Wilde while up at Oxford, 'an Oxford Reminiscence' by W W Ward, and some unpublished poems in prose (*TLS* 43)

Wilde's life was a drama not only because he lived flamboyantly and himself embodied theatrical conflicts, but also because he was at his best in conversation and the kinds of writing nearest to the give and take of talk John Furnell[32] has re-created in dialogue form the last years of Wilde's career, from 1891, when in his house in Tite Street he met Lord Alfred Douglas, to his death in a mean Paris hotel There are twelve scenes, in three Books, arranged so as to include suitable quotations from his work and to reveal 'three quite separate and distinct philosophies' In Book I 'the majority of quotations come from *Dorian Gray*', where 'Wilde presented his earlier and Pagan philosophy', in Book II 'Neronian days of splendour' are illustrated from 'his plays, paradoxes, and epigrams', in Book III quotations from the complete *De Profundis* reveal 'a deeper and far more comprehensive philosophy of life' The book is more than a clever and scholarly tissue of excerpts, the author has invented some excellent dialogue, and the tension rarely flags, and the success of the work is never greater than in its moving presentation of Wilde in decline after his release In a brief introduction Professor G Wilson Knight points out that the impulse which drove him to his ruin is no uncommon one among men of genius, and that it was linked with 'many of the finest Christian, and other, virtues'

For Erich Ebermayer[33] the central situation is the Trial Scene, and his life of Wilde is mainly occupied with the bad heredity of the poet and its working out in public disgrace The story is clearly told, with much reliance on Frank Harris ('the truest of friends and the great help in all times of need'), and the conclusion is that what destroyed Wilde was his unrequited love for Lord Alfred Douglas

Three years before *The Importance of Being Earnest* was produced, one of the most successful of all farces,

[30] *Oscar Wilde's Plays, Prose Writings and Poems*, Introduction by Hesketh Pearson Dent Everyman 858 pp xix+428 6*s*

[31] *Son of Oscar Wilde*, by Vyvyan Holland Hart-Davis, 1954 pp 272 18*s*

[32] *The Stringed Lute An Evocation in dialogue of Oscar Wilde*, by John Furnell Rider pp xvii+198 16*s*

[33] *Das ungewohnliche Leben des Oscar Wilde*, von Erich Ebermayer Bonn Athenaeum-Verlag, 1954 pp 324 DM 14

Charley's Aunt, was played for the first time Lovers of the Victorian and Edwardian theatre will enjoy Jevan Brandon-Thomas's life of his father,[34] which incorporates material collected by his mother and letters going back to the 1850's It is the tale of an industrious young man who succeeded first as a reciter (despite a Liverpool accent), then as actor and playwright He invented, or adapted from the French, other pieces, but *Charley's Aunt* was his one great success, and its story is told with full appreciation here. (*TLS* 618)

3 *Critics and Other Prose Writers*

The most important work about literary criticism published in 1955 was the first two volumes[35] of René Wellek's massive *History of Modern Criticism 1750–1950*—the first volume concerned with the later eighteenth century, the second with 'The Romantic Age' Regarding criticism as a branch of the history of ideas rather than as a guide to poetic practice, Wellek looks on the past as a means of illuminating the present, so that his work never loses sight of later developments in tracing the earlier stages His view is spacious, his learning European, and he rightly precedes his account of English critics with a survey of German critical thought in the Schlegels, and early romantics such as Schelling, Novalis, and Jean Paul France lagged behind despite Madame de Stael's exposition of the classical-romantic distinction in *De l'Allemagne* In a wide over-all view 'the rise of an emotional concept of poetry, the establishment of the historical point of view, and the implied rejection of the imitation theory, of the rules and genres, are the decisive signs of change'—and these occurred in the eighteenth century, and the 'Romantics' of the new century brought no radical change 'In a more narrow sense, we can speak of romantic criticism as the establishment of a dialectical and symbolistic view of poetry'—which grew in Germany 'out of the organic analogy developed by Herder and Goethe' but is found elsewhere only in Coleridge and Hugo 'Wordsworth and Hazlitt remained in the empirical psychological tradition', and criticism after Coleridge was little affected by his ideas for many years This theme of Wellek's second volume, outlined in the introduction, is filled in as he surveys individual critics, insisting that 'in England, as opposed to the Continent, there was no "romantic" movement' with a conscious programme of the kind elaborated by the Schlegels 'None of the English poets of the time recognised himself as a romanticist', and Byron definitely rejected the application Not until the 1850's was an English 'romantic school' written about, under continental influence, but a reaction against neo-classicism is found in Jeffrey as well as in the poets he attacked Shelley's *Defence* is remarkable not for 'the extravagance of the prophetic claim', but for 'the sketch of a general social history of literature' which implied that poetry participated in and fostered the 'grand march of intellects' An acute analysis of Wordsworth's position shows that it is 'ambiguous or transitional' He gives a social twist to the old theory of imitation, and modifies the eighteenth-century view of poetry as passion 'by his description of the

[34] *Charley's Aunt's Father A Life of Brandon Thomas*, by Jevan Brandon-Thomas Douglas Saunders with MacGibbon & Kee pp 232 18*s*

[35] *A History of Modern Criticism 1750–1950*, by René Wellek Vol II The Romantic Age Cape pp v+459 With Vol I 63*s*

poetic process as "recollection in tranquillity" . . '. 'But he also adopts . a theory of poetry in which imagination holds the central place as a power of unification and ultimate insight into the unity of the world ' Coleridge's 'random eclecticism' prevents his attaining a coherent aesthetic At his best he recognized the fundamental unity of the mind in art, and kept a firm grasp of 'the unity and the things unified, the whole and the parts' He investigated the nature of symbol, justifying 'romantic anthropomorphism, but fails to see the uses of the symbolic view as a justification of other types of metaphoric expression' He has 'little to say about historical types of literature', his 'remarks on the plays and characters of Shakespeare are often disappointing' His comments on his contemporaries were often shrewd, but gave evidence of 'amazing prudishness, bigotry and chauvinism'. Lamb's criticism is mainly 'detached thoughts on books and reading'. 'But it seems impossible to claim for these marginalia great significance in a history of criticism ' Hazlitt, the journalist, 'practised the criticism of beauties, the communication of the pleasures of literature to a new and eager audience' But he had some grasp of ideas and 'more than any of his English contemporaries has a strong awareness of the relations between literature and society and a strong historical sense' After his death and that of Coleridge, criticism in Britain suffered many years of decadence till Arnold revived it in the 1860's This book is valuable for its great range and for its Olympian detachment, which brings out the comparative provinciality of English critical thought in this great poetic period.

A small section of Wellek's work is covered, with somewhat similar conclusions, in an essay by Thomas Crawford[36] who contends 'that the *Edinburgh's* readers, between 1815 and 1830 were on the whole encouraged to take a sympathetic view of contemporary poetry', but a tendency 'to present contradictory views in the same number and even in the same article' 'must have impeded the appreciation of Romanticism' In his review of Alison's *Essays on the Nature of Taste* in May 1811, Jeffrey made a distinction between those ideas common to most educated men and those arising from 'personal and accidental associations' A poet, writing for other men, should construct only 'such objects as are the *natural* signs and inseparable concomitants of emotions, of which the greater part of mankind are susceptible' Hence Jeffrey 'could appreciate Crabbe's portrayal of everyday things, but not Wordsworth's' Hallam gibed 'at the children of poetry and romance, who admire nothing but rural simplicity, and sicken at the appearance of those terrible things, art and opulence' Nevertheless, Hallam approved of the Picturesque and both he and Jeffrey admitted the directive force of strong emotion The *Edinburgh* reviewers 'regarded the Elizabethan era as the golden age of English poetry', and disliked Dryden and Pope who interrupted the tradition Wordsworth and his kind were suspect because they laid claim to special intuitions, and their country-folk were unreal Shelley's great fault was imprecision Keats was more precise and he returned to the Elizabethan tradition 'Passion plus reality', that was Jeffrey's formula for contemporary poetry, but the *Edinburgh* reviewers were inconsistent in their notions of 'reality'—hence their critical 'see-saw'

[36] *The Edinburgh Review and Romantic Poetry (1802–29)*, by Thomas Crawford Auckland N Z Auckland Univ College Bulletin 47, English Series 8 pp 42

In a large and handsomely produced volume Miss R F Brinkley[37] presents in orderly fashion Coleridge's 'many illuminating comments concerning the seventeenth century, its movements and its writers' The sections cover 'history, philosophy, theology, science, prose style, and literary criticism, the last including prose works as well as poetry and drama' The collection of so much scattered stuff has obviously involved great labour, and the text has been carefully gone over Much use is made of marginalia and other notes on authors (both favourite and detested) L Bredvold's introduction treats the seventeenth century as Coleridge's 'spiritual home', pointing out that he saw a continuity from Edward VI to 1688, with 'traditions of sound thought and great style' 'His own style was consciously modeled on that of the seventeenth century', whose prose idiom he thought essentially English and 'evolved by an organic inner principle' To understand his view of the imagination and his whole philosophy we must go back to his seventeenth-century reading Miss Brinkley gives short and illuminating introductions to the several sections of her anthology which will be a treasure-house for all Coleridgeans and lovers of the seventeenth century

Lord David Cecil's lecture on Walter Pater[38] considers the critic as 'an active, inquisitive searching mind' with 'an intellectual vision of aesthetic experience' and a moral view of life which he at first used to subserve aesthetic taste Later 'the hard gemlike flame has begun to veer and flicker in a Christian wind', though Pater never became intellectually convinced that Christianity was true Because he was a relativist he studied a variety of artists and personalities, and became 'the most expert of time-travellers', seeing each work as the expression of a period or phase of culture He fails, however, to escape from his own languid personality, and the weakness colours his imaginative biographies, and his painful style, though he could evoke a mood of reverie, which Lord David expresses quite beautifully

'Pater's taste for curious flavours sometimes led him to dwell on curiously unpleasant ones' This is true, for Pater was influenced by Swinburne and Baudelaire in his attitude to strange sins and to art criticism A most attractive edition of the latter's critical studies translated by Jonathan Mayne[39] is therefore very relevant The selection 'includes all three of Baudelaire's *Salons*, the articles on the *Exposition Universelle* 1855, the essay on Laughter and finally the great obituary panegyric on Delacroix'. Baudelaire's approach to the work of art was very like Pater's 'The starting point is nearly always *volupté*—the shock of pleasure experienced in front of a work of art, the poet-critic then proceeds to examine and analyse the *pourquoi*—the why and the wherefore—until finally he is able to transform the initial shock of pleasure into knowledge—the *volupté* into *connaissance*' Such a method results in 'creative criticism', and as Baudelaire declared, 'the best account of a picture may well be a sonnet or an elegy' There are sixty-eight illustrations (*TLS* 736)

In contrast with this must be noticed the informative and fascinating joint

[37] *Coleridge on the Seventeenth Century*, ed by Roberta Florence Brinkley, Introduction by Louis I Bredvold Duke U P and C U P pp xxviii+704 94*s*

[38] *Walter Pater, the Scholar-Artist*, by Lord David Cecil (The Rede Lecture, 1955) C U P pp 29 2*s* 6*d*

[39] *The Mirror of Art Critical Studies*, by Charles Baudelaire Translated and ed with Notes and Illustrations by Jonathan Mayne Phaidon Press pp xx+361 18*s*

biography of Darwin and Huxley[40] by William Irvine which traces the evolution controversy, the researches connected with it, and the interplay between the minds of the great men who caused such 'convulsions in the national mind' Darwin's patience and integrity are shown, but of course Huxley emerges as the more vivid figure—'He could think, draw, speak, write, inspire, lead, negotiate, and wage multifarious war against earth and heaven with the cool professional ease of an acrobat supporting nine people on his shoulders at once ' And there are plenty of excerpts from his works to prove that he was one of the finest polemical writers in English literature The book illuminates by its detail and vivacity the intellectual life of the Victorian period (*TLS* 471, *NS* 165–6, *YR* xliv 632–4)

In *The New Paul and Virginia* W H Mallock made a satiric attack on Huxley, Tyndall, W K Clifford, Frederick Harrison, and others who seemed tarred with the 'Positivist' brush in setting agnostic humanism above revealed religion P M Yarker[41] has studied both the skit and its background in *ES* 1955, explaining that this 'short satirical story in the style of Voltaire's *Candide*' (Mallock) differs from *The New Republic* in mocking his opponents by using 'a selection of their actual words, made ridiculous by being uttered in circumstances of exaggerated simplicity' The time is surely ripe for a new edition of some of Mallock's writings besides his first work

A new edition of George Bourne's *Change in the Village*[42] (the first for twenty years) is to be welcomed for its picture of rural society and the decline of its 'culture' in the second half of the nineteenth century since 'the enclosure of the commons, no longer ago than 1861' It bridges the gap between George Eliot and the modern rural novel An introduction by Geoffrey Grigson includes facts about George Sturt and his life

Last but not least comes the huge study of William Morris by E P. Thompson,[43] which fits here more aptly than in the first section because the author is primarily interested in Morris's political development Not that he ignores the poems, but they are treated mainly as evidence of the decline of the Romantic movement Like Rossetti, Morris 'maintained that the true artist at work within capitalist society must always be forced to "Look back!"', and even in 1891 he declared, 'When an artist has really a very keen sense of beauty he can not literally represent an event that takes place in modern life' A 'poignancy of eager life struggling against overmastering odds' appears in the earlier poems, but in *The Earthly Paradise* he ran away from real action into decoration and revulsion against the modern world Somewhat uneasy in literary judgements, Thompson is happier in tracing the growth of Morris's social sympathies and the political struggle which began when in 1871 he wrote his Manifesto 'To the Working-men of England' The great bulk of the book deals in illuminating detail with the intricate cross-currents of radical opinion and propaganda in the last quarter of the century Morris opposed the Fabian policy 'because he saw it as no more than a lengthy détour leaving the serious assault upon Capitalism still

[40] *Apes, Angels and Victorians A Joint Biography of Darwin and Huxley*, by William Irvine Illustrated Weidenfeld & Nicolson pp 399 21*s*

[41] *Voltaire among the Positivists A Study of W H Mallock's 'The New Paul and Virginia'*, by P M Yarker In *ES* 1955. The English Association

[42] *Change in the Village*, by George Bourne Duckworth pp xv+206 10*s* 6*d*

[43] *William Morris, Romantic to Revolutionary*, by E P Thompson Laurence & Wishart pp 908 50*s*

unattempted'. He was no Anarchist, nor a Utopian, but a follower of Marx and Engels—though some biographers have denied this The final alternatives he expressed thus 'International Capitalism and the workman a hungry machine, International Socialism and the workman a free man and the master of his own destiny' Despite some partisan crudities the book is valuable for students of Victorian thought, through its picture of Morris's vast mental energy and 'moral realism', and its lavish use of those of his writings (often neglected by literary students) which bear on his revolutionary social ideals

(*b*) **Periodicals**

By P M YARKER

1 *Poets*

SEVERAL of Wordsworth's letters appear in print for the first time, the earliest being *Wordsworth's Unpublished Letter to Thomas Wilkinson*, of 29 March 1806, published by Russell Noyes (*NQ*), now in his possession *Two Wordsworth Letters* to unidentified correspondents are published by David Bonnell Green (*NQ*) The first, dated from Rydal Mount, 30 January 1828, describes the poet's reaction to a suggestion that a selection from his poems should be published, the second, almost the latest of his surviving letters, is dated from Rydal Mount, 24 December 1849, and provides further evidence of his grief at the death of his eldest daughter These letters are in the possession of Mr R Norris Williams, and the Historical Society of Pennsylvania The writer thoughtfully supplies, in a footnote, a list of places where new letters have appeared since the publication of *The Letters of William and Dorothy Wordsworth*, by Ernest de Selincourt With some help from unpublished letters to Thomas Noon Talfourd in the Wordsworth Collection at Cornell University Library, P M Zall traces the history of *Wordsworth and the Copyright Act of 1842* (*PMLA*), showing how assiduously he worked for the passage of the Bill in his age A short biographical account by H Rossiter Smith of *John Gough, 1757–1825, The Blind Philosopher* (*NQ*) contains some detail of Wordsworth's friendship with him

Thomas M Raysor in *The Establishment of Wordsworth's Reputation* (*JEGP*) suggests that too much attention has been paid to the reviews of his work, whether favourable or unfavourable, in assessing the growth of Wordsworth's popularity, and that 'the material facts of sales, as expressed in the numbers and size of the various editions' are a surer guide He gives some of these 'material facts', eked out sometimes by conjecture, which indicate a situation not widely different from that suggested by the tone of the reviews

When Coleridge complained of the 'sudden and unprepared transitions from lines or sentences of peculiar felicity to a style not only unimpassioned but undistinguished' Wordsworth took heed, and modified all the passages cited save one His reasons for refusing to tamper with this one are discussed by Florence G Marsh in *Resolution and Independence Stanza XVIII* (*MLN*) Wordsworth was right to stand firm, for the transition that Coleridge disliked represents the deliberate movement from the inner world of Wordsworth's mind to the outer world of the 'weary moors', which is the purpose of the poem

As *A Prelude to 'The Prelude'* (*EC*), Edwin Morgan, treating the 1850 version as though it were a consecutive

composition, sets out to show that Wordsworth 'had to learn, up to the concluding book . , how to infuse into his natural descriptions that absolutely suggestive correspondence which makes them reveal and underscore the theme' Not without astonishment we trace the young poet's steadily developing skill throughout the version of 1850, from Book I, where are to be found 'simple description of the mere physical delight of activity in the open air' and 'the beginnings of what is going to be Wordsworth's method' to his culminating achievement in the Snowdon passage, with its interpretation, in Book XIV No hint is given that there are problems of chronology, or textual variants connected with the poem, and no mention is made throughout this remarkable essay of the existence of a suggestion that some of the finest passages of the poem were those written earliest Lisle Cecil John finds a link between *Wordsworth and Gray* (*NQ*) in 'the similarity in subject, tone and phrasing' between *The Longest Day* and the *Ode on a Distant Prospect of Eton College*. Carl R Woodring writes *On Liberty in the Poetry of Wordsworth* (*PMLA*), showing a 'correlation' between the poet's changing attitude from the earlier to the latest poems, and the type of imagery he chose to depict it.

A close, penetrating, but none the less comprehensive examination of the evidence for *Coleridge's Early Knowledge of German* from his discovery of Schiller in 1794 until he landed at Hamburg in 1798, leads Werner W Beyer (*MP*) to the conclusion that his knowledge of both language and literature was much more extensive than has been supposed *Ludwig Tieck and Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, by Earl L Griggs (*JEGP*), gives an account of Tieck's visit to Coleridge at Highgate in 1817, together with Coleridge's estimate of his guest, and prints two letters from Tieck to Coleridge, one of them for the first time

Cecil C Seronsy gives details of *More Coleridge Marginalia* (*SP*) in three volumes in the Harvard Library They are *Il Petrarca di nuovo ristampato*, Venice, 1651, *The Birds* of Aristophanes, translated by Henry Francis Cary, London, 1824, and J Walker's *Rhyming Dictionary*, London, 1775 The first two books were given to Coleridge by Cary, the translator of Dante The copy of Walker's dictionary harbours two notes and an autograph letter, which last is shortly to be published by Earl L Griggs in his edition of Coleridge's letters Similarities between Coleridge's discussion of the Cabiric deities in a fragmentary lecture of 1818 and Schelling's 'Über die Gottheiten von Samothrake' have been pointed out, but Richard Haven, in *Coleridge and the Greek Mysteries* (*MLN*) notes that Coleridge was reading Boehme at the time, and several marginal notes in his copy of Boehme's *Works* in the British Museum reveal that, though he probably had Schelling's essay in mind, the similarities 'provide another example of the addition of material from Schelling to ideas which Coleridge had already at least partially developed himself'

Southey is awarded the authorship of two anonymous items The article *On the Means of Improving the People* in No 37 of the *Quarterly Review*, originally supposed to be by Southey, but subsequently attributed to his friend John Rickman, is returned to him by Nat Lewis Kaderly in *Southey and the Quarterly Review* (*MLN*) B R McElderry, in *Southey and Wordsworth's 'The Idiot Boy'* (*NQ*), reprints the anonymous poem 'The Idiot' from the *Morning Post* of 27 July 1798, and, attributing it to

Southey, suggests that he never acknowledged it because of the ridicule encountered by Wordsworth's poem, and that this was responsible for his own strictures on that work

Beckford et Byron by André Parreaux (*Ea*) traces in great detail parallels between *Vathek* and Byron's poetry, and in a note on *Byron and Sterne* (*MLN*) Earl R Wasserman points out the influence of Slawkenbergius's tale in Volume IV of *Tristram Shandy* on *Don Juan*, II xviii–xx

Keats's Sonnet 'Nebuchadnezzar's Dream' is 'one of the few real puzzles in his work remaining to be solved' says Aileen Ward (*PQ*) Although there is an autograph and three other manuscripts, its authenticity has been doubted Its date is uncertain, and it has been ascribed to 1816, referring to Keats's determination to abandon medicine for poetry, or to 1818, with reference to his defiance of the reviewers The writer suggests that both these dates and interpretations are wrong, and that the poem, based on Nebuchadnezzar's dream in the second chapter of the Book of Daniel, is, like that, a political allegory, and refers to the situation confronting the Government in 1817 Read thus, the poem takes on a new meaning and interest, and is very close 'in both substance and feeling to the explosive first twenty lines of the third book of *Endymion*' 'Keats probably did some reading on Egypt for *Hyperion*, but in the main, it seems impossible to trace his sources to specific books and articles' says Barbara Garlitz in *Egypt and Hyperion* (*PQ*) She rejects the view that he found the material in three articles in *Annals of the Fine Arts* for 1818 and 1819, but cites numerous other possible sources Subjecting *Keats's Well-examined Urn* to yet one more inspection, Peter Williamson (*PQ*) concludes that the pronoun 'ye' in the final aphorism refers to the urn itself, not to mankind Aileen Ward decides that July 1819 is 'the most probable by far of all the dates that have been proposed' as *The Date of Keats's 'Bright Star' Sonnet* Besides the letter to Fanny Brawne of 25 July, with its striking parallels with the sonnet, she finds additional evidence in the fact that Keats was at Shanklin at the time, within sight and sound of the 'moving waters'. The character of the sonnet, moreover, fits into the pattern of his life that summer more completely than into that of winter or spring, or of the autumn of the year before, which are all dates that have been proposed

In *Painting and the Poetry of Keats Some Further Identifications* (*MLR*) D S Bland notes that ten original Poussins were on view at the British Institution in 1816, and that the passage beginning at line 360 in *Sleep and Poetry* may describe Poussin's *Bacchus and Ariadne* in the Prado The continuation of the passage, to line 371, is, however, undoubtedly a description of Claude's *Sacrifice at the Temple of Apollo on the Isle of Delos* in the Doria Gallery in Rome Titian's *Diana and Actaeon* is, perhaps, the original of the next lines of the poem

> See in another picture, nymphs are wiping
> Cherishingly Diana's timorous limbs,

The source of the description of the Palace in *The Fall of Hyperion* could have been John Martin's *The Fall of Babylon* The possibility of *Keats's Debt to Mrs Robinson* is explored by R. D Base (*TLS*, 26 Aug), who gives a number of parallels in vocabulary, subject, expression, and feeling Mrs A L Stevenson points out (*TLS*, 16 Sept) that the obvious link between Keats and Mrs. Robinson was their common debt to Milton 'Keats outgrew Browne his later poetry was different in kind. Yet phrases from

Browne's poems continued to vibrate in his memory' says Joan Grundy, who, in *Keats and William Browne* (*RES*) identifies and examines a number of such echoes in both the earlier and later poems of Keats She also notes possible influences of Sandys's translation of Ovid's *Metamorphoses* on *Endymion* and other poems in *Keats and Sandys* (*NQ*).

In a note on *Keats and 'The Smith and Theodore Hook Squad'* (*MLN*) William G Lane recalls that Coleridge gave this title to the circle around James and Horace Smith, and that in the letter to his brothers dated 21 December 1817, Keats expressed his disapproval of them after sampling their company 'These men say things which make one start without making one feel, they are all alike '

Ben W Griffiths points out (*MLN*) that a marginal note on the Bodleian manuscript of the poem suggests that *The Removal of Incest from 'Laon and Cythna'* was intended by Shelley even before Charles Ollier, his publisher, advised it In his method of *Myth-making in 'Prometheus Unbound'* Shelley followed the syncretists in assuming that all myths are really one, 'and by means of a central unifying premise' making 'interconnections that are implicit or potential, but not explicit or traditional' says Earl R Wasserman (*MLN*) 'Any interpretation of *Prometheus Unbound* which makes the play turn on the hero's change of heart and subsequent regeneration rests on taking one word in a sense which it can hardly bear' says Philip Drew in a letter (*TLS*, 16 Dec) on *Shelley's Use of 'Recall'* The word occurs in Act I, lines 56–59.

> I speak in grief,
> Not exultation, for I hate no more,
> As then ere misery made me wise
> The curse
> Once breathed on thee I would recall

Given the meaning 'revoke', this has been called the dramatic climax of the play But such a use for 'recall' would be unique in Shelley, who elsewhere uses the word with the more normal meaning 'bring back to the memory' If this meaning is allowed in the present passage, Prometheus, though purged of hatred by suffering, wishes not to revoke his curse of Jupiter, but to bear it in mind Many difficulties are thereby reduced, for example, the objection is overcome that it is wrong for Prometheus to forgive Jupiter, who is the Principle of Evil, and the passage becomes much more consistent with the remainder of Act I

Sylva Norman gives details (*TLS*, 7 Jan) of the early printing history of *Adonais* and *Epipsychidion*

An account of *Shelley's Arrest for Debt* at Carnarvon in September 1812, taken from various records in the National Library of Wales, the county archives of Carnarvonshire and elsewhere, is given by H M Dowling (*NQ*).

In 1944 Frederick L Jones published a collection of Mary Shelley's letters, but deeply regretted that it contained few written during Shelley's lifetime He now publishes twenty-seven such letters for the first time in *Mary Shelley to Maria Gisborne New Letters 1818–1822* (*SP*) They exist only in transcripts made by John Gisborne in a notebook now in Lord Abinger's Shelley Collection Gisborne transcribed in all seventy-eight letters from Mary, and the originals of the others are now in the Bodleian. They have been published The present collection contains several distinctly new details, and the prize is a P S by Shelley himself to the letter of 19 July 1820

Some notes on *Harriet Shelley's Brother-in-law*, drawn from the obituary of 'R F Beauchamp Esq ' in the *Gentleman's Magazine* for March

1841, by a correspondent (*TLS*, 11 Nov) are of distant biographical interest to Shelley scholars in providing a new approach to the Westbrook family Louise Boas contributes further information on the subject (*TLS*, 2 Dec) In *'Erasmus Perkins' and Shelley* (*MLN*) Louise Boas also gives an account of the *Theological Inquirer*, the journal edited by 'Erasmus Perkins' in 1815, which gave Shelley, then unknown, 'a disproportionate amount of attention and space', including lengthy excerpts from the unpublished *Queen Mab* 'Erasmus Perkins' is identified as George Cannon, to whom references are made in the Shelley journals early in 1815

In *Browning's 'Popularity' and the Spasmodic Poets* (*JEGP*) Jerome Thale identifies 'Hobbs, Nobbs, Stokes and Nokes' as 'Philip James Bailey, Alexander Smith, Sydney Dobell, and perhaps J Stannan Biggs', the Spasmodics, who achieved 'a brief and amazing celebrity' by an exaggerated imitation of Keats

'If this is a "framework" poem in which the frame only exists to set off the picture, it is a most unusual example' says Margaret Eleanor Glen, examining *The Meaning and Structure of 'Pippa Passes'* (*UTQ*) 'For one thing, the frame, including the prologue, conclusion, and talks by the way, is nearly as extensive as the picture ' Pippa herself, moreover, is part of the 'frame' It is more satisfactory to look for a single theme behind both the episodes and Pippa This theme is expressed in Pippa's New Year Hymn, namely 'that men are in the hands of God, be they conscious or unconscious of it'

Writing to Elizabeth Barrett, Browning contrasted the 'white light' of her lyric utterance with his own refracted 'prismatic hues' William O. Raymond makes this the basis of *'The Jewelled Bow' A Study in Browning's Imagery and Humanism* (*PMLA*) Browning's humanism 'pivots on the worth and paramount importance of the moral struggle in the life of the individual' 'The world is ordained to be a moral battle ground, a sphere of trial, testing and probation ' 'Were an unclouded vision of eternity vouchsafed to man it would thwart the moral purpose of his earthly life ' Therefore man on earth 'in his weakness and finitude' can receive only the 'deflected prismatic hues' of an imperfect revelation In *The Ring and the Book* the Pope uses the imagery of the spectrum 'to illustrate the media through which the white light of eternal truth must pass to reach man's mind and heart' Thus, although Browning's image may have come from Shelley's 'dome of many-coloured glass' his attitude is remote from Shelley's, because to him these colours do not 'stain' the white radiance, but transmute and transfigure it

Dr G Wilson Knight begins *The Scholar Gipsy An Interpretation* (*RES*) with the references in the poem to Dido and to the Tyrian trader, and sees in them an image of the supersession of the ancient Tyrian system by the efficiency of the Graeco-Roman world, whose descendant was the nineteenth-century Philistinism from which the Scholar Gipsy was advised to fly But when he proceeds, by 'attention to its various effects in mutual and spatial interaction' to elicit the poem's true meaning, namely its connexion with 'the esoteric schools originating from the East', he can do so only by getting rid of Matthew Arnold (who would look uncomfortable in the company of 'Rudolph Steiner, Ouspensky and John Cowper Powys') Accordingly, he detaches him neatly in the last sentence by declaring that 'from such an

approach we gain insight into the poetry's, which is not necessarily the poet's, wisdom'

Writing of *Christina Rossetti's 'Sing-Song' and Nineteenth Century Children's Poetry* (*PMLA*) Barbara Garlitz says that the book has always been related to Lear and Carroll because it was published in 1872, at the height of the vogue for nonsense and fantasy in children's literature In fact, however, at least half the pieces belong to the moral tradition in children's verse that goes back to Watts's *Divine Songs for Children*, 1717 *Method in Madness A Note on Edward Lear* by A E Dyson (*English*) takes nonsense seriously, which is no doubt excellent in psychoanalysis, but dangerous in criticism The writer denies, for example, that either Lear or Carroll wrote nonsense at all, but that their 'method transcends the consciousness of its author, and works by strange associations and reverberations below the conscious level of the mind' No mention is made of the distressful circumstances of Lear's existence, which surely accounted for at least part of the 'strange' quality of his poems, but the poems are seen as 'an expression of the moods they parody', and the result is a superior form of Romanticism which does not demand a suspension of disbelief

Hopkins's 'wings that spell' in 'The Wreck of the Deutschland' does not represent a departure from the pattern of imagery in the rest of Stanza II of Part I of the poem, where the expression is found, suggests Sister Mary Adorita (*MLN*), for the Northern dialect form *Speel*, meaning 'to mount or ascend by climbing' can also be written *Spell*, a form especially common in North Wales

J. G Ritz proposed a threefold interpretation of *The Windhover* (*TLS*, 6 May) based on the kestrel itself, Christ, and Christ's imitator Answering him (*TLS*, 20 May), William Empson maintained that the poem concerned Hopkins's Jesuit training, which had driven his heart into hiding W H Gardner pointed out (*TLS*, 24 June) that Professor Ritz's interpretation was similar to his own, although he emphasized a number of minor differences, notably the importance of the word 'buckle', which 'strongly suggests the voluntary self-crippling of the crucifixion' G L Nolan also emphasizes this point in a letter in the same place Archibald A. Hill approaches *An Analysis of 'The Windhover'* (*PMLA*) as a problem in geometry, because the poem has 'pattern it would be possible to demonstrate its symmetry by spatial diagram' he says He does not go so far as this, but avails himself of 'a process called a Markoff chain that is, a chain of continually differentiated probabilities, where the highest probability is always treated as if it were 100 per cent'. This aid, however ingenious, does not apparently advance our understanding of the poem by any new revelation Writing of *Hopkins and the Prometheus Myth* (*PMLA*) Sister Mary Humiliata complains of 'the failure of most Hopkins critics to deal adequately with the "terrible" sonnets in general, with Sonnet 65 ("No worst, there is none") in particular'. Hopkins himself said that 'in any lyric passage of the tragic poets there are . two strains of thought running together . . , the overthought, that which everybody, editors, see , the other, the underthought, conveyed chiefly in the choice of metaphors etc ' W H Gardner suggested *King Lear* as the source of the 'underthought' in Sonnet 65, but the Prometheus myth is more likely Hopkins had long been interested in it, and at the time (1865) he was engaged in correcting Bridges's *Prometheus the Firegiver*. A strong Chris-

tian tradition in the use of the myth linked the Titan with Christ, but Hopkins did not adopt this direct analogy, but connected the myth with the doctrine by which the Christian, being identified with Christ, shares his suffering for the sins of men

V de S Pinto, in a letter on *Hopkins and 'The Trewenesse of the Christian Religion'*, suggests that the idea of 'inscape' may have come from this work of Sir Philip Sidney, where the word 'inshape' occurs

2 *Novelists*

'The cold-blooded rationalism of *Political Justice*, its apparently placid nihilism, was conceived in passion' says P N Furbank in a study of *Godwin's Novels* (*EC*), and this passion found its outlet in *Caleb Williams*, which 'is a highly dramatised symbolic picture of Godwin himself in the act of writing *Political Justice*' Caleb is Godwin, Falkland is the *ancien régime*, and the opening of the trunk in which is concealed the evidence of Falkland's crime is the writing of *Political Justice* Within this fable, all the complexities of Godwin's motives, and the powerful stresses under which he worked, are brilliantly worked out, and it 'represents the writer's guilt-situation *vis-à-vis* revolution more satisfactorily than either Schiller's *Robbers* or Wordsworth's *Borderers*' It differs from the other novels in having this symbolic application, but they resemble it in that they too are exact studies and dramatization of morbid passion In the latter part of his article Furbank illustrates this from *St Leon, Fleetwood,* and *Mandeville*

Scott's practice in proof correction was peculiar He would receive two sets of proofs from his printer, James Ballantyne, and would enter his corrections on one of them Ballantyne then transcribed the corrections on to the other sheet, which was the one sent to press. In the process, however, Ballantyne offered a great deal of comment and suggestion, much of which Scott accepted Six sets of proofs thus enhanced are preserved in the National Library of Scotland, and W M Parker gives specimens from them of Ballantyne's comments and Scott's replies in *Correcting Scott's Texts* (*TLS*, 9 Dec) P F Fisher examines *Providence, Fate and the Historical Imagination in Scott's 'The Heart of Midlothian'* (*NCF*), showing how Scott, having united the novel with the romance, 'could concentrate on manners without abandoning the sense of history and the reference to the unusual'

New Letters from Jane Austen's Home by Geoffrey Grigson (*TLS*, 19 Aug) records that a number of letters to Anna Lefroy, Jane's niece, from her grandmother and others, have lately come on the market They begin in 1814, and cover the period of the Austen ladies' residence at Chawton Cottage, and include the announcement by Francis, Jane's naval brother, 'in a brief, quarterdeck communication', of her Aunt Jane's death in 1817 Correspondence continues with Cassandra, and the letters 'confirm how perfectly Jane Austen had been placed, how exactly betwixt and between, in how deep a humus of ordinary life, for observation, record and interpretation'

'Several critics have remarked about a kind of light opera atmosphere that pervades the novels but they have pursued the idea no further' says Paulina June Sale, who investigates *Peacock's use of Music in his Novels* (*JEGP*) and finds that music and musical imagery fill them on every level

The protracted controversy concerning Dickens's separation from his wife has been further complicated by

the fact that one of the central documents has been a suspected forgery, and withheld from publication. It is a letter, purporting to have been written by Helen Thomson (Mrs Dickens's aunt) to Mrs Stark. Several copies exist, and from one of them, now in the possession of Professor Edgar Johnson, K J Fielding publishes the text for the first time in *Charles Dickens and his Wife Fact or Forgery?* (*Ea*), together with an analysis of the reasons for suspecting it, which he is inclined to reject He supplies further material concerning Dickens's separation in *Dickens and the Hogarth Scandal* (*NCF*), publishing some letters (now in the possession of Sir Leslie Farrer) dealing with alleged slanders spread about Dickens by his wife's family concerning his relations with his sister-in-law Georgina

Dickens's dedication to the task of raising the profession of letters in England to its proper dignity, and his fury at any hint of patronage were responsible for his efforts to capture control of the Royal Literary Fund on behalf of the writers K J Fielding records a further engagement in this campaign in *Dickens and the Royal Literary Fund—1858* (*RES*) (see *YW* xxxiii 260 and xxxv 205) In 1857 it became evident that efforts to reform the Fund from within were unavailing, and, remarking that he was 'resolved to reform it—or ruin it' Dickens began to attack the management of the Fund in pamphlets which did not hesitate to deal with the personalities of members of the Committee The ill-nature thus betrayed, which was as unproductive of reform as earlier constitutional efforts had been, was, Fielding maintains, 'linked with the resentment he felt at the difficulties of his domestic life and at anyone who seemed to stand in his way'.

Examining *The Structure of 'Martin Chuzzlewit'* (*PQ*) Edwin B Benjamin agrees that the novel 'was written in serial form in Dickens's somewhat haphazard fashion, the author not knowing from one instalment to the next where the story was going to take him' But it has, nevertheless, a firm structure rooted in the relation of the characters and action to the central theme of hypocrisy, the characters representing different aspects of the theme, and the action different phases of it

Of individual novels, *Bleak House* receives most attention John Butt, examining *'Bleak House' in the context of 1851* (*NCF*), finds that, although as in other novels Dickens intended the action to represent an earlier period, it nevertheless closely reflects matters that were very much before the public at that time To take no more obscure example than the central theme of Chancery, Dickens's indictment 'was more than merely topical It followed in almost every respect the charges already levelled in the columns of *The Times*' which had been greatly occupied with this subject throughout the year In *The Mystery and the Moral Point of View in Dickens's 'Bleak House'* M E Grenander analyses the structure of the novel, with its 'multilinear plot' and change of narrator, not only for a further understanding of the book itself, 'but for an increased awareness of a typical problem of representation, and an able solution' At the end of Part X of the novel occurs the death of Krook by spontaneous combustion, and this phenomenon was immediately challenged by G H Lewes, with whom Dickens was friendly Dickens retaliated in the next part by citing his authorities in a manner calculated to dispel scepticism, but Lewes returned to the attack An account of the subsequent engagement is given by Gordon S Haight in

Dickens and Lewes on Spontaneous Combustion (*NCF*) In *Skimpole and Leigh Hunt Again* (*NQ*) K J Fielding refers to the articles on Leigh Hunt by John Stores Smith in *Freelance* (Manchester) in April 1868, in which he announced his astonishment at Dickens's denial that he intended Skimpole for Hunt

'In presentation, or point of view, as well as in structure, the novel is controlled by the three phases of Pip's life' says Thomas E Connolly, analysing *Technique in 'Great Expectations'* (*PQ*) Writing in the first person, Dickens had nevertheless to present three different aspects, that of 'childhood psychology', that of 'snobbish duality', and that of final realization. Of these the second presented the most formidable task, for Pip's illusions must be described after his realization of them, and yet no comment must appear Dickens's success in this resulted in powerful tragic irony The problem of the third stage was to maintain interest when the irony could no longer function, and Dickens solved this by the introduction of melodrama

Pointing out that Dickens 'never produces in one place a literary theory or key to his method as a novelist, and he rarely talks at length about his writing', Monroe Engel presents, in *Dickens on Art* (*MP*), a number of Dickens's critical remarks, and ekes them out with some comment of a general nature on his practice as a novelist

The paeon of praise after Dickens's death was not quite unbroken The *Freeman*, predecessor to the *Baptist Times*, wrote 'If Mr Dickens had confined himself to an exposure of hateful and mischievous falsehoods we, at least, should have no fault to find, but how is it that his canting, snivelling, red-nosed imposters invariably hail from Ebenezer Chapel?' That against the Nonconformists was the most protracted of all Dickens's campaigns, and in *Dickens and the Brick-and-Mortar Sects* (*NCF*) Arthur H Adrian traces it from Mr Stiggins and before until the very end of his life Dickens had no more respect for the Establishment than for the Dissenters, why did he attack only the latter? Adrian suggests that his hostility was emotional, deriving from the impact of evangelical methods upon his deep reticence in spiritual matters

It 'deserves a place on the shelves between *Past and Present* and *Culture and Anarchy*' says Gordon N Ray of *Thackeray's 'Book of Snobs'* (*NCF*) 'The mean admiration of mean things' was rife in the mid-century, and 'Thackeray was simply bearing witness to the existing condition of English society, not unconsciously revealing a blemish in his own moral character, when he took snobbery as his guide in surveying English life'

In *'Vanity Fair' and the Celestial City* (*NCF*) Joseph E Baker finds in Thackeray more affinity with St Augustine than with Bunyan, for whereas Bunyan 'was an artist but not a philosopher', Thackeray 'was a great thinker, but never wrote philosophy' 'I do not say that Thackeray and St Augustine were in complete agreement', he says, 'but they were closer together than is popularly supposed' *Vanity Fair* should not be taken as a complete record of human life, like St Augustine, Thackeray presents 'a picture of life as it *would be* without the spiritual' Baker points out that Amelia is among those 'odious people' who are 'living without God in the world', but Mark Spilka suggests that the reason for the failure of *Thackeray's Amelia* (*NCF*) must be sought in the new orthodoxy, rather than the old Thackeray's love for his childlike wife, Isabella, and 'his

excessive fondness for the domestic virtues' indicate that 'he has probably confused the parent–child relationship with adult love' Amelia, therefore, lacks conviction, she 'is much more of an effect than a cause, she feels rather than thinks her way through life, and yet her very feelings are conveyed through other agents than herself' The result is that she is 'falsely drawn', for we are unable to conceive her as capable of deep and sustained affection

Arthur Sherbo contributes, as *A Suggestion for the Original of Thackeray's Rawdon Crawley* (*NCF*), a sketch of the life of the first Lord Cholmondeley (1749–1827), whose person, pursuits, and circumstances present some close parallels

Admitting the 'emotional defects' of the book, Maurice Hussey examines the *Structure and Imagery in 'Adam Bede'* (*NCF*), and finds 'an intimate dissection of modes of living, a study of psychology in contrasting environments, and a perpetual cycle of the seasons' When Arthur Donnithorne first realized that he was falling in love with Hetty he pitched the book he was reading into a corner This action was symbolic, says Jerome Thale in *'Adam Bede' Arthur Donnithorne and 'Zeluco'* (*MLN*), for the book was Dr Moore's *Zeluco,* chosen not only to indicate the period, and the social status of Arthur Donnithorne, but also because it is a moral story in which the hero, in many ways parallel to Donnithorne himself, comes to appalling ruin, and might, had the book been read to the end, have signalled a timely warning

Imagery in George Eliot's Last Novels underwent a change, says Barbara Hardy (*MLR*) Whereas earlier the images had been occasional only, 'usually therefore to heighten an emotional appeal or to brighten a moral generalization', in *Middlemarch* and *Daniel Deronda* 'we find single images and clusters of images which recur throughout the long narrative, the recurrence acting as a mnemonic which helps the reader to see the book as a whole'. These images and clusters of images, taken, like those of the earlier books, 'from objects which have an actual presence in the novel', also take the place, to some extent, of the passages of 'open generalization' in which George Eliot had formerly expounded her theme 'Her own voice is still heard in the last novels, but it is sometimes silent and the imagery speaks for her '

Alice R Kaminsky divides an article on *George Eliot, George Henry Lewes, and the Novel* (*PMLA*) into two parts, the first representing a statement of Lewes's theory of the novel, and the second an account of his influence on George Eliot Lewes's own attempts at novel writing led him to place the form in the first rank of literary production, as 'the representation of human life by means of a story' To a Comtist nothing was more exalted than human life, and it must be realistically portrayed, 'only those works which are distinguished by any felicity of realism in their treatment are capable of conveying any durable pleasure to the cultivated reader'. An enthusiastic student of psychology, Lewes also insisted on the importance to the novelist of the power 'of representing the psychological interpretation of material phenomena', or, in other words, 'the power of connecting external appearance with internal effects'. Examples from George Eliot's novels show how closely she followed these opinions, and 'amply warrant the rejection of the traditional view which assigns to Lewes the rôle of undiscriminating adulator'.

In an account of *Blackmore's Novels before 'Lorna Doone'* (*NCF*) William E Buckler describes in detail the diffi-

culties that Blackmore encountered in the publishing of *Clara Vaughan* and *Cradock Nowell*

The cudgels are taken up in a spirited fashion by Rosemary Beresford in *Mark Rutherford and Hero Worship* (*RES*) to defend William Hale White against charges of a 'tendency to confuse pursuit of the "best" with pursuit of the "best" men', which were levelled by W H Stone (see *YW* xxxiv 283) Mr Stone, whose biography of White has been published in the interim (*YW* xxxv 188), adds a note in defence of his opinion

Division of Purpose in George Gissing, says Jacob Korg (*PMLA*), should not be attributed to lack of vitality, but is 'the mark of an allegiance divided between social reform and art' Gissing, zealous for reform, and 'moved to exert his best powers not by creation for its own sake, but by the hope of accomplishing a moral mission through his novels', was nevertheless easily discouraged, and prone to take refuge in the Ivory Tower

In a copy of Shelley's poems, now owned by Mr Frederick B Adams, Jr, Hardy marked a number of passages which reveal 'a special sympathy for Shelley's idea of the perfect woman and of ideal love' Following this clue, Phyllis Bartlett, in *'Seraph of Heaven', A Shelleyan Dream in Hardy's Fiction* (*PMLA*), traces the Shelleyan references chronologically through the novels from *The Poor Man and the Lady* to *Jude the Obscure*

Although once very popular, the work of Sir Walter Besant has been neglected for a long time now, and Fred W Boege takes steps to remedy this (*NCF*) with a biographical and critical memoir Beginning with the collaboration with James Rice, from 1872 to 1882, he supplements Besant's own account with material from other sources Percy Fitzgerald, for example, reveals that Besant was the 'skilled writing-partner' and Rice the business manager After a critical survey of the novels of the collaboration, Besant's work after Rice's death is reviewed, his writings about East London, and the founding of the People's Palace

3 *Criticism, &c*

In a recent essay (see *YW* xxxv 207) Donald M Foerster examined the attack on the epic as a poetic form during the Romantic period in England He now deals with the *Critical Approval of Epic Poetry in the Age of Wordsworth* (*PMLA*), showing that the attack was not all out Approval was extended to the epic not as a measure of acceptance of the standards of the previous age, but for quite new reasons Interest in Primitivism, for example, encouraged study of Homer, as of Ossian, to discover the basic permanent elements in man's nature The new school, however, did not look for changeless universal truths, but for 'vivid representation of the Christian ideal (the narrowest view), or of the ideal of religion as a whole, or of the ideal of truth and beauty as reflected in the actual and grasped intuitively by the imagination' Dante and Milton for this reason, and because they were thought to reflect an extreme subjectivity, were widely acclaimed 'It is Milton himself whom you see in his Satan, his Adam, his Raphael' said Coleridge Hazlitt admired Dante because 'he interests by exciting our sympathy with the emotion by which he himself is possessed' Action, as such, and unity of action, were not required of the epic, the emphasis was all on 'emotion in its interaction with thought'

The notorious review of *Christabel* in the *Edinburgh Review* for Septem-

ber 1816 remains anonymous, although Jeffrey has been named as the author, and Coleridge himself was the source of the belief that Hazlitt wrote it In *The Unknown Reviewer of 'Christabel' · Jeffrey, Hazlitt, Tom Moore* (*PMLA*), Elizabeth Schneider introduces, by way of T F. Dibdin's *Reminiscences of a Literary Life*, London, 1836, the suggestion that Tom Moore was the author Another early review, although a favourable one this time, of which the authorship has been in doubt, was *Observations on 'The Revolt of Islam'* in *Blackwood's* for January 1819 It has long been thought the work of John Wilson, but A L Strout in *Lockhart, Champion of Shelley* (*TLS*, 12 Aug) reveals that Lockhart wrote it, information contained in some pages in the handwriting of William Blackwood himself now in the National Library of Scotland As the review has been called 'by far the worthiest recognition that Shelley's genius received in his lifetime' a curiously mixed attitude to the young poets on Lockhart's part is indicated, and this is discussed A number of letters, also in the National Library of Scotland, by William Maguin, and having a bearing on *Blackwood's* and its contributors, are discussed by Strout in *William Maguin as Gossip* (*NQ*)

'He never got beyond the Mrs Radcliffe stage, and he was a poor judge of a novel' said his daughter Emily of Thomas De Quincey Charles I Patterson, examining *De Quincey's conception of the Novel as Literature of Power* (*PMLA*), challenges this with a review of De Quincey's statements about the novel Although he denounced them as ephemeral and localized, he nevertheless admitted novels to the category of 'Literature of Power', although to the lowest division, and he 'recognized the growing social importance of the novel, and sensed something of the cosmic outlook which it began to acquire as the century progressed'.

'One of the things which mark Carlyle as a Romantic is the way he had of seeing the world in his own magnified image' and this has led some to wonder 'whether many of the things which look autobiographical in his writing may not be, after all, largely imaginary' Carlisle Moore examines *'Sartor Resartus' and the problem of Carlyle's conversion* (*PMLA*) from this point of view, and concludes that, in spite of his insistence that Teufelsdroeckh's conversion in the Rue St Thomas de l'Enfer 'happened quite literally to myself in Leith Walk', his own conversion was by no means so sudden The Leith Walk incident was merely the beginning of a process, here examined in detail, which continued at least until *Sartor* was begun in September 1830 Carlyle received so many letters from young admirers requesting spiritual guidance that he eventually devised a form of reply which would cover all likely problems At first, however, he answered each request with great sympathy, and he was sometimes rewarded with lasting friendship In *Four Unpublished Letters of Thomas Carlyle* (*PMLA*) Susanne H Noble gives an example of this The letters (present whereabouts not disclosed) are to Geraldine Jewsbury, and are dated 26 April 1840, 15 June 1840, 21 October 1840, and 1 December 1849

An account of *Newman and the Oriel Fellowship* by Martin J Svaglic (*PMLA*) deals with the family circumstances, emotional factors, and religious opinions behind Newman's 'audacious idea' of standing for a Fellowship at Oriel in 1822

Two Arnold Letters are published for the first time, with notes, by R Liddell Lowe (*MP*) The first, longer and more interesting, is dated from

Wilton Place, 28 December 1857, to his brother Tom, and is now in the Pierpont Morgan Library After speaking of *Merope*, shortly to be published, Arnold says he expects the popularity of the Romantics to decline He continues with a discussion of the relation of poetry to the age, in the particular context of Pope Pope's poetry was 'adequate' to his age, but the age was a poor one The present age, on the other hand, was 'first class', but the poetry was not adequate to it The second letter is dated from the Athenaeum, 3 August 1882, to Sidney Colvin, acknowledging receipt of his *Selections from Landor*, and commenting that Landor was a writer who had much to gain from 'selection' This letter is now in the University of Chicago Library Kenneth Allott, in *Matthew Arnold Two Unpublished Letters* (*NQ*), prints two letters to Rev William Henry Lucas, now in the possession of Mr Oliver Warner

From an examination of all available reports, R H Super issues a list of *Arnold's Oxford Lectures on Poetry* (*MLN*) Details are given of twenty-four lectures between November 1857 and June 1867, with notes of their subsequent publication, and other information concerning Arnold's tenure of the Chair of Poetry

Professor J Dover Wilson, in his edition of *Culture and Anarchy* (1935), pointed out that Arnold misquoted John Bright in the preface when he represented him to have said 'I believe the people of the United States have offered to the world more valuable information during the last forty years than all Europe' What Bright said was 'more valuable *inventions*' Merle M Bevington, in *Matthew Arnold and John Bright* (*PMLA*), traces the source of the error to the report of Bright's speech in *The Times* for 6 February 1868, and records some ironic sequels. Another belated attempt to accord justice to Bright is made by Charles T Dougherty, who, in *Matthew Arnold's 'Barbarians'*, suggests that Bright himself may have supplied Arnold with this famous term

Not two, but three versions of the *Preface* to *Poems of Wordsworth* in the *Golden Treasury* series are in existence, for at the second printing of the selection, in November 1879, Arnold not only revised his choice of poems, but also made some changes in his *Preface* These are listed by S O A Ullman in *A 'New' Version of Arnold's Essay on Wordsworth* (*NQ*)

In *Matthew Arnold Visits Chicago* (*UTQ*) John P Lang explores the files of the *Chicago Daily Inter-Ocean* and other local newspapers for the city's impressions of Arnold, and Arnold's letters for his impressions of Chicago, particularly of its newspapers An account of the 'great Matthew Arnold Hoax', which was the sequel to the visit, is also given

Conflicting reports of *The Source of the Word 'Agnostic'* are reviewed by George W Hallam (*MLN*), who concludes that Huxley himself was responsible for some of the confusion R H Hutton is quoted in *OED* to the effect that Huxley, in his hearing, referred the word to the Athenian altar 'To the Unknown God' In an early essay Huxley had referred to 'the altar of the Unknown and Unknowable God', but he later rejected the second of these attributes, saying 'I do not very much care to speak of anything as "unknowable"'

XV. THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

By MARJORIE THOMPSON

1. *Novels*

AN important addition to studies of Conrad is made by E H Visiak[1] who illuminates by the light of fifty years' study the relation between Conrad's work and his life There is little new material, but a shrewd divination of the roots and causes of Conrad's characteristic attitudes and values His obsession with faith and the betrayal of faith is seen to reach back to his own desertion of his fatherland 'He had been told before he left Poland to embark on the international ocean that he was no less than a deserter of his country and this damning insinuation, uttered like an anathema in a sacrarium, sank deep into his adolescent mind ' Yet it is made clear that Conrad was, in life as well as in fiction, governed by a sense of fatality, of inevitability, of doom, a conception which caused him (and there will doubtless be some disagreement) 'to become eventually a tragic writer in the old, classic signification rather than, what he is usually styled, a romantic realist' The book is somewhat overweighted with not always relevant Miltonic parallels, and other references are sometimes incomplete, but it offers a valuable illustration of the process by which experience is transmuted into literature

In *Joseph Conrad's American Friend* (*MP*) Arnold T Schwab publishes for the first time in its entirety the correspondence between Conrad and James Gibbons Huneker, the American critic, who, though he has nothing discerning to say about Conrad, was largely responsible for establishing his reputation in America The correspondence is a valuable commentary on Conrad's reception there

Conrad's debt to Zola is illustrated in *Zola and Conrad's 'The Idiots'* (*SP*) in which Milton Chaikin relates Conrad's story to *La Terre* and *La Joie de Vivre*, pointing out that 'on every page we find some imitation of Zola, either a general reflection of his style or a resemblance more specific', the influence being especially noticeable in the descriptive writing

The battle of Eastwood still rages F R Leavis[2] is the most belligerent in the ranks of Lawrence's defenders, and deals hefty blows right and left on his detractors His weakness is that he protests too much His repeated insistence on the claims of Lawrence to be 'the great writer of our phase of civilization' and 'one of the greatest English writers of any time' makes too violent an assault on the reader's sympathies 'The need is to get recognition of the kind of major achievement they (i e *The Rainbow* and *Women in Love*) are', 'in any case whatever criticism may be urged against them, both books are, in sum, magnificently achieved great novels, major creations'—such phrases rain their hammer blows too frequently, the reader prefers subtler methods and resents being bludgeoned into evaluation. Nevertheless, there is much critical insight and sound assessment, the obvious similarity between George Eliot and Lawrence is qualified in the distinction between her 'ethical' and his 'religious' outlook; the remark that *Aaron's Rod* is for Lawrence 'a letter to himself', with all that it implies of his art as a novelist,

[1] *The Mirror of Conrad*, by E H Visiak Werner Laurie pp 255 18*s*

[2] *D H Lawrence, Novelist*, by F R Leavis Chatto & Windus pp 318 21*s*

is pregnant with significance Even so, this is melodramatic criticism on the whole, and the villain of the piece emerges as T S Eliot

Harry T Moore is less of a partisan He describes his work[3] as 'not one of literary criticism, though critical values inevitably play some part in it The book is, in the fullest sense, a biography' 'Fullest sense' is indeed the correct term Lawrence's life is documented down to the smallest detail, such as the distance he had to walk from his lodgings to the Davidson School in Croydon, memoirs, recollections, and statements have been collected from every conceivable associate, 200 unpublished letters and one unpublished manuscript have been unearthed The result, however, is not a shapeless mass of data, but a satisfying, unbiased, and well-digested study, though concentrating on the material that went to make the artist rather than on the artist proper, it offers many sound judgements and observations, such as its indication of Lawrence's anticipation of contemporary ways of thought, for example, 'in taking Melville seriously Lawrence was one of the first voices in the great Melville revival' Though he agrees with Leavis in regarding *The Rainbow* and *Women in Love* as the height of Lawrence's achievement, Moore considers him, with some justification, to be more important as prophet than as artist, particularly as prophet crying in the wilderness of a mechanized civilization that threatens to destroy itself

Eliot Fay[4] 'endeavours to interpret the main currents in the life of D H Lawrence from 1920 to 1930', having chosen this period for its 'incomparable dramatic power' He thus adopts an approach to scholarship that has been gaining in popularity of late—that of collating and sifting existing records and criticism The book is a synthesis of the varying memoirs and accounts of Lawrence during this last decade, and though it consists rather in a string of incidents than in any positive interpretation, it is successful in weaving its way through many conflicting versions It was originally inspired by the writer's visit to Taos

Yet another approach to Lawrence is found in Mary Freeman's 'basic study of his ideas'[5] She too concentrates on the prophet and philosopher, tracing the evolution of Lawrence's ideas from novel to novel, emphasizing (and this is a valuable contribution) the 'exploratory' nature of his writing Once again, the book is on the whole a reminder rather than a revelation, but it makes clear the development of Lawrence's thought towards greater discrimination and to a sense of the wholeness of life It summarizes particularly clearly his ideas on education, on democracy, on class, on leaders, it searches out the implications in his distrust of the mind and leads to an ultimate explanation of his ambiguousness

An interesting effort to resolve the difficulties of James Joyce is made by Kristian Smidt[6] who in his examination of the fusion of art and religion in Joyce's mind ventures bold, but on the whole acceptable assertions He makes searching raids on Joyce's innermost nature, which produce stimulating results, though in many cases the arguments could have been extended and more fully developed

[3] *The Intelligent Heart The Story of D H Lawrence*, by Harry T Moore Heinemann pp xii+468 25*s*

[4] *Lorenzo in Search of the Sun D H Lawrence in Italy, Mexico and the American South-West*, by Eliot Fay Vision Press pp 148 12*s*

[5] *D H Lawrence A Basic Study of His Ideas*, by Mary Freeman Univ of Florida Press pp vii+277 $5

[6] *James Joyce and the Cultic Use of Fiction*, by Kristian Smidt Oslo Akademisk Forlag Oxford Blackwell pp vii+106 12*s* 6*d*

The main thesis is that fiction was for Joyce 'a persistent cultic and ritualistic urge which has the general effect of a substitute religion replacing his Catholic orthodoxy', that is, it takes on the sacredness of a religious cult To this 'nostalgic exile from religion' the 'oneness of the Word' was a 'groping towards the divine', but the strength of his suppressed faith is betrayed by his very ridicule of it In the pride of his intellect Joyce resented the Unknowable, regarded it as a denial of life, in Smidt's interpretation he emerges as a kind of fallen angel, defying his instincts, sublimating them in blasphemy and setting up the artist in the place of the God he has despised and rejected An interesting parallel is pointed out in the attitude to religion in Attic comedy

Jane H Jack in *Art and 'The Portrait of the Artist'* (*EC*) demonstrates that in distinction from *Stephen Hero* Joyce's second autobiographical account concentrates on the artist and not on the man (as the titles imply) She gives an interesting analysis of the symbols and metaphorical values, pointing out that for Joyce art was 'a main artery in the body of life'

In *'Ulysses' and the Legends* (*EC*) Philip Edwards examines Joyce's use of legend, maintaining that his purpose is not merely to belittle the present by comparison with the heroic past, but rather to show that past and present are one—'Odysseus is in modern Dublin, Bloom in the Mycenaean Age', that in this deliberate fusion Joyce is 'debunking the grandeur of the past', and that the correspondences between past and present add sharp definition to situations and relationships and give universality to the story

Richard Ellmann in *The Limits of Joyce's Naturalism* (*Sewanee Review*) points out that though Joyce frequently paid insistent attention to unimportant details, his descriptions are never exact—'Dublin is not described but taken for granted' Naturalism moves easily into myth, with its 'attendant paradoxes' Bloom, for all his minute realism of treatment, is a 'collection of prototypes', this method being 'part of Joyce's effort to negotiate between spirit and matter' Joyce only goes a little way with naturalism, for his work is an 'act of prophecy', in which present and past, myth and fact, are combined to 'give insight into the methods of the universe'

Ellsworth Mason in *Mr Stanislaus Joyce and John Henry Raleigh* (*MLN*) challenges Raleigh's interpretation of Joyce's treatment of his brother in *Finnegans Wake* (*MLN*, 1953), declaring that he is far from being regarded as his 'brother's keeper', and disproving Raleigh's conception of him as the 'moral and artistic conscience and authority for his wavering brother'

George Orwell is subject to shrewd and sympathetic analysis by John Atkins,[7] though at times the work is marred by overstatement and a labouring of points, especially in the political sections Apart from this weakness, this is a balanced and illuminating study Atkins makes the initial assertion that decency was the common virtue which Orwell sought in men and that he believed that the decay of decency coincided with the decay of religion His own peculiar distinction was that while he had the mind of an intellectual he had the feelings of the common man His limitations as an artist lay in his being more 'interested in society than in individuals' and he 'lacked psychological insight', though no man seems to have had more insight into the psychology of poverty Fine distinctions are drawn in the definition of Orwell as 'not a literary critic but a

[7] *George Orwell A Literary Study*, by John Atkins John Calder pp 348 18*s*

literary sociologist', and he is claimed to be outstanding as a political writer The exposition of the satirical novels is full and revealing, the clue to the possibly unsatisfying effect of *1984* being contained in the word 'over-rational' It is, no doubt, the predominance of rational common sense that gives that certain touch of aridity to his work, in its ignoring of the mysterious, the inexplicable, the complex in human nature, in its emphasis on the social organization of man rather than on fundamental human nature, like judging the efficiency of an institution by its administrative staff rather than by the work done there '*1984* is one of those books that overpower you as you read but which do not leave any strong conviction in the mind ' This study supports one's appreciation of Orwell as a sociologist, persuades one of the 'sainthood' claimed for the man, but confirms regret at the incompleteness of the artist Yet Orwell emerges as essentially a man of his age, if only for the fact that, as with most modern writers, 'all the leading characters are victims, like himself' Orwell's childhood miseries and suppressions are admirably described in such a way as to explain not only the man but the artist and his failings

E M Forster serenely bestrides and transcends his age and Glen O Allen's *Structure, Symbol and Theme in E M Forster's 'A Passage to India'* (*PMLA*) bears the reminder that 'proportion is the secret' The analysis of the symbols of cave, echo, and snake in relation to Hindu philosophy, the recognition of the three parts of the book as reflecting the three seasons of the Indian year, the discerning of three attitudes to life—the 'path of activity, the path of knowledge and the path of devotion', representing ways of salvation—all these indicate a grasp of fundamental profundities in the life of man all too frequently overlooked in contemporary formulae

R T. Davies in *Charles Williams and Romantic Experience* (*Ea*) ruthlessly analyses this elusive writer in the light of his definition of himself as a 'romantic theologian', asserting that his strength lay in 'singular insights rather than comprehensive vision', that he failed in 'clear evaluation', that his novels are guilty of 'intangibility and confusedness', and questioning his presentation of evil in a final paragraph which closes in a sentence of particularly damning implications

J Dobrinski in *Aspects Biographiques de W Somerset Maugham L'Enfance* (*Ea*) traces the influence of a lonely and 'deprived' childhood on the work of Somerset Maugham

Robert Liddell[8] elucidates the significances and assesses the achievement of Ivy Compton-Burnett in a welcome study of an author who has received surprisingly little critical attention She is rightly regarded as a 'pure artist' whose work is always a 'gain in experience' for the reader In her obsession with tyranny and the lust for power within the confines of her 'unhappy families' she is shown to have clear affinities with Sophocles, though with the added astringency of comedy This is a neat, concise, and sensitive study which enriches the reader's experience of the books

A general study of the technique of the novel is offered by Robert Humphrey[9] in the third of his group of 'Perspectives in Criticism', which aims to make the term 'stream of consciousness' 'useful and meaningful' He maintains that it is loosely used and should refer solely to 'pre-speech

[8] *The Novels of I Compton-Burnett*, by Robert Liddell Gollancz pp 112 10*s* 6*d*

[9] *Stream of Consciousness in the Modern Novel*, by Robert Humphrey Univ of California Press and C U P pp vii+127 21*s*

levels of consciousness', and should not be confused with either 'inner awareness' or the 'monologue intérieure'. He examines the technique of novelists using this form, amongst whom William Faulkner is seen to combine most effectively the 'stream of consciousness' and external action But can a 'dichotomy' be 'tenuous'? and was Joyce so 'faithless'?

2 *Prose*

Charles Carrington's biography of Rudyard Kipling[10] seems to speak from and for a lost generation, but is admirable in its proportion, orderliness, and clarity of outline, preserved in spite of the formidable mass of material under consideration It is a timely reinstatement of Kipling and its significance is conveyed in the preface—'I find no writer who has seen through the eyes of my generation with such sharpness of observation ' With access to family papers the writer gives a full account of Kipling's life and work interspersed with sound critical evaluations The continued discrepancy is observed between the enthusiastic appreciation of the public and the strong hostility of the critics, this situation being explained no doubt in the definition of Kipling's creed as 'Art for Duty's sake' However, to this day, it is urged, 'he makes men lose their tempers, a sure proof of his importance' The book is also notable for the admirable references to the changing historical background, the author making us aware in their turn of the state of India, the state of the frontier tribes, the state of Victorian England, the influence of Henley and the *Scots Observer*, the pre-war and post-war moods, the whole flavour of Kipling's times is made palpable and tangible With insight and precision the writer sums up Kipling's achievements as he sees them, noting his understanding of the soldier, his insistence on the 'Law', that 'undefined *nomos* which provided him with a sort of special substitute for religion' (how many times in this survey has this phrase been used?), his ability to 'astonish the world with a phrase', all summed up in the bold assertion that 'his impact upon the age he lived in was greater than that of any writer since Dickens' Modern prejudice has in some degree manufactured the opposition to Kipling, literary fashion has changed, and the word 'imperialism', even though of Kipling's brand, in which 'the Flag of England stood for service and sacrifice, not for racial superiority' has become almost indecent, perhaps—and this is suggested in the writer's comparison of Kipling with Yeats and Eliot—the final pronouncement should be that his influence lies not in English letters, but in English life, and this is surely symbolized at his funeral, when the pall-bearers were statesmen, soldiers, eminent academics, and public figures, not one of them a man of letters (see Chapter XIV, note 15)

Hilaire Belloc in J B Morton's personal memoir[11] also steps out of another age This is an authentic impression of the man, with his paradoxes and eccentricities—the 'mixture of Victorian England and Republican France', and of the artist whose 'greatness was more apparent in his talk than in his books' The heartiness usually attributed to Belloc as his outstanding characteristic is here qualified, and his dominant virtues emerge as faith, fortitude, and a belief that we are but exiles on the earth, destined for ultimate Beatitude Belloc belongs

[10] *Rudyard Kipling, His Life and Work*, by Charles Carrington Macmillan pp xxiv+549 25*s*

[11] *Hilaire Belloc, A Memoir*, by J B Morton Hollis & Carter pp x+181 12*s* 6*d*

to a surer, more confident generation, his vigour, zest, and infectious rhythms will always have their appeal, but they do not speak for this age, which in its debilitated spiritual state looks for something subtler, gentler, indeed more equivocal Belloc comes to the twentieth century as an aggressively healthy visitor to an ailing hypochondriac, his rude health almost an insult

V de S Pinto[12] recalls a figure of much less obtrusive charm and influence in R M Hewitt, one of those memorable but uncelebrated academic figures who lurk quietly in universities all their days but may unwittingly make minor alterations in the course of the universe Hewitt was 'the true sage, the man who combines learning with wisdom, tolerance and exquisite courtesy', who is 'great for his influence on others rather than for his own productions though he published so little himself his influence can be seen in a number of books by other men' The selections from his essays and lectures, bearing witness to his sane, shrewd judgement, make it a matter of regret that he 'published so little', and the editor's graceful commemoration is welcome for itself and for making these fragments known

Bonamy Dobrée provides a fitting summary of this section in *Some Remarks on Prose in England Today* (*Sewanee Review*), in which he observes the loss of the 'sense of prose as an instrument'—'For very few is prose a muse'—asking whether the 'toning down of Victorian exuberance hasn't led to a thinning, an impoverishment' He notes that the period of experimentation seems to be over, and advocates a revival of 'something like the old schools of rhetoric' to reawaken the consciousness of prose as 'a form that has to be worked at'

3 *Poetry*

Poetry may be introduced by two general surveys, widely differing in spirit and viewpoint Robert Graves in *These be Your Gods, O Israel!* (*EC*) makes in what is the last of his Clark Lectures an irreverent and unorthodox attack upon the poets who are at this time accorded the highest respect It is a somewhat startling approach for its occasion, but there is a grain of truth in the theme, however flamboyant its presentation One by one the idols go down Yeats is accused of 'having nothing to say', Eliot, though granted the virtue of sound scholarship, of 'plundering other writers', Dylan Thomas, of 'being drunk with melody', though credited with an 'alert and sober intelligence' The final lament is that there are no 'fighting men' among them

A more balanced and sober survey is offered by Herbert Read in *The Drift of Modern Poetry* (*Encounter*) He notes the impressive output of poetry in the twentieth century, equal in volume to the Elizabethan, but, as he adds, with no comparison in population (The mere question of the ratio of volume to population does not seem unduly depressing, the twentieth century has many other accomplishments, undreamt of by the Elizabethans) It is claimed that there is no dominating poet, but undoubtedly many would in future label this the Age of Eliot Repeating the familiar complaint of the 'lack of a characteristic myth' and of 'an integral social consciousness', observing that 'poetry is no longer our daily bread' the writer concludes 'We have the poetry we deserve, fragmented, personal, spasmodic'

[12] *Reginald Mainwaring Hewitt (1887–1948) A Selection from his Literary Remains*, edited with a memoir by Vivian de Sola Pinto Oxford Blackwell pp vi+ 149 10*s* 6*d*

Publication of collected poems by two leading poets challenge these not altogether encouraging surveys W H Auden's latest volume[13] is described on the dust-cover as 'illustrating the wide range of his interest, his insight and his intelligence' This might be a testimonial for an aspiring headmaster or personnel manager—it might refer to any worthy person—and gives no indication of the art of the poet, of his subtle metrical experiments, his delicate precision of vocabulary and characteristic blend of profundity and grace, this is poetry which may have a design upon you, but it is not palpable The poems are arranged in three sections (with musical associations)—Bucolics, In Sunshine and Shade, Horae Canonicae In the last sequence the poems *Prime* and *Nones* have already appeared in print, but are now included in their proper place as part of the whole sequence

Stephen Spender[14] 'at long last' produces the first full collection of his poems, representing the work of twenty-five years, chosen with care by him to give a full picture of his development, leaving out nothing significant, however immature or dated, *The Pylons*, for example, is included as a matter of 'historic interest' The order is autobiographical, and the poet has scrupulously avoided 'touching up' youthful items He hopes that 'anyone who has the patience to read through all the volume will see certain broad lines more clearly and strongly expressed than he might have expected from reading twice as many poems in the previously published volumes' The poems might roughly be said to progress from preoccupation with the disturbing external phenomena of our time to the enduring, universal, inner, personal things—birth, death, parenthood, absence, parting, dusk. This does not seem to be an altogether unpromising outlook for modern poetry

Much useful, if at times minute, scholarship, has been concentrated on W. B Yeats A special number of *Irish Writing* is devoted to him This includes an article by the late Peter Allt on *Lady Gregory and Yeats's Cult of Aristocracy*, in which Yeats's respect for Lady Gregory as a survival of Renaissance aristocracy is compared with Ben Jonson's reverence for the great ladies of his day Peter Ure in *Yeats's 'Demon and Beast'* takes the poem as a basis for the study of Yeats's ultimate 'right mastery of natural things' and makes a substantial contribution to the understanding of Yeats's treatment of nature Valentin Iremonger writes on Yeats as a playwright, Donald Davie on Yeats, Berkeley, and Romanticism, and Hugh Kenner on *The Sacred Book of the Arts*

In *Blake and Yeats* (*NQ*) Robert F Gleckner examines a link between Blake's *Public Address* and Yeats's *A Coat*

Max Wildi in *The Influence and Poetic Development of W B Yeats* (*ES*) detects influences which changed the course of Yeats's development, those of Arthur Symons and Ezra Pound being of special importance

Harry Modean Campbell in *Yeats's 'Sailing to Byzantium'* (*MLN*) adds to the numerous commentaries on this poem a theory that the existing interpretations which concentrate on the religious or the aesthetic are both inadequate, and asserts that art being for Yeats a symbol of immortality, Byzantium was for him 'an unorthodox but devoutly religious version of the New Jerusalem'

Jerome S Rubenstein in *Three Misprints in Yeats's Collected Poems*

[13] *The Shield of Achilles*, by W H Auden Faber pp 80 10*s* 6*d*

[14] *Collected Poems*, by Stephen Spender Faber. pp 211 15*s*

MLN) shows how misprints have iven rise to misinterpretations which he correct readings put right

Marion Witt in *An Unknown Yeats 'oem* (*MLN*) establishes the identity if the periodical *Roma* mentioned in Allan Wade's *Bibliography* as containing a poem of Yeats, but which ie had been unable to find The poem s *The Glove and the Cloak* and is a entimental expression of the poet's esolution to abandon his pursuit of Maud Gonne

George Williamson[15] suggests a new ipproach to T S Eliot, asserting that too much novelty' has been assumed n Eliot's work and assuming in his urn that 'poetry as meaning is neither plain sense nor nonsense, but a form of imaginative sense' His introduction is a supremely valuable guide, iot only to Eliot, but to poetic criticism in general, with its cogent warning that 'a lyric poem as plain sense ecomes an abstraction, as imaginative sense it is always realizing something more than its obvious meaning' n approaching Eliot he insists that it s not necessary to discover every illusion, nor justifiable to condemn im for his borrowings, for this is 'to ondemn no less a poem than *Lycidas*' He hopes to suggest 'the kind of questions to be asked in an Eliot poem', ind to offer not a full analysis, but some guidance to the evident but not obvious patterns' He summarizes Eliot's achievement, firmly in control of the essentials, and follows it with a useful outline of Eliot's poetic theory As may be expected from this both businesslike and sensitive introduction, the analysis of the poems has much suggestive interpretation to offer

Two single poems of Eliot have been submitted to close scrutiny, in Ernest Schanzer's *Mr Eliot's 'Sunday Morning Service'* (*EC*) and in Sears Jayne's *Mr Eliot's Agon* (*PQ*), the latter being a full analysis of *Sweeney Agonistes*

Eliot's critics are also becoming themselves the subject of scholarly research A H Nelson in *The Critics and 'The Waste Land'* (*ES*) surveys the body of critical opinion that has over the years accumulated round the poem, providing an interesting documentation of changes in literary tastes, manners, cults, and snobberies

Volumes of poems by two lesser-known poets complete the year's contribution Blanaid Salkeld[16] and Erica Marx[17] both reflect the age they live in and show marked individual qualities

4 *Drama*

Estella Ruth Taylor's study of Irish writers[18] forms a link between poetry and drama It too is a collation of existing critical work The contributors to the Irish revival are examined from the point of view of their 'scattered statements of opinion and their reflections and self-evaluations which form a body of criticism distinguished by its highly personal and self-conscious tone' The effect is to give an impression of the cohesion of aims and ideas which united the group, and is useful in its classification of opinion under headings and also in its study of the 'expatriate' and its revelations of the results and process of collaboration

Winifred Bannister's study of Bridie[19] has a foreword by Eric Link-

[15] *A Reader's Guide to T S Eliot A Poem-by-Poem Analysis*, by George Williamson Thames & Hudson pp 248 15*s*

[16] *Experiment in Error*, by Blanaid Salkeld Hand & Flower Press pp v+44 7*s* 6*d*

[17] *Some Poems, A Small Selection written between 1930 and 1953*, by Erica Marx Hand & Flower Press pp 47 7*s* 6*d*

[18] *The Modern Irish Writers Cross Currents of Criticism*, by Estella Ruth Taylor Univ of Kansas Press pp 176 $3 50

[19] *James Bridie and His Theatre, A Study*

later, paying tribute to Bridie's character, claiming that he 'had virtues' as a playwright which 'still await recognition' and defining his chief characteristic, the 'ambience he created' as 'deep affection' The book is a lively personal memoir by a close professional associate and ardent admirer, it ranks Bridie 'second only in significance to Shaw', but denies that he was influenced by Shaw, Ibsen rather is said to have been his master The plays are analysed in detail, and though many readers will not accept the high place accorded to Bridie, there is much of interest in this study of a playwright who found great favour with the audiences of his day

H Ludeke in *Some Remarks on Shaw's History Plays* (*ES*) makes some exceedingly valuable observations, and so unusual an achievement as a satisfying interpretation of Shaw is welcome He begins by stressing that the enduring element in Shaw's work is his art, and goes on to show that in view of Shaw's faith in the final victory of mankind, in his making rationalism a mystical belief, his history plays have a profound religious quality The immediate occasions of their conception are usefully indicated, Shaw nearly always producing them as a challenge to some topical and popular version of the same theme, e g Beerbohm Tree's *Julius Caesar*, Sardou's *Madame Sans-Gêne* A parallel is drawn between Shaw's Caesar and Christ, through the study does not go far enough here in examining Shaw's persistent search for those qualities which constitute the strength and power of great men of action Throughout the essay, however, interesting and stimulating suggestions are to be found, and it is to be regretted that they are not more fully developed

The relevant sections in C B Purdom's study of Granville Barker[20] stress the highly distinctive quality of his plays which indicates that 'a dramatist of the first order was lost' when he abandoned playwriting Much light is thrown on the meaning and design of the plays, it is pointed out that each one presents the theme of 'difficulty of adjustment to the conditions of life', and that in each Barker is dramatizing himself It is justifiably claimed that 'the elements he introduced into drama have by no means been fully taken up and worked upon as they deserve to be' In spite of defects such as coldness in love scenes, experience undigested and betraying a defect in imagination, Barker undoubtedly 'had a new thing to say in dramatic form but neither said it clearly nor perfected the form'. Unfulfilled potentialities are perhaps best explained and attributed to a lack of 'the complete emotional energy' necessary to drama

of James Bridie's Personality, his stage plays and his work for the foundation of a Scottish National Theatre, by Winifred Bannister Rockliff Press pp xii+262 25*s*

[20] *Harley Granville Barker, Man of the Theatre, Dramatist and Scholar*, by C B Purdom Rockliff pp xiv+322 30*s*

XVI. AMERICAN LITERATURE

By MARCUS CUNLIFFE

1 *General*

THE year 1955 saw the publication of the first volume of a massive bibliography, compiled by Jacob Blanck for the Bibliographical Society of America.[1] It is to be followed by seven or eight others Despite its awesome scope, it is a selective work, ranging roughly from the American Revolution to the twentieth century (excluding authors who died after 1930) Unlike the great surveys of Evans and Sabin, which it complements, this one attempts to confine itself to *belles-lettres*, omitting historians, theologians, and scientists as well as the authors of juvenilia As Blanck admits, the line is hard to draw though Brooks Adams and Orestes Brownson are left out, Amos Bronson Alcott and George Bancroft are in Still, this is a work of rare learning and discrimination, embellished by some forty plates It lists first editions of books, with descriptive (though not critical) details, important reprints, other publications —such as pamphlets—'containing the first appearance of any prose (except letters) or poetry' by the writer under discussion, and major biographical and bibliographical references to each author

A slighter and less magisterial guide, to 'books written in or about the Southwest or by authors native to or closely identified with the region', is provided by Walter S Campbell ('Stanley Vestal')[2] After introductory comments on the nature of the Southwest, books are listed with brief evaluations under various heads biography, description and interpretation, folk-lore, anthologies, and so on There is a full index of authors and editors

A collection of essays edited by Floyd Stovall[3] is, he says, intended as an interim history of American literary criticism, 'until a complete history shall be provided' Viewed in that modest light, it is a worthwhile book, though inevitably a little crowded and uneven Of the contributors, Harry H Clark deals with the period 1800–40, Richard H Fogle with 1840–70, Robert P Falk with 1870–1900, John H Raleigh with 1900–30, and C Hugh Holman with the glories of criticism since 1930

Two general surveys are offered, one by an American (Robert E Spiller) and one by an Englishman (Alan Wykes)[4] Spiller's is a fluent, expert summary, which does not group authors in a too rigid system of categories but which does provide a welcome sense of shape and development Spiller combines a broad 'organic' thesis with a good deal of biographical and critical information

[1] *Bibliography of American Literature*, comp by Jacob Blanck Vol I *Henry Adams to Donn Byrne* Yale U P and O U P pp 1+474 $15 £6

[2] *The Book Lover's Southwest A Guide to Good Reading*, by Walter S Campbell ('Stanley Vestal') Univ of Oklahoma Press pp xii+287 $4 50

[3] *The Development of American Literary Criticism*, ed by Floyd Stovall Univ of North Carolina Press and O U P pp ix+262 $4 32*s*

[4] *The Cycle of American Literature An Essay in Historical Criticism*, by Robert E Spiller New York and London The Macmillan Company pp xv+318 $4 75 33*s*

A Concise Survey of American Literature, by Alan Wykes London Barker, and New York Library Publishers pp 200 12*s* 6*d* $3 75

on individual figures Wykes, on the other hand, gives the impression that he is 'having a bash' at the subject, with enthusiasm but with no close knowledge Though his book has the virtue of liberal quotation, it is marred by some careless errors

Hart and Gohdes are the editors of a workmanlike anthology for college use [5] They present 250 examples from forty-six different authors, from John Smith to William Faulkner The anthology is amply illustrated, and contains, in addition to bibliographical notes, sound introductions to each author and period

In a lighter vein, Robert P Falk has assembled a fine collection of humour [6] Not all the contributions are 'parodies', even as loosely interpreted by the editor, the word can hardly be applied to Aldous Huxley's devastating essay on Poe, or Twain's on Fenimore Cooper, or William James's remarks on his brother's 'third manner' But one ought not to quibble at a volume that includes, together with such old favourites as Max Beerbohm on 'The Mote in the Middle Distance', many examples that will be less familiar to British readers for instance, the delicious burlesques of Van Wyck Brooks by Frank Sullivan, of Whitman by E B White, of a patriotic oration by 'John Phoenix', or of John P Marquand by Wolcott Gibbs There is a short bibliography

Another view of American literature is proffered by the late Stanley T Williams [7] His theme is the impact of Spanish culture (whether emanating from Spain itself, from Mexico and Latin America, or from the American South-west) upon the literature of the United States, and by culture he understands painting, music, and architecture as well as the printed word His first volume is devoted to a general analysis, his second to closer studies of the eight principal American interpreters of Spanish civilization (Washington Irving, Ticknor, Prescott, Bryant, Longfellow, Lowell, Bret Harte, and W D Howells) This is a difficult, perhaps an impossible subject to handle Yet Williams, the biographer of Irving, was uniquely qualified to essay it, and he devised a work which, if not entirely and completely satisfying, is nevertheless a fascinating source-book Well illustrated and fully indexed, it has 180 pages of notes

Franz Stanzel's study is a lucid, rigorous examination of methods of narration in the novel [8] He distinguishes between the novel as told by the author (exemplified by *Tom Jones*), that told in the first person (as in *Moby Dick*), and the kind seen by some third person who is involved in the action (as in *The Ambassadors*) Stanzel also discusses *Ulysses* as a work in which all three, and still other techniques are used Apart from his main references to Melville and James, there are shrewd observations on these techniques as employed by Faulkner, Truman Capote, Robert Penn Warren, and John Steinbeck, and several English novelists

R W B Lewis undertakes an ambitious study of American intellectual attitudes during the nineteenth cen-

[5] *America's Literature*, by James D Hart and Clarence Gohdes New York Dryden Press pp xvi+958 $6 50

[6] *American Literature in Parody A Collection of Parody, Satire, and Literary Burlesque of American Writers Past and Present*, ed by Robert P Falk New York Twayne, and London Mark Paterson (as *The Antic Muse*, 1956) pp 279 $3 75 10*s* 6*d*

[7] *The Spanish Background of American Literature*, by Stanley T Williams Yale U P and O U P 2 vols pp xxvii, 432+441 $10 80*s*

[8] *Die Typischen Erzahlsituationem im Roman*, by Franz Stanzel Wiener Beitrage zur Englischen Philologie, Vol LXIII Wien-Stuttgart Wilhelm Braumüller pp viii+176 $4 70

tury.[9] At the beginning of that era, he argues, the American saw himself as Adam—'a figure of heroic innocence and vast potentialities, poised at the start of a new history'. Following and extending the terminology of Emerson, he identifies three main positions those of the party of Hope (for whom the key word is 'innocence'), of the party of Memory ('nostalgia'), and of Irony ('tragic optimism') Lewis has his money on the third group, whose spokesmen include Hawthorne, Melville, and the elder Henry James There is something a little modish about his book But it is sophisticated in an admirable as well as in a dubious sense, and he has some perceptive things to say about Horace Bushnell, Charles Brockden Brown, Robert Montgomery Bird, Bancroft and Parkman, Theodore Parker and Orestes Brownson

Finally, it is a pleasure to welcome the first volume of a new Italian publication devoted to American Studies [10] Its eleven articles all reach a respectable standard, and some are excellent Four are concerned chiefly with Hawthorne, among these, Agostino Lombardo and Carlo Izzo are particularly good Vittorio Gabrieli writes on Tom Paine, Biancamaria Tedeschini Lalli on nature in American literature, and Alfredo Rizzardi on Melville's poetry There is a valuable essay on Faulkner by Nemi d'Agostino, and other contributions deal with Wallace Stevens and William Carlos Williams While all the articles are in Italian, it is not intended to confine *Studi Americani* to Italian criticism

[9] *The American Adam Innocence, Tragedy, and Tradition in the Nineteenth Century*, by R W B Lewis Chicago U P and C U P pp ix+205 $5 50 41*s* 6*d*

[10] *Studi Americani Rivista annuale dedicata alle lettere e alle arti negli Stati Uniti d'America*, ed by Agostino Lombardo Rome· Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura Vol I 1955 pp 316 L 1,200 (paper)

2 *Colonial*

Jefferson's important *Notes on the State of Virginia* was first printed (privately) in Paris in 1785 A London edition was published in 1787 Subsequent editions have come out, but none has been issued as a separate volume for sixty years William Peden makes good the omission in a most attractive yet scholarly manner [11] Jefferson's own London copy, owned by the University of Virginia, contained many additions in the author's hand Peden has incorporated all of these, either in the text or as footnotes He has collated the text with the Paris edition, and with Jefferson's manuscript However, in view of the forthcoming 'definitive edition' of the *Notes* in the Princeton *Papers of Thomas Jefferson*, Peden has wisely refrained from encumbering the text unduly The result is a triumph of unobtrusive annotation

3 *Early Nineteenth Century*

In line with other recent critics, Arvid Schulenberger views James Fenimore Cooper as a forerunner of Hawthorne and James [12] Like James, Cooper explained his views in the prefaces to collected editions of his novels Schulenberger maintains that, while Cooper expressed opinions rather than theories, it is possible to trace a progression in his thought from 'realism' to 'idealism' Schulenberger does not sustain this contention very plausibly But within the limits of a short book he does clarify Cooper's position as an early American novelist

[11] *Notes on the State of Virginia*, by Thomas Jefferson, ed with an Introduction and Notes by William Peden Univ of North Carolina Press and O U P pp xxv+315 $5 40*s*

[12] *Cooper's Theory of Fiction*, by Arvid Schulenberger Univ of Kansas Press pp viii+105 $3

Stanley M Vogel is on firmer ground with his painstaking study,[13] not merely of the effect of German literature and philosophy upon the Transcendentalists (Emerson, Channing, Parker, Margaret Fuller, and others), but also upon New England as a whole from about 1790 to 1845 His book is nicely balanced, and he does not make the mistake of claiming too much 'Transcendentalism', Vogel says, 'was a faith rather than a philosophy, and it went to Germany to find confirmation of that faith ' The Transcendentalists did not care to grapple with Kant, they were content to absorb what they needed from Coleridge or Carlyle, or from the convenient commentaries of German men of letters There are appendixes on the accumulation of German library resources in and around Boston, and on the books of German interest in Emerson's personal library

Howard M Fish, Jr (*AL*), prints *Five Emerson Letters* from Edinburgh libraries whose text was not reproduced in Ralph L Rusk's *Letters of Ralph Waldo Emerson* In *The Diary of Thoreau's 'Gentle Boy'* (*NEQ*), Clayton Hoagland describes the journal, and some letters, of Edmund Quincy Sewall, a boy who was the subject of Thoreau's poem *Sympathy* Sewall boarded with the Thoreaus in Concord, and for one term attended the school conducted by Henry Thoreau and his brother John

There are three books to mention on Nathaniel Hawthorne That by Hyatt H Waggoner[14] is in some respects an orthodox evaluation of Hawthorne as a writer whose works 'initiate and define the great tradition in American fiction'. However, Waggoner is unusual in allotting no less than three of his ten chapters to Hawthorne's short stories, which he feels have been somewhat neglected in favour of the novels Of the stories, he especially singles out *My Kinsman, Major Molineux, Roger Malvin's Burial, Young Goodman Brown,* and *Rappaccini's Daughter* He has no hesitation in asserting that *The Scarlet Letter* is the best of the novels, nor in discussing Hawthorne's serious limitations Rudolph von Abele[15] is more brusque, taking as his text the dictum that 'a work of art is the social act of a solitary man', he relates Hawthorne's life and writings, and concludes that the sterility of the latter—with the exception of *The Scarlet Letter* and one or two of the stories—is accounted for by the emptiness of the former By contrast, Alfred S Reid is less sweeping[16] With some success, he seeks to do for *The Scarlet Letter* what Livingstone Lowes did for *Kubla Khan* namely, to trace some of the raw materials to which Hawthorne applied his creative imagination Reid believes —and, seemingly, proves—that Hawthorne's principal sources were various accounts of the murder of Sir Thomas Overbury a sordid intrigue which fascinated him, and to which he makes two direct references in *The Scarlet Letter* In his careful investigation Reid traces a number of parallels Perhaps he makes a little too much of his discovery, but there is no doubt of its interest Hugh N Maclean analyses the symbols and chapter-structure of the same novel in *Hawthorne's 'Scarlet*

[13] *German Literary Influences on the American Transcendentalists*, by Stanley M Vogel Yale U P and O U P pp xvii+ 196 $4 32*s*

[14] *Hawthorne A Critical Study*, by Hyatt H Waggoner Belknap Press of Harvard U P and O U P pp 268 $4 74 38*s*

[15] *The Death of the Artist A Study of Hawthorne's Disintegration*, by Rudolph von Abele The Hague Martinus Nijhoff, and London Batsford pp 111 17*s* 6*d*

[16] *The Yellow Ruff and 'The Scarlet Letter' A Source of Hawthorne's Novel*, by Alfred S Reid Univ of Florida Press pp vii+150 $3 75

Letter' 'The Dark Problem of This Life' (*AL*) Marvin Laser examines the terms *'Head', 'Heart', and 'Will' in Hawthorne's Psychology* (*NCF*) He suggests that the system of psychology taught by Thomas Cogswell Upham at Bowdoin College, where Hawthorne was an undergraduate, was useful to the novelist 'in contriving his characters and in analysing their states of mind'. Also in *NCF*, C Hobart Edgren offers a fresh interpretation of *Hawthorne's 'The Ambitious Guest'*

Herman Melville continues to be scrutinized and disputed over In a provocative account of the comic elements in Melville, Edward H Rosenberry[17] points out that Melville was once described by R L Stevenson as 'a howling cheese' 'An unnatural cleavage has developed', according to Rosenberry, 'between that merry figure and the tragic titan that has reached mythic proportions in modern criticism' He goes on to claim that, up to the end of 1856 (that is, up to the completion of *The Confidence-Man*) Melville wrote as a comic author, in intention at any rate, and that with the loss of his comic impulse came an almost total loss of creative energy Rosenberry develops his theme with an appropriate dexterity and geniality, and he supplies a useful corrective to Melville scholarship But it leads him to extend his definition of 'comedy' to alarming limits Where 'tragedy' is merely unitary, 'comedy' is complex, seeking to resolve and balance so it swallows up 'tragedy'. One feels that Rosenberry has allowed himself the comic license of exaggeration

An opportunity to test his thesis is provided by Elizabeth S Foster's edition of *The Confidence-Man* (published in 1954)[18] She reproduces the text of the New York edition of 1857, and supplies a long introduction and another hundred pages of explanatory and textual notes In her acute estimate of the novel, she maintains that, while it 'baffled and vexed Melville's contemporaries', it 'is well worth recovering As a philosophical satire on optimism, it is a modern *Candide*' She sees in it Melville's search for some middle view, according to which men are not so much fools, or knaves, as victims Though *The Confidence-Man* will probably still baffle and vex the casual reader, Elizabeth Foster makes out an impressive case for its serious study

Howard C Horsford reveals a devotion almost beyond the call of duty in his meticulous study[19] of notebooks first published, in a limited and unreliable edition, as *Journal Up the Straits* (1935) The editorial apparatus includes some valuable notes, a full index, and five maps, four pages of Melville's crabbed manuscript are reproduced, and there is a near-hieroglyphic section in type facsimile As Horsford remarks in his introduction, the notebooks for the most part reveal a tone of 'joyless skepticism' We can learn from them more of Melville's plans for a sequel to *The Confidence-Man*, and see how his extensive revisions hint that he had a travel-book in view We can, too, find in them sources for his long poem *Clarel* and for some of the shorter poems in *Timoleon* In short, Horsford has performed a valuable editorial labour, though (see review in

[17] *Melville and the Comic Spirit*, by Edward H Rosenberry Harvard U P and O U P pp x+211 $4 32*s*

[18] *The Confidence-Man His Masquerade*, by Herman Melville, ed by Elizabeth S Foster New York Hendricks House, 1954 pp xcv+392 $4

[19] *Journal of a Visit to Europe and the Levant, October 11, 1856–May 6, 1857*, by Herman Melville, ed by Howard C Horsford Princeton U P and O U P pp xiv+299 $5 40*s*

AL [1956], 82–93, by William H. Gilman) it is possible to query a few of his readings, and one or two of his editorial principles

John Parke, in *Seven 'Moby-Dicks'* (*NEQ*), examines the levels of meaning in Melville's masterpiece He concludes that, for Melville, 'the universe is neutral and unpurposeful in terms of human values and purposes' In *NCF* Richard H Fogle discusses *The Unity of Melville's 'The Encantadas'* He maintains that these ten sketches, like the cetology chapters in *Moby Dick*, are 'experiments in total, indivisible knowing, at once imaginative, metaphysical, and scientific' But after stating various views of reality, Melville reaches no final verdict, either of pessimism or of contentment

Since 1955 was the centenary year of the first edition of *Leaves of Grass*, it was natural and appropriate that Whitman received a great deal of attention Pride of place should be given to Gay Wilson Allen's critical biography [20] Probably the foremost living scholar of Whitman, Allen was already known for his most useful *Walt Whitman Handbook* (1946) His new biography confirms and consolidates his reputation Much fresh material on Whitman has become available since H S Canby's study was published in 1943 Allen has assimilated it all Here is an abundance of reliable information on the poet's family, his early career, his burgeoning as a writer, his later publications and revisions, his travels, his friends, and so on It will be long before *The Solitary Singer* is supplanted as *the* record of Whitman's life As a critical study, Allen's book is not quite so satisfying, his judgements, while careful and reasonable, are somewhat unadventurous However, we are in his debt for having given us so much, and we can turn for further guidance to the selection of *Walt Whitman's Poems* of which Allen is co-editor [21] This contains the 1855 preface to *Leaves of Grass*, the whole of *Song of Myself* (in the 1855 version), and a generous sample of Whitman's other verse, including most of his best-regarded pieces. These are interspersed with straightforward explications and comments on Whitman's prosody

Richard Chase attempts a much bolder interpretation of Whitman [22] Except for the first chapter, he is not much concerned with biographical details His picture of Whitman is of a complicated and neurotic person who in the 1850's, by building up for himself a 'rich fantasy life', solved the problem of personal identity in a chaotic America, and produced some great poetry in the process Later, Chase asserts, Whitman's original vision was weakened and blurred, so that he shows singularly little development as a poet, in theme or in technique This is a vivacious book, which may be deemed 'unsound' but which is full of arresting speculation

Part of Chase's work is also to be found in the collection of six essays edited by Milton Hindus,[23] who himself for good measure contributes a preliminary essay His book represents an almost bewildering range of opinion J Middleton Murry sees Whitman as the 'poet of democracy'; Chase would think this too simple an

[20] *The Solitary Singer A Critical Biography of Walt Whitman*, by Gay Wilson Allen New York and London The Macmillan Company pp xii+616 $8 42*s*

[21] *Walt Whitman's Poems Selections with Critical Aids*, ed by Gay Wilson Allen and Charles T Davis New York U P and O U P pp x+280 $3 75

[22] *Walt Whitman Reconsidered*, by Richard Chase New York William Sloane, and London Gollancz pp 191 $3 75 16*s*

[23] *'Leaves of Grass' One Hundred Years After*, ed by Milton Hindus Stanford U P and O U P pp 149 $5 40*s*

approach, and so would Leslie A. Fiedler, who is preoccupied with the manifold roles that Whitman assumed and that others wished upon him William Carlos Williams makes some remarks on free verse and the American language, in relation—more or less—to Whitman, Kenneth Burke dissects Whitman's vocabulary, and David Daiches, in a judicious essay, shows how Whitman generalized from his own experience, cultivating 'an epic pose in order to write lyrics'

Gay Wilson Allen is responsible for yet another book about Whitman, this time as the editor of a series of foreign assessments [24] There are twenty-odd contributions, which where necessary have been rendered into English, with introductory notes on Whitman's reputation in each respective country, a short bibliography, and a general index There is nothing from England, nor from Schyberg's Danish study—presumably because it is available in translation One could have wished for a more complete collection, still, it does offer, if in slightly random form, a conspectus of Whitman's standing abroad So do the modest pieces assembled by Harry R Warfel [25] These are brief essays by German students at Philipps-Universitat, Marburg, written for a seminar on Whitman that Warfel conducted as visiting Fulbright professor Though as a whole they are uneven and sometimes elementary, several of the pieces are freshly intelligent Four are in German, the remainder in English

Leadie M Clark[26] surveys Whitman's many and various comments (in prose as well as poetry) on the ordinary man—and also upon Indians, immigrant Irish, Negroes, women, and other 'underprivileged' groups Her book has some value as a sort of handy reference-work on this topic It must though be used with caution, since some of Whitman's hasty *dicta* as a journalist ought not to be taken as seriously as his later, more deliberate opinions For a much more ambitious and more widely useful work of reference, the reader will wish to consult Edwin Harold Eby's admirable *Concordance*,[27] which was brought to completion with the publication of the fifth 'fascicle' in 1954 It is a concordance of *Leaves of Grass* (including the 'rejected poems') and, in a separate section, of much of Whitman's prose The whole line of verse containing the word in question is quoted, and for prose a phrase or clause References are to the ten-volume *Complete Writings* (1902), but Eby has also employed a general descriptive system which means that an entry can be traced in any standard edition of *Leaves of Grass* A most praiseworthy enterprise

Another labour of love on Whitman has been accomplished by Fredson Bowers[28] in his diligent collation of the intermediate stages between the second and third editions of *Leaves of Grass* It is based on the hitherto unpublished manuscripts of Whitman himself, together with some additional manuscript material In printing the final text of the third (1860) edition,

[24] *Walt Whitman Abroad Critical Essays from Germany, France, Scandinavia, Russia, Italy, Spain and Latin America, Israel, Japan, and India*, ed by Gay Wilson Allen Syracuse U P pp xii+290 $5

[25] *Studies in Walt Whitman's 'Leaves of Grass'*, ed by Harry R Warfel Gainesville, Florida Scholars' Facsimiles and Reprints, 1954 pp 116 $4

[26] *Walt Whitman's Conception of the American Common Man*, by Leadie M Clark New York Philosophical Library pp xiv+178 $3 75

[27] *A Concordance of Walt Whitman's 'Leaves of Grass' and Selected Prose Writings*, by Edwin Harold Eby Univ of Washington Press, 1949–54 pp xiii+964 5 parts, each $4 50 (paper)

[28] *Whitman's Manuscripts 'Leaves of Grass' (1860), A Parallel Text*, ed by Fredson Bowers Chicago U P and C U P pp lxxiv+264 $12 50 94*s*

Bowers indicates where still further changes were made. He examines different types of paper, ink, and pencil to explain, or at any rate conjecture, the successive stages in revision. The reader is thus enabled to follow in minute detail an important stage in the development of Whitman's ever-sprouting book

In *Thoreau and Whitman The Record of a Pilgrimage* (*NEQ*), Andrew Schiller fills out a little the well-known story of Thoreau's visit to Whitman in 1856, and his subsequent, somewhat delayed reaction Thoreau's response was 'a selective enthusiasm for the poetry and an uncomfortable respect for the man' Whitman, later in life, accused Thoreau of an 'aggravated case of superciliousness' Another reaction is described by Herbert Bergman in *Ezra Pound and Walt Whitman* (*AL*) He discusses some estimates of Whitman's influence upon Pound, and prints a short, unpublished, and warmly appreciative essay by Pound on Whitman, written in 1909 And, finally, in *Whitman Pursued* (*AL*), Emory Holloway presents some evidence of heterosexual activities by the Good Gray Poet

The American Civil War is the subject of a new edition of *Miss Ravenel's Conversion*[29] It is pleasing to have this novel back in print Haight, who in 1939 edited a revised version of the book, has here gone back to the original text of the 1867 edition, merely correcting a number of typographical errors and providing an introduction Possibly he claims too much for *Miss Ravenel's Conversion*, but, if not a great work, it is an honest and thoughtful novel, by an articulate New Englander The other side of the war is depicted in the fourth volume of a splendidly thorough edition of the letters of the Charleston writer William Gilmore Simms,[30] It contains 359 letters, drawn from no less than thirty-five different collections A fluent correspondent and an ardent Southerner, Simms expresses himself vigorously on the impending crisis, on the tribulations of wartime (at the close of which he lost his library of 10,000 volumes), and on the difficulties of resuming his literary career when the war is over. These well-edited letters present a remarkable picture of the Southern literary scene The fifth and final volume will contain a full index, though each volume has its own

The periodical *Civil War History* devotes a whole issue to the theatre, North and South In addition to discussing plays performed during the war, and plays performed afterwards about the war, it has an article by William Reardon and John Foxen on *The Propaganda Play* which deals mainly with such didactic dramas of the New Deal era as *One-Third of a Nation*

4 *Later Nineteenth Century*

Apart from the concentration on Whitman, 1955 was also notable for work on Emily Dickinson At last, nearly seventy years after her death, the sad litigious record is becoming clear A major step in this direction has been taken by Thomas H Johnson, with his long-awaited, sorely needed, finely edited collection of Emily Dickinson's poems[31] Johnson

[29] *Miss Ravenel's Conversion from Secession to Loyalty*, by John William De Forest, ed by Gordon S Haight New York Rinehart Editions pp xx+485 $1.45 (paper)

[30] *The Letters of William Gilmore Simms*, collected and ed by Mary C Simms Oliphant, Alfred Taylor Odell, T C Duncan Eaves Vol IV, *1858–1866* Univ of South Carolina Press pp xxvi+643 $8 50 ($31 25 the set of 5 vols)

[31] *The Poems of Emily Dickinson (Including Variant Readings Critically Compared With All Known Manuscripts)*, ed by Thomas H Johnson Belknap Press of Harvard

has gathered together 1,775 poems, or fragments, including forty-one not previously printed in any version, garbled or otherwise The text is based on a careful comparison of all known manuscripts, and variations are noted Johnson has numbered the poems, and has grouped them as far as possible in chronological order He has established this order in part by a scrutiny of Emily's handwriting, which (as some facsimile reproductions show) changed considerably over the years Rescued from the former muddle of some previous editing of her verse, we can see—with relief—that not many of her poems have in fact suffered grievously through such 'improvements' Indeed, in a few cases the reader will prefer the old, dubious reading to the emendation, and he may not always feel comfortable with Emily Dickinson's brand of punctuation These are matters for future editors to think about, the vital thing was to establish an authentic canon, and this Johnson has done with a noble precision His handsomely printed edition contains eleven appendixes, including brief biographies of the poet's correspondents

Not content with this masterly edition, Johnson has also published an excellent critical biography of Emily Dickinson,[32] which is a most satisfactory blend of information and interpretation Here, as far as will ever be feasible, we see Emily plain, set against the background of her family and their Connecticut Valley environment, free from the sickly cultishness that has surrounded her name That she was in love with Charles Wadsworth and Judge Otis Lord appears in Johnson's account as a wholesome fact he does not waste space in refuting the notion that she was also in love with Kate Anthon. But that she *was* in love with Judge Lord, and he seemingly with her, is corroborated in a carefully edited little volume by Millicent Todd Bingham [33] This reproduces the first drafts of letters written (though not necessarily sent) to Lord by Emily during 1882–4 He was then a widower, eighteen years her senior, and may have come near to marrying her He died in 1884

Another valuable supplement to the work of Johnson is made available in scholarly form by Millicent Todd Bingham, in the shape of a large collection of Dickinson family letters [34] The publication of these has been delayed for five years by copyright problems They amplify in absorbing detail the broad outline sketched by Johnson Their editor has unearthed a mass of biographical information on the Dickinson circle of friends and acquaintances They shed much new light on the hectoring father and the sensitive children—so different from many of their neighbours, and so aware of their differences The affinity between Emily and her brother Austin is particularly striking

To turn to Mark Twain is to enter another atmosphere, though—as some of the critics in Arthur L Scott's compendium[35] stress—Twain likewise has his complexities Scott presents what he calls 'the cream of Mark Twain criticism' from 1867 to 1951 Some of the cream consists of separate articles,

U P and O U P 3 vols pp lxviii+1,266 $25 £10

[32] *Emily Dickinson An Interpretive Biography*, by Thomas H Johnson Belknap Press of Harvard U P and O U P pp viii+276. $4 50 36*s*

[33] *Emily Dickinson—A Revelation*, by Millicent Todd Bingham New York Harper, 1954 pp 109 $3

[34] *Emily Dickinson's Home Letters of Edward Dickinson and His Family*, ed by Millicent Todd Bingham New York Harper pp 600 $6 50

[35] *Mark Twain Selected Criticism*, ed and with an Introduction by Arthur L Scott Southern Methodist U P pp xii+289 $5

some of chapters taken from longer studies—by Van Wyck Brooks, Lewis Mumford, V L. Parrington, Constance Rourke, and others They constitute a useful and authoritative body of opinion It is a pity, however, that Scott could not incorporate the recent commentaries on *Huckleberry Finn* by T S Eliot and Leo Marx, and one would like to have seen some recent reassessment of *Pudd'nhead Wilson*

In *Chicago Review* Dennis S R Welland (*Mark Twain the Great Victorian*) suggests that while Twain is an 'innocent American', he has various features in common with the 'sophisticated European' such as Thackeray or Tennyson, whose unevenness is akin to his own *The Journal of The 'Quaker City' Captain*, by Charles E Shain (*NEQ*), deals with the unpublished log of Captain Duncan, commander of 'the ship that took Mark Twain and the other innocents abroad in 1867 on the first tourist cruise in American history' Fred W Lorch, in *Mark Twain's Lecture Tour of 1868–1869 'The American Vandal Abroad'* (*AL*), gives an entertaining account of Twain's first extended lecture-season, a profitable venture for which he prepared a lecture based on his *Quaker City* excursion In *Civil War History* John Gerber presents a well-edited version of Twain's brief, inglorious military narrative, *The Private History of a Campaign that Failed* Gerber regards this as a literary rather than an historical document—a comic narrative in the vein of *Huckleberry Finn* Portions of that novel were published in periodical form Arthur L Scott, in *The 'Century Magazine' Edits 'Huckleberry Finn', 1884–1885* (*AL*), examines deletions made by Twain and by the editor, and concludes that some were obviously designed to avoid offending the taste of a magazine audience. Frank Baldanza (*AL*) has some sensible remarks on *The Structure of 'Huckleberry Finn'* He believes that recent comment on the novel has been too portentous, overlooking the fact that Twain was an inspired improviser with confused standards, whose working method was decidedly erratic The rhythms and patterns that Twain establishes are unconscious, and it is misleading to attribute an elaborate symbolism to him

In a useful article on *The New England Hierarchy* (*NEQ*) Leonard Lutwack examines the collective reputation in the late nineteenth century of Emerson, Hawthorne, Longfellow, Lowell, Whittier, and Holmes Their work was revered as the 'great, harmonious literature' that a polyglot, distracted America yearned for Hence, 'in the presence of the hierarchy, criticism was abdicated in favor of myth-making'

In *RES* Miriam Allott (*James Russell Lowell A Link Between Tennyson and Henry James*) explains how Lowell furnished the plot for James's *The Romance of Certain Old Clothes* and for Tennyson's poem *The Ring*

It was unlucky for Robert C Le Clair that he was anticipated by the appearance in 1953 of the first volume of Leon Edel's biography of Henry James—a volume covering exactly the same period as his own [36] Edel's fine work will no doubt take rank as the definitive biography But Le Clair's will, one hopes, not be overlooked Less attractively written, it is nevertheless a thorough study of the developing consciousness of the novelist, drawing freely upon James's autobiographical writings Description and interpretation are capably mingled, and there is a considerable though not excessive ground-bass of footnotes

In *James's Portrait of the Southerner*

[36] *Young Henry James 1843–1870*, by Robert C Le Clair New York Bookman Associates pp 469 $6 50

(*AL*) Charles L Anderson analyses the character of Basil Ransom in *The Bostonians* He agrees with James's own criticism that the novel is 'too diffuse and insistent—far too describing and explaining and expatiating' Anderson thinks this is because James grew too interested in defining the nature of conservatism, and because he lacked first-hand knowledge of the South

Max F Schultz, in *The Bellegardes' Feud With Christopher Newman* (*AL*), demonstrates how, in revising the 1877 text of *The American* for the New York edition (1907), James 'felt his task to be principally one of adding to the Bellegardes' dislike for Newman', so as to render more plausible the 'queer falsity' of their conduct

Jean Kimball, in *The Abyss and The Wings of the Dove the Image as a Revelation* (*NCF*), contends that—contrary to the usual view—the 'central situation' in James's novel 'is not Milly's passive suffering in a world of uncomprehended evil, but rather her desperate effort, which is never passive, to "achieve, however briefly and brokenly, the sense of having lived," and even further to live beyond death' She suggests a parallel between Milly Theale's illness and James's own obscure ailment

Francis Fergusson disagrees with F R Leavis and others who feel that the later James lost his way In *'The Golden Bowl' Revisited* (*Sewanee Review*) Fergusson pays tribute to the elaborate theory of Quentin Anderson, according to which James's last three major novels 'comprise a spiritual cosmology which may be called the divine novel'. In *The Golden Bowl* 'James was attempting the imaginative feat of suggesting a meaning in western history and in human life without benefit of an objectified system of philosophy or religion' Dealing with the same novel in the same periodical, Caroline Gordon (*Mr Verver, Our National Hero*) also makes high claims for *The Golden Bowl*, though she does not accept the interpretations of Anderson, Matthiessen, Blackmur, and others In her opinion, James here achieves what he has hitherto been groping after a presentation of 'the archetypal patterns of Christianity' *Caritas* is the message of the book, and Maggie Verver and her father stand as fully realized heroine and hero *Tot homines*

Henry Adams and the Adams family are the subject of two books and an interesting article The last-mentioned, *Adams Goes to School*, by R P Blackmur (*Kenyon Review*), is a subtle and sympathetic discussion of Henry Adams's intellectual growth It appears to be an excerpt from a forthcoming book One hopes so, for Blackmur is a first-rate critic, and though Elizabeth Stevenson is a capable biographer, her study of Adams[37] does not say the last word on that elusive figure It is, however, the best general account of Adams that has been published so far The author has had the advantage of working on the unpublished Adams papers at Harvard Hers is a reliable narrative biography, with competent summaries of Adams's writings She does not attempt any very ambitious interpretation, beyond asserting that Adams's life was shattered past repair when his wife committed suicide

In his lucid biography of Adams's younger brother Brooks Adams, Arthur F Beringause[38] has also benefited from the great mass of Adams papers, which will be quarried for

[37] *Henry Adams A Biography*, by Elizabeth Stevenson New York and London The Macmillan Company pp xv+425 $6 42*s*

[38] *Brooks Adams A Biography*, by Arthur F Beringause New York Knopf pp xiii+414 $6

many years to come. Brooks is a minor figure in comparison with Henry, and Beringause has on the whole resisted the temptation to exaggerate the intrinsic importance of Brooks's work For those whose main concern is Henry, the chief value of this book lies in its close examination of the two brothers in relation to one another 'Brooks is my double', Henry declared in 1908, and Beringause provides fresh evidence of the ways in which the older man absorbed the theories of the younger—particularly those theories stated in *The Law of Civilization and Decay*

While not of any great significance, the thirteen letters of Stephen Crane edited by Edwin H Cady[39] do add something to our understanding of that juvenile near-genius Seven of the letters are addressed to a young woman whom Crane met in 1895, and whom he seems to have been prepared to take seriously—if she had let him There are four new photographs of Crane, and appendixes on Crane's connexions with Syracuse

In *Stephen Crane and the American Background of 'Maggie'* (*AQ*), Marcus Cunliffe maintains that *Maggie* probably owes more to American reformist literature of the time than to Zola's *L'Assommoir* Robert Wooster Stallman shows how in *Stephen Crane's Revision of 'Maggie A Girl of the Streets'* (*AL*) the text of the second American edition (1896) was improved by various minor excisions One omission, seven sentences in length, should, however, be restored to subsequent editions

Donald Pizer (*NCF*) takes *Another Look at 'The Octopus'* and defends Frank Norris's novel of that name against the charge that it is marred by 'grave philosophical inconsistencies'. This charge, Pizer claims, rests on the mistaken belief that the main character, Presley, is merely a spokesman for Norris

Sumner Ives (*AL*) contends that America is richer in dialects than G P. Krapp and others have realized. He gives examples, among negroes and among whites, of *Dialect Differentiation in the Stories of Joel Chandler Harris*

5 *Twentieth Century*

Coming now to writers whose work lies mainly within the twentieth century, we may start with Gordon Mills on *Jack London's Quest for Salvation* (*AQ*), an outline of the opposing concepts of 'individualism' and 'socialism' in London's fiction In *Jack London on the Oakland Waterfront* (*AL*) Sam S Baskett points out the unreliability of *John Barleycorn* as an autobiographical record of London's adolescent years

Ellen Glasgow's posthumous autobiography[40] was apparently written between 1936 and 1943 It is a moving personal record of one who—as Thomas H Johnson notes—resembled Emily Dickinson in that she never married, but had two unhappy love-affairs which had a profound influence upon her work Otherwise, of course, Ellen Glasgow was more fortunate, at least in securing recognition during her lifetime *The Woman Within* reveals how hard and lonely was her struggle, in the bosom (if that is the word) of an unsympathetic family and as a would-be writer in the South, 'where conversation, not literature, is the serious pursuit of all classes'. Deafness was an added trial. Yet, as she testifies, she was not without

[39] *Stephen Crane's Love Letters to Nellie Crouse*, ed by Edwin H Cady and Lester G Wells Syracuse U P, 1954 pp xi+87 $2 50

[40] *The Woman Within*, by Ellen Glasgow. New York Harcourt, Brace, 1954, and London Eyre & Spottiswoode pp xii+307 $5. 21*s*.

friends One of the earliest, and most valued, friendships was with her fellow-Virginian James Branch Cabell, who has also spoken of it in his volume of whimsical reminiscences [41] Cabell speaks, too, of a number of contemporary authors, including Carl Van Vechten and Sinclair Lewis, as they have appeared to him

Where does Dreiser stand? Alfred Kazin and Charles Shapiro present many different answers in their excellent collection,[42] to which Kazin has supplied a perceptive introduction, in which he argues that Dreiser belongs to a 'very old, a very difficult, a very lonely American tradition' Dreiser is disliked by most critics in our present 'prig's paradise', yet 'what counts most with a writer is that his reach should be felt as well as his grasp, that words should be his means, not his ends' The survey has four parts a few reminiscences, a batch of early newspaper reviews (1900–7), a longer section on the 'critical battle' (which includes Mencken's eloquent defence and a powerful attack by Lionel Trilling), and a final group of studies which are more judicial in tone Among these are chapters from the book-length studies by Robert H Elias and F O Matthiessen, and a very good essay by Charles C Walcutt on Dreiser's naturalism There is a full bibliography

Another compendious survey (though written by one man) is Frederick J Hoffman's record of the period 1918–32 in American life and literature [43] His method is to take up a theme, examine it in broad terms, and then illustrate it in more detail through discussion of a chosen 'text'. Thus, the period as a whole is exemplified by Pound's *Hugh Selwyn Mauberley* (which is printed as an appendix), 'The War and the Postwar Temper' by Hemingway's *The Sun Also Rises* (known in Britain as *Fiesta*), 'The Very Young' by Scott Fitzgerald's *The Great Gatsby*, 'Forms of Traditionalism' through the work of Willa Cather, 'Forms of Experiment and Improvization' by Hart Crane's *The Bridge*, 'Science and the "Precious Object"' by *The Waste Land*, and 'Critiques of the Middle Class' by Sinclair Lewis's *Babbitt* Hoffman also provides brief biographies, a chronology, and a good bibliography Some reviewers have complained that his method, while it looks neat, is too fragmentary we see the trees but are not always aware of the wood, or sense it as too dark a wood Certainly Hoffman is a cautious chronicler, yet his dossier is fascinating

Two articles in *AL* deal with Willa Cather In *The Genesis of 'Death Comes for the Archbishop'* Edward A Bloom and Lillian D Bloom uncover some of the sources, in print and in personal experience, of her novel (for instance, of her long interest in the 'Enchanted Mesa' of the Ácoma Indians) In *Willa Cather's Uncollected Short Stories* Curtis Bradford lists twenty-three that she did not care to reprint as her 'canonical works'. Most of them were early pieces She came to regret nearly all her early writing, and 'perhaps even to conceal [it] in so far as she could'

Sheldon Grebstein describes *The Education of a Rebel Sinclair Lewis at Yale* (*NEQ*) as the progress of a restless, lonely, ambitious youngster In *AL* Lyon N. Richardson's *'Arrowsmith'. Genesis, Development, Ver-*

[41] *As I Remember It Some Epilogues in Recollection*, by James Branch Cabell New York McBride pp ix+243 $3 75

[42] *The Stature of Theodore Dreiser A Critical Survey of the Man and His Work*, ed by Alfred Kazin and Charles Shapiro Indiana U P pp viii+303 $5

[43] *The Twenties American Writing in the Postwar Decade*, by Frederick J Hoffman New York. Viking pp xiv+466. $6.

sions is mainly a comparison of the novel with the shorter version (which he thinks superior) produced by Lewis for serial publication in the *Designer*

Painted Lace is the fifth volume in the Yale edition of the unpublished writings of Gertrude Stein [44] In more ways than one these are occasional pieces. They are grouped as 'Events', 'Voice Lessons and Calligraphy', 'Eye Lessons', 'Landscapes and Geography', and 'Portraits and Figures' They vary in length from a few words to sixty pages (in the case of *Natural Phenomena*)

Edward Lueders's book[45] is a study of a novelist and critic who both defined and typified the 1920's—and who incidentally was a close friend of Gertrude Stein Lueders seeks to suggest something of the social history of the decade, and to offer a critical introduction to Van Vechten's work from *Music After the Great War* (1915) to *Sacred and Profane Memories* (1932) There is interesting material on music, Harlem, Mabel Dodge Luhan, and other features of the era, and there are some good photographs, by and of Van Vechten

In a witty and affectionate introduction to *The Vintage Mencken*,[46] which is one of the excellent examples of recent 'paper-back' publishing in the United States, Alistair Cooke explains that he has arranged its contents so as 'to give to the new Mencken reader a running account of his life as he wrote and lived it' There are no extracts from the *American Language*, but room has been found for many of Mencken's deservedly famous pieces, such as *The National Letters*

As Louis D Rubin makes clear, fiction and autobiography are inseparable in the novels of Thomas Wolfe [47] Are these, then, spoiled by the naive egotism of their author? Rubin thinks not, though he concedes that only in Wolfe's first novel, *Look Homeward, Angel*, is its autobiographical substance kept adequately under control He argues that Wolfe himself must be considered as the main 'protagonist', and if possible accepted as such If this thesis is open to objection, Rubin's discussion of Wolfe's ideas on time, immortality, and America supplies a more orthodox commentary

Among the work on American poetry are two articles from *AL* on Hart Crane In *'Three Songs' of Hart Crane's 'The Bridge'* John R. Willingham suggests that these, which form Part V of the poem, 'far from marring the structure of *The Bridge*, . provide a bridge between the apparently disparate American worlds of Pocahontas and of Dickinson, Duncan, and Hart Crane' Laurence Dembo's *The Unfractioned Idiom of Hart Crane's 'Bridge'* is a qualified defence of the poem as an attempt to define and reconcile 'the potentially disillusioning aspects of American life'

The poems of the late Wallace Stevens have been collected in a handsome edition[48] that brings together—except for a few individual poems—all the work previously printed in *Harmonium, Ideas of Order, The Man With the Blue Guitar, Parts of a World, Transport to Summer,* and *The Auroras of Autumn* A seventh section, 'The Rock', consists of twenty-

[44] *Painted Lace and Other Pieces [1914–1937]*, by Gertrude Stein, with an Introduction by Daniel-Henry Kahnweiler Yale U P and O U P pp xviii+317 $5 40*s*

[45] *Carl Van Vechten and the Twenties*, by Edward Lueders Univ of New Mexico Press pp 150 $4 50

[46] *The Vintage Mencken*, by H L Mencken, gathered by Alistair Cooke New York Vintage Books pp xiv+240 $0 95 (paper)

[47] *Thomas Wolfe The Weather of His Youth*, by Louis D Rubin, Jr Louisiana State U P pp xiii+183 $3 50

[48] *Collected Poems of Wallace Stevens* New York Knopf, 1954, and London Faber pp xvi+539 $7 50 42*s*

five later poems that had hitherto been published in periodicals In *The Substance that Prevails* (*Kenyon Review*) R P Blackmur views Stevens as one who apprehends rather than comprehends, 'a nominalist longing to find his names realities' Elder Olson, discussing *The Poetry of Wallace Stevens* in *College English*, also maintains that though Stevens is interested in ideas he is not a philosophical poet but 'primarily a poet of images'.

In *Robert Frost and the Interrupted Dialogue* (*AL*) Harold H Watts holds that while Frost writes magnificently of man-and-nature, he is lacking in 'societal piety' and therefore unsatisfactory and evasive when his 'dialogue' treats of man-and-society

Henry W Wells's book[49] is a clear though uninspired account of one of America's most remarkable living poets, who began his literary career as one of the Fugitives in Nashville, and who like W C Williams continued to write verse with prodigal ease despite the claims of a busy medical practice There is a bibliography of Moore's writings, including 141 'medical and psychological' items, and many of his poems are quoted in full in the text

Louise Bogan is an accomplished poet her reviews and articles show that she is also an able critic[50] Most of them are concerned with poetry, and about half deal with American writing Though the reviews suffer a little from their brevity, they do not seem dated or perfunctory They include some accurate observations on Emily Dickinson, Ezra Pound, Marianne Moore, and Robinson Jeffers.

In an attractive little volume[51] John Crowe Ransome has assembled forty-four of his poems and eight critical essays With the exception of one on *Humanism at Chicago*, the latter involve American literature only indirectly their themes include Hardy's verse, Shakespeare's language, and Kant's conception of poetry

Randall Jarrell's *Poetry and the Age*[52] is a welcome reprint of essays first published in book form in 1953 He is a high-spirited critic, with a nimble and generous mind, who has some particularly good comments on Frost, Ransom, Whitman, Marianne Moore, Robert Lowell, and W C Williams (see Chapter I) The twenty-eight review-essays by Alfred Kazin[53] reach an even higher level of eloquent insight About half his book is devoted to American authors, among whom are Thoreau, Melville, William and Henry James, Sherwood Anderson, E E Cummings, and William Faulkner

The thirteen essays in *An End to Innocence*[54] provide a brilliantly idiosyncratic glimpse of contemporary American intellectual life There is a study of Whitman (also printed in Milton Hindus's symposium), a piece on 'the Negro and the homosexual [as] stock literary themes' in American writing, and one on Scott Fitzgerald, others discuss *Dead-End Werther the Bum as American Cul-*

[49] *Poet and Psychiatrist Merrill Moore, M D , A Critical Portrait with an Appraisal of Two Hundred of His Poems*, by Henry W Wells New York Twayne pp 325 $5

[50] *Selected Criticism Poetry and Prose*, by Louise Bogan New York Noonday Press pp 404 $5

[51] *Poems and Essays Selected, Edited and Arranged by the Author*, John Crowe Ransom New York Vintage Books pp vi+185 $0 95 (paper)

[52] *Poetry and the Age*, by Randall Jarrell New York Vintage Books pp viii+246 $0 95 (paper) London Faber pp 240 18*s*

[53] *The Inmost Leaf A Selection of Essays*, by Alfred Kazin New York Harcourt, Brace pp viii+273 $4 75

[54] *An End to Innocence Essays on Culture and Politics*, by Leslie A Fiedler Boston Beacon Press pp x+214 $3 50 (cloth), $1 25 (paper)

ture Hero and *Adolescence and Maturity in the American Novel*

The Human Prospect is a selection of essays, chapters, and reviews by Lewis Mumford,[55] which reveal the astonishing richness and variety of the author's interests A section entitled 'Glimpses of the Man' contains autobiographical documents, Mumford's important contributions to architecture and social planning are given due place; and literature is represented by excerpts from *The Golden Day* and Mumford's study of *Herman Melville*

Modern American novelists have not been neglected In *AL* James B Colvert (*Ernest Hemingway's Morality in Action*) denies that Hemingway is indifferent to moral problems Ursula Brumm argues, in *Wilderness and Civilization A Note on William Faulkner* (*Partisan Review*), that Faulkner is opposed to 'civilization' in all its attributes, and that a similar hostility can be detected in much of American literature, as far back as Cooper In *The Complex World of James Gould Cozzens* (*AL*) Louis O Coxe presents Cozzens as an undervalued author who has 'written at least three novels, perhaps four, to rank with the best of our time'

Two books examine or exhibit the French reaction to recent American fiction[56] Thelma M Smith and Ward L Miner are mainly concerned with the period since 1944, and with the popularity and critical standing of five novelists in particular Faulkner, Hemingway, Erskine Caldwell, Steinbeck, and Dos Passos Though they do not pretend to have exhausted the topic, they have amassed a quantity of information, some of which is summarized in a useful check-list Michel Mohrt is a young critic and novelist who has visited the United States He is especially impressed by the work of Robert Penn Warren, but manages to deal freshly and knowledgeably with a large number of other figures

And last of all, Malcolm Cowley, in a medley of sociology, professional gossip, and shrewd literary criticism,[57] ranges over the present-day situation of American authors (principally novelists) their incomes and habits, their means of publication, occupational hazards, favourite themes, and so on He concludes that recent American writing has been technically admirable but otherwise rather dapper and timid 'only the critics have seemed to know where they were going'.

[55] *The Human Prospect*, by Lewis Mumford, ed by Harry T Moore and Karl W Deutsch Boston Beacon Press, and London. Secker & Warburg, 1956 pp xiii+319 $1 45 (paper) 21*s*

[56] *Transatlantic Migration The Contemporary American Novel in France*, by Thelma M Smith and Ward L Miner Duke U P and C U P pp ix+264 $4 50 34*s*

Le Nouveau Roman Americain, by Michel Mohrt Paris Gallimard pp 266 Fr 900

[57] *The Literary Situation*, by Malcolm Cowley New York Viking, 1954, and London Deutsch pp xi+259 $3 75 18*s*.

INDEX I. AUTHORS

Abbott, C C , 194
Abele, R v , 230
Abercrombie, D , 41
Adams, R M , 150, 159
Addison, W , 196
Aden, J M , 123, 169
Adorita, Sister M , 210
Adrian, A A , 213
Africa, C , 42
Albert, E , 10
Aldus, P A , 107
Alexander, P , 99, 116
Allen, A B , 188
Allen, E G , 110
Allen, G O , 117, 221
Allen, G W , 232, 233
Allen, W , 17, 183, 199
Allott, K , 217
Allott, M , 236
Allt, P , 224
Alvarez, A , 120
Amphlett, H , 104
Anderson, C L , 237
Ankers, L B , 48
Applegate, J , 145
Armens, S M , 177
Armstrong, W A , 128, 129
Arngart, O , 65
Arnold, A , 113
Arrowsmith, W , 17
Arthos, J , 111
Ashe, D J , 128
Atkins, J , 220
Atkins, S D , 165
Atwood, E B , 30
Auden, W H , 224
Austin, W B , 123
Avis, W S , 30, 54
Axelrad, A J , 127
Ayer, A J , 40

Babler, O F , 110
Bache, W B , 116, 123
Bacon, W A , 117
Baillie, J , 21
Baird, R C , 110
Baker, D C , 86
Baker, J E , 213
Baldanza, F , 236
Baldini, G , 170
Baldwin, R , 79
Baldwin, T W , 122, 147
Bannister, W , 225
Barber, C L , 16
Bar-Hillel, Y , 41
Barke, J , 179
Barlow, F , 57
Barnouw, A J , 84
Barritt, C W , 44
Bartlett, P , 215
Base, R D , 207
Baskett, S S , 238
Bates, R , 120
Baughan, D E , 108
Baum, S V , 53
Bawcutt, N W , 131
Baxter, J K , 18
Baxter, S L , 49
Beal, A , 15
Becker, D W , 146
Becker, H , 32
Behre, F , 50
Beichner, P E , 70
Bell, H I , 10
Benjamin, E B , 212
Bennett, J A W , 155
Bennett, P E , 114, 130
Bennett, W H , 44
Beresford, R , 215
Berger, M D , 31, 52
Bergman, H , 234
Bergstrom, F , 46
Beringause, A F , 237
Berkley, D S , 54, 118, 171
Berthold, D , 30
Bessborough, Earl of, 183
Bethurum, D , 86
Bevington, M M , 217
Beyer, W W , 206
Bickersteth, G L , 25
Bigelow, G E , 54
Bingham, M T , 235
Birdwhistell, R L , 41
Biswanger, R A , 53, 123, 172
Black, M W , 99
Blackmur, R P , 237
Blanchard, R A , 157, 181
Blanck, J , 227
Bland, D S , 207
Blayney, G H , 130, 136
Bliss, A J , 45, 71, 97
Bloom, E A , 239
Bloom, L D , 239
Bloomfield, L , 29
Bloomfield, M W , 82
Blumentyal, W H , 19
Blunden, E , 162
Boas, F S , 144
Boas, G , 121
Boas, L , 209
Boege, F W , 215
Bogan, L , 241
Bogard, T , 112, 127
Bolinger, D L , 31
Bond, W H , 145
Bonjour, A , 60
Booth, A D , 42
Borcherdt, H H , 123
Borinski, A L , 107, 109
Borinski, L , 114
Bourne, G , 204
Bowers, F , 102, 103, 116, 127, 233
Bowers, R H , 72, 73, 140
Bowra, C M , 14, 23
Box, K , 49
Boyce, B , 151
Boyle, R J , 115
Bradbrook, M C , 109, 120, 124
Bradford, C , 239
Bradley, D , 178
Brady, F , 186
Brandon-Thomas, J , 201
Bredvold, L I , 149, 203
Brewer, D S , 74, 78, 97, 147
Breyer, B R , 115
Briley, J , 121
Brinkley, R F , 149, 203
Brook, G L , 58
Brooks, C , 16
Brown, A , 103, 131
Brown, I , 101
Brown, J R , 99, 109
Brown, P W F , 52
Browning, I R , 114
Brumm, U , 242
Brunner, K , 31, 46
Buckler, W E , 214
Bull, W E , 42
Bullough, G , 20
Burchfield, R W , 61
Burke, J , 186
Burrow, T , 34
Burrows, L , 178
Bush, D , 162
Butler, A Z , 163
Butler, L , 20
Butt, J , 212
Butterfield, H , 92

Cabaniss, A , 60
Cady, E H , 238
Cairncross, A S , 104, 113
Cameron, K , 10
Campbell, H M , 224
Campbell, J J , 63
Campbell, W S , 227
Cannon, G , 180, 187
Cantineau, J , 38
Cantrell, P L , 103
Caraman, P , 141

Carnoy, A , 35
Carpenter, N C , 157
Carre, M H , 150
Carrère, F , 129
Carrington, C , 194, 222
Cassirer, E , 88
Cassidy, F G , 54
Casson, L F , 53
Cawley, A C , 75
Cecil, Lord David, 203
Chadwick, H M , 58
Chaikin, M , 218
Chang, H C , 142
Chapin, C F , 188
Chapman, R L , 66
Chapman, R W , 195
Charleston, B W , 32, 50
Charlton, H B , 126
Chase, R , 232
Chase, S , 40
Chatman, S , 51
Cherry, C , 40
Chester, A G , 97
Chinol, E , 21
Christensen, F , 51
Church, R , 19
Clark, C , 68, 86
Clark, D L , 164
Clark, L M , 233
Clark, W S , 10
Clemen, W , 108, 125
Clements, R J , 97, 139
Cleveland, E , 164
Clifford, J L , 185, 187
Coatman, J , 49
Coghill, N , 110
Cohen, J M , 26
Colie, R L , 146
Collins, V H , 47
Colvert, J B , 242
Conley, J , 37
Connolly, T E , 213
Cooke, A , 240
Cope, J I , 134
Copley, J , 117
Cowley, M , 242
Cox, C B , 21
Coxe, L O , 242
Craig, H , 14, 75
Crane, M , 111
Crane, W S , 140
Crawford, T , 202
Crinò, A , 140
Crittenden, W M , 184
Crompton, M , 198
Cross, G , 133
Cross, J E , 64
Crow, J , 21
Crowell, T L , 53
Crowley, A F , 48
Cullifford, S G , 114
Cummings, G C , 55
Cunliffe, M , 238
Cunningham, D , 131
Cunningham, D G , 118
Curry, J V , 125
Curry, W C , 147
Cutlerm, J L , 72
Cutts, J P , 135, 136

D'Agostino, N , 21
Danielsson, B , 46
Danks, K B , 104, 111, 113, 116
Dannenfeld, T , 98
Darbyshire, H , 161
Dauzat, A , 30
Davenport, A , 153, 155
David, R , 122
Davidson, D , 174
Davie, D , 224
Davies, C , 165
Davies, R B , 154
Davies, R T , 75, 221
Davis, H , 181
Davison, D , 156
Day, R A , 187
Dean, L F , 114
Dean-Smith, M , 112
de Beer, E S , 166
Dembo, L , 240
DeMott, B , 39
Denonian, J J , 158
Dent, R W , 133
Dettering, R , 39
Deutsch, K W , 242
DeVane, W C , 192
Devlin, C , 122
Dickenmann, E , 30
Dickinson, W C , 94
Dieth, E , 52
Dobbek, W , 123
Dobrée, B , 223
Dobrinski, J , 221
Dobson, E J , 45
Dobrzycka, I , 198
Dodd, S C , 42
Dodson, S C , 146
Donaldson, G , 139
Donner, M , 84
Donovan, J , 83
Dorius, R J , 101
Dorsch, T S , 100, 118
Dostert, L E , 42
Dougherty, C T , 217
Dowling, H M , 208
Downs, H , 17
Draper, J W , 110
Drew, P , 208
Dubois, A E , 61
Duncan, E H , 82
Duncan-Jones, E E , 156, 157, 197
Durand, M , 31
Durr, R A , 163
Duthie, G I , 100
Dyson, A E , 21, 162, 210

Eaves, T C D , 234
Ebermayer, v E , 200
Eby, E H , 233
Edgren, H , 231
Edinborough, A , 121
Edwards, M , 187
Edwards, O , 178
Edwards, P , 220
Ekeblad, I-S , 131, 133, 134
Elliott, C , 72
Elliott, R W V , 61
Ellmann, R , 220
Elmen, P , 153
Elton, G R , 93
Emerson, E H , 156
Emerson, K T , 82
Empson, W , 210
Emslie, M , 85, 117, 147, 153, 156
Engel, M , 213
Engelhardt, G J , 59, 68
Enright, D J , 114
Erades, P A , 51
Erametsa, E , 35
Erben, J , 31
Erzgraber, W , 69
Esch, A , 149
Evans, Sir B I , 40
Evans, G B , 104
Evans, M , 94
Evans, O , 21
Evans, R O , 159
Everett, D , 66, 76

Fairbanks, G H , 35
Falk, R P , 228
Fay, E , 219
Fenton, R , 105
Feraud, P , 29
Fergusson, A B , 96
Fergusson, F , 237
Fergusson, Sir J , 11
Feuerlicht, I , 53
Fielding, K J , 212, 213
Fiedler, L A , 233
Fiehler, R , 113
Finberg, H P R , 56
Fiore, A P , 163
Firbas, J , 32
Firth, J R , 28
Fischer, W , 110
Fish, H M , 230
Fisher, P F , 211
Fitts, D , 24
Fixler, M , 164
Flasdieck, H M , 52
Fleece, J , 122
Fletcher, H , 161
Foerster, D M , 215
Fogle, R H , 232
Foot, D , 196

Ford, B , 106
Forster, L , 62
Forster, M , 63
Foss, K , 192
Foster, B , 45
Foster, E S , 231
Foster, J R , 54
Fowkes, R A , 53
Fox, Sir C , 56
Francis, P J , 112
Francis, W N , 153
Frankau, P , 184
Frankis, P J , 73
Frazier, M W , 55
Freedman, M , 165
Freeman, M , 219
Freeman, W , 47
Frei, H , 32, 51
Fries, C C , 29
Frost, W , 168
Fry, D B , 41
Frye, R M , 97, 115
Funke, O , 39
Furbank, P N , 211
Furnell, J , 200
Fusillo, R J , 113

Ganz, P F , 35
Gardner, H , 20, 118
Gardner, W B , 64
Gardner, W H , 210
Garey, H B , 35
Garlitz, B , 210
Garmonsway, G N , 21, 64
Garnett, D , 19
Garrison, W B , 47
Garvin, P L , 38
Gassner, J , 10
Gatch, K H , 17
Gatenby, E V , 29
Gathorne-Hardy, R , 158
Gesner, C , 156
Gibbens, V E , 51
Gilbert, A , 144
Gladstone, R , 23
Glazier, L , 143
Gleason, H A , 27
Gleckner, R F , 224
Glen, M E , 209
Glinz, H , 32
Gneuss, H , 44
Gohdes, C , 228
Goldberg, S L , 148
Golding, A , 140
Goldman, M S , 145
Goolden, P , 119
Gordon, C , 237
Gordon, I A , 45
Grace, W J , 168
Grant, D , 168
Graves, R , 25, 223
Grebstein, S , 239
Green, D B , 205
Greene, D , 23
Greenfield, S B , 59
Greer, C A , 108, 113
Greffin, A V , 22
Greg, Sir W W , 102, 112
Grenander, M A , 153, 164, 212
Griffith, D D , 61, 76
Griffiths, B W , 208
Griggs, E L , 206
Grigson, G , 204, 211
Grossman, A , 165
Grundy, J , 208
Gudschinsky, S C , 35
Guidi, A , 21
Guiraud, P , 39, 40
Gurrey, P , 29, 49
Guthrie, T , 122

Hackforth, R , 24
Haddakin, L , 178
Hagopian, J V , 85
Haight, G S , 212, 234
Hakewell, G , 151
Haldane, J B S , 40
Hallam, G W , 53, 217
Hamilton, A F , 172
Hamilton, M P , 67
Harbage, A , 120
Hardie, W F R , 37
Harder, K B , 14, 55, 147
Hardy, B , 214
Hargreaves, H , 70
Harkness, S B , 199
Harper, K E , 42
Harris, Z S , 28, 31, 32
Harrison, G B , 101
Harrison, M , 49
Hart, J D , 228
Harvey, B , 50
Harwood, F W , 38
Hassell, J W , 147
Hastings, W T , 108
Haugen, E , 32
Haun, E , 162
Haven, R , 206
Healey, G H , 180
Heath, H T , 167
Heffner, R L , 16, 132
Hegedu, L , 30
Hellman, C D , 90
Hemingway, S B , 110
Heninger, S K , 147
Henry, N , 157
Hepburn, R W , 150
Herbert, T W , 120
Herrick, M T , 17
Heuer, H , 108
Hewlett, D , 190
Hill, A A , 31, 39, 51, 210
Hill, B , 63
Hill, L A , 31
Hindus, M , 232
Hinman, C , 103
Hiscock, W G , 167, 194
Hoagland, C , 230
Hockett, C F , 31, 32, 51
Hodgson, P , 70
Hoepfner, T C , 118
Hofler, O , 33
Hoffman, C , 104
Hoffman, F J , 239
Hofman, E , 32
Holaday, A , 151
Holland, V , 200
Holloway, E , 234
Hone, J , 155
Honingmann, A J , 112
Honsa, V , 29
Hoppe, H R , 136, 142, 146
Horden, J , 155
Horne, D , 101
Horner, J , 144
Horsford, H C , 231
Horsman, E A , 154
Hossack, A , 48
Hotson, L , 112
House, H , 14
Howarth, R G , 133, 157
Howse, E M , 106
Huckaby, C , 143
Hughes, R E , 162
Hulbert, J R , 47
Hulme, H , 109
Humiliata, Sister M , 210
Humphrey, R , 221
Hunter, W B , 161
Huntley, F L , 158
Hussey, M , 214
Husson, R , 37
Hyde, I , 71

Innes, M M , 25
Iremonger, V , 224
Irvine, W , 204
Irving, W H , 183
Ives, S , 238

Jack, J H , 116, 220
Jackson, Sir B , 120
Jackson, K H , 30
Jacquot, J , 122
Jarrell, R , 14, 241
Jarvis, K , 193
Jeffreys, M D W , 53
Jenkins, H , 110
John, L C , 206
Johnson, G , 49
Johnson, R B , 195
Johnson, T H , 234, 235
Johnston, G B , 132
Jones, F L , 208
Jones, G F , 82
Jones, P M , 22
Jones, W T , 91
Jorden, E H , 32

Jorgensen, P A , 107
Joseph, B , 9, 120
Jost, K , 62
Joyce, M , 185

Kaderly, N L , 206
Kahnweiler, D -H , 240
Kaiser, L , 33
Kaminsky, A R , 214
Kaplan, A , 41
Kazin, A , 239, 241
Keast, W R , 47
Keen, A , 105
Kelley, M , 165
Kendall, P M , 92
Kendall, L H , 154
Kenner, H , 224
Ker, W P , 13, 58
Kermode, F , 114
Ketton-Cremer, R W , 177
Kimball, J , 237
Kin, D , 48
King, W N , 146
Kingsmill, H , 21
Kinsley, J , 10, 169
Kirchner, G , 33, 50, 51
Kirschbaum, L , 102, 130
Knight, G W , 119, 209
Knights, L C , 9, 106, 122
Knox, B , 16, 110
Knox, R A , 22
Kolb, G J , 46
Korg, J , 215
Korninger, S , 21
Koschmieder, E , 38
Kottler, B , 79
Koziol, H , 33, 36
Krahe, H , 33
Kristeller, P O , 88
Kroeber, A L , 35
Krook, D , 146
Krumpelmann, J T , 53
Kuhn, S M , 44
Künstler, E , 112
Küpper, H , 36
Kurath, H , 44

Lado, R , 29
Lam, G L , 182
Lambardi, A , 170
Lambert, E , 49
Lane, W G , 208
Lang, J P , 217
Laser, M , 231
Lattimore, R , 23, 24
Law, R A , 105
Lawlor, J , 21
Lawrence, T E , 20, 23
Leavis, F R., 218
Lecky, E , 39
Le Clair, R. C , 236
Lee, D W , 32
Lee, H D. D., 24
Leech, C , 108
Lees, F N , 126
Lefranc, R P , 144
Legouis, P , 153
Lehmann, J , 20
Lehmann, W P , 33
Lehnert, M , 58
Lenneberg, E H , 36
Lever, J W , 112
Lewis, R W B , 228, 229
Lewis, W S , 182
Liddell, R , 221
Lindblad, K E , 54
Lindsey, D , 53
Linklater, E , 225
Lisca, P , 83
Lloyd, M , 21
Locke, L G , 172
Locke, W N , 42
Lockhart, H M , 50
Lockwood, W B , 36
Lombardo, A , 229
Long, J H , 107
Long, M , 71
Lorch, F W , 236
Low, D M , 21, 22
Lowe, E L , 216
Ludeke, H , 226
Lueder, E , 240
Lumiansky, R M , 74, 79, 82
Lustaud, O , 165
Luttrell, C A , 69
Lutwack, L , 236
Lyman, J , 54
Lyons, J O , 135

Macdonald, C O , 86
Mack, M , 16
Mackenzie, A M , 11
Mackey, W F , 29
Maclean, C M , 198
MacLure, M , 107
Madden, W A , 78
Magoun, F P , 59, 62, 79, 82, 83, 85
Main, C F , 157, 158
Main, W W , 83
Majut, R , 33
Makarewicz, Sister M R , 76
Malkiel, Y , 35
Malloch, A E , 152
Malone, K , 52
Manning, S , 155
Marchand, H , 36, 52
Marchand, J W , 34
Marcus, H , 51, 147
Marder, L , 108
Marilla, E L , 161, 164
Maritain, J , 11
Maritain, R , 11
Marsh, F G , 205
Marsh, N , 122
Martinet, A , 34
Martz, L C , 16
Marz, E , 225
Mason, E , 220
Massey, B W A , 53
Matthews, W , 19
Matthews, W R , 18
Mattingly, G , 91
Maurer, D W , 55
Maxwell, J C , 9, 106, 133, 157
Mayne, J , 203
McAdam, E L , 185
McAtee, W L , 55
McAvoy, W C , 113
McCullen, J T , 96
McDavid, R I , 55
McElderry, B R , 206
McGlinchee, C , 117
McLane, P E , 142
McManaway, J G , 108, 128
McManaway, M R , 128
McNeir, W F , 130, 147
Meidner, O M , 39
Meinsma, G L , 37
Melchiori, G , 170
Mellers, W , 9
Merchant, W M , 115, 190
Merton, C , 112
Meyerhoff, H , 12
Meyerstein, R S , 29
Meynell, F , 21
Michel, L , 112
Mikus, F , 29
Miller, E H , 140, 147
Miller, R P , 83
Mills, G , 238
Miner, W L , 242
Mohrt, M , 242
Monch, W , 150
Monk, S H , 169
Moore, C , 216
Moore, H T , 15, 219, 252
Moore, R S , 14
Moorman, C , 67
Morgan, E , 205
Morse, J M , 53, 83
Morton, J B , 222
Morton, R , 171
Mossé, F , 78
Mounts, C E , 142
Mudrick, M , 17
Muecke, D C , 74
Muir, K , 111, 114, 116, 118, 158
Mulder, W , 151
Müller-Bellinghausen, A , 109
Müllerschotte, H , 33
Müller-schwefe, G , 192
Mumford, L , 242

Mundy, P D , 171
Murphy, K M , 145
Murry, J M , 105, 182, 191
Muscatine, C , 82
Mustanoja, T F., 45, 74, 85, 115
Mutschmann, H , 162
Myer, W , 98

Nathan, N , 113, 118, 157
Nangle, B C , 187
Nelson, A H , 225
Nelson, H B , 48
Nelson, W , 95
Newcomb, R , 174
Newels, K , 146
Nicholas, D , 151
Nicoll, A , 10, 108
Nitze, W A , 110
Noble, S H , 216
Nolan, G L , 210
Nørgaard, H , 116, 123
Norman, S , 208
Norwood, G , 23
Nosworthy, J M , 100, 119
Novak, M , 153
Noyes, G E , 39
Noyes, R , 205

Oakes, U , 173
O'Connor, J , 135
O Connor, J D , 51
O'Connor, J J , 157
Odell, A T , 234
Oettinger, A G , 42
Ogg, D , 166
O'Hern, E M , 30
Ohlander, U , 73
Oldham, E D , 180
Oleson, T J , 57
Oliphant, L , 49
Oliphant, M C S , 234
Oliver, H J , 127
Olsen, M , 63
Opie, I , 22
Opie, P , 22
Oras, A , 144
Ornstein, R , 129, 134
Orwen, W R , 156
Outler, A C , 25
Owen, C A , 80, 81
Owen, W J B , 143

Page, D , 24
Pahler, H , 65
Parke, J , 232
Parker, M D H , 106
Parker, W M , 211
Parkin, R P , 177
Parks, E W , 83
Parnell, P E , 128
Parreaux, A , 207
Parry, T , 10
Parsons, H , 113, 120
Partridge, E B , 131
Patch, H R , 85
Patrick, J M , 187
Patterson, C I , 216
Payne, R T , 54
Pearsall, D A , 68
Pearson, H , 200
Peden, W , 229
Perrin, P G , 48
Perrine, L , 156
Perry, J W , 43
Peterson, G E , 41
Peterson, W M , 171
Pettet, E C , 108
Peyre, H , 16
Phialas, P G , 101, 131
Phillips, J E , 173
Piccolomini, A S , 112
Pilch, H , 31, 45, 54
Pike, K L , 37
Pinto, V de S , 152, 211, 223
Pisani, V , 34
Pizer, P , 238
Poli, S , 21
Pokorny, J , 35
Pollock, T C , 48
Pope, J C , 61
Pope, P M , 24
Pottle, F A , 186
Potts, A F , 117
Pound, L , 55
Powys, J C , 15
Pratt, R A , 83
Press, J , 11
Price, D J , 87
Price, H T , 133
Prior, M E , 109
Pulgram, E , 34
Putnam, G N , 30

Quintana, R , 181
Quirk, R , 50, 58, 62

Race, S , 111
Randal, W , 55
Randall, J H , 88
Rankin, K W , 37
Ransome, J C , 241
Ratchford, F E , 193
Ray, G N , 197, 213
Raymo, R R , 70
Raymond, W O , 209
Raysor, T M , 205
Read, A W , 39
Read, Sir H , 223
Redpath, T , 9
Reed, R R , 116
Rees, J , 115
Reeves, J D , 146
Reichardt, K , 16
Reid, A S., 230
Reid, T B W , 32
Reidy, M F , 141
Reifer, M , 47
Reifler, E , 41, 43
Révész, G , 33
Reynolds, R L , 60, 61
Ribner, I , 118, 129, 130
Richards, I A , 38
Richardson, L N , 239
Richens, R H , 42
Ritz, J G , 210
Robbins, R H , 72, 73
Roberts, P , 28
Robinson, H W , 122
Robson, C A , 35
Rogers, H L , 59
Rogers, R W , 176
Rosenberg, E , 138
Rosenberg, M , 118
Rosenberry, E H , 231
Rosenfeld, S , 170
Rouse, I , 35
Rowse, A L , 93
Rubenstein, J S , 224
Rubin, L D , 240
Ruffin, D , 86
Ruland, V L , 158
Ruoff, J E , 135, 158
Rupp, H R , 68
Russell, A , 156
Ruth, W , 31

Sait, E M , 91
Sale, P J , 211
Salingar, L G , 9, 111
Salkeld, B , 225
Salle, J C , 183
Salter, F M , 83
Salter, K W , 156
Samuels, M L , 45
Sands, D B , 52
Sanvic, R , 125
Sarton, G , 90
Saunders, J W , 160
Sawin, L , 153
Sawtell, M , 193
Sayers, D L , 25
Schaar, C , 77
Schanzer, E , 110, 112, 115, 123, 163
Schiller, A , 234
Schlauch, M , 28
Schlismann, A , 36
Schmidt-Hidding, W , 33
Schneider, E , 157, 216
Schoeck, R J , 86, 98, 147, 162.
Schoenbaum, S , 126
Schulenberger, A , 229
Schultz, H , 159, 237
Schuster, Sister M F , 96, 146
Schwab, A. T., 218

Scott, A L , 235, 236
Scott-James, R A , 192
Scouten, A H , 181
Seale, L L , 53
Sells, A L , 18, 106, 138
Senn, G T , 157
Sensabaugh, G F , 165
Seronsy, C C , 112, 206
Sewall, R B , 16
Shaaber, M A , 104, 148
Shackton, A H , 164
Shain, C E , 81, 236
Shapiro, I A , 108, 110, 119, 239
Sharrock, R , 172
Shaw, J , 110
Shawcross, J T , 162
Shen, Y , 29
Sherbo, A , 214
Sheridan, M C , 48
Shield, H A , 105
Shipley, J T , 9, 47
Shirley-Price, L , 57
Shumaker, W , 163
Shulman, D , 55
Sieberer, A , 39
Siegel, P N , 116, 117
Siertsema, B , 27
Simpson, A , 151
Simpson, P , 105, 124
Sirluck, E , 123, 132, 158
Slaughter, E E , 85
Sledd, J , 28, 46
Sloane, E H , 48
Smidt, K , 219
Smith, D V , 41
Smith, G H , 48
Smith, H R , 205
Smith, R M , 144
Smith, T M , 242
Smith, W H , 182
Spang-Hannsen, H , 28
Speaight, R , 113
Spencer, T , 13
Spender, S , 15, 224
Sperber, H , 53
Spilka, M , 213
Spiller, R E , 227
Spira, T , 112
Sprague, A C , 121, 122
Stallman, R W , 238
Stamm, R , 108, 109, 122
Stanford, W B , 13
Stanzel, F , 228
Starnes, D T , 90
Steadman, J M , 53, 163
Steer, F W , 158
Stenton, F M , 63
Stern, M R , 67
Stevens, L C , 96
Stevenson, A L , 207
Stevenson, J W , 14
Stewart, B T , 108
Stilwell, G , 82
Stockwell, R P , 44
Stokoe, W C , 69
Stone, J A , 10
Stone, L , 57
Stone, W H , 215
Stovall, F , 227
Straumann, H , 38
Stroud, T A , 84
Strout, A L , 216
Stuart, D M , 183
Suddaby, E , 69
Summers, J H , 163
Sundby, B , 45
Super, R H , 191, 217
Sutherland, J , 13
Sutherland, R C , 61
Svaglic, M J , 216
Swadesh, M , 35
Symons, T , 57
Sypher, W , 95

Talbert, E W , 90
Taylor, A , 174
Taylor, D , 35, 164
Taylor, E M M , 118
Taylor, E R , 225
Teichroew, D , 42
Temple, W M , 62
Thale, J , 209, 214
Thass-Thienemann, T , 37
Thielke, R , 33
Thompson, E P , 204
Thompson, F , 20
Thomson, J A K , 24, 105
Thomson, P , 139
Tillotson, K , 195
Tindall, W Y , 11
Tinker, C B , 16
Togeby, K , 32
Touster, E , 14, 60
Trapp, J B , 71
Traversi, D , 9, 106
Trevor-Roper, H R , 155
Tschirch, F , 37
Tubb, M , 9
Tucker, P E , 75
Turner, C , 156
Tyner, R E , 53, 155

Ullman, S O A , 217
Unwin, R , 18
Ure, P , 9, 112, 224

Vachek, J , 31, 33, 52
Vallins, G H , 49
van Meurs, J C , 59
Vickers, Sir G , 40
Vinaver, E , 74
Visiak, E H , 218
Visser, F T , 32, 45, 50, 51
Vogel, S M , 230

Wadsworth, F W , 134
Waggoner, H H , 230
Walker, A , 103
Walker, D P , 145
Walker, R , 108
Waller, R D , 126
Walton, G , 150
Walton, J K , 104
Ward, A , 207
Ward, A C , 9
Warfel, H R , 233
Warner, R , 23
Wasserman, E R , 207, 208
Watkins, A , 30
Watkins, F C , 54
Watkins, R , 120
Watson, G , 150
Watson, S R , 117
Watson-Williams, H , 179
Watt, I , 9
Watts, A E , 24
Watts, H H , 241
Waugh, E , 141
Weaver, W , 42
Webb, H J , 97, 139
Webster, T B L , 41
Weinstein, R H , 40
Weisgerber, L , 39
Weisinger, H , 91, 122
Weiss, S A , 157
Welland, D S R , 236
Wellek, R , 201
Wells, H W , 241
Welsby, P A , 141
Werner, H , 38
West, E J , 121
West, R H , 117, 160
Whalley, G , 190
Wheeler, T , 96
Wheelwright, P , 12
Whitaker, V K , 122
White, W , 55
Whitehead, F , 179
Whitelock, D , 56, 63
Whitford, R C , 54
Whiting, G W , 165, 174
Whitlock, B W , 152, 169
Wickes, G , 155
Wildi, M , 224
Wilding, L A , 25
Wilding, R W L , 25
Wilkinson, L P , 25, 120
Willey, B , 157
Williams, A , 176
Williams, D , 48
Williams, E R , 54
Williams, F B , 148
Williams, G , 54
Williams, G W , 103
Williams, P , 103
Williams, S T , 228
Williamson, G , 225
Williamson, J A , 93

Willingham, J R , 240
Wilson, F P , 136, 147
Wilson, J D , 100, 104
Wilson, J H , 170
Wilson, R M , 87
Wimsatt, W K , 16, 132
Winter, W , 33
Wirl, J , 41
Withington, E , 157
Witt, M , 225
Wittkower, R , 40
Wolfit, D , 121
Woodhouse, A S P , 142
Woodring, C R , 206
Woolf, R , 61
Wrenn, C L , 58
Wright, C E , 62
Wunderheiler, A , 43
Wunderheiler, L , 43
Wykes, A , 227

Xenaxis, J , 39

Yao Shen, 29
Yarker, P M , 21, 204
Yngve, V H , 42, 43
Young, C B , 101
Young, J Z , 40

Zall, P M , 205
Zandvoort, R W , 145
Zavala, S , 97
Zeeman, E , 71
Zumthor, P , 36

INDEX II. AUTHORS TREATED

Adams, Henry, 237
Adams, Thomas, 151
Aeschylus, 12
Akenside, Mark, 20
Alfred, 65
Amis, Kingsley, 17
Anacreon, 24
Andrewes, Lancelot, 141
Anderson, Maxwell, 22
Aristophanes, 23
Aristotle, 24
Arnold, Matthew, 192, 209, 216, 217
Auden, W H , 15
Augustine, St , 25
Austen, Jane, 195, 211

Bacon, Francis, 9, 96, 97, 146–7, 161
Barclay, Alexander, 95
Barker, H Granville, 226
Barnes, William, 18
Beckford, William, 207
Bede, The Venerable, 57, 58, 62
Behn, Aphra, 171, 172
Belloc, Hilaire, 222
Besant, Sir Walter, 215
Blackmore, R D , 214
Blake, William, 179
Bloomfield, Robert, 18
Bogan, Louise, 241
Boswell, James, 186
Brandon-Thomas, J , 201
Bridie, James, 225
Bronte, Charlotte, 21, 195, 198
Bronte, Emily, 193
Browne, Sir Thomas, 158
Browning, Robert, 209
Bryant, James Frederick, 18
Burton, Robert, 161
Butler, Samuel (Erewhon), 199
Byron, Lord, 190, 207

Cædmon, 62
Carew, Thomas, 157
Carlell, Lodowick, 135
Carlyle, Thomas, 18, 196, 216
Cather, Willa, 239
Catullus, 18
Chapman, George, 9, 147, 214, 215
Chatterton, Thomas, 20
Chaucer, Geoffrey, *Equatorie of the Planetis*, 87–88, general studies, 74, 76–79, Language, 54, minor poems, 85–87, *Tales*, 78–79, 84, *Troilus*, 77, 84–85
Chesterfield, Lord, 46
Church, Richard, 19
Clare, John, 18
Coleridge, S T , 18, 149, 190, 202, 205, 206
Collins, Wilkie, 22
Collins, William, 188
Congreve, William, 17, 170
Conrad, Joseph, 199, 218
Cooper, J Fenimore, 229
Corbett, Richard, 155
Cowley, Abraham, 150
Cozzens, J G , 242
Crabbe, George, 18, 178, 179
Crane, Hart, 240
Crane, Stephen, 238
Crashaw, Richard, 149, 150, 155
Cummings, E E , 241

Daniel, Samuel, 9
Dante, 25
Darwin, Charles, 204
Defoe, Daniel, 180
Dekker, Thomas, 124, 125, 127, 133, 147
Deloney, Thomas, 147
De Quincey, Thomas, 216
Dickens, Charles, 195, 196, 199, 211–13
Dickinson, Emily, 234, 235
Dodsley, Robert, 18
Donne, John, 20, 94, 149, 152, 153
Douglas, Norman, 22
Doyle, Sir Arthur Conan, 22
Dreiser, Theodore, 239
Dryden, John, 165, 168–70, 173
Duns Scotus, 69
D'Urfey, Thomas, 172

Eliot, George, 214
Eliot, T S , 17, 225
Emerson, Ralph Waldo, 230
Euripides, 17, 23
Evelyn, John, 166

Falconer, William, 18
Fane, Mildmay, 157
Farquhar, George, 170, 171
Faulkner, William, 241, 242
Field, Nathan, 136
Fitzgerald, Scott, 13, 239, 241
Fleming, Abraham, 146
Fletcher, Giles, 151
Ford, John, 127, 128, 135
Forster, E M , 221
Franklin, Benjamin, 174
Frost, Robert, 14, 241

Garnett, David, 19
Gaskell, Mrs , 195
Gay, John, 170, 177
Geoffrey of Monmouth, 65
Gissing, George, 215
Glasgow, Ellen, 238
Godwin, William, 211
Goffe, Thomas, 135
Goldsmith, Oliver, 170
Gower, John, 70
Gray, Thomas, 177, 178, 188
Green, Henry, 12
Greene, Robert, 129, 140
Gurney, Anna, 21

Hakluyt, Richard, 146
Hardy, Thomas, 15, 215
Harrington, Sir John, 145, 147
Hartley, L P , 17
Hawthorne, Nathaniel, 21, 230, 231
Hayward, Sir John, 148
Hazlitt, William, 201
Hemingway, Ernest, 239, 242
Henryson, Robert, 72
Herbert, George, 149, 155
Herrick, Robert, 157
Hewitt, R M , 223
Heywood, Thomas, 124, 131
Hicks, George, 64
Hilton, Walter, 69, 70, 72
Hobbes, Thomas, 18
Hogarth, William, 186
Homer, 13, 18, 23
Hooker, Richard, 18
Hopkins, Gerard Manley, 21, 194, 210
Housman, A E , 15
Hunt, Leigh, 190
Hutton, Luke, 148
Huxley, Aldous, 22
Huxley, T H., 204, 217

James, Henry, 21, 191, 236–7, 241
James, William, 241
Jefferson, Thomas, 229
Jeffrey, Francis, 201, 202, 216
Johnson, Robert, 140
Johnson, Samuel, 185, (Dictionary) 46
Jones, Sir William, 180
Jonson, Ben, 9, 17, 131–3, 157
Joyce, James, 12, 13, 219, 220

Keats, John, 191, 207, 208
Kingsley, Charles, 198
Kipling, Rudyard, 194, 222
Knox, John, 94
Kyd, Thomas, 127, 129

Lamb, Charles, 191
Landor, Walter Savage, 191
Langland, William, 69
Lawrence, D H , 218, 219
Lawrence, T E , 20
Lear, Edward, 210
Lehmann, John, 20
Lewis, Sinclair, 239
Locke, John, 18
Lockhart, J G , 216
London, Jack, 238
Love, Nicholas, 72
Lovelace, Richard, 157
Lowell, J Russell, 236
Lowell, Robert, 241
Lydgate, John, 71, 73, 74
Lyly, John, 128, 146

Machiavelli, Nicholas, 91, 92
Mallock, W H , 21, 204
Malory, Sir Thomas, 74, 75
Marlowe, Christopher, 9, 91, 96, 124, 126, 129–30
Marston, John, 124, 125, 127
Martial, 18
Marvell, Andrew, 156
Massinger, Philip, 135
Maugham, W Somerset, 221
Melville, Herman, 54, 231, 232, 241, 242
Mencken, W , 240
Middleton, Thomas, 9, 126, 131
Mill, J S , 184
Milton, John, 14, 21, 158, 165
Mirk, J , 71
Mitford, Miss, 197
Monmouth, Geoffrey of, 65
Moore, Marianne, 14, 241
Moore, Merrill, 241
Moore, Thomas, 216
More, Sir Thomas, 96, 97
Morris, William, 204

Nashe, Thomas, 147
Newby, P H , 17
Newman, John Henry, Cardinal, 197, 216
Norris, F , 238

Oakes, Urian, 173
Orwell, George, 220
Otway, Thomas, 170
Overbury, Sir Thomas, 151
Ovid, 24, 25

Pater, Walter, 14, 203
Peacock, Thomas Love, 211
Peele, George, 128, 146
Pepys, Samuel, 167
Plato, 24, 25
Plautus, 17
Pléiade, 18
Pope, Alexander, 20, 176, 177
Pound, Ezra, 21, 239
Powell, Anthony, 17
Preston, Thomas, 128

Quarles, Francis, 155

Rabelais, 26
Raleigh, Sir Walter, 9
Ransome, John Crowe, 14, 241
Relph, Josiah, 18
Rice, Elmer, 22
Rice, James, 215
Riche, Barnabe, 147
Rossetti, Christina, 193, 210
Ruskin, J , 21
'Rutherford, Mark', 198, 215

Sandys, George, 154
Scott, Sarah, 184
Scott, Sir Walter, 199, 211
Shakespeare, William, biographical studies, 104–5, editions, 99–102, general works, 9, 105–8, 122–3, 124, 132, comedies, 16, 109–12, historical plays, 92, 112–13, tragedies, 20, 113–20, *Sonnets*, 120, style and language, 109, textual and bibliographical studies, 102–4, theatre and actors, 120
Shaw, G B , 226
Shelley, Percy Bysshe, 208, 209, 216
Sheridan, R B , 170
Sidney, Sir Philip, 142, 144, 145, 146
Smith, John, 21
Smollet, Alexander, 183
Snow, C P , 17
Sophocles, 12, 16
Southey, Robert, 206
Southwell, Robert, 138, 139
Spenser, Edmund, 139, 142, 143, 144
Stanyhurst, Richard, 146
Stein, Gertrude, 240
Sterne, Laurence, 183
Stevens, Wallace, 14, 240
Stevenson, Robert Louis, 22, 199
Strachey, Lytton, 22
Strode, W , 157
Swift, Jonathan, 21, 181, 182
Swinburne, A C , 192

Tatersal, Robert, 18
Taylor, Jeremy, 158
Thackeray, W Makepeace, 195, 197, 213, 214
Thomas, Dylan, 15, 21, 150
Thomson, James, 18
Thoreau, H D , 234, 241
Tillotson, J , Archbishop, 172
Tourneur, Cyril, 9, 134
Traherne, Thomas, 156
Trollope, Anthony, 22
Twain, Mark, 22, 235, 236

Vaughan, Henry, 149, 156
Virgil, 18

Wain, John, 17
Walpole, Horace, 182
Warren, Robert Penn, 242
Webster, John, 127, 133
Weston, William, 141
White, W Hale, 198, 215
Whitman, Walt, 232, 234, 241
Wilde, Oscar, 17, 200
Williams, Alfred, 18
Williams, Charles, 221
Williams, W Carlos, 14, 241
Wilson, Angus, 17
Wither, George, 154
Wolfe, Thomas, 240
Wollstonecraft, Mary, 184
Woodhouse, James, 18
Woolf, Virginia, 12, 13
Wordsworth, William, 190, 201, 205, 206
Wyclif, John, 69

Yearsley, Ann, 18
Yeats, W B , 224

INDEX III. SUBJECTS TREATED

Absalom and Achitophel, 169
Acting, 9, 121, 136
Adjectives, 51
Adonais, 208
Aelfric's Homilies, 62
All's Well that Ends Well, 101, 111
Alphonsus, 129
Alton Locke, 198
American Civil War, The, 234
American Literature, general surveys, 14, 227–9, 239, 241
American place-names, 53
American, The, 237
Amoretti, 139
Analysis of Beauty, The, 186
Anatomy of Melancholy, The, 161
Ancient Mariner, The, 123
Animal Poetry, 18
Anglo-Saxon Art, 57
Anglo-Saxon Poetry general, 59
Annals of Winchester, The, 65
Annual publications, 20–21
Anthologies, 17, 25
Antony and Cleopatra, 107, 112, 114, 116, 118
Apology for Actors, An, 131
Apposition, 51
Arabic, Renaissance study of, 98
Arcadia, 142, 145
Arden of Feversham, 130
Aristotelianism in the Italian Renaissance, 89
Arrowsmith, 239
'Asra' poems, 190
Astrolabe, 87
Astrology and witchcraft, 145
Astrophel and Stella, 139, 145
As You Like It, 111
Atheist's Tragedy, The, 134
Autobiographies, 19
Augustan satire, 176–8

Bald's Leechbook, 62
Bartholomew Fair, 132
Battle of Maldon, The, 66
Beaux Stratagem, The, 170
Beowulf, 14, 59–61
Bible, The, 22, 139
Bird names, 55
Bleak House, 212
Blue-Stockings, 184
Book of Snobs, The, 213
Book of the Duchess, The, 86
Bostonians, The, 237
Brut, 66

Caleb Williams, 211
Cambises, 128
Canterbury Tales, The, 78, 79–84
Chance, 123
Changeling, The, 131
Characters, 151
Charley's Aunt, 291
Charm against a Wen, 66
Childe Roland, 86
Chronicle, The, 62
Classical Myth in Renaissance Dictionaries, 90
Cloud of Unknowing, The, 70
Cocktail Party, A, 17
Colin Clout's Come Home Againe, 142
Colloquial English, 50
Comedy of Errors, The, 101
Comic theme in Shakespeare, 110
Communication, 40, 41
Comus, 21, 161, 162
Confidence Man, The, 231
Confidential Clerk, The, 17
Coriolanus, 114
Cornelia, 115
Criticism, general, 11–16, 201–3, 215, 223
Cymbeline, 100, 118

Death Comes for the Archbishop, 239
Defence of Poesy, The, 145, 146
Dialect, 30, 45, (American) 54, 238
Diary of John Evelyn, The, 166
Dick of Devonshire, 128
Dictionaries, 9, 35, 36, 44, 46, 47, 53–54, (American) 54, (Corrections) 53, (Renaissance) 90
Divina Commedia, 25, 66
Dombey and Son, 196
Drama, Histories of, 10
Dr Faustus, 96, 124, 129
Duchess of Malfi, The, 127
Dunciad, The, 176

Ecclesiastical History, 57
Edinburgh Review, The, 202, 215
Editorial problems, 21
Edward I, 128
Edward II, 126, 130
Eighteenth-century background, 188–9
Eighteenth-century correspondents, 182–3
Eighteenth-century novelists, 183
Elizabethan comedy, 124, 125
Elizabethan drama (general studies), 105
Elizabethan rhetoric, 146
Elizabethan theatre (general studies), 120–1, 125, 136
Emblems, 97, 139
Encantadas, The, 232
English feudal kingdom, 57
English historical documents, 56
Epicoene, 131, 132
Epipsychidion, 208
Epistolary novels, 187
Equatorie of the Planetis, 87
Essay of Dramatic Poesy, The, 169
Etymology, 52
Every Man in his Humour, 117

Faerie Queen, The, 139–44
Falstaff, 113
Familiar Letters, The, 187
Family of Love, The, 131
Feminine beauty in medieval literature, 74, 78
Finnegan's Wake, 220
First Worcester Fragment, 66
Foure Hymnes, The, 139
Four Prentises of London, The, 131
Frederyke of Jennen, 100

Gawain, 66, 68, 69
Genesis, 62
Glossematics, 27
Gnomic Poetry, 65

Golden Bowl, The, 237
Gondal's Queen, 193
Grammars, 48, 49
Grand Tour, 186
Great Expectations, 196, 213
Greek literature, 23–25
Gulliver's Travels, 182

Hamlet, 103, 107, 109, 114, 116, 117
Harley Lyrics, 74
Heart of Midlothian, The, 211
Henry IV, 112
Henry V, 101, 103
Hero and Leander, 147
Hicks's Thesaurus, 174
Historia Regum Britanniae, 65
History of Anglo-Saxon scholarship, 21, 64
Honest Whore, The, 127
House of Fame, The, 86
Huckleberry Finn, 236
Husband's Message, The, 61
Hymn to the Virgin, The, 45
Hyperion, 207

Il Filostrato, 76
Il Pensoroso, 161
Irish drama, 10
Italian history, Anglo-Italian relations in the seventeenth century, 140
Italian influence in English poetry, 106, 138, 139

Jacobean dramatic lyrics, 136
James II, 166
Jane Eyre, 196
Jesuits, 141.
Judith, 62
Juliana, 61
Julius Caesar, 100, 107, 115
July and Julian, 128

King John, 112
King Lear, 104, 107, 114, 118
King of Tars, The, 71
Knack to Know a Knave, A, 114, 130
Kubla Khan, 180

Ladder of Four Ronges, The, 70
Lady of May, The, 144
Lagrime di S Pietro, 139
L'Allegro, 161
Laon and Cythna, 208
Latin Charters, 63
Latin loans, 44
Latin poems by English writers, seventeenth century, 162
Latin versification, Shakespeare's use of, 124
Leaves of Grass, 232, 233
Leicester, Earl of, 138
Life of St George, The, 95
Lindisfarne Gospels, The, 63
Logical syntax, 38
Looking Glass for London, A, 130
Love's Labour's Lost, 105, 110
Love's Martyr, 120
Love's Metamorphosis, 128
Lycidas, 66, 161, 162

Macbeth, 107, 115, 116, 133
Machiavellism, 91, 92
Mac Flecknoe, 169
Maggie, 238
Magnificent Entertainment, The, 127
Malahide Papers, 185, 186
Mansfield Park, 195
Manx Inscriptions, 63
Manx language, 30
Martin Chuzzlewit, 212
Mary Barton, 196
Masques, 131
Measure for Measure, 110
Medieval Romances, 66
Merchant of Venice, The, 99, 103, 107
Merope, 192, 217
Merry Wives of Windsor, The, 110
Metaphysical Poetry, 150–6
Middle English, 44, 45
Middle English minor poems, 72–73
Midsummer Night's Dream, A, 110, 111
Mirror for Magistrates, A, 100
Misfortunes of Arthur, The, 129
Moby-Dick, 232
Modern poetry, 223, 224
Modest Proposal, A, 101
Monthly Review, The, 187
Morte Arthure, 66, 74, 75
Mr Eliot's 'Sunday Morning Service', 225
Mucedorus, 130
Mum and the Sothsegger, 96
Music, Shakespeare's use of, 107

Nature in Shakespearian tragedy, 113
Nebuchadnezzar's Dream, 207
New Paul and Virginia, The, 21, 204
New Way to Pay Old Debts, A, 135
Northward Ho, 127
Nosce Teipsum, 147
Notes on the State of Virginia, 229
Novel, general studies, 17

Ocean to Cynthia, The, 144
O E D corrections, 53
Offa's Dyke, 56
Old English grammar, 58
Orlando Furioso, 147
Orthography, 33
Othello, 20, 101, 107, 114, 118, 123

Pamphlets during the Civil War, 132
Pandosto, 112
Paradise Lost, 159–61, 162, 163
Paradise Regained, 164
Parlement of Foules, The, 76, 85, 86
Passage to India, A, 221
Patristic influence on Chaucer, 76
Pearl, The, 66, 67
Peregrine Pickle, 183
Pericles, 119
Perkin Warbeck, 135
Peter Grimes, 179
Philip of Burgundy, 72
Philology, 32–35
Philosophical writing, 18
Phoenix and the Turtle, The, 119, 120
Phonetics, 31
Phonology, 31
Pick-pockets' behaviour patterns, 55
Piers Plowman, 69
Pippa Passes, 209
Poems and Ballads, 193
Political Justice, 211
Prefixes, 45
Prelude, The, 205
Prima Pastorum, 75
Proper names, 39
Prose style, contemporary, 223
Proverbs, 48, 65
Psychology of language, 36, 37.
Puritanism, 97, 151

Purvey's Psalter, 71

Quantitative verse in the sixteenth century, 145
Quip for an Upstart Courtier, A, 140

Rainbow, The, 218–19
Rape of the Lock, The, 177
Rare Triumphs of Love and Fortune, The, 100
Regularis Concordia, 57
Religio Medici, 158
Religious drama, 75
Religious lyrics of the seventeenth century, 149
Renaissance humanism, 89–91, 96, 98
Renaissance philosophy, 89
Renaissance science, 90
Resolution and Independence, 205
Restoration Drama, 17, 170
Revenger's Tragedy, The, 126, 134
Revenge theme, the, 124
Richard Cœur de Lion, 66
Richard II, 99, 112
Richard III, 92, 99, 104, 107, 112, 113
Riddles, 61
Rights of Women, The, 184
Roman de la Rose, 74
Romeo and Juliet, 100, 111, 114
Royal Literary Fund, The, 212
Runes, 63
Rural poetry, 18

Sailing to Byzantium, 224
Saint Peter's Complaint, 139
Sakuntala, 180
Samson Agonistes, 14, 161, 164
Sartor Resartus, 216
Scarlet Letter, The, 230
Scholar Gipsy, The, 209
Scottish Poetry, 10
Scottish Prayer Book, The, 139
Scottish Proverbs, 174
Second Maiden's Tragedy, The, 126
Selimus, 129
Semantics, 27, 36–38, 39, 40
Sermons, 187
Seventeenth-century acting, 136
Shakespearian criticism, History of, 122–3
Shepheardes Calender, The, 139, 142
Short View of the State of Ireland, A, 181
Sir Degaré, 69
Sir Gawain and the Green Knight, 66, 68, 69
Sir Thomas More, 119
Sixteenth-century poetry, 94–95
Slang, 49
Sonnets of Shakespeare, The, 120
Sophonisba, 133
Spanish Tragedy, The, 127, 129
Structural linguistics, 28, 29
Sweeney Agonistes, 225
Symbols, 12
Syntax, 32, 50

Tale of a Tub, A, 182
Tamburlaine the Great, 129
Taming of the Shrew, The, 109
Tempest, The, 101, 107, 110, 114
Testament of Cressid, 72
Textual studies of Shakespeare, 102–4
Time in literature, 17
Timon of Athens, 115
Titus Andronicus, 103, 114, 130
Tragicomedy, 17
Tragic theme, 16
Translation, 22–26, 168, (mechanical) 42
Tristram Shandy, 183
Troilus and Cressida, 114
Troilus and Criseyde, 76, 84, 85
Tudor period, Histories of, 93–94
Twelfth Night, 111

Ulysses, 220
Ulysses theme, The, 13
Underwood, 132
Utopia, 97

Vanity Fair, 196, 197, 213, 214
Vanity of Human Wishes, The, 178, 185
Veal, Mis , 181
Verbs, 32
Viking antiquities in England, 63
Vox Clamantis, 70

Waste Land, The, 179, 225
Way of All Flesh, The, 199
Way of the World, The, 170
Welsh Literature, 10, 45, 65
Westward Ho, 127
White Devil, The, 127
Whore of Babylon, The, 127
Widsith, 56
William III, 166, 174
Windhover, The, 39, 210
Winner and Waster, 66
Winter's Tale, The, 112
Witenagemot, The, 57
Word-formation, 36
Wreck of the Deutschland, The, 210

Yeast, 198

PRINTED IN
GREAT BRITAIN
AT THE
UNIVERSITY PRESS
OXFORD
BY
CHARLES BATEY
PRINTER
TO THE
UNIVERSITY