TEXT FLY WITHIN
THE BOOK ONLY

UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY

OU_158484

UNIVERSAL
LIBRARY

OSMANIA UNIVERSITY LIBRARY

Call No. 277.3 | B96C Accession No. G. 1105

Author Burr, Nelson R.

Title Critical bibliography of religion America. 1961. vol. 4. pts. 3, 4

This book should be returned on or before the date last marked below.

A CRITICAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RELIGION IN AMERICA

PRINCETON STUDIES

IN AMERICAN CIVILIZATION

NUMBER 5

VOLUME IV, PARTS 3, 4, AND 5

RELIGION IN AMERICAN LIFE

A CRITICAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RELIGION IN AMERICA

BY NELSON R. BURR

IN COLLAB[illegible]H [illegible]E EDITORS:

JAMES WA[illegible] [illegible]AND JAMISON

PRINCETON, NEW JERSEY

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS

1961

Copyright © 1961, by Princeton University Press
All rights reserved
L. C. Card 61-5383

The Editors wish to express their gratitude
to the Carnegie Foundation
for a generous grant which made these four volumes possible,
and to Mrs. Helen Wright
for her continuous invaluable assistance in many ways.

Printed in the United States of America
by Vail-Ballou Press, Binghamton, New York

CONTENTS, VOLUME IV
PARTS THREE, FOUR, AND FIVE

PART THREE

RELIGION AND SOCIETY

I. Background

A. Religious Sociology: General 545
1. History 545
2. Theory 546
3. Culture and Society 548
4. Religion and Modern Secular Life 549
B. Religion and Society in America 551
1. Religion and the American Spirit 551
2. Group-Mindedness and Cultural Pluralism 553
C. Religious Sources of the Democratic Ideal 555
1. The Rise of the Democratic Ideal 555
2. Modern Commentaries 558
D. Foreign Observers of American Religion and Society 561
E. Community and Parish 571
F. Special Ministries 576

II. Religion and the Law

A. Church and State: Free Churches in a Free State 582
1. The Rise of the Doctrine of Separation 583
2. The Doctrine of Separation in Law 585
3. The Protestant Attitude 586
4. The Catholic Doctrine of the State 588
B. The Rise of Religious Freedom 591
C. Tolerance and Intolerance 594
D. Documentary Sources and Judicial Decisions 595
1. Documentary Sources 595
2. Judicial Decisions 597
3. The Jehovah's Witnesses and Religious Freedom 598

III. Religion and Economics

A. Religion and Capitalism 600
B. Church and Class 606
C. The Church and the Race Problem 610

IV. Religion and Politics

A. Religion and Nationalism 614
Abraham Lincoln as Religious Leader 620
B. Religion and American Wars 621
1. Religion in the Revolutionary War 621
2. Religion in Wars: 1812–1898 626
3. World War I 631
4. World War II 633
5. Peace Movements 637
6. Churches and Pacifism 639
7. Nonresistance; Conscientious Objectors 641
C. Religion and Internationalism 645
D. The Church as a Pressure Group 647
1. The Prohibition Campaign 650
2. Religion and Fascism 652

V. Religion and Education

A. Puritanism and Education 654
B. Higher Education and Religion 655
C. Secular Transformation 663
D. Religion and Public Education 666
1. Constitutional and Legal Aspects 671
2. Denominational Attitudes 675

VI. Religion and Social Reform

A. Revivalism and Social Reform 677
1. Holiness and Perfectionist Movements 678
2. The Anti-Slavery Crusade 683
a. Revivalism, Evangelicalism, and Slavery 683

b. Religious Motives of the Anti-Slavery Movement 683
c. The Appeal to the Bible 685
d. Anti-Slavery Movements in the Churches 687
e. Congregational and Unitarian Anti-Slavery Champions 689
f. Methodists and Slavery 690
g. The Presbyterian Drift Toward Schism 691
h. Other Churches 692
B. The Later Social Gospel 693
1. The Preparation 693
a. Evangelical Unitarianism and the Social Gospel 695
b. Protestant Revivalistic Evangelism 696
2. Theology of the Social Gospel 698
3. Rauschenbusch's Theology 702
4. Criticism of the Social Gospel; Decline and Revival 704
5. The Gospel of Wealth 706
C. Christian Socialism 709
Churches and Socialism 711
D. Social Action 714
1. Protestant Social Action. Social Teachings of Jesus 714
2. The Anglican Phase 718
3. Roman Catholic Social Action 720
4. The Churches and Labor 723
a. Attitude of Labor Toward the Churches 723
b. Protestant Churches. Growing Awareness 725
c. Roman Catholic Church 732
5. The City Church 734
a. The Modern City's Challenge to Protestantism 736
b. Planning 737

c. Surveys 739
d. Roman Catholic Church 741
6. The Rural Church Problem 743
a. Planning 747
b. Action 749

PART FOUR

RELIGION IN THE ARTS AND LITERATURE RELIGION AND THE ARTS

I. General References

II. Architecture

A. Guides and Bibliographies 756
B. General Histories 759
C. Architects: Biography 761
D. Types and Periods 764
1. Spanish Missions 764
2. Colonial Meeting-House and Church 766
a. The New England Meeting-House 769
b. The Middle Region 772
c. The Old South 773
3. The Greek Revival 774
4. The Gothic Revival 775
a. The Romantic Background 775
b. Early American Gothic 776
c. The Later Gothic Revival 780
5. The Brown Decades 781
6. Modern Church Architecture 784
a. Manuals and Guides 784
b. Denominational Manuals and Guides 788
7. The Synagogue 790

III. Liturgical Arts

A. Decoration and Furnishing 791
B. Worship 795
1. General Studies: Psychology of Worship 795
2. Protestant Liturgical Revival 798
a. Protestant Worship Manuals 801
b. Anglican Liturgical Movement 803
c. Lutheran Liturgical Revival 804
3. Roman Catholic Liturgical Revival 805

IV. Music

A. General References 809
B. American Religious Music: General 810
1. Spanish and French Mission Music 813
2. Anglo-American Colonial Music 815
3. Pennsylvania German Music 816
4. Denominational 819
C. Psalmody 823
D. Hymnody 824
1. Bibliography and General History 824
2. American Hymnody 828
3. Denominational Hymnody 830
E. Revival Songs, Gospel Songs, Spirituals 834
F. Negro Spirituals 839
1. Discovery 840
2. Interpretations: Critical and Historical Works 842
3. Collections 844

RELIGION AND LITERATURE

I. Bibliography

II. Religion and Literature: General

A. Religion and Modern Literature: General 851
B. Literature and Religious Belief 853
C. Literature and Theology 854
D. Religion and American Literature: General 856

III. The Bible in Literature

IV. Puritanism and Literature

A. Puritan Literature: Spring 862
B. Flowering and Decline 865

V. Some Denominational Aspects

A. Protestant 870
B. Jewish 872
C. Roman Catholic 876

VI. Fiction

A. Bibliography 880
B. General Histories and Commentaries 881
C. Religion and Fiction 883
D. The Clergy: Writers and Subjects 885
E. Propagandist Novels 887
1. Anti-Catholic Propaganda 887
2. Sentiment and Pious Edification 888
3. Social Criticism 891
F. Religious Historical Novels 895
G. The Religious Best Seller 897
H. Studies of Novelists 902
1. New England Puritans and Transcendentalists 902
2. Two Southerners: Poe and Faulkner 906
3. Western Realists 908

VII. Religion and Poetry

A. Religion and Poetry: Philosophy and Criticism 909
B. Bibliography and General History of American Poetry 912
C. Anthologies 913
1. General Anthologies 913
2. Anthologies of American Religious Poetry 915
D. Religion in American Poetry: Philosophy and Criticism 917

E. Phases of Faith and Doubt 920
1. Colonial Poetry: Piety and Metaphysics 920
2. New England Liberals and Transcendentalists 922
3. Quaker Influences 925
4. The Religious Mysticism of Nature 926
5. Thomas Merton: Catholic Contemplative 927
6. T. S. Eliot: Anglo-Catholic 928
7. Modernism: Conflict of Skepticism and Faith 929

VIII. Religion and Drama

A. The Relation of Religion and Drama 931
B. General History and Bibliography of American Drama 932
C. Religion in Contemporary American Drama 933
D. Drama in the Teaching of Religion 935

IX. Negro Religious Literature

A. Bibliography and History of Negro Literature 938
B. Religion in Negro Poetry and Drama 940
C. Religion in Negro Fiction 942

X. The Sermon

A. History and Criticism 943
1. Masters of the Pulpit 943
2. The Art of Preaching 944
3. The Pulpit and American Life 946
B. Collections 948
C. Special Types 949

XI. The Religious Press

PART FIVE

INTELLECTUAL HISTORY, THEOLOGY, PHILOSOPHY, AND SCIENCE AMERICAN THEOLOGY

I. General Works

A. Bibliography 958
B. General History: Background of European Theology 960

II. Classical Protestantism in America

A. Calvinism: The Background of American Religious Thought 963
B. The New England Theology 966
1. Intellectual Origins 967
2. Covenant Theology 969
3. Regeneration 971
4. General Course of the New England Theology. History and Commentary 972
C. Jonathan Edwards and the Reconstruction and Defense of Calvinism 976
1. Origins of His Thought 977
2. His Theology 979
3. Edwards as Idealist: Pantheism and Idealism 984
4. Commentaries on Edwards 985
D. The Development of Liberal Orthodoxy 987
The Liberalization of Calvinism 987
a. The Development of Liberal Orthodoxy: Introduction 988
b. The Faithful Edwardseans 990
c. Hopkinsianism 993
d. The New Haven Theology 994
e. The Andover Theology 997
E. The Princeton Theology 999
F. The Mercersburg (Reformed) Theology 1004
G. Natural Theology 1010

H. Early Non-Calvinist Theologies 1012
Liberal Theologies 1012
1. Enlightenment Theology 1012
2. Unitarian Theology: "Enlightened Christianity" 1016
The Prelude to Unitarian Theology 1016
3. Transcendentalist Theology 1021
4. Early Non-Calvinist Theologies 1026
a. Evangelical Theologies 1026
b. Methodist Theology 1027
c. Universalist Theology 1028
d. Anti-Calvinist New Lights 1030
5. Anglican Theology 1030
Anglican "Modernism": William Porcher DuBose 1033
I. Lutheran Theology 1035
J. Roman Catholic Theological Revival 1038
Contemporary Catholic Thought in America 1038

III. Theology and Modern Science

A. General History 1043
1. Puritanism and Science 1043
2. The Modern Wrestle of Religion and Science 1045
B. Theology and Evolution 1047
1. Evolutionary Philosophy and Religion 1047
2. Evolution and the Scientists 1048
3. Typical Religious Reactions to Evolution 1049
4. Evolution of John Fiske's Cosmic Philosophy: The Faith of an Evolutionist 1053
C. Evolutionary Religion and Theology 1054
Christianity and Evolution: A Mediating Position 1054
D. The Rise of Biblical Criticism 1057
E. The Rise and Development of Liberal Theology 1059
1. Liberalism and Modernism 1059
2. A Liberal Theory of Religious Experience: Horace Bushnell 1060

a. Early Liberalism 1060
b. The New Liberal Theology 1062
(1) The Systematizing of Liberalism 1063
(2) Theistic Liberalism 1064
3. Protestant "Modernism" 1065
4. Denominational Reactions to Liberalism 1066
5. Criticisms and Appraisals of Liberal Theology 1067
F. Scientific Liberal Theology: The "Chicago School" 1069
1. Radical Pragmatism and Subjective Idealism 1070
2. Religious Humanism 1070
3. Metaphysical or Neo-Naturalism 1071
G. Process Philosophy: A. N. Whitehead 1073
H. Theological Realism 1074
I. Neo-Orthodoxy 1076
1. Rise in Europe: Criticism of Liberalism 1077
a. New Biblical Exegesis and Interpretation 1078
b. The German Social-Christian Movement 1079
c. The Swedish or Lundensian (University of Lund) Movement in Theology 1079
d. The Crisis Theology of Karl Barth 1080
2. Movement to America 1081
3. American Critics of Liberalism: The Shift to Conservatism 1084
4. Representative Figures 1088
5. Critics of Neo-Orthodoxy 1092
J. Southern Conservatism 1092
K. Fundamentalist Reaction: The Fundamentalist Criticism of Modernism 1097
L. Teaching of Theology (Protestant) 1101

IV. Religion and Philosophy

A. General 1109
B. Theism 1111

C. Philosophical Orthodoxy 1112
D. Idealism and Religion 1114
1. Philosophical Idealism 1114
Personalism: Borden Parker Bowne (1847–1910) 1116
2. Idealism and Religion: Josiah Royce 1119
E. Radical Empiricism 1121
F. Voluntarism: William James 1123
G. Pragmatism 1125
H. Humanistic Alternatives to Religion 1128
1. Humanism as a Philosophy 1128
2. Religious Humanism 1130
3. Religious Criticism of Humanism 1133
I. Pantheism 1134
J. Non- and Anti-Religious Philosophies 1135
1. Rationalism 1135
2. Positivism 1137
3. Naturalism. Studies in Naturalistic Philosophy 1139
a. Criticisms of Naturalism; Mostly from a Religious Viewpoint 1141
4. Secularism 1142
5. Skepticism 1145
6. Agnosticism 1147
7. Atheism 1149

V. Religion and Psychology

A. Scientific Studies 1151
B. Popularizing Religious Psychology: "Peace of Mind" 1156
Psychology in the Service of Religion 1156
C. Popular Theology 1159
D. Recent Revival 1162
E. Religion and the Intellectuals 1167

Index 1171

PART THREE

RELIGION AND SOCIETY

I. BACKGROUND

A. Religious Sociology: General

1. HISTORY. The sociological study of religion has emphasized the common functional elements of all historic religious forms, notwithstanding their divergent theological and ecclesiastical expressions. In its most recent forms, sociological study has brought to light religion's involvement in the dynamics of social change. The historic involvement of religion in that process has perhaps never been better studied than in Ernst Troeltsch, *The Social Teaching of the Christian Churches,* translated by Olive Wyon, with an introductory note by Charles Gore (New York, 1931, 2 vols.), with notes including bibliography. This encyclopedic treatise covers the ground through the eighteenth century, and is unrivaled for comprehensiveness as an exposition with relation to contemporary conditions, ideas, and problems—a history of Christian social philosophy. The more recent theoretical development, and the differentiation between religious and secular sociology, are presented in Talcott Parsons, "The Theoretical Development of the Sociology of Religion," in *Journal of the History of Ideas,* Vol. 5, no. 2 (Apr. 1944), pp. 176–190. This broad view over the past century shows the two main streams of thought: doctrinal Christian and positivist. It is also a critique of the positivist theory of Tylor and Spencer, and a review of the contributions of Pareto, Malinowski, Durkheim, and Max Weber. The present controversial and admittedly inadequate state of religious sociology is stated by J. Milton Yinger, in "Present Status of the Sociology of Religion," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 31, no. 3 (July 1951), pp. 194–210, with bibliography in "Notes." He pleads for an adequate sociology, and for study of types of religious leadership, the processes of its recruitment and training, relation to institutional structures, strategies of social action, development of specific religious doctrines under varying social conditions, and religious toleration. Present tools and methods are inadequate; re-

ligious sociology must be related to larger theoretical studies.

2. THEORY. The many and various efforts to work out a valid sociology of religion, which apparently have resulted in the impasse suggested by Yinger, may be traced in a series of representative studies since the early years of the twentieth century. A pioneer essay is Georg Simmel's "A Contribution to the Sociology of Religion," in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 11, no. 3 (Nov. 1905), pp. 359–376, reprinted May 1955, tr. W. W. Elwang. This remarkable and stimulating essay reviews the impulses, ideas, and conditions giving rise to religion. It is "an attempt to determine the religious significance of the phenomena of social life which preceded all religion in the order of time." An early effort to apply sociological methods to the study of religion is Lacey Lee Leftwich, "Methods of Social Science in the Discovery of Religious Attitudes" (Bachelor of divinity dissertation, University of Chicago, 1952, with a bibliography, diagrams, and forms). The difficulties presented by this manner of approach are suggested in a critique by Carl Meyer, "The Problem of a Sociology of Religion," in *Social Research*, Vol. 3, no. 3 (Aug. 1936), pp. 337–347, chiefly a criticism of Bergson, calling for an adequate philosophical basis for any sociology of religion. The crux of the problem appears clearly in L. L. Bernard, "The Sociological Interpretation of Religion," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 18, no. 1 (Jan. 1938), pp. 1–18. He declares that religion hitherto has been in the field of philosophical hypothesis rather than of scientifically verified data. Since the application of scientific method has entered the field of religion, one may look forward to a philosophy of religion based on realistic experience and hypothesis, and a science of religion based on tested knowledge.

A determined effort to bridge the gap between the study of religion and the social sciences was undertaken by Joachim Wach in his *Sociology of Religion* (Chicago, 1944), with bibliography and references to cultural anthropology. His-

torical as well as logical in order, it discusses the relation of religion to society, the coincidence of natural and religious grouping, the impact of social differentiation upon religion, and the relation of religion to the state. One should consult also his brief summary of the history of dominant trends and major tasks of the sociology of religion in *Twentieth Century Sociology,* ed. George Gurvitch (New York, 1945), ch. 14, "Sociology of Religion," and his *Church, Denomination, Sect* (Evanston, 1947). The empirical approach is considered by Arnold Bergstraesser, in "Wilhelm Dilthey and Max Weber: An Empirical Approach to Historical Synthesis," in *Ethics,* Vol. 57, no. 2 (Jan. 1947), pp. 92–110, with many bibliographical references in the footnotes. Dilthey's aim was "to speak about the formation and activity of a religious-philosophical view of the world, which, it seems, lies buried under the ruins of our theology and philosophy." Weber's work on the sociology of religion is devoted to the social consequences of primary phenomena of religious charisma in world history. Dilthey had "indestructible religious faith in the continuity of the creative power," with which he opposed relativity. The functional theory is treated at length by William L. Kolb, "Values, Positivism, and the Functional Theory of Religion: The Growth of a Moral Dilemma," in *Social Forces,* Vol. 31, no. 4 (May 1953), pp. 305–311. The positivistic sociologist, who denies the "ontic status of religious values," as a citizen must allow people to adhere to the "religious illusions" which help to integrate social life and institutions. J. Milton Yinger makes an effort to solve the dilemma in his *Religion, Society and the Individual, An Introduction to the Sociology of Religion* (New York, 1956). He distinguishes between "the sociological analysis of religion" and "the sociological analysis of particular religions," and seeks "to discover the general principles concerning the relationship of religion to society," with illustrative readings. George Willis Cooke, *The Social Evolution of Religion* (Boston, 1920) represents the liberal

Unitarian viewpoint. Simon Deploige, *The Conflict Between Ethics and Sociology* (St. Louis, 1938) discusses the value of the sociology of religion from a Roman Catholic angle. So also does Joseph H. Fichter, *Sociology* (Chicago, 1957), a general treatment, with frequent reference to religion.

The state of the sociology of religion during the past decade appears in several bibliographies. Joseph F. Fletcher, comp., "Christianity and Civilization," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 40, no. 2 (Jan. 1948), pp. 5–8, is briefly annotated. It includes works on the Christian world-view respecting social developments and current theories of history and social order, particularly philosophy of history and society, and institutional problems. Prentice Pemberton, "Sociology of Religion," in *Journal of the Bible and Religion*, Vol. 17, no. 1 (Jan. 1949), pp. 34–40, is a list of current articles, books, and research projects. Mother Patricia Barnett, R.S.C.J., ed., *Church and Society: A Bibliography*, July 1956–Jan. 1958 (in *Social Order*, St. Louis) concentrates on politics and public office, church and state, general censorship, census, education, legal aspects, etc.

3. CULTURE AND SOCIETY. Frederick Schleiter, *Religion and Culture; a Critical Survey of Methods of Approach to Religious Phenomena* (New York, 1919), with bibliography, is an anthropological study. The centrality of religion is argued by Henry M. Rosenthal, "On the Function of Religion in Culture," in *Review of Religion*, Vol. 5, no. 2 (Jan. 1941), pp. 148–171; no. 3 (Mar. 1941), pp. 290–309, with bibliography in footnotes. This elaborately develops the thesis that religion is the central art in culture for control of the emotional system, and approaches its ideal activity as it nears centrality in life. Kimball Young, *Sociology: a Study of Society and Culture* (New York, 1942), in ch. 19, "Religion," outlines the function of religion in society and personality, and summarizes types of religious organizations and their relation to elements of social structure. A special feature

is the church membership and related data for the United States. Ruth Benedict, *Patterns of Culture* (Boston, 1934, repr. 1946) has general observations on the place of religion in the cultural pattern.

Clifford Kirkpatrick, *Religion in Human Affairs* (New York and London, 1929) has a useful bibliography. R. M. MacIver, *Society: a Textbook of Sociology* (New York, 1937) is a brief and meaty summary of the role of religious organization in social life. Other valuable modern authorities on religion and the social structure are: W. A. Visser't Hooft and J. H. Oldham, *The Church and its Function in Society* (Chicago, 1937); Randolph C. Miller, *The Church and Organized Movements* (New York, 1946); Knight Dunlap, *Religion, Its Functions in Human Life* (New York, 1946); J. Radhakrishnan, *Religion and Society* (London, 1947); Clifford Kirkpatrick, *Religion and Humanitarianism; a Study of Institutional Implications* (Washington, D.C., 1950), with a bibliography, published by the American Psychological Association; and Anton Theophilus Boisen, *Religion in Crisis and Custom; a Sociological and Psychological Study* (New York, 1955). Robert S. Lynd, in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science,* Vol. 279 (1942), pp. 228ff., discusses the Roman Catholic Church as a "power structure in relation to the larger society."

Bradford S. Abernethy, "Religion and Social Engineering," with comments, in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 6, 1945 (New York, 1947), pp. 699–705, avers that the concept of sacrifice on the cross can break social barriers raised by the "dead load of institutions." Tradition is yielding somewhat to movements toward Christian unity and interracial fellowship, and to the idea of God as the source of the moral law of the supreme worth of the individual.

4. RELIGION AND MODERN SECULAR LIFE. Charles A. Ellwood, *The Reconstruction of Religion, A Sociological View*

(New York, 1922) argues for the adaptation of religion to the changing modern world. The part of the church in ministering within the "worldly" society is competently explained by Harold Lehman Lunger, "The Nature of the Church, and its Function in Relation to the Secular Community" (Master's thesis, Oberlin College, 1936, typewritten, with a bibliography). J. Milton Yinger, *Religion in the Struggle for Power* (Durham, N.C., 1946) is a readable and rather diffuse introduction to the sociology of religion, particularly emphasizing a typology of religious groups, and a general statement of the problem of religion in a mundane social order. The problem is thoroughly discussed also in Pitirim A. Sorokin, *Society, Culture, and Personality: Their Structure and Dynamics* (New York, 1947). His "Differentiation into Religious Groups" gives a taxonomy of such groups and their relation to secular organizations and institutions. Other good treatments of the subject are George Finger Thomas, *Religion in an Age of Secularism* (Princeton, N.J., 1940); George G. Hackman, Charles W. Kegley, and Viljo K. Nikander, *Religion in Modern Life* (New York, 1957), which has a large selected bibliography, by chapters; and Alexander Dunlap Lindsay, *Religion, Science, and Society in the Modern World* (New Haven and London, 1944).

The value of religion to the individual in the environment of secular society is considered in Dashiell J. Stoops, "Religion and Social Institutions," in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 18, no. 6 (May 1913), pp. 796–807. The emphasis is upon the evolution in the Ancient World, from the religion of the state, the society, and the family, to that of the individual, which is inward and spiritual, and which interprets the older institutional religion in the spirit of love. The way was opened for the religion of reform through individual action. The social psychology of this individual and personal religion is thoroughly studied in Gordon Allport, *The Individual and His Religion* (New York, 1950); and in Paul E. Pfuetze, *The Social Self* (New York, 1954).

B. Religion and Society in America

1. RELIGION AND THE AMERICAN SPIRIT. Carl Wittke, "Religious Influence in American History," in *California University Chronicle* (Berkeley, 1924), Vol. 26, pp. 451–477, provides a good introductory survey, illustrating the shaping influences upon ideals and culture. This general background theme is amplified by two excellent and more recent works: George Sherwood Eddy, *The Kingdom of God and the American Dream; the Religious and Secular Ideals of American History* (New York and London, 1941), and Bennett Harvie Branscomb, *The Contribution of Moral and Spiritual Ideas to the Making of the American Way of Life; a Lecture Delivered at the University of Wisconsin on March 19, 1952* (Madison, 1952). A comprehensive review, based on long study and composed in a semi-popular vein, is offered by Liston Pope's address, "Religion as a Social Force in America," in *Social Action*, Vol. 19, no. 6 (May 1953), pp. 2–15. A survey of various theories of the relation of religion to culture precedes observations on religious influences since the colonial period, especially for liberty and reform, and for the Social Gospel and its diverse manifestations after 1918, particularly in political reform and social changes in the 1930's. The rise of materialism and association of churches with social and economic distinctions and segregation is a challenge to righteous action. (See also Part One, sect. VI, D, *Later Sociological Interpretation.*)

Several quite competent studies trace the evolution of religious influences in American society from the first permanent settlement at Jamestown to the early twentieth century. Louis Booker Wright, *The Cultural Life of the American Colonies, 1607–1763* (New York, 1957), with bibliographical references, stresses the part of religion in moulding cultural institutions in the formative period of American society. The narrative is carried nearly to the middle of the nineteenth century by William Warren Sweet, *Religion in the Development*

of American Culture, 1765–1840 (New York, 1952), with a bibliography. Written for the layman, its primary theme is the share of organized religion in the westward migration, and in the rescue of the frontier and post-frontier society from barbarism. The history of American religion is closely related to the "American spirit" because the laity have had such a large share in running the churches, turning them toward social activism, righteousness in action, not passive piety—"the cooperation of man with God in making a better world as well as a better life." Arthur M. Schlesinger, "A Critical Period in American Religion, 1875–1900," in Massachusetts Historical Society, *Proceedings*, Vol. 64 (June 1932), pp. 523–547, discusses the adjustment of religion to sociological and intellectual changes, emphasizing the great capacity of American Christianity for adaptability. Charles Stelzle, *American Social and Religious Conditions* (New York, 1912) studies the period of political and social reform, the "Progressive Era," indicating the influence upon the social-reform movements.

The persistent vitality of the association between religion and the "American Way" could be demonstrated by a multitude of citations. Among the best ones is Howard W. Odum, *Understanding Society: The Principles of Dynamic Sociology* (New York, 1947), which in ch. 8, "Culture and Religion," has observations on "Religion and American Culture." Other excellent references in point are Bernard Eugene Meland, *America's Spiritual Culture* (New York, 1948), and Robin M. Williams, Jr., *American Society* (New York, 1951), which examines the relatively distinct features of American religion, and the relation of religion to other institutions and to the structure of American society. Everett C. Parker, David W. Barry, and Dallas W. Smythe, *The Television-radio Audience and Religion* (New York, 1955), with bibliography and bibliographical footnotes, is an illustration of the pervasive influence of religion, even among non-churchgoers, as a moulder of the "American spirit." Likewise are Ronald Ed-

win Osborn, *The Spirit of American Christianity* (New York, 1958), with a bibliography; and Reinhold Niebuhr, *Pious and Secular America* (New York, 1958). Arthur Powell Davies, *America's Real Religion* (Boston, 1949), based on a series of four sermons, with "Sources," declares frankly that America's real religion is democracy, as the "American Way of Life," a secular ideal supported by religion. Bernard Iddings Bell, *Crowd Culture; an Examination of the American Way of Life* (New York, 1952) is a searching and rather caustic criticism of the ideal which Davies and others acknowledge, and indicates the rather superficial and perhaps not always sincere aspects of the popular "revival of religion" as a prop of secular ideals. (See below, Part Three, sect. I, D, *Foreign Observers of American Religion and Society*.)

2. GROUP-MINDEDNESS AND CULTURAL PLURALISM. The evolution of American religion, in its relations to society, has displayed two tendencies that often have been and still are in conflict. One is the tendency to exclusiveness and sectarianism, especially in the immigrant and Anglo-American evangelistic groups. The other emphasizes likenesses rather than differences. The latter, especially in recent times, has encouraged the evolution of a kind of American religion, superior to all social and ethnic differentiations, and proclaiming religion as a supporter of the "American Way of Life."

The tendency toward individuation, exclusiveness, and sectarianism is closely and learnedly observed in a notable series of essays, "Studies in the Sociology of Religion," by Henrich H. Maurer, in *American Journal of Sociology*. The first is "The Sociology of Protestantism," Vol. 30, no. 3 (Nov. 1924), pp. 257–286. It announces the intention to deal with the problem of American religious sectionalism and particularism, "from the angle of religious group-mindedness," and with the development of different social types in the individual, the group, and the state, from different concepts of salvation. Other essays in the series develop this thesis by study of immigrant and sectarian groups. "Religion and American Sectional-

ism, The Pennsylvania German," Vol. 30, no. 4 (Jan. 1925), pp. 408–438, states that the German-speaking religious groups furnish "perfect clinical cases" for studying the significance of religion as "a principle of structural and functional individuation." "The Problems of a National Church before 1860," Vol. 30, no. 5 (Mar. 1925), pp. 534–550, maintains that Christianity in the eighteenth century did not allow the logic of a creed to interfere much with integration and union within Christian society. But the social situation of the nineteenth century once more "gave the confessional principle an important social function," for defense against rivals and against revolutionary radicalism. "The Problems of Group-Consensus; Founding the Missouri Synod," Vol. 30, no. 6 (May 1925), pp. 665–682, shows how a German immigrant group in a transitional crisis "objectified its fellowship in its creed." The creed was its "fellowship law," its "principle of identity and continuity." "The Fellowship Law of a Fundamentalist Group, The Missouri Synod," Vol. 31, no. 1 (July 1925), pp. 39–57, describes a specific religious "individualism" as "a mode and function of a specific religious group life." "The Consciousness of Kind of a Fundamentalist Group," Vol. 31, no. 4 (Jan. 1926), pp. 485–506, declares that "The categories of the spiritual man serve to define the social situation between the group and the outgroup."

The contrary tendency toward the evolution of a general American religious ethos, without necessarily abolishing denominational organizations, has been frequently noticed. Catholic, Protestant, and Jew remain such, but with a disposition to have many sentiments in common, to accept religious pluralism as a part of the general American cultural pluralism, and to discuss their common problems in religious congresses. This trend was noticeable in the 1930's, especially at the Williamstown Institute of Human Relations, held under the auspices of the National Conference of Jews and Christians, at Williams College, August 1935. The proceedings, edited by Newton Diehl Baker, Carlton J. H. Hayes,

and Roger Williams Straus, appeared as *The American Way; a Study of Human Relations among Protestants, Catholics, and Jews* (Chicago and New York, 1936). Benson Young Landis, *Religion and the Good Society; an Introduction to Social Teachings of Judaism, Catholicism and Protestantism* (New York, 1943), with bibliography, is another study in religious "cultural pluralism," and stress on likenesses. Will Herberg, *Protestant, Catholic, Jew; an Essay in American Religious Sociology* (Garden City, N.Y., 1955) includes bibliography, and stresses the growth of cultural pluralism in religion, and its acceptance as a matter of course, a part of the "American Way of Life," similar in all American groups. William Warren Sweet, *American Culture and Religion; Six Essays* (Dallas, 1951) emphasizes the tradition of American cultural pluralism, the roots of the American democratic spirit in popular Protestantism, and the ever-growing trend toward ecumenicity. (See also sect. II, C, *Tolerance and Intolerance.*)

C. Religious Sources of the Democratic Ideal

1. THE RISE OF THE DEMOCRATIC IDEAL. The relationships between religion and democracy may be approached in a descending order of generalization. At the most general level, one must ask whether there is any real connection between religion, which deals with the ultimate needs in man's life, and democracy, which deals with man's immediate political necessities. If one should view religion as essentially and completely directed toward the achievement of life out of this world, one might logically deny any relevance to this topic. This section, therefore, considers first how religion is implicated in both the eternal and the temporal aspects of man's condition. Once one accepts the connection between religion and democracy and considers how important it has been historically in the American experience, nearly every aspect of social and political life can be related in some way to the problem.

Ernest Sutherland Bates, *American Faith; Its Religious, Political, and Economic Foundations* (New York, 1940) begins with a survey of the Reformation in Europe, because he conceives the American experiment in religious, economic, and political democracy to have originated in "the attempted revival of primitive Christianity by the radical lower-class sects of the Protestant Reformation." He attempts to translate the old religious and theological controversies into modern language to reveal their inner meaning as fountains of democratic philosophies. G. P. Gooch, *English Democratic Ideas in the Seventeenth Century;* with Supplementary Notes and Appendices, by Harold J. Laski (Cambridge, Eng., 2nd ed., 1927), a standard work, treats the religious sources and relations of the growing democratic movement, and especially its connection with Puritanism. The latter relation is further established in an essay by Winthrop S. Hudson: "Theological Convictions and Democratic Government," in *Theology Today,* Vol. 10, no. 2 (July 1953), pp. 230–239. The part of religion in democracy was "to win an acknowledgment of the sovereignty of God as the solid ground upon which the concept of a fundamental moral law rests." Theological bases were contributed by churches of the Puritan-Calvinist reformed tradition. Clifford K. Shipton, in "Puritanism and Modern Democracy," in *New England Historical and Genealogical Register,* Vol. 101, no. 403 (July 1947), pp. 181–198, declares that "The Puritan had many faults of his century, but his virtues were the bridge between medieval society and modern American democracy." Perry Miller, *Orthodoxy in Massachusetts, 1630–1650* (Cambridge, Mass., 1933) analyzes congregational church government, indicating the individualistic and democratic tendencies inherent in congregationalist Puritanism, generally overlooked by earlier historians.

Those tendencies found an expression that struck a chord in the popular heart, in two Congregational ministers—Thomas Hooker of Hartford, and John Wise of Ipswich,

Mass. Hooker's influence is appreciated by Clinton Rossiter, in "Thomas Hooker," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 25, no. 4 (Dec. 1952), pp. 459–488: "Hooker first planted and nurtured in New England soil the seeds of democracy hidden away in the brittle pod of Puritanism." (See *Amer. Lit.*, Vol. 25, no. 2, May 1953, p. 260.) Rossiter's *Seedtime of the Republic* (New York, 1953) is a thoughtful, close-knit analysis of the background of sectarian religion and democratic aspiration in the colonial period. The alliance was a fundamental trait of Revolutionary political and constitutional thought. Vernon L. Parrington, in his *Main Currents in American Thought* (New York, 1927), Vol. 1, pp. 118–125, has a penetrating account of Wise, who defended congregational church polity against the explicitly anti-democratic character of the Puritan theocracy. The episode showed the rising democratic sentiment, and its powerful support from congregationalism, already becoming the typical form of American church polity.

Wise's defense was republished in 1772, only a few years before the Revolution, and is believed to have influenced the political thinkers of the Constitutional Period, especially through the covenant theory. Andrew C. McLaughlin, *The Foundations of American Constitutionalism* (New York, 1932) finds important sources of the theory of constitutionalism in the Puritan theology and church polity of the covenant ("Federalism"), which Hooker and Wise vigorously defended. Ralph Barton Perry, *Puritanism and Democracy* (New York, 1944) ties the general problem of religion and democracy more particularly to the American experience, and provides a thoughtful answer to the question: what elements did the religious tradition contribute to the American mind as it was crystallized in the generation of Revolutionary leaders?

Ralph Henry Gabriel, *The Course of American Democratic Thought, an Intellectual History Since 1815* (New York, 1940) points to continuing ties between democratic

thought and democratic elements in the churches, especially the Protestant sectarians. The thesis is further established by his essay, "Evangelical Religion and Popular Romanticism in Early Nineteenth Century America," in *Church History*, Vol. 19, no. 1 (Mar. 1950), pp. 34–47. This illustrates the connection between the Christian evangelism of the frontier and the revival, and the American democratic creed. The popular religion and the Transcendentalism of the intellectuals were both romantic religions, and supported democratic idealism by their faith in the worth and goodness of man.

2. MODERN COMMENTARIES. By far the most formidable collection of arguments, for the necessity of a religious foundation of democracy, was inspired by the travail of the democratic ideal during the period of World War II. Theologians, philosophers, and scientists of various faiths (or of no creed) assembled to present addresses and engage in discussions, which were published in the volumes of the *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium.*

Edwin E. Aubrey, "Science, Religion and Democracy," Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 21–35, declares that, since the democratic way of life is best for realizing the supreme end of man, science and religion must live together, not in mere toleration but in active cooperation, their discipline enabling men to meet the requirements of democracy. Charles W. Morris, "Empiricism, Religion, and Democracy," Vol. 2, 1941 (New York, 1942), pp. 213–241, with comments by six others, states that empiricism is not the sole guardian of democracy and does not imply a particular religious or social organization. It helps to remove obscurities from a realistic confronting of issues in religious and social life, and to lay the foundation for creation of valid symbols, without emotional or doctrinal conflict with science, leaving room for diversity in a democratic society. The Princeton Group (J. Douglas Brown and others), "The Spiritual Basis of Democracy," *ibid.*, pp. 251–257, reveals their commitment to the principle that democratic institutions and cultural activities are based upon

the assumption that man, a part of nature, is yet a spiritual being whose highest good should be defined in terms of spiritual values. The major problem is deeper understanding and loyalty to this idea, for military defense will fail without it.

Millar Burrows, "Democracy in the Hebrew-Christian Tradition; Old and New Testaments," *ibid.*, pp. 399–412, traces the anti-monarchial tendency of the Old Testament, and the persistent democratic tradition of the Hebrews, their basic conviction of the worth and rights of every man, even without political democracy, the recognition of social responsibility, and opposition to tyranny in the Hebrew-Christian tradition. Albert C. Outler, "The Patristic Christian Ethos and Democracy," *ibid.*, pp. 446–471, avers that Christianity and democracy have much in common and that modern democracy is indebted to the Christian tradition of human solidarity and equality, universalism and humanitarianism, and primary concern for the individual's happiness as shared with others. Patristic Christianity, while not democratic in the modern sense, was intended to secure and enlarge values with which democracy is concerned.

Nels F. S. Ferré, "Christianity and Democracy from the Point of View of Systematic Christian Theology," *ibid.*, pp. 413–434, states that theology requires education in a democracy to be socially adequate and to include religion as a discipline, tapping an ideal power that helps man in his search for a better communal life. The Church must offer Christian community and forsake mere doctrinal content and withdrawal from the world, or approaching it without an adequate basis for concern. His argument is elaborated in two other papers: "The Meaning of Human Dignity from a Theological Perspective," Vol. 3, 1942 (New York, 1943), pp. 277–296, with comment by five others; and "The Motivational Power of Christianity for Democracy," Vol. 10, 1949 (New York, 1950), pp. 659–675. He takes the position that man does not understand himself except by realizing

that he is a creature, participating organically in natural processes and yet differentiating himself from nature and using it for his own purposes. Democracy is meaningless without the idea of eventual human brotherhood under God, and social theory must be rooted in theology and trust in God.

The Roman Catholic defense of democracy and theological support of its ideals are summarized in two essays. William O'Meara, "Philosophical Foundations of Religion and Democracy," Vol. 2, 1941 (New York, 1942), pp. 435–445, declares that religion does need a purely philosophical establishment of the existence of God; democracy needs the idea of a necessary, immutable being, and Thomistic critical realism provides both. Yves R. Simon, "Thomism and Democracy," *ibid.*, pp. 258–272, states that Thomistic philosophy is dominated by the idea of the common good. Its concept of authority, based upon the essential function of guiding the multitude to common welfare, is not incompatible with democracy, as it is supplemented by the principles of autonomy and equality of opportunity. Its metaphysical idea of species, that all members are one in essence, is equalitarian.

Simon Greenberg, Clarence Manion, and Luther A. Weigle, "The Religious Background of Democratic Ideas," *ibid.*, pp. 517–548, present the Jewish, Roman Catholic, and Protestant ideas of democracy, all agreeing that it is firmly rooted in the Hebrew-Christian religious and moral tradition, all people being equally children of one Creator.

Clarence R. Skinner, comp., "Religion and Democracy: Bibliography," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 36, no. 3 (April 1944), pp. 5–7, with short notes, includes the historical background, the religious implications of community, and the church's function in democracy.

Reinhold Niebuhr, "Christianity as a Basis for Democracy," in *University Observer*, Vol. 1, no. 2 (Spring–Summer, 1947), pp. 90–95, discusses religious and secular contributions to the rise of democracy. Christianity is a conservator of human-

rights values, and of the true definition of the right of property. It guards against absolutism of the extreme right or left. In America democracy is kept from purely secular utopian fanaticism by its growth in a Christian culture. Max Lerner, "Christian Culture and American Democracy," in *American Quarterly*, Vol. 6, no. 2 (Summer, 1954), pp. 126–136, sees opposing strains in Christian doctrine that make it compatible with both democratic and authoritarian movements. The American religious tradition is individualistic, pluralistic, and anti-authoritarian. This tradition of non-conformity has been a counterforce to the danger of "conformism" in American democracy. Protestant church leadership has been a main center of resistance to the new conformist trend. Roy F. Nichols, *Religion and American Democracy* (Baton Rouge, La., 1959), with a bibliography, and references in notes to the text, observes the "intimate wedding" of politics and religious affairs. The growth of a broadly tolerant democratic society is never out of touch with the deep popular instinct for morality and religion. He refers to the evolution of political and religious beliefs against the background of social and intellectual history, and the influences of various beliefs upon statesmen and education.

D. Foreign Observers of American Religion and Society

During the past century and a half many foreign visitors have attempted to interpret to Europeans the peculiar features of American life and culture, including the religious ones. Some of the interpretations illustrate the dangers of inadequate knowledge resulting in hasty generalizations. They stress only crudities (such as the excesses of "revivalism") which were no more representative of American religion as a whole than similar things in the observer's native country. A few of the visitors wrote books that have come to be regarded as classic interpretations. Their accounts of American religious organization and practices in their time are still worth read-

ing, partly for parallels with conditions at the present time.

These books are far too numerous to list and describe separately. Fortunately, American scholars have compiled several bibliographies of such accounts, sometimes including critical notes. Others have written studies of these writings, beginning with the colonial period. These provide an adequate introduction to the various phases of the vast literature.

A general guide to the bibliographies is provided in Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History, Guide to Materials for Research* (New York, 1942), pp. 236–238, "Exploration and Travel." A much older but still useful aid is Charles W. Plympton, "Select Bibliography on Travel in North America," in *New York State Library Bulletin* (May 1897), bibliography no. 3, pp. 35–60. The period from 1583 to 1900 is quite completely covered by essays and bibliographies in the *Cambridge History of American Literature:* George P. Winship and Maude E. C. Cowell, "Travellers and Explorers, 1583–1763," Vol. 1 (New York, 1917), pp. 1–13, 365–380; Lane Cooper, "Travellers and Observers, 1763–1846," *ibid.*, pp. 185–214, 468–490; and Frederick S. Dellenbaugh, "Travellers and Explorers, 1846–1900," Vol. 3 (New York, 1921), pp. 131–170, 681–728. A comprehensive list for the later colonial and early national periods was compiled by Solon J. Buck, Hope F. Kane, and others, as "Bibliography of American Travel and Description," 1750–1830, with some revision in 1943 (Washington? 1943). A microfilm copy of the typescript was made in 1943 by the Library of Congress, from the original in the National Archives, Washington; microfilm Z-48.

There are several valuable bibliographies of travel (including foreigners) for special periods and regions. The later colonial and Revolutionary periods are surveyed in Ruth Henline's "Travel Literature of Colonists in America, 1754–1783; an Annotated Bibliography with an Introduction and an Author Index" (ref. in Northwestern University, *Summaries of Doctoral Dissertations,* Vol. 15, pp. 10–13). The

years 1690–1783 are covered by Newton Dennison Mereness, ed., *Travels in the American Colonies* (New York, 1916). Extensive bibliography on "Travel and Observation," with essays, occurs in R. L. Rusk, *The Literature of the Middle Western Frontier* (New York, 1925), Vol. 1, pp. 38–51, 79–130, and Vol. 2, pp. 101–129, with some references to observations on religion. The Middle West is covered also in Solon J. Buck, "Travel and Description, 1765–1865," in *Collections of the Illinois State Historical Society*, Vol. 9 (Springfield, Ill., 1914), which includes some foreign titles with references to religion in the region generally, as well as in Illinois. Remarks by foreigners about religion in the South are found in Ellis Merton Coulter, comp., *Travels in the Confederate States; a Bibliography* (Norman, Okla., 1948), with an alphabetical, annotated list of publications, 1862–1945.

Henry T. Tuckerman, *America and Her Commentators, with a Critical Sketch of Travel in the United States* (New York, 1864), contains comments on British, French, northern European and Italian travelers and critics, with references to their observations on American religious life. John Graham Brooks, *As Others See Us, A Study of Progress in the United States* (New York, 1908) has a bibliography of English, French, and German criticisms during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The comments on the authors notice their references to religious toleration, separation of church and state, religious unrest, commercialism in the churches, Jews, and the apparent decline of Protestant churchgoing. Oscar Handlin, *This Was America, True Accounts of People and Places, Manners and Customs, as Recorded by European Travelers to the Western Shore in the Eighteenth, Nineteenth, and Twentieth Centuries* (Cambridge, Mass., 1949) has bibliographical notes, and annotated selections from forty authors of several European nations, who made observations (1753–1939) on the wide variety of religious and ecclesiastical topics listed in the index. Reuben Gold Thwaites, ed., *Early Western Travels, 1748–1846, A Series of Annotated*

Reprints of Some of the Best and Rarest Contemporary Volumes of Travel (Cleveland, O., 1904–1907, 32 vols.), with a full analytical index in Vols. 31–32, comprises numerous narratives with observations on religion, by travelers for pleasure and adventure, and by missionaries and explorers.

Jane Louise Mesick, *The English Traveller in America, 1785–1835* (New York, 1922), with a bibliography, devotes a chapter to religion, with footnotes giving exact references to observations on religion in the books. The index lists other references, especially under authors' names. The special chapter covers a wide range of topics, with especially interesting notes on the fashionableness of the Episcopal Church, and the deep impression made by William Ellery Channing. One of the best references, for the early nineteenth century, is Max Berger, *The British Traveller in America, 1836–1860* (New York, 1943), with a huge critical bibliography. The footnotes to ch. VI, "Religion," cover nearly all the travelers who made remarks on religion, noting particularly voluntary support, varying opinions on American religious sincerity, evangelism, class distinctions in churches, sectarianism and freakish cults, and the rise of Roman Catholicism. Allan Nevins, comp. and ed., *American Social History as Recorded by British Travellers* (New York, 1923) has an annotated bibliography comprising all the important titles. It contains especially interesting notes on American religion by Frances Trollope, and John Melish's remarks on the religious communistic colony of the Rappites. A revised and enlarged edition appeared as *America Through British Eyes* (New York, 1948), with an annotated bibliography. The selections are arranged chronologically, 1789–1946, with introductions and notes.

Frank Monaghan, *French Travellers in the United States, 1765–1932; a Bibliography* (New York, 1933) has a valuable critical introduction. It lists the authors alphabetically with bibliographical notes and location symbols, and has a selected chronological list, and a very thorough index including refer-

ences to religion. The full titles and the notes sometimes indicate whether or not the writers discussed religion. Charles H. Sherrill, *French Memoirs of Eighteenth-Century America* (New York, 1915), with illustrations, in the chapter "Religious Observances" mentions the impression made upon French travelers by strict Sunday observance, religious liberty, sincere religious sentiment in all social classes, the simplicity of the churches, hearty congregational singing, and the importance of ministers in the community. Lee W. Ryan, *French Travellers in the Southeastern United States, 1775–1800* (Bloomington, Ind., 1939) has a bibliography of travel books, and references to Negro religion, Methodist evangelism, the Quakers, funeral customs, and the attitude toward churchgoing. A longer period is reviewed by Genevieve C. Hubbard, "French Travellers in America, 1775–1840, a Study of Their Observations" (unpublished thesis, American University, Washington, D.C., 1936, with a bibliography). One of the best studies is Samuel Tinsley Chambers, "Observations and Opinions of French Travellers in the United States from 1790 to 1835 together with: Some Comparisons with Observations and Opinions of British Travellers in the Same Period" (Master's thesis, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., 1949, typed copies at Georgetown University and the Library of Congress). Chapter 4 is devoted to observations on religion, with references to several important writers. George Wilson Pierson, *Tocqueville and Beaumont in America* (New York, 1938) refers repeatedly to their observations on religion, including general conditions, belief in the separation of church and state, religion in education, on the frontier, and in the South, and the political and moral influence of religion. A good illustrated source is André Morize and Elliott M. Grant, eds., *Selections from French Travelers in America* (New York, 1929) with introductions, notes, and a vocabulary. Some comment on religion appears in José De Onis, *The United States as Seen by Spanish American Writers, 1776–1890* (New York, 1952), with a bibliography; a Colum-

bia University thesis published by the Hispanic Institute in the United States.

Many observations on American religion are imbedded in works with a much wider scope, sometimes including only a chapter or two, or random and scattered notes. These may be located in the general bibliographies and other volumes listed above. Many writings have been devoted specifically to religion, and a few of these are or seem likely to become authoritative classics. A selection from these (in English, French, and German) will give some idea of the wealth of this literature. A comprehensive historical and critical survey of the observations of foreigners on American religious life, beginning with the colonial period, is very much to be desired.

Andrew Reed and James Matheson, *A Narrative of the Visit to the American Churches, by the Deputation from the Congregational Union of England and Wales* (New York, 1835, 2 vols.), in the form of letters, pays much attention to the benefits and dangers of revivalism. Other emphasized topics are religious opinions and differences, and infidelity; the voluntary principle as contrasted with establishment; the "activism" of American churches in missions, charity, education, and reform societies; evangelization of the West; and the great versatility and optimism of American religion. George Lewis, of Ormiston, *Impressions of America and the American Churches* (Edinburgh, 1845) is based upon his journal, kept as a member of the delegation from the Free Church of Scotland to the United States in 1844. He notices the "gaiety and luxury" of American churches, along with careful observance of the Sabbath, and liberality to missions. He observed especially the popularity of revival preaching, the state of religion in various cities, the multitude of sects, the dependent position of the clergy, and the advantages and disadvantages of voluntary support. Isabella Lucy (Bird) Bishop, *The Aspects of Religion in the United States of America*, by the author of "The Englishwoman in America" (London, 1859), contrasts the American nonstate-church reli-

gion with the statism of English religion, and notices the dominance of Protestant dissent, revivalism, and the activity of the churches in social and moral causes. There is a good chapter on American preaching. The author regarded the churches of America as the most flourishing in the world, destined (with those of Great Britain) to evangelize the earth—a kind of "manifest destiny."

The classic British work is James Viscount Bryce, *The American Commonwealth* (London, 1889, 2 vols.; New York, 1911, new ed., 2 vols.; and New York abr. ed.). In "The Churches and the Clergy" and "The Influence of Religion," he comments on the establishment of religious freedom and the controversy over giving state funds to denominational institutions. He also stresses that, while the United States has no state church, it is far from an irreligious nation, with the churches in a secure legal position and public recognition as a moral and social force. Religion is a socially meliorating influence, undergirding the reverence and self-control necessary to a democracy. He notes also the lack of ecclesiastical social distinctions, the ecumenicity of American Protestantism, and the respected status and wide influence of the clergy. Harold J. Laski's *The American Democracy* (New York, 1948) in ch. 7, "Religion in America," has an important commentary by this noted British author on politics, observing the importance of religion in sustaining the democratic way of life.

Alexis de Tocqueville, *De la Démocratie en Amérique*; English tr., "Democracy in America," ed. Phillips Bradley (New York, 1946) is well known for its shrewd observations of the effect of peculiarly American environmental factors in religious development and the pervasive influence of religion. The best interpretation of his remarks, based upon travel in the 1830's, is in Joachim Wach's "The Rôle of Religion in the Social Philosophy of Alexis de Tocqueville," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 7, no. 1 (Jan. 1946), pp. 74–99. He emphasizes that De Tocqueville, while indicating that

religion played no direct part in American government, regarded it as a primary force among political institutions. He saw it as a bulwark of republicanism, through strengthening the moral ties of society. Very valuable are the references to works by or on De Tocqueville in the footnotes.

Henry Bargy, *La Religion dans la Société aux Etats-Unis* (Paris, 1902), one of the finest books on the topic ever written, emphasizes the evolution from Puritan colonial religion to social Christianity and civic religion, with its relative indifference to dogma in favor of moralism. Importance is attributed to the rise of Christian free thought, "practical mysticism," and the social spirit in Christian philosophers like W. E. Channing. Other points stressed are sociological Catholicism, laicism, innumerable societies for moral culture, and the institutional church; and the effects of this type of Christianity upon Judaism, the growth of religious peace, interchurch cooperation, and tolerance in Biblical interpretation. Paul Henri Benjamin Estournelles, Baron de Constant, *Les Etats-Unis d'Amérique* (Paris, 1913) has interesting notes on Mormonism and its community life, and notices the modernization and activism of American religion, indifference to dogma, stress on the duty of man, and a common religious moralism, which he regarded as a return to the true Christian spirit. He compares the growing laicism with the similar spirit in France, and makes special references to the rise of Christian Science and psychotherapy, Unitarianism, and the liberalism of Phillips Brooks. The author hazards some observations on the future of American religion. *Initiation à la Vie aux Etats-Unis . . . Préface de M. Charlety* (Paris, 1931) has an essay by André Siegfried, on religions in the United States and their influences in practical life, and one by Firmin Roz on religious schools. Victor Monod and Henri Anet, *Les Forces du Protestantisme Américain Contemporain, avec un Préface du Rev. Ch[auncey] W. Goodrich, pasteur de l'Eglise Américaine de Paris* (Paris et Bruxelles, 1921), by a French and a Belgian Protestant pastor, was published under the auspices

of the Protestant Federation of France. It covers distinctive characteristics and diversity of the Protestant churches, strivings for unity in action and thought, methods of publicity, finance, and teaching, charities, service in the armed forces and to civilians, and generous relief work in the postwar era.

Friedrich Wilhelm Franz Nippold, *Handbuch der Neuesten Kirchengeschichte* (Elberfeld, 1880–1892, 4 vols., imprint varying) devotes Vol. 4 (Berlin and Philadelphia, 1892) to the church history of the United States since the Declaration of Independence. It is a highly valuable treatment of American Protestanism, emphasizing its ethical basis, the possible role of the Episcopal Church in unifying Protestantism and Catholicism, "progressive orthodoxy," the holiness reform of popular life, the rise of sectarianism, Unitarianism and the ethical following of Christ, the national religious meaning of American Lutheranism, the relations between pietism and Puritanism, the opposition of evangelicalism to both ultramontane Catholicism and unbelief, and the origins of a peculiarly American theology. Wilhelm Muller, *Das Religiöse Leben in Amerika* (Jena, 1911), with a bibliography of works consulted, sketches the field since New England Puritanism, the revolt from it leading to an alienation of the church from life, and the resulting rise of liberalism with its effort to close the breach. Other topics of importance are Southern religious life, the Protestantism of the 1848 German immigrants, the future of Judaism, the rise of new sects, ethical culture, lay religious organizations, revivalism and conversions, faith healing, and the significance of America as the birthplace of a new, free, and lay religion. Adolf Zahn, *Abriss einer Geschichte der Evangelischen Kirche in Amerika im Neunzehnten Jahrhundert* (Stuttgart, 1889), with bibliography, stresses church freedom under the voluntary principle, the importance of Calvinism, and of Sunday observance, the Bible, and revivalism. A large space is devoted to manifold church activities, such as the temperance and anti-slavery movements, societies and associations for missions, tracts, edu-

cation, youth, etc.; and there is a special chapter on liberal groups. Adolf Keller, *Dynamis, Formen und Kräfte des Amerikanischen Protestantismus* (Tübingen, 1922) bears down heavily upon free-churchism and the Puritan spirit, and the dynamic nature of American free Protestantism, with its trend from individualism to unity. He discusses the mystical and institutional types of piety, and the relations of Protestantism to missions, social problems and service, immigration and the Negro question, the international importance of its idealistic policy, and participation in ecumenical movements.

Karl Bornhausen, *Religion in Amerika, Beiträge zu ihrem Verstandnis* (Giessen, 1914), with some references in footnotes, emphasizes the necessity of studying American religious conditions. Included are remarks on the friendship between German and American Protestantism, English and American Protestantism in the nineteenth century, and the relations of religion to labor, student life, missions, society, Christian socialism, practical and pragmatic emphases, the immigrant, and youth movements. His *Der Christliche Aktivismus Nordamerikas in der Gegenwart* (Giessen, 1925) is concerned with the contemporary and multifarious expressions of socialized, "practical" Christianity. Hermann Werdermann, *Das Religiöse Angesicht Amerikas, Einzeilenindrücke und Charakterzüge* (Gutersloh, 1926), with bibliography in the notes, records observations mostly in and around the large cities. Chapters are devoted to denominations, parish life, services and worship, preaching, types of piety, schools, theological education, youth movements, pastors and their work, parsonages, and the Evanston world interchurch conference. Hermann Sasse, *Amerikanisches Kirchentum* (Berlin-Dahlem, 1927) discusses the relations of the church to American civilization and the ecumenical movement. He considers American Protestantism as the greatest missionary power in the world, and notes its influence upon European churches and at the world conference in Stockholm. This is an effort to promote real comprehension of the world importance of American

religion. Adolf Keller, *Amerikanisches Christentum—Heute . . .* (Zurich, 1943), with good bibliography by chapters and statistics of membership, is the best recent survey of American Christianity by a foreigner, and covers the whole field, from the European origins to the American churches and reconstruction after World War II. It specially emphasizes ecumenism, the dynamic and adaptable character of American church life, battles with moral and social evils and secularization, and relations with the "American spirit," the people, the state and economic life, problems of race and missions, youth and modern ecumenical movements, Protestant-Catholic problems, wars and relief work, the "unchurched," and Christian Europe.

E. Community and Parish

American Academy of Political and Social Science, *Organized Religion in the United States* (Philadelphia, 1948), with a bibliography, furnishes an excellent scholarly summary in sixteen essays by authors of various faiths. They comprise contemporary religious institutions, their relations to others, churches and social action, trends and future prospects, characteristics of organized religion, and its relations with the state, the economic system, social classes and the family, the press and other publicity organs, science, and liberalism. Tables show class composition of religious groups, occupations, trade union membership, educational levels, and political and ethnic divisions. Winfred E. Garrison, "Characteristics of American Organized Religion," in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol. 256 (March 1948), pp. 14–24, emphasizes the sociological aspects of religion in a scholarly vein.

The effect of the catastrophic economic depression of the 1930's is revealed in several investigations by church leaders and historians, who had access to official reports and studies. Gaius Glenn Atkins, *Religion in Our Times* (New York,

1932) is primarily sociological in emphasis. Benson Young Landis, "Organized Religion, 1933," in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 38, no. 6 (May 1933), pp. 905–912, surveys the situation and activities of the churches during a period of radical rethinking of their social philosophy and message, in view of the challenge presented by the economic and political crisis. The article was reprinted as a pamphlet. A more searching and thorough treatment is found in Samuel C. Kincheloe, "Research Memorandum on Religion in the Depression," in Social Science Research Council *Bulletin*, no. 33 (1937) containing "Studies in the Social Aspects of the Depression." These consider church membership and attendance, finances, the clergy, "secularization," the message of the churches, their programs and activities, regional variations, and effects of the depression upon the local church. The impact of the economic and social situation upon the general character of religious life is considered at length in C. Luther Fry, "Changes in Religious Organizations," in *Recent Social Trends in the United States* (New York, 1933, 2 vols.) in Vol. 2, pp. 1009–1060.

The social stresses and spiritual needs of the depression stimulated much searching of heart regarding the effectiveness of religious leadership. A most forthright treatment of this subject, although limited to one denomination, might be applied to other "standard" Anglo-American Protestant denominations: Joseph Van Vleck, *Our Changing Churches; a Study of Church Leadership* (New York, 1937), which is written from a sociological viewpoint, and originated in an extensive survey of Methodist churches in New York City and an adjacent suburban county. It very frankly handles factors that are often ignored by the clergy but are important to laymen, describing leadership as produced by interaction among ministers, members, and outsiders, with the background of seminary traditions, and of secular life as it affects members.

The depression and World War II compelled also a recast-

ing of thought about administration and support of religion. The literature on administration during those periods is summarized conveniently in a bibliography by Everett C. Herrick: "Church Administration," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin,* Vol. 42, no. 2 (Jan. 1950), pp. 5–7, with brief notes. It comprises finance, pastoral leadership and work, expansion, business, the church school, parents and education, visual aids, voluntary labor, the church building, effective urban ministry, rural churches, stewardship, older people, young people, and the small church. Support is exhaustively investigated in a well-documented study by Luther Phillip Powell, "The Growth and Development of the Motives and Methods of Church Support with Special Emphasis upon the American Churches" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1951).

There are some scientific investigations of religious sociology of various types of communities and classes of people. Robert S. Lynd, and Helen Merrill Lynd, *Middletown, a Study in Contemporary American Culture* (New York, 1930) has a chapter on religion in the sociological setting of a small industrial city, and studies parish life and its religious and social characteristics and motivations. Their *Middletown in Transition* (New York, c.1937) is a continuation of *Middletown* (1930), with references to religio-sociological changes, viewing the effects of economic depression, in ch. VIII. The Lynds noticed a tendency toward marked ethnic and social differentiation in the churches of an industrial city. These differences and tensions are sociologically examined in Kenneth W. Underwood, *Protestant and Catholic Religious and Social Interactions in an Industrial Community* (Boston, 1957).

The industrial town, with the working and the owning and managerial classes living in fairly close proximity, has become in considerable measure a retreating social phenomenon. The rise of the suburbs, tending to concentrate the "white-collar" and managerial classes in a predominantly Protestant community, has produced a new type of religio-social study.

Phases of this emergent aspect are noticed in David Reisman, *The Organization Man* (New York, 1956), which has a remarkable chapter on religion in "Suburbia," with a critique of the social organization of religion in suburban parishes, often an accentuation of the identification of types of religion with social classes. Beyond Suburbia still lies the countryside, where churches have peculiar parish and community problems. These are discussed at length in ch. 22 of Howard W. Odum, *American Social Problems* (New York, 1939), on modern and rural churches. A later and more complete study of the country church is James West, *Plainville, U.S.A.* (New York, 1945), which in ch. 4 studies a "small contemporary American rural community," and its reactions to the "constant stream of traits and influences pouring into it from the cities and from more 'modern' farming communities." The Southern situation is very thoroughly investigated in a study published for North Carolina University, Institute for Research in Social Science: *Church and Community in the South* (Richmond, 1949), with illustrations, and essays on rural and urban areas, and church-community relationships.

The rise of the Social Gospel, especially, brought to light the too frequent failure of the churches (particularly Protestant churches) to avail themselves of the vast reservoir of power among laymen. The untapped resources and the opportunities for laymen's service were disclosed in William B. Patterson's extensive study, *Modern Church Brotherhoods; a Survey of the Practical Activities of the Churchmen's Clubs and Brotherhoods* (New York and Chicago, 1911). Although descriptive of work in the Episcopal Church, the book was a challenge to all Christian laymen. Another study, similar in purpose, and addressed to laymen of all faiths, is Carl Delos Case, *Men and the Church* (Philadelphia and Boston, 1914), issued by the American Baptist Publication Society. Characteristic of the effort to enlist the lapsed, inactive, or indifferent laymen are William Figley Weir, *Giving the Men a Chance* (Chicago, c.1931) and Ford G. Birchard, *Out of*

the Rut, a Layman's Point of View (Boston, c.1931). Desire to win greater interest among men involved the task of educating and training them to assume leadership. The effort to meet the challenge is described by three notable and lengthy studies, all of which contain bibliographies of pertinent literature: Ernest Eugene Elliott, *The Problem of Lay Leadership* (New York and Chicago, c.1914); Leo Vaughn Barker, *Lay Leadership in Protestant Churches* (New York, 1934); and Gerrit Verkuyl, *Qualifying Men for Church Work* (New York and Chicago, c.1927).

The participation of women in church work, always taken more or less for granted, has not been intensively studied until recently, from the viewpoint of its influence in the church itself and in society. One of the best surveys is Inez M. Cavert's *Women in American Church Life; a Study Prepared under the Guidance of a Counseling Committee of Women Representing National Interdenominational Agencies* (New York, 1949), published for the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America. Other more recent and highly informative studies are: Mossie Allman Wyker, *Church Women in the Scheme of Things* (St. Louis, 1953) and Charles Caldwell Ryrie, *The Place of Women in the Church* (New York, 1958). The vast contribution of women to church activities, including social work, appears clearly in many manuals, such as: Frederick Alfred Agar, *Church Women at Work* (Philadelphia and Boston, 1937); Jane Kirk, *Group Activities for Church Women* (New York, 1954), illustrated; and Carolyn Philips Blackwood, *How to be an Effective Church Woman*, with an introduction by Andrew W. Blackwood (Philadelphia, 1955), based upon questionnaires sent to ministers, women lay workers, and women seeking church work. A general and very effective bibliography is Janette E. Newhall, comp., "Women in the Church," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 44, no. 2 (Jan. 1952), pp. 4–7, with good short notes. This suggests readings on the struggle for equality in the modern church, vocations

of women, their place in the ordained ministry, home and foreign missions, ministers' wives, and women at worship.

Robert Harder, "The Ministry of the Laity in the World and the Whole People of God," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 51, no. 1 (Nov. 1958), pp. 5–11, has books and articles respecting signs of a new type of laymen's and women's ministry.

A good study of familial religion occurs in Ray E. Baber, "Religion and the Family," in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol. 256 (Mar. 1948), pp. 92–100. An excellent list of references of recent date, on this topic, is in Wesner Fallaw, comp., "Strengthening Family Life," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 45, no. 1 (Oct. 1952), pp. 4–7. Annotated, it includes "Religion in the Home."

F. Special Ministries

The rise of the Social Gospel and of better methods of religious education, around the turn of the century, led the churches to regard children as a special ministry. One of the most complete early expressions of the new attitude is James Atkins, *The Kingdom in the Cradle* (Nashville, Tenn. and Dallas, Tex., 1905), issued by the Publishing House of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, with essays on all aspects of the problem of reaching children with a religious message. Another evidence of the awakened interest, including sermons to children and a bibliography, is Henry Woodward Hulbert, *The Church and Her Children* (New York and Chicago, c.1912).

There are many modern references on the ministry to children. One of the best, expressing a sense of the pastoral responsibility as "lived" by the authors, is Mildred Olivia (Moody) Eakin and Frank Eakin, *The Pastor and the Children* (New York, 1947), with reading suggestions and source references. Other good references are: Frank Guy Coleman,

The Romance of Winning Children (Cleveland, 1948); Gaines Stanley Dobbins, *Winning the Children* (Nashville, 1953); and Phillips Henderson, *Our Children and Evangelism* (Philadelphia, 1955), illustrated. A rapidly growing literature regarding religious appeal to boys is well represented by Dimmock Steeves, *Reaching Boys with a Christian Program* (Chicago, 1943), illustrated. One of the most effective types of appeal is through the Boy Scout troop. The approach of many parishes is illustrated by a guide issued by the National Protestant Committee on Scouting: *The Scouting Program in Protestant Churches; a Manual Showing how the Protestant Churches and the Boy Scouts of America can work together in the Interest of the Boy Membership of the Church* (New York, c.1951), issued by the Boy Scouts of America, with illustrations.

The first concerted effort to establish a particular ministry to youth and young people arose from the great revival movements of the 1850's in the rapidly growing cities, where young people tended to drift away from the churches and from all religious influences. The results were the Y.M.C.A. and the Y.W.C.A., both founded in the 1850's. The history and accomplishments of the Y.M.C.A. are completely reviewed in Charles Howard Hopkins, *History of the Y.M.C.A. in North America* (New York, 1951). It has "Notes on the Sources," and "Footnotes" by chapters, including bibliographical notes. It is objective and definitive, based upon extensive research in original records of local associations and inter-association organizations, and portrays the origin and development of the movement with its background of American social, economic, intellectual, and religious history. The writer (sympathetic to but not involved in the organization) is the author also of *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism, 1865–1915*. Mary Sophia Stevens Sims, *The Natural History of a Social Institution—the Young Women's Christian Association* (New York, 1936) is a semi-official and objective study, giving the general history, 1855–1934, and chapters on rela-

tions to the women's movement, religion, and foreign work, largely derived from reports and resolutions of boards, committees, etc., with emphasis upon policy decisions. Although scientific in method and treatment, it is not sociologically deep. *International Survey of the Young Men's and Young Women's Christian Associations* (New York, The International Survey Committee, 1932) is a careful and objective study, and attempts a full appraisal of the work done by the organizations in foreign countries—general history, personnel, finance, philosophy, interreligious problems, and "indigenous" movements abroad.

The religious skepticism of the 1920's, and the economic trials of the 1930's, upset the religious convictions of a large segment of American youth. They suggested a more serious effort to ascertain the religious attitudes of youth, and to revise the churches' approach to the whole group. A typical study is one undertaken under Presbyterian auspices: Jacob Avery Long, *Young People and the Church: a Study of the Attitudes of 726 Pittsburgh Presbyterian Young People Toward the Church and its Program* (Philadelphia, c.1940), with bibliography. A similar study, based upon a questionnaire sampling of 1,935 youths and interviews with 100, was edited by Murray G. Ross as *Religious Beliefs of Youth: a Study and Analysis of the Structure and Function of the Religious Beliefs of Young Adults* . . . Foreword by Gordon W. Allport (New York, 1950), with a bibliography.

The outcome of such studies, together with the rising concern about juvenile delinquency, has directly inspired a very extensive literature on church youth programs. Among the more significant recent titles, mainly of Protestant origins, are: Herbert Carleton Mayer, *Young People in Your Church, on Building a Program* (Westwood, N.J., 1953); Rowena Ferguson, *Youth and the Christian Community* (Nashville, 1954); Lawrence M. Reese, *Youth Work in Today's Church* (Philadelphia, 1956); Henry N. Tani, *Ventures in Youth Work* (Philadelphia, 1957); and Vincent J. Giese, *Patterns*

for Teenagers (Chicago, 1956), with illustrations. The intention of youth work in preventing delinquency is treated in Robert Webb and Muriel Webb, *The Churches and Juvenile Delinquency* (New York, 1957); Guy L. Roberts, *How the Church Can Help Where Delinquency Begins* (Richmond, 1957); and C. Kilmer Myers, *Light the Dark Streets* (Greenwich, Conn., 1957).

Religious ministry to young adults has taken a steadily larger place in the thought of the churches, and is discussed in the following representative selections: Mark Leo Rippy, *The Church Working with Young Adults* (Nashville, c.1938), with a bibliography; George Gleason, *Church Activities for Young Couples* (New York, 1949), with a bibliography; and his *Single Young Adults in the Church* (New York, 1952), issued by the National Board of Young Men's Christian Associations. A special field, long rather neglected, is completely covered by *Youth Work in the Rural Church*, by Mark Rich, Mossie Allman Wyker, Mary Heald Williamson, and others (St. Louis, Mo., c.1940), illustrated, with a bibliography.

There are a few comprehensive accounts of Protestant ministry to youth. Probably the best earlier one is Myron Taggart Hopper, *Young People's Work in Protestant Churches in the United States* (Chicago, 1941, pp. 260–283, lithoprinted), part of a doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1938, with bibliographical footnotes. The best recent study was issued by the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America, Bureau of Research and Survey: *A Study of Youth Work in Protestant Churches*, by Helen F. Spaulding and Olga Haley, produced for the Committee on Youth Work, National Council of Churches.

A typical Roman Catholic youth program is completely described, with a bibliography, in Brother Augustine McCaffrey's *Youth in a Catholic Parish* (Washington, D.C., The Catholic University of America, 1941), with illustrations. The basic principles underlying the Roman Catholic youth

program have been gathered into a collection: Catholic Church, Pope, *The Popes on Youth; Principles for Forming and Guiding Youth from Popes Leo XIII to Pius XII*, compiled and edited by Raymond B. Fullam (New York, c.1956).

Ministry to the inmates of prisons, jails, workhouses, and reformatories began early in the national history, and by the middle of the nineteenth century had become a well-recognized ministry of the churches. An excellent review of this ministry is comprised in a scholarly work by J. Arthur Hoyles, *Religion in Prison* (New York, 1955). This has a bibliography of general and historical references, memoirs, psychological studies, and religious works. He refers to American conditions since William Penn's experiments with prisons in Pennsylvania, and has notes on the prison chaplaincy and religious services, religion and prison reform, punishment and rehabilitation, and provides a good background for the entire subject.

James Bradley Finley's *Memorials of Prison Life*, edited by the Rev. B. F. Tefft, D.D. (Cincinnati, 1850), with illustrations, relates experiences during his first years as a chaplain at the Ohio State Penitentiary. A similar narrative was written by Hosea Quinby, who ministered as a chaplain in the New Hampshire State Prison: *The Prison Chaplaincy, and Its Experiences* (Concord, N.H., 1873). The evangelistic approach, together with suggestions for prison reform, appears in John Josiah Munro's *Christ in the Tombs; or, a Square Deal for the Man in Stripes, A Plea for the Preaching of the Old Gospel in Prison* (Brooklyn, N.Y., The Author, c.1917), with illustrations. References to the part of religion in prison life appear also in Frank Tannenbaum's story of Thomas Mott Osborne (1859–1926), a warden and a reformer of prison methods: *Osborne of Sing Sing, with an Introduction by Hon. Franklin D. Roosevelt* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1933). Another excellent account is Louis John Bown, *Gates of Dannemora* (Garden City, N.Y., 1951). Among the best recent accounts are A. Roy Beasley, *In Prison . . . and Visited Me, by a*

Prison Parson . . . as Told to Ewart A. Autry (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1952); and George Lavelle Murphy, "The Social Role of the Prison Chaplain" (Thesis, University of Pittsburgh; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich. (1957), pub. no. 18,251; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 17 (1957), no. 5, p. 1142), with a bibliography.

Chaplain service to the mentally ill, a ministry increasingly emphasized by the churches, is described from the Roman Catholic viewpoint in John Joseph Humensky's *Chaplain Service in a Mental Hospital* (Washington, D.C., The Catholic University of America, 1937), with a bibliography. Huey E. Snell, *My Ministry in a Mental Hospital* (Wichita Falls? Tex., c.1958) is by a Protestant chaplain. The value of religious ministrations to the mentally ill is professionally discussed by Anton Theophilus, in *The Exploration of the Inner World; a Study of Mental Disorder and Religious Experience* (Chicago and New York, 1936).

In its comparatively short existence, radio and television evangelism has accounted for an extensive literature. Most of it is in the field of guidance in methods, with only occasional references to the history of this ministry. Nearly all the publications contain bibliographies for further reading. Among the most useful titles are: Samuel Franklin Lowe, *Successful Religious Broadcasting . . . with an Introduction by the Honorable Walter F. George* (Atlanta, Ga., 1945); Wendell Phillips Loveless, *Manual of Gospel Broadcasting* (Chicago, 1946), with illustrations and a bibliography; Everett C. Parker, *Religious Radio; What to do and How,* with Elinor Inman [and] Ross Snyder (New York, 1948), with "Reference material," and his *The Television-radio Audience and Religion* [with] David W. Barry [and] Dallas W. Smythe (New York, 1955), with bibliography and bibliographical footnotes; Wendell K. Freeman, *Why Not Broadcast the Gospel? Radio Broadcasting Methods, Sermons, Questions* (1952), with illustrations; Clayton T. Griswold and Charles H. Schmitz, comps., *Broadcasting Religion* (New

York, c.1954, rev. enl. ed.), illustrated, with a bibliography, issued by the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A., Broadcasting and Film Commission; James E. Kinsey, *How to Conduct Religious Radio Programs* (St. Louis, 1958), part of a bachelor of divinity dissertation, School of Religion, Butler University; and Mary Agnes (Tynan) Schroeder, *Catholics, Meet the "Mike," a Radio Workbook Giving Professional Guidance to the Amateur . . . with an Introduction by Daniel A. Lord, S.J.* (St. Louis, Mo., The Queen's Workshop of the Air, the Queen's Work, 1944), with illustrations and a bibliography. The field of television is adequately covered in Charles Henry Schmitz, *Religious Television Program Ideas: Counseling, Demonstration, Devotional, Dramatic, Interview, News, Quiz* [and] *General* (New York, 1953), issued by the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A., Broadcasting and Film Commission.

The ministry of radio and television has been helpful especially to many shut-in, sick, and aged people, whose dependence upon religious service is discussed in George Gleason, *Horizons for Older People* (New York, 1956).

II. RELIGION AND THE LAW

A. Church and State: Free Churches in a Free State

EVER since the era of disestablishment, the separation of church and state, or religious freedom, has generally been held by most Americans to be a cardinal national principle. But in fact the separation never has been and is not complete. In several respects the churches enjoy the privileges of public institutions, such as tax exemption and occasional educational provisions. These privileges sometimes result in conflicting claims, and raise embarrassing questions, such as the role of churches in a national state with which they have no organic relation, and their efforts to "spiritualize the secu-

lar," and to modify the ethics of national interest with the ethics of Jesus Christ, and to shape the democratic idealism of the community at large.

1. THE RISE OF THE DOCTRINE OF SEPARATION. Frank Stanton Burns Gavin, *Seven Centuries of the Problem of Church and State* (Princeton, N.J., 1938), with bibliographical notes with the chapters, consists of lectures covering the period from the Emperor Justinian to Thomas Aquinas, but is projected into the problems and conflicts of twentieth-century America, discussed in a very objective and scholarly manner. It alludes to four solutions: parity of powers, theocracy, independence of the church, and state superiority. The impact of these theories upon America perhaps has never been more thoroughly and intelligently studied than in Evarts Boutell Greene, *Religion and the State; the Making and Testing of an American Tradition* (New York and London, c.1941), with "Bibliographical Notes." The subject is not of purely antiquarian interest, because in various ways it is involved in political and social issues that produce disagreement. The author reviews the long background of present theory and practice in the colonies and the nation, and in the older societies of Europe that determined early American attitudes and practice. The question has been rendered acute by the rise of totalitarian states and by the vast expansion of governmental functions and the increase of nationalism. The study is closely packed and heavily documented, and for the contemporary period stresses questions regarding education and freedom of conscience.

The colonial tradition of state-churchism, from which American practice widely departed, is described in two scholarly essays. A. B. Seidman, "Church and State in the Early Years of the Massachusetts Bay Colony," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 18 (June 1945), pp. 211–233, studies the close association of church and state in an American theocracy, which was broken by the rise of the doctrine of separation. Reba Carolyn Strickland, *Religion and the State in Georgia*

in the Eighteenth Century (New York, 1939) reviews a typical example of the association of church and state under an Anglican legal establishment, and the resulting restlessness and longing for separation. Separation became an actuality in the Revolutionary era, and the contemporary theory is clarified by Richard J. Hooker's study, "John Dickinson on Church and State," in *American Literature*, Vol. 16, no. 2 (May 1945), pp. 82–98, a documented review of the emergent theory of separation of church and state. A full discussion of the development of the principle is given by Loren Peter Beth's "Church and State in American Political Theory" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1949; typewritten, and microfilm by University of Chicago Libraries); also in his *The American Theory of Church and State* (Gainesville, Fla., 1958), with a bibliography.

The doctrine of separation has never implied a lack of sympathy between church and state. That the United States has flourished without a state church but with morally influential religion is maintained by many authorities. The following three are fairly representative: Thomas J. Vaiden, *America Vindicated from European Theologico-Political and Infidel Aspersions* (New York, 1855) is a formidable defense of the "American Way" of voluntary churches not connected with government but morally influential, against both European state-churchism and the sharp criticism of non-religious rationalists. Even more convincing is Isaac Amada Cornelison, *The Relation of Religion to Civil Government in the United States of America; a State without a Church, but not without a Religion* (New York, 1895). David Josiah Brewer, *The United States a Christian Nation* (Philadelphia, 1905) consists of three lectures, in the first of which a former Associate Justice of the United States Supreme Court endeavors to prove the point by citing court decisions, colonial charters, state constitutions and laws, and popular sentiment and practice. Alvin Walter Johnson, *Separation of Church and*

State in the United States (Minneapolis, 1948) is a revised and enlarged edition of his *The Legal Status of Church-State Relationships in the United States*, emphasizing especially the effect of the doctrine of separation upon secular and religious education.

2. THE DOCTRINE OF SEPARATION IN LAW. Anson Phelps Stokes, *Church and State in the United States* (New York, 1950, 3 vols.), with a critical and classified selected bibliography in Vol. 3, is the first comprehensive treatment of the subject, intended as a survey of the present-day points of friction, with adequate quotations from existing laws and relevant court decisions, and authoritative utterances on both sides of the questions involved, with historical background. The material is arranged for "case study," or as an arsenal of arguments in favor of defending and applying to current and future problems the principles of religious freedom embodied in the Constitution and the Bill of Rights. Much of the material was selected from little known books and pamphlets. This should be supplemented by Mark De Wolfe Howe, *Cases on Church and State in the United States* (Cambridge, 1952). The first part is concerned with the disestablishment of state churches, particularly in Virginia and Massachusetts, memorials, remonstrances, defense of minorities, acts for religious freedom, court cases, etc. The second deals with the church as a corporation holding property. The third is on the effect of ecclesiastical adjudications. Part Four deals with police powers. The fifth is on education, including religion in the public schools. Carl Frederick Gustav Zollmann, *American Church Law* (St. Paul, 1933) is a well-edited compilation of the laws and judicial decisions bearing on religious bodies as corporations, and covering tax exemption, ownership of property, religious education, civil rights of church officers, religious liberty, and similar matters. It is invaluable as a book of legal reference, citing nearly 2,500 cases, with dates, court records, summaries, and quotations.

The constitutional history of church and state relations is competently reviewed by Robert Kemp Morton, *God in the Constitution* (Nashville, c.1933), with a bibliography.

3. THE PROTESTANT ATTITUDE. Edwin E. Aubrey, "Church and State in Contemporary Protestant Thought with Special Reference to the American Scene," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 29, no. 3 (July 1949), pp. 171–180, gives a brief scholarly summation of Protestant views in the twentieth century. William Adams Brown, *Church and State in Contemporary America; a Study of the Problems they Present and the Principles Which Should Determine their Relationship* . . . (New York, 1936), with a classified bibliography, represents the liberal Protestant effort to define the problem of the relations between church and state and its historical context. He reviews the issues, their origins, the attitude of different groups and individuals toward them, the alternatives for action, the questions of conscience and of expediency. The conflict between church and state results from different views of the nature and life of man. Leo Pfeffer, *Church, State, and Freedom* (Boston, 1953), with a bibliography, presents the viewpoint of Unitarian liberal Protestantism.

Frank Joseph Klingberg, *A Free Church in a Free State, America's Unique Contribution* (Indianapolis, 1947) has bibliographical footnotes, and voices the attitude of an Episcopalian scholar and historian. S. Parkes Cadman, *Christianity and the State* (New York, 1924) illustrates the typically American attempt to reconcile ethical and political obligations. Conrad Henry Moehlman, *The Catholic-Protestant Mind; Some Aspects of Religious Liberty in the United States* (New York and London, 1929), with bibliographical footnotes, has been criticized for lack of historical perspective, but has a valuable sketch of the Church's relations to temporal government, a contribution to better understanding of this much-controverted issue. Winthrop Still Hudson, *The Great Tradition of the American Churches* (New York, 1953) dis-

cusses church and state at length, from the classical viewpoint of Protestantism.

The uncompromising conservative and anti-Catholic attitude is voiced by Conrad Henry Moehlman, *The Wall of Separation Between Church and State; an Historical Study of Recent Criticism of the Religious Clause of the First Amendment* (Boston, 1951), with bibliography. He gives special attention to the controversy over state aid to private religious schools. The same uncompromising spirit appears in *Church and State* (May 15, 1948–) monthly, irregular, the organ of the "P.O.A.U.," published at first (May 1948–July 1952) as *Church and State Newsletter,* with indexes for Vols. 1–5 in Vol. 5. The organization, "Protestants and Other Americans United for Separation of Church and State," has constituted itself as the guardian of the principle. Its leaders are listed in *Who's Who in the P.O.A.U.* (Huntington, Ind.). Joseph Martin Dawson, *Separate Church and State Now* (New York, 1948), by the recording secretary of the "P.O.A.U.," opposes financial aid to religious private schools, and a United States representative at the Vatican, and expresses the straight free-church tradition, regarding the Roman Catholic view of the church-state relation as a threat to separation, which is the only way to preserve civil and religious liberties.

Only a few competent studies have been written on the attitudes of particular denominations respecting separation of church and state. Because of its very great social and political prestige, the attitude of the Presbyterian Church always has been influential. It is exhaustively investigated by William Barr McAlpin, "Presbyterians and the Relation of Church and State: An Interpretation of the Pronouncements Made in the Meetings of the General Assemblies of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A., As Recorded in the Journal of the General Assembly, 1789–1953" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1954; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 14, no. 9 (1954), pp. 1469–1470; *University Microfilms,* Ann

Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 7993). This relates especially to the Federal government, and includes Sabbath observance, temperance, slavery, civil liberty, the attitude toward war, conscription, conscientious objectors, education, minorities, religious and civil freedom in other nations, economic and industrial conditions. A similar valuable study is Gordon Lichty Shull, "The Presbyterian Church in American Politics; a Study in Contemporary Church-State Relations" (Doctoral dissertation, with bibliography, University of Illinois; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 15,270; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 16 (1956), no. 2, pp. 369–370). This describes the practice of the Presbyterian Church, U.S.A., in public policy making, with respect to political, economic, and social policies, in direct lobbying, group study, and action in the local church. He concludes that only a small minority of ministers and people were really active. Harold Lehman Lunger, "The Political Ethics of Alexander Campbell" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1949) points to the uneasy blending of left-wing Protestantism and Lockean natural rights philosophy in this Disciples leader, in his view of church-state relations. He represents the emergence, from sectarianism, of a characteristic American denominational type of political orientation, seeking a modus vivendi with the state but critical of it. Therald N. Jensen, *Mormon Theory of Church and State* (Chicago, 1940) is an abstract of a doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1938, reproduced from a typewritten copy, and with bibliographical footnotes.

4. THE CATHOLIC DOCTRINE OF THE STATE. The Roman Catholic doctrine of the state has a peculiar significance in the United States because, unlike the Protestant churches, the Roman Church is an international body. It must, therefore, take a different view of national allegiance. This fact lies at the base of some of the conflicts between Catholicism and Protestantism in the United States. The following titles suggest the importance of specific Catholic doctrines respecting

nationalism, the authority of the state over the church, and the theory of political structure.

Christopher Dawson, *Religion and the Modern State* (New York, 1936), especially in ch. VIII, "The Catholic Doctrine of the State," defines the traditional view of the church-state relationship. Father C. Lattey, ed., *Church and State* (London, 1936) includes particular issues defined by Catholic doctrine, as discussed by several authors: H. Outram Evennet, "Authority and the Moral Order"; John Eppstein, "The Totalitarian State"; and Alphonsos Bonnar, "The Claims of the Church." William Adams Brown, *Church and State in Contemporary America* (New York, 1936) gives an objective summary of the Catholic theory by a Protestant theologian.

Catholic apologists have repeatedly asserted the compatibility of the church's doctrine with the American ideal of church-state constitutional relations, and in fact have claimed that a Catholic-founded province—Maryland—was the first to achieve the principle, as in Matthew Page Andrews, "Separation of Church and State in Maryland," in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 21, no. 2 (July 1935), pp. 165–176. This scholarly study is based on official archives and other source material, and discusses various interpretations of the "Act Concerning Religion" of 1649. Under the guidance of George Calvert, probably a reader of St. Thomas More's *Utopia*, the functions of church and state were separated. Francis E. McMahon, "Orestes Brownson on Church and State," in *Theological Studies*, Vol. 15 (1945), pp. 175–228, points out that the noted convert accepted the American democratic principle of separation, and tried to adjust Catholic doctrine to it, maintaining that Catholicism was not a menace to American freedom.

This line of argument has been followed by modern American Roman Catholic writers, to meet the current attacks by secularists and by certain sections of the Protestant press. Typical of these efforts is an essay by Vincent F. Holden,

"Church and State in America," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 166, no. 993 (Dec. 1947), pp. 247–253. He addresses "non-Catholics who, in all good faith, see the Catholic Church as a threat to the American form of life." American Catholics are committed to "mutual co-ordination" of church and state. The American system is not condemned by the Pope or the congregations, and Catholics are satisfied with the church-state situation. Wilfred Parsons, *The First Freedom, Considerations on Church and State in the United States*, with a Foreword by Francis P. Keough (New York, 1948) takes much the same stand. William Macdonough Agar, a Roman Catholic scientist, in *Where Do Catholics Stand?* (New York, c.1941), Vol. 4 in the series, "America in a World at War," defines the relationship between church and state, and rallies Catholics to defense of the Christian way as opposed to the secular totalitarian state represented by Nazism.

Two Roman Catholic authorities on law have expressed interesting opinions concerning the more recent decisions of the Supreme Court in religious freedom cases. Joseph Hugh Brady, *Confusion Twice Confounded; the First Amendment and the Supreme Court, an Historical Study* (South Orange, N.J., 1955, 2nd ed.) comments on the prohibition of legislation establishing religion, with reference to the contradiction between the decisions of the Supreme Court in the Everson (parochial school bus fare) and McCollum (released time) cases, by a skillful arrangement of historical and factual data. F. William O'Brien, *Justice Reed and the First Amendment: the Religious Clauses* (Washington, 1958), with bibliography and a table of cases cited, discusses learnedly the share of an Associate Justice of the Supreme Court in moulding the more recent view of the Court, that the due process clause of the Fourteenth Amendment applies to states as well as the Federal government in cases of religious liberty. The amendment incorporates the first amendment regarding religious liberty and the prohibition of the establishment of religion.

B. The Rise of Religious Freedom

Sanford Hoadley Cobb, *The Rise of Religious Liberty in America; A History* (New York, 1902) has a bibliography, and is a systematic narrative of the historical development by which, after a long conflict, American civil law decreed complete liberty of conscience and worship. The story extends from the beginning of colonial settlement to the adoption of the Federal and state constitutions providing for religious liberty, and the disestablishment of the churches. The author traces the influences and events which brought the United States to a "unique solution of the world-old problem of Church and State—a solution so unique, so far-reaching, and so markedly diverse from European principles as to constitute the most striking contribution of America to the science of government." Sidney E. Mead, "The American People: Their Space, Time, and Religion," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 34, no. 4 (Oct. 1954), pp. 244–255, holds that the outstanding accomplishment of American religion is religious freedom and its outstanding failure is theological structure. These are reexamined in terms of the view that, in the formation of the American mind and spirit, space has overshadowed time. Another excellent philosophical discussion is Joseph Martin Dawson, *America's Way in Church, State, and Society* (New York, 1953), which includes bibliography.

The attainment of the "way" was a long and often painful process, which began in fierce struggles in the mother country. These are related in W. K. Jordan, *The Development of Religious Toleration in England from the Accession of James I to the Convention of the Long Parliament (1603–1640)* (London, 1936). This provides a rich background for consideration of the problem in the American Colonies. Clinton Rossiter, *Seedtime of the Republic* (New York, 1953) includes a brief but searching examination of colonial religion, and the rise of liberty of religious belief and worship before the Revolution. The colonial struggle for liberty was led by

many individuals. A few are appreciated in Roland Herbert Bainton, *The Travail of Religious Liberty, Nine Biographical Studies* (Philadelphia, 1951), a well-written study by an eminent specialist, which includes American champions of religious freedom. A typical leader, little known until recently, was Samuel Davies, whose career is related in George Henry Bost, "Samuel Davies: Colonial Revivalist and Champion of Religious Toleration" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1942, published in part by University of Chicago Libraries, Chicago, Ill., 1944, reproduced from typewritten copy), with bibliographical footnotes. Davies was a leader in the Southern phase of the Great Awakening and in the spread of the Presbyterian Church in the South, also in opposition to the established Episcopal Church. An example of the colonial struggle against state-churchism and religious intolerance took place in North Carolina. The story is related by Stephen B. Weeks, in *The Religious Development in the Province of North Carolina* (Baltimore, 1892). He considers in detail the effort to impose the state Church of England upon the religious diversity of North Carolina, and the resulting battle for religious freedom. J. Moss Ives, *The Ark and the Dove, The Beginning of Civil and Religious Liberties in America* (New York, 1936) is sympathetic with the Roman Catholic claim that the Maryland colony founded by Calvert was the first experiment in religious freedom in America.

The movement toward disestablishment of state-churchism gained headway during and after the Revolution. But the basis of the campaign was firmly laid in the colonial period. Thomas Cuming Hall, *The Religious Background of American Culture* (Boston, 1930) refers to tendencies toward the disestablishment of state churches, and toward religious liberty, inherent in the character of the colonial churches. The progress of the disestablishment campaign is chronicled and explained by Francis Joseph Thorning, *Religious Liberty in Transition; a Study of the Removal of Constitutional Limitations on Religious Liberty as Part of the Social Progress in the*

Transition Period (Washington, D.C., 1931), with selected bibliography. He emphasizes the slow growth of religious liberty in the states, 1789–1833, in a step-by-step analysis, reviewing the debate, the constitutional provisions and the laws, the conservative and liberal leaders. He concludes that the result was due to political opportunism rather than to religious conviction. Arthur M. Schlesinger, Jr., *The Age of Jackson* (Boston, 1945) has a brief discussion referring particularly to the Jacksonian period, on religious intolerance and freedom, showing that the attainment of true religious liberty was still far from complete. This fact is emphasized by the notorious case of Abner Kneeland, studied by Leonard W. Levy, in "Satan's Last Apostle in Massachusetts," in *American Quarterly*, Vol. 5, no. 1 (Spring, 1953), pp. 16–30, with bibliographical footnotes. He narrates Kneeland's trial and imprisonment for blasphemy in the 1830's, and his establishment of the utopian community of Free Inquirers in Iowa. The real issue was whether or not religious beliefs should be supported by penal law.

That the question of religious liberty is still not entirely quieted in the United States, is evident from many recent books and essays. M. Searle Bates, *Religious Liberty: An Inquiry* (New York and London, 1945), with a large bibliography, was inspired by the evident weakening of the tradition of religious liberty over large areas. The problem is seen in its historical and contemporary settings, including the United States, and the writer concludes with proposals to promote the ideal by preaching, teaching, and legislation. Merrimon Cuninggim's *Freedom's Holy Light* (New York, 1955) has "Notes," bibliographical references, and "Suggested Readings." This effort to promote a better understanding of the origin and nature of religious freedom sees the true relation of church and state as "organic disconnection and sympathetic association," with supremacy of conscience and freedom of worship. Religious freedom is the focus of all freedoms. A similar contemporary discussion of the unsolved

problem is Edwin R. Spann, "The Freedom of the Church and the Freedom of the Citizen," in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 25, no. 2 (Spring, 1956), pp. 205–216. Fund for the Republic, *Religion and the Free Society,* by William Lee Miller and others (New York, 1958) is devoted largely to a discussion of actual religious liberty in America. (See also Part Two, sect. II, B, *Reaction against the State Churches.*)

C. Tolerance and Intolerance

Gustavus Myers, *History of Bigotry in the United States* (New York, 1943), with bibliographical footnotes, without partisan aim, exposes the deep-seated causes and the effects of religious intolerance. He shows that while the outbursts of bigotry are spasmodic, the causes are always operative, and that times of crisis and tension suddenly render them terribly effective. A full knowledge of the facts is essential to combat them. In themselves, the *constitutional guarantees of full religious freedom are not enough,* and education is necessary. Everett Ross Clinchy, *All in the Name of God* (New York, 1934), with bibliography, is by a nationally known Presbyterian minister, who in 1928 became director of the National Conference of Jews and Christians. His purpose was to explain the fundamentals of group conduct among Protestants, Catholics, and Jews. The relations cannot be understood purely as ethical or moral problems, for they demand intelligent approach in the spirit of historical method. We must understand the group attitudes inherited from Europe. The later chapters indicate ways of dealing with intercultural adjustments as suggested by social scientists. Clarence Edwin Silcox, *Catholics, Jews and Protestants: a Study of Relationships in the United States and Canada* (New York and London, 1934) for the Institute of Social and Religious Research, is based on a series of community case studies on interfaith relationships and examines forces making for isola-

tion, indifference and difficulties, also social forces tending to create understanding and greater cooperation.

The efforts of leaders to promote greater understanding and tolerance are represented by studies written by two Roman Catholics, a Jew, and a liberal Protestant. Gustave Weigel, *Faith and Understanding in America* (New York, 1959) is a group of essays and lectures by a noted Roman Catholic, on the relations between Roman Catholics and Protestants. Gerald B. Phelan, "Group Relations as a Philosophical and Theological Problem," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 5, 1944 (New York, 1945), pp. 561–576, with comment, sees the solution in the law of love, which is the moral aspect of the problem considered from the theological viewpoint, and in prayer; all men are one in the mystical body of Christ. Ira Eisenstein, *The Ethics of Tolerance Applied to Religious Groups in America* (New York, 1941) has a selected bibliography, and is a Jewish approach to the subject. Leo Pfeffer, *Creeds in Competition; a Creative Force in American Culture* (New York, 1958) expresses the liberal Protestant view that diversity of religious belief need not lead to intolerance and isolation, and may be the motive to a richer cultural pluralism. (See also sect. 1, B, 2, *Group-Mindedness and Cultural Pluralism,* above.)

D. Documentary Sources and Judicial Decisions

1. DOCUMENTARY SOURCES. Joseph Leon Blau, ed., *Cornerstones of Religious Freedom in America* (Boston, 1949) has bibliographical references in "Notes," and a "List of Sources." The editor believes that freedom of religion has been comparatively neglected in current discussions of freedom. He compiled this volume to clarify the meaning of the term, by including some clear statements by American champions of religious liberty, prefacing each major group of statements

by an interpretation to define the stage of the drama. A like motive inspired a similar compilation by William Addison Blakely: *American State Papers and Related Documents on Freedom in Religion* (Washington, published for the Religious Liberty Association by the *Review and Herald*, 1949). This "sets forth the true American idea of the absolute separation of church and state." It includes many state documents, early colonial religious laws still in state statute books, important Federal and State Supreme Court decisions upholding the constitutional guaranties of civil and religious liberty, the origin and history of compulsory Sunday-observance legislation, and documents concerning religious persecutions. There are also statements on the struggle for complete separation of church and state in the critical period of formation of the Federal government. His *Legislative, Executive, Judicial American State Papers Bearing on Sunday Legislation* (New York and Washington, National Religious Liberty Association, 1891) has a thorough index and a historical introduction, and is a source book of legislation and pronouncements by public men on religious freedom. It includes documents on Sunday mails, essays on civil government and religion, religion in the public schools, Christianity and the common law, the constitutionality of religious laws, and so on.

The student of American religious freedom should consult certain massive compilations of constitutional provisions and Federal and State laws. One of the best recent ones is by Conrad Henry Moehlman, comp.: *The American Constitutions and Religion; Religious References in the Charters of the Thirteen Colonies and the Constitutions of the Forty-eight States, a Sourcebook on Church and State in the United States* (Berne, Ind., 1938). A helpful commentary on the subject since colonial times is Daniel C. Donoghue, "Federal Constitutional Provisions with Respect to Religion," in *American Catholic Historical Society Records*, Vol. 39, no. 1 (Mar. 1928), pp. 1–26, which reviews colonial religious tests for

holding office, and the background of the First Amendment, differences regarding freedom of worship, toleration, the right to vote, the survival of office-holding tests in some of the early state constitutions, and cases respecting what constitutes prohibition of free exercise of religion. Charles Kettleborough, *The State Constitutions and the Federal Constitution and Organic Laws of the Territories and Other Colonial Dependencies of the United States of America* (Indianapolis, 1918) provides excellent source material for study of constitutional provisions regarding religious freedom. An early but still valuable compilation shows the stage of development in the mid-nineteenth century: Randon Hebbard Tyler, *American Ecclesiastical Law: the Law of Religious Societies, Church Government and Creeds, Disturbing Religious Meetings, and the Law of Burial Grounds in the United States, with Practical Forms* (Albany, 1866). Alpha Jefferson Kynett, *Laws and Forms Relating to Churches and Other Religious Societies; Being the Laws of the Several States and Territories Concerning Such Organizations*, etc. (New York, 1887) contains legal forms, an introduction on American religion and civil structure, the legal position of Christianity, and the relations between the civil and ecclesiastical societies. His *The Religion of the Republic, and Laws of Religious Corporations* (Cincinnati and New York, 1895) is a revision and enlargement of the first edition, 1887.

2. JUDICIAL DECISIONS. William George Torpey, *Judicial Doctrines of Religious Rights in America* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1948), with bibliography, begins with a historical analysis and includes the religious situation in the Spanish, French, and English colonies, early state constitutions and their revisions, the Federal Constitution and the First Amendment, the Fourteenth Amendment, the relation of Christianity to American law, and the part of the judiciary in defining religious rights. Clarence E. Martin, "The American Judiciary and Religious Liberty," in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 8, new ser., no. 1 (Apr. 1928), pp. 13–37, declares that courts

at all times have protected and perpetuated the right to worship, without peril to public safety or morals. The cases cited include freedom of worship, Christianity as a part of the common law, Sunday laws, religion and education, religious garb in public schools, church property, evidence in court, and the seal of the confessional. American Civil Liberties Union, *Religious Liberty in the U.S. Today; a Survey of the Restraints on Religious Freedom* (New York City, c.1939) was compiled by Edward Ford, assisted by Virgil Lowder and Amos B. Hulen. An excellent definition of what constitutes restraint appears in an essay by two members of the staff of the United States Department of Justice. Victor W. Rotnem and F. G. Folsom, Jr., "Recent Restrictions upon Religious Liberty," in *American Political Science Review*, Vol. 36, no. 6 (Dec. 1942), pp. 1053–1068, has many citations of cases in the notes. The authors review cases involving conscientious objection to saluting the flag, license taxes, and the conflict of religious and social interests. Within five years the Supreme Court "has added decisions of greater importance to the case law of religious freedom than had been accumulated in all the years since the adoption of the Bill of Rights." The decisions cited are important for "subordination of freedom of action based on sectarian beliefs to the restrictions of society as a whole." Clyde W. Summers, "The Sources and Limits of Religious Freedom," in *Illinois Law Review*, Vol. 41, no. 1 (May–June 1946), pp. 53–80, maintains that the historical argument for such freedom is the least useful, and that the political process argument is basically sound, but seldom applicable to religious freedom cases. The protection of minorities argument is by far the most effective. Religious activity is beyond judicial protection only when it creates extremely serious public danger.

3. THE JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES AND RELIGIOUS FREEDOM. The American idea of freedom of religion under Constitutional Law owes a great debt to this group, because their claims have obliged the courts, and especially the Supreme Court, to in-

vestigate more deeply the constitutional doctrines of freedom of religion under the First Amendment to the Federal Constitution.

The debt is emphasized in a long, detailed, and scholarly article by Edward F. Waite, "The Debt of Constitutional Law to Jehovah's Witnesses," in *Minnesota Law Review*, Vol. 28, no. 4 (Mar. 1944), pp. 209–246. He cites and quotes many decisions, noting the broadening of constitutional guaranties of personal liberty by the Supreme Court, mostly in 31 Witness cases (sixteen deciding opinions). Query: "Has the right of a religious group to propagate its faith reached its limit?" The same writer returns to the subject in his "Constitutional Law—Due Process under the Fourteenth Amendment—Freedom of Religion, Speech and Assembly," in *ibid.*, Vol. 32, no. 5 (Apr. 1948), pp. 498–502, with citations of cases in footnotes. Abridgment of fundamental rights in forbidding outdoor religious meetings is justified only by clear and present danger to the state. Cognate freedoms of religion, speech, and assembly are not absolute, and are under the implicit protection of the due process clause of the Fourteenth Amendment. "Religious Freedom and the Jehovah's Witnesses," in *Virginia Law Review*, Vol. 34, no. 1 (Jan. 1948), pp. 77–83, also has many citations of cases in footnotes. Recurring legal successes in the past ten years "have accentuated the constitutional protection accorded religious freedom." The legal protector is the Fourteenth Amendment. Cases noted include victories of Witnesses regarding their right to distribute literature, but not in avoiding penalties for violations of the Selective Service Act in World War II. The Witnesses have compelled a more accurate definition of civil liberties, and religious freedom has gained. But they are inconsistent in claiming court protection when they disregard the duties of a citizen. Many cases are cited also in Louis B. Boudin, "Freedom of Thought and Religious Liberty under the Constitution," in *Lawyers Guild Review*, Vol. 4, no. 3 (June–July 1944), pp. 9–24. He discusses the appeals of the

Witnesses to the courts, with respect to freedom of religion and freedom from certain taxes, and the flag salute, and considers the whole problem of nonconformity. Cases involving religious freedom have brought the Supreme Court to the doctrine that the state has no authority in the domain of thought, but in the domain of conduct has a right to protect itself from imminent danger. (See also Part Two, sect. v, E, 1, *Jehovah's Witnesses.*)

III. RELIGION AND ECONOMICS

A. Religion and Capitalism

HARRY F. WARD, "Religion and Economics," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin,* Vol. 34, no. 2 (Jan. 1942), pp. 6–12, with brief notes, includes general reference works and historical background; the functional relation between economics and religion; the Biblical background; teaching and practice of Christian churches; Christianity and the economic order; Christianity, socialism, and communism; and the church's relations to industry and labor. Few books deal specifically with this topic, for it is usually treated as a part of general social history, or of general discussions of religion and social questions. Alfred Dudley Ward, ed., *Goals of Economic Life* (New York, 1953) introduces a series of books embodying the results of a study originated in 1949 by the Department of the Church and Economic Life of the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ (now the National Council of Churches), partly to explore ethical economic principles that are consistent with Christian teaching. The books combine the experience and thought of various intellectual and religious leaders, and present analyses of modern economic life and ways of making its ethics conform to Christian principles. This volume, a collection of essays by economists and theologians, describes and criticizes possible goals, with theology as one of the criteria of judgment. Kenneth E.

Boulding, *The Organizational Revolution, A Study in the Ethics of Economic Organization*, with a commentary by Reinhold Niebuhr (New York, 1953) studies the continuously increasing importance of large organizations, and the problems created by them in human relationships, and in ethics as judged from a religious standpoint. Howard R. Bowen, John C. Bennett, William Adams Brown, Reinhold Niebuhr, and Roswell P. Barnes, *Ethics and Economic Life* (New York, 1953?) discusses the chief economic questions raised in the series, and interprets the problems they present to Christians as individuals and to the Church, in relation to the nation's internal economic stability and its responsibility to the world at large. Frank H. Knight and Thornton Merriam, *The Economic Order and Religion* (New York, 1945) explores the implications of religious teaching for economic ethics. An economist and a theologian discuss each other's position. Walter G. Muelder, *Religion and Economic Responsibility* (New York, 1953), with a bibliography, presents the religious approach to economic life with respect to vocation, the worker and management, the ethical functions of collective bargaining, and the religious conception of property.

The relation between various religious beliefs and teachings, and the institutions and ethics influencing economic organization and activities, has been the subject of considerable research and argument. Perhaps the closest relevance of this general problem to contemporary American institutions is seen in the theory associated with the work of the German sociologist, Max Weber: that the development of capitalist institutions was closely associated with the particular branch of Protestant theology known as Calvinism. The association is claimed to apply only to the beginnings of capitalism, which later developed somewhat independently of its ideological sources. Many scholars are convinced that the relationship continues in a more tenuous and secularized form in contemporary America. This section reviews the main argument

regarding Protestant influence on capitalist development, and the criticism of the theory, with observations on the extent to which aspects of contemporary American economic organization appear to have elements lending credence to it.

Max Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, translation by Talcott Parsons, Foreword by R. H. Tawney (New York, 1950) develops a mature expression of his thesis that the rise of capitalist economics was peculiarly favored by the Calvinist ethic and economic philosophy. Hans H. Gerth and Hedwig I. Gerth, "Bibliography on Max Weber," in *Social Research*, Vol. 16, no. 1 (Mar. 1949), pp. 70–89, comprises many hundreds of books and articles, nearly all in German, French, and English. Hans H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills, eds., *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology* (New York, 1946) has a paper on "The Protestant Sects and the Spirit of Capitalism" with numerous illustrations from the United States. Lowell L. Bennion, *Max Weber's Methodology* (Paris, 1933) criticizes his technique of socio-economic analysis. The criticism is completely reviewed in Robert W. Green, ed., *Protestantism and Capitalism; the Weber Thesis and its Critics* (Boston, 1959). Winthrop S. Hudson, "Puritanism and the Spirit of Capitalism," in *Church History*, Vol. 18, no. 1 (Mar. 1949), pp. 3–17, discusses Weber's statement of the economic significance of Calvinism. Hector M. Robertson, *Aspects of the Rise of Economic Individualism: A Criticism of Max Weber and His School* (Cambridge, Eng., 1933) is one of the most searching examinations of the "Weber-Tawney thesis." Robertson's views are criticized, in turn, by Talcott Parsons, in "H. M. Robertson on Max Weber and His School," in *Journal of Political Economy*, Vol. 43, no. 5 (Oct. 1935), pp. 688–696. Ephraim Fischoff, "The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism," in *Social Research*, Vol. 11, no. 1 (1944), pp. 53–77, cites numerous criticisms of Weber, and discusses misunderstanding of his thesis. He rejects the usual interpretation that the Protestant ethic was a causative influence. It was rather "an exposition of the rich

congruency of such diverse aspects of a culture as religion and economics." Weber paved the way for an adequate social theory of religion. Richard H. Tawney, *Religion and the Rise of Capitalism* (New York, 1929) rests upon the thesis that Protestant ethics favored the development of a capitalist economy by abolishing the restraints of feudalism and Catholicism upon business enterprise. Vigo Auguste Demant, *Religion and the Decline of Capitalism* (New York, 1952) brings up to date R. H. Tawney's thesis, holding capitalism to be an autonomous activity, dissociated from religious and ethical norms. J. Milton Yinger, *Religion in the Struggle for Power* (Durham, N.C., 1946) briefly reviews the problem of Protestantism and the spirit of capitalism. Arthur K. Davis, "Veblen on the Decline of the Protestant Ethic," in *Social Forces*, Vol. 22, no. 3 (Mar. 1944), pp. 282–286, makes an interesting comparison of Max Weber's and Thorstein Veblen's theories on the Protestant ethic and capitalism.

Recent criticism of the "Weber-Tawney thesis" tends to lay stress more upon the Puritan-Protestant doctrine of "vocation" and its influence upon the American "gospel of work." Charles and Katherine George, "Protestantism and Capitalism in Pre-Revolutionary England," in *Church History*, Vol. 27, no. 4 (Dec. 1958), pp. 351–369, contends that statements of the relation between Protestant ideology and the early capitalistic psychology often have been based upon inadequate study of the literature, or inaccurate analysis of social theory in the period 1570–1640. There is little in the English Protestant doctrine of "vocation" to justify calling it "capitalistic," the primary interest having been not so much business as productive toil, not bourgeois capitalism but industry. The significance of the doctrine of vocation is explored in Fern McCarty, "Diligence in Business, a Religious Virtue" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Colorado). Robert Slocum Michaelsen, "The American Gospel of Work and the Protestant Doctrine of Vocation" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1951) traces the doctrine to its full fruition in the

nineteenth century and its influence in twentieth-century American industrial society. He attempts to demonstrate the change of the doctrine in late seventeenth-century Puritanism, contributing to the rise of the gospel of work, mentions the influence of the "Yankee" spirit and of Franklin, and has notes on the place of this gospel in textbooks and sermons.

In the colonial period the Church used its political power to influence economics. The source of this power was legal and formal. After the separation of church and state, the Church could no longer operate directly through politics, and adopted informal persuasion over the hearts and minds of Americans in that part of their lives in which they were earning a living.

If religion is to have any relevance to social ethics and organization, it cannot well avoid the problems posed by the economic system: the status of property, inequalities of income, and the rights of labor. In this as in other fields Christianity, as a number of distinct denominations and groups, has not spoken with a single voice or even made recommendations in the same directions. The predominant voice of organized religion in the United States has been conservative in tone, but there have been many exceptions, and even more inconsistency, with regard to the form or degree of conservatism.

John Rutherford Everett, *Religion in Economics, a Study of John Bates Clark, Richard T. Ely* [and] *Simon N. Patton* (New York, 1946), with bibliographical references in the "Notes" and a selected bibliography, shows how religious ideas influenced the Protestant formulators of the most potent American economic theories. They are studied in the light of their expressed religious and philosophical convictions. A seemingly nonreligious science actually is full of religious assumptions. J. Paul Williams, *What Americans Believe and How They Worship* (New York, 1952) comments on the impact of church organizations on the nation's economic affairs, especially in the field of political pressure. Roger

Marshall Larson, "Trends in the Pronouncements of the Major American Church Bodies on Economic Issues from 1908 to 1948" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California) probably is the best summary of the economic philosophies of church people since the promulgation of the "Social Creed of the Churches" in 1908. R. B. Y. Scott and Gregory Vlastos, eds., *Towards the Christian Revelation* (Chicago, 1936) consists of essays presenting the view of liberal Protestantism regarding economic problems and the possibility of a new economic and social order, and discussing the challenge of Marxian communism. Joseph F. Fletcher, ed., *Christianity and Property* (Philadelphia, 1947) includes two essays presenting a modern Protestant view of property. Prentiss Lovell Pemberton, "Preliminary Proposals Toward a Protestant Cultural Ethic in the Areas of Security and Property" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1951) discusses the "inadequate" answers of Marxism and of Roman Catholic and Protestant Christianity. Christianity can again mould western culture only by developing a new ethic. Standard norms, between ultimate ideals and secular norms, can and should be held by Christians regarding security and property, to produce solutions of conflicts. James Hutchinson Smylie, "The American Protestant Churches and the Depression of the 1930's" (Th.M. dissertation, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1950, typescript), with a bibliography, reviews their efforts to work out a new economic philosophy of responsibility for the welfare of the masses. The attempt sometimes involved church people in support of specific panaceas. Collectivist economic philosophy gained a following, according to Irvin Eugene Lunger, "Contemporary American Religious Thought and the Rise of Collectivism" (B.D. thesis, University of Chicago, 1936, typescript). Many fixed their hopes upon consumer cooperation, and their activities are detailed by William Hoyt Moore, "Religion and the Consumer's Cooperative Movement" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1938, published in part, reproduced

from typewritten copy, "Private edition, distributed by the University of Chicago Libraries," 1940).

That the basic economic philosophy, Catholic and Protestant, remained conservative, is amply demonstrated by several studies of particular groups. Walter R. Wagoner, "Economic Changes in the Southeastern Region of the United States, 1915 to 1945, with Their Implications for the Churches and Organized Religion" (Doctoral dissertation, Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1954) has important observations on the efforts of churches to adjust their social philosophy to the new conditions, especially during the depression of the 1930's. George Dennis Kelsey, "The Social Thought of Contemporary Southern Baptists" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1946) explains the doctrines systematically and assesses them within the framework of the history of Christian social teachings and the history and culture. The structure is generally conservative, stressing duty, the ascetic character of labor, trusteeship of property, and the connection between prosperity and righteousness. Edward A. Keller, *Christianity and American Capitalism* (Chicago, 1953) was published for the Council of Business and Professional Men of the Catholic Faith, by the Heritage Foundation. It is a reasoned defense of capitalism, controlled by Christian principles, from the viewpoint of Roman Catholic theology and ethics. (See also sect. VI, B, 5, *The Gospel of Wealth*, below.)

B. Church and Class

Like the state, the church is in principle a "vertical association," cutting across other lines of social division, such as occupation, income, or membership in various other voluntary associations like political parties. But when the church is separated from the state and becomes itself a voluntary association, it is possible and indeed probable that church membership will correspond roughly to other differentiating and

even psychological characteristics. To a greater or lesser degree all branches of Christianity emphasize the "brotherhood of man," and few Christian sects or denominations explicitly and openly limit membership to certain class, ethnic, or racial groups. Even Judaism, which historically has placed great importance upon "separateness," has not done so on the explicit grounds of a special status in the secular class structure.

The references in this section relate to the extent to which organized religion in American life has taken a critical position regarding the existing class structure, and the extent to which the class structure is reflected in religious allegiances and cleavages.

David O. Moberg, "Social Class and the Churches," is a summary of a paper read before the Religious Research Fellowship, in National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America, *Information Service,* Vol. 37, no. 12 (June 14, 1958), pp. 6–8. It has a bibliography of seventy-two books and articles, probably the most comprehensive one yet published on this subject. Reinhard Bendix and Seymour M. Lipset, eds., *Class, Status and Power* (Glencoe, Ill., 1953) provides an excellent introduction to the study of social stratification in American society, with a selection of readings, showing diversity of theories about class structure. The most valuable is Liston Pope's "Religion and the Class Structure," reprinted from *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science,* Vol. 256 (March 1948), pp. 84–91. H. Richard Niebuhr, *The Social Sources of Denominationalism* (New York, 1940, new ed.) closely studies the tendency of denominational cleavages to follow social class lines. Robert Cooley Angell, *The Integration of American Society* (New York, 1941) is a brief statement on the significance for social integration of religious affiliation along class lines. Milton Yinger, *Religion in the Struggle for Power* (Durham, N.C., 1946) has remarks on social stratification in religion, and the status of the church as a prop of class. Jerome Davis, *Capitalism and its Culture* (New York, 1941) gives

a frankly Marxist interpretation of social stratification and religion, and the part of the church in class conflict, sustaining the dominant group. Herbert W. Schneider, *Religion in 20th Century America* (Cambridge, Mass., 1952) offers a contrasting non-Marxist approach to the subject of religion and class.

A recent challenge to the churches, to make an effort to overcome social distinctions, is presented in a republished essay by Abraham Kuyper, *Christianity and the Class Struggle*, translated by Dirk Jellema (Grand Rapids, 1950), originally written to be read at the opening of the Christian Social Congress in 1891. It expresses the essence of the social philosophy of American Calvinists, that all men are of one family, and is a general criticism of both class distinction in the church and of the Marxian secular doctrine of the class war. Another challenge is presented by Albion W. Small: "The Church and Class Conflicts, An Open Letter to the Laymen's Committee on Interchurch Survey," in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 60, no. 6 (May 1955), pp. 54–74. He claims that the churches have no definite attitude or policy; but without such, they cannot impress people whose lives are affected by class problems. The Protestant churches and clergy have little contact with "labor," and need greater attention to economic conflicts to make religion real to the wage-earner.

Evidence of the scandal of class distinction in religion has been steadily accumulating, and is forcibly presented by many special studies. Among the superior ones is Wesley and Beverly Allinsmith, "Religious Affiliation and Politico-Economic Attitude: a Study of Eight Major U.S. Religious Groups," in *Public Opinion Quarterly*, Vol. 12, no. 3 (Fall, 1948), pp. 377–389. This discusses the relation between political and economic opinions and religious affiliations. The authors summarize and comment on a public opinion study conducted for the Federal Council of Churches: "Christianity and the Economic Order," Study No. 10, "Social-Economic Status and Outlook of Religious Groups in America," pub-

lished in *Information Service,* Department of Research and Education, Federal Council of Churches of Christ in America, no. 27 (May 15, 1948), pp. 1–8. Hadley Cantril, "The Educational and Economic Composition of Religious Groups," in *American Journal of Sociology,* Vol. 48, no. 5 (Mar. 1943), pp. 574–579, presents ample evidence based upon polling techniques. Harlan Paul Douglass, "Cultural Differences and Recent Religious Divisions," in *Christendom,* Vol. 10, no. 1 (1945), pp. 89–105, observes the variances, mainly between standard brand Protestant denominations and lower-class evangelistic splinter groups.

Frederick Alexander Shippey, "Religio-Socio-Economic Characteristics of Urban Church Officers" (Doctoral dissertation, Northwestern University, 1947) shows that control rests in the upper-income prestige group; officers are more homogeneous than the rank and file of members; and there is a marked difference between officers and active members. A similar special study was made by Charles Lundeen Swan in "The Class-related Characteristics of Lay Leaders in the Churches of a Small Midwestern City" (Doctoral dissertation, Northwestern University, 1955; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich. (1955), pub. no. 13,142; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 15, no. 11 (1955), p. 2322, with a bibliography). The city studied was Three Rivers, Michigan. W. Lloyd Warner and Paul S. Lunt, *The Social Life of a Modern Community* (New Haven, 1941) presents brief data on denominationalism and class structure in a small New England industrial city. Liston Pope, *Millhands and Preachers; a Study of Gastonia* (New Haven, 1942) is a "case study" describing the clergy's role in stratification in the cotton towns of North Carolina. This is the best empirical review of the position of the church in the economic structure of a local community, and contains exceptionally able studies of class denominationalism in a mill town, and the specific role of churches in a bitterly fought strike.

James West [pseud.], *Plainville, U.S.A.* (New York,

1945), ch. IV, "Religion," concerns a small farming community in the South Central region, and considers the relation of religious denomination to social class. A similar view is that of Walter R. Goldschmidt, in "Class Denominationalism in Rural California Churches," in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 49, no. 4 (Jan. 1944), pp. 348–360. The most thorough study of rural stratification is presented in James Bright Wilson, "Religious Leaders, Institutions, and Organizations among Certain Agricultural Workers in the Central Valley of California" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1944). This investigation of types of religious appeal was based upon historical and field methods. The chief social processes—competition, conflict, accommodation, and assimilation—operate on various levels of the religious front. The church type and sect type are in sharp contrast. Trained leadership is necessary for success, and the Pentecostals are especially successful in social control. The most effective approach is by social service in the community-centered church.

Vattel Elbert Daniel, "Ritual and Stratification in Chicago Negro Churches" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1940; partly published in *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 7, no. 3 (June 1942), pp. 352–361, with bibliographical footnotes) is a study of the relations between ritual and social class and shows that the upper-class churches are liturgical, the lower ones ecstatic; it discusses the part of ritual in social adjustment.

C. The Church and the Race Problem

"The Question of Race: Interpreted by Science and Religion," in Buell G. Gallagher and Dwight Bradley, "Bibliography on the American Negro," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 36, no. 1 (Oct. 1943), pp. 5–9, contains many references to the problem of racial prejudice and segregation.

Denominational and local manifestations of the problem are investigated at length in a number of studies. Among the better ones is Valentine Foy, "A Historical Study of Southern Baptists and Race Relations, 1917–1947" (Doctoral dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1950). A study of attitudes in another major denomination is Dwight W. Culver, *Negro Segregation in the Methodist Church* (New Haven, 1953, Yale Studies in Religious Education, Vol. 22), with bibliography. The Southern attitude is noted in "Religion in the South: Problem and Promise," by Clyde L. Manschreck, in Francis B. Simkins, ed., *The South in Perspective, Institute of Southern Culture Lectures at Longwood College, 1958* (Farmville, Va., 1958), referring to struggles of conscience respecting the race question. Lyford P. Edwards, "Religious Sectarianism and Race Prejudice," in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 41, no. 2 (Sept. 1935), pp. 167–179, declares that sectarianism may occasionally mitigate it, but that with the majority it is dominant over sectarian beliefs. The element that gives sectarianism greater power over race consciousness is mystical experience. The recent Roman Catholic approach to the dilemma is explained by John La Farge, in *The Catholic Viewpoint on Race Relations* (New York, 1960, rev. ed.), and in *The Race Question and the Negro, a Study of the Catholic Doctrine on Interracial Justice* (New York and Toronto, 1943), originally published in 1937 as "Interracial Justice," and here expanded and rewritten, with bibliography. Frank David Dorey, "The Church and Segregation in Washington, D.C., and Chicago, Illinois: A Prolegomenon to the Sociological Analysis of the Segregated Church" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1950) presents aspects of the question at the community "grass roots," and frankly states the difficulties.

Since the period of World War I the churches and the intellectuals (sometimes in sympathetic cooperation) have been striving to find a satisfactory way to apply Christian ideals to racial tensions and church segregation in practical

ways. Their efforts are traced in a series of reports, studies, and conference records. The first important one resulted from Negro Christian Student Conference, Atlanta, 1914: *The New Voice in Race Adjustments; Addresses and Reports Presented at the Negro Christian Student Conference,* Atlanta, Georgia, May 14–18, 1914, A. M. Trawick, editor, published by order of the Executive Committee of the Conference (New York, 1914). This pioneer report on the religious aspects of race relations reveals one of the first approaches to a major problem of the churches. Another path-breaking report was issued by the National Interracial Conference: *Toward Interracial Cooperation; What was Said and Done at the First National Interracial Conference Held under the Auspices of the Commission on the Church and Race Relations of the Federal Council of the Churches and the Commissions on Interracial Cooperation,* Cincinnati, Ohio, March 25–27, 1925, published by the Commission (New York, 1926). An advanced position appears in Trevor Bowen, *Divine White Right; a Study of Race Segregation and Interracial Cooperation in Religious Organizations and Institutions in the United States,* with a section on "The Church and Education for Negroes," by Ira De A. Reid (New York and London, c.1934), published for the Institute of Social and Religious Research. With references for each part, this study considers the economic background, institutional segregation, and the part of the church in education for negroes. The general practice is described in Alfred S. Kramer's "Patterns of Racial Inclusion among Selected Congregations of Three Protestant Denominations" (Thesis, New York University; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich. (1955), pub. no. 13,621; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 15 (1955), no. 10, p. 1928), with bibliography.

Talcott Parsons, "Racial and Religious Differences as Factors in Group Tensions," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 5, 1944 (New York, 1945), pp. 182–199, considers the influence of religion upon

group solidarity, and declares that, in spite of the universalistic element in prophetic religions, it is doubtful whether its influence has reduced group clashes, because of the ingrown quality of communal religion. William Stuart Nelson, "Religion and Racial Tension in America Today," in *ibid.*, Vol. 5, 1944 (New York, 1945), pp. 544–560, with comments by four others, avers that the real sources of tension are amenable to the moral will. With the exception of philanthropy, the post-Civil War period was generally barren of real religious effort to solve the problem. The mood has been fearful, action merely meliorative, paternalistic, and missionary in motive; and doctrine has not been translated into understanding or action. The Kingdom of God must appear first in the Church. Buell G. Gallagher, "Christianity and Color," in *ibid.*, Vol. 6, 1945 (New York, 1947), pp. 453–468, discusses Christianity as a possible determining factor in eliminating race conflict and achieving human solidarity, based on equity and integration by abolition of arbitrary barriers. William Stuart Nelson [and others], *The Christian Way in Race Relations* (New York, 1948) is a series of thirteen essays, written in cooperation by members of the Institute of Religion, sponsored by the School of Religion, Howard University, Washington, D.C., and is the product of four years of study of race relations in America. The authors attempt to explain the central part which the members of the Institute feel the Christian way of life should play in solving the problems. The whole subject is considered in the light of the contest between Christianity and the world. The conscientious Christian approach is further illuminated by Charles Everett Tilson, *Segregation and the Bible* (New York, 1958), with a bibliography; and Thomas Bufford Maston, *Segregation and Desegregation: a Christian Approach* (New York, 1959), with bibliography.

Recent progress in solving the problem through the medium of applied Christianity is disclosed in Robert Root, *Progress against Prejudice; the Church Confronts the Race*

Problem (New York, 1957); and in Robert R. Brown, *Bigger than Little Rock* (Greenwich, Conn., 1958). (See also Part Two, sect. VI, 1, *Religion and Segregation.*)

IV. RELIGION AND POLITICS

A. Religion and Nationalism

THE separation of church and state in the United States in theory has given to organized religion a substantial independence from detailed supervision by the state. But by the same token the church has become another special association, in a large degree subservient to the state. The problem of relationships arises in many forms, some of which are covered in other special topics. It is especially acute with respect to the church's position relative to modern nationalism.

Various religious groups have attempted to solve the problem of national sovereignty in diverse ways. Some maintain that religion is a supra-national or at least a non-national form of allegiance, so that occasionally the devout religious believer may claim loyalty to a "higher law" than that represented by the civil authorities. Others would make the church virtually an organ of the state, subservient in all political issues to the secular power. A third position, closely related to the second, attempts a radical dualism of authority: "Render unto Caesar the things that are Caesar's."

The essence of the problem may lie in the character of nationalism itself: like religion, nationalism and its associated patriotic sentiments assume the character of an ultimate value. Nationalism in itself becomes a sort of religion. It is therefore hardly surprising that in the United States the religious and nationalistic types of ultimate values sometimes come into conflict, and that this has caused American, and especially Protestant, churches to take a number of rather inconsistent positions.

The following bibliography explores certain aspects of the

relations of modern American religion to the national state. The particular emphasis is upon nationalism as such, rather than upon various aspects of legislation, religious education problems, or other church-state relations.

Evan Edward Thomas, *The Political Aspect of Religious Development* (London, 1938) is a scholarly presentation of the interaction of political and religious forces. Nils Ehrenstrom, *Christian Faith and the Modern State* (Chicago, 1937) is a satisfactory general description of the problem of the relation of religion to nationalism, which also assumes the character of an *ultimate value* in itself. Salo Wittmayer Baron, *Modern Nationalism and Religion* (New York, 1947), with bibliographical references included in "Notes," discusses the peculiar characteristics of Protestant individualism with respect to nationalistic sentiment; interrelations of modern nationalism and religion; varieties of nationalist experience; and some representative nationalisms, including that of Thomas Jefferson.

Edward Frank Humphrey, *Nationalism and Religion in America, 1774–1789* (Boston, 1924), with bibliography, illustrates the part of religion in creating American nationalism, and in "the moulding of the still deeper spirit of American unity." It was one of the most potent factors in forming the nation, which is Christian, even though Christianity is not the state religion. The period of formation of American nationality marked "a turning point in the politico-religious history of the world," in its principles of separation of church and state, and of religious freedom. These concepts stemmed largely from the ideals of liberty which patriots, statesmen, and clergymen found in the Bible. Paris Marion Simms, *The Bible in America; Versions that Have Played Their Part in the Making of the Republic* (New York, 1936), with bibliography, reviews the general concept of the Bible as an underlying element in the development of the nation and of "Americanism." Biblical ideals prevented the American national spirit from becoming unreligious.

This fact is elucidated by several titles that illustrate the persistence of the idea that the United States is a Christian nation. An early example is Benjamin Franklin Morris' massively documented work, *Christian Life and Character of the Civil Institutions of the United States, Developed in the Official and Historical Annals of the Republic* (Philadelphia and Cincinnati, 1864), with a bibliography. Striking confirmations are James M. Wheeler's *The United States, a Christian Nation* (Temple City, Calif., 1955) and Rufus Washington Weaver, *The Christian Faith at the Nation's Capital; a Series of Sermons* (Philadelphia and Boston, c.1936). The strength of this conviction, that the nation is basically Christian, is revealed by the consideration given to a proposal examined by the U.S. Congress, Senate, Committee on the Judiciary: *Christian Amendment, Hearings . . . on S. J. Res. 87, Proposing an Amendment to the Constitution of the United States Recognizing the Authority and Law of Jesus Christ,* May 13 and 17, 1954 (Washington, 1954). The connection between religion and the national spirit is admirably described by Peter F. Drucker, "Organized Religion and the American Creed," in *Review of Politics,* Vol. 18, no. 3 (July 1956), pp. 296–304, discussing the separation of church and state, presupposing a religious society. He contrasts the American and the European concepts of a "secular" state, the American friendly to religion and in fact created by it, the latter hostile.

The nation turns to religion for moral support, especially in periods of crisis like the reform era of the early 1900's. It was natural that the National Reform Association, Pittsburgh, should publish *A Plea for Religion in the Nation* (Pittsburgh, 1907). This pleads for religion as a sustainer of the national moral fibre, a pillar of society, in a period of social unrest and reform, and of apparent religious and moral declension. A similar example appears in *Is Religious Faith Declining in the United States? If so, what are the causes? What will be the effect upon the life of the Republic? What is the remedy?* —one of a series of nonpartisan, nonsectarian, and nonracial

discussions conducted under the auspices of the Republican Club of New York (New York, 1912). This consists of addresses by the Rt. Rev. David H. Greer, Fred B. Smith, and others. Significantly, the discussions coincided with the culmination of the Progressive reform crusade of the early 1900's, led by Theodore Roosevelt and other political chieftains who derived their inspiration in part from the concept of the United States as a religiously guided nation.

This concept, throughout the national history, has supported and promoted the ideal of America's providential guidance in world leadership. The implications of the ideal can be fully explored in a number of books written by Americans of various religious faiths, during more than a century: (1) George Barrell Cheever, *God's Hand in America, with an Essay, by the Rev. Dr. Skinner* (New York, 1841), presenting the views of a noted New York Congregational minister. (2) James Franklin Love, *The Mission of Our Nation* (New York and Chicago, 1912), a course of lectures at the Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary. (3) William Carl Heyer, *American Trust in Providence; an Outline of the Topic along General Lines* (Boston, 1925). (4) Fulton John Sheen, *For God and Country* (New York, 1941), by the nationally known Roman Catholic philosopher and radio and television preacher. (5) W. Earl Waldrop, *What Makes America Great?* (St. Louis, 1957). (6) Dan Smoot, *The Hope of the World* (Dallas, 1958), illustrated.

Albert K. Weinberg, *Manifest Destiny: A Study of Nationalist Expansion in American History* (Baltimore, 1935) shows how the idea of providence, some forms of which have been natural rather than supernatural, has constantly been implicit in American Nationalism. The idea of a special providence guiding America has influenced the attitude of the churches and the clergy toward patriotism and wars. The origin and operation of this sense of national mission is studied in Jerald C. Brauer, "The Rule of the Saints in American Politics," *Church History*, Vol. 27, no. 3 (Sept. 1958), pp.

240–255, with notes and bibliography. The present tendency of Americans to believe in themselves as a chosen people with a special mission, to redeem the world morally, is traced to the Puritan theocracy. When church and state were separated, the ideal was transformed, and worked through revivals and voluntary associations, to bring religious influence to bear upon politics and society. God had a special part for America to play, and the Puritan theocratic ideal became "Manifest Destiny." After the Civil War the ideal was reformulated in terms of the Social Gospel, and it is still potent in "crusading" national and international politics. Charles E. Kistler, *This Nation under God; a Religious Supplement to American History* (Boston, c.1924) also is evidence of the persistent sentiment that America is a nation peculiarly favored by Providence, a kind of chosen people working out a "manifest destiny." The same ideal inspires Elbert Duncan Thomas, *This Nation under God* (New York, 1950), an expression of the traditional ideal by a United States Senator, discussing the religion of the Presidents.

This expression was a perfectly natural and honest one, with abundant justification in the religious utterances of a long line of American statesmen, some of whom were frankly regarded by the people as true religious and moral leaders. Norman Cousins, ed., *"In God We Trust," The Religious Beliefs and Ideas of the American Founding Fathers, with Introduction and Commentary* (New York, 1957), is a selection of passages from letters, diaries, and official pronouncements of Benjamin Franklin, George Washington, John Adams, Thomas Jefferson, James Madison, Alexander Hamilton, John Jay, Thomas Paine, and others, showing the core of religious conviction which their influence wove into American nationalism. The conviction that the nation's leaders have been and should be men of religious faith, and that they should give public evidence of the fact, is firmly established by a considerable number of works on the faith of the Presidents. The subject receives a general review in William Jud-

son Hampton's *The Religion of the Presidents, also Ancestry, Education, Public Service, Religion, etc., of Pres. Calvin Coolidge . . . Introduction by L. O. Hartman* (Somerville, N.J., c.1925), with portraits. The point is driven home by Vernon Boyce Hampton, *Religious Background of the White House* (Boston, c.1932), with portraits and a bibliography; and by Bliss Isely, *The Presidents: Men of Faith* (Boston, 1953), illustrated. Presidential references to the Bible, which have strengthened the American people's conception of the religious character of the office, are discussed by James Wilson Storer's *These Historic Scriptures; Meditations upon the Bible Texts Used by our Presidents, from Lincoln to Truman, at Their Inaugurations, Portrait Drawings of the Presidents* by T. Victor Hall (Nashville, 1952).

How Presidents and other statesmen, from Washington to the present day, have regarded their own and the nation's religious background, is illustrated by a few studies of personal convictions and influence. John C. Fitzpatrick, "George Washington and Religion," in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 15, no. 1 (Apr. 1929), pp. 23–42, discusses Washington's view of religion as a support of patriotism and general morality, a prop of society and the state, as shown in his writings and utterances, particularly messages to the churches. Religious influence upon a lesser statesman is shown by Woodrow Wilson Wasson, *James A. Garfield: His Religion and Education; a Study in the Religious and Educational Thought and Activity of an American Statesman* (Nashville, Tenn., 1952), with bibliography. This reviews his early religious life, membership in the Disciples of Christ, growing religious and educational interests, and emergence as a leader of the progressive movement in the denomination while he was a Congressman. His widening religious thought was related to the growing importance of natural and social sciences and the democratic ideal. David Wesley Soper, "Woodrow Wilson and the Christian Tradition" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1945; partially published in *The Personalist*, University of

Southern California) is a theological analysis of the ideas expressed in Wilson's writings, and points out the influence of Christianity upon his political thought. A modern instance of the deep religious influence in American statesmanship appears in a statement by John Foster Dulles, Secretary of State 1953–1959, in: U.S. Dept. of State, *The Secretary of State on Faith of Our Fathers* (Washington, 1954, pub. 5300, General Foreign Policy Series, 84) based on an address delivered at the First Prsbyterian Church of Watertown, N.Y., Oct. 11, 1953.

ABRAHAM LINCOLN AS RELIGIOUS LEADER. Many studies have been written on aspects of the part of religion in the Civil War, as, for example, the use of Biblical sanctions by both sides. Nothing demonstrates more clearly how the American character is oriented toward religion than the way in which the people translated nearly every phase of their struggle into religious terms. (See, for example, the arguments of the Abolitionists, summarized by Oscar Sherwin, "The Armory of God," *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 18 (Mar. 1954), pp. 70–82.) A clear instance of the religious psychology, so prominent on both sides, is the imputation of the role of providential agent to Lincoln.

Paul M. Angle, ed., *Herndon's Life of Lincoln* (Cleveland, 1949) reveals Lincoln's religious attitudes and the imputation to him of the role of providential agent, which are emphasized, especially in Angle's introduction. The roots of Lincoln's religious faith are traced in Gresham George Fox, *Abraham Lincoln's Religion; Sources of the Great Emancipator's Religious Inspiration* (New York, 1959), which should be supplemented by William J. Wolf, *The Almost Chosen People; a Study of the Religion of Abraham Lincoln* (Garden City, N.Y., 1959). Roy P. Basler, *The Lincoln Legend: A Study of Changing Conceptions* (Boston, 1935) is a good treatment of the problem of considering the tendency of Lincoln's time to see him as God's right-hand man. Edmund Wilson, "Abraham Lincoln: The Union as Religious

Mysticism," in *The New Yorker,* Vol. 29, no. 4 (Mar. 14, 1953), pp. 116–136, excellently appraises the controversy about Lincoln as a religious leader, allowing him a high degree of self-consciousness in that respect. The same author's "Homage to General Grant," in *The New Yorker,* Vol. 29 (Apr. 4, 1953), pp. 117–128, considers the imputation to Grant, a devout Methodist, of the same kind of religious mission as was ascribed to Lincoln, although in a lesser degree in Grant's case.

B. Religion and American Wars

Henry J. Cadbury, "War and Religion, a Bibliography," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin,* Vol. 33, no. 2 (Jan. 1941), pp. 5–11, includes literature on the Bible and war, historical and theological works, nonviolence, the Christian alternative to war, the conscientious objector, pacifism in positive action, personal experiences in wartime, and quotations on peace and war. An admirable anthology, compiled during World War II, comprises illustrative sermons on the war theme since the Revolution: *Render unto Caesar, a Collection of Sermon Classics on all Phases of Religion in Wartime* (New York, 1943), which is described as "Our heritage of religious thought from the four great American wars."

1. RELIGION IN THE REVOLUTIONARY WAR. Even if one were to take the attitude that thought is simply the reflex of material motives, one must see that at some stage history depends on the power of ideas. The present world struggle for men's minds recognizes the necessity of psychological imperatives for action. In colonial America, the chief way to men's minds was the pulpit. It was perhaps inevitable that the churches were drawn into the Revolutionary struggle; they never could have withstood so catastrophic a social movement. Yet the clergy were not by accident propagandists for revolution. There was an intimate relation between ecclesias-

tical polity and political theory; the same forces which were leading to violent revolution were quietly transforming religious ideas. John Locke was the staple of New England clergymen before he provided the rationale of the American Revolution. Alice M. Baldwin has said, "There is not a right asserted in the Declaration of Independence which had not been discussed by the New England Clergy before 1763."

John C. Miller, *Origins of the American Revolution* (Boston, 1943) discusses religious conflicts, especially between Anglicans and Dissenters, as a cause of the war; and the part of the clergy in pro- and anti-Revolutionary propaganda. Frank Dean Gifford, "The Influence of the Clergy on American Politics from 1763 to 1776," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 10, no. 2 (June 1941), pp. 104–123, observes the essential part of the clergy as apologists for or opponents of the revolutionary movement. Claude H. Van Tyne, "Influence of the Clergy, and of Religious Sectarian Forces, on the American Revolution," in *American Historical Review,* Vol. 19, no. 1 (Oct. 1913), pp. 44–64, shows that the Anglicans were divided (Tory and Whig), the Dissenters largely Whig, propagandists of freedom and independence. Philip Davidson, *Propaganda and the American Revolution* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1941) pays attention to the clergy as rival propagandists for the Whig or the Royalist cause.

Charles H. Metzger, "Chaplains in the American Revolution," in *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 31, no. 1 (Apr. 1945), pp. 31–79, has a list of chaplains, with their military units and denominational affiliations. It is a favorable view of their character and contributions; they not only ministered spiritually to soldiers, but also sustained morale and aroused patriotism. This may be supplemented by a much older but still valuable work, J[oel] T[yler] Headley's *The Chaplains and Clergy of the Revolution* (New York, 1864).

Alice Mary Baldwin, *The New England Clergy and the American Revolution* (Durham, N.C., 1928), with bibliog-

raphy, discusses a phase of the Revolution about which little had previously been written. The arguments against imperial policy were not new, but were the result of generations of discussion and traditional belief, and continual reinterpretation of the Bible in the light of new philosophy, particularly that of John Locke, apologist of the English Revolution of 1688. The ministers in discussion and sermon kept alive the liberal republican political doctrines of the seventeenth century and instilled them into the people; they studied constitutional government and related it to the teachings of the Bible. John Wise, *A Vindication of the Government of New England Churches* (Boston, 1717, 1772), written in response to a purely religious controversy, indicates the close alliance between religious and political thought long before the agitation for independence, and contains the first clear formulation of the idea of natural liberty, which was slowly emerging in colonial thought. Lindsay Swift, "The Massachusetts Election Sermons," in *Transactions of the Massachusetts Colonial Society*, Vol. 1 (1892–1894), Dec. 1894, pp. 388–451, shows the importance of the New England clergy as moulders of public opinion, by their sermons, throughout New England history from the 1630's. How they and other ministers continued this service is displayed by Frank Moore, ed., *The Patriot Preachers of the American Revolution, with Biographical Sketches* (New York, 1862). The general type of stirring sermons they preached is illustrated by the anthology compiled by John Wingate Thornton, ed., *The Pulpit of the American Revolution: or, The Political Sermons of the Period of 1776, with a Historical Introduction, Notes, and Illustrations* (Boston and New York, 1860; Boston, 1876, 2nd ed.). This collects nine of the more important sermons related to the theme of natural liberty. Especially important are the "Introduction" by the editor, and Jonathan Mayhew's "Discourse Concerning Unlimited Submission and Non-resistance to the Higher Powers," which has been called the "Morning-Gun" of the Revolution.

The Presbyterian clergy, not behind their Congregational brethren, are studied in Wayne W. Witte, "John Witherspoon: Servant of the Author of Liberty—A Study in Doctrinal History and Political Calvinism" (Doctoral dissertation, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1954), which indicates his Calvinism impelling him to adopt the libertarian view in the Revolution as a clerical champion of independence. Leonard John Kramer, "The Political Ethics of the American Presbyterian Clergy in the Eighteenth Century, 1700–1783" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1942) traces their political ideas and participation, and the reasons for their utterances and acts. Their ethics advocated freedom of religion, a just war for liberty, protest against political inequality, and resistance as a religious duty. The connection of Presbyterian Calvinist teachings with the movement for American liberty is briefly reviewed by Thomas Balch, *Calvinism and American Independence* (Philadelphia, 1909), originally published in the *Presbyterian Quarterly Review* for July 1876. An extensive review of Presbyterian participation is available in William Pratt Breed, *Presbyterians and the Revolution* (Philadelphia, c.1876). The Calvinistic Baptists also were generally strong supporters of the Revolutionary cause, and their sympathy with the patriot party is demonstrated by William Cathcart's *The Baptists and the American Revolution* (Philadelphia, 1876, published for the author), with a bibliography and illustrations.

Arthur L. Cross, *The Anglican Episcopate and the American Colonies* (New York, 1902) presents irrefutable proof that the propaganda of the Northern Anglican clergy for an American episcopate, and Dissenting fear of it, were major causes of the Revolution: fear of the Anglican Church as an agent of imperial policy. Charles Mampoteng, "The New England Clergy in the American Revolution," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 9, no. 4 (Dec. 1940), pp. 267–304, reviews the activity of the Anglican clergy as royalists, and their consequent hardships. Walter

Herbert Stowe, "A Study in Conscience; Some Aspects of the Relations of the Clergy to the State," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 19, no. 4, pp. 301–323, considers the painful position of the loyalist clergy, their refusal to violate their oaths of allegiance and supremacy, and their sufferings at the hands of the revolutionary governments. G. MacLaren Brydon, "The Clergy of the Established Church in Virginia and the Revolution," in *Virginia Magazine of History and Biography*, Vol. 41, no. 1 (Jan. 1933), pp. 11–18, is an important consideration of the political role of the clergy in the South, and shows that many of the Anglican clergy there were firm Whigs.

The attitudes and wartime services or pacifism of the German churches of Pennsylvania are carefully described in two documented studies. Henry Melchior Muhlenberg Richards gives a general review in *The Pennsylvania-German in the Revolutionary War, 1775–1783 . . . a Historical Sketch . . .* prepared at the Request of the Pennsylvania-German Society (Lancaster, Pa., 1908), with illustrations. The Moravians, who suffered for their nonresistant principles, have found a sympathetic historian in Kenneth Gardiner Hamilton, whose *John Ettwein and the Moravian Church during the Revolutionary Period* (Bethlehem, Pa., 1940), with illustrations, narrates the hardships of the group, who were heavily taxed and yet contributed much voluntarily to relieving the sufferings of others.

Other minority groups also made significant contributions, which have been reviewed in a few studies by scholars of the same faith. By far the most extensive and scholarly treatment is that of Martin Ignatius Joseph Griffin, *Catholics and the American Revolution* (Ridley Park, Pa., the Author, 1907–1911, 3 vols.), illustrated. Their relation to the movement for American autonomy has been appreciated by Father John Mary Lenhart's *Catholics and the American Declaration of Independence, 1774–1776* (St. Louis, Mo., 1934). Division of sentiment among Roman Catholics is revealed in Thomas

P. Phelan, "Catholic Patriotism in Revolutionary Days," in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 1 (n.s.), no. 4 (Jan. 1922), pp. 431–440. This has references in footnotes, and reviews the part of Roman Catholics in the war, as both Whigs and Tories. The long unknown and unappreciated support of the Revolutionary cause by many Jews was first publicized in an essay by Madison Clinton Peters: *The Jews Who Stood by Washington; an Unwritten Chapter in American History* (New York, 1915).

2. RELIGION IN WARS: 1812–1898. Clayton Sumner Ellsworth, "American Churches and the Mexican War," in *American Historical Review*, Vol. 45, no. 2 (Jan. 1940), pp. 301–326, indicates the division of opinion in the churches, and factors making for support or opposition. "No church with its members concentrated in the Southwest or with a strong stake there opposed the war." He shows the part of "Manifest Destiny" in winning church support, along with anti-Catholic feeling. Against no other war, however, have the clergy protested so vigorously—because of anti-slavery sentiment. Blanche Marie McEniry, *American Catholics in the War with Mexico* (Washington, D.C., 1937), with bibliography, investigates the attitudes of the hierarchy and (so far as it could be ascertained) of the rank and file, and points to the embarrassment caused by the fact that the war was against a traditionally Catholic country. Benjamin J. Blied, *Catholic Aspects of the War for Independence, the War of 1812, the War with Mexico, the War with Spain, Four Essays* (Milwaukee, Wis., 1949), with bibliographical references in the footnotes, has much material on the attitudes of other religious groups, suspicion of Roman Catholics in the Mexican War, their divided attitude toward imperialism in the Spanish war, and their emotional strain when the United States has fought against Catholic countries.

Robert Livingston Stanton, *The Church and the Rebellion; a Consideration of the Rebellion against the Government of the United States and the Agency of the Church, North and*

South, in Relation Thereto (New York, 1864) completely reviews the varying attitudes of the churches and their support of the Federal and Confederate governments. The Protestant clergy in the loyal states, as sustainers of patriotism and morale, are depicted in Stuart W. Chapman, "The Northern Protestant Clergy and the Union Cause" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1938–39). This topic is exhaustively studied, with reference to variances of opinion, in Chester Forrester Durham's *The Attitude of the Northern Clergy toward the South, 1860–1865* (Toledo, O., 1942), with bibliography.

There are but few competent studies of the participation of particular Protestant denominations in the war. Perhaps the best one is Lewis G. Vander Velde, *The Presbyterian Churches and the Federal Union 1861–1869* (Cambridge, Mass., 1932), based upon extensive research into original documents, and illustrating division of opinion as between conservative and liberal groups, and between Northern and Southern synods—an inheritance from the schism of 1837–1838 over liberalism and anti-slavery feeling in the Northern synods. Methodist opinion and action is generally reviewed by William Warren Sweet's *The Methodist Episcopal Church and the Civil War* (Cincinnati, 1912), with a bibliography, a doctoral thesis for the University of Pennsylvania. Another interesting and scholarly denominational study is Charles William Heathcote, *The Lutheran Church and the Civil War* (New York and Chicago, c.1919), with a bibliography. Jewish participation, generally inspired by libertarian ideals and opposition to slavery, has but recently received a complete investigation in Bertram Wallace Korn, *American Jewry and the Civil War*, with an Introduction by Allan Nevins (Philadelphia, 1951), with a bibliography and illustrations. An older but still useful work is Simon Wolf, *The American Jew as Patriot, Soldier and Citizen*, ed. Louis Edward Levy (Philadelphia and New York, 1895), which discusses the participation of Jewish soldiers.

Robert Joseph Murphy reviews the Roman Catholic position in "The Catholic Church in the United States during the Civil War Period (1852–1866)," in *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society*, Vol. 39, no. 4 (Dec. 1928), pp. 272–346, with bibliographical footnotes and bibliography. He remarks that the pulpit was reserved in dealing with the slavery question, and so saved the Church from political danger; and that the bishops, priests, and people generally responded to the appeal of patriotism. The great Catholic contributions to wartime relief have been narrated in George Barton, *Angels of the Battlefield, A History of the Labors of the Catholic Sisterhoods in the Late Civil War* (Philadelphia, 1897), with illustrations.

An extensive literature exists, regarding the direct participation of the Christian churches, especially the Protestant denominations, in relief work, revivalism, and morale building, in the Union and Confederate armies. A summary of Northern Protestant work is provided in an exhaustive illustrated history by Lemuel Moss: *Annals of the United States Christian Commission* (Philadelphia, 1868). The author was home secretary of the Commission and had access to the records. Religion in the Union forces is reviewed in Horatio Balch Hackett, *Christian Memorials of the War: or, Scenes and Incidents Illustrative of Religious Faith and Principle, Patriotism and Bravery in Our Army, with Historical Notes* (Boston and New York, 1864), with extensive remarks on evangelism. A similar record is Amos Stevens Billingsley's *From the Flag to the Cross; or, Scenes and Incidents of Christianity in the War* (Philadelphia, Boston, [and] Burlington, Iowa, 1872; also published in Philadelphia, 1872, under title: *Christianity in the War*). For the Confederate side there are two sources of information, published while the memories were still fresh. One is William W. Bennett's *A Narrative of the Great Revival which Prevailed in the Southern Armies during the late Civil War between the States of the Federal Union* (Philadelphia, 1877), illustrated. The other is J[ohn]

William Jones, *Christ in the Camp; or, Religion in Lee's Army, with an Introduction by J. C. Cranberry* (Richmond, 1887). The service of the Southern churches in bolstering the Confederate cause has received its first scholarly treatment in James Wesley Silver's *Confederate Morale and Church Propaganda* (Tuscaloosa, Ala., 1957, Confederate Centennial Studies, no. 3), with a bibliography.

William Archibald Karraker, "The American Churches and the Spanish-American War" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1940; published in part, pp. 277–283, lithoprinted, Chicago, 1943) is the most thorough study. Walter Millis, in *The Martial Spirit* (Cambridge, Mass., 1931), with bibliography, makes some references to clerical proclamations of the Spanish-American War as a crusade in behalf of Christian civilization against the cruelties of a "decadent" Spanish colonial regime. The crusading aspect is revealed in Thomas Scott Bacon's essay, *A New Religion as Revealed in Three Months of War* (n.p., 1898?); and the spirit of sacrifice in Henry Van Dyke, *The Cross of War, A Sermon Preached by the . . . Pastor of the Brick Presbyterian Church, New York, on May First, 1898* (New York, 1898).

The spirit in which the clergy and the churches viewed the war is obvious from numerous sermons preached throughout the nation during the spring and summer of 1898, and as late as 1900, when the question of "imperialism" had become a moral and political issue. Quite typical are three preached by the prominent Congregational minister, Lyman Abbott: *Is It Peace or War, The Meaning of War,* and *The Duty and Destiny of America* (Brooklyn, N.Y., 1898, in "Plymouth Morning Pulpit," Vol. 1, nos. 5, 10, and 11). The third expresses clearly the theme of moral responsibility and "Manifest Destiny" to fight for civilization against "decadent" colonialism.

This theme runs through many other sermons of the period. Examples are: Charles Gordon Ames, *In War Time; a Ser-*

mon Preached in . . . Boston, April 24, 1898 (Boston, 1898); Charles Reynolds Brown, *A Palm Sunday Sermon . . .* (San Francisco, 1898?); John White Chadwick, *The Present Distress; a Sermon upon Our Oriental War . . .* (New York, 1899); Roswell Randall Hoes, *A Sermon Preached on Board U.S. Battle-ship "Iowa," in Guantanamo Bay, Cuba, July 10, 1898, the Sunday Following the Naval Battle of Santiago . . .* (New York, 1898); William Reed Huntington, *Duties of War Time: A Sermon Preached in Grace Church, New York, on the Sunday after the Breaking Out of Hostilities between the United States and Spain, April 24th, 1898'. . .* (New York, 1898?); Charles Edward Jefferson, *Temptation from the Mountain: a Sermon Preached . . . on Sunday Morning, June 19, 1898 . . .* (n.p., 1898? "Reprinted from the *Christian Work*"); Joseph May, *America at War,* April 24, 1898, *The Peril of Our Republic,* November 26, 1899, and *Mankind a Unit, Civilization a Stewardship* [1900] (Philadelphia, Unitarian Book Room 1898?–1900); Herbert Welsh, *The Ethics of the War Viewed from the Christian Standpoint* (Philadelphia? 1898? an address delivered before the Ethical Society of Philadelphia, Sunday, June 19, 1898); and Samuel Burns Weston, *The Ethics of Our War with Spain . . . a Lecture Given Before the Society for Ethical Culture . . . Sunday, May 8th, 1898* (Philadelphia, 1898?). These are all contained in a collection, "Sermons and Addresses on the Spanish American War," 1898–1902, in the Library of Congress, Washington, D.C. They illustrate the mingling of strident and rather imperialistic patriotism, and warnings of the dangers of nationalistic arrogance and of defection from Christian moral standards.

An interesting and little investigated aspect of the Spanish-American War is the participation of the Jews. This is reviewed in Abraham Eber Hirschowitz, *Jewish Patriotism and Its Martyrs in the Spanish-American War, 1898, A Sermon Delivered at the Synagogue Sons of Israel . . .* New York

. . January 28th, 1899 . . . (New York, 1899), printed Hebrew and English.

3. WORLD WAR I. Since 1914 either the actuality or the ɔssibility of global war has shaped the entire course of human ɾents. Religionists of every persuasion have been compelled ɔ explore the relevance of their faith to this most serious ɪsease of civilization. Atomic power has added an almost ɔsmic dimension to the problem. Church bodies have been ɪrred to pass resolutions (which few persons read) and un-ɔunted sermons seek to define the proper Jewish or Christian ɪtitude toward war, its causes, effects, and remedies. No nanimity has been reached in these discussions, aside from ɪe propositions that war is in general an undesirable method f settling international affairs, and that it should be avoided ɜ long as possible. Only a few small denominations, and a ecided minority of individuals within the larger churches, ave taken the position of absolute pacifism. The vast ma-ɔrity of Christians and Jews in America have given full, lthough frequently critical, support to the national effort in wo world conflicts. Various aspects of the matter are in con-ɪant debate, particularly among those who believe that reli-ion pertains quite as much to this world as the next.

Marion John Bradshaw, *The War and Religion; a Pre-iminary Bibliography of Material in English, Prior to Janu-ry 1, 1919, compiled . . . for the Committee on the War nd the Religious Outlook* (New York, 1919) is perhaps the nost complete list ever published on the relations of the hurches to the many facets of World War I. Federal Council ɪf the Churches of Christ in America, Commission on Chris-ian Education, comp., *Selected Quotations on Peace and War, with Special Reference to a Course of Lessons on Inter-ıational Peace* (New York, c.1915) offers proof of the ɪxtent to which American Protestantism (at least in official ɪircles) was committed to pacific philosophy on the eve of the war. Washington Gladden, *The Forks of the Road* (New

York, 1916), by a pioneer of the Social Gospel, won a prize offered by the Church Peace Union for the best essay on war and peace, and illustrates the anti-war stand of many liberal churchmen previous to American participation. John Haynes Holmes, *New Wars for Old, Being a Statement of Radical Pacifism in Terms of Force Versus Nonresistance, with Special Reference to the Facts and Problems of the Great War* (New York, 1916) consists of sermons and addresses, with a bibliography, by the liberal pastor of the Community Church in New York, and fairly represents advanced Christian opinion before American participation.

Elias Hershey Sneath, ed., *Religion and the War, by Members of the Faculty of the School of Religion, Yale University* (New Haven, 1918) marks the adjustment of hopeful theologians and church people to the ideal of a "just war" for civilization, once the nation had become involved. William Herbert Percy Faunce, *Religion and War* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1918) consists of lectures on the attitude of the Old and the New Testament, the pacifism of rationalists, and the moral leadership of the church. It expresses the considered opinion of a leading Baptist minister, then president of Brown University: war is a challenge to the moral leadership of the church, which must work for a union of nations to abolish war. Benjamin Wisner Bacon, *Non-resistance Christian or Pagan?* (New Haven, 1918) is a rather typical representation of the unfavorable reaction of many church leaders to radical pacifism, after the nation's actual involvement in the conflict. The shift in attitude appears in the utterances at the May 1917 session of the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America: *The Churches of Christ in Time of War, a Handbook for the Churches* (New York, c.1917), edited by Charles S. MacFarland. Official participation appears in the Council's General Wartime Commission's *War-time Agencies of the Churches; Directory and Handbook*, edited by Margaret Renton (New York, c.1919). This reveals the profound involvement of the churches in manifold ministries to the

armed forces and the civilian population, to relieve the suffering and tensions of war. Ray H. Abrams, *Preachers Present Arms* (New York, 1933) studies the participation of the clergy in World War I and is very sharply critical of some ardent pro-war clergymen, such as the Rev. Dwight Newell Hillis. Committee on the War and the Religious Outlook, *Religion among American Men as Revealed by a Study of Conditions in the Army* (New York, 1920) was a startling revelation to the churches of the religious illiteracy of masses of soldiers, and of the alienation of too many from official organized religion—a situation most uncomplimentary to previous efforts in religious education.

4. WORLD WAR II. Ray H. Abrams reviews the progress from neutrality to belligerency, in "The Churches and the Clergy in World War II," in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, no. 256 (Mar. 1948), pp. 110–119. The early ascendency of pacifist and near-pacifist groups, and the rather pacifist tone of the religious press, yielded to the influence of preparedness propaganda, and churches became resigned to participation. A "guilty necessity" was transformed into a "holy war." The Roman Catholic Church supported the war, and Jews favored intervention to check the spread of Nazism. The mingled reluctance and hope for a better world after the war appear in *If America Enters the War—What Shall I Do? A Series of Articles by Ten Christian Leaders* (Chicago, 1941). The immediate reaction of one of the most liberal Christian journals appears in Charles Clayton Morrison's editorials in *The Christian Century*, after Pearl Harbor: "The War as Tragedy," Vol. 59, part 1 (1942), pp. 6–8; "God and the War," pp. 38–41; "The Position of the Pacifist," pp. 102–104; "The Non-Pacifist," pp. 134–136. Also, in the same volume, pp. 390–397, is the full text of a pronouncement by the Delaware Methodist Conference on "The Churches and a Just and Durable Peace." The Roman Catholic position is completely explained and discussed by John Joseph Carrigg, *American Catholic Press Opinion*

with Reference to America's Intervention in the Second World War (Washington, 1947), a dissertation for the degree of Master of Arts, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C.

A number of representative works illustrate the attitudes of individual Protestant and Roman Catholic clergymen regarding participation in the war. One of the most forthright is Justin Wroe Nixon, *Protestantism's Hour of Decision* (Philadelphia and Chicago, 1940), with references at the end of each chapter. It is a frank and fearless defense of democracy by a Baptist minister, intended to awaken Protestant churches to their responsibility for preserving democracy through a better understanding of their part in developing it. He discusses the issue between Christian pacifists and Christian patriots. Other Protestant opinions are given in Daniel Alfred Poling, *A Preacher Looks at War* (New York, 1943). Roman Catholic preachers are well represented by Fulton John Sheen, *God and War* (New York, 1942), and John James Burke, *The Catholic at War* (New York, 1942).

A large share of the wartime preaching looked forward hopefully to postwar reconstruction with the possibility of a durable peace and a new world order. John Knox, ed., *Religion and the Present Crisis* (Chicago, c.1942), with bibliographical references, consists of essays on pacifism, and on fellowship across the lines of conflict. In anticipation of the postwar mentality, he emphasizes preparation for a durable peace, education for a new world order, and the redemption of culture through the crisis. Andrew W. Blackwood, comp., "Preaching in War-Time, Looking Forward to Days of Rebuilding," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 37, no. 3 (April 1945), pp. 5–7, briefly annotated, comprises present-day sermons, the philosophy of wartime preaching, and the church and the contemporary wartime crisis. Harry H. Kruener, "Proposals for Post War Reconstruction," in *ibid.*, Vol. 34, no. 3 (April 1942), pp. 5–7, briefly annotated, comprises general surveys, definite plans, and the Church's part in building the new order.

Books relating to the contributions of churches of various denominations to the war effort are almost innumerable. The part of Protestant churches in general was summarized during the conflict by a guide issued by the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America, Coordinating Committee for Wartime Service: *Wartime Services of the Churches, a Handbook* (New York, 1943), including bibliographies. The work of the Defense Service Council of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S. (Southern) is described by Daniel Templeton Caldwell and B. L. Bowman, in *They Answered the Call* (Richmond, c.1952), illustrated. Methodist activities are summarized briefly in Methodist Church (United States), *Some Wartime Services of Methodist Churches, Prepared and Published by a Committee Appointed by the Council of Bishops of the Methodist Church* (Nashville and New York, c.1943), with bibliographies. The National Lutheran Council has narrated the services of that church in an illustrated volume, *By Their Side, a Memorial; War Service of the National Lutheran Council, 1940–1948* (n.p., 1949). The Christian Science Publishing Society has issued *The Story of Christian Science Wartime Activities, 1939–1946* (Boston, 1947), illustrated. The part of a liberal church appears in Sydney Bruce Snow's *The Unitarian Front in the War of Ideas* (Boston, Mass., 1940?), American Unitarian Association Tracts, no. 357.

Smaller groups, more conservative than the Unitarians, also played larger parts than has been realized. Adventist activity is described by Francis David Nichol in *The Wartime Contribution of Seventh-day Adventists, a Statement of the Unique Relationship of This Religious Body to the War and to Postwar Plans* (Takoma Park, Washington, D.C., 1943). Quaker war work, on a strictly civilian basis, is best narrated in Anna L. Curtis, *The Quakers Take Stock* [with] contributions by Emma Cadbury, Leonard S. Kenworthy [and] Howard E. Kershner; Introduction by Clarence E. Pickett (New York, 1944). Arthur Dunham's *Friends and Com-*

munity Service in War and Peace (Philadelphia? 1942), with "References for further reading," was published jointly by the Peace Section of the American Friends Service Committee and the Social Service Committee of the Philadelphia Yearly Meeting. A brief summary is given in the Society of Friends, American Friends Service Committee, *Quaker Peace Efforts in War-time* (Philadelphia, 1942).

Roman Catholic war efforts on the home front have probably never been described in more detail than in Rita LeBille Lynn, *The National Catholic Community Service in World War II* (Washington, 1952), a doctoral dissertation for the Catholic University of America, with bibliographical footnotes.

Interesting special phases of religious wartime service concern the city and the small town. One of the best is Harlan Paul Douglass, *The City Church in the War Emergency* (New York, 1945). A smaller community is intensively studied in Lowry Nelson, *Red Wing Churches During the War* (Minneapolis, 1946).

Emma Lucile Frank, *The Chaplaincy in the Armed Services, a Preliminary Bibliography* (The Library, Oberlin Graduate School of Theology, Oberlin, Ohio, July, 1945) has articles on all aspects of the chaplaincy in World War II, and selected articles on the chaplaincy in earlier wars, with references to books, pamphlets, and periodicals found in the larger libraries. One of the better descriptions of chaplain service has been compiled by the Methodist Church (United States) Commission on Chaplains: *Chaplains of the Methodist Church in World War II: a Pictorial Record of Their Work* (Washington, 1948).

The "follow-up" of the chaplains' service, in ministry to veterans, has been more thoroughly described than for any previous war in the nation's history. Roy Abram Burkhart, *The Church and the Returning Soldier; the Church and its Ministry to the Soldier Now, and its Total Guidance of all the Returning Soldiers* . . . (New York and London, 1945),

with a bibliography, reveals the general conviction of a permanent responsibility toward the veteran, lest the religious ground gained by ministry during the war should be lost. Other significant titles on this subject are: John Gordon Chamberlin, *The Church and Demobilization* (New York and Nashville, 1945), with bibliographical footnotes, discussing the entire range of practical problems; and Otis Radcliffe Rice, *The Church's Ministry to Returning Service Men* (Evanston, Ill., 1945), issued by the Episcopal Seabury-Western Theological Seminary. Harold Wilke, in *Greet the Man* (Philadelphia and St. Louis, 1945) offers a guide to Christian helpfulness to the veteran, from the viewpoint of a successful pastor in a university town.

The problem of the veteran had no sooner been considered, than the churches were compelled to confront the challenge of possible atomic warfare. The leading Protestant organization almost immediately responded by publishing *Atomic Warfare and the Christian Faith; Report* (New York, 1946), issued by the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America, Commission on the Relation of the Church to the War in the Light of the Christian Faith. The Council's *The Christian Conscience and Weapons of Mass Destruction; Report of a Special Commission* (New York, 1950) expresses the general Protestant opinion with respect to the threat presented to the survival of civilization by nuclear war. With this should be read: Edward LeRoy Long, *The Christian Response to the Atomic Crisis* (Philadelphia, 1950), and Vincent Edward Smith, *Footnotes for the Atom* (Milwaukee, 1951).

5. PEACE MOVEMENTS. The early literature of the crusade for peace, including the participation of the religiously inspired advocates and of the churches, is listed in an extensive bibliography by Edwin Doak Mead, *The Literature of the Peace Movement* (Boston, World Peace Foundation, 1912).

W. Freeman Galpin, *Pioneering for Peace: A Study of American Efforts to 1846* (Syracuse, N.Y., 1933) considers the participation of the churches and of individual Christians

in the movement. Typical expressions of the Christian motivation in the early peace crusade are represented by the three following essays: (1) [David Low Dodge], *War Inconsistent with the Religion of Jesus Christ, as it is Inhuman, Unwise, and Criminal* (New York, 1815), by a Calvinist merchant, who was one of the founders of the New York Peace Society (1815), was republished in 1905, with a biographical introduction by Edwin D. Mead. (2) [William Ladd], *Essays on Peace & War, which First Appeared in the Christian Mirror* . . . (Portland, [Me.], 1827, rev. and cor. by the author) was published under the name of "Philanthropos" by a Congregational minister, who was one of the founders of the American Peace Society in 1828, and was also a pioneer in the theory of international organization. (3) Jonathan Dymond, *An Inquiry into the Accordancy of War with the Principles of Christianity . . . with . . . notes by Thomas Smith Grimke* (Philadelphia, 1834).

The result of the efforts of these religious protagonists of peace is most ably and brilliantly summarized by Merle E. Curti, *The American Peace Crusade, 1815–1860* (Durham, N.C., 1929), with an extensive bibliography including official manuscript records. He discusses the movement as one of the most significant internationalist manifestations of American Protestantism, resulting from the general humanitarian and reformist ferment stirred up by the great revivals of the early 1800's. Devere Allen, *The Fight for Peace* (New York, 1930) is a general history of the peace movement, especially in the United States, by a convinced pacifist. Edson L. Whitney, *The American Peace Society: A Centennial History* (Washington, D.C., 1928) also is founded upon research in official records, and reviews the efforts and accomplishments, with references to religious support. The practical modern efforts of the churches are thoroughly investigated and criticized by Doniver A. Lund, "The Peace Movement Among the Major American Protestant Churches, 1919–1939" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nebraska, 1956;

University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 16,243; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 16, no. 4 (1956), p. 742). This is based largely upon study of the *Christian Century* and *Christian Advocate,* official minutes of governing bodies, pamphlets, journal articles, and unpublished studies of denominations, and includes the League of Nations, the World Court, the Kellogg-Briand Peace Pact, preparedness, and pacifism. It analyzes the policies of churches in support of specific peace movements, and sees more pacifists among the clergy than among the laity. The door was left open to the possibility of war as the lesser of two evils. Pacifism helped to lay the foundation of neutrality laws, and the churches supported the right to be pacifist, and showed a growing consciousness of international peace as their concern, while establishing denominational peace agencies.

6. CHURCHES AND PACIFISM. Umphrey Lee, *The Historic Church and Modern Pacifism . . .* (New York, c.1943), with bibliographical notes, surveys the traditional attitudes of organized religion toward war, and its general contemporary opinion of religious or secular and rationalistic pacifism. An even more thorough treatment of the topic is Roland Herbert Bainton, *The Churches and War; Historic Attitudes Toward Christian Participation, a Survey from Biblical Times to the Present Day* (New York, 1945), with a bibliography. Walter William VanKirk, *Religion Renounces War* (Chicago and New York, 1934), with bibliography in notes to chapters, represents the rather extreme pacifism of the period after World War I, in reaction against the participation of the clergy and the churches in that conflict, as revealed in Ray H. Abrams, *Preachers Present Arms* (New York, 1933). Reinhold Niebuhr, *Christianity and Power Politics* (New York, 1940) presents the considered view of a noted theologian, who recognizes the conflict between national and religious aims, and yet rejects the absolute pacifist position. John Knox, ed., "Re-examining Pacifism," in *Religion and the Present Crisis* (Chicago, 1942) reveals the conscientious perplexities of a

sensitive Christian, who sought to relate his religious values to the brutal reality of war. The painful dilemma is sympathetically and realistically investigated by the Episcopalian scholar and historian, James Thayer Addison, in *War, Peace, and the Christian Mind; a Review of Recent Thought*, Foreword by Henry Knox Sherill (Greenwich, Conn., 1953), with a bibliography. Vernon Howard Halloway, "American Pacifism Between Two Wars, 1919–1941" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1949; abstract published in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 19, no. 3 (Summer, 1950), pp. 367–379) distinguishes nonresistant and nonpolitical pacifism; millenarian pacificism rooted in religious expectations of the imminent end of history; religious pacifism substituting ethics for politics and war; secular pacifism based upon reason and moral and educational effort; and Marxist hopes of world harmony based on a classless society. An excellent sequel is Ralph Luther Moellering, *Modern War and the American Churches; a Factual Study of the Christian Conscience on Trial from 1939 to the Cold War Crisis of Today* (New York, c.1956), with a bibliography. Robert Cameron Fisher, "The American Churches in the Twentieth Century and War" (essay submitted in competition for the 1947 Fellowship in Church History by "Hatch Fletch" [pseud.], 1947: Princeton Theological Seminary), typescript, with a bibliography, is a very thorough and frank review.

The impact of the peace and pacifist problem upon specific religious organizations is closely studied in two well-documented essays. The opinion and policy of a Protestant denomination is reviewed in James Walter Gladden, "The Methodist Church and the Problem of War and Peace" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1946). The liberal social creed of the merged church of 1939 put Methodism on record as a "peace church," but under pressure of circumstances in 1944, it officially supported the war, although there was bitter opposition. There is a more general ap-

preciation of peace education and of international organization to eliminate war.

Samuel Solomon Cohon, *Judaism and War* (Trinidad, Colo., n.d.) was published by the Alfred Freudenthal Memorial Foundation in cooperation with the Union of American Hebrew Congregations. He observes that Jews, like Christians, are of divided opinions, but the predominant attitude is that a "righteous war" is justified, in defense of civilized values. This should be read along with Roland Bertram Gittelsohn, *The Jew Looks at War and Peace* (Cincinnati, Ohio, 1935) in five parts, mimeographed, with a bibliography for each part.

7. NONRESISTANCE; CONSCIENTIOUS OBJECTORS. Melvin Gingerich, *Service for Peace* (Akron, Pa., 1949) is the first scholarly and comprehensive study of America's largest group of conscientious objectors during World War II, including Mennonites and affiliated groups. The official (and traditional) attitude of the denomination is expounded in numerous publications, including: (1) John Horsch, comp., *Symposium on War* (Scottdale, Pa., 1927), published by [the] Mennonite Peace Problems Committee. (2) Guy Franklin Herschberger, *Can Christians Fight? Essays on Peace and War* (Scottdale, Pa., 1940, Mennonite Peace Publications). (3) Also his *War, Peace, and Nonresistance* (Scottdale, Pa., 1944), and (4) his *The Mennonite Church in the Second World War* (Scottdale, Pa., 1951), which discusses the peace work of the "Old Mennonite" Church. (5) Willard D. Hunsberger, *The Franconia Mennonites and War* (Souderton, Pa., 1951), published by the Peace and Industrial Relations Committee of Franconia Mennonite Conference, has a valuable bibliography. The actual treatment of Mennonite conscientious objectors during World War II is related in detail in Peter Lester Rohrer and Mary E. Rohrer, *The Story of the Lancaster County Conference Mennonites in Civilian Public Service, with Directory* (Lancaster, Pa., 1946).

Margaret E. Hirst, *The Quakers in Peace and War: An Account of Their Peace Principles and Practice* (London, The Swarthmore House) is a well-documented study. Rufus Matthew Jones, ed., *The Church, the Gospel and War* (New York, 1948), with bibliographical footnotes, fairly represents the Quaker religious philosophy of nonresistance. The most thorough recent review of the Friends' "concern" for peaceful methods is Harvey Joseph Daniel Seifert, "The Use by American Quakers of Nonviolent Resistance as a Method of Social Change" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1940; abstract published by Boston University Graduate School, 1940), which considers the conscientious objectors in World War I.

There are several excellent accounts of the experiences of Quaker conscientious objectors in the nation's wars. The Revolutionary sufferings are related in great detail by Thomas Gilpin, ed., *Exiles in Virginia; with Observations on the Conduct of the Society of Friends during the Revolutionary War* . . . (Philadelphia, 1848). Their treatment in the Confederate States during the Civil War is told by Fernando Gale Cartland, in *Southern Heroes; or, The Friends in War Time . . . with an Introduction by Benjamin F. Trueblood* . . . (Cambridge, 1895), with illustrations. The Quakers, together with others, are discussed in Edward Needles Wright, *Conscientious Objectors in the Civil War* (Philadelphia, 1931), "A scholarly study, unbiased and well documented" (Latourette, *The Great Century*, p. 496), stressing the legal aspects of the objector's position. The story of Friends as pacifists in World War I is briefly summarized in Arle Brooks and Robert J. Leach, *Help Wanted! The Experiences of Some Quaker Conscientious Objectors* (Philadelphia, the American Friends Service Committee, 1940). The determined and sacrificial efforts of Quakers to provide a way by which their "C.O.'s" might perform non-fighting service have been amply detailed in two publications by the Society of Friends, American Friends Service Committee. The

most complete, with "Suggestions for further reading" at the end of most of the chapters, is: *An Introduction to Friends Civilian Public Service; the Motivation, Policies and Structure of Friends Civilian Public Service, and the Issues and Alternatives Facing Conscientious Objectors under Conscription* (Philadelphia, 1945), illustrated. A briefer account is in *Projects and Incentives; a Study of the Work Projects and the Incentives for Work in the Civilian Public Service Camps and Units under the Administration of the American Friends Service Committee* (Philadelphia, 1946).

Rufus David Bowman, *The Church of the Brethren and War, 1708–1941* (Elgin, Ill., 1944), with a bibliography, indicates the origin of the group's opposition to war, and the development of the attitude from 1708 to the outbreak of World War II, and interprets significant changes in attitude within the general area of church-state relationships. Rufus David Bowman, *Seventy Times Seven* (Elgin, Ill., 1945) briefly reviews the historic position of the Church of the Brethren regarding war, the philosophical and Biblical basis for pacifism, and specific plans for a peace education program. Fulfilment of the denomination's ideal, of service to peace both in and beyond wartime, is completely narrated by Leslie Eisan, *Pathways of Peace, a History of the Civilian Public Service Program, Administered by the Brethren Service Committee* (Elgin, Ill., Brethren Publishing House, 1948), with bibliographical note, and illustrations.

Since the beginning of World War I the position of the conscientious objector with relation to the law has been almost continuously debated and defined. The situation in World War I was described by the American Civil Liberties Union in *The Facts about Conscientious Objectors in the United States under the Selective Service Act of May 18, 1917* (New York and Washington, 1918). A sympathetic treatment of the "C.O." during the pacifist period of the 1930's is found in Lowell Harris Coate, *The Conscription of Conscience* (Los Angeles, c.1934).

Paul Gia Russo, "The Conscientious Objector in American Law," in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 10, no. 3 (Summer, 1941), pp. 333–345, reviews the debate in the Constitutional Convention and James Madison's favor toward the objector's right to refuse service. Russo declares that the legislature has control over the religious pacifist, and reviews State and Federal laws, Selective Service Act cases, the objector in citizenship cases, the status of the non-religious objector, and recent controversies under the 1940 law. Exemption is a matter of privilege, not of right. Julien Cornell, *The Conscientious Objector and the Law* (New York, 1943) is a general account of the "C.O." in World War II and his legal position. Nathan T. Elliff, "Jehovah's Witnesses and the Selective Service Act," in *Virginia Law Review,* Vol. 31, no. 4 (Sept. 1945), pp. 811–834, observes the general restraint and absence of hysteria regarding nonconformists in World War II. He includes a long review of cases of violation of the act since 1940, based upon the claim of all members to be ministers of religion. Interpretation of the ministerial exemption was "most liberal," and susceptible to misuse. A new definition of conscientious objection is needed to cover the Witnesses, who do not call themselves objectors. Scruple must have a limit in cases of vital national interest.

The actual experiences of conscientious objectors under the law, in World War II, are briefly comprehended by a report of the American Civil Liberties Union: *A Report on the Treatment of Conscientious Objectors in World War II; Conscience and the War* (New York, 1943). Another review, presenting the facts impartially and objectively, yet sympathetic toward the "C.O." viewpoint, is Mulford Quickert Sibley, *Conscription of Conscience; the American State and the Conscientious Objector, 1940–1947* (Ithaca, 1952). With Ada Wardlaw as co-author, he presents those who suffered for conscience's sake in *Conscientious Objectors in Prison, 1940–1945* (Philadelphia, Pa., 1945, in Publications of the Pacifist Research Bureau, no. 13), with bibliographical foot-

notes. (See also sect. II, D, 3, *The Jehovah's Witnesses and Religious Freedom.*)

C. Religion and Internationalism

John T. McNeill, *Christian Hope for World Society* (Chicago, 1937) suggests that Christianity exerted an important internationalizing influence during the seventeenth, eighteenth, and nineteenth centuries. Walter Marshall Horton, *Can Christianity Save Civilization?* (New York, 1940) is a sophisticated analysis of the relation of religion to culture, and of the potentialities of Christianity as a world-wide faith binding the nations together. Henry P. Van Dusen, *For the Healing of the Nations* (New York, 1940) offers a view of the personal impact of the new Protestant internationalism on one of its leading American protagonists.

Suggested readings are available in Richard Terrill Baker, ed., *The Church and World Order; Today's Jobs for Tomorrow's World; Reports of the Seminars to the Conference on Christian Bases of World Order,* Delaware, Ohio, March 8–12, 1943 (New York and Nashville, 1943). A similarly hopeful collection was published by the Institute for Religious and Social Studies, Jewish Theological Seminary of America: *Religion and the World Order, A Series of Addresses and Discussions,* ed. F. Ernest Johnson (New York and London, 1944), in the "Religion and Civilization Series." The World Council of Churches, *Man's Disorder and God's Design* (New York, 1949, 4 vols. in 1) served as the basis of discussion at the first assembly of the World Council of Churches. Vols. I and IV are especially relevant to ecumenicalism as an international bond. The same optimism prevails in Edwin E. Aubrey [and others], "Religious Foundations for Enduring Peace," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 4, 1943 (New York, 1944), pp. 724–824, with comments. In considering the problems of the coming peace, they state that religion should enunciate the

principle of peace as a religious truth, and see that it is energized in personal conduct, in the church, and in the hopeful ecumenical movement. Nels F. S. Ferré, "A Religion for One World," in *ibid.*, Vol. 8, 1947 (New York, 1948), pp. 495–510, with comments by six others, represents the need of a world faith based upon truth and universality, and suggests that the probable result will be a kind of "democratic pluralism of many religions." Philosophy alone is too lacking in spiritual vitality. Cross-fertilization of cultures and religions can lead to the birth of an adequate religion for one world. Forrest L. Knapp, "Contributions of the Christian Movement to Foundations of World Organization," in *ibid.*, Vol. 11, 1950 (New York, 1952), pp. 95–101, considers missionary enterprise and interdenominational cooperation, referring almost exclusively to Protestantism, stressing increased mutual understanding, sense of community, and concern for general welfare. World organizations have encouraged these tendencies. M. W. Beckelman [and other staff members], "The American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee as Related to the Experience of Private Cooperation in the Areas of International Cooperation," in *ibid.*, Vol. 11, 1950 (New York, 1952), pp. 153–170, points out that, while the organization was intended to aid distressed Jews, it is a phase of religiously supported international cooperation, placing American social service skills at the service of the world. James G. Vail, "Observations from American Friends Service Committee Experience in Transnational Activity and Organization," in *ibid.*, Vol. 11, 1950 (New York, 1952), pp. 141–152, with comment, describes aspects of experience of the Committee in international working groups concerned primarily with relief and rehabilitation. The results of such dedicated service, moved by spiritual responses, point to international comity.

The general trend of Protestant opinion and pronouncements, during the successive crises caused by world-wide conflicts, is reviewed and criticized by Arthur H. Darken in "The National Council of Churches and Our Foreign Policy," in

Religion in Life, Vol. 24, no. 1 (Winter, 1954–1955), pp. 113–126, with some bibliographical references in footnotes. He analyzes certain basic defects in the churches' position: overemphasis upon peace and nonviolence, rather than justice or freedom; failure to understand the struggle for power; and unwillingness to use American power as a restraint. A trend toward realism appears in recognition of the hard facts of political power and the complex nature of international relations, the ambiguous nature of man, and his perversions of God's power. An excellent review of the attitudes and influence of the Protestant churches respecting American responsibility for world order is Ernest Warren Le Fever's "Protestants and United States Foreign Policy, 1925–1954" (reference in *Index to American Doctoral Dissertations Combined with Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 16, no. 13, 1955–1956).

D. The Church as a Pressure Group

Although the separation of church and state has long been established as a general principle of American social organization, this does not mean that there are no areas of common or conflicting interests between the two forms of association, the secular and the religious. On the contrary, it is only in situations where the two are separate that one can readily study their convergence and conflict. The fact that the church is not an agency of the state raises the immediate possibility that the church, like other voluntary associations, may occasionally attempt to influence the course of legislation, either in its own interests as an organization, or in conformity with its beliefs and teachings about the kind of social system it favors. A notable instance of that latter kind in recent times was a concerted effort of various Protestant denominations to secure state and national laws prohibiting the manufacture and sale of intoxicating beverages (see sect. IV, D, 1, *The Prohibition Campaign*, below).

The following section attempts to illustrate the types of

problems to which the church, as a political pressure group, may apply itself. To some extent the pressure is in behalf of the church as an organization, for tax exemption and similar privileges; to some extent it is an effort to translate Christian ethics into the legal structure of civil, secular society. This section is concerned with the general question of church activity in behalf of political issues, and the types of organization and procedure used to influence the course of legislation.

John R. Bodo, *The Protestant Clergy and Public Issues, 1812–1848* (Princeton, 1954) reveals the activity of the clergy as leaders of public opinion on a wide variety of social and political questions, an inheritance from theocratic concepts of the relation of church and state. Richard M. Johnson, "Sunday Observance and the Mail," in Joseph L. Blau, ed., *Social Theories of Jacksonian Democracy* (New York, 1947) studies the attitude of a Kentucky political leader toward religious pressure against Sunday carriage of mail, one of the burning issues of the 1830's. That the clerical politicians and lobbyists did not escape scathing criticism is obvious in the following typical attack: William F. Jamieson, *The Clergy a Source of Danger to the American Republic* (Chicago, 1873, 2nd ed.) bitingly criticizes and condemns ministerial pressure in politics and public issues, at a time when the churches were beginning to lobby for prohibition and other moral causes. William Warren Sweet, "Methodist Church Influence in Southern Politics," in *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (Mar. 1915), pp. 546–560, declares that the influence of the churches was never so potent as during the slavery controversy, the Civil War, and Reconstruction, and points to the activities and office-holding of Methodist ministers, and the Negro association of new freedom with religion. *Political Action of Our Church Members and Clergy, a Chief Cause of Our Present Religious Declension* (New York, 1848) points up the fact that organized religion as a political pressure group is nothing new, and raises the cry of a "perverted pulpit."

Such criticism appears not to have diminished the efforts of organized religion to mould public opinion and influence legislation. The modern situation is exposed in detail by the three following essays: Arthur E. Holt, "Organized Religion as a Pressure Group," in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol. 179 (May 1935), pp. 43–49, briefly discusses the ways in which religious organizations function as political pressure groups under the American system of church-state separation. A similar study is Harry F. Ward, "Organized Religion, the State, and the Economic Order," in *ibid.*, Vol. 256 (March 1948), pp. 120–131. Alfred McClung Lee, "The Press and Public Relations of Religious Bodies," in *ibid.*, details the particular public relations procedures used by churches to influence opinion on issues.

Perhaps the most understanding modern essay on this bitterly debated subject is an address by Liston Pope, "Organized Religion and Pressure Groups," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium*, Vol. 5, 1944 (New York, 1945), pp. 444–449. He states that placing confidence in changed individuals, who in turn will reform society, does not consider the degree of moulding by supra-individual forces. Functional isolation of the churches is impossible, and neutrality toward pressure groups is outmoded and immoral; religious groups must fulfill their responsibility through intermediary organizations. William Adams Brown, *Church and State in Contemporary America* (New York, 1936) summarizes the variety of religious pressures on public issues. Daniel S. Boorstin, *The Genius of American Politics* (Chicago, 1953) has brief notes on the churches and their activities as pressure groups. J. Milton Yinger, *Religion and the Struggle for Power* (Durham, N.C., 1946) gives a summary of the activities of organized religion with respect to the economic order. Stanley High, *The Church in Politics* (New York and London, 1930) completely reviews the subject, from the viewpoint of an observer familiar with lobbying

activities in the national capital. Luke E. Ebersole, *Church Lobbying in the Nation's Capital* (New York, 1951), with "Notes and References," describes methods used by churches to influence political decisions in Washington.

1. THE PROHIBITION CAMPAIGN. One of the outstanding examples of organized pressure by Protestant churches upon the state, in behalf of a particular social and legal reform, was the campaign to secure state and federal legislation to prohibit the manufacture and sale of intoxicating beverages. The long-continued and finally successful campaign illustrates the concern by the Protestant denominations for direct social reform. Its special concentration upon a directly "moral" issue, rather than on the economic organization of society, points to a lack of independence of the churches from the social order in which they function. This section emphasizes not only the overt activity of the churches in the campaign, but also the doctrinal bases of the movement behind the propaganda and the pressure.

John A. Krout, *The Origins of Prohibition* (New York, 1925), with copious notes and an extraordinary bibliography, studies in detail the religious origins and growth of the temperance movement up to 1851, the passage of the Maine liquor law. The Prohibition Amendment did not result from temporary conditions, but finally expressed influences that had been coming since the great revivals of the early nineteenth century. The religious motivation is illustrated by the biography of one of the reform leaders. Henry Martyn Baird, *Life of the Rev. Robert Baird, D.D.* (New York, 1866) is a scholarly tribute to the labors of an eminent minister in the causes of temperance reform and ecumenicity, and is also an illuminating view of early religious pressure groups. All his reform activities were inspired and pervaded by a deep evangelical piety. E. H. Cherrington, ed., *Standard Encyclopedia of the Alcohol Problem* (Westerville, Ohio, 6 vols., 1925–1930) includes material on the evangelical religious organizations backing the prohibition movement.

Clark Warburton, "Prohibition," in *Encyclopaedia of the Social Sciences*, Vol. 12, pp. 499–510, presents a good general introduction to a case study of the national campaign for prohibition of liquor as waged by religious groups. Peter H. Odegard, *Pressure Politics: The Story of the Anti-Saloon League* (New York, 1929) is among the best detailed descriptions of the prohibition campaign, and the best single source on the activities of the church-supported lobby. Justin Steuart, *Wayne Wheeler: Dry Boss* (New York, 1928) severely criticizes the dominating chief of the religiously backed Anti-Saloon League. Virginius Dabney, *Dry Messiah: The Life of Bishop Cannon* (New York, 1949) analyzes the southern Methodist church leader who, more than any other person, symbolized the organized pressure of religious groups for prohibition.

The reawakening of the prohibition campaign, within a few years after the repeal of the amendment, was characterized by a new strategy of enlisting the support of business men and waging a campaign of education. The new line of attack appeared in the presidential campaign of 1940. Roger W. Babson, *Our Campaign for the Presidency in 1940: America and the Churches* (Chicago, 1941) is an apology by the candidate of the Prohibition Party. Babson was noted as a business commentator and as a reviver of the prohibition movement, with religious support. Further evidence is assembled by Alfred McClung Lee, "Techniques of Social Reform: An Analysis of the New Prohibition Drive," in *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 9, no. 1 (Feb. 1944), pp. 65–77, with bibliographical references in footnotes. He indicates the resurgence of the movement, partly with church backing, and analyzes ten major factors in the fight, including opposition of religious forces to drink, and anti-Romanism due to "identification" of Roman Catholics with saloon politics. Professional evangelism seized upon prohibition as a cause. Alson J. Smith, "Inside Prohibition Headquarters," in *American Mercury*, Vol. 66, no. 289 (Jan. 1948), pp. 57–63,

describes the new campaign of the Methodist Board of Temperance, Prohibition and Public Morals—a quiet one of education rather than overt political pressure. Virginius Dabney, "Prohibition's Ghost Walks Again," in *Collier's*, Vol. 124 (November 26, 1949), pp. 13–15, 73–74, analyzes the attempted revival of the crusade and the part of certain church leaders in it. Based upon a close study of past and present prohibition movements, this is a warning of the alleged unholy association of prohibition, gangsterism, and political reaction.

2. RELIGION AND FASCISM. Fanatical "fringes" of organized religion have been active in native fascist movements of different kinds, especially during the economic depression of the 1930's. Anti-Jewish agitation, often of a very scurrilous character, has been a common feature of such movements, but the objectives have gone far beyond that familiar feature. In some cases clergymen have been leaders in these movements, and one of the most striking examples was Father Coughlin, the "radio priest" of the Shrine of the Little Flower at Royal Oak, Michigan, who organized the "Social Justice" and "Christian Front" campaigns, and finally went to such extremes of abuse that he was silenced by his ecclesiastical superiors.

T. W. Adorno, *The Authoritarian Personality* (New York, 1950) supplies background material on the relation of extreme religious, fanatical, conservative, and reactionary movements to political authoritarian upheavals. Leo Lowenthal and Norbert Guterman, "Portrait of the American Agitator," in *Public Opinion Quarterly*, Vol. 12 (Fall, 1948), pp. 417–429, is a clear and simple presentation of the social-psychological approach to an understanding of the Christian Fascist agitator in his historical context. It indicates differences from genuine reformers and revolutionaries, and explains the secret of their hold over their followers, and their appearance in 1930–45. They are symptoms of social disorganization. A much more thorough study of the personalities and their

movements is Raymond Swing's *Forerunners of American Fascism* (New York, 1935), which has an informative and analytical essay on Father Coughlin. John Roy Carlson, *The Plotters* (New York, 1946) offers an exposition of the activities of Father Coughlin, and of other so-called fascist leaders in the United States, in the Depression period and beyond. His *Under Cover* (New York, 1943) relates the story of Father Coughlin as an important Catholic representative of native American fascism in the 1930's. Wallace Stegner, "The Radio Priest and His Flock," in Isabel Leighton, ed., *The Aspirin Age* (New York, 1949) portrays Father Coughlin's influence in terms of his effects upon people. His agitation is studied as a serious, purposeful one in Nick Arthur Masters, "Father Coughlin and Social Justice; a Case Study of a Social Movement" (Thesis, University of Wisconsin; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1956), pub. no. 16,193; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 16 (1956), no. 5, p. 987), with a bibliography.

Ralph Roy, *Apostles of Discord* (Boston, 1953) contains a perceptive consideration of Gerald L. K. Smith as a Protestant representative of "Christian fascism." The most extensive exposition of the Protestant brand is comprised in Seventy-Ninth Congress, Second Session, House of Representatives, Committee on Un-American Activities, Jan. 30, 1946: *Investigation of Un-American Propaganda Activities in the United States* (Washington, 1946). This presents a vivid personal introduction to Smith's mind and personality. The relation of religion to his and kindred movements is exhaustively studied in Frederick K. Wentz, "The Reaction of the Religious Press in America to the Emergency of Nazism" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1954). This analyzes the various types of attitude, ranging from friendliness to "liberal" condemnation. Frank Bohn, "The Ku Klux Klan Interpreted," in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 30, no. 4 (Jan. 1925), pp. 385–407, emphasizes the prominence of religious intolerance as a superficial aspect of ethnic conflict.

His social interpretation of certain conservative Protestant religious movements designates the Klan as the most important phase of militant nationalism. On the other hand, Robert Moats Miller, "A Note on the Relationship between the Protestant Churches and the Revival of the Ku Klux Klan," in *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 22, no. 3 (Aug. 1956), pp. 355–368, has copious references to church publications, showing denunciation of the Klan by Protestant liberal and Fundamentalist leaders. It is not possible to aver a connection between the Fundamentalists and the Klan, which is not an official instrument of Protestantism. Nels F. S. Ferré, "The Motivational Power of Christianity for Democracy," in *Perspectives on a Troubled Decade: Science, Philosophy, and Religion, 1939–1949*, Tenth Symposium, ed. Lyman Bryson [and others] (New York, 1950) discusses the question of the necessity of democratic action.

V. RELIGION AND EDUCATION

A. Puritanism and Education

LIKE most forms of Protestant Christianity, Puritanism placed great value on education. A literate laity was required in a system which made the Bible and preaching central in religious living. Consequently, it is not surprising that Harvard College was founded in 1636, and that a statute of 1647 provided that every township with fifty householders should employ a schoolmaster to teach the elements to all children, either at public expense or at a reasonable charge to the parents. This plan of elementary education was frankly religious in its aims, and pious books constituted the basic materials of instruction. The religious orientation persisted for at least two centuries, in New England and in other sections, although the increasingly secular character of American society reduced the degree of ecclesiastical control of elementary schools. (See also Part Two, sect. VIII, B, 1, *Philosophy: Re-*

ligious Education and Democracy.) Samuel Eliot Morison, *The Puritan Pronaos* (New York, 1936) notes the pervasive influence of the Puritan leaders as educators, and the religious coloring they gave to early American education—the ideal of religion as its fostering parent. Robert F. Seybolt, *Apprenticeship & Apprenticeship Education in Colonial New England & New York* (New York, 1917) shows that education was a moral and religious obligation in the Puritan theocracy. His *Public Schools of Colonial Boston, 1635–1775* (Cambridge, Mass., 1935) observes the potency of religious influences promoting the establishment of the New England school system. Clifford K. Shipton, "Secondary Education in the Puritan Colonies," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 7, no. 4 (Dec. 1934), pp. 646–661, with references in footnotes, points out that schools were favored by the ministers not for religious ends only, but for secular citizenship, and were not exclusively religious. Samuel Eliot Morison, in *The Founding of Harvard College* (Cambridge, Mass., 1935) again sounds the note of early American Puritanism as the fostering parent of education.

B. Higher Education and Religion

The American churches dominated higher education, not only in the West but throughout the nation, at least until 1860. The titles in this section are intended not only to determine the part religion played in the founding and quality of American higher education, but also in the general transmission of values and learning through the religious impulse.

William Warren Sweet, *Religion in the Development of American Culture: 1765–1840* (New York, 1952) shows the major contribution of religion and ecclesiastical interests in the promotion of academies and colleges. The chief authority on the subject is Donald G. Tewksbury, *The Founding of American Colleges and Universities Before the Civil War, with Particular Reference to the Religious Influences Bear-*

ing on the College Movement (New York, 1932). This work is solidly founded upon extensive research in primary and secondary sources.

The New England Puritan (Congregational) and the Presbyterian Church influences were especially prominent, particularly in the Middle West. Excellent authorities on this section are: (1) Vernon Franklin Schwalm, "The Historical Development of the Denominational Colleges in the Old Northwest to 1870" (Thesis, University of Chicago, 1926, typescript, with bibliography and illustrations); (2) Raymond Bradley Stevens, *The Social and Religious Influences of the Small Denominational College of the Middle West* (New York, 1929); and (3) E. Kidd Lockard, "The Influence of New England in Denominational Colleges in the Northwest, 1830–1860," in *Ohio State Archaeological and Historical Quarterly*, Vol. 53 (1944), pp. 1–13, with bibliographical footnotes.

Leonard J. Trinterud, *The Forming of an American Tradition* (Philadelphia, 1949) has valuable observations on Presbyterian founding of colleges. Other authoritative references to Presbyterian influence in early higher education are: (1) William Warren Sweet, *Religion on the American Frontier: The Presbyterians* (New York, 1936), with references to Western colleges; and (2) Walter B. Posey, *The Presbyterian Church in the Old Southwest: 1778–1838* (Richmond, 1952).

The early dissemination of Presbyterian influence in higher education proceeded largely from the College of New Jersey (Princeton University). That general influence is appreciated in the two following references: Varnum Lansing Collins, *President Witherspoon* (Princeton, 1925, 2 vols.) is the most scholarly biography of this president of Princeton, 1768–1794, with notes on his views of religion in higher education. John Witherspoon, *The Works of the Reverend John Witherspoon* (Philadelphia, 1801, 4 vols.) includes essays revealing his educational ideas and their relation to

religion. His influence as president of Princeton, and as a lecturer and teacher, carried his ideas far and wide, especially in the West and South. One should consult also Curtis P. Nettels, *The Roots of American Civilization* (New York, 1938), with reference to colonial developments; Nelson R. Burr, *Education in New Jersey, 1630–1871* (Princeton, 1942), emphasizing the part of religion in the college's establishment and influence; and Thomas J. Wertenbaker, *Princeton, 1746–1896* (Princeton, 1946).

A typical illustration of the Princetonian-Presbyterian penetration of the transmontane states is seen in John E. Pomfret, "Philip Lindsley, Pioneer Educator of the Old Southwest," in Willard Thorp, ed., *The Lives of Eighteen from Princeton* (Princeton, 1946), pp. 158–177. He reviews the influence of this Princetonian in promoting Presbyterian influence in higher education, especially in Tennessee. The rival influence of Methodism is discerned by William Warren Sweet, in *Methodism in American History* (New York, 1933), surveying the part of Methodists in education, especially through colleges in the Southern and Western States.

Religious coloring of early higher education was imparted, to a large extent, by the ministerial president. Instances of his influence may be studied in Albea Godbold, *The Church College of the Old South* (Durham, N.C., 1944), with a bibliography. Peter G. Mode in his *The Frontier Spirit in American Christianity* (New York, 1923) pays a notable tribute to the broad cultural influence of the old-time denominational college president. And George P. Schmidt, *The Old Time College President* (New York, 1930) describes the qualities and pervasive influence of the all-around man (often a clergyman) in higher education. A fairly typical example was the Rev. John Witherspoon, president of the College of New Jersey, whose pupils founded or taught in many Southern and Western colleges and academies (see ref. above).

Until the 1890's, and even until the period of World War I, the privileged position of religion in American higher

education seemed fairly secure. The weight of academic tradition was strengthened by revivalism, denominationalism, family practice, and numerous student Christian movements. The assumption was that religion should be an integral part of learning, and compulsory attendance at services was normal. The rise of natural science in the late nineteenth century introduced an increasingly skeptical attitude on campuses, and by the 1920's many teachers and undergraduates were unbelievers or regarded traditional religion as unreal and irrelevant. This attitude inspired an effort to examine critically the basic ideals and purposes of denominational higher education, illustrated by the following studies: Paul Moyer Limbert, *Denominational Policies in the Support and Supervision of Higher Education* (New York, 1929), with a bibliography; and Leslie Karr Patton, *The Purposes of Church-related Colleges; a Critical Study, a Proposed Program* (New York, 1940), with a bibliography.

The religious atmosphere in many colleges early in the present century is suggested by Edwin Noah Hardy, *The Churches and Educated Men; a Study of the Relation of the Church to Makers and Leaders of Public Opinion* (Boston and New York, 1904). The challenge of religion to the students is probably nowhere better studied than in Clarence P. Shedd, *Two Centuries of Student Christian Movements, Their Origin and Intercollegiate Life* (New York, 1934), which is the standard account, and covers chiefly the period from 1700 to 1900, based upon careful research in the sources.

The decline of the nineteenth-century evangelistic spirit and the growing lack of interest in formal religion are evident in many sources, especially in essays in the religious periodicals. A representative one, in the questioning 1920's, is Parker Albert Fitch, "What is the Present Attitude of College Students toward Organized Religion?" in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 1, no. 2 (Mar. 1921), pp. 113–128. The churches do not appeal; religion, to the sensitive college youth, is not candid, intelligent, beautiful, and dignified. Churches will have to

change more than the students, who regard them as hostile to mental freedom, indifferent to duty, and morally backward. Charles W. Gilkey, "Religion Among American Students," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 4, no. 1 (Jan. 1924), pp. 1–15, asks whether college religion is turning out real leaders to guide democracy, and to lift it above mediocrity. This British leader of students comments on lack of moral firmness to accompany charm and intelligence. The extent of doubt is suggested in a study by Lacey Lee Leftwich, "A Survey of the Attitudes toward Religion of a College Freshman Class" (Master's thesis, University of Chicago, Department of Practical Theology, 1924, typewritten, with bibliography, University of Chicago Libraries). The beginning of a more serious inquiring attitude appears in Jessie Allen Charters, *The College Student Thinking it Through* (New York and Cincinnati, 1930), with bibliography. The situation after World War II, during a period of "religious revival," is viewed in Gordon W. Allport, James M. Gillespie, and Jacqueline Young, "The Religion of the Post-War College Student," in *Journal of Psychology*, Vol. 25, no. 1 (Jan. 1948), pp. 3–33.

Extensive discussion of undergraduate attitudes led to many surveys and proposals concerning the best means of organizing and promoting religious education in institutions of higher learning. The actual situation in the 1920's is surveyed in an article by the liberal Protestant theologian, Shailer Mathews: "Agencies for Promoting Religion in the Colleges" in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 4, no. 3 (May 1924), pp. 293–305.

The development of thought on the problem among secondary and higher school leaders is best seen in two studies, and the proceedings of several conferences held during the 1920's and 1930's. The recommended books are: David Richard Porter, ed., *The Church in the Universities* (New York, 1925) and William Houston, *The Church at the University; Her Opportunities, Obligations and Methods* (Co-

lumbus, Ohio, 1926). Three conferences held during the troubled period were: (1) Conference on Religion in Universities, Colleges, and Preparatory Schools, Princeton, N.J., 1928: *Religion in the Colleges; the Gist of the Conference . . .* held at Princeton, N.J., February 17–19, 1928; edited by Galen M. Fisher (New York, 1928), with bibliographies. (2) Milton Carsley Towner, ed., *Religion in Higher Education; Containing the Principal Papers Read at the Conference of Church Workers,* Chicago, Ill., December 31, 1930–January 2, 1931 . . . etc. . . . with introductions by Shailer Mathews and Frederick J. Kelly (Chicago, 1931). (3) *Religion in the Preparatory Schools: the Proceedings of the National Conference of Preparatory School Masters,* held at Atlantic City, N.J., Oct. 7–9, 1938; ed. Boyd Edwards and Harold B. Ingalls (New York, 1932).

Development of new religious leadership on the campus is demanded by Ellis Huntington Dana, *Modern Christian Adventure, New Dynamics for New Leaders* (Wellesley, Mass., 1942). The inherent difficulties in such a program are outlined, however, by the experienced observer of college religion, Lacey Lee Leftwich, in "The Administration of Religion in the Liberal Arts College" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1942; abstract published in *Religious Education,* Vol. 36, no. 4 (Oct.–Dec. 1941) with bibliographical footnotes; original copy in University of Chicago Libraries). He points out the weaknesses in campus attempts at community integration, traces early attempts to make religion a part of campus life, and proposes integration of the liberal arts college about living religious values.

The problem of religious instruction is difficult in private colleges, universities, and academies, and even more so in state-supported institutions, where the question of state-church relations must be considered. The problem in general is thoroughly canvassed by Clarence Prouty Shedd, *The Church Follows Its Students* (New Haven and London, 1938, Yale Studies in Religious Education, Vol. 10), with notes, which

relates the story of the student chaplain movement, begun by the pioneer work of university pastors in the state and larger independent schools. By far the best account of this phase is Seymour A. Smith's *The American College Chaplaincy* (New York, 1954), a history of chaplaincies in American colleges, considering work in worship, teaching, counseling, etc.

Ways of encountering the problem in the religiously oriented colleges and universities have been investigated in three especially notable studies: (1) Eugene Rone Arnold, "Survey of Religious Activities of Liberal Arts Colleges Related to Churches Composing the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A." (Thesis, University of Pittsburgh; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1957), pub. no. 20,997; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 17 (1957), no. 5, pp. 1008–1009), with bibliography. (2) Murray Howard Leiffer, *Methodist Student Work at the Colleges and Universities of Arizona, California, and Nevada; Report to the California-Nevada and the Southern California–Arizona Conferences of the Methodist Church* (Evanston? Ill., 1951). (3) Mary Elizabeth Mackley, *The Lutheran Church and its Students; Work with Students by the Board of Education of the United Lutheran Church of America* (Philadelphia, 1948), with sources.

Religion in the public-supported colleges and universities is completely covered in four well-documented works: (1) Herbert Leon Searles, *The Study of Religion in State Universities* (Iowa City, The University, 1927), with a bibliography. An exhaustive investigation of the subject is available in the (2) Minnesota, University, Institute on Religion in State Universities [*Proceedings*] 1949, 1951 (Minneapolis, 1949–1951, 2 vols.; title, 1949: *Religion in the State University: an Initial Exploration*). Other excellent discussions are in (3) Howard William Hintz, *Religion and Public Higher Education* (Brooklyn, N.Y., Brooklyn College, 1955), with selected bibliography; and (4) Erich Albert Walter, ed.,

Religion and the State University (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1958), with bibliographical references in the notes.

For all higher schools, the attitude of the students and the flood of new learning posed the problem of changes in methods of teaching religion. The new orientation of study, which was well under way in the 1920's, is evident in two scholarly studies. Typical of many is Shirley Jackson Case, "The Problem of Teaching the Bible to Undergraduates," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 6, no. 2 (Mar. 1926), pp. 154–162. He suggests the shift of emphasis from the Bible alone to the history of early Christianity, and to the social viewpoint and method: religion as lived, rather than theological exposition. The Bible is to be taught as an introduction to creative religious living. Thornton W. Merriam, "Religion in the College Curriculum Today," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 15, no. 4 (Oct. 1935), pp. 462–470, tries to determine how adequately religion is adjusting itself to curricular changes in forty-six state universities and colleges. The commanding place of Bible study is slowly yielding to the history and philosophy of religion and social ethics. Many teachers of religion are on the defensive; their courses are not appealing, and need broad culture and more interpretation.

The development of new attitudes and methods in college and university study and teaching of religion may be studied in the following selected works: Edward Sterling Boyer, *Religion in the American College; a Study and Interpretation of Facts* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1930), with a bibliography; two essays by Robert L. Calhoun and Charles W. Gilkey, on "The Place of Religion in Higher Education," in University of Pennsylvania Bicentennial Conference, *Religion and the Modern World* (Philadelphia, 1941), pp. 63–71, 73–87; Christian Frederick Gauss, ed., *The Teaching of Religion in American Higher Education* (New York, 1951); Amos Niven Wilder, ed., *Liberal Learning and Religion* (New York, 1951), consisting of essays by fellows or officers of the National Council on Religion in Higher Education; and

George Percy Hedley, *Religion on the Campus; Some Sermons in the Chapel of Mills College* (New York, 1955).

C. Secular Transformation

One prominent feature of the separation of church and state has been the steady secularizing of public education. This tendency has been strongly urged by the Protestant denominations, not because they have been opposed to religious education, but because of their views concerning the role of individual interpretation of religious doctrine, and the natural propriety of differing denominational teaching. At the same time, the growing numerical importance and political weight of Roman Catholicism has increased the impact of its insistence upon church-orientation in all levels of education.

The result is a growing issue of religious *vs.* secular education, which assumes various forms and brings to the fore the whole question of church-state relations. The following titles summarize the particular points at issue and indicate the current status of the several controversies.

Secularization was long delayed by the potent influence of religious revivalism—as is demonstrated by Wayland J. Chase's essay, "The Great Awakening and its Educational Consequences," in *School and Society*, Vol. 35, no. 901 (Apr. 2, 1932), pp. 443–449. The movement gave a tremendous impulse to education through the demand for training of ministers, but so strengthened the religious element in it that secularism was long out of the question. But the Awakening also contributed to weakening the New England Puritan state church, and therefore (together with other causes) was also a motive in eventual secularization. The process in New England is traced by Homer F. Cunningham, "The Effect of the Decline of the Puritan Oligarchy upon the Schools of Massachusetts between 1664–1758" (Doctoral dissertation, New York University, 1954; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 10,625, *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 15,

no. 2 (1955), pp. 255–256). This discusses the varied causes of the gradual secularization of life, which undermined the early religious motives of Puritan education—an educated ministry and a Bible-reading people.

The transition was still in progress when Horace Mann was secretary of the Massachusetts State Board of Education (1837–1848), and is reviewed in Raymond B. Culver, *Horace Mann and Religion in the Massachusetts Public Schools* (New Haven, 1929), an exposition of the problem as he faced it. "Essentially a Puritan without a theology," he did not wish to exclude religious instruction from the public schools, and hoped that there might be a way to foster religious faith in a non-sectarian and generally acceptable manner. The *Life and Works of Horace Mann* (Boston, 1891) contains some of his ideas on the relation of religion to education. Neil Gerard McCluskey, *Public Schools and Moral Education: The Influence of Horace Mann, William Torrey Harris and John Dewey* (New York, 1958) analyzes their philosophies and solutions of the problem, which is here said to be insoluble under the interpretation of religious freedom now generally accepted. The author blames their views for the elimination of religion from the public schools.

The legal aspects of the secularizing process over the nation are revealed in Samuel Windsor Brown, *The Secularization of American Education as Shown by State Legislation, State Constitutional Provisions and State Supreme Court Decisions* (New York, 1912), with a bibliography. Probably the best detailed analysis of the secularizing process in a section is Douglas MacNaughton, "The Developmentt of Secularism in Education in the Northwest Territory Prior to 1860" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1956, abstract in *Church History*, Vol. 27, no. 4 (Dec. 1958), p. 373). He traces the movement from its origins in New England in the seventeenth century, and discusses the various causes. The rise of diverse sectarianism was one, assisted by the rise of Sunday Schools, preoccupation with evangelism, science, and

the idea that religious study was beyond public school children. Secularization of the curriculum is analyzed by Adrian Augustus Holtz, in *A Study of the Moral and Religious Elements in American Secondary Education up to 1800* (Menasha, Wis., 1917). This exhaustive study, based upon consultation of many published and unpublished sources, illustrates the early religious tone, which gradually yielded to secularizing of the curriculum. Important notes on religious influence in the founding of American schools, and the gradual democratizing and secularizing of education occur in Edwin E. Slosson, *The American Spirit in Education* (New Haven, 1921); Merle Curti, *The Social Ideas of American Educators* (New York, 1935), a survey of the background; and William Clayton Bower, *Church and State in Education* (Chicago, 1944).

Quite typical of the religiously conservative protest against modern secularization is Edward Harold Rian, *Christianity and American Education* (San Antonio, 1949), with bibliographical footnotes. The public schools are said to be "overwhelmingly naturalistic or secularistic in their emphasis," regarding no order beyond nature, and the Roman Catholic educational philosophy is claimed as the answer to naturalism. The contrasting attitudes of groups toward the "secularized" public educational system appear in a study by Richard Ward De Remer: "The Attitude of Public School Patrons and Nonpublic School Patrons toward Public Education" (Thesis, University of Pittsburgh; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1954), pub. no. 8887; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 14 (1954), no. 9, pp. 1331–1332), with a bibliography.

The steady advance of secularism appears nowhere, perhaps, more clearly than in the changing character of nineteenth-century school books. The process, over a long period of time, is the theme of Harold Collins Warren, in "Changing Conceptions in the Religious Elements in Early American School Readers" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1951; available at the Tougaloo College Library; ab-

stract published in the *University of Pittsburgh Bulletin*, Vol. 48, no. 10, June 5, 1952). Limited to the most used and influential readers, 1690–1880, this studies trends in specific religious ideas and motives, and relates gradual secularization and diversification to many causes, including nationalism, new methods of teaching, science, industrialism, the growth of sectarianism, etc. Oscar Adolf Tingelstad, "The Religious Element in American School Readers up to 1830; a Bibliographical and Statistical Study" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1925, typescript, also microfilm copy, University of Chicago Libraries) reveals the heavily religious content of instruction, soon to be eliminated by secularization. The decline of religious material in school books, after the separation of church and state, is strikingly illustrated in Karl Kenneth Wilson's "Historical Survey of the Religious Content of American Geography Textbooks from 1784 to 1895" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1951; abstract published by the University). He considers only specifically religious concepts, and states that the comparatively large amount of religious material in early books was owing to the fact that many of the authors were ministers, like Jedediah Morse.

D. Religion and Public Education

Despite the theoretical separation of church and state in America, there have been many points at which the two inevitably impinge upon each other. The place of religion in education has been an especially acute problem ever since the state assumed responsibility for the primary and secondary schooling of all children. The last twenty years have seen a renewed demand, from many quarters, for inclusion of religious elements in the educational process, whether through parochial schools, "released time" arrangements, or some type of nonsectarian religious instruction in the public schools. This has given rise to a spirited discussion and a series of important

Supreme Court decisions. The following sections outline the specific points over which controversy has arisen, the principles developed by recent court decisions, and the attitude of various groups.

There are two excellent brief modern bibliographies on the controverted subject of the relations between organized religion, the secular state, and education. (1) American Jewish Committee, Library of Jewish Information: *Church, State and Education; a Selected Bibliography* (Prepared by Diana Bernstein, member of the research staff, with the editorial assistance of Iva Cohen, assistant librarian, New York, 1949); and Joseph Politella, comp., *Religion in Education: An Annotated Bibliography* (Oneonta, N.Y., 1956), which lists many publications on the relation between religion and secular education, and the problem of the relation of church schools to the state.

These topics are considered specifically in many books and articles of fairly recent date. The School of Law, Duke University, has published *Religion and the State* (Durham, N.C., 1949), with bibliographical footnotes, a collection of essays on relations among the church, the state, and the schools. R. Freeman Butts discusses the whole problem in *The American Tradition in Religion and Education* (Boston, 1950), with bibliographical references in the "Notes." With careful documentation, he objectively explains the principle of separation of church and state in its historical framework, how the founding fathers understood it, how it has worked in practice, and what it means today. He maintains that any cooperation between the state and a religious group is unconstitutional. Anson Phelps Stokes, *Church and State in the United States* (New York, 1950) in Vol. 2 has a comprehensive general survey of religious aspects of the problems of public education. The dilemma at the level of state and local government is treated in two well-documented studies: (1) Sherman Merritt Smith, *The Relation of the State to Religious Education in Massachusetts* (Syracuse, N.Y., 1926), with bibliography, is

based on a doctoral thesis, Clark University, 1925. (2) Sadie Bell, *The Church, the State, and Education in Virginia* (Philadelphia, 1930), with bibliography, is a doctoral thesis, University of Pennsylvania.

Descending from this theoretical level to the actual problem of religious instruction in the public school, one discovers that the question is by no means new. It was troubling individual and public conscience even before the Civil War. This fact is evident from Stephen Colwell's essay, *The Position of Christianity in the United States, in Its Relations with Our Political Institutions, and Especially with Reference to Religious Instruction in the Public Schools* (Philadelphia, 1854). That the essential aspects of the question have not changed appears in two modern studies. Lamar Taney Beman, comp., *Religious Teaching in the Public Schools* (New York, 1927) has a bibliography. A brief but thorough discussion is found in Payson Smith's readable essay, "The Public Schools and Religious Education," in Willard Learoyd Sperry, ed., *Religion and Education; One of a Series of Volumes on Religion in the Post-war World* (Cambridge, Mass., 1945). Perhaps the best introduction to a study of the immense public discussion is the series of reports issued by the American Council on Education, especially one resulting from the Conference on Religion and Public Education, Princeton, N.J., 1944: *Religion and Public Education; Proceedings . . .* (Washington, D.C., 1945). Indispensable are the reports of the Council's Committee on Religion and Education, particularly: (1) *The Relation of Religion to Public Education; the Basic Principles* (Washington, D.C., 1947) in the Council's *Studies*, ser. 1, "Reports of Committees and Conferences," no. 26, Vol. 11, Apr. 1947. (2) Nevin Cowger Harner, *Religion's Place in General Education, Including the Relation of Religion to Public Education: the Basic Principles, a Committee Report . . .* (Richmond, c.1949). (3) *The Function of the Public Schools in Dealing with Religion; a Report on the Exploratory Study . . .* (Washington, 1953), with a bib-

liography. (4) *The Study of Religion in the Public Schools, an Appraisal* . . . Edited by Nicholas C. Brown (Washington, 1958), with bibliographical references in notes, papers by F. Ernest Johnson and others.

The result of such discussions and reports, during the revived interest in religion after the mid-1930's, often was a longing and a demand for more recognition of religious and moral teaching in the public schools. The trend (deplored by secularists and even by some religious people) is reflected in many studies. An example is Henry Lester Smith, Robert Stewart McElhinney, and George Renwick Steele, *Character Development Through Religious and Moral Education in the Public Schools of the United States,* in *Bulletin of the School of Education,* Indiana University, Vol. 13, no. 3 (Bloomington, Ind., 1937), with a bibliography. The subject is even more elaborately considered by I. Lynd Esch, in "The Appreciation of Religious Values in the Public Schools of the United States" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1942). Separation of church and state does not require schools to be irreligious, and local authorities may establish almost any program of instruction they desire. The bases for an adequate program are genuine concern, local autonomy, an objective approach, and recognition on pupil records of outside religious activities. F. Ernest Johnson, "Religion and the Philosophy of Education," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 336–349, criticizes secularism for making departments of life independent of any general spiritual sanction, and for stressing liberty at the expense of equality and fraternity. These cannot be realized outside the concept of Man as a child of God. Secularized public education is immunity from religion.

A determined effort to solve the perennial problem was made in a series of addresses, delivered under the auspices of the Institute for Religious and Social Studies, Jewish Theological Seminary of America, and published as *American*

Education and Religion: the Problem of Religion in the Schools; a Series of Addresses (New York, 1952), with bibliographical footnotes. The addresses clarify the valuable function of the private school as a cultural institution free to teach religion. They point to a constructive course, between an attempt by organized religion to dictate to the schools, and the perpetuation in public schools of a negative attitude toward religious faith. Criticism of the "failure" of the public school in this respect is voiced by Morris Alton Inch, "Teaching About Religion in the Public Schools of the United States" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University School of Theology, 1955; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 12,297; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 15, no. 8 (1955), p. 1453). Increasing social concern about the weakening of ethical conduct is coincidental with failure to recognize the significance of religion in daily life. The public school has contributed to the situation by its limited consideration of religion. The study aims to furnish an adequate teacher's guide. The practical working of such a philosophy is illustrated by an actual experiment conducted in one state, described by Wendell Jay Hansen, "An Iowa Experiment in Public School Bible Teaching" (Doctoral dissertation, State University of Iowa). The literature on the subject, in the early stages of the recent controversy, is gathered in a list by Adelaide T. Case: "Recent Books on Religious Education and Public Schools, a Brief Bibliography," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin,* Vol. 38, no. 1 (Oct. 1945), pp. 5–6, with brief annotations.

Growing insistence upon introduction of some kind of moral and religious instruction into the public schools has sometimes taken little or no account of the constitutional difficulties involved. It has also stirred intense protest against attempted "church domination" of public education. The tide of resentment was rising as early as the 1920's, as is evidenced by Louis Israel Newman, *The Sectarian Invasion of the Public Schools* (San Francisco, 1925), with bibliography. This concentrates

mainly upon overt efforts to introduce religious material into the curriculum, or to secure "released time" or some other method of reaching the public school pupil. Indirect attempts are studied intensively in Howard K. Beale, ed., *Are American Teachers Free? An Analysis of Restraints upon the Freedom of Teaching in American Schools,* Report of the Commission on the Social Studies, part XII (New York, 1936). This has a chapter on freedom of religious expression, including remarks on official banishment of sectarian teaching from public schools by necessity, in heterogeneous communities. But indirect and subtle control by religious groups, in some school systems, causes the issue to smoulder under the surface of the apparent truce. John L. Childs, "Pragmatism, Religion and Education," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 2, 1941 (New York, 1942), pp. 110–121, avers that pragmatism implies that discovery of truth is a wholly human enterprise, strictly empirical. The introduction of religion into the public schools would undermine this kind of pursuit by imposing authoritarian indoctrination.

The grounds of opposition by many Protestant leaders are summarized by Conrad Henry Moehlman, in his *School and Church: the American Way; an Historical Approach to the Problem of Religious Instruction in Public Education* (New York and London, 1944), with bibliography and bibliographical footnotes. He argues that there are many cogent grounds for rejecting attempts to reintroduce religious teaching into public schools, and that sectarian differences make Bible teaching impossible. Vivian Trow Thayer, in *Religion in Public Education* (New York, 1947), with bibliographical footnotes, deplores the insistence upon publicly supported religious instruction, and refers particularly to the controversy regarding the claim of the parochial schools to share in public funds. He ably summarizes the arguments against the anti-secular campaign in his *The Attack upon the American Secular School* (Boston, 1951), with bibliography.

1. CONSTITUTIONAL AND LEGAL ASPECTS. William G. Tor-

pey, *Judicial Doctrines of Religious Rights in America* (Chapel Hill, 1948) summarizes judicial decisions on controversial aspects of religion and the schools. Horace B. Sellers, *The Constitution and Religious Education* (Boston, c.1950), with bibliographical footnotes, also cites many relevant cases in law, and affords a general review of the fiercely controversial subject. The difficulty of favoring religion as a general support of morality, while refraining from direct teaching, is thoroughly discussed by Carl Zollman, "The Constitutional and Legal Status of Religion in Public Education," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 2, no. 3 (May 1922), pp. 236–244, cases in footnotes. The principle of separation of church and state makes impossible the direct teaching of religion in public schools. The Northwest Ordinance of 1787 declares that religion is to be encouraged, but with no direct contribution. "The common law back of the Constitution recognizes Christianity as a part of the law of the land. This has been expressly stated in a Pennsylvania court decision. Legislation prohibiting teaching contrary to Christianity is thus probably constitutional. The difficulty of such legislation will lie in the definition of terms and the administration of the law."

Alvin W. Johnson, *The Legal Status of Church-State Relationships in the United States, with Special Reference to the Public Schools* (Minneapolis, 1934) reviews the legal status of such controversial issues as Bible reading in public schools, public aid to sectarian schools, "released time" for religious instruction, and laws against instruction in evolution. Robert Fairchild Cushman, "The Holy Bible and the Public Schools," in *Cornell Law Quarterly*, Vol. 40, no. 3 (Spring, 1955), pp. 475–499, has bibliographical footnotes. He gives a complete legal review covering a century, of the vexed question of reading the Bible, citing cases in state courts, surveying the arguments in important cases, and pointing to the definition of "sectarian" as the difficult problem. F. Ernest Johnson, "Church, School, and Supreme Court," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 17, no. 4 (Autumn, 1948), pp. 483–493, defends the

traditional "wall of separation," but asks whether or not we are to surrender to complete secularization of public education. Protestants and extreme secularists are allied against state support of religious education. Yet Protestants are shocked at the ruling against released time, by the Supreme Court, in the McCollum and Everson cases. This seems to ban all specific religious teaching in public schools.

The general status of legal and lay opinion regarding the situation left by the decision in *Everson v. Board of Education* (330 U.S. 1,1947) is summarized in several commentaries and articles: (1) Case notes, *Michigan Law Review,* 45:1001; *Harvard Law Review,* 60:793; *Virginia Law Review,* 33:349. (2) "Constitutional Law–Due Process–Establishment of Religion," *Southern California Law Review,* 21:61–76 (Dec. 1947). (3) "Public Aid to the Establishment of Religion," *University of Pennsylvania Law Review,* 96:230–241 (Dec. 1947). (4) "Establishment of Religion Clause Applied to States," *Cornell Law Quarterly,* 33:122–129 (Sept. 1947). (5) J. M. O'Neill, "Church, Schools, and the Constitution," *Commentary,* 3:562–570 (June 1947). (6) T. R. Powell, "Public Rides to Private Schools," *Harvard Educational Review,* 17:73–84 (Spring, 1947). (7) L. B. Wheildon, "Religion in the Public Schools," *Editorial Research Reports* (Sept. 12, 1947), pp. 667–682.

In the American interpretation of the doctrine of the separation of church and state, it is usually assumed that the churches are free to play a religious part in the community. At what point in state action does recognition of the principle that religion should be free to play its role in the American community reach such proportions as to be "an establishment of religion" proscribed under the Bill of Rights? This question has been dramatically presented in the case of the *People of Illinois ex rel. McCollum v. Board of Education of School District No. 71, Champaign County, Ill.* (333 U.S. 203, 1948).

Opinions on the decision are summarized in commentaries

and articles: (1) "Tracing the 'Wall': Religion in the Public School System," *Yale Law Journal*, 57:1114–1122 (Apr. 1948). (2) "The State and Sectarian Education," *National Education Association Research Bulletin*, 24:1–44 (Feb. 1946). (3) Luther A. Weigle, "Church and State in America," *Religion in Life*, 16:506–514 (1947). (4) W. J. Butler, "No Lamb of God in School," *Catholic World*, 167:203–211 (June 1948). (5) "Religious Instruction in the Public School System," *Columbia Law Review*, 47:1346–1355 (Dec. 1947). (6) Case note, *Harvard Law Review*, 61:1248 (July 1948). (7) Case note, *Michigan Law Review*, 46:828 (1948). (8) "Statement of Catholic Bishops Attacking Secularism as an Evil," *New York Times*, Nov. 21, 1948.

Frank Swancara, *The Separation of Religion and Government: the First Amendment, Madison's Intent, and the McCollum Decision; a Study of Separationism in America* (New York, 1959), with bibliographical footnotes, thoroughly explores the constitutional aspects of the much-discussed case. It is discussed from the personal viewpoint of the initiator, by Vashti (Cromwell) McCollum, in *One Woman's Fight* (Garden City, N.Y., 1951). She attempts to give a step-by-step account of her legal battle to preserve (as she believed) the nonsectarian public school against the "released-time" advocates and the "encroachments" of Roman Catholicism.

The controverted question of financial aid to private schools (including religious ones) from public funds is discussed from a Roman Catholic viewpoint in Richard James Gabel, *Public Funds for Church and Private Schools* (Washington, D.C., 1937), a doctoral thesis at the Catholic University of America, with bibliography. The issues raised are exhaustively reviewed in Harvard Law School Forum, *Public Aid to Parochial Education; a Transcript of a Discussion of a Vital Issue* (Cambridge, Mass., 1951). The theoretical aspects are discussed at length, and with thorough documentation, by Cleon Carthue Caldwell, in "The Development of Concepts Regarding the Use of Tax Funds for Public and Parochial Schools" (Thesis,

University of Minnesota; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1956), pub. no. 17,841; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 16 (1956), no. 10, pp. 1822–1823). The legal aspects are comprised in a collection of laws and rulings issued by the National Education Association of the United States, Research Division: *State Aid to Private Schools; Constitutional Provisions, Statutes, Court Decisions* (Washington, D.C., 1943).

2. DENOMINATIONAL ATTITUDES. "The Court Concurs," in *Christian Century*, Vol. 69, no. 20 (May 14, 1952), pp. 582–583, is a favorable Protestant reaction to a Supreme Court decision favoring public aid to private schools by "released time" in the Zorach case, 1952. The secular liberal reaction toward religious instruction in public schools is one supported by many Protestants. It is expressed in an editorial, "'Released Time,'" in *The Nation*, Vol. 174, no. 9 (May 10, 1952), p. 441, on the Supreme Court decision in the Zorach case (1952), upholding the New York released-time program, a reversal of the position in the McCollum case in Illinois. It favorably notices Justice Jackson's dissenting opinion, that the program uses public schools as jails for pupils who will not attend church, and breaks down the "wall of separation" between church and state. Charles Clayton Morrison, "Protestantism and the Public School," in *Christian Century*, Vol. 63, no. 16 (Apr. 17, 1946), pp. 490–493, presents a different militant Protestant point of view, stating that the time has come to break taboos against religion in general education. Protestantism is at a disadvantage in the secularizing of the public schools, which in effect are anti-religious. Conrad H. Moehlman, *School and Church* (New York, 1944), on the other hand shuns any breaking down of the "wall of separation" by bringing religious education into the public school system.

A general opinion, from the Jewish viewpoint, is ably presented by Nathan Schachner in "Church, State and Education," in *American Jewish Yearbook*, Vol. 49 (1947–1948), pp. 1–48, reviewing the question of church-state conflict in the

area of education, and its problems. The serious doubts of many Jews, regarding religious education in the public schools, appear strongly in an article by Milton R. Konvitz, "Whittling Away Religious Freedom: the Current Threat to Separation of Church and State," in *Commentary*, Vol. 1, no. 8 (June 1946), pp. 4–13. He is frankly opposed to those who would use the public schools for religious instruction on released time, and criticizes Jews for cooperating in the program; religion in the public schools means Protestant instruction. He opposes also aid to the Roman Catholic parochial schools.

The traditional Roman Catholic position regarding religious instruction in a secularized school system is ably reviewed by Burton Confrey, in *Secularism in American Education: Its History* (Washington, D.C., 1931). This gives a detailed summary of the legislation on religious instruction in public schools, the use of school buildings for religious purposes, and similar issues. Chapter 3 constitutes a review of the appropriate constitutional provisions, statutes, and court decisions, with a summary chart, and argues for the Catholic view on secularization.

Richard J. Gabel, *Public Funds for Church and Private Schools* (Washington, D.C., 1937), published by the Catholic University of America, offers an able defense of the Roman Catholic position. Likewise does Francis X. Curran, *The Churches and the Schools, American Protestantism and Popular Elementary Education* (Chicago, 1954). A very able defense of the parochial school is in Joseph McSorley, "State Aid to Parish Schools," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 165, no. 986 (May 1947), pp. 131–135, which is reprinted in Kingsley Davis, Harry C. Bredemeir, and Marion J. Levy, Jr., *Modern American Society* (New York, 1948), Vol. 2, pp. 541–546, and has references to helpful literature on the subject, in footnotes. The parochial school lifts a burden from the taxpayer, and is a bulwark against atheistic totalitarianism and positivism. "Unsectarianism" is pagan, and is trying to destroy

the Roman Catholic school system. Roman Catholic opinion on the Zorach case is favorably expressed in "A Matter of Tradition," in *Commonweal*, Vol. 61, no. 6 (May 16, 1952), pp. 133–134. The New York released-time plan enables public school pupils to go from classes to attend religious instruction of their choice, and conforms to the First Amendment and the tradition of separation. The fear of clericalism remains, among Protestants and secularists who make democracy a religion. A similar article is that of Robert F. Drinan, "The Supreme Court and Religion," in *ibid.*, Vol. 56, no. 23 (Sept. 12, 1952), pp. 554–556.

VI. RELIGION AND SOCIAL REFORM

A. Revivalism and Social Reform

THERE was a clear connection between revivalism and the benevolent reform movement of the early and mid-nineteenth century. By 1830 benevolent societies had spread over the nation, promoting Sunday Schools, missions, Sunday observance, temperance, etc. They were interdenominational religious associations, constituting "the benevolent system." The system was controlled by an interlocking directorate based upon the interest and activities of a small number of Presbyterian and Congregational ministers and laymen. Fresh inspiration was given in 1830 by the revivalist, Charles Grandison Finney, who brought to New York City the Great Revival he had begun in Western New York in 1825.

In the 1850's revivalism generally won over the opposition. Because the laity played a large part in organizing revivals and in the administration of the agencies they inspired, lay leadership became more and more important. The laity were prepared to take part in such agencies as the practical phases of the later Social Gospel demanded. Revivalism, being interdenominational, encouraged the first American Protestant

ecumenical movement, and created a new ethical seriousness, which favored the growth of the later social reform movements.

A brief, well-selected list of references on the religious, social, and philanthropic activities inspired by revivalism, particularly in the Second Great Awakening, is in the "Bibliographical Note" to Charles Roy Keller, *The Second Great Awakening in Connecticut* (New Haven, 1942), pp. 253–254. For the later nineteenth century, one of the best sources is W. H. Tolman and William J. Hull, *Bibliography of the American Institute of Christian Sociology* (New York, 1893, 2nd ed.), with good short descriptions and bibliographies of the principal religious reform organizations.

William D. P. Bliss, ed., *The New Encyclopedia of Social Reform* (New York, 1908), compiled by an Episcopal priest who was very active in the social reform movement, has contributions by many writers, including some distinguished scholars. Articles on various American reform crusades and their religious leaders, with bibliographical references, illuminate the connection of religious zeal with social reform. There were previous editions in 1897 and 1898. Frank Grenville Beardsley, *Religious Progress through Religious Revivals* (New York, 1943) answers the objection that revivals are concerned only with salvation of souls and ignore great social, political, and economic problems. "Saved individuals . . . are the saving salt of society." Extremely detailed evidence in each chapter shows that, while the purpose of revivals is individual awakening, the results are primarily social. Timothy Lawrence Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform in Mid-Nineteenth-Century America* (New York, 1957) has an invaluable "Critical Essay on the Sources of Information." This really pioneering study covers the period 1840–1857, and offers a new view of the origins of the Social Gospel, which is often attributed only to the post-Civil War era.

I. HOLINESS AND PERFECTIONIST MOVEMENTS. *Perfectionism, The Holiness Movement, Millennialism, and Social*

Christianity. The sources of the Social Gospel movement may be traced to perfectionist and holiness doctrines that permeated Protestant churches before the Civil War. One of the most potent movements was the "Holiness Revival" at Oberlin College in Ohio. Ministers there spread doctrines of Christian perfectionism, which bore marked resemblances to Wesleyan ideals, and expressed dramatically the desire for a higher and holier type of life that inspired church people in the revivalist period of the 1840's and 1850's. Such ideals found ready acceptance in the Northern branch of the Methodist Episcopal Church, which had inherited them from the eighteenth-century revival. They were promoted by intellectual and church leaders and popular preachers, and by Phoebe Palmer and her friends.

During the revivals of 1858 and the following years, the holiness movement spread among the people, because it was a radical and popular expression of the ideals and practices of the new evangelism. It was also a popular reflection of the social and spiritual aims of the Transcendental philosophy of Emerson and others. It appealed to the practicality of Americans, their belief that Christianity should "work."

The powerful influence of Methodism in promoting the perfectionist ideals is demonstrated conclusively in a number of scholarly works. Orrin Avery Manifold, "The Development of John Wesley's Doctrine of Christian Perfection" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1945) describes major sources from which the doctrine was derived, and analyzes its development from Jeremy Taylor, Thomas à Kempis, William Law, and the Bible. Sanctification through grace was largely influenced by the pattern of conversion experience, learned principally from the Moravians. Harold Lindstrom, *Wesley and Sanctification, a Study in the Doctrine of Salvation* (Stockholm, 1946) surveys the Methodist background of the holiness movement.

Claude Holmes Thompson, "The Witness of American Methodism to the Historical Doctrine of Christian Perfection"

(Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1949) maintains that the call to sainthood was central in the theology of John Wesley, and was embodied to some extent in all subsequent Methodist doctrine. Methodism was the source of all modern perfectionist movements, as is witnessed by American Methodist theologians and other church leaders. John Leland Peters, "The Development of the Wesleyan Doctrine of Christian Perfection in American Methodism in the Nineteenth Century" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1950) studies the doctrine as received and developed by Wesley, and its effect upon the history of American Methodism. Controversies about it significantly affected American history, producing schisms which might be healed by a new understanding of the idea. His *Christian Perfection and American Methodism* (New York and Nashville, 1956) discusses the quest for holiness, but without penetration of the social dynamics of the movement. Another excellent study is Robert B. Clark, "The History of the Doctrine of Christian Perfection in the Methodist Church Up to 1845" (Doctoral thesis, Temple University, 1946). Wade Crawford Barclay, *To Reform the Nation*, Vol. 2 of *Early American Methodism 1769–1844* (New York, 1949) acknowledges the influence of holiness piety, and relates it to social movements.

Two modern studies summarize the history and far-reaching effects of the movement. M. E. Gaddis, "Christian Perfectionism in America" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1929) offers a comprehensive survey of the origins, progress, and religious and social effects of the crusade for personal holiness and social reform. Benjamin B. Warfield, *Perfectionism* (New York, 1931) is a collection of essays, devoted more to the personal than to the social dynamics of the movement.

The Christian Perfectionist movement was furthered by innumerable books and pamphlets of a popular character. Many were published by Phoebe Palmer and Thomas C. Upham. (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, foot-

notes, pp. 105–106, 117–119.) Most of the works listed by Smith (p. 246) went through numerous editions. Richard Wheatley, *The Life and Letters of Mrs. Phoebe Palmer* (New York, 1876) is a lengthy study, showing the wide influence of perfectionism, and especially of her writings, and of the group she inspired and led. Phoebe Palmer, *The Way of Holiness* (New York, 1851) was the "most influential tract" of one of the leaders of the holiness-perfectionist movement. (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 246.) Thomas C. Upham, *Principles of the Interior, or Hidden Life* (New York, 1845, 2nd ed.) and his *A Treatise on Divine Union* (Boston, 1851) expressed the peculiar views of a devout Methodist, but the books cultivated perfectionist interest "among the mystic-minded outside the Methodist fold." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 246.) George Peck, "Dr. Upham's Works," in *The Methodist Quarterly Review*, Vol. 28 (1846), pp. 248–265, is a generally favorable review. This article "extended a Wesleyan welcome to the mystic philosopher of holiness." (See *ibid.*, p. 245.)

Perhaps equally influential was the group of perfectionists at Oberlin College in Ohio, headed by the great revivalist, Charles Grandison Finney. His *Views of Sanctification* (Oberlin, Ohio, 1840) contains essays which had appeared in *The Oberlin Evangelist*, expounding the earlier Oberlin doctrine of perfection. Roy Alan Cheesebro, "The Preaching of Charles G. Finney" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1948) tries to fill a gap in studies of the relation of Finney's work, in revivals and social movements, to American religious history and life. His preaching produced "some very significant results in social reform and activity."

Edward Beecher, "The Nature, Importance, and Means of Eminent Holiness Throughout the Church," in *The American National Preacher*, Vol. 10, nos. 1–2 (June, July 1835), pp. 193–224, "Best distills the ideas which, scattered through Finney's lectures and the literature of temperance and aboli-

tion, were responsible for the birth of social Christianity." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 247.) Edward Beecher, "The Scriptural Philosophy of Congregationalism and of Councils," in *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 22, no. 86 (1865), pp. 284–315, summarizes Beecher's doctrine of the kingdom, "foreshadowing George D. Herron and Walter Rauschenbusch." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 247.) Asa Mahan, *Scripture Doctrine of Christian Perfection* (Boston, 1840) is another popular exposition of the earlier Oberlin doctrine of Christian perfection. George O. Peck, *The Scripture Doctrine of Christian Perfection Stated and Defended* (New York, 1842) is "a kindly and semi-official Methodist rejoinder [to the Oberlin perfectionists] consisting of lectures delivered in several New York City churches." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 246.) J. C. Lord, "Finney's Sermons on Sanctification, and Mahan on Christian Perfection," in *The Princeton Review*, 2nd ser., Vol. 13, no. 2 (Apr. 1841), pp. 231–250, scornfully rejects perfectionism, which is characterized as a "heresy"—too easy a standard, by "conversion" rather than long effort, and fanatical in its tendencies. James H. Fairchild, "The Doctrine of Sanctification at Oberlin" in *Congregational Quarterly*, Vol. 18, no. 2 (Apr. 1876), pp. 237–259, is in definite opposition to perfectionism. Robert S. Fletcher, *A History of Oberlin College; from Its Foundation through the Civil War* (Oberlin, Ohio, 1943) illuminates the quest for holiness, but does not reveal the social dynamics of the movement.

Post-Millennialism and the Kingdom Gospel. The Kingdom Gospel of the post-Civil War period did not originate then, but had a forerunner in the hope for Christ's early reign (the Kingdom of God) on earth. A dramatic example of that hope was the Adventist movement led by William Miller in the 1840's. The hope was illusory, but the social influence of the idea was real, through the identification of post-millennial doctrines with the patriotic idea which had been voiced by the Deistic thinkers of the late eighteenth and early nine-

teenth centuries: that it would be the destiny of America to establish an ideal democracy and to drive poverty and injustice from the land. (See notes on Joel Barlow, Part Two, sect. III, B, 3, *Deism Invades America*, the ideal expressed in his "The Columbiad.")

David Brown, *On the Second Advent. Will It Be Pre-Millennial?* (New York, 1851), by a Baptist, is one of the numerous works which, on the eve of the Civil War, "signaled the conversion of hitherto conservative groups to optimistic postmillennialism." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 248.) Other works, expressing a similar hope are: (1) George B. Taylor, "Society's Future," in *Christian Review*, Vol. 22, no. 89 (July 1857), pp. 356–380. (2) Joseph F. Berg, *The Second Advent of Jesus Christ, Not Pre-millennial* (Philadelphia, 1859). (3) S. P. Hickok, "Humanity Progressing to Perfection," in *The American Presbyterian and Theological Review*, n.s., Vol. 6, no. 24 (Oct. 1868), pp. 532–550, is an indication of "the post-war thrust of Christian hope." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 248.) The same hope is voiced in (4) George T. Ladd, "What is the True Doctrine of Christ's Second Coming?" in *New Englander*, Vol. 33, no. 127 (Apr. 1874), pp. 356–383.

2. THE ANTI-SLAVERY CRUSADE. *a. Revivalism, Evangelicalism, and Slavery.* The anti-slavery movement was in large measure motivated by the ideals of perfectionism and holiness that characterized revivalistic and evangelical Protestantism. The idea of individual perfection and holiness was transmitted from the personal to the social field, and was translated into the conviction that humanity is capable of perfection. How, then, can humanity attain to perfection in slavery, which degrades it? Those who most readily swept aside the obstacles to anti-slavery agitation were the revivalists and holiness advocates within the churches. They adopted a liberal interpretation of the Bible to defend their position.

b. Religious Motives of the Anti-Slavery Movement. Alice Felt Tyler, in *Freedom's Ferment; Phases of American Social*

History to 1860 (Minneapolis, 1944), with bibliography and notes, tells the story of religious and secular reform movements in the early years of the republic, and discusses their sources of inspiration, largely in religious optimism. The fundamentals of the American faith and way of life were set by the crusaders, but the earlier movements for a time were "swallowed up in the crusade against slavery." William Warren Sweet, *The Story of Religion in America* (New York, 1950) discusses the part of religion in the events leading to the Civil War, including the controversy over slavery. Howard K. Beale, "What Historians Have Said about the Causes of the Civil War," in *Theory and Practice in Historical Study: A Report of the Committee on Historiography* (New York, 1946) has an extensive bibliography. He points out that the moral issue of slavery was an important cause of the war. The religious impulse of the day was translated into anti-slavery sentiment. His work is largely based upon Gilbert H. Barnes, *The Antislavery Impulse, 1830–1844* (New York, 1933), which considers the religious conviction that was translated into the anti-slavery cause, proceeding from the strongly ethical impulse radiated by evangelism. Dwight L. Dumond, *Anti-Slavery Origins of the Civil War in the United States* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1939) explores in great detail earlier phases of the evangelical attack on slavery. The connection between the anti-slavery movement and religious revivalism is made perfectly clear in Gilbert H. Barnes and Dwight L. Dumond, eds., *Letters of Theodore Dwight Weld, Angelina Grimké Weld, and Sarah Grimké, 1822–1844* (New York, 1934, 2 vols.). The introduction especially stresses the relationship between the revivals inaugurated by Charles Grandison Finney and the activities of the benevolent Tappan brothers. Weld's anti-slavery meetings were, in form and spirit, like the "protracted meetings" of Finney revivalism, and were very influential among Presbyterian ministers.

Arthur Cushman McGiffert, Jr., "Charles Grandison Finney," in *Christendom*, Vol. 7, no. 4 (Autumn, 1942), pp.

496–506, reveals the powerful influence of Finney upon anti-slavery sentiment. Basing his view upon Edwards' teaching, that disinterested benevolence is an attribute of God, he made a practical application to social reform and, under the influence of Weld, interpreted it to mean abolition of slavery. Another potent personal religious influence is shown in Ralph Volney Harlow, *Gerrit Smith, Philanthropist and Reformer* (New York, 1939), which is based largely upon manuscript primary sources. One should consult also Octavius Brooks Frothingham, *Gerrit Smith: A Biography* (New York, 1878), which emphasizes that the genesis of the reform movement was "religious in an emotionally evangelical, revivalistic sense." It was encouraged by the American Bible Society, the American Tract Society, and the American Sunday School Union. The conversion of Smith to reform is an illustration.

c. The Appeal to the Bible. Oscar Sherwin in "The Armory of God," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 18, no. 1 (Mar. 1945), pp. 70–82, with references in the footnotes, summarizes the religious arguments of the Abolitionists, and illustrates the use of Biblical sanctions on both sides in the Civil War. Caroline L. Shanks, "The Biblical Anti-Slavery Argument of the Decade 1830–1840," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 16, no. 2 (Apr. 1931), pp. 132–157, maintains that the arguments of both pro- and anti-slavery champions rested upon forced constructions. Abolitionists were compelled to fall back upon the position that slavery was contrary to the *spirit* of Christianity, in their effort to justify a profound moral sentiment by the highest authority they knew.

Several other fairly representative publications of the early period illustrate the development of the Bible-based argument. American Anti-Slavery Society, *The Bible Against Slavery* (New York, 1837) was written by Theodore Dwight Weld, and was published with the express purpose of convincing pious Christians that slavery was a sin. It has been described as an exhaustive summary of the Lane Seminary agents' doctrine that slavery was a sin. Beriah Green, *The*

Chattel Principle the Abhorrence of Jesus Christ and the Apostles: or No Refuge for American Slavery in the New Testament (New York, 1839) expresses the attitude of the powerful American Antislavery Society. The Massachusetts Abolition Society's *Second Annual Report* (Boston, 1841) throws ". . . light on the earlier phases of evangelical anti-slavery in New England." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 247.) Typical arguments are criticized by William C. Wisner, *The Bible Argument on Slavery, Being Principally a Review of T. D. Weld's Bible Against Slavery* (New York, 1844). Albert Barnes, *An Inquiry into the Scriptural Views of Slavery* (Philadelphia, 1846), is a smashing attack on the scriptural defense of slavery, a book "which set the trend toward rational interpretation of the Bible." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 248.)

A few selected titles illustrate later phases of the Scriptural anti-slavery polemic. Charles Elliott, *The Bible and Slavery* (Cincinnati, 1857) is a restrained argument, based upon the Bible. Other attacks worthy of study appear in "Slavery and the Bible," in *New Englander*, Vol. 15, no. 57 (Feb. 1857), pp. 102–134. This reviews several works attacking slavery on Biblical grounds. (1) Joseph P. Thompson, of Broadway Tabernacle Church, N.Y.: *Teachings of the New Testament on Slavery* (New York, 1856). (2) Albert Barnes, *The Church and Slavery* (Philadelphia, 1857). (3) William W. Patton, *Slavery and Infidelity: or, Slavery in the Church Insures Infidelity in the World* (Cincinnati, c.1857). George Barrell Cheever, *The Guilt of Slavery and the Crime of Slaveholding, Demonstrated from the Hebrew and Greek Scriptures* (Boston, 1860) is an "impetuous" attack by a New York City Congregational minister, on the eve of the war. (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 248.)

The anti-slavery protagonists did not have the field clear of able and determined opponents. The Southern pro-slavery literature is reviewed very ably in William Sumner Jenkins, *Pro-Slavery Thought in the Old South* (Chapel Hill, N.C.,

1935), a thorough analysis of the pro-slavery argument, with some reference to religious views and Biblical arguments. Typical arguments in a conservative, pro-slavery religious journal are the editorials of Thomas Meredith, in *The Biblical Recorder* (Oct. 5, 12, 19, 26, Nov. 2, 1844). He undertook to prove that slaveholding "is expressly recognized by apostolic authority as compatible with justice and equity." It is not a disqualification for the ministry, is compatible with Biblical moral precepts, and is not a justifiable cause of dissension in the church. Abolitionists are not worthy of Christian fellowship. That this was often the view in Northern States is demonstrated by Adelaide Avery Lyons, "Religious Defense of Slavery in the North," in Trinity College Historical Society, *Historical Papers*, ser. 13 (Durham, N.C., 1919), with bibliographical footnotes. In the early nineteenth century religious sentiment was strongly anti-slavery, but hostility relaxed as churches grew influential and greater numbers of members became slave-holders. Study of the Bible, in the literal-inspiration way, made church leaders find Biblical warrant for slavery. The Abolition movement of the 1830's was regarded with suspicion as infidel. Many church members accepted abolition, but the majority of leaders continued to oppose it, fearing schisms in the churches. William E. Dodd, "The Fight for the Northwest, 1860" in *American Historical Review*, Vol. 16, no. 4 (July 1911), pp. 774–788, maintains that the powerful churches feared anti-slavery radicalism, and that the pro-slavery Dr. Nathan L. Rice of St. Louis, at McCormick Theological Seminary, pushed the Presbyterian churches toward conservatism. The churches sided with wealth, and this perhaps accounts for Lincoln's not joining a church.

d. Anti-Slavery Movements in the Churches. Quakerism and Slavery. Thomas E. Drake, *Quakers and Slavery in America* (New Haven, 1950) is the best treatment of the slavery question as it affected a particular denomination. Based upon exhaustive research in voluminous and neglected sources,

the study reveals the "gradualism" of Quaker policy, which was guided by the doctrine of the "inner light" and of the sovereignty of conscience. Herbert Aptheker, "The Quakers and Negro Slavery," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 25, no. 3 (July 1940), pp. 331–362, corrects the impression that Quakers were always anti-slavery. By reference to many records he points to the very gradual evolution of the movement from 1688 until the eve of the Civil War, from condemnation of the slave trade to condemnation of slavery itself, indicating the internal conflicts and reconciliation of the opposed groups about 1857. The spiritual inspiration is revealed by Allen Clapp Thomas, "The Attitude of the Society of Friends toward Slavery in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries, Particularly in Relation to its Own Members," in American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 1st ser., Vol. 8 (1897), pp. 263–299. Research in meeting minutes, journals, books, and official epistles reveals the basic principle of the gradually growing anti-slavery movement: the conviction of George Fox respecting the equality of all men. The advance was due to the hard work of individuals with strong religious convictions, including Americans, especially Lay, Benezet, and Woolman.

Carter G. Woodson, "Anthony Benezet," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 2, no. 1 (Jan. 1917), pp. 37–50, regards him as the greatest Quaker anti-slavery leader, and traces the gradual development of the Quaker policy toward Negroes, resulting in efforts to prepare them for emancipation. G. David Houston, "John Woolman's Efforts in Behalf of Freedom," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 2, no. 2 (Apr. 1917), pp. 126–138, indicates deep religious conviction as the motive force of his abolitionism and his belief in the brotherhood of man. His influence in 1758 was the first important movement toward abolition among the Quakers. Another later personal influence is thoroughly studied in Ruth Ketring Nuermberger's "The Free Produce Movement: A Quaker Protest Against Slavery," in Trinity College Historical So-

ciety, *Historical Papers,* ser. 25 (Durham, N.C., 1942), with extensive bibliography. This discusses the movement (1826–1856) to boycott the products of slave labor by selling free-labor products. It refers especially to George W. Taylor, the conductor of a free-produce store in Philadelphia (1847–1867).

The generally neglected anti-slavery movement in Southern Quakerism has been appreciated in an essay by Stephen B. Weeks, "Southern Quakers and Slavery, A Study in Institutional History," in *Johns Hopkins University Studies in Historical and Political Science,* Extra Volume 15 (Baltimore, 1896). He emphasizes the difficulty of witness against the moral and economic evils of slavery, emancipation and schemes for colonization of freed Negroes, and the migration of anti-slavery Quakers to Ohio and Indiana. (See also Part Two, sect. v, c, 2, b, *Quaker Social Conscience.*)

e. Congregational and Unitarian Anti-Slavery Champions. Benjamin Platt Thomas, *Theodore Weld, Crusader for Freedom* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1950), with bibliography and references in notes to chapters, does belated justice to a long-neglected Congregational leader in the anti-slavery campaign —one recognized by his contemporaries as foremost. The study sets in its rightful place the Western group that drew inspiration from Weld and set up its headquarters in New York City. George Barrell Cheever, *God Against Slavery; and the Freedom and Duty of the Pulpit to Rebuke It* (New York, 1857) is a significant volume by one of the most influential abolitionists from the revivalist camp. Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform,* p. 248, calls this the "platform of New York City Congregationalists." William Warren Sweet, "Some Religious Aspects of the Kansas Struggle," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 7, nos. 5–6 (Oct. 1927), pp. 578–595, has valuable bibliographical references in the footnotes. The New England Emigrant Aid Company, which sent settlers and arms to aid the Free Soil cause in Kansas, was led largely by Congregationalists, and was an agent for the Free Soil churches of the

North. The intimate connection of Congregationalism with the Middle Western anti-slavery movement appears vividly in Herman R. Muelder, *Fighters for Freedom, the History of Anti-Slavery Activities of Men and Women Associated with Knox College* (New York, 1959), with an extensive bibliography, displaying connections with revivalism in Central New York and Illinois. Theodore Parker, *Speeches, Addresses, and Occasional Sermons* (New York, 1864, 3 vols.) contains ample source material bearing upon this Unitarian minister's passionate opposition to slavery, based upon his liberal religious convictions; and opposed to the conservative element of Unitarianism. One should consult also Henry Steele Commager, *Theodore Parker* (Boston, 1936), pp. 197ff.

f. Methodists and Slavery. How deeply the slavery question cut into the Methodist conscience is seen in Lucius C. Matlack's *The History of American Slavery and Methodism from 1780 to 1849: and History of the Wesleyan Methodist Connection of America* (New York, 1849). The Wesleyan secession from the Methodist Episcopal Church was due to the slavery controversy, and the influence of slavery upon the church's policy. The volume narrates the struggle of the Abolitionists within the church to 1842. His *The Life of Rev. Orange Scott* (New York, 1847) is important as a record of Wesleyan Methodist abolitionism, and illuminates "the earlier phases of evangelical antislavery in New England and western New York." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform,* pp. 244, 247.) William Hosmer, *The Higher Law* (Auburn, N.Y., 1852) was written by a Methodist editor in Genesee County, New York, and perhaps was the source of William H. Seward's doctrine of "The Higher Law." Seward came from Upstate New York. (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform,* p. 248.) Abel Stevens, "Slavery—The Times," in *Methodist Quarterly Review,* Vol. 39 (1857), pp. 260–280, and "American Slavery—Its Progress and Prospects," *ibid.,* pp. 437–463, express the attitude of the Methodist (Episcopal) Church toward slavery.

The tendencies leading toward a major schism in the Methodist Episcopal Church, because of sectional differences of opinion, are clarified in an essay by Walter Brownlow Posey, "Influence of Slavery upon the Methodist Church in the Early South and Southwest," in *Mississippi Valley Historical Review,* Vol. 17, no. 4 (Mar. 1931), pp. 530–542. He accents the opposition to slavery of the earliest American preachers, but indicates the growth of a compromising attitude as cotton became a dominant economic interest, and many Methodist small farmers became slave-owners. Northern Methodist opinion is reviewed by John Nelson Norwood, *The Schism in the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1844: a Study of Slavery and Ecclesiastical Politics* (Alfred, N.Y., 1923), with a good bibliography. Slavery always was much more than an economic question, and by 1840 was primarily a moral and religious one to many Northern church people. The schism in the Methodist Church was important because of the church's national character, and hastened the trend toward political schism.

g. *The Presbyterian Drift Toward Schism.* Irving Stoddard Kull, "Presbyterian Attitudes Toward Slavery," in *Church History,* Vol. 7, no. 2 (June 1938), pp. 101–114, declares that in 1818 the Church confidently adopted strong anti-slavery principles based on the Gospel of Christ and the humane philosophy of the Revolution. In the South it moved to a position of defending slavery as a positive good. In 1837 came the split of the Old and New Schools, partly as a result of growing abolitionism in the New York and Ohio synods. The Slave Power moved into the Old School, while the New School moved to open condemnation of slavery and slaveholders. The larger and more orthodox group bowed to the dominant economic and political power. Albert Barnes, *The Church and Slavery* (Philadelphia, 1857, 2nd ed.) defends the anti-slavery course of the New School Presbyterians. The contrary current of opinion in the South is the theme of Walter Brownlow Posey, "The Slavery Question in the

Presbyterian Church in the Old Southwest," in *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 15, no. 3 (Aug. 1949), pp. 311–324. This study, based largely upon minutes of presbyteries and synods, reveals the trend toward apology and defense between 1787 and the schism of 1837–38, which was caused in part by differing opinions regarding slavery. C. Bruce Staiger, "Abolitionism and the Presbyterian Schism of 1837–1838," in *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 36, no. 3 (Dec. 1949), pp. 391–414, has bibliographical references in the footnotes. The ostensible cause of the Old-New School split was differing opinion about doctrine, and historians have given the slavery question a minor role, or ignored it. But slavery was "closely interwoven" in the conflict.

h. Other Churches. Walter Brownlow Posey, "The Baptists and Slavery in the Lower Mississippi Valley," in *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 41, no. 2 (Apr. 1956), pp. 117–130, emphasizes early Baptist anti-slavery pronouncements, recognition of Negro equality in religion, and opposition to expansion of slavery. He admits growing hesitation after 1830, and notices the migration of anti-slavery preachers from the South, and the schism in the church due to increasing friction over the question. The history of the question among Lutherans is learnedly reviewed in Robert Fortenbaugh, "American Lutheran Synods and Slavery, 1830–1860," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 13, no. 1 (Jan. 1933), pp. 72–92. This outstanding essay, with bibliographical references, closely examines the official attitudes of several synods and of the General Synod, and concludes that "the church as a whole did not formally and authoritatively deliver itself on the subject nor did it seek to force a consensus of opinion." Madeleine Hooke Rice, "American Catholic Opinion in the Slavery Controversy," in Columbia University, *Studies in History, Economics and Public Law*, no. 508 (New York, 1943) stresses Catholic interest in the religious life of the slave, rather than his economic condition, and the lack of an official stand on abolitionism, 1830–1860, due to caution against sec-

tional division. There is no indication of the attitude of the Catholic masses, or whether or not they followed the Catholic press. The hierarchical attitude is studied in Joseph Delfman Brokhoge, *Francis Patrick Kenrick's Opinion on Slavery* (Washington, 1955).

B. The Later Social Gospel

1. THE PREPARATION. If religion is to be relevant to social ethics and organization, it cannot avoid problems posed by the economic system, such as the status of property, inequality of income, and the rights of labor. In this, as in other fields, Christianity in the United States, because of its division into distinct groups, has not spoken with a single voice or recommended the same kind of policy or action. Some religious people have considered socialism as an enemy of religion, while others (including some prominent advocates of the Social Gospel) have embraced it as a fulfillment of Christian teaching. While the predominant attitude of organized religion has been conservative, there have been and are many exceptions, and even more inconsistency regarding the form or degree of conservatism. The literature on the subject is enormous, but also diffuse and hortatory. Religious writers have done little sound research on the actual reciprocal impact of religion and the economic system. There have been some empirical studies on the relation of religion to the class structure, but few on the relation of religion to the basic institutions of property, the division of labor, and exchange. The following sections attempt to distinguish the leading contemporary views on the appropriate role of the church regarding the economic order, and to indicate the principal points at which the part of organized religion has a clear relevance for the conduct of economic affairs.

Thomas H. Greer, *American Social Reform Movements; Their Pattern Since 1865* (New York, 1949), with a bibliography, is an elaborate general survey, pointing out both the

religious and the secular currents of thought. The now "classic" history of the Social Gospel movement itself is Charles Howard Hopkins, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism, 1865–1915* (New Haven and London, 1940), with bibliographical footnotes. This is the first effort to compose an adequate history of the movement to socialize and ethicize Protestantism. It demonstrates that social Christianity was not the achievement of a handful of clergymen who, at the opening of the twentieth century, challenged conservatism. Study of the literature indicates that the Social Gospel started in the early years of the "Gilded Age," was proclaimed by many, and was a part of the much broader social and humanitarian effort between the Civil War and World War I. Hopkins, however, does not give sufficient credit to the pre-Civil War influences emphasized by Timothy L. Smith's *Revivalism and Social Reform* (New York, 1957). Henry Farnham May, *Protestant Churches and Industrial America* (New York, 1949), with a bibliography, maintains that the adjustment of religious thought to industrialism began in the period 1877–1895, after the great economic depression of 1873 and the railroad strikes of 1877. The Protestant churches, retaining their historic position of intellectual and moral leadership, played a major part in the beginning of a new type of social thought.

While these excellent studies explore the more immediate causes of the later Social Gospel movement, others illustrate its deeper rootage in previous Hebrew-Christian traditions and American ideals. Chester C. McCown, *The Genesis of the Social Gospel* (New York and London, 1929) points out that the social element in Christianity is at least as old as the Gospel itself. Jesus inherited the high moral aspirations of Hebrew prophets who in a sense were social reformers. Christians have tried to apply Jesus' teachings in every age. "The American social gospel is but one of the latest adjustments of the Christian ethic to the exigencies of history." H. Richard Niebuhr, *The Kingdom of God in America* (Chicago and

New York, 1937) discusses the American kingdom-of-God ideal of the Puritan settlers, who wished to create a godly commonwealth; their expression of hope for a perfect society became an element in "the American dream." The equalitarian democratic ideals of the early nineteenth century blended with the Kingdom hope to create a climate of opinion favorable to the start of the modern Social Gospel. Arthur M. Schlesinger, *The American as Reformer* (Cambridge, Mass., 1950) has bibliographical references in "Commentary and Notes." He observes that the reform impulse has been sustained and refreshed by two basic ideals—the Declaration of Independence and Christianity. No element in reform is more potent than religion. The American core of Puritanism, without its theological husks, is an intense moral zeal for individual and community salvation. Liberal movements in politics have turned to the Bible for inspiration, and Christian reformers have stressed remaking souls as the prerequisite to remaking institutions. Maurice C. Latta, "The Background for the Social Gospel in American Protestantism," in *Church History*, Vol. 5, no. 3 (Sept. 1936), pp. 256–270, stresses the deep background of the movement in revivalism and its effects. And Ralph H. Gabriel, *The Course of American Democratic Thought* (New York, 1940) interprets the Social Gospel movement, and relates it to the American democratic faith, in a general discussion.

a. Evangelical Unitarianism and the Social Gospel. There was a Unitarian element in the intellectual and spiritual preparation for the Social Gospel after the Civil War. Unitarianism was not merely rationalistic, but had sympathies with evangelical doctrines. This was made possible by the fact that revivals had undermined orthodoxy by stressing experience and emotion, and so had popularized an untheological faith that could share Unitarianism's ethical, spiritual and unsectarian spirit. There was a point where Unitarians and Evangelicals could agree—society needed reforming.

The early rise of the Unitarian social passion is perceived

in Christopher R. Eliot, "Joseph Tuckerman, Pioneer in Scientific Philanthropy," in Unitarian Historical Society, *Proceedings*, Vol. 4 (1935), pp. 1–32. This emphasizes the insistence of Unitarianism upon humanitarian service, illustrated by the Boston "ministry at large" to the "unchurched," conducted by Tuckerman. This was the first serious effort of a religious group to deal with social and religious problems of "submerged" city people. Tuckerman's own account is in his *The Principles and Results of the Ministry at Large in Boston* (Boston, 1838). A similar spirit influenced later Unitarian leaders: Theodore Parker, Edward Everett Hale, Orville Dewey, and Frederic Dan Huntington. Joseph H. Allen, *Our Liberal Movement in Theology* (Boston, 1882) and George Willis Cooke, *Unitarianism in America* (Boston, 1902) both indicate one of the origins of the Social Gospel in Unitarian stress upon ethics and good life, the dignity and divine possibilities of man, achievement of salvation from cultivation of character, and the importance of the present life. Transcendentalism, which had strong ties with Unitarianism, also presented a humanitarian challenge of moral idealism. Frederic Dan Huntington, *Divine Aspects of Human Society* (Boston, 1858; repr. New York, 1891, as: *Human Society: Its Providential Structure, Relations, and Offices*) is his most significant early utterance on social religion. Huntington became an Episcopalian, and as Bishop of Central New York, exerted a strong influence in behalf of the Social Gospel. The general effects of theoretical social liberalism are summed up in Gordon Arthur Riegler, *Socialization of the New England Clergy, 1800 to 1860* (Greenfield, Ohio, 1945), with bibliographical references included in "foot notes," and a bibliography. This reveals the increasing concern of the clergy with the application of Christian doctrine to social issues.

b. Protestant Revivalistic Evangelism. Not all the currents flowing together to fertilize the later Social Gospel came from the liberal emphasis upon God's goodness and man's

perfectibility. They proceeded also from the powerful and lasting ethical impulses in Protestant revivalistic evangelism before and after the Civil War. This is made very clear by Charles C. Cole, Jr., *The Social Ideas of the Northern Evangelists, 1826–1860* (New York, 1954), which "covers adequately the opinions of a rather diverse group of individual leaders, but not their relations to the movements in church life which they represent." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform*, p. 238.) The group included Lyman Beecher, Henry Ward Beecher, Peter Cartwright, Francis Wayland, Charles Grandison Finney, and Horace Bushnell. The latter's influence, especially, is indicated in Arthur C. McGiffert, Jr., *The Rise of Modern Religious Ideas* (New York, 1929), which points out that the social gospel of Washington Gladden and others stemmed directly from the liberal theology of Bushnell. His *Christian Nurture* did more than any other work to break down extreme Puritan individualism. John Wright Buckham, *Progressive Religious Thought in America* (Boston and New York, 1919) indicates Bushnell's insistence upon *experience* in theology, his abolishing the old distinction between nature and the supernatural, and making Christ the center of Christian thought. His were the premises of the "new theology" that provided the background of a religiously inspired social gospel.

Assertions of the duties of Christians regarding social and political questions appear in a number of pre-Civil War evangelical writers and preachers. Typical examples are: (1) Lyman Beecher, "Lectures on Political Atheism and Kindred Subjects" in his *Works* (Boston, 1852, Vol. 1). (2) Caleb Cushing, *A Discourse on the Social Influence of Christianity* (Andover, 1839). (3) Royal H. Tyler, *The Bible and Social Reform* (Philadelphia, 1860). (4) Samuel Harris, "Politics and the Pulpit," in *New Englander*, Vol. 12, no. 46 (May 1854), pp. 254–275. An indication of the working of the new social spirit is an essay by an anonymous writer: "The Relation of the Church to the Poor," in *Princeton Review*, Vol.

34, no. 4 (Oct. 1862), pp. 601–634. This typically illustrates the growth of the new sense of responsibility, and emphasizes the duty of the church and its people to care for the poor. Alienation of the poor from the church accompanies pew rent, and preaching the Gospel according to the taste of the wealthy. The churches should spend more for them, and reach them by prayer and social meetings. The churches were stirred also by attacks of secular writers, such as Stephen Colwell's *New Themes for the Protestant Clergy* (Philadelphia, 1851), which has been described as the "earliest statement of a social gospel in the modern sense." This Philadelphia iron merchant and economist "startled religious circles." (See Hopkins, *Rise of the Social Gospel*, p. 6.) He blamed the slow progress of Christianity upon preoccupation with creeds and doctrine rather than true charity. Other notable works by him are: *Politics for American Christians* (Philadelphia, 1852); *The Race for Riches* (Philadelphia, 1853); and *Charity and the Clergy* (Philadelphia, 1853).

2. THEOLOGY OF THE SOCIAL GOSPEL. A bibliographic guide is found in the footnotes in Charles Howard Hopkins, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism, 1865–1915* (New Haven, 1940), ch. 1. Hopkins discerns four types of thinking in the post-Civil War era, constituting the "theological climate" in which the Social Gospel grew. (1) Conventional, orthodox, and institutional Protestantism—complacent, pietist, and set against "meddling" with social problems. (2) Enlightened conservatism, striving to reconcile the truths of Christianity with the new science and to adjust Protestant ethics to the newly industrialized society. (3) The evangelical hope and fervor that inspired the earlier crusade against slavery and intemperance, and the devotion to missions. (4) The rational, influential Unitarian school that challenged the presuppositions and the ethics of conservatism with the "Religion of Humanity."

The theological background is closely examined by Harold Allen Durfee, "The Theologies of the American Social Gos-

pel, a Study of the Theological and Philosophical Presuppositions of the American Social Gospel" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1950; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 2809; *Microfilm Abstracts,* Vol. 11 (1951), no. 4, pp. 1059–1060). He indicates the unity and diversity of theological positions, and the background movements—sectarianism, Calvinism, the Enlightenment, and Christian Socialism—and analyzes the theologies of Americans who anticipated the Social Gospel writers. An effort to ascertain the socio-intellectual factors contributing to the rise of the movement is found in Oscar William Lever, "The Idea of the Kingdom of God as Reflected in the American Social Gospel Movement, 1865–1917" (Doctoral dissertation, Duke University, 1941). He determines and analyzes its fundamental conceptions. The Kingdom idea was an effort to recognize rising social consciousness and new scientific developments. It was based upon teachings of Jesus and the prophets, and did not exclude hope of a spiritual kingdom beyond history. The church should be the chief agency in bringing the Kingdom. The movement is studied in Robert T. Handy, "George D. Herron and the Social Gospel in American Protestantism, 1890–1901" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1949; microfilm, University of Chicago Libraries, also typewritten copy). Herron, a colorful and controversial figure, was the storm center of several important Christian social movements, moving leftward in social and theological views and inspiring the Kingdom Movement. Later he became a radical political Socialist and abandoned Christianity. He dramatized the Social Gospel by his ideal of the Kingdom of Heaven, to be actualized in a Christian state, and his agitation coincided with the Western Populist political movement, which to a large extent was religiously inspired. A bibliography of his movement is provided by the footnotes to three chapters in Charles Howard Hopkins, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism:* ch. 6, "The Kingdom of God and 'Our Country,' " ch. 7, "Evolution

and the Kingdom," and ch. 11, "George D. Herron: Social Redemption Through Sacrifice."

Paul Frederick Battenhouse, "Theology in the Social Gospel, 1918–1946" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1950) answers the question whether or not there is a change in approach to social action when theology changes. Domination by "liberal" theology led to optimism concerning establishment of the Kingdom of God, confidence in man's ability to bring it, the immanence of God, and the essential goodness of man. Reinhold Niebuhr's *Moral Man and Immoral Society* (1932) marked an orthodox challenge to the theology of liberalism; social problems are to be solved first on a religious plane. J. Neal Hughley, *Trends in Protestant Social Idealism* (New York, 1948) has many bibliographical references in the "Notes," and selected bibliographies by chapters, including many periodical articles. This discusses the historical orientation of the Social Gospel and the contemporary attack upon it, and is devoted mostly to detailed illustration of outstanding and influential Protestant writers as spokesmen for or critics of the social viewpoint. The author confines his attention to social thought and sympathizes with Christian Socialism.

A strong secular inspiration of Social Gospel theology is uncovered in David W. Noble's "The Religion of Progress in America, 1890–1914," in *Social Research,* Vol. 22, no. 4 (Winter, 1955), pp. 417–440. Here is discussed "the rapidly rising religious enthusiasm of American intellectuals in the years of the twentieth century before World War I." It "found expression in the millennial hope of immediate spiritual salvation within the secular environment." Noble doubts that all these intellectuals had been converted to Darwinism, in the sense of a "detached scientific attitude." Joseph Norris Loper, "The Leading Conceptions of Property in American Social Christianity" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1952) reveals the significance of basic property ideas conceived by leaders of the Social Gospel, c.1875 to the present. The question was one of *right use:* property is secondary, human

personality is primary. Political socialism was rejected, as not enough concerned with personality; idealism is a prerequisite of social progress.

The mingling of religious and secular strains of thought in the preachers and writers of the Social Gospel era, before World War I, is well illustrated by a few writings of or commentaries on some of the outstanding personalities. The liberal Christian viewpoint appeared strongly in Francis Greenwood Peabody, whose position is studied in Edwin Richardson Edmonds, "The Principle of Social Correlation in the Social Ethics of Francis Greenwood Peabody" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1949). Peabody was concerned largely with social reform rooted directly in Christianity: drawn from the principle of conservation of physical energy and the social teachings of Jesus. He was one of the first to apply the principle specifically to social reform—a distinctive contribution to theory. Josiah Strong's *The New Era* (New York, 1893), especially chs. 2, 6, 11, and 16, outlines the thought of a champion of the Social Gospel approach to religion, who also was a fervid nationalist. The eloquent statement of his position reveals the influence of social Darwinism and of the Bible. Washington Gladden, *The New Idolatry and Other Discussions* (New York, 1905) is a protest against the commercializing of life and religion, the tendency to power-worship in church and state and to ignoring the interests of justice and freedom, the dethronement of God and enthronement of mammon. Charles Reynolds Brown, *The Social Message of the Modern Pulpit* (New York, 1906) maintains that the chief duty of preachers, at least in the present situation, is to inculcate true principles of social action and lead in social reconstruction. Brown's long experience in conflicts between labor and capital convinced him that academic discussion of theological matters obscured the message of Christ. John Marshall Barker, *The Social Gospel and the New Era* (New York, 1919), with bibliography for chapters, has a clear and adequate concept of the meaning and value of

the Kingdom ideal and spirit, and surveys widening fields of opportunity for social service, into which churches should enter and work more earnestly to realize the triumph of God in human affairs.

The impact of the new gospel upon a "secular" academic teacher is excellently illustrated by Richard T. Ely's *Social Aspects of Christianity and Other Essays* (New York, 1889). This devout Episcopalian was a professor of economics at The Johns Hopkins University, and one of the leaders in the post-Civil War reform movement, bringing to it not only an interest in theology, but also a much-needed knowledge of economics. Even more impressive is the influence of religious inspiration upon the "secular" reformer, Edward Bellamy. This is amply demonstrated by Joseph Schiffman, "Edward Bellamy's Religious Thought," in *Publications of the Modern Language Association*, Vol. 68, no. 4, part 1 (Sept. 1953), pp. 716–732. He proves that religion actually was a major influence in Bellamy's social thought, and in fact in modern American intellectual history. The point is further pressed home in Joseph L. Blau, "Bellamy's Religious Motivation for Social Reform: A Review Article," in *Review of Religion*, Vol. 21, nos. 3–4 (Mar. 1957), pp. 156–166. The religious motivation of reform in the Social Gospel is very ably reviewed in Howard Eikenberry Jensen and William Peter King, eds., *Social Progress and Christian Ideals* (Nashville, 1931), with bibliography.

3. RAUSCHENBUSCH'S THEOLOGY. Rauschenbusch has become a personal symbol of the Social Gospel, but his theological position has a greater significance. The principal difference between him and so many other advocates of social concern was his connection with the Church's evangelical tradition, and the expression of his viewpoint in terms of doctrine. He emphasized Christian social involvement with one's neighbors, the embodiment of evil in society outside the individual, and social concern apart from doctrines of personal sin and salvation. He saw sin as something embodied in so-

cial institutions, and evil as "super-personal." Yet he was extraordinarily optimistic about the reformability of human nature, in contrast to Calvinists like Edwards and Hodge and the Lutheran Walther. A key doctrine in his Social Gospel was the "Kingdom of God," humanity organized to do the will of God. The Church could serve to advance the Kingdom, even though its record was one of hindrance. His inspiration came not from the Church, but from sociologists, economists, and his own observations of American society, and he dramatized the crisis of industrialism.

His theological position is outlined in the following works: (1) *Christianity and the Social Crisis* (New York, 1907), a historic survey, reviewing the roots of a socialized democracy in Judaism, the flowering of the ideal in the teachings of Jesus, its transferred development in Christian history, and discussing modern duty to realize the social aspect of Christianity. (2) *Christianizing the Social Order* (New York, 1912) deals immediately with the institutions of modern society, and resumes the question at the point left by *Christianity and the Social Crisis*, expanding and supplementing the treatment of the social ideas of Jesus, and carrying the basic theme of the Kingdom of Righteousness into the midst of social problems. (3) *A Theology for the Social Gospel* (New York, 1922), written during World War I, is in his optimistic vein, emphasizing sin as a reformable social inheritance, not inherent. Sin and social evil apparently became practically identical in his thought. This is an effort to tighten the relationship between his social interests and the Church's theology. The union really was in his person, not in a theological system.

Readings in Rauschenbusch's Social Gospel theology are conveniently arranged in the following works: (1) *A Gospel for the Social Awakening; Selections from the Writings of Walter Rauschenbusch*, compiled by Benjamin E. Mays (New York, 1950), with bibliography. (2) *A Rauschenbusch Reader; the Kingdom of God and the Social Gospel*, com-

piled by Benson Y. Landis; with an "Interpretation of the Life and Work of Walter Rauschenbusch" by Harry Emerson Fosdick (New York, 1957). The latter comprises digests of his major books, with brief notes on their social settings, and Fosdick's comments based upon personal acquaintance, critically suggesting immaturities in the author's economic formulations, and the need of revision of his thought.

Interpretations of Rauschenbusch are fairly numerous, and the following are selected as probably the best: (1) Vernon Parker Bodein, "The Development of the Social Thought of Walter Rauschenbusch," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 6, no. 3 (Summer, 1937), pp. 420–431, issued also as a reprint (New York, 1937). (2) Dores Robinson Sharpe, *Walter Rauschenbusch* (New York, 1942), a detailed and sympathetic account by his secretary, but an inadequate portrait. (3) Donovan Ebersole Smucker, "The Origins of Walter Rauschenbusch's Social Ethics" (Chicago Library, Dept. of Photographic Reproduction, University of Chicago, 1956; microfilm copy of typescript, microfilm 5296 HM, bibliography). (4) Anna M. Singer, *Walter Rauschenbusch and his Contribution to Social Christianity* (Boston, c.1926).

4. CRITICISM OF THE SOCIAL GOSPEL; DECLINE AND REVIVAL. Winfred E. Garrison, *The March of Faith* (New York, 1933) briefly reviews the Social Gospel movement *and its opponents*, covering the period since the Civil War, and relating religion to economic, social, and cultural development. Frederick Ernest Johnson, *The Social Gospel and Personal Religion: Are They in Conflict?* (New York, 1922) discusses the supposed antithesis between the social concern of the liberals and the emphasis of conservative evangelicals upon personal conversion and individualistic pietism. Charles Clayton Morrison, *The Social Gospel and the Christian Cultus* (New York, 1933) deals with reasons for the decline of the social emphasis in recent years. It has revealed the prophetic spirit of the ministry, but has not reached into the "priestly realm," which sets emotional and volitional church life. The

prophetic outlook must include worship, theology, and ethics, within the cultus.

Frederick Ernest Johnson, *The Social Gospel Re-examined* (New York and London, c.1940) meets the criticism not only by religious and economic conservatives, but also by theologians, who in some cases (like Reinhold Niebuhr, Paul Tillich, and Emil Brunner) are politically and economically "radical." He discusses the nature of Christian ethics, secular culture, Christianity and war, democracy and the Christian ethic. The general direction of theologically inspired criticism is clarified by George Hammar, *Christian Realism in Contemporary American Theology, A Study of Reinhold Niebuhr, W. M. Horton, and H. P. Van Dusen* (Uppsala, Sweden, 1940), with bibliography. "Where the social gospel lost its connection with evangelicalism it became merely a social substitute for Christianity." Maurice B. Reckitt, *Maurice to Temple: A Century of Social Movement in the Church of England* (London, 1947) has been influential in the United States, and includes penetrating observations on the criticism of the Social Gospel by Neo-Orthodoxy. The theology of crisis and Neo-Calvinism have made the word "social" an object of suspicion to those aware of the gravity of the Barthian strictures on a religion of social concern only. Social concern, pleaded in the name of religion, too often implies flight from the other-worldliness of an authentic Christianity. John C. Bennett, *Christian Ethics and Social Policy* (New York, 1946) is a good general statement on the various possible positions of organized religion with regard to social policy, and critically examines the Social Gospel position.

Paul Allen Carter, *The Decline and Revival of the Social Gospel* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1954), with bibliography, covers the period 1920–1940, and examines the reasons for the decline before 1929, including the Neo-Orthodox attack upon the theological presuppositions of the Social Gospel. Recovery, under way by 1932, was facilitated by the depression and the New Deal, revision of religious ethics, the Ecumenical move-

ment, and constructive criticism by the Neo-Orthodox. Strong evidence of revived and more realistic interest appears in a highly significant essay by Olin Trivette Binkley, *The Churches and the Social Conscience* (Indianapolis, 1948), with bibliographical footnotes. He shows how the power of the Spirit in men's lives is a foundation and a force for national progress. He illustrates the influences of the churches in social thought and action since the Great Awakening, and holds that religion in the organized life of the churches has sharpened social conscience. There is evidence of renewed emphasis upon the reforming power of the Gospel, in reexamination of the churches' social strategy, and development of research agencies bearing upon specific problems. The bibliographical footnotes survey much writing on the Social Gospel since World War I. Further evidence of revived interest is Benson Young Landis, ed., *Religion and the Good Society; an Introduction to Social Teachings of Judaism, Catholicism and Protestantism* (New York, 1943), with bibliography, published under the auspices of the National Conference of Christians and Jews. The new, realistic, and practical strategy of action is evidenced also by Jerome Davis's *Religion in Action* . . . Introduction by E. Stanley Jones (New York, c.1956). D. Ivan Dykstra, "Evangelical Christianity and Social Concern," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 24, no. 2 (Spring, 1955), pp. 269–277, considers the possibility of a Christianity which is individually pious and also socially concerned, thereby indicating the present general trend of thought.

5. THE GOSPEL OF WEALTH. Merle Curti, *The Growth of American Thought* (New York, 1943), ch. 25, "The Conservative Defense," is a characterization of the individualistic philosophy, which has criticized and opposed the Social Gospel, often in a constructive and helpful way. Arthur Schlesinger, Jr., in *The Age of Jackson* (Boston, 1948) outlines the general context in which the problem of wealth assumed its full significance, when American capitalism was in its

beginnings. Ralph H. Gabriel, *The Course of American Democratic Thought* (New York, 1956, 2nd ed.) gives an account of the "gospel of wealth" in the "Gilded Age" after the Civil War—the period of the emergence of great fortunes. Matthew Arnold, "American Civilization in 1883–84," in Allan Nevins, ed., *American Social History as Recorded by British Travellers* (London, 1948) has some pertinent observations on the contemporary attitude toward the relations between wealth and religion.

The doctrinal justification of the gospel of wealth, stressing social responsibility, is explained by Ruth Douglas See, "The Protestant Doctrine of Vocation in the Presbyterian Thought of Nineteenth-Century America" (Doctoral dissertation, New York University, 1953; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 5426; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1953), Vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 603–604). The doctrine was socially important because of the vast social prestige and influence of this church and its business men. The essay examines the early ideal in Calvin's writings and in the church's official records. The doctrine was rather obscured in the nineteenth century by stress upon salvation of individuals, individual morality rather than social responsibility. Its recovery would help to provide direction and meaning need in contemporary society. Gail Kennedy, ed., *Democracy and the Gospel of Wealth* (Boston, 1949) is a collection of readings, offering a convenient survey of the historical problem and the doctrine of stewardship of wealth. Particular attention should be given to selections from the writings of Andrew Carnegie, Bishop William Lawrence, Elbert Hubbard, and Charles S. Pierce. The careers of business "tycoons," who were more or less influenced by the Christian doctrine of stewardship, are assessed by Matthew Josephson in *The Robber Barons; the Great American Capitalists, 1861–1901* (New York, 1934). He analyzes the motives and achievements of a set of leaders, who devoted their lives to support of the existing economic and political system.

He tells, with some gusto and with frequent value judgments, how the new industrial plutocracy and certain church leaders supported each other in mutual and genuine admiration.

Allan Nevins, *Study in Power: John D. Rockefeller, Industrialist and Philanthropist* (New York and London, 1953, 2 vols.) presents a brilliant and sympathetic study of the man who perhaps represents most strikingly the ideals of the "Gospel of Wealth." (See Vol. 2, pp. 156–220, 386–402.) Andrew Carnegie, *Autobiography* (Boston and New York, 1920) is the self-portrait of a Christian business "tycoon" in the age of rising great industry. Carnegie was a synthesis of realistic and often ruthless financial acumen, sincere piety, and paternalistic benevolence.

The type of sermons and bookish arguments that influenced these business leaders, and many others like them, is fairly summarized by Russell H. Conwell, *Acres of Diamonds* (New York, 1915), which reflects the Protestant ethic in the last half of the nineteenth century, with a brief biography by Robert Shackleton following Conwell's essay, to explain the appeal of his message. This is the best-known discourse of one of the nation's most popular lecturers, with an appreciative foreword by his friend, John Wanamaker, the Philadelphia merchant. (See reprint in Thomas B. Reed, ed., *Modern Eloquence* (Philadelphia, 1900–1903), Vol. 4, pp. 307–338.) Conwell may be considered as a forerunner of Dale Carnegie's and Norman Vincent Peale's religion of successful living. Gerald D. Heuver, *The Teachings of Jesus Concerning Wealth* (Chicago, 1903) severely criticizes the Socialist clergyman, George D. Herron, for emphasizing the social aspects of Jesus' teachings. Socialism fails to realize the necessity of moral transformation, or appeal to character, and relies on external reforms to change human personality.

More recently, the business man himself has assumed the task of attempting to adjust business to Christian ethics. Bruce Barton, *The Man Nobody Knows, A Discovery of Jesus* (Indianapolis, 1925) is a quite unconventional and un-

professional portrait by a business man unhampered by the dialect of theology. It is also a twentieth-century defense of the Gospel of Wealth, based upon the doctrine of stewardship as seen in the teachings of Jesus. Roger Ward Babson, *Religion and Business* (New York, 1922) states that religion is the important element in life, more comprehensive than the practice of the churches, and that there should be closer relations between religion and business. The churches must be more efficient, to penetrate the whole community (and particularly the business community) with the spirit of service. Religious business men must discover a new force, to take the place of both socialism and individualism. By promoting disinterested service, "religion" (as now known) can regain the confidence of the masses. But Jerome Davis, ed., *Business and the Church; a Symposium* (New York and London, c.1926), a collection of statements by business and labor leaders, reveals considerable confusion of thought and a lack of concern for any useful function of religion on the part of some segments of the business world. An effort to inspire a new "religious look" in business is observable in Theodore Conrad Graebner, *The Business Man and the Church* (Clinton, S.C., 1943). (See also sect. III, A, *Religion and Capitalism.*)

C. Christian Socialism

English Christian Socialism, 1848–1854, was a pervasive influence. The leaders who had the greatest influence in America were Frederick Denison Maurice and Charles Kingsley, and they were interpreted to Americans mainly by Episcopalians. Kingsley's social protest was expressed in his novels, *Yeast* and *Alton Locke,* and Maurice's influence lay in his theology, especially in the following works: (1) *The Gospel of the Kingdom of Heaven* (London and Cambridge, 1864). (2) *The Commandments Considered as Instruments of National Reformation* (London, 1866). (3) *Social Moral-*

ity (London and Cambridge, 1869), and (4) *Faith and Action* (Boston, 1886), a compilation with a preface by Phillips Brooks.

Frederick Denison Maurice, *The Life of Frederick Denison Maurice, Chiefly Told by His Own Letters*, edited by his son, Frederick Maurice (London, 1884, 2 vols.), emphasizes his increasing social concern after 1847, meetings with working men and interest in the democratic movement of Chartism, the economic cooperative movement, the adoption of Christian Socialism, and explanation of the principles and aims of its followers. Charles E. Raven, *Christian Socialism, 1848–1854* (London, 1920) sympathetically covers the English background of this movement, which ultimately affected the thought and action of some American advocates of the Social Gospel, such as W. D. P. Bliss. Gilbert Clive Binyon, *The Christian Socialist Movement in England, An Introduction to the Study of Its History* (London, 1931) is a sympathetic and careful consideration by a Yorkshire vicar with a lifetime association with social applications of Christianity. It fails to recognize the basic, irreconcilable conflict between Christianity and materialistic, class-conflict socialism, the ideal of the Kingdom of God and secular equalitarianism imposed by force.

A bibliography of the Christian Socialist movement in the United States will be found in the bibliographical footnotes to ch. 10, "Christian Socialism," in Charles Howard Hopkins, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism 1865–1915* (New Haven, 1940), including books and magazine articles. Further bibliography is in ch. 14, "The Christian Socialist Fellowship," also including books and articles.

Even before the Civil War, some liberal clergymen, disturbed by social unrest and economic injustice, were attracted by the utopian socialism of the 1840's, and thought that Christ's promise of heaven on earth might be fulfilled in a collectivist society, which appeared to them as definitely Christian. Typical expressions of their views are: (1) William

Henry Channing, *The Christian Church and Social Reform* (Boston, 1848), and (2) Henry James, *Moralism and Christianity* (New York, 1850). The fate of the various experiments with utopian socialist colonies is completely reviewed by Charles Nordhoff, *The Communistic Societies of the United States: From Personal Visit and Observation* (New York, 1875), which includes the societies of Christian inspiration, and has a large bibliography. Another perceptive and sympathetic account is Robert J. Hendricks, *Bethel and Aurora, An Experiment in Communism as Practical Christianity with Some Account of Past and Present Ventures in Collective Living* (New York, 1933).

CHURCHES AND SOCIALISM. Bibliographic references appear in the footnotes to ch. 4, "The Church Challenges Socialism," in Hopkins, *Rise of the Social Gospel.* The church was challenged, after the great strikes of 1877, by the rapid growth of the ideas of scientific socialism in the ranks of labor, which aroused deep concern among the Protestant clergy. It was not idealistic and utopian communism of the Fourierist type, but a class-conscious and militantly political movement. Socialism began to receive attention from the clergy in the 1870's, and they gradually began an effort to accommodate Christianity to socialist ideals. Many reached a compromise: Christian social teaching is midway between socialism and the classical laissez-faire economics, a mediator between them, and understanding the weaknesses of both.

Attempts to reconcile socialism and Christianity appear in the writings of several church authors in the years before World War I. See, especially: (1) Washington Gladden, *Christianity and Socialism* (New York and Cincinnati, 1905), chs. 3 and 4. (2) Percy S. Grant, *Socialism and Christianity* (New York, 1910). (3) Henry C. Vedder, *Socialism and the Ethics of Jesus* (New York, 1912). (4) Charles Stelzle, *Christianity's Storm Center* (New York, 1907). (5) Herbert G. Coddington, *Christianity and Socialism* (Syracuse, N.Y., 1905). (6) Vida D. Scudder, *Socialism and Character* (Bos-

ton and New York, 1912). All hold that socialism and Christianity, although different in methods, really have the same purpose, in social progress toward the Kingdom of God. They are not contradictory or exclusive. Gladden was a liberal Congregational minister in Ohio; Vedder a professor at Crozer (Baptist) Theological Seminary; Stelzle of the Presbyterian Department of Church and Labor; Grant and Scudder were leaders of the Social Gospel movement in the Episcopal Church.

The boldest effort to reconcile socialism and Christianity was made in *The Christian Socialist*, a periodical started in 1903 in Webster City, Iowa, and later edited by the Rev. Edward Willis Carr of Danville, Ill. Supported by religious radicals, it urged ministers and people to follow the Social Gospel, and advised the Socialist Party not to ignore religion. It was class-conscious as well as religious, but more concerned to reach Christians than Socialists, and attained a circulation of 20,000 before its collapse in the antisocialist reaction after World War I. From it developed the "Christian Socialist Fellowship."

Some of the most representative arguments for Christian Socialism appeared in magazine articles of the period 1890–1914. The following ones are fairly typical: Frank Mason North, "The Christianity of Socialism," in *Zion's Herald*, Vol. 69 (Jan. 28, 1891), p. 25; and "Socialism and Christianity," *ibid.*, Vol. 69 (Feb. 4, 1891), p. 34. North was among those who found much value in socialism, but did not call themselves Christian Socialists. The two articles above are selected from four in *Zion's Herald* (1891) on "Socialism and the Christian Church." He pointed out the "similarity" of Christianity and socialism, and held that the common brotherhood of man was the gospel of both, cited some aims of the Knights of Labor as Christian, and declared that socialism challenged the church to apply its morals to life.

J. O. Bentall, "Why I Am A Christian Socialist," in *Arena*, Vol. 37, no. 211 (June 1907), pp. 600–604, points to

the alleged incompatibility of economic competition and the Christian ideal of social justice, and the possibility of the Christian ideal under socialism, while averring that capitalism is socially and morally corrupting—the familiar argument of Christian Socialists in that period. In Eliot White's "The Christian Socialist Fellowship," *Arena,* Vol. 41, no. 229 (Jan. 1900), pp. 47–52, the secretary of the Fellowship in Massachusetts holds that American socialism is *not* hostile to religion, and embraces many ministers and church members. He gives a brief account of the Fellowship, its publications, activities, principles, conferences, etc. Socialism is the Christian economic and social system. Representative of the opposition is a book by Edward R. Hartman, *Socialism Versus Christianity* (New York, 1909). It is typical of the rejection of socialism by conservative ministers, declaring it to be anti-Christian, because it seeks the establishment of brotherhood by force, eliminates the need for the sacrifice of Christ, believes in man's ability to save himself, and substitutes fallible reason for the plan of God.

There are very few good general histories of the American Christian Socialist movement. For bibliography, an excellent guide is Paul F. Laubenstein, *A History of Christian Socialism in America* (New York, 1925), a thesis, library of Union Theological Seminary, New York, with valuable notes on Christian Socialist periodicals early in the twentieth century. A real treasure-trove of information, with a comprehensive bibliography, is James Dombrowski, *The Early Days of Christian Socialism in America* (New York, 1936), which reveals the diverse influences that led to modern social Christianity, and the part of each. He devotes much attention to the career of W. D. P. Bliss and the Society of Christian Socialists, with its activities and publications. A good brief summary of the movement is provided by Christopher L. Webber, "William Dwight Porter Bliss (1856–1926) Priest and Socialist," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 28, no. 1 (Mar. 1959), pp. 9–39, with a

bibliography including his works and the "Declaration of Principles of the Society of Christian Socialists." This is a documented account of the movement, its relations to the Church and social reform, and its decline. Robert T. Handy, "Christianity and Socialism in America, 1900–1920," in *Church History*, Vol. 21, no. 1 (Mar. 1952), pp. 39–54, has many bibliographical notes, and reviews the activities of many Christians within the socialist ranks, and their vigorous contributions to socialist propaganda. Handy criticizes the Christian Socialist movement for its identification of the Kingdom of God with the socialist state. The movement disappeared in the 1920's, but its influence contributed to the spread of Protestant concern with social issues in the 1930's.

D. Social Action

1. PROTESTANT SOCIAL ACTION. SOCIAL TEACHINGS OF JESUS. Around the turn of the century the Protestant Social Gospel discovered a solid Scriptural basis in the deeper study of the *practical* social implications of the teachings of Jesus. The movement recognized this as the source of a true, valid, and authoritative foundation for Christian sociology. Until that time the rather vague "Kingdom" ideal had been predominant. The Jesus of history and his practical social teachings made an impression upon American Protestant social leaders through European New Testament scholarship, conveyed by writings of British scholars and by Americans who had studied in Germany. The emphasis shifted from the "Kingdom" ideal to the definite social teachings of Jesus and to practical social action. For bibliography, see: footnotes to ch. 12, "The Discovery of the Social Teachings of Jesus," in Charles Howard Hopkins, *Rise of the Social Gospel.*

The way toward a more practical and "realistic" social action was prepared by many books, essays, and lectures. The following titles are typical selections. Wilbur Fisk Crafts, *Practical Christian Sociology; a Series of Lectures at Prince-*

ton Theological Seminary and Marietta College on Moral Reforms and Social Problems (New York and London, 1907) has a list of "Sociological Literature." Other representative publications are: Charles Stelzle, *American Social and Religious Conditions* (New York and Chicago, c.1912); Graham Taylor, *Religion in Social Action,* with an Introduction by Jane Addams (New York, 1913), with "references"; and James Myers, *Religion Lends a Hand; Studies of Churches in Social Action* (New York and London, 1929), with bibliography. Committee on the War and the Religious Outlook, *The Church and Industrial Reconstruction* (New York, 1921) is one of the earliest Protestant analytical treatments of the relation of organized religion to social policy. The forces of opinion that have moulded policies are extensively studied in Norman L. Trott and Ross W. Sanderson, *What Church People Think about Social and Economic Issues; Report of an Opinion Survey Made in Baltimore under the Baltimore Rauschenbusch Fellowship of the Council of Churches and Christian Education of Maryland and Delaware . . .* Introduction by F. Ernest Johnson (New York, 1938), with a bibliography. The direction in which progressive Protestant thought has been moving since the depression period appears in Harold C. Letts, *Christian Action in Economic Life,* ed. Arthur H. Getz (Philadelphia, 1953).

Robert Moats Miller in *American Protestantism and Social Issues, 1919–1939* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1958) reviews the new practical policy, is founded upon exhaustive use of primary sources (especially church periodicals), with a classified bibliography including many doctoral dissertations, and reviews previous studies. This painstaking, comprehensive survey of the attitudes and action of the churches has been criticized for its rather defensive attitude, as if it needed to be proven that religion is not always "reactionary." The impact of the new sociology upon typical Protestant groups is very closely studied in Edward Eldredge Brewster, "Patterns of Social Concern in Four American Protestant Denominations"

(Doctoral dissertation, 1952, abstract published by Boston University), which treats the problem of the Church's survival as a social institution, without abandoning its religious ethic, and discusses responses of the church type and the sect type. He surveys and analyzes the social pronouncements of Presbyterians, U.S.A., Methodists, Baptists (American Convention), and the Congregational-Christian Church upon issues of property and the state, 1923–1948. Growth of social concern showed basic unanimity of opinion, the necessity of courageous, sect-type minorities, and of a vital, original, rigorous ethic.

One of the most effective campaigns for practical social action developed in the Methodist churches. Its growth and principles are demonstrated by Francis E. Kearns, "Changing Social Emphases in the Methodist Episcopal Church" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1939); also by Forrest R. Brown, "The Development of the Social Creed of the Methodist Church" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1942; typewritten copy in library; abstract published Boston, 1942); and by Hillman T. Williams, "The Methodist Episcopal Church and Industrial Reconstruction, 1908–1939" (Doctoral dissertation, Temple University). The program is reviewed in Milton John Huber, Jr., "A History of the Methodist Federation for Social Action" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1949, abstract published in *Zion's Herald*). Its continuous unofficial relation with Methodism, and its radical program unhampered by officialdom, have made the church most influential in promoting the Social Gospel. The background of social thought and action, and the emphases at various periods, are traced since Wesley's day. An excellent study of local action is provided by Ernest W. Thacker, in "The Methodist Church in Southern California in Relation to the 'Social Gospel,' 1928 Through 1941" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1952). He determines the extent of acceptance and practice of the basic principles: the idea of Christianity involving a

change in the structure of society, and the Church's right to speak on social, economic, and political issues. He gives examples of action, and pronouncements that made definite contributions to social progress.

Another church that responded readily to the appeal for practical action was the Congregational, which had a long tradition of reforming zeal inspired by both liberalism and revivalism. The growth of the movement in this group is thoroughly reviewed in Carl Hermann Voss, "The Rise of Social Consciousness in the Congregational Churches: 1865–1942" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1942). The practical results appear in a study by Cyrus Ransom Pangborn, "Free Churches and Social Change, A Critical Study of the Council for Social Action of the Congregational-Christian Churches of the United States" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1951). The Council was the first such agency (1934) of a denomination, with *official* status. The founders wished to bear witness to the Calvinist-Puritan ideal of holiness in common life. Its social views express normal liberalism, opposed to individualism by viewing society organically.

The response of a doctrinally and socially conservative Protestant church appears very clearly in Harold Herbert Lentz's study: "History of the Social Gospel in the General Synod of the Lutheran Church in America, 1867–1918" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1943). This points out the degree to which the Synod adopted social-reform ideas, and outlines a pattern of social action derived from Luther. The concept of separate spheres of state and church responsibilities, however, prevented active *official* espousal of the Social Gospel. This did not imply lack of social action, and the great actual accomplishment is extensively reviewed in Walter Emanuel Miesel, "The Development of the Lutheran Inner Mission Societies in the Lutheran Church in America with Special Reference to Pennsylvania" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1947; abstract in *Uni-*

versity of Pittsburgh Bulletin, Vol. 44, April 10, 1948). The areas of service included institutional visitation, family welfare, child care, service to prisoners, social welfare work, spiritual therapy through application of the Word of God, and use of the best social-work principles and methods: a *spiritualized* Social Gospel.

The social attitudes of one of the smaller, so-called "unworldly" churches are explained by Lewis Henry Braumbaugh's "Changed Emphases of the Church of the Brethren toward Certain Social Problems" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1945; abstract published by the University). The changes are discerned against the background of the evolving social ideals of American society, with references to temperance, race relations, war, etc. Social thinking and activities have been largely the result of environmental influences.

The predominantly Protestant environment of American Judaism combined with its own prophetic social tradition to arouse an ever-growing social concern and action among Jews, especially in the Reform congregations and among their eminent rabbis. The best study of this movement is Leonard Judah Mervis, "The Social Justice Movement of the American Reform Rabbis, 1890–1940" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1951). He portrays their social ideals and action, as reflected in proceedings of the Central Conference of American rabbis, and in the careers of selected leaders. The strong social platform has been augmented to keep abreast of social questions, in cooperation with the Federal Council of Churches and the National Catholic Welfare Conference. Communities are indebted to the social zeal of rabbis.

2. THE ANGLICAN PHASE. Frank Joseph Klingberg, *Anglican Humanitarianism in Colonial New York* (Philadelphia, The Church Historical Society, c.1940, pub. no. 11) illustrates the origins of Anglican social thought in the reform movement of the early eighteenth century and ministry to laboring and dependent classes. William Wilson Manross, "The Epis-

copal Church and Reform," in *Protestant Episcopal Historical Magazine,* Vol. 12, no. 4 (Dec. 1943), pp. 339–366, combats the idea that the Episcopal Church has been opposed to social reform, and gives many instances of participation.

The sources of social-reform ideals in the American Episcopal Church were greatly augmented after the 1840's by the revival of theology and social action in the Church of England, stemming from a group at Oxford University. Their influence in America is noticed by William George Peck, *The Social Implications of the Oxford Movement* (New York, 1933), in which an Anglo-Catholic shows that the movement in England had a profound effect upon the participation of the American Episcopal Church in the Social Gospel, especially in great cities. The movement was not merely pietistic, but was aware of the moral challenge of the industrial revolution and its social effects. One of the American leaders affected was Richard T. Ely, whose *Social Aspects of Christianity and Other Essays* (New York, 1889) expresses the social philosophy of one of the earliest American proponents of the Social Gospel, an Episcopalian layman and economist, and a professor at The Johns Hopkins University. Among the distinguished leaders was Chauncey B. Brewster, Bishop of Connecticut, a High Churchman, who voiced the opinions of some of his thoughtful episcopal brethren in his *The Kingdom of God and American Life* (New York, 1912). The social question, he held, is ultimately moral, and its solution is in the gospel of the Kingdom of God. He considers the relation of the Church to the Kingdom and the democratic ideal, and the relevance of the Kingdom to American citizenship and to industry. This is a non-partisan treatment for conservatives, emphasizing high idealism, accepting the consequences of democracy and rejecting socialism.

Practical action by the Episcopal Church, with official sponsorship, is studied at length by Spencer Miller and Joseph F. Fletcher in *The Church and Industry* (New York and London, 1930), with a bibliography. The study was made possible

by a grant from the Church's National Council to the Department of Christian Social Service, for the establishment of a Division on Industrial Relations. It briefly traces the history of the Christian social movement in the Church of England and the Episcopal Church in the United States. The development of official strategy is outlined by M. Moran Weston, "Social Policy of the Episcopal Church in the Twentieth Century" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1954, published by *University Microfilms*).

3. ROMAN CATHOLIC SOCIAL ACTION. Previous to the massive impact of the Papal encyclicals on social questions, which began to take effect around the turn of the century, Roman Catholic leaders in the United States were deeply disturbed by the agitations caused by industrial unrest and social evils. One of the earliest was the radical convert, Orestes A. Brownson, who came to the Church after a long experience in Protestant liberalism. His influence has been appreciated only in comparatively recent times. One of the best studies is that of Sister M. Felicia Corrigan, *Some Social Principles of Orestes A. Brownson* (Washington, D.C., 1939), with an extensive bibliography. This discusses the value of his contributions to American social thought after his conversion in 1844. Their basis was in Roman Catholic doctrine, which he considered necessary to social reform. He attacked laissez-faire economics, and viewed Christian marriage and healthy family life as the bases of social welfare. His suspicion of secular socialism and statism is revealed by M. A. Fitzsimmons, "Brownson's Search for the Kingdom of God: The Social Thought of an American Radical," in *Review of Politics*, Vol. 16, no. 1 (Jan. 1954), pp. 22–36. "Brownson clearly perceived the danger of tyranny lurking in the reformer's general willingness to use the power of the state" (*Amer. Lit.*, Vol. 26, no. 3, Nov. 1954, p. 462). Another early Catholic radical reformer is appreciated in Stephen Bell, *Rebel, Priest and Prophet, A Biography of Dr. Edward McGlynn* (New York, 1937), sympathetic toward the fiery and rebellious New York

City priest who became a follower of Henry George's single-tax movement and for years was excommunicated. His emphasis upon social justice was influential in imparting a new social outlook to a rather complacent American Christianity. Agnes Claire Schroll, *The Social Thought of John Lancaster Spalding, D.D.* (Washington, D.C., 1944, *Catholic University of America Studies in Sociology*, Vol. 11) has an extensive bibliography of his writings. She summarizes the religio-social philosophy of a bishop who was a leader in the Roman Catholic phase of the Social Gospel, emphasizing the church's social mission, and its relation to the state, the family, education, industrialism, labor, urban social problems, racial minorities, etc.

The officially sanctioned movement of Roman Catholic social thought and action in the United States may be reviewed in several scholarly collections and commentaries on the great social encyclicals issued since the 1880's, such as Joseph Husslein, *The Christian Manifesto, An Interpretative Study of the Encyclicals Rerum Novarum and Quadragesimo Anno of Pope Leo XIII and Pope Pius XI* (Milwaukee, 1931). His *Social Wellsprings, Fourteen Documents by Pope Leo XIII* (Milwaukee, 1940) includes those on social evils, socialism, Christian marriage, civil government, the Christian constitution of states, human liberty, and labor, with an index. G. C. Treacy, *Five Great Encyclicals* (New York, 1939) contains "Condition of Labor," by Leo XIII; and the pronouncements by Pius XI: "Christian Education of Youth," "Christian Marriage," "Reconstructing the Social Order," and "Atheistic Communism." Also valuable are Raymond Augustine McGowan, *Toward Social Justice; a Discussion and Application of Pius XI's "Reconstructing the Social Order"* (New York, 1933) written for the Social Action Department of the National Catholic Welfare Council; and Raymond Joseph Miller, *Forty Years After; Pius XI and the Social Order, a Commentary* (St. Paul, c.1947), with bibliographies. Virgil George Michel, *Christian Social Reconstruction; Some*

Fundamentals of the Quadragesimo Anno (Milwaukee and New York, c.1937) is a popular exposition of the encyclical on renewing and perfecting the social order according to the Gospel. Philip Hughes, ed., *The Pope's New Order* (New York, 1944) summarizes systematically all the great social encylicals and addresses from Leo XII to Pius XII, and is probably the best source on the social thought of the modern Papacy, covering practically all current social problems. The influence of Papal pronouncements may be traced in those of the American hierarchy: Catholic Church in the U.S., *Our Bishops Speak: National Pastorals and Annual Statements of the Hierarchy of the United States; Resolutions of Episcopal Committees and Communications of the Administrative Board of the National Catholic Welfare Conference*, 1919–1951, with a foreword, notes, and index by Raphael M. Huber (Milwaukee, 1952). This is a "Companion to . . . The national pastorals of the American hierarchy: 1791–1919."

There is a very rich literature by Americans, Protestant and Catholic, on the theology and realization of Catholic social principles and their application to American conditions. Among the best is Henry Schumacher, *The Social Message of the New Testament* (Milwaukee, c.1937). Robert George Brehmer, Jr., *Social Doctrines of the Catholic Church*, with a preface by Reverend James M. Gillis (New York, 1936) has a bibliography, and offers an objective, documented discussion, by a non-Catholic, of the church's teachings regarding certain social, economic, and political areas. Theodore Martin Hesburgh, *The Theology of Catholic Action* (Notre Dame, Ind., 1946) has a bibliography, and a special one on the background of modern secularism. John Francis Cronin, *Catholic Social Principles; the Social Teaching of the Catholic Church Applied to American Economic Life* (Milwaukee, 1950) comprises the Christian social order, social principles in economic life, and American Catholic social thought. He interprets the application of official pronouncements to labor unions, man-

agement, housing, social security, wages, income, taxes, and the family. This authoritative statement is intended primarily for Catholic teachers and students, to bring harmony of thought and practice, but is of general interest, and has an annotated reading list.

4. THE CHURCHES AND LABOR. The background of concern in the churches about labor and its problems was the growing industrial unrest after the Civil War. It exploded in the violent strikes of 1877, in Socialist propaganda, and in the establishment of militant organizations, including the powerful Knights of Labor (1869) and the American Federation of Labor (1886). Bibliography on this early phase is available in the footnotes to ch. 5, "Applying Christianity to the Labor Question," in Charles Howard Hopkins, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism*, comprising books and articles.

a. Attitude of Labor Toward the Churches. Especially after about 1880, the labor, religious, and general secular periodicals published many articles on the growing alienation of labor from the churches, and the reasons for it, and serious books on the subject began to appear. The following selected titles reveal the growing seriousness of the situation and the stirrings of conscience among both church and labor leaders. Fred Woodrow, "The Pulpit and the Poor," in *The Labor Problem* (New York, 1886), expresses the attitude of a proletarian preacher, who called the pulpit a relic rather than a power, and suggested that the poor were unwelcome in churches, while declaring "pure" Christianity to be the remedy for social ills. W. H. Benson, "A Hint to Preachers," in *Workmen's Advocate* (New Haven, Feb. 26, 1887) suggests consideration of technological unemployment, and declares that ministers should be concerned with the earthly happiness of mankind, investigate socialism, and help the poor in their fight against economic injustice. J. Willet, "Letter from a Workingman," in *The Christian Union*, Vol. 32, no. 18 (Oct.

19, 1885), pp. 7–8, voices a belief in Jesus and his teachings, but not in the teachings of pretended Christians, who fail to protest against obvious economic injustice.

Amory H. Bradford, "Why the Artisan Classes Neglect the Church," in *The Christian Union,* Vol. 32, no. 1 (July 2, 1885), pp. 7–8, and no. 2 (July 9), pp. 7–8, describes the results of inquiry among labor groups, revealing a generally decreasing attendance, because of unbelief in Christianity as practiced by the churches. Washington Gladden, *Applied Christianity* (Boston and New York, 1886) stresses inability to dress well enough, and the feeling of injustice at the hands of employers, who are said to control the churches. H. Francis Perry, "The Workingman's Alienation from the Church," in *American Journal of Sociology,* Vol. 4, no. 5 (Mar. 1899), pp. 622–629, gives statements by labor leaders, unfavorable to the churches with respect to their treatment of labor. The church is subsidized by the rich, the ministry does not discuss living issues, and is not well enough informed on economic and social questions. The workingman is not welcomed, and the church is not aggressive in helping him to secure his rights.

Robert Francis Coyle, *Workingmen and the Church* (Chicago, Ill. and Winona Lake, Ind., 1903) is a typical evangelical Protestant discussion of the alienation of "labor" from organized religion, and a consideration of the remedy through socializing of the Gospel. Clarence Bertrand Thompson, *The Churches and the Wage Earners, a Study of the Cause and Cure of Their Separation* (New York, 1909), with bibliography in the footnotes, and a list of the best literature on the subject, reviews the workingmen's complaints against the churches, and the church's attitude toward them, and the opportunity to counteract atheistic secular socialism by a truly Christian social preaching and practice. Craig S. Thoms, *The Working Man's Christ* (New York, 1914), with a bibliography on the rights of labor, surveys the reasons for not going to church, especially among workingmen, the historic attitude

of the church toward workingmen, and reasons why they should support the church: chiefly, Christ's interest in them and his ideal of social justice, and the social responsibility of creators, including labor. Jerome Davis, ed., *Business and the Church, A Symposium* (New York and London, 1926) is the record of a discussion between business men and labor leaders, on their conception of God's will for them and the church, with the idea that business is as sacred a calling as religion, and that the Christian task is to make the Christian way practical in the world. The keynote was: let the laymen speak for themselves, not merely hear what the minister thinks they should do. Jerome Davis, ed., *Labor Speaks for Itself on Religion; a Symposium of Labor Leaders Throughout the World* (New York, 1929) includes some very frank pronouncements by American union leaders on the misunderstandings, and the possibility of cooperation in securing greater social justice.

b. The Protestant Churches. Growing Awareness. When the great strikes stirred the conscience of the clergy, certain ministers became outstanding in their warnings to the churches. Washington Gladden, in his *Applied Christianity* (Boston and New York, 1886) reveals his painful impression of the relations between employers and labor—a virtual state of war—in which the workers organized to secure a larger and more just share of the profits of industry. Newman Smyth, the liberal pastor of the Center (Congregational) Church in New Haven, Conn., in his *Social Problems: Sermons to Workingmen* (Boston, 1885) analyzes labor's complaints, showing his awareness of genuine grievances. These ministers voiced thoughts that had stirred in the minds of Christian leaders for thirty years or more.

One of the earliest expressions of them is in John William Mears, *The Bible in the Workshop; or, Christianity the Friend of Labor* (New York, 1857), written by a clergyman, on the increasing concern of Protestant ministers about the drift of labor away from the churches. H. W. Cadman, *The*

Christian Unity of Capital and Labor (Philadelphia, American Sunday-School Union; New York, 1888), with bibliographical references in footnotes, criticizes factory-system evils and the error of treating labor as a commodity, and discusses the ethics of ownership and cooperation, while condemning secular solutions like socialism and anarchism, and reviewing the bearing of Christianity on industrial relations, the Bible as a guide to the philosophy of work, and the ideal of bringing industrialism under Christian control.

The first reaction of many Protestant church people to labor's unrest and criticism was hostility. The feeling was brought to a festering head by the fierce Pullman strike, which was one phase of the general discontent that had long been gathering, and was aggravated by the economic slump that began in 1893. This reaction is carefully explained in a documented essay: Z. Swift Holbrook, "The American Republic and the Debs Insurrection," in *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 52, no. 205 (Jan. 1895), pp. 135–152; and no. 206 (April 1895), pp. 209–231. The participation of Eugene V. Debs, Socialist leader and unionist, in the strike revealed to many church people that a labor movement and a labor problem existed, and enlisted most churches on the anti-labor side. The often hostile tone of church opinion appears also in Carl Warren Griffiths, "Attitudes of the Religious Press toward Organized Labor, 1877–1896" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1942; published in part as "Some Protestant Attitudes on the Labor Question in 1886," in *Church History*, Vol. 11 (June 1942), with bibliographical footnotes).

After the turn of the century the attitude began to change, largely because of the widely read pleadings of Christian economists and pastors, who wrote without official sanction. Henry Demarest Lloyd, *Man, the Social Creator* (New York, 1906) includes an essay, "The Religion of Labor," on the transformation of private wealth to commonwealth through religious reforming zeal and the establishment of a cooperative democracy. Other portions discuss the potency of love in

society, the religious character of social progress, and the operation of a new Christian conscience in society and industry. Luther Hess Waring, *The Law and the Gospel of Labor* (New York and Washington, 1907), by a pastor in an industrial community who witnessed many labor troubles, reviews the legal position of labor unions, then discusses the Christian view of labor, the law of love in industrial relations, and the relation of the civil law regarding labor to the Gospel of Christ.

Harry Frederick Ward, *The Gospel for a Working World* (New York, 1918) has a bibliography on industrial conditions, wages in the United States, occupational diseases, industrial relations, and social religion. He discusses non-Christian conditions and relations in the workaday world, envisages the plantation of the gospel in industrial life, and declares that it cannot be carried to men unjustly treated by leaders of organized religion. Other titles worth consulting are Charles Stelzle, *The Church and Labor* (Boston and New York, 1910), with suggested books; his *The Gospel of Labor* (New York and Chicago, c.1912); and Parley Paul Womer, *The Church and the Labor Conflict* (New York, 1913), with a bibliography. John Moran Cochran Wilson's *The Labour Movement and the Church* (Boston, 1922) is a collection of papers on the Incarnation and human brotherhood, the Atonement and the union spirit, the Church and the rebuilding of society, religion and the workingman. James Addison Kirtley, *The Attitude of the Church Toward Labor's Industrial Problems* (Nashville, Tenn., 1934) is an abstract of a thesis, 1932. Alva W. Taylor, *Christianity and Industry in America* (New York, 1933), with a selected topical bibliography, sees the great evil of the age as the failure of ethics to keep pace with technical progress and social complexity. He hopefully suggests Christian teachings as ample to guide social and industrial relationships, in which they have hardly been tried. Justice comes before charity in the Gospel, and the Kingdom of God is at least as important as individual salvation.

Over the years since the 1880's the consciousness of religion's responsibility to labor has found expression in many publications issued under the auspices of official Protestant church agencies. Some of the most remarkable and effective ones proceeded from the socially influential Presbyterian Church, U.S.A. Robert Ellis Thompson, *The Duty of the Church in the Conflict Between Capital and Labor* (Philadelphia, Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1887) is a tract on the duty of the Church not to be a divider over men, but rather to infuse the Christian spirit and the sense of the sacredness of vocation and of work into economic life to counteract covetousness. George William Coleman, *The Churches Outside the Church* (Philadelphia, c.1910), a pamphlet published for the Social Service Commission of the Northern Baptist Convention, is devoted to a consideration of the unions and other labor organizations as the nonreligious workingmen's churches.

Charles Stelzle, *Not "Missions," but Churches for Working-Men* (New York, n.d.), a leaflet published by the Board of Home Missions of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A., reflects the opposition of the workingmen themselves to "lady bountiful" missionary propaganda. Stelzle's *The Workingman and Social Problems* (Chicago and New York, 1903) was written from the standpoint of the laborer to help in promoting mutual understanding between "masses" and "classes," by the pastor of a workingman's congregation. Three chapters treat the relation of labor to the church, preaching, and evangelism, but oppose purely "labor" churches, as did 300 labor leaders who were questioned. His *Messages to Workingmen* (New York and Chicago, c.1906) were written in cooperation with editors of the labor press, who originally published the essays. They show an intelligent appreciation and sympathy for all grades of working people, derived from personal talks and from discussions in labor halls. This is a very forthright attempt to break down religious class barriers and to promote understanding. John McDowell and Cleland

B. McAfee, *The Fellowship of Toil, Messages on Industrial Relationships* (New York and Chicago, 1930) summarizes ten years of teaching by a Presbyterian minister in Labor Day messages, based on the conviction that genuine Christian discipleship may be realized through industry, provided that the church and the ministry will produce the Christian leadership.

William Monroe Balch, sometime secretary of the Methodist Federation for Social Service, in his *Christianity and the Labor Movement* (Boston, 1912), with bibliography in footnotes, comments on the estrangement between the church and wage-earners and the cheap valuation of human life as contrary to the Gospel. His appeal is for an effort of "capital" and "labor" to know each other, and especially to the ministry and the churches to adopt and implement a Christian social creed. G. Bromley Oxnam, *Labor and Tomorrow's World* (New York and Nashville, 1945), lectures by a Methodist bishop, concerns the extension of democracy to the economic order, the Church's duty to defend the concept of the infinite worth and the rights of personality, the failure of many churchmen to see in the labor movement the coming of a new social order, Christianity's duty to workers, and their opinion of the church. A well-considered Lutheran treatise on church and industrial relations is John Daniel, *Labor, Industry, and the Church; a Study of the Interrelationships Involving the Church, Labor, and Management* (St. Louis, 1957), illustrated and with a bibliography. Protestant Episcopal Church in the U.S.A., Diocese of Albany, *Men at Work in God's World, Papers Delivered at the Church and Work Congress held in Albany, New York, October 19–20, 1955*, ed. Canon G. E. DeMille (New York, London, and Toronto, 1956) is the report of a panel representing various callings and faiths, devoted mainly to discussion of an adequate "theology of work," a concept of Christian vocation in work, and control of economic life by the law of love.

With the establishment of interdenominational cooperative

organization, Protestant churches began to formulate something like an official policy and strategy regarding the labor question. One of the earliest evidences of the new trend is a publication by the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America: *The Church and Modern Industry* (New York, c.1908), an epoch-making pamphlet, including a report and an appended statement of a social creed, with recommendations unanimously approved and adopted by the Council, December, 1908. The Council's Commission on the Church and Social Service issued *Continuous Toil and Continuous Toilers or One Day in Seven for Industrial Workers?* (New York, c.1916), typical of the many pamphlets issued by the Commission, expressing the views on industry and labor of the socially-conscious Protestant churches, after the adoption of the social creed in 1908.

Early efforts to mediate in industrial conflicts reached a culmination in the Interchurch World Movement, Commission of Inquiry, *Report on the Steel Strike of 1919 . . . with the Technical Assistance of the Bureau of Industrial Research, New York* (New York, 1920). The new interest is displayed in the immense amount of detailed investigation devoted to the Commission's report, *Public Opinion and the Steel Strike, Supplementary Reports of the Investigators . . . with the Technical Assistance of the Bureau of Industrial Research, New York* (New York, 1921). This thorough report of views, respecting one of the most bitterly fought strikes in American history, illustrates how the churches essayed the role of mediator, and were bitterly criticized for "interfering." Marshall Olds, *Analysis of the Interchurch World Movement Report on the Steel Strike . . . Part Two, History of the Interchurch Report on the Steel Strike,* with the assistance of numerous officials and associates of the Interchurch World Movement (New York, 1922) is a detailed criticism of the report, declaring it to have been inspired by social and political radicalism, and to be inaccurate and biased in factual material.

The conversion of official Protestant opinion to continuing interest in industrial problems is evident in efforts to educate both the clergy and the laity. The emergence of informed opinions appears strikingly in a useful collection of papers published by the American Academy of Political and Social Science: "Industrial Relations and the Church," in its *Annals*, Vol. 103 (1922). Clarence Dan Blachly, in *The Treatment of the Problem of Capital and Labor in Social Study Courses in the Churches* (Chicago, 1920) explores the content, by analyzing several hundred pamphlets and reports, and replies to questionnaires and letters of inquiry. As a method of approach, he prefers incorporation of modern scientific and sociological facts into primarily religious teaching.

The result of the prolonged educational movement is evidenced by the maturity of viewpoint that had been attained by the depression period of the 1930's. An evidence of this is a general review of Protestant attitude and policy in Edmund Bigelow Chaffee, *The Protestant Churches and the Industrial Crisis*, with a Foreword by Henry Sloane Coffin (New York, 1933). The director of the Labor Temple in New York City explores the relation of religion to economics, with special reference to problems confronting labor, such as the profit motive, the part of machinery in the crisis of the 1930's, unemployment, and the responsibility of the churches and of individual Christians in the economic crisis. The outlook is optimistic, with a definite plan of procedure. Walter G. Muelder, "The Church and the Labor Movement," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 16, no. 4 (Autumn, 1947), pp. 483–493, reviews recent relations, and the responses of various church groups to the claims of labor, showing a maturity of outlook in general, far removed from the open hostility of many church people in the late nineteenth century. Institute for Religious and Social Studies, Jewish Theological Seminary of America, *Labor's Relation to Church and Community, a Series of Addresses*, ed. Liston Pope (New York, 1947) presents a representative liberal Protestant view of the relation of the

church to organized labor. Especially informative are: Kermit Eby, "Labor's Challenge to the Church"; Bernard C. Clausen, "Religion's Contribution to Labor Leadership"; and John Ramsey, "The Reconciliation of Religion and Labor."

c. Roman Catholic Church. The Roman Catholic Church experienced the same head-on collision with the rising labor unrest as did the Protestant churches. It also passed through the same phases of doubt and even official hostility toward the organized labor movement, and finally of effort to understand it and to develop a policy toward it. But while the Protestant churches were compelled to work out their policies and strategies individually, and often without any tradition to guide them, the Roman Catholic Church already had a guide in Thomistic theology, which issued in the papal encyclicals in the later decades of the nineteenth century. The first serious trouble came with the rise of the Knights of Labor after 1869, which is discussed in Henry Joseph Browne, "Terence V. Powderly, His Relation with the Catholic Church, 1879–1888" (Master's thesis, Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C., 1945, typewritten, with a bibliography, copies in Catholic University Library and Library of Congress). The gist of the work is contained in the author's "Terence V. Powderly and Church-Labor Difficulties of the Early 1880's," in *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 32, no. 1 (April 1946), pp. 1–27. Powderly, head of the Knights of Labor and a Roman Catholic, brought to a crisis the relations between his Church and the growing labor movement, and raised the question whether or not the Church ought to favor or condemn it. The ultimate result was that the Church did not condemn it. Browne's *The Catholic Church and the Knights of Labor* (Washington, D.C., 1949, Catholic University Studies in American Church History, Vol. 38) has a classified essay on sources, including documents, unpublished essays, and periodical articles. This very detailed study reviews the Church's trouble with the Knights and with Henry George, which marked the beginning of a greater concern

about social and labor questions. But the origin of a great immediate Social Gospel movement came long after the encyclical *Rerum Novarum*, 1891. The conflict between the Church and Henry George's single-tax movement, which appealed to Catholic labor, is vividly illuminated by George's reply to the encyclical on labor issued by the Church: *The Condition of Labor: an Open Letter to Pope Leo XIII* (New York, 1891).

The basic doctrine of the Church, which has been the inspiration of its social action regarding labor questions in America, is expressed in Pope Leo XIII, *Two Basic Encyclicals: "On the Condition of Workers," Leo XIII, and Forty Years After "On Reconstructing the Social Order," Pius XI* (Washington, Catholic University of America, 1943). (See sect. VI, D, 3, *Roman Catholic Social Action*, above.) John David Munier, *Some American Approximations to Pius XI's Industries and Professions* (Washington, 1943) attempts to find American applications of the encyclical of Pius XI on labor. The principles of thought and action are thoroughly reviewed by Joseph Husslein, lecturer in the Fordham University School of Sociology, in *The World Problem, Capital, Labor, and the Church* (New York, 1918). This survey of all phases is also an exposition of Catholic principles, criticizing both socialism and rationalistic capitalism, in the light of the papal encyclicals, with special attention to the Church's relations with labor organizations, and to Christian democracy and cooperative industrial organization. The Church's policy regarding child labor legislation appears in great detail in Vincent Augustine McQuade, *The American Catholic Attitude on Child Labor Since 1891* . . . (Washington, D.C., 1938), with bibliography.

John A. Ryan and Joseph Husslein, *The Church and Labor* (New York, 1920), with bibliography and primarily documentary, concisely and authoritatively summarizes the Roman Catholic view on the rights of property and labor, as expressed both in papal encyclicals and in other statements by

ecclesiastical authorities, with extensive quotations of pronouncements by the American heirarchy. It contains all important pronouncements since the beginning of the industrial revolution. Practical policy in labor relations is explained in Aaron I. Abell, "American Catholic Reaction to Industrial Conflict: The Arbitral Process," in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 41, no. 4 (Jan. 1956), pp. 385–407. A valuable insight into general Roman Catholic opinion on labor questions is the Catholic Digest's *A Look at Labor* (St. Paul, c.1946), a compilation of articles, with sources.

5. THE CITY CHURCH. *Early City Missions.* Even before the Civil War, a few clergymen were becoming concerned—even somewhat alarmed—about the lack of religious life and growing religious indifference in great industrial cities. Typical representatives of the group were Henry M. Dexter, a Congregationalist and a noted historian, and William A. Muhlenberg, an Episcopal rector in New York City. Their thoughts are expressed in Dexter's *The Moral Influence of Manufacturing Towns* (Andover, 1848) and in Anne Ayres, *Life and Work of W. A. Muhlenberg* (New York, 1880). From such concern came, eventually, the "institutional" church, the religious social settlement, and the city mission church. The cause of city missions was pleaded in many books, and especially in essays in church periodicals. "City Missions" in *The Church Review*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (Oct. 1855), pp. 392–405, is an early and characteristic evidence of the awakening interest in ministry to the urban poor, who were generally excluded from the churches by pew rent. The article reflects the views of Muhlenberg, who established the "free" Church of the Holy Communion in New York City.

The zeal so aroused persisted into the post-Civil War period, and inspired a huge literature of propaganda for urban religious social service. A characteristic example of the writing is Thomas Guthrie, *The City, Its Sins and Its Sorrows* (New York, 1873), which "awakened compassion for the poor

in both England and America." (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform,* p. 247.) Samuel B. Halliday, *Winning Souls* (New York, 1873) contains the reminiscences of a Congregational evangelist and city missionary.

The work in New York City, like Tuckerman's earlier labors in Boston, set a pattern that generally has lasted to the present day. Its general outlines are sketched in various reports of the period from 1835 to 1870. "The Five Points House of Industry" in *American Church Monthly,* Vol. 3 (1858), pp. 209–222, 289–297, 350–360, is another typical record of early religious efforts in urban social service. New York City Tract Society, *Annual Report . . . with the . . . Annual Report of the Female Branch* (New York, 1838–1863) abounds in references to many early religious efforts in social service. New York City Mission and Tract Society's *Walks About New York, Facts and Figures Gathered from Various Sources* (New York, 1865) provides an excellent review of the work of early city missions. Henry Cammann and H. N. Camp, *The Charities of New York, Brooklyn and Staten Island* (New York, 1868) is "an invaluable catalogue, which includes historical statements, statistics, and lists of officers," and has reference to religiously inspired charities. (See Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform,* p. 247.)

The city mission is still a vital part of the work of urban Protestantism. A general survey of its methods and influence is Kenneth Dexter Miller, *Man and God in the City* (New York, 1954). Another brief but excellent review is Lucy M. Eldredge, ed., *When Your Home is in the City* (New York, c. 1954). A discussion of the problems confronting city missions is in the Methodist Church, Board of Missions, Joint Section of Education and Cultivation, *Crowded Ways; a Symposium* (New York, 1954) by Murray H. Leiffer [and others]. Two very useful studies have been issued under Baptist auspices: Solomon F. Dowis, *O Jerusalem! Our Cities for Christ* (Atlanta, 1951), issued by the Home Mission

Board of the Southern Baptist Convention, with a bibliography; Lincoln Burdette Wadsworth, *Mission to City Multitudes; American Baptists at Work* (Philadelphia, 1954).

a. The Modern City's Challenge to Protestantism. The post-Civil War problems of the urban Protestant parish are most thoroughly studied in Aaron Ignatius Abell, *The Urban Impact on American Protestantism, 1865–1900* (Cambridge, Mass., and London, 1943), with bibliographical essays and footnotes. This reviews the general religious and social effects, when the wage-earners began to expect religion to establish an economic and social order with greater justice for them, and cities began to turn to the churches for social service. Through research chiefly in newspapers, periodicals, and reports of religious organizations, Abell considers the origins and development of church efforts to adjust to urbanism and their relations to environment. The factors that made the task so difficult, and often discouraging, are explained by William H. Leach, "The Weakness of Protestantism in American Cities," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 2, no. 6 (Nov. 1922), pp. 616–623. The weakness is not intellectual, but a failure to take seriously Jesus' injunction to preach the gospel to all. Protestantism is not taking seriously the task of redeeming the city, but is preaching only to those intellectual enough to "understand." The obstacles are parochialism and denominationalism.

Such conditions, earlier in the century, challenged Protestant leaders to examine the problems and devise ways to meet them. The three following books fairly represent their efforts to arouse interest and guide action. Josiah Strong, in *The Challenge of the City* (New York, 1907) attempts to guide those inspired by the urban Social Gospel movement and wishing to take part in city missions and Christian social service, drawing upon his own experience as president of the American Institute of Social Service. He discusses the problem of churches crowded out by business, and finds the remedy in federation. Charles Hatch Sears, *The Redemption*

of the City, Introduction by Edward Judson (Philadelphia and Boston, 1911), with notes, references, and bibliography, presents social problems facing urban parishes, and challenges them to recognize and strive to meet actual needs, such as the peculiarly difficult situation of the foreign-born and their longing for religious ministry. Arcadius McSwain Trawick, *The City Church and its Social Mission; a Series of Studies in the Social Extension of the City Church* (New York, 1913), with bibliography, is a handbook for church social workers. It considers the relation of the city church to family life, public child care, the charity and labor problems, and vice, and illustrates the full penetration of the Social Gospel movement. The result of the "Social Mission" often was the "institutional" church, whose work is outlined in a volume that became a standard guide: Edward Judson, *The Institutional Church; a Primer in Pastoral Theology,* with an introductory word by Bishop [Henry Codman] Potter (New York, c.1899). Bishop Potter was one of the early leaders of the Social Gospel in New York City and in the Episcopal Church. (See also Part Two, sect. VI, H, *The City Church and its Problems;* sect. VIII, A, 5, *Missions to Immigrants and Other Special Groups.*)

b. Planning. The rise of the institutional social-service church inspired and was in turn aided by a large literature on planning the organization and program of the urban church. One of the earliest and best authorities is Frederick DeLand Leete, *The Church in the City* (New York and Cincinnati, 1915), with a bibliography. Issued under Baptist auspices is Charles Hatch Sears, ed., *Church City Planning* (Philadelphia and Boston, c.1928), first issued in 1926 as *Baptist City Planning.* Among the distinguished authorities on the subject is Ross Warren Sanderson, two of whose books are practically indispensable: *The Strategy of City Church Planning* (New York, c.1932) under the auspices of the Institute of Social and Religious Research; and his *The Church Serves the Changing City* (New York, 1955) for the Department

of the Urban Church, with the cooperation of the Committee on Field Research, National Council of Churches.

The entire subject of planning for urban life is discussed in a symposium issued by the Interdenominational Conference on the City Church, Asbury Park, N.J., 1937: *The City Challenges the Church; Addresses* . . . (New York, 1937) under the auspices of the Committee on City and New Americans of the Home Missions Council, and the Council of Women for Home Missions.

There are many superior recent studies, and one of the most thorough is Frederick Alexander Shippey's *Church Work in the City* (New York, 1952). *City Story* (motion picture), Broadcasting and Film Commission of the National Council of Churches, made by Paul F. Heard, Inc., "depicts the problems of a downtown church located in what was once a residential area and is now a district inhabited by people of diverse economic and cultural backgrounds. Dramatized incidents show how one church learned to meet the needs of the changing community." The screen play is by Margaret Fitts. *The World Within* (motion picture), made by Alan Shilin Productions for the National Council of the Protestant Episcopal Church, 1955, "shows what happens to city churches in the trend toward mass movement to the suburbs, traces the life of a young boy who is helped by the church."

Other excellent studies on the planning of urban church programs are: Murray Howard Leiffer, *The Effective City Church* (Nashville, 1955, rev. ed.); and Walter Kloetzli and Arthur Hillman, *Urban Church Planning; the Church Discovers Its Community* (Philadelphia, 1958), with a bibliography, issued under Lutheran auspices. The part of the ministry in city church work is reviewed in a report issued by the Austin, Tex., Summer School on the Church and the Urban Ministry, under the auspices of the Research Center in Christian Theology and Culture, Episcopal Theological Seminary of the Southwest: *The Church and the Urban Ministry* (Austin, 1958).

c. Surveys. The best way to discover, assess, and meet the problems of urban churches was the "church survey," conducted in some representative city by a denomination or by interdenominational cooperation. In this field pioneer work was accomplished by Harlan Paul Douglass, in his *The St. Louis Church Survey, A Religious Investigation with a Social Background* (New York, 1924), which was carefully done and courageously expressed. Similar is his *The Springfield [Mass.] Church Survey, A Study of Organized Religion with Its Social Background* (New York, 1926), including religious organizations, education, recreation, and the interrelationships of the churches and social movements. His *The Church in the Changing City, Case Studies Illustrating Adaptation* (New York, 1927) shows how sixteen big city churches tried to keep abreast of surrounding changes and continue their usefulness in new or altered forms; and notices the breadth of the programs and equipment needed. His *1000 City Churches; Phases of Adaptation to Environment* (New York, c.1926), compiled for the Institute of Social and Religious Research, reviews church work in all cities of 100,000 population or more. Douglass offers practical suggestions for surveying the needs and character of the urban congregation in his *How to Study the City Church* (Garden City, N.Y., c.1928), with bibliography and references for each chapter.

Other excellent surveys are two by Murray Howard Leiffer: *City and Church in Transition; a Study of the Medium-sized City and Its Organized Religious Life* (Chicago and New York, 1938), with maps; and *Manual for the Study of the City Church* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1939), with maps and diagrams and "Books for further reading." The character of a supposedly typical city church is studied by Thomas Randolph Kilian and Arnold E. Boyum, in *A Sample of Religious Understanding and Beliefs of an Urban Church Congregation* (Sioux Falls? S.D., c.1952). One of the best recent studies is one issued by the Methodist Church: *The Church in Urban Life, a Fact Book* (New York, 1954)

for the Convocation on Urban Life in America, by the Department of City Work and the Department of Research and Surveys, Division of National Missions of the Board of Missions. Samuel Clarence Kincheloe, *The American City and Its Church* (New York, 1938), with a reading list, is based mainly on conditions in Chicago as representative of most great cities, and considers many urban problems as they affect the church in a dynamic and democratic society. Special topics include problems of city folk, unemployment, relief, personal demoralization, poverty, and the family.

The way out of the impasse, in many instances, has been found in interchurch and interdenominational cooperation. One of the best discussions of this phase is found in Wilbur Chapman Hallenback, *Urban Organization of Protestantism* (New York, 1934), published by the Institute of Social and Religious Research. This investigates city church extension agencies, exposes past errors, and provides enlightenment for much-needed new metropolitan advance, with remarks on the weakness and frequent absurdity of approach by a single denomination. The future Protestant strategy lies in united effort. Harlan Paul Douglass, *Church Comity; a Study of Cooperative Church Extension in American Cities* (Garden City, N.Y., 1929), with diagrams, was issued by the Institute of Social and Religious Research, which published also his *Protestant Cooperation in American Cities* (New York, 1930), based upon studies extending over nearly a decade, and contacts with church federations and councils. It is confined mostly to large cities, but has illustrations from other communities and mentions temporary cooperation in specific projects. The presentation and analysis in case studies is accompanied by valuable generalizations.

The recent situation of the city Protestant church, complicated by flight to the suburbs, has awakened renewed interest in long-term policy. The meaning and effects of the shift of population are exhaustively surveyed in William Egli May's "A Study of the Factors Influencing the Geo-

graphical Movement of Churches in a Metropolitan Area" (Thesis, University of Pittsburgh, with bibliography; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1956), pub. no. 18,246; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 16 (1946), no. 12, p. 2548). Wilbur C. Hallenbach, "The Organization of Religion," in *American Urban Communities* (New York, 1951) mentions the gradual dispersal of urban Protestant congregations over wide areas as a cause of parochial disintegration, reaching about the same conclusion as Samuel Kincheloe's *The American City and Its Church* (New York, 1938). One should consult also Frederick A. Shippey, "The Changing Fortunes of Urban Protestantism," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 18, no. 4 (Autumn, 1949), pp. 523–532; Russell Henry Stafford, Howard Conn, and William J. Villaume, "Church And City, The Challenge of the Modern Urban Congregation," in *ibid.*, Vol. 24, no. 4 (Autumn, 1955), pp. 483–515; and Frederick A. Shippey, *Church Work in the City* (New York, 1952). Winthrop S. Hudson, *The Great Tradition of the American Churches* (New York, 1953) explains the policies of churches trying to meet the problems of a growing urbanism, absorbing the neighboring regions. Another good treatment of the subject is Ross Warren Sanderson, *The Church Serves the Changing City* (New York, 1955), written for the Department of the Urban Church with the cooperation of the Committee on Field Research of the National Council of Churches.

Recent efforts of a representative Anglo-American denomination to deal with the city-church problem are ably surveyed in a report by the Convocation on Urban Life in America, Columbus, O., 1954: *Methodism Looks at the City; Addresses, Section Reports, and Supplemental Data*, edited by Robert A. McKibben (New York, 1954), with bibliographies.

d. Roman Catholic Church. The Roman Catholic Church, which is overwhelmingly urban in composition, has made determined efforts to study the problem of urban religious decline, and to devise means of saving the urban parish from

extinction or, at best, the quiet despair of slow death. The scientific sociological approach is illustrated admirably by C. J. Nuesse and Thomas J. Harte, eds., *The Sociology of the Parish* (Milwaukee, 1951), a symposium by a group of Roman Catholic sociologists.

The necessity of adaptation to city conditions is clarified in two studies by Joseph H. Fichter. His "Dynamics of a City Church," in Vol. 1 of *Southern Parish* (Chicago, 1951) intensively studies a parish in New Orleans, with notes on the people and their spiritual life, recruitment, use of the confessional, marriage, vocations to the religious life, ministry to the sick, pious observances, and Catholic revivalism. The conclusions indicate much laxity, and the necessity of a new approach to city parishioners. His *Social Relations in the Urban Parish* (Chicago, 1954) declares that the internal conception of the parish must be adapted to apostolic missionary action, with concerted effort among parochial priests, and a total vision of the city apostolate. This requires better comprehension of urban structures, an effort to have a living and significant liturgy, and less comfortable clerical life.

Harold Fosselman, *Transitions in the Development of a Downtown Parish* (Washington, D.C., 1952) emphasizes encourging conclusions from a census of old St. Patrick's parish in Washington, D.C., with 76 per cent regular attendance at Mass in spite of the fluctuating population. It is available in the Catholic University of America *Studies in Sociology, Abstract Series,* Vol. 6. Sister Martina Abbott, *A City Parish Grows and Changes* (Washington, 1953), with a bibliography, is a study of "the effects of ecological change, population mobility, and ethnic succession on an urban territorial parish," in Pittsburgh, Pa. National Conference of Catholic Charities, ed., *The Church and Neighborhood Conservation* (Washington, D.C., 1955) relates the experience of a group of Chicago pastors in developing a

positive social program, aimed to prevent headlong flight from from the city and parochial disintegration.

6. THE RURAL CHURCH PROBLEM. Along with concern about problems of the city church, the Social Gospel movement inspired an intensive rethinking of the ministry of the country parish. With the growth of industrialism, and the drift of population to the cities, denominational religious life in the countryside tended to run to seed. Seminary courses on the problem, and the interest of rural sociologists, stimulated interest in collecting the extensive literature on rural religion and its problems. The result has been the compilation of many bibliographies. Even the older ones are still valuable for tracing the course of concern and the development of policy. One of the better early lists is Henry Kalloch Rowe's *Selected Bibliography on the Country Church Problem* (Newton Center, Mass., Newton Theological Institution, 1909), a classified list with very brief notes, reissued in revised form in 1913, 1917, and 1922. Another list, eventually containing several hundred references, was issued by Rochester Theological Seminary, Rochester, N.Y., Library: *A List of Books in the Library of the Rochester Theological Seminary Concerning the Rural Church and Community* (Rochester, 1912), without notes. Editions were issued in 1913 and 1914 with brief notes, and in 1917 without notes. A collection of about fifty titles was compiled by the Library of Congress as *List of References on the Country Church in the Life of the Community, including the Church Library* (Washington, 1919).

The modern period is well covered by three very useful lists: (1) Benson Y. Landis, comp., *A Guide to the Literature of Rural Life* (New York, 1939, 4th, rev. ed.) was issued by the Department of Research and Education of the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America. (2) Hilda Libby Ives, "The Country Parish, Bibliography," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 32, no. 3 (Apr.

1940), pp. 10–16, is by a former president of the New England Town and Country Church Commission, and Lecturer in Rural Church, Andover-Newton Theological School. It stresses the larger parish, interdenominational cooperation, and surveys of the problem; and contains periodicals and pamphlets, and bibliographies. (3) Kenneth C. MacArthur, comp., "The Rural Church and Related Subjects," in *ibid.*, Vol. 42, no. 1 (Oct. 1949), pp. 6–9, briefly annotated, includes general works on rural sociology, the rural church, and periodicals and pamphlets.

By the period of World War I, the decline of rural church life, due largely to cityward migration and overchurching, had become sufficiently serious to inspire studies aimed to expose the true conditions and to stimulate a more adequate strategy of rural evangelism. One of the best from an historical viewpoint is Roy Edwin Bowers, "The Historic Rural Church," in *Ohio State Archaeological and Historical Quarterly*, Vol. 51 (1942), pp. 89–100, a study of old churches in the Western Reserve. An excellent early sociological survey is Garland Armor Bricker's *The Church in Rural America* (Cincinnati, 1919). How serious the problem had become at this date is strikingly shown in a study by Charles Otis Gill and Gifford Pinchot, *Six Thousand Country Churches* (New York, 1920), a careful survey of the character, religious life, and problems of Ohio churches, revealing a great number of poorly attended ones with non-resident or inadequately educated pastors. This picture of "denominationalism gone to seed" inspired the compilers to recommend community churches.

More intensive studies on a local basis generally confirmed these conclusions: Marjorie Patten, *The Country Church in Colonial Counties as Illustrated by Addison County, Vt., Tompkins County, N.Y., and Warren County, N.Y.* (New York, 1922); and Hermann Nelson Morse and Edmund de S. Brunner, *The Town and Country Church in the United States as Illustrated by Data from One Hundred and*

Seventy-nine Counties and by Intensive Studies of Twenty-five (New York, c.1923), with map. Charles Luther Fry, *Diagnosing the Rural Church, A Study in Method* (New York, 1924), published by the Institute of Social and Religious Research, applies scientific methods to analysis of churches of thirty-two counties in twenty-six states. It considers varied factors influencing church life and compares the present with past conditions, but does not study the ministers or their messages, or the church's function in changing environment and providing inspiration.

Probably the most scientific and statistical study is Elizabeth Robbins Hooker's *Hinterlands of the Church* (New York, 1931), with bibliographical footnotes, tables, diagrams, and maps. The study, begun in 1928, investigated six types of territory where rural churches were comparatively ineffective, the test being the proportion of members to population. The result showed a surprisingly low proportion in rural regions, and inspired suggestions for improvement. Two other most useful and informative studies of the period are Ralph Almon Felton's *Our Templed Hills, a Study of the Church and Rural Life* (New York, c.1926), with a bibliography; and Alexander John William Myers, and Edwin E. Sundt, *The Country Church as It Is; a Case Study of Rural Churches and Leaders* (New York and Chicago, c.1930), with a brief bibliography. A Baptist survey of the rural church's difficulties is in John William Jent, *Rural Church Problems* (Shawnee, Okla., 1935), issued by the Baptist University Press. Other useful studies are: Edwin Hunter, *The Small Town and Country Church* (Nashville, 1947); Rockwell Carter Smith, *The Church in Our Town, a Study of the Relationship between the Church and the Rural Community* (New York, 1955, rev. and enl. ed.), illustrated; and his *People, Land and Churches* (New York, 1959). A particular facet of the problem is exposed by Hermann Nelson Morse in *The Country Church in Industrial Zones; the Effects of Industrialism upon the Church Life of Ad-*

jacent Rural Areas as Illustrated by Two Typical Counties (New York, 1922), illustrated. Much of the material obtained by these surveys is summed up in an objective, scholarly work by John Harrison Kolb and Edmund deS. Brunner: *A Study of Rural Society, Its Organization and Changes* (Boston, 1935). This is not specifically oriented to religious interests, but has a good chapter on "Religion and the Rural Church," with a bibliography.

A special phase of rural religious needs is presented by Edmund deS. Brunner, in his *Immigrant Farmers and Their Children; with Four Studies of Immigrant Communities* (Garden City, N.Y., 1929), a painstaking study of a previously rather neglected subject, with reference to the place of churches in rural life. Another facet of the problem, especially acute during the economic depression of the 1930's, is exposed vividly by Harold E. Fey, in "The Religious Crisis in Rural America," in *American Scholar*, Vol. 4, no. 2 (Spring, 1935), pp. 181–189. He discusses the acute religious problem caused by farm tenancy and the resulting poverty and displacements.

New England, whose hill towns were among the places first affected by rural religious declension, began to discover the answer early in the twentieth century, through interchurch cooperation. The trend there is presented by two studies: George Frederick Wells, "An Answer to the New England Country Church Question," in *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 64, no. 254 (Apr. 1907), pp. 314–330; and Charles Garabad Chakerian, *A New England Town in Transition* (New Haven, 1931), published by the Interseminary Commission for Training for the Rural Ministry.

Other sectional studies of special value concern the rural South and West: Edmund DeS. Brunner, *Church Life in the Rural South; a Study of the Opportunity of Protestantism Based upon Data from Seventy Counties* (New York, c.1923), with a bibliography; and Committee on Town and Country, *The People, the Land, and the Church in the Rural*

West (Chicago, Farm Foundation, 1944?), the result of a series of conferences at various places in the Far West, in 1943, sponsored by the Land Tenure Committee of the Town and Country Committee of the Home Missions Council and the Federal Council of Churches, and the Farm Foundation.

a. Planning. By the 1930's the situation of the country church had become well known through the many preceding studies and surveys, and the churches had well-developed plans for dealing with the crisis in rural life. The general situation since 1930, as the basis for intelligent planning, is thoroughly reviewed by Edwin Einar Sundt's *The Country Church and Our Generation* (New York and Chicago, c.1932), with a bibliography. Other enlightening essays are those by Aaron Henry Raphing, *Building the Kingdom of God in the Countryside* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1938); Benson Young Landis, comp., *American Rural Life, a Christian Concern; a Discussion Guide for Rural and Urban Groups and Churches* (Philadelphia, 1942) for the Department of Social Education and Action, Board of Christian Education of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A., with "Reading and study sources"; and Mark Rich, *Rural Prospect* (New York, 1950).

Intelligent grasp of the rural church plight has inspired a flood of publications during the past fifty years on planning for the future. A few of these works are of outstanding merit and enable the student to trace the development of the general rural church revival. One of the earliest and most influential is Warren Hugh Wilson's *The Church of the Open Country; a Study of the Church for the Working Farmer* (New York, 1911), with a bibliography, published by the Missionary Education Movement of the United States and Canada. Especially valuable for its selected bibliography on the country church is Garland Armor Bricker's *Solving the Country Church Problem* (Cincinnati and New York, c.1913) in cooperation with fourteen collaborators, and with

illustrations, plans, and music. A definite suggestion of the church's program is found in Harlan Luther Feeman, *The Kingdom and the Farm* (New York and Chicago, 1914), a series of essays on cooperation between the church and the farming community. Planning for the future in the depression period appears in the report of the First National Conference on the Rural Church, Washington, D.C., 1936: *The Rural Church, Today & Tomorrow* (New York? 1936), with a bibliography, under the auspices of the Home Mission Council and the Council of Women for Home Missions.

A typical planning book is David Edgar Lindstrom, *Rural Life and the Church, A Revision of The Church in Rural Life* (Champaign, Ill., 1946), with "Readings" at the end of each chapter. James McLeod Carr's *Bright Future; a New Day for the Town and Country Church* (Richmond, 1956) was published for the Board of Church Extension of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S. (Southern) with illustrations. The participation of women in the rejuvenation of the country church is reviewed by Mary (Heald) Williamson in *The Countrywoman and Her Church* (New York and Nashville, c.1940), with "Suggestions and sources of study."

Definite problems of administration are discussed expertly in four books: John Davis Freeman, *Country Church; Its Problems and Their Solution* (Atlanta, Ga., 1943), issued by the Home Mission Board of the Southern Baptist Convention, with maps, plans, and forms; Ralph Almon Felton, *The Size of the Rural Parish* (Madison, N.J., c.1946), published by the Department of the Rural Church, Drew (Methodist) Theological Seminary; Rockwell Carter Smith, *Rural Church Administration* (Nashville, 1943); and Martin T. Judy, *The Larger Parish and Group Ministry* (New York, 1959).

Progress toward a solution of the problems, through cooperation and the larger parish movement, may be traced in a series of scholarly and interesting investigations: (1)

Edmund deS. Brunner, *The Larger Parish, a Movement or an Enthusiasm?* (New York, c.1934), with diagrams, published by the Institute for Social and Religious Research. (2) Mark Rich, *The Larger Parish, an Effective Organization for Rural Churches* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1939), illustrated, published by the New York State College of Agriculture of Cornell University, *Cornell Extension Bulletin* no. 408, May 1939; also (3) his *A Basic Philosophy for Promoting Cooperation among Rural Churches* (New York, 1941), published by the Christian Rural Fellowship, *Bulletin* no. 63. (4) Ralph Almon Felton, *Local Church Cooperation in Rural Communities* (New York, 1940), published by the Home Missions Council; and (5) his *The Art of Church Cooperation* (Madison, N.J., c.1948), published by the Department of the Rural Church, Drew Theological Seminary. (6) Ira W. Moomaw, *Deep Furrows; Goals, Methods and Results of those Who Work Toward a Brighter Tomorrow* (New York, 1957), published by Agricultural Missions, for the Rural Missions Cooperating Committee of the Division of Foreign Missions.

b. Action. Books on the country church in action are almost innumerable. The progress of the awakening during the last half century may be profitably studied in Edwin Lee Earp's *The Rural Church Movement* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1914), with a selected bibliography; and Mark Rich, *The Rural Church Movement* (Columbia, Mo., 1957).

The picture of the rural church in action, within the last thirty years, may be studied in the following selected volumes: Henry Woods McLaughlin, ed., *The Country Church and Public Affairs* (New York, 1930), consisting of opinions expressed in the open forum and discussions at the 1929 Institute of Public Affairs at the University of Virginia; Ralph Almon Felton, *What's Right with the Rural Church; an Application of Christian Principles to the New Rural Life* (Philadelphia, 1930), with "Helpful Books" at the end of each chapter; Kenyon Leech Butterfield, *The Christian*

Enterprise among Rural People (Nashville, c.1933); Arthur Wentworth Hewitt, *God's Back Pasture, a Book of the Rural Parish* (Chicago and New York, 1941), with bibliographical references in notes; Carl Anderson Clark, *Rural Churches in Transition* (Nashville, 1959); and Wilfred Bockelman, *On Good Soil* (New York and Philadelphia, 1959).

Experiences in rural parish life, under the conditions of the new and hopeful outlook, are detailed by Ralph Almon Felton in *One Foot on the Land; Stories of Sixteen Successful Rural Churches* (Madison, N.J., 1947), published by the Department of the Rural Church, Drew Theological Seminary (Methodist); and by James Martin Bailey, *Windbreaks; Six Stories of the Rural Church in Action* (New York, 1959), illustrated. The story from the viewpoint of the ministry is interestingly presented in Arthur Wentworth Hewitt, *Highland Shepherds; a Book of the Rural Pastorate* (Chicago and New York, 1939) with "Notes"; and by Anna Laura (Munro) Gebhard's *Rural Parish! A Year from the Journal of Anna Laura Gebhard* (New York, 1947), with illustrations.

PART FOUR

RELIGION IN THE ARTS AND LITERATURE

RELIGION AND THE ARTS

While much has been written about religion and American life in general, there are few penetrating studies of the fine arts in American culture, and even fewer in the relation of religion to the fine arts in the course of American history. This section attempts to organize existing literature regarding the influence which religious ideas, church organizations, and worship have had upon the fine arts. It may suggest certain periods in which the fine arts have shown an unusual sensitivity to religious ideas and organizations, and the reasons for the influence, not only of religion on architecture (for example), but also of traditional architectural forms upon religion itself.

I. GENERAL REFERENCES

A list of reference works on the fine arts, many of which refer to the relation of religion to the arts, is found in Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951). Included are general bibliography, indexes, dictionaries and encyclopedias, history, biography of artists, symbolism, and various branches of art found in churches—painting, sculpture, architecture, and music. Samuel H. Miller, "Religion and the Arts, a Bibliography" in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 34, no. 1 (Oct. 1941), pp. 5–8, is briefly annotated, suggestive only, and does not include liturgy, music, and drama, but has works on definitions and interpretations, architecture, and symbolism and the sanctuary.

Percy Dearmer, ed., *The Necessity of Art* (London, 1924) consists of essays by Dearmer, A. Clutton Brock (an English follower of William Morris), and others, all critical of "both the bleak indifference of our puritan tradition and the decadent hedonism which was a reaction against it." Art cannot be understood except as part of life as a whole, and especially of religion. Art and religion are the two chief

factors in adjustment to life, and many artists are hampered by the prevalent ignorance of the historic relations between religion and art. A plea for a revival of the historic dialog is eloquently phrased by Von Ogden Vogt in *Art and Religion* (Boston, 1948, rev. ed.), with illustrations. He pleads for the unity of religion and art, and for recognition of the effective language of painting, architecture, decoration, music, and liturgy. Critical of the prevalent ugliness in religious art, he discusses technical questions, theory, aesthetics, and philosophy. His *Cult and Culture, a Study of Religion and American Culture* (New York, 1951), with bibliographical references in the notes, continues the theme that "religion is the creative, cohesive and comprehensive element which gives life to culture." Based upon examination of many facets of civilization, there are good chapters on religion in relation to art.

The serious modern alienation of the two is examined critically in Geddes MacGregor, *Aesthetic Experience in Religion* (London, 1947), with bibliography. He endeavors to provide "a clue to the solution of the problem of why religion should appear to be somehow hostile to the beauties of sense, and yet, to the extent that it in the least neglects them, irrelevant to life and therefore dead." He considers the development of modern aesthetics, the difficulties of a new approach, and the knowledge of God in relation to aesthetic experience, and has a significant chapter on the function of aesthetic experience in religion. More specifically, Fred Eastman, Arthur C. McGiffert, Jr., Carl S. Patton [and others] in *Finding God Through the Beautiful* (Chicago 1929) discuss the means of finding God through poetry, music, drama, sculpture, painting, architecture, nature, and character. A similar valuable authority is Albert Edward Bailey, ed., *The Arts and Religion* (New York, 1944), with bibliographies. There are four lectures: by Bailey on sculpture and painting, Kenneth John Conant on architecture, Henry Augustine Smith on music, and Fred

Eastman on drama. Their studies, based upon archaeology, present many varieties of religious belief and practice, and are aware of the recent forces modifying religious orientation. The lecture on music attempts to be "practically helpful in coordinating music and worship in Protestant churches."

The "Protestant suspicion" of art in religion is a major theme in Herbert Edward Read's *Art and Society* (New York, 1950?, 2nd ed.), with bibliographical footnotes. He devotes a chapter to "Art and Religion," and includes a general discussion of religion and civilization, types of civilized religion, the uses of art in various religions, and Christian art in northern Europe. The loss of aesthetic elements in northern countries, and Protestant suspicion of sensuous values, is the background of the attitude of many American Protestants. Agreement with this position has been classically expressed by the noted Gothic revivalist, Ralph Adams Cram. His *The Ministry of Art* (Boston and New York, 1914) has seven essays on art as an agency for the redemption of human character, and is based upon wide reading in history and philosophy, but has been criticized as somewhat rhapsodic and prejudiced. Cram's maturer thought on Catholicism as opposed to Protestantism, with respect to artistic expression in religion, appears in his *The Catholic Church and Art* (New York, 1930). He sees the only hope for the revival of true art in the Catholic Church. This is not a history of Christian architecture, but an interpretation of the development of architecture under Christian impulse and inspiration, and probably exaggerates the part of the Church in the development of art. Cram's gothic revivalism found a severe and often caustic critic in his contemporary, Frank Lloyd Wright. His *Autobiography* (New York, 1943) is a classic by America's outstanding contemporary architect, and discusses the relations between religion and the fine arts. The non-religious humanist attitude finds one of its best expressions in Walter Lippman, *A Preface to Morals* (New York, 1929). He wrote it for those who had lapsed from old faiths

and were perplexed, and attempted to find guidance through a higher form of humanism, inspired by disinterestedness, and demanding a new approach to art.

The great debate finds suggestions for an eventual solution, and much hope for a new friendliness between religion and art, in a notable symposium: George Kubler, ed., "Three Discussions of Contemporary Art and the Churches," in Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion: *Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 8, 1947 (New York, 1948). The participants mention the alienation of artists from the churches since the mid-nineteenth century, accepted as normal; the general divorce of religion from art; and the lowering of religious artistic standards. Iconoclasm proceeds from fear of distraction and of polytheism. Artistic expression among Puritans came through the sermon and the meeting-house. Churchmen now share the unaesthetic attitude of the majority—not hostile, but indifferent. There is no parallel in religion to secular interest in art, and the problem is to develop a common ground for the artist and the churchman. There is promise in a growing interest in the immense resources of the visual experience in religion, and in builders of churches consulting artists.

II. ARCHITECTURE

A. Guides and Bibliographies

PROBABLY the most extensive reference and source collection relating to American church architecture is comprised in the vast holdings of the Prints and Photographs Division of the Library of Congress. A basic introduction to the resources there is Paul Vanderbilt, comp., *Guide to the Special Collections of Prints & Photographs in the Library of Congress* (Washington, D.C., 1955), which lists collections containing churches. Various resources in the collections may be found also through the following indexes: (1) Stereograph files,

arranged by geographical location and subject. (2) "Periodical Literature," with references to illustrations of churches in magazines. (3) Early American architectural reference books. (4) Builders' manuals. (5) "Index to Illustrations" by states. (6) "Historical Reserve," lithographs and other prints. (7) The Frances Benjamin Johnston collection of photographs of American architecture, by states. (8) "Miscellaneous Lots" of photographs, under "Church" and "Religion," including references to church buildings and religious life. The "Pictorial Archives of Early American Architecture" contain photographic negatives and prints of structures of architectural interest in the seventeenth to nineteenth centuries. The collection is indexed. (For a description, see entry 583 in *Guide to the Special Collections of Prints & Photographs in the Library of Congress.*) Another indispensable guide is Historic American Buildings Survey, National Park Service, *Catalog of the Measured Drawings and Photographs of the Survey in the Library of Congress,* March 1, 1951 (Washington, D.C., 1951). The index refers to hundreds of churches, cathedrals, chapels, synagogues, missions, monasteries, cloisters, and meeting-houses, by states. The collection has an index, and the photographs are kept in binders, by states, with typewritten notes. There is also a collection of negatives. The Library of Congress and other large libraries have full sets of United States, Work Projects Administration *State Guides,* with notes on art and architecture in the various states, and innumerable references to historic churches and their architecture, together with many photographs.

Many articles on church architecture and historic or artistically meritorious churches may be found in the following periodicals: *American Architect and Architecture* (Boston, New York, etc., Vols. 1–152, Jan. 1, 1876–Feb. 1938), which merged into the *Architectural Record* (New York, July 1891–), with index to Vols. 1–20 in Vol. 21, and issued the *Great American Architects Series* (New York, nos. 1–8, May 1895–1902; the *Architectural Forum* (Boston,

1892– , Vols. 1–25, 1892–1916 issued as the *Brickbuilder*); American Institute of Architects, *Journal*, Vols. 1–16, 1913–Dec. 1928, which superseded the Institute's *Quarterly Bulletin*, Vols. 1–13, no. 3, 1900–Oct. 1912, and was superseded by *Octagon* (Washington, D.C., 1929–); *Inland Architect and News Record* (Western Association of Architects, Chicago, Vols. 1–52, Feb. 1883–Dec. 1908), Vols. 1–8, 1883–1887, as *Inland Architect and Builder;* merged into *American Architect and Architecture; Pencil Points* (New York; Stamford, Conn., June, 1920–); and the *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* (Louisville, Ky., Vol. 1, Jan. 1941–), with illustrations. Among the most useful bibliographies is R. F. Bach, "Early American Architecture and the Allied Arts," in *Architectural Record*, Vol. 59 (1926), pp. 265–273, 328–334, 483–488, 525–532; Vol. 60 (1926), pp. 65–70; Vol. 63 (1928), pp. 577–580; Vol. 64 (1928), pp. 70–72, 150–152, 190–192.

Individual bibliographies of high value include Frank John Roos, *Writings on Early American Architecture; an Annotated List of Books and Articles on Architecture Constructed before 1860 in the Eastern Half of the United States* (Columbus, 1943). This has bibliographies and a section on general references, including: religious architecture; Colonial architecture; the Greek and Gothic revivals; New England and other states; references on noted architects; and an alphabetical list of architects, with brief notes. Henry-Russell Hitchcock, *American Architectural Books, A List of Books, Portfolios, and Pamphlets on Architecture and Related Subjects Published in America before 1895* (Minneapolis, 1946) has 1,461 entries, and a subject index for churches; also material on church architecture under Builders' Guides; Colonial; Description—U.S., Nineteenth Century; Gothic and Gothic Revival; Individual Buildings and Projects; Romanesque and Romanesque Revival. *The Monograph Series, Records of Early American Architecture*

(New York, 1915–1940, 26 vols. in 21), with illustrations and plans, includes churches.

B. General Histories

Ernest Henry Short, *A History of Religious Architecture* (New York, 1951, 3rd. rev. ed.) has illustrations and plans and a short bibliography in English, with references to special periods. It is a general survey beginning with ancient Egypt and including modern American styles. The introduction, on architecture as a means of religious expression, has observations on what is lacking in modern religious architecture. Andrew Landale Drummond, *The Church Architecture of Protestantism, an Historical and Constructive Study* (Edinburgh, 1934) is the best general book on the history of Protestant church architecture everywhere, even though the author was a minister with no training in historiography or architecture. Especially good are the chapters on America, and a passage on Protestant aesthetics as the philosophical basis for church architecture.

A general review of the background of the various historic styles of American churches may well begin with Talbot Faulkner Hamlin, *The American Spirit in Architecture* (New Haven, 1926), illustrated. This provides a general background for ecclesiastical architecture, by reviewing the various periods of American architecture in general, the influences that shaped them, and what they expressed. One should consult also his *Architecture Through the Ages* (New York, 1944, rev. ed.). Sidney Fiske Kimball, *American Architecture* (Indianapolis and New York, c.1928) has notes which really are a useful bibliography. This well-known architectural scholar speaks with authority, especially on the Greek Revival and the influence of Thomas Jefferson upon American architecture. His is the best book on the subject to date, condensing the observations and conclusions of years

of investigation, and is a series of papers rather than an organic history. Thomas Eddy Tallmadge, *The Story of Architecture in America* (New York, 1936, enl. and rev. ed.) is characterized by animated style and fine understanding, and discusses architectural trends of the past decade, but is somewhat superficial. Wayne Andrews, *Architecture, Ambition and Americans; a History of American Architecture, from the Beginning to the Present* (New York, 1955), illustrated, considers outstanding buildings, their designers, and the people for whom they were built. The critical survey of American taste probably makes it the best comprehensive book by an avowed romantic. Lewis Mumford, *Sticks and Stones; a Study of American Architecture and Civilization* (New York, 1955), illustrated, is written from a sociological, evolutionary viewpoint, and does not appreciate the classic tradition. It is a highly interpretative analysis of architecture in relation to American civilization, including churches.

Volumes devoted to study of historic and architecturally meritorious churches are almost numberless. Any selection from them should include Nellie Urner Wallington, *Historic Churches of America,* introduction by Edward Everett Hale (New York, 1907). This includes nearly 70 churches, finely illustrated, and is a series of brief entertaining sketches, tracing also the growth of the religious movements that produced the churches. Frederic Jennings Haskin, *Historic Churches in the United States* (Washington, D.C., c.1938), illustrated, is small, but has value as a survey of the different types of buildings, with brief historical notes. Varying styles comprise early square New England meeting-houses, Georgian churches, Quaker meeting-houses, the Pennsylvania German style, early Virginia Gothic, Greek Revival, Gothic Revival, the Mormon temple, Lutheran and Roman Catholic churches, and Spanish missions. Robert Carlton Broderick, *Historic Churches of the United States,* with drawings by Virginia Broderick (New York, 1958), has an appendix, with a list of remarkable churches, by states. Hugh Sinclair Mor-

rison, *Early American Architecture from the First Colonial Settlements to the National Period* (New York, 1952) has "Reference Notes" by chapters and an index of "Sources of Illustrations," as well as extensive coverage of churches and meeting-houses, colonial and Georgian, also of Spanish missions in Arizona, Florida, California, New Mexico, and Texas. James Edward Talmage, *The House of the Lord: a Study of Holy Sanctuaries, Ancient and Modern,* published by the [Mormon] Church (Salt Lake City, Utah, 1912), with forty-six illustrations, generally surveys various styles, including some American churches. Desider Holisher, *The House of God* (New York, 1946), with illustrations, and a list of picture sources, was compiled with the interest, encouragement, and assistance of many ministers, priests, rabbis, and laymen, and was intended to illustrate the wide diversity of edifices in which Americans worship—cathedrals, synagogues, temples, tabernacles, store-front churches, etc. It is arranged not by denominations, but by sections of the country.

C. Architects: Biography

Henry F. Withey and Elsie Rathburn Withey, *Biographical Dictionary of American Architects, Deceased* (Los Angeles, c.1956) is the only up-to-date and reliable source, and comprises many architects who have been noted for their contributions to ecclesiastical architecture.

An examination of the origins of professional ecclesiastical building ought properly to begin with Carl Bridenbaugh, *Peter Harrison, First American Architect* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1949), with illustrations. This surveys the life, work, and influence of the most notable architect of colonial America, the designer of King's Chapel, Boston, Christ Church in Cambridge, and the synagogue in Newport. Harrison's influence is appreciated in Ralph Clarke Kingman, *New England Georgian Architecture* (New York, 1931),

with illustrations. Antoinette Forrester Downing and Vincent J. Scully, Jr., *The Architectural Heritage of Newport, Rhode Island, 1640–1915* (Cambridge, Mass., 1952) has illustrations, diagrams, maps and plans, and bibliographical references in the notes, and contains some examples of Harrison's work. James Gibbs (1682–1754), *A Book of Architecture, Containing Designs of Buildings and Ornaments* (London, 1728), including plans, had an extensive and lasting influence upon the designing of early American churches in the classical or "Colonial" style. His life and influence are ably reviewed in Bryan D. G. Little, *The Life and Work of James Gibbs, 1682–1754* (London, 1955), illustrated.

One of the most influential church architects of the early national period was Asher Benjamin, who has not been the subject of a separate biography (see sketch in the *Dictionary of American Biography*, Vol. 2, New York, 1929, pp. 179–180, with bibliography). He attained great eminence as a teacher of others through his books, notably: *The American Builder's Companion* (Boston and Charlestown, 1806); and *The Architect; or Complete Builder's Guide* (Boston, 1845), with illustrations and plans. Appreciation of his influence is shown in a republication of his writings by Aymar Embury II, ed., including *The Country Builder's Assistant, The American Builder's Companion, The Rudiments of Architecture, The Practical House Carpenter,* and *Practice of Architecture* (New York, 1917), with illustrations and plans. Another master builder of churches, in the early national period, was Charles Bulfinch. The best account of his life and work is Ellen Susan Bulfinch, ed., *The Life and Letters of Charles Bulfinch, Architect, with other Family Papers,* with an Introduction by Charles A. Cummings (Boston and New York, 1896), with illustrations, portraits, maps, plans, and facsimiles. Charles Alpheus Place, *Charles Bulfinch, Architect and Citizen* (Boston and New York, 1925), richly illustrated and based largely upon the above work, interestingly seizes upon the importance of this noted designer of

classical New England churches, who followed the general scheme of Wren's London churches, with great attention to the varieties of the type. He was noted especially for his version of the Adam style, and was dominant in New England until the Greek revival about 1820.

Two preeminent exemplars of the Greek Revival are Benjamin Henry Latrobe and William Strickland. The former's influence is studied by Talbot Faulkner Hamlin, in *Benjamin Henry Latrobe* (New York, 1955), with illustrations, bibliography, and bibliographical footnotes. Latrobe originated the Greek revival in America, designed some notable churches (including the Roman Catholic cathedral in Baltimore and St. John's in Washington, D.C.), and was the teacher of Strickland and Robert Mills. Agnes Eleanor (Addison) Gilchrist, *William Strickland, Architect and Engineer, 1788–1854* (Philadelphia, 1950), with illustrations including plans, and bibliographies, sees him as the outstanding exponent of the Greek revival in America. He designed numerous churches and was trained by Benjamin Latrobe.

The two outstanding and brilliant promoters of a later phase of the classical revival, in the Romanesque vogue of the late nineteenth century, were Richardson and White. Mariana G. Van Rensselaer's *Henry Hobson Richardson and His Works* (New York, 1888) observes his influence as the designer of numerous notable churches, including Trinity in Boston. He gained fame especially for promoting the "Richardsonian" Romanesque style, after a period of specializing in simplified Victorian Gothic, and he influenced McKim, Mead, and White. Charles C. Baldwin, *Stanford White* (New York, 1931) chronicles the brilliant career of an adept in the "Richardsonian" Romanesque style, who designed churches or supervised their erection, including such notable ones as the Madison Square Presbyterian in New York, and the Judson Memorial Baptist in the same city.

The origins of the rebirth of gothicism are detailed in

Roger Hale Newton, *Town and Davis, Architects, Pioneers in American Revivalist Architecture, 1812–1870, including a Glimpse of their Times and their Contemporaries* (New York, 1942), illustrated. Ithiel Town (1784–1844) was a pupil of Asher Benjamin, and a famed church-builder and promoter of the early Gothic Revival in America. He was a partner of Alexander Jackson Davis (1803–1892), who was in part trained by Town and worked with him as a partner, designing many churches in various styles. Davis was noted especially for his widely used and influential book: *Rural Residences, Consisting of Designs Original and Selected for Cottages, Farmhouses, Villas and Village Churches* (1837). There is no good separate biography of James Renwick (1818–1895), another eminent promoter of Gothic church architecture and designer of the famous Grace Church, New York City. A bibliography of him is located in the *Dictionary of American Biography*, Vol. 15 (New York, 1935), pp. 507–508. C. H. Whitaker narrates the later development of Gothicism in *Bertram Grosvenor Goodhue, Architect and Master of Many Arts* (New York, 1925). Goodhue, a pupil of the gothicist, James Renwick, was inspired by the Gothic Revival and High Church ritualism, and designed numerous churches. Later he moved toward severe classicism and modernism. Ralph Adams Cram, *My Life in Architecture* (Boston, 1936), illustrated, gives the story of his career as America's outstanding exponent of Gothic architecture, especially for churches, discusses the trends of church architecture in his time, and is flavored by his biting criticism of much American ecclesiastical and other architecture.

D. Types and Periods

1. SPANISH MISSIONS. Rexford Newcomb, *Spanish-Colonial Architecture in the United States* (New York, 1937) has many photographs and drawings of churches, and emphasizes Spanish architecture outside California, the historic and

artistic backgrounds, and contemporary work. His *The Old Mission Churches and Historic Houses of California; Their History, Architecture, Art and Lore* (Philadelphia and London, 1925), with illustrations and plans, has notes on the setting, rise, and development of the mission system, an account of mission architecture, and descriptions of the chief missions. His *The Franciscan Mission Architecture of Alta California* (New York, 1916), a lavish folio volume, is a complete study of this type, with notes, plans, detail drawings, exterior and interior views, photographs of models, and a map of the missions. It has a historical introductory note on the establishment of the missions, mission civilization, and general characteristics of the architecture. Jesse Stephen Hildrup, *The Missions of California and the Old Southwest,* with illustrations from photographs (Chicago, 1920, 5th ed.) offers a brief but capable summary of the mission system and its art and architecture.

For an appreciation of the mission architectural heritage of Texas, the best authority is Charles Mattoon Brooks, Jr., *Texas Missions; Their Romance and Architecture* (Dallas, Tex., 1936), which observes the missions in their present condition, and pictures them as they would look if reconstructed. There are numerous informative notes with each chapter, a complete list of missions, a glossary of architectural terms, a bibliography, and architectural sketches of mission enclosures. Walter Flavius McCaleb, *The Spanish Missions of Texas,* Introduction [by] Carlos E. Castañeda (San Antonio, 1954) has a bibliography, including manuscripts, books, and periodicals. Although not primarily concerned with architecture, the work has some notes on buildings, with a number of good photographs and illustrations of details. Primarily of pictorial interest and value is Harvey Partridge Smith, *The Charm of Old San Antonio, a Spanish Settlement of the Southwest,* photographs by H. Patteson and H. L. Summerville, drawings by E. M. Schiwetz (New York, c.1931).

Less well known is the Spanish ecclesiastical heritage of New Mexico. The best early authority still is LeBaron Bradford Prince, *Spanish Mission Churches of New Mexico* (Cedar Rapids, Ia., 1915), based upon many years of travel, and of research and study in official records. There is an interesting and authentic account of each church, illustrated from the author's photographs. Although criticized for lack of "atmosphere," the volume offers the first comprehensive account of these churches. George Kubler, *The Religious Architecture of New Mexico in the Colonial Period and Since the American Occupation* (Colorado Springs, 1940), with illustrations, plans, and bibliography, apparently is the first thorough study of the mission churches, simply as buildings. Their construction is called "an unusual feat of European adaptation to limited materials and aboriginal techniques," an architectural type formulated early in the seventeenth century. The work is based upon study of buildings and some documentary research, and includes the historical background of the missions, materials, plans, structure, mass, lighting, etc. Edgar Lee Hewitt and Reginald G. Fisher, *Mission Monuments of New Mexico* (Albuquerque, N.M. 1943) is illustrated and has a selected bibliography. John Tate Lanning, *Spanish Missions of Georgia* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1935), with illustrations, has a bibliography for missions in other states. This scholarly but popularly written account of the missions, for 150 years before the coming of the English, brings to light a vital and little known portion of history, from the results of archival investigation.

2. COLONIAL MEETING-HOUSE AND CHURCH. The American Protestant meeting-house originally was designed for the more radical denominations of the Colonial period, and for Calvinistic groups like the New England Puritans, the Reformed Dutch, and the Presbyterians, which emphasized preaching and eschewed liturgy and ornament as superfluous. After the beginning of the eighteenth century, those denominations generally tended to abandon the simple meeting-

house in favor of the churchly type of building with a steeple. In this they followed the contemporary "Georgian" taste in England, stemming from the work of Sir Christopher Wren and his followers and imitators. They imitated also the example of the English Episcopal Church in the colonies, which in the 1720's began to erect more elaborate churches in the Georgian "Colonial" style.

The origins of the colonial meeting-house are discerned in Anthony Garvan, "The Protestant Plain Style before 1630," in *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, Vol. 9, no. 3 (Oct. 1950), pp. 5–13, with illustrations. The essay briefly discusses the evolution of the Protestant church, intended for preaching and simple worship rather than elaborate liturgical ceremonial—the predecessor of the bare but dignified American meeting-house. Two good articles on colonial churches are listed in Roos, *Writings on Early American Architecture*, p. 41, nos. 229, 230. See also the entries under sections and states, particularly "New England, Religious," communities, and the sections on religious architecture—e.g., Boston. Harold Donaldson Eberlein, *The Architecture of Colonial America*, illustrated from photographs by Mary H. Northend and others (Boston, 1915) points out that the "Colonial" architecture really was Georgian. The historical treatment is extended to the post-colonial period and the classic revival, including many little known or forgotten buildings, with some churches. Joseph Francis Ambrose Jackson, *American Colonial Architecture, Its Origin and Development* (Philadelphia, c.1924), with a bibliography and excellent illustrations, indicates the influences shaping the development of particular styles, and has a fresh and interesting approach, with a background of social and economic life. His *The Development of American Architecture, 1783–1830* (Philadelphia, c.1926), with illustrations and a bibliography, is a continuation, and a quest for an explanation of development in changing cultural environment and historic background. He gives a non-technical description of the

work of different architects, from the viewpoint of the historian rather than of the professional architect.

Hugh Sinclair Morrison, *Early American Architecture, from the First Colonial Settlements to the National Period* (New York, 1952), with illustrations, plans, and annotated chapter bibliographies, includes statements on church architecture in the various areas of English, Spanish, and French colonial America, from the first buildings to the early 1800's. Comprehensive treatment of geographic and stylistic phases makes this more than a history of architecture, through a thoughtful combination of political, social, and economic history, and passages from diaries and chronicles, with notes at the time when the buildings were new. It is the most comprehensive work in the field: well documented, brilliantly organized, and a guide to the literature. William Rotch Ware, *The Georgian Period; Being Photographs and Measured Drawings of Colonial Work with Text* (New York, c.1923, folio, 6 vols.), with plans and bibliography, is a standard authority and the first concerted effort to compile an extensive record of the period. It comprises the work of 92 architects and draftsmen, a numerical chronology of buildings, 1623–1838, and many pictures of and comments on churches. Aymar Embury, II, *Early American Churches* (Garden City, 1914), illustrated, by a well-known American architect, is a "classic" book, but somewhat superficial. It mentions every church of "respectable antiquity, which either possesses architectural interest or historical traditions of importance." The photographs, the richest collection for colonial churches assembled to that date, are accompanied by brief historical sketches. Edward Francis Rines, *Old Historic Churches of America; Their Romantic History and Their Traditions* (New York, 1936), with a bibliography, is arranged by locality, beginning with Virginia churches, and extending to the Spanish missions of the Southwest, and has a chronological list of churches and fine photographs. The author collected many previously unknown stories of the

churches for this objectively presented and thorough guide, based upon a vast extent of research. Hobart Brown Upjohn, *Churches in Eight American Colonies Differing in Elements of Design*, photographs by Kenneth Clark, measured drawings from the George F. Lindsay collection (New York, c.1929) covers the period 1736–1835, in Massachusetts, Vermont, New Hampshire, Connecticut, New Jersey, New York, North and South Carolina.

a. The New England Meeting-house. Thomas Jefferson Wertenbaker, *The Puritan Oligarchy* (New York, 1947) has observations, based upon close study of sources, on the English and other origins of the New England colonial meeting-house, and clearly develops the Puritan influence upon architecture, with heavy reliance upon Samuel E. Morison, Perry Miller, and other delvers into the Puritan mind. Noah Porter, *The New England Meeting House* (New Haven, Published for the Tercentenary Commission, 1933) considers the meeting-house as a religious and social center, with some reference to architecture. The best sociological study of the background of the meeting-house is Ola E. Winslow, *Meetinghouse Hill: 1630–1783* (New York, 1952). Although this is actually a study of the social character of the New England colonial meeting-house, it contains observations on its structure, details of the interiors, seating, etc., and recreates the building and the life it symbolized.

An excellent, detailed architectural study is Charles A. Place, "From Meeting House to Church in New England," in *Old Time New England*, Vol. 13, no. 2 (Oct. 1922), pp. 69–77; no. 3 (Jan. 1923), pp. 111–123; no. 4 (Apr. 1923), pp. 149–164; Vol. 14, no. 1 (July 1923), pp. 3–20, with excellent photographs and plans. He illustrates the evolution from the plain, square, hip-roofed meeting-house to the Georgian, decorated, pitch-roof church of the early nineteenth century, with much detail on the evolution of the steeple. He ascribes the transition to the "church" to Church

of England influence, and regards the first quarter of the nineteenth century as the golden age of church building. Mary Schell (Hoke) Bacon, *Old New England Churches and Their Children* (New York, 1906) is a charming book with many fine illustrations from photographs, and is based upon research in ecclesiastical histories, town records, and old sermons. It considers 28 churches, with an introductory essay on the churches as social institutions, and architectural notes woven into the narrative. Elsie L. Lathrop, *Old New England Churches* (Rutland, Vt., c.1938), illustrated, is arranged by states, and includes churches combining more than a century of age with interesting history. There are chapters on Boston, and one on other churches in Massachusetts. George Francis Marlowe, *Churches of Old New England, Their Architecture and Their Architects, Their Pastors and Their People*, illustrated with photographs by Samuel Chamberlain (New York, 1947) has references, and is a popular guidebook. It comprises a judicious selection of churches in each state, of architectural merit and historical interest, and uses diaries and church records to reconstruct the lives of the people. This pleasant non-technical book stresses the cultural medium of the buildings and the simple beauty of Puritan architecture.

Charles Albert Wright, *Some Old Time Meeting Houses of the Connecticut Valley* (Chicopee Falls, Mass., c.1911), with pen sketches of types of meeting-houses, concentrates on the period 1780–1850, but continues to the latest examples of the "Colonial" style. A valuable essay, "The Genesis of the Old Time Meeting House," discusses the character of religious life and worship. Although somewhat amateurish, this is one of the earliest studies and is good reading for the layman. John F. Kelley, *Early Connecticut Meeting Houses* (New York, 1948, 2 vols.), with illustrations, map, plans, and a bibliography, is the work of a professional architect. His admirable account of those erected before 1830 is based chiefly upon town and parish records. This is the "classic"

work on the subject. Theodore Sizer, "The Lebanon Meetinghouse, Lebanon, Connecticut," in *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians,* Vol. 14, no. 2 (May 1955), pp. 8–11, discusses the designer, John Trumbull, and describes the reconstruction of a typical meeting-house after the destructive hurricane of 1938.

Robert Peabody Bellows, *An Architectural Monograph: Country Meeting Houses along the Massachusetts-New Hampshire Line . . . containing also Measured Drawings from the George F. Lindsay Collection of Early American Documents* (New York, c.1925) includes illustrations and plans, and studies a cluster of remarkably similar ones, built in the early 1800's, showing the wooden country meeting-house at its best, and mentioning notable details, with fine photographs of exteriors, details of woodwork, and spires. Percy Metcalf Leavitt, *Souvenir Portfolio of Universalist Churches in Massachusetts* (Boston, Mass., 1906), with many illustrations from photographs, comprises about 120 buildings, and is the result of much research and travel, with a historical sketch for each church. The pictures are a most interesting review of the varying styles in one denomination, from the plainest clapboarded meeting-houses to elaborate stone gothic and Romanesque churches in large cities. It is a view of the eclecticism of American church architecture in the nineteenth century, with some buildings in the "shingle style." Priscilla Metcalf, "Boston Before Bulfinch: Harrison's King's Chapel," in *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians,* Vol. 13, no. 1 (Mar. 1954), pp. 11–14, illustrates the beginning of the marked departure from the plain meeting-house style toward the Anglican, churchly style inspired by the new churches of London designed by Christopher Wren and others. Eva Augusta (Clough) Speare, *Colonial Meeting-Houses of New Hampshire Compared with their Contemporaries in New England* (Littleton, N.H., c.1938), with illustrations and bibliography, has a list of meeting-houses in New Hampshire, and illustrations of exteriors, interiors, and

details. In a popular style she discusses different types, including Anglican churches and Quaker meeting-houses. Especially valuable are the essays, "The Town Meeting House," "Building a Meeting House," and "The Influence of Charles Bulfinch." Edgerton Swartwout, *An Architectural Monograph: Some Old Time Churches of Vermont . . . Containing also Measured Drawings from the George F. Lindsay Collection of Early American Documents* (New York, c.1927) includes illustrations and plans. He analyzes a group of churches, with drawings of details, elevations, floor plans, and fine photographs of spires and interiors. One can derive from the book a clear idea of how the designers and builders worked in the period 1780–1840, the classic period of the New England "Colonial" church and meeting-house. Maine Writers Research Club, *Historic Churches and Homes of Maine, with Photographic Illustrations* (Portland, Me., 1937) has chapters on old village churches and meeting-houses, and is a competent study.

b. The Middle Region. Thomas Jefferson Wertenbaker, *The Founding of American Civilization: The Middle Colonies* (New York, 1938) reviews the varying styles of religious edifices in these cosmopolitan provinces, and their origins, with much attention to the transition and American development of European religious architecture. Philip B. Wallace and William Allen Dunn, *Colonial Churches and Meeting Houses, Pennsylvania, New Jersey and Delaware,* introduction by Horace Wells Sellers (New York, c.1931) has measured drawings by Dunn. This handsome contribution to the history of "Colonial" church architecture has also a splendid collection of photographs of the styles of churches and meeting-houses of various denominations. G. Edwin Brumbaugh, "Colonial Architecture of the Pennsylvania Germans," in Pennsylvania German Society, *Proceedings . . . Papers,* Vol. 41 (Norristown, Pa., 1933) is a scholarly general essay, comprising a discussion of European origins in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance, and the transfer to Amer-

ica. The history of German building in Pennsylvania includes references to stone buildings, notes on Ephrata and Bethlehem, building methods, and a special essay on church building. The plain Quaker type is well described in John Russell Hayes, *Old Quaker Meeting-houses* (Philadelphia, 1911, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.), with 166 illustrations.

c. The Old South. Thomas Jefferson Wertenbaker, *The Founding of American Civilization: The Old South* (New York, 1942) displays good plates and drawings of Southern architecture, including churches. Henry Chandlee Forman, *The Architecture of the Old South: the Mediaeval Style, 1585–1850* (Cambridge, 1948), with illustrations, and bibliography, discusses the earliest architecture (including churches), based on English and late Gothic models, mainly in Virginia and Maryland, with descriptive captions indicating specific features from English styles. Helen West Ridgely, *The Old Brick Churches of Maryland,* with illustrations by Sophie DeButts Stewart (New York, 1894), with a map showing the locations of the churches, is not scholarly but rather antiquarian and reminiscent, and has reproductions of sketches, with some notes on architectural details, but one suspects inaccuracies. Henry Irving Brock, *Colonial Churches in Virginia,* Introduction by Hamilton James Eckenrode, photographic studies by Frances Benjamin Johnston (Richmond, 1930) is not a work of solid scholarship, but is handsomely illustrated with dull-finish photographs by an authority, and has an essay with each church. George Carrington Mason, *Colonial Churches of Tidewater Virginia* (Richmond Va., 1945), with maps and plans, was first published in the *William and Mary Quarterly Historical Magazine,* 1938–1943, and has bibliographical footnotes. The author studied fifty ancient brick churches, using old records, and performed a painstaking research enterprise, throwing new light upon the history of the more famous churches, correcting errors in dates, and demolishing some time-honored legends. The impression of the society that built the churches makes the

book "a kind of scholarly elegy, an appreciation of a noble culture."

3. THE GREEK REVIVAL. A good list of references on the Greek Revival in America, including notices of its influence upon church architecture, is available in Frank J. Roos, Jr., *Writings on Early American Architecture* (Columbus, 1943), pp. 45–46, nos. 282–290. See also the list of architects, pp. 225–235. Especially valuable is the following reference: W. H. Goodyear, "Greek Architecture in the United States," in *Chautauquan,* Vol. 16, no. 1 (Oct. 1892), pp. 3–11; no. 2 (Nov. 1892), pp. 131–137; and no. 3 (Dec. 1892), pp. 259–267. This general historical and critical survey has some references to the influence of the movement on ecclesiastical architecture, especially in Philadelphia. The movement is traced to the Renaissance, with remarks on "Greek temple style" churches, and on architects of the American Revival. A general survey of the movement appears in Montgomery Schuyler, "The Old Greek Revival—in Four Parts," in *American Architect,* Vol. 98, no. 1816 (Oct. 12, 1910), pp. 121–126, 128; no. 1826 (Dec, 21, 1910), pp. 204, 206–208; Vol. 99, no. 1836 (Mar. 1, 1911), pp. 81–84, 86–87; no. 1845 (May 3, 1911), pp. 161–166, 168. These essays, well illustrated, discuss the work of Latrobe, Mills, Strickland, and other architects, and survey the movement from its origins in the 1760's, with a few examples to illustrate the general character of Greek Revival churches: Latrobe's Roman Catholic cathedral in Baltimore, the Monumental Church in Richmond, the Middle Dutch Church in New York, and St. Peter's Roman Catholic Church in New York. Talbot F. Hamlin, "The Greek Revival in America and Some of its Critics," in *Art Bulletin,* Vol. 24, no. 3 (Sept. 1942), pp. 244–258, affords a general survey and discussion, which briefly notices its effects upon church architecture, with bibliography in the footnotes. References to criticisms by Gothicists and others, upon the "imitativeness" of the Revival, are accompanied by Hamlin's criticisms of fakery in the Gothic Re-

vival, which would apply to churches, together with his estimate of the contributions of the Greek and Gothic movements. Local phases of the movement, with references to its effects upon church architecture, are explored in the three following essays: Theodore Sizer, "Philadelphia's First Presbyterian Church by 'Mr. Trumbul,'" in *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, Vol. 9, no. 3 (Oct, 1950), pp. 20–22; Eva Ingersoll Gatling, "John Berry of Hillsboro, North Carolina," in *ibid.*, Vol. 10, no. 1 (Mar. 1951), pp. 18–22; and Russell S. Potter and Henry C. Montgomery, "Classic Revival Architecture in Cincinnati," in *ibid.*, Vol. 6, nos. 3–4 (July–Dec. 1947), pp. 18–21.

4. THE GOTHIC REVIVAL. *a. The Romantic Background.* In the first half of the nineteenth century, one of the clearest reflections of the religious spirit in the fine arts was the Gothic Revival in church architecture. It was part of a general awakening of interest in the art and literature of the Middle Ages, which began in the middle decades of the eighteenth century. In the Church, especially, the Gothic Revival expressed a romantic glorification of the past, and an effort to revive the Christian religious spirit, which had long lain dormant under rationalism and deism, encouraged by the Enlightenment of the eighteenth century. The movement in church architecture and decoration was led by those denominations, like the Roman Catholic and the Episcopal, which had traditions derived from the Middle Ages, and which had a revival of interest in the medieval liturgy. The earliest impressive evidence of the architectural revival was in the Episcopal Church, because of the influence of the Oxford Movement in the Church of England, which attempted to recover Catholic doctrine and liturgy.

A brief bibliography of the Gothic Revival is available in Frank J. Roos, *Writings on Early American Architecture*, p. 46. Consult the list of architects, pp. 225–235; also "Gothic Revival," index, p. 253; and entries under sections and states.

Agnes Eleanor Gilchrist, *Romanticism and the Gothic*

Revival (New York, 1938), with bibliography and illustrations, is an excellent essay on the emotional background of the return to Gothic as *the* "Christian" architecture, in the revival of romantic literary interest in the Middle Ages, their poetry, religion, and art. Kenneth McKenzie Clark, *The Gothic Revival, an Essay in the History of Taste* (London, 1950), with bibliographical footnotes, reviews the background of the revival in England, especially the Oxford and Camden movements in the Church of England. A still more detailed (and indispensable) study is Charles Locke Eastlake, *A History of the Gothic Revival; An Attempt to Show How the Taste for Mediaeval Architecture, Which Lingered in England During the Two Last Centuries, Has Since Been Encouraged and Developed* (London, 1872), with illustrations. He offers a general survey of the cultural background of the revival in England–literary, antiquarian, and emotional, which set the tone of the movement in America after about 1815. Basil Fulford Lowther Clarke, *Church Builders of the Nineteenth Century, a Study of the Gothic Revival in England* . . . with a preface by Sir Charles Nicholson (London and New York, 1938), illustrated, investigates the movement on the technical side, as professional architecture, imitated more or less by early American Gothicists.

b. Early American Gothic. Agnes Eleanor (Addison) Gilchrist, "Early American Gothic," in George Boas, ed., *Romanticism in America* (Baltimore, 1940) is an exposition of the general development of Gothic revivalism in the United States. The architectural movement is seen as part of a larger one, which also included painting, music, literature, and philosophy. It was led by a few eminent professional architects, whose influences are estimated in the following scholarly studies. Rexford Newcomb, "Ithiel Town of New Haven and New York," in *Architect,* Vol. 11, no. 5 (Feb. 1929), pp. 519–523, illustrated, briefly appreciates the Connecticut architect who in 1810 settled in New Haven, became a partner of Alexander J. Davis, and worked in the Georgian,

Greek Revival and Gothic styles. Davis' influence is estimated by Edna Donnell in "A. J. Davis and the Gothic Revival," in Metropolitan Museum, *Studies,* Vol. 5, part 2 (Sept. 1936), pp. 183–233, illustrated. This has a list of source books of Gothic Revival ornament, 1742–1872, and deals mostly with Gothic homes, but has remarks on his two designs for Gothic churches. The value of the essay is in its exposition of the Gothic taste of the period, the background of religious Gothicism.

Gothicism found its most enthusiastic friends among the High Church Anglicans. One was the first Bishop of Vermont, John Henry Hopkins. His *Essay on Gothic Architecture, With Various Plans and Drawings for Churches: Designed Chiefly for the Use of the Clergy* (Burlington [Vt.], 1836), illustrated, should be consulted. This small book was extremely influential in promoting the revival. Hopkins was a High Churchman, sympathetic toward the Oxford Movement in England, and toward the New York Ecclesiological Society. The Society's *Third Annual Report,* 1851 (New York, 1851), the first one printed, includes a review of all transactions since the foundation, with a list of papers read at the meetings, April 2, 1848–May 12, 1851. This society, like the Camden Society in England, furthered the Gothic Revival. It was founded in 1848 "to promote the knowledge of Church architecture, and matters of ritual." The presidential address praises Gothic as *the* Christian architecture. The Society aimed to gather a complete bibliography on church architecture, decoration, music, etc., and maintained correspondence with the Camden Society. Its *Transactions,* 1855 (New York, 1857) contains two excellent essays, "The Cathedral System in the City," and "The Cathedral System in Rural Dioceses," by the Rev. John Henry Hopkins, Jr., a son of the Bishop of Vermont who wrote *Essay on Gothic Architecture* (1836), *q.v.* The son was influential in inspiring the Anglican cathedral movement in America. Low Churchmen dissented strenuously, and one typical evidence of their

alarm is *Puseyite Developments, or Notices of the New York Ecclesiologists, Dedicated to their Patron, the Right Rev. Bishop Ives of North Carolina By a Layman* (New York, 1850). The author makes a frontal attack upon the Anglican High Church promoters of the American Gothic Revival, and of ritualism and Catholic theology.

Opposition in the Episcopal Church was overborne, largely by the genius of the inspired designer Richard Upjohn. Everard Miller Upjohn's *Richard Upjohn* (New York, 1939) is richly illustrated with photographs and plans of houses and churches. It discusses his influence, and the profound effect of Trinity Church in New York, and of his book of designs of country churches, which helped to spread Gothicism into the small towns. This standard biography perceives how he infused genuine Gothic feeling into his churches, and induced the public to accept it. Richard Upjohn, *Upjohn's Rural Architecture, Designs, Working Drawings and Specifications for a Wooden Church, and other Rural Structures* (New York, 1852) was perhaps the most widely influential of many architectural manuals that favored the Gothic revival, especially the phase known as "Carpenter's Gothic."

The revival reached its apogee in strongly Episcopalian New York City. Its origin and history are traced in "New York Gothic," in *Pencil Points,* Vol. 22, no. 3 (July 1940), a description of an exhibition of illustrations at the Museum of the City of New York, including a considerable number of churches. An analysis of the revival, inspired by this display, is presented by John Walden Myer, in "The Gothic Revival in New York," in Museum of the City of New York, *Bulletin,* Vol. 3, no. 5 (Apr. 1940), pp. 50–56, illustrated. He describes it as a romantic emotional overflowing, marked by great enthusiasm and lasting about sixty years. It was purely American, and was not affected by Continental European influences. Before 1820 it was generally decorative, but the later revival was structural, and reached its greatest ecclesi-

astical flowering in New York. It began rather suddenly, with the erection of St. Thomas's Church, against determined opposition to it as un-American and un-Protestant. The criticism is typically voiced by "St. Thomas's Church, New York," in *American Penny Magazine*, Vol. 2, no. 38 (Oct. 24, 1846), p. 600. This article expresses an often-repeated criticism of Gothic as not suited to the times, nor to the American nation and its institutions. The favorable view appears in "St. Thomas's Church, Corner of Broadway and Houston Street," in *Monthly Repository*, Vol. 4, no. 10 (Mar. 1834), pp. 357–358. This describes a Gothic-Revival church erected in 1824–1826 and demolished in 1905, with an engraving. The building was considered the best specimen of New York Gothic and was one of the earliest, and the article is one of the earliest on the American Gothic revival. (See also: *American Penny Magazine*, Vol. 2 (Oct. 24, 1846), p. 600.)

New York Gothic attained its culmination in Richard Upjohn's Trinity Church on Broadway at the head of Wall Street. Among the best appreciations of its style is Montgomery Schuyler's "Trinity's Architecture," in *Architectural Record*, Vol. 25, no. 6 (June 1909), pp. 411–425, which includes other New York City churches, and has photographs showing various styles of architecture favored by the parish, reflecting changes in taste. A single parish provides good examples, in its main church and chapels, of prevailing styles of periods. William Rhinelander Stewart, *Grace Church and Old New York* (New York, 1924), illustrated, is more concerned with the religious and social influence of the parish than with its architecture, which, however, is accorded its due importance, with reference to the designer, James Renwick, one of the most effective promoters of the revived Gothic style.

The Gothic Revival spread from New York across the nation, and its penetration is attested by many essays in architectural magazines. Notable examples are: James D. Van Trump, "St. Peter's, Pittsburgh, by John Notman," in *Jour-*

nal of the Society of Architectural Historians, Vol. 15, no. 2 (May 1956), pp. 19–23; and Lyle F. Perusse, "The Gothic Revival in California, 1850–1890," in *ibid.*, Vol. 14, no. 3 (Oct. 1955), pp. 15–21.

c. The Later Gothic Revival. After Upjohn, Renwick, and their contemporaries, the most eminent promoter of the Gothic Revival was Ralph Adams Cram, along with his friend, Bertram Goodhue. Cram was a Unitarian minister's son who became an Anglo-Catholic. To his way of thinking, as to Pugin's, the great protagonist of Gothicism in nineteenth-century England, the only truly Christian architecture must be Gothic.

Von Ogden Vogt, *Art and Religion* (Boston, 1948, rev. ed.), with illustrations and music, has perhaps the best known notes on the influence of Cram and of Anglo-Catholicism upon American church architecture. Cram's *Church Building; a Study of the Principles of Architecture in Their Relation to the Church* (Boston, 1914, 2nd ed.) is an early exposition of the ideals of the leading American Gothicist of the twentieth century. His *The Gothic Quest* (Garden City, N.Y., 1915, rev. ed.) consists of essays that previously were lectures, or articles in religious or architectural magazines, on Gothicism, and the church in contrast to the meeting-house. It is mainly a discussion of ecclesiastical architecture from the Gothic standpoint of the English High Churchman, and reveals his contagious enthusiasm for medieval art. His *American Church Buildings of Today* (New York, c.1929), with illustrations and plans, emphasizes recently erected churches, predominantly Gothic. The introduction briefly surveys church architecture since about 1885, with special reference to a sound revival of good taste in the past generation. In *The Work of Cram and Ferguson, Architects* (New York, 1929), with plans, he comprised work by Cram, Goodhue, and Ferguson, with an introduction by Charles D. Maginnis. His long campaign for the realization of his ideals is best summarized in his autobiography: *My Life in Architecture*

(Boston, 1936). This is the life and professional story of one who for many years was the foremost proponent of Gothic architecture in the United States. Written in a romantic vein and with real gusto, it is an apologia for Gothicism, with biting but sincere criticism of modern architecture. Donald D. Egbert, "The Architecture and the Setting," in Charles G. Osgood [and others], *The Modern Princeton* (Princeton, 1948) narrates Cram's relations with Princeton University, and the major reasons why the University adopted its type of Gothic architecture, including the chapel, a modern development of the Revival. Basil F. L. Clarke, *Anglican Cathedrals Outside the British Isles*, with a foreword by John Betjeman (London, 1958) includes a considerable number of American cathedrals, with illustrations, and reveals the great extent to which the Gothic ideals of Cram, Goodhue, and their followers have triumphed.

5. THE BROWN DECADES. A. R. Cooper, *The Cultivation of Art, and its Relation to Religious Puritanism and Money-Getting*, being the substance of a paper read before the Louisville Library Association, December 8, 1873 (New York, 1874) is a severe criticism of contemporary degenerate artistic taste, blamed upon money-getting business and Puritanism, the latter disapproving cultivation of expression of the sentiments. Art cannot be harmonized with "a gloomy, uninspiring and metaphysical theology," or flourish in the atmosphere of American popular religion. The plea for art in the Protestant churches shows the influence of the Ruskinian philosophy of beauty. Talbot Hamlin, "The Rise of Eclecticism in New York," in *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, Vol. 11, no. 2 (May 1952), pp. 3–8, considers the mingling of styles that led, eventually, to the architectural conglomeration of the late nineteenth century. John Maass, *The Gingerbread Age; a View of Victorian America* (New York, 1957), with bibliography, shows a decline in taste at the turn of the century. Architecture is related to characteristics of Victorian society, including the more solid ones of vigor, boldness, in-

ventiveness, imagination, and creativeness. The photographs of various American churches include even "Americanized Egyptian." Vincent Joseph Scully, *The Shingle Style; Architectural Theory and Design from Richardson to the Origins of Wright* (New Haven, 1955) has illustrations and a bibliography with references to writings of architects. He traces the main course of theory and design, which grew into a unique American style. The style was adapted to churches, including a considerable number of summer chapels.

The post-Civil War period is summarized in Lewis Mumford, *The Brown Decades; a Study of the Arts in America, 1865–1895* (New York, 1955, 2nd rev. ed.), with bibliographies for chapters, and illustrations. It has some references to churches of the period, and to the work of Henry Hobson Richardson, Louis Sullivan, and John Root. Mumford estimates architects who broke the way toward new experiments in ecclesiastical architecture. The contribution of a typical architect of the period is studied briefly in Ellen W. Kramer, "Detlef Lienau, An Architect of the Brown Decades," in *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians,* Vol. 14, no. 1 (Mar. 1955), pp. 18–25, with a few comments and illustrations relating to his contribution to church design. Edward Robert DeZurko, *Early Kansas Churches* (Manhattan, Kans., 1949), illustrated, with a bibliography, is a surprisingly interesting monograph, treating the development of church design in the state to 1876, from the most primitive thatched church to the Romanesque cathedral of Leavenworth. The illustrations show the wide variety of styles, and the absence of any dominant one, in the middle- and late-nineteenth century.

This fact is emphasized vividly by a few representative manuals. George Bowler, *Chapel and Church Architecture, with Designs for Parsonages* (Boston and New York, 1856), with pictures and plans, includes "A Brief History of Sacred Architecture" on design, locality, adaptability, construction, harmony, suggestions on ventilation, light, pews, galleries,

organs, etc. The designs include fine lithographic tinted plates, elevations, sections, floor plans, wooden churches for Protestant parishes of moderate means, modifications of Gothic, Byzantine, and Romanesque styles, and some Georgian designs. Henry Hudson Holly, *Church Architecture, Illustrated with Thirty-five Lithographic Plates, from Original Designs* (Hartford, Conn., 1871), with ground plans and perspective views, was compiled by a noted architect. The text discusses style, ventilation, wooden construction, sites, organs, fittings, color, symbolism, spires, clocks, and bells. Obviously writing with Anglican and anti-sectarian bias, the author is strongly sympathetic toward Gothicism. Another noted designer was Frederick Clarke Withers, who produced a typical manual of the period: *Church Architecture; Plans, Elevations, and Views . . . Photolithographed from original drawings, with numerous illustrations showing details of construction, church fittings, etc.* (New York, 1873). An unusual form of guide is Eugene Clarence Gardner's *Common Sense in Church Building, Illustrated by Seven Original Plates* (New York, 1880). This is an imaginative series of letters between churchmen and the architect, and pleads for the tabernacle style of Protestant church for large congregations, built for utility, with attached parish and school rooms. American Architect and Architecture, *Plates from the American Architect, Churches, Schools and Colleges* (Boston? 188?), including plans, admirably surveys the widely varying tastes and styles of the eclectic period, with engravings of interiors and exteriors, and plans (mostly American) illustrating the trend toward more elaborate architecture in various groups. The designs range from summer chapels to cathedrals, and a few are in the tabernacle style. George Wolfe Shinn, ed., *King's Handbook of Notable Episcopal Churches in the United States, One Hundred Illustrations* (Boston, 1889) includes colonial, early nineteenth-century and modern buildings, and cathedrals, with a list of architects mentioned. The engravings represent a veritable conglomeration of styles, a

good survey of the eclectic era. William Wallace Martin, *Manual of Ecclesiastical Architecture . . . with over 550 illustrations* (Cincinnati and New York, 1897) has an essay on the inheritance of church architecture, with emphasis upon the Basilican, Byzantine, Romanesque, Gothic, and Renaissance styles, and their modern adaptations. Chapter x, "Architecture of the Modern Church," has plans and views of churches of the period, remarks on the development of the Protestant edifice, the meeting-house and altar-centered types. Decoration is considered at length, and there is an essay on architecture and Christian worship, with a glossary of technical terms. George W. Kramer, *The What, How and Why of Church Building* (New York, 1897) is a typical manual on the worst phase of American ecclesiastical architecture at the turn of the century, full of illustrations of "practical" (and ugly) tabernacle churches, largely Romanesque or neo-Gothic, with typical floor plans.

6. MODERN CHURCH ARCHITECTURE. *a. Manuals and Guides.* A selection from this vast field of publications illustrates the gradual improvement in church architecture since the early years of the twentieth century. The conservative, Gothic, and liturgical tradition is well represented by two volumes inspired by the ideals of Ralph Adams Cram. The earlier is *American Churches . . . A Series of Authoritative Articles on Designing, Planning, Heating, Ventilating, Lighting and General Equipment of Churches as Demonstrated by the Best Practice in the United States,* with an Introduction by Ralph Adams Cram (New York, 1915, 2 vols.), with plans and pictures. Volume 2 comprises "American Churches . . . Illustrated by the Work of the New York office of Cram, Goodhue and Ferguson . . . By James McFarland Baker, M.S." Cram's *American Church Building of Today, A Selection of Photographs of Exteriors, Interiors, Details and Plans of Churches Recently Erected* (New York, 1929), is entirely American, and illustrates various denominational and liturgical traditions. It has a valuable introduction on the re-

vival of American church architecture after the 1880's, beginning with Richardson and McKim, the new revival of Gothic and of "Colonial," and the modern movements and fads, of course from the Cram Catholic viewpoint, opposed to "modernism." The ideal of beauty, combined with practical utility, informs the influential helps to builders of John Ryland Scotford: his *The Church Beautiful; a Practical Discussion of Church Architecture* (Boston and Chicago, c.1945), with illustrations and a brief bibliography; and his *When You Build Your Church* (Great Neck, N.Y., 1958, 2nd ed.). This has photographs of 31 interesting modern churches of various denominations and regions, and an appendix of "Churches Worth Seeing," with comments. He considers all problems, and illustrates the adaptation of modern American churches to conditions of life.

Some of the "how-to-do-it" guides are intended to appeal to all faiths, and to various types of church life. One of the most professional and catholic is Paul Thiry, Richard M. Bennett, and Henry L. Kamphoefner, *Churches & Temples,* illustrated in the historical preface and Protestant Church sections by Duncan R. Stuart (New York, 1954), with a bibliography. Three practicing architects offer a book to inspire people of all creeds who have responsibility for church and Jewish temple architecture. A selection of "best examples" includes American Roman Catholic, Jewish, and Protestant buildings. The preface treats the development of the architecture of each faith, and shows a deep knowledge of the background of religious thought, from which the architecture springs. A similar guide is the Architectural Record's *Religious Buildings for Today,* edited by John Knox Shear (New York, c.1957), with a bibliography. This summary of the best in contemporary building represents "a great variety of faiths, of rites, of budgets, of program requirements, structural methods, and attitudes." The illustrations are American, and include Jewish, Roman Catholic, Anglican, Orthodox, and Protestant churches.

Modernity and practicality, and functional adaptation to contemporary social needs, are heavily emphasized in many of the church-builders' guides. A rather typical one of this kind is William Ward Watkin, *The Church of Tomorrow* (New York and London, 1936), with plates, an example of the effort to relate church architecture to modern "social" religion. His mature experience and convictions are summarized in *Planning and Building the Modern Church* (New York, 1951), with plans and pictures. Mouzon William Brabham, *Planning Modern Church Buildings* (Nashville, Tenn., 1928) has plates and plans, and references for further reading. Edward David Mills, *The Modern Church* (New York, 1956) with plans, pictures, and bibliography, is a manual of modern taste and practice and comprises churches in various countries, some in the United States, with details of furnishings, decorations, etc. Katharine (Morrison) McClinton, *The Changing Church; Its Architecture, Art, and Decoration* (New York, 1957), illustrated, includes bibliography, and outlines procedures for planning and building, and accents the responsibility of the church for increasing service in a changing society, without costly imitation of earlier buildings. It covers the field of building and furnishing, with chapters on the church school, and "Art in the Church," richly illustrated with photographs and plans of churches of modern design, of various denominations and regions. The "social" emphasis appears clearly in a manual by the Interdenominational Bureau of Architecture: *Planning Church Buildings . . . Designs, Floor Plans and Recommendations to Help in Planning Church Buildings for Worship, Religious Education and Fellowship Activities, to Cost from $30,000 to $850,000 . . .* (New York, 1946), edited by E. M. Conover, with pictures and plans. This is based frankly upon the assumption that the church is a community center for the whole week, in the modern Protestant sense. Photographs of existing churches of varying styles and of different

denominations illustrate adaptations to different types of communities and sections of the country.

The problem of the small congregation, confronted by great building costs, is solved by Frederick Roth Webber's *The Small Church; How to Build and Furnish It, with Some Account of the Improvement of Existing Buildings* (Cleveland, 1937), with illustrations, plans, and a selective bibliography.

The older types of churches, planned largely for either liturgical worship or for preaching, generally showed little concern for school needs or for weekday activities. Parish houses usually were halls for meetings and entertainments, without classrooms. The shift in emphasis toward organized education is illustrated by Henry Edward Tralle and George Ernest Merrill, *Building for Religious Education* (New York, c.1926), one of the earlier manuals accenting the adaptation of the church to modern emphasis upon "efficient" educational methods. The full development of the new philosophy regarding the communal function of the church "plant" appears in Elbert Moore Conover, *The Church School and Parish House Building* (Chicago, 1949), with pictures and plans, a complete revision of *Building and Equipment for Christian Education.* It summarizes his matured ideas, his philosophy of Protestant church-building, with many photographs of existing facilities, and suggested plans for types of churches. The emphasis is upon the combination of worship, education, and fellowship.

In recent years there has been an effort to reappraise the modern trends in church building. John R. Scotford, "What Do Our Church Buildings Say?" in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 25, no. 3 (Summer, 1956), pp. 397–408, is a review of the influence of modern interpretations of religion upon architecture, by a church building consultant. James R. Blackwood, "Church Building in 1956. How Contemporary Can We Get?" in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 25, no. 3 (Summer, 1956),

pp. 409–420, is a criticism of "modernistic" extremes, by a Presbyterian college pastor.

b. Denominational Manuals and Guides. Elbert Moore Conover, *Building the House of God* (New York, 1928), with bibliography, illustrations, and plans, is by the one-time director of the Bureau of Architecture of the Methodist Church. One should see also his *The Church Builder* (New York, 1948). This Protestant manual shows evidence of improving taste, and has remarks on the significance of the church building, the history of erecting churches, the American heritage from England, and a discussion of the chief problems involved in American building. The aim is a multiple-purpose structure for worship, education, and fellowship. William Herman Leach, *Protestant Church Building; Planning, Financing, Designing* (Nashville, 1948), with illustrations and bibliography, is a practical manual, considering the site, financing, fund campaign, duties of the building committee, functional designing, mechanical equipment, furnishings, and parsonage. There is a sketchy discussion of historic styles. The author insists upon worship rooms suited to add dignity and meaning to the services.

The best Anglican (Episcopal) thought and practice is represented by Darby Wood Betts, ed., *Architecture and the Church, An Official Publication of the Joint Commission on Architecture and the Allied Arts . . .* Foreword by the Right Reverend G. Ashton Oldham, D.D. (Greenwich, Conn., 1952). With a brief bibliography, it has advice and "practical hints" for new buildings, or alterations to produce more beautiful and satisfactory ones. It is an evidence of the renewed conversation between religion and the arts. The Presbyterian tradition and its modern development has been reviewed by Duane Virgil Fifer, in "Christian Art in the Place and Form of Presbyterian Worship; a Historical Survey of Church Architecture and Ecclesiastical Art from the Standpoint of the Presbyterian Church" (Th.M. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1956, typescript, with an extensive

bibliography). One of the most astonishing evidences of architectural improvement in American Protestantism appears in two volumes on Christian Science churches. Luther Myrick Holt, *Christian Science Church Architecture, Giving Exterior and Interior Views* (Los Angeles, Cal., 1908), illustrated, is arranged by states. Its chief value is in providing a view of the dreary conglomeration of undistinguished styles at the turn of the century—church architecture at its nadir. Charles Draper Faulkner, *Christian Science Church Edifices* (Chicago, 1946 2nd ed.), richly illustrated, reveals the immense increase in the wealth and importance of the group, and the almost incredible melioration of taste since 1908. The predominant note is classical refinement and simplicity.

The beginnings of the American Roman Catholic efforts to promote a more seemly and liturgically correct church architecture are discernible in Edward Joseph Weber, *Catholic Church Buildings, Their Planning and Furnishing* . . . with an Introduction by the Right Reverend John J. Swint . . . Containing upwards of 250 full page and text illustrations (New York and London, c.1927), with pictures, plans, and bibliography. Introductory remarks stress the great improvement in the last twenty-five years, and the requirements for a Catholic church architect. He mentions the growth of artistic interest among the clergy, and discusses all aspects of church building, with a glossary of technical terms, and many pictures of American Roman Catholic churches and their details. Local improvement, with direct episcopal encouragement, is evident in a handsome volume issued by the Brooklyn (Diocese), Diocesan Building Commission: *Building, Past, Present, Future, Diocese of Brooklyn* (Brooklyn, N.Y., c.1936), with pictures and plans. Eugene Augustin Roulin, *Modern Church Architecture,* translated by C. Cornelia Craigie and John A. Southwell [pseud.] (St. Louis, Mo. and London, 1947), with illustrations, plates, and plans, indicates the new departures, especially in Roman Catholic church architecture. One of the superior Roman Catholic aids

is Peter Frederick Anson, *Churches, Their Plan and Furnishings,* illustrated by the Author, revised and edited by Thomas F. Croft-Fraser and H. A. Reinhold (Milwaukee, 1948), with bibliography. This general guide, to be used in English-speaking countries, was written by a former Anglican who became a Roman Catholic monk. Its rather popular and practical treatment is aimed to encourage those in agreement with the liturgical movement, and is based upon wide travel, observation, and reading, and the idea that the function of the church is more important than superficial "beauty." John Berthram O'Connell, *Church Building and Furnishing: the Church's Way; a Study in Liturgical Law* (Notre Dame, Ind., 1956), illustrated, with bibliography, is written from the special viewpoint of liturgical law, but considers practically all phases of construction of a church. Illustrations reveal the high quality of modern Roman Catholic churches in the United States. Architecture is considered incidentally, except as affected by the Church's law. The building and furnishing of the church are in themselves acts of worship.

7. THE SYNAGOGUE. Rachel (Bernstein) Wischnitzer, *Synagogue Architecture in the United States; History and Interpretation* (Philadelphia, 1955), illustrated, with bibliographies, throws much light on contemporary church design. The synagogues illustrated "reveal an extraordinary slice through the geologic layers, as it were, of our architectural heritage." All styles are represented, since the colonial period. The last chapter emphasizes suburban Judaism, and the growth of the idea of the Jewish community center, and a concluding essay reveals the place of the synagogue in the contemporary architectural scene. Peter Blake, ed., *An American Synagogue for Today and Tomorrow; a Guide Book to Synagogue Design and Construction* (New York, 1954), illustrated, represents collaboration by about forty authors and contributors—rabbis, historians, critics, artists, architects, lawyers, and engineers. Written to improve the synagogue, it gives "detailed analysis of every conceivable

aspect of synagogue building." The new architecture is flexible, with an apparent lack of recognizable "style." Desider Holisher, in *The Synagogue and Its People* (New York, 1955), illustrated, and in *The House of God . . .* with 300 photographs by the author and others (New York, 1946) details synagogue architecture and arrangements. He portrays the religious heritage of Jews, the Jewish place of worship, varying styles of architecture, the classic pattern, and new designs, with traditional and modern symbols, and the synagogue as a community center. (See also Volume II of *Religion in American Life,* Donald D. Egbert's illustrated essay "Religious Expression in American Architecture."

III. LITURGICAL ARTS

A. Decoration and Furnishing

A. H. ANDREWS COMPANY, Chicago, *Guide to Church Furnishing and Decoration* (Chicago, 1876), illustrated, is a typical manual of the period, revealing the mass of Victorian "gingerbread" from which the churches have escaped. It has an essay on taste (!), the architecture and furnishing of primitive churches, Gothic church art, symbolism, wood decoration, etc.

The following studies and manuals, in refreshing contrast, reveal the vast melioration of taste since the 1870's. Among the best is one issued by the Institute for Religious and Social Studies, Jewish Theological Seminary of America: *Religious Symbolism,* ed. F. Ernest Johnson (New York, c.1955), including bibliographies. It is a symposium by fourteen Protestant, Roman Catholic, and Jewish authors, and discusses the theological and liturgical aspects, psychology, architecture, dancing, religious drama, and literature. The Protestant essays indicate the acute need of a set of symbols by which a "wholly other" God may be conceived. The awakening of Protestant awareness to such values is

pointed up in a careful study by Thomas Albert Stafford, *Christian Symbolism in the Evangelical Churches; with Definitions of Church Terms and Usages* (New York and Nashville, 1942), with bibliography, and illustrations by the author. He offers a fairly comprehensive survey of the varieties of symbolism employed throughout church history, except those repugnant to Protestant ideas and practice, including some of merely antiquarian interest; and a glossary of church terms and usages. Worth consulting also is his *Within the Chancel* (New York, 1955), on the importance of the chancel in the church structure: a reliable guide to understanding and good taste, including the altar, symbolic lights, monograms, symbols, stained glass, and flags. It indicates the trend toward ritualism, which is penetrating even the traditionally plain Congregational churches, as is seen in Congregational Christian Churches, Arts Guild, *Church Arts*, compiled and edited by Richard H. Ritter, Charles A. Butts, John R. Scotford, and Harold G. Jones (Boston, The Arts Guild, 1944).

The most massive campaign for improvement, aimed to escape from the frequent tawdriness of the nineteenth century, has occurred in the Roman Catholic Church. One of the earlier, superior guides is Edward Joseph Weber, *Catholic Ecclesiology . . . Containing Chapters on the Liturgically Correct Church and Furnishings and Illustrated with Photographs and Drawings of the Author's Work* (Pittsburgh, Pa., 1927), with a bibliography. This is based largely upon the Roman Catholic cathedrals of Wheeling and Pittsburgh, and other churches in West Virginia and Pennsylvania. It illustrates the conscious effort to promote concern for beautiful buildings, now that the pioneer period is over and means are available, and is critical of past and present work. Eugene Augustin Roulin, *Modern Church Architecture . . .* translated by C. Cornelia Craigie and John A. Southwell [pseud.] (St. Louis, Mo. and London, 1947), with illustrations, considers furniture, decoration and orna-

ment, as well as architecture, with special emphasis on contemporary building and adequate design, and proper equipment of the sanctuary. The course of Roman Catholic thought on churchly arts may be traced through many essays, fully illustrated, in *Liturgical Arts; a Quarterly Devoted to the Arts of the Catholic Church* (New York, The Liturgical Arts Society, 1932–1936, 4 vols. in 2). Perhaps the most scholarly treatment of the subject is a series of articles in *Liturgical Arts*, Vol. 20, no. 1 (Nov. 1951); reprinted as *Approaches to Living Christian Art* (New York, 1951), illustrated. These are thoughtful essays by Jacques Maritain, G. Gallois Montbrun, and others, with architectural designs by Jean Labatut and paintings by André Girard. Anton Henze and Theodor Filthaut, *Contemporary Church Art*, translated by Cecily Hastings, edited by Maurice Lavanoux (New York, c.1956), with illustrations, contains essays on "potentialities of modern church art and its position in history," by Henze, and "Church Art and the Liturgy," by Filthaut. The discussion is concerned with construction and decoration, vestments, etc., and interprets twentieth-century art in the light of history. The legal aspect is fully explored in Erwin L. Sadlowski, *Sacred Furnishings of Churches* (Washington, D.C., 1951), with a bibliography.

A brief selection of titles illustrates certain special ecclesiastical arts. The authoritative work on silver is E. Alfred Jones, *The Old Silver of American Churches*, privately printed for the National Society of Colonial Dames of America (Letchworth, Eng., 1913). It is lavishly illustrated with dull-finish photographs, and covers several hundred churches by places, with dates of the founding of churches, indexes of churches by states, donors, and silversmiths, elaborate descriptions of pieces, and a long introduction on church silver. Elizabeth Clifford Neff, *An Anglican Study in Christian Symbolism* (Cleveland, Ohio, 1898) includes *vestments and embroidery*, and considers symbolisms of form, color, numbers, language, action, vestments, needle-

work, and embroidery, and is based on long study of accessible records. This handbook is rare in its time, for little was previously published in the United States for guidance of altar societies and guilds. Georgiana Brown Harbeson, *American Needlework, The History of Decorative Stitchery and Embroidery from the Late 16th to the 20th Century*, illustrated, with photographs and drawings by the author (New York, 1938) has a bibliography. Chapter XXVII, "Religious Needlework," briefly notices work by American women for churches, and the groups formed to preserve the art, and mentions samples of exquisite work, described in considerable detail. Thomas M. Boyd, *Worship in Wood*, illustrations by Harold Smalley (Chicago, Ill., 1927) is one of the few competent books on woodwork in American churches, based upon broad study, and comprises essays on the religious art of the past, and chapters on altars, rails, screens, lecterns, early American churches, and church furnishings.

Some of the finest examples of wood-carving are found in the Spanish missions of the Southwest. Realization of the beauty and significance of this religious folk art appears especially in the growing literature on *santos*—images of saints. The most extensive recent bibliography is E. Boyd, "The Literature of Santos," in *Southwest Review*, Vol. 35, no. 2, drawn from journals or reports of early travelers, historical accounts, and critical papers by artists. His *Saints & Saint Makers of New Mexico* (Santa Fe, 1946), with bibliography and illustrations, was written with the cooperation of Archbishop Gerken of Santa Fe, and is the authoritative book on the subject of New Mexican folk art in religious painting and carving. Mitchell A. Wilder, *Santos; the Religious Folk Art of New Mexico;* text and photographs by Mitchell A. Wilder and Edgar Breitenbach, with a Foreword by Rudolph A. Gerken (Colorado Springs, 1943) has a bibliography. It is a sensitive and scholarly study of a peculiar type of American religious folk art, "part of the oldest record

of Church, State and society existing in the United States." It discusses the historical and artistic background and the type of devotion. Kurt Baer, *Painting and Sculpture at Mission Santa Barbara* (Washington, D.C., 1955), illustrated, has a catalog, and a bibliography. It does not discuss artistic merit, but assembles all possible documentary evidence to assign pieces, and is the most thorough study of the history and art of the mission, with a wealth of notes on Spanish colonial architecture and art.

B. Worship

1. GENERAL STUDIES: PSYCHOLOGY OF WORSHIP. The background of the revival of worship as an art, and of the liturgical sense in modern American churches, is the theme of this section. All the titles listed—particularly those by Vogt, Davies, and Underhill—have been influential in stimulating the revival in the United States. Among the most suggestive lists of authorities on worship in general is Willard L. Sperry and Henry Wilder Foote, comps., "Public Worship," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 35, no. 1 (Oct. 1942), pp. 5–18, with brief notes on reference books. The list includes historical or descriptive works, theory and practice, older liturgies with commentaries, modern liturgies, books on or consisting of prayers, religious symbolism, music and drama, silent worship, worship of children and youth, and a list of selected chapters in books.

The growth of general appreciation of the place of worship in American life may be traced largely to a classic book by John Perham Hylan, *Public Worship; a Study in the Psychology of Religion* (Chicago and London, 1901), with a bibliography of works considered to be of most direct value. This study, written at Harvard University and Clark University in Worcester, was begun under the auspices of the noted psychologist G. Stanley Hall. It was based upon study of about 200 people of various national derivations and re-

ligious faiths to ascertain, as exactly as possible, the essential mental processes of worship and their meaning with regard to the evident contemporary "decline of religion." It is a pioneer study in this field, revealing the immensely important function of religion as a means of adjusting to environment, and of maintaining personal moral responsibility toward it. More or less indebted to it were the authors of the succeeding references. Richard Clarke Cabot, *What Men Live By: Work, Play, Love, Worship* (Boston and New York, 1929) regards worship as one remedy for "broken souls and wounded characters," the others being work, recreation, and affection; and is written for the layman in a most engaging style. Angus Dun, *Not by Bread Alone* (New York and London, c.1942) furnishes an illuminating analysis of worship as "something called out of men by their meetings with God," and stresses God's reality and presence, the fact of Christ, and the social context in which men find God. James Bissett Pratt, *Eternal Values in Religion* (New York, 1950) consists of essays on the psychology and justification of worship, the mystical sense of divine presence, worship and sincerity, knowledge and religious experience. This is an effort to view religion in the whole context of life, discussing morality and religion, instruction and worship, and justifying worship for its own sake. Horton Davies, *Christian Worship, Its Making and Meaning* (New York, c.1957), with a bibliography of studies of worship and on different liturgies, was written for the layman. It is not a history or a study of the philosophy and psychology of worship, but an explanation of its parts, content and relevance to life, intended to promote sympathetic understanding of various rites. Evelyn Underhill, *Worship* (New York, 1957) has had an extensive influence in the United States on the revival of interest in worship, and studies the fundamental characteristics of Christian worship, especially eucharistic action. Descriptive and historical studies illustrate the principles as

embodied in the chief types of cultus, and interpret them in an effort to discover general underlying realities.

The specific relations of worship to the American spirit have inspired a number of studies. Among the earliest and most notable is that of Stanton Coit, *The Soul of America; a Constructive Essay in the Sociology of Religion* (New York, 1914), written from a liberal viewpoint. He considers worship as an expression of the American spirit, part of a way of conserving and developing the nation's spiritual resources, giving to moral principles and social ideals a "sense of reality and urgency." Worship is one way of organizing and giving conscious power to spiritual potencies. One should consult also his *Social Worship: for Use in Families, Schools and Churches* (New York, 1914, 2 vols.), a consideration of social worship in different lands and all historical periods. Worship is viewed as a way to social brotherhood and righteousness. Von Ogden Vogt, *Cult and Culture, a Study of Religion and American Culture* (New York, 1951), with bibliographical references included in "Notes," reviews religion in the context of American culture, as the element that creates and holds it together. The liberal Unitarian author draws heavily upon archaeological and anthropological discoveries, and surveys of contemporary and specifically American culture as seen in various facets, especially art and liturgy, his special fields of interest. The book lacks emphasis upon the distinctive historical expressions of the principal groups and their special ministries, and views religion as a generalized expression. Of special American interest is "Book B," with chapters on the racial, economic, religious, intellectual, and educational "clefts" in American life, which the author sees as dangers to national understanding. One should consult also his *Modern Worship* (New Haven and London, 1927), and his *The Primacy of Worship* (Boston, 1958).

Renewed exploration of the values in worship has led to deeper study of ritual and ritualism, and to a ritualistic trend

in Protestant churches, which has provoked comment and not a little opposition. Frederick Goodrich Henke, *A Study in the Psychology of Ritualism* (Chicago, Ill., 1910), with bibliography, is a critical, scientific study from the psychological viewpoint, to find the laws of origin, development and survival of ritualism. Chapter VII discusses specifically the development of Jewish and Christian ritual, and the Eucharist as a communal rite. Bernard Eugene Meland, *Modern Man's Worship; a Search for Reality in Religion* (New York and London, 1934), illustrated, correlates significant modern developments contributing to the new interest in worship, gives distinctive basis to the religious response, and makes affirmations regarding religious living. The author critically considers Catholic and Protestant liturgical movements in America, Germany, and France. His own position is that of "mystical naturalism," a kind of nature worship, but not nature without God. He points to a recovery of the element of mysticism in worship, a sense of oneness with the creation and God, as an objective reality to integrate lives. Orrin Edgar Klapp, *Ritual and Cult, a Sociological Interpretation* (Washington, 1956) has notes, and a list of selected readings. This background study considers the mistrust of ritual and cult in the modern world, due to secularism, positivism, and Protestantism. He includes lengthy discussion of the nature and function of ritual and its place in modern society—if not religious, then secular and possibly totalitarian.

2. PROTESTANT LITURGICAL REVIVAL. Williston Walker, "The Genesis of the Present Customary Form of Public Worship in the Reformed Non-prelatical Churches of America," in American Society of Church History, *Papers*, 2nd ser., Vol. I, 1913, pp. 79–91, provides an excellent background for the understanding of Anglo-American Protestant worship of the Reformed and Puritan traditions. The best recent study is Horton Davies, *The Worship of the English Puritans* (Westminster, London, 1948), with a bibliography.

He considers the Reformed tradition, and shows its relevance in Christian worship today, to reawaken the interest of Reformed churches in their rich liturgical inheritance. His effort had forerunners nearly a century ago in the studies of the liturgists at the Reformed Mercersburg Seminary in Pennsylvania. That movement is extensively discussed in Scott Francis Brenner, *The Way of Worship* (New York, 1944), tracing its origin to about the middle of the nineteenth century, closely parallel to the Oxford Movement in the Anglican Church. Independent of the English movement, it tended toward the same general ecclesiastical and liturgical conclusions, and was a truly distinctive American religious development. (See Part Five, sect. II, F, *The Mercersburg* [*Reformed*] *Theology.*) A typical expression of its liturgical spirit is *A Liturgy: Or Order of Christian Worship,* prepared and published by the direction and for the use of the German Reformed Church in the United States of America (Philadelphia, 1858). Its later title is *The Order of Worship for the Reformed Church in the United States.* The general trend toward liturgical services is reflected also in a sister church, the Presbyterian: David Rodney Bluhm, "Trends of Worship Reflected in the Three Editions of the Book of Common Worship of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America" (Dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1956; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 19,614; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 17 (1957), no. 1, p. 178. This remarks on the increasing concern for liturgy that inspired the first publication of the book in 1906, and the social and religious influences affecting the later editions of 1932 and 1946, with special attention to the influences of Neo-Orthodoxy and the Ecumenical Movement, and to common liturgical ground between the Presbyterian and Episcopal churches.

This steady progress toward a rethinking and revision of Protestant worship is evidenced by the flood of studies since the beginning of religious revival in the 1930's. Among the

earliest and most influential is George Walter Fiske, *The Recovery of Worship; a Study of the Crucial Problem of the Protestant Churches* (New York, 1931), with a selected bibliography. He sees the chief problem of Protestant churches as the development of a more convincing, compelling, satisfying worship, in place of pulpit oratory, revivals, music, social benevolence, and intellectualism as efforts to "save the church." A deeper sense of God's presence and power is needed; but he does not lose sight of the value of preaching and ethical teaching. Genuine worship would bring greater preaching, appreciation of the Bible, and better living. Andrew Watterson Blackwood, *The Fine Art of Public Worship* (Nashville, c.1939), with a bibliography, is based upon a conviction that "the time has come for a revival of public worship as the finest of the fine arts." The young, especially, are irritated by lack of inspiration in worship. The meaning, leadership, and function of worship are reviewed from a Reformed Protestant viewpoint, with an excellent chapter on "The Supremacy of the Lord's Supper." This book would have been almost impossible in the Protestant setting of twenty years before. The significance of worship in Christian reunion is explored by Scott Francis Brenner, *The Way of Worship, a Study in Ecumenical Recovery*, Introduction by John R. Mott (New York, 1944), with a bibliography. The essay is an outgrowth of meetings of clergymen of various communions to study liturgy. The introduction stresses the function of a common liturgy in drawing people together, and Brenner emphasizes the ecumenical appeal of eucharistic worship, and the preservation of valuable and effective traditions in various groups. Appendix III is an interesting survey of the Mercersburg Movement. Clarice Margurette Bowman, *Restoring Worship* (New York, 1951) expresses a conviction that something is lacking in American Protestant worship. God, not the minister, comes first, and people should be trained for worship with special emphasis upon children and youth, and upon fellow-

ship in prayer. There are significant remarks on the disappointment of some seeking people when they attend Protestant worship. Clarence Russell Skinner, *Worship and the Well-Ordered Life* (Boston, Universalist Historical Society, 1955) provides more evidence of the increasing concern with worship among Anglo-American Protestants. The church is a *community* held together by worship. The author, a noted Universalist minister, represents the maturity of Universalist faith, as a great liberal and social-gospel preacher. Howard G. Hageman, "The Liturgical Revival," in *Theology Today*, Vol. 6, no. 4 (Jan. 1950), pp. 490–505, reviews the recent literature, and mentions the amazing unanimity of the movement based upon a common norm of Christian worship. He criticizes superficial, merely decorative liturgies, and stresses content, corporate worship, and the relation between liturgy and doctrine. All Christian worship is basically sacramental; not a lecture, but a meeting with eternity. Certain dangers are indicated by Ilion Tingnal Jones in *A Historical Approach to Evangelical Worship* (Nashville, 1954). He criticizes the Protestant trend toward ritual and liturgy as dangerous and backward-looking, and stresses conflict between *priestly* and *prophetic* religion, and the effort to develop an "evangelical cultus" in communion, symbolism, worship materials, and order of service.

a. Protestant Worship Manuals. These volumes reflect the general revival of interest in the improvement of worship, and in making it more real to the people. They are valuable especially for their bibliographies of books and manuals. Arthur Stephen Hoyt, *Public Worship for Non-liturgical Churches* (New York, 1911), with a list of "Books on Worship," was aimed to deepen the age's devotional life by reverence, adoration, and praise. The writer is conscious of something lacking in Protestant worship, and of the need to cultivate a social spirit by more popular participation, and reveals the Protestant yearning for less individualism and more corporate activity. Samuel Arthur Devan, *Ascent to*

Zion, illustrations by George F. Ketcham, Jr. (New York, 1942) has a bibliography of "useful modern books on worship," and discusses ritual in contrast to free worship, and the need of a revival of corporate devotion, which is emphasized by the stresses of the age. He insists upon the restoration of Communion to its primitive primacy and frequency. Henry Sloane Coffin, *The Public Worship of God, A Service Book* (Philadelphia, 1946), with a selected bibliography, is a manual for all concerned in conducting public services, especially for those in the Reformed tradition, and reviews the subject from many angles. The study shows a strong sense of historical background, and is sensitive to the needs of contemporary congregations. George Percy Hedley, *Christian Worship, Some Meanings and Means* (New York, 1953) traces the history of each aspect of Protestant worship, explaining its philosophy and practice, and suggesting reverent and creative ways to use traditional materials in music, preaching, occasional services, family worship, and private devotions. This very readable book leans to Episcopalian liturgical practices, and appeals to the layman. Edward Krusen Ziegler, *Rural People at Worship* (New York, Agricultural Missions, Inc., 1943) includes music, worship materials and programs, and emphasizes the ecumenical movement. There are two companion volumes: *A Book of Worship for Village Churches* (1939), and *Country Altars* (1942). These include services for various rural festivals, such as rogation Sunday, and various other celebrations appropriate to country living, as well as sacramental services. Herbert Herman Henry Wintermeyer, *Rural Worship* (Philadelphia and St. Louis, 1947), illustrated, has a bibliography, "The Worship Library." Alice Anderson Bays, *Worship Programs in the Fine Arts for Young People* (Nashville, c.1940), with bibliographical references in the notes, comprises thirty-five services centered in painting, sculpture, and other art forms, and indicates the growing interest in worship as an art. Margaret Palmer Fisk, *The*

Art of the Rhythmic Choir; Worship through Symbolic Movement, illustrated by Lois-Louise Hines (New York, 1950) has a bibliography, which significantly contains no title on dancing in American churches. Symbolic movement may be used as a medium for interpreting religion, not as a cult, but in any church. A historical review of the art in churches has a chapter on groups using it, including some in America.

b. Anglican Liturgical Movement. Louis Pope Gratacap, *Philosophy of Ritual; Apologia pro Ritu* (New York, 1887), with bibliography in the footnotes, was an early outgrowth of the mid-nineteenth century "ritualistic controversy" in the Anglican Church. It was intended to present a connected, non-technical view of the case for ritual, and to discover "underlying principles and inherent concordances in nature which justify and enforce it." Surprisingly sophisticated for its time, it includes the place of art in ritualism. The present trends of thought on liturgy and ritual in the American Episcopal Church are expounded by two authoritative studies of the *Book of Common Prayer*. Edward Lambe Parsons and Bayard Hale Jones, *The American Prayer Book; its Origins and Principles* (New York, 1937), written by experts, is a standard exposition of the American Episcopal liturgy. It should be used with John Wallace Suter and George Julius Cleaveland, *The American Book of Common Prayer; its Origin and Development* (New York, 1949), with a bibliography. This surveys the historical background from the Prayer Book of 1549, the character and influence of the Prayer Book and its contemporary value; and for all Protestants interprets the significance of the American Prayer Book.

By far the highest authorities on the American Prayer Book are the studies by Massey Hamilton Shepherd. His *The Living Liturgy* (New York, 1946) emphasizes the importance of liturgy in the work of the church in such a way as to appeal to Protestants in general, and gives new and

fresh meaning to usages that often are taken for granted, without adequate understanding. *The Worship of the Church* (Greenwich, Conn., 1952), with a bibliography, undoubtedly is the best work on the Anglican liturgy by an American. It should be used with his *The Oxford American Prayer Book Commentary* (New York, 1950), and with his *The Liturgical Movement and the Prayer Book* (Evanston, Ill., 1946), a very important lecture. It surveys the history of the Prayer Book from its origin in 1549, the Scottish liturgical renaissance of the eighteenth century, and its influence upon the American Prayer Book, also the flowering of liturgical studies during the English Oxford Movement, and its effects in the American revisions of 1892 and 1928. There are valuable remarks on the influence of the modern liturgical movement upon the American Church, its philosophy and theological background, and the revival of the central position of the Eucharist. Shepherd has compiled a most useful bibliography of writings on the Prayer Book: "The Book of Common Prayer: 1549–1949," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin,* Vol. 41, no. 3 (Apr. 1949), pp. 4–6, with annotations, including texts and reference works, general books on Christian worship, and special studies. The eucharistic emphasis is clarified in W. Norman Pittenger, *The Christian Sacrifice, A Study of the Eucharist in the Life of the Christian Church* (New York, 1951). This is an exposition of the natural development of the eucharistic idea, the nature of the church in which the sacrifice occurs, the historical origins of the rite, and its theological aspect, reflecting the Church's faith and life. (See also Part Two, sect. IV, B, 1, c, *Low and High Church.*)

c. Lutheran Liturgical Revival. A thorough study of Lutheran liturgics, with criticism of current general Protestant practice, is in Harold Aberley Dunkelberger, "Symbols in the Service: A Study of Symbolic Functions of Liturgy in American Lutheranism" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1950; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich.,

1950, pub. no. 2106; *Microfilm Abstracts*, Vol. 11 (1951), no. 1, pp. 182–183). The Common Service is studied to suggest how the symbols work in their context, and to define liturgical symbolism as developed from structure and function. The shift from visual to verbal emphasis in Protestant liturgy has weakened the dynamic hold of most symbols upon worshipers. Lutheran effort to promote clearer understanding and more intelligent use of liturgy is illustrated by the proceedings of the Liturgical Institute, Valparaiso University, 1949, *Essays Presented at the First Liturgical Institute*, June 7th, 8th, and 9th, 1949 (Valparaiso, 1950), with bibliographies. These essays consider theological interpretation of form and tradition in worship, the pastor's part in the liturgy, the Eucharistic liturgy, and music, and offer a complete discussion from the conservative Lutheran viewpoint. Similar study in the Missouri Synod is available in *Pro Ecclesia Lutherana* (Hoboken, N.J., published by the Liturgical Society of Saint James, December 1933). The society originated about 1925, and held conferences to discuss worship and Lutheran liturgical traditions, attempting to improve worship by liturgical forms, and to counteract the general Protestant indifference to them.

3. ROMAN CATHOLIC LITURGICAL REVIVAL. The general history of the liturgical movement, for improvement of worship in the Roman Catholic Church, has been thoroughly covered in Paul B. Marx, *Virgil Michel and the Liturgical Movement* (Collegeville, Minn., 1957), which has bibliography in the notes to chapters, a bibliography of Michel, and a bibliographical essay. It narrates the early course of the movement, and discusses its relation to Catholic life, religious education, culture, and social and philosophical thought, and traces Michel's wide influence until his death in 1938. This ranks with the works of Ellard (*q.v.*) as an authority on the liturgical renaissance in America. Another authoritative exposition, by a pioneer in the revival, is Dom Gregory Dix, *The Shape of the Liturgy* (Westminster,

1945), which has had an immense influence upon the Roman Catholic liturgical movement in English-speaking countries. Protestant appreciation of the revival probably has not been better expressed than by Ernest Benjamin Koenker, in *The Liturgical Renaissance in the Roman Catholic Church* (Chicago, 1954). He notices the movement's spread to the Anglican and Protestant churches, and considers it as the most promising evidence of new life in the Roman communion. He is concerned with the central issue of church life, the God-man relation, mediated in sacramental life; and discusses the organic concept of the church, the general priesthood, and the penetration of society by the church's message, culture, and spirituality. The recent actual effects of the movement are surveyed in Koenker's "Objectives and Achievements of the Liturgical Movement in the Roman Catholic Church Since World War II," in *Church History*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (June 1951), pp. 14–27, with bibliography in notes. He stresses the theological meaning, and the fact that it is interested not in new practices, but in restoring old meaning to worship through the dialog Mass, increasing use of the vernacular, the restoration of pure Gregorian chant, and congregational singing.

The aims of the revival in the United States may be illustrated by a brief selection of writings by liturgical scholars. Robert Joseph Giguere, *The Social Value of Public Worship According to Thomistic Principles* (Washington, 1950), with bibliography, thoroughly reviews the present trends in American worship, the decline due to religious illiteracy and popular religious philosophy, and the separation of religion from life. A long discussion of the nature of worship and its bases emphasizes its social character and its value in the ordering of life. Louis Bouyer, *Liturgical Piety* (Notre Dame, Ind., 1955), with bibliographical footnotes, treats the theological background of the liturgy, but does not present a detailed history of the Mass or treat vestments or furnishings. An appendix, "On Liturgical Studies," reviews

the literature since 1609. This volume provides the basis for liturgical reform in the United States, together with William J. O'Shea, *The Worship of the Church; a Companion to Liturgical Studies* (Westminster, Md., 1957), illustrated, by a leader of the movement. He strives to make people really conscious of the meaning of the liturgy, and mentions the escape of the revival from merely academic circles. It is becoming an apostolate to Christianize and redeem the world.

Perhaps the most widely influential writer on American participation in the liturgical revival, and on its effect in actual parochial practices, is Gerald Ellard. His *Men at Work at Worship; America Joins the Liturgical Movement,* with a preface by the Most Reverend John G. Murray (New York, 1940), with illustrations and a bibliography, is written for the layman in a popular lecture style. It discusses popular participation and the social and educational implications of worship. Communal social life and harmony depend upon communal prayer, looking toward a more corporate-minded and socially responsible church. In "The Liturgical Movement in Catholic Circles," in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 17, no. 3 (Summer, 1948), pp. 370–381, with bibliography in footnotes, he reviews the fifty years of growing concern for lay participation, and points out a basic connection with the Church's social concern. Social order is to be achieved in and through the Mass. His philosophy of the Mass, through which the new interpretation of the liturgy should be realized, is expounded in three widely read works. *The Dialog Mass, A Book for Priests and Teachers of Religion,* with preface by the Most Rev. Michael J. Curley, D.D., Archbishop of Baltimore and Washington (New York, 1942) has bibliographical footnotes. The keynote is the widespread recognition of the function of the dialog Mass in renewing Christian spirit through lay participation, and the cooperation of priest, choir, and people. There are notes on the progress of the movement in dioceses, especially in the

Middle West, and the activities of bishops in promoting it. *The Mass of the Future* (Milwaukee, 1948) has bibliographies of books and articles and of papal directives, and photographs illustrating liturgical Masses. The ideal is to obviate passivity and "personalism," and to make worship corporate, social, and active, not by making changes in the liturgy, but by changing people through active participation. His *The Mass in Transition* (Milwaukee, 1956), with bibliographies, contains papal documents and other relevent statements, and is by far his most complete work on the liturgical movement and its progress. The topics include simpler rubrics, reforms in the Mass, the lay priesthood, architecture suited to the liturgy, vernacular missals, choral speaking, and popular prayer. A chapter on non-Catholic worship notices the Protestant liturgical revival, and has valuable bibliographical sources on Protestant worship. John L. Murphy, *The Mass and Liturgical Reform* (Milwaukee, 1956), with bibliographical footnotes, is intended to arouse interest in the American Church, which is criticized for being hitherto "somewhat negligent" of the liturgical movement. There is a discussion of reform in Europe, together with particular suggestions for improvement, including Mass in the vernacular. William R. Bonniwell, *Interpreting the Sunday Mass* (New York, 1949) attempts to bring the intelligent use of the Roman missal within reach of the average layman—the aim of the liturgical movement—with a brief sketch of each variable part of the Mass and its meaning in the modern missal.

IV. MUSIC

THE purpose of this section is to explore the relation of religion to music in the development of American culture. It is intended to suggest the influence of religion on the general musical culture of the United States, including both secular and sacred music. Since Puritan and Calvinistic influences in

the colonial period were important in the shaping of American religious development, a section is devoted to the colonial period, with special attention to the influence of Puritanism on music and the controversy about it. Other intentions of this section are to study American religious music from the standpoint of what it reveals about American religious development; and the significance of religion in American "folk culture," as it appears in the religious music of both white and Negro people, especially in the Southern States. (See Leonard W. Ellinwood's essay, "Religious Music in America," in Volume II of this series.)

A. General References

Walter E. Buszin, Theodore M. Finney, and Donald M. McCorkle, eds., have outlined the bibliographical sources in their *A Bibliography on Music and the Church,* Prepared for the Commission on Music, Dept. of Worship and the Arts, National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A. (New York, August, 1958). This includes encyclopedias and dictionaries, general histories, historical and general works on church music, Christian hymnody, companions and handbooks to hymnals, chanting and plainchant, church music in practice, instruments, particularly the organ; choir, and so on. A most valuable guide to special studies, including some on church music, is a compilation by the Joint Committee of the Music Teachers National Association and the American Musicological Society: *Doctoral Dissertations in Musicology, A List* (Denton, Tex., 1952), which comprises both completed and uncompleted theses, listed by institutions, with author and subject indexes. The supplement (1953–1954) was compiled by Helen Hewitt.

There are many general reviews of religious music, which provide the background for more detailed studies of the specific role of music in American religious life. Edward Dickinson, *Music in the History of the Western Church*

(New York, 1902), with bibliography, discusses music in the Catholic liturgy, the rise of Lutheran hymnody and of the German cantata and "passion," the music of the Church of England, congregational song in England and America, and problems in American church music. Waldo Selden Pratt, *Musical Ministries in the Church; Studies in the History, Theory and Administration of Sacred Music* (New York and London, 4th ed., enl.) has a valuable bibliography on church music in general, hymns and hymn-writers, and American church hymnals since 1880. The general remarks include a brief history of English hymnody and criticism of current practices, intended to raise music from general pastoral neglect. Stanley Armstrong Hunter, ed., *Music and Religion,* Introduction by Clarence Dickinson (New York and Cincinnati, 1930) consists of sermons by ministers of various communions on the value of music in worship. This is one of the early evidences of the revival of interest in worship and the part of music in it. Its purpose is to enhance appreciation of the heritage of hymnody and to improve sadly neglected congregational singing. Winfred Douglas, *Church Music in History and Practice* (New York, 1937), by an Episcopal clergyman, is an earnest and serious even if not very profound study. Archibald Thompson Davison, *Church Music, Illusion and Reality* (Cambridge, 1952) generally discusses its nature and purpose, with learned commentary, and stimulating remarks on contemporary practice in Protestant churches. A stimulating discussion of all phases of music in church life, for the layman, is Austin C. Lovelace and William C. Rice, *Music and Worship in the Church* (New York, Nashville, 1960), with a bibliography.

B. American Religious Music: General

Waldo Selden Pratt, *American Music and Musicians* (Philadelphia, 1920) has highly valuable references to church music, and bibliographies of hymnbooks and tunebooks.

John Tasker Howard, *Our American Music: Three Hundred Years of It* (New York, 1946, 3rd ed., rev.), with bibliography, includes religious music; and while not the best history possible, is practically the only one to date, considered a classic. Herbert W. Schneider, *Religion in 20th Century America* (Cambridge, 1952) discusses recent significant developments in religious music, in the context of the revolutionary changes in American religious habits, ideas, and institutions, and is a stimulating book for the general reader.

Although they are now much outdated and superseded by recent studies, three early histories of American religious music are still of interest as pioneer efforts, with some material not elsewhere available. Nathaniel Duren Gould, *Church Music in America, Comprising Its History and Its Peculiarities at Different Periods, with Cursory Remarks on its Legitimate Use and its Abuse, with Notices of the Schools, Composers, Teachers, and Societies* (Boston, 1853) lists American collections of sacred music for schools and churches since 1810, and is one of the earliest attempts to compile a comprehensive history. It deplores the lack of congregational singing and the very low level of taste and performance. Richard Storrs Willis, *Our Church Music; a Book for Pastors and People* (New York, 1856) is one of the earlier and better general discourses, evidently written with an intention of improving the product. Henry Mason Brooks, *Olden-time Music; a Compilation from Newspapers and Books* (Boston, 1888) is a miscellany, not well arranged but interesting, an example of the research spadework that needs to be done for a really detailed history. Leonard Webster Ellinwood, *The History of American Church Music* (New York, 1953) includes notes and a bibliography, music, biographies of American church musicians (mostly still living), and portraits, and is the best modern authority. It surveys the colonial era, the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and the contemporary field. With it should be used his

English Influences in American Church Music (Taunton? Eng., 1954), first published in the Royal Musical Association, *Proceedings*, 80th sess., 1953/54. This emphasizes the debt of modern American church music to English composers, and briefly reviews the colonial period, with notes on early organs, early English musicians, the immense influence of the Oxford Movement in raising the musical standard, and its spread to non-Anglican churches.

Special phases of religious music may be approached through a selection of special studies, which present leads to further bibliography. Allen P. Britten and Irving Lowens, "Unlocated Titles in Early Sacred American Music," in *Music Library Association Notes*, Vol. 11, no. 1 (Dec. 1953), pp. 38ff., is good especially for anthems. Ralph McVety Kent, "A Study of Oratorios and Sacred Cantatas Composed in America before 1900" (Dissertation, State University of Iowa; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1954), pub. no. 9583; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 14 (1954), no. 10, p. 1757) has a valuable bibliography. The early history of choral music is reviewed extensively by Henry Edward Krehbiel, *Notes on the Cultivation of Choral Music and the Oratorio Society of New York* (New York, 1884). Thomas Hastings, *The History of Forty Choirs* (New York, 1854) is one of the earliest attempts at such a work, and is amateurish and not historical, with familiar and random remarks by a composer and church musician. Edwin Hall Pierce, "The Rise and Fall of the 'Fugue Tune' in America," in *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 16, no. 2 (April 1930), pp. 214–228, is a general history of a type that was formerly much used in religious singing. Irving Lowens, "The Origins of the American Fuging Tune," in *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, Vol. 6, no. 1 (Spring 1953), pp. 43–52, gives the credit for its popularity to the American composer, William Billings. Frank Johnson Metcalf, "History of Sacred Music in the District of Columbia," in *Columbia Historical Society Records*, Vol. 28 (1926), pp. 175–202,

generally reviews composers and compilers of sacred music and their works, to the early twentieth century, with some illustrations, and is an example of the kind of local studies of which there are too few. Paul Allwardt, "Sacred Music in New York City, 1800–1850" (Thesis, Union Theological Seminary, New York City) is a tolerably competent study, and has a bibliography and "Musical Examples." A microfilm copy of the typescript is available. Works Progress Administration, Northern California, San Francisco, "History of Music in San Francisco Series, Vol. 1, Music of the Gold Rush Era" (San Francisco, 1939), typewritten, has some material on the contemporary church music.

Aside from the standard dictionaries of music and musicians, there are few authorities on composers and compilers. The most thorough work, to its date, is Frank Johnson Metcalf, *American Writers and Compilers of Sacred Music* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1925), which includes about ninety tune composers, beginning with the Rev. John Tufts in the early eighteenth century; and has notes on the revivalist composers and camp-meeting music. It includes nearly all the composers before 1800. Robert G. McCutchan, "American Church Music Composers of the Early Nineteenth Century," in *Church History*, Vol. 2, no. 3 (Sept. 1933), pp. 139–151, fills some gaps in Metcalf's work. Irving Lowens, "Daniel Read's World; The Letters of an Early American Composer," in *Music Library Association Notes*, 2nd ser., Vol. 9, no. 2 (March 1952), pp. 233–248, is a biographical glimpse of a pioneer who was interested in church music and psalmody, a promoter of singing schools, and a prolific publisher. Frederic E. J. Lloyd, comp., *Lloyd's Church Musicians Directory, The Blue Book of Church Musicians in America* (Chicago, 1910), Vol. 1, no other vols. published, is the most complete compilation for the early twentieth century.

I. SPANISH AND FRENCH MISSION MUSIC. Until fairly recently, historians of religious music in the United States have

paid only passing attention to its cultivation in the Spanish missions of the Southwest, from Texas to California. Since about 1920 a series of special studies has revealed the long-forgotten work of Spanish padres who introduced Catholic liturgy and music to their Indian converts, and began a tradition of religious folk music and drama that has survived to the present day.

Gilbert Chase, *Guide to Latin-American Music* (Washington, D.C., Music Division, Library of Congress, 1945) is a bibliography, including works on early Spanish mission music and religious folk theatre, with introductory remarks. Lota M. Spell, "The First Teacher of European Music in North America," in *Catholic Historical Review*, new ser., Vol. 2, no. 3 (Oct. 1922), pp. 372–378, narrates the life and work of the Mexican, Pedro de Gante, who started a tradition of music that eventually pentrated the Southwest through the Spanish missions. Lillie Terrell Shaver, "Spanish Mission Music," in Music Teachers National Association, *Papers and Proceedings*, 13th ser. (Hartford, Conn., The Association, 1919), pp. 204–208, has notes on the story of Pedro de Gante, and on the masses, vespers, and plainsong used in the missions. Anna Blanche McGill, "Old Mission Music," in *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 24, no. 2 (Apr. 1938), pp. 186–193, furnishes a general survey of the subject. A thorough study is that of Owen DaSilva, O.F.M., ed., *Mission Music of California, A Collection of Old California Hymns and Masses* (Los Angeles, 1941), by the sometime professor of music at St. Anthony's Seminary, Santa Barbara, Calif. It contains much music, and has references to the location of music, remarks about the style of mission music, a list of padre musicians, and a large bibliography. Many references are found in Charles Anthony (Father Zephyrin) Engelhardt, *Missions and Missionaries of California: San Diego Mission* (San Francisco, 1920); *Mission San Juan Bautista, A School of Church Music* (Santa Barbara, Calif., Mission Santa Barbara, 1931), Appendix F, "Church Music

at the Missions," largely nineteenth century; *Mission Santa Ines, Virgen y Martir, and its Ecclesiastical Seminary* (Santa Barbara, Calif., Mission Santa Barbara, 1932), Appendix E, "Singing at Divine Service": titles of hymns, mention of a famous Spanish Peruvian singer there, and music used. Alfred Robinson, *Life in California* (New York, 1846) has references to music at the missions; and Hubert Howe Bancroft, *California Pastoral* (San Francisco, 1888) has references to mission music, and a discussion of a Nativity play, with the music. Sister Joan of Arc, *Catholic Music and Musicians in Texas* (San Antonio, Texas, Our Lady of the Lake College, 1936) contains examples of music used in the missions. Lota M. Spell, *Music in Texas, a Survey of Cultural Progress* (Austin, Texas, 1936) includes notes on the early church music, and on the organs. Her "Music Teaching in New Mexico in the 17th Century," in *New Mexico Historical Review*, Vol. 2, no. 1 (Jan. 1927), pp. 27–36, a serious and scholarly example of research, mentions the first music teachers in America, and organs in New Mexico. Dorothy L. Pillsbury, "Christmas at San Felipe," in *Cathedral Age*, Vol. 26, no. 4 (Christmas, 1951), pp. 22–23, describes the Nativity play and music at a pueblo in New Mexico between Albuquerque and Santa Fe, and mentions Cristobal de Quiñones, the first music teacher between 1598 and 1604. Lota M. Spell, "Music in New France in the Seventeenth Century," in *Canadian Historical Review*, Vol. 8, no. 2 (June 1927), pp. 119–131, an accurate study, with exact references, is founded largely upon the "Jesuit Relations," and mentions the music brought by the missionaries who penetrated the Middle West.

2. ANGLO-AMERICAN COLONIAL MUSIC. The most detailed scholarly studies of American colonial church music are two doctoral dissertations. The first, by the well-known authority Cyclone Covey, is "Religion and Music in Colonial America" (Stanford University, 1949, reference in *Doctoral Dissertations in Musicology*, Denton, Texas, 1952, p. 40). The later

colonial period is reviewed in great detail by Sister Hermana Maurer, "The Musical Life of Colonial America in the Eighteenth Century" (Ohio State University, 1950, reference in *Doctoral Dissertations in Musicology*, Denton, Texas, 1952, p. 40). Oscar George Theodore Sonneck, *Francis Hopkinson, the First American Poet-Composer, and James Lyon, Patriot, Preacher, Psalmodist, Two Studies in Early American Music* (Washington, D.C., 1905) includes extensive remarks on their noteworthy contributions to religious music in the eighteenth-century colonial period. Distinctive gifts to colonial religious music must be ascribed to the New England Puritans. This sometimes unrecognized fact is emphasized by Percy Alfred Scholes, in *The Puritans and Music in England and New England; a Contribution to the Cultural History of Two Nations* (London and Oxford, 1934), with bibliography. This very controversial work, regarding the effects of Puritanism upon music, was written to combat the long-accepted idea that the seventeenth century Puritans were hostile to music. Scholes succeeds in refuting the erroneous assumption, by research in "innumerable obscure documents." His "The Truth About the New England Puritans and Music," in *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 19, no. 1 (Jan., 1933), pp. 1–17, with bibliography in the footnotes, also combats the prevalent notion that Puritans hated and forbade music. He found no enactment against music as such, and presents evidence of their taking interest in it (and in dancing) for granted. Waldo Selden Pratt, "The Earliest New England Music," in *Proceedings of the Unitarian Historical Society*, Vol. 1, part 2 (1928), pp. 28–47, with illustrations of psalm tunes, underlines the fact that lengthy psalm-singing, rich in emotional and spiritual content, was a deep worship experience, "fellowship with things divine and eternal"; spirit, not technical finish, was the intention.

3. PENNSYLVANIA GERMAN MUSIC. By far the most scholarly and authoritative treatise on the distinctive character and influence of the "Pennsylvania Dutch" religious music is one

published by the Pennsylvania branch of the National Society of the Colonial Dames of America: *Church Music and Musical Life in Pennsylvania in the Eighteenth Century,* Prepared by the Committee on Historical Research (Philadelphia, printed for the Society, 1926–47, 3 vols. in 4), richly illustrated and with a bibliography in each volume. This is the first effort to collect and illustrate the music of the Pennsylvania colonists. It indicates the gradual awakening of talent, the coming of professional musicians, and the course of musical influences. The material was gathered from histories, diarists, and antiquarians, and includes Swedish Lutheran, German sectarian, Anglican, Welsh, Reformed, Roman Catholic, and Jewish music. Robert Rutherford Drummond, *Early German Music in Philadelphia* (New York, 1910) has some notes on sacred music. The broadening and enriching influence of the Moravians has been completely reviewed by Hans Theodore David, in "Musical Life in the Pennsylvania Settlements of the Unitas Fratrum . . . ," in Moravian Historical Society, Nazareth, Pa., *Transactions* (Bethlehem, Pa.), Vol. 13 (1942), pp. 19–58, with bibliographical footnotes. This is a general sketch of the history, as seen in musical material rather than literary sources. It surveys the religious and political background in Europe; musical culture in Bohemia; beginnings in Pennsylvania; early musicians and composers and their works and influence into the early nineteenth century; and the merging of Moravian musical activity into the general American current. Donald M. McCorkle, "The Moravian Contribution to American Music," in Music Library Association, *Notes,* 2nd ser., Vol. 13, no. 4 (Sept. 1956), pp. 597–606, is a study by an authority, on activities in the period 1740–1840. Ruth Holmes (Scott) Bird covers approximately the same period in greater detail, in "Music among the Moravians, Bethlehem, Pennsylvania, 1741–1816" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Rochester, Eastman School of Music, 1956; copy available in New York Public Library; microcard ML3172), with a bibliography

and examples of music. Another detailed and scholarly study is Rufus A. Grider, *Historical Notes on Music in Bethlehem, Pa. (From 1741–1871)*, reprinted from the original ed. of 1873, with a foreword by Donald M. McCorkle (Winston-Salem, N.C., 1957, Moravian Music Foundation Publications, no. 4). Raymond Walters, *The Bethlehem Bach Choir; a History and a Critical Compendium . . . Silver Anniversary Edition* (Boston and New York, 1923) describes the nationally famous organization that represents the culmination of over two centuries of cultivation of the Moravian musical idiom.

There are extensive observations on the religious music of the smaller groups in Julius Friedrich Sachse, *The German Sectarians of Pennsylvania, 1742–1800* (Philadelphia, 1900), the exhaustive standard work on these groups. And his *The Music of the Ephrata Cloister* (Lancaster [Pa.], Printed for the Author, 1903), illustrated, is one of the very few scholarly works on a peculiar but influential type of spiritual music cultivated by the German Baptist Brethren of Pennsylvania in the first half of the eighteenth century. It was based upon the harmonic system of their leader, Conrad Beissel, especially his "Dissertation on Harmony"; and this essay makes use of the original score and tune books of the cloister. Lamech and Agrippa, *Chronicon Ephratense* [in German] (Ephrata, Pa., 1786, English translation, Lancaster, 1889) has observations on the development of music at the Kloster in Ephrata. George Pullen Jackson, "The Strange Music of the Old Order Amish," in *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 31, no. 3 (July 1945), pp. 275–288, generally reviews their musical tradition since the period of the Reformation, with a discussion of musical books. Albert G. Hess, "Observations on the 'Lamenting Voice of the Hidden Love'" in *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, Vol. 5, no. 3 (Fall 1952), pp. 211–223, discusses a typical German Pietist music manuscript. Donald McCorkle, "John Antes, 'American Dilettante,'" in *Musical Quarterly*, Vol.

42, no. 4 (Oct. 1956), pp. 486–499, estimates a German-American composer of church music, working in the European style. (See also Part Two, sect. v, c, 1, *German Sects.*)

4. DENOMINATIONAL. A general survey and criticism of Protestant taste and practice is voiced in Archibald Thompson Davison's *Protestant Church Music in America* (Boston, c.1933), with illustrations and brief selections of various types of music. This is an opinionated and controversial but stimulating discussion of faults, by an avowed reformer opposed to the ideas of many Episcopalians and evangelicals. Robert Stevenson, *Patterns of Protestant Church Music* (Durham, N.C., 1953), with bibliography, deals largely with the Calvinistic tradition, and covers important phases from Luther's influence to Sankey and "gospel hymnody." Although factual, scholarly, and analytical, this is not a book for specialists only, but also for church musicians and the clergy and laity in general.

A good brief summation of the contribution of the Episcopal Church is Edward N. West's "History and Development of Music in the American Church," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 14, no. 1 (Mar. 1945), pp. 15–37. This essay extends from the early colonies to the revised *Hymnal* of 1940, has many useful references in the footnotes, and indicates the general trends. There is no general history of the rise and development of choral music in the American Episcopal Church. The subject, however, is fairly well covered to the early twentieth century, in a few special studies, which emphasize the influence of New York parish choirs. Valuable observations on the earlier period are given by Christopher W. Knauff, *Doctor Tucker, Priest-Musician, A Sketch Which Concerns the Doings of the Rev. John Ireland Tucker, S.T.D., Including a Brief Converse about the Rise and Progress of Church Music in America* (New York, 1897). He included a large amount of information on the introduction of choral music into Episcopal churches. Arthur Henry Messiter, *A History of the Choir*

and Music of Trinity Church, New York, from its Organization, to the Year 1897 (New York, 1906) provides a very complete account, and is one of the very few parochial histories devoted solely to music. Morgan Dix, *A History of the Parish of Trinity Church in the City of New York*, part IV (New York, 1906) has extensive and reliable information on music in the parish, which had a wide influence upon Episcopal church music in America. William Rhinelander Stewart, *Grace Church and Old New York* (New York, 1924) includes notes on the music of a parish generally celebrated for attention to its choir.

Abdel Ross Wentz, in his *A Basic History of Lutheranism in America* (Philadelphia, 1955) includes some notes on Lutheran church music in various branches of the communion. Contemporary practice and ideals are reviewed in Henry E. Horn, *O Sing unto the Lord; Music in the Lutheran Church* (Philadelphia, 1956), illustrated. The liturgical movement in American Lutheranism has been accompanied by a strenuous and well-informed effort to improve the musical setting of the services. The character of this campaign is definitely clarified in Theodore Hoelty-Nickel, ed., *The Musical Heritage of the Church* (Valparaiso, 1946?). This is a collection of essays read at the Second Lutheran Church Music Conference at Valparaiso University, Indiana, in 1945. E. Buszin discusses "the doctrine of the universal priesthood and its influence upon the liturgies and music of the Lutheran Church," and J. E. Sanderson considers various aspects, problems, and attitudes in church music.

Music has exerted a powerful influence in creating a sense of community in all religious groups. This is true especially of the sectarian and "peculiar people" religions, like the Mormons (Latter Day Saints) and the Shakers. In these music has been a social as well as a spiritual bond. For the Mormons, this is illustrated by two thorough essays: D. Sterling Wheelwright, "The Role of Hymnody in the Development of the

Latter Day Saints Movement" (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Maryland, 1943); and Ina T. Webb, "Congregational Singing in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints" (unpublished M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah, 1931). The importance of music in the life of Mormon communities, especially in Utah and California, appears in Howard Swan, *Music in the Southwest, 1825–1950* (San Marino, Calif., 1952), with illustrations and a bibliography. The four chapters on Mormon music are the best, but do not discuss the music itself extensively. Shaker music, which is predominantly religious, is discussed in general books and essays on the history and devotional observances of the community. A study of its character as a communal influence is Harold Cook, "Shaker Music: a Manifestation of American Folk Culture" (Doctoral dissertation, Western Reserve University, 1947; reference in *Doctoral Dissertations in Musicology*, Denton, Texas, 1952, p. 50).

A non-scholarly, popularly written, and useful summary of the history of Roman Catholic music is Erwin Esser Nemmers, *Twenty Centuries of Catholic Church Music* (Milwaukee, 1949), with illustrations, music, good bibliographies, and a glossary of church music terms. It is a review of history and principles, and includes the Church's music in America. Periodicals, with many articles on Roman Catholic church music, critical and historical, are: *Catholic Choirmaster*, published by the Society of St. Gregory of America, 1915– ; and *Caecilia*, published by the American Caecilian Verein, 1874– . Paul Hume (music critic, organist, and choir director) criticizes current practices and suggests certain reforms, in *Catholic Church Music* (New York, 1956), which has a bibliography of recordings of sacred music. In Roman Catholic circles the volume is regarded as a long overdue help for the chancery office and the rectory. The melioration of taste and performance, which it suggests, are slowly arriving, and are reviewed in Christian Rosner, "Contemporary Trends in

the Musical Settings of the Liturgical Mass" (Rochester, N.Y., c.1957, microprint copy of typescript, microcard ML-3088; dissertation, University of Rochester, Eastman School of Music, with a bibliography). There are some interesting and informative essays on the origins of Roman Catholic religious music in America. A few illustrate the wealth of material in the periodicals from which they are selected. Among the better ones is Erwin Esser Nemmers, "Early American Catholic Church Music," in *The Catholic Choirmaster*, Vol. 40, no. 4 (Winter, 1954), pp. 158–159, 190. Philip T. Weller, "Early Church Music [Catholic] in the United States," in *Caecilia, Monthly Magazine of Catholic and School Music*, Vol. 66, no. 8 (Sept. 1939), pp. 297–304, is devoted chiefly to the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Nicola A. Montani, "Early Church Music in America, An Example of the Style in Vogue in the Year 1814—with Reflections on the Sacred Music of Today," in *Catholic Choirmaster*, Vol. 14, no. 1 (Jan., Feb., Mar., 1928), pp. 7–11, comments on the work of John Aitken of Philadelphia as a compiler of Roman Catholic church music in the early 1800's. J. Vincent Higginson, "Professor John B. Singenberger" [1848–1924] in *Catholic Choirmaster*, Vol. 27, no. 3 (Sept. 25, 1941), pp. 101–104; and "John B. Singenberger, Musician," in *ibid.*, Vol. 28, no. 1 (March 6, 1942), pp. 6–8, 54, discuss a musician who was very influential in the reform of church music in the second half of the nineteenth century.

No comprehensive history of Jewish religious music in America has ever been written. The nearest approach to such a study is Eric Werner's *In the Choir Loft; a Manual for Organists and Choir Directors in American Synagogues* (New York, 1957), with music and a bibliography. This has a historical introduction, and a chapter on the development of American synagogue music, with references to trends, influences, and personal contributions. He comments on the "uneven, almost chaotic" state of American synagogue music.

C. Psalmody

Henry Alexander Glass, *The Story of the Psalters; a History of the Metrical Versions of Great Britain and America from 1549 to 1885* (London, 1888) is a chronological treatment, with full notes. For other bibliographies and works on hymns and psaltries, see: John G. Barrow, *A Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion,* pp. 313–330. James Warrington, *Short Titles of Books Relating to or Illustrating the History and Practice of Psalmody in the United States, 1620–1820* (Philadelphia, privately printed, 1898) is a tentative list, preparatory to a history of psalmody in the United States. Frank Johnson Metcalf, comp., *American Psalmody; or Titles of Books, Containing Tunes Printed in America from 1721 to 1820* (New York, 1917), with illustrations, is an alphabetical list with a few notes.

George Hood, *A History of Music in New England; with Biographical Sketches of Reformers and Psalmists* (Boston, 1846) has a "List of Works Published Before 1800." The pioneer work of its kind, this is a history of psalmody from the settlement, and is based upon wide research; valuable as a revelation of the huge difficulties and controversies, from which emerged something of decency and real artistry in church music. Hamilton Crawford Macdougall, *Early New England Psalmody; an Historical Appreciation, 1620–1820* (Brattleboro, Vt., c.1940), with illustrations and music, is a study of the music, tracing its origins to the Protestant Reformation, and discussing early singing, the *Bay Psalm Book,* and the influence of William Billings, the first New England composer. The subject is rescued from the realm of ignorance and ridicule. The pioneer work of Billings receives its just due in J. Murray Barbour, *The Church Music of William Billings* (East Lansing, Mich., 1960). Henry Wilder Foote, *An Account of the Bay Psalm Book* (New York, 1940) gives a detailed review of the successive editions, together with

an account of the revival of church singing in the early eighteenth century. John Spencer Curwen, *Studies in Worship Music* (first series, London, 1888, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.) is devoted chiefly to congregational singing, with a chapter on psalm-singing in New England. Efforts to reform the "decayed" art of psalmody in New England, in the early eighteenth century, are evidenced by two treatises: [Thomas Symmes], *The Reasonableness of, Regular Singing, or, Singing by Note; In an Essay, To Revive the True and Ancient Mode of Singing Psalm-Tunes* (Boston, 1720) and Peter Thacher and John Danforth, *An Essay Preached by Several Ministers of the Gospel . . . as to Sundry Questions and Cases of Conscience Concerning the Singing of Psalms . . .* (Boston, 1723). Irving Lowens extensively discusses colonial psalmody in the foreword to his edition of John Tufts, *An Introduction to the Singing of Psalm-Tunes, in a Plain & Easy Method, With a Collection of Tunes in Three Parts*, facsimile reprint of the 5th ed., earliest located edition (Philadelphia, 1954).

D. Hymnody

1. BIBLIOGRAPHY AND GENERAL HISTORY. *The Hymn as a Literary and Theological Form.* The Protestant practice of congregational singing grew out of the older liturgical tradition of Catholicism. The Calvinistic churches at first favored only metrical versions of the psalms, which naturally gave little scope for originality of form or idea. Gradually, however, hymnody began to replace psalm-singing, and by the nineteenth century it had an important place in the typical Protestant service of worship.

Henry Wilder Foote, "Christian Hymnody, a Bibliography," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 33, no. 1 (Oct. 1940), pp. 5–11, with brief annotations, includes general, Latin, German, Greek, English and American hymnody; anecdotes of hymns and their writers; hand-

books to hymnals; hymnological studies; and music as associated with hymnody. His "Christian Hymnody: Recent Publications, Bibliography," in *ibid.*, Vol. 45, no. 4 (July 1953), pp. 5–7, includes psalmody and lists publications since 1940; standard books, older commentaries on hymnals, recently published handbooks, and other recent studies. Alice Marion Richardson, *Index to Stories of Hymns; an Analytical Catalog of Twelve Much-used Books* (Yardley, Pa., 1929) is arranged alphabetically by titles of hymns and gives authors, references to the twelve sources and first lines, and is an excellent introduction to knowledge of the part of hymns in religious living. Caroline Louisa (Leonard) Goodenough, *High Lights on Hymnists and their Hymns . . .* published by the Author (New Bedford, Mass., c.1931) does not pretend to be a scholarly bibliography, but provides a great deal of information on American hymnists, men and women, with indexes of authors and first lines. *The Hymn,* published by the Hymn Society of America (New York, 1949– , quarterly) contains many scholarly articles on American hymnody. The Society's *Papers,* Vols. 1–19, 1930–1955, also have many essays on American psalmody and hymnody. David Riddle Breed, *The History and Use of Hymns and Hymn-Tunes* (New York and Chicago, c.1934, 8th ed.), illustrated, combines studies of hymns and tunes without a great burden of technical detail. It traces the history of hymns from ancient times, and gives full treatment to various periods of Christian hymnody, including American writers, the history of hymn tunes, and the perfecting of the tune in modern times, particularly by Lowell Mason.

The rise and development of the English hymn are studied in numerous books, essays, and theses. The following references are selected as being of superior value. Louis Fitzgerald Benson, *The English Hymn, Its Development and Use in Worship* (New York, 1915) gives full consideration to such important creators as Isaac Watts and the Wesleys, and compares their points of view, and is more concerned with doc-

trinal content than with literary quality. There is a special discussion of evangelical and romantic hymnody. Also to be consulted is his *The Hymnody of the Christian Church, the Lectures on "The L. P. Stone Foundation," Princeton Theological Seminary,* 1926 (New York, c.1927). Benjamin Griffith Brawley, *History of the English Hymn* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1932) has a selected bibliography and is concerned primarily with words rather than music. The appeal is to the general reader and student, with emphasis upon the hymn's place in the life and worship of the church, and stories about famous hymns and their authors. Another valuable general study is Harvey Blair Marks, *The Rise and Growth of English Hymnody,* Foreword by James De W. Perry . . . Introduction by H. Augustine Smith (New York, c.1937), with bibliographies at the end of most chapters. The influence of the hymn as an expression of communal character and feeling is thoroughly studied, for the period when the English hymn was reaching its highest development, in Phyllis Wetherell Bultmann, "Everybody Sings: the Social Significance of the 18th-Century Hymn" (Doctoral dissertation, University of California at Los Angeles, 1950; reference in *Doctoral Dissertations in Musicology,* Denton, Texas, 1952, p. 18). Jeremiah Bascom Reeves, *The Hymn as Literature* (New York and London, c.1924), with a bibliography, places the hymn as the "most popular form of English poetry," and discusses the essential qualities of a great hymn, and the development of the English hymn and psalmody. Several chapters consider Isaac Watts, the Wesleys, Reginald Heber, and some modern hymnists.

There is a rich literature on the authorship and history of hymns and hymn-tunes. It comprises a vast treasury of tradition, anecdote, and popular stories concerning the writers, the scriptural sources, circumstances of the origins of hymns and their music, and the influences of hymns in popular piety, evangelism, and the lives of people. Theron Brown and Hezekiah Butterworth, *The Story of the Hymns and*

Tunes (New York, 1923), classified, with full notes and indexes, is a new and revised edition combining Butterworth's *Story of the Hymns* and *Story of the Tunes*. The introduction defines a hymn as devotional approach to God in the emotions, and sketches the history of hymns. Chapters discuss various types, and include tunes with the hymns. George Alfred Leask, *Hymn-writers of the Nineteenth Century, with Selections and Biographical Notices* (London, 1902) includes a list of the writers mentioned, first lines of hymns referred to or quoted, and a list of important hymns translated during the nineteenth century. Albert Edward Bailey, *The Gospel in Hymns; Backgrounds and Interpretations* (New York, 1950), with a selected bibliography and many illustrations, comprises the authorship, history, and meaning of over three hundred, and discusses the relation between history and hymns, with a large amount of anecdotal material on authors and social background. But some important writers are omitted, the comment on tunes has been considered as insufficient, and the book has been criticized as "somewhat sensational," and controversial with respect to interpretations. A more scholarly work, by an expert in the history of hymnody, is Louis Fitzgerald Benson's *Studies of Familiar Hymns* (Philadelphia, 1926, new ed.), based largely upon his own collection, the Benson Hymnological Collection, in the library of the Princeton Theological Seminary. Henry Augustine Smith, *Lyric Religion; the Romance of Immortal Hymns* (New York and London, c.1931) includes music and a bibliography, and discusses Biblical origins, with stories of authors and hymns, and suggestions for use in worship. There are indexes to sources, tunes, Scripture passages, authors, translators, composers, and subjects. William Cecil Northcott, *Hymns We Love; Stories of the Hundred Most Popular Hymns* (Philadelphia, 1954), with indexes by first lines and authors, discusses one hundred favorites in Australia, Canada, Great Britain, and the United States. Robert Guy McCutchan, *Hymns in the Lives of Men* (New York

and Nashville, 1945) has good "References," and mentions the influence of hymns upon the religious and moral lives of individuals. William John Hart, *Hymn Stories of the Twentieth Century,* with a Foreword by W. Earl Ledden (Boston, 1948) has a bibliography of the best authorities and an index of hymns. Hymn-singing is described as the most ready bond in common worship. The hymns are mostly old, the stories of the present day, related to definite moments and unusual experiences in America and Great Britain. John Barnes Pratt, *Present Day Hymns and Why They Were Written* (New York, c.1940) has a bibliography on hymn stories, by Carl F. Price, and comprises hymns originating during the past thirty years, and accounts of how they were written.

2. AMERICAN HYMNODY. Henry Wilder Foote's *Three Centuries of American Hymnody* (Cambridge, Mass., 1940) is the indispensable standard work, pleasantly written, revealing the relation of hymnody to American religious development, and comprising the story of hymns and hymn-writers from the early colonial period. His "Recent American Hymnody," in the Hymn Society of America *Papers,* Vol. 17 (1952), pp. 1–23, with a bibliography, comments on the steady improvement of American hymn books, and the fine quality of hymns written in the first half of the twentieth century. Included are hymns not found in *Three Centuries of American Hymnody,* and notes on Roman Catholic hymnology and recent denominational hymnals. Another scholarly standard authority is Edward Summerfield Ninde, *The Story of the American Hymn* (New York and Cincinnati, 1926). A brief but informative survey is available in Howard Chandler Robbins, "Notes on American Hymnody," in *Anglican Theological Review,* Vol. 26, no. 3 (July 1944), pp. 159–165. Morgan Phelps Noyes, "Louis F. Benson, Hymnologist," in the Hymn Society of America *Papers,* Vol. 19 (1955) has bibliographical references in the footnotes, and offers a brief biography and estimate of America's fore-

most hymnologist. It reviews his many contributions to hymnological literature and his opinions on hymn-writing, together with a critique of his own work as a hymn-writer with very few equals. Henry Lowell Mason, "Lowell Mason, An Appreciation of his Life and Work," in the Hymn Society of America *Papers*, Vol. 8 (1941) is a brief, well-balanced account of Mason's probably unequaled work in making religious music, especially hymns, a part of American everyday life.

The peculiar contribution of the Southern Protestant states to American hymnody is sketched by Arthur Linwood Stevenson in *The Story of Southern Hymnology* (Salem, Roanoke, Va., c.1931), with bibliographical notes. This is a cursory history of Baptist, Presbyterian, and Methodist hymnology, including the gospel hymn and singing schools, and considering the charges of commercialization of the gospel hymn and psychological explanations of its power in society. Typical southern hymn-writers are briefly appreciated in Mary O. Eddy, "Three Early Hymn Writers," in *Southern Folklore Quarterly*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (Sept. 1946), pp. 177–182, on Amzi Chapin (1768–1835), Samuel Wakefield (1799–1895), and Amos Sutton Hayden (1813–1880). See also sect. E, *Revival Songs, Gospel Songs, Spirituals.*

Examination of the hymnals of almost any American church or sect reveals, beyond doubt, the immense debt of our hymnody to German Reformation hymns, and to Pietist spiritual songs of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. The introduction of German influence is established by William August Haussmann, "German-American Hymnology, 1683–1800" (Doctoral dissertation, The Johns Hopkins University, 1895; published in *Americana Germanica*, Vol. 2, no. 3, reprint no. 20, Philadelphia, 1899), which has "Prints of Hymn-books" and a bibliography. A briefer but scholarly paper is Clifford Hornaday, "Some German Contributions to American Hymnody," in *Monatshefte für Deutschen Unterricht*, Vol. 32, no. 3 (Mar. 1940), pp. 120–127. The-

odore B. Hewitt, "German Hymns in American Hymnals," in *German Quarterly,* Vol. 21, no. 1 (Jan. 1948), pp. 37–50, observes the large proportion in Protestant hymnals, with comments on their history, popularity, deeply poetic quality, and Pietist influence; and gives lists of German hymn-writers and translators into English.

The hymn has been one of many influences promoting the growth of the ecumenical movement among American churches. Joint participation in worship, by revealing the common heritage of sacred song, has tended to minimize differences, especially through the hymn festival. This aspect of ecumenical fellowship is described by Reginald Ley McAll, "The Hymn Festival Movement in America" in the Hymn Society of America, *Papers,* no. 16 (1951). This briefly reviews the rise of modern hymn festivals, their organization and types, with illustrations, cooperation of the churches in them, and festivals for anniversaries and communities. He stresses the influence of the movement in fostering Christian and community brotherhood, improved taste in music, better spirit in worship, and the penetration of religion into the people's life through music. Further evidence of the trend appears in a publication of the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America, Commission on Worship: *Ecumenical Trends in Hymnody* . . . edited by Howard Chandler Robbins (New York, 1941). This consists of essays by writers of several Protestant denominations on the hymnals of their churches, showing the trends and the tendency toward realization of common ground in worship, and improvement of hymnody.

3. DENOMINATIONAL HYMNODY. One of the best studies of American hymnody ever published, a model for all such works, was prepared for the Joint Commission on Revision of the Hymnal of the Protestant Episcopal Church. *The Hymnal 1940 Companion* (New York, c.1940), with music, is solidly founded upon original research by the Rev. Dr. Leonard W. Ellinwood. It comprises historical essays on

texts and tunes, with notes, also biographies of authors, composers, translators, and arrangers, and indexes of first lines, tunes, and Biblical references. Baptist contributions to the literature of American hymns are considered in two conscientious works. Henry Sweetser Burrage, *Baptist Hymn Writers and Their Hymns* (Portland, Me., 1888) is considered by the Baptist historian, Leo T. Crismon, as "the greatest contribution to this study," and stresses the fact that many of the universally sung hymns were written by Baptists. Carey Bonner, *Some Baptist Hymnists from the Seventeenth Century to Modern Times* (London, 1937) was first published as four articles in *The Baptist Quarterly* (London, 1937.) New material, including chapters on American hymn writers, was added when it appeared as a book.

Methodist hymns have made a distinctive gift to the spirit of American evangelical Christianity. By far the best study of them, and probably the most thorough analysis of the hymns of an American church, is Benjamin Franklin Crawford's *Our Methodist Hymnody* (Carnegie, Pa., c.1940), with a bibliography. Hymnody is regarded as a revelation of religious concepts and motives and of the general trends of religion during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. It is related here to changing conceptions of worship, doctrine, the Christian life, and religion in general. The hymns are classified, and trends are illustrated by tables and graphs. The author based his studies partly upon such older works as Charles S. Nutter, *Hymn Studies* (New York, 1888), really an annotated edition of the hymnal of the Methodist Episcopal Church; and the same writer's *The Hymns and Hymn Writers of the Church* (New York, 1911), an outgrowth of his previous annotated edition of the hymnal. Robert Guy McCutchan, *Our Hymnody, a Manual of the Methodist Hymnal . . . with an Index of Scriptural Texts* [by] Fitzgerald Sale Parker (New York, Cincinnati and Chicago, c.1937) has music, illustrations, and a bibliography, and information about each hymn and tune. It comprises also chants,

responses, and other aids to worship, the sources and first publications of hymns and tunes, antecedents of the Methodist hymnal, and a discussion of hymnals, 1737–1935.

Along with the Anglo-American strain, a potent influence from German sources has been firmly woven into the texture of American denominational hymnody. This is evident from a study by John Dahle, professor of hymnology and liturgics in the Luther Theological Seminary, St. Paul, Minnesota, in his *Library of Christian Hymns* . . . Volume One, English translation by the Rev. M. Casper Johnshoy (Minneapolis, Minn., c.1924). He includes histories of 188 hymns used by the Lutheran churches of America. Apparently no more volumes were published. Another group of German origin possesses one of the finest studies revealing the hymn as an essential element in popular culture. This is Armin Haeussler's *The Story of Our Hymns; the Handbook to the Hymnal of the Evangelical and Reformed Church* (St. Louis, 1952), with music, bibliography, and biographical and historical notes on authors, translators, composers, and arrangers. Based upon a vast amount of research and correspondence, it includes a discussion of the nature of the hymn, hymn-singing and playing, the hymnody of this particular church, and articles on hymns, responses, and canticles. The best authority on Mennonite hymns is Lester Hostetler, *Handbook to the Mennonite Hymnary* (Newton, Kans., 1949), with a list of "Principal Works Consulted." This explains the origin of the words and music of over 600 hymns, and rejects popular and doubtful stories about some hymns. There is a general review of the history of Mennonite hymnody, and a classification of hymns by the denominations of their authors. The spirit of Mennonite sacred song, with references to hymns, is appreciated in an essay by Leonard W. Ellinwood: "Singer's Glen—A Plea for the Local History of Music," in American Guild of Organists, *Quarterly*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Oct. 1957), pp. 138–141, concerning the work of Joseph Funk (1777–1862), a singing teacher and compiler

of early nineteenth-century Virginia. Allen Anders Seipt, *Schwenkfelder Hymnology and the Sources of the First Schwenkfelder Hymnbook Printed in America* (Philadelphia, 1909) is a scholarly discussion, based upon a doctoral dissertation for the University of Pennsylvania.

Notable accessions to American hymn literature and music have come from several groups outside the older churches, which have originated or largely developed in the United States. American Unitarians have led the way in elevating the literary quality of American hymnody. Conclusive evidence is advanced by Harold William Stephenson's *Unitarian Hymn-Writers* (London, 1931), with a bibliography, and including Americans, notably Frederic H. Hedge, Oliver Wendell Holmes, Theodore Parker, Samuel Longfellow, and William Channing Gannett, with quotations from hymns. The tone of the hymns is prevailingly Transcendentalist. David Sterling Wheelwright, "The Role of Hymnody in the Development of the Latter-Day Saints Movement" (Doctoral dissertation, Maryland University, 1943) shows the influence of popular hymns in welding the unity and loyalties of a peculiarly American group. The same idea is the theme of George Dollinger Pyper, *Stories of Latter-day Saint Hymns, Their Authors and Composers* (Salt Lake City, 1939), illustrated. The Mormons, a singing people, had hymnbooks as early as 1835. Their early writers adapted hymns to old tunes, and related them to great events in the history of their people and church. The most peculiar of all spiritual songs are those of the Shakers, which are illustrated by a collection compiled and published by the North Family of Mount Lebanon, Columbia County, N.Y.: *Original Shaker Music* (New York, 1893), comprising hymns composed by Daniel Offord, Lucy Bowers, and Martha J. Anderson. (For other references to Shaker hymnody, see J. P. MacLean, *A Bibliography of Shaker Literature* (1905), p. 30, and the titles in Part Two under *Sectarianism.*) Edward Deming Andrews, *The Gift to be Simple; Songs,*

Dances and Rituals of the American Shakers (New York, 1940) includes music, illustrations, diagrams of dances, and a selected bibliography. An introduction on the history, spread, and organization of the group is followed by a very detailed analysis of the music and dancing as integral parts of worship. The Shaker rituals were expressions of true folk art and were perfected in weekday singing meetings.

E. Revival Songs, Gospel Songs, Spirituals

From the Moravians John and Charles Wesley learned the value of hymns in promoting the social intention of the gospel, and in unifying "the whole visible church." Isaac Watts was the founder of modern English hymnody, but the new type of religious poetry was brought to perfection by the Wesleys, under German Pietist influence represented by the Moravians (See John Louis Haney, "German Literature in England before 1790," in *Americana Germanica*, Vol. 4, 1902.) On his visit to America in 1735–1736, John learned about the Moravian hymns and compiled the first hymnbook for use in the Church of England. It was published at Charleston, S.C., in 1737, contained five translations from the German, and was repeatedly republished in England with more translations (see James Taft Hatfield, "John Wesley's Translations of German Hymns," in *Publications of the Modern Language Association*, Vol. 11 (1896), pp. 171–200, giving the origins of all hymns in the first five editions, with criticisms of Wesley's work as a translator).

The German hymns came from Pietist sources, particularly the *Herrnhuter Gesangbuch*, compiled by Count Nicholas von Zinzendorf. These hymns were intensely personal, expressing longing for mystical union with the Divine, thanksgiving for help, petitions for divine assistance, and trust in the goodness and wisdom of an overruling providence. (See W. Garrett Horder, *The Hymn-Lover*, chs. 7, 8.)

Charles Wesley's hymnody was especially indebted to his association with the Moravians, but also to the devotional writings of William Law.

Before the great revivalists died, they had originated a new type of church hymnody, which had a permanent influence, especially through the popular revivals and the hymn-singers associated with great evangelists. The use of hymns in keeping American religion vital and effective, and in maintaining the individual's sense of communion with the Divine, has been a feature of American evangelical religion ever since the Great Awakening of the 1740's.

One should consult two collections in the Washington Cathedral Library, Washington, D.C., for source materials: (1) the "George C. Stebbins Collection" of over 1,000 gospel song books and notebooks, with the complete works of Stebbins and of Philip Paul Bliss; and (2) the "Charles Winfred Douglas Collection" of hymnology and liturgics, with the check list of this collection by Leonard W. Ellinwood and Anne Douglas, *The Praise of God: The Life and Work of Charles Winfred Douglas* (The Hymn Society, 1958).

An excellent brief review of the background and development of the gospel hymn is an essay by Austin C. Lovelace: "Early Sacred Folk Music in America," in *The Hymn*, Vol. 3, nos. 1–2 (Jan.–Apr. 1952), pp. 11–14, 56–63, with a bibliography. Hubert McNeill Poteat, *Practical Hymnology* (Boston, 1921) is a general history of the gospel hymn movement. One of the most useful compilations of this type of sacred music is that of Annabel Morris Buchanan: *Folk Hymns of America, Collected and Arranged* (New York, 1938). One of the most potent influences in the development and popularization of the gospel hymnody was the Methodist camp-meeting, especially in the West and the South. An early and still reliable authority on this phase of the evolution is an article by B. St. James Fry, "The Early Camp-Meeting Song Writers," in *Methodist Quarterly Review*, 4th ser., Vol. 11, no. 3 (July, 1859), pp. 401–413. One

of the best recent studies is by Samuel E. Asbury and H. E. Meyer: "Old-Time White Camp Meeting Spirituals," in *Texas Folklore Society Publications* (Austin, 1932), no. 10, pp. 169–185, with music.

The gospel hymn is the mature, natural expression of popular, Protestant spiritual poetry, and particularly of the religious experience and fact of conversion. It records, primarily, the distilled religious throes of innumerable individuals, including the writers, the composers, and the persons whose lives have been changed and uplifted. There is a wealth of literature concerning the origins of the gospel hymn in personal experience, and its popularizing by many evangelists and singers. One of the earliest and best narrations is by the internationally famous gospel singer, Ira David Sankey: *Sankey's Story of the Gospel Hymns and of Sacred Songs and Solos, with an Introduction by Theodore L. Cuyler* (Philadelphia and Toronto, 1906), with music and Sankey's story of his life, particularly concerning his American travels with the evangelist, Dwight L. Moody. An English edition appeared as *My Life and Sacred Songs* (London, 1906). An enlarged American edition also was published (Philadelphia, 1907), with indexes of authors, titles, and first lines, brief narratives of the circumstances occasioning the composition of hymns, and incidents connected with the use of very many gospel songs. Jacob Henry Hall's *Biography of Gospel Song and Hymn Writers . . . fully Illustrated* (New York and Chicago, c.1914) has portraits, mostly from photographs, and claims to be the first collection of such biographies. There are sketches of 76 men and women, beginning with Lowell Mason, and many references to their hymns and other writings. One of the most famous American gospel singers, Homer Alvan Rodeheaver, discusses the origins of gospel hymns in popular religion, and their influence upon people's lives, in his *Hymnal Handbook for Standard Hymns and Gospel Songs; a Collection of Stories and Information about Hymns, Gospel Songs and*

Their Writers (Chicago and Philadelphia, c.1931). George Washington Sanville, *Forty Gospel Hymn Stories* (Winona Lake, Ind., 1943) has the stories of the hymns and their music on opposite pages, and is a popular, non-scholarly work, intended to present the "human interest" side of hymns, their popular appeal, and their origins in specific spiritual experiences. The roots of evangelistic, popular song in the lives of ordinary people, including many Americans, are revealed in a popularly written account by Phillip Stanley Kerr: *Music in Evangelism and Stories of Famous Christian Songs; a Handbook of Information for Evangelists, Gospel Singers, Church Musicians, Choir Members, Song Directors, and all Others who are Interested in Christian Music* (Glendale, Calif., 1954, 4th ed.).

In recent times certain musicologists have devoted intensive study to the background, origins, and development of the type of religious folk song that is sometimes known as the "white spiritual," with special reference to its growth in the Southern States. Some of these studies pay special attention to the sociological background, particularly the relationship between class distinctions and types of religious music. A brief general introduction to the bibliography is available in Eugene C. Wylie, "The White Spirituals" (M. Mus. Ed. dissertation, Minneapolis College of Music, 1950, typewritten, in Music Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C.). This reviews the literature, points out defects in knowledge of the origin and development, and discusses the "Sacred Harp," the singing movement in New England, and the relation of Negro to white spirituals. There are notes also on singing schools, the use of spiritual folk songs in city churches, the present state of the art in country regions, and the traditions of the "fasola people." Irving Lowens, "John Wyeth's Repository of Sacred Music, Part Second; A Northern Precursor of Southern Folk Hymnody," in *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, Vol. 5, no. 2 (Summer 1952), pp. 114–131, is devoted to a dis-

cussion of the evolution of popular hymnody. Some valuable notes on development of the type are included in Dorothy Horne, "Shape-Note Hymnals and the Art of Music in Early America," in *Southern Folklore Quarterly*, Vol. 5, no. 4 (Dec., 1941), pp. 251–256. Charles Seeger's "Music and Class Structure in the United States," in *American Quarterly*, Vol. 9, no. 3 (Fall 1957), pp. 281–294, contrasts folk and sophisticated levels, including religious music. His "Contrapuntal Style in the Three-Voice Shape-Note Hymns," in *Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 26, no. 4 (Oct. 1940), pp. 483, 493, mentions collections, and dwells upon the sociological and economic background of hymnology.

The greatest recognized authority in study and interpretation of the "white spiritual," and its relation to the Negro version of the gospel song, is George Pullen Jackson. His basic study of the subject is *Spiritual Folk-Songs of Early America* (New York, 1937). The mature fruit of his researches over many years is contained in *Down-east Spirituals, and Others; Three Hundred Songs Supplementary to the Author's Spiritual Folk-songs of Early America* (Locust Valley, N.Y., 1953, 2nd ed.), with unaccompanied melodies, a bibliography, and illustrations. This consists chiefly of previously uncollected songs, including religious ballads, folk hymns, and spiritual revival songs. The introduction discusses the history and character of the songs and their Methodist and Baptist sources, with notes on the Baptists as folk-hymn singers, and on the spread of revival spirituals and their use and abuse in camp-meetings. Jackson's *The Story of the Sacred Harp, 1844–1944, a Book of Religious Folk Song as an American Institution* (Nashville, 1944), with illustrations, studies this famous collection of psalm and hymn tunes, odes, and anthems, originally compiled by Benjamin Franklin White and E. J. King. There are notes on the origin and development of the collection, old Baptist music, famous singers and their lives; and the discovery of

the influence of American spiritual folk songs as moulders of the religious thought of a large section of the people.

Jackson's researches have been penetrating especially in the much-controverted subject of the true relationship between the white and the Negro spiritual. He argues that the Negro version is a descendant of white camp-meeting songs, in *White Spirituals in the Southern Uplands, The Story of the Fasola Folk, Their Songs, Singing, and "Buckwheat Notes"* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1933). This includes music, a bibliography, and lists of old song books and Southern musical periodicals, and stresses the geographical, cultural, and personal backgrounds of this type of singing. The problem of the relations between white and Negro song is treated also in his *Another Sheaf of White Spirituals, Collected, Edited, and Illustrated* (Gainesville, Fla., 1952), which has a general history of the shape-note tradition, based upon the recording and study of renditions by singers. This, his third collection of spiritual folk songs, brings the total of his published tunes to 900. Probably his most thorough study of the white-spiritual origin of Negro religious folk song is in *White and Negro Spirituals, Their Life Span and Kinship . . . 116 Songs as Sung by Both Races* (New York, 1944). He surveys over two centuries, and discusses the religious and social backgrounds of folk hymn-singing, published Negro religious folk song, Negro variants of white tunes and treatment of song texts, and Negro-borrowed tunes from Great Britain.

F. Negro Spirituals

The rich heritage of the Negro religious folk song, or "spiritual," which had been accumulating since the eighteenth century, began to make an impression upon students of American history and culture in the 1850's. The real discovery came after the Civil War, in the 1870's, through the

performances of the Jubilee Singers from Fiske University at Nashville, and of the students of Hampton Institute in Virginia. Northern audiences then became aware of their beauty, and of their revelation of the Negro's religious adjustment to his tragic social lot. The following titles comprise the discovery of the spirituals in the period 1855–1875, their early collection and recent recording, critical and historical works about them, and the connections between the Negro and white spirituals.

Charles Haywood, *A Bibliography of North American Folklore and Folksong* (New York, 1951) has an excellent section on the Negro spirituals, consisting of bibliographies, general studies, collections, arrangements and recordings to 1948, and is unique in the field.

1. DISCOVERY. "Evangelist" [pseud.] gave to musical literature one of the earliest appreciations of the Negro spiritual in "Songs of the Blacks," in *Dwight's Journal of Music,* Vol. 10, no. 7 (Nov. 15, 1856), pp. 51–52. This essay contrasts "the song-loving Negro and his natural musicianship with the average, anxious American, who though 'favored above other people on earth' goes to his task 'songless and joyless.'" Negro religious music is discerned as the outlet of deep emotions, the expression of an element of freedom which the slave found in his religion. Another sympathetic early study is in J. Miller McKim's "Negro Songs," in *ibid.,* Vol. 21, no. 19 (Aug. 9, 1862), pp. 148–149. McKim, an agent of the Port Royal Relief Society, visited the Sea Islands of South Carolina in 1862, and noticed the profoundly religious quality and joy of hope in the singing. The idea of a song was elaborated in a "praise meeting" until it had attained an acceptable form. The spirituals were brought to public attention especially by Thomas Wentworth Higginson of Boston, the commander of a Negro regiment in the Civil War. They are discussed at length in ch. IX of his *Army Life in a Black Regiment* (Boston, 1870), and in his essay "Negro Spirituals," in *Atlantic Monthly,* Vol. 19, no. 116 (June

1867), pp. 685–694, which includes the texts of 34 religious and two secular songs. Higginson, a student of Scottish ballads, found great enjoyment in being brought suddenly "into the midst of a kindred world of unwritten songs," and collected and studied the texts. He observed their elements of patience in this life and triumph in the next, Biblical imagery, mystical effect, passionate striving, and the "stimulus to courage and a tie to heaven." The earliest collection of the spirituals was made by William Francis Allen, Charles Pickard Ware, and Lucy McKim Garrison: *Slave Songs of the United States* (New York, 1867), comprising 136 songs, recording some versions different from those now familiar. Allen was inspired by the interest of Higginson, and at the close of the Civil War discovered the Negro secular and religious songs in refugee camps. His compilation was only a partial revelation of their quality, as he could not give adequate notation to the unique folk way of singing them.

The first true interpretation was given to the spirituals by the choral renditions of the Fisk Jubilee Singers. Their world-wide popularizing of the songs was recorded by Gustavus D. Pike's *The Jubilee Singers, and Their Campaign for Twenty Thousand Dollars* (Boston and New York, 1873). This is one of the earliest collections, with 61 melodies, including 40 with harmonization, and a preface by Theodore F. Seward, who arranged the music. A more complete version of the campaign is J.B.T. Marsh, *The Story of the Jubilee Singers, with Their Songs* (Boston, 1881, rev. ed.), with music and words, including Pike's 61 melodies and 67 more, mostly harmonized, presumably by Seward, who wrote the preface. This is a revised form of two earlier publications, with music arranged by Seward and George L. White, the first of which was published in New York in 1872. J. F. Loudin, *The Story of the Jubilee Singers, with Supplement, Containing an Account of Their Six Years Tour Around the World, and Many New Songs* (Cleveland, 1892) contains the text of the music of 139 spirituals.

2. INTERPRETATIONS: CRITICAL AND HISTORICAL WORKS. Howard W. Odum, "Religious Folk Songs of the Southern Negroes," in *Journal of Religious Psychology*, Vol. 3, no. 3 (July 1909), pp. 265–365, argues that the spiritual intensified the emotion upon which primitive Negro religion depended, and emphasized consciousness of the supernatural. Religious fervor depended upon the reality of imagery, the contrast between the world and the future life. Henry Edward Krehbiel, *Afro-American Folk Songs; a Study in Racial and National Music* (New York and London, c.1914) is by one of the most eminent music critics of his time, who "gave the spirituals serious and adequate musical analysis and interpretation" (ref. in Margaret Just Butcher, *The Negro in American Culture*, p. 58). An essay on folk songs in general precedes a discussion of the originality of Afro-American songs, the extent of imitation, their development, the predominance of religious songs among the slaves, the influence of camp-meetings, and an analysis of modes and psychology. Howard W. Odum and Guy B. Johnson, *The Negro and His Songs; a Study of Typical Negro Songs in the South* (Chapel Hill, 1925) has a "Select Bibliography of Negro Folk Songs," and two chapters on religious ones, with many texts; and makes a genuine contribution to intelligent understanding of the significance of the Negro contribution to American music. William Edward Burghardt DuBois, *The Souls of Black Folk; Essays and Sketches* (Chicago, 1929, 16th ed.) contains a celebrated interpretative chapter on the spirituals—"Of the Sorrow Songs." Society for the Preservation of Spirituals: *The Carolina Low-Country*, by Augustine T. Smythe and others (New York, 1931) includes a chapter on the spirituals by Robert W. Gordon, with words and music, together with notes and a glossary of dialect words, and indications of the districts where the songs were heard. Guy Benton Johnson, *Folk Culture on St. Helena Island, South Carolina* (Chapel Hill, 1930), with music and a bibliography, includes a study of the spirituals.

Howard Thurman, *The Negro Spiritual Speaks of Life and Death* (New York, 1947) is a brief, perceptive interpretation of the religious meaning of the spirituals. He restudies the greater ones to discover their contributions to thought on immortality. They express at once a religious hope and a practical philosophy, making an intolerable life become bearable and significant. Roland Hayes, *My Songs; Aframerican Religious Folk Songs Arranged and Interpreted* (Boston, 1948) states that his contact with native Africans in London indicated African characteristics in the songs. The spirituals are a fusion of American experience and native musical gifts, and "speak of that endless search for better understanding of the Divine Law which shapes the destinies of men." They brought the Negro into close relationship with the Bible, as "a fountain of illimitable solace," and substituted the Negro himself for Biblical personages and situations. Miles M. Fisher, *Negro Slave Songs in the United States*, with a Foreword by Ray Allen Billington (Ithaca, 1953) is one of the most extensive studies of the subject, and has texts of songs without music, and a bibliography. This is an outgrowth of his "The Evolution of Slave Songs in the United States" (Doctoral dissertation in divinity, University of Chicago, 1948, ref. in *Doctoral Dissertations in Musicology*, Denton, Texas, 1952, p. 18). Margaret Just Butcher, *The Negro in American Culture, Based on Materials Left by Alain Locke* (New York, 1956) in chs. 2, 3, and 5, discusses the evolution of spirituals from episodes and imagery of the Bible. She emphasizes their expression of longing for freedom and immortality, assimilation of African religious expression to Christian ideas, derivation from hymns, combination of poetry, faith and simple but consummate artistry, emotional depth, and lack of bitterness and vindictiveness. The spiritual background is intensively studied in Henderson Sheridan Davis, "The Religious Experience Underlying the Negro Spiritual" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1950). Howard Thurman,

Deep River: Reflections on the Religious Insight of Certain of the Negro Spirituals is illustrated by Elizabeth Orton Jones (New York, 1955 rev. and enl. ed.). The spirituals express the movement of the creative spirit of God, moulding the human spirit in its conflict with tragedies of social experience, its fighting against disillusionment and despair. They helped in the Negro's struggle for courage, self-respect, and emotional security. L. M. Friedel, *The Bible and the Negro Spirituals* (n.p., 1947) with references in footnotes, is interesting as one of the few works on the subject by a Roman Catholic author. He emphasizes the slave and folk elements, religious and sorrowful, rooted in the Bible, and suggests that Negroes could retain them as Catholics.

3. COLLECTIONS. Since the original collections of Higginson, Allen, and Pike, there have been many efforts to gather the Negro spirituals. Some of the anthologies are valuable for their notations as well as for the texts. Such a one is William Eleazar Barton's *Old Plantation Hymns; a Collection of Hitherto Unpublished Melodies of the Slave and the Freedman, with Historical and Descriptive Notes* (Boston and New York, 1899), reprinted from the *New England Magazine* for December 1898 and January and February 1899. A more authoritative collection was arranged by the musical directors of the Hampton Normal and Agricultural Institute of Hampton, Va., as: *Religious Folk Songs of the Negroes as Sung on Plantations* (Hampton, Va., 1909, 5th ed.). The original edition, by Thomas P. Fenner, was entitled *Cabin and Plantation Songs as Sung by the Hampton Students,* and was issued in 1874; there is an enlarged edition by Thomas P. Fenner and Frederic G. Rathbun (New York, 1891). The notes to William Arms Fisher, ed., *Seventy Negro Spirituals* (Boston, c.1926), with bibliography, emphasize the spiritual's unique power, springing from a deep emotional experience, from "native capacity for rhythmic musical expression, the gift of improvisation . . .

a condition of life that ranged from the most naïve lightheartedness to tragic sombreness, and an utter dependence for consolation upon faith in invisible realities . . ." The comments survey the labor of many Negro and white musicians in gaining recognition of the spiritual's true meaning and value.

Another collection valuable for its notations is Robert Nathaniel Dett's *Religious Folk Songs of the Negro as Sung at Hampton Institute* (Hampton, Va., 1927), with some melodies published for the first time, and choral arrangements. This outstanding Negro musician helped greatly to preserve the Negro heritage of religious and secular folk song. His most important compositions are based upon spirituals. Mary Allen Grissom, *The Negro Sings a New Heaven* (Chapel Hill, 1930), with music, includes various types of spirituals, arranged in sections, and rendered "exactly as they are found and sung." They were gathered mostly from Negroes who used them in contemporary worship around Louisville and in rural sections of Adair County, Kentucky. Dialect is recorded as it was heard, unaccompanied by elaborate harmonies. Edward Avery McIlhenny compiled *Befo' de War Spirituals; Words and Melodies* (Boston, c.1933), with an introduction to the music by Henri Wehrmann. The singing was by Louisiana Negroes on an Avery Island plantation where the compiler lived. The tunes, not modernized, were those familiar to two aged Negro women, and some of these songs do not appear in previous collections. John Wesley Work, ed., *American Negro Songs and Spirituals* (New York, 1940), with a bibliography and an index of song titles, represents more than fifty years of research. His arrangements are notable for their simplicity. The notes suggest that the only Bible the slaves had was the spiritual, which represents a remarkable development of native folk song in a comparatively short period. James Weldon Johnson, *The Book of American Negro Spirituals, Musical Arrangement by J. Rosamond Johnson and Additional Num-*

bers by Lawrence Brown (New York, 1933) is by a Negro musician who has contributed greatly to the preservation of his people's folk music. The notes in the preface oppose the idea of derivation, and regard the spirituals as the creation of the American Negro, based upon his own rhythms and the spirit of Christianity. The songs were created by religious bards, and their harmonization makes them unique in folk song. Johnson's *Second Book of Negro Spirituals, Musical Arrangements by J. Rosamond Johnson* (New York, 1933) continues his work of setting the spirituals in permanent form. He discerns the basic sources in native African rhythms and the King James version of the Bible. Their astonishing variety is explained by their nature as a record and revelation of deep thoughts and experiences over two hundred years, and by the Negro's many-mooded nature, and lively imagination not dulled by stereotyped ideas. The Negro now realizes the value of the spiritual as an artistic creation and as a strong element in American music. (See also Part Two, sect. VI, K, *Negro Religious Expression.*)

RELIGION AND LITERATURE

IT IS a fact that almost every major American writer, until very recent times, had a firm upbringing in some religious faith. This early training often had momentous consequences in the careers of these writers. In some cases they rejected their religious heritage, and sometimes they modified its teachings. In any event they felt compelled to introduce religious problems into their writings. The selection of general and special works in this section is intended to answer two questions: What religious position does the author take? And how does this position compare or contrast with religious views that were current at the time his works were written?

I. BIBLIOGRAPHY

THIS section comprises general bibliographies and histories of American literature, together with some guides to special studies. A large proportion of the superior critical writings, on the relation of religion and theology to American literature in general, and concerning the religious ideals and influences of particular authors, is found in indexes to articles in periodicals, and in bibliographies of doctoral and other dissertations. Without these guides, this section of the bibliography could not have been compiled. Many of the dissertations never have been published, or have appeared only partially in periodicals or as abstracts. In such cases, the annotations indicate where unpublished copies may be found, or the abbreviated forms in which the studies have appeared.

Jacob Nathaniel Blanck, *Bibliography of American Literature*, compiled . . . for the Bibliographical Society of America (New Haven, 1955– , 3 vols.), to Bret Harte, is a basic source for information on published works with references to religious and theological influences. *The Cambridge History of American Literature*, ed. William Peterfield Trent, John Erskine, Stuart P. Sherman, and Carl

VanDoren (New York, 1917–1921, 4 vols.), with classified bibliographies, covers all phases, with references to specifically religious writing and to religious influences upon other aspects, and works by and relating to numerous authors. Howard Mumford Jones, *Guide to American Literature and Its Backgrounds Since 1890* (Cambridge, Mass., 1953), with "Index of Writers Listed in Part II," includes general guides, reference works and histories, religious history, special literary histories, and such themes as fiction, poetry, criticism, and drama. Part II has sections with references to religion, particularly "The Fictional Attack on 'Puritanism.'" An invaluable guide to various sources is Ernest Erwin Leisy, comp., "Materials for Investigations in American Literature; a Bibliography of Dissertations, Articles, Research in Progress, and Collections of Americana," compiled for the American Literature Group of the Modern Language Association of America, in *Studies in Philology*, Vol. 23, no. 1 (Jan. 1926), pp. 90–115; Vol. 24, no. 3 (July 1927), pp. 480–483. The best guides to dissertations are the following: Ernest E. Leisy and Jay B. Hubbell, comps., "Doctoral Dissertations in American Literature," in *American Literature*, Vol. 4, no. 4 (Jan. 1933), pp. 419–465, has a considerable number of entries of published and unpublished theses on the relation of religion to American literature; continued 1933–1948, in *ibid.*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (May 1948), comp. Lewis Leary. James Woodress, *Dissertations in American Literature, 1891–1955* (Durham, N.C., 1957), with index of authors, contains over 2,500 theses written at about 100 universities; supplements and recovers the list in *American Literature*, 1933, by Ernest E. Leisy and Jay B. Hubbell, and Lewis Leary's supplement in *American Literature*, 1948. The listing of dissertations in progress is incomplete, containing only *reported* ones. There is no attempt to indicate whether or not a completed dissertation has been published. References to religion are found under "Religion," "Puritanism," "Fiction," "Poetry,"

"Drama," "Negro," "Literary Criticism," "Dissertations on Individual Authors," and "Transcendentalism."

Articles and essays are well covered by the following guides: "Articles on American Literature Appearing in Current Periodicals," in *American Literature,* is irregular to May 1930; quarterly since March 1931; by J. B. Hubbell (1929–1931); Clarence Gohdes (1931–1938); Gregory L. Paine (1938–1941); Lewis Leary (1941–). See also: "Research in Progress," *American Literature,* quarterly since March 1929; by E. E. Leisy (1929–1938); Gregory L. Paine (1938–1940); Raymond Adams (1941–). These lists are gathered in Lewis Gaston Leary, ed., *Articles on American Literature Appearing in Current Periodicals: 1920–1945,* edited from materials supplied by the Committee on Bibliography of the American Literature Group of the Modern Language Association of America, and the University of Pennsylvania Library (Durham, N.C., 1947), with index of authors. See, particularly, "Religion," pp. 313–316; also "Bibliography: Special," "Fiction," "Negro," "Poetry," "Social Aspects," and "Theater." This is supplemented by Jackson Cope, Otis B. Davis, Samuel Henderson, Elizabeth A. Larson, and Joseph Smeale, "Addenda to 'Articles on American Literature Appearing in Current Periodicals, 1920–1945,'" in *American Literature,* Vol. 22, no. 1 (Mar. 1950), pp. 61–74. Lewis Gaston Leary, ed., *Articles on American Literature, 1900–1950* (Durham, N.C., 1954), topically arranged, has a section on religion, with about 85 entries; and others on fiction, poetry, and drama, with some references to religious influences. Thomas F. Marshall, *An Analytical Index to "American Literature,"* Vols. 1–20, Mar. 1929–Jan. 1949 (Durham, N.C., 1954), has author-subject and book review indexes.

There are several special bibliographies of high value, including two by a long-time student of the dialogue between literature and religion in America—Amos Niven Wilder. His "Bibliography," in Harvard University Divin-

ity School, *Bulletin,* "Annual Lectures and Book Reviews," Vol. 21, 1955–56, pp. 151–159, includes books and pamphlets, contributions to periodicals, and chapters in books, 1923–1955, on the relations between theology and religion and literature. And his "Bibliography on Theology and Modern Literature" in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin,* Vol. 49, no. 4 (Sept. 1957), pp. 4–8, is an excellent, selective brief guide, consisting of books by theologians or with a primarily theological concern, other titles in the general field of literary criticism, and single chapters or short articles. Clyde H. Cantrell and Walton R. Patrick, *Southern Literary Culture, A Bibliography of Masters' and Doctors' Theses* (University of Alabama Press, 1955), with a bibliography of references and an index, has a considerable number of references to religious literature, philosophy and religious thought, poetry, and religious newspapers and periodicals. Ralph Thompson, *American Literary Annuals and Gift Books, 1825–1865* (New York, 1936) lists some publications of a religious character, with extensive comment on some, and a general catalog of this type of literature.

II. RELIGION AND LITERATURE: GENERAL

UNTIL the religious "revival" of the 1930's, it was a prevalent opinion that Western literature generally, and American literature particularly, had ceased to be interested in traditional religious "values." It had become, it was believed, predominantly "realistic" and naturalistic, and according to many critics, should be judged solely by secular and aesthetic standards. The optimistic liberalism of the early 1900's, also, had appeared to weaken reliance upon supernatural religious and divine sanctions, and to place man's dependence primarily upon himself. But two world wars in only thirty years (1914–1945), and a world-wide economic depression, excited doubt regarding the inevitability of automatic material and moral progress. Both religious and secular critics

began to question humanistic, secular, and naturalistic standards, and to seek profoundly and essentially religious elements in historic and contemporary literature. There began a resumption of the interrupted (or, at best, fitful) dialog between literature (along with the other arts) and religion. The result has been a flood of anthologies, articles in magazines, essays, books, and dissertations, on the relations between religion and literature in general. Studies have multiplied on the specific interactions of literature with definite religious belief, theology, and the American spirit in literature. The following four sections present significant studies of these relationships, selected from this vast and amazingly prolific critical literature.

A. Religion and Modern Literature: General

Edwin Mims, *Great Writers as Interpreters of Religion* (New York and Nashville, c.1945) is a very general study of great writers as harmonizers of culture and religion, like Phillips Brooks; also champions of moral values, like Hawthorne on conscience and the penalty of sin; Emerson as a prophet and seer; Whitman as reconciler of individualism and the cosmos; and Lanier as a poet revealing the beauty and wonder of nature. E. Boyd Barrett, "Modern Writers and Religion," in *The Thinker*, Vol. 3, no. 5 (May 1931), pp. 32–38, asserts that modern writers cannot avoid religion, and considers reactions to religion of the pessimists, naturalists, and humanists. He pleads for responsibility in literature and consideration of the claims of religion as a constructive force. Modern writers are aware of the yearning for a solution of life's mystery. Ashley Sampson, "Religion in Modern Literature," in *Contemporary Review*, Vol. 147, no. 832 (Apr. 1935), pp. 462–470, refers to Thornton Wilder's *The Bridge*, and Countee Cullen's "Ghosts." Wilder's novel is a transformed morality play; Cullen's poem revives the notion of the influence of the dead on the living. The time-

less religious element in poetry shows the inescapability of the problem of human destiny. John Rothwell Slater, *Recent Literature and Religion; the Ayer Lectures, the Colgate-Rochester Divinity School,* 1938 (New York and London, c.1938) is not literary criticism, but gives many instances of "how recent fiction, drama, and poetry in a skeptical age still reflect moods of faith in God and man," including American literature since 1900. "Contemporary literature is not predominantly pagan," nor humanistic without divinity. Halford Edward Luccock and Frances Brentano, eds., *The Questing Spirit; Religion in the Literature of our Time* (New York, 1947) is by far the best anthology of its type, with selections from a wide range of authors and forms. Critical essays with the sections, and a critical introduction by Luccock, stress the theme of modern hunger for spiritual affirmation, the realization that faith is the only alternative to chaos. This point is driven home by a series of studies sponsored by the Institute for Religious and Social Studies, Jewish Theological Seminary of America: *Spiritual Problems in Contemporary Literature; a Series of Addresses and Discussions,* ed. Stanley Romaine Hopper (New York, 1952). The essays consider the artist's situation; the contemporary novel, drama, and poetry; mysticism and poetry, morals, religion and the artist's mission; Protestantism and poetry; the literary mind and religious responsibility. Nathan A. Scott, Jr., *Modern Literature and the Religious Frontier* (New York, 1958) has an excellent selected bibliography and references in notes to chapters, and considers the relation of the modern mind to poetry and religion, theology and criticism, the Christian poetic, man in recent literature, poetic and religious vision in present literature. The major task of contemporary Christian theology is "to negotiate a continuous conversation between the faith of which it is the custodian and the world of contemporary culture in which this faith must have its actual life."

B. Literature and Religious Belief

William Joseph Rooney, *The Problem of "Poetry and Belief" in Contemporary Criticism* (Washington, D.C., 1949), with a bibliography, is based upon "The Problem of 'Belief' in Contemporary English and American Criticism" (Doctoral dissertation, Catholic University, 1945), and is primarily metaphysical and aesthetic in interest, including I. A. Richards, Yvor Winters, John Crowe Ransom, Allen Tate, and T. S. Eliot. Thomas Stearns Eliot, "Religion and Literature" in *Selected Essays* (New York, 1950) is an explicit comment, by a modern poet who is also a religious one, on the question of relationships between belief and artistic practice. Martin Jarrett-Kerr, *Studies in Literature and Belief* (New York, c.1954), with bibliographical references in the chapter notes, makes a few references to Americans, especially T. S. Eliot, American born, but now a British citizen. Earl Marlatt, *Lands Away* (New York and Nashville, 1944), with some bibliographical references in footnotes, consists of essays about novels, poems, and plays since the First World War, discussing the nature of the spiritual values in them, with reference to some American writers, and is charmingly written, but appreciative rather than profoundly critical. Amos N. Wilder, "Artist and Believer," in *Christianity and Crisis*, Vol. 13, no. 16 (Oct. 5, 1953), pp. 123–125, sees in the artist's life analogies to the life of faith that should instruct the Christian in a day of unreal, indulgent religion; this is true especially in the new poetry. The modern artist realizes (and the Christian believer must) the necessity of breaking with the existing order to follow Jesus disinterestedly. His "Contemporary Literature and the Teaching of Religion," in *Journal of Bible and Religion*, Vol. 7, part II (May 1939), pp. 64–68, 112, holds that the religious curriculum and teaching tend to be scholastic and unreal, and that teachers should read contemporary poets

and novelists speaking in the day's idiom and expressing religious experiences and ideals outside academic religion, engaged in true religious quests, making use of Biblical material in a living context.

C. Literature and Theology

Samuel Law Wilson, *The Theology of Modern Literature* (Edinburgh, 1899) has an interesting, detailed essay on Emerson's theology, criticizing his "undue exaltation" of human nature and distrust of logic, and noting his acceptance of the intuitional Transcendentalist theology, the incompatibility of his views with the Gospels, and his effect in breaking down traditional beliefs. The new note of return to a more traditional view is sounded in R. W. Brown, "The Creative Spirit and the Church," in *Harper's*, Vol. 150, no. 895 (Dec. 1924), pp. 42–49. This is one of the earliest evidences of the challenge to a new relationship between the church's beliefs and the world of the artist, which for a long period had seemed to live in almost complete estrangement because of the church's lack of vision. Amos N. Wilder, *Theology and Modern Literature* (Cambridge, Mass., 1958), with bibliography in notes, considers the "historic divorce" between modern arts and religion, and the beginning of a resumption of former relations, in the concern of theology with the indirect ministry of grace in modern art, and the spiritual values in modern literature that is not professedly "religious," with special attention to Robinson Jeffers and William Faulkner. Roy Battenhouse, "The Relation of Theology to Literary Criticism," in *Journal of Bible and Religion*, Vol. 13, no. 1 (Feb. 1945), pp. 16–22, with bibliographical notes, after reviewing modern literature on the subject, concludes that literature cannot take the place of dogma, which gives final character through "latent presuppositions." Asthetics cannot be wholly independent and unregulated by theology. The Christian critic can relate the

interests of theology and literature, viewing the natural world in the mood of the supernatural. Nathan A. Scott, Jr., "The Relation of Theology to Literary Criticism," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 33, no. 4 (Oct. 1953), pp. 266–276, with bibliography in notes, indicates the tendency of Protestantism to relate itself to artistic movements, particularly in literature, and refers to critical writings by Protestants on poetry, and religious and spiritual problems in literature. He reviews the clash between Christian and Marxist literary criticism, and considers whether or not theological commitment has a place in criticism. The inadequacy of a writer's metaphysic or religion may entail aesthetic failure. The important point is not a specific belief or disbelief, but a general orientation. The Christian community has failed to present itself to the artist as something with which to make a common cause, and the Christian critics' part therefore is to reconcile modern arts and the church. Protestantism is rejected by modern artists for its failure to do this, and the point is demonstrated by references to contemporary Anglo-American writers. In his "Beneath the Hammer of Truth," in *Christianity and Crisis*, Vol. 16, no. 16 (Oct. 1, 1956), pp. 124–126, he states that illumination comes not from the technical jargon of academic philosophers and social scientists, but from prophetic theologians, poets, and novelists; and that the antagonism between art and religion, particularly in Protestantism, is not so acute as formerly, because Protestant complacency has been broken. Writers with Christian vision, although not necessarily churchmen, have reminded the Christian of the half-forgotten truths of incarnation and redemption. The problem now is to bring Christian faith into a dialogical relationship with modern literature. His *The Tragic Vision and the Christian Faith* (New York, Association Press [1957]), with a bibliography and notes on essayists, includes "The Vision of Evil in Hawthorne and Melville," by Randall Stewart; and "William Faulkner's Passion Week of the Heart," by Hyatt H. Waggoner. Scott indicates

a reawakening of tragic sense, within the Christian community, after a long sympathy for gospels of melioration by science, education, and reform. The authors considered are not tested by Scripture, but by what they offer as analyzers of the human problem in Christian terms. They see man as wayward, but not beyond redemption, and ask questions about man's destiny, which a wholly pragmatic and positivistic culture considers irrelevant.

D. Religión and American Literature: General

Robert E. Spiller, Willard Thorp [and others], eds., *Literary History of the United States* (New York, 1948, 3 vols.) has references to the impact of religion, especially upon the novel, in Vol. 3. Vernon Louis Parrington, *Main Currents in American Thought; an Interpretation of American Literature from the Beginnings to 1920* (New York, 1939) has a bibliography at the end of each part, and general comment on the relations of religion to literary currents; religion itself is considered only as a phase of "the politics of the economic drift." Harry Hayden Clark, ed., *Transitions in American Literary History* (Durham, N.C., 1953) has many valuable bibliographical footnotes on religious influences, and references to the literary influence of the Bible, and of the theological reviews and attacks on religion, the effects of religion in poetry and fiction, Calvinism and literary criticism of it, the concept of God and concern with sin and Christian ethics, and the traces of various religious, philosophical, and cultist movements, especially liberal and Transcendental thought. Gilbert P. Voigt, "The Spiritual Aspect of Recent American Literature," in *Lutheran Church Quarterly*, Vol. 17, no. 1 (Jan. 1944), pp. 3–13, is packed with meaty observations on the attitudes of contemporary writers, mostly American, toward man's spiritual quest and toward religion. Many are sharply critical of organized religion, for neglect of suffering; others are pantheistic. Some warn

against the spread of hatred and plead for deeper spirituality. Strong ethical feeling appears in great creative writers, and an increasing and influential minority affirms religious truths and values.

A Protestant critique appears in two studies by Halford Edward Luccock. The first, *Contemporary American Literature and Religion* (Chicago and New York, 1934) closely searches American creative literature since World War I. The viewpoint is not that of literary criticism, but of seeing literature as a manifold expression of the life and moods of an era, and of looking into "the world Jesus knew and the church forgot." Literature confronts the church with the world, and attempts the role of an intermediary between them. The volume displays wide and deep reading, in an entertaining style, with a wealth of documentation and many shrewd and sound critical judgments. His *American Mirror; Social, Ethical and Religious Aspects of American Literature, 1930–1940* (New York, 1940), with bibliographical footnotes, has as its general thesis a quotation from *Green Pastures:* "Everything nailed down is comin' loose." The volume reflects the literary reaction to the collapse of the 1920's boom; and examines characteristic portions of the literature of the 1930's in social, ethical, and religious aspects, but does not attempt to make final judgments. One of the chief topics is the critical and doubting spirit, and the search for faith, the "quest for certainty." The interest is social; the criterion of selection is "The closeness of impact and relationship to life as experienced during the decade." Harold Charles Gardiner, ed., *American Classics Reconsidered; a Christian Appraisal* (New York, 1958) includes bibliographies and notes to the essays and on contributors, and is a symposium by Roman Catholic scholars. They view the philosophies and theologies, and the attitudes toward God, man, and nature of representative American authors of the nineteenth century, and the degree to which those attitudes shaped their lives and work. They express the Roman Cath-

olic viewpoint regarding a group of authors more concerned with eternal problems than any other group since their time. Randall Stewart, *American Literature and Christian Doctrine* (Baton Rouge, La., c.1958) selectively explores a largely untouched field, and criticizes the purely objective approach to literature as neutral, colorless, and sterile. Especially emphasized is the noticeable shift away from academic agnosticism. Authors are tested by the touchstone of Christian orthodoxy, particularly by their recognition of the doctrine of original sin. Democracy and Christianity are not incompatible, as some have assumed; democracy must think in Christian terms to survive, not in terms of romantic deification of man, egoism, or naturalism. Yvor Winters, *Maule's Curse; Seven Studies in the History of American Obscurantism* (Norfolk, Conn., c.1938) treats the curse, in Hawthorne's *The House of the Seven Gables*, as "a symbol of human as opposed to non-human values," developing the thesis that American writers have not fully grasped the intellectual problems inherent in human (and essentially religious) values, and that the result has been obscurity as a principle of expression. Chapters are devoted to Very's mystical poetry, Cooper, Melville, Poe, Emerson, Emily Dickinson, and Henry James.

Jay B. Hubbell, *The South in American Literature, 1607–1900* (Durham, N.C., 1954) contains many passages on religious influences in Southern literature. For a more thorough study of the religious or pseudo-religious attitudes of certain individual authors, one should study carefully Harry M. Campbell, "Notes on Religion in the Southern Renascence," in *Shenandoah*, Vol. 6, no. 3 (Summer, 1955) pp. 10–18. He analyzes the Southern "liberal" writer's attitude toward religion: the invention of Gods regarded as the mark of a high sense of reality, and the philosophy of "as if" God exists, as a useful and beautiful myth to organize the emotions, a system of "self-conscious illusion." Examples are given from the works of contemporary authors, some of whom (like

Robert Penn Warren) are uneasy in this attitude. Others have a strong deep faith founded on definite doctrine, including Allen Tate, who became a Roman Catholic out of dissatisfaction with sophisticated make-believe.

III. THE BIBLE IN LITERATURE

THE pervasive influence of the Bible, and especially of the King James Version of 1611, upon English and American literature is usually taken for granted. This section furnishes some selected evidence of the general truth of this assumption, beginning with a few over-all appreciations, and continuing into some detailed studies of Biblicisms in specific works of individual writers. Henrietta Tichy, *Biblical Influences in English Literature, a Survey of Studies* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1953) attempts to present a comprehensive bibliography, with a critical introduction surveying literature on the subject, comprising books and articles. This should be consulted for general, not specifically American references. (See also Carlos Baker's essay "The Place of the Bible in American Fiction," in Volume II of *Religion in American Life.*)

Mason Long, comp., *The Bible and English Literature* (State College, Pa., c.1935), with a bibliography, lists English and American literary pieces revealing indebtedness to the Bible. Oscar Loos Joseph, *The Influence of the English Bible upon the English Language and upon English and American Literature* (New York, 1936), with a brief bibliography, prepared for the commemoration of 400 years of the printed English Bible (1935), illustrates influence upon language and style, and includes fourteen American poets, from Longfellow to James Weldon Johnson. Reference is made to Elvira Slack, *Christ in the Poetry of Today,* with poems by over 130 authors. Prose citations include Americans, from Hall Caine to the twentieth century. The list, "Book and Story Titles Drawn from the Bible," includes American au-

thors. The essay by Odell Shepard, "The English Bible and American Men of Letters," is a general appreciation of Biblical influence. Lawrence Emerson Nelson, *Our Roving Bible; Tracking its Influence Through English and American Life* (New York and Nashville, 1945), with references, containing a large amount of bibliography, has a chapter on the transition of the Bible to America and its influence in New England literature and culture; and many references to Biblical influences upon American authors from Irving to Lowell; Bible influence on hymns, poetry and novels, humorists, statesmen, orators, political campaign oratory and literature; in magazines; and in fictional critics of religion. Perry Miller, "The Garden of Eden and the Deacon's Meadow," in *American Heritage*, Vol. 7, no. 1 (Dec. 1955), pp. 54–61, 102, cursorily surveys the Old Testament permeation of American thought in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, persisting even into the early nineteenth; but notes that with the great revivals American Protestant piety and thought turned toward "an ecstatic discovery" of the *New* Testament.

The deep coloration of homespun New England by the Bible is suggested in a study by James Stacy Stevens: *Whittier's Use of the Bible* (Orono, Maine, 1930), a book of quotations amply illustrating the poet's vast knowledge, and relating to slavery, witchcraft, religious freedom, and the beauty and grandeur of nature: over 800 passages directly or indirectly derived. The author compares his treatment of themes with contemporary poets. That Emerson also was a thorough Biblicist is proved by Harriet Rodgers Zink, in her "Emerson's Use of the Bible," in *University of Nebraska Studies in Language, Literature, and Criticism*, no. 14 (Lincoln, Nebraska, 1935), with bibliographical references in the footnotes, an appendix of Biblical allusions in his works, and a bibliography. This study reveals a mind saturated with Biblical language and philosophy, which he used as unconsciously as he breathed, with a wide range and diversity

of allusions, direct quotations, paraphrases, and other uses. The Bible's continuing literary influence, upon a New England author even farther removed from clerical orthodoxy than Emerson, appears in John Cline, "Hawthorne and the Bible" (Doctoral dissertation, Duke University, 1948). William Mentzel Forrest, *Biblical Allusions in Poe* (New York, 1928) has an appendix of "Poe's Biblicisms," with titles of writings in which they are found. The first such study, this reveals an astonishing and unsuspected knowledge. Religious and spiritual elements are studied from the angles of spirituality, pantheism, mysticism, death and after-life, the world's end, and judgment.

Gay Wilson Allen, *Biblical Echoes in Whitman's Works* (Durham, N.C., 1934), a reprint, originally appeared in *American Literature,* Vol. 6, no. 3 (November 1934), pp. 301–315, has bibliographical footnotes, and presents a fairly complete catalog of the Good Gray Poet's use of Bible language and cadence. His use of particular symbols is illustrated by John M. Steadman's "Whitman and the King James Bible," in *Notes and Queries,* Vol. 3, no. 4 (Dec. 1956), pp. 538–539. He points out that his use of the setting star to represent the dead President Lincoln could have been influenced by a passage in a dedicatory epistle of the King James Bible. The peculiar music of Whitman's blank verse is traced to the Bible by Gay Wilson Allen, in *Biblical Analogies for Walt Whitman's Prosody* (Paris, France, 1933), an extract from *Revue Anglo-Americaine* (August 1933), indicating analogies between "Leaves of Grass" and Old Testament poetry, with bibliographical footnotes. Meredith Neill Posey, "Whitman's Debt to the Bible, with Special Reference to the Origins of His Rhythm" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Texas, 1938) reinforces the argument by a multitude of specific instances. Leon Spitz, "Walt Whitman and Judaism," in *Chicago Jewish Forum,* Vol. 13 (Spring 1955), pp. 174–177, lends support to the preceding references by revealing the poet's interest in He-

braic literature and religion. Whitman was far from alone in this interest, according to Leon Spitz, *The Bible, Jews and Judaism in American Poetry* (New York, 1923), which, although old, is fairly useful, but not scholarly, and has no bibliography. It covers Bryant, Longfellow, Whittier, Emerson, Lowell, Holmes, Poe, Lanier, Riley, Field, Whitman, and the Hebrew spirit, and has a chapter on Biblical influences on patriotic songs. Lloyd N. Jeffrey, "A Concordance to the Biblical Allusions in *Moby Dick*," in *Bulletin of Bibliography*, Vol. 21, no. 10 (May/Aug. 1956), pp. 223–229, uncovers an astonishingly broad familiarity with the Scriptures in Herman Melville, who without cleaving to any definite theology, remained as profoundly religious as any descendant of Scottish Presbyterians should be.

IV. PURITANISM AND LITERATURE

A. Puritan Literature: Spring

In no community would there have been less chance for an "art for art's sake" movement to arise than in the Bible Commonwealth of Massachusetts. Firmly committed to the idea that this world existed solely in preparation for the next, the Puritans subordinated literature to divine ends. Literature had value only as it served a purpose outside itself. As aestheticians, the Puritans bear comparison to modern Marxists, who would subordinate literature to man's struggle to attain the classless society. The Puritans subordinated literature to man's struggle to attain heaven. Although literature had an inferor place in the hierarchy of cultural values, the Puritans were not unaware of form and style. Since literature was to be used in God's service, the dominant tendency was to seek a plain, utilitarian style, which did not mean a crude style. Language was not to be clouded with conceits and metaphors which would confuse the simple layman but, in its sparseness, was still meant to touch the imagination and to lift

the reader (or listener in the case of a sermon) to a position more receptive to truth. As the isolation of New England broke down toward the end of the seventeenth century, writers such as Cotton Mather became more sensitive to the demands of literary fashions. In their desire to escape the charge of provincialism, Puritans fell under the influences of European practices. Such self-consciousness of style, the consideration of literature in its own right, is an index to the decline of the Bible Commonwealth. (See also Part Two, sect. I, B, 3, *The Puritan Heritage and Controversy.*)

Moses Coit Tyler, *A History of American Literature During the Colonial Period, 1607–1765* (New York, 1950, rev. ed., 2 vols.), a standard history with excellent critical general references to Puritan literature, is indispensable. Josephine K. Piercy, *Studies in Literary Types in Seventeenth Century America (1607–1710)* (New Haven, 1939), with references in footnotes, is the first comprehensive study of literary types in early America, with chapters on religious and philosophical meditations, sermons, and religious discourses, and Cotton Mather as a Puritan literary lion. The scope includes non-Puritan colonies, and critical estimates of Puritan writing. Mrs. Thomas G. Wright, ed., *Literary Culture in Early New England, 1620–1730* (New Haven, 1920) reviews literary culture, education, libraries, book circulation, literary ties with England, and the production of literature, largely religious. The latter element tended to decline, the secular to increase, with fading of the early Puritan impulse and of theocracy. Kenneth Ballard Murdock, *Literature & Theology in Colonial New England* (Cambridge, 1949), with bibliography in the notes, is a general study of relations between Puritan-Calvinist theology and literary theory and practice, and the successes and failures of Puritans as literary artists. Their principles and environment interdicted success comparable to that of other schools of thought. The writer also discusses the fundamental question: how are religious ideas given adequate expression? An early estimate

of the Puritan literary tradition is that of H. Sheffield Clapham, "The Influence of Puritanism on American Literature," in *Living Age*, Vol. 235, no. 3039 (Oct. 4, 1902), pp. 38–47. The history of American literature is that of religious development, and therefore largely of Puritan Calvinism. Early New England literature is practically Puritan history, and the early national writers were largely of Puritan derivation. The influence pervaded the Transcendentalist era, through a lofty standard of thought and life, and was felt even by those who opposed it, like O. W. Holmes. Puritanism has been responsible for both virtues and defects in American literature.

Perry Miller, *The New England Mind; the Seventeenth Century* (New York, 1939) has excellent philosophical notes on Puritanism as a literary influence. That influence is regarded as tending toward realism, in a study by Lawrence Willson: "The Puritan Tradition in American Literature," in *Arizona Quarterly*, Vol. 13, no. 1 (Spring, 1957), pp. 33–40, which avers that if the principal aim of a literary art is to hit the truth, then the Puritan may be considered as the originator of realism, opposed to art that fails to tell the truth, and regarding content as more significant than style. Hattie L. Hawley, "Puritan Literature," in *Historical Outlook*, Vol. 21, no. 8 (Dec. 1930), pp. 369–372, is a general but fairly scholarly survey, emphasizing the high value of the original and vigorous writing in history, travel, religion, and Indian narratives. The Puritan genius reached its acme in Edwards. Puritan literature was functional, expressing the life of a "peculiar people." This point may be well illustrated by a few studies of Puritan authors. F. O. Matthiessen, "Michael Wigglesworth, A Puritan Artist," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (Oct. 1928), pp. 491–504, comprises a critical estimate of his enormously popular religious poem, "The Day of Doom" (Boston, 1662), a vivid account of the day of judgment. While the poem proves that Puritanism did not exclude literary art, nevertheless it does exhibit the sterility inevitably resulting from subordination of art to a

strict creed. Kenneth B. Murdock, ed., *Selections from Cotton Mather* (New York, 1926), is a critical anthology, illustrating the character of the Puritan minister as a literary artist employing the mannerisms of sophisticated style in defense of the Puritan way of life and belief. Clarence H. Faust and Thomas H. Johnson, eds., *Jonathan Edwards: Representative Selections* (New York, 1935), in the essay, "Edwards as a Man of Letters," offers another general comment on the Puritan as literary craftsman. Perry Miller, *Images or Shadows of Divine Things by Jonathan Edwards* (New Haven, 1948), in the "Introduction" has a penetrating and thorough commentary on Edwards' use of poetic imagery in his brief essays on religious truths.

B. Flowering and Decline

Randall Stewart, "Puritan Literature and the Flowering of New England," in *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3 ser., Vol. 3, no. 3 (July 1946), pp. 319–342, holds that the writers of the "flowering" did not break with the Puritan tradition, but continued it with modifications. Its persistent influence inspired an essay by Richard A. Condon, "The Broken Conduit: A Study of Alienation in American Literature," in *Pacific Spectator*, Vol. 8, no. 4 (Autumn, 1954), pp. 326–332. This prolongs the "Puritan Equation" between sin and identity into nineteenth- and twentieth-century fiction, as in Hawthorne, Melville, and Hemingway. Reasons for the contested dominance are suggested by Barriss Mills in his "Attitudes of Some Nineteenth-Century American Writers toward Puritanism" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Wisconsin, 1942). One of the most eminent of the Puritan derivatives is closely examined by Katherine May Heaton in "Emerson and Puritanism" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Iowa, 1940).

The literary figure of New England's flowering, who has become virtually the symbol of Puritanism in American let-

ters, is Nathaniel Hawthorne. The copious critical writing on this aspect of his work is reviewed in Barriss Mills, "Hawthorne and Puritanism," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 21, no. 1 (Mar. 1948), pp. 78–102. He surveys opinions of various critics on Hawthorne's relation to Puritanism, and examines the evidence of his writings for treatment of Puritanism and its influence upon his thought, from 1830. He was the most sympathetic among major writers of his day, yet not one of the Puritans, and too much of an artist to be wholly in sympathy with Puritan intellectualism and moralism. Thomas Gunn Selby, *The Theology of Modern Fiction* (London, 1896) regards Hawthorne as a depicter of stern Puritan morality, of the inward struggle of conscience, the inward punishment of sin, and the efficacy of confession. His ethic was veiled by fantasy and romance; his theology lacked a compensating doctrine of sacrifice and mediation. Austin Warren, *Nathaniel Hawthorne, Representative Selections* (New York, 1934) in the introduction discusses the difficult problem of the relation of Hawthorne, the man, to Puritanism. Hawthorne, the literary artist, recording and brooding over the outward forms and inward spiritual conflicts of his ancestral culture, has often been studied.

Investigation might begin profitably with Randall Stewart, ed., *The American Notebooks of Nathaniel Hawthorne* (New Haven, 1932), helpful in discerning the New England Puritan background of his "tales." Elizabeth Lathrop Chandler, "A Study of the Sources of the Tales and Romances Written by Nathaniel Hawthorne Before 1853," in *Smith College Studies in Modern Languages*, Vol. 7, no. 4 (July 1926), pp. 64ff., has notes on the literary well of the Puritan past, from which Hawthorne drew; reviews previous writings on the subject; and includes a chronological table of composition of the works considered, and a reference list. Perry Miller and Thomas H. Johnson show in *The Puritans* (New York, 1938) his use of the New England Puritan past, in such tales as "The Minister's Black Veil," "The Gentle

Boy," and "The May-Pole of Merrymount." Fannye N. Cherry, "The Sources of Hawthorne's 'Young Goodman Brown,'" in *American Literature,* Vol. 5, no. 4 (Jan. 1934), pp. 342–348, also indicates Hawthorne's drawing from the wellspring of the New England Puritan past for his literary inspirations. G. Harrison Orians, "The Angel of Hadley in Fiction: A Study of the Sources of Hawthorne's 'The Grey Champion,'" in *American Literature,* Vol. 4, no. 3 (Nov. 1932), pp. 257–269, appreciates Hawthorne's sense of the Puritan past, and his spiritual kinship with it. His discernment of the power of evil forms the subject of a study by William B. Stein: *Hawthorne's Faust, a Study of the Devil Archetype* (Gainesville, Fla., 1953), with bibliography. That other authors also found an almost inexhaustible source in Puritanism is conclusively demonstrated by Charles Burnell Brooks, in "Puritanism in New England Fiction, 1820–1870" (Doctoral dissertation, Princeton University, 1943; *University Microfilms, Ann Arbor,* 1952, pub. no. 2921; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 12, 1952, no. 3, pp. 296–297), with bibliography. He dismisses the idea that Hawthorne may be regarded as the only interpreter of Puritanism in American fiction. He analyzes many of his predecessors and contemporaries who dealt with Puritanism, but generally were more interested in contemporary issues and more liberal in theology.

The decay of Puritanism as a religious, moral, theological, and general cultural force had begun long before the youth of Hawthorne, but did not become the subject of *artistic* literary interpretation until the middle of the nineteenth century. The polemical attack that slowly undermined it is described in Elizabeth Jackson, "Reaction against Puritanism in American Periodicals of the Eighteenth Century" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota). The basic elements of the reaction are investigated in an essay by Clarence H. Faust, "Decline of Puritanism," in Harry Hayden Clark, *Transitions in American Literary History* (Durham, N.C.,

1953). This reviews the causes of the decline—intellectual, theological, philosophical, economic, and political—with references to literary expressions of the changes in the New England mind. A superior study of Puritan decline, as expressed in literature of the late 19th century, is Edward Foster, *Mary E. Wilkins Freeman* (New York, 1956), with notes to chapters and an extensive bibliography of her works and writings about her. He observes her Puritan Calvinist background, and its reflection in her tales of village life in New England's "Indian Summer," the decline of Puritanism in a too straitened environment, the clash between conformity and independence, and her kinship with Robert Frost. Thomas Shuler Shaw, "A Nineteenth Century Puritan; being a Biography of Mary A. Wilkins Freeman" (n.p., n.d., typewritten, Rare Books Division, Library of Congress) has bibliographies of her works and of writings about her; and stresses her long Calvinist-Puritan background, and the influence of a dying Puritanism upon the characters and atmosphere of her stories and novels. Howard Mumford Jones, "Literature and Orthodoxy in Boston after the Civil War," in *American Quarterly*, Vol. 1, no. 2 (Summer, 1949), pp. 149–165, emphasizes the enormous vogue of Elizabeth Stuart Phelps' *Gates Ajar* (1868), a novel of religious consolation, representing a deintellectualizing of the Puritan creed, and a revolt from a theology more concerned with sin than with salvation.

The literary reaction is discerned also in the stress upon the central place of love in Christianity, as seen in certain works of Longfellow, Whittier, and O. W. Holmes. The long Indian summer and the sere and yellow leaf of Puritanism are comprehended by P. H. Boynton's essay "The Novel of Puritan Decay from Mrs. Stowe to John Marquand," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 13, no. 4 (Dec. 1940), pp. 626–637. Harriet Beecher Stowe pictured a pristine, theologically trained society, but novels after the 1860's displayed open apostasy from Puritanism or semi-satire of its

decadence, as in Marquand. Analysis of novels displays gradual weakening of the Puritan tradition, through the Social Gospel period to insecure people of high-born estate, who inherit only the pride of descent from Puritanism. By the early 1900's doubt of Puritan values had shifted to open hostility, which produced a rank crop of literary anti-Puritans. A brief bibliography, "The Fictional Attack on 'Puritanism,'" is in Howard Mumford Jones, *Guide to American Literature and Its Backgrounds Since 1890* (Cambridge, Mass., 1953), p. 113. The attack inevitably provoked a vigorous defense, which is estimated as a movement and in the works of certain critics, in James Robert Vitelli, "The Resurrection of the Puritan: A Study of an American Literary Symbol," (*Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 15, no. 5, p. 832; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor (1955), pub. no. 11, 441). The appearance (1901–1931) of a collective symbol of the Puritan served to develop criticism, and created articulate consciousness of American literature. Controversy over the good or bad influence of the Puritan reveals both anti-Puritan bias and favor in several writers, out of which emerged a deeper understanding and a broadened and enriched symbol.

V. SOME DENOMINATIONAL ASPECTS

THE story of the real influence of particular religious groups upon American literature is, largely, still to be written. There is not a large body of critical and historical writing answering certain questions: How has the form and spirit of a denomination, sect, or cult been expressed in poetry, fiction, or drama, written either by its own adherents or by outsiders? How has the group appeared to others in these forms, either favorably or unfavorably? Naturally, the communities most attractive to writers, especially in fiction and drama, are those outside the usual Anglo-American norms of religious expression, such as the Quakers, the Mennonites (particularly the Amish), the Jews, the Roman Catholics, and the

Negro churches. In short, the minority groups are the ones that appear to be the most interesting to the creative artist. In the case of the Jews, the line between Judaism as a religion, strictly speaking, and Judaism as a civilization and ethnic expression, is fine and wavering. The three succeeding sections comprise a selection of special studies, which suggest how much more might be written in these fields. Further references will be found in the later succeeding sections on fiction, poetry, and drama.

A. Protestant

H. W. Hinty, "The Quaker Influence in American Literature," in *Friends' Intelligencer*, Vol. 96, no. 28 (July 15), no. 31 (Aug. 5); no. 32 (Aug. 12); no. 34 (Aug. 26); no. 36 (Sept. 9); and no. 38 (Sept. 23, 1939), pp. 455–457, 506–507, 523–524, 555–556, 585–586, and 619–620, surveys the widely read and influential Quaker writings by or about Quakers (William Penn, Thomas Paine, John Woolman, Charles Brockden Brown, and James Fenimore Cooper), and claims them for the "liberal" tradition—which is questionable in the case of Cooper. A more lengthy and scholarly treatment is Edward Earle Stibitz, "The Treatment of Quakerism in American Historical and Literary Writing" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan; *Microfilm Abstracts*, Vol. 11 (1951), no. 2, pp. 352–353; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich., (1951), pub. no. 2467). He studies the beliefs and practices of Friends as treated in writings since the mid-seventeenth century: fairness and shifting attitudes, in areas of intellectual and social history, and in techniques of writing. Treatment became more favorable with the decline of Puritanism. The field from the mid-seventeenth to the mid-twentieth century is thoroughly covered by two other authors: Robert H. Morgan, "The Literature of the American Friends, from the First Settlement to 1825" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1939),

and Thomas Kimber, "The Quaker as Author and Subject in American Literature, 1825–1940" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1941). Elizabeth Horsch Bender, "Three Amish Novels," in *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, Vol. 19, no. 4 (Oct. 1945), pp. 273–284, discusses the literary merit and authenticity of Helen R. Martin's *Sabina, A Study of the Amish* (1905); Ruth Lininger Dobson's *Straw in Wind* (1937); and Joseph W. Yoder's *Rosanna of the Amish* (1940). The Amish theme, rich in "color," has been little used until recently because of general ignorance of the group in literary circles. Yoder presents the most authentic picture.

Floyd K. Baskette, "Early Methodists and Their Literature," in *Emory University Quarterly*, Vol. 3, no. 4 (Dec. 1947), pp. 207–216, with footnotes, discusses early nineteenth-century journalism and book publication, emphasizing cheap popular literature for all groups, developing a pattern of literary production and promotion. Methodist literature, as the only reading of many people, helped to start on its way the growth of the vast American reading public, and to discipline and refine literary taste. Millard G. Roberts, "The Methodist Book Concern in the West, 1800–1850" (Bachelor of divinity dissertation, University of Chicago, 1942, abstract pub. by the university) shows the growth of Methodist educational accomplishment, and discusses the materials published, with special reference to moral and social issues, and the close link between Methodism and the Middle-Western common people as reflected in literature. See also his "The Methodist Book Concern in the West, 1800–1870" (Doctoral dissertation, 1947, typewritten and microfilm, University of Chicago Library), with bibliography. American Presbyterian influence apparently is represented by but one study: Daniel Seely Gregory, "The Influence of Princeton Theological Seminary on the Religious Literature of the World," in *Princeton Theological Seminary Alumni Association, Addresses, 1876*, pp. 39–65.

Few American religious groups, in recent times, have approached the Mormons as inspirers of creative and historical writing. Their impact in fiction, especially, is comprehensively reviewed and estimated by two essays: Cassie Hyde Hock, "The Mormons in Fiction," in *University of Colorado Studies, General Series,* Vol. 26, no. 4 (Nov. 1941), pp. 94–96, studies 87 novels and short stories, based on legendary or historical materials, and mostly rather weak in imagination, and conventional; representing the development of the national attitude toward Mormonism, with much distortion, and emphasis upon lurid episodes and polygamy. The Mormon, the writer believes, still does not *live* in fiction. Dale L. Morgan, "Mormon Story Tellers," in *Rocky Mountain Review,* Vol. 7, no. 1 (Fall, 1942), pp. 1, 3, 4, 7, concerns the vast exploitation of Mormon fictional riches since 1939, in contrast with previous comparative neglect, especially before 1900, and critically assesses the former and contemporary periods, the latter aimed largely at the epic and "colorful" interpretation of Mormon life and adventure. Future writing probably will be less ambitious and opportunistic, and more serious. Among the better modern novels are Frank C. Robertson, *The Rocky Road to Jericho* (New York, 1935); Virginia Sorenson, *A Little Lower Than the Angels* (New York, 1942); and Maurine Whipple, *The Giant Joshua* (Boston, 1941).

B. Jewish

Harold U. Ribalow, "Jewish Literature in the United States and England," in *The Jewish People Past and Present,* Vol. 3 (New York, 1952), pp. 220–238, largely on American literature, is a general survey of novels, short stories, poetry, and drama, including some with religious reference, with a bibliography. Joseph Mersand's *Traditions in American Literature: A Study of Jewish Characters and Authors* (New

York, 1939), comprises drama, novels, and poetry by Jewish authors, and the Jews as portrayed by Jews or non-Jews; and has bibliographies including literature of interest to students of Jewish life in America, American Jewish autobiographies, biographies by American Jews, criticism and belles-lettres, a general bibliography, and footnotes. Charles Angoff, "Three Hundred Years of Jewish-American Culture," in *Reconstructionist*, Vol. 19, no. 13 (Nov. 6, 1953), pp. 12–17, holds that "Jewish-American writing, which first was significantly represented by Mary Antin's *The Promised Land* (1912), seems finally ready to flower as Jewish-American assimilation nears completion." The gradual rapproachement of the three major sects has tended to promote greater cultural unity and to reveal the Jewish-American soul, suggesting religious sources for a flowering of literature. The same thesis appears in his "Notes on 300 Years of Jewish-American Letters," in *Chicago Jewish Forum*, Vol. 13, no. 2 (Winter, 1954–1955), pp. 114–118. Shlomo Noble, "The Image of the American Jew in Hebrew and Yiddish Literature in America, 1870–1900," in *Yivo Annual of Jewish Social Science*, Vol. 9 (New York, 1954), pp. 83–108, paints a vivid picture of the yearnings, aspirations, and bewilderment of the immigrant generation; of *Hebrew* literature very gloomy because of low spiritual fire, and *Yiddish* literature hopeful of adjustment of secular and religious traditions to American life. Joseph Opatoshu, "Fifty Years of Yiddish Literature in the United States," in *Yivo Annual of Jewish Social Science*, Vol. 9 (New York, 1954), pp. 72–82, has some references to religious life, the rise of young Jewish-American writers, and the process of Americanization in the religious and secular community. Lee M. Friedman, "Jews in Early American Literature," in *More Books*, Vol. 17, no. 10 (Dec. 1942), pp. 455–474, comprises a very general survey from the Puritan speculations on the Indians as the "Ten Lost Tribes of Israel," through the sentimental sympathy

with the Jewish plight to about 1860, citing appearances in poetry, novels, and even almanacs, with a wealth of bibliographic detail.

The novel has been, by far, the most accurate reflection of American Jewish religious and secular life, as well as the most attractive art form to Jewish and other authors seeking to depict the Jewish-American people. Edward D. Coleman, "Jewish Prototypes in American and English *Romans* and *Drames A Clef*," in American Jewish Historical Society, *Publications*, Vol. 35 (1939), pp. 227–280, covers the field from 1634 in England to 1936, with notes and comments. Abraham H. Steinberg, "Jewish Characters in Fugitive American Novels of the Nineteenth Century," in *Yivo Annual of Jewish Social Science*, Vol. 11 (New York, 1956/57), pp. 105–121, discusses forty-eight generally unsympathetic portraits of men and women, predominantly German Jews, with some references to religion, and to intermarriage and conversion either to Christianity or to Judaism. More comprehensive is his "Jewish Characters in the American Novel to 1900" (Doctoral dissertation, New York University; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 16, no. 6, pp. 1142–1143; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Michigan (1956), pub. no. 16,778). This panoramic view since the eighteenth century includes about 250 novels, in many of which religion is the significant theme, mostly inspired by the Bible—Biblical "best-sellers"—also religious novels by Jewish authors, notably Isaac Mayer Wise; and a definition of the rationale of the treatment of the Jew in religious novels. Harold U. Ribalow, "Jewish Life in the American Novel," in *American Mercury*, Vol. 71, no. 319 (July 1950), pp. 109–117, generally reviews novels about Jews, by Jews or others, mentioning ten during the past thirty years, giving accurate insight into American Jewish life, with critical comment of great value, especially on Jews of the New York East Side. Jews are pictured as much like other Americans in the struggle of life. Jewish self-hate is terribly depicted. Religious motifs are more or less

present in the agony of trying to find a good adjustment. David Boroff, "The Jew in Recent American Fiction," in *Reconstructionist*, Vol. 21, no. 17 (Dec. 30, 1955), pp. 20–23, notices the tendency to present extremely victimized or aggressive Jews, and the trend in recent novels to balance these with normal and conservative Jewish types. A neglected area is the relation of the Jew to his own community, the milieu of the authentic Jewish personality. A brief review is offered by Edith Menard's "Jews in Fiction," in *American Hebrew*, Vol. 55 (Mar. 29, 1946), pp. 5, 12. An extensive scholarly study of an American Jewish novelist, who depicts some people in the religious community, is William Robert Bittner's *The Novels of Waldo Frank* (Philadelphia, 1958), with a bibliography. A summary of his conclusions appears in his "Waldo Frank as a Jewish Writer," in *Chicago Jewish Forum*, Vol. 15, no. 3 (Spring, 1957), pp. 158–162, regarding him as "a contemporary exponent of the ancient Jewish ideal of spiritualizing and socializing human character." Edward D. Coleman, "Plays of Jewish Interest on the American Stage, 1752–1821," in American Jewish Historical Society, *Publications*, Vol. 33 (1934), pp. 171–198, with notes, describes the "stage Jew," taken over bodily from English plays, with no reference to the American Jew as a type.

There have been, unfortunately, too few scholarly studies of American Jewish authors who have referred more or less to Judaism as a religious community. Assuredly the best is Heinrich Eduard Jacob, *The World of Emma Lazarus* (New York, 1949), with a bibliography, probably the most scholarly biography of the influential Jewish-American poetess, who expressed poignantly the longing for freedom in America of the oppressed Jewish masses, and the ardent spirituality of American Jewish idealism. Isaac Goldberg, in his *Mordecai Manuel Noah* (Philadelphia, 1936) presents a scholarly and highly readable life of the early American Jewish publicist, journalist, politician and utopian reformer.

C. Roman Catholic

Roman Catholicism in American literature presents peculiar problems to both the Catholic writer and critic, and the critic and creative artist outside the faith. This section suggests, first, the Catholic "color" in American creative writing. Succeeding titles indicate the generally indifferent attitude of the Roman Catholic masses toward creative writing, which frequently is a frustrating burden and problem to ambitious and honest American Catholic authors. A few references illuminate the travails of the Catholic writer, caused largely by certain limitations imposed by the dogmas of his faith. A few studies are included on the attitude of certain classical American authors, of the Puritan Protestant tradition, toward Roman Catholicism. This special field still awaits extensive and detailed scholarly study.

Michael Williams, "The Catholic Spirit in American Literature," in *Forum,* Vol. 80, no. 3 (Sept. 1928), pp. 441–449, mentions the decline of the Puritan tradition, the drift toward modernism, and the essential Christian doctrine preserved by Catholicism. American literature has stemmed from Puritanism or revolt against it. There is no great American Catholic writer, but many of lesser rank flourish, and Catholic tradition appears in modern novels by non-Catholics. The revival of humanism is a favorable sign for development of Catholic literature. The same critic's "Catholicism and American Literature," in *Catholicism and the Modern Mind* (New York, 1928) observes an increasing importance of Catholicism in literature, and the necessity of this element against barbarizing tendencies. Literature must follow the return to religion as devitalized Puritanism passes. Catholicism is becoming the center of gravity for rebels against decadent Puritanism, and vulgarity. Walter J. Ong, "American Catholicism and America," in *Thought,* Vol. 27, no. 107 (Winter, 1952–1953), pp. 521–541, includes treatment of American Catholics' attitudes toward literature. His "Con-

trasts in Catholicism," in *Commonweal*, Vol. 43, no. 9 (Dec. 2, 1955), pp. 215–219, contrasts American and French Catholics' attitudes toward literature, pointing out the more tolerant and cultured approach in France. Henry Rago, "Catholics and Literature," in *Commonweal*, Vol. 59, no. 4 (Oct. 30, 1953), pp. 81–84, sees no Catholic literary revival in America; the best critics, generally, are not Catholic, and the most "pure-minded" reading of literature is in non-Catholic universities. What might be, however, is suggested by Edward J. Drummond, "A Critical History of Catholic Literary Criticism in America: Studies of Brownson, Azarias, and Egan, with an Essay for Catholic Critics" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Iowa, 1942). This clearly suggests the possibility of a respectable intellectual approach, without sacrificing the essentials of the faith. Likewise does Sister Helen Margaret, "Religion and the Literary Technique," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 157, no. 4 (July 1943), pp. 390–393.

An extensive number of searching essays exist, probing the difficult path of the Catholic writer who tries consciously to create a literature expressive of true Catholic values, yet avoiding dogmatism and affected piety. "Problems of the Catholic Writer," editorial in the *Catholic World*, Vol. 161, no. 996 (Mar. 1948), pp. 481–486, concerns the claim of the Roman Catholic Church to dogmatize on the duty of literature to hew to the line of official pronouncements on morality, and notes the rebellion of some Catholic writers against the straitjacket. Allen Tate, "Orthodoxy and the Standard of Literature," in *New Republic*, Vol. 128, no. 1 (Jan. 5, 1953), pp. 24–25, discusses the "standing quarrel between the imaginative writer and the Church." There is a growing rebellion among Roman Catholic writers against vague and ignorant piety, as they realize that works by Roman Catholics must be judged by the same standard as any other literature, and that much American Catholic writing is mediocre, a statement of doctrine rather than true literature. The Roman Catholic author is in a painful dilemma.

The problem is nowhere more stubborn than in the field of fiction. A general discussion appears in Francis Xavier Talbot, ed., *Fiction by Its Makers* (New York, c.1928), consisting of essays by Catholic novelists, first published in *America*, with a bibliography; also in J. W. Guinan, "The Catholic and the Novel," in *Catholic Churchman*, Vol. 5 (Mar.–Apr., 1942), pp. 112–114. Jack English, "Can a Catholic Write a Novel?" in *American Mercury*, Vol. 31, no. 121 (Jan. 1934), pp. 90–95, discerns no important novel by an American Catholic; Catholic novels are written by non-Catholics like Willa Cather. Lack of incentive is due to the small and usually uneducated Catholic public, but there are hopeful signs, in the popularity of novels about Catholics. Examples, selected from many novels illustrating Catholic values, are: Willa Cather, *Death Comes for the Archbishop* (New York, 1927), concerning Catholic civilization in New Mexico; and her Catholic Quebec story, *Shadows on the Rock* (New York, 1931). Franz Werfel's *The Song of Bernadette* (New York, 1942), although not American in theme, has been an American best seller. Also worthy of inclusion is Henry Morton Robinson, *The Cardinal* (New York, 1950). These all present very human Catholics. The nun, favorite stock character, is far less approachable. Jean Holzhauer, "The Nun in Literature," in *Commonweal*, Vol. 65, no. 21 (Feb. 22, 1957), pp. 527–529, comments on the problem presented by depiction of the nun to readers: her remoteness. Examples of nuns in modern American literature are *The White Sister*, *The Bells of St. Mary's*, and *Come to the Stable*, as creators of a type. The problem is to present various types, rather than the pious stereotype the public appears to want. Walter V. Gavigan, "Nuns in Novels," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 140, no. 836 (Nov. 1934), pp. 186–195, has critical notes on depiction of nuns in novels by some American authors: Fannie Hurst, *Appassionata* (New York, 1926); Helene Mullins, *Convent Girl* (New York, 1929); nuns in Willa Cather's *Shadows on the Rock* (New York,

1931); and *Death Comes for the Archbishop;* Mary Ellen Chase, *Uplands* (Boston, 1927); F. Marion Crawford, *The White Sister* (New York, 1908); and Thornton Wilder, *The Bridge of San Luis Rey* (New York, 1928).

The contrast between Protestant and Catholic values, as illuminated by classic American authors, is vividly illustrated by studies of literature in Puritan New England, the section often considered as most antithetic to Catholicism. Jeremiah K. Durick, "Catholicism and the Literature of New England, 1815–1865" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Ottawa, 1943) presents an over-all study of the late-Puritan and Transcendentalist attitudes, which are studied closely by Charles C. Charvat, in "Emerson and Catholicism" (Doctoral Dissertation, University of Iowa, 1940). G. P. Voigt, "Hawthorne and the Roman Catholic Church," in *New England Quarterly,* Vol. 19, no. 3 (Sept. 1946), pp. 394–397, shows that he "appreciated certain of its features, such as the confessional, but . . . never approved or accepted the Catholic creed or code of ethics." (See: *American Literature,* Vol. 18, no. 3, Nov. 1946, p. 276.) The details of his attitude are solidly filled in by Henry G. Fairbanks, "Hawthorne and the Catholic Church," in *Boston University Studies in English,* Vol. 1, no. 3 (Autumn, 1955), pp. 148–165. Remarks in the French and Italian notebooks and *The Marble Faun* "purportedly show that as Hawthorne 'protested against the increasing fragmentation of American experience' he 'approached a view which approximated the Catholic view relieved of dogmatic rigidity.' " (See: *American Literature,* Vol. 28, no. 4, Jan. 1957, p. 562.) Lawrence Willson, "Thoreau and Roman Catholicism," in *Catholic Historical Review,* Vol. 42, no. 2 (July 1956), pp. 157–172, claims that Thoreau was committed to Protestantism, but that his reading in the history of Catholic America inspired more respect for Catholicism than he had originally. (See also Part Two, above, sect. IX, B, 10, *Roman Catholicism and American Democracy.*)

VI. FICTION

A. Bibliography

Otis Welton Coan and Richard G. Lillard, *America in Fiction, an Annotated List of Novels that Interpret Aspects of Life in the United States* (Stanford, Cal., 1956, 4th ed.) has very brief annotations, with recommended titles starred, and includes some religious novels. The first century of the novel after American independence is exhaustively covered by three bibliographies: Oscar Wegelin, *Early American Fiction, 1774–1830, a Compilation of the Titles of Works of Fiction by Writers Born or Residing in North America North of the Mexican Border, and Printed Previous to 1831* (New York, 1929, 3rd ed., cor. and enl.) is useful for locating the few "religious" novels and stories published before the mid-century popularity of such fiction. Lyle Henry Wright, *American Fiction, 1774–1850; a Contribution toward a Bibliography* (San Marino, Cal., 1948, rev. ed.), has 2,772 titles, and a chronological index, and lists novels, romances, short stories, allegories, and tract-like tales, located in libraries and private collections, with a title index. His *American Fiction, 1851–1875; a Contribution toward a Bibliography* (San Marino, Cal., 1957), with a title index but with no annotations, is an excellent guide for tracing early Victorian religious fiction. Frances Brentano, ed., *The Word Lives On; a Treasury of Spiritual Fiction,* with an introduction by Halford E. Luccock (Garden City, N.Y., 1951) includes topically classified American selections and deals with religion in a broad sense, and with the passion for righteousness. Based upon a vast extent of research, it is intended to indicate the great concern of fiction with religion in people's lives, and reveals a complete change of attitude since the 1920's, when it was held that religion was based only upon fear and sorrow, which were no longer concerns of cultured people. Francis X. Talbot, ed., and Stephen

J. M. Brown, comp., *Novels and Tales by Catholic Writers* (New York, 1930, American ed., rev. by Walter Romig) lists all fiction, original or translated, by Catholic writers in English, arranged alphabetically by authors, and includes many Americans and fiction with religious background and purpose.

B. General Histories and Commentaries

Alexander Cowie, *The Rise of the American Novel* (New York, 1948) is a detailed study concentrating upon the period down to and including Henry James, and is considered the best authority on the period covered. Arthur Hobson Quinn, *American Fiction, an Historical and Critical Survey* (New York, 1936) is regarded as the most detailed study of novels and short stories, with bibliographies by chapters, and with a mass of information on the older novelists not available elsewhere; but it is not sympathetic toward the modern tendencies. Edward Charles Wagenknecht, *Cavalcade of the American Novel, from the Birth of the Nation to the Middle of the Twentieth Century* (New York, 1952), with a very valuable annotated bibliography, has a chapter on "The Soul's Romance: Hawthorne," one on Melville, and a section on the "Purpose-Novels" (sometimes religious) of the 1880's. Richard Volney Chase, *The American Novel and its Tradition* (Garden City, N.Y., 1957), with "Works Cited," covers a wide range of topics, illustrated by citations and quotations of many novelists. He gives special attention to moral standards in fiction, the influence of theology and of Puritan spirituality, and the use of traditional Biblical language, moral dilemmas, Calvinist and general Christian influence, sources of moral values, clergymen in fiction, the idea of evil, moral standards in the novel of manners, and the frequent falsity of conventional religion. Carl Clinton Van Doren, *The American Novel, 1789–1939* (New York, 1940, rev. and enl. ed.), with bibliography, is a general sur-

vey, with a few references to novels of religious interest.

The most comprehensive review, since the rise of realism and naturalism, is presented in three studies by Maxwell David Geismar. His *Rebels and Ancestors: The American Novel, 1890–1915: Frank Norris, Stephen Crane, Jack London, Ellen Glasgow, Theodore Dreiser* (Boston, 1953), with bibliographies of individual works of the authors, reference works, biographies, and critical writings on them, contains little on specific religious influences or allusions, but much on the reaction from idealism, and the obsession of the American novel with Darwinism, the idea of survival of the fittest, primitivism, and the force of animal desires, symbolism, and supernaturalism in Dreiser. The general movement was away from traditional "religious values." *The Last of the Provincials: The American Novel, 1915–1925: H. L. Mencken, Sinclair Lewis, Willa Cather, Sherwood Anderson, F. Scott Fitzgerald* (Boston, 1947) has bibliographies of the individual works of the authors, and studies of them. There is little specific observation on religion, but important comment on Willa Cather's interest in Roman Catholicism as an apparent solution of religious restlessness, Mencken's attack upon modern Protestantism, and the undercurrent of Catholicism in the social frustration of Fitzgerald. Geismar's *Writers in Crisis: The American Novel between Two Wars, 1925–1940* (Boston, 1942) has studies of Ring Lardner, Ernest Hemingway, John Dos Passos, William Faulkner, Thomas Wolfe, and John Steinbeck.

Harold Charles Gardiner, ed., *Fifty Years of the American Novel; a Christian Appraisal* (New York, 1951), with notes on the contributors of the essays, is the best general Roman Catholic critique. Without a marked "party line" or agreement, it regards each author from the general viewpoint of coming to grips with man, in action and involved in the sphere of morals. Regis Michaud, *The American Novel Today; a Social and Psychological Study* (Boston, 1928), with references to novels treating religious themes, is almost

obsessed by Puritanism as an element of conflict in the American mind and literature, as seen in Hawthorne, Poe, Dreiser, Anderson, and Mencken. Lewis's *Elmer Gantry* is used as an illustration of the decline of religious ideals, and of the death of idealism in the novel. Harry Redcay Warfel, *American Novelists of Today* (New York, 1951) comprehensively lists the authors, with biographical and bibliographical data, but is not critical.

C. Religion and Fiction

Andrew Landale Drummond, *The Churches in English Fiction; a Literary and Historical Study from the Regency to the Present Time of British and American Fiction* (Leicester, Eng., 1950), with bibliographical footnotes, is mostly devoted to British novelists, but notices American novels combining liberal theology and the Social Gospel: Margaret Deland and liberation from Calvinism; Winston Churchill and Christian economic responsibility, linking social reform and doctrinal modernism; Harriet B. Stowe's novels on life and religion in New England, in transition from Puritanism to "mitigated" Evangelicalism. The rise of religious interests in the novel before the Social Gospel is admirably surveyed in two studies: Lorenz Blankenbuehler, "Religious Elements in the Novel before 1830" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1928); and Leonard Burwell Hurley, "The American Novel, 1830–1850: Its Reflection of Contemporary Religious Conditions, with a Bibliography of Fiction" (Doctoral dissertation, North Carolina College for Women, Greensboro, N.C., 1932, unpublished). Henry Walter Featherstun, *The Christ of Our Novelists* (Nashville, Tenn. and Dallas, Tex., 1904), while neither very critical or scholarly, is nevertheless one of the earliest and most interesting books on this topic, offering a few selected examples of the religious power of fiction, as seen in Nathaniel Hawthorne, E. P. Roe, Augusta J. Evans, Edward

Eggleston, and Lew Wallace. Calvary is considered as the "lodestone" of these novelists. E. Virginia Williams, "Religion and the Church as Motifs in American Fiction" (Master's thesis, Vanderbilt University, 1930) pays special attention to Southern writers, and particularly to Corra Harris.

The restoration of religious interest to the novel, due partly to religious "revival" since the late 1920's, and partly to reaction from materialism, skepticism, and "brutal naturalism," is admirably summarized by Armand Henry Ulbrich, in his "The Trend Toward Religion in the Modern American Novel, 1925 to 1951" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1953; *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 13 (1953), no. 3, pp. 395–396; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1953), pub. no. 5104). He attempts to determine the exact nature of the return to religion, and to trace it in selected examples of fiction by Sinclair Lewis, Theodore Dreiser, Ernest Hemingway, Willa Cather, Ellen Glasgow, Thornton Wilder, and William Faulkner. The tendency is away from naturalism and toward a sympathetic consideration of religion, but not usually toward traditional orthodoxy. There is a parallel to the decline of liberalism, and the rise of Neo-Orthodoxy and existentialism. John J. Bunting, Jr., "Religion among the Novelists," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 24, no. 2 (Spring, 1955), pp. 208–218, with bibliographical footnotes, points to the rich mine of religious suggestiveness in leading contemporary American novelists usually neglected and often maligned by Christians. They have seen the emptiness and disillusionment without God and have found, if not Christ, at least the principles He embodies—dignity, pity, compassion, and redemption. Their asking of the right questions challenges the church. Van Meter Ames, "Religious Fiction," in Winfred E. Garrison, ed., *Faith of the Free* (Chicago and New York, 1940) rapidly surveys the field, with notes on the implicit religious and moral

significance of several novelists, including John Steinbeck, James T. Farrell, and Henry James. The real need is more imagination, compassion, and social responsibility, rooted in religion. Maude Miller Hawkins, "Religious Aspects of Modern American Fiction" (Master's thesis, University of South Carolina, 1932) pays special attention to Southern writers, particularly Elizabeth Madox Roberts.

Thomas John Beary, "Religion and the Modern Novel," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 166, no. 993 (Dec. 1947), pp. 203–211, is a critique from the viewpoint of modern Roman Catholic standards of literary criticism, and points out the risks run by the novelist who tackles religion. He sees the year 1940 as the point of turning toward greater interest in religious novels, by spontaneous reaction against materialism and the grimness of war. His analysis of Harry Sylvester's *Moon Gaffney* declares that its criticism of the Church fails because it is too extreme.

D. The Clergy: Writers and Subjects

Gilbert P. Voigt, "Our Evangelist Clergymen-Novelists," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 22, no. 4 (Autumn, 1953), pp. 604–615, studies eight examples, representing various denominations and a persistent trend in popular literature since the 1830's, including early-Christian, Social-Gospel and modern "redemptive" novels. Their technique, whether orthodox or liberal, represented the blend of sincerity, humanitarianism, sentimentalism, and common speech, which the average reader wanted. Richardson Wright, *Hawkers and Walkers in Early America, Strolling Peddlers, Preachers, Lawyers, Doctors, Players, and Others, From the Beginning to the Civil War, with 68 Illustrations from Old Sources* (Philadelphia, 1927) presents picturesque examples of the itinerant evangelists. The New England type of parson, as depicted by novelists and story-writers, appears in Katherine

Koller's "The Puritan Preacher's Contribution to Fiction," in *Huntington Library Quarterly*, Vol. 11, no. 3 (Aug., 1948), pp. 321–340.

James H. Penrod, "Teachers and Preachers in Old Southwestern Yarns," in *Tennessee Folklore*, Vol. 18, no. 4 (Dec. 1952), pp. 91–96, examines humorous writings of Longstreet, Baldwin, Hooper, G. W. Harris, Taliaferro, and Lamar, in which ministers are generally portrayed as hypocrites, charlatans, ignoramuses, or prigs. The best general scholarly study, from a sociological and philosophical angle, is Emerson Clayton Shuck, "Clergymen in Representative American Fiction, 1830–1930; A Study in Attitudes toward Religion" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Wisconsin, 1943).

Arnold F. Keller, Jr., "The Clergyman in Recent Fiction," in *Lutheran Church Quarterly*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (April 1947), pp. 193–198, claims that during the past 25 years portraits of the clergy "with very few exceptions, have proven to be mediocre facsimiles of the real thing." Roman Catholic priests have come off rather better than Protestant ministers. Novelists generally have presented the least worthy side, as a result of the secularization of literature, which appeals to a large block of the reading public. Charles Neider, ed., *Men of the High Calling* (Nashville, 1954) consists of short stories about clergymen, including some by American authors (S. V. Benét, Henry Cuyler Bunner, Lloyd C. Douglas, and Nathaniel Hawthorne). Robert McAfee Brown, "The Minister and Contemporary Literature," in *Union Seminary Quarterly Review*, Vol. 12, no. 1 (Nov. 1956), pp. 9–19, pleads for the minister's study of contemporary literature as something more than a source of sermon illustrations. He needs a realistic appraisal of and communication with life, to discover a Christian message of redemption to confused and lost people, and to see what life is like apart from faith, and to prepare for an "invasion of grace." The sensitivity, compassion, and concern for persons of contemporary writers

is the heart of Christian faith. Nancy Bullock Woolridge, *The Negro Preacher in American Fiction before 1900* (Chicago, 1945) is part of a doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1942, reproduced from typewritten copy, and with bibliographical footnotes; typewritten copy in University of Chicago Library.

E. Propagandist Novels

The novel made a slow start in America. In the early years of the nineteenth century many public men spoke against novel-reading, condemning it as either downright immoral or as a waste of time. Paradoxically, the novel made its way, in part, because it was presently used as a weapon of propaganda by religious persons, and even by religious groups which earlier had been most severe in condemning it. This use of the novel as religious or socio-religious propaganda has been little explored, and there is almost no secondary material dealing with it in general, or with such a phase as the adoption of fiction as a propaganda agency of the Methodists—to cite but one example. There are, however, studies of the use of fiction in the anti-Catholic movement of the mid-nineteenth century.

1. ANTI-CATHOLIC PROPAGANDA. Ray A. Billington, "Tentative Bibliography of Anti-Catholic Propaganda in the United States (1800 to 1860)" in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 18, no. 4 (Jan. 1933), pp. 492–513, is the best bibliography on the subject, including reports of societies, newspapers, magazines, books, gift books and almanacs, histories, pamphlets, nativistic party documents, and a section on "Novels, Plays and Verse." His *The Protestant Crusade* (New York, 1938), particularly ch. XIV, on the literature of anti-Catholicism, illustrates the ingenuity and variety of the fictional attacks on the Roman Catholic Church, with references to anti-Catholic fiction. And his "Maria Monk and Her Influence," in *Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 22, no. 3

(Oct. 1936), pp. 283–296, discusses the notorious and typical anti-Catholic novel, Maria Monk [*pseud.*], *The Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk* (Burlington, 1836), a fictionalized account of a girl's adventures in a Quebec monastery, which aroused intense anti-Catholic feeling. The authorship has been attributed to several writers. A similar discussion is Allen Churchill's "The Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk," in *American Mercury*, Vol. 37, no. 145 (Jan. 1936), pp. 94–98. Edmund Farrenc, *Carlotina and the Sanfedisti; or, A Night with the Jesuits at Rome* (New York, 1853) is another typical anti-Catholic novel of the Know-Nothing era. The heroes are defenders of "Republicanism." Illustrations of the Roman Catholic effort to promote a counter-propaganda in fiction are: Hugh Quigley [*pseud.*, "A Missionary Priest"], *The Cross and the Shamrock; or, How to Defend the Faith, An Irish-American Tale of Real Life* (Boston, 1853); and Elizabeth Brun, *Oramaika, An Indian Story* (New York, 1854). (See also Part Two, sect. IX, B, 8, *Anti-Catholic Reaction.*)

2. SENTIMENT AND PIOUS EDIFICATION. The sentimentally religious novel written for pious edification began to emerge as early as the 1820's, and an early example is Chandler Robbins Gilman, *Memoirs of a New England Village Choir* (Boston, 1829; 2nd ed., Boston, 1834; 3rd ed., Boston, 1846). Soon this genre was utilized in loosely narrative books written to edify children in the Christian life. Remarkable among these efforts were the "Rollo Books" of Jacob Abbott, particularly *The Young Christian* (Boston, 1832). Jacob was emulated by his brother, John Stevens Cabot Abbott, in *The Mother at Home. Little Stories to Illustrate Piety* (Boston, 1833). In fact, this type of novel had almost innumerable manufacturers. James Fenimore Cooper tried his hand at it in *The Sea Lions* (New York, 1849), a love story in which the girl refuses to marry a man who is not convinced of the divinity of Christ. Another of his ventures is *The Oak Openings* (New York, 1848).

The popularity of the pious novel swept into the 1850's and the post-Civil War era, in such works as Susan Warner's *Wide, Wide World* (New York, 1851), a domestic novel about a middle-class home, filled with religious sentiment. Considerable popularity was attained by Miriam Fletcher's *The Methodist; or, Incidents and Characters from Life in the Baltimore Conference* (New York, 1859, 2 vols.). The Southern novelist Augusta Jane Evans introduced a strong religious element into her novel *Beulah* (New York, 1859), celebrating a triumph of religion over philosophy, and into her *St. Elmo* (New York, 1867). One could cite innumerable other more recent examples of this fictional craft, and a few must suffice. Henry Van Dyke's *The Story of the Other Wise Man* (New York, 1896) is a short tale expressing the religious feeling of the 1890's; and his *The Blue Flower* (New York, 1902) collects parables of the beauties of Christian life in various ages and lands. Religious sentiment colors many novels by Harold Bell Wright, such as *The Shepherd of the Hills* (New York, 1907), *The Calling of Dan Matthews* (Chicago, 1909), and *The Re-creation of Brian Kent* (Chicago, 1919).

The optimism of American Protestant theology, which attained its furthest reaches in the serenity of Emerson, was unable to deal with the trauma of war. In response to the psychological needs of a distraught people, Elizabeth Stuart Phelps wrote *The Gates Ajar* (Boston, 1869), an attempt to evade the bleakness of orthodox theology and the nebulousness of Transcendentalism. She made heaven (beyond the gates) a middle-class mansion, purged of mundane irritations. The author became "America's foremost authority on the home life of heaven," by the three sequels: *Beyond the Gates* (Boston, 1883), *The Gates Between* (Boston, 1887), and *Within the Gates* (Boston and New York, 1901). Her other sentimental novels that attained wide popularity are *The Sunny Side, or The Country Minister's Wife* (Philadelphia and New York, 1851), and *A Singular Life* (Boston, 1894),

which became a best seller. Mary Angela Bennett, *Elizabeth Stuart Phelps* (Philadelphia, London, 1939), with a bibliography of her writings, background, and biography, treats at length her religious fiction, devoting a chapter to *The Gates Ajar*, indicating its sources, especially its roots in her own bereavement and that of countless others in the Civil War, and its perfect answer to the mood of countless people through its use of "art for truth's sake." This type of novel is most capably described and criticized by Herbert Ross Brown, in *The Sentimental Novel in America, 1789–1860* (Durham, N.C., 1940), with a huge bibliography. A chapter, v in Book II, "Stepping Heavenward," is devoted to the religious novel, with references in footnotes. Brown tartly comments on lack of realism, with right always victorious and wrong always worsted, the specious plots carefully contrived by divine providence, the "essential falsity to life," and insistence that religious life must pay substantial dividends or offer some "compensation" in an after-life.

Some American novelists attempted to scour deeper than the writers for pious sentiment and edification. One of them was Oliver Wendell Holmes, a Unitarian liberal, who explored the problem of religion, morals, and the individual in his *Elsie Venner* (Boston, 1858–59) and other novels: *The Guardian Angel, A Mortal Antipathy*. His effort is appreciated in Clarence P. Oberndorf, *The Psychiatric Novels of Oliver Wendell Holmes* (New York, 1946, rev. ed.), with abridgment, introduction, and psychiatric annotations. Henry James touched upon religious problems in his *The Altar of the Dead* (New York, 1895). The deep spiritual aspects of religious conversion are explored in the Rev. Edward P. Roe's *Barriers Burned Away* (New York, 1872), using the setting of the great Chicago fire of 1871 as the background of spiritual conversion; also in his *Opening a Chestnut Burr* (New York, 1874). E. L. Grant Watson, "Melville's Pierre," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 3, no. 2 (Apr. 1930) pp. 195–234, treats "Pierre" as a rec-

ord of his mystical experience—coming of knowledge of good and evil, the fall from childhood innocence, and increase of consciousness, possible only for one with a spiritual inheritance of Christianity. Watson considers "Pierre" as the height of Melville's achievement.

3. SOCIAL CRITICISM. As the Social Gospel took hold upon the minds of progressive clerical and lay leaders, there grew up a vast literature of books and magazine essays, devoted to an analysis of the social situation and the Church's relations to it, challenging the Christian community to "do something about it," and prescribing remedies. An introduction to this extensive bibliography is provided by the footnotes to ch. VIII, "The Church Faces a New Age," pp. 135–148, in Charles H. Hopkins, *Rise of the Social Gospel;* and by Henry F. May, *The Protestant Churches and Industrial America* (New York, 1949), p. 207. The literature in the 1890's reveals serious questioning respecting the task of the Church, and the efficiency of traditional methods in meeting the new social needs. A unique form is the "Social Gospel novel." Most church and non-church people could hardly be expected to read articles in the theological journals, and the novel was a short-cut to the public mind. It probed into the Church's failures, her message and methods. The underlying attitude usually was optimistic, but expressed a sense of urgency, described forces hostile to religion, indicated the Church's errors, pointed to her true function, and exhorted her to do something to regain lost prestige and retain her influence in society. (See also Part Three, sect. VI, B, *The Later Social Gospel.*)

John Curtis Underwood, *Literature and Insurgency; Ten Studies in Racial Evaluation* (New York, 1914) includes novelists affected by the Social Gospel reform movement, such as William Dean Howells, Frank Norris, and Winston Churchill. Obed Brooks, "The Problem of the Social Novel," in *Modern Quarterly,* Vol. 6, no. 3, (Autumn, 1932), pp. 77–82, takes a Marxist approach, viewing the social-problem

novel in America, in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, as essentially reformist and middle-class—the helping hand extended from above—not the work of people who had actually felt the suffering of the exploited, and certainly not identified with the working classes. Robert L. Shurter, "The Utopian Novel in America, 1865–1900" (Doctoral dissertation, Western Reserve University, 1936) has references to some novels of this type, with religious inspiration and purpose. H. H. Eddy, "The Utopian Element in American Literature" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University) discusses many Utopian novels, including some with more or less religious inspiration and background. Rachel Ball, "A Study of Some American Religious Problem Novels" (Master's thesis, Southern Methodist University, 1930) pays special attention to Southern writers, particularly James Lane Allen, the Kentucky "local color" novelist, and T. S. Stribling.

The novel of social propaganda and criticism attained prominence long before the Social Gospel. It is well illustrated in the 1850's by the novels of Harriet Beecher Stowe, including *Uncle Tom's Cabin* (Boston, 1852), *The Minister's Wooing* (Boston, 1859), and *Poganuc People* (Boston, 1878). Forrest Wilson, *Crusader in Crinoline, the Life of Harriet Beecher Stowe* (Philadelphia, London and New York, c.1941), with a bibliography, considers her New England stories as authentic records of the decline of Puritanism, and *The Minister's Wooing* as marking a revolution in religious life, a departure from absorption in dogmas and the beginning of a more liberal and emotional type of observance.

As the post-Civil War industrial revolution got under way, the novel of social criticism began to make a real impression upon literary history. Among the more successful novels of this genre are: Elizabeth S. Phelps, *The Silent Partner* (Boston, 1871); Emery J. Haynes, *Dollars and*

Duty (New York, 1887); Edward Everett Hale, *How They Lived in Hampton* (Boston, 1888), a study of practical Christianity applied in the manufacture of woolens; Albion W. Tourgee, *Murvale Eastman, Christian Socialist* (New York, 1890, 1891); William T. Stead, *If Christ Came to Chicago!* (Chicago, 1894); and James Lane Allen, *The Reign of Law* (New York, 1900), blending Christian Socialism and science; also his *The Choir Invisible* (New York, 1897). Charles M. Sheldon's *In His Steps* (New York, 1896), a fabulously popular religious novel, attempts a naïve solution of the social problems of the "Gilded Age" following the Civil War, by a Congregational minister of Topeka, Kansas. It displays the spirit of the Social Gospel Movement, at a time of interest in religious work among the poor. He wrote also: *His Brother's Keeper, The Crucifixion of Philip Strong,* serialized and then published in book form. The idealistic note was sustained by Robert Herrick, who is studied in Blake Nevius, "The Idealistic Novels of Robert Herrick," in *American Literature,* Vol. 21, no. 1 (Mar. 1949), pp. 56–70. This studies his coloring of mysticism in *The Real World, A Life for a Life, The Healer, Clark's Field,* and *The Master of the Inn.* Another idealist was the immensely popular and politically knowledgeable Winston Churchill, who is assessed as a social critic by Lloyd W. Griffin, "Winston Churchill, American Novelist," in *More Books, the Bulletin of the Boston Public Library,* Vol. 23, no. 9 (Nov. 1948), pp. 331–338. The critic analyzes his *The Inside of the Cup* (1913) as a vehicle of his belief in a religion of positive social righteousness, dedicated to service and not to property; also his last book, *The Uncharted Way,* embodying his religious philosophy of self-reliance, and the duty of the individual to improve himself and the human race. Kenneth W. Cameron, "Novelist Winston Churchill and the Episcopal Church," in *Historiographer of the Episcopal Diocese of Connecticut,* no. 9 (Oct. 1954), pp. 6–7,

contains a long letter from Churchill to Bishop Edward L. Parker of New Hampshire, Apr. 7, 1917, on his Social Gospel novel-writing.

Among the novelists who entered the field of social criticism and reform was the mildly "realistic" William Dean Howells, in the following: *The Minister's Charge; or the Apprenticeship* (Boston, 1877); *Annie Kilburn* (New York, 1888); and *A Hazard of New Fortunes* (New York, 1889, 2 vols.). Mark Twain essayed social criticism in *Personal Recollections of Joan of Arc* (New York, 1893); also in *The Mysterious Stranger* (New York, 1916), and *The Man That Corrupted Hadleyburg* (New York, 1898). Of these two, Howells was by far the more sophisticated, as is revealed in Arnold Benjamin Fox, "Howells as a Religious Critic," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 25, no. 2 (June 1952), pp. 199–206, with bibliographical footnotes, an abridgment of a thesis, New York University. It is significant that Howells became a convert to Socialism, for he was a troubled agnostic, who had lost the religious faith of his youth and made his *The Leatherwood God* a satire on revealed religion. In novels he depicted clergymen who failed to effectuate the Christian gospel, through their surrender to environment and expediency. The churches generally had become sustainers of social position and social centers. A similar study of his religious attitude is Hannah Graham Belcher, "Howells' Opinions on the Religious Conflicts of his Age as Exhibited in Magazine Articles," in *American Literature*, Vol. 15, no. 3 (Nov. 1943), pp. 262–278.

Among the most determined and caustic novelistic critics of American society and religion were Frank Norris and Upton Sinclair. Representative of their work in this field are Norris's *The Octopus* (New York, 1901), on the struggle of California farmers against the political and economic power of the Southern Pacific Railroad, and *The Pit* (New York, 1902), a study of the impersonal economic forces motivating speculation in wheat, and of the entire social

implications. Upton Sinclair, who frankly used the novel as a lecture platform, attacked conditions of life and labor in the Chicago meat-packing business in *The Jungle* (New York, 1905), and assailed commercial exploitation of religion in *The Profits of Religion* (Pasadena, 1918). Far more fiercely anti-ecclesiastical was Jack London. His assault is analyzed by Sam S. Baskett in "A Source of The Iron Heel," in *American Literature*, Vol. 27, no. 2 (May, 1955), pp. 268–270. He claims Austin Lewis's articles in the Oakland *Socialist Voice* as a source for London's attack on organized religion because of its lack of social realism. (See also Part Three, sect. VI, B, 1, *The Preparation.*)

F. Religious Historical Novels

Ernest Albert Baker, *A Guide to Historical Fiction* (London, New York, 1914) has a complete index of authors, titles, historical names, places, events, allusions, and topics, and considers American fiction to about 1915, by periods, with a considerable number of works involving religious themes: the Puritans, New England religion, Catholic missions, Quakers, camp-meeting religion, and revivalism on the frontier. Jonathan Nield, *A Guide to the Best Historical Novels and Tales* (New York, 1925) is a general list, with titles, authors, publishers, and subjects, through the nineteenth century; supplementary lists, bibliographies, and indexes of titles and authors; and includes many American titles, some with religious significance. Ernest Erwin Leisy, *The American Historical Novel* (Norman, Okla., c.1950) follows the development from the colonial period through the 1940's with a topical treatment, analysis, and evaluation of individual novels, and a chronological annotated appendix of other novels. Although without attempt to interpret the historical novel as a whole, this is the first satisfactory guide. A. T. Dickinson, Jr., *American Historical Fiction* (New York, 1958) has a considerable number of references to re-

ligion in historical fiction, including such topics as Puritanism, Quakerism, revivals, religion on the frontier; also a classified list of American historical novels published in the United States, 1919–1956, a bibliography on historical and other fiction, and an appendix of historical novels among the best sellers, 1917–1955. John Yarnale, "The American Historical Novel from 1896 to 1906" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1938) includes a few with religious themes, at a time when the historical novel was at a height of popularity and was being used frankly for religious propaganda.

Examples of this type of religious fiction occur at least as early as the 1830's, one being William Ware's *Zenobia* (New York and Boston, 1838), on the struggles of the early Christians. Another immensely popular religio-historical novel was Joseph Holt Ingraham's *The Prince of the House of David* (New York, 1855); also *The Throne of David* (Philadelphia, 1860). Once the vogue was set, many other American writers took it up, and one of the most astonishing successes was General Lew Wallace's *Ben-Hur* (New York, 1880), set in the early Christian era. Imitations of *Ben Hur* came thick and fast in the 1880's, and one should mention George John Whyte-Melville, *The Gladiators* (New York, 1872); Marie Corelli, *Barabbas* (New York, 1893); and Florence Kingsley, *Titus, a Comrad of the Cross* (Elgin, Ill., 1894). Even Henry Adams tried the genre, and produced the not very popular *Esther* (New York, 1884). One of the enormously popular high romances of the period was Henry K. Sienkiewicz's *Quo Vadis* (Boston, 1896), based upon the apostolic labors of Saint Peter, and the Roman persecution of Christians. Irving McKee, *"Ben-Hur" Wallace, the Life of General Lew Wallace* (Berkeley, Cal., 1947), with a bibliography, devotes a chapter to *Ben-Hur*, emphasizing its importance as an answer to the agnosticism of Robert G. Ingersoll, and as an influence in breaking down religious prejudice against the novel, by presenting the Gospel story

through Victorian eyes. It was the inspiration of the vast wave of religious novels, which has been mentioned previously.

The popularity of the religious historical novel persisted through the 1890's and into the early twentieth century, borne on the tide of secular romantic historical fiction. Among the outstanding successes of the period were Hall Caine, *The Christian* (New York, 1896–97); Francis Marion Crawford, *Via Crucis: a Romance of the Second Crusade* (New York and London, 1898); William Allen Knight, *The Song of Our Syrian Guest* (Boston, 1904). The more recent revival of religious interest has carried to wide sales such novels as Robert Keable, *Simon Called Peter* (New York, 1921); Gladys Schmitt, *David, the King* (New York, 1946); and her *Confessors of the Name* (New York, 1952).

G. The Religious Best Seller

The popular American novelist always has been delicately attuned to the vagaries of his public's taste. One literary flavor, however, has remained in constant demand, and that is the religious best seller. The religious bias of the American mind is discernible in our literature from Michael Wigglesworth's poem, *The Day of Doom* (1662) to Lloyd Douglas's novel, *The Robe* (1943). The religious best seller held its own in the late nineteenth century, because the period pressed two matters on the consciousness of religious-minded people: how to accommodate one's mind to the awful destruction of the Civil War, and how to approach in Christian terms the social problems of capitalism. In both instances, novelists quickly responded to the sentiment of their times and produced books that gave answers. More recently, the best seller has been riding the crest of the religious "revival." (See *Recent Revival* in Part v, sect. v, *Religion and Psychology*.)

Frank Luther Mott, *Golden Multitudes: The Story of*

Best Sellers in the United States (New York, 1947) has chronological lists of "Over-all Best Sellers in the United States"; religious best sellers of colonial times; religious fiction of the 1850's, 1880's, and 1890's; the phenomenal Harold Bell Wright and the popularity of religious fiction in a period of declining church attendance; a critique on elements in his success; the popularity of Lloyd Douglas; comment on the continuing strength of the religious appeal; and the popularity of novels advocating reforms in the churches. Alice Payne Hackett, *Fifty Years of Best Sellers* (New York, 1945) includes a "Selective Bibliography" of literature on best sellers; a section on "Best Sellers before 1880," with some religious books; an "Alphabetical List of American Best Sellers to 1945," also including religious works, with sales, and a list, 1880–1945, in order of sales; also a list of religious best sellers over the years. See also her *Seven Years of Best Sellers, 1945–1951*, and her *Sixty Years of Best Sellers, 1895–1955* (New York, 1956). Dorothy C. Hockey, "The Good and the Beautiful, a Study of Best-selling Novels in America, 1895–1920" (Doctoral dissertation, Western Reserve University, unpublished, 1947) includes comments on the religious best sellers.

James D. Hart, *The Popular Book: A History of America's Literary Taste* (New York, 1950) has a bibliographical check-list and a chronological index of books considered, and discusses what happens to religious ideas when they become the themes of popular fiction. He notes especially the influence of the Civil War in promoting religious fiction and its vast popularity throughout the rest of the century. It was promoted by the religion and science controversy of the 1880's, and the reaction against Ingersoll; the influence of the rising Social Gospel and the application of fiction to social problems; and the revival of the religious best-selling novel after 1931, with the renewed interest in religion due to the need for faith caused by the depression and World War II. A penetrating view of elements in the popularity of

religious novels appears in James D. Hart, "Platitudes of Piety: Religion and the Popular Modern Novel," in *American Quarterly*, Vol. 6, no. 4 (Winter 1954), pp. 311–322. He advances the opinion that, while the American novel was popular before it dealt with religion, it was not "respectable." After examining a large quantity of popular religious fiction in the past century or more, he concludes that the truly popular American religious novel has to be undenominational to please a people divided among many churches, who would not accept anything else. E. D. Branch, "Jingle Bells: Notes on Christmas in American Literature," in *Saturday Review of Literature*, Vol. 16 (Dec. 4, 1937), pp. 3–4, 20–24, 28, comments on one of the sentimental veins in American religion that keep religious fiction popular. Maurice Falcolm Tauber, *Russell Herman Conwell, 1843–1925, a Bibliography* (Philadelphia, 1935), mimeographed, comprises over two hundred writings by and about him, including his religious fiction, and his immensely popular *Acres of Diamonds*, a "success" book that appealed to the same public as his and other religious novels.

Eugene Exman, "Reading, Writing, and Religion," in *Harper's*, Vol. 206, no. 1236 (May, 1953), pp. 84–90, makes comments and interpretations on the steady rise in the sale of religious books, especially fiction, since about 1935. K. T. Norris, "Religion and Popular Fiction," in F. X. Talbot, *Fiction by Its Makers* (New York, c.1928) consists of essays by Catholic novelists, first published in the magazine *America*, and has a bibliography. A Protestant view is reflected in Daniel A. Poling's "Books with Religious Significance Reach an All-Time High," in *Publisher's Weekly*, Vol. 151, no. 8 (Feb. 22, 1947), pp. 1236–1238. This briefly reviews recent religious fiction and non-fiction, with some critical notes, and a hopeful view that growth in quality, spiritual vision, and passionate purpose is penetrating deeper into genuine religious living.

Warren G. French, "A Hundred Years of a Religious

Best Seller," in *Western Humanities Review*, Vol. 10, no. 1 (Winter, 1956), pp. 45–54, is a critique of Joseph Holt Ingraham's novel, *The Prince of the House of David*, presenting an excellent analysis of the reasons why the popular religious novel is so successful. Perhaps the most prolific modern practitioner of the art is Lloyd C. Douglas, in his *The Magnificent Obsession* (Chicago and New York, 1929); *Forgive Us Our Trespasses* (New York, 1932); *The Green Light* (Boston, 1934); *White Banners* (New York, 1936); *Disputed Passage* (Boston, 1939); *The Robe* (Boston, 1942); and *The Big Fisherman* (Boston, 1948). *The Robe*, which became an immensely successful motion picture, is historically reviewed in "The Robe: Novel of Early Christianity Has Become a Popular Classic," *Life*, Vol. 23, no. 23 (Dec. 8, 1947), pp. 90–94, a brief history of the novel, with color photographs of the illustrations. Douglas's workmanship is contrasted with that of Sholem Asch by Horace J. Bridges in "Jesus in Fiction: 'The Robe' and 'The Nazarene,'" in *Standard*, Vol. 31, no. 6 (Mar. 1945), pp. 165–171, with high praise for the work of Asch and severe criticism of Douglas' taking liberties with the Gospel story and with historical facts. The popularity of these two novels is explained by the degradation of humanity through misinterpretation of the Darwinian evolutionary hypothesis—man is only a beast, life is unmoral. Popularity of such novels reveals a longing for a higher standard of moral judgment, in the epiphany of a person—*Jesus*.

The longing achieves one of its greatest satisfactions in the filming of religious novels. The technical problems are discussed in George Bluestone, *Novels Into Film* (Baltimore, 1957), with an extensive selected bibliography and some footnotes with references. This offers some commentary on filming and detailed observations on the problems of resetting. The dangers of misinterpretation appear in Malcolm Boyd, *Christ and Celebrity Gods, the Church in Mass Culture*

(Greenwich, Conn., 1958), with suggested readings. He discusses the "celebrity cult" as a means of vicarious living, and its invasion of the church; also the "religious" movie and its portrayal of Christ, classes of religious films, relations of the secular press to them, and problems of producing religious films that will appeal to the public and still hew close to the accepted religious line. Religious films are analyzed critically, and the subject of movies and religion is reviewed from the standpoint of Christian ethics. The church is in danger of being misled by the success of its own celebrity-seekers, and of so-called "religious" movies.

Among the most widely read best sellers are the novels of the Judaeo-Christian world of the First Century by Sholem Asch, including *The Nazarene* (New York, 1939); *The Apostle* (New York, 1943); *Mary* (New York, 1949); and *Moses* (New York, 1951). Others that should be named are Thomas Costain, *The Silver Chalice* (Garden City, N.Y., 1952); A. J. Cronin, *The Citadel* (Boston, 1937), and his *The Keys of the Kingdom* (Boston, 1941); Laura Keane Hobson, *Gentleman's Agreement* (New York, 1947); and Agnes Turnbull, *The Bishop's Mantle* (New York, 1947), and *The Gown of Glory* (Boston, 1952). Few of the popular religious fictionists appear to have a consistent philosophy. One, however, has published his credo, which is clearly explained in Sholem Asch, *What I Believe*, translated by Maurice Samuel (New York, 1941), an answer to the question asked by his readers: is Asch a Jew or a Christian, and what does he believe? His real intent is to use the medium of his work "to point to ancient moral values which are charged with the power of salvation for us and for our days." With his novels as the background, he considers personality, religion and faith, the transmission of faith from Jews to Gentiles, the period of atheism, and the struggle to regain faith as the foundation of freedom from the dominion of evil and negations. In America this mission may be realized,

and America may be a light to the Gentiles. (See also Willard Thorp's essay in Volume II of the present series: "The Religious Novel as Best Seller in America.")

H. Studies of Novelists

Note: References to the works of individual authors, and to commentaries on them, will be found in the list of authors in Lewis Gaston Leary, ed., *Articles on American Literature, 1900–1950* (see I, Bibliography).

I. NEW ENGLAND PURITANS AND TRANSCENDENTALISTS. Ruth Suckow, "An Almost Lost American Classic," in *College English*, Vol. 14, no. 6 (Mar., 1953), pp. 315–325, considers Harriet Beecher Stowe's *Oldtown Folks*, a successful novel on a religious theme in New England village life, which could be easily understood by a successful novelist of Middle-Western country living. Ernest Erwin Leisy, "The New England Religious Background in Mrs. Stowe's Novels" (Master's thesis, University of Chicago, 1919, typewritten copy, University of Chicago Library) has a bibliography, and a "Chronological Outline of Mrs. Stowe's Life and Works."

Mellicent Bell, "Hawthorne's 'Fire Worship'; Interpretation and Source," in *American Literature*, Vol. 24, no. 1 (Mar. 1952), pp. 31–39, gives "hints of Hawthorne's views of the new styles of religious thinking, his skepticism as to their value, and his conviction of the superior moral service performed by the older Christian beliefs." (See *American Literature*, Vol. 24, no. 3, Nov. 1952, p. 422.) William B. Stein, "The Parable of the Antichrist in 'The Minister's Black Veil,'" in *American Literature*, Vol. 27, no. 3 (Nov. 1955), pp. 386–392, states that "the parable of the black veil is the story of betrayal, of the man of God turned antichrist" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 28, no. 1, Mar. 1956, p. 113). Thomas E. Connolly, "Hawthorne's 'Young Goodman Brown': An Attack on Puritanic Calvinism," in *Ameri-*

can Literature, Vol. 28, no. 3 (Nov. 1956), pp. 370–375, with bibliography in footnotes, reviews previous critics and holds that Brown did not lose faith, but learned the "full and terrible significance" of the Puritan Calvinist doctrine of the elect and the damned—so few "saved" as practically to abolish the chance of salvation. James E. Miller, Jr. "Hawthorne and Melville: The Unpardonable Sin," in *Publications of the Modern Language Association*, Vol. 70, no. 1 (Mar., 1955), pp. 91–144, is a detailed analysis, carried through various stories by Hawthorne, of the steps by which pride of the intellect, losing touch with humanity, becomes the unpardonable sin; also a tracing of a common pattern for the commission of the unpardonable sin in *Moby-Dick* (see *American Literature*, Vol. 28, no. 1, Mar. 1956, p. 113).

Mentor L. Williams, "Some Notices and Reviews of Melville's Novels in American Religious Periodicals, 1846–49," in *American Literature*, Vol. 22, no. 2 (May 1950), pp. 119–127, with bibliography in footnotes, considers his strictures on missionary work in Polynesia, which were resented by the orthodox religious press. Liberal churches were not bothered and recommended home missionary work. Roman Catholics relished accounts of Protestant failure. William Braswell stresses the conflict between idealism and rationalism in *Herman Melville and Christianity* (Chicago, 1936; private edition, distributed by University of Chicago Libraries, part of Ph.D. thesis, 1934, photolithographed). Original idealistic faith gave way to skepticism and a sense of futility and despair. Melville came to believe that salvation lies in love and goodness as expressed in the Sermon on the Mount, but he was progressively disillusioned with the church. His theological cast of mind, bent toward Calvinism, prevented development of a liberal, happy attitude. His *Melville's Religious Thought, an Essay in Interpretation* (Durham, N.C., 1943), with bibliographical references included in "Notes," reviews Melville's early Calvinism, his abandoning the church, and his inability to account for

evil, leading him to reject the Christian concept of an entirely benevolent deity. *Moby-Dick* is his artistic expression of this view. *Mardi* and *Pierre* symbolize his spiritual conflict and increasing disillusionment, his idea of the incapacity of man to live by Christian ethics, and final resignation to the inscrutable laws of the universe. Henry F. Pommer, "Melville as Critic of Christianity," in *Friends Intelligencer*, Vol. 102, no. 8 (Feb. 24, 1945), pp. 121–123, holds that nineteenth-century hostility to him was largely an unreflective reaction to his analysis of denominational religion, which became an increasingly vehement attack. Unable either to believe dogmas or to derive satisfaction from unbelief, he fell back upon a Quaker-like doctrine of religion as a guide to conduct.

Lawrance Roger Thompson, *Melville's Quarrel with God* (Princeton, 1952), with bibliography in the extensive notes, stresses Melville's disillusionment with his early Calvinist religion, which made him a confused agnostic, in his rebellion striking out against Christianity and God. Never an atheist, he experimented with several solutions of the religious problem, but was never satisfied. An inverted mystic, he believed in, but conceived himself to be persecuted by, God. His literary artistry invented elaborate devices for concealing his real hostility to religion and God. Much the same idea is clarified in Frank Clark Griffith, "Melville and the Quest for God" (*Dissertation Abstracts*, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1952), Vol. 12, no. 5, p. 619). There was one continuing religious crisis in his life after his return from the South Pacific, as seen in *Mardi*, *Moby Dick*, *Pierre*, *Clarel*, and *Billy Budd*. He believed God to be responsible for evil, a malignant demon, not a just god. A contrary view appears in Perry Miller, "Melville and Transcendentalism," in *Virginia Quarterly Review*, Vol. 29, no. 4 (Autumn, 1953), pp. 556–575. This essay reminds one that *Pierre* seems like a critique of the "shallowness and smugness of Transcendentalism," but it is not a treatise, rather a "romance." There is

no "escape" or "retreat" into Christianity in *Moby Dick* or *Pierre*. Melville is not attacking Jehovah as a demon, is not bitterly anti-Christian. He is not feuding with a Christian God, his fundamental terms are not God and man, but man and nature, and so the works are Transcendental.

Sophie Hollis, "Moby Dick: A Religious Interpretation," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 162, no. 974 (May 1946), pp. 158–162, holds that the story is "a religious allegory of fate and free will, and it reveals the tragedy of the man who is neither believer nor infidel" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 18, no. 3 (Nov. 1946), p. 227). Francis Xavier Canfield, "*Moby-Dick* and the Book of Job," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 174, no. 1042 (Jan. 1952), pp. 254–260, concludes that "By using Melville's own copy of the Bible, it can be supposed that *Job* was a prevailing influence in the creation of *Moby-Dick*" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 24, no. 1 (Mar. 1952), p. 128). R. E. Watters, "Boston's Salt-Water Preacher," in *South Atlantic Quarterly*, Vol. 45, no. 3 (July 1946), pp. 350–361, considers the life and works of Edward Thompson Taylor, who apparently served as a model for Melville's Father Mapple in *Moby-Dick*. Allan H. MacDonald, "A Sailor among the Transcendentalists," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 8, no. 2 (June 1935), pp. 307–319, also relates to "Father Taylor" as the original of Father Mapple. William B. Stein, "The Moral Axis of 'Benito Cereno,'" in *Accent*, Vol. 15, no. 3 (Summer, 1955), pp. 221–223, is an "Analysis of the tale's religious, ritualistic overtones and its mood of bleak despair" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 28, no. 1 (Mar. 1956), p. 114). G. Giovannini, "The Hanging Scene in Melville's *Billy Budd*," in *Modern Language Notes*, Vol. 70, no. 7 (Nov. 1955), pp. 491–497, strives to impart some religious meaning to the whole story. This thesis is contradicted by Harry Modean Campbell, "The Hanging Scene in Melville's *Billy Budd:* A Reply to Mr. Giovannini," in *ibid.*, Vol. 70, no. 7 (Nov. 1955), pp. 497–500, which maintains that Melville's intent was ironic, and there

can be "no interpretation seeing religious rescue of Billy's soul." (See also Part Two, sect. 1, B, 3, *The Puritan Heritage and Controversy*.)

2. TWO SOUTHERNERS: POE AND FAULKNER. Claire E. Partridge, "Religious Tendencies of Edgar Allan Poe" (Master's thesis, Boston University, 1931) minutely examines his prose tales and other works for evidences of religious belief. Joshua McClennen, "William Faulkner and Christian Complacency," in *Papers of the Michigan Academy of Science, Arts, and Letters,* Vol. 41 (1956), pp. 315–322, with a brief bibliography, maintains that virtually all his novels and short stories reflect a conviction that a good life is impossible without genuine spiritual religion. At the same time they score the tragic, stiff complacency and Puritan Protestant inflexibility of many churches, which inspire "superiority," and make real understanding and forgiveness impossible. Professionalism has lost sight of Christ, but Negroes still have an access to Him that whites have lost. Peter Swiggert, "Moral and Temporal Order in *The Sound and the Fury*," in *Sewanee Review,* Vol. 61, no. 2 (Spring, 1953), pp. 221–237, a study of a Faulkner novel, describes his dramatization of moral concerns. His idea is that those are saved who have "a basically religious insight into the unity of human experience," based upon the power of human love which, outwardly projected, protects against the passage of time. But religion can be corrupted to be only moral complacency. R. C. Carpenter, "Faulkner's *Sartoris*," in *Explicator,* Vol. 14, item 41 (Apr. 1956) is "A symbolic reading, as an exploration of the Christian myth of sin, guilt, and redemption, indicates the oblique climax of *Sartoris* as a probing of spiritual crises rather than a failure in technique" (see *American Literature,* Vol. 28, no. 3, Nov. 1956, p. 418). William Van O'Connor, "Protestantism in Yoknapatawpha County," in *Hopkins Review,* Vol. 5, no. 3 (Spring, 1952), pp. 26–42, discusses the concern of Faulkner with the spirit of Southern Protestantism, which is the thematic center of two novels. Prepared to find virtues, he

is also harshly critical, troubled by sanctimoniousness and cruel righteousness (the bitter parody of the doctrine of predestination), and by the church as a cause of social destruction by lack of compassion and forgiveness, and religious professionalism divorced from the masses. Inside genuine religion one can still find direction, discipline, and consolation.

The same theme is explored in Julian N. Hartt, "Some Reflections on Faulkner's Fable," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 24, no. 4 (Autumn 1955), pp. 601–607. Assailed as blasphemous, but really neither cynical nor dishonorable in motivation, it strives to come to grips with the question, who is Christ? Long evident in his work is a striving for righteousness beyond the petty moralism of conventional Christianity. He espouses a religion of humanity, and moves toward an unconventional religion of belief in man. His use of traditional symbols, however, is revealed by Beekman W. Cottrell, "Christian Symbolism in 'Light in August'," in *Modern Fiction Studies*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Winter, 1956–1957), pp. 207–213. Harry Modean Campbell and Ruel E. Foster, *William Faulkner, a Critical Appraisal* (Norman, Okla., 1951) with a bibliography, studies structural and ideological phases of his work: imagery, symbolism, and primitivism. Irving Howe, *William Faulkner, A Critical Study* (New York, 1952) reports on social and moral themes, and tries to analyze and criticize the more important novels as works of art. Opposed to the fashionable view of him as an upholder of "traditional values," Howe regards him as an "authentic moralist," striving to realize the meaning of human virtue. R. W. B. Lewis, "The Hero in the New World," *Kenyon Review*, Vol. 13, no. 4 (Autumn, 1951), pp. 641–660, declares that Faulkner's books take the reader into a "world after the Incarnation," in which characters suffer the humiliation of Christ, with the possibility of redemption. This theological approach prevails throughout Edwin A. Penick, Jr., "A Theological Critique of the Interpretation of Man in the Fiction and Drama of William Faulkner, Ernest Hemingway, Jean-Paul Sartre,

and Albert Camus" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1954). A review of books and articles is provided by T. J. Hoffman and O. W. Vickery, eds., *William Faulkner: Two Decades of Criticism* (East Lansing, Mich., 1954).

3. WESTERN REALISTS. George Pierce Clark, "The Devil That Corrupted Hadleyburg," in *Mark Twain Journal*, Vol. 10, no. 1 (Winter, 1956), pp. 1–4, takes the position that "Twain's 'The Man That Corrupted Hadleyburg' belongs with his other late works showing his interest in Satan; perhaps a Miltonic influence can be established" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 29, no. 2, May 1957, p. 239). Essential religious interest has been traced also in F. Scott Fitzgerald, by H. W. Häusermann, "F. Scott Fitzgerald's Religious Sense: Notes and Query," in *Modern Fiction Studies*, Vol. 2, no. 2 (May, 1956), pp. 81–82. His basic Christianity is revealed in a close study of one of his novels by Douglas Taylor, "The Great Gatsby: Style and Myth," in *University of Kansas City Review*, Vol. 20, no. 1 (Autumn, 1953), pp. 30–40. "Fitzgerald uses myth (largely Christian) 'to alchemize the anarchy of modern life into a unity and permanence'; his basic feeling for experience is essentially religious and ethical" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 26, no. 1, Mar. 1954, p. 135). Ernest E. Leisy, "Dreiser's Mennonite Origin," in *Mennonite Life*, Vol. 9, no. 4, (Oct. 1954), pp. 179–180, establishes the fact that his mother was a Mennonite, and avers that his fundamental Protestant sectarian pietism, of a compassionate nature, is shown by his joining a Protestant church late in life. Peter Lisca, *The Wide World of John Steinbeck* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1958), with bibliographical references in the notes, has a chapter devoted to the Biblical background, structure, and symbolism of his novel, *The Grapes of Wrath*, and its Bible-reading folk; the references lead farther afield in discussions of his religious attitude, and the effect of religion upon his art. Christian imagery in Steinbeck's thought is clarified by Martin Shockley's essay, "Christian Symbolism in *The Grapes of Wrath*,"

in *College English*, Vol. 18, no. 2 (Nov., 1956), pp. 87–90. Ernest Hemingway's basic interest in religion, especially in Catholicism, is the subject of several interesting studies. Leo J. Hertzel, "Hemingway and the Problem of Belief," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 184, no. 1099 (Oct. 1956), pp. 29–33, maintains that Catholicism forms an important part of the texture of his early novels. Melvin Backman, "Hemingway: The Matador and the Crucified," in *Modern Fiction Studies*, Vol. 1, no. 3 (Aug., 1955), pp. 2–11, shows the "crucified" as one of two dominant motifs in his work, representing "the taking of pain, even unto death." Carlos Heard Baker, *Hemingway, the Writer as Artist* (Princeton, N.J., 1956, 2nd ed.) stresses the religious symbolism in some of his novels and stories—for example, a parallel between the experience of Santiago and Calvary; similarity of passages to Biblical language, parables in particular; and the note of "all is vanity" from Ecclesiastes. His "unobtrusive natural piety," and nondoctrinaire attitude to dramatizing religious motifs, show consciousness of God, awareness of the Book of Common Prayer.

VII. RELIGION AND POETRY

A. Religion and Poetry: Philosophy and Criticism

Hoxie N. Fairchild studies "Some Historical Interrelations of Religion and Poetry," in Conference on Science, Philosophy, and Religion in Their Relation to the Democratic Way of Life, *Science, Philosophy, and Religion, A Symposium*, Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 49–66. He describes a historical approach to the question of the necessity of the religious sentiment in a society for the prosperity of literature. Thomas Stearns Eliot, "Religion and Literature," in his *Essays Ancient and Modern* (London, 1936) consists of remarks on religion and poetry in general by one of the foremost American-born modern poets. George Finger

Thomas, *Poetry, Religion and the Spiritual Life* (Houston, 1951), in essays like sermons, gives testimony to the vitality of traditional idealism in poetry and religion. Cleanth Brooks, *Modern Poetry and the Traditions* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1939) maintains that English poetry and poetic theory were sidetracked from their richest tradition by scientific rationalism, and so departed from religion, but that T. S. Eliot and others have begun to resume the earlier line of growth. He discusses Archibald MacLeish at length.

There are many studies of the specific influences of religion and theology in modern poetry since the reawakening discerned by Brooks. Amos Niven Wilder's *The Spiritual Aspects of the New Poetry* (New York, c.1940), with "Orientation and reading guide," and bibliography, is among the outstanding studies, comprising critical notes on the general distinguishing characteristics of the new poetry, and the problem of defining the spiritual and religious element in the highly varied types of American poetry. He examines the factors making for denial of religious faith, and the faiths offered by poets: pantheism, nihilism, Marxism, and Christianity. Babette Deutsch, "Religious Elements in Modern Poetry," in *Menorah Journal*, Vol. 29, no. 1 (Jan.–Mar., 1941), pp. 21–48, analyzes the problem of the modern poet, unable to accept images of Greek paganism or the Christian myth, and suffering from loss of faith in science and "progress." Examples of poets' responses to loss of religious feeling are cited. The poet's assent to life, and death as a part of it, is somewhat religious. Revival of the feeling of oneness with nature, the kinship between man and the universe, make the poet aware of ethical responsibility, and of man as "one of the finer imaginings of God." William Van O'Connor, *Sense and Sensibility in Modern Poetry* (Chicago, 1948) is devoted mostly to aesthetic considerations, but discusses the alienation between the artist and society, including religion, and tries to guide the bewildered reader through the symbolic and other aspects of contemporary verse, mention-

ing several American poets, all more or less influenced by Eliot. He further explores their intellectual subtleties in his essay, "The Influence of the Metaphysicals on Modern Poetry," in *College English*, Vol. 9, no. 4 (Jan. 1948), pp. 180–187.

Nathan A. Scott, Jr., "Poetry, Religion and the Modern Mind," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 33, no. 3 (July 1953), pp. 182–197, with bibliographical notes, declares that those who seek to relate Christian faith to contemporary culture should read important imaginative literature and think deeply on its significance for religious thought. The theological critic, in relating poetic truths to those of theology, should not make of them an explicit metaphysic, a substitute religion. Religious tradition is operating in disguise in "secularized" groups and forces; modern writers, seemingly outside the faith, may be really its "outriders." Amos Niven Wilder, *Modern Poetry and the Christian Tradition: a Study in the Relation of Christianity to Culture* (New York, 1952) is a detailed consideration by a leading authority of the relations of religion to poetry. And his "The Protestant Witness in Contemporary Poetry," in *Theology Today*, Vol. 6, no. 2 (July 1949), pp. 196–205, with bibliography in footnotes, discusses Protestantism and the arts, and the thesis that Protestantism is "unaesthetic," and argues that its real aesthetic is expressed indirectly: lacking a large body of symbols, it brings to poetry not a tradition but a leaven, as is shown by W. H. Auden, a poet of Protestant background, who represents a protest against false culture and prophets, and offers a positive faith and morality. Manfred A. Carter, "Poetry Using Ministers," in *Religion and Life*, Vol. 22, no. 2 (Spring, 1953), pp. 243–250, with bibliographical footnotes, pleads for ministerial use of poetry, not as sermon decoration and soothing syrup, but as exploration of life, the poetry *using them* to speak often unwelcome truths. He cites many examples of the profounder poetry needed in the dialog between religion and art.

Scott, Wilder, and Carter represent a Protestant viewpoint. The Catholic attitude is summarized by Henri Brémond, in *Prayer and Poetry*, translated by Algar Thorold (London, 1927), which offers an illuminating treatment of the problems raised by the conjunction of religion and poetry. The area of definite religious or theological belief is traversed critically by Sister Mary James Power, "The Question of Belief as Evidenced by Certain Representative Contemporary Poets, 1900–1935" (Doctoral dissertation, Fordham University, 1936). And her *Poets at Prayer* (New York and London, 1938) reviews, with notes, "the attitude toward religion of some of the generally acknowledged leaders in contemporary English and American poetry."

B. Bibliography and General History of American Poetry

"The Beginning of Verse, 1610–1808," Book I, ch. IX, by Samuel Marion Tucker, in *Cambridge History of American Literature*, Vol. I (New York, 1917), pp. 150–184, has an extensive bibliography, pp. 457–467, including general and special bibliographies, biography and criticism (general and special), anthologies, early colonial and national verse, and early religious poetry. References to early American religious poetry are found also in the following bibliographies: New York Public Library, *Early American Poetry, 1610–1820, A List of Works in the Library*, J. C. Frank, comp. (New York, 1917); and Oscar Wegelin, *Early American Poetry; a Compilation of the Titles of Volumes of Verse and Broadsides by Writers Born or Residing in North America, North of the Mexican Border* (New York, 1930, 2 vols., 2nd ed., rev. and enl.). William Bradley Otis, *American Verse, 1625–1807* (New York, 1909) has a bibliography, incl. bibliography and chronology, compendiums of American literature, literary history, biography and criticism, and books of American verse. Chapter II, on "Religious Verse," a general sur-

vey, includes some interesting curiosities and poems rarely mentioned in general literary histories, with critical notes. This is a valuable if not profound study, for most histories of American poetry have no special chapters on religion. William B. Cairns, "Magazines, Annuals, and Gift-Books, 1783–1850," ch. xx in Book II, *Cambridge History of American Literature*, Vol. 2 (New York, 1918) includes religious annuals and gift books (often containing poetry), with a bibliography, pp. 516–518. Horace Gregory and Marya Zaturenska, *A History of American Poetry, 1900–1940* (New York, 1946), with a descriptive bibliography, has some references to religious verse, but not many in proportion to the entire bulk of the work, and no section on religious poetry as such, or the religious element in poetry. United States, Library of Congress, General Reference and Bibliography Division, *Sixty American Poets, 1896–1944*, Selected, with Preface and Critical Notes by Allen Tate (Washington, D.C., 1954, rev. ed.), with brief annotations, is an excellent guide to modern poets who have shown interest in religious themes and philosophy.

C. Anthologies

1. GENERAL ANTHOLOGIES. The following titles illustrate the persistent popularity of religious verse for more than a century past. Some are the general anthologies, while others illustrate particular religious traditions and viewpoints. Some lean heavily to sentimentality. But, while the verse may be mediocre, they represent the popular taste, and so are historically important.

Rufus Wilmot Griswold, ed., *The Illustrated Book of Christian Ballads and Other Poems* (Philadelphia, 1844) was compiled by an indefatigable anthologist and critic, intended for the household, and "embellished" with engravings, "to elevate the taste and deepen the religious sentiments." With some selections from American verse, it is a

typical, rather sentimental, anthology of the romantic era. His *The Sacred Poets of England and America, from the Earliest to the Present Time* (New York, 1850, new improved ed.) was succeeded by his *Sacred Poets of England and America, for Three Centuries* (New York, 1886), and by Philip Schaff and Arthur Gilman, eds., *A Library of Religious Poetry; a Collection of the Best Poems of All Ages and Tongues, with Biographical and Literary Notes* (New York, c.1889). This includes some American contributions, and is truly catholic, with representatives of various faiths. Based upon extensive study, it was designed to be popular. Thousands of selections range from orthodox believers to natural religionists like Thoreau. Stephen Greenleaf Bulfinch, comp., *The Harp and the Cross: A Collection of Religious Poetry* (Boston, 1857) includes English and American verse, selected for various moods and occasions, from writers of various faiths, but with considerable accent upon liberalism. Anson Davies FitzRandolph, comp., *The Changed Cross, and Other Religious Poems* (New York, 1897) contains many American selections.

Fred Merrifield, comp., *Modern Religious Verse and Prose; an Anthology* (New York, 1925) includes American selections—much verse and little prose—and represents many faiths and lands, with selections classified, including such topics as yearning for God, infinite life of the universe, divine possibilities of man, Jesus in every-day life, service and world brotherhood, and worship. Thomas Curtis Clark, comp., *The Golden Book of Religious Verse; The Golden Book of Faith* (Garden City, N.Y., 1937) includes American selections, indexes of authors and first lines, titles, and a bibliography of sources. Many American selections represent various faiths and are classified by topics. *Testament of Faith; an Anthology of Current Spiritual Poetry* [1942–] (New York, Harbinger House, 1942–), with brief biographical notes, represents not the higher ranges of spiritual verse, but the run-of-the-mill, written by ordinary ministers and

lay people: the sort of verse found in religious magazines, from which it was largely selected.

2. ANTHOLOGIES OF AMERICAN RELIGIOUS POETRY. Anthologies of American poetry, containing some religious verse, are listed in Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951). There have been almost innumerable compilations of American religious verse, and the following titles represent some of the superior ones. George Thomas Rider, comp., *Lyra Americana; or, Verses of Praise and Faith, from American Poets* (New York, 1865) is one of the better early American collections. A similar excellent one is Charles Dexter Cleveland, ed., *Lyra Sacra Americana: or, Gems from American Sacred Poetry, Selected and Arranged, with Notes and Biographical Sketches* (New York and London, 1868). Theodore Whitefield Hunt, *American Meditative Poetry* (New York, 1896) has an essay on "The Spiritual Element in Poetry," and includes Bryant, Longfellow, Emerson, Poe, Whittier, Lowell, Taylor, Holmes, and Harriet Beecher Stowe; "American Memorial Lyrics: Elegies"; "American Devotional Lyrics: Hymns"; and "Some Later Lyrists." William Garrett Horder, ed., *The Treasury of American Sacred Song, with Notes Explanatory and Biographical* (London and New York, 1900, rev. and enl. ed.) was repeatedly reissued. The perennial appeal of the life and person of Jesus inspires Martha Foote Crow, comp., *Christ in the Poetry of Today; an Anthology from American Poets* (New York City, 1917). A wellspring of American religious feeling which is often neglected, or supposed scarcely to exist, has been uncovered by Irene Louise Hunter's *American Mystical Verse; an Anthology*, preface by Zona Gale (New York, 1925).

A few of the better collections represent particular religious views. Such are two Anglican anthologies: The Living Church, *Lyrics of the Living Church; Original Poems Compiled from "The Living Church,"* ed. C. W. Leffingwell (Chicago, 1891), and *A Draught Outpoured; an Anthol-*

ogy of Anglican Verse; Poems Published in "The Living Church," 1924–1934, ed. Portia Martin (Milwaukee, Wis., c.1934). Typical Roman Catholic anthologies are well illustrated by Theodore Maynard, *The Book of Modern Catholic Verse* (New York, c.1926); and Francis X. Talbot, ed., *The America Book of Verse* (New York, 1928). The best comprehensive one is Joyce Kilmer's *Anthology of Catholic Poets,* with a new supplement by James Edward Tobin (Garden City, N.Y., new, rev. ed., 1955), comprising nearly 300 pieces by 164 poets (with some Americans) since the middle of the nineteenth century, some religious in theme, with remarks on the nineteenth-century rebirth of Catholic poetry. Catholic religious verse appears frequently in *Spirit, a Magazine of Verse* (New York, Mar. 1934–), published by the Catholic Poetry Society of America. The pious type of anthology is represented by William Stanley Beaumont Braithwaite, ed., *Our Lady's Choir, a Contemporary Anthology of Verse by Catholic Sisters,* with a Foreword by the Rev. Hugh Francis Blunt and an Introduction by Ralph Adams Cram (Boston, 1931); also by Sisters of the Holy Cross, *Songs of the Road; a Century of Verse, by Sisters of the Holy Cross, Saint Mary's of the Immaculate Conception, Notre Dame, Holy Cross, Indiana, 1841–1941* (Paterson, N.J., c.1940).

One of the most remarkable compilations affords an insight into the intense religious life of Protestant liberalism, which often is mistakenly considered as unemotional: Alfred Porter Putnam, *Singers and Songs of the Liberal Faith; Being Selections of Hymns and Other Sacred Poems of the Liberal Church in America, with Biographical Sketches of the Writers, and with Historical and Illustrative Notes* (Boston, 1875). The semi-Oriental "cultist" emotional life is represented by Unity School of Christianity, *Best-loved Unity Poems; the First of a Series of Anthologies to be Compiled from the Unity Periodicals* (Kansas City, Mo., 1946).

D. Religion in American Poetry: Philosophy and Criticism

Henry Martin Battenhouse, *Poets of Christian Thought; Evaluations from Dante to T. S. Eliot* (New York, 1947) considers Emerson and T. S. Eliot very minutely and interprets them in terms of their Christian thought, its influence upon their lives and writing, and their modern readers. It presents "a balanced view of developing Christian thought down the centuries as it is reflected in the writings of our major poets." Augustus Hopkins Strong, *American Poets and Their Theology* (Philadelphia and Boston, 1916) discusses the old poets: Bryant, Emerson, Whittier, Poe, Longfellow, Lowell, Holmes, Lanier, and Whitman. Elmer James Bailey, *Religious Thought in the Greater American Poets* (Boston and Chicago, 1922) also includes the elder poets: Bryant, Poe, Emerson, Whittier, Longfellow, Holmes, Lowell, and Whitman, with a general introductory essay on religious elements in poetry, and a philosophical conclusion on the contributions of the nineteenth-century American poets, as a group, to religious thinking. A similar study is that of Gilbert Paul Voigt, "The Religious and Ethical Element in the Major American Poets," in University of South Carolina, Graduate School, *Bulletin*, no. 1, June 1, 1925 (Columbia, S.C., 1925).

Stuart Holroyd, *Emergence from Chaos* (Boston, 1957), with bibliographical references in notes, offers an extended discussion of religious experience, art and religion, and various kinds of apprehension of reality, and considers several modern poets' experience and expression of religion, including Whitman's healthy-minded paganism, and T. S. Eliot's intellectualized and theologized awareness of man's religious problem. The poet, peculiarly sensitive to the contemporary confusion, strives to impose order upon the chaos of the blind, instinctive forces of the unconscious. Yvor Winters,

In Defense of Reason; Primitivism and Decadence; A Study of American Experimental Poetry; Maule's Curse; Seven Studies in the History of American Obscurantism; The Anatomy of Nonsense; The Significance of "The Bridge" by Hart Crane (New York, 1947) republishes essays defending an absolutist theory of literature: literature aims to express "a particular kind of objective truth." This theory, applied especially to poetry, the main concern, implies a theistic position, derived from his critical and moral notions. The poets included are Melville, Poe, Jones Very and Emerson, Emily Dickinson, Wallace Stevens, T. S. Eliot, Hart Crane, and many lesser modern ones. Hugh Thomson Kerr, *The Gospel in Modern Poetry* (New York and Chicago, c.1926) is a collection of radio addresses including Alan Seeger ("I have a Rendezvous with Death"), Vachel Lindsay ("General William Booth"), W. H. Carruth ("Each in His Own Tongue"), Edwin Markham ("Man with the Hoe"), and Joaquin Miller ("Columbus"). He analyzes poems to discern religious meaning. The function of the poet, like that of the preacher, is not to prove things, but to make people see. Not all the poets are necessarily Christian, but all are essentially religious, wistfully seeking a beyond. Frederick William Conner, *Cosmic Optimism; a Study of the Interpretation of Evolution by American Poets from Emerson to Robinson* (Gainesville, Fla., 1949), with notes and a bibliography, does not pretend to completeness, but touches many major and minor figures, the aim being historical as well as critical and philosophical. The poets were not interested in detailed scientific evidence of evolution, but rather in "how the new theories could be related to deeply rooted and persistent convictions concerning the benevolence and efficacy of God and the spiritual nature of man." Robert Daniel, "Odes to Dejection," in *Kenyon Review*, Vol. 15, no. 1 (Winter, 1953), pp. 129–140, traces the nineteenth-century odes (including Poe's "Raven") to the weakening of religious faith. In the twentieth century, Eliot and Tate wrote their

odes to dejection, "Prufrock" and "Confederate Dead," before their conversions.

Betty Louise Greek, "Christian Affirmation in Modern Poetry; a Study of the Evidence and Nature of Christian Affirmation in Modern Poetry and its Values for Christian Education" (M.R.E. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, typewritten, with bibliography) studies several American poets at length, and emphasizes their expression of the "glorious present tenses of religion." Modern poetry reveals man's immediate spiritual need of God, and the obstacles to faith, of which it is a very sensitive record; and "shows up" the Church for not revealing God, and for exhibiting the same lack of love as the "world." Poetry speaks to people immediately, as formal theology cannot, because the poet uses the contemporary idiom and creates an existential situation. Bernard E. Meland, "Kinsmen of the Wild: Religious Moods in Modern American Poetry," in *Sewanee Review*, Vol. 41, no. 4 (Oct.–Dec., 1933), pp. 443–453, with bibliography in footnotes, states that the religious quality is not traditionally "moralizing," but a break from the traditional religious sense of strangeness in the natural world, which may help to achieve a sense of at-homeness. He discerns religious moods of integrity in seeing realistically, in adventure, openness to life, readiness to adapt to the ways of the universe, and to meet death unafraid, fellow feeling for creatures in nature other than man. Hyatt Howe Waggoner presents a similar and far more exhaustive study in *The Heel of Elohim, Science and Values in Modern American Poetry* (Norman, Okla., 1950). From the viewpoint of a Christian humanist, he assumes that "questions of belief are relevant in an examination of poetry"; tries to show "how belief is embodied in form"; and examines certain poets against a background of modern science and philosophy: Robinson, Frost, Eliot, Jeffers, MacLeish, and Hart Crane. Basically, the philosophical problems considered are cosmic and religious.

William Joseph Rooney, *The Problem of "Poetry and*

Belief" in Contemporary Criticism (Washington, D.C., 1949), with selected bibliography, studies I. A. Richards, Yvor Winters, John Crowe Ransom, Allen Tate, and T. S. Eliot, and discusses the problem of the relation of their beliefs to their poetic expression, including moral and religious beliefs. Amos N. Wilder, "Christian Significance of Recent Poetry," in *Christendom*, Vol. 5, no. 4 (Autumn, 1940), pp. 524–533, with a brief bibliography, perceives Christian themes in several recent American poets, some of whom appear to be working toward "a true valuation of Christian resources," despite the stumbling blocks of official religion. He notices their hospitality toward Christian values and insights, which should not be rebuffed by revived dogmatism, but completed and reinforced. His "Religious Poetry in America," in *Christian Century*, Vol. 57, no. 42 (Oct. 16, 1940), pp. 1279–1280, notes that current criticism tends to ignore religious and idealistic poetry as sentimental or didactic, and asks whether or not there is a relation between its weakness and that of contemporary religion. Biblical religious material seems to have lost appeal, and religious verse tends to be pantheistic or pagan; and neither the religious poet nor the church drinks deeply enough at the Christian spring. Protestant poets, especially, must recapture the world-shaping tradition of the Reformation (see also Richard P. Blackmur's "Religious Poetry in the United States," in Volume II of *Religion in American Life*).

E. Phases of Faith and Doubt

1. COLONIAL POETRY: PIETY AND METAPHYSICS. R. C. Wood, "Life, Death and Poetry as Seen by the Pennsylvania Dutch," in *Monatshefte fur Deutschen Unterricht*, Vol. 37 (Nov. 1945), pp. 453–465, traces the history of a peculiar local form of religious and devotional poetry, derived from the deep pietism of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries in Germany—a poetry having affinities with the

Puritan Calvinist verse of New England. The latter variety is described in Harold S. Jantz, "The First Century of New England Verse," in American Antiquarian Society, *Proceedings*, Vol. 53, part 2 (Oct. 20, 1943), pp. 219–523, with an exhaustive bibliography. This essay reviews previous literature on the subject, and includes much frankly religious verse indicating the influence of Dutch, German, and Swiss pietistic poetry, and rescuing a considerable amount of worthy poetry from oblivion. A typical expression of the early Puritan poetic spirit is *The Poems of Mrs. Anne Bradstreet (1612–1672) together with Her Prose Remains, with an Introduction by Charles Eliot Norton* (Boston, 1897). Norton depicts her religious nature and its expression in certain poems, the general background of the Calvinistic theology, and her occasional religious doubts.

Another and much more sophisticated expression, which has come to light only in recent times, is that of the Westfield, Massachusetts minister, Edward Taylor, in *The Poetical Works of Edward Taylor*, ed. Thomas H. Johnson (New York, 1939). This constitutes the first extensive publication of a nearly forgotten religious poet of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, whose manuscripts long lay unpublished. He is now recognized as the greatest American colonial poet, and is the subject of a large number of scholarly studies. He is set in the tradition of the British "metaphysical" poets by Willie T. Weathers, "Edward Taylor and the Cambridge Platonists," in *American Literature*, Vol. 26, no. 1 (Mar. 1954), pp. 1–31, with bibliography in footnotes. Taylor is a metaphysical poet in thought as well as style —his inspiration a "personal Platonism supported by a theologian's sincere belief in the Neoplatonic Christian dogma of the Cambridge revival." In poetry he "sought to make himself an inspired medium for the interpretation of the Bible's inspired revelation." Sometimes he was hampered by inevitable conflict between the Puritan and the humanist. In poetic mood he was close to Anglican and Catholic meta-

physical poets. Wallace C. Brown, in "Edward Taylor: American 'Metaphysical,'" in *American Literature,* Vol. 16, no. 3 (Nov. 1944), pp. 186–197, declares some poems metaphysical in the sense of dynamic logic and tight logical structure. In the full tradition of metaphysical poetry, he is the best before Freneau; the first (and perhaps only) truly metaphysical American poet. His relation to contemporary religious culture is set forth by Roy Harvey Pearce in "Edward Taylor: The Poet as Puritan," *New England Quarterly,* Vol. 23, no. 1 (Mar. 1950), pp. 31–46. Puritan culture was inadequate for major poetry, allowing little room for individual will and human drama. Taylor's poetry places a minimal value on specifically human experience, and attempts not to study human experience of order in the world, but to show how and where order exists. His theological bent appears in Donald E. Stanford, "Nineteen Unpublished Poems by Edward Taylor," in *American Literature,* Vol. 29, no. 1 (Mar. 1957), pp. 18–46, and in Stanford's edition of *The Poems of Edward Taylor* (New Haven, 1960). His *Sacramental Meditations,* written between 1682 and 1725, show his essential Calvinism, which is proved also in his "Edward Taylor and the Lord's Supper," in *American Literature,* Vol. 27, no. 2 (May 1955), pp. 172–178, displaying evidence to show the Calvinist orthodoxy of his *Sacramental Meditations.* But modification is argued by M. Black's "Edward Taylor: Heaven's Sugar Cake," in *New England Quarterly,* Vol. 29, no. 2 (June 1956), pp. 159–181. "The inconsistencies and tensions in Taylor's poetry are a revelation of the humanization of the original austerity of Puritan thought" (see *American Literature,* Vol. 28, no. 4, Jan. 1957, p. 561). Taylor's problem, in endeavoring to express religious truths adequately, is examined by H. Blau. His "Heaven's Sugar Cake: Theology and Imagery in the Poetry of Edward Taylor," in *New England Quarterly,* Vol. 26, no. 3 (Sept. 1953), pp. 337–360, holds that some of Taylor's images are too great for the meaning.

2. NEW ENGLAND LIBERALS AND TRANSCENDENTALISTS. G. L.

Roth, in "New England Satire on Religion, 1790–1820" in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 28, no. 2 (June, 1955), pp. 246–254, notes that "A considerable body of satiric verse points out the faults in the practice of orthodox religion and strikes down those dissenters who threatened it" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 27, no. 4, Jan. 1956, p. 628). Such questioning prepared the way for the rise of liberalism and Transcendentalism. It attained poetic expression in John Trumbull, one of the verse-writing "Hartford Wits." Bruce Ingham Granger, "John Trumbull and Religion," in *American Literature*, Vol. 23, no. 1 (Mar. 1951), pp. 57–79, shows that Trumbull was orthodox, but moderate, shunning the dogmatism of metaphysicians like Bellamy, also deistic skepticism, and was hostile to Arminians, Anglicans, and Catholics, but critical of hypocrisy and incompetence in the state church. Liberalism attained dignified and moderate poetic expression in James Russell Lowell, the Cambridge intellectual "Brahmin." His attitude is explained in Leon Martin Shea, *Lowell's Religious Outlook* (Washington, D.C., 1926), with a bibliography of his writings, pertinent works about him, and related works pertinent to the subject. The essay is a collection and systematic organization of his theological pronouncements, using illustrations from prose and verse, but does not investigate the sources of his convictions or their ethical elements. A similar study is Aaron Boyland Fitz-Gerald, "The Literary, Political, and Religious Ideas of James Russell Lowell" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1943; abstract in *Doc. Disser. in the Field of Religion*, 1940–1952, no. 119). Lowell has not been given his due by literary historians. His religious ideas, Christian in the temperate and classic sense, stressed the duty of the man of letters and the good citizen to incarnate Christian principles in everyday life, and in social and political institutions. The ultimate rather confused and skeptical poetry resulting from mid-nineteenth century liberalism appears in Edwin A. Robinson, according to Yvor Winters, "Religious and Social Ideas in the Didactic

Work of E. A. Robinson," in *Arizona Quarterly*, Vol. 1, no. 1 (Spring, 1945), pp. 70–85. Robinson is set against the background of New England religious history, particularly Calvinist theology and the Unitarian revolt. The poet was of Unitarian stock with traditional moral sense and curiosity, but non-theological. His greatest poems are moralistic; the human drama is understood in terms of traditional Christian morality. But his didactic poems are confused—tendencies from Calvinism, Unitarianism, and Emerson are not in rational agreement.

Elsie F. Brickett; "Studies in the Poets and Poetry of New England Transcendentalism" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1937) surveys the field from the origins of Transcendentalism, with a rich collection of references. The first and probably the most truly "transcendental" was Emerson's short-time friend, who is studied by W. B. Berthoff in "Jones Very: New England Mystic," in *Boston Public Library Quarterly*, Vol. 2, no. 1 (Jan. 1950), pp. 63–75. Very is "remembered for his extraordinary religious consciousness. He is the one figure of his generation who succeeded in translating the power of religious vision into formal poetry" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 22, no. 2 (May 1950), p. 233). Very's extreme mysticism, which other Transcendentalists could not follow, appears in Carlos Baker, "Emerson and Jones Very," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 7, no. 1 (Mar. 1934), pp. 90–99, with bibliographical footnotes. This article reviews their brief friendship, and Emerson's ultimate repulsion from Very's Oriental religious mysticism, with its complete submission to God's will, as expressed in the poems which Very claimed to have been dictated by the Holy Spirit. A comprehensive review of the mystic's life is given by William I. Bartlett, "Jones Very: His Life and Works" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Virginia, 1936).

Ralph Waldo Emerson's more reasoned poetic expression of Transcendentalism is explained by William A. Huggard, "Emerson's Glimpse of the Divine," in *Personalist*, Vol. 36,

no. 2 (Apr. 1955), pp. 167–176, with references in footnotes. The basic and oft-repeated theme of God's existence appears in Emerson, and the concept of a divine spirit was central in his thought, holding nature and man in friendly control. Examination of his writings suggests that his poetic affirmations of this concept had a background of reasoning and discussion of chief evidences enabling him to assert God's actuality. But that Emerson's poetically expressed religious ideas came in part from a mystical source is shown by Clarence Paul Hotson, "Emerson and Swedenborg" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1929, typewritten, 2 vols., with a bibliography, Harvard College Library). He indicates the extensive influence of Emanuel Swedenborg's religious and philosophical ideas upon Emerson. Elements of Transcendentalism in Herman Melville's verse are discerned in Walter E. Bezanson, "Melville's 'Clarel': The Complex Passion," in *Journal of English Literary History,* Vol. 21 (June 1954), pp. 146–159, which analyzes the historical, theological, and psychological dilemma that permeates this poem, written late in his career.

3. QUAKER INFLUENCES. Henry J. Cadbury, "Whittier's Early Quaker Poems," in *New England Quarterly,* Vol. 18, no. 2 (June, 1945), pp. 251–256, considers several not in his collected works: two on Penn, his favorite hero; one on the martyr William Leddra; and one on the minister David Sands—all religious leaders. Arthur Christy, "The Orientalism of Whittier," in *American Literature,* Vol. 5, no. 3 (Nov. 1933), pp. 248–257, with bibliography in footnotes, deals with poems indicating "Whittier's Quaker affinities with Oriental monism and general parallels between his beliefs and Vedanta." It is suggested that "interesting parallels could also be drawn between his theism and the theism of the Hindu movement," the Brahmo Somaj. George L. Sixbey, " 'Chanting the Square Deific'—A Study in Whitman's Religion," in *American Literature,* Vol. 9, no. 2 (May 1937), pp. 171–195, with bibliography in footnotes, maintains that

the poem is "an intensely subjective statement of Whitman's theological tenets," harmonizing his nonconformity to one creed "with his eagerness to embrace all creeds." In theology it marks his fulfillment as a poet, his effort to answer "the question of the whole," and to express "a single, fairly compact concept of deity," embracing "much of American idealism." This mystical, non-theological faith is described by Walter Benjamin Fulghum, Jr., "Quaker Influences on Whitman's Religious Thought" (Doctoral dessertation, Northwestern University, 1943).

4. THE RELIGIOUS MYSTICISM OF NATURE. Donald A. Ringe analyzes poetic expression of the religion of nature in "Kindred Spirits: Bryant and Cole," in *American Quarterly*, Vol. 6, no. 3 (Fall, 1954), pp. 233–244. "Bryant in his poetry and Thomas Cole in his paintings expressed similar philosophic and religious views on the relation of man to nature and used comparable artistic means in the expression of their views" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1955), p. 140). Charles L. Sanford expresses a similar interpretation in his essay, "The Concept of the Sublime in the Works of Thomas Cole and William Cullen Bryant," in *American Literature*, Vol. 28, no. 4 (Jan. 1947), pp. 434–448: ". . . their moral and religious feeling for nature had a national coloration which centered in the concept of the sublime" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 29, no. 2 (May 1957), p. 234).

John J. Lanier, "The South's Religious Thinkers," in *Southern Literary Messenger*, Vol. 2, no. 1 (Jan. 1940), pp. 19–24, discusses the religion of Sidney Lanier and Edgar Allan Poe: "theopanism," the presence of God in nature and in man, revealed to man through nature. Religion is the poetry of the universe, and man's religious insight is a response to it. The claim that these two poets were supreme religious thinkers is exaggerated, but the article does prove their deep and passionate interest. The point is driven home by three studies of Lanier: Lelia Z. Moore, "The Religious Element in Sidney Lanier's Works" (Master's thesis, Uni-

versity of Kansas, 1924); Marguerite Weed, "The Ethical and Religious Beliefs of Sidney Lanier" (Master's thesis, Columbia University, 1932); and Hortense Watkins, "A study of the Religious Concepts of Sidney Lanier" (Master's thesis, Southern Methodist University, 1947).

Emily Dickinson is considered as a mystical religious poet of nature by many modern critics. Dorothy Waugh, "Dickinson's 'Those Not Live Yet,'" in *Explicator*, Vol. 15, item 22 (Jan. 1957) declares that "The signature 'Easter' relates the theme to the Christian celebration of the resurrection and the annual revival of nature" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 29, no. 2 (May 1957), p. 240). Sister Mary James Power, *In the Name of the Bee, the Significance of Emily Dickinson* (New York, 1943) tries to place her in the mainstream of Catholic poetry, stating that her imagery is that of the Church Fathers, being the "outward signs" of nature which they recognized as those of divinity; and claiming that she brought real Catholic poetry out of the cloying atmosphere of mere piety and "piosity." But, on the other hand, Ruth F. McNaughton, "Emily Dickinson on Death," in *Prairie Schooner*, Vol. 23, no. 2 (Summer, 1949), pp. 203–215, is an extended discussion of Emily Dickinson's constant battle between skepticism and faith (see *American Literature*, Vol. 21, no. 4 (Jan. 1950), p. 526). Thomas H. Johnson, *Emily Dickinson, A Biography* (Cambridge, 1955) refers to the sources of her prosody in the hymns of Isaac Watts, and details her interest in religious themes in poetry. The mystical element is minimized by J. Davidson in "Emily Dickinson and Isaac Watts," *Boston Public Library Quarterly*, Vol. 6, no. 3 (July 1954), pp. 141–149. "Much of what is regarded as metaphysical in Emily Dickinson may have been derived more from Watts than the seventeenth century poets" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1955), p. 144).

5. THOMAS MERTON: CATHOLIC CONTEMPLATIVE. James A. Thielen, "Thomas Merton: Poet of the Contemplative Life," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 169, no. 1010 (May 1949),

pp. 86–90, discusses his conversion from pagan intellectualism to the life of a Christian contemplative. His work is animated by a conviction of the necessity of leaving worldliness for realization of the reality of God by contemplative prayer. His *Figures for an Apocalypse* (Norfolk, Conn., 1947) is a collection of religious poems, with an essay on "Poetry and the Contemplative Life," stressing the centrality of liturgy, theology, and mystical experience, and maintaining that Christian poetry is not possible except the writer be a contemplative. Will Lissner, "Toast of the Avant-Garde: A Trappist Poet," in *Catholic World*, Vol. 166, no. 995 (Feb. 1948), pp. 424–432, is both biographical and critical, and is considered the best estimate of Merton's quest for God as revealed in poetry. Aelred Graham's "Thomas Merton: A Modern Man in Reverse," in *Atlantic Monthly*, Vol. 191, no. 1 (Jan. 1953), pp. 70–74, "reminds this 'propagandist of mysticism for the masses' that mysticism is not for the masses but for an 'elite'" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 25, no. 1 (Mar. 1953), p. 134). The same criticism is voiced in Graham's "The Mysticism of Thomas Merton," in *Commonweal*, Vol. 62, no. 6 (May 13, 1955), pp. 155–159.

6. T. S. ELIOT: ANGLO-CATHOLIC. Harry M. Campbell, "An Examination of Modern Critics: T. S. Eliot," in *Rocky Mountain Review*, Vol. 8 (Summer, 1944), pp. 128–138, regards his acceptance of Anglo-Catholicism as the most important influence in his critical thought. The relation of religion to his theory of poetry is discussed in Kristian Smidt, *Poetry and Belief in the Work of T. S. Eliot* (Oslo, 1949), with a bibliography of Eliot's works, and books and essays on him. His views on a Christian aesthetic, poetry and religion, and the relation of his aesthetic to Christianity, are seen in comparison with Maritain and Kirkegaard, Christian doctrines, and values in his poetry and mysticism. The author shows the relation of his aesthetic theories and religion to his poetic "message," his movement from skepticism to faith. Eliot's final attainment of a Christian viewpoint is observed

by Charles Moorman, "Order and Mr. Eliot," in *South Atlantic Quarterly*, Vol. 52, no. 1 (Jan. 1953), pp. 73–87. "The sacramental point of view which finds its method in the constant reconciling of disparate elements can be said to underlie all of Eliot's work and is the foundation upon which he has constructed his poetry, his critical theory, and his conception of the nature of culture in a Christian society" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 25, no. 1 (Mar. 1953), p. 132). Wilbur Dwight Dunkel, "T. S. Eliot's Quest for Certitude," in *Theology Today*, Vol. 7, no. 2 (July 1950), pp. 228–236, finds nothing original in the religious ideas of *The Cocktail Party* and nothing outside the church and Christian theology —no definitive Christian answers. The "successful" people of the upper middle class, restless and unhappy, never make a decision; they drift, and only one finds an answer in sacrifice on a religious mission. Nathan A. Scott, Jr., "T. S. Eliot's *The Cocktail Party:* of Redemption and Vocation," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 20, no. 2 (Spring, 1951), pp. 274–285, sees Eliot's drama as an analysis of issues of faith arising from modern experience. It is a restatement of the Christian concept of vocation, a clarification of distinct Christian insight into the integral relation between "redemption" and "vocation," the spiritual necessity of finding one's place and its tasks; but the dramatic expression is not fully persuasive, and the aesthetic failure is basically theological. Robert A. Colby, in "The Three Worlds of the Cocktail Party: The Wit of T. S. Eliot," in *University of Toronto Quarterly*, Vol. 24, no. 1 (Oct. 1954), pp. 56–69, "seems to show how the three elements of his ideal Christian society—the Community of Christians, the Christian State, the Christian Community—divide off" (see *American Literature*, Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1955), p. 147). Benvenuto Matteucci, "La Madonna in Thomas Stearns Eliot," in *Humanitas*, Vol. 6 (June 1954), pp. 527–546, is an examination of his works to discover his attitude toward the cult of the Virgin Mary.

7. MODERNISM: CONFLICT OF SKEPTICISM AND FAITH. Wil-

liam Van O'Connor, *The Shaping Spirit, a Study of Wallace Stevens* (Chicago, 1956), with a bibliography, critically discusses the values of his poetry, and its dominant theme, the relation between imagination and reality. Bernard Heringman, "Wallace Stevens; the Reality of Poetry" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich. (1946), no. 15,739; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 16 (1956), no. 3, p. 535), with a bibliography, touches upon religion in reference to Stevens' interest in a synthesis between imagination and reality, which is life. Warren Carrier, "Wallace Stevens' Pagan Vantage," in *Accent,* Vol. 13, no. 3 (Summer, 1953), pp. 165–168, explains the poem "Study of Images" to indicate the paganism of Stevens.

Radcliffe Squires, *The Loyalties of Robinson Jeffers* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1957), with a bibliography, is a tribute by an admirer who is himself a poet. He emphasizes Jeffers' conviction of his duty to interpret universal truths as he has known them, and analyzes the purposes, symbols, and themes of his work, making a determined effort to discern a coherent moral philosophy. This is considered as the first considerable general appraisal. T. H. Jones, "The Poetry of Robert Lowell," in *The Month* (London), Vol. 9, n.s., no. 3 (Mar. 1953), pp. 133–142, discerns religion as one of its chief themes. W. P. Southard, "The Religious Poetry of Robert Penn Warren," in *Kenyon Review,* Vol. 7, no. 4 (Autumn, 1945), pp. 653–676, reviews his *Selected Poems, 1923–1943.* His poetry is seen as an embodiment of certain "preliminary concepts of religion, the conditions of participation, knowledge, and investment, which in turn are the conditions of love." (See *American Literature,* Vol. 17, no. 4, Jan. 1946, p. 390.) Harry Roskolenko, "Five American Jewish Poets," in *Chicago Jewish Forum,* Vol. 12, no. 1 (Fall, 1953), pp. 22–25, includes David Ignatow, Selwyn Schwartz, Morton Seif, Morris Weisenthal, and Neil Weiss, and comments on the real loss of contact of serious Jewish poets with tradi-

tional religion. All represent the "old conflict of materialism versus the religious spirit," science and pantheism against patterns of denominational religion. There is not much real passion, and more of literature than of faith in much modern American Jewish poetry.

VIII. RELIGION AND DRAMA

A. The Relation of Religion and Drama

FRED EASTMAN, *Christ in the Drama, a Study of the Influence of Christ on the Drama in England and America* (New York, 1947), with a bibliography, lists plays by major dramatists, indicating those recommended for reading and study by persons interested in the influence of religion on drama, including many American ones since 1800. A chapter on "Modern American Drama" criticizes a number of plays of religious significance. An excellent chapter on "Drama in the Modern Church" suggests a better religious drama, and mentions plays and collections of them, the dramatic work of various churches, and the state of drama in the church. His *Religion and Drama: Friends or Enemies? Being a Brief Account of Their Historical Connection and Their Present Relation* (New York, c.1930) holds that they should aid one another, and have suffered from separation, especially in the contemporary religious and moral crisis. He reviews the battle in the modern theater between commercialized "escapism" and the art of interpreting the struggles of human souls, and hopefully notices the rise of church dramatic groups, and growing cooperation between religious and theatrical leaders. Preston A. Roberts, Jr., "A Christian Theory of Dramatic Tragedy," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 30, no. 1 (Jan. 1951), pp. 1–20, from the standpoint of Christian theology considers the nature of dramatic tragedy as a literary form, as (for example) in Hawthorne and Mel-

ville. He contrasts the irresistible doom in Greek tragedy with the Christian trust in God, who is not an enemy, a void, or a vague ideal, but a suffering servant and friend. Christian tragedy moves from knowledge through sin to judgment and forgiveness, reenacting the passion and resurrection. George B. Kernodle, "Patterns of Belief in Contemporary Drama," in *Spiritual Problems in Contemporary Literature*, ed. Stanley Romaine Hopper (New York, 1952) is concerned with plays that are not specifically religious but deal seriously with man's relation to the world, his fellow men, and God. They dramatize Biblical events, historic religious figures, or contemporary religious problems. Playwrights have discovered that a truly inward and idealistic religious faith can remould the world in its image. One should consult also, in the same collection of essays, Theodore Spencer, "Man's Spiritual Situation as Reflected in Modern Drama."

B. General History and Bibliography of American Drama

Arthur Hobson Quinn, *History of the American Drama, from the Beginning to the Civil War* (New York, 1943, 2nd ed.) has a list of plays, and a bibliography. His *A History of the American Drama from the Civil War to the Present Day* (New York and London, 1937, rev. ed., 2 vols. in 1) also has a general bibliography and a list of American plays, 1860–1936. Religious drama, and plays with a religious theme, may be located in the following bibliographies: Frank Pierce Hill, *American Plays Printed 1714–1830; a Bibliographical Record* (Stanford, Calif., 1934), and Robert F. Roden, *Later American Plays, 1831–1900* (New York, 1900), containing some with religious themes. Barrett H. Clark, ed., *America's Lost Plays* (Princeton, N.J., 1940–42, 20 vols.) has previously unpublished texts, collected under the auspices of the Dramatists' Guild of the Authors' League of America, and includes some religious ones.

C. Religion in Contemporary American Drama

Brooks Atkinson's "Foreword," in *New Voices in the American Theatre* (New York, 1955) refers to the growing interest in essentially (even if not formally and traditionally) religious themes. Harold Bassage, "The Moral Price of Freedom, Problems of Personal Freedom Reflected in Modern American Drama" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1951; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich. (1951), no. 3098), with a bibliography, discusses the ethical and spiritual problems treated in American drama since World War I; and analyzes plays by several leading dramatists, dwelling upon individual longing for freedom. Many suggest that the quest is basically a moral enterprise, and that ultimately creation of full freedom requires good relationship with the supreme creative power of the universe. Earl Hubert Brill, "Religion in Modern American Drama: a Theological Analysis of Five Contemporary American Plays" (Th.M. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, May 1958, typescript, with a bibliography) generally discusses the relations between them, theological analysis of modern drama, and the possibility of creating a new "Christian theater." The plays, without any specific references to church, theology, or doctrine, nevertheless suggest the Christian idea of redemption through repentance, forgiveness, love and understanding, and point the way to a realistic religious drama. Winifred Smith, "Mystics in the Modern Theatre," in *Sewanee Review,* Vol. 45, no. 1 (Jan.–Mar., 1942), pp. 35–48, comments on T. S. Eliot and Eugene O'Neill as expressing a return to Christian faith (Anglo- or Roman Catholic) in their plays, after long periods of doubt and pain. The essential interest in religion of O'Neill appears in Woodrow Geier, "O'Neill's Miracle Play," in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 16, no. 4 (Autumn, 1947), pp. 515–526. "In *Days Without End* O'Neill not only summarizes modern obsessions but also suggests the Christian solution" (see *American Literature,*

Vol. 20, no. 1, Mar. 1948, p. 104.) Barrett Harper Clark, *Eugene O'Neill, the Man and His Plays* (New York, 1947, rev. version), with a bibliography, first published in 1929 and several times reissued, probably is the best critical work on O'Neill's drama, generally considered as an honest piece of criticism, clear, terse, and just. John D. Lee, "The Faith of Maxwell Anderson," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 17, no. 3 (Summer, 1948) pp. 357–369, with bibliography in footnotes, emphasizes Anderson's repeated stress upon every man's need of a "faith individually chosen," but is not sufficient from the Christian viewpoint. Lee suspects that he doubts "the sufficiency of the theater as a replacement for the church," and will draw closer to an orthodox Christian faith.

Joseph Mersand, *The American Drama Presents the Jew; an Evaluation of the Treatment of Jewish Characters in Contemporary Drama* (New York, 1939) notes the traditional unfavorable portrayal in plays, 1752–1821. Presentation in contemporary drama is the most varied and appreciative in the history of the stage. Jews are portrayed in widely variant roles, and the Jew has emerged from comic parts into real dignity as a result of American dramatization. Charles I. Glicksberg, "The Jewish Element in American Drama," in *Chicago Jewish Forum*, Vol. 10, no. 2 (Winter, 1951–52), pp. 110–115, points out the wide variety of Jewish-written drama, from radically Marxist to conservative, together with the ideal of social justice expressed in the plays of representative dramatists, whose works are discussed. Prophecy and social compassion are the keynotes—the voices of Isaiah and Hezekiah.

Charles Burkhart, "The Amish Theme in Recent American Theatricals," in *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, Vol. 31, no. 2 (Apr. 1957), pp. 140–142, points up the dramatic appeal of a religious minority. "Picturesque" quality is a natural invitation to theatrical treatment. The musical comedies, "Plain and Fancy" and "By Hex," and the moving

picture, "Violent Saturday," have revealed the Amish to many Americans for the first time. In spite of some over-idealizing, all are sympathetic from the world's viewpoint. Malcolm Boyd, "Theology and the Movies," in *Theology Today*, Vol. 14, no. 3 (Oct. 1957), pp. 359–375, states that the best realistic movies proclaim essential truths of the Gospel far better than the commercial "religious" ones. The degradation they depict indirectly proclaims man's need of the holy. He analyzes several of this type, with Christian comment. The "unredemptive" ones represent organized religion eating the crumbs of publicity; while the Church condemns "raw life" films, it seems not to have ability to speak by grace to such situations. Consideration is given to the production of genuinely Christian films based upon realism and honesty.

D. Drama in the Teaching of Religion

E. Martin Browne, "Religion and the Arts, Part III, Religious Drama," in *Union Seminary Quarterly Review*, Vol. 12, no. 3 (Mar. 1957), pp. 51–65, contrasts the divorce of religion from drama, in the Reformation and post-Reformation periods, with the present growing reunion expressing religious faith, not dogmatically or didactically, but implicitly as in Eliot, Greene, Fry, and Tennessee Williams. He describes the religious drama program at Union Seminary, New York. The rise of interest in the churches, since the 1920's, appears in religious drama manuals and play collections, so numerous that only a few can be cited as examples. The most outstanding leader in these publications, and in the return of drama to the churches, has been Fred Eastman, whose activity has been effective since the 1920's. His *Modern Religious Dramas* (New York, c.1928), with music, has a bibliography "Manuals, reference books, and collections of religious drama," and thirteen plays by various authors. With Louis Wilson he also compiled *Drama in the*

Church, a Manual of Religious Drama Production (New York and Los Angeles, 1942 rev. ed.). This contains "a selected list of religious dramas." One of the best guides is his "A Religious Drama Bibliography," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 41, no. 4 (July 1949), pp. 4–6, briefly annotated, including historical and general background, anthologies of medieval and modern dramas, writing religious plays, and production techniques. He has well covered the field of the brief drama in *Writing the One-act Religious Play* (New York, 1948), with bibliography; also in *Ten One-act Plays, Selected and Edited* (Chicago and New York, 1937), containing dramas evidently intended for various denominations; and in *One-act Plays of Spiritual Power* (Boston, 1948), with ten plays by various authors.

Another influential pioneer in the revival of dramatic forms in teaching religion is Harold Adam Ehrensperger. His philosophy of religious drama is set forth by remarks in *Conscience on Stage* (New York and Nashville, 1947), with a bibliography of plays and of various subjects such as the history, technique, production, and use of drama in church. His notes stress the proper use of dramatics as a teaching medium, and reveal the important position recently attained by plays in American church life. His own contribution to this field of literature is illustrated by three collections, which he compiled: *Plays to Live By, Four Plays for Church Production* (New York, c.1934); *Plays for These Times, Five Plays for Church Production* (New York, c.1936); and *Plays for the Changing World* (New York, c.1938).

Anthologies of "church plays" are almost innumerable; the following titles may be taken as fairly typical: Thelma Sharman Brown, ed., *Treasury of Religious Plays,* introduced by Harold Ehrensperger (New York, 1947) contains twenty plays mostly written or adapted by American authors. By far the most extensive collection of plays written specifically for church and parish-house use is Lawrence Martin Brings, comp., *The Golden Book of Church Plays: a Compilation of*

One-act Plays and Pageants Selected and Adapted for Production by Teenagers and Adults for the Inspiration of Audiences and Participants (Minneapolis, 1955). Clarence M. Beard's *Gospel Skits and Dialogues* (Boston, 1949) includes radio dramas. An excellent guide to techniques in this special field is Horace M. McMullen's bibliography, "Religious Broadcasting," in Boston, General Theological Library, *Bulletin*, Vol. 39, no. 4 (July 1947), pp. 5–6. It has brief notes for general works on radio, pamphlets, script writing, production, music, and education. Two titles are outstanding in recent "how-to-do-it" guides for church amateur dramatic groups: Floyd Merwyn Barnard, *Drama in the Churches* (Nashville, 1950), and Joseph Edward Moseley, *Using Drama in the Church* (St. Louis, 1955, rev. ed.), which include bibliographies. A comprehensive review of the religious dramatic revival and its accomplishment since the 1920's is *Religious Drama . . . Five Plays . . . Selected and Introduced by Marvin Halverson* (New York, 1957). The editor reviews the resurgence of religious drama in the twentieth century, and the realization on the church's part of its dramatic heritage in the liturgy, and of the value of drama in teaching. The illustrations are explicitly religious in theme. The revival (begun in England in 1928) has been continued by several playwrights, whose works are critically examined.

Drama always has played an important part in Roman Catholic religious teaching. In one region of the United States—New Mexico—it has for many generations exemplified the character of religious theater as a folk art. The best study of this primitive drama is Sister Joseph Marie McCrossan, "The Role of the Church and the Folk in the Development of the Early Drama in New Mexico" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pennsylvania, 1945). A. L. Campa, "Religious Spanish Folk-Drama in New Mexico," in *New Mexico Quarterly*, Vol. 2, no. 1 (Feb. 1932), pp. 3–13, observes its origin in the efforts of Roman Catholic

missionaries to present the faith vividly to the Indians, and describes certain cycles of plays of Spanish derivation. The art today represents a fusion of Indian, Spanish, and Anglo-American elements into a genuine folk-art.

IX. NEGRO RELIGIOUS LITERATURE

A. Bibliography and History of Negro Literature

JOHN S. LASH presents an essential guide in his essay "The American Negro and American Literature: A Check List of significant Commentaries, Part II," in *Bulletin of Bibliography*, Vol. 19, no. 2 (Jan.–Apr. 1947), pp. 33–36. Dorothy Burnett Porter, "Early American Negro Writings: A Bibliographical Study," in *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America*, Vol. 39 (Third Quarter, 1945), pp. 192–268, also is essential, and has a preliminary essay and a check list of literature and authors, 1760–1835, with all known publications. Much of the writing is by ministers and on religious subjects: sermons and poetry, religious biography and experiences. Mollie E. Dunlap, comp., "A Selected Annotated List of Books by or about the Negro," in *Negro College Quarterly*, Vols. 1–3 (Mar., June, Sept. 1945), pp. 40–45, 94–96, 153–158, has some titles of religious interest, including other bibliographies that list such works. Some bibliographical aid is available in U.S., Library of Congress, *75 Years of Freedom, Commemoration of the Seventy-Fifth Anniversary of the Proclamation of the Thirteenth Amendment to the Constitution of the United States, December 18, 1940* (Washington, D.C.). This catalog of an exhibit contains entries of religious literature under biography, of and by Negroes; religious experience; fiction; jubilee songs and spirituals; interpretations and collections; poetry; references under portraits of religious leaders; religious writings; and manuscript sermons.

Aside from the bibliographical guides, there are many

references to religious reflections in histories of Negro culture in general, and of Negro writing in America. (See Part Two, sect. VI, K, *Negro Religious Expression.*)

Margaret Just Butcher, *The Negro in American Culture, Based on Materials Left by Alain Locke* (New York, 1956) in ch. 6, "Formal Negro Poetry," refers to the early religious verse of Jupiter Hammon, and to the "preacher poets," also to Vachel Lindsay's appreciation of Negro religion, Countee Cullen's *The Black Christ*, and the experiences related in *God Struck Me Dead.* Benjamin Brawley, *The Negro Genius, A New Appraisal of the Achievement of the American Negro in Literature and the Fine Arts* (New York, 1946) has a large bibliography, comprising Negro authors; critical, biographical and interpretative works; important articles; and a few titles of religious interest. Sterling A. Brown, Arthur P. Davis, and Ulysses Lee, eds., *The Negro Caravan, Writings by American Negroes* (New York, 1941) has a chronology of important landmarks in Negro history and literature, and an index of authors and selections, including a considerable number of religious subjects, such as camp-meeting poetry and spirituals, the folk sermon, drama, autobiography, and religion in college life. Another anthology, Herman Dreer, *American Literature by Negro Authors* (New York, 1950), with a bibliography, comprises a selection of spirituals; Zora Neale Hurston's "The Folk Sermon"; a few poems; W. E. B. DuBois, "Of the Faith of the Fathers," from *The Souls of Black Folk;* Paul L. Dunbar, "The Strength of Gideon"; and ch. 6 of Countee Cullen's *One Way to Heaven,* a satire on the Episcopal Church.

More specific studies might well begin with Sterling A. Brown, "Negro Life and Character in American Literature" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1933); followed by Hugh Morris Gloster, "Chief Trends of Thought in American Negro Literature Since 1900" (Doctoral dissertation, New York University, 1943).

Elizabeth Atkinson (Lay) Green, *The Negro in Con-*

temporary American Literature (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1938) includes bibliographies, and refers to religious influence in spirituals and early verse, contemporary poetry, the younger poets, the Negro plays of Eugene O'Neill, Paul Green as an interpreter of Southern Negro spirituality, and fiction by both Negro and white authors. There are specific references to Cullen's revolt against traditional religion, and to the religious note in recent Negro folk tales. Sister Mary Anthony Scally, *Negro Catholic Writers* (Detroit, 1945) has a bibliography, a list of authors, and brief biographies. The study reflects the increasing influence of the Roman Catholic Church among American Negroes, and calls attention to the considerable number of outstanding Negro Catholic scholars and authors. The thoughtful ones are anxious to abolish racial discrimination. Benjamin E. Mays, *The Negro's God as Reflected in His Literature* (Boston, 1938) presents a brilliant study of Negro religious ideology, 1760–1937, in both "mass" and "classical" literature. The ideas have grown out of the Negro's social situation, to compensate, to effect social change, or to move toward communism. Mays notes the growing tendency of younger, post-World War I writers to abandon the idea of God as useless to the Negro. There is an extensive bibliography.

B. Religion in Negro Poetry and Drama

Dorothy Burnett Porter, *North American Negro Poets, a Bibliographical Checklist of Their Writings, 1760–1944* (Hattiesburg, Miss., 1945) is an expansion of Arthur A. Schomburg, *A Bibliographical Checklist of American Negro Poetry* (1916). Robert T. Kerlin, *Negro Poets and Their Poems* (Washington, D.C., 1923) is a critical anthology, indexed by title, including some definitely religious selections, and has also an index of authors, with biographical and bibliographical notes. Jay Saunders Redding, *To Make a Poet Black* (Chapel Hill, N.C., 1939), with bibliography and an

index of authors and titles, has many references to religious material in the works of American Negro poets, from Jupiter Hammon's first published work, 1760, to James Weldon Johnson. Johnson's *God's Trombones: Seven Negro Sermons in Verse* (New York, 1955) is a Negro poet's imaginative recreation of the old-fashioned Negro preacher and his folk sermons, and is illustrated with drawings by Aaron Douglas. Johnson here renounces traditional "Negro dialect," and creates "poetry in free verse," using "the truer idiom of the folk imagination," linking the sermons to the spirituals. The persistence of the religious heritage is strongly emphasized by Thomas Pinckney Carriger's study, "The Religious and Ethical Aspects of Recent Negro Poetry" (Bachelor of divinity thesis, Duke University, 1935). Two excellent early examples of the emergence of the Negro as an influence in poetry with religious color are: Charles R. Dinkins, *Lyrics of Love, Sacred and Secular* (Columbia, S.C., 1904), and Joseph S. Cotter, Jr., *The Band of Gideon and Other Lyrics* (Boston, 1918).

The blending of Negro poetry with drama is the basic theme of an essay by Sterling A. Brown, *Negro Poetry and Drama* (Washington, D.C., 1937), with references. This general survey from the colonial period, with biographical notes and criticism, stresses the continuity of the literary tradition, and has extensive observations on folk poetry and spirituals, preacher poets, white poets writing about Negro life, and considerable comment on the dramatic quality in Negro religious life. Walter White, "The Negro on the American Stage," in *English Journal*, Vol. 24, no. 3 (Mar. 1935), pp. 179–188, comments on the rise of the Negro in drama, and on a few plays of religious significance. Hilda Josephine Lawson, "The Negro in American Drama," in *Bulletin of Bibliography*, Vol. 17, nos. 1–2 (Jan./Apr.–May/Aug., 1940), pp. 7–8, 27–30, has a bibliography of contemporary Negro drama, and some titles of religious dramas, with brief critical annotations. George Warren Shier,

"Superstition and Religion in American Negro Drama, 1913–40" (Master's thesis, Ohio State University, 1944) gives special emphasis to Southern playwrights, particularly Randolph Edmonds, Paul Green, and Willis Richardson. Marcus Cook Connelly, *The Green Pastures; a Fable, Suggested by Roark Bradford's Southern Sketches, "Ol' Man Adam an' His Chillun,"* (New York, 1929), with the cast of characters as presented in New York in 1930, attempts "to present certain aspects of a living religion in the terms of its believers."

C. Religion in Negro Fiction

Maxwell Whiteman, *A Century of Fiction by American Negroes, 1853–1952; a Descriptive Bibliography* (Philadelphia, 1955) has an introduction with some remarks on the origin and development of Negro fiction, and lists about twenty pieces with a religious theme. These relate to lives of the clergy, moral questions, fictionalized Bible stories, spiritual experiences, religious folklore, Catholic Negroes, religious charlatanry, church life in Harlem, the story of the Good Samaritan told by a minister, Moses, conversion, the Negro Protestant, and criticism of the clergy and the church. Hugh M. Gloster, *Negro Voices in American Fiction* (Chapel Hill, 1948), with bibliographical notes to chapters, and extensive bibliography of "Fiction by Negro Authors," discusses a few novels or stories with specifically religious interest. The bibliography lists some reviews of them in magazines and newspapers. This is an expansion of his earlier work, *The Negro in American Fiction* (Washington, D.C., 1937), which has a selected reading list. Alfred Farrell, "The Negro Novel in America, 1920–1946" (Doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University, 1946) summarizes the tendencies since the beginning of a conscious Negro literary movement in Harlem and other large communities. Both the traditional and the modern tendencies appear in a few notable works of fiction. William Stanley Beaumont Braith-

waite, *Going Over Tindel, a Novel* (Boston, 1924) is the story of a personal religious experience. Countee Cullen, *One Way to Heaven* (New York and London, 1932) is his only novel. The main character, "Sam Lucas," a one-armed religious charlatan, satirizes Harlem upper-class social and church life. Zora Neale Hurston, *Their Eyes Were Watching God; a Novel* (Philadelphia and London, c.1937) represents one of the outstanding Negro writers, a trained folklorist and anthropologist. It shows insight into Negro peasant life in an all-Negro town in Florida, with references to religious customs and superstitions. Adam Clayton Powell, Sr., *Picketing Hell, a Fictitious Narrative* (New York, 1942) is a Baptist minister's attack upon the church and the clergy. Med Bridgeforth, *Another Chance, a Novel* (New York, 1941), first published in 1927 under the title *God's Law and Man's,* is "A religious story whose moral is to give man another chance for taking God's law and debasing it for man's materialistic gain." Chancellor Williams, *Have You Been To The River? A Novel* (New York, 1952) tells the story of a charlatan cult leader, and his betrayal of his credulous followers. James Baldwin, *Go Tell It on the Mountain* (New York, 1953), by a young Negro war veteran, has been acclaimed as "possibly the finest novel so far by a Negro author dealing with some aspects of Negro life." A Negro boy, desirous of escaping into the outer world, is converted and joins his father's church, which imprisons him in a traditional formula of resignation to the Negro ghetto's lot, and placing hopes in religion.

X. THE SERMON

A. History and Criticism

1. MASTERS OF THE PULPIT. Clarence Edward Noble Macartney, *Six Kings of the American Pulpit* (Philadelphia, 1942) includes George Whitefield, Matthew Simpson,

Henry Ward Beecher, Phillips Brooks, T. DeWitt Talmage, and William Jennings Bryan, with critical comments. William Cleaver Wilkinson, *Modern Masters of Pulpit Discourse* (New York and London, 1905) includes Americans in its criticisms, mostly written during the lifetime of the subjects, and published as a series under a common title in the *Homiletic Review*. Joseph Fort Newton, *Some Living Masters of the Pulpit; Studies in Religious Personality* (New York, c.1923) also includes several eminent Americans. Edgar DeWitt Jones, *American Preachers of To-day; Intimate Appraisals of Thirty-two Leaders* (Indianapolis, c.1933) considers and gives biographies of thirty-two sermonizers of various schools of theology, mostly Protestant. The introductory chapter, "The Age of Preaching," claims the period as rich beyond example in able preachers. Comment on the general qualities of preaching stresses the deemphasis of theology and the gain in ethical and social notes, simplicity, directness, and restraint. The mature conclusions of his long study appear in *The Royalty of the Pulpit; a Survey and Appreciation of the Lyman Beecher Lectures on Preaching Founded at Yale Divinity School 1871 and Given Annually (with four exceptions) since 1872* (New York, 1951), with a bibliography. This standard authority sets the discussion "in close relation to the varying currents of thought and experience" of seventy-five years, with portraits of the great personalities. It reflects the historical trends in the character of preaching, and the shift from the formal, oratorical style to the direct and conversational.

2. THE ART OF PREACHING. Roland Cotton Smith, *Preaching as a Fine Art* (New York, 1922) consists of lectures to the faculties and students of the Episcopal divinity schools in Alexandria, Va., Cambridge, Mass., and New York. The structure of American sermons, and their composition to make the most effective appeal to the audience, are carefully examined in Robert Lofton Hudson, "American Sermons: A Study in Purpose, Backgrounds, and Psychological Ap-

proach" (Doctoral dissertation, George Peabody College for Teachers, Nashville). The manner in which the great Puritan preachers blended popular and scriptural ideas into the sermon, as an art form, is expounded by E. K. Trefz, "Satan as the Prince of Evil: The Preaching of New England Puritans," in *Boston Public Library Quarterly*, Vol. 7, no. 1 (Jan. 1955), pp. 3–22. His detailed study reveals that many elements of their thought came from popular medieval assumptions, which they blended with Biblical data to construct a dramatic picture of Satan. The study is continued in his "Satan in Puritan Preaching," in *ibid.*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (July 1956), pp. 148–157. The culmination of the sermon, as a medium of instruction and as a Puritan literary art form, is the theme of Ralph G. Turnbull, *Jonathan Edwards the Preacher* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1958), with a large bibliography. Edwards' literary artistry, his aesthetic sense as displayed in the meticulous composition of his sermons, is minutely analyzed by E. H. Cady's essay, "The Artistry of Jonathan Edwards," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 22, no. 1 (Mar. 1949), pp. 61–72. His celebrated sermon, "Sinners in the Hands of an Angry God," is seen as an artistic emotional, intellectual, and verbal production, a genuine work of literary art. A useful commentary on types of sermons in his time—the age of rationalism and Deism and the Great Awakening—is Donald George Smith's thesis, "Eighteenth Century American Preaching" (see *Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 16, no. 13 (1955–1956), index). E. Clowes Chorley, "Early Preaching in the American Church," in *American Church Monthly*, Vol. 24, no. 3 (Nov. 1928), pp. 215–229, gives a critical survey of Anglican sermons in the colonial and early national periods, with reference to both doctrine and form. One of the outstanding colonial preachers, the early intellectual leader of Anglicanism in New England, is appreciated by Jean H. Hagstrum, in "The Sermons of Samuel Johnson" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1941).

3. THE PULPIT AND AMERICAN LIFE. Arthur Stephen Hoyt, *The Pulpit and American Life* (New York, 1921) assesses the contributions of Jonathan Edwards, Lyman Beecher, William Ellery Channing, Horace Bushnell, Henry Ward Beecher, and Phillips Brooks, to the old and the new evangelism. Other topics include the present American pulpit, the pulpit and social welfare, and the pulpit and the national spirit. A long period distinguished by influential preaching is covered brilliantly by Gerald Kennedy, "Seventy-Five Years of American Preaching," in *Christendom*, Vol. 7, no. 2 (Spring, 1942), pp. 214–225. This review begins in 1870 and notes the vast influence of the pulpit in America and its shifting emphases, with special attention to the Pacific Coast. It quotes criticisms of preaching, and indicates the influences of the theory of progress, Emersonian philosophy, the Social Gospel, Unitarianism, evolutionary theory, and revivalism. The author reviews the pulpit controversies of the 1920's, the lack of a clear and unified message in the 1930's, the danger of too much contemporaneity in preaching, and the return of striving to achieve really great preaching. Ernest Trice Thompson, *Changing Emphases in American Preaching* (Philadelphia, 1943) has references in the notes. These lectures, delivered at the Princeton Theological Seminary, review the work of five men who reflected or helped to determine important trends in the American pulpit. Preaching reflects the age, and constantly corrects, renews, or revives truths: as with Bushnell, an originator of liberalism; Beecher, the popular anti-Calvinist; Moody and revivalism; Gladden and the new theology; Rauschenbusch and the Social Gospel. An excellent brief summary of preaching in the golden day of liberalism is by Ozora S. Davis, "A Quarter-Century of American Preaching," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 6, no. 2 (Mar. 1926), pp. 135–153. A former president of the Chicago Theological Seminary interprets certain clearly defined tendencies, and concludes that the American Protestant pulpit is

well aware of "the movements of the community mind" and honestly trying "to express a workable body of truth" for people who must find a religion to live by. He reviews the sermon literature critically and refers to important collections of sermons. Davis examines the prevailingly social emphasis of American liberal preaching before the 1930's in his *Preaching the Social Gospel* (New York and Chicago, c.1922).

Probably the best summation of this phase, published just before the rise of American Neo-Orthodoxy, is a noteworthy series of essays edited by a Methodist bishop, expressing the Christian radicalism of the 1930's: Garfield Bromley Oxnam, *Preaching and the Social Crisis; a Series of Lectures Delivered before the Boston University School of Theology* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1933). These essays are by leading Protestant liberals, confronting the despair of economic depression, the rise of dictatorship, and the threat of war. They are mostly slanted toward the Social Gospel attitude, dealing with Socialism, the Communist challenge, industrial problems, and revolution, but touch also the relation of the Social Gospel to personal problems and worship. The same tendency prevails in his own *Preaching in a Revolutionary Age* (New York and Nashville, 1944), consisting of his "Lyman Beecher Lectures on Preaching" at Yale University, with bibliographical footnotes. His interest is in preaching that will unite those who believe in a better society, to avoid a war of classes. Faith must not be repudiated by postponing its realization to another world, and abandoning allegiance to the revolutionary Christ who preached love. The effect of reaction against this advanced liberalism, and of the renewed interest in doctrine, is evident in Gaius Glenn Atkins, *Preaching and the Mind of Today* (New York, 1934). He assays the effort of preaching to meet the challenge of depression, secularism, and criticism of religion. The vocation of the preacher is to meet pressing personal and social problems and to mould

souls, and he must know his theology and understand "science." Theodore Otto Wedel, *The Pulpit Rediscovers Theology* (Greenwich, Conn., 1956), with bibliography in the footnotes, stresses the renewed interest in and understanding of the Bible, and the preacher's problem in mediating the new wealth to the congregation. His intention is to help preachers to utilize the "rediscovered" Bible—a startling evidence of the shift in emphasis away from the liberal, undogmatic preaching of the 1920's.

B. Collections

The earliest large anthology of American sermons is *The American Preacher; or, A Collection of Sermons from Some of the Most Eminent Preachers, Now Living in the United States, of Different Denominations in the Christian Church* (Elizabeth, N.J., 1791–93, 4 vols.). The early national period is well covered by a magazine, *The National Preacher and Village Pulpit, Original Sermons From Living Ministers of the United States* (New York, June 1826–Dec. 1857, 31 vols.; new series, Jan. 1858–1866), with various titles and editors; superseded by *Western Pulpit* (Chicago, 1865–Jan. 1867). There is a subject index to Vols. 1–38, 1826–1864, in 1 vol.; also *A General Index, a Topical Index, and a Textual Index of the National Preacher, for Forty Years, from 1826 to 1866* . . . (New York, 1872); previously issued in 1863 and 1865. Other useful collections, for the middle and later decades of the nineteenth century, are: *Pulpit and Rostrum* (New York, nos. 1–39, Nov. 15, 1858–1866; *The Pulpit, a Magazine of Sermons* (Fredericksburg, Pa., 1890–1900, 37 vols.); and *The Pulpit* (American Sabbath Tract Society, Plainfield, N.J., 1906–June 1917, 12 vols.). Charles Clayton Morrison, ed., *The Christian Century Pulpit, a Periodical of Contemporary Preaching* (Chicago, Oct. 1929–) contains a careful selection of the best contemporary sermons, with

portraits of the preachers and an editorial page. Another modern collection is *Pulpit Digest; Outstanding Sermons of the Month* (Great Neck, N.Y., May 1936–) which has issued an anthology: *The Best from Pulpit Digest* (Great Neck, N.Y., 1951). This comprises sermons which brought the greatest reader response over the last fifteen years. They include a wide variety of topics, by ministers of various faiths; the Bible as a sermon source, church building, and sermons for anniversaries of national and religious importance. This is a cross-section of the pulpit appeal to an audience wanting religion brought close to life's realities. *The American Pulpit Series* (New York and Nashville, 1945–) includes selected sermons by preachers of varying faiths, intended to represent the best, together with biographical notes. *Great Pulpit Masters* (New York, c.1941–) includes the most eminent and influential Americans. Theodore Wilhelm Engstrom, ed., *Great Sermons by Great American Preachers* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1943) has eighteen sermons by preachers of evangelical denominations, in all parts of the country—"a cross-section of the fundamental, sound ministers."

C. Special Types

Philip D. Jordan, "The Funeral Sermon, A Phase of American Journalism," in *American Book Collector*, Vol. 4, nos. 3–4 (Sept.–Oct. 1933), pp. 177–188, has bibliography in the footnotes and reproduces title pages. The type is reviewed as a literary art form which died as the newspaper obituary became longer and as theology became liberal and less preoccupied with mortality. It is historically important for its records of eminent and lesser persons, and is valuable to historians, genealogists, and students of the religious and moral tone of the old American community.

The persistence of the funeral sermon as a religious and

literary form is evident from the large number of aids (manuals, cyclopedias, etc.) to help in its composition. The following selections are typical: William Ezra Ketcham, comp. and ed., *Funeral Sermons and Outline Addresses; an Aid for Pastors* (New York, c.1899); Gerard B. F. Hallock, comp., *Cyclopedia of Funeral Sermons and Sketches, with Ministrant's Manual* (New York, c.1926); Earl Daniels, *The Funeral Message; Its Preparation and Significance* (Nashville, Tenn., c.1937); Charles Longworth Wallace, ed., *The Funeral Encyclopedia, A Source Book* (New York, 1953). A representative anthology of such sermons is *The Light Shines Through; Messages of Consolation by Ministers Eminent for Their Services of Solace* (New York, 1930).

Another historic and influential type of pulpit discourse is the New England election sermon, described in Robert William Glenroie Vail, *A Check List of New England Election Sermons*, a reprint from the *Proceedings* of the American Antiquarian Society for October, 1935 (Worcester, 1936). This includes references to complete collations in Evans, Sabin, and Gilman: alphabetical by states, chronological in each section; author, title, place, publisher, date; symbols for holding libraries. The election sermon played a most significant part in early American life, as a moulder of public opinion, especially in New England. There are two excellent lists of such sermons: Lindsay Swift, *The Massachusetts Election Sermons; an Essay in Descriptive Bibliography*, reprinted from the *Publications* of the Colonial Society of Massachusetts, Vol. 1. (Cambridge, Mass., 1897), which discusses publications, with bibliographical data in footnotes. Ralph Dunning Smith, *Statistics of the Connecticut Election Sermons 1674 to 1830, from the manuscripts of the Hon. Ralph Dunning Smyth (sic), of Guilford, Conn.*, edited by Bernard C. Steiner (Boston, 1892) is reprinted from the *New England Historical and Genealogical Register* for April 1892: tabular form, with columns for date, name of publisher, graduation, residence, and text.

The election sermon was important in the colonial wars and in the Revolution as a stimulus to patriotism. That this tradition is a constant factor in American national life is amply demonstrated by *Render unto Caesar, a Collection of Sermon Classics on all Phases of Religion in Wartime* (New York, 1943), which includes the Revolution, the Civil War, and World Wars I and II, and was inspired by questions about the purpose of war. Based upon research to find sermons typical of each war, and requests to preachers for sermons, it represents various denominations and sections of the country. The Spanish-American conflict is quite completely covered by a collection of pamphlets assembled by the Library of Congress: "Sermons and Addresses on the Spanish-American War," 1898–1902.

Another form of sermon that has been highly developed in the United States is the college chapel one. The number of collections in this genre is huge, and the following selections merely represent them, with emphasis upon various types of preacher. A good anthology is *Noontime Messages in a College Chapel; Sixty-nine Short Addresses to Young People by Twenty-five Well-known Preachers* (Boston and Chicago, c.1917). Elmore McNeill McKee, *Preaching in the New Era* (Garden City, N.Y., 1929) is a collection of sermons edited by a former pastor of the Church in Yale University, and consists of discourses by liberal Protestant preachers on topics of pressing importance, especially to youth. These are not "best sermons," but are characteristic of the men and representative of the "college sermon." They make the "real Jesus" central to life, and present a view of this type of preaching to rather skeptical audiences. Gerard Benjamin Fleet Hallock, *210 More Choice Sermons for Children; a Source Book of Suggestions* (New York, 1949) represents a type of preaching which has attained a higher development and popularity in the United States, perhaps, than in any other country, especially in Protestant churches.

XI. THE RELIGIOUS PRESS

OBVIOUSLY, the denominational and independent religious press has had an immense effect upon the national life and thought. It has shaped the opinions of religious and even of other persons, on a broad variety of religious, moral, and general public topics and questions. There are, however, comparatively few publications which examine specifically the influence of the religious press, as distinguished from historical references in bibliographical guides to periodicals, and in general accounts of magazines and newspapers. (See Part One, sect. 11, *Periodical Indexes and Guides*, particularly C.) The best over-all review of the period of origins is Howard Eikenberry Jensen, "The Rise of Religious Journalism in the United States . . ." (Doctoral dissertation with bibliography of journals and abstract, University of Chicago, 1920, typewritten, and published in part in University of Chicago, *Abstracts of Theses, Humanities Series*, Vol. 3, pp. 253–261).

R. C. White, "Writings Pertaining to Religion in Eighteenth-Century American Magazines" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1935) discloses broad trends of opinion, and is valuable especially for editorial and popular ideas on revivalism, controversies, preaching, and influential intellectual currents such as liberalism and Deism, and reactions against them. Clifford P. Morehouse, "Origins of the Episcopal Church Press from Colonial Days to 1840," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 11, no. 3 (Sept. 1942), pp. 201–318, is a challenging illustration of the minute research which should be devoted to the history of the press in all the major religious groups. Another example is John Theodore Hefley, "The *Christian Century* in American Culture, 1920–1941" (Doctoral dissertation, *Dissertation Abstracts*, University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Mich. (1953), Vol. 13, no. 4, p. 603). He traces the course of thought in this independent, undenominational magazine, mostly in the editorials, emphasizing the Social Gospel, the

anti-war attitude, ecumenical leadership, and anti-Catholicism. The magazine often has expressed much that is central in American liberal culture, especially its mild theism and social reformism. Contemporary religious journalism and its problems are dispassionately considered by Roland E. Wolseley, "The Influence of the Religious Press," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 26, no. 1 (Winter, 1956–1957), pp. 75–86. The editors are said to be not sure about the effect they want to have upon rank-and-file opinion, according to replies from fourteen of them. A few are beginning to use scientific methods to discover it, and are generally following E. L. Godkin's policy of influencing the right few, the opinion-makers. (See Part One, sect. 11, c, *Histories of Periodical Literature.*)

PART FIVE

INTELLECTUAL HISTORY, THEOLOGY, PHILOSOPHY, AND SCIENCE

AMERICAN THEOLOGY

It is sometimes assumed, by European and American interpreters, that there has been no "American theology," because of the supposedly exclusive concern of American Christians with "activism." This picture never was true, of New England especially. But New England was not the only center of theological concern, for there have been other, non-Puritan traditions in American theology, with long and rich histories. American theological tradition is diverse: New England Puritan derived from England; Presbyterian, strong in the Middle Atlantic States and the South, derived from Scotland and the Continental Reformed scholastics; Lutheran, associated with German theology, and so on. American theology is derivative, because of the immigrant character of the nation, and its harking back to the old homelands. Wide diversity has given to American theology "an unusually broad catholic tendency." (See Sydney Ahlstrom, "Theology in America, a Historical Survey," in *Religion in American Life*, Volume One.) The first quarter of the nineteenth century was a turning-point with respect to theological influences. Up to that time British sources prevailed; after 1815 German influences increased, much facilitated by the prestige and labors of Coleridge and Carlyle.

This part is concerned not so much with the philosophy of religion, per se, as with systematic thought about the Church's message and its teaching. Various types of theological thinking are illustrated by references to works of representative theologians in particular traditions. By sheer intellectual force, some succeeded in impressing their stamp upon their ecclesiastical communities. The approach, like that of Ahlstrom, aims to "preclude the impression that theological movements and traditions come into being and transform themselves due to impersonal, immanent forces."

I. GENERAL WORKS

A. Bibliography

BIBLIOGRAPHIES of specifically American theological writings are generally included in more comprehensive guides, or in the commentaries on various "schools" of American theological development, which are listed in the succeeding sections of this part. Some helpful references occur in Constance M. Winchell, *Guide to Reference Books* (Chicago, 1951, 7th ed.), in Section K, "Religion," under "General Works," including encyclopedias, and under "Christian Religion," including general works, bibliographies, and encyclopedias. John G. Barrow's *A Bibliography of Bibliographies in Religion* (Ann Arbor, Mich., 1955) indexes a considerable number of titles, but mostly in German. Henry Putney Beers, *Bibliographies in American History* (edition of 1958) also indexes some references under "Theology," and there are highly valuable references in F. E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, 1954, 1956), particularly in the footnotes and bibliographies on the theologies of various groups, most notably in the excellent sections, "Genetic History of Reformed Theology," and "The Reformed Confessions."

Wilbur M. Smith, *A List of Bibliographies of Theological and Biblical Literature Published in Great Britain and America, 1595–1931* (Coatesville, Pa., 1931), containing 300 entries, is indispensable for American references. Other titles that should be listed separately are: John F. Hurst, *Bibliotheca Theologica, A Select and Classified Bibliography of Theology and General Religious Literature* (New York, 1883), containing 6,000 entries; and his *Literature of Theology; a Classified Bibliography of Theological and General Religious Literature . . .* (New York, 1896); William Swan Sonnenschein, *A Bibliography of Theology, Being the Sections Relating to that Subject in The Best Books and The*

Readers Guide (1897), with 4,000 entries; Newton Theological Institution, Newton Center, Mass., Library, *Theological Bibliographies* (Newton Center, Mass., 1914, rev. ed., the Institution *Bulletin*, Vol. 6, no. 2, February, 1914; first issued in 1910); Union Theological Seminary, New York, Library, *The McAlpin Collection of British History and Theology, Catalogue* . . . Compiled and edited by Charles Ripley Gillett . . . (New York [Seminary], 1927–1930, 5 vols.); *Doctoral Dissertations in the Field of Religion, 1940–1952, Their Titles, Locations, Fields, and Short Précis of Contents*, supplement to Vol. 18, *Review of Religion*, 1954 (New York, Columbia University Press, c.1954), containing entries for over 500 theses, mostly with excellent brief summaries of contents.

A colossal amount of bibliographical information is stored in the principal American theological and religious journals. Most of these have not only essays with footnotes and bibliographies, but also book reviews. Some have bibliographies of recent books and periodical publications, lists of recent theses, and the like. It would be impossible here to list all such magazines, and the following therefore are suggested as of really indispensable importance: *American Journal of Theology* (Chicago, Jan. 1897–Oct. 1920, Vols. 1–24, 24 vols. in 27); Vols. 2–6 include "Theological and Semitic Literature for 1898–1901 . . . ," by W. Muss-Arnolt; general index in Vol. 24; superseded by *Journal of Religion* (Chicago, Jan. 1921–). Other American and British theological journals to be consulted should include: *Andover Review; a Religious and Theological Monthly*, 1884–1893 (Congregational); *Anglican Theological Review*, 1918– ; *Christian Review*, Vols. 1–28, March 1836–Oct. 1863 (Boston, 1836–63, Baptist, quarterly), merged into *Bibliotheca Sacra*, 1844– ; *Church History*, 1932– ; *Church Quarterly Review* (Anglican), 1875– ; *Concordia Theological Monthly* (Lutheran), 1930– ; *Harvard Theological Review* (Unitarian), 1908– ; *Journal of Theological Studies*, Lutheran,

quarterly, 1849–1927; *Princeton Quarterly Review* (Presbyterian), 1929– ; *Religion in Life; a Christian Quarterly,* 1932– ; *Review of Religion,* 1936– ; *Theology,* 1920– ; *Theology Today,* 1944– .

B. General History; Background of European Theology

GENERAL histories of the development of Christian theology are included in the bibliographies referred to in Part One, above. The standard and most accessible general history of Christian theology to the Reformation is Arthur C. McGiffert, *The History of Christian Thought* (New York, 1932–1933, 2 vols.). A modern survey, written from the standpoint of an existentialist theologian, is Paul Tillich, *A History of Christian Thought, Recorded and Edited by Peter H. John* (Providence? R.I., 1956, privately printed), lectures, 1953, with "Bibliography of Paul Tillich (1952–1956)." These lectures cover the development of Christian thought through the Reformation quite adequately, but the entire post-Reformation period is dismissed in a single chapter.

Jaroslav Pelikan, *From Luther to Kierkegaard; a Study in the History of Theology* (St. Louis, c.1950) has bibliographical references included in "Notes," and emphasizes the modern return to the "classical," orthodox theology of the age of the Reformation. Also bearing down heavily upon the development of the Continental Protestant theology that affected America is Arthur Cushman McGiffert, *Protestant Thought Before Kant* (New York, 1911), with a valuable bibliography; a lucidly written, scholarly, and historical analysis, for both the student and the layman. It covers the period from the sixteeenth to the nineteenth century, considering the spread of rationalism as a preparation for the transition to the modern period which Kant began. Edward Caldwell Moore, *An Outline of the History of Christian thought Since Kant* (New York, 1912) continues McGif-

fert's work on the development of modern theology, reviewing the destruction of scholastic theology, the development of idealism from Kant to Ritschl, the critical and historical movement from Strauss to Harnack, and particularly the impact of science in the doctrine of evolution. A chapter on the English-speaking peoples briefly sketches the progressive or reactionary movement from Samuel Taylor Coleridge to William James. The crisis that overtook American Protestant theology, and inspired the tension between liberal and neo-orthodox thinking, is explained in Hugh Ross Mackintosh, *Types of Modern Theology; Schleiermacher to Barth* (New York, 1937), an expansion of lectures delivered in 1933, concentrating in an objective manner upon the movements within Protestantism, appraising as well as explaining, with the unique revelation of God in Christ as the criterion of judgment. A provocative criticism of German theology in the nineteenth century is Karl Barth, *Protestant Thought from Rousseau to Ritschl*, tr. Brian Cozins and others (New York, 1959). Two other reviews, pointing up the elements of the modern theological crisis, are: Carl Ferdinand Howard Henry, *Fifty Years of Protestant Theology* (Boston, 1950), with bibliographical footnotes; and his *The Protestant Dilemma; an Analysis of the Current Impasse in Theology* (Grand Rapids, 1949); also Josef Lukl Hromádka, *Theology between Yesterday and Tomorrow* (Philadelphia, 1957). William Hordern, *A Layman's Guide to Protestant Theology* (New York, 1955) makes an objective effort to steer the somewhat bewildered mass of seriously interested Anglo-American Protestants, puzzled by the conflicts between liberal and conservative schools of thought, by studying, explaining, and interpreting the main trends in theological belief on a far higher plane than the popular literature on "religious revival," and the books about "peace of mind" and "positive thinking." A lucid discussion of the American theological scene at the close of World War II is given in George F. Thomas's chapter, "New Forms for Old Faith," in Dixon Wecter, et al., *Chang-*

ing Patterns in American Civilization (Philadelphia, 1949). University of Pennsylvania, Bicentennial Conference, *Religion and the Modern World*, by Jacques Maritain, Josef L. Hromádka, William J. McGarry, and others . . . (Philadelphia, 1941) discusses contemporary renewals in religious thought, and modern trends in European Protestant and Catholic theology.

Because Protestant theological trends on the Continent of Europe and in England inevitably influenced those in the United States, one should refer to bibliographies on Protestant thought in Europe. A brief but well-chosen one is at the close of ch. XLVII, "Protestantism on the Continent of Europe . . ." in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (New York, 1953). This includes works by or concerning Schleiermacher, Ritschl, Kierkegaard, Grundtvig, Barth, Kant, Herrmann, and Harnack. The following general surveys should be carefully examined: Otto Pfleiderer, *The Development of Theology in Germany since Kant, and Its Progress in Great Britain since 1825*, tr. by J. Frederick Smith (London, 1890; 2nd ed., with an appendix, 1893); Frédéric Auguste Lichtenberger, *History of German Theology in the Nineteenth Century* tr. and ed. W. Hastie (Edinburgh, 1889), with bibliography, characterized by Latourette, p. 1157, as "a comprehensive sketch"; V. F. Storr, *The Development of English Theology in the Nineteenth Century, 1800–1860* (London, 1913), the best work on the subject for the years covered; Leonard Elliott Elliott-Binns, *The Development of English Theology in the Later Nineteenth Century* . . . (London, 1952), brief but comprehensive, with bibliographical footnotes; and his *English Thought, 1860–1900, the Theological Aspect* . . . (London, 1956), with a select bibliography; also John Kenneth Mozley, *Some Tendencies in British Theology, from the Publication of Lux Mundi to the Present Day* (London, 1951). A stimulating view of the whole course of Protestant thought is given by John Dillenberger and

Claude Welch, *Protestant Christianity Interpreted Through Its Development* (New York, 1954).

II. CLASSICAL PROTESTANTISM IN AMERICA

A. Calvinism: The Background of American Religious Thought

THE history of American religious thought during most of the colonial period forms a chapter in the evolution of Calvinism. The theological system of John Calvin provided the point of departure for the New England Puritan theologians, although they variously modified and reformulated it. Toward the middle of the eighteenth century Jonathan Edwards, who was "profoundly attached to the Calvinistic system," attempted to rehabilitate it. But because he was influenced by more recent intellectual currents, his Calvinism did not simply reaffirm the tenets of the Genevan Reformer, and "New England Theology" introduced further modifications. This theology eventually lost its dominant position in American religious thought, and many distinctive affirmations of Calvinism were repudiated by creative theologians. Nevertheless, an appreciation of Calvinism is essential to an understanding of American thought to the end of the eighteenth century.

The New England Puritans drew their theological inspiration from various sources, of which John Calvin's system was only one. Perry Miller has observed that "if the New Englanders were Calvinists, it was because they happened to agree with Calvin; they approved his doctrine not because he taught it, but because it seemed inescapably indicated when they studied scripture or observed the actions of men. . . . The source of the New England ideology is not Calvin, but England, or more accurately, the Bible as it was read in England, not in Geneva." Nevertheless, Calvin's systematic

presentation of the Christian faith offers the clearest and most comprehensive statement of the general theological point of view of the New England Puritans. Certainly they shared his emphasis on such austere doctrines as the absolute sovereignty of God, human depravity, divine predestination and election, and the religious significance of work. The "New England Theology," which Edwards systematized, eventually modified the rigors of Calvinism in important respects, and the prevalent thrust of American theological thinking since the eighteenth century has been away from a consistent Calvinism, even among Presbyterians. Despite these qualifications, however, it remains true that an understanding of the main themes of Calvinism is necessary to an understanding of American religious thought in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.

A selected bibliography on Calvin's life and theology, and on the churches stemming from Calvinism, appears in F. E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, 1956). Works on Calvin, his place in the Reformation, and his theological system, are almost legion, and the following titles comprise a selection for the better ones, with bibliographies: John T. McNeill, *The History and Character of Calvinism* (New York, 1954), with "Book List"; and his "Thirty Years of Calvin Study," in *Church History,* Vol. 17, no. 3 (Sept. 1948), pp. 207–240, with an "Addendum," Vol. 18, no. 4 (Dec. 1949), p. 241; R. N. Carew Hunt, *Calvin* (London, 1933); James Mackinnon, *Calvin and the Reformation* (London and New York, 1936); and Georgia Harkness, *John Calvin, The Man and His Ethics* (New York, 1931), a brief and generally accurate biographical sketch, somewhat unfavorable to Calvin and therefore needing to be balanced by other points of view. Calvin's best-known work, which was familiar to the early American Puritan theologians, is judiciously appreciated by John T. McNeill, *Books of Faith and Power* (New York, 1947), a brief, lucid introduction to Calvin's *Institutes of the Christian Religion* (1st ed., 1536;

London, 1562, translated into English by Thomas Norton), his theological masterpiece and the proper source for studying his ideas. A brief summary is provided by Hugh Thomson Kerr, *A Compend of Calvin's Institutes* (Philadelphia, 1939); and by William W. Fenn, "The Marrow of Calvin's Theology," in *Harvard Theological Review*, Vol. 2, no. 3 (July 1909), pp. 323–339, which stresses the main features of Calvin's theological system, and points out that the Calvinist theology comforted its adherents by its insistence that salvation is in God's hands, not dependent upon rites or deeds. The departure from "Romanism" was by the spirit of God, and that alone was evidence of election, and God's grace would carry them through all trials—a conviction that was a great stimulus to spiritual endeavor. There have been numerous modern American studies and criticisms of Calvinism and its theological progeny. The more important ones include representatives of various points of view, conservative and liberal: Henry Jackson Van Dyke, *Variations of Calvinism* (New York, 1890), from the *New York Evangelist*, Aug. 7, 14, 21, 1890; Benjamin Breckinridge Warfield (Princeton Theological Seminary), *Calvin and Calvinism* (New York and London, 1931), with a bibliography, and a prefatory note, signed by Ethelbert D. Warfield, William Park Armstrong, Caspar Wistar Hodge, committee, "On the Literary History of Calvin's 'Institutes' "; Arthur Dakin, *Calvinism* (Philadelphia, c.1946, first issued, 1940); A. Mitchell Hunter, *The Teaching of Calvin* (New York, 1950); John T. McNeill, *John Calvin on God and Political Duty* (New York, 1950); Edward A. Dowey, *The Knowledge of God in Calvin's Theology* (New York, 1952); Wilhelm Niesel, *The Theology of Calvin*, translated by Harold Knight (Philadelphia, 1956); Louis Berkhof, *Reformed Dogmatics* (Grand Rapids, 1941, 2nd rev. and enl. ed.; also published under title: *Systematic Theology*), with bibliography; and Jacob Tunis Hoogstra, ed., *American Calvinism; a Survey*, edited for the Calvinistic Action Committee (Grand Rapids, 1957),

consisting of papers read at the Calvinist Conference, Grand Rapids, June 20–21, 1956, with the more relevant discussions. The indispensable guide to the continuing stream of studies dealing with all aspects of the Protestant Reformation and its theology is *Church History*, which periodically publishes revisions of previous bibliographical surveys.

B. The New England Theology

The New England Theology was founded upon the rediscovered New Testament, and the Continental Reformed theology, which differed from the Anglican, Lutheran, and "left-wing" movements. Reformed theology began with Zwingli's revolt in Zurich, which spread into Germany and France, and was a well-formed tradition when Calvin's *Institutes* first appeared in 1536. The Puritan impulse in the English Reformation is more accurately called "Reformed" than "Calvinistic." Reformed theology, in revolt against ecclesiasticism, aimed at a radical reconstruction of Christian life. English Puritanism was a unique product of this movement. It produced a carefully articulated theology in the works of Perkins, Preston, Ames, Sibbes, and others, and reached its perfection of dogmatic expression in the Westminster Confession and Catechism.

The essential tenets of the Puritan theology were the depravity of man, the sovereignty of God, and the necessity of worshiping God and ordering His Church in strict accord with Biblical prescription. The last point became the root of divisions among Congregationalists, Presbyterians, and Episcopalians.

New England Puritan theology, as a system of thought, moulded the religious spirit of the Colonies, and affected the popular social and political ideals. The men who shaped it were "in a very real sense the founders of the American nation." The Puritan theological system was developed during the reign of Elizabeth I (1558–1603), when outwardly the

Reformation in England had been "settled" by the adoption of the Thirty-nine Articles defining doctrine, the Book of Common Prayer providing a liturgy, and the idea of the monarch as "Supreme Governor" of the reformed Church. But the Puritan demand for more thorough reformation was growing, and during the reigns of James I and Charles I (1603–1649) became a fully articulated point of view, though total consensus was by no means achieved. (See also Part Two, sect. I, B, I, *The Theocratic Holy Commonwealth.*)

I. INTELLECTUAL ORIGINS. Emmanuel College, Cambridge University, was an especially formative influence on New England Puritan theology. Dr. William Whitaker, Regius Professor of Divinity, was the author of the Reformed "Lambeth Articles" (1595). William Perkins, lecturer at Great St. Andrew's, was one of the originators of the Federal or Covenant Theology of the New England Puritans. Laurence Chaderton, Master of Emmanuel College, was a powerful preacher. John Preston, successor of Chaderton as Master (1622), was the author of *The New Covenant, Or The Saints Portion* (London, 1629), an exposition of the covenant doctrine ranking with the works of William Ames as a source of New England theology. Ames was also at Cambridge but he became an exile for his nonconformity. Yet another representative of the Puritan theology was Richard Sibbes. These men all influenced the thought of men like Cotton, Shepard, and Hooker, who became the first pastor of the church in Hartford, Conn.

The following are representative works, which were well known to the early Puritan theologians and preachers of New England. Among the most potent formative influences was Peter Ramus, who is most recently studied by Walter Ong, *Ramus: Method and the Decay of Dialogue; from the Art of Discourse to the Art of Reason* (Cambridge, Mass., 1958), with a bibliography which is a vital source of information on the covenant concept. Ong has also edited *Ramus and Talon Inventory; a Short-Title Inventory of the*

Published Works of Peter Ramus (1515–1572) and of Omer Talon (c.1510–1562) in Their Original and in Their Variously Altered Forms . . . (Cambridge, Mass., 1958). Another enduring influence was that of Ames (1576–1633), who was read in New England for several generations: *Medulla S. S. Theologiae* . . . (Amsterdam, 1628, 1648, 1652, 1656; London, 1629, 1630). Ames was still being read at Yale College early in the eighteenth century, when Jonathan Edwards was a student there. Colonial students often knew his work by the translation: *The Marrow of Sacred Divinity, Drawne out of the Holy Scriptures, and the Interpreters Thereof, and Brought into Method, Translated out of the Latine* . . . (London, 1638?, 1642, 1643). Other influential works of Ames, read in New England, are: *Conscience, with the Power and Cases thereof* . . . *Translated out of Latine into English for more Publique Benefit* . . . (London, 1643, 5 parts in 1 vol.); [William Bradshaw], *English Puritanisme, Containing the Maine Opinions of the Rigidist Sort of Those That are Called Puritans in the Realme of England* (London, 1641), "Written by William Ames," first published anonymously in 1605, and translated into Latin for foreign use by Ames, and entitled "Puritanismus Anglicanus" (1610); *The Workes Of The Reverend and Faithful Minister of Christ William Ames Doctor and Professor of the Famous University of Franeker in Friesland, Translated out of Latine for publike Use* . . . (London, 1643). It would be difficult to overestimate the influence of Ames in New England theology.

Early New England ministers were familiar also with the works of William Perkins (1558–1602): *The Foundation of Christian Religion, Gathered into Sixe Principles* . . . (London, 1590, 1595, 1597, 1617, 1626, 1641; Cambridge and London, 1642; London, 1661; Boston, 1682; London, 1723); *A Golden Chaine, Or The Description of Theologie, Containing the Order of the Causes of Salvation and Damnation, according to God's Woord* . . . (London, 1591, 1592;

Cambridge, 1595, 1597, 1598, 1600; London, 1612, 1621, 1635); *An Exposition of The Symbole Or Creed Of The Apostles* . . . (Cambridge, 1595), which went through many printings, and appeared at London as late as 1631; and *The Works of That Famous and Worthie Minister of Christ . . . M. W. Perkins: Gathered into one Volume and newly Corrected* . . . (London and Cambridge, 1596–97; Cambridge, 1603; many eds., printed at Cambridge as late as 1648). The marrow of the theology of John Preston (1587–1628) is well expressed in *A Treatise of Effectuall Faith: Delivered in Sixe Sermons upon I Thes. 1:3* . . . (London, 1630, 1631). Richard Sibbes (1577–1635) exerted a wide influence upon Puritan theology, which may be seen in: *The Works of the Reverend Richard Sibbes, D.D., Late Master of Catharine-Hall in the University of Oxford, and Preacher of Gray's Inn, London, to Which is Prefixed, a Short Memoir of the Author's Life* (Aberdeen and London, 1809, 3 vols. in 1); also *Complete Works* (Edinburgh, 1842–44, 7 vols.); *The Complete Works of Richard Sibbes, D.D.*, edited, with *Memoir*, by the Rev. Alexander Balloch Grosart (Edinburgh, 1862–64, 7 vols.).

2. COVENANT THEOLOGY. The covenant is the clue to the New England Puritan understanding of regeneration, and of the order of church and society—the "Holy Commonwealth." Preston (see above) called the covenant between God and man the ground of all man's hopes. To the Puritan, God had always dealt with his children by covenant. By the covenant, foreordained and saving grace is given to the "elect." It was not only *individual*, between each man and God; it was also *public*, respecting the formation of churches and of civil government. Each church was established by converted persons in covenant with one another as a "communion of saints," and the state was established upon a covenant, like the Mayflower Compact of 1620. The Puritan theology therefore considered economic, political, and social affairs in a *corporate* sense, and the Church assumed responsibility for society be-

cause the Puritans considered both church and state as under the covenant. In this respect Hooker's thought was typical, "a serious effort to expound God's will as it applied to the problem of forming a new commonwealth" (see Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "Theology in America: a Historical Survey," in Volume One). His theological tenets are clearly defined in *A Survey of the Summe of Church-Discipline, Wherein, the Way of the Churches of New-England is Warranted out of the Word, and all Exceptions of Weight, which are Made against it, Answered* . . . (London, 1648). Hooker defended the covenant theological basis of the New England Puritan churches, and was "an ideal representative of the New England mind of the first generation (see Ahlstrom), because his life summed up the Puritan experience—Reformed divinity at the university, the search for a true conversion, silencing and exile, migration to New England, and the effort there to found and defend a "Holy Commonwealth." One of the best modern reviews of Hooker's theology is Everett H. Emerson, "Thomas Hooker and the Reformed Theology: The Relationship of Hooker's Conversion Preaching to Its Background," in *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 4 (Dec. 1955), pp. 369–370, an abstract of a dissertation, Louisiana State University, 1955. For other estimates of Hooker, one should consult: George Leon Walker, *Thomas Hooker* (New York, 1891), and Perry Miller's essay on Hooker in *Errand into the Wilderness* (Cambridge, Mass., 1956), ch. 2.

The covenant idea is thoroughly reviewed, with a wealth of references, in William Wakefield McKee, "The Idea of Covenant in Early English Puritanism, c.1580–1643" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1948), which asserts that the idea is traceable among Continental Reformers, and was developed by English Puritans to describe God's relation to man, outline the theory of salvation, bind men to ethical living, interpret the course of history, and characterize the nature of society. Family, church, and commonwealth were

established by covenant, like all human voluntary relationships. The implication is that government is by covenant, not by decree. The covenant emphasizes mutuality and voluntarism, ethical activity, and social responsibility, and affirms the freedom and duties of man in human and divine relationships. Peter Ymen DeJong traces the development of the concept in America, in *The Covenant Idea in New England Theology, 1620–1847* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1945), an abbreviated form of a doctoral thesis (Hartford Theological Seminary), with bibliography.

3. REGENERATION. The most vital area of the Puritan's spiritual concern was the idea of regeneration, "the profoundly felt knowledge of his implantation in Christ, the assurance of election, the certainty that the covenant of grace was for him" (see Ahlstrom). The main concern of religion was to be prepared and instructed for this experience. Conversion became the requirement for church membership, and provided the starting point for Puritan preaching, dogmatics, and church order. Practical preaching was aimed at this end; the sermon was a means of grace, to stimulate human cooperation in the work of grace. It was not a mere mechanical procedure on God's part, nor could it be obtained solely by human effort. Perhaps the clearest exposition of this doctrine is found in the writings of Thomas Shepard (1605–1649): *The Works of Thomas Shepard, First Pastor of the First Church, Cambridge, Mass., with a Memoir of His Life and Character* . . . (Boston, 1853, 3 vols.), with "Life of Thomas Shepard," by John A. Albro. He has often been cited as typical of the early New England Reformed theologians and preachers, and was Hooker's successor at Cambridge. Like Hooker, he emphasized the necessity of regeneration and conversion. Probably nobody in modern America has displayed a keener intellectual understanding of this basic Puritan doctrine than has Perry Miller, in " 'Preparation for Salvation' in Seventeenth-Century New England," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 4, no. 3 (July 1943), pp. 253–286,

with some bibliographical references in footnotes. Miller points out that the first "federal" theologians conceived of conversion as a logical process for evangelical, not social reasons. But this was altered by new circumstances to preparation to save the state, in which even the unregenerate could take part. Thus religion more and more became a matter of outward observance, its psychology wholly changed. The consequence was reliance on human exertion, and belief in conversion by rational argument and moral persuasion. The road was open to Arminianism and secularization, "the ethics of reason and the code of civic virtues."

4. GENERAL COURSE OF THE NEW ENGLAND THEOLOGY. HISTORY AND COMMENTARY. Long after the originators of the New England Puritan theology were dead, and just as it was about to be modified by new intellectual tendencies, it was summarized by Samuel Willard, in *The Complete Body of Divinity* (Boston, 1726), published after the divine's death. It is considered to be the fullest organization and expression of the Puritan theology, and consists mostly of lectures on the Presbyterian Westminster Confession of Faith. Willard was largely ignored, because he held to a theology which the "Enlightenment" of the eighteenth century was already displacing. A general early modern review of the development of New England theology, and of its modifications, is offered in David Alexander Wallace, *The Theology of New England, An Attempt to Exhibit the Doctrines now Prevalent in the Orthodox Congregational Churches of New England*, with an Introduction by Daniel Dana, D.D. (Boston, 1856). Williston Walker, in his *Ten New England Leaders* (New York and Boston, 1901), lectures delivered at the Andover Theological Seminary in 1898 and 1899, reviews the lives and thought of some who were influential in the origin and development of New England theology: William Bradford, John Cotton, Richard Mather, John Eliot, Increase Mather, Jonathan Edwards, Charles Chauncy, Samuel Hopkins, Leonard Woods, and Leonard Bacon. One should not fail

to consult Williston Walker, *A History of the Congregational Churches in the United States* (New York, 1894), with an excellent bibliography of works to 1894, as well as his superbly edited *The Creeds and Platforms of Congregationalism* (New York, 1893), also a vast bibliographical resource. George Nye Boardman gives a comprehensive survey in *A History of New England Theology* (New York, 1899). By far the most scholarly and exhaustive history came from the vast industry of Frank Hugh Foster. The genesis, development, and mature expression of his work are seen in the following titles: "The Eschatology of the New England Divines," in *Bibliotheca Sacra,* Vol. 43, no. 169 (Jan. 1886), pp. 1–32; no. 170 (Apr. 1886), pp. 287–302; no. 172 (Oct. 1886), pp. 711–726; Vol. 45, no. 180 (Oct. 1888), pp. 669–694; Vol. 46, no. 181 (Jan. 1889), pp. 95–123, with many footnotes and bibliography, comprises a practically complete history of the New England theology and its schools and controversies from Edwards to the conflict with the Universalists and Unitarians, and the doctrinal contributions of the leading Calvinistic theologians. His "The History of the Original Puritan Theology of New England, 1620–1720," in *American Journal of Theology,* Vol. 1, no. 3 (July 1897), pp. 700–727, has bibliographical references in the footnotes, and emphasizes the decline of the ideal of *converted membership,* the growth of Arminianism and the Halfway Covenant, and Edwards' repreaching of the fundamental doctrines of Calvinism. For Foster, the cause of decline was the *doctrine of inability,* preached so as to "deplete the churches, by discouraging repentance and faith." The essay is an earlier form of his masterpiece: *A Genetic History of the New England Theology* (Chicago, 1907), with biographical and bibliographical footnotes, a survey from Jonathan Edwards to Edwards A. Park, emphasizing its intellectual and spiritual fount in Yale; its exaltation of personal religion; its inspiration of missions, education, revivals, and cooperation; its character as a world-wide phenomenon; its replenishment from outside sources;

and the reasons for its ultimate failure, due to rigidity, in spite of efforts of great leaders to adapt it to changes of thought.

Another sympathetic interpreter is Joseph Haroutunian, in *Piety Versus Moralism; the Passing of the New England Theology* (New York, c.1932), with bibliography, revealing the substitution of "practical" and secularized pietism for the old, orthodox, other-worldly Calvinism. Several other special studies illustrate the stages of the transition, from early orthodoxy, through modifications by accommodation to contemporary thought, to the liberalism of the period 1880–1930. Perry Miller's *Orthodoxy in Massachusetts, 1630–1650, A Genetic Study* (Cambridge, Mass., 1933), a careful piece of work, exhibits the New England theology in its early covenant stage. Other valuable comments are in Miller's *The New England Mind: the Seventeenth Century* (New York, 1939), and in his "The Marrow of Puritan Divinity," in *Publications of the Colonial Society of Massachusetts*, Vol. 32 (1935), pp. 247–300: very detailed and scholarly, with many bibliographical references in the footnotes.

The aim of Puritan theology was to elucidate the laws of God's universe, and yet to remind one of the ultimate mystery of God. The modification of Calvinism by the covenant idea encouraged a native rationalism and a slow liberalization, until Edwards rejected the covenant scheme, and "made grace irresistible," with God as absolute sovereign, thus becoming New England's first "consistent Calvinist." An indispensable study of the modifications is Lewis Smith, "Changing Conceptions of God in Colonial New England" (*Dissertation Abstracts*, Vol. 13, p. 383; University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Mich., pub. no. 4992), which traces the genesis and important changes in the attitude toward God in the Reformed churches, and analyzes certain fairly well-defined conceptions of deity and their relationships to the social and cultural context. Lawrence Willson's "The Gods of New England," in *Pacific Spectator*, Vol. 9 (Spring 1955), pp. 141–153, discusses the

Puritan God and that of the Deists, and New England's later struggles to achieve a balance between the two. Cushing Strout, in "Faith and History: the Mind of William T. Shedd," in *Journal of the History of Ideas,* Vol. 15, no. 1 (Jan. 1954), pp. 153–162, with bibliographical references in the footnotes, studies Shedd (a teacher at Auburn, Andover, and Union Seminaries) as illustrating nineteenth-century American intellectual history in his assimilation of the ideas of Calvin, Locke, Kant, and Darwin; and his efforts to infuse new ideas, which only revealed the decline of orthodoxy. David Everett Swift's "The Controversy in American Congregationalism over Future Probation" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University) points up one aspect of the gradual moderation of the rigors of primitive New England Calvinism. Gerald Harvey Jones, in "George A. Gordon and the New England Theology" (Doctoral thesis, Boston University, abstract, Boston, 1942) uses a historical approach to define Gordon as the eminent voice in the New England tradition while pastor (1884–1929) of the Old South Church, Boston, and to review his theology's identities with Calvin's system in proclaiming the kinship of man and God, the Trinity, the happiness theory of virtue, and irresistible grace. John Frederick Olson, in "George Angier Gordon's Christology" (Doctoral thesis, Boston University, abstract, Boston, 1949), views him as a liberal leader against Calvinism in the Congregational Church, moving from humanistic bases to theistic conclusions, emphasizing Christ as the incarnation of God rather than an atoning sacrifice, universalizing the Edwardsean view, remaining a Trinitarian, and indicating the essential problems of Christology. This section may appropriately close with an essay by John Wright Buckham, "The New England Theologians," in *American Journal of Theology,* Vol. 24, no. 1 (Jan. 1920), pp. 19–29, with bibliographical references in the footnotes, and brief biographical notes on various theologians. This is a general review of their doctrines, maintaining that the noblest and most enduring legacy of New England theol-

ogy was the doctrine of virtue as "disinterested benevolence." A valuable feature is the review of the Oberlin College divines —Finney, Mahan, and Fairchild—and the dominance of "Taylorism" there (see sect. II, D, *Development of Liberal Orthodoxy*).

C. Jonathan Edwards and the Reconstruction and Defense of Calvinism

Edwards emerged as a major figure in New England a hundred years after the founding of the Massachusetts Bay Colony. In the intervening century the Puritan Calvinism of the founders had undergone a process of vitiation and transformation. First, the internal logic of the Covenant Theology, the Puritanized version of Calvinism, had gradually and steadily softened the emphasis on the sovereignty of God and the helplessness of man, and had increasingly stressed the part of *man* in the process of salvation. Second, the American environment had not encouraged maintaining the intense piety of the pioneer generation. Frontier conditions tended to exalt freedom and individualism as values. Opportunities for making money, rather than the will of God, more and more became the focus for interests and loyalties. By the second and third generations, the churches were forced to recognize the diminution of piety, and to compromise with secularizing tendencies. The essence of their compromise was the Half-Way Covenant, which admitted respectable people "half-way" into the churches, even though they could not give the convincing evidences of regeneration formerly required. Finally, around 1700, the influence of the Newtonian-Lockean scientific and philosophical revolution began to affect New England. The new world-view emphasized the *rationality* of God and man, the beneficence of God's design for the world, and the ability of rational men to discover and conform to the divine purposes. By Edwards' time, the leading New England ministers were still using Calvinistic phrases, but in a way that

gave a wholly different emphasis. In place of the absolute helplessness of sinful man before the arbitrary decrees of a sovereign God, they played up good works as a means to salvation. The tone of urbanity and tolerance in their words symbolized the profound (but as yet not openly avowed) shift in New England attitudes.

Edwards was one of the first, if not the first colonial person, to read Newton and Locke with a full understanding of their significance. His towering achievement lay in his comprehension of the full implications of the most advanced thought of his day, and in his reconstruction of the essential tenets of Calvinism in terms of the new philosophy.

1. ORIGINS OF HIS THOUGHT. The New England philosophical and rational theology was challenged by the Pietist view of an increasing number of colonists. Antinomians, Quakers, Anabaptists, and others "sought salvation by knowing God as revealed through individual interpretation of Scripture and through mystic communication rather than by reasoning from special or general revelation" (see George Reuben Metcalf, "American Religious Philosophy and the Pastoral Letters of the House of Bishops," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1958), pp. 10–84). From this attitude sprang the sectarians who challenged the Congregational and Anglican state churches (see Part Two, sect. I, *From State Churches to Disestablishment;* II, *The Battle for Disestablishment;* and V, *Sects and Cults*). The result was a long conflict between individualism and ecclesiasticism, enthusiasm and sober-mindedness, "raised affections" and the "enlightened mind." This struggle culminated during the Great Awakening in the contest between Edwardsean revivalism and Charles Chauncy (see Part Two, sect. III, A, 6, *Critics and Controversy*). Edwards' theology broke with the "federal" or "covenant" theology of Congregational New England not only by supporting strict Calvinism, but also by inclining toward religious individualism and revivalism. He became the inevitable intellectual leader

of the "New Light" revivalists, after a long and rigorous intellectual preparation.

Basic in the origin of Edwards' philosophy was his delighted discovery of John Locke (1632–1704), whose enlightened rationalism penetrated the interior of New England and influenced him when he was at Yale, about 1717. The book which inspired him was *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding* (London, 1690; issued with a preface by Russell Kirk Chicago, 1956). Reading this, Edwards came into contact with certain basic ideas of the Enlightenment, which he made his own and later conformed to the basic principles of Calvinism—which the Enlightened mind disliked. A general idea of the enormous influence of Locke upon Edwards, and upon many later theologians and philosophers, may be gleaned from Merle Curti, "The Great Mr. Locke, America's Philosopher, 1783–1861," in *Huntington Library Bulletin*, no. 11 (April 1937), pp. 107–151. Edwards' religious philosophy was based not only on Locke's psychology and theory of knowledge, but also upon Platonism. He avidly read Francis Hutcheson, *An Inquiry into the Original of Our Ideas of Beauty and Virtue* (London, 1725). Another element in his religious philosophy was Pietism from German and Dutch sources, which he derived, apparently in large measure, from Pietro van Mastricht, *Theoretico-practica Theologia* (1715). Edwards absorbed and was deeply indebted to Sir Isaac Newton's consideration of the theological difficulties attending René Descartes' distinction between extended substance and thinking substance, and agreed with Newton that God is extended and that material things exist in the Divine Mind. Human wills exist in the Divine Will and act only in God. Newton's impression upon Edwards and other colonial philosophers (including Samuel Johnson) is noted by F. E. Brasch, "The Newtonian Epoch in the American Colonies," in *Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society*, Vol. 49, n.s., part 2 (Oct. 1939), pp. 314–332. The same topic is treated in James H. Tufts, "Edwards and

Newton," in *Philosophical Review,* Vol. 49 (Nov. 1940), pp. 609–622. Like Johnson (see below, sect. II, H, 5, *Anglican Theology*), Edwards considered reality as all one and immaterial, and identified reality with God. Like Johnson, he agreed with Newton that God always sustains the universe, but he differed from Newton regarding the divine method. Like Johnson, he adopted Newton's empirical view of human understanding, and developed an epistemology based upon observation of the psychology of religion, but also was considerably influenced by his Pietist sympathies. Unlike Johnson, he did not admit free will. For him, true religion was founded on orthodox Calvinism, viewed through the Platonism of Ramus and the psychology of Locke. Edwards' philosophical views are conveniently illustrated in Harvey G. Townsend, ed., *The Philosophy of Jonathan Edwards from His Private Notebooks* (Eugene, Ore., 1955).

There are many specific studies of Edwards' interest in science, and of its influence upon his mind. Among the better essays are Theodore Hornberger, "The Effect of the New Science upon the Thought of Jonathan Edwards," in *American Literature,* Vol. 9, no. 2 (May 1937), pp. 196–207; and Clarence H. Faust, "Jonathan Edwards as a Scientist," in *American Literature,* Vol. 1, no. 4 (Jan. 1930), pp. 393–401. Perry Miller, *Jonathan Edwards* (New York, 1949) is a brilliant elaboration of the theological situation in New England in Edwards' time, and of his use of Newton and Locke. Valuable comments on New England "declension" and Edwards' cultural background are found also in Miller's *The New England Mind: from Colony to Province* (New York, 1953).

2. HIS THEOLOGY. During the rise of enthusiasm in New England, in the Great Awakening, Edwards fused Calvinism, Platonism, Pietism, and Lockean empiricism into a system of religious philosophy. In it the absolute sovereignty of God becomes an "inward, sweet delight," not through reason but by an additional or sixth sense. There was, he believed, abundant empirical evidence for such a gift of God to the

"elect"—the converted. In Platonic forms he argued that holy, supernatural love of God is Platonic love of the universal. God, the archetype of excellence, is known and appreciated through ideas derived from data supplied by the sixth sense, as well as from the five upon which understanding depends. His was an ingenious synthesis, and it was later altered by New Light disciples (see below, sect. II, D, *The Development of Liberal Orthodoxy*) into a "rationalized, pietistic apologetic that reduced Edwards' brilliant religious philosophy to absurd extremes" (see Metcalf, "American Religious Philosophy . . ."). Edwards' "system" actually was developed not in one large treatise, but in many writings, which may be located in an admirable bibliography by Thomas H. Johnson, *The Printed Writings of Jonathan Edwards, 1703–1758* . . . (Princeton, N.J., 1940). A review of Edwards' theology, with a full bibliography of his writings and principal manuscripts, and of references to him, is in Douglas J. Elwood, *The Philosophical Theology of Jonathan Edwards* (New York, 1960).

The claim of Edwards to be the founder of the New England "school" of "Reformed Divinity" is based upon three works, the first two written while he was an Indian missionary pastor at Stockbridge, Mass.: *A Careful and Strict Enquiry into the Modern Prevailing Notions of that Freedom of Will . . . etc.* (Boston, 1754; and *Freedom of the Will*, ed. Paul Ramsey (New Haven, 1957, in his *Works*, Vol. 1); *The Great Christian Doctrine of Original Sin Defended* . . . (Boston, 1758, and many later issues: London, repr., 1766; Dublin, 1768; Glasgow, 1768); and *A Treatise Concerning Religious Affections* . . . (Boston, 1746; and many other printings: London, 1762; New York, 1763; Boston, New York, 1768; Elizabethtown, N.J., 1787). These works, with some other writings, reveal Edwards the philosopher, Lockean psychologist, and empirical thinker, who used the new philosophy to bolster traditional theology, to become "the eighteenth-century philosophical apologist for the truths of the

Christian religion." The four principal points of his "New Divinity" were (1) To restate the Reformed theology in Scriptural terms as a full Christian message; (2) To assimilate it to the new scientific thought of his time, and particularly to the philosophy and psychology of John Locke; (3) To attempt a solution of the "ineffable problems of Being"; and (4) To express his conviction "that the ultimate mode of expressing the meaning of the Christian faith was through . . . salvation history, sacred history" (see Ahlstrom).

The implications of his doctrine of the will are clarified by the commentary on the essay, "Freedom of the Will," in the "Introduction" to Clarence H. Faust and Thomas Johnson, *Jonathan Edwards, Representative Selections* (New York, 1935), exemplifying his effort to phrase deterministic Calvinist doctrine in the terms of the Lockean philosophy. This volume contains a good bibliography. Paul Ramsey's introductory essay to his edition of *Freedom of the Will* (New Haven, 1957) gives the most adequate appreciation of the theological and philosophical issues involved in Edwards' essay. A very detailed study of this phase is H. G. Townsend, "The Will and the Understanding in the Philosophy of Jonathan Edwards," in *Church History*, Vol. 16, no. 4 (Dec. 1947), pp. 210–220. This stresses Edwards' view that "the sense of delight added to the demonstrations of the understanding . . . distinguishes religion from philosophy." Will without understanding is empty. Moral and religious character is given by forms of action issuing from willed choices expressing likes and dislikes. Destiny depends upon will, and there is no salvation merely in the form of will. Good inheres in the *object of choice*, and good is that which in God's wisdom is worthy of choice. Man is saved by the rightness of his choices. P. R. Anderson and M. H. Fisch, eds., in *Philosophy in America* (New York, 1939), give an example of the widespread opposition to Edwards' position on freedom of the will, particularly in the statement of Ethan Allen, the Deist.

One aspect of Edwards' thought was not well known in his

time, and is still not fully explored, because his expressions of it were published after his death or are still unpublished. This is his character as a speculative theologian, the Christian Platonist, the metaphysician. It is illustrated by his posthumously published *An Essay on the Nature of True Virtue* . . . (London, 1778; New London, 1786). The ultimate basis of his conception was Augustinian, not Calvinistic or Lockean. A philosophical study of Edwards' idea of Being is Thomas Anton Schafer, "The Concept of Being in the Thought of Jonathan Edwards" (Doctoral thesis, Duke University, 1951; reviewed in *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 2 (June 1955), pp. 179–180). His conception of being furnished a synthetic core for the rest of his philosophy and theology; his idealism was objective, its central concept being "the outflow and return of being via the hierarchical chain of orders of existence." Blaisdell Nelson Baker, in "Anthropological Roots of Jonathan Edwards' Doctrine of God" (Doctoral thesis, University of Southern California, 1951, typewritten, film 300, no. 14.98a) notes Edwards' rejection of the Arminian anthropology of freedom and insistence upon man's depravity and absolute dependence upon God, to exalt God by abasing man, a doctrine rooted in his own psychological needs. His Trinitarian idea of God is expounded in Edwards A. Park, "Remarks of Jonathan Edwards on the Trinity," in *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 38, no. 149 (Jan. 1881), pp. 147–187, and no. 150 (Apr. 1881), pp. 333–369, with some references. This very long and detailed treatise on Edwards' Trinitarian dogmatics stresses the dependence of Edwards upon revelation rather than human reason in forming his doctrine, and his rigid Trinitarian orthodoxy.

Yet another aspect of Edwards' thought, never fully expressed before his early death, is detailed in his projected *A History of the Work of Redemption, Containing, the Outlines of a Body of Divinity, in a Method Entirely New* . . . edited by John Erskine (Edinburgh, 1774; Boston, 1782; New York, 1788, 1839, 1840; Worcester, 1808, etc.), which

is believed to constitute Edwards' claim to real originality: a system of theology in the form of a history of God's work of redemption. Its origin may be traced to *God Glorified in the Work of Redemption, by the Greatness of Man's Dependence upon Him in the Whole of It . . .* (Boston, 1731), his first published writing, a "Thursday Lecture" delivered in Boston, 1731, announcing his life work—a defense of the sovereign character of God and man's need for redemption, which inspired his interest in "experimental" religion, revivals, and analyzing the process of conversion. The text is readily available in J. L. Blau, ed., "God Glorified in Man's Dependence," in *American Philosophic Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946). The Edwardsean idea of redemption is analyzed in John Clayton Feaver, "Edwards' Concept of God as Redeemer" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1949), maintaining that the concept implied a remarkable Christocentric and anthropological emphasis, and considering his idea of "the beauty and holiness of God diffused in the world seeking to unite all men with God in such relations as will assure endless spiritual growth." Dorus Paul Rudisill expounds "The Doctrine of Atonement in Jonathan Edwards and His Successors" (Doctoral dissertation, Duke University, 1945). Thomas Anton Schafer, "Jonathan Edwards and Justification by Faith," in *Church History*, Vol. 20, no. 4 (Dec. 1951), pp. 55–67, clarifies his doctrinal views as found in published works and notebooks, with extensive bibliography in references and notes. Edwards' "reaffirmation" of the covenant theology of the Church is explained at length in Schafer's "Jonathan Edwards' Conception of the Church," in *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 1 (March 1955), pp. 51–66, with references and bibliography, on Edwards' idea of the church of the "elect" being mankind as intended in the creation, the completion of God's "primal urge to love and communicate good"; asserting his concept of the oneness of the visible and invisible churches; and his "reaffirmation" of the covenant's legal and real features, so strengthening the classical Protestant ideal of the

Church. A somewhat neglected phase of his thinking, his ethical system, is thoroughly studied in Clyde Amos Holbrook, "The Ethics of Jonathan Edwards" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1945), discussing his idea of virtue, and holding that he attempted to avoid excessive subjectivism or anthropocentrism by exalting the reality, transcendence, and glory of God; and that his later works developed his ideas of the regenerate self and the glory of God in an almost pantheistic sense. In "Edwards' New Departure in Eschatology," *Church History*, Vol. 28, no. 1 (Mar. 1959), pp. 25–40, C. C. Goen reexamines Edwards' eschatological thought.

3. EDWARDS AS IDEALIST: PANTHEISM AND IDEALISM. Edwards' intellectual life falls into three major periods: youthful speculations prior to the conversion related in his "Personal Narrative"; the theological period of the great sermons, ending with his dismissal from his pastorate at Northampton; and the final period of systematic writing. It is misleading to judge him solely by any one of these periods. The present topic is concerned primarily with the first and third. In his youth Edwards' position was similar to that of Bishop George Berkeley. He defends the doctrine that "to be is to be perceived" in a manner which closely resembles Berkeley's in many respects. Since Edwards arrived at this position independently, it is not surprising that he often differs from Berkeley. One of his most significant unique features is the pantheistic form of his idealism. The myth that he deserted his early philosophy for Calvinist theology is exploded by the major works of his third or final period. The very last of his writings constitute an attempt to embody certain features of Calvinist theology within the context of an idealism reminiscent of his early notes.

Alexander Campbell Fraser, in his *Life and Letters of George Berkeley* . . . (Oxford, 1871) was the first author on Edwards to name Bishop Berkeley as the origin of his idealism. A very thorough exposition of this sometimes neglected phase is Egbert G. Smyth's "Jonathan Edwards' Ideal-

ism . . . ," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 1, no. 4 (Oct. 1897), pp. 950–964, with fairly extensive bibliographical references in the footnotes; accenting the constant influence of his spiritual philosophy upon his theology and Christology, and his doctrine of divine sovereignty as a way of expressing God's supreme personality and exalting the concept of human personality. A similar interpretation prevails in H. N. Gardiner, "The Early Idealism of Jonathan Edwards," in *Philosophical Review*, Vol. 9, no. 6 (Nov. 1900), pp. 573–596, with references in the footnotes, on the centering of his thought in the contemplation of God's perfection and absoluteness, his *mystical* piety—"the enjoyment of God in complete self-surrender to His spirit"—and the pervasion of his theology by a concept of the ideality of the universe, an "infinitely exact and precise Divine idea." Carl Van Doren, ed., *Benjamin Franklin and Jonathan Edwards: Selections from their Writings* (New York, 1920) in the "Introduction" presents a brief and competent appraisal of both men, and of Edwards' idealism and his potentiality as a scientist. Edwards' philosophical and theological outlook is summarized by Clarence H. Faust and Thomas H. Johnson, eds., *Jonathan Edwards: Representative Selections* (New York, 1935), which in the "Introduction" has an excellent brief summary of Edwards' life and thought, his psychological conceptions, his theory of excellence, and his translation of Calvinist theology into his own philosophic terms, particularly "depravity," into adopted Lockean terms.

4. COMMENTARIES ON EDWARDS. A few selected commentaries will serve to review the development and changes in attitudes toward Edwards during the past century. Joseph P. Thompson, "Jonathan Edwards, His Character, Teaching, and Influence," in *Bibliotheca Sacra*, Vol. 18, no. 72 (Oct. 1861), pp. 809–839, with some bibliographical references in the footnotes, asserts that Edwards did not plan or write a theological *system*, but by rejecting the doctrine of inability and of ecclesiastical grace, he did introduce a new *type* of

theology. His influence is seen in spiritual reformation, use of reason in New England theology and preaching, and his example of personal holiness. Increase N. Tarbox's essay, "Jonathan Edwards," in *Bibliotheca Sacra,* Vol. 26, no. 102 (Apr. 1869), pp. 243–268, emphasizes Edwards' thorough Calvinism in the doctrine of divine sovereignty, regarding him as a transitional figure, turning theological thought into new channels, and providing for "a larger and freer place for man, to work out harmoniously the problem of his liberties and powers." I. Woodbridge Riley's *American Philosophy; the Early Schools* (New York, 1907) still has the best commentary on Edwards' earlier works, and contains the entire text of his early notes. His *American Thought from Puritanism to Pragmatism* (New York, 1915) comments briefly on Edwards' philosophy in general, and should be supplemented by Rufus O. Suter, Jr., "The Philosophy of Jonathan Edwards" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1932); Donald H. Rhoades, "Jonathan Edwards: Experimental Theologian" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1945); Herbert W. Schneider, *A History of American Philosophy* (New York, 1946), with its brief comments on Edwards' philosophy in general; Alexis Gerhard, "Calvinism and Mysticism in Jonathan Edwards" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1947); and H. G. Townsend, *Philosophical Ideas in the United States* (New York, 1934), with brief comments. By far the most understanding and yet sympathetic comment by a modern theologian is by Joseph G. Haroutunian, in "Jonathan Edwards, Theologian of the Great Commandment," in *Theology Today,* Vol. 1, no. 3 (Oct. 1944), pp. 361–377, with bibliographical references in the footnotes, and a bibliography of Edwards' treatises and sermons. The kernel of the article is that the obsession of modern theology with man and his plight needs to be corrected by a concept of God, not as a means to an end—the welfare of man—but as a deity to be loved and worshiped. Love of God, as seen in Edwards, is "the essence of all true virtue and the condition of justice,

peace, dignity, and joy among men." Study of Edwards will show that man-centered religion is not really Christian! The persistence of his ideas, which affected several later "schools" of theology (see sect. II, D, E, and F, below) is reviewed in Raymon Clinton Miller, "Jonathan Edwards and His Influence upon Some of the New England Theologians" (Doctoral dissertation, Temple University, 1945). His influence, which became gradually more and more attenuated, colored with varying shades of intensity the development of New England "Liberal Orthodoxy."

D. The Development of Liberal Orthodoxy

THE LIBERALIZATION OF CALVINISM. American Religion During the Nineteenth Century. Because the nineteenth century was one of tremendous intellectual ferment throughout the Western world, its currents produced marked effects in the stream of religious speculations, in America as well as in Europe. There is no "definitive" study of the development of theology and religious ideas in America during the nineteenth century, and this section and the following ones therefore consist of a selection of various works, designed to outline at least the major currents of theological development.

At the opening of the century American religion and theology were in a state of transition, with two easily discernible trends: one toward Unitarianism, another toward "Liberal Orthodoxy," a modification of Colonial Calvinism. Out of the Unitarian movement proceeded perhaps the major intellectual product of American religion during the first third of the century—Transcendentalism (see Part Two, sect. III, F, *Transcendental Religion*). By the middle of the century the introduction of German philosophy had produced profound effects in religious thought. It had begun with the Transcendental movement, but gained new and markedly distinct impetus with the introduction of Hegel's writings. At approximately the same time occurred the most important event of the century

from the standpoint of religious ideas and of theological development—the advent of the theory of Evolution. As religion slowly adapted itself to these new ideas, there occurred many subsidiary developments, including the emergence of the new discipline of Biblical criticism. It employed the methods of secular historical and literary analysis, and assumed, for the most part, the implicitly naturalistic world-view of the sciences. By the later 1800's theological thinking was greatly complicated by social ideals that culminated in the Social Gospel movement (see Part Three, sect. VI, B, *The Later Social Gospel*).

a. The Development of Liberal Orthodoxy: Introduction. Three major factors in American religious life in the first half of the nineteenth century affected the development of theology. (1) At that time the churches were able to attract the vast majority of Americans. The work of the Great Awakening was triumphantly completed by a series of revivals beginning around 1800 and continuing to about 1830. (2) The evangelistic campaign was accompanied by a fundamental transformation in the nature of American Protestant Christianity. The emphasis on emotion, initiated by Jonathan Edwards, became the characteristic feature of American religion. The "romanticizing" of religious life brought about a subordination of the rigorous Calvinistic doctrines of the older orthodoxy, and an increased emphasis on the love of God for all men, the possibility of salvation for all, and the importance of human effort in the process of salvation. This tendency gave renewed importance to the Non-Calvinist theologies of Universalism, Methodism, Anglicanism, and other persuasions (see sect. II, H, *Early Non-Calvinist Theologies*).

"Probably no 'school' of American thought has been graced by so many men of originality and brilliance as the 'New England Theology' founded or set in motion by Edwards" (see Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "Theology in America, A Historical Survey," in Volume One). It comprised a galaxy of brilliant men: Jonathan Edwards, Jr., Joseph Bellamy,

Samuel Hopkins, Nathanael Emmons, Timothy Dwight, Nathaniel William Taylor, Bennet Tyler, Edwards Amasa Park, and Leonard Woods—to name only the most eminent. Their influence was incalculably immense, especially through the hundreds of ministers they trained, and the widespread prestige of certain New England seminaries, particularly the Yale Divinity School, the Theological Institute of Connecticut (now the Hartford Seminary Foundation), and the Andover Seminary. Each had a "school" of theologians, who were intellectual sons of Edwards, but usually with a difference. They were not "docile Edwardseans," with the exception of Tyler, and each made innovations, which provoked controversies.

Great as were their contributions they represented, at least in the earlier period, a negative side of "Philosophical Orthodoxy" (see sect. IV, C, *Philosophical Orthodoxy*) appeared also in rationalism and liberalism, and particularly in the "Unitarian Orthodoxy." The final outcome was that the Edwardsean system became so hopelessly involved in subtleties that it was no longer taken seriously, and theologians ceased trying to give their orthodoxies a philosophical foundation. To a consideration of these groups we now turn, after examining a few general works on the process of liberalization.

Herbert W. Schneider in his *The Puritan Mind* (New York, 1930) gives the best general account of the liberalization of the original form of New England Calvinism, which was greatly accelerated in the period following the Great Awakening. Joseph Haroutunian, *Piety Versus Moralism* (New York, 1932) has the best description, from the point of view of an Edwardsean, of the liberal transformation of Calvinism by its defenders, such as Samuel Hopkins. It is regarded as a gradual substitution of "moralism" for the exalted piety of Edwards, with the result that the happiness of man rather than the glory of God was made central, under the influence of rationalism and humanitarianism. Frank H. Foster, in *A Genetic History of the New England Theology* (Chicago, 1907), has a more sympathetic account than Harou-

tunian, with an estimate of two important Edwardseans—Joseph Bellamy and Samuel Hopkins—and reference to the culmination of the development in Nathaniel W. Taylor.

b. The Faithful Edwardseans. The Edwardsean tradition was immediately continued by several ministers. They were either related to him (like his son, Jonathan, Jr., or his grandson Timothy Dwight, President of Yale College), or had been closely associated with him (like Joseph Bellamy). Jonathan Jr. and Bellamy were "his most faithful successors" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). These three men had vast influence, because they trained hundreds of ministers. Dwight, more than any other individual, started the "Second Great Awakening," an outburst of revivalism that exceeded the one associated with his grandfather, the elder Edwards. This group lived in Connecticut and formed a Connecticut "school" of Edwardseans. With them was associated Nathanael Emmons, who was born in East Haddam, Conn., and passed most of his ministry in Massachusetts.

The earliest of the group was Joseph Bellamy (1719–1790), who wrote *True Religion Delineated; or, Experimental Religion as Distinguished from Formality on the one Hand, and Enthusiasm on the Other, Set in a Scriptural and Rational Light . . .* (Boston, 1750), with a preface by Jonathan Edwards himself. Bellamy studied theology in Edwards' home, and in this treatise gave to Edwardsean theology a clear and systematic expression, comprehensive, and with a minimum of enlargement or alteration. Bellamy's influence extended far into the nineteenth century, and was promoted especially by his *A Careful and Strict Examination of the External Covenant, and of the Principles by Which it is Supported . . . A Vindication of the Plan on which the Churches in New England were originally Formed* (New Haven, 1770). This is an elaborate defense of the original covenant theology, regarding the churches as select societies of converted people—the principle which Edwards had defended, and which encouraged revivals. It is included, together with

other important theological treatises, in *The Works of Joseph Bellamy, D.D., First Pastor of the Church in Bethlem, Conn., with a Memoir of His Life and Character* [by Tryon Edwards] (New York, 1811–12, 3 vols.; Boston, 1850, 2 vols.). His allegiance to Calvinistic orthodoxy is revealed vividly by his *Four Sermons on the Wisdom of God in the Permission of Sin* (Morriston, N.J., 1804), especially sermons 1 to 3. The great influence of Bellamy, and of his theological position, are estimated in a scholarly, brief study by Percy Coe Eggleston: *A Man of Bethlehem, Joseph Bellamy, D.D., and His Divinity School, Printed for the Bethlehem, Connecticut, Centenary* (New London, Conn., 1908). The school is sometimes said to have been the first theological academy in the United States.

After Bellamy, in the Edwardsean line of succession, comes Jonathan Edwards, Jr. (1745–1801). His strict Calvinistic position, following the general argument of his father, is seen in his *The Salvation of All Men Strictly Examined . . . Endless Punishment of the Impenitent Defended against the late Dr. Charles Chauncy of Boston, in "The Salvation of all Men," &c.* (New Haven, 1790). Further confirmation may be sought in his *Works: with a Memoir of His Life and Character by Tryon Edwards* (Andover, Mass., 1842).

When the younger Edwards died in 1801, the Rev. Timothy Dwight was reaching the culmination of his theological, religious, and political influence, as the Congregational-Federalist President of Yale College, continuing the Edwardsean tradition. He found the college a hotbed of "infidelity," but made it a bastion of Congregational Calvinist orthodoxy and of the Federalist conservative political party. A complete exposition of his position is contained in his *Theology; Explained and Defended, in a Series of Sermons . . . With a Memoir of the Life of the Author . . .* (Middletown, Conn., 1818–19, 5 vols.), the memoir being by his son, Sereno Edwards Dwight. The popularity of this collection is attested by the fact that it was issued at New Haven

as late as 1836 (9th ed.), and at Glasgow (1837). After Bellamy the successors of Edwards tended to modify his idea of the atonement, "and to insist that God's permission of sin in the world was essential to a moral (as against purely mechanical) order" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). Dwight took advantage of this view to favor "human agency" in salvation, and devoted 72 sermons to man's practical and ethical obligations in the drama of salvation, thus marking a distinct transition to greater liberalism and flexibility. When Dwight died in 1817, the old order was rapidly changing. The Congregational-Federalist oligarchy was losing the political battle, and the pure Edwardsean theology was beginning to be modified.

Although classed as an Edwardsean, Nathanael Emmons (1745–1840) belonged to the modifying school, and had a considerable influence in New England. He published little in his lifetime, for he was mainly a pastor, but after his death his intellectual labors became known through the following publications: *A System of Divinity . . . Edited by Jacob Ide* (Boston, 1842, 2 vols.); *Works; with Memoir, Edited by Jacob Ide* (Boston, 1846, 6 vols.), containing his "Systematic Theology" in Vols. 4–5; and Edwards Amasa Park, *Memoir of Nathanael Emmons; with Sketches of His Friends and Pupils* (Boston, 1861).

Bennet Tyler (1783–1858) is the exception to the statement that the group of Connecticut theologians were not "docile Edwardseans." He was a strict one, and taught at the Theological Institute of Connecticut, which was founded at East Windsor (where Jonathan Edwards was born and reared) in 1834, in protest against the liberalizing tendencies at Yale, where Nathaniel W. Taylor was teaching (see below). The Theological Institute of Connecticut later moved to Hartford, and its history is reviewed in Curtis Manning Geer, *The Hartford Theological Seminary, 1834–1934* (Hartford, 1934). Tyler disapproved of Taylor and the "New Haven Theology," and made his opinions clear in *Lectures on Theol-*

ogy, With a Memoir, by Rev. Nahum Gale, D.D. (Boston, 1859). What Tyler thought of the New Haven group appears also in his *Letters on the Origin and Progress of the New Haven Theology, From a New England Minister to One at the South* (New York, 1837). He was doubtful even of Samuel Hopkins.

c. Hopkinsianism. Samuel Hopkins (1721–1803) was born in Waterbury, Conn., but spent his fruitful ministry as pastor of the First Congregational Church in Newport, R.I. He belonged by birth and general character to the Connecticut "school," and certainly was one of its greatest members. He has been considered the most "arresting" and courageous, in facing implications of "Consistent Calvinism" fearlessly (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). The burden of Hopkins' theological system is contained in *The System of Doctrines, Contained in Divine Revelation, Explained and Defended . . .* (Boston, 1793, 2 vols.; Boston, 1811, 2nd ed., 2 vols.). Of vast importance to the development of New England religious and social idealism was his *An Inquiry into the Nature of True Holiness* (Newport, R.I., 1773). His stress upon "disinterested benevolence" influenced the humanitarian movement in New England, and inspired William Ellery Channing, his fellow Rhode Islander (see sect. II, H, 3, *Transcendentalist Theology*). His commanding position in modified Calvinism is revealed by the continuing interest in his writings, which were still published half a century after his death: *The Works of Samuel Hopkins, D.D. . . .* (Boston, 1852, 3 vols.), with a "Memoir of His Life and Character," by Edwards A. Park, in Vol. I. A scholarly appreciation of his work and effect is Dick Lucas Van Halsema, "Samuel Hopkins (1721–1803), New England Calvinist" (Doctoral dissertation, Union Theological Seminary, New York, 1956). This regards him as a greater promoter of Edwards' theology in New England, and as the author of the first systematic treatise on New England theology, and of the ideal of "disinterested benevolence," the watchword of American missions.

An early exposition of the modifications made by Hopkins in the Calvinistic theological system is contained in Ezra Stiles Ely's *Contrast between Calvinism and Hopkinsianism* (New York, 1811). Despite doubts of his orthodoxy, Hopkins remained enough of a Calvinist to insist upon the necessity of sin in the world, and upon the willingness of a genuinely converted Christian to suffer damnation if God should will it! Hopkins' watering-down of Calvinist orthodox determinism appalled the strict, but came far short of satisfying those who were advancing into more daring ventures of liberalism at New Haven.

d. The New Haven Theology. The post-Edwardsean modification of Calvinistic theology culminated in Nathaniel W. Taylor (1786–1858), who first really faced the philosophical questions Edwards had raised. George Park Fisher in 1880 called him America's greatest metaphysical theologian since Edwards, and "Taylorism" was more influential than any other New England theological system since Edwards. The Yale Divinity School, founded in 1822, became a center of theological fermentation, with a faculty in sympathy with Taylor's views, and students who carried his ideas far and wide. He was professor of theology from 1822 until 1858. The school's influence was spread especially by its magazine, the *Quarterly Christian Spectator*, published at New Haven from January 1819 until November 1838 (20 vols.), with varying titles.

Taylor's highly rational apologetic apparently was inspired during the Unitarian controversy of the 1820's by his observation that the orthodox arguments of the Andover Seminary group (see below) were damaging the Trinitarian cause. He determined to make orthodoxy acceptable to the contemporary mind by using the rationalistic philosophical armory of the Unitarians for what he considered orthodox purposes. Because he had been converted during the "Second Great Awakening," his was a "revival theology." Taylor's great interest was the freedom and moral agency of man, whereas

Edwards' had been God and Being. Instead of Locke, Taylor took as his guide the Scottish philosophers, Thomas Reid and Dugald Stewart, following their "Common Sense Realism," stressing man's moral ability in contrast to Edwards' and Tyler's idea of "moral inability," and the Bellamy and Hopkins idea of sin as a necessary good. His idea of the certainty but not necessity of man's sin was not outside orthodoxy, and was essential, because his audience no longer knew the Reformation theology and did not accept the idea of man's "total depravity." Taylor exerted a strong influence upon the revivalists, especially Charles G. Finney, whose theological system at Oberlin College, Ohio, "bore clear marks of Taylorism" (see Ahlstrom, essay in Volume One; also Part Two, above, sect. III, A, *Revivalism and its Continuing Influence,* references to Finney). Taylor had no real successor and his system, based upon the philosophy of mid-eighteenth-century Scots, was inadequate, as was clear to Horace Bushnell, his pupil (see below).

A summation of the Scottish "Realistic Philosophy," which profoundly influenced Taylor, is provided by Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "The Scottish Philosophy and American Theology," *Church History,* Vol. 24, no. 3 (Sept. 1955), pp. 257–272, and by James McCosh, *The Scottish Philosophy, Biographical, Expository, Critical, from Hutcheson to Hamilton* (New York, 1875). Another summary is George Alexander Johnston, ed., *Selections from the Scottish Philosophy of Common Sense* (Chicago and London, 1915), which includes selections from the writings of Thomas Reid, Adam Ferguson, James Beattie, and Dugald Stewart. Taylor's favorite guide, as John Locke was to Jonathan Edwards, was Thomas Reid (1710–1796), whose philosophical position is illustrated by *The Works of Thomas Reid, D.D., now Fully Collected . . . Preface, Notes and Supplementary Dissertations, by Sir William Hamilton, bart . . . Prefixed, Stewart's Account of the Life and Writings of Reid . . .* (Edinburgh, 1863, 6th ed., 2 vols.). Probably his most effective work, at least for

Taylor, was the "Inquiry into the Human Mind on the Principles of Common Sense," found in *The Philosophy of Reid . . . With Introduction and Selected Notes,* by E. Hershey Sneath . . . (New York, 1892), with a bibliography. Taylor knew well Dugald Stewart (1753–1828); *Elements of the Philosophy of the Human Mind* (London, 1792, 1814, 1827). The American influence of Stewart is suggested by the considerable number of American printings (Philadelphia, 1793; Brattleborough, Vt., 1808, 1813 (3rd Amer. ed., cor.); New York, Boston, 1814–27, 3 vols.; New York, 1818, 2 vols.; Boston, 1864, new ed., rev. and abbrev.); and by *The Collected Works of Dugald Stewart . . . Edited by Sir William Hamilton* . . . (Edinburgh, 1854–60, 11 vols.; Cambridge, Mass., 1829, 7 vols.).

Taylor's peculiar theological position is most evident in three publications issued after his death in 1858—the centennial of the death of Jonathan Edwards: *Lectures on the Moral Government of God* (New York, 1859, 2 vols); *Essays, Lectures, &c. upon Select Topics in Revealed Theology* (New York, 1859); and *Memorial of Nathaniel W. Taylor, D.D. Three Sermons:* by Leonard Bacon . . . Samuel W. S. Dutton . . . George P. Fisher . . . Published by Request (New Haven, 1858). By far the best exposition of Taylor and his influence is Sidney E. Mead, *Nathaniel William Taylor, 1786–1858: A Connecticut Liberal* (Chicago, 1942), a revision of a doctoral dissertation for the University of Chicago, with bibliographical footnotes and a list of manuscript materials. This study views Taylor as the most important figure in the transition from Calvinism to "Liberal Orthodoxy," because he defended the freedom of the will, and insisted that the divine government of the world must be conceived in a way that is consistent with man's moral responsibility. In close cooperation with Lyman Beecher, Chauncey Goodrich, and Eleazer Fitch, Taylor worked out a liberal orthodoxy. Controversy between "Taylorites" and conservative "Tylerites" (followers of Bennet Tyler) prepared the

way for Horace Bushnell and later Congregational liberalism.

Lyman Beecher (1775–1863), a close friend of Taylor, was also his "most energetic disciple" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). After serving as pastor of the Congregational church in Litchfield, he went to Boston to oppose Unitarianism with revivalism. Later, as president of the Lane Theological Seminary in Cincinnati, he promoted Taylor's views among the Western "New School" Presbyterians. Although he has never been considered as one of the great American theological thinkers, he is important as a promulgator of the New Haven views, as in *Views in Theology, Published by Request of the Synod of Cincinnati* (Cincinnati and New York, 1836), which includes treatises on natural and moral ability, original sin, total depravity, and regeneration. Beecher was called on the carpet for his advanced views, which are expounded in *Views of Theology; as Developed in Three Sermons, and on his Trials before the Presbytery and Synod of Cincinnati, June 1835, with Remarks on the Princeton Review* (Boston and Cleveland, 1853), also in Beecher's *Works*, vol. 3.

Taylor's theology did not find a warm welcome among many Connecticut Calvinists. It was opposed by Bennet Tyler and his colleagues at the Theological Institute of Connecticut in East Windsor. They had many sympathizers, whose viewpoint is well illustrated by a Congregational minister in Norwich, Conn., the Rev. Levi Nelson (1779–1855), who attacked the New Haven school in *A Letter to the Theological Professors at New Haven, Concerning Their Supposition that God may not have been able to prevent sin in a moral system . . . &c* (Norwich, Conn., 1848); and *Letters to the Christian Public, Concerning Unscriptural Speculations in Theology* (Hartford, 1851).

e. The Andover Theology. But the most formidable opposition came from the group of theologians associated with the Andover Seminary in Massachusetts, founded in opposition to Unitarian liberalism. Evidence of this is a pamphlet by the

man who practically personified that seminary, the Rev. Leonard Woods: *Letters to Nathaniel W. Taylor, D.D.* [On sin] (Andover, 1830). Woods (1774–1854) has become the symbol of a group which, although firmly opposed to Unitarianism and critical of "Taylorism," has been considered relatively "liberal." In fact, they are often described as the "Andover Liberals," whose general character and influence is estimated in Daniel Day Williams, *The Andover Liberals; a Study of American Theology* (New York, 1941), with a bibliography, a doctoral thesis for Columbia University. Woods's own writings summarize the history of the Andover "school," which stood about midway between Taylor and the ultra-conservative group at East Windsor. For a general appreciation by one of them, perhaps the best source is Leonard Woods, *History of the Andover Theological Seminary* (Boston, 1885). His writings, life, and influence may best be studied in *The Works of Leonard Woods* (Andover, 1850–51, 5 vols.; Andover and Boston, 1863, 5 vols.); and in Edwards Amasa Park, *The Life and Character of Leonard Woods* (Andover, 1880). Moses Stuart (1780–1852) was the second of the "big three" who set the tone of Andover in the early and mid-nineteenth century. The following writings are representative of his viewpoint: *Critical History and Defence of the Old Testament Canon* (Andover, Mass., New York, 1845; London, 1849; and rev. ed., Andover, Mass., 1872); *Miscellanies . . .* (Andover, 1846), a collection of miscellaneous essays. Appreciations of Stuart's life and thought are available in special tributes by pupils and colleagues: Edwards Amasa Park, *A Discourse Delivered at the Funeral of Professor Moses Stuart* (Boston, 1852), with a "Partial Catalogue" of Stuart's published writings; and William Adams, *A Discourse on the Life and Services of Professor Moses Stuart . . . January 25, 1852* (New York, 1852). The last of the Andover triumvirate was Edwards Amasa Park (1808–1900), who lived to see liberalism triumphant in many seminaries. The later tone of Andover is sounded by his

The Associate Creed of Andover Theological Seminary (Boston, 1883); and *Memorial Collection of Sermons by Edwards A. Park, Compiled by his Daughter* (Boston, c.1902). His career and contributions to theology are summarized by the great historian of the "New England Theology," Frank Hugh Foster, in *The Life of Edwards Amasa Park (S.T.D., LLD) Abbot Professor, Andover Theological Seminary . . .* Foreword by Walter Marshall Horton (New York, c.1936).

The "Andover Liberals" were opposed not only by the Edwardseans of East Windsor; they found ideological foemen yet more worthy of their subtlety in the "school" of Calvinists at the official seminary of the Presbyterian Church in Princeton, New Jersey.

E. The Princeton Theology

In the early history of American Presbyterianism, New England influence was strong, especially in persuading a large section of the Presbyterians to support the Great Awakening and revivalism. This caused a schism in 1741–1758, and brought Jonathan Edwards to the presidency of the college in Princeton. That marked the high tide of New England revivalist influence, which shortly ebbed because of heavy immigration of conservative Scotch-Irish Presbyterians, and the coming of John Witherspoon, a Scot, to the presidency of Princeton. The conservative element was strengthened by the emergence into prominence of the Alexander family. Archibald Alexander (1772–1851) was not unaffected by or unsympathetic toward revivalism. But when he participated in founding the theological seminary at Princeton (1812) and became its first professor, his theological influence was conservative. He turned away from Edwardsean influence, and stressed the Westminster Confession and Cathechism, and "the great scholastic theologians of the Reformed tradition" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One).

A survey up to the founding and early years of the Prince-

ton Seminary, and the rise of "Princeton Theology," is afforded in a study by Walter R. Clyde, Jr., "The Development of American Presbyterian Theology, 1705–1823" (Doctoral dissertation, Hartford Seminary Foundation, Hartford, Conn., c.1938–39). A review of the Princeton theology itself is John O. Nelson, "The Rise of the Princeton Theology" (unpublished Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1935). The influence of Archibald Alexander, first professor in the Princeton Seminary and teacher of Charles Hodge (see below), upon the development of the "Princeton Theology," is suggested in his biography by James Waddel Alexander, *The Life of Archibald Alexander, D.D., First Professor in the Theological Seminary, at Princeton, New Jersey* (New York, 1854; New York and Philadelphia, 1856), with a bibliography of his works. A clear insight into his Biblicism, a persistent characteristic of the Princeton theology, is provided by his *Evidences of the Authenticity, Inspiration, and Canonical Authority of the Holy Scriptures* (Philadelphia, 1836?), with running title, *Evidences of Christianity,* and expanded with the title: *A Brief Outline of the Evidences of the Christian Religion.*

Alexander's most devoted pupil was Charles Hodge (1797–1878). He joined the faculty as Professor of Old Testament in 1822, and later became Professor of Exegetical, Didactic, and Polemic Theology. During fifty years he taught over 3,000 students, who carried his influence all over the United States and the world. Without him, according to Danhof (see below), American Presbyterianism and Calvinism would have been entirely different. Hodge studied in Germany, whence he derived his lifelong interest in Biblical criticism. His theology rested upon "an almost absolutely rigidified biblicism"—the literal inspiration of the Bible, its inerrancy, and infallibility (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). Also important was Hodge's reliance not on Locke (as in Edwards), but on John Witherspoon's Scottish "common sense" realism. Hodge's theological system was not only

Biblical; it rested also upon the Reformed confessions. He suspected Edwards, deprecated Samuel Hopkins, attacked Edwards A. Park, and put Nathaniel W. Taylor outside the pale. (See sect. II, D, *The Development of Liberal Orthodoxy*.) Hodge was the prince of American Calvinist theologians in his time, and probably the best informed one in the country. The influence of John Witherspoon (1723–1794), president of Princeton, upon the development of the "Princeton Theology" through his Scottish "common-sense" philosophy is suggested in *The Works of the Rev. John Witherspoon* . . . (Philadelphia, 1802, 4 vols., rev. and cor.; also Edinburgh, 1815, 9 vols., with his lectures on divinity in Vol. 8, and his lectures on moral philosophy in Vol. 7); also in Varnum Lansing Collins, *President Witherspoon, a Biography* (Princeton, 1925, 2 vols.), with bibliography in Vol. 2. The debt of the "Princeton Theology" to the philosophy of Witherspoon and his pupils (derived from the "common sense" realists of Scotland, critics of John Locke, post-Lockean determinism, and utilitarian ethics), shows that the school was *not* a continuation of the Edwardsean interpretation of Calvinism. This fact is clarified in Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "The Scottish Philosophy and American Theology," in *Church History*, Vol. 24, no. 3 (Sept. 1955), pp. 257–272, with references and bibliography. Hodge's *Systematic Theology* (New York, 1872–1875, 3 vols.) remained a standard textbook for many years and was many times reissued (by Eerdmans, Grand Rapids, Mich., as late as 1929 and 1952). It is neither comprehensive nor orderly, and is certainly not novel. It builds upon the dogmas of the Reformed confessions, and its "inductive" manner is traceable to Witherspoon and the Scottish Realists. It reflects a scholastic rather than an "Old Calvinist" viewpoint, with a clear separation between natural and revealed theology. "No nineteenth-century American strove so hard as Hodge to expound faithfully and then to defend strict, scholastic Reformed confessional theology" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One).

When the "New School" men in 1836 founded Union Theological Seminary in New York, Princeton became the intellectual center of the "Old School" led by Hodge. It opposed the "New Haven Theology" of Taylor, which had spread into some Northern Synods and was expelled from the Presbyterian Church in 1837. The "Old School" spirit survived at Princeton into the 1920's, when the extreme Calvinists, led by J. Gresham Machen and Cornelius Van Til, withdrew to found the Westminster Seminary in Philadelphia. The Hodge tradition lives on in the Orthodox Presbyterian Church (1936) and other small, strict groups (see sect. III, K, *Fundamentalist Reaction*). Hodge's influence is described in a remarkable biography by his son, Archibald Alexander Hodge (1823–1886), *The Life of Charles Hodge . . . Professor in the Theological Seminary, Princeton, N.J. . . .* (New York, 1880); and in the Princeton Theological Seminary's *Discourses Commemorative of the Life and Work of Charles Hodge . . .* (Philadelphia, 1879), published by order of the directors and trustees, and containing a funeral address by W. M. Paxton, a tribute by Professor C. A. Aiken, and a memorial discourse by H. A. Boardman. Ralph J. Danhof, in *Charles Hodge as a Dogmatician . . .* (Goes, The Netherlands, 1930) states that Hodge was "the greatest theologian America has ever produced," and gives a bibliography of "The Writings of Charles Hodge," and "Articles of Charles Hodge which appeared in the 'Biblical Repertory' and the 'Biblical Repertory and Princeton Review.'" The influence of Hodge, his colleagues, friends, and pupils, reached innumerable people through the *Princeton Review*, of which Hodge himself was the editor for many years. The *Review* appeared from 1825 to 1888, inclusive, under varying titles. Hodge's particular literary influence is revealed in *Essays and Reviews, By Charles Hodge, D.D., Selected from the Princeton Review* (New York, 1857). Kenneth Paul Berg, in his "Charles A. Hodge, Controversialist" (Doctoral dissertation, State University of Iowa, 1952), objectively surveys his life

and ideas, and the impact of his Calvinism upon New England theology, examining Hopkinsianism, Taylorism, revivalism, Bushnell's thought from the Hodge viewpoint, and Hodge's chief objections to Darwinism.

· The "Princeton Theology" was embodied not only in Hodge's own *Systematic Theology,* but also in a famous and long-used work by his son: Archibald Alexander Hodge, *Outlines of Theology* (New York, 1860), which was many times reissued (by Eerdmans of Grand Rapids, Mich., as late as 1928, 1949, reprint of the New York, 1879, rewritten and enl. edition). It is a "vast text in dogmatics" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). A brief outline of the younger Hodge's theology is given in *Presbyterian Doctrine Briefly Stated* (Philadelphia, 1869), issued by the Presbyterian Board of Publication. The Princeton theological influence is illustrated by the addresses and essays in: Princeton Theological Seminary, *The Centennial Celebration of the Theological Seminary of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America* . . . (Princeton, N.J., 1912); and by William Daniel Livingstone, "The Princeton Apologetic as Exemplified by the Work of Benjamin B. Warfield and J. Gresham Machen; A Study in American Theology, 1880–1930" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University); also by Benjamin Breckenridge Warfield, *Studies in Theology* (New York, 1932), with a prefatory note signed by Ethelbert D. Warfield, William Park Armstrong, Caspar Wistar Hodge, committee; and a "List of Other Studies in Theology" (see also his *Works,* Vol. 9). Other distinctive expressions of Warfield's thought are found in *Biblical and Theological Studies* . . . , ed. Samuel G. Craig (Philadelphia, 1952), and *Critical Reviews* (New York, 1932). A study of the modification of Presbyterian theology, away from Princeton orthodoxy, is Lefferts A. Loetscher, *The Broadening Church: A Study of Theological Issues in the Presbyterian Church Since 1869* (Philadelphia, 1954). Loetscher's "C. A. Briggs in the Retrospect of Half a Century," in *Theology Today,* Vol. 12,

no. 1 (April 1955), pp. 27–42, with bibliographical footnotes, is a scholarly study of the trial for heresy of Professor Charles Augustus Briggs of the Union Seminary, New York City. Briggs' point of view marked a liberal departure from the theological orthodoxy represented by the Princeton Seminary: William Adams Brown, "Changes in the Theology of American Presbyterianism," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (July 1906), pp. 387–411, is a review of the modification and progressive liberalization of the old orthodoxy, which resulted eventually in the secession of the followers of J. Gresham Machen from the Princeton Seminary, the formation of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church, and of the Westminster Seminary in Philadelphia; and the position of Machen as a Fundamentalist leader. (See sect. III, K, *Fundamentalist Reaction*, below; also Part Two, sect. IV, B, 6, a, *Presbyterians, Divisions and Reunions.*)

F. The Mercersburg (Reformed) Theology

While the Princeton Seminary group of Presbyterian theologians were hewing to the line of strict Calvinistic orthodoxy, a distinct group at the Theological Seminary of the German Reformed Church in Mercersburg, Pennsylvania, was leading another kind of conservative movement. They stressed the orthodox Reformation concept of the Church and of the sacraments. This crusade has been comparatively little understood or appreciated until fairly recent times.

The man who led it, determined to repair "the havoc which revivalism was working on Reformed Church life in America" (see Ahlstrom essay in volume one) was the Scot John Williamson Nevin (1803–1886) of the Mercersburg faculty. He made the most distinguished effort of his time to reconvert American Reformed churches to a "pre-Puritan" understanding of the Church, the sacraments, and the historical Catholic heritage. He was the chief theologian of the Mercersburg movement, and a pioneer of the post-Kantian re-

birth of German theology in America. But the Mercersburg theologians, especially Nevin, had to wait a century for adequate recognition beyond their own church and a small circle of readers and admirers.

Nevin opened his campaign with an attack on Charles Grandison Finney's "New Measures" in revivalism: *The Anxious Bench* (Chambersburg, Pa., 1843; 1844, 2nd ed., rev. and enl.). This first of his controversial writings attacked revivalism as contrary to the spirit of the Heidelberg Catechism, unfavorable to deep and intelligent piety and true devotion, and injurious to genuine worship. It is a closely knit theological argument leveled against the superficiality of radical "experimentalism." Further evidence of Nevin's determined campaign for deeper appreciation of churchly tradition is the "Introduction" to his English translation of Philip Schaff's *Das Princip des Protestantismus* (Chambersburg, 1845), issued as *The Principle of Protestantism as Related to the Present State of the Church* (Chambersburg, 1845). He approved Schaff's historical approach, and was convinced that "out of it could come a conception of the Church more adequate to the American scene than the attenuated Puritanism of the revivalists" (Ahlstrom). The attack continued with Nevin's *The History and Genius of the Heidelberg Catechism* (Chambersburg, 1847), a group of essays giving a theological and historical exposition of its origin and character, and pointing to the radical departure of British Puritanism, American revivalism, and rationalistic modernism from the deeply catholic and churchly standard of the great Reformers. Nevin still further clarified his position in *The Church . . .* (Chambersburg, 1847); *The Apostles' Creed; Its Origin, Constitution and Plan* (Mercersburg, 1849); and *The Doctrine of the Reformed Church on the Lord's Supper* (Mercersburg, 1850).

The last work, a return to the conservative, catholic doctrine of the Reformers, caused a thrill of excitement among many in the Reformed and Presbyterian churches, to whom it appeared to be novel. It was a shortened form of his rather dar-

ing *The Mystical Presence: A Vindication of the Reformed or Calvinist Doctrine of the Holy Eucharist* (Philadelphia, 1846, 1867). Strikingly similar to the views of the contemporary Anglican Oxford Reformers, this maintains that the very core of theology and church life is the doctrine of the Eucharist. It meticulously expounds the sacramental theology of the original Reformed leaders, particularly Calvin and the framers of the Heidelberg Catechism. It asserts that they believed in the Real Presence, and severely criticizes the Puritan divines and the modern Reformed churches for forsaking Calvin's high views of the Church and the sacraments, and for making the Eucharist a mere voluntary memorial meal. With such ideas, Nevin naturally favored a reform of the liturgy to bring it more into accord with the spirit of the Reformers. This aspect of his thought appears in his *Liturgical Question with Reference to the Provisional Liturgy of the German Reformed Church* . . . (Philadelphia, 1862); and *Vindication of the Revised Liturgy, Historical and Theological* (Philadelphia, 1867). The occasion for the latter work was an attack on the revised liturgy by John Henry Augustus Bomberger, *A History and Criticism of the Ritualistic Movement in the German Reformed Church* (Philadelphia, 1867). The startling impact of Nevin's "ritualism" upon the Calvinistic churches is reviewed by Charles P. Krauth, a leader of the conservative theological movement in the Lutheran Church, in *The Liturgical Movement in the Presbyterian and Reformed Churches* (Philadelphia, 1869) (see sect. II, 1, *Lutheran Theology*).

Nevin's career and work, which to many contemporaries seemed to be a failure, was reviewed shortly after his death in Theodore Appel's *The Life and Work of John Williamson Nevin* (Philadelphia, 1889; Lancaster, 1889). His influence was prolonged by the devotion and appreciation of admirers and pupils. One conservator of his tradition was the Rev. William H. Erb, a pupil, who compiled and edited *Dr. Nevin's Theology, Based on Manuscript Classroom Lectures*

(Reading, Pa., 1913). His influence, and that of his colleagues (see below) was promulgated throughout America by the *Mercersburg Review*, which began to appear in 1849, and included many of their essays. It reveals the movement's rise and progress, and its efforts to recover the catholic faith of the early Reformers, to promote historical understanding of the Church's past (especially the early Church and pre-Reformation history), and to encourage the reunion of Christendom. Recent scholarship, delving into the files of this remarkable review, has originated a really adequate and sensitive appreciation and comprehension of Nevin's ideals. One of the notable tributes is Scott Francis Brenner's essay, "Nevin and the Mercersburg Theology," in *Theology Today*, Vol. 12, no. 1(April 1955), pp. 43–56, with bibliographical footnotes. He sketches Nevin's education and career, and reviews the movement which he led, emphasizing its distinctly American origin and development. He notices its independent trend toward the ecclesiastical, theological, and liturgical conclusions of the Anglican Oxford Movement, and its grounding upon the centrality of Christ and his Church, in the sacramental aspect of the Real Presence as taught by Calvin. Another scholarly and much longer appreciation is Kenneth Moses Plummer, "The Theology of John Williamson Nevin in the Mercersburg Period, 1840–1852" (Doctoral thesis, University of Chicago, Chicago [Dept. of Photoduplication, University of Chicago Library], 1958, positive microfilm copy of typescript, including bibliography, microfilm 5653BX).

The most influential of Nevin's colleagues at Mercersburg was the long-lived and incredibly laborious Philip Schaff (1819–1893), the great church historian and bibliographer. His contribution to the Mercersburg movement consisted mainly of his conception of the study of church history, expressed at an early date in his *What is Church History? A Vindication of the Idea of Historical Development, Translated from the German* (Philadelphia, 1846), based upon his introductory address at the opening of a course of lectures on

church history at the Mercersburg Seminary. It expresses a philosophy of historicity, which had been largely lost in the Anglo-American revivalist churches. An extensive bibliography of his writings, and an estimate of his work and influence, appear in David Schley Schaff, *The Life of Philip Schaff, in Part Autobiographical* (New York, 1897). On the Mercersburg faculty, Schaff replaced the highly learned and earnest young Frederick Augustus Rauch (1806–1841), a German-educated philosopher-psychologist, and an extensive writer. He studied under the Heidelberg theologian, Carl Daub, and is credited with introducing into Mercersburg the philosophy of mind of Hegel. His brief but important career is reviewed in Howard J. B. Ziegler, "Frederick Augustus Rauch; American Hegelian" (Doctoral thesis, Columbia University, 1950; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich., 1950, AC-1, no. 2362, positive copy of typescript, with bibliography; *Microfilm Abstracts*, Vol. 11 (1951), no. 2, pp. 390–391; abridgment in Franklin and Marshall College, *Studies*, 1953). Ziegler drew extensively upon John Williamson Nevin's funeral sermon, *Eulogy on the Life and Character of the Late Dr. Frederick A. Rauch, President of Marshall College, Pa.* . . . (Chambersburg, 1841; 1859, rev. and enl., with variant title). The strongly confessional and doctrinal character of the Mercersburg theology emphasized the catechism, and was underlined by another of Nevin's colleagues, Henry Harbaugh (1817–1867), who was also a religious poet of more than commonplace merit. He supplied the Reformed Church with a new translation and notes: *The Heidelberg Catechism, with Prooftexts and Explanations as Used in the Palatinate, Translated from the German . . . With Forms of Devotion* (Reading, Pa., c.1892). A bibliography of his works is available in Linn Harbaugh, *Life of the Rev. Henry Harbaugh, D.D., with an Introduction and Eulogy* . . . (Philadelphia, 1900).

Full study and appreciation of the Mercersburg theologians and liturgists did not arrive until Nevin had been dead for about sixty years. The earliest modern appreciation is John I.

Swander, *The Mercersburg Theology . . . a Course of Lectures Delivered in the Theological Seminary of the Reformed Church in the United States, at Lancaster, Pa. . . .* (Philadelphia, 1909). Valuable comments on Nevin, Rauch, Schaff, and other men identified with the Mercersburg movement, are in George Warren Richards, *History of the Theological Seminary of the Reformed Church in the United States, 1825–1934, Evangelical and Reformed Church, 1934–1952* (Lancaster, Pa., 1952), with a bibliography. Richards summed up his conclusions in "The Mercersburg Theology—Its Purpose and Principles," in *Church History,* Vol. 20, no. 3 (Sept. 1951), pp. 42–55, with bibliography in notes. He indicates the prophetic vision of Schaff and Nevin in discerning the main question of the time as *the nature of the church* and its relation to the individual and the world. Their influence upon theology continues, and they aided the advance from "fixed" to progressive theology, and participated in reconciling German and American thought and life. The most systematic study of the theological writings of Nevin and Schaff is that of Luther John Binkley, *The Mercersburg Theology; with an Introduction by John B. Noss* (Lancaster? Pa., 1953, Franklin and Marshall College Studies, no. 7). This is a shortened version of his Harvard University doctoral dissertation, 1950 (Harvard University Library, 2 copies, HU90.5716). Following an account of the German background, he reviews its rise and decline and its various doctrines (particularly its central Christology), and reveals its influence upon thought in the German Reformed Church.

The persistent effort of the Mercersburg theologians was to achieve the creation of a "Christ-centered theology," in opposition to the subjectivistic revivalism and moralistic rationalism, which Nevin considered to be not so different as was usually supposed. Their influence was prolonged by later professors, and affected the theology, catechism, liturgy, and even architecture of the German Reformed Church. The effects of the movement recall those of the Oxford Reform

in the Anglican Church, which in fact exerted some influence upon Nevin and his colleagues (see below, sect. II, H, 5, *Anglican Theology*). The tradition was continued and amplified in the *Mercersburg Review* (1849–1926), a great treasury of articles by the defenders of this position. (See also Part Two; sect. IV, B, 6, C, *German Reformed Church.*)

G. Natural Theology

The passage of Calvinistic theology through various modifications, ending in Protestant liberalism, was accompanied and often aided by the vogue of "natural" theology. This quiet intellectual current colored the colonial mentality, and was an element in the rise of the eighteenth-century "Religion of Nature" and of Deism (see Part Two, sect. III, B, 1 and 2). In the colleges and the churches, it encouraged the rise of non-Calvinistic theologies, based largely upon free-will Arminianism, which affected rational and urbane Anglicanism, Universalism, Unitarianism, Methodism, the Free-will Baptists, and other groups. Its origins are explored in Irving Goldman, "The Beginnings of Theories of Natural Ethics and Theology in Seventeenth-Century America" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1937). One of the earliest, if not the earliest American writing attempting to employ natural theology to support Christian revelation is Cotton Mather's *The Christian Philosopher: a Collection of the Best Discoveries in Nature, with Religious Improvements* . . . (London, 1721).

Literature on natural theology and "natural religion" was rather widely read in the colonies during the eighteenth century. Among the more popular and influential works was William Wollaston's *The Religion of Nature Delineated* . . . (London, 1724), familiar to Benjamin Franklin and Samuel Johnson, and many other colonial intellectuals. Thomas Burnet, author of *The Demonstration of True Religion* . . . (London, 1725, 2 vols.), was a relative of Governor William

Burnet of New York, a correspondent of Johnson and a defender of Deism. Matthew Tindal's *Christianity as Old as the Creation; or, The Gospel, a Republication of the Religion of Nature* (London, 1730) was widely read and admired in America, but considered dangerously deistic. Very popular, among the orthodox who admitted reason as well as revelation, was Bishop Joseph Butler's *The Analogy of Religion, Natural and Revealed* . . . (London, 1736). Many colonial scholars read Henry Home, Lord Kames, *Essays on the Principles of Morality and Natural Religion* . . . (Edinburgh, 1751); also William Jones, *Essay on the First Principles of Natural Philosophy* (Oxford, 1762), and the anti-Deist, William Warburton, *Principles of Natural and Revealed Religion Occasionally Opened and Explained* . . . (London, 1753–54, 2 vols.). The popularity of books on natural theology and religion endured into the Revolutionary period and the early nineteenth century. Among the most effective promoters of the "natural religion" attitude was the Unitarian pioneer, Joseph Priestley, author of *Institutes of Natural and Revealed Religion* . . . (London, 1772–73, 2 vols.). The standard authority among the orthodox was William Paley's *Natural Theology* . . . (London, 1788), which appeared in many editions throughout the early nineteenth century. Also popular was Thomas Chalmers, *On the Power, Wisdom, and Goodness of God, as Manifested in the Adaptation of External Nature to the Moral and Intellectual Constitution of Man* (Philadelphia, 1836, new ed.).

How formidable a threat natural religion and theology appeared to many Christians is seen in Robert Frederick West, *Alexander Campbell and Natural Religion* (New Haven, 1948), with bibliography. Campbell, a well-known apologist for Christianity against the claims of natural religion and an organizer and apologist of the Disciples, resolved the tension between belief and enlightenment by placing faith in the Bible and primitive Christianity. But his anti-ecclesiasticism was in sympathy with the natural religionists and religious sectari-

ans. James McCosh's *Christianity and Positivism: a Series of Lectures to the Times on Natural Theology and Apologetics* . . . (New York, 1871) also reveals the continuing tension between Christian orthodoxy and the nineteenth-century extension of natural religion. Various conservative and liberal attitudes appear in the following titles, selected from a large body of writings on natural theology: Henry Drummond, *Natural Law in the Spiritual World* (New York, London, 1884, 8th ed.; New York, 1885, 1887); George Park Fisher, *Manual of Natural Theology* (New York, 1893); Newman Smyth, *Constructive Natural Theology* (New York, 1913), and his *Through Science to Faith* (New York, 1902); Gerald Heard, *Is God Evident? An Essay Toward a Natural Theology* . . . (New York, c.1948); Julian Victor Langmead Casserley, *Graceful Reason; the Contribution of Reason to Theology*, Foreword by John Heuss (Greenwich, Conn., 1954), and his *The Scope and Variety of Natural Theology* (Washington?, c.1953), lectures at the Protestant Episcopal Theological Seminary in Virginia, 1953.

H. Early Non-Calvinist Theologies

LIBERAL THEOLOGIES. *1. Enlightenment Theology.* The preparation for the peculiar theology of the Enlightenment period, in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, was partly in New England Puritanism, and was not due solely to secular rationalistic liberalism. In New England, more than elsewhere, Christian Platonism was widely applied to nature and history. Science was viewed "not as secular knowledge but rather as the divine wisdom." (This and other quotations in the notes on Enlightenment Theology are from George Reuben Metcalf, "American Religious Philosophy . . . ," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 27, no. 1 [March 1958].) This requires a special mental discipline, conforming the mind to the logic of eternal wisdom and to the will of God. Both natural laws

and social order exhibit the principles of general order or reason, and all nature "declares the glory of God" and supports the obligations imposed upon the citizen by the theocratic commonwealth. Independent of Biblical support, this theory of knowledge stands close to Deism and natural religion (see Part Two, sect. III, B, 2, *English Deism*, and 1, *The Eighteenth Century Religion of Nature*), to which Puritan philosophy was an unconscious preparation.

The American Enlightenment, therefore, was not an imported, "godless," rationalistic materialism. It was largely indigenous, and was composed of various elements. One was the "cult of benevolence," which is described as "an inward sense of moral obligation, and a confidence in the reliability of divine revelation through human reason applied to natural evidences." American Enlightenment was inclined to be spiritualistic and pious. Benevolence did not come from the Edwardsean concept of "a special sense of the benevolence of God," existing for God's glory and the soul's benefit, but from an element of theological optimism that was evident even in the colonial period. This element was well expressed by Cotton Mather's essay, "The Christian Philosopher" (see above), included in Kenneth B. Murdock, ed., *Selections from Cotton Mather* (New York, 1926) (see sect. II, G, *Natural Theology*). Mather, in a rather complacent way, was a humanitarian reformer who "went about doing good in the name of a God Who cares most of all for the happiness of His creatures." His Puritan religious philosophy of benevolence was adopted by Benjamin Franklin, a descendant of New England Puritans. In his writings and reforming zeal the ethic of benevolence became secularized and utilitarian, directed toward the welfare of the entire community, concerned with instrumental rather than final values. In this appears an element of modern American "Pious Utilitarianism" (see sect. V, B, *Popularizing Religious Psychology* and D, *Recent Revival*). Franklin's philosophy of benevolence is expressed by his "Dissertation on Liberty and Necessity, Pleas-

ure and Pain," included in P. R. Anderson and M. H. Fisch, eds., *Philosophy in America* (New York, 1939); and is discussed in F. L. Mott and C. E. Jorgenson, "Introduction" to *Benjamin Franklin: Representative Selections* (New York, 1936). Another protagonist of secularized Enlightenment religion and theology was Benjamin Rush, the Philadelphia physician, who like Franklin was a signer of the Declaration of Independence and a religious liberal. His philosophy and its influence upon his religious and ethical thinking are described in "The Influence of Physical Causes on the Moral Faculty," in J. L. Blau, ed., *American Philosophic Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946). A disciple of Rush was Joseph Buchanan (1785–1829), who represents the decline of Enlightenment rationalism. His position is seen in *The Philosophy of Human Nature* (Richmond, Ky., 1812), attempting to demonstrate how genius might be produced at will by "rational methodology." Buchanan "confused the rationalist position by seeking rationally to control the 'sentiments' on which man's behavior was thought primarily to depend."

The religious philosophy of the Enlightenment, associated with eighteenth-century natural religion, eventually aided in the secularization of the state, the separation of church from state, the disestablishment of the Anglican and Congregational state churches, and the establishment of religious liberty. This was "a secular development of theocratic principles of colonial New England." To Puritans, government was a religious concern, and the theocratic community based on covenant was fundamental. In the Enlightenment, the concern of religion with civil government received support not simply from the Scriptures, but also from reason and the theory of natural rights. The progress of thought soon abandoned the argument from Scripture, and only the argument from natural rights remained, but the separation between church and state did not become anti-religious. The following works reveal the development of the argument: John Wise (of Ipswich, Mass.), in *A Vindication of the Government of New England*

Churches (Boston, 1772), argued in behalf of the liberty of the local congregation, deriving it not alone from Calvinist theocratic principles, but also from natural right—the "capital immunities belonging to man's nature." John Witherspoon, a signer of the Declaration of Independence, argued that history showed that civil liberty and religious freedom stand or fall together, in his sermon, *The Dominion of Providence over the Passions of Men* (Philadelphia, 1776). Adam Ferguson's *Essay on the History of Civil Society* (Edinburgh, 1767) marked the culmination of the appeal to nature, and was "immensely popular" after 1800. Ferguson followed the argument of Montesquieu, picturing man as socially progressive, developing gradually by collective effort—an idea not unlike William E. Channing's (see sect. II, H, 2, *Unitarian Theology*). In the effort man is aided and preserved by society, resulting from natural state and human art. The defenders of freedom frequently referred to principles drawn from Roman law and Greek political philosophy, thus adding to the secularized theory of Puritan church covenant the ancient idea of a republic based upon a voluntary agreement among citizens to protect each other's natural rights. By the next step "the increasingly secularized theocratic state gradually became independent of religious sanction."

The outcome of the evolution is evident in the writings of James Madison and Thomas Jefferson. Madison in his "Memorial and Remonstrance on the Religious Rights of Man" (1785), in Bernard Smith, ed., *The Democratic Spirit* (New York, 1941), declared that every man's religion must be left to his own conviction and conscience. Jefferson's "Act Establishing Religious Freedom in Virginia" (1786), quoted in P. R. Anderson and M. H. Fisch, eds., *Philosophy in America* (New York, 1939), states that civil rights do not depend upon religious opinions. See also: Adrienne Koch and William Peden, eds., *The Life and Selected Writings of Thomas Jefferson* (New York, 1944). The argument for a purely secular basis of the state was strengthened by the popularity of Thomas Paine.

Although this position regarding the relation of church and state was sometimes anti-church and anti-clerical, it was *not anti-religious,* but was considered (as by Jefferson himself) an essential support of real spiritual and ethical religion. Paine shared the same sentiment. (For the connection of the Enlightenment Theology and religious philosophy with the campaign for disestablishment of state churches and with religious freedom, see Part Two, sect. II, *The Battle for Disestablishment,* and Part Three, sect. II, B, *Rise of Religious Freedom.*)

2. UNITARIAN THEOLOGY: "ENLIGHTENED CHRISTIANITY." *The Prelude to Unitarian Theology.* A continuation of the Enlightenment was Unitarian theology, and the prelude to it was the rationalism of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, as has been pointed out in a previous section (see Part Two, sect. III, B, 1, *Eighteenth Century Religion of Nature,* and 2, *English Deism*), which is concerned with Unitarianism as a broad religious movement. Samuel Willard's *Complete Body of Divinity* (1726; see sect. II, B, *New England Theology*) became obsolete because of the intellectual revolution caused by the *Principia Mathematica* (1686) of Isaac Newton, which pictured a cosmos of ordered law controlling the events of history; and by John Locke's sensational psychology, and his expression of the "New Science" in terms of philosophy, psychology, morals, religion, and government, which the layman could understand. The result was an "enlightened" and "reasonable" Christianity—in which revelation was perfectly explained by reason and natural law. Even conservatives accepted the "reasonable" explanations, and were confident of the ability of the human mind to solve the religious problem, and of their own ability to make Christianity simple and acceptable. Theological speculation (particularly about Trinitarian dogma) faded, and confidence in man's moral freedom and goodness reigned. Deep concern for conversion and salvation yielded to an equation of faith with intellectual assent, and natural law replaced divine provi-

dence. New England felt the impulse of this type of thinking, which captured Harvard College and the seaboard Congregational churches. The way was prepared for Unitarianism. One of the path-breakers, a leader in pre-Unitarian "Arminianism," was Charles Chauncy, minister of the First Church in Boston, critic of the Great Awakening, and of Edwards, and the leader of a gradual intellectual movement toward liberalism. The eventual result was the Unitarian schism of 1825 and the formation of a liberal denomination, which is outlined in James Basden, "A Study in the Rise of Early American Unitarianism" (Doctoral dissertation), and in William Herman Gysan, "Early American Unitarianism and Philosophy: a Study of the Philosophical Antecedents and the Philosophical Issues of Early American Unitarianism, circa 1750–1860" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1942, typewritten, Harvard University Library, HU90.4171). More recent and comprehensive research on origins of Unitarian thought is embodied in Conrad Wright, *The Beginnings of Unitarianism in America* (Boston, 1955).

American Enlightenment theology did not generally follow Franklin's lead into secular humanitarianism, or devote itself to promoting political and religious liberty. Generally it became the "sentimentalized benevolence of liberal religion, the theological complacency of which ultimately spawned a secularized religion, difficult to distinguish from simple humanitarian ethics." More than any other individual, William Ellery Channing (1780–1842) expressed the Enlightenment of religious philosophy. He stood between the eighteenth-century Enlightenment and Transcendentalism, and inherited the three faiths of the revolutionary era: rationalism, pietism, and republicanism. He blended them, and gave them "a new stimulating expression that transformed them from a mere heritage of the eighteenth century into the guiding principles of the nineteenth" (Metcalf, p. 43, quotation from H. W. Schneider, *A History of American Philosophy*, p. 61). The derivation of Channing's theological and philosophical ideas

is clearly outlined in Herbert W. Schneider, "The Intellectual Background of William Ellery Channing," in *Church History*, Vol. 7, no. 1 (Mar. 1938), pp. 3–23. Channing's pietism apparently originated in his study of Samuel Hopkins, one of the disciples of Jonathan Edwards (see sect. II, D, *Development of Liberal Orthodoxy*). From Hopkins came his ideal of "disinterested benevolence" derived from Platonic moral philosophy and natural religion. "New Light" Pietism and Platonic idealism came to Channing through Calvinistic pietism before he ever became acquainted with German and British sources of Transcendentalism (see Metcalf, pp. 43–44). Channing's thought and its influence are embodied in a considerable bibliography of his own writings and of works about him, more particularly in his *Works* . . . (Boston, 1898); "Likeness to God," in J. L. Blau, ed., *American Philosophic Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946); and William Henry Channing, *Memoir of William Ellery Channing* (Boston, 1848), with extracts from his correspondence and manuscripts, particularly Vol. I. His specific defense of Unitarian theology is embodied in his celebrated sermons: *The Moral Argument against Calvinism*, in his *Works* (Boston, 1841, Vol. 17); and *Unitarian Christianity; a Discourse on Some of the Distinguishing Opinions of Unitarians, Delivered at Baltimore in 1819* (Boston, 1919). This was his manifesto of the liberal movement in American theology. Although Norton (see below) was the titular head of Unitarian thought, its deepest theological inspiration came from Channing. The Scottish philosophers revealed to him "the glory of the divine disinterestedness . . . [and] the sublimity of devotedness to the will of Infinite Love." The Baltimore sermon reveals the principles of Unitarian theology: the Holy Scriptures as the inspired revelation of the Word of God, reasonably interpreted; Christ divine but not God; God's will wrought in man through the agency of the Holy Spirit. Carl Wilson McGeehon's "The Controversial Writings of William Ellery Channing" (Doctoral disserta-

tion, 1940; abstract published in *University of Iowa Doctoral Dissertations*, Vol. 4) investigates their significance in the development and establishment of Unitarianism, and reviews his writings defending Unitarianism, making articulate the uncertain liberal thought of the early nineteenth century.

The liberal clergy, especially in New England, continued to preach Enlightenment religious philosophy, but were not progressive, to the great disappointment of Channing, and settled down upon a "rationalistic orthodoxy" that became a kind of creed. The ultimate result was a revolt of the younger men and the establishment of the Free Religious Association (see Part Two, sect. III, E, *Unitarianism*, and G, *Free Thought*). The basic principles of orthodox Unitarian theology were classically stated by Andrews Norton, in *A Statement of Reasons for not Believing the Doctrine of Trinitarians Respecting the Nature of God, and the Person of Christ . . .* (Boston, 1819; Cambridge and Boston, 1833; Boston, 1856). Norton (1786–1853), sometimes called the Unitarian "Pope," was the outstanding theologian of the movement before the Civil War, and after 1830 attacked the more radical younger clergy. His statement was occasioned by letters addressed to Channing by Professor Moses Stuart of the Andover Seminary, attacking Unitarianism, and was first published as articles in the *Christian Disciple*. It became one of the most popular expositions of the Unitarian viewpoint. Another representative of conservatism is Norton's magnum opus, *The Evidences of the Genuineness of the Gospels* (Boston, 1837–1844, 3 vols.). The advance of Unitarian theology toward radicalism was promoted especially by Theodore Parker (1810–1860) of Boston, whose position is clarified by John Edwards Dirks, *The Critical Theology of Theodore Parker* (New York, 1948), with bibliography, on his basic philosophical ideas, characteristic methods in Biblical and historical criticism, examination of the basis of religious truth, formation of an "educated theology," and relation to the Transcendentalist temper and to Emerson in particular, his Tran-

scendentalism being closely related to the Enlightenment. A considerable number of modern Unitarian theological thinkers, although poles apart from traditional orthodoxy, have nevertheless been theists and written cogent expositions of theism from the advanced liberal viewpoint. A selection from their writings should include: Minot Judson Savage, *Belief in God: an Examination of Some Fundamental Theistic Problems . . . To which is added an Address on The Intellectual Basis of Faith* (Boston, 1881, 2nd ed.); Francis Ellingwood Abbot, *Scientific Theism* (Boston, 1885), based upon a lecture at the Concord Summer School of Philosophy in 1885; Charles Carroll Everett, *Theism and the Christian Faith; Lectures Delivered in the Harvard Divinity School*, edited by Edward Hale (New York and London, 1909), on the existence of God and Christian doctrine, showing that Unitarianism was *not* negative; and Minot Simons, *A Modern Theism* (Boston, Mass., c.1931), mostly sermons at the Unitarian Church of All Souls, New York City.

The advanced Unitarian theological standpoint of the present day appears in Julius Seelye Bixler, *Religion for Free Minds* (New York and London, 1939), somewhat expanded from Lowell Institute Lectures delivered at King's Chapel, Boston, in 1937, with "Notes." A less radical approach is indicated by John Haynes Holmes, the pastor of the New York Community Church, an advanced liberal, in *Why Reason in Religion is Not Enough* (New York, 1943; the Community Pulpit Series, 1943–44, no. 4). The Unitarian reaction against the revival of theological conservatism, particularly as expressed in Neo-Orthodoxy, has pressed the more advanced thinkers into a decidedly radical, anti-orthodox and anti-theological attitude, evinced by Fred L. Cairns, *Progress is Unorthodox*, with a Foreword by M. C. Otto (Boston, 1950); James Henry Leuba, *The Reformation of the Churches* (Boston, 1950), with bibliographical footnotes; and Duncan Howlett, *Man against the Church; the Struggle to Free Man's Religious Spirit* (Boston, 1954), with bibliographical references

included in "Notes." A general review of theology, from early nineteenth-century conservative anti-Trinitarianism to twentieth-century radicalism, is provided in an essay by Francis A. Christie, "Unitarianism," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 21, no. 4 (Oct. 1917), pp. 554–570, which considers movements in Unitarian theology, stressing its undogmatic character, its descent from the Socinians and Arminians, its development in the nineteenth century to Unitarian modernism, its expression in hymns, its conception of Jesus as "a climax of religious evolution," not a divinity, and Unitarian thought as a bond between East and West. (See also Part Two, sect. III, E, 4, *Early American Unitarian Thought.*)

3. TRANSCENDENTALIST THEOLOGY. Transcendentalism as an intellectual theology stemmed partly from growing German influence upon American thinking in the early nineteenth century. Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "Continental Influence on American Christian Thought Since World War I," in *Church History*, Vol. 27, no. 3 (Sept. 1958), pp. 256–257, notes the very slight influence shortly after 1800, as shown by the casual reference to Immanuel Kant in the Rev. Samuel Miller's *A Brief Retrospect of the Eighteenth Century* (New York, 1803, 2 vols.). A marked change came after 1810, through the acquaintance with German New Testament criticism of Joseph Buckminster of Harvard and Moses Stuart of Andover. German philosophical ideas reached the United States through scholars who studied at German universities, such as Ticknor, Cogswell, Everett, Bancroft, and especially Frederic Henry Hedge. This influence is strikingly revealed in two scholarly studies: Henry A. Pochmann, *German Culture in America, 1600–1900: Philosophical and Literary* (Madison, 1957), with extensive bibliography; and Stanley M. Vogel, *German Literary Influences on the American Transcendentalists* (New Haven, 1955). A brief bibliography on Immanuel Kant and his influence is in Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (1953), in ch. 44, "Repudiation and Revival." The label "Transcendentalism,"

though derived from the terminology of Kant, is virtually a misnomer. For a clear account of the meaning of the words "transcendent" and "transcendental" in the philosophy of Kant consult H. J. Paton, *Kant's Metaphysic of Experience* (New York, 1936, 2 vols.), esp. Vol. II, p. 430. American Transcendentalism was "less an adoption of post-Kantian philosophy than a reaction to the metaphysical viewpoint of the American Enlightenment" (Metcalf, p. 47).

The first aspect was a culmination of faith in certain characteristics of the Enlightenment itself, particularly the creative power of reason and secular moralism. It began where the liberal theologians of the previous generation (the "Orthodox Unitarians") stopped, and is typified by Theodore Parker. He became a powerful preacher of the faith of the Enlightenment. He was a Kantian, using the insights of practical reason to complement the limited findings of the natural sciences. His religious philosophy is outlined in J. E. Dirks, *The Critical Theology of Theodore Parker* (New York, 1948); Theodore Parker, "The Philosophic Idea of God," in J. L. Blau, ed., *American Philosophic Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946); and his essay "Transcendentalism," in W. G. Muelder and M. Sears, *The Development of American Philosophy* (Boston, 1940).

Secondly, Transcendentalism was a revolt, refusing to accept scientific method as a substitute for philosophy or religion. The Transcendentalists believed that God is immanent in the spirit of man, who is therefore transcendent over nature, and contains within himself the essence of eternity. They rejected institutionalism (including that of the church) as encouraging loss of selfhood and dependence upon material power, which is earthly and stifles the spirit. These characteristics appear in Emerson, Thoreau, Melville, and Henry James, Sr., as typical Transcendentalists. Emerson's expression of the Transcendentalist revolt against materialism may be studied in his "Divinity School Address," in J. L. Blau, ed., *American Philosophic Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946); H. D.

Gray, *Emerson; a Statement of New England Transcendentalism* (Berkeley, Calif., 1917); René Wellek, "Emerson and German Philosophy," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 16, no. 1 (Mar. 1943), pp. 41–62; and Emerson's "Self Reliance," "Compensation," "The Oversoul," and "Intellect," in *Essays, First Series* (Boston, 1878); and *Nature, Address and Lectures* (Boston, 1883). Emerson's doctrine of self-reliance was linked to his Transcendentalist philosophy. It was "a personal faith in the divine character of introspection and reflection based on the resulting peace of self-acceptance" (Metcalf, p. 48). Emerson shifted the chief interest of the mind from nature as mere existence to nature as "food for the spirit." Another spiritualizer of nature was Thoreau, who drew spiritual sustenance from study of and absorption into nature, and retreated from society for a time. Introductory remarks on Thoreau's association with Transcendentalism appear in Perry Miller, ed., *The Transcendentalists* (Cambridge, Mass., 1950); and his theological significance is understood by John Sylvester Smith, "The Philosophical Naturism of Henry David Thoreau, with Special Reference to Its Epistomological Presuppositions and Its Theological Implications" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, Madison, N.J., 1948). Thoreau as a systematic thinker believed that the study of man as a natural creature would reveal much of the purpose of his existence, and assumed that the purpose would be religious, as life has a basically religious significance.

Melville "devoted his writing to pointing out the distinction between mere civilized standards and true transcendental values" (see Metcalf, p. 48). His expression of Transcendentalist religious philosophy is studied in William Brasswell, *Melville's Religious Thought* (University of North Carolina, 1943); Raymond Weaver, *Herman Melville, Mariner and Mystic* (New York, 1921); and his own *Pierre; or, The Ambiguities* (New York, 1929). (Reference to Melville's literary expression of religious philosophy occurs in Part Four, RELIGION AND LITERATURE, sect. VI, H, 1, *New England Puri-*

tans and Transcendentalists.) In Henry James, Sr., the Transcendentalist revolt took the form of opposition to interpreting human nature as the result of biological organism. He defended a "redeemed form of man," a fellowship of those who have rejected individual independence and conceive of God as completely human, the mass of mankind. The Transcendentalists tended thus to identify God and man. James's views are reviewed exhaustively in Frederic H. Young, *The Philosophy of Henry James, Sr.* (New York, 1951), and his attitude toward material culture is in his own essay, "The Social Significance of Our Institutions," in J. L. Blau, ed., *American Philosophic Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946). Young's work, with an exhaustive bibliography, traces the sources of his thought and his systematic articulation of them into a religious philosophy, which was strikingly original, stressing knowledge of the divine as a major method of salvation. Religion was his central concern.

The third aspect of Transcendentalism, often overlooked, is its reform of the outlook of the Enlightenment, developing the views of Parker and Channing. Church leaders realized that rationality was not enough, and that religion needed the powerful piety in traditional and evangelical churches. In theology and philosophy the study of nature became less important than the study of the soul. This phase was greatly indebted to the Vermont minister, James Marsh, a student of Samuel Taylor Coleridge's *Aids to Reflection;* with a Preliminary Essay by James Marsh (Burlington, Vt., 1829). This publication spurred the trend toward a Transcendentalist movement by revealing Coleridge's techniques for attaining a "spiritual" religion that differed from revealed religion and from the inadequacies of a "natural" one. Such a religion appealed to those eager to escape from dry rationalism and fossilized Calvinism. Marsh contributed heavily to Transcendental religious philosophy by his own writings, gathered in *The Remains of the Rev. James Marsh,* ed. Joseph Torrey (Boston, 1843). He developed a philosophy based upon

"spontaneous" consciousness, through which power of life proceeds from a divine source. There is a "spiritual principle" in every man, which (when inspired by God) "freely strives after those noble and glorious ends which reason and the spirit of God prescribe." He held to a complete philosophy of sin and grace that linked him with colonial Puritans like Edwards. Among the better appreciations of his influence is John Dewey, "James Marsh and American Philosophy," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 2, no. 2 (Apr. 1941), pp. 131–150, which maintains that Marsh did not force his speculations beyond accepted beliefs in religion, and depended upon Coleridge and German idealists for expression. Religion to him was a supreme value, and his conception of it condemned contemporary popular religion as "merely an attempt to include God and the next world in a scheme of personal advancement and success."

The Transcendentalist theology was greatly furthered by the Episcopal clergyman Caleb Sprague Henry, who in 1834 introduced into America the psychology of Victor Cousin, in his "Introduction" to Cousin's *Elements of Psychology* (New York, 1856, 4th ed.). Cousin suggested a transcendental argument for the possible attainment of absolute truth, and Henry held that the most practical way to attain truth is through development of spiritual consciousness by the regenerated soul. His spirituality resembled that of Theodore Parker, and he believed that morality is psychologically spontaneous, not dependent on divine will or self-interest. Naturally, Henry was a social reformer, for his philosophy of history regarded man's life as a moral struggle between opposing forces, and the eventual result is the perfection of human society.

One of the profoundest influences upon Transcendentalism was exerted by a minister who was not himself a Transcendentalist, the Rev. Frederic H. Hedge, a teacher at Harvard, 1857–1884. He was probably the most deeply informed New Englander in German philosophy, but not a true Transcen-

dentalist, because he regarded the eternal Church as the guide of mankind. His ideas are completely set forth in his *Ways of the Spirit and Other Essays* (Boston, 1877). He dwelt upon the unity of nature and spirit, regarded natural history and human history as phases of the growth of "nature's self-consciousness" (see Metcalf, p. 50), and believed in a close relationship between spirituality and practical morality, which would bring upon earth God's kingdom and social perfection. Marsh, Henry, and Hedge have been regarded as Christian Transcendentalists, and their lives, works, and general influence are reviewed by Ronald Vale Wells, *Three Christian Transcendentalists: James Marsh, Caleb Sprague Henry, Frederic Henry Hedge* (New York, 1943). (See also Part Two, sect. III, F, *Transcendental Religion.*)

4. EARLY NON-CALVINIST THEOLOGIES. *a. Evangelical Theologies.* The religious revivals which began in the 1730's proved to be powerful institutional agencies for the dissemination of non-Calvinist theologies throughout America. These views proved to be acceptable particularly in the more recently settled parts of the country. They appealed to many people who had lost contact with the older churches; but they also made serious inroads into the Calvinistic denominations, especially the Puritan Congregationalists, the Presbyterians, and the Calvinistic Baptists. Among the new denominations and sects which developed around non-Calvinist theologies were the Methodists, the Free-Will Baptists, the Cumberland Presbyterians, the Universalists, and the Shakers. These groups were all evangelical in temper, and are to be distinguished in this respect from Unitarianism and Quakerism, which were also non-Calvinist. At the beginning of the nineteenth century they were all zealously engaged in home-missionary activity, and their rapid growth was probably the most striking feature of early nineteenth-century religion in America. The following section deals with theological trends among the non-Calvinist evangelicals. The new theologies were centered upon the traditional piety, emphasizing sin and

regeneration through the grace of God in Christ. But they departed from Calvinist teaching by emphasizing man's moral responsibility for his sin and his free agency in seeking salvation. They also insisted upon the universality of God's grace and its perfecting influence upon character. Calvinist doctrines on these points were frequently attacked as being inhumane. These deviations from Calvinism proved to be congenial with the activist and reformist spirit of nineteenth-century democratic ideology.

The theological and philosophical background of the anti-Calvinist movement was the spread of Arminianism, which alarmed Jonathan Edwards. Francis Albert Christie, in "The Beginnings of Arminianism in New England," in American Society of Church History, *Papers* (2nd ser., Vol. 3, 1912, pp. 153–172), refers to the spread of English Arminianism and the alarm it aroused, especially in the interior parishes. Further evidence of its silent penetration is adduced by Conrad Wright's "Arminianism in Massachusetts, 1735–1780" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, typewritten, in Harvard University Library, HU90.5091); also in his "Edwards and the Arminians on the Freedom of the Will" (by "Dana W. Edwards," *pseud.*, typewritten, Harvard University Library, HU89.125.46); reprinted from *Harvard Theological Review*, Vol. 35, no. 4 (Oct. 1942), pp. 241–261 (Cambridge, Mass., 1942).

b. Methodist Theology. The largest non-Calvinist denomination was Methodism, which took root in America during and after the Great Awakening through the activity of George Whitefield and Francis Asbury. Unfortunately no comprehensive history of Methodist Arminian theology is available. The nearest approach to a general history is Leland H. Scott, "Methodist Theology in America in the Nineteenth Century" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University), partly published in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 25, no. 1 (Winter, 1955–56), pp. 87–98. Works devoted to the discussion of Wesleyan or Methodist theology, including the doctrine of perfection,

are listed in Edward L. Fortney, "The Literature of the History of Methodism" (cited above, in Part Two, sect. IV, B, 5, *Methodists*). John Boyce Bennett, "Albert Taylor Bledsoe: Social and Religious Controversialist of the Old South" (Doctoral dissertation, Duke University, 1942, microfilm, University of Virginia Library), reveals how Bledsoe (1809–1877) exemplified the intellectual and emotional strains of refined Southerners, attacked Edwardsean Calvinism, and defended slavery. The Methodist Awakening influenced certain Baptists of New England, who abandoned their Calvinist views of regeneration and founded the Free-Will Baptist sect. Their theological attitude is defined in the *Free Baptist Cyclopedia* (1889), article "Doctrines," pp. 164–168, particularly the sections on "Divine Government and Providence," "Atonement and Mediation of Christ," and "Justification and Sanctification."

c. Universalist Theology. Universalism was in many respects an expression of the English Enlightenment, particularly in its confidence in the innate goodness of man and his capacity for redemption. But it was also, originally, an evangelical faith, with much of the proselytizing spirit that characterized Methodism. Its English founder, James Relly, had been a Methodist, and Universalist thought shared Methodism's emphasis upon free grace and man's capacity to redeem himself by his own free-will effort. James Relly's *Union; or, a Treatise of the Consanguinity and Affinity between Christ and His Church* (Boston, n.d., a reprint of the original) was practically the Bible of John Murray, the founder of American Universalism. As an exposition of the doctrine of universal salvation, it is completely antinomian: *all* men are saved. Universalist theology in America tended to range from near-Calvinism to extreme liberalism. The conservative element is represented by Joseph Huntington's *Calvinism Improved; or, the Gospel Illustrated as a System of Real Grace, issuing in the Salvation of All Men, etc.* (New London, 1796). He remained in the orthodox Congregational ministry,

but was a Universalist, influenced by Relly; at first an Arminian, he became a Calvinist, but modified the doctrine by teaching universal salvation. Elhanan Winchester, originally a Baptist, the next great Universalist leader after Murray, founded his proofs upon orthodox premises, and was a "Restorationist," in: *The Universal Restoration Exhibited in Four Dialogues between a Minister and his Friend, etc.* (Litchfield, 1795); and *A Course of Lectures on the Prophecies that Remain to be Fulfilled* (Walpole, N.H., 1800). No early protagonist of Universalist theology surpassed Hosea Ballou, whose *A Series of Lecture Sermons* (Boston, 1832, 2nd ed.) reveals the extent to which Universalism was important as a step in the transition from Calvinism to the humanistic theism of the late nineteenth century, by its insistence upon the concept of God as a loving father, who desires the salvation of all his children. Ballou's thought was developed in *A Treatise on Atonement,* with an Introduction by A. A. Miner (Boston, 1882, 4th ed.), an exposition of an entire system of Universalist doctrine, treating sin, atonement, and consequences of atonement—opposed to the whole orthodox scheme. A general survey of Universalist theology, and of the controversy between Universalists and defenders of Calvinism, is in essays by Frank H. Foster, "The Eschatology of the New England Divines," in *Bibliotheca Sacra,* Vol. 45, no. 180 (Oct. 1888), pp. 669–694; and Vol. 46, no. 181 (Jan. 1889), pp. 95–123. He reviews the Universalist theological writers (James Relly, Joseph Huntington, Elhanan Winchester, Hosea Ballou), with references to their works, and bibliographical references in the footnotes; and surveys the replies to Relly and Winchester by Calvinists. Thomas Baldwin Thayer (1812–1886), in his *Theology of Universalism: Being an Exposition of Its Doctrines and Teachings . . .* (Boston, 1891), presents a modern exposition of Universalism as a theological *system,* which has attained the advanced position of liberalism of the *Tufts Papers on Religion, a Symposium* by Clarence R. Skinner, Bruce W. Brotherston, John

M. Ratcliff, and others of the faculty, Tufts College School of Religion (Boston, 1939). (See also Part Two, sect. III, D, *Universalism.*)

d. Anti-Calvinist New Lights. Richard McNemar's *The Kentucky Revival* (New York, 1846) includes an account of the doctrines of the "New Light" or Schismatic Presbyterians, who arose from the Second Great Awakening of 1800, by one of the leaders. Some of the "New Lights" withdrew to the Shakers, whose theological system probably has not been expounded more ably than by John Dunlavy, in *The Manifesto, or a Declaration of the Doctrine and Practice of the Church of Christ* (Pleasant Hill, Ky., 1818), an exposition of their explicit anti-Calvinism by the leading Shaker theologian, who used moralism, rationalism, and the anti-Edwardsean psychology of free-will to appeal to disaffected Calvinists. The Shakers drew many members from the Free-Will Baptists and "New Light" Presbyterians.

5. ANGLICAN THEOLOGY. The chief early expositor of American Anglican theology was Samuel Johnson, one of the two eminent theologians of the colonial period, the other being Jonathan Edwards. He was an idealist, who embraced Arminianism and so accepted the concept of freedom of the human will, which Edwards rejected. He shared Edwards' idealism, and for a time favored George Berkeley's, whereby "all ideas must exist in God's mind together without awareness of those ideas." Really he never forsook Puritan Platonism, according to which the human mind is independent of but related to the Divine Mind. Human independence and free will are properly attributed to those who are genuine agents of divine, original, and absolute Being. Johnson distinguished between reality and God, and inclined more and more toward the special revelation of Scripture as an antidote to free-thinking and Deism (see Part Two, sect. III, B, 3, *Deism Invades America*). He was convinced that the apostolic Church is "one of Christ's institutions," and found in Anglicanism "the surest avenue to peace of mind and public

order." The position of Johnson and his followers with respect to relations between the "New Science" of Locke and Newton and traditional philosophy and theology appears in Theodore Hornberger, "Samuel Johnson of Yale and King's College, a Note on the Relation of Science and Religion in Provincial America," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 8, no. 3 (Sept. 1935), pp. 378–397. An excellent, scholarly study of Johnson as a theologian, with his published theological writings and his previously unpublished works, is in Herbert W. Schneider and Carol Schneider, eds., *Samuel Johnson, President of King's College, His Career and Writings* (New York, 1929, 4 vols.), especially the "Noetica" and other theological and philosophical writings in Vol. II, to which should be added, for more biographical detail, Eben Edwards Beardsley, *Life and Correspondence of Samuel Johnson, D.D., Missionary of the Church of England in Connecticut, and first President of King's College, New York* (New York, 1874).

The tone of Anglican theology in the United States during the early national period was determined largely by Bishop William White of Pennsylvania, for many years Presiding Bishop of the Episcopal Church, and author of its early pastoral letters issued by the House of Bishops. White's theological contribution is assessed by Sydney Absalom Temple, *The Common Sense Theology of Bishop White: Selected Essays from the Writings of William White, 1748–1836 . . . with an Introductory Survey of his Theological Position* (New York, 1946), with bibliographical references in "Notes," and bibliography. Much of White's theological writing was "against all dualism of mind and matter such as destroys the ontological possibility of sacramental Christianity (such as Platonism)" (see Metcalf, pp. 20, 36). His theological sympathies harked back to the Elizabethan, Richard Hooker, and linked the Episcopal Church in the United States to the Anglican Reformation. Revival of interest in orthodox theology of the Reformation, represented by Neo-Orthodoxy, is re-

flected among Anglicans by interest in Elizabethan theologians, and modern Episcopalians are tending to approach White's theological position. A summary of his thought is offered by Leicester C. Lewis' "Notes on the Theology of Bishop White," in his pamphlet, *Advancing the Kingdom* (London, 1934); and valuable notes by a well-known Anglican historian, on his theology, appear also in Walter Herbert Stowe, *The Life and Letters of Bishop William White; together with the Services and Addresses Commemorating the one hundred fiftieth Anniversary of his Consecration to the Episcopate* (New York and Milwaukee, 1937; Church Historical Society, Publication no. 9).

The genesis of American Anglican High Church or Anglo-Catholic theology is clarified in a scholarly essay by W. G. Andrews, "The Parentage of American High Churchmanship," in *Protestant Episcopal Review*, Vol. 12, no. 4 (Jan. 1899), pp. 196–221. The theology of the early American Anglo-Catholics is traced to the Caroline English divines of the seventeenth century and the Nonjurors, and its descent from Samuel Johnson and his friends of the eighteenth-century Connecticut clergy, to Thomas B. Chandler of New Jersey; his son-in-law, Bishop John Henry Hobart of New York; and Bishop John Stark Ravenscroft of North Carolina. A formative influence in the development of Anglo-Catholic theology was that of Samuel Seabury, the first Bishop of Connecticut, who was in the tradition of the Nonjurors and of Samuel Johnson. His thought may be studied in his *Discourses on Several Subjects* (Hudson, N.Y., 1815, 2 vols.); and in papers by Edward Rochie Hardy, Jr., "The Significance of Seabury," in *American Church Monthly*, Vol. 37, no. 1 (Jan. 1935), pp. 26–40; and Frank H. Hallock, "Bishop Seabury's Sermons," *ibid.*, Vol. 15, no. 2 (April 1924), pp. 117–128. The Anglo-Catholic theological tradition was transmitted from Samuel Johnson to Thomas Bradbury Chandler, rector of St. John's Church in Elizabeth Town, N.J. His daughter married John Henry Hobart, who edited Chandler's biog-

raphy of Johnson. Hobart became a champion of High Church theology as Bishop of New York, until his death in 1830, and through his influence it became dominant in the Episcopal Church in the mid-nineteenth century. Many documents relating to Hobart's thought and influence are in *The Correspondence of John Henry Hobart* (New York, 1911–12, 6 vols.). A detailed and scholarly review of the rise of Anglo-Catholic theology in the American Episcopal Church occurs in George Edmed DeMille, *The Catholic Movement in the American Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, c.1941), with bibliography. Another survey of the Anglo-Catholic theology, and its differences from the Evangelical and Broad Church movements, is included in Edward Clowes Chorley, *Men and Movements in the Episcopal Church* (New York, 1946). Francis Joseph Hall, Bishop of Vermont, in his *Theological Outlines,* Revised by the Rev. Frank Judson Hallock . . . (Milwaukee, c.1933, 3rd ed.), with a bibliography, fairly represents the High Church or Anglo-Catholic school.

Anglican "Modernism": William Porcher DuBose. DuBose (1836–1918), a Southerner, in 1871 went to the University of the South, Sewanee, Tenn., as professor of moral science, and founded the theological department. He spent the rest of his life there, as a beloved teacher and pastor, writing theological works which were "almost completely unappreciated in America even by his fellow-Episcopalians" (see Ahlstrom essay, *Religion in American Life,* Volume One). He is now regarded as one of the few really important creative theologians in the American Episcopal Church. He was influenced by German theologians, particularly Neander's passion for history, Olshausen's feeling for the Church, and Dorner's concern for Christology; also by the Oxford Movement and the Mercersburg theology (see sect. II, F). Although an incarnational theologian, DuBose adopted evolutionary thought, and like Bushnell and the Transcendentalists, spoke of "the interfusion of the divine and the natural." His writings linked evolution and the incarnation. He was in the liberal tradition,

historical and optimistic, yet faithful to the witness of the historic Church. His thought is practically all contained in the following selected writings, which were repeatedly issued: *The Ecumenical Councils* . . . with an Introduction by the Rt. Rev. Thomas Gailor (New York, 1896), with bibliography, in "Ten Epochs of Church History," Vol. 3; and *The Gospel in the Gospels* (New York and London, 1906). Belated appreciations of DuBose and his theology are Theodore DuBose Bratton, *An Apostle of Reality; the Life and Thought of the Reverend William Porcher DuBose* . . . (London and New York, 1936), a series of lectures on the DuBose Foundation, delivered at the University of the South, Sewanee, Tenn.; John Sedberry Marshall, *The Word Made Flesh; the Theology of William Porcher DuBose,* Introduction by William T. Manning (Sewanee, Tenn., 1949); and John Owen Farquhar Murray, *DuBose as a Prophet of Unity* (London, New York, and Toronto, 1924), a series of lectures on the DuBose Foundation, delivered at the University of the South. DuBose's *Unity in the Faith,* ed. W. Norman Pittenger (Greenwich, Conn., 1957), with bibliography, reveals his ecumenical passion. The editor, himself a noted American Anglo-Catholic theologian, professor at the General Seminary in New York City, expresses the modern Anglo-Catholic outlook in *Theology and Reality; Essays in Restatement* (Greenwich, Conn., 1955); and in *Christian Affirmations* (New York, 1954). Lewis B. Smedes' *The Incarnation: Trends in Modern Anglican Thought* . . . (Kampen, 1953), with bibliography, in a general survey stresses the marked trend toward incarnational theology. The general history and changing trends in Anglican religious philosophy and theology in the United States may be conveniently reviewed in a very scholarly and clearly written essay by George Reuben Metcalf, "American Religious Philosophy and the Pastoral Letters of the House of Bishops," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church,* Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1958), particularly in ch. 2, "Types of Religious

Philosophy in the Pastoral Letters (1808–1953)," with many bibliographical footnotes; also ch. 4, "The Pastoral Letters and American Philosophy."

I. Lutheran Theology

The development of American Lutheran theology has been affected by issues outside Anglo-American traditions. The Lutheran Church adapted itself to American ecclesiastical voluntarism and revivalism, as did Benjamin Kurtz, editor of *The Lutheran Observer*, and Samuel Simon Schmucker (1799–1873), whose influence backed the organization of the national General Synod (1820) and the founding of Gettysburg Seminary (1826). Lutheranism became more "Lutherisch" after the massive immigration from Germany in the early nineteenth century, which resulted in the organization of new and more "Orthodox" synods. The trend is personified by Carl Ferdinand Wilhelm Walther (1811–1887), who has been called "easily the most commanding figure in the Lutheran Church of America during the nineteenth century" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). Educated in the tradition of German "Enlightenment Rationalism," he rebelled while a student at the University of Leipzig, and joined a group of Pietists and made a profound study of Luther—curiously like the Wesley group at Oxford a century before. He could not abide the state church, and with his brother migrated in 1839 from Saxony to the United States, with a group aiming to found a pure Lutheran Church in Missouri, the genesis of the Missouri Synod. He soon became a preeminent teacher and theologian, professor of theology in Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, 1849–1887. His influence as a conservator of orthodox Lutheranism is seen in *Walther and the Church*, by Wm. Dallmann, W. H. T. Dau, and Th. Engelder (ed.), Foreword by F. Pfotenhauer . . . (St. Louis, Mo., 1938), with an essay on "Walther a Christian Theologian." His life and influence are appreciated in

William Gustave Polack, *The Story of C.F.W. Walther* (St. Louis, 1947, rev. ed.). His views imparted to American Lutheranism one of its fundamental characteristics: "a strong emphasis on biblical rather than institutional authority, and on concern for questions of doctrine rather than church-order" (see Ahlstrom). His influence spread through the Lutheran churches and kept them loyal to the "biblical and doctrinal heritage" of the Reformation, resisting the revivalist and liberal tendency to emphasize the human part of salvation. Walther's attitude coincided with a reaction among Lutherans against revivalism, and a turning of American attention to philosophical, theological, and "churchly" concern in European Lutheran countries. The result was a profound split in American Lutheranism: between leaders who followed Walther, and those who followed Schmucker and Kurtz. Schmucker's *Definite Synodical Platform* (1855) made the conflict explicit, and the result was the withdrawal or expulsion of conservatives from the General Synod, and the organization of the "confessional" General Council in 1867. The continuous conservative position of the Missouri Synod is exhaustively comprised in the essays in its successive theological periodicals: *Theological Quarterly*, 1897–1920; *Theological Monthly*, 1921–1929; and *Concordia Theological Monthly*, 1930– . Recent conservative Lutheran theological thinking is surveyed by Theodore Ferdinand Karl Laetsch, ed., *The Abiding Word; an Anthology of Doctrinal Essays for the Year 1945–46* (St. Louis, 1946 [–47], 2 vols.), with bibliographies.

Samuel Simon Schmucker's (1799–1873) opposition is expressed in one of his early writings: *Elements of Popular Theology, with Special Reference to the Doctrines of the Reformation, as Avowed before the Diet at Augsburg in MDXXX* [1530] (Baltimore, 1842). In opposition to Walther and Krauth, he sympathized with the revivalistic "New Measures" prevalent in American Protestantism in the mid-nineteenth century. This volume, expounding his type of Lutheran doctrine, was repeatedly issued and very widely

read. A useful biography is Peter Anstadt, *Life and Times of Rev. S. S. Schmucker* (York, Pa., 1896), with a bibliography of his publications. His *Definite Synodical Platform*, published anonymously in 1855, made explicit the long-developing tension between the confessionally minded Lutherans like Walther and Krauth, and those like Schmucker and Kurtz, who were not primarily interested in the "churchly" thought of European Lutheranism, and based their idea of American Lutheranism upon rationalism, revivals, and popular American Puritanism. Their influence was counteracted by Charles Porterfield Krauth, in his repeatedly issued *The Conservative Reformation and Its Theology: as Presented in the Augsburg Confession, and in the History and Literature of the Evangelical Lutheran Church* (Philadelphia, 1899), with bibliographical footnotes, which considers the Lutheran Reformation, in the features distinguishing it from the Zwinglian and Calvinistic. This summary of his life work, considered "the most influential Lutheran doctrinal work of native American authorship" (see Ahlstrom), stresses the *Confessions*, and the Church, which must stand for definite doctrine. Like Nevin, he sought a clearer liturgical and doctrinal understanding of the Eucharist. His American manner and interests made the rebirth of Lutheran theology relevant, and provided a basis for dogmatic study. He was a major force in the organization and reforming of American Lutheranism in the post-Civil War period, just as Walther had influenced him. Adolph Spaeth's *Charles Porterfield Krauth* . . . (New York, 1898, 2 vols.) is still the best appreciation of American Lutheranism's greatest theological thinker. There is no comprehensive history of American Lutheran theology; the closest approach to a general study is Gothard Everett Arden, "The Interrelationships between Cultus and Theology in the History of the Lutheran Church in America" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1944, typewritten copy and microfilm available). Another useful general study is Vergilius Ferm, *The Crisis in American Lutheran Theology, A*

Study of the Issue Between American Lutheranism and Old Lutheranism (Grand Rapids, 1927), with a detailed bibliography and many quotations from minutes and periodicals.

J. Roman Catholic Theological Revival

CONTEMPORARY CATHOLIC THOUGHT IN AMERICA. In the present century American Roman Catholicism has gained greatly in self-confidence. Numerically it has become the largest single religious group, and it has acquired intellectual and social prestige. Consequently, Catholic propaganda (closely related to the popularizing of theology) has taken a more aggressive turn. The pattern followed by Brownson—the theory that the best defense is a strong offense—is the prevailing apologetic strategy of Catholic leaders. Bishop Fulton J. Sheen, in particular, has conducted a vigorous crusade for the mind and soul of America, insisting most positively that the Catholic way is the only way of salvation for our democracy and our whole civilization. Catholic apologists have always made a similar contention, but the newer strategy proceeds more confidently than ever before in America.

Nevertheless, American Roman Catholicism has yet to produce a creative theologian or philosopher of the first rank. Its really original thinkers of the present era—such as Gilson and Maritain—belong to the European tradition. The revival of Thomism has stimulated considerable philosophical activity among American Catholic scholars, yet their writings are not much known outside technical circles. It is interesting and significant that one of the most articulate Neo-Thomists has been Mortimer J. Adler, who is of Jewish birth. Of real importance are those Catholic spokesmen who, at a popular level, are seeking to make their faith *and theology* intelligible and acceptable to the American mind. Some concentrate on social and political matters, and their position is frequently far more liberal than that of even the most enlightened Prot-

estants. On the intellectual and strictly "religious" side, too, effective warfare is waged in behalf of the Catholic "case."

The deep background of the "case" is suggested by a few basic works on Catholic dogma and thought. J. L. Neve's *A History of Christian Thought* (Philadelphia, 1943), in Vol. 1 contains the history of dogma, including the theology of the Council of Trent (1549–1564), and in Vol. 2 has two short sections on modern phases of Roman Catholic theology. J. A. Moehler's *Symbolism, or Exposition of the Doctrinal Differences Between Catholics and Protestants*, tr. J. B. Robertson (London, 1906), is described as "a stimulating, incisively penetrating study of Roman theology in contrast to Protestantism" (F. E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America*, 1956, p. 122). George D. Smith, *The Teaching of the Catholic Church, a Summary of Catholic Doctrine* (New York, 1948, 2 vols.) is "a collection of essays by recognized Roman Catholic theologians" (*ibid.*). Edwin A. Burtt, in *Types of Religious Philosophy* (New York, 1939), ch. 2, discusses "The Catholic Philosophy of Religion," the main propositions of Scholastic and more specifically of Thomistic theology. Other general surveys of Catholic thought are Karl Adam, *The Spirit of Catholicism*, tr. Justin McCann (New York, 1937); and *One and Holy*, tr. Cecily Hastings (New York, 1951). Étienne Gilson's *Reason and Revelation in the Middle Ages* (New York, 1938) is a consideration of the problem of moral authority, by a French Catholic philosopher, who has widely influenced Catholic philosophy in the United States.

Renewed interest in Newman's theory of theological development, and in essentials of Roman Catholic dogma, has led to a remarkable proliferation of American publications of books on basic doctrine. Among the more significant volumes is John Henry (Cardinal) Newman's *An Essay on the Development of Christian Doctrine*, new ed., ed. with a pref. and introd. by Charles Frederick Harrold (New York, 1949, text that of the rev. ed. of 1878, with select bibliography and bib-

liographical footnotes). Other works of major importance, intended to place theological study upon a solid documentary and historical foundation, are: Anton Charles Pegis, ed., *The Wisdom of Catholicism* (New York, 1949), with bibliography; Pietro Parente, *Dictionary of Dogmatic Theology* [with] Antonio Piolante [and] Salvatore Garofalo, tr. from the 2nd Italian ed. by Emmanuel Doronzo, 1st English ed. (Milwaukee, 1951), with bibliography; *Theological Library*, by a group of theologians under the editorship of A. M. Henry, tr. William Storey (Chicago, 1954–); Gerardus Cornelius van Noort, *Dogmatic Theology*, tr. and rev. by John J. Castelot and William R. Murphy (Westminster, Md., 1955–), including bibliographies; *The Church Teaches; Documents of the Church in English Translation* . . . tr. and prepared for publication by John F. Clarkson and others of St. Mary's College, St. Marys, Kansas (St. Louis, c.1955), taken principally from the 24th, 28th, and 29th eds. of Heinrich Denzinger's *Enchiridion Symbolorum;* and Denzinger's *The Sources of Catholic Dogma*, tr. Roy J. Deferrari from the 30th ed. of *Enchiridion Symbolorum* (St. Louis, 1957), with bibliographical footnotes.

Samuel G. Craig presents a brief review of *The Revival of Theology in the Roman Catholic Church* . . . (Philadelphia, c.1938), with a bibliography. Much of the writing on revived Roman Catholic theology is found not in formal theological treatises, but in popular works presenting the Church to the American mind as a faith and a culture. Adam Andrew Micek's *The Apologetics of Martin John Spalding* (Washington, D.C., 1951) is a study of a noted American bishop who was a leader in explaining the faith to Americans, and in reviving interest in the Thomistic or Scholastic philosophy and theology. One of the most convincing modern evidences of the serious attempt to revitalize and interpret the Scholastic spirit, so earnestly urged by Pope Leo XIII, is the establishment of a periodical, *The Thomist; a Speculative Quarterly* (New York, 1939–), ed. the Dominican Fathers

of the Province of St. Joseph. The effort of scholars to revive the classic theology and to adjust it to the modern American temper is perhaps nowhere better represented than in the writings of Mortimer Jerome Adler, beginning with his *Saint Thomas and the Gentiles* (Milwaukee, 1938). This consists of the Aquinas Lectures under the auspices of the Aristotelian Society, Marquette University, 1938, maintaining that the true Thomism is not mere acceptance of St. Thomas' conclusions as final, but seeking truth in his way. He continues in *Problems for Thomists; the Problem of Species* (New York, 1940), a revision of papers in *The Thomist*, with an index of references to Aristotle and St. Thomas, an effort to present Thomism as a developing philosophy, to reconcile it with evolutionary ideas, and to revitalize the tradition of Scholasticism. Adler's passion for popularizing Thomism appears in his determination to make familiar to Americans the Sholastic studies of Jacques Maritain, in his edition of Maritain's *Scholasticism and Politics* (New York, 1940), consisting of lectures delivered in the United States in 1938 and translated by Adler.

The revival has inspired the publication of a large number of popular and semi-popular works, intended to present Catholic doctrine primarily to the layman. From these may be selected the following: Joseph Clifford Fenton, *The Concept of Sacred Theology* (Milwaukee, c.1941), with bibliographical footnotes; Matthias Joseph Scheeben, *The Mysteries of Christianity* . . . , tr. Cyril Vollert (St. Louis, 1947); and his *Nature and Grace*, tr. Cyril Vollert (St. Louis, 1954); Henri de Lubac, *Catholicism; a Study of Dogma in Relation to the Corporate Destiny of Mankind* (New York, 1950), tr. Lancelot C. Sheppard, with bibliographical footnotes; Cyril C. Martindale, *The Faith of the Roman Church* (New York, 1951); Emile Mersch, *The Theology of the Mystical Body*, tr. Cyril Vollert (St. Louis, 1951); Charles Journet, *The Wisdom of Faith, an Introduction to Theology*, tr. R. F. Smith (Westminster, Md., 1952), a translation of

Introduction à la Théologie, with bibliographical references in footnotes; James Canon Bastible, ed., *Fundamentals of Catholic Dogma*, tr. from the German by Patrick Lynch (St. Louis, 1954?), including bibliography; Paul Haberer Hallett, *What Is Catholicity?* (Cleveland, 1955), including bibliography; and Francis J. Sheed, *Theology for Beginners* (New York, 1957). Sheed's *Theology and Sanity* (New York, 1947), by a scholarly layman, is valuable for an understanding of the attitude of intelligent Catholics toward contemporary attacks on religion, and particularly on their own faith. Fulton J. Sheen's *The Philosophy of Religion* (New York, 1948) is an excellent example of the attempt of Catholic spokesmen, at a popular level, to make their faith intelligible and acceptable to the American mind in simplified theological terms. His "Decline of Historical Liberalism," in *Communism and the Conscience of the West* (Indianapolis, 1948), presents a Roman Catholic view of the retreat of liberalism before the revival of Catholic religious philosophy and theology. Two useful books to compare Roman Catholic with other present-day theologies are: John W. Moran, *Catholic Faith and Modern Theologies; the Theology of Emil Brunner* (Worcester, Mass., 1948), with bibliographical footnotes; and Gustave Weigel, *A Survey of Protestant Theology in Our Day* (Westminster, Md., 1954), with bibliography. One should consult also the individual monographs in Catholic University of America, *Studies in Sacred Theology*, 1st and 2nd series; and Woodstock College, *Theological Studies*, 1940– , quarterly (New York, America Press, 1940–). A primary source for essays concerning the history, development, and revival of Roman Catholic theology in America is the *Ecclesiastical Review* (Washington, D.C., Jan. 1889–).

The history of Roman Catholic seminaries in the United States still lacks a scholarly and comprehensive study. The story up to the Second Plenary Council of Baltimore is related in two works: Lloyd Paul McDonald, *The Seminary Movement in the United States; Projects, Foundations and Early*

Development, 1784–1833 (Washington, D.C., 1927), with bibliography; continued by William Stephen Morris [same title], 1833–1866 (Washington, D.C., 1932), with bibliography. Two typical histories and descriptions of Roman Catholic seminaries, based upon real scholarship, are: Robert F. McNamara, *The American College in Rome, 1855–1955*, Foreword by His Eminence, Edward (Cardinal) Mooney (Rochester, N.Y., 1956), with bibliographical note and bibliography in notes; and *St. Charles Seminary, Overbrook, A History . . . 1832–1943* (Philadelphia, 1943), with documentary appendix and bibliography. Pope Pius XII set forth the most recent standards adopted by the Holy See for theological training, in *The Apostolic Constitution: Sedes Sapientiae and the General Statutes Annexed to it on the Religious, Clerical, and Apostolic Training to be Imparted to Clerics in the States of Perfection to be Acquired* (Washington, D.C., 1957, 2nd ed.).

III. THEOLOGY AND MODERN SCIENCE

A. General History

1. PURITANISM AND SCIENCE. The Puritans conceived of God as free to penetrate history at will at any moment. Because the modern mind generally thinks of "science" as a body of immutable laws, there has been a tendency to believe that the Puritan religious mentality was inimical to the scientific spirit. Such was not the case. Although in the Puritan scale of values salvation was more important than the investigation of natural phenomena, man was free to study nature so long as he did not stop simply with the fact. Nature was symbolic, and nature study in the proper spirit was commendable, because it would inevitably discover God in the laws which governed the universe. The question whether Puritanism was receptive toward science as a body of data must be carefully distinguished from the question whether Puritanism was receptive

toward science as a method of experimental induction. Science to the Puritan was still a handmaid of religion, and was used to bolster the claims of theology. The following titles on American Puritanism and science indicate that in the early history of American religion and theology there was no "conflict between science and religion" such as later developed, especially after the coming of the doctrine of Evolution.

Frederick E. Brasch includes notes on clerical interest in the "New Science" in "The Royal Society of London and Its Influence upon Scientific Thought in the American Colonies," in *Scientific Monthly*, Vol. 33 (Oct. 1931), pp. 336–355, 448–469. Colonial science was dominated by Puritanism, natural theology, and supernaturalism, until the English school of rationalism and empiricism after the Revolution. And Brasch's *Sir Isaac Newton, 1727–1927* (London, 1928) discusses "Newton's First Critical Disciple in the American Colonies—John Winthrop [Jr.]" showing the interest of Puritans in the "New Science." Theodore R. Hornberger illustrates this point in "American Puritanism and the Rise of the Scientific Mind" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1934); and in "Science and the New World," in *Catalogue of the Huntington Library* (1937), pp. 3–18. Hornberger's "The Date, the Source, and the Significance of Cotton Mather's Interest in Science," in *American Literature*, Vol. 6, no. 4 (Jan. 1935), pp. 413–420, by revealing his genuine scientific spirit, helps to redress the balance against Parrington's denigration of Mather as merely a "morbid priest." The same writer's "Puritanism and Science: the Relationship Revealed in the Writings of John Cotton," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (Sept. 1937), pp. 503–515, with references in footnotes, combats the view of many, including H. W. Schneider, that the Puritans were anti-scientific. They welcomed science, as did Cotton, for practical purposes, and as a homiletic aid to drive home spiritual truth. Such receptivity opened the way to advance. In "The Science of Thomas Prince," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 9, no. 1 (Mar.

1936), pp. 26–42, with references in the footnotes, he shows how Prince's scientific interests, like those of Cotton Mather, illustrate the function of the New England clergy in spreading scientific knowledge. Prince, an educator in the pulpit, even more than Mather tried to reconcile Newtonian science with religion. Samuel Eliot Morrison's *Harvard College in the Seventeenth Century* (Cambridge, Mass., 1936), in chs. 10–12, deals with the Puritan teaching of mathematics, astronomy, physics, and medicine, and their relation to religion.

2. THE MODERN WRESTLE OF RELIGION AND SCIENCE. The battles between science and religion in the colonial period were mild in comparison with those of the succeeding century, when the new geology began to upset the Biblical chronology, and the doctrine of Evolution questioned the orthodox concept of the origin of mankind. There had always been more or less conflict, and the atmosphere of the coming struggle in America is suggested by Andrew Dickson White's *A History of the Warfare of Science with Theology in Christendom* (London, 1896, 2 vols.), which provides about the most comprehensive introduction to the topic. Edward Arthur White's *Science and Religion in American Thought; the Impact of Naturalism* (Stanford, Calif., 1952) has bibliographical footnotes, covers a century, and analyzes the thought of leading American intellectuals. Eminent scientists have not been openly hostile to all aspects of Christianity or unconcerned about the relations of science and religion. The author gives a good brief account of the evolutionary controversy, and displays an avowedly Christian point of view, set in a popular and scholarly text. Edward LeRoy Long, Jr., in *Religious Beliefs of American Scientists* (Philadelphia, 1952) works out a systematic study of types of religious philosophy in the book-length credos of American natural scientists: seeking to derive religious philosophy from known scientific truths, and to reconcile scientific facts with given religious viewpoints. Scientists hold no religious view uniquely their own, and the credos suggest that science and religion are different categories. Rec-

onciliation truly comes in the dialectical attempt to relate both to a total world view. Some of the most enlightening insights into the religion-and-science problem are the papers and comments scattered through the collection of volumes, *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium: 1940–1955* (New York, 1941–1956). Among the significant papers are: Albert Einstein (Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton), "Science and Religion," Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 209–214; Hudson Hoagland (Clark University), "Some Comments on Science and Faith," Vol. 2, 1941 (New York, 1942), pp. 33–55, with comments by others; Walter M. Horton (Oberlin), "Theology, Science, and the Humanities," Vol. 5, 1944 (New York, 1945), pp. 677–690, with comment; E. Jerome Johanson (Hartford Theological Seminary), "Two Problems in the Relations Between the Natural Sciences and Theology," Vol. 5, 1944 (New York, 1945), pp. 709–722; Alfred C. Lane (Tufts College), "Some Common Aims of Science and Religion," Vol. 8, 1947 (New York, 1948), pp. 486–494. A lucid analysis of the interaction between science and religion is given by Edwin E. Aubrey, in "Religious Bearings of the Modern Scientific Movement," in John T. McNeill and others, eds., *Environmental Factors in Christianity* (Chicago, 1939), pp. 361–379.

It would be impossible to list all of the special studies of the impact made by developments in science upon the attitudes of individual men toward religion. An example of unpublished material is Mentor Lee Williams, "Oliver Wendell Holmes: The Impact of Science upon Religion in the 'Authentic Brahmin'" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1938). Another unpublished piece is Philip Henry Phenix's "Infinitude: A Study of Science, Theology, and the Scientific Spirit, with Special Reference to the 'New Physics'" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1950; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, Mich.). Among published books should be mentioned Henry Nelson Wieman's *Religious Experience and Scientific Method* (New York, 1927), and his

The Wrestle of Religion with Truth (New York, 1928). For contrast, see Derwyn Randolph Grier Owen's *Scientism, Man, and Religion* (Philadelphia, c.1952).

Few fields of study are more prolific at the present time than that of the philosophy of science, but little attention has been paid to religion by authors in this field. Perhaps the best of recent works by philosophers who are attentive to problems in the philosophy of science is *New Essays in Philosophical Theology*, Antony Flew and Alasdair MacIntyre, eds. (London, 1955).

The application of scientific method to the study of religion is discussed in the symposium "What Constitutes a Scientific Interpretation of Religion?" in the *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 6, no. 3 (May 1926), pp. 225–258.

B. Theology and Evolution

1. EVOLUTIONARY PHILOSOPHY AND RELIGION. Just as Transcendentalism was in part a reaction against the Enlightenment, so the "cosmic philosophy" inspired by the doctrine of Evolution was a reaction against the "irrational and unscientific character of transcendentalist and Calvinist pronouncements" (see Metcalf, ref. to "cosmic philosophy"). The "cosmic philosophy," however, did not come without a long struggle between traditional theology and the new science, represented by the doctrine of Evolution; a type of warfare largely unknown to the early American Puritan theologians (see sect. III, A, 1). American interest in the biological origins of mankind long antedated Darwin's *Origin of Species* (1859). As early as the end of the eighteenth century, some scientifically minded academic men became interested in evolutionary biology. The Rev. Samuel Stanhope Smith, president (1795–1812) of Princeton, in 1787 gave an address to the American Philosophical Society on human differences of appearance: *An Essay on the Causes of the Variety of Complexion and Figures in the Human Species, To Which are Added Strictures on*

Lord Kaim's Discourse, on the Original Diversity of Mankind (Philadelphia, 1787). This mild and religiously innocuous interest sharpened into conflict with the coming of Evolution, as is shown by Bert James Loewenberg, in "The Impact of the Doctrine of Evolution on American Thought, 1859–1900" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1934; in Harvard University Library).

2. EVOLUTION AND THE SCIENTISTS. Loewenberg's "The Reaction of American Scientists to Darwinism," in *American Historical Review*, Vol. 38, no. 4 (July 1933), pp. 687–701, with much bibliography in footnotes, analyzes three views. Agassiz' objection, not religious but intellectual, heartened theologians who believed that it sustained the old theology. Asa Gray, evolutionist and "unflinching theist," believed that the theory did not take "the first cause" from the realm of faith. James Dwight Dana was an evolutionist, but believed in a creating deity. Loewenberg's "Darwinism Comes to America, 1859–1900," in *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*, Vol. 28, no. 3 (Dec. 1941), pp. 339–368, with many bibliographical references in footnotes, emphasizes theological orthodoxy and the formal classical curriculum as impediments to scientific culture. The preparation for naturalistic interpretation of religious belief lay in the undermining of "special creationism." He reviews the reactions of various schools of thought, and mentions preachers who made Evolution "respectable," and the emergence of *immanence* and social Christianity. Theistic "creationism" remained the basic American view, and Darwinism attacked not its substance but its linguistic formulations. Philip P. Wiener's "Chauncey Wright's Defense of Darwin and the Neutrality of Science," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 6, no. 1 (Jan. 1945), pp. 19–45, with extensive bibliography in footnotes, sees the chief historical significance of his defense in his insistence upon the metaphysical and ethical neutrality of scientific method. As a "consistent empiricist" he was anxious to protect scientific inquiry from dynamic theology. Another evidence of Wright's defense of

Evolution against attacks is his own essay, "Evolution of Self-consciousness," in Charles Eliot Norton, ed., *Philosophical Discussion* (New York, 1877). A significant expression of the scientific point of view, during the heated debate on evolutionary theory, is one by the noted paleontologist, Edward Drinker Cope (1840–1897): *The Theology of Evolution; a Lecture* (Philadelphia, c.1887). A modern view, by a celebrated physicist, is Robert Andrews Millikan, *Evolution in Science and Religion . . .* (New Haven, 1927), consisting of three lectures at Yale. He sketches the evolution of physics for the last thirty years, and considers "the relations between new truth and old as revealed in the history of physics," and the evolution of religion under scientific influence, for the layman. A kind of summation of the whole matter appears in William E. Ritter, "Reason, Emotion, Morals and Religion in the Darwinian Theory of Evolution," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium*, Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 248–278.

3. TYPICAL RELIGIOUS REACTIONS TO EVOLUTION. Windsor Hall Roberts presents a general picture of the development in "The Reaction of American Protestant Churches to the Darwinian Philosophy, 1860–1900" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1936; partly published Chicago, 1938, lithoprinted, with bibliographical footnotes). Frank Hugh Foster, *The Modern Movement in American Theology; Sketches in the History of American Protestant Thought from the Civil War to the World War* (New York, c.1939), continues his *Genetic History of the New England Theology*, with references at the end of most of the chapters, and discusses the reaction of the theologians to the Darwinian hypothesis, from the period when it became generally known, specifically in ch. 3, "The Reception of Evolution by Theologians." Richard Hofstadter's *Social Darwinism in American Thought* (Philadelphia, 1945) describes the reception of Darwinism in America, the tremendous controversy provoked by it, and its challenge to orthodox religious notions and theology. Stow

Persons, ed., "Evolution and Theology in America," in his *Evolutionary Thought in America* (New Haven, 1950), relates how certain American religious thinkers attempted to bring Christian theology into line with evolutionary ideas. Avery Milton Church, "The Reaction of the American Pulpit to the Modern Scientific Movement from 1850–1900" (Doctoral dissertation, Southern Baptist Seminary), reviews the "warfare of science with theology," which arose as a result of the rise of the doctrine of Evolution, and which eventually resulted in its general acceptance and its use as a means of developing an evolutionary concept of theology. Gradual acceptance by American theologians and preachers, and their adaptation of theology to it, is demonstrated also in Henry Sloane Coffin, *Religion Yesterday and Today* (Nashville, 1940), and in Carl F. H. Henry, *Fifty Years of Protestant Theology* (Boston, 1950). Herbert W. Schneider's "The Influence of Darwin and Spencer on American Philosophical Theology," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 6, no. 1 (Jan. 1945), pp. 3–18, with considerable bibliography in footnotes, summarizes four philosophical attitudes on the question of evolutionary theology: (1) "Complete separation of revelation and science accepted by conservative scientists and evangelical clergy." (2) "Justification of revealed theology and supernatural selection by a theological version of Darwinian natural selection." (3) "Justification of liberal or rationalistic theology by a theological version of the Spencerian doctrine of progressive adaptation and the evanescence of evil." (4) "Restriction of evolutionary theory to specific scientific problems, the restriction of religion to practical problems, and the separation of philosophy from both."

Special studies will illustrate various aspects of the accommodation. Ira V. Brown's "Lyman Abbott: Christian Evolutionist," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 23, no. 2 (June 1950), pp. 218–231, with bibliographical footnotes, states that his "reconciliation" of Evolution and religion was vague and superficial, but encouraged a friendly attitude toward science,

preserved spiritual values, and encouraged a progressive social outlook. Robert B. Notestein, in his "The Moralist Rigorism of W.[illiam] G.[raham] Sumner," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 16, no. 3 (June 1955), pp. 389–400, with some bibliographical references in footnotes, holds that Sumner, the so-called "Social Darwinist," exalted the religiously inculcated virtues of temperance, chastity, frugality, industry, and devotion to duty, which should be rewarded, "Because for Sumner the priest they were the external signs of inward grace, and for Sumner the social scientist they were the prerequisites for survival and success in a world governed by natural law." Bert James Loewenberg's "The Controversy over Evolution in New England, 1859–1873," in *New England Quarterly*, Vol. 8, no. 2 (June 1935), pp. 232–257, with extensive bibliographical references in footnotes, states that arguments against the concept were largely theological or Biblical: the Bible is not a book of science, but of religion and morals, and does not deny evolutionary development. The strongest argument was against scientific method, by reassertion of the classical dualism between intuitive and empirical faculties. A good account of the reaction of New England theologians is found in Daniel Day Williams, *The Andover Liberals; a Study in American Theology* (New York, 1941), particularly in "Evolutionary Philosophies," "Ethics and Evolution," and "Evolution and Historical Criticism." Charles Hodge, *What is Darwinism?* (New York, 1874) illustrates typical opposed arguments of the most prominent Protestant theologian of his day, stating the case against the evolutionary hypothesis. A more liberal viewpoint was that of his neighbor, the president of Princeton, James McCosh, in *The Religious Aspect of Evolution* . . . (New York, 1888). As early as 1850, before coming to America, he had been something of an evolutionist, believing in spontaneous variations introduced by God. Such special providences cause a gradual adaptation of nature to fulfillment of the eternal purposes of God's will. Supernatural design produces natural selection, Darwin's

discoveries are an exposition of general revelation. John H. Gerstner, Jr., "Scotch Realism: Kant and Darwin in the Philosophy of James McCosh" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1945, typewritten, Harvard University Library, HU90.4764, 2 copies), discusses his restoration of natural theology, his opposition to Kant as implicitly idealistic or agnostic, and sympathy toward Darwin when conservatives were generally hostile. He tried to support Evolution by Biblical as well as philosophical arguments, and stressed Darwin's latent theistic features, but rejected his account of morals. Joseph Smith Van Dyke, on the other hand, in *Theism and Evolution; an Examination of Modern Speculative Theories as Related to Theistic Conceptions of the Universe,* with an Introduction by Archibald A. Hodge (New York, 1886), represents a conservative Presbyterian viewpoint, typical of the Princeton "school" of theologians. Other conservative positions are reflected in Howard MacQueary, *The Evolution of Man and Christianity* (New York, 1890); and Edgar Payson Powell, *Our Heredity from God, Consisting of Lectures on Evolution* (New York, 1897, 4th ed.), with bibliography. Liberal views are illustrated by Woods Hutchinson, *The Gospel According to Darwin* (Chicago, c.1898), and John Calvin Kimball, *The Romance of Evolution, and Its Relation to Religion* (Boston, 1913), essays given as lectures before the Brooklyn Ethical Society, the Meadville Theological School, and various clubs and societies. The division of opinion among Roman Catholics appears in John Lee Morrison, "A History of American Catholic Opinion on the Theory of Evolution, 1859–1950" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Missouri, with bibliography; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor, Mich. (1951) pub. no. 2894; *Microfilm Abstracts,* Vol. 11 (1951), pp. 1007–1008). They tried to establish an independent position, critical of developments in non-Catholic scientific thought, condemning social Darwinism completely, and accepting the more patently theistic conception of Evolution, with a long-range tendency toward increasing toleration. Sister Mary Frederick's *Religion and Evolution Since 1859;*

Some Effects of the Theory of Evolution on the Philosophy of Religion . . . (South Bend? Ind., 1935), with bibliography, also reveals aspects of Roman Catholic opinion. Other recent bibliographical data appear in Gail Kennedy, ed., *Evolution and Religion, the Conflict between Science and Theology in Modern America*, in "Problems in American Civilization, Readings Selected by the Department of American Studies, Amherst College" (Boston, 1957).

4. EVOLUTION OF JOHN FISKE'S COSMIC PHILOSOPHY: THE FAITH OF AN EVOLUTIONIST. Fiske, inspired by modern science (especially by Von Humboldt, Buckle, and Spencer), tried to construct a comprehensive and logical account of the universe in temporal, phenomenal and progressive terms. He meant a cosmos revealing an infinite and eternal power making for righteousness and being the eternal source of all phenomena. He was in revolt against the "orthodox drama of damnation, so repellent to those outside the fold, and the machine-like Newtonian world . . ." which appeared to be artificial. He was attracted rather by "the cosmic, organic, evolutionary picture drawn by the scientists." Fiske looked for God, and believed that he found Him in the organic development of nature. In short, Evolution was united with the concept of God (for quotations, see Metcalf, ref. to "cosmic philosophy," pp. 50–51). Fiske's splendid vision is revealed in *Outlines of Cosmic Philosophy, Based on the Doctrine of Evolution, with Criticisms on the Positive Philosophy* . . . (Boston, 1875, 2 vols.), and is discussed by Josiah Royce, "Introduction" to Fiske's *Outlines of Cosmic Philosophy* . . . (Boston, 1903). Fiske's *The Idea of God as Affected by Modern Knowledge* (Boston and New York, 1886) gives the clearest summary of his position as the chief propagandist for Darwinist views in America, especially important for his effort to reconcile Darwinism with Christianity. The type of theism that reaches its conclusion through the study of nature is exemplified by Fiske, particularly in his *Through Nature to God* (Boston and New York, 1899), with its discussions of the mystery of evil, the cosmic roots of love and self-sacrifice,

and the everlasting reality of religion. H. Burnell Pannill's *The Religious Faith of John Fiske* (Durham, N.C., 1957) is a revised form of a doctoral dissertation, "John Fiske: Cosmic Theist" (Duke University, Durham, N.C., 1952). He attempts to evaluate the work of Fiske as a popular exponent of evolutionary theism, with considerable attention to the sources of his thought and that of contempoaries in religion, philosophy, and science. Fiske is a stimulating example of the attempt to adjust the Christian message to contemporary thought patterns. Its slight influence was due to failure to recognize the limits of any scientific verification of religious truth. The bibliography is practically a review of all books and periodical articles on the relations of religion and theology to science and philosophy in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Herbert W. Schneider, *A History of American Philosophy* (New York, 1946), in chs. 30–32, on the intellectual context of Fiske's work, states that he was not a first-rate thinker, but important in the history of American thought, as one of the most thoroughgoing and widely read advocates of the evolutionary philosophy, devoting himself to a reinterpretation of theism in the light of a broadly based philosophy of evolution. Other useful reviews are John Spencer Clark, *The Life and Letters of John Fiske* (New York, 1917, 2 vols.), especially chs. 20 and 21, Vol II, with a commentary on Fiske's philosophy regarding Evolution; and I. Woodbridge Riley, *American Thought from Puritanism to Pragmatism and Beyond* (New York, 1923), with comment on Fiske's evolutionary position. A perceptive treatment of Fiske is provided in Philip Paul Wiener, *Evolution and the Founders of Pragmatism* (Cambridge, Mass., 1949).

C. Evolutionary Religion and Theology

CHRISTIANITY AND EVOLUTION: A MEDIATING POSITION. The nineteenth century witnessed the beginning of bitter conflict between science and religion. In the first half and even earlier,

the physical sciences had begun to make their impact upon religious thinking, particularly in Biblical studies. Geology and archaeology forced a revision of traditional Biblical chronology, and the scientific methodology of "Higher Criticism" demolished cherished notions concerning the age, authorship, and historical reliability of individual documents within the Bible. Critics treated the Bible simply as another book, and subjected it to analysis that was not always reverent. Intellectual defenders of Christian orthodoxy found it hard to resist these apparent attacks on the stronghold of faith, and many earnest Christians searched for a valid reconciliation between the new science and the old faith. The controversy over the evolutionary hypothesis and its philosophical implications further aggravated the predicament of religion. Religionists reacted in various ways, from virtually total rejection of all that science (Evolution, in particular) professed to reveal, to equally total acceptance of science, with a consequent rejection of most tenets of orthodox belief. There were mediators, however, who tried to make Christianity compatible with science. Henry Ward Beecher, Newman Smyth, and Lyman Abbott represent the mediating attitude, seeking to reinterpret essential Christian convictions in terms congenial with the assured conclusions of the latest scientific theories.

This task of accommodation was made vastly easier by the extent to which the old Calvinism had already been watered down by the romantic tendencies of the earlier part of the century. Henry Ward Beecher, pastor of the Plymouth Church in Brooklyn, and the most celebrated preacher of his day, was a representative embodiment of this romanticized Christianity. This fact made it easy for him to accept evolutionary science, and his capitulation to Darwin had an enormous influence on the whole Protestant community. This "romantic" evolutionary theology, together with Biblical criticism, produced the dominant liberal Protestant theology of the late nineteenth century, which lasted until the rise of Neo-Orthodoxy in the 1930's. Beecher's approach to the

problem of accommodation appears in his *Yale Lectures on Preaching* (New York, 1872, 1873). Although he was not a systematic thinker of any great ability, his kind of "romantic Christianity" was a necessary background for the development of an evolutionary theology. His *Evolution and Religion* (New York, 1885) summarized his religious philosophy, and at the time popularized evolutionary theology. Paxton Hibben, *Henry Ward Beecher: an American Portrait* (New York, 1927), with "Sources Cited" and "Notes" by chapters, asserts that Beecher was not a pioneer in the great work of liberalizing American theology and religion, but a voice who proclaimed the changes in words the masses could understand. His evolution from a New England Calvinistic Puritan into a modern religious liberal mirrored exactly what took place in the American mind, and he popularized the religion of growth and experience rather than that of dogma. A far more weighty intellectual approach was that of Lyman Abbott, who acknowledged the great popularizer's service in *Henry Ward Beecher* (Boston, 1904) as a friend and admirer. Abbott's own more closely reasoned apologia for evolutionary religion and theology was developed in *The Evolution of Christianity* (Boston, 1892); *The Theology of an Evolutionist* (New York and Boston, 1897), an excellent summary of his theological position; and *Reminiscences* (Boston, 1915), his account of the evolution of his religious ideas. Ira V. Brown's *Lyman Abbott: Christian Evolutionist* (Cambridge, 1953) commends Henry Ward Beecher's successor as pastor of Plymouth Church as a major architect of the new theology. Practically as much could be said for the stature of Newman Smyth, long-time pastor of the First Church (Congregational) of New Haven, who promoted the new faith in *Old Faiths in New Light* (New York, 1879); and in *Through Science to Faith* (New York, 1902). A prominent Unitarian minister, Minot J. Savage, had no difficulty in accommodating Evolution to his theology, as is shown in his *The Religion of Evolution* (Boston, 1876). George Aaron

Barton's *Christ and Evolution; a Study of the Doctrine of Redemption in the Light of Modern Knowledge* (Philadelphia, 1934) summarizes, from a conservative point of view, the bearing of evolutionary theory on a particular aspect of Christian doctrine.

D. The Rise of Biblical Criticism

(For remarks upon the general effects of modern, scientific Biblical criticism upon the development of theology see the general note at the beginning of sect. III, C, *Evolutionary Religion and Theology.*)

T. K. Cheyne's *Founders of Old Testament Criticism, Biographical, Descriptive, and Critical Studies* (New York, 1893) is described as "judiciously sympathetic" (Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christianity*, 1953, p. 1157). A more recent study of the rise and development of Biblical criticism is Samuel Terrien's article, "The Modern Period," in Vol. I of the *Interpreter's Bible* (New York and Nashville, 12 vols., 1952–1957), pp. 127–141. The most comprehensive recent account of the progress of Old Testament criticism is given by Emil G. Kraeling, *The Old Testament Since the Reformation* (New York, 1956). Another indispensable survey of modern Biblical research is H. R. Willoughby, ed., *The Study of the Bible, Today and Tomorrow* (Chicago, 1947). Charles Farace, "The History of Old Testament Higher Criticism in the United States" (Doctoral dissertation, Divinity School, University of Chicago, 1939, partly published by University of Chicago Libraries, Chicago, 1939), has discussions of Moses Stuart, Theodore Parker and others, and about half of it consists of bibliographies. The technical labor behind the new criticism is described in John L. Cheek, "The Translation of the Greek New Testament in America: a Phase of the History of American Criticism and Interpretation" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1938, partly published, University of Chicago, 1942, lithoprinted).

Such careful scholarship provided the solid foundation for the development described by Donald S. Klaiss, "The History of the Interpretation and Criticism of the New Testament in America, 1620–1900" (B.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, 1934; abstract entitled "The Early History of the Interpretation of the New Testament in America," typewritten, University of Chicago Library).

The serious problems raised by the new Higher Criticism, and the adjustment of theological study to the flood of new knowledge, appear in two studies in the *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium:* Donald W. Riddle, "New Testament Study and the Time-Lag," Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 369–378; and William F. Albright, "Archaeology and Religion," Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 279–306. An example of the way in which an individual teacher of progressive tendency met the problems is presented by Lester Hubert Colloms, *Wilbur Fisk Tillett, Christian Educator* (Louisville, Ky., 1949), with bibliography, a revision and rearrangement of a doctoral thesis, Duke University, Durham, N.C., 1942. Based upon primary sources, this reviews the life and work of Tillett (1854–1936), teacher and administrator at Vanderbilt University, as a pioneer in theological education in the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. He had a wide influence through his writings, showing the effect of new scientific and religious thought, especially in Biblical interpretation, as an example of the changed attitude of innumerable liberal ministers. The eventual issuance of the new criticism in popular preaching has been studied in William McLeister, "The Use of the Bible in the Sermons of Selected Protestant Preachers in the United States from 1925 to 1950" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, *University Microfilms,* pub. no. 24,748; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 18, no. 3 (1958), p. 1118). Derived from a study of fifteen men considered outstanding in homiletical excellence, this notes the changing emphases in attitude toward the Bible and its authority in doc-

trine and life, and toward inspiration and higher criticism. The largest area of reference is in application to life situations in connection with social implications of the Gospel and personal problems (see sect. III, L, *Teaching of Theology (Protestant)*).

E. The Rise and Development of Liberal Theology

1. LIBERALISM AND MODERNISM. "Liberalism" is a protean term, in religion as well as in politics and economics. It has been employed invidiously by Fundamentalists and extreme right-wing conservatives, but has also served as a title of distinction for those Protestant Christians who have wished to keep religious faith in harmony with the most enlightened philosophcal and scientific thought. It may be that "liberalism" should properly designate a method, rather than any form of creed or lack of creed. A clear analysis of "Modernism," which may be considered as left-wing liberalism, is given in Edwin Aubrey's *Present Theological Tendencies* (New York, 1936), ch. I. There were and are all varieties and degrees of Modernists, ranging from passionate theists like Harry Emerson Fosdick to naturalists like Shailer Mathews. One group has even proposed for itself the paradoxical term "naturalistic theists," including H. N. Wieman and his disciples, like Bernard Meland and Harold Bosley. All these liberals or Modernists have several common characteristics. They are strongly empirical, preferring to base their religious faith on experienced reality rather than on supernatural revelation. They are pragmatic, tending to accept as true those beliefs and values which "work." Their interests are more ethical than metaphysical; they cheerfully accept the findings of modern science, although they reserve the right to interpret them in religious categories. Most have tried to remain somewhere in the neighborhood of classical Christian concepts and language, and within the framework of the institutional churches.

2. A LIBERAL THEORY OF RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE: HORACE BUSHNELL. The early "Covenant Theology" of New England Puritanism stressed the significance of Christian education for children. In the eighteenth century, because of the decline of religious fervor except in times of special "awakening" or revival, less importance was assigned to the educational process as a means of fostering religious character. A pessimistic view of human nature implied the necessity of radical (and highly emotional) "conversion." This implication was not—perhaps could not be—accepted by many serious persons, who otherwise adhered to a reasonably orthodox conception of Christianity. Among the latter was Horace Bushnell (1802–76), who developed and defended his position in his most influential book, *Christian Nurture* (see below).

a. Early Liberalism. In the two decades before the Civil War the "Church Question" deeply agitated the Protestant and Anglican groups. Fundamentally the issue was the Catholic tradition against Protestant revivalism. Bushnell's anti-revivalism apparently was partly a reaction from Nathaniel W. Taylor, under whom he studied. As pastor of the North Church in Hartford, and as preacher, lecturer, and writer, he worked out a new creative religious viewpoint, which has won for him the title "Father of American Liberalism." The work by which he is most widely known is *Christian Nurture* (New York, 1916), which in its present form first appeared in 1860. This was Bushnell's defiance of revivalism: conversion is gradual, if really effective, and the aim of Christian education is that the child shall grow up never knowing himself as anything but Christian. Bushnell's striking theological contribution, which broke new ground and brought upon him severe conservative criticism, was *Nature and the Supernatural, as Together Constituting the One System of God* (New York, 1858). Like Nevin at Mercersburg, Bushnell was deeply influenced by German romantic idealism, particularly by Schleiermacher's immanentist theology of feeling, and found in his work a mediating position, between scientific materialism

and romantic pantheism. The Church, to him, was a community of faith, not individuals voluntarily gathered to promote revivals, and he optimistically conceived the idea of a democratic "divine society." John Arthur Boorman, in "A Comparative Study of the Theory of Human Nature as Expressed by Jonathan Edwards, Horace Bushnell, and William Adams Brown, Representative Protestant Thinkers of the Past Three Centuries" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1954, *University Microfilms,* pub. no. 8608; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 14, no. 9, 1954, pp. 1467–1468), declares that to Bushnell man was a "being supernatural," superior to natural laws of causation. He reflected the popular idea of the rights and dignity of man, and stressed Christian character. E. Clinton Gardner's "Horace Bushnell's Doctrine of Depravity," in *Theology Today,* Vol. 12, no. 1 (April 1955), pp. 10–26, with bibliographical footnotes, reveals the close association of his doctrine with his view of human nature. Two excellent studies of Bushnell as a theologian, and as a mediator of liberal theological concepts to the people, are Harold Richel Heininger, *The Theological Technique of a Mediating Theologian—Horace Bushnell* . . . (Chicago, 1935, portion of a doctoral thesis, University of Chicago, 1933); and Barbara M. Cross, *Horace Bushnell: Minister to a Changing America* (Chicago, 1958), including a bibliography. The biographical approach may be taken through two very competent works by admirers: Theodore Thornton Munger, *Horace Bushnell, Preacher and Theologian* (Boston and New York, 1899), with a bibliography, "Published Writings"; and Warren Seymour Archibald, *Horace Bushnell* (Hartford, Conn., 1930), by the pastor of the Second or South Congregational Church in Hartford. An excellent account of his career is given in Mary A. Cheyney, ed., *Life and Letters of Horace Bushnell* (New York, 1880).

Although Bushnell profoundly shocked New England traditional Calvinists like Bennet Tyler, his thought often was accepted by contemporaries, and Edwards A. Park of Andover

showed his influence in an address, "The Theology of the Intellect and That of the Feelings." Among his admirers in Connecticut, one who wielded great influence was the Rev. Theodore Thornton Munger (1830–1910), pastor of the United Church in New Haven, where Jonathan Edwards, Jr. had been pastor. Munger's views are set forth in *The Freedom of Faith* (Boston and New York, 1883), consisting of 17 sermons, preceded by an essay on "The New Theology," and expressing particularly his reasons for finding his childhood faith inadequate. Munger's influence upon the development of liberalism, and his expression of Bushnell's viewpoint, are seen in Benjamin Wisner Bacon, *Theodore Thornton Munger, New England Minister* (New Haven, 1913), with a bibliography of Munger's "Selected Writings." Another important admirer was the Rev. Newman Smyth (1843–1925), pastor of Center Church in New Haven, where Nathaniel W. Taylor had preached. He developed his own liberal theology in *Old Faiths in New Light* (New York, 1879); *The Orthodox Theology of To-day* (New York, 1881); *Constructive Natural Theology* (New York, 1913); and *Through Science to Faith* (New York, 1902), a series of lectures delivered at the Lowell Institute in Boston during the winter, 1900–1901. Bushnell's influence was still rather small in 1865, but through such men as Munger and Smyth it spread in the next fifty years and moulded the character of American liberal Protestant theology until the reaction that began in the 1930's, toward Neo-Orthodoxy.

b. The New Liberal Theology. General Presuppositions and Characteristics. Evolutionary philosophy and modern Biblical criticism confronted the Church and theology with troublesome problems, which were postponed for a few years by the Civil War, but were faced during the rest of the century. Theologians had to reconstruct the older thinking, by sublimating the positivistic and mechanistic tendencies of the new science and adjusting to the ideas of "progress" and American democracy. The result was a fairly well-integrated

"Liberal" theology, which had certain definite basic traits: a favorable view of human nature and destiny that paralleled the secular idea of "progress"; an increased emphasis upon ethical counsel and education; less concern with church and doctrine and more with moralism and religious experience; the unity of God, man, and nature; the "naturalization" of Christ and his work; the divine element in human nature. In the view of critics like H. Richard Niebuhr, the Christian faith was watered down to the point of insipidity.

(1) THE SYSTEMATIZING OF LIBERALISM. This was largely the work of William Newton Clarke (1840–1912), a Baptist. He was one of many "Liberal" theologians who were fully aware of the enormous problems raised for religion by science and criticism of the Bible, for he was close to the students and faculty of the Newton Seminary. He came to appreciate Bushnell's theology and the new Biblical criticism, and through teaching at Colgate Seminary he adopted the methods of modern Biblical criticism, which appeared in his first publication, *Commentary on the Gospel of Mark* (Philadelphia, 1881), which gave only small intimations of changes in approach that were expounded in his last complete book (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). The most completely developed expression of his critical liberalism is *The Use of the Scriptures in Theology* . . . (New York, 1905), which consists of the Nathaniel William Taylor Lectures for 1905, at the Yale Divinity School—"a bold defense of critical scholarship" (Ahlstrom). Clarke felt that his real vocation was in the construction of an elaborate, systematized body of liberal theology. To this task he addressed himself in *An Outline of Christian Theology* . . . (Cambridge, 1894), which fully accepted evolutionary theory and historical criticism, and became "virtually the *Dogmatik* of American liberalism." Religion, he held, precedes theology, and there are "sources" of theology outside Christian revelation: science, history, other religions, and man. Clarke apparently was deeply loved by his students and friends, and his colleagues at the seminary.

Interesting, intimate, revealing remarks on his life as a teacher and theologian appear in [Emily Smith Clarke], *William Newton Clarke; a Biography, with Additional Sketches by His Friends and Colleagues* (New York, 1916).

(2) THEISTIC LIBERALISM. A general survey, which gives a clear picture of the Liberal scene in the late nineteenth century, before more radical developments changed it, is John Wright Buckham's *Progressive Religious Thought in America; a Survey of the Enlarging Pilgrim Faith* (Boston and New York, 1919), including Horace Bushnell, Theodore T. Munger, George A. Gordon, William J. Tucker, Egbert C. Smyth, Washington Gladden, and Newman Smyth, and discussing their various contributions to the origins, definition, relations, universalizing, effect in action, socializing, and later progress of the new "school." A typical Liberal of the turn of the century was George Angier Gordon (1853–1929), pastor of the Old South Church, Boston. The following titles are representative of his effort to make Christ real and to follow in general Clarke's idea that to know Man is to know God: *The Christ of To-day* (Boston and New York, 1895); *Through Man to God* (Boston and New York, 1906); *Revelation and the Ideal* (Boston and New York, 1913); *Humanism in New England Theology* (Boston and New York, 1920), and *My Education and Religion* (Boston and New York, 1925). An appreciation of Gordon's relation to modern theology and his contribution to it is Gerald Harvey Jones's *George A. Gordon and the New England Theology* . . . (Boston, 1942; abstract of a doctoral thesis, Boston University). A complete bibliography of Gordon's writings, including his published sermons, is furnished by John Frederick Olson, *George Angier Gordon's Christology* . . . (Boston, 1949; abstract of a doctoral thesis, Boston University). Olson relates Gordon's liberalism to the thought of Edwards and the Unitarians.

Other important representative writings in the area of Protestant liberalism should be consulted, particularly: Washing-

ton Gladden, *Present Day Theology* (Columbus, O., c.1913, 2nd ed.); Arthur Cushman McGiffert, *The Rise of Modern Religious Ideas* (New York, 1915); Harry Emerson Fosdick, *Adventurous Religion* (New York, 1926), an explanation of the rationale of his liberalism, and his *As I See Religion* (New York, 1932), showing why he has been regarded by many as the most eminent American exponent of liberal Christianity; William Adams Brown, *Beliefs That Matter* (New York, 1929), with its more specifically evangelical point of view than that of Fosdick; James Gordon Gilkey, *A Faith to Affirm* (New York, 1940); Edwin E. Aubrey, "Christianity and Society," in *The Christian Answer*, ed. Henry P. Van Dusen (New York, 1945), a brief statement of the position of the liberal Protestant; Russell James Clinchy, *Faith and Freedom* . . . (New York, 1947); and Emmet John Hughes, *The Church and the Liberal Society* . . . (Princeton, N.J., 1944), with bibliographical references in "Notes."

3. PROTESTANT "MODERNISM." The liberalizing tendencies of the nineteenth century reached a climax in the first three decades of the twentieth. The new form of Christianity that evolved was called, by its enemies at first, "Modernism." This represented various fairly extreme compromises of traditional Christian doctrine with the scientific world-view and the philosophical tendencies that accompanied it. There were and are all kinds of Modernists. Many have been virtually indistinguishable from Unitarians, except that they have attempted to remain within established ecclesiastical institutions and to use (while freely interpreting) the forms and concepts of orthodox Christianity. A general survey of the "Modernist" tendencies in American theological thought since about 1900 is found on pp. 481–482 of F. E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, 1956). Shailer Mathews, in *The Faith of Modernism* (New York, 1924), chs. 1–4, 8–9, outlines the essential position of Modernism. Gaius Glenn Atkins, *Religion in Our Times* (New York,

1932) discusses Christianity and modern life, science and religion, and modernism, which are treated also in James Gordon Gilkey, *What Can We Believe? A Study of the New Protestantism* (New York, 1933). Robert D. Richardson's *The Gospel of Modernism* (London, 1933, in the "Modernist Series," 2nd ed., 1935), with a bibliography, was influential in America. General reviews of the basic convictions of the Modernists include also Edwin A. Burtt, "Modernism," in *Types of Religious Philosophy* (New York, 1939), ch. 8; and Clarence C. McIntyre, "The Modern Idea of God among American Protestant Theologians" (Doctoral dissertation, Fordham University, 1933–34). The most persuasive advocate of Modernism in the decades before World War II was Harry Emerson Fosdick, whose *The Living of These Days* (New York, 1956) defends his brand of liberalism in autobiographical form.

4. DENOMINATIONAL REACTIONS TO LIBERALISM. Henry C. Sheldon, "Changes in Theology among American Methodists," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 10, no. 1 (Jan. 1906), pp. 31–52, contends that Methodism has "preserved a fair balance between conservative and progressive tendencies," avoiding rash dogmatic ventures, carefully testing new opinions by scholarship and piety, and not closing the door to dogmatic amelioration, and tolerating "improved points of view." Williston Walker, "Changes in Theology among American Congregationalists," in *ibid.*, Vol. 10, no. 2 (April 1906), pp. 204–218, sees modern Congregationalism increasingly less conservative in theology, with modifications accompanied by no lessening of spiritual earnestness, or sense of need of salvation, or the demands of spiritual life, in "an epoch of doctrinal transition," responsive to changes perhaps more than other groups. William Adams Brown, "Changes in the Theology of American Presbyterianism," in *ibid.*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (July 1906), pp. 387–411, with some bibliography in footnotes, points to modifications in theology in the liberal direction, as seen in the new creed by comparison with

the Confession of Faith, and in the new *Book of Common Worship* (1906), with its enriched and dignified worship and trend to catholicity. Albert H. Newman, "Recent Changes in the Theology of Baptists," in *ibid.*, Vol. 10, no. 4 (Oct. 1906), pp. 587–609, stresses the conservatism of the Baptist masses in doctrine, as shown in the denominational press, with only a small minority "liberal," and Biblical criticism not acceptable to the mass of people, clergy, and teachers.

5. CRITICISMS AND APPRAISALS OF LIBERAL THEOLOGY. Winthrop S. Hudson's *The Great Tradition of the American Churches* (New York, 1953) generally surveys the development of the "New Theology," in the effort to accommodate Christianity to science and to "Higher Criticism" in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The conflict of liberalism with the old orthodox tradition is explained in John Bruce Behney, "Conservatism and Liberalism in the Theology of Late Nineteenth-Century American Protestantism" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University). The critical account is continued into the twentieth century by Frank Hugh Foster, *The Modern Movement in American Theology; Sketches in the History of American Protestant Thought from the Civil War to the World War* (New York, c.1939), which continues his *Genetic History of the New England Theology*, and has "References" at the end of most of the chapters. Loral W. Pancake, "Liberal Theology in the Yale Lectures, Extent and Influence of Liberal Theology on Christian Preaching" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1950), discusses the attitude of liberal theology toward the themes of God, Man, Christ, and the Kingdom of God; continuity of Man and God, Jesus as the high point of Man's perfection, the Kingdom as the pattern of Man's design; a general lack of interest in theology; preaching made practical, optimistic regarding Man's ability to improve by education. Recent lectures show a reaction against uncritical liberalism, and indications of a return to transcendence theology and doctrinal preaching. Arthur Cushman McGiffert, "The Prog-

ress of Theological Thought during the Past Fifty Years," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 20, no. 3 (July 1916), pp. 321–332, stresses the evolutionary control of theological thought, the recognition of experience as the only legitimate basis of theology, the increasing dominance of the historic spirit and interest and of modern Biblical criticism, scientific study of the history of Christian thought, and social emphasis in theology, and cites books and lectures that are landmarks in theological progress. Carl S. Patton, "The American Theological Scene: Fifty Years in Retrospect," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 16, no. 4 (Oct. 1936), pp. 445–462, cites many books that wrought the transformation of the theological schools after 1886, and others commenting upon the shift to liberalism, surveys the general orthodox belief c.1886 and contrasts it with the doctrinal position of 1936, noting the influence of the evolutionary concept, and stating that almost nothing remained of the old orthodoxy, as modern theology became philosophy of religion.

The position of modern liberal American theism in the 1930's, at the height of the humanistic and modernist movements, is well illustrated by Walter Marshall Horton's *Theism and the Modern Mood* . . . with an Introduction by William Adams Brown (New York and London, 1930), rejecting humanistic religion, and postulating the need for God in human experience and Christian faith, as an advocate of "workable and reasonable theism." Arthur Cushman McGiffert, "The Future of Liberal Christianity in America," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 15, no. 2 (Apr. 1935), pp. 161–175, states that the Liberal Christian holds no common doctrine, and may be idealist, realist, or naturalist. Liberalism is expressed in humanitarianism and modernism, the effort to discover an abiding reality under varying categories of thought. Almost all religious liberalism has "a vein of comprehensiveness." Liberalism can save religion from both dogmatism and superficiality. Henry Sloane Coffin, *Religion Yesterday and Today* (Nashville, c.1940) reviews the prog-

ress of liberal theology critically. *Liberal Theology, an Appraisal; Essays in Honor of Eugene William Lyman,* by John C. Bennett (and others) . . . David E. Roberts, Henry Pitney Van Dusen, eds. (New York, 1942), surveys the history, foundations, and meaning of liberalism, its relations with other religious traditions, and its attitude toward various contemporary religious and theological questions and problems. The rise of a critical attitude toward liberalism appears in Rufus Matthew Jones, *Re-thinking Religious Liberalism* (Boston, 1935), an address at the International Congress of Religious Liberals, Copenhagen, 1934, published also in the *Christian Register,* Oct. 18, 25, 1934. Edwin E. Aubrey's *Present Theological Tendencies* (New York, 1936), in ch. 2 analyzes Modernism, which may be considered as left-wing liberalism. He suggests that "liberalism" should designate a definite *trend* of thought. Charles Earle Raven, in *The Present Position and Prospects of Liberal Theology* . . . (Sweet Briar, Va., 1950), attempts to assess the position of liberalism vis-à-vis the rise of Neo-Orthodoxy and of frankly non-religious philosophies. Vergilius Ture Anselm Ferm, ed., *Contemporary American Theology; Theological Autobiographies* (New York, 1932–33, 2 vols.) illustrates the generally liberal tone of the first third of the century, soon to shift toward Neo-Orthodoxy. (See also sect. III, K, *Fundamentalist Reaction: The Fundamentalist Criticism of Modernism,* below.)

F. Scientific Liberal Theology: The "Chicago School"

After 1900 the Divinity School of the University of Chicago became the center of an important development in religious philosophy. It marked a shift in the center of theological thinking from the Eastern seminaries and colleges, to the rising West, with its keen interest in new scientific knowledge. The new school based its religious philosophy upon biology, psychology, and sociology, in marked contrast

to the popular liberal theology of the late nineteenth century with its romantic idealism. Its far more radical liberalism rested upon scientific interpretations of the universe expressed in philosophical rather than theological terms. Without formal ecclesiastical ties, the "Chicago School" emphasized the priority of pursuing truth as the aim of all high religion. Its present representatives have accepted the name "Neo-Naturalists," and are characterized by a high order of ethical aspiration, and an effort to supplant revealed religion by religious philosophy. It has been said of them: "For honesty, for integrity, for singleness of purpose, and for wholeness of view, these religious philosophers are unsurpassed in modern times. If man *can* live by philosophy alone, they must have made it possible" (see Metcalf, ref. to "Chicago School"). A general account of this school is available in Alden Drew Kelley, "The Chicago School of Theology," in *Theology*, Vol. 55, no. 379 (Jan. 1952), pp. 19–24. The "Chicago School" has three main expressions:

1. RADICAL PRAGMATISM AND SUBJECTIVE IDEALISM. The influence of John Dewey and George Herbert Mead was potent upon the mind of George Burman Foster, who in the early 1900's developed this expression. His mature views appear in *The Finality of the Christian Religion* (Chicago, 1906), and in *Christianity in Its Modern Expression*, D. C. Macintosh, ed. (New York, 1921). "For him the concept of God had only symbolic validity; but the element of illusion in religion he regarded as necessary for the preservation of its psychological benefits" (see Metcalf, ref. to "Chicago School," p. 62).

2. RELIGIOUS HUMANISM. This is a religion without God, describing religion as consciousness of the highest social values. This phase is represented by Edward Scribner Ames, Gerald Birney Smith, A. Eustace Haydon, and Shailer Mathews. Generally they followed in the direction indicated by Foster. Edward Scribner Ames' *The New Orthodoxy* (Chicago, c.1925, 2nd ed.) and his *Religion* (New York,

1929) show that in his view God possessed objectivity only as a symbol. Two writings by Gerald Birney Smith also represent the humanistic school: *A Guide to the Study of the Christian Religion* (Chicago, 1916), and *Social Idealism and the Changing Theology* (New York, 1913). Smith turned away from the "discursive, analytical method of that rigid, naturalistic, empirical theology exemplified by Foster and Ames," inclined to the mystical type of naturalism of other representatives of the school, and "conceived belief in God as recognition of a sustaining quality in the cosmic process" (see Metcalf). Another prominent representative of religious humanism is Shailer Mathews, who did not accept the new cosmic outlook of process philosophy (see sect. III, G), but remained primarily sociological. His viewpoint is clarified by two important works: *Growth of the Idea of God* (New York, 1931), and *Immortality and the Cosmic Process* (Cambridge, Mass., 1933). For him "God is man's own conception based on his experience of the reality of personality-producing elements in the cosmic environment." His theism was conceptual, recognizing personal relations in the cosmos as the source of personality. He abandoned metaphysical theism as barren, theoretical, and unvital.

3. METAPHYSICAL OR NEO-NATURALISM. The leaders of Neo-Naturalism are Henry N. Wieman and Bernard E. Meland, in whom the philosophy possesses ethical aspiration of a high order. Wieman perhaps is the more widely known, and is represented by the following among his many works: *Religion and the Scientific Method* (New York, 1926); *The Wrestle of Religion with Truth* (New York, 1927); and *The Source of Human Good* (Chicago, 1946). The liberal Neo-Naturalist viewpoint is vigorously defended by Wieman against the Neo-Orthodox in a widely-read essay in Henry N. Wieman (and others), *Religious Liberals Reply* (Boston, 1947). "Wieman . . . combines the primordial and consequent natures of God and the ideal forms from Whitehead's philosophy (see sect. III, G) into one self-fulfilling life process. This process brings

increasing significance to man as he achieves greater sensitiveness of structure essential to the working of creativity in his life-span" (see Metcalf, ref. to "Chicago School," p. 63). Other well-known representative works of this school are Bernard Eugene Meland's *Faith and Culture* (New York, 1953), with bibliographical footnotes; *The Reawakening of Christian Faith* (New York, 1949); and *Seeds of Redemption* (New York, 1947). "Meland sees the possibility of bringing together the events of biblical history and contemporary metaphysics . . . he anticipates a new metaphysics which will not only seek to explain the creative passage of events but will also distinguish between creative force and the 'gentle working that is the redemptive influence upon force' " and that brings meaning and character. Man's chief end is "to glorify God," who is regarded as a creative workman, through fulfilling his creation. Genuine disinterestedness may come from devotion to creation of value as man's spiritual end. Such commitment allows one to attain real transcendence of oneself and the tragedy in life. This redemption releases a person for maximum fulfillment as a human being (see Metcalf, p. 63, quoting *Seeds of Redemption*). Charles Hartshorne, in *Man's Vision of God, and the Logic of Theism* (Chicago and New York, 1941), gives a clearly reasoned examination of theism, outlines a logically complete classification of all possible ideas about God, and produces a "new theism." Another representative of Neo-Naturalism is Daniel D. Williams, whose position is illustrated by his well-known work, *God's Grace and Man's Hope* (New York, 1949). As the decades wore on, there began a reaction against this type of liberalism, which has become known as Neo-Orthodoxy. The collision of the two schools is evident in Wieman's *Religious Liberals Reply*, an attack on Neo-Orthodoxy. The clash is described also in Bernard M. Loomer, "Neo-Naturalism and Neo-Orthodoxy," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 28, no. 2 (Apr. 1948), pp. 77–91 (see sect. III, 1, *Neo-Orthodoxy*).

G. Process Philosophy: A. N. Whitehead

The "philosophy of organism" developed by the British mathematician and philosopher Alfred North Whitehead includes an extraordinarily subtle theological doctrine. Whitehead, entering philosophy by way of mathematics and science, and proclaiming his rejection of Cartesian dualism, ended by insisting upon the "two-fold nature of the Divine." God has on the one hand a "Primordial Nature" as the "conceptual realization" of all possibility. He is in this respect not unlike the "Unmoved Mover" of Aristotle. But God has also a "Consequent Nature" which emerges as He experiences the temporal process of history. He is in this respect more akin to the Holy Spirit of Christianity. Whitehead's theology consists in the attempt to bring together these two "Natures" of God. God is in one sense the cause of all becoming; He is in another sense the result of all that has become. Man stands, as it were, in the midst of this process urged by God to a "conscious disinterestedness" and to rational purposes which will enable God Himself to become.

Whitehead's *Religion in the Making* (Cambridge, 1927) is the most concise statement of his views, far from Christian orthodoxy, and is the only book he devoted solely to religion. Other expressions of his philosophy include *Process and Reality* (New York, 1936), especially part v; *Adventure of Ideas* (New York, 1933); and *Science and the Modern World* (New York, 1935), especially the chapters on "God" and "Religion and Science." There are several satisfactory critiques of Whitehead. Perhaps the most widely read is Dorothy M. Emmet, *Whitehead's Philosophy of Organism* (London, 1932). Also R. Das, *The Philosophy of Whitehead* (London, 1938); Victor Lowe, "Alfred North Whitehead," in Max H. Fisch, ed., *Classic American Philosophers* (New York, 1951); and William Christian, *An Interpretation of Whitehead's Metaphysics* (New Haven, 1959). Several papers concerning

his religious ideas are included in Paul Arthur Schilpp, ed., *The Philosophy of Alfred North Whitehead* (Evanston, 1941). Whitehead's process philosophy enabled several of the "Chicago School" to propound a philosophy including "all of man's scientific knowledge and experience of his world" (see Metcalf, ref. to "Chicago School," p. 62). By it the religious humanism of Ames, Smith, Haydon, and Mathews was transformed into the metaphysical naturalism or neo-naturalism of Wieman, Meland, Williams, Loomer, Hartshorne, and others (see sect. III, F, 3, *Metaphysical or Neo-Naturalism*).

H. Theological Realism

By 1900 liberal theology prevailed in many important seminaries, particularly Oberlin, Chicago, Yale, Union, and Harvard, and influenced others. The peak came probably in the mid-1920's, when Liberalism appeared as Modernism and engaged in a tussle with the Fundamentalists (see sect. III, K, *Fundamentalist Reaction*). In the 1920's Liberalism received a "boost" from the militant "Realists" led by Douglas Clyde Macintosh of Yale and Henry Nelson Wieman of Chicago. The sources and character of American realism appear in Victor Emmanuel Harlow, *Bibliography and Genetic Study of American Realism* (Oklahoma City, 1931). Another general study, with a bibliography, is James Donald Butler's *Four Philosophies and Their Practice in Education and Religion* (New York, 1957). A typical representative of the realistic theology is studied by Frederick William Wittaker, in "Samuel Harris, American Theologian" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1950), with a comprehensive biography of Harris (1814–1899), an exposition of his writings, and an appraisal of his contribution to American theology. As professor of theology at Bangor and Yale, he developed a theology founded upon philosophical realism, with a doctrine of man realistically optimistic. Strongly evangelical and ethical, he was one of the earliest Social Gospel

advocates, a mediating and transitional figure. (See his *The Kingdom of Christ on Earth* (Andover, Mass., 1896); *The Philosophical Basis of Theism* (New York, 1883); and *The Self-Revelation of God* (New York, 1887.)

The revolt of the Realists from the romantic subjectivism of the earlier liberals, like Bushnell, is well illustrated by Douglas Clyde Macintosh's *Theology as an Empirical Science* (New York, 1919), revealing their denial that the object of faith is merely the "God-idea," their acceptance of William James's idea that a new era in religion would begin when it followed the empirical method. The widespread acceptance of Realism inspired the symposium of views which Macintosh edited: *Religious Realism*, by A. K. Rogers, J. B. Pratt, J. S. Bixler . . . [and others] (New York, 1931), with a bibliography at the end of ch. 3. This volume "brought a large and distinguished group of men under the Realist banner" (see Ahlstrom essay in Volume One). The essential attitude of the Realists was voiced as late as 1940 by Macintosh in "The Logic of Constructive Theology" in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium*, Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 150–161. Another influential champion was Henry Nelson Wieman. Probably his most distinguished contribution is *Religious Experience and Scientific Method* (New York, 1926). Among the most popular and persuasive advocates are the works of Walter Marshall Horton, especially: *A Realistic Theology* (New York and London, 1934), which asserts that old liberal theology is dead, and points the way to a new, realistic theology, with a greater interest in social salvation and action, but does not see the inclusiveness of Catholic theology and its inclusion of his "new" affirmations. His *Theism and the Scientific Spirit* (New York and London, 1933) includes discussions of science and theism in the contemporary world and of the future of theism, and efforts to restate theistic thought in consonance with the dominant scientific aspects. Paul Arthur Schilpp, in *The Quest for Religious Realism; Some Paradoxes of Religion* (New

York and London, 1938), interprets religion as commitment to an ideal (not the whole of religion), to God as an ideal rather than an object of devotion. John C. Bennett's *Christian Realism* (New York, 1942) summarizes the outlook and philosophy of the Realistic "school." It should be recognized, however, that the "realism" of Bennett and Horton was developed in closer relation to classical orthodoxy than that of Macintosh and Wieman, who leaned heavily upon modern philosophy for theological construction.

Theological and philosophical realism became a step in the direction of Neo-Orthodoxy, which has used its technique to proclaim a return to orthodoxy, and to point to the futility and "failure" of Liberalism.

I. Neo-Orthodoxy

Trends of religious thought during recent years have been numerous and complex. One is a continuous development from nineteenth-century humanism to naturalism, which has become one of the essential factors in twentieth-century American thought. The contention of John Dewey, that religion must be discarded in order to release "the religious experience," has found many adherents. This somewhat drastic culmination of the humanizing tendency has led to various vigorous reactions. Many theologians have recognized a need for religion to return to the firmer ground of creedal orthodoxy. While Roman Catholic theologians have never deviated significantly from the creedal orthodoxy of the church, the Neo-Thomist movement, represented by such spokesmen as Étienne Gilson and Jacques Maritain, has sought to engage the old Scholasticism in relevant dialogue with modern thought and problems. The same spirit has appeared in quite different ways in the return to Reformation thought, led by such German and Swiss theologians as Barth, Tillich, and Brunner.

Neo-Orthodoxy must be distinguished from Fundamentalism. The latter is characterized by a literal interpretation of

Scripture in conformity with classical creedal formulations, and has sharply reacted against modification of traditional beliefs under the impact of naturalism. The Neo-Orthodox or Neo-Reformation theologians, on the other hand, have accepted the results of modern science, including Biblical criticism, but have sought confirmation of classical Christian doctrines in a realistic analysis of human nature and history. Sydney E. Ahlstrom, in his article, "Neo-Orthodoxy Demythologized," in the *Christian Century*, Vol. 74, no. 21 (May 22, 1957), pp. 649–651, has demonstrated the ambiguous usage of the label "Neo-Orthodox" in much of contemporary theological discussion, and attempts to give some precision to the various categories of reaction against the older liberalism. Ahlstrom lists 16 American theologians usually considered as Neo-Orthodox, who nevertheless differ in important respects.

I. RISE IN EUROPE: CRITICISM OF LIBERALISM. Walter Marshall Horton's *Contemporary Continental Theology, An Interpretation for Anglo-Saxons* (New York, 1938), together with his *Contemporary English Theology; an American Interpretation* (New York, 1936), broadly sketches the general theological scene in which criticism of liberal theology arose and Neo-Orthodoxy developed. Otto Piper, in *Current Trends in Continental Theology* . . . (Philadelphia, c.1938), with bibliography, emphasizes the rise of Neo-Orthodoxy, especially in Germany.

There was a long preparation for the emergence of Neo-Orthodoxy in the writings of Søren Kierkegaard, Jacob Burckhardt, Franz Overbeck, Ludwig Wittgenstein, Miguel de Unamuno, and others. Burckhardt's vision of coming crisis and suffering is suggested in Karl Löwith, *The Meaning in History* (Chicago, 1949), and James H. Nichols, "Introduction" to Burckhardt's essays, *Force and Freedom, An Interpretation of History* (New York, 1955). Franz Overbeck's *Christentum und Kultur*, ed. C. A. Bernouli (Basel, 1919) was influential upon Karl Barth, especially in pointing out the

tragic identification of Christianity with contemporary culture. Miguel de Unamuno's *The Tragic Sense of Life in Men and in Peoples* (1912, tr. London, 1926) is a radically existential critique of the current liberalism. Ludwig Wittgenstein, as seen in José Ferrater Mora, "Wittgenstein, A Symbol of Troubled Times," in *Philosophy and Phenomenal Research*, Vol. 14, no. 1 (Sept. 1953), pp. 89–96, appears as another critic of the liberal bourgeois ideologies, secular and religious. A bibliographical guide to the large literature on criticism of secular and religious liberalism in Europe is in F. H. Heinemann, *Existentialism and the Modern Predicament* (New York, 1958), consisting of the chief primary and secondary works, and of other bibliographies. Sydney E. Ahlstrom's essay, "Continental Influence on American Christian Thought Since World War I" (*Church History*, Vol. 27, no. 3 (Sept. 1958), p. 261) discerns four phases of the influence upon American "post-liberal" thinking.

a. New Biblical Exegesis and Interpretation. As the twentieth century opened, translations began to make the new criticism of liberalism known to Americans. One of the eye-openers was Albert Schweitzer's influential study, *Geschichte der Leben-Jesu-Forschung* (Tübingen, Germany, 1906), a thorough criticism of the liberal effort to make Jesus "real" in a practical, humanist sense. The immense popularity of the English translation is shown by the number of editions and reprintings, the latest of which, under the title, *The Quest of the Historical Jesus*, in the translation by W. Montgomery, appeared in 1955. Schweitzer's influence received additional weight from his reputation as a medical missionary and as an authority on Bach. Three other significant books by him, illustrating "the new evangelical temper in New Testament exegesis and scholarship," are *Paul and His Interpreters* (1st German ed., 1912; tr. W. Montgomery, London, 1912); *The Mystery of the Kingdom of God* (London, 1925); also his autobiography, *Out of My Life and Thought* (New York, 1933; Mentor Book ed., 1953), particularly ch. 10. Other

authors, who promoted the new interpretation of Jesus in the period 1920–1935, are Martin Dibelius, Rudolf Bultmann, and Karl Ludwig Schmidt. An American scholar, Chester C. McCown, has extended Schweitzer's review of recent research on the life of Jesus in his volume entitled *The Search for the Real Jesus* (New York, 1940).

b. The German Social-Christian Movement. This movement was one of the influences leading away from liberalism, displaying Marxian traits, and stressing the "bankruptcy" of capitalism, the blindness of the bourgeoisie, the Church's tragic involvement in a diseased society, and uncritical acceptance of the prevailing ideology by Christian thinkers. This school of thought, which sought to end the alienation between the Church and the laboring classes, gave a Christian evangelical tone to the Socialist outlook, quite different from the optimistic one of British and American Social-Gospelers (see Ahlstrom, "Continental Influences . . . ," pp. 262–263). Its most important figure for Americans is Paul Tillich, who came to America to teach at Union Seminary, New York (see sect. III, 1, 4, *Representative Figures*).

c. The Swedish or Lundensian (University of Lund) Movement in Theology. A potent element in the rise of Neo-Orthodoxy was a revival of interest in Martin Luther, in Germany and Scandinavia, through the influence of Karl Holl of Berlin and Werner Elert of Erlangen. In Sweden it attained great power in the works of Anders Nygren, Gustaf Aulen, and Inge Brilioth. Its vintage is shown in Einar Billing, *Luther's Doctrine of the State* (1900). Swedish theology was influential because it was concerned with reconstruction and church reform, and demanded a theology and ethics grounded upon the idea of redemption. A general study of this movement is presented in Nils F. S. Ferré, *Swedish Contributions to Modern Theology with Special Reference to Lundensian Thought* (New York, c.1939), with a bibliography. Another study illustrating the power of revived interest in Lutheran theology, and of the Swedish move-

ment, is Edgar M. Carlson, *The Reinterpretation of Luther* (Philadelphia, 1948), and his *The Church and the Public Conscience* (Philadelphia, 1956).

d. The Crisis Theology of Karl Barth. It has been observed that when Barth broke away from liberalism and began to proclaim a new, evangelical message, "it was a Church dogmatics that he began to propound, not some new hyper-individualism" (see Ahlstrom, p. 263). The evidence for this is Barth's *Church Dogmatics* . . . Editors . . . G. W. Bromley . . . T. F. Torrance . . . (Edinburgh, 1936–1957, 4 vols.), continuing, comprising "The doctrine of the Word of God (Prolegomena to church dogmatics)," "The doctrine of God," and "The doctrine of reconciliation." A shorter expression is his *Dogmatics in Outline,* translated by G. T. Thomson (New York, 1947), containing his own summary of his theology. A splendid review of the Barthian movement in theology has been written in Wilhelm Pauck's *Karl Barth* (New York, 1931), of which it is said that "Probably no American book caught the spirit of the early Barthian movement better . . ." (Ahlstrom, "Continental Influences . . . ," note 15). The movement was promoted in Germany also by Eduard Thurneysen, and above all by Heinrich Emil Brunner's *The Theology of Crisis* (New York and London, 1929), with brief bibliography, comprising essays originally written for the Swander Lectures at the Theological Seminary of the Reformed Church in the United States, Lancaster, Pa.—an appropriate place (see sect. II, F, *The Mercersburg [Reformed] Theology*). Another of his influential works is *Dogmatics* . . . tr. Olive Wyon . . . (London, 1949–1952, 2 vols.), including "The Christian Doctrine of God" and "The Christian Doctrine of Creation and Redemption." The doctrine of God as held by the modern Continental Neo-Orthodox theologians is discussed in a study by J. Rodman Williams, "The Doctrine of the Imago Dei in Contemporary Theology, A Study in Karl Barth, Emil Brunner, Reinhold

Niebuhr, and Paul Tillich" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1954).

One of the most prominent features of the Neo-Orthodox movement is its intense interest in the Church as an institution. The revived interest in *church* dogmatics ran contrary to the liberal current of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, which had tended to sweep theologians away from interest in the church and ecclesiology. The following titles point to principal traits of this interest, as it revived in Europe and then in America: Richard Stanley Emrich, *The Conception of the Church in the Writings of Baron Friedrich von Hügel* (Munich, 1939); Leonard Hodgson, *The Doctrine of the Church as Held and Taught in the Church of England* (Oxford, 1946); American Theological Committee, "The Conception of the Church," in *Christendom*, Vol. 9, nos. 3, 4 (Summer, Autumn, 1944), pp. 409–417, 548–556; H. Richard Niebuhr, "The Norm of the Church," in *Journal of Religious Thought*, Vol. 5 (1946), pp. 5ff.; and William Robinson, *The Biblical Doctrine of the Church* (St. Louis, 1948).

2. MOVEMENT TO AMERICA. The dominant note in American religious philosophy since 1930 has been Neo-Supernaturalism, better known as Neo-Orthodoxy. It began in the nineteenth century with the Danish theologian, Søren Kierkegaard (1813–1855), and later was developed in Germany by Karl Barth, Emil Brunner, and Paul Tillich. Its earliest and most eminent promoter in America has been Reinhold Niebuhr, who has concentrated upon its sociological and political implications, while Tillich has been a chief exponent of its philosophical and theological aspects. Other American Neo-Supernaturalists are G. W. Richards, Wilhelm Pauck, and John Bennett. This theology has been described as "an extreme form of supernaturalism." It does not trust reason to bolster revelation, denies that God reveals himself only through the institutional church, and even repudiates Holy

Scripture as infallible authority, since God completely transcends history and society.

These principles are clarified and criticized by remarks in Henry N. Wieman and Bernard E. Meland, *American Philosophies of Religion* (Chicago, 1936). The principal characteristics respecting man and his relation to God are explained by Reinhold Niebuhr in *The Nature and Destiny of Man* (New York, 1951, 2 vols.). Man cannot fully know truth or escape the error of pretending that he does. The grace of God always is partly contradictory to nature, not merely its fulfillment, and fully enters and purifies human thought and action only when the contradictions between it and nature are understood. Sin is man's refusal to admit his finiteness. Neo-Supernaturalism simply states that the human and the divine are not reconcilable in world history, but only in the "super-history" beyond time and space, as revealed in the Bible and the Christian faith. Only the grace of God can span the gap and make man transcend his natural self and history, and Christianity alone explains this process. This "theology of crisis" has become appealing as international tension has increased and idealistic liberalism has retreated.

Moreover, European Neo-Orthodox theologians fairly demanded that "America must listen." One of the most important mediators was John Mackay, sometime president of the Princeton Theological Seminary, who in Europe became acquainted with Miguel de Unamuno's *The Tragic Sense of Life,* with Kierkegaard, and with Barth. His own theological position appears in his inaugural address as president of the Princeton Theological Seminary, *The Restoration of Theology* (Princeton, N.J., 1937), from Princeton Seminary *Bulletin,* April 1937; in *A Preface to Christian Theology* (New York, 1941), and in *God's Order—The Ephesian Letter and This Present Time* (New York, 1953). Another mediator was Douglas Horton, who in 1928 issued a translation of Barth's *Das Wort Gottes und die Theologie.* He became (1953/54) dean of the Harvard Divinity School.

Barthianism was brought to America also by visiting Europeans, such as Adolf Keller, author of *Karl Barth and Christian Unity*, and Wilhelm Pauck, who published the first American exposition of Barth. Paul Tillich came to Union Seminary in 1933, and had vast influence through *The Religious Situation*, translated in 1932 by H. Richard Niebuhr.

By the 1930's the American religious world was becoming aware of Kierkegaard's criticism of the complacent "Liberal" Christian world, through translations and appreciations by the Anglican scholar, Walter Lowrie of Princeton, such as *Kierkegaard's Attack upon "Christendom," 1854–1855* (Princeton, N.J., 1944), with bibliographical references in the "Notes." Lowrie's own theological contributions, beyond his translations, are appreciated in Alexander C. Zabriskie, ed., *Doctor Lowrie of Princeton: Nine Essays in Acknowledgment of a Debt* (Greenwich, Conn., 1957). Lowrie contributed enormously to the fame of Kierkegaard by his appreciation, *Kierkegaard* (London and New York, 1938), including translations of many extracts from his works, "Synopsis of Kierkegaard's Works" and "A Select Bibliography," and his own translations. Another translator and interpreter of Kierkegaard is David Ferdinand Swenson, whose *Something about Kierkegaard*, ed. Lillian Marvin Swenson (Minneapolis, 1941) includes bibliographies.

Another powerful influence in the transition from Europe was the translation of works by Karl Barth, such as his *The Epistle to the Romans* (Der Römerbrief, 1918, tr. from the 6th ed. by Edwyn C. Hoskins, with a new preface by the author, London, 1933), and *The Word of God and the Word of Man* (*Das Wort Gottes und Die Theologie*, 1928, tr. Douglas Horton, Boston, Chicago, c.1928; new ed., New York, 1957). Significantly, the translator was of the liberal school. The sermons of Barth and of Edward Thurneysen, translated by George W. Richards, Elmer G. Homrighausen, and Karl J. Ernst, had vast influence: *Come, Holy Spirit* (New York, 1933), and *God's Search for Man* (New York,

1935). The theological bent of the translator George Warren Richards is illustrated by his own *The Heidelberg Catechism; Historical and Doctrinal Studies* (Philadelphia, 1913). Richards taught at Mercersburg, where John W. Nevin and his friends promoted a conservative theological movement (see sect. II, F, *The Mercersburg [Reformed] Theology*).

A brief general bibliography on American Neo-Orthodoxy should include: John Dillenberger and Claude Welch, *Protestant Christianity* (New York, 1955); Daniel D. Williams, *What Present-Day Theologians are Thinking* (New York, 1959); Hans Frei, "Niebuhr's Theological Background," and "The Theology of H. Richard Niebuhr," in Paul Ramsey, ed., *Faith and Ethics: The Theology of H. Richard Niebuhr* (New York, 1957); Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "Neo-Orthodoxy Demythologized," in *Christian Century* (May 22, 1957); Henry N. Wieman and Bernard E. Meland, *American Philosophies of Religion* (Chicago, 1936), decidedly criticizing it as reactionary. A selective list, with references to Karl Barth, Reinhold Niebuhr, and other leaders, appears in F. E. Mayer, *The Religious Bodies of America* (St. Louis, 1956), including books and articles.

3. AMERICAN CRITICS OF LIBERALISM: THE SHIFT TO CONSERVATISM. By 1930 the liberal movement in American theology had about run its course, and the stalemate of the Fundamentalist controversy arrested real thinking. Little heed was paid to the message of the churches, and there was a reaction against idealism. World War I did not profoundly affect the American liberal current, for America had not suffered as severely as Europe. Liberalism continued to speak as usual, but its complacency was ruffled by voices of criticism from the Continent of Europe (Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "Continental Influence on American Christian Thought Since World War I," in *Church History*, Vol. 27, no. 3 (Sept. 1958), p. 260). In the 1930's the American liberal movement began to splinter and retreat, due to disillusionment with optimistic liberalism after World War I, the failure of the peace

settlement, harsh social criticism and satire, the economic debacle of 1929, the depression of the 1930's, the rise of brutal gangster fascism, disillusionment with the Communist experiment in Russia, and the "relativism" of the new psychology, sociology, and cultural anthropology. By the early 1940's American theologians were fully consicous of the conservative shift. A perceptive evidence of their awareness is W. Norman Pittenger's essay, "Changing Emphases in American Theology," in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 12, no. 3 (Summer, 1943), pp. 412–420, where he reviews American theological liberalism of the early twentieth century, and the shift beginning in the 1920's, owing to: deepening social insight, historical study of the New Testament world, the influence of Barth and Brunner, Reinhold Niebuhr's criticism of popular liberal theology, emphasis upon the Church as the "carrier of salvation," and the revival of scholastic philosophy and theology in the Roman Church. The same tendency is noted also in Arnold Samuel Nash, *Protestant Thought in the Twentieth Century: Whence and Whither* (New York, 1951), with bibliographies, in which the keynote is the recovery of the Bible, of faith, and of theology, and the emphasis is conservative, evangelical, and almost Neo-Orthodox.

Other evidence of the trend appears in Daniel Day Williams, *What Present-day Theologians are Thinking* (New York, 1952), with bibliographical references in "Notes"; and David Wesley Soper, *Major Voices in American Theology; Six Contemporary Leaders* (Philadelphia, 1953), with essays on Edwin Lewis, Reinhold Niebuhr, N. F. S. Ferré, Paul Tillich, H. R. Niebuhr, and R. L. Calhoun, all critics of liberalism. This should be supplemented by his *Men Who Shape Belief, Major Voices in American Theology,* Vol. 2 (Philadelphia, 1955); and by F. Ernest Johnson, *Patterns of Faith in America Today* (New York, 1958), consisting of essays on the major religious traditions, chiefly from the theological viewpoint. Vergilius Ture Anselm Ferm, ed., *Contemporary American Theology; Theological*

Autobiographies (New York, 1932–33, 2 vols.), with "Principal Publications" at the end of each "autobiography," consists of twenty-three narratives of religious and theological experiences, mostly by professors and deans of theological seminaries, emphasizing the growth of the scientific liberal temper and of shying away from dogmatism, liberalism reaching its culmination just before the onset of Neo-Orthodoxy in the mid-1930's. The swift change is revealed by "How My Mind Has Changed in This Decade," a series of spiritual autobiographies in the *Christian Century*, Jan. 18–Feb. 8, 1939, by Willard L. Sperry, Henry Nelson Wieman, Frederick D. Kershner, and John C. Bennett. By contrast with the intellectual biographies in Ferm, these reveal that in the intervening seven years the penetration of the works mentioned above had basically transformed the general temper of American theology. The change did not depend upon the influence of any man or group, but the Niebuhr brothers, H. Richard and Reinhold, contributed heavily to the momentum of the new criticism of Liberalism and of the partial return to the old orthodoxy (see sect. III, 1, 4, *Representative Figures*).

A translator of Karl Barth, George Richards, was a noted theologian, who undertook a criticism of both the extreme American positions in *Beyond Fundamentalism and Modernism; The Gospel of God* (New York, 1934), with a bibliography, which indicates strongly that by the 1930's Modernists and Fundamentalists no longer expressed the temper of the times. In a way, Richards continued the tradition of John W. Nevin and Philip Schaff at the Mercersburg Seminary, and in this work "called the Church back to its calling," and showed the influence of Spengler, Dilthey, Carl Becker, and Schweitzer, and the "Luther Renaissance" on the Continent. Another Richards work, foreshadowing his 1934 position, is *Creative Controversies in Christianity* (New York, 1928), which declares that the American philosopher and theologian should turn from the older German liberal theologians,

Schleiermacher, Ritschl, and Troeltsch, to Kierkegaard and Barth. A native-American influence militating against Liberalism was that of the Methodist Edwin Lewis, who in 1934 issued *A Christian Manifesto* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1934). That year was the critical one in the turn toward a new evangelical protest against the assumptions of Liberalism. Lewis published also an essay, "The Fatal Apostasy of the Modern Church," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 2, no. 4 (Fall, 1933), pp. 483–492, which stirred his own church to great anger. He was then a professor at Drew University, Madison, N.J. The *Manifesto* was addressed to the American churches, calling for a crusade in behalf of the historic witness of the Church.

Walter Marshall Horton's *Realistic Theology* (New York and London, 1934), a series of lectures at the Andover-Newton Theological School, marked his break from the school led by Douglas Clyde Macintosh and Henry Nelson Wieman, and scored the liberal "failure" effectively by applying his criticism historically to the American scene. He considered the problem of the Church, which the Ecumenical Movement was bringing to attention with increasing intensity, and accused liberals of watering down the conception of the Church until it had ceased to be Christian. The attack continued in his *Theology in Transition* (New York and London, 1943), an abbreviated form of his *A Psychological Approach to Theology* (New York, 1931) and *Realistic Theology*. George Hammar's *Christian Realism in Contemporary American Theology* (Uppsala, Sweden, 1940) is the best analysis of the emergence of Neo-Orthodoxy in America, written from the Neo-Orthodox point of view. Another account, emphasizing the point that the movement is not a complete break with the past, is C. C. Morrison, "The Liberalism of Neo-Orthodoxy," in *Christian Century*, Vol. 67, nos. 23, 24, 25 (June 7, 14, 21, 1950), pp. 697–699, 731–733, 760–763. John H. Otwell, "Neo-Orthodoxy and Biblical Research," in *Harvard Theological Review*, Vol. 43, no. 2 (April 1950), pp. 145–

157, with bibliographical references in the footnotes, reveals the slight progress of Neo-Orthodoxy among Biblical critics.

Mary Frances Thelen's *Man as Sinner in Contemporary American Realistic Theology* (New York, 1946), with bibliography, examines the doctrine of man of Reinhold Niebuhr with special reference to modern dynamic psychology. The accompanying conservative idea of redemption is defined by Stimson Ronald Smalley, "The Concept of Salvation in American Realistic Theology" (Doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1951). Realistic theology accepts all facts of life in the total light of man, sin, and salvation, and man's helplessness to save himself, which requires assistance from beyond man in a revelation from God. Reinhold and Richard Niebuhr, John Coleman Bennett, Robert Lowry Calhoun, Walter M. Horton, and Edwin Lewis all have broken with liberalism in varying degrees, because of its optimistic approach to man and the world. The long-range intellectual and theological currents set in motion by the Neo-Orthodox movement have flowed into Biblical scholarship, Christian education, consideration of problems of church membership, sacramental life, and the doctrinal witness of the Church. These various effects are surveyed in a series of essays, Arnold S. Nash, ed., *Protestant Thought in the Twentieth Century* (New York, 1951); also in H. Shelton Smith, *Faith and Nurture* (New York, 1941) and Smith's *Changing Conceptions of Original Sin* (New York, 1955); and Stephen Fielding Bayne, *The Optional God* (New York, 1953). This movement combats "the Pious Utilitarianism that still dominates the nation's religious life," (see Ahlstrom, "Continental Influences . . . ," p. 267) and is attempting to transcend the old Fundamentalist and Modernist controversy.

4. REPRESENTATIVE FIGURES. The most influential leader of this development among American Protestants is Reinhold Niebuhr. He has been variously described as "Neo-Orthodox," "Neo-Supernaturalist," "Neo-Liberal," and "Neo-Protestant." None of these labels is precisely applicable; all

are at least suggestive, inasmuch as they describe some aspects of his effort to reclaim for intellectual respectability many basic insights of traditional Christianity, especially in its Augustinian and Reformation expressions. He has not blindly turned to the past for certainty, nor does he represent a more sophisticated type of Fundamentalism. He takes the Bible altogether seriously, but not on the basis of literalism. He consistently exposes the fallacies of modern optimistic liberalism, both Christian and secular.

In the 1930's the Niebuhr brothers, Helmut Richard and Reinhold, emerged as critics of Liberalism and protagonists of Neo-Orthodoxy. One of the most impressive manifestos of the new school was issued by H. Richard Niebuhr, Wilhelm Pauck, and Francis P. Miller, as *The Church Against the World* (Chicago and New York, 1935), with two essays by Niebuhr: "The Question of the Church" and "Toward the Independence of the Church." This is one of several works in which the Niebuhrs pointed out the tie-up of the Church's thought to contemporary nationalism, ethnic loyalty, and class ideologies. The Church had lost the power to think independently. The significant essay by Pauck is "The Crisis in Religion." H. Richard Niebuhr's essay, "Religious Realism and the Twentieth Century," in Douglas C. Macintosh, ed., *Religious Realism* (New York, 1913), had already declared that Continental European "realism" could be brought to bear upon the American scene in a very relevant way. His *The Meaning of Revelation* (New York, 1941) develops his widely accepted idea of the distincton between inner and external history, and his idea of the Church's apprehending the revealing Word of God through aspects of the community life of man. Another significant critical work is his *Christ and Culture* (New York, 1951).

Reinhold Niebuhr's first important book, *Moral Man and Immoral Society; a Study in Ethics and Politics* (New York, 1932) criticizes individualistic and utopian thought, and questions the assumptions of the Social Gospel, especially that the

evolutionary process is inevitably meliorating, and that change of environment necessarily changes people. *An Interpretation of Christian Ethics* (New York and London, 1935), a series of lectures, among the most influential of the period, voiced Niebuhr's evangelical principles as the heart of his protest against over-optimistic liberalism. The same general note sounds in his "The Christian Church in a Secular Age," in *Christianity and Power Politics* (New York, 1940). *Religion and the Modern World* (Philadelphia, 1941), especially "Religion in Action," considers how religion is implicated in both the temporal and the eternal aspects of man's condition. *The Nature and Destiny of Man* (New York, 1951, 2 vols.) is the fullest statement of his theological position, but *Faith and History; a Comparison of Christian and Modern Views of History* (New York, 1951) develops some aspects of his thought more clearly. David R. Davies, in *Reinhold Niebuhr: Prophet from America* (New York, 1948), relates Niebuhr's movement from liberalism to Neo-Orthodoxy, from a Neo-Orthodox viewpoint, with a biographical and critical background; a method continued in his *On to Orthodoxy* (New York, 1949). Three superior recent studies and summaries of his theological position are Edward John Carnell, *The Theology of Reinhold Niebuhr* (Grand Rapids, 1951), with bibliographical footnotes; Hans Hofmann, *The Theology of Reinhold Niebuhr*, tr. Louise Pettibone Smith (New York, 1956); and Gordon Harland, *The Thought of Reinhold Niebuhr* (New York, 1960), an interpretation of his thought against the background of major events, including his views on contemporary questions. These must be supplemented by scholarly studies of particular aspects of his thought, such as Donald George Bloesch, "Reinhold Niebuhr's Revaluation of the Apologetic Task" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago Divinity School, 1956; microfilm, MJF0930.252, University of Chicago Library). Grover Carlton Bagby's "Human Freedom and Responsibility in the Light of the Writings of Reinhold Niebuhr" (Doctoral dis-

sertation, Drew University, 1947), mentions personalistic insights, including the primacy of the ethical over the intellectual, the distinction between thought and reality, and the essential unity of the personal self, with a paradox in the understanding of man's relation to God as one of dependence/independence. James Luther Martin, "The Doctrine of Sin in the Theology of Reinhold Niebuhr and Emil Brunner" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1951) presents a systematic analysis and comparison of their doctrines of sin and original sin, their individual and social implications, and important deviations from the original meaning of the doctrine of original sin. Essays in appreciation and criticism of Niebuhr, together with a response by him, are included in Charles W. Kegley and Robert W. Bretall, eds., *Reinhold Niebuhr, His Religious, Social and Political Thought* (New York, 1956) in "Library of Living Theology," Vol. 2. A recent listing of Niebuhr's vast production is Duncan Robertson, *Reinhold Niebuhr's Works; a Bibliography* (Berea, Ky., 1954).

Paul Tillich's essay, "Existential Thinking in American Theology," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 10, no. 3 (Summer, 1941), pp. 452–455, on H. Richard Niebuhr's *The Meaning of Revelation*, grasps the essential points of his "successful attempt to interpret the idea of revelation in existential terms," making "historical relativism the necessary correlate of revelation." Revelation is the "conversion and permanent revolution of our human religion through Jesus Christ." Tillich's own contributions to the Neo-Orthodox view include: "The World Situation," in *The Christian Answer*, ed. by Henry P. Van Dusen (New York, 1945); *Systematic Theology* (Chicago, 1951–1957, 2 vols.); *The Religious Situation*, tr. H. Richard Niebuhr (New York, 1932); *The Interpretation of History* (New York, 1936); *The Protestant Era* (Chicago, 1948); *The Shaking of the Foundations* (New York, 1948); and *The Courage To Be* (New Haven, 1952). An excellent analysis and critique of Tillich's thinking is in C. W. Kegley and R. W. Bretall, eds., *The Theology of Paul*

Tillich (New York, 1952). Tillich's philosophy of religion is summarized in James Luther Adams, "Paul Tillich's Philosophy of Culture, Science and Religion" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago Divinity School, microfilm MJF0930.252, University of Chicago Library, 1947), with bibliographical footnotes. The whole line of attack upon retreating liberalism is surveyed in George Hammar's *Christian Realism in Contemporary American Theology; a Study of Reinhold Niebuhr, W. M. Horton, and H. P. Van Dusen,* preceded by a General and Historical Survey . . . (Uppsala, Sweden, 1940), with bibliography.

5. CRITICS OF NEO-ORTHODOXY. Henry Nelson Wieman and Walter Marshall Horton, "Modern Religious Tendencies," in *The Growth of Religion* (Chicago, 1938) has an able appraisal of Neo-Orthodoxy. Much more thorough is Henry Nelson Wieman and others, *Religious Liberals Reply* (Boston, 1947), a critique of Reinhold Niebuhr and of Neo-Orthodoxy in general, from the standpoint of contemporary religious liberalism, discussing the basic differences between Niebuhr and his liberal critics. A view of Neo-Orthodoxy as obscurantist and reactionary is voiced by L. Harold DeWolf, *The Religious Revolt Against Reason* (New York, 1949). The present dilemma of Protestant theology, created by the clash of Neo-Orthodoxy and Liberalism, is discussed in an article by Nils F. S. Ferré, "Where Do We Go From Here in Theology?" in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 25, no. 1 (Winter 1955–1956), pp. 5–34, with remarks also by Paul Tillich, Cornelius Van Til, and Alden D. Kelley.

J. Southern Conservatism

Romantic religious tendencies in the ante-bellum South were just as strong, if not stronger, than in the rest of the country. But the South had an entirely different brand of Romanticism from the North, and there was an equal divergence between the patterns of religious development in the

two sections. Where romantic religion in the North tended toward theological liberalism, humanitarianism, and perfectionism, the South experienced a decided reaction from the Jeffersonian liberalism of the early 1800's to an increasingly rigid orthodoxy in the middle years of the century. This tendency is evidenced in three notable books by historians of the South: Rollin G. Osterweis, *Romanticism and Nationalism in the Old South* (New Haven, 1949), in a brilliant analysis of the unique configuration of Southern Romanticism, considers an aspect of romantic influence in religious development. Wilbur Joseph Cash, in *The Mind of the South* (New York, 1941), has some observations on conservative Southern religion and its origins, and Francis Butler Simkins, *The South, Old and New: A History, 1820–1947* (New York, 1947), probably the best work on the Southern mind and culture, also describes conservative Southern religiosity.

The transition from Jeffersonian, deistic and Unitarian liberalism to orthodoxy and social conservatism has been well documented by a number of fairly recent studies. Clement Eaton's *Freedom of Thought in the Old South* (Durham, N.C., 1940) establishes the reasons why the earlier freedom from c.1790–1820, during the period of Jeffersonian enlightenment, yielded to growing conservatism, as the South felt the need of an acceptable creed to bolster its social system, which was coming under increasing criticism. His detailed study of the fate of two liberal leaders, "Winifred and Joseph Gales, Liberals in the Old South," in *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 10, no. 4 (Nov. 1944), pp. 461–474, with bibliographical references in the footnotes, discusses their leadership in the Southern Unitarian movement, and notes its decline in the later ante-bellum period, because of Unitarian anti-slavery sentiment in the North and the intellectualism of Unitarian preaching and theology. His observations are reinforced by Clarence Gohdes, "Some Notes on the Unitarian Church in the Ante-Bellum South," in David K. Johnson, ed., *American Studies in Honor of William Kenneth Boyd* (Durham, N.C.,

1940), on the early rise of the movement, and its decline after the 1820's. The same tendency in the academic life of the South is accented in Dumas Malone's *The Public Life of Thomas Cooper, 1783–1839* (New Haven, 1926), which indicates the liberalism of Cooper in religion, and its unpopularity as the region grew more conservative under the pressure of pro-slavery sentiment. Two regional studies reveal the hardening orthodoxy of the Southern States. Niels Henry Sonne's *Liberal Kentucky, 1780–1828* (New York, 1939), with a bibliography, describes the early political and religious liberalism of the Upper South, derived from the Enlightenment and Jeffersonian Virginia. The breakdown of this tradition is illustrated by Elmer Garr Million, "Protestantism in the Kentucky Blue Grass, 1865–1940" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1950, copy in the library), which outlines a sociological approach to Southern church history since 1865, using the region as an example of a type neglected or treated with sectional bias, and concentrating on the Baptists, Disciples, Methodists, and Presbyterians as revivalistic, Biblical, and socially conservative. The religious atmosphere of Dixie is described by Charles Dwight Dorough, "Religion in the Old South: A Pattern of Behavior and Thought . . ." (Doctoral dissertation, University of Texas, 1946, copy and microfilm, University library), with bibliography. Allen Tate, in "Remarks on the Southern Religion," in Twelve Southerners, *I'll Take My Stand: The South and the American Tradition* (New York, 1930), proves conclusively that what the Southerner wanted in religion was "a fine set of images to contemplate . . . a discipline in virtue, which had the effect of building up in him an inner restraint." Religion created a willingness to abide by tradition. R. M. Weaver's "The Older Religiousness in the South," in *Sewanee Review*, Vol. 51, no. 2 (Spring, 1953), pp. 237–249, states that the South rejected rationalism as too questioning and dangerous to social order, and regarded religion not as a reforming but as a conserving force, the one sure bulwark in a changing world.

This is true not only of the upper class, but also of the people generally. Defeat in the Civil War began to undermine this attitude, but it persisted into the Fundamentalist movement of the 1920's (see sect. III, K, *Fundamentalist Reaction*).

Its impression upon the strongest Southern denomination is evident in a study by Sherman E. Towell, "The Features of Southern Baptist Thought, 1845–1879" (Doctoral dissertation, Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1955–56). Southern conservative Baptist defenses appear in a fairly complete listing of the major English and American Baptist theological works, with comments, in Leo T. Crismon, "The Literature of the Baptists," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 25 (Winter, 1955–56), pp. 128–131. An eminent representative of Southern orthodox conservatism is Edgar Young Mullins (1860–1928), "the leading philosophical and theological spokesman for conservative Baptists in a difficult time of controversy" (Ahlstrom, essay in Volume One). He was not a fanatical Fundamentalist, but the urbane and reasonable defender of an intelligent orthodoxy, interested in comparative religion, science, and the new Biblical criticism, supporting faith and revelation by liberal methods and arguments. He admired William James's emphasis upon will, and the idealism of Borden Parker Bowne, particularly his concept of the self as above nature. His *The Christian Religion in Its Doctrinal Expression* (Philadelphia and New York, 1917), repeatedly reissued, is the best expression of the influences and tendencies incorporated into his systematic theology—"a ringing defense of personal idealism as the only adequate way of construing reality and as an excellent way of re-enlivening the historic proofs for the existence of God." He was a moderate Calvinist, recalling sometimes Nathaniel W. Taylor and the "New School" Presbyterians. He opposed Methodist "Perfectionism," and was traditionally orthodox, not a social ethicist, or interested in ecclesiastical problems, the ministry, and "ordinances." His concern was with conversion, religious experience, and growth in holiness, as with the early Puritans.

Other important works by Mullins round out the body of his thought: *Why Is Christianity True? Christian Evidences* (Chicago, 1905), with bibliography, his first major work; *Freedom and Authority in Religion* (Philadelphia, 1913); and *Christianity at the Crossroads* (New York and Nashville, c.1924). The theme is Christian apologetics, ardently defending the Christian view of life from philosophical materialism and naturalism, relying upon the Scriptures in dogma, and not councils, creeds, and confessions. His most widely read book, *The Axioms of Religion; a New Interpretation of the Baptist Faith*, (Philadelphia and New York, c.1908), reveals his loyalty to Baptist tradition, particularly conversion and experience, the religion of the heart.

Southern conservatism among upper-class Christians is reflected in studies of the ante-bellum Presbyterians. Growing conservatism in this politically and socially influential group is the subject of a study by Clarence E. Hix, Jr., "The Conflict Between Presbyterianism and Free Thought in the South, 1776–1838" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago; abstract [Chicago] 1940, lithoprinted). Frank Bell Lewis, "Robert Lewis Dabney: Southern Presbyterian Apologist" (Doctoral dissertation, Duke University, 1946), estimates him as a typical defender of "Calvinist Scholasticism," the philosophy of the Scottish "common sense" school, slave-based economy, and Southern culture, 1830–65, and ascertains influences that shaped his thought. Margaret Burr Des Champs, "Union or Disunion? South Atlantic Presbyterians and Southern Nationalism, 1820–1861," in *Journal of Southern History*, Vol. 20, no. 4 (Nov. 1954), pp. 484–498, a study based largely on original sources, reveals the tragedy of Southern Presbyterian conservative separatism, alienating the group from the Northern brethren after the Missouri Compromise conflict of 1820, as shown by the desire for a Southern seminary and church. The reluctant growth of secession sentiment culminated in 1860, and in the organization of the theologically conservative Southern church.

K. Fundamentalist Reaction: The Fundamentalist Criticism of Modernism

Early in the present century there arose a determined opposition to attacks on Christianity by non-Christians, and to the dilution of "essential" Christianity by the Modernists. The new defenders of the faith were proud to style themselves "Fundamentalists," and they have continued to battle for the preservation of what they regard as the fundamentals of the Christian faith. Their basic premise is the literal interpretation and acceptance of the Bible, with no concessions to any apparent contradictions of the Scriptures by science or Biblical criticism. This form of theological archaism is quite different in method and results from Reinhold Niebuhr's brand of Neo-Orthodoxy, and it commands the support of large numbers of Protestants. The theological conservatism of the Fundamentalists is generally accompanied by political and social conservatism, as in the Deep South (see sect. III, J, *Southern Conservatism*).

Stewart Grant Cole's *The History of Fundamentalism* (New York, 1931), with bibliography, the first scholarly critique, attempts to trace the outline of the conflict between progressives and Fundamentalists in various religious groups, to clarify the essential points of the controversy, and to sketch the background of the conflict in the social pattern of inherited Christianity since the colonial period. Conservative reactions to liberal Christianity are reviewed in the Prophetic Conferences, professional evangelism, orthodox schools, tract propaganda, polemical preaching, the appeal of "The Fundamentals," trends in the Fundamentalist movement, and the revival of orthodoxy after World War I. Cole is perhaps too optimistic in assuming Fundamentalism to be defunct, but his study approaches the subject with the really rare quality of historical mindedness. Especially valuable is his treatment of the controversy at the Princeton Theological Seminary and Machen's part in it. Norman F. Furniss' *The Fundamentalist*

Controversy, 1918–1931 (New Haven, 1954), with bibliographical references and "Note," is not a close analysis of the strictly theological position of Fundamentalists, but a factual account of men, movements, and events, centering mostly in certain personalities, seminaries, and denominational papers. It gives a general account of their position and the reasons for it, and traces the course of the controversy in the country and in certain denominations, showing its varying violence, and the reasons why some denominations got off lightly and others did not. Interesting features are the analysis of the ultra-conservative mind, and the account of the battle for freedom of teaching. Decline of the controversy was due to problems of the depression, social concerns, prohibition, the death of Bryan, and the spread of knowledge. Robert T. Handy, in "Fundamentalism and Modernism in Perspective," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 24, no. 3 (Summer, 1955), pp. 381–394, with bibliography in footnotes, traces the roots of the conflict to seventeenth-century Protestant "Biblicism," the separation of faith and reason in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, and the effort to reconcile them in rationalism and evangelical pietism, both issuing from Puritanism. The recent "theological revival" is an effort to reconcile intellectual and emotional aspects of Protestantism, to bring faith and reason together in creative action.

Eldred C. Vanderlaan, *Fundamentalism Versus Modernism* (New York, 1925), is an anthology of statements by leading Fundamentalists and Modernists, on the salient controverted points. The extreme Fundamentalists' position may be studied "out of their own mouths" in a series of booklets, *The Fundamentals: A Testimony to the Truth* (Chicago, 1909–1915, 12 vols.), including essays by American and foreign conservatives and Fundamentalists, making no concession to modern Biblical criticism or evolutionary thought, or the Social Gospel. The raging conflict over Biblical inspiration and authority is reflected in three widely read books on the Fundamentalist side. George Wilson McPherson, *The*

Modern Conflict over the Bible (Yonkers, N.Y., c.1919), a companion volume to *The Crisis in Church and College* (Yonkers, c.1919), defends the evidences, authority, and inspiration of the Bible. John Lorne Campbell's *The Bible under Fire, With an Introduction by Robert Dick Wilson* (New York and London, 1928), attacks the "higher or destructive criticism of the Bible," modernism, and organic evolution. Allison Norman Trice and Charles H. Roberson, *The Bible Versus Modernism; a Compendium of Sundry Critical Hypotheses and Their Refutation* (Nashville, Tenn., c.1935), with bibliography, is a typical Fundamentalist polemic. The arguments are generally reviewed in James W. Johnson, *Fundamentalism Versus Modernism, a Layman's Viewpoint* (New York and London, c.1925).

By far the most eminent Fundamentalist, in the public mind, was the tireless lecturer and writer, William Jennings Bryan, who devoted the later years of his life to fighting a losing rearguard action against Modernism. This aspect of his career is appreciated by Wayne C. Williams, *William Jennings Bryan* (New York, 1936), a sympathetic account presenting the Fundamentalist point of view during the Scopes trial at Dayton, Tenn., in 1925. Probably the most convincing reply to Bryan was offered by the scientist, Henry Fairfield Osborn, *The Earth Speaks to Bryan* (New York, 1925), particularly in ch. 2, "Evolution and Religion," published separately in 1923. Osborn discusses the trial of Scopes, the science teacher, the new inquisition into religious belief by Fundamentalists, evolution and daily living, and presents the credo of a naturalist. Osborn's *Evolution and Religion in Education; Polemics of the Fundamentalist Controversy of 1922 to 1926* (New York, 1926), with bibliography of the controversy, consists of addresses and essays for the press or students, and discusses the question interestingly, non-technically, authoritatively, and tolerantly, with constant reference to Thomas Huxley, his "master." Ray Ginger's *Six Days or Forever?* (Boston, 1958) considers the Scopes trial and its

implications for religion, science, and civil liberties. Alonzo W. Fortune, in "The Kentucky Campaign against the Teaching of Evolution," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 2, no. 3 (May 1922), pp. 225–235, illustrates the belated impact of evolution upon religious thinking in a conservative Southern state, and describes the campaign to secure legislation to forbid the teaching of "Darwinism," aided by Bryan, with texts of bills and account of arguments for and against. The result was a widespread public education in evolution. Wilbur M. Smith's *Therefore Stand* (Boston, 1945) states the Fundamentalist case, with an attack on Protestant Modernism, and is probably the best work of one of the eminent conservative champions. Carl Ferdinand Howard Henry, in *The Uneasy Conscience of Modern Fundamentalism* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1947), analyzes the weaknesses of Fundamentalism, basing the argument upon brief, popular lectures in the Gordon College of Theology and Missions.

The conflict between Fundamentalists and progressives rent several denominations, and was especially bitter in the Presbyterian and Northern Baptist churches. The Presbyterian "row" is detailed by Robert Hastings Nichols in "Fundamentalism in the Presbyterian Church," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 5, no. 1 (Jan. 1925), pp. 14–36, with bibliographical references in footnotes, presenting a clear view of the rise and development of the movement from the heresy charges in the 1890's against Professors C. A. Briggs, H. P. Smith, and A. C. McGiffert. Concern for Biblical infallibility became insistence upon doctrinal orthodoxy. Actions of presbyteries and the General Assembly in the case of H. E. Fosdick are cited, and the significance of the controversy is interpreted. Edwin Harold Rian, *The Presbyterian Conflict* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1940), reviews the controversy in the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A., and the emergence of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church. The leading personality in the genesis of that group was J. Gresham Machen, whose *Christianity and Liberalism* (New York, 1930) is a

good statement of the Conservative position in the 1920's, important because of its hold upon a large portion of American Protestants. William Masselink's *Machen as Apologist . . .* (Bonn, Germany, 1938?), with bibliography, studies his defense of the Fundamentalist tenets and apologetic. A partisan but well-documented account of Machen's personal conflicts with his colleagues in Princeton Seminary is found in Ned B. Stonehouse, *J. Gresham Machen, A Biographical Memoir* (Grand Rapids, 1955). A more balanced appraisal is Lefferts A. Loetscher's *The Broadening Church . . .* (Philadelphia, 1954). Chester Earl Tulga's *The Foreign Missions Controversy in the Northern Baptist Convention, 1919–1949; 30 Years of Struggle* (Chicago, 1950), provides a conservative view of the controversy in one deeply divided denomination. (See also sect. III., E, 5, *Criticisms and Appraisals of Liberal Theology*, above.)

L. Teaching of Theology (Protestant)

The earliest colonial ministers received their training in the universities of Great Britain and the Continent of Europe. After the establishment of the nine colonial colleges, candidates received the traditional academic education there, then studied privately or with noted ministers. Some clergymen, like the Anglican Samuel Johnson and the Congregational Joseph Bellamy, conducted private theological academies. There were no formally established and organized seminaries until after the Revolution, when theological education gradually became a separate faculty in its own institutions. Before 1825 nearly all the major denominations had founded theological schools. There is no satisfactory, comprehensive, up-to-date history of American theological education and ministerial training. The story must be assembled from articles, theses, essays, histories of seminaries, and denominational and general surveys intended to improve the quality of preparation. There are two brief general

reviews in James Ernest Roscoe, *A Short History of Theological Education* (London, rev. ed., 1948), and Keith R. Bridston, *Theological Training in the Modern World* . . . (Geneva, World's Student Christian Federation, 1954), mimeographed. The best general history still is Charles Augustus Briggs, *History of the Study of Theology* . . . prepared for publication by his daughter, Emilie Grace Briggs . . . (New York, 1916, 2 vols.), with bibliography, Vol. 2. The evolution of college training for the ministry, the rise of private theological academies, and the courses of study, are comprised in Mary Latimer Gambrell, *Ministerial Training in Eighteenth-Century New England* (New York and London, 1937), with bibliography. Z. Freeman's *Manual of American Colleges and Theological Seminaries; Giving Statistical Statements of Their Origin, Endowments, Libraries, Students, Alumni, &c., with Supplementary Notes* (Rochester, 1856) is about the earliest source for extensive information on the schools of divinity. James Laurence Bowdoin, in "Some American Theological Seminaries," in *The Sunday Magazine*, Vol. 10, no. 5 (Nov. 1881), pp. 465–474, presents a statistical summary and general survey, based upon a few representative ones of various churches, with illustrations, a good view of education and administration on the eve of great changes in the curriculum caused by the rise of liberalism and Biblical criticism.

Much of the best information on the development of ministerial education and theological teaching is found in exhortations and studies contemplating improvement, especially after the rise of scientific criticism in the 1850's. Edwards Amasa Park, himself a teacher at Andover, suggested improvement in *Theological Education, An Address, Delivered Before the American Education Society, at the Anniversary Meeting in Boston, May 30, 1865* (Boston, 1865). Very pointed remarks on reform appear in three articles and an editorial discussing the stagnation of the theological seminaries, in *The Outlook*, Vol. 92, no. 1 (May 1909), pp. 66–

68, 75–82: editorial, "Ministers as Men of the World," pp. 66–68; Charles Stelzle, "Jebusites Versus Chicagoites," pp. 75–77; Thomas Jesse Jones, "Are Our Theological Seminaries Stagnating?", pp. 77–79; and "Twenty-Five Seminaries Speaking for Themselves," pp. 79–82. The editorial is a forthright comment on the failure of seminaries to educate men for a modern intelligent ministry in the industrial world. The ideal and the curriculum are too unworldly. Stelzle and Jones indicate the tragic failure to adjust courses to the changed social situation, likewise the summary of information from seminaries of various denominations. Arthur S. Hoyt of Auburn Theological Seminary, in *The Preacher; His Person, Message, and Method* . . . (New York, 1909), with bibliographies, also scores the failure to educate men to minister to people in an industrial age. The clergy have been trained as an intellectual and religious caste, without vision of a social remedy in the Gospel. Individualism is too dominant in theology and the church.

Such criticism eventually produced many serious studies, assessing theological training and suggesting reforms, such as *Theological Study Today: Addresses Delivered at the Seventy-fifth Anniversary of the Meadville Theological School, June 10, 1912* (Chicago, 1912). Other highly competent investigations are in Anson Phelps Stokes, *University Schools of Religion,* especially the essay (New Haven, 1914) "The Yale University School of Religion" [by] Benjamin W. Bacon; and Garrett Biblical Institute, *The Theological School Today; Addresses Given on the Occasion of the Inauguration of President Frederick Carl Eiselen* . . . (Evanston, Ill., 1924?). Robert Lincoln Kelly's "Tendencies in Theological Education in America," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 4, no. 1 (Jan. 1924), pp. 16–31, was based on a thorough survey authorized by the Institute of Social and Religious Research, and carried on by the Council of Church Boards of Education. It reveals "the serious attempt by many seminaries to adapt the courses of study to the religious needs

of today." The result of the research was his monumental report, *Theological Education in America; a Study of One Hundred Sixty-one Theological Schools in the United States and Canada,* with a Foreword by Charles Henry Brent (New York, c.1924). Mark A. May [and others], *The Education of American Ministers* (New York, 1934, 4 vols.), the most comprehensive survey published, is an assessment of strong and weak features, with suggestions for improvement, and estimates of the seminaries. Another suggestion for reform was made by William Adams Brown, in "A Century of Theological Education and After," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 6, no. 4 (July 1926), pp. 363–383. He traces the origins of theological education to the practical needs of denominations for an educated ministry to support their beliefs, describes the early curriculum, changes in ideals and social habits, and resulting changes in religious ideas and problems, and outlines the task of modern theological education, with special reference to the Social Gospel, Christian unity, interest in religious education, and the Fundamentalist movement, emphasizing the organization of scholarship and research in better correlation with the needs of the church. His own experience as a seminary teacher is told in *A Teacher and His Times, A Story of Two Worlds* (New York, 1940), the autobiography of one much loved by his students and very influential in the American Protestant churches.

Other personal visions which should be mentioned, of a more realistic approach to the problem, are: Abdel Ross Wentz, "A New Strategy for Theological Education," in *Christian Education,* Vol. 20, no. 4 (April 1937), pp. 291–318; and Ernest Cadman Colwell, "Toward Better Theological Education," in *Journal of Religion,* Vol. 20, no. 2 (April 1940), pp. 109–123, which points to the chief weakness in the work of theological schools, as "confused thinking as to the nature of the work," and proposes a reform of the curriculum. One of the latest and most competent personal surveys is by Hermann Nelson Morse, "The Integration of

Education for the Christian Ministry," in American Association of Theological Schools, *Bulletin,* no. 18 (June 1948), pp. 93–124. Indeed, one of the most comprehensive views of modern thinking on the subject is the Association's *Bulletin* (Louisville, Ky., 1920–), containing records of the biennial meetings, addresses, and discussions on many aspects of theological education, affording a good way of following the trends and suggestions for reform in Protestant theological training. The latest result of the organization's many years of research is its *Survey of Theological Education in the United States and Canada, The Ministry in Historical Perspectives,* ed. H. Richard Niebuhr and Daniel Day Williams (New York, c.1956), with bibliographical references in "Notes," essays, including references to education of the Protestant ministry in America. Other products of this study are: H. Richard Niebuhr, *The Purpose of the Church and its Ministry; Reflections on the Aims of Theological Education,* in collaboration with Daniel Day Williams and James M. Gustafson (New York, 1956); and H. Richard Niebuhr, Daniel Day Williams, and James M. Gustafson, *The Advancement of Theological Education* (New York, 1957).

Field work as an essential phase of training is ably described and evaluated in Frank Clifton Foster, *Field Work and Its Relation to the Curriculum of Theological Seminaries* (Johnson City, Tenn., n.d.); Carl Hamilton Morgan, *The Status of Field Work in the Protestant Theological Seminaries of the United States . . .* (Philadelphia, 1942); and Seward Hiltner, ed., *Clinical Pastoral Training . . .* Commission on Religion and Health, Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America (n.p., 1945); also in J. Christy Wilson, ed., *Ministers in Training; a Review of Field Work Procedures in Theological Education,* by the Directors of Field Work in the Seminaries of the Presbyterian Church, U.S.A., Representatives of the Boards of the Church and other Specialists (Princeton, N.J., 1957), with a bibliography.

There are a few outstanding studies of theological education

in denominations, including four respecting the Presbyterian churches: Samuel John Baird, *A History of the Early Policy of the Presbyterian Church in the Training of her Ministry; and of the First Years of the Board of Education* . . . (Philadelphia, 1865); Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, Council on Theological Education, *Report* . . . prepared . . . 1953 by Donald G. Stewart, mimeographed; John McNaugher, *The History of Theological Education in the United Presbyterian Church and its Ancestries* (Pittsburgh, 1931); and William Oxley Thompson, *A Report of a Survey of the Theological Seminaries and the Assembly's Training School of the Presbyterian Church in the United States* . . . (Louisville, Ky., 1928). Lutheran administration of ministerial training is reviewed in Oscar Ahlenius Winfield, *The Control of Lutheran Theological Education in America* (Rock Island, Ill., 1933). One of the best denominational reports is Northern Baptist Convention, Board of Education, *Theological Education in the Northern Baptist Convention, a Survey;* prepared by Hugh Hartshorne and Milton C. Froyd for the Commission on a Survey of Theological Education of the Northern Baptist Convention, 1944–45 (Philadelphia, 1945). The Methodist Church, Board of Education, Division of Educational Institutions, has published a comprehensive report on theological training: *A Survey of Ten Theological Schools Affiliated with the Methodist Church,* under the Auspices of the Commission on Theological Education, the Board of Education, and the Association of Methodist Theological Schools (Nashville, 1948). Riley Benjamin Montgomery's *The Education of Ministers of Disciples of Christ* (St. Louis, 1931) is a technical survey. William Walker Rockwell, "Theological Libraries in the United States," in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 13, no. 4 (Sept. 1944), pp. 545–555, reviews three eras of theological education—college, tutorial, and seminary—and the spread of seminaries, 1807–1817. Library development, corresponding to the eras, is surveyed from 1638, with a general review

of the holdings in the Northeastern states, by classes of literature.

The genesis and development of various types in American theological education may be profitably approached by study of selected examples from the steadily growing bibliography of seminary histories. These vary considerably in scholarly merit. In the round, however, they present an accurate panorama of theological education since the separation of theology from the liberal arts college between about 1810 and 1830. They comprise general accounts of origin and progress, development of the curriculum, lives of the teachers, controversies, changes in the content and orientation of theology, growth of physical "plants," financial support, and relations with the sponsoring denominational organizations.

The liberal tradition of New England is illuminated by George Huntston Williams, ed., *The Harvard Divinity School, Its Place in Harvard University and in American Culture* (Boston, 1954), with bibliography in the footnotes. Practically the entire history of the modification of New England Calvinist theology is chronicled in Roland H. Bainton's *Yale and the Ministry, A History of Education for the Christian Ministry at Yale from the Founding in 1701* (New York, 1957), with bibliography in notes by chapters. Another phase of gradual liberalization is told in *History of Andover Theological Seminary* (Newton, Mass., 1933) by the ecclesiastical historian, Henry K. Rowe. The most conservative New England seminary in origin, and now one of the most liberal, is described entertainingly in Curtis M. Geer's *The Hartford Theological Seminary, 1834–1934* (Hartford, 1934).

Conservative Presbyterianism is represented by abundant historical data in a massive memorial volume, *Centennial Celebration of the Theological Seminary of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America at Princeton, New Jersey* . . . (Princeton, N.J., 1912). The influence of one seminary in promoting conservative Southern religion is

searchingly studied in Louis C. LaMotte's *Colored Light, The Story of the Influence of Columbia Theological Seminary, 1828–1936* (Richmond, Va., 1937), with an extensive bibliography. The "New School" Northern Presbyterian type of doctrine and teaching comes to light in John Quincy Adams' *History of Auburn Theological Seminary, 1818–1918* (Auburn, N.Y., 1918), and in George Lewis Prentiss' carefully detailed *The Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York: Historical and Biographical Sketches of its First Fifty Years* (New York, 1889).

Interesting insights into the development of the Mercersburg Reformed theology abound in George Warren Richards' admirable *History of the Theological Seminary of the Reformed Church in the United States, 1825–1934* . . . (Lancaster, Pa., 1952), with its massive bibliography. The Reformed Dutch conservative tradition is commemorated in two memorial volumes, heavily weighted with historical data: *The One Hundred Fiftieth Anniversary of the Founding of New Brunswick Theological Seminary* . . . (New Brunswick, N.J., 1934); and the *Semi-Centennial Volume, Theological School and Calvin College, 1876–1926* (Grand Rapids, Mich., 1926), which has an unusually complete list of writings by members of the faculty. Abdel Ross Wentz, a scholar of the United Lutheran Church, has traced the growth of an important seminary in *The History of Gettysburg Theological Seminary* (Philadelphia, 1926).

Northern and liberal traditions in Baptist theological education are embodied in the history and achievements of the Rochester Theological Seminary, as recorded in the *Seminary Bulletin, The Anniversary Volume* . . . May, 1925, Seventy-sixth year, no. 1 (Rochester, 1925). Southern orthodoxy inspires L. R. Scarborough's *A Modern School of the Prophets, A History of the Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary . . . Its First Thirty Years, 1907–1937* (Nashville, 1939).

Anglican teaching is best described in one of the most exhaustive studies of an American theological school ever pub-

lished: William A. R. Goodwin's two-volume *History of the Theological Seminary in Virginia and Its Historical Background* (New York, 1923). One of the best briefer histories, distinguished by a complete bibliography of books by faculty members, is James Arthur Muller's *The Episcopal Theological School, 1867–1943* (Cambridge, Mass., 1943). Another excellent volume, probably the best on Methodist teaching of divinity, is James Richard Joy's *The Teachers of Drew, 1867–1942* . . . (Madison, N.J., 1942), compiled for the seventy-fifth anniversary. Among the superior histories is an interesting and well-documented account of a Swedish Baptist school, by Adolf and Virgil A. Olson; *Seventy-five Years, A History of Bethel Theological Seminary, St. Paul, Minnesota, 1871–1946* (Chicago, 1946), with a list of sources.

(For Roman Catholic theological teaching, see above, sect. II, J, *Roman Catholic Theological Revival.*)

IV. RELIGION AND PHILOSOPHY

A. General

ARTHUR KENYON ROGERS, *The Religious Conception of the World; an Essay in Constructive Philosophy* (New York and London, 1914), is a good standard introduction to the general subject of the philosophy of religion, along with Friedrich, Freiherr von Hügel, *Essays and Addresses on the Philosophy of Religion* (London and Toronto, New York, 1928), widely read and respected by American religious philosophers and theologians; and Archibald Allan Bowman, *Studies in the Philosophy of Religion*, ed. with a memorial introduction by Norman Kemp Smith (London, 1938, 2 vols.), with bibliography, which is regarded as a careful and scholarly presentation of problems in the area, surveys anthropological evidences, and examines questions bearing on the concept and validity of religion, but has been criticized as an over-intellectualized view of religion. Peter Anthony

Bertocci, *Introduction to the Philosophy of Religion* (New York, 1951) has bibliographies and is a superior text for students, taking religious life for granted, and helping them to analyze religious problems philosophically and to understand religion in terms of the most modern philosophy. Fulton John Sheen's *Philosophy of Religion, the Impact of Modern Knowledge on Religion* (New York, 1948), with bibliographies, establishes the relationship between human reason and religion from a Thomistic theological viewpoint, and critically assesses major currents of modern thought. Edwin Arthur Burtt's *Types of Religious Philosophy* (New York and London, c.1939) has bibliographies with most of the chapters, and includes early historical background, Catholic and Protestant Fundamentalist views, the religion of science, agnosticism, ethical idealism, modernism, humanism, individual philosophies, and current trends. A review of modern empiricism in America, influential especially before the 1930's, is given by James Alfred Martin, *Empirical Philosophies of Religion, with Special Reference to Boodin, Brightman, Hocking, Macintosh and Wieman* (New York, 1947), with bibliography.

One of the best authorities on American religious philosophy, unsurpassed up to its time, was written by empiricists, Henry Nelson Wieman and Bernard Eugene Meland, *American Philosophies of Religion* (Chicago and New York, 1936), with bibliography. They endeavor to interpret for academic people the contemporary types, classified as supernaturalism, liberalism, idealism, and naturalism, with attention to their historic sources and temper of thought, in relation to the present cultural situation, estimating their importance as efforts to formulate faith for the time. The authors stress the need for philosophy of religion, and the efforts of religious thinkers to find one against great odds, and criticize overemphasis upon science-mindedness and intellectualism as a barrier to constructive presentation of spiritual and personal religion. George Reuben Metcalf's essay,

"American Religious Philosophy and the Pastoral Letters of the House of Bishops," in *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Vol. 27, no. 1 (Mar. 1958), pp. 10–84, has an extensive bibliography, including "An Introductory Bibliography in American Religions Arranged According to Representative Men and Movements." This consists of general works, and studies of the various schools of thought, by their protagonists or critics, from Colonial philosophy to modern Neo-Supernaturalism. Chapter 3 analyzes the thought of representative American philosophers and schools, 1700–1953. Several general histories of American philosophy present interestingly its relations to religion. Recent trends are charted in William Arthur Richards, "The Perfection of God: A Survey of Recent American Religious Philosophy" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1950, University of Chicago Library). Joseph L. Blau, *Men and Movements in American Philosophy* (New York, 1952), with bibliography, traces the development of philosophical ideas and systems from Edwards to Dewey, including movements with significant relations to religion: transcendentalism, idealism, pragmatism, realism, and naturalism. Other general texts to be consulted are: P. R. Anderson and M. H. Fisch, *Philosophy in America* (New York, 1939); W. G. Muelder and M. Sears, *The Development of American Philosophy* (Boston, 1940); Herbert W. Schneider, *The History of American Philosophy* (New York, 1946); and M. H. Fisch, ed., *Classic American Philosophers* (New York, 1951).

B. Theism

The history of American theism is well covered by the general histories of religious philosophy. A few studies devoted specifically to theistic philosophy chart its course from the colonial period, when the "New Science" and the rise of Deism began to alter the ideas of God as stated in classical theology. The impact of the new philosophy is studied

in Lewis Smith, "The Changing Concept of Deity in Eighteenth-Century American Thought" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Iowa, 1948). Varying theistic concepts, conservative and liberal, during the theological ferment of the nineteenth century, are illustrated by Frederic Henry Hedge, *Reason in Religion* (Boston, 1867, 4th ed.), by a Unitarian conservative, including essays on "Religion within the Bounds of Theism" and "Rational Christianity"; Samuel Harris, *The Philosophical Basis of Theism . . .* (New York, 1883); Borden Parker Bowne, *The Philosophy of Theism* (New York, 1887); and George Park Fisher, *The Grounds of Theistic and Christian Belief* (New York, 1902, rev. ed.). The variety of American theistic systems around the turn of the century, when Bowne and Fiske were being widely read and discussed, shows the fluidity of thought in the field, described in Alfred Caldecott, *The Philosophy of Religion in England and America* (London, 1901), part 1, "The Types Described," part 2, "The Types Illustrated": thirteen schools of philosophical thought discussed in critical reviews, with references to the more important writings. Two works by eminent religious apologists expound the relations of theism with certain prominent non-theistic philosophies, particularly humanism, naturalism, and empiricism: William Hallock Johnson, *Humanism and Christian Theism* (New York and Chicago, c.1931), lectures at the Princeton Theological Seminary, with references and notes; and Orville Anderson Petty, *Common Sense and God; a Critique of Naturalism* (New Haven, 1936).

C. Philosophical Orthodoxy

The Enlightenment eventually stimulated a reaction toward philosophical and theological orthodoxy, which took a modified Calvinistic direction. It was concerned not so much with exploring new frontiers of learning, as with finding systematic ways of imparting knowledge of the well known.

The result was that theologians and philosophers were not usually outstanding individuals, but that their common outlook was historically important. The theologians refined their systems of thought to preserve and promote religious truth as they saw it. Liberal religion tended to become Unitarian "orthodoxy," free-thinking went its own way, and the "New Light" Edwardseans went theirs, refining and trying to adjust their system to new currents of thought.

The "freezing" of philosophical orthodoxy in later Edwardseanism, rationalism, and liberal orthodoxy was not all loss. It raised an opposition that led onward to new types of thought. Opposition to Edwards' denial of free will created a new "faculty psychology," which criticized Edwards and Locke for failing to consider the faculty called consciousness, emotion, or feeling. The new psychology relied extensively upon introspection. The result was a revolution in teaching academic philosophy, the chief interest being in the intellectual and moral powers of the mind. Following this line, late in the nineteenth century, came speculative academic idealism (see sect. IV, D, *Idealism and Religion*). A general outline of philosophical orthodoxy is in Herbert W. Schneider's chapter, "Orthodoxy," in *The History of American Philosophy* (New York, 1946). Typical expressions are: Noah Porter, "The Sciences of Nature versus the Science of Man, a Plea for the Science of Man," in J. L. Blau, ed., *American Philosophical Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946); Laurens P. Hickok, *Rational Cosmology; or The Eternal Principles and the Necessary Laws of the Universe* (New York, 1858). Walter Thomas James, "The Philosophy of Noah Porter" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, 1951; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor (1951), no. 2823; *Microfilm Abstracts*, Vol. 11, no. 4, pp. 1064–1065), studies his criticism of Transcendentalism. His systematic philosophy was "transcendental realism," an effort to reformulate the "Yale orthodoxy" to combat Transcendentalism, British empiricism, and Spencerian evolutionism.

The movement toward a new psychology, which deeply affected religious thinking, is traced in Jay W. Fay, *Psychologies before William James* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1939). It appeared also in the bold psychology of religious education of Horace Bushnell, especially in his *Christian Nurture* (New York, 1883), and in *Nature and the Supernatural: The One System of God* (New York, 1864). Emphasis upon the moral aspect prepared the way for the new religious philosophy of Transcendentalism. The direction in which thought was moving appeared in Francis Wayland's (1796–1865) Phi Beta Kappa address, 1831, "A Discourse on the Philosophy of Analogy," in Joseph L. Blau, ed., *American Philosophic Addresses, 1700–1900* (New York, 1946); summarized also in Blau's *Men and Movements in American Philosophy* (New York, 1952). The "Discourse" emphasizes mental and moral "sensitivity." Wayland abandoned the Paley type of natural religion (long a mainstay of philosophical and religious orthodoxy), and adopted an anti-utilitarian system of conscience and duty. He even suggested "that the Christian scientist will achieve a more reliable estimate of the truth than any other man because he is closer to the Source of truth, that is, God" (see Metcalf, p. 47). The New England theologian, Samuel Hopkins, emphasized "man's progress toward increasing refinement of sensitivity for 'moral conditioning'" (*ibid.*). This movement of orthodox philosophers away from the old orthodoxy, based upon Scottish realistic intuitionism, was leading to objective idealism. It did not bolster orthodoxy, but displaced French "ideology" by bringing in German psychology and Transcendentalism (see sect. II, H, 3, *Transcendentalist Theology*).

D. Idealism and Religion

1. PHILOSOPHICAL IDEALISM. Orthodox academic philosophy tended toward "mentalization of matter" (Metcalf, p. 53) and toward idealism. This idealistic trend, which deeply

affected theology, was greatly strengthened after the Civil War, when teachers brought from German universities their psychology and speculative philosophy, independent of both science and religion. American philosophy shifted from traditional orthodoxy to German idealism, from "conscious mind as the door to understanding reality, to mind as the essentially real." This was made easier by the previous idealistic trend, from Edwards through Channing, Wayland, and Porter. The outlook became decidedly Hegelian—a trend which Porter and Tayler Lewis had seen, as in Lewis' "The Two Schools of Philosophy," in *American Theological Review*, Vol. 4, no. 13 (Jan. 1862), pp. 102–134; and Porter's *Elements of Intellectual Science* (New York, 1871). Porter welcomed critical idealism as a means of countering the influence of American Coleridgeans. He declared the universe to be "a *thought* as well as a *thing*," an absolute to be assumed in order to make thought and science possible. The Coleridgean influence is estimated by Verne A. Spindell, "The Influence of Samuel Taylor Coleridge on Nineteenth-Century American Religious Thought" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1941).

The history of the introduction of Hegelianism, as the basis of a new academic idealism, is related by J. H. Muirhead, "How Hegel Came to America," in *Philosophical Review*, Vol. 37, no. 3 (May 1928), pp. 226–240. Laurens P. Hickok (1798–1888) was the pioneer systematic expositor of German idealism among American theologians, and was an Hegelian, teaching that "true liberty is the freedom of the community," that individual freedom is a hopeless bondage, and that knowledge of God is attained by the "insight of reason" (Metcalf, p. 54). His views were set forth as early as 1862, in two articles: "Modern Philosophy Pantheistic," in *American Theological Review*, Vol. 4, no. 14 (April 1862), pp. 199–227; and "Psychology and Skepticism," in *ibid.*, Vol. 4, no. 15 (July 1862), pp. 391–414. Hickok's widespread influence inspired other teachers in American colleges and uni-

versities, who believed in the power of German idealism (particularly of Kant and Hegel) to "reform American morals and religion" (Metcalf, p. 54, quoted in Schneider, *The History of American Philosophy*, p. 452). Several idealistic schools, differing but all raising up religious force, gave faith and moral life to many non-church intellectuals, just as Transcendentalism had done. Their faith in God, approached through criticism and intellectual communion, was a relief from wornout orthodoxy, the sentimental, evolutionary moralism of many liberal Protestants, and Transcendental vagueness. Schools and associations studied German idealism in various places, including St. Louis and Concord, Mass. The St. Louis and Concord schools were associated (see Part Two, sect. III, F, *Transcendental Religion*, refs. to St. Louis Hegelians and the Concord School of Philosophy).

Personalism: Borden Parker Bowne (1847–1910). The best-known academic idealistic tradition is that of Borden Parker Bowne, of the Methodist Boston University, who had a vast influence upon theological development. Bushnell in the Church and Emerson outside it had begun to lay the basis of theological liberalism through German romantic idealism. Later many religious and idealistic philosophers provided the philosophical basis for a new theology to meet the challenge of science and the new materialistic and naturalistic philosophies. Bowne was the most influential in the churches: a sharp critic of materialistic evolutionists, a pupil of Rudolph Hermann Lotze, who attempted to synthesize the facts and methods of science and religion into a unified idealistic philosophy. Bowne's system rested upon "the single and ideal ground of all reality and the absolute irreducible nature of the self" (see Ahlstrom essay, "Theology in America . . . ," in Volume One). His was a "personalistic idealism." Down to World War I (about the time when Liberalism reached its peak) nearly all theological liberals tended to follow the main trends of his thought: idealism, personalism,

immanentism, and ethicism. Bowne's influence upon many seminaries was great, and his tradition was continued by A. C. Knudson and E. S. Brightman, professors in the School of Religion at Boston University. The outlines of his Christian philosophical idealism are clearly drawn in his *Theism* (New York and Cincinnati, 1902); *Studies in Theism* (New York and Cincinnati, 1879, 1907); *Philosophy of Theism* (New York, 1887); *The Immanence of God* (Boston and New York, 1905); *Studies in Christianity* (Boston and New York, 1909); and *Metaphysics* (Boston, 1943). Bowne's was the only idealistic philosophy to serve as a religious one in the strict sense, and to maintain close church connections. His "personalistic" philosophy was most clearly expressed in *Personalism* (Boston, 1908; new ed., Norwood, Mass., 1936), which like Lotze's defended the idea of the self, and "argued that since persons can only be caused by persons, the ultimate cause must be 'at least personal'" (see Metcalf, p. 54). His followers stressed personality as the center of all value, perspective, meaning, and ultimate reality. Bowne influenced so many Methodist ministers that his life and influence are appropriately assessed by a Methodist bishop, Francis John McConnell, in *Borden Parker Bowne, His Life and His Philosophy* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1929), with bibliography.

The successor of Bowne as a "personalist" was Edgar Sheffield Brightman, whose views are summarized in *Personality and Religion* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1934), written for the average educated man, and comprising the fundamental principles of the personalistic philosophy of religion: liberal, with a scientific approach and a practical purpose. An excellent study of Brightman's personalistic philosophy is James John McLarney, *The Theism of Edgar Sheffield Brightman* . . . (Washington, D.C., 1936), with bibliography; and in *Personalism in Theology, a Symposium in Honor of Albert Cornelius Knudson*, by associates and former students, ed. Edgar Sheffield Brightman (Boston, 1943), in-

cluding the relations of personalism to metaphysics, nature, history, ethics, race, religion, education, etc., with a bibliography of Knudson's writings.

Another school of idealistic philosophy developed at Cornell University. The leader was James Edwin Creighton, whose doctrine has been called "objective idealism." Its chief tenets were that the only complete empiricism is understanding of human experience in historical course and institutional forms, and that "all experience is an absolute, coherent organic whole" (Metcalf, pp. 54–55). Creighton's position appears in *Studies in Speculative Philosophy* (New York, 1925), and H. G. Townsend, *Philosophical Ideas in the United States* (New York, 1934). A school of idealistic philosophy at the University of Michigan was headed by George Sylvester Morris, author of *Philosophy and Christianity* (New York, 1883). His contribution to idealism and its relation to religion is studied in Marc E. Jones, *George Sylvester Morris: His Philosophic Career and Theistic Idealism* (New York, 1948). His vewpoint emphasized "the logic of life in a dynamic idealism," derived largely from German Kantian philosophy, and he made knowledge and being correlative terms. Another member of this group was Alfred H. Lloyd, author of *Dynamic Idealism* (Chicago, 1898). He developed a dynamic idealism, maintaining that the universe is a living thing, a thinking organism. Soul is the very substance in which organic matter and dynamic mind are one. Living and thinking at their highest, creative level are full of conflict and doubt, and he therefore thought of history in the Hegelian sense (Metcalf, p. 55). He is estimated in Evelyn Shirk, *Adventurous Idealism* (Ann Arbor, 1952).

Critical estimates of idealism are found in the following works: G. Stanley Hall, "Philosophy in the United States," in *Mind*, Vol. 4 (1879), pp. 89–105; C. C. Everett, *Theism and the Christian Faith* (New York, 1900); George Herbert Palmer, *Autobiography of a Philosopher* (Boston, 1930); Felix Adler, *The Reconstruction of the Spiritual Ideal* (New

York, 1924); and William Ernest Hocking, *The Meaning of God in Human Experience* (New Haven, 1912). Mary Edith Runyan, in "Philosophical Idealism and Recent Protestant Theology in America" (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia University; *University Microfilms*, 1957), declares that idealism, the traditional support of Protestant theology, was compelled to adapt itself to changes in theology and religious experience since 1900. W. E. Hocking is an example of trying to make idealist philosophy serve Christian theology. Whitehead, Hartshorne, and Wieman left idealism in favor of the philosophy of creative process in nature, but retained important idealistic doctrines. The result was a more intelligible and fruitful rationalization of religious experience than was provided by the older idealism.

2. IDEALISM AND RELIGION: JOSIAH ROYCE. Royce was perhaps the greatest proponent of "Absolute Idealism." He not only believed (as had Edwards) that to be real is to be mental, but also that reality consists in nothing short of the total, all-embracing experience of the "Absolute" or divine mind. Insofar as he was an "Absolute Idealist," Royce's thinking was essentially Hegelian or "Germanic." But he was also intensely American in his desire to do justice to the doctrine of the selfhood of the free individual. Most of Royce's thinking was aimed at easing the relationship between absolutism and individualism. Both in his political thinking and in his philosophy of religion, he tried to bridge the gap between the Absolute and the individual by means of a concept which increasingly fascinated him—the concept of "loyalty." Royce "devoted his life to drawing a comprehensive picture of God that would satisfy the deepest needs of intelligent men." He stressed the categorical moral imperative: living as if one's life and his neighbor's were the same, thus restating the Kantian ethics of good will, which he later developed into a "philosophy of loyalty," in which happiness is not individual but social and communal—"a collective goal, collectively attained." He adopted C. S. Peirce's view of a perfect society

as one like "an infinite community of scientists engaged in the unselfish and cooperative pursuit of truth." He was indebted partly to G. Holmes Howison's theory of the City of God, described in J. W. Buckham and G. M. Stratton, eds., *G. Holmes Howison, Philosopher and Teacher; a Selection from His Writings with a Biographical Sketch* (Berkeley, Calif., 1934); and his *The Limits of Evolution and Other Essays* (New York, 1901).

Royce's religious outlook is perhaps best summarized in *Sources of Religious Insight* (New York, 1912), especially in ch. 5, "The Religion of Loyalty." This illustrates his aim at religious unity, and emphasis on sources rather than creeds or philosophies, on individual and social experience as sources, "the unity of the spirit and the invisible church." Aspects of his philosophy were developed in *The Conception of God* (New York, 1897), and *The World and the Individual* (New York, 1905), especially Lecture 1, "Religious Problems and the Theory of Being," and Lecture 9, "Universality and Unity." *The Philosophy of Loyalty* (New York, 1909), especially in Lecture 8, "Loyalty and Religion," illustrates the effort of this proponent of "absolute idealism," in his philosophy of religion, to attempt to bridge the gap between the absolute and the individual. Further insight into the religious characteristics of Royce's idealistic philosophy is gained from his *The Religious Aspects of Philosophy* (Boston, 1885), and *The Problem of Christianity* (New York, 1913, 2 vols.). Commentaries on Royce's philosophy in general, and his opinions on religion, are in H. G. Townsend, *Philosophical Ideas in the United States* (New York, 1934); A. K. Rogers, *English and American Philosophy since 1800* (New York, 1922), ch. 5, sect. 5; Herbert W. Schneider, *A History of American Philosophy* (New York, 1946), ch. 37; Ralph H. Gabriel, *The Course of American Democratic Thought* (New York, 1940), ch. 21; and S. G. Brown, ed., *The Religious Philosophy of Josiah Royce* (Syracuse, 1952). Paul Leonard McKay discusses "The Religious Aspect of the Philosophy

of Josiah Royce" (Doctoral dissertation, New York University, School of Education, 1945, with bibliography, LD3907. E3, 1945, M25). Wilfred Manlove Mitchell's "Josiah Royce, H. B. Alexander and Christianity: A Normative Study in Christian Metaphysics" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1940) states that each claimed his own as the only metaphysics to explain the phenomena of Christian religion and dogmatics, and determines their adequacy as interpreters of Christianity, Alexander being the more successful. R. Paul Ramsey estimates Royce in "The Doctrine of Man in the Philosophy of Josiah Royce and Bernard Bosanquet" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1943; abstract published as "The Idealistic View of Moral Evil: Josiah Royce and Bernard Bosanquet," in *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research,* Vol. 6, no. 4 (June 1946), pp. 544–589, bibliographical footnotes), and emphasizes his profound insights into the nature of man. Contemporary Neo-Orthodoxy is an heir of his profound thought, more than of personalistic or ethical idealism. See also John E. Smith, *Royce's Social Infinite* (New York, 1950).

Royce described his "Great Community" in terms that recall Calvinist theology. Individualism is sin, salvation is the communication of God's grace through the community. Disloyalty in the individual must be atoned for by greater loyalty of others. His God and church appealed to many disheartened and bewildered people in a naturalistic generation, who accepted a Spencerian universe without ground for religious faith. People who could not accept Calvinism nor evolutionary optimism found a new hope in his idealism.

E. Radical Empiricism

After the death of Royce, idealism tended to lose its identity as a distinct type of philosophy, largely because interest in the "objective mind" theory supplanted interest in search for the "Absolute." The period following World War I saw

the rise of pragmatism, instrumentalism, and radical empiricism. Reason, truth, and value were increasingly viewed in a temporal context, and the "Absolute" was reduced to the natural status of rational ideals and moral ends. The result was doubt with respect to the traditional allegiance of religion to the idea of absolute ethical and moral values.

Three pioneers of radical empiricism, based upon psychobiology and pragmatic realism, had been Chauncey Wright, Francis Ellingwood Abbott, and Charles Sanders Peirce. The latter was especially important, and his work is briefly summarized in Justus Buchler, ed., *The Philosophy of Peirce: Selected Writings* (New York, 1940), and Thomas A. Goudge, *The Thought of C. S. Peirce* (Toronto, 1950). The three most eminent names in the development of radical empiricism are William James (son of Henry James, Sr., the Transcendental idealist), John Dewey, and George Herbert Mead. Mead (1886–1931), a pupil of Royce, who moved away from idealism and "worked out a relativistic system of naturalistic realism . . . Reality consists of the aggregate of temporal situations, each with its own past and its own future." Intelligent human experience consists of the "manipulation" of these situations to produce communities of experience, and the use of experience to achieve values in life. Mead emphasized social acts and moral conduct, and believed that the development of social institutions had left theological interpretation behind and concentrated its interest in the present. Typical expressions of his philosophy are: *The Philosophy of the Present* (Chicago, 1932); *Mind, Self and Society* (Chicago, 1934); and *The Philosophy of the Act* (Chicago, 1938). Two superior commentaries are Grace Chin Lee, *George Herbert Mead, Philosopher of the Social Individual* (New York, 1945), and T. V. Smith, "The Religious Bearings of a Secular Mind: George Herbert Mead," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 12 (1932), pp. 200–213. There is said to be no historical work which "does justice to the great significance for theology of logical positivism [and] logical empiricism" (Ahlstrom,

"Continental Influence on American Christian Thought since World War I," *Church History*, Vol. 27, no. 3 (Sept. 1958), p. 272, note). Recommended summaries and bibliographies are in Herbert Feigl, "Logical Empiricism," in Dagobert D. Runes, ed., *Twentieth Century Philosophy* (New York, 1947). Examples of theological literature in the area are John Hick, *Faith and Knowledge* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1957), and E. L. Mascall, *Words and Images* (London, 1957).

F. Voluntarism: William James

James was one of the few American philosophers before the twentieth century to receive serious consideration outside the United States. Religion is a major theme in many of his philosophical writings, and he seemed honestly to attempt "to build a superstructure of belief upon a foundation of scepticism" (Bertrand Russell). In the effort to find a firm philosophical ground he turned to inner experience as the area in which religious truth can be discovered. James and Jonathan Edwards are to be compared in respect to this emphasis upon experience. His empirical and voluntaristic treatment of religion has exercised a profound influence on subsequent American thinking, even down to the modern "peace of mind" books, which reflect no little of James's notion of "the will to believe" (see below, sect. v, B, *Popularizing Religious Psychology*).

James's pragmatic approach resulted from his conclusion that "consciousness does not exist as an entity but is rather a grouping of characters borrowed from the environment." The function of knowledge is "to provide substitutes for things which it is practically impossible to know directly." Ideas should be tested by direct knowledge, knowledge is limited to what can be presented, and relations between things are as much matters of direct experience as things themselves (see Metcalf, pp. 57–58). His pragmatic philosophy is outlined in the classic work, *Pragmatism* (New York, 1943),

Lecture 8, "Pragmatism and Religion," an essential reading, a brief statement of his attitude toward religion, which appears also in *A Pluralistic Universe* (New York, 1943). Another classic, *The Varieties of Religious Experience* (New York, 1902) is James's major work in the field of religion, still useful for the study of religious psychology. *The Will to Believe and Other Essays* (New York, 1903), especially in "The Will to Believe" and "Reflex Action and Theism," states his belief that God is the "deepest power in the universe and a power not ourselves that not only makes for righteousness but means it and which recognizes us."

Edmond Darvil Benard discusses "The Problem of Belief in the Writings of John Henry Newman, William James and St. Thomas Aquinas" (Doctoral dissertation, Catholic University of America, 1950, typewritten copy, Catholic University Library, B21.C36, Vol. 116, in Catholic University of America, Philosophical Series; microcard BD215). Julius Seelye Bixler's *Religion in the Philosophy of William James* (Boston, 1926), especially chs. 7 and 9, comments on the conflict of monistic and pluralistic values, and James's final decision for pluralism and its "aggressive attitude toward life," while retaining some monistic concepts, and gives evidence for James's belief in survival. Another useful general commentary is Charles Whitney Leslie, "The Religious Philosophy of William James" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1944, typewritten, Harvard University Library, HU90.4798). John Beattie Harrington, "William James's Theory of Religious Knowledge" (Doctoral dissertation, Princeton University, 1953; *University Microfilms*, Ann Arbor, pub. no. 6810; *Dissertation Abstracts* (1954), Vol. 14, no. 2, p. 372), is a long and elaborate critique, and stresses his emphasis on experience rather than theology, philosophy, and ecclesiastical organizations. Empiricism is linked with religion through the study of experience. His religious empiricism was expressed in pragmatic experimentalism, voluntaristic fideism, and experientialism. James's idea

of deity is discussed in Jay Graham Frisbee's "The Idea of a Limited God in James, Ward, and Tennant" (Doctoral dissertation, Yale University, 1941). Wesley Northridge Haines, in "The Function of the Factor of God in the Philosophy of William James" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1949, typewritten, Harvard University Library, HU90.5571.5), attempts to indicate how God functioned as a *factor*, not merely an idea, in James's empiricism, pragmatism, meliorism, pluralism, and individualism. He defends James against the accusation that he made God in man's image, and shows how much later thought in the philosophy of religion has been impregnated by James's thinking. Horace M. Kallen's *William James and Henri Bergson* (Chicago, 1914), especially in ch. 5, "Divinity—Its Nature and Its Role in Human Affairs," also analyzes James's concept of God.

There have been many general commentaries on James as a philosopher, with references to his religious thought. Ralph Barton Perry's *The Thought and Character of William James* (Boston, 1935, 2 vols.) is the "standard" commentary, together with his "The Philosophy of William James," in *Present Philosophical Tendencies* (New York, 1921). Theodore Flournoy, in *The Philosophy of William James* (New York, 1917, tr. Edwin B. Holt and William James, Jr.), includes James's rejection of monism, and various aspects of his thought—pragmatism, radical empiricism, pluralism, meliorism and moralism, theism, the will to believe—and is considered by many as the best commentary. Herbert W. Schneider's *A History of American Philosophy* (New York, 1946) has a useful bibliography on James.

G. Pragmatism

The influence of the doctrine of Evolution in the formation of the pragmatic attitude is explained in Philip P. Weiner, *Evolution and the Founders of Pragmatism* (Cambridge,

1949). Denton Loring Geyer, *The Pragmatic Theory of Truth as Developed by Peirce, James, and Dewey* (Urbana? 1916), with bibliography, is practically a history of pragmatic philosophy in the United States. Sidney Hook's *The Metaphysics of Pragmatism,* with an Introductory Word by John Dewey (Chicago and London, 1927), with bibliographical footnotes, embodies a substantial contribution toward a just synthesis of the pragmatist pioneers, especially Peirce and Dewey, with the positions of their classical critics, and is considered "not far from a model apologia for the pragmatist." Charles Sanders Peirce is generally considered as the "father" of American pragmatism, an attribution that seems justified by the following studies: W. B. Gallie, *Peirce and Pragmatism* (Harmondsworth, England, 1952), and Manley Haun Thompson, *The Pragmatic Philosophy of C. S. Peirce* (Chicago, 1945), part of a doctoral thesis, University of Chicago, 1942, reproduced from typewritten copy.

Pragmatism and its religious significance are usually identified with John Dewey (1859–1952). Sometimes known as "instrumentalism" or "contextualism," his viewpoint regards ideas as "instrumental within the particular context in eliminating conflicts of experience and in bringing about a relative integration." Solutions are tested by experimentation: an idea that "works" is true. That the world of nature and the world of thought are of the same order, is the basis of his "naturalistic metaphysics." There is no difference between moral science and other sciences, morality being intelligence applied to human life. Mature intelligence, applied in forming and fixing values by which to live, will make for a democratic way of life. The aims of democracy will be achieved and the highest capacities of human nature utilized by using scientific experimentalism in morals and social action (see Metcalf, pp. 59–60). Excellent works for the study of the evolution and nature of Dewey's pragmatism and "instrumentalism" are: John Dewey, "The Development of American Pragmatism," in *Philosophy and Civilization* (New York, 1931); Morton G.

White, *The Origin of Dewey's Instrumentalism* (New York, 1943); Jerome Nathanson, *John Dewey* (New York, 1951); and Paul A. Schilpp, ed., *The Philosophy of John Dewey* (Evanston and Chicago, 1939). Dewey's philosophy, as expounded in his own writings, is perhaps most clearly seen in *Experience and Nature* (Chicago, 1925); *Human Nature and Conduct* (New York, 1930); *How We Think* (Boston, 1933); and *A Common Faith* (New Haven, 1934). The latter is an expression of his democratic religious philosophy.

Dewey's religious philosophy issued from his type of pragmatism. The authority of the traditional concepts of God comes from ideal qualities which are more effective without "divine" sanction. His religious faith lay in "the universal possibilities of shared experience." Cooperative effort to discover truth is really more religious than completed revelation. Religion is "commitment to ideal ends and values," and the religious goal is ideal fulfillment of natural experience. The pragmatic religious approach, which he favored, is outlined in Loren Benjamin Macdonald, *Life in the Making: An Approach to Religion Through the Method of Modern Pragmatism* (Boston, 1911), which proposes a solution to the mystery of life through experience, converting the material world into terms of life, with no theories about God and life not growing from one's own experience: a good example of how a pragmatist thinks about God and religion. Briefer summaries are given by Joseph Roy Geiger, in his *Some Religious Implications of Pragmatism* (Chicago, 1919); by William Eugene Felch in *A Pragmatic Theory of the A Priori as Applied to the Religious Problem of Value* (Chicago, 1944, part of a doctoral thesis, University of Chicago, 1942, reproduced from typewritten copy); and in Gail Kennedy, ed., *Pragmatism and American Culture* (Boston, 1950), readings selected by the Department of American Studies, Amherst College, with bibliography and bibliographical footnotes. Arnold vanC. Huizinga, *The American Philosophy, Pragmatism Critically Considered in Relation to Present-day Theology* (Boston,

1911), is a protest against pragmatism which, the author claims, "fails to vindicate its rejection of all normative standards which an objective static truth guarantees." Another discussion is in Leslie J. Walker, *Theories of Knowledge* (London, 1911).

H. Humanistic Alternatives to Religion

Quite apart from the merely clever atheists and priest-despisers, there always are serious thinkers who find the assumptions of traditional religion unacceptable, but who have a genuine concern about some religious dimension of human living. The humanistic alternatives to supernatural, revealed religion often have their foundation in a naturalistic approach to moral values. This approach is explained and analyzed in some selected works on:

1. HUMANISM AS A PHILOSOPHY. Walter Marshall Horton, *Theism and the Modern Mood,* with an Introduction by William Adams Brown (New York and London, 1930) refers to the attitude of humanistic philosophy to traditional religion. Alfred Jules Ayer, *Language, Truth and Logic* (New York, 1936) is based upon a most extreme form of philosophical renunciation of traditional theology, by an English author who has had a widespread influence upon American thinkers, especially in ch. 5, "Critique of Ethics and Theology." Johannes A. C. F. Auer and Julian Hartt discuss the modern conflict of two religious outlooks, in *Humanism Versus Theism* (Yellow Springs, O., c. 1951); and various types of humanistic approach to religion and life are surveyed in Frederick Henry Burkhardt, *The Cleavage in Our Culture; Studies in Scientific Humanism in Honor of Max Otto* (Boston, 1952), a collection of essays tied together by a unifying view of scientific humanism; also in John Bunyan Eubanks, "Modern Fashions in Humanism" (Master's thesis, 1938, University of Chicago Library, UCL38-3528). Much of the preparation for humanism was made by John Dewey, especially in *The Quest for*

Certainty (New York, 1929), particularly ch. 5, "The Construction of Good," important because of his powerful influence on the thinking of laymen, especially by indirection, through the pervasive implementation of his educational theories. His *A Common Faith* (New Haven, 1934), three lectures at Yale University, tries "to formulate a faith not confined to any sect or creed." Empiricism and naturalism, in conflict with concepts of historic religions, suggest to the orthodox a very attenuated religion of natural piety, however idealistic.

In the popular mind, however, humanism has been associated with Paul Elmer More, Irving Babbitt, and Norman Foerster. Paul Elmer More's *On Being Human* (Princeton and London, 1936), on the revival of humanism, has notes on Irving Babbitt, religion and social discontent, the church and politics, for Christians confused by modern social difficulties and their possible solutions. M. D. C. Tait, in "The Humanism of Paul Elmer More," in *University of Toronto Quarterly*, Vol. 16, no. 2 (Jan. 1947), pp. 109–122, traces the development of More's philosophical and religious thought. A much less tolerant and urbane defender, who aroused great antagonism, was Professor Irving Babbitt of Harvard. The hostility is seen in Harry Salpeter, "Irving Babbitt: Calvinist," in *Outlook and Independent*, Vol. 155, no. 11 (July 16, 1930), pp. 421–423, 439. He views Babbitt as a harsh character with a negative morality, and gives a biographical sketch, and an outline of his career and expression of humanist doctrine. His brand of humanism is criticized as a philosophy of fear, timidity, denial, and rejection, a hard dogma, pessimistic and misanthropic. Foerster (whom Salpeter calls the "recruiting sergeant of the humanist school") in "Humanism and Religion," *Forum*, Vol. 82, no. 3 (Sept. 1929), pp. 146–150, notes the growing weariness with revolt and skepticism, and the longing for intelligent and spiritual order, which humanism provides. Humanism and religion are opposed to "naturism," but humanism is a working philosophy of life

and not a religion, standing between dogma and skepticism, without revelation and ecclesiasticism. The humanists can be a saving remnant in the battle against "naturism," perhaps in the collapse of dogmatic religion. Foerster's *Humanism and America* . . . (New York, c. 1930) consists of essays by disciples of the "new humanism," applying their philosophy to various aspects of intellectual life. Criticized as full of careless thinking and outworn ideas, the book is nevertheless typical of the period's vague humanitarian sentiment.

2. RELIGIOUS HUMANISM. Religious humanism in America originated partly in Unitarianism, and partly in humanistic philosophy introduced from Europe, especially through the writings of George Santayana. It has accented the idea that man's religious needs can be satisfied without appeal to the supernatural. Its more advanced thinkers often have discarded theism entirely. The influence of Santayana proceeded largely from his *The Life of Reason* (New York, 1905–06), Vol. 3, "Reason in Religion," expounding an interesting variety of religious humanism that has attracted many Americans. His *The Idea of Christ in the Gospels* (New York, 1946) is interesting for a comparison, in his remarks about the function of religion, with *The Life of Reason.* Highly competent commentaries on Santayana's religious humanism are in Irwin Edman, ed., *The Philosophy of Santayana* (New York, 1936), with selections from *Reason in Religion;* and Paul A. Schilpp, ed., *The Philosophy of George Santayana* (Chicago, 1940), especially the essay "Reason in Religion and the Emancipated Spirit," by H. L. Friess and H. M. Rosenthal. Paul Grimley Kuntz reviews Santayana's peculiar humanistic religion in "Religion in the Life of George Santayana" (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, 1946, typewritten, Harvard University Library, HU90.4997). Unitarian sources of American religious humanism are explored in Stow Persons, *Free Religion, an American Faith* (New Haven, 1947), with bibliographical note, explaining the origin and nature of American free re-

ligion, an attitude that ultimately encouraged religious humanism.

Modern expressions of Unitarian humanism are very numerous. One of the most convincing is by John Haynes Holmes, long-time pastor of the Community Church, New York City: *New Churches for Old; a Plea for Community Religion* (New York, 1922), calling for a wholly new statement of religion, based on democratic social idealism, and held together by common interests, stressing social rather than individual salvation. Robert Lester Mondale's *Three Unitarian Philosophies of Religion* (Boston, 1946) discusses deism, theism, and especially humanism—an example of the overlapping of viewpoints in modern liberal religion. James Henry Leuba, in *The Reformation of the Churches* (Boston, 1950), with bibliographical footnotes, expresses the belief that religion and the churches can save civilization, after shedding old superstitions, severely criticizes popular religion, and taxes the Modernists with insincerity, but is amateurish in philosophy. John Hassler Dietrich, *The Humanist Pulpit . . . Addresses* (Minneapolis, 1931–36, 8 vols.) is a typical expression of radical Western humanistic Unitarianism.

After World War I religious humanism, indeed, tended to become more radical. The following titles illustrate its manifold aspects. Roy Wood Sellars, in *The Next Step in Religion; an Essay Toward the Coming Renaissance* (New York, 1918), and *Religion Coming of Age* (New York, 1928) sees the center of gravity in religion as changing from supernaturalism to humanistic naturalism, and traces the history of the movement. The last chapter describes a humanist's religion, loyalty to spiritual values of human life. Curtis Williford Reese, ed., *Humanist Sermons* (Chicago and London, 1927), preached in behalf of a growing non-theistic humanism, reveals a revolt against supernatural coloring, and is a protest against speculative thought not founded on experience, and reliance upon authority. The sermons appear to disregard deep personal re-

ligious needs and longings, and to offer no satisfactory interpretation of man's cosmic situation. Charles Francis Potter's *Humanism, a New Religion* (New York, 1930), and *Humanizing Religion* (New York and London, 1933) define humanism as "faith in the supreme value and self-perfectibility of human personality," rejecting God to accept selfhood and self-improvement, science as opposed to supernaturalism. Curtis Williford Reese's *Humanist Religion* (New York, 1931) defines humanism as "a philosophy of life able to challenge the traditional philosophies and religions and covering all aspects of human well-being," compares it with materialism and theism, and discusses humanist trends in modern religious developments. Edwin Arthur Burtt, *Types of Religious Philosophy* (New York, 1939) discusses modern humanism in general, with reference to some outstanding advocates of the position. William Floyd, *Humanizing Biblical Religion* (New York, 1943) discusses Biblical criticism and interpretation, free thought, and modern humanism. Richard Wilson Boynton, *Beyond Mythology; a Challenge to Dogmatism in Religion* (Garden City, N.Y., 1951) proposes humanism as a universal religion, following the line of naturalistic philosophy, for laymen unable to reconcile Christian doctrine with science. Lloyd and Mary Morain, *Humanism as the Next Step, an Introduction for Liberal Protestants, Catholics, and Jews* (Boston, 1954), by the president of the American Humanist Association and his wife, director of the International Humanist and Ethical Union, makes out a case for religious humanism. A recent radical expression is Kenneth Leo Patton's *Man Is The Meaning* (Boston, 1956). George Angier Gordon, a liberal Congregationalist, in *Humanism in New England Theology* (Boston and New York, 1920) expresses a much milder Christian humanist interest. Every form of theism is founded upon a humanistic interpretation of the universe, and the New England divinity is a variety of humanism enduring as a type, although obsolete as a system of opinion. Lynn Harold Hough, *Evangelical Humanism* (New

York and Cincinnati, c.1925) is another expression of conservative humanism in religion; likewise his *Christian Humanism and the Modern World* (Toronto, 1948). Charles Henry Dickinson's *The Religion of the Social Passion* (Chicago, 1923) treats the relationship between humanism and the social type of gospel.

3. RELIGIOUS CRITICISM OF HUMANISM. Francis John McConnell, a Methodist bishop, in *Humanism and Christianity* (New York, 1928) emphasizes human worth and the effort of the church to safeguard it. "Instrumentalism" is an enemy to society and the higher individualism of the true "personalist," as described by the philosophy of Borden P. Bowne. William Hallock Johnson's *Humanism and Christian Theism* (New York and Chicago, c. 1931), with references and notes, criticizes humanism from the orthodox Presbyterian viewpoint. William Peter King, ed., *Humanism; Another Battle Line* (Nashville, 1931), with selected bibliography and books by contributors, is a symposium by ten authors, who oppose the materialistic implications of humanism and its non-theism, but make an effort to understand it as a needed protest. Louis Joseph Alexandre Mercier, *The Challenge of Humanism; an Essay in Comparative Criticism* (New York, 1933), with references and notes, one of the most important books on humanism, comments on Paul Elmer More and Irving Babbitt, and studies the relation of humanism to religion, covering the whole movement in America, and the history of humanism from the Renaissance. Charles Hartshorne's *Beyond Humanism; Essays in the New Philosophy of Nature* (Chicago and New York, 1937), with bibliographical references, is not content with humanism or mild theism, and expounds "theistic naturalism," a radical interpretation of religion in terms of the philosophy of A. N. Whitehead and the doctrine of relativity. Elias Andrews, *Modern Humanism and Christian Theism* (Grand Rapids, c. 1939), with bibliography, reviews the history of humanism and discusses modern types, including the religious, and appraises modern humanism in the light of

Christian theism: a very thorough effort to discredit modern humanism, but with too extended a range of approach. Lynn Harold Hough's *The Christian Criticism of Life* (New York and Nashville, 1941) criticizes humanist philosophy, regarding secularity as an abdication of moral responsibility and an abandonment of the heritage of civilization. Johannes A. C. F. Auer and Julian Hartt, *Humanism Versus Theism* (Yellow Springs, O., 1951) originated in a public discussion on the question, "Is humanism the religion of the future?" and is a formal statement of the basic issues between humanism and theism, with Hartt opposed to humanism. Probably the best Christian philosophical critique of humanism is by Arthur Hazard Dakin, in *Man the Measure; an Essay on Humanism as Religion* (Princeton and London, 1939), interested primarily in humanistic ideas of God, and in analyzing the worth of the humanist movement as protest against theism. Rejecting humanism as inadequate, he exposes contradictions in its thought, and points to the limited, middle-class character of humanism in the early 1930's, and the logical feebleness of most of its anti-theist propaganda. Roman Catholic criticism may be represented by Sister Mary Vincent Killeen, *Man in the New Humanism* (Washington, D.C., 1934), with bibliography; and Werner Wilhelm Jaeger, *Humanism and Theology*, under the Auspices of the Aristotelian Society of Marquette University (Milwaukee, 1943), with bibliographical references.

I. Pantheism

John Shertzer Hittell, a cultural historian of the late nineteenth century, in *A Plea for Pantheism* (New York, 1857), discusses the subject of pantheism versus anthropomorphism. Among other American defenses of pantheism as a religious philosophy are: Charles Orendorff, *The Pantheist; or, The Dial of Progress* (Springfield, Ill., 1865); John Franklin Clark, *Nature the One and Only Deity* . . . (Boston, 1882);

F. E. Titus, *The Pantheism of Modern Science . . .* (Chicago, 1900); and Oliver Leslie Reiser, *Nature, Man, and God; a Synthesis of Pantheism and Scientific Humanism* (Pittsburgh, 1951). Charles Murray Nairne, *Atheism and Pantheism . . .* (Albany, 1848), a lecture by a clergyman to a Young Men's Association, reflects the spreading influence of pantheistic ideas. Other American criticisms of pantheism appeared at intervals throughout the nineteenth and into the twentieth century. Among them should be mentioned Morgan Dix's *Lectures on the Pantheistic Idea of an Impersonal-Substance Deity, as Contrasted with the Christian Faith Concerning Almighty God* (New York and Boston, 1864); Robert Patterson, *Fables of Infidelity and Facts of Faith: Being an Examination of the Evidences of Infidelity* (Cincinnati, 1875), with bibliography; Abraham Kuyper, *Pantheism's Destruction of Boundaries*, tr. by J. Hendrik de Vries (New York? 1893), first published in the *Methodist Review* (New York), July, Sept., 1893; and Henry Clay Sheldon, *Pantheism Dilemmas and Other Essays in Philosophy of Religion* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1920), which considers pragmatism.

J. Non- and Anti-Religious Philosophies

1. RATIONALISM. American rationalist criticism of religious faith sprang from the rationalist movement of the eighteenth century, which is covered largely under the topics *Deism* and *Free Religion* (see Part Two, sect. III, B and G). Rationalism tended to fade in the early 1800's, but there is evidence of its persistence between 1810 and 1860. Among the evidences is an important but now practically forgotten book: George Bethune English, *The Grounds of Christianity Examined, by Comparing the New Testament with the Old* (Boston, 1813). English was a noted rationalist and was read and appreciated by Jefferson and other liberals. Rationalistic propaganda has been spread by periodicals since the pre-Civil War era. A few

of the more important ones, which have criticized revealed religion, are: *The Monthly Beacon* (New York, ed. G. Vale (1788–1866), 1848–1849, 2 vols.), superseded by the *Independent Beacon. The Age of Reason, a Liberal and Independent Paper* (New York, 1848–1849), ed. P. Eckler. *The Truth-Seeker; a Magazine for Free-Tthinkers* (New York, Sept. 1873–Dec. 1929, 56 vols., with varying titles) issued the "Truth-Seeker Tracts upon a Variety of Subjects," by different authors (New York, 1876, 3 vols.). The story of this magazine is told by George E. H. MacDonald, in *Fifty Years of Free-Thought; Being the Story of the Truth Seeker* . . . (New York, 1929–31, 2 vols.), covering the period 1875–1925. *The Age of Reason* (New York, Freethinkers of America, Jan. 1937–Oct. 1951) appeared with varying title. Books in defense of the rationalist viewpoint, with a dominantly anti-religious bias, were very numerous in the post-Civil War era and the early years of the twentieth century. Representative titles include: Frederick Gerhard, *The Coming Creed of the World, Is There Not a Faith More Sublime and Blissful Than Christianity? A Voice Crying in the Wilderness* (Philadelphia, 1884); Robert Chamblett Adams, *Travels in Faith from Tradition to Reason* (New York and London, 1884); Herbert Newton Casson, *The Crime of Credulity* (New York, c.1901); Henry Frank, *The Doom of Dogma and the Dawn of Truth* (New York and London, 1901), with bibliography; Robert Chamblett Adams, *Good Without God* (New York, 1902); and Emanuel Haldeman-Julius, *This Tyranny of Bunk* (Girard, Kan., c.1927).

Since Darwinism burst upon the American religious and intellectual scene, there have been many *anti*-rationalist works, and others trying to reconcile religious faith and rationalism. A selection of these should include: Robert Patterson, *Fables of Infidelity and Facts of Faith* (Cincinnati, 1852); George Park Fisher, *Faith and Rationalism* . . . (New York, 1885, new and enl. ed.); Joseph Hine Rylance, *Christian Rational-*

ism; Essays on Matters in Debate between Faith and Unbelief (New York, 1898), an important work by a liberal Episcopal clergyman, an early protagonist of the Social Gospel; William Henry Fitchett, *The Beliefs of Unbelief; Studies in the Alternatives to Faith* (New York and Cincinnati, 1907); and Arthur Holmes, *The Decay of Rationalism* (Philadelphia, 1910), with references. Critiques of rationalistic attitudes toward religion have come from several authors who might be said to represent denominations: George Henry Bennett, *Challenge of the Church, Rationalism Refuted . . .* (Cincinnati, 1914) voices a Methodist point of view. Also by a Methodist is Bishop John Fletcher Hurst's *History of Rationalism; Embracing a Survey of the Present State of Protestant Theology . . .* (New York and Cincinnati, 1901, rev. ed.), with bibliography. Theodore E. W. Engelder represents a Lutheran view in *Reason or Revelation?* (St. Louis, Mo., 1941). André Bremond's *Religions of Unbelief . . .* (Milwaukee, c.1939) is a Roman Catholic analysis of the modern rationalist substitute for religion and of human reasons for seeking salvation in revelation, dependent upon Hocking and A. E. Taylor, largely a convenient summary of the anti-rationalist arguments by a philosophically trained man.

2. POSITIVISM. Richmond Laurin Hawkins, in *Auguste Comte and the United States, 1816–1853* (Cambridge, Mass., 1936) relates the beginning of Positivist influence, through the correspondence of Comte with George Frederick Holmes. His continuation of this volume, *Positivism in the United States, 1853–1861* (Cambridge, Mass., 1938) discusses the American attitude toward Comte's philosophy, polity, and religion, and notices Henry Edger as the American apostle of Positivism in the remarkable village of "Modern Times." Special attention is devoted to British sources of American Positivism, including Harriet Martineau. This carefully documented book fills an important gap in American intellectual history. Edger's influence is further studied in Robert Edward

Schneider, *Positivism in the United States: the Apostleship of Henry Edger* (Rosario, Argentina, 1946), with a bibliography. Early American reactions to the Positivist philosophy are well represented by those of a liberal minister, Andrew Preston Peabody, author of *The Positive Philosophy, An Oration Delivered before the Phi Beta Kappa Society of Amherst College, July 9, 1867* . . . (Boston, 1867), one of the most important early commentaries, by a Boston Unitarian. James Martineau's *Religion as Affected by Modern Materialism* . . . with an Introduction by the Rev. Henry W. Bellows (New York, 1877) was influential because of the author's constant association with American liberal Christians like Bellows. Ranson Bethune Welch's *Faith and Modern Thought* . . . with Introduction by Tayler Lewis (New York, 1876) was one of the earliest American philosophical reactions to Positivism. Tayler Lewis, a Christian philosopher, earlier had begun to oppose non-religious philosophies in his attack upon Naturalism (see sect. IV, J, 3, *Naturalism*).

The most determined later American proponent of Positivism was Frederic Harrison (1831–1923), whose convictions are completely set forth in *The Creed of a Layman: Apologia pro Fide Mea* (New York, 1907), the story of his conversion to the Positivist viewpoint, and attainment of spiritual rest, including Positivist services. This uncompromising polemic, with all its sincere and fervent conviction, was criticized for "solemn absurdities of the positivist religion," and as too abstract and indifferent to facts. His *The Philosophy of Common Sense* (New York, 1907) is a companion volume and includes discourses on natural theology, heaven, and the "Ghost of Religion," and summarizes the philosophical grounds on which *The Creed of a Layman* is based. Harrison's *The Positive Evolution of Religion, Its Moral and Social Reaction* (New York, 1913) embodies the substance of lectures published in the *Positivist Review*, June 1911 to June 1912: a luminous statement of the Positivist

"Religion of Humanity," and a trenchant study of others from the Positivist viewpoint; but criticized as "outgrown," with no vigorous philosophical examination of the foundations of religion.

There has been much debate concerning the alleged hostility to religion of recent logical positivism. Perhaps the best source of insight into this matter is the preface and essays of *New Essays in Philosophical Theology,* Antony Flew and Alasdair MacIntyre, eds. (London, 1955).

3. NATURALISM. *Studies in Naturalistic Philosophy.* Harvey G. Townsend, ed., *Studies in Philosophical Naturalism* (Eugene, Ore., 1931) is a good brief introduction to a field which is quite thoroughly covered by Yervant Hovhannes Krikorian, ed., *Naturalism and the Human Spirit* (New York, 1944), a collection of essays, with one by S. P. Lamprecht, "Naturalism and Religion," and "Naturalism in America," by H. A. Larrabee, "The Naturalism of Frederick Woodbridge," by H. T. Costello, and "The Nature of Nauralism," by J. H. Randall. R. Lester Mondale's "Henry David Thoreau and the Naturalizing of Religion," in *Unity,* Vol. 137, no. 1 (Mar.–Apr., 1951), pp. 14–17, suggests the solitary of Walden Pond as a pioneer naturalistic philosopher. An important early defender of the philosophy was the pragmatist, Charles Sanders Peirce, seen as a naturalist by Philip Paul Wiener and Frederic H. Young, eds., *Studies in the Philosophy of Charles Sanders Peirce* (Cambridge, Mass., 1952). Evidently widely read and influential in America was Samuel Alexander, a British philosopher, the subject of a study by John William McCarthy, *The Naturalism of Samuel Alexander* (New York, 1948), with bibliography, which regards him as a systematizer, his work alternative to the Thomistic and Aristotelian synthesis. It is carefully documented and critical, but is criticized for a too ready acceptance of the weakest aspect of Alexander—evolutionary optimism. Roy Wood Sellars' *Evolutionary Naturalism* (Chicago and London, 1922) is an effort "to square criti-

cal realism with naturalism," and to establish a philosophical system upon an interpretative synthesis of the physical and biological sciences and psychology, avoiding the "old" naturalism, founded on the exact sciences only. John Dewey's *A Common Faith* (New Haven, 1934) makes a striking presentation of the naturalistic polemic against religion; published also in Joseph Ratner, ed., *Intelligence in the Modern World* (1938), chapter "The Religious in Experience." Benjamin Wolstein's *Experience and Valuation; a Study in John Dewey's Naturalism* (New York, 1949) has bibliographical footnotes and a selected bibliography.

An evidence of the penetration of naturalistic ideas into religious philosophy is presented by Ernest L. Snodgrass, *Naturalism and Supernaturalism in E. W. Lyman's Philosophy . . .* (Chicago, 1939). Walter Terence Stace, in *Time and Eternity; an Essay in the Philosophy of Religion* (Princeton, 1952) "proposes to reconcile naturalism with religion by deriving all religious experience from mysticism." God can be known only through intuition, not through intellect, and religious concepts are to be interpreted symbolically, not literally. A briefer statement of his attitude is an article, "Man Against Darkness," in *Atlantic Monthly*, Vol. 182, no. 3 (Sept. 1948), pp. 53–58, an illustration of the tenor of contemporary naturalism in religion: science has replaced the concept of a benevolent universe governed by spiritual values, by the idea of one which is "purposeless and meaningless"; this has killed the essential religious spirit in Western civilization—without which (he admits) it cannot survive. Theodore M. Greene replies in "Man Out of Darkness, Religion Has Not Lost Its Power," in *Atlantic Monthly*, Vol. 183, no. 4 (Apr. 1949), pp. 45–49, supporting a *critical* religious faith, rather than a cynical acceptance of minor illusions of worldly success, without belief in God. Religion is an end in itself, and a condition of cultural vitality. Irwin Edman, in "A Reasonable Life in a Mad World," in *Atlantic Monthly*, Vol. 183, no. 3 (Mar. 1949), pp. 60–62, is profoundly pes-

simistic: man apparently is an irrational animal in an irrational universe; resignation and endurance (not zeal, or epicureanism, or mysticism) will do. His solution is a stoic life of reason, with an element of hope for improvement. John Herman Randall's *Nature and Historical Experience; Essays in Naturalism and in the Theory of History* (New York, 1958), with bibliographical footnotes, sums up the modern outlook of naturalism.

a. Criticism of Naturalism; Mostly from a Religious Viewpoint. An evidence of the beginning of debate between Naturalism and Christianity in America is a lecture delivered at Union College, Schenectady, New York, in 1849, by Tayler Lewis: *Nature, Progress, Ideas, A Discourse on Naturalism, in its Various Phases, as Opposed to the True Scriptural Doctrine of the Divine Imperium . . .* (Schenectady, 1850). A critique widely known and admired in the United States is Rudolf Otto (University of Göttingen), *Naturalism and Religion . . .* Translated by J. Arthur Thomson . . . and Margaret E. Thomson; ed. with an Introduction by the Rev. W. D. Morrison (London and New York, 1907): a compact review of the main points in the naturalism versus religion controversy; the theory of naturalism, that the free creative mind does not exist, is refuted by the very existence of the naturalist philosophy. The controversy between naturalism and religion became rather bitter in the 1930's, and left such evidences as Irvin Eugene Lunger, "The Influence of Contemporary Naturalism upon Religion" (Master's thesis, University of Chicago, 1935, UCL36-1971); Orville Anderson Petty, *Common Sense and God; a Critique of Naturalism* (New Haven, 1936); and James Bissett Pratt, *Naturalism* (New Haven and London, 1939), on the meaning and history of naturalism, its relation to life and evolution, the relations of naturalism with mind, morality, and religion: a witty and hard-hitting study. J. S. Pennepacker wrote one of the best criticisms of naturalism in "Theism and Pragmatic Naturalism," in *Religion in Life,*

Vol. 10, no. 3 (Summer, 1941), pp. 411–423, with bibliographical footnotes. He reviews the life work of Charles Sanders Peirce (1839–1914), "father of American pragmatism," also religious naturalism, and attempts to determine the direction of theism under that pressure. Theism will follow naturalism in finding God as an "ordering force within the natural universe." William Fletcher Quillian's *The Moral Theory of Evolutionary Naturalism* . . . (New Haven and London, 1945), with bibliography, analyzes a type of theory widely popular but rarely examined adequately by defenders or opponents, points out the distinction between description of the rise of morality and value judgments on standards, and the illogical nature of the transition from descriptive to evaluational statements. Naturalists' affirmations are largely convincing, their denials and exclusions "dogmatic and unconvincing." Other able critiques are found in Paul Tillich, *Christianity and the Problem of Existence; Three Lectures* (Washington, D.C., 1951), from the viewpoint of one of the principal leaders of the Neo-Orthodox theological movement; and James Donald Butler, *Four Philosophies and Their Practice in Education and Religion* (New York, 1957, rev. ed.), including bibliography, and discussions of naturalism, idealism, realism, and pragmatism. Arnold Bruce Come's "Naturalism and the Religious Problem in America" (Doctoral thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, typescript, with bibliography) reviews the history and present influence of naturalism.

4. SECULARISM. American secularism, generally indifferent or hostile to religion, sprang partly from the Enlightenment movement of the eighteenth century in France. Secularism had widespread influence in Great Britain, where it probably was influenced less by French rationalism than by native Deistic and other rationalist movements. British secularism affected Americans in the latter half of the nineteenth century, especially through the writings and notoriety of Charles Bradlaugh (the atheist who was denied a seat in Parliament),

and of George Jacob Holyoake. The views of English secularists and their Christian opponents are clarified by several debates: Brewin Grant (b. 1821), *Christianity and Secularism, Report of a Public Discussion between Brewin Grant and George Jacob Holyoake, Esq., Held in the Royal British Institution . . .* (London, 1853); [Charles Bradlaugh] (1833–1891), *Christianity and Secularism Contrasted, Report of the Debate at Wigan, between "Iconoclast" and Mr. W. M. Hutchings* (London, 1861); George William Foote (1850–1915), *Is Secularism the True Gospel for Mankind? Verbatim Report of a Debate Held in the Town Hall, Batley . . . 1877, between G. Foote and George Sexton . . .* (London, 1877); George Sexton, *Christianity & Secularism: Which is the Better Suited to Meet the Wants of Mankind? A Written Debate between the Rev. George Sexton . . . and Charles Watts . . .* (London, 1882), reprinted from *The Secular Review*. One of the most influential secularists was the English reformer, George Jacob Holyoake (1817–1906). His writings were published and largely read in the United States, and must be considered to have had much influence in spreading secularism as an attitude toward life: *Secular Responsibility* (New York, 1867); *English Secularism; a Confession of Belief* (Chicago, 1896), which originally appeared as a series of articles in the *Open Court* magazine; and *Sixty Years of an Agitator's Life* (London, 1892, 2 vols.). John Milton Bonham's *Secularism: Its Progress and Its Morals* (New York and London, 1894) illustrates the widespread influence of the doctrine, which became a serious rival to religion in the present century—a fact revealed by the following selected criticisms.

Philip Arthur Micklem, *The Secular and the Sacred; an Enquiry into the Principles of a Christian Civilization* (London, 1948), with bibliography, has been extensively read and rather influential among American Christians. J. Richard Spann, ed., *The Christian Faith and Secularism* (New York, 1949), a symposium of essays, defines secularism as "an

evasive, often unconscious, philosophy which does not deny but ignores the presence and ethical influence of a living God." The authors consider the influence of secularism upon creative forces, politics, and economic and social issues. David Richard Davies, *Secular Illusion or Christian Realism?* (New York, 1949), with bibliographical footnotes, by an Anglican clergyman, has been influential in the United States. From the viewpoint of the Barthian theology, and reflecting the influence of Reinhold Niebuhr and Archbishop William Temple, he locates the origin of evil in man's free will, not (as secularists claim) in animal heredity and social conflict. Georgia Elma Harkness, *The Modern Rival of Christian Faith; an Analysis of Secularism* (New York, 1952), defines secularism as "the organization of life as if God did not exist," discusses rival secular faiths, and suggests practical ways to make Christian hope effective. Several other works deal with the conflict between Christianity and secularism: Alexander Roper Vidler, *Secular Despair and Christian Faith* (London, 1941); Howard Hong, *This World and the Church; Studies in Secularism* (Minneapolis, 1955), lectures at the Luther Theological Seminary, St. Paul, 1952; and Gene McClendon, *Secularism and Salvation* (New York, 1958). The Roman Catholic attitude toward secularism is well expressed by National Catholic Alumni Federation, *Man and Modern Secularism; Essays on the Conflict of the Two Cultures* (New York, 1940), papers originally read at the 1939 convention, an attack on secularism, and the Roman Catholic answer to it; and John La Farge, *Secularism's Attack on World Order* . . . a Preliminary Report of the Committee on Ethics and the Sub-committee on Religion and Culture (Washington, D.C., 1944?). A Jewish attitude is expressed by Ben Zion Bokser (Rabbi, Forest Hills Jewish Center): "Religion and Secularism," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium,* Vol. 10, 1949 (New York, 1950), pp. 563–579. Edwin Ewart Aubrey, in *Secularism a Myth; An Examination of the Current Attack on*

Secularism (New York, 1954), declares that "Secularism" has become a rallying cry for a religious crusade, but the attack is diffuse and misleading and the issue should be defined. The dissociation of the Church from secular culture would be fatal to Christianity, which should acknowledge the genuine spiritual values in secular movements and adopt a new strategy, "humbler and bolder, less plaintive and more responsible." Horace Meyer Kallen defends secularism in *Secularism is the Will of God; an Essay in the Social Philosophy of Democracy and Religion* (New York, 1954), with all his well-known ardor for human and religious liberty, pleading for "orchestration" of religions on the theme of union of their values and pluralism in their expression. Religious intolerance and aggressiveness comes from defending their least sure feature—exclusive dogmatism.

5. SKEPTICISM. The number of scholarly defenses of skepticism as a way of approach to religion is considerable; the following are selected titles by modern philosophers: Charles David Darling, *Doubters and Their Doubts* (Boston, 1916); and Paul Elmer More, *The Sceptical Approach to Religion* (Princeton, 1934), for the intellectual elite, consisting of essays on rationalism and faith, illusions of reason, and so on. Christianity is viewed as the only completely teleological religion, injured by Roman legalism and medieval scholasticism, which are alien to its original spirit. Walter Terence Stace, in *Religion and the Modern Mind* (Philadelphia, 1952) endeavors to answer for the layman the question: is there a reasonable and significant place for religion in a scientific age? Science and the moral order are both here to stay. Is religion needed to sustain the moral order? George Santayana's *Scepticism and Animal Faith; Introduction to a System of Philosophy* (New York, 1955) is a landmark in the literature contrasting the skeptical-intellectual and dogmatic approaches to religion. A reasoned, popular defense of the skeptical approach is Thomas Vernor Smith, *Creative Sceptics; in Defense of the Liberal Temper* (Chicago and

New York, 1934), with a bibliography, which discusses belief and doubt, liberalism, and skepticism, and sees philosophical doubt as the foundation of freedom and social tolerance.

American Christian apologists have been waging a battle with religious skepticism from the beginning. President Timothy Dwight of Yale College, a typical orthodox protagonist, entered the lists with *The Nature, and Danger, of Infidel Philosophy* . . . (New Haven, 1798). He attacked the Deists and rationalists, like Paine, and the war continued into the early decades of the nineteenth century. It became more acute with the rise of scientific rationalism, especially after the publication of Darwin's *Origin of Species,* which to many appeared to discredit the Bible and revelation. In the very year of Darwin's work, a Philadelphia lawyer issued a layman's view of the controversy between religion and skepticism: Francis Wharton, *A Treatise on Theism, and on the Modern Skeptical Theories* (Philadelphia and London, 1859). The rise of agnosticism in the United States, after the Civil War, gave rise to polemics against skepticism, such as that of the noted preacher, Richard Heber Newton: *Philistinism; Plain Words Concerning Certain Forms of Modern Skepticism* (New York and London, 1885). The influence of scientism, naturalism, and other secular movements in the 1920's and 1930's, and attacks on organized religion, inspired some serious, scholarly efforts to combat religious doubt. John E. Graham's *The Way of the Skeptic* . . . (New York and Toronto, c.1931), a Roman Catholic polemic, was intended as an answer to H. L. Mencken's "Treatise on the Gods," and to enable Catholics to defend their faith: a rather typical ultra-conservative reply, with some hard language. Religious answers to the skeptical position are, in fact, very numerous. Among the representative ones may be selected: John B. Koehne, *A Challenge to Modern Skepticism* (Philadelphia, 1911); Edgar Everton Saltus, *The Anatomy of Negation* (New York, 1925), with bibliography;

and Ralph S. Meadowcroft, *Postlude to Skepticism* (Louisville, Ky., 1947). George Arthur Buttrick, a noted Presbyterian minister, in *The Christian Fact and Modern Doubt; a Preface to a Restatement of Christian Faith* (New York and London, 1934) examines for laymen the sources of modern doubt and the cardinal points of the Christian faith, and tries to answer questions put to faith by modern thinking, and discusses the cause of modern doubt, and the way to face it. Hornell Norris Hart's *Skeptic's Quest* (New York, 1938), with annotated bibliography, attempts to present, in dialogue form, the modern search for a philosophy of life, and uses science to refute skepticism and despair. David Wesley Soper's *Epistle to the Skeptics* (New York, c.1956) is an American theologian's account of his own religious quest from sterile faith to atheism, then to creative faith: a strong apologetic for faith gained through skepticism.

6. AGNOSTICISM. Edgar Fawcett's *Agnosticism, and Other Essays* . . . with a Prologue by Robert G. Ingersoll (New York and Chicago c.1889) vigorously defends the current agnosticism, inspired largely by Ingersoll, which soon bade fair to become a popular movement—the only really strong agnostic agitation in American history. It is closely studied in Herbert Wiltsee, "Robert G. Ingersoll, a Study in Religious Liberalism" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1941). One of the most famous debates between an agnostic and a defender of faith, during the Ingersollian period, is recorded in Henry Martyn Field, *The Field-Ingersoll Discussion, Faith or Agnosticism? A Series of Articles in the North American Review* . . . (New York, c.1888), one of several debates with Ingersoll, which thrilled the 1880's and 1890's. One of the most determined early protagonists of agnosticism was Emanuel Haldeman-Julius, the noted freethinker of Girard, Kansas, publisher of a vast amount of radical and free-thought literature. His best defense of agnosticism is *An Agnostic Looks at Life; Challenges of a Militant Pen* (Girard, Kan., c.1926). A kind of agnostic's bible was

issued a few years later by Clarence Seward Darrow and Wallace DeGroot Cecil Rice, as *Infidels and Heretics; an Agnostic's Anthology* (Boston, c.1929), a collection of poetic and prose excerpts from works by famous agnostics, skeptics, and atheists, including the compilers, and much from contemporary free thought. It is criticized for poor arrangement, and for some "trivial" selections from contemporaries, but is probably the best volume of its kind. Another anthology of free thought and agnosticism is Rufus King Noyes, *Views of Religion* . . . (Boston, 1906).

One of the most vigorous and caustic critics of agnosticism was Paul Carus, in *Kant and Spencer, a Study of the Fallacies of Agnosticism* (Chicago, 1899); and *The Philosopher's Martyrdom; a Satire* (Chicago, 1908). Carus was the editor of "The Monist," and the author of *Pleroma: an Essay on the Origin of Christianity* (1907). His position was that Christianity is not the result of accident, but of necessity, and may be established upon scientific investigation. Defenders of the Christian faith were, in fact, not slow to take up the challenge of agnosticism. Orthodox Protestants, Roman Catholics, and advocates of Free Religion attacked it. One of the most vigorous onslaughts was by James McCosh: *The Agnosticism of Hume and Huxley, with a Notice of the Scottish School* (New York, 1884). McCosh, an orthodox Presbyterian, was an adherent of the Scottish "Common Sense Philosophy." Philosophical studies of agnosticism are found in William Pierson Merrill, *Faith and Sight; Essays on the Relation of Agnosticism to Theology* (New York, 1900); and Jacob Gould Schurman, *Agnosticism and Religion* (New York, 1896), a discussion of Huxley and scientific agnosticism, philosophic agnosticism, and the evolution and essence of spiritual religion. Francis Ellingwood, an advanced liberal, joined the attack, in *The Way Out of Agnosticism; or, The Philosophy of Free Religion* (Boston, 1890), based on the notes for lectures (1888) in philosophy, Harvard University. Carol R. Murphy's *The Faith of an Ex-Agnostic* (Wal-

lingford, Pa. and Pendle Hill, 1949) is by a Quaker convert from agnosticism. A rather typical modern Protestant view of agnosticism, and treatment of the problem of belief and doubt, is by Marcus Louis Bach, in *The Will to Believe* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1955), which considers belief and doubt and clarifies the meaning and process at the heart of the will to believe. All will be well, if you believe firmly enough. George Joseph Lucas' *Agnosticism and Religion; Being an Examination of Spencer's Religion of the Unknowable, Preceded by a History of Agnosticism* (Baltimore, 1895), is a typical Roman Catholic critique, valuable especially for its notes on the history of agnosticism in America. Other representative Roman Catholic approaches to the agnostic problem, the first by a scholar, the second by an archbishop, are: William Joseph Madden, *The Reaction from Agnostic Science* (St. Louis, 1899), and John Lancaster Spalding, *Religion, Agnosticism and Education* (Chicago, 1903), in part a reply to the lectures of Robert G. Ingersoll. A typical Anglican reply to agnosticism is one by the noted educator, preacher, and theologian, Bernard Iddings Bell: *Beyond Agnosticism, a Book for Tired Mechanists* (New York and London, 1943).

7. ATHEISM. The American Association for the Advancement of Atheism issues an *Annual Report*, and a *Bulletin* (New York, 1926–), which are indispensable sources for the study of American atheistic polemical literature. Modern American defenses of atheism, with any pretensions to scholarship, are not numerous. Among the better ones are: Homer H. Moore, *The Anatomy of Atheism as Demonstrated in the Light of the Constitution and Laws of Nature* (Cincinnati and New York, 1890); Woolsey Teller, *The Atheism of Astronomy; a Refutation of the Theory that the Universe is Governed by Intelligence* (New York, The Truth Seeker Co., c.1938); and his *Essays of an Atheist* (New York, The Truth Seeker Co., 1945). David Marshall Brooks, *The Necessity of Atheism* (New York, Freethought Press As-

sociation, 1933) argues that religion has been intellectually, socially, and morally pernicious, while atheism gives man confidence to subdue environment. That American atheism, although now most unpopular, has not given over the fight, appears in Joseph Lewis, *An Atheist Manifesto* (New York, Freethought Press Association, 1954); and James D. Bales, *Atheism's Faith and Fruits* (Boston, 1951).

Interesting public debates between atheists and defenders of religion—which would be unusual today—occurred rather frequently during the period of rising skepticism after the Civil War. Examples are: Benjamin Franklin Underwood, *The Underwood-Marples Debate, Commencing July 20, 1875 and Continuing four Evenings, between B. F. Underwood . . . and the Rev. John Marples . . .* (New York, 1877); and Griffith Henry Humphrey, *Christianity and Infidelity; or The Humphrey-Bennett Discussion between Rev. G. H. Humphrey . . . and D. M. Bennett . . . conducted in the Columns of the Truth Seeker, Commencing April 7, 1877, Closing Sept. 29, 1877 . . .* (New York, 1877). A modern debate, enlivened by the presence of Clarence Darrow, is contained in Robert MacGowan, *Is Religion Necessary? (Debate) Yes, Rev. Robert MacGowan; No, Clarence Darrow* (Girard, Kan., Haldeman-Julius Publications, c.1931), recorded at Pittsburgh, Jan. 15, 1931, under the auspices of the National Speakers' Forum.

Criticisms of atheism range from the Revolutionary period to the present day. James Dana's *The Folly of Practical Atheism, A Discourse, Delivered in the Chapel of Yale-College . . . November 23, 1794* (New Haven, 1795) voices the alarm of a defender of the New England religious orthodoxy, at the atheistic tendencies of the French Revolutionary period—the first American encounter with militant atheism. Theodore Parker's *Sermons of Theism, Atheism, and the Popular Theology* (Boston, 1859, 2nd ed.) includes an analysis of atheism by a liberal, Unitarian-Transcendentalist philosopher and theologian. Felix Adler's *Atheism: a*

Lecture . . . before the Society for Ethical Culture, Sunday, April 6th, 1879 (New York, 1879, 2nd ed.) represents the considered view of the founder and long-time leader of the Ethical Culture Society of New York. An anti-atheist warfare flared up in the "skeptical" 1920's and 1930's and inspired such polemics as John S. Zybura, *Contemporary Godlessness, Its Origins and Its Remedy* (St. Louis and London, 1924); and Howard Agnew Johnston, *We Can Surely Believe; a Christian Answer to Current Atheism* (New York and Chicago, c.1928); William A. Corey, *Men Without God: the Testimony of a Reclaimed Atheist* (New York, c.1932); and Sidney Dark and R. S. Essex, *The War Against God* (New York and Cincinnati, c.1938), including a historical sketch of atheism, and a description of modern anti-religion: a startling revelation of the anti-theism of modern political and national movements. Theodore Conrad Graebner's *God and the Cosmos; a Critical Analysis of Atheism* (Grand Rapids, 1932), with bibliography, expresses the views of a leading conservative Lutheran theologian. William I. Lonergan, in *The Menace of Atheism* (New York, c.1930), with suggested readings, represents the Roman Catholic viewpoint, but not with its usual urbanity.

V. RELIGION AND PSYCHOLOGY

A. Scientific Studies

WITHIN the past century psychology has emerged from the womb of its parent, philosophy, to claim its status as an independent science. This new approach to man has been both an obstacle and a help to religion. William James pioneered in the area of "psychology of religion," analyzing the phenomena of religious experience, with findings only partly comforting to theologians. The most disturbing challenge to traditional conceptions of man and of the nature and function of religion was offered by psychoanalysis, which many hailed

as an adequate substitute for the "cure of souls" which had been the exclusive province of the Church. Others have attempted to employ the techniques of psychoanalysis within a more or less orthodox frame of reference. Erich Fromm has succinctly stated the problem: "Is the psychoanalyst trying to occupy the priest's domain, and is opposition between them unavoidable? Or are they allies who work for the same ends and who should supplement and interpenetrate each other's field both theoretically and practically?"

During the past half-century the United States has been notable for its scientific study of religious psychology, and for the popularizing of the results through books on the psychology of religion and on popular theology. This section begins with a brief survey of the earlier studies in religious psychology, and reviews a few devoted to the psychology of evangelical revivalism or "awakening" (see Part Two, sect. III, A, 9, *Revivalism*). A review of some works on psychoanalysis and religion precedes sections on the results of the scientific studies, in works by those who have tried to apply the knowledge to make religion understandable in popular terms. These have had a considerable effect in stimulating the current "revival of religion," which began in the 1930's, with a strong emphasis upon reviving interest among intellectuals, who have often suffered disillusionment with non- and anti-religious philosophies (see above, sect. IV, J, 1 and 7).

Jonathan Edwards' *Religious Affections* and William James's *The Varieties of Religious Experience, a Study in Human Nature* . . . (New York, 1936) are the two classic American analyses of all aspects of religious feeling, illustrated by case studies of individuals, and based upon a viewpoint of supernaturalism, even though James did not accept either popular Christianity or scholastic theism. He rejected naturalism and medical materialism, and accepted the intervention of spiritual forces in human life, without which practical religion seems to evaporate. In this he ran counter

to the current of academic thought around 1900. James's researches set in motion a powerful current of interest and study, which inspired a review by Edward L. Schaub, "The Psychology of Religion in America during the Past Quarter-Century," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 6, no. 2 (Mar. 1926), pp. 113–134. This indicates America's leading place in developing psychological study of religion, the outstanding theories of psychological sources of religion, methods devised to discover and interpret religious experiences, and leading investigations into primary phenomena of religion; and considers the significance of subconscious and social factors in the development of religious ideas and activities. Louis N. Wilson's *List of Papers in the Field of Religious Psychology Presented at Clark University* . . . (Worcester, Mass., 1911) lists master's and doctoral theses, and papers published in journals, and is a good guide to pioneer works.

Three of the great pioneers were George Albert Coe, James Bissett Pratt, and Edward Scribner Ames. Coe's attitude toward religion is suggested by two important essays. "What Does Modern Psychology Permit Us to Believe in Respect to Regeneration?" in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 12, no. 3 (July 1908), pp. 353–368, with bibliography in footnotes, concludes that any hypothesis about the power of Jesus to transform a human soul, and belief in the mystical presence and operation of Christ or the Holy Spirit, is not within the range of observation. Non-historic knowledge of Jesus is on the psychological plane of spiritism, which is difficult for scientific men to accept. The moral power of Jesus needs no defense by dubious psychology. "Religion and the Subconscious," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol., 13, no. 3 (July 1909), pp. 337–349, with bibliography in footnotes, criticizes the theory that "spirit" goes and comes by "the route of the subconscious," and defends the idea of "a self-sufficing value-judgment expressive of immediate experience," useful to religion. Pratt's *The Religious Consciousness* (New York, 1920) is "considered one of the

best psychological analyses of the so-called modern 'charismatic' phenomena" (F. E. Mayer, *Religious Bodies of America*, 1954, p. 341). Among the scholarly studies of Pratt's work, one should consult: David Henry Bremer, "George Albert Coe's Contribution to the Psychology of Religion" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University, 1949), which gives a convenient summary of the development and influence of his ideas; Willis Paul Browning, "James Bissett Pratt's Psychology of Religion" (Doctoral dissertation, Boston University); and Joel Pilant Sanders, "The Concept of God in the Philosophical Writings of James Bissett Pratt" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1946–47, University Library). From a more humanistic point of view, Edward Scribner Ames, in his *The Psychology of Religious Experience* (Boston and New York, 1910) further examined the phenomena of the religious consciousness. For about a decade G. Stanley Hall of Clark University edited the *Journal of Religious Psychology* (Vols. 1–7, 1904–1915).

Clarence Augustine Beckwith, "The Influence of Psychology upon Theology," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 15, no. 2 (Apr. 1911), pp. 194–204, with bibliographical references in footnotes, avers that the application of psychology to interpretation of religion is not new, cites examples in the history of religion, and discusses blockades to the psychological approach and the application of psychology to study of man's relation to God. He criticizes the tendency to refer the secret of divine action wholly to the subconscious, and notes limitations of the psychological approach and danger of overconfidence. James Henry Leuba, *A Psychological Study of Religion, Its Origin, Function, and Future* (New York, 1912) has a bibliography of the author's writings on the psychology of religion and religious philosophy. One of the pioneer American books on the subject, this points out that insight into religious consciousness can be won only by psychology, discusses religion as a type of

rational behavior, and constructively criticizes current concepts of religion. William K. Wright's "A Psychological Definition of Religion," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 16, no. 3 (July 1912), pp. 385–409, with bibliographical references in footnotes, concludes that the "social and personal usefulness of religion once established, the question of its metaphysical validity will largely take care of itself." The subjective definition of religion is adequate. If this claim is accepted, the validity of religious faith can be defended by contemporary metaphysics. Thomas Alexander Symington, in *Religious Liberals and Conservatives; a Comparison of those who are Liberal in their Religious Thinking and those who are Conservative* (New York, 1935), with bibliography, studies the variant psychologies of religious people and their causes. W. E. Gregory's "The Psychology of Religion: Some Suggested Areas of Research of Significance to Psychology," in *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, Vol. 47, no. 2 (Apr. 1952), pp. 256–258, with references, suggests research "of more general value than simply the understanding of religion," including the type of personality attracted to sects, religion as cultural accommodation, intergroup accommodation, and the like. Closely related to the psychology of sects is that of conversion experience, which is explored in Elmer T. Clark's *The Psychology of Religious Awakening* (New York, 1929), with extensive bibliography, and based upon student replies to a questionnaire on personal religious experience, supplementing and bringing up to date the work of James, Starbuck, and Coe. John G. McKenzie, in *Psychology, Psychotherapy and Evangelicalism* (New York, 1940), critically examines evangelical experience and doctrine according to psychological and psychotherapeutic principles. Joe Lee Davis' "Mystical Versus Enthusiastic Sensibility," in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 4, no. 3 (June 1943), pp. 301–319, studies the differences between the psychologies of mystical religion (often quietist) and the revivalist or awakening types.

Irving King's "The Religious Significance of the Psychotherapeutic Movement," in *American Journal of Theology*, Vol. 14, no. 4 (Oct. 1910), pp. 533–551, favors mental healing through the agency of the church, and estimates its value, although the minister should enter the field not as an expert therapist, but as a character-builder. David E. Roberts in *Psychotherapy and a Christian View of Man* (New York, 1950) explores the wider area of psychotherapy with respect to dealing with the human personality by religious workers. Erich Fromm's *Psychoanalysis and Religion* (New Haven, 1950) discusses the relationship from the viewpoint of a humanist who is quite sympathetic with the religious enterprise. Harry A. Overstreet's "When Religion Becomes Mature," in *Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposium*, Vol. 1, 1940 (New York, 1941), pp. 184–192, touches the subject at the point to which the elaborate studies of religious psychology have arrived. Mature religion is a means not of "escape," but of adjustments to realities and of transforming them into effective life. At this point the "popularizers" begin their effort to solve, by more or less profound religious means, the problems of daily living that confront us.

B. Popularizing Religious Psychology: "Peace of Mind"

PSYCHOLOGY IN THE SERVICE OF RELIGION. In some form or another religion always has functioned as one of the most important factors in the everyday life of men. The past century has witnessed the emergence of an elaborate "science" of religious psychology, and many eminent religious leaders have attempted to incorporate the findings of scientific psychology into religious doctrine. The point of emphasis varies. Some claim that great religion has always known the essential points in the "newly discovered" truths. Others find historical religion less omniscient, and call for the modifica-

tion of traditional religious ideas to adapt them to man's increased understanding of himself. In any event theologians look for support of their religion in the findings of scientific psychology. The works they produce under this inspiration are often "best sellers." The tendency has been confined to no denomination or creed, and has been evident since the early 1900's.

One of the earlier successful practitioners of religious psychology to build up personal effectiveness was Orison Swett Marden (1848–1924), whose many books are represented by *Every Man a King; or, Might in Mind-Mastery, With the Assistance of Ernest Raymond Holmes* (New York, 1906). This volume is the prototype of the continual stream of more-or-less religiously inspired books aimed to promote "victorious living." The appearances of such works have increased vastly since the turning away from skepticism that began in the 1930's. Henry C. Link's widely read *The Return to Religion* (New York, 1937) is credited by many as an early inspiration of the "religious revival" after about 1940. A professional psychologist, a Methodist turned practically pagan, discovered the true value of religion as a strengthener of the spirit and of morality, through his counseling of disturbed people. Harry Emerson Fosdick, in *On Being a Real Person* (New York, 1943), illustrates the theologian's seeking support for practical religion in the field of scientific psychology. Among the most popular of all the "best seller" advocates of personal "adjustment" is Joshua L. Liebman, whose *Peace of Mind* (New York, 1946) gave a name to a cult. A rabbi and a spokesman for liberal Judaism, he considers maladjustments of personality in a religious context. Fulton J. Sheen's *Peace of Soul* (New York, 1949), although a rather biased attack on Freud and the psychoanalytic movement, is yet an effort to integrate certain insights of the psychoanalytic approach into Catholic theology and piety. Norman Vincent Peale's *The Power of Positive Thinking* (New York, 1952), the most fabulously successful of the

"peace of mind" books, was intended to furnish "a simple and yet scientific system of practical techniques of successful living." Peale's enormous influence has inspired a serious study by Arthur Gordon, *Norman Vincent Peale; Minister to Millions, a Biography* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1958). His influence upon the millions has aroused some grave queries regarding the soundness of its psychological and religious foundations. For example, William Lee Miller, in "Some Negative Thinking About Norman Vincent Peale," in *Reporter,* Vol. 12, no. 1 (Jan. 13, 1955), pp. 19–24, cites a considerable number of the publications that have promoted his popularity, with a criticism of *The Power of Positive Thinking.* Peale, he claims, is, in a way, "the rich man's Billy Graham," and a guide to getting success and peace of mind without the hard effort of the old Horatio Alger success cult, without really facing a problem, and with an encouragement to avoidance of really serious thought. The appeal is to executives, the already "successful," but does not lead to real maturity.

Rollo May's *Man's Search for Himself* (New York, 1952), a study solidly erected upon both psychology and theology, represents the best features of the effort to use psychology in the service of religion and personal "adjustment." The more popular and often superficial type of "peace of mind" religious books is sharply attacked by Wayne E. Oates's essay, "The Cult of Reassurance," in *Religion in Life,* Vol. 24, no. 1 (Winter, 1954–55), pp. 72–82. He dissects Peale's psychological-religious formula for success, the factors in its appeal, and his religious and psychological "fallacies." His success-religion overlooks the factor of acceptance of one's real limitations, tends to deny that there are any, and makes religion only a means to an end. There is no real repentance or self-examination. "Pealeism" is a kind of incantation that really obscures the inner self and prevents a truly religious experience. The degeneration of this type of religion in "pious utilitarianism" is described fully in Sydney E. Ahlstrom, "The

Pieties of Usefulness," in *Bulletin of Stetson University* (Vol. 57, no. 3, July 1957). In another analysis, "The Levels of Religious Revival," *Conference*, Vol. 4, no. 1 (Apr. 1955), pp. 32–43, Ahlstrom further characterizes the postwar upsurge of religious interest. In the same number appears William Lee Miller's study of "The 'Religious Revival' and American Politics," pp. 44–56. Louis Schneider and Sanford M. Dornbusch, *Popular Religion; Inspirational Books in America* (Chicago, 1958), with bibliographical references, takes a more favorable view than that of many critics of "religious revival" literature and piety. (See also Part Two, sect. V, E, 4, *New Thought, Faith Healing, and Unity*.)

C. Popular Theology

Popular interest in religion, during the present-day "revival," is by no means confined to the field of psychology and "peace of mind" books. There is also a deeper and growing interest in popular expositions of doctrine and general religious thought. This section comprises a few representative works, ranging from the evangelistic radio type of sermon to Protestant Liberalism and Neo-Orthodoxy.

Donald Grey Barnhouse, *Teaching the Word of Truth* . . . (Philadelphia, c.1940, 2nd ed.) takes a conservative approach, by one of the most popular of the evangelistic radio preachers. William Franklin ("Billy") Graham, in *Peace with God* (Garden City, New York, 1953) represents the basic theological convictions of the popular international evangelist. Borden Parker Bowne's *The Essence of Religion* (Boston and New York, 1910), a collection of sermons, tries to make religion practical, by discussing basic Christian doctrines—the supremacy of Christ, the mystery of life and its practical solution, righteousness as the essence of religion, prayer, salvation, obedience, *the law of successful living*, and the resurrection. Heinrich Emil Brunner, *Our Faith*, translated by John W. Rilling (New York, 1936), by one of the

leaders of the Neo-Orthodox theology, represents the reversion to a churchly and dogmatic redemptive approach to religion. In *A Preface to Christian Theology* (New York, 1941) John Alexander Mackay, the Presbyterian president emeritus of the Princeton Theological Seminary, writes as one of the introducers of the Neo-Orthodox thought to America. Walter Marshall Horton's *Christian Theology, an Ecumenical Approach* (New York, 1955), with bibliography, is the fruit of many years of teaching by a leader of the school of "realistic" theology, a step toward Neo-Orthodoxy. The modern Anglo-Catholic viewpoint is adequately represented by *The Christian Way in a Modern World* (Louisville, Ky., 1944), with bibliography, by W. Norman Pittenger, a leading Anglo-Catholic theologian, professor at General Seminary, New York City, and co-author, with Bishop James Pike, of *The Faith of the* [Episcopal] *Church.* One of the most prolific "popularizers" of Christian thought is Charles Stedman Macfarland, whose liberal approach is represented by *Contemporary Christian Thought* (New York, c.1936), book reviews and bibliography; *Trends of Christian Thinking* (New York, c.1937), book reviews and bibliography; *The Christian Faith in a Day of Crisis* (New York, c.1939), with bibliography; and *Current Religious Thought: a Digest* (New York, c.1941), with "Volumes Discussed." Other typical "outline" books, promoting the trend toward a renewal of faith, are: Albert Wentworth Palmer, *The Light of Faith; an Outline of Religious Thought for Laymen* (New York, 1946), with notes and references; Harold Augustus Bosley, *A Firm Faith for Today* (New York, 1950), with bibliography; William Burnet Easton, *Basic Christian Beliefs* (Philadelphia, 1957), with references in "Notes"; and Rachel Henderlite, *A Call to Faith* (Richmond, 1955), with bibliography. The accomplishment of a "popularizer," more learned than most of this class of authors, is appreciated by Simon Arthur Talman, "The Life and Contributions of James David Moffat, 1846–1916 (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1957; micro-

film publication no. 22,866; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol 17, no. 10, 1957, pp. 2326–2327). As minister, college president, and editor, he was notable for clear presentation of major doctrines, although not a great theologian. He was further an eminent promoter of character development in religious education, and a well-rounded promoter of religion.

The vast, honest effort to adjust doctrine to "life situations" and to apply theology in "practical" religion is perhaps best shown in the trend of preaching. This field of study has but recently been explored, in studies such as Eugene Kenneth Eakin, "Recent Trends in Preaching: an Analysis of Sermons in the *Homiletic Review* and the *Christian Century Pulpit,* 1890–1940, in the Light of Recent Homiletical Teaching" (Doctoral thesis, abstract published by the University of Pittsburgh). The trends show a search for a vital message, effective statement, and means to secure attention. Authoritarianism has declined, as doctrinal preaching has yielded to sermons on problems of contemporary living, the "life-situation approach." Lloyd J. Gray's "A Study of Protestant Preaching in the United States, 1920–1929" (Doctoral dissertation, Southern Baptist University, 1946) also reveals the swing away from theological dogma and toward practical preaching to meet "life situations." The reformulation of theological concepts, with references to secular crises in the contemporary world, is vividly portrayed by Harold Theodore Porter's "Ideas of God Reflected in Published Sermons of 25 American Protestant Preachers Selected as 'Most Influential' in 1924" (Doctoral thesis, University of Pittsburgh, with bibliography; *University Microfilms,* Ann Arbor (1957), pub. no. 19,643; *Dissertation Abstracts,* Vol. 17 (1957), no. 1, p. 179). Selected by a national poll conducted by the *Christian Century,* 1924, the sermons were published 1895–1950, and include theological positions from the most conservative to the more liberal. The test: *is doctrine applicable and reasonable?* Evidence is presented of movement of thought from individualism to social concern. Preachers are sensitive to and

influenced by the world situation. The main type of sermon aims at solving life situations of actual people by leading discussion to doctrinal and Biblical sources. This gives the sermon a new relevance.

D. Recent Revival

A low point in American religious life was reached in the late 1920's, the culmination of the post-World War reaction against idealism. The churches had been somewhat injured by the Fundamentalist-Modernist controversy, and the liberal Protestant theological movement was already declining. Humanism had not won the masses—and indeed could not—and the impact of Neo-Orthodox thinking was still unfelt. Then came the long economic depression of the early 1930's, with slashed parochial and missionary budgets. Many religious leaders looked for an upturn in church attendance, a "return to religion," which for some time did not materialize. The way for it was being prepared by the silent penetration of Neo-Orthodox thought, and by a slow rise of interest in books on popularized theology and religious thought. In the meantime, heart-searching for reasons for the delay in religious awakening appeared in such editorials as "Why No Revival?" in the *Christian Century*, Vol. 52, no. 38 (Sept. 18, 1935), pp. 1168–1170: Humanism and materialism are questioned, but there is no mass movement toward the churches, no sympathetic contact of the church with the general community. One reason is the belief that economic calamity is *not* an act of God requiring repentance for sin. The church is unprepared to minister to this situation. Protestant evangelicalism, not aware of the possibility of repentance for *social* or *corporate* evil, has assumed God to be on the side of established order, and so is unable to speak clearly when the order is changing.

The best assessment of reasons for the "decline" is Willard Learoyd Sperry, ed., *Religion in the Post-war World* (Cambridge, Mass., 1945, 4 vols.), a symposium by Protestants,

Catholics, and Jews, covering religion and denominational divisions, the religion of soldiers and sailors, religion and racial tensions, religion and education. The studies show a decline of attachment to revelation and even to reason. Wilfred Parsons stresses a "pathetic and groping humanitarianism," with information, but no solution of religious problems. Kenneth Scott Latourette, in "The Condition of Religion in the United States," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 7, no. 3 (Summer, 1938), pp. 335–345, took a happier view in discussing the "prophets of gloom"—those outside the church and religion, alarmed conservatives, those who try to arouse apathetic church people, and the defeatists. He notes a remarkable vitality of Christianity in spite of assaults, the penetration of secular life by religion, support of religion by voluntary giving, and striving for a Christian society. Complaints may be signs of life—of trials, of struggles of growth. Dixon Wecter, in *The Age of the Great Depression, 1929–1941* (New York, 1948), in ch. 10, "Age in Quest of Security," notices the growth of social idealism in the churches and cultism outside, the quiet preparation for the later "revival of religion." In the following year appeared another hopeful view: Samuel McCrea Cavert's "A Look at the American Churches," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 18, no. 3 (Summer, 1949), pp. 323–331, which reviews his appraisal of the American church situation presented to the Ecumenical Assembly at Amsterdam. He notes the apparent lack of real influence upon a secularized society, and the actual penetration of it by the Social Gospel; actual unity of action under diversity of form; and growth of ecumenicity and cooperation—a more cheerful view of the "revival" than others have given. Still another hopeful view is presented by a historian of American philosophy, Herbert W. Schneider, in "The Old Theory and the New Practice of Religious Loyalty," in *American Quarterly*, Vol. 5, no 4 (Winter, 1953), pp. 291–300. The Christian churches, during the Modernist-Fundamentalist controversy and later, have regained much of the ground lost in

the early 1900's, and are able to hold the loyalty of those "tempted by science and philosophy to rebel." A greater relevancy is conceded to the theology of sin and salvation, and the call to loyalty and sacrifice is more potent. Christianity and Judaism have discovered themselves through cultural crisis, with a new understanding of faith but less confidence in their ability to interpret the world or reveal God's will. Reinhold Niebuhr's article, "Is There A Revival of Religion?" in *New York Times Magazine* (Nov. 19, 1950, pp. 13, 60, 62, 63) declares that the evidences are not conclusive, despite popular conversion, receptivity among intellectuals, departments of religion in colleges, and manifestations of "escapism." The "age of crisis" is more explicitly religious, tending to refute the quasi-religion of an age of relative stability and ease. Upheavals of history sweep away the neat little patterns of sophisticated rationality. There is disillusionment with the Marxist substitution of "an improbable utopia for an improbable heaven." Less intellectual and more confident seers have had their say in such books as James Edwin Orr's *Good News in Bad Times; Signs of Revival* (Grand Rapids, c.1953), and Edward L. R. Elson's *America's Spiritual Recovery* (Westwood, N.J., 1954).

The tie between "spiritual revival" and contemporary longing for an expression of "religious values" in public life—a symbol of "this nation under God"—is discussed by William L. Miller in "The 'Religious Revival' and American Politics," in *Confluence*, Vol. 4, no. 1 (Apr. 1955), pp. 44–56, pointing out the peril when popular religious revival sees religion as a help in achieving national goals against "materialistic" communism, and runs the risk of forgetting God in contemplating the good of "faith" to oneself and the nation. Religion, in danger of merely reflecting its environment, leads to crusading for an "ideal," with no continuous realistic policy, and a separation of popular from intellectual revival. Recovery of theological and spiritual depth may influence politics to be more careful and hardheaded. Longing for *personifica-*

tion of the religious-political national "values" is discerned by Paul Hutchinson, editor of the *Christian Century*, who sees a symbol of national "faith in faith" in "The President's Religious Faith," in *Life*, Vol. 36, no. 12 (March 22, 1954, pp. 151–152, 154, 156, 159, 160, 162, 167, 168, 170), emphasizing the identification of the President's faith with the "revival of religion." Development of Eisenhower's faith from the Fundamentalism of the River Brethren to a kind of religion of "moral and spiritual values" has affected public life. Pietism has been translated into a religion of decency and democracy. The tendency to identify religious and spiritual values with "Americanism" has been noticed by many religious writers, remarkably by Sidney E. Mead, in "From Denominationalism to Americanism," in *Journal of Religion*, Vol. 36, no. 1 (Jan. 1956), pp. 1–16, with bibliography in "Notes." During the second half of the nineteenth century, denominational Protestantism became identified with the "American way of life," and the results are part of the "revival of religion." Protestantism has become harmonized with industrialism, free enterprise, and imperialism, but the churches were not blind to their Christian heritage, and in this lay the elements of religious renewal and theological reconstruction. The tendency to deeper seriousness, however, seems to many to be threatened by the rise of "social religion," or parish-house piety. Kenneth D. Miller's "Our Growing Suburbs and Their Churches," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 24, no. 4 (Autumn, 1955), pp. 516–523, strives to assess the place of the church in suburbia, and asks: how much does the busy suburban church really minister to religious as distinct from socializing needs?—to the city?—to the colored immigrant? Without a broader social vision, suburban Christianity may sink into smug complacency. The effort of the movies to "cash in" on the revival meets a searching inspection by William L. Miller, in "Hollywood and Religion," in *Religion in Life*, Vol. 22, no. 2 (Spring, 1953), pp. 273–279. He criticizes as part of the "revival of religion," as the popularizing

of a vague sentiment, recent films devoted to religious themes. These are not the genuinely religious ones, which deal with essentially religious and moral themes without extravagant décor.

Serious analyses of the basic motives and aspects of the resurgence of religion have begun to appear. Motives in church-going are urged at a deeper level than "at church on Sunday to attend, will serve to keep the world thy friend." Truman B. Douglass' *Why Go To Church?* (New York, 1957), a series of radio talks addressed primarily to non-churchgoers, sees the church as the conserver of remembrance, and as a teacher. With a praiseworthy lack of current superficiality, he seriously discusses the nature of the church and completely reviews traditional and new reasons for attendance. A valuable brief essay, reprinted from the *Atlantic Monthly* (June 1955), is Harry C. Meserve, "The New Piety" in Joseph Henry Satin, *The 1950's; America's Placid Decade* (Boston, 1960). A. Roy Eckardt's *The Surge of Piety in America* (New York, 1958) is typical of many contemporary criticisms of inflationary American religion. It characterizes the "revival" as a "culture religion," emphasizing happiness and success, nationalism, God on our side in the war against communism, close cooperation of many leaders with socially reactionary forces, the superficial "peace of mind" cult, "adjustment," trivial cultism, and the ideal of Americans as a chosen people, but admits that there is sincerity in the movement. Will Herberg, in *Protestant—Catholic—Jew* (Garden City, N.Y., 1955) describes the pluralism of the American religious community, and contends that a highly secularized version of the Judaeo-Christian tradition is the real American faith. Herberg's thesis is supported and further illustrated by Martin E. Marty, *The New Shape of American Religion* (New York, 1959), written from the stance of one who is editor of a leading nondenominational journal and the pastor of a suburban church. Sydney E. Ahlstrom's "The Levels of Religious Revival," in *Confluence*, Vol. 4, no. 1 (April 1955),

pp. 32–43, shows that the present "revival" is an organic part of American history, not a freak. The levels are: the deluge of religious or pseudo-religious literature; truly religious responses transcending mere social amenities and forming a genuine community in the parish church, with deeper understanding of corporate worship and the sacraments and Biblical preaching; and a theological renaissance radiating into parish churches.

Another serious and confident view is in Stanley J. Rowland, Jr., *Land in Search of God* (New York, 1958) expressing a belief that Americans are seeking fuller self-understanding and that their search is increasingly religious.

E. Religion and the Intellectuals

Science has had a continuing impact upon religion. At its extreme it has become another kind of religious emotion, and it has forced adaptation even upon those whose religious sensibility is highly developed. Perhaps even more corrosive than the intellectual challenge of science has been the pervasive material well-being of the ruling classes in the Western World since the middle of the last century. Technological development has been too easily equated with progress. It is perhaps appropriate that the very magnificence of technology has revealed its failure as a talisman. The mushrooming cloud of atomic explosion may well represent the great question mark of our time. There is no doubt that the increasing concern with religion among intellectuals springs in part from the moral confusion which, if not caused by, is insisted upon by modern science. This is not to say that religion is simply a reflex action of the tender minded. At its base, the conflict between the scientific attitude and the religious attitude is a matter of the *source* of one's ethical authority.

While the revival of religious interest has been rolling forward on the popular level, the scholars have experienced their own kind of "revival." There could scarcely be a more

complete revelation of the impact of the religious dilemmas of the age upon intellectuals than is found in the Conference on Science, Philosophy and Religion, in Their Relation to the Democratic Way of Life, which has issued *Science, Philosophy and Religion, A Symposuim,* 1940–1955 (New York, 1941–1956, 15 vols., with varying titles). The series affords a sweeping view of the concern of professors in universities, colleges and seminaries, philosophers, authors, journalists, et al., with modern problems often relating to religion, or for which religion may offer a solution, since the beginning of the "religious revival" c.1940. The addresses often have comments at length, on a wide range of topics: science, theology, philosophy, art, democracy, international affairs, racial and cultural relations, peace, education, and so on. A similar collection of opinions is available in *Religion and the Intellectuals; a Symposium with James Agee and Others* (New York, 1950), first published in the *Partisan Review,* Vol. 17, no. 2–5, Feb.–May/June, 1950, with responses by Arendt, Auden, Blackmur, Dewey, Hook, MacDonald, Maritain, Richards, Rosenfeld, Tate, and Tillich; it goes beyond the problem of the sanctions of ethics to discuss historical causation and cultural consequences.

Both these collections illustrate the many-sided effort to answer the questions already being raised by a Neo-Orthodox leader in the 1920's, in Reinhold Niebuhr's *Does Civilization Need Religion?* (New York, 1928), which speaks for the intellectually dominant Protestant position in "Transcending and Transforming the World." The pragmatic, non-theistic answer, that intelligence will suffice, is given by John Dewey in "The Religious in Experience," in Joseph Ratner, ed., *Intelligence in the Modern World: John Dewey's Philosophy* (New York, 1939), and in his "Morals are Human," in Joseph Ratner, ed., *Human Nature and Conduct* (New York, n.d.). Typical arguments on both sides of the question of human and divine sanctions for moral and spiritual values are practically exhausted in the debate between Irwin Edman

and Edward DeLos Myers: "Do Spiritual Values Require a Theological Basis?" in *American Scholar*, Vol. 18, no. 1 (Winter, 1948–49), pp. 97–105. Edman, a philosopher at Columbia University, advocates a position regarding moral and spiritual issues from a this-worldly, nonsupernatural, and nontheological viewpoint—a natural one. Myers, dean and professor in humanities at Roanoke College, remarks (as does Edman) that the number of the secular-minded is very small in any age, the empiricists even fewer. How is one to develop "an immutable law of right and wrong" by a purely secular approach? Why not recognize the realities of both "science" and the human experience of nonmaterial intellectual and moral values? "The Reader Replies . . ." in *American Scholar*, Vol. 18, no. 2 (Spring, 1949), pp. 217–229, is a collection of letters to the editor from seventeen scholars and laymen, supporting or attacking Edman and Myers, with one from Edman on Myers. These reveal vividly the relevance of the question in contemporary religious and philosophic thought; also the apparent irreconcilability of the secular-empirical and religious-intuitive viewpoints. An increasingly accepted view among intellectuals is that of Nathan M. Pusey (President, Harvard University): "A Religion for Now," in *Harper's*, Vol. 207, no. 1243 (Dec. 1953), pp. 19–22, stating that the problem of the source of ethical authority is of immediate concern to intellectuals. The early twentieth-century religion of good works and increased knowledge is too easily optimistic. We still have need of churches, creeds, and metaphysics. Disappointment in the fruits of works and good will has produced "a paralyzing disbelief." Not knowledge, but faith, is lacking. Better theological education must lead to a more Christian society, and combat "a formless and uninformed faith."

AUTHOR INDEX

Abbey, Charles J., 202
Abbot, Francis Ellingwood, 259, 1020
Abbott, Ernest Hamlin, 61
Abbott, Jacob, 888
Abbott, John Stevens Cabot, 888
Abbott, Lyman, 180, 629, 1056
Abbott, (Sister) Martina, 742
Abbott, Wilbur Cortez, 65-66
Abel, Theodore F., 430
Abell, Aaron Ignatius, 734, 736
Abernethy, Bradford S., 549
Abernethy, Thomas P., 160
Abhedananda, Swami, 533
Abrams, Ray H., 63, 633, 639
Abramtsov, David Feodor, 496, 502, 503, 505
Adam, Karl, 1039
Adams, Brooks, 105-106
Adams, Charles Francis, 104, 105, 323
Adams, Henry, 896
Adams, James Luther, 1092
Adams, James Truslow, 29, 106, 107
Adams, John Coleman, 214-215
Adams, John Quincy, 1108
Adams, Raymond, 849
Adams, Robert Chamblett, 1136
Adams, William, 998
Addison, Daniel Dulaney, 47, 278
Addison, James Thayer, 276-277, 640
Adler, Felix, 266-267, 268, 1118, 1150-1151
Adler, Mortimer Jerome, 1041
Adorno, T. W., 652
Agar, Frederick Alfred, 575
Agar, William Macdonough, 590
Agrippa, 818
Agus, Jacob Bernard, 520, 522
Ahlstrom, Sydney E., 957, 970, 989, 995, 1001, 1021, 1033, 1077, 1078, 1079, 1084, 1088, 1116, 1122-1123, 1158-1159, 1166-1167
Aikman, Robert, 171
Ainslie, Peter, 383
Akhilananda, Swami, 525
Albright, Raymond Wolf, 295-296
Albright, William F., 1058
Aldridge, Alfred Owen, 191
Alexander, Archibald, 50, 124, 215-216, 1000
Alexander, Gross, 294
Alexander, James Waddel, 166, 171, 1000
Alexander, Samuel Davies, 125-126
Allen, Alexander V. G., 136
Allen, Devere, 638
Allen, Edith Hedden, 417
Allen, Ethan, 198
Allen, Gay Wilson, 861
Allen, James Lane, 893
Allen, Joseph Henry, 220-221, 227, 230, 696
Allen, W. O. B., 89
Allen, William Francis, 841
Allinsmith, Beverly, 608
Allinsmith, Wesley, 608
Allison, William Henry, 15
Allport, Gordon W., 550, 659
Allwardt, Paul, 813
Alma, Sister Maria. *See* Maria Alma, Sister
al-Magdissi, Nadim, 536-537
Alper, Michael, 518
Alter, J. Cecil, 330
Ames, Charles Gordon, 629-630
Ames, Edward Scribner, 1070-1071, 1154
Ames, Van Meter, 884
Ames, William, 968
Ander, O. Fritiof, 491
Anderson, Charles A., 298-299
Anderson, Nels, 331
Anderson, Paul Russell, 196, 199, 981, 1014, 1015, 1111
Anderson, Rasmus B., 491-492
Anderson, Rufus, 402
Anderson, William K., 297
Andrews, Charles McLean, 80, 88, 101, 128
Andrews, Dean Timothy, 494

Andrews, Edward Deming, 325, 833-834
Andrews, Elias, 1133
Andrews, Emerson, 178
Andrews, Matthew Page, 589
Andrews, Theodore, 473
Andrews, Wayne, 760
Andrews, William Given, 25, 280, 1032
Anet, Henri, 568-569
Angell, Robert Cooley, 607
Angle, Paul M., 620
Angoff, Charles, 873
Anson, Peter Frederick, 790
Anstadt, Peter, 1037
Anthony, Alfred Williams, 384
Antin, Mary, 873
Appel, Theodore, 1006
Aptheker, Herbert, 688
Archibald, Francis A., 163, 292
Archibald, Warren Seymour, 127, 1061
Arden, Gothard Everett, 1037
Arends, Robert L., 293
Argow, Waldemar, 263
Armstrong, Maurice Whitman, 298-299
Arndt, Johann, 139
Arnold, Eugene Rone, 440, 661
Arnold, Matthew, 138, 707
Arrington, Leonard J., 332
Asbury, Samuel E., 836
Asch, Sholem, 901
Ashworth, Mae Hurley, 431
Athearn, Clarence R., 389-390
Athearn, Walter Scott, 436-437
Atkins, Gaius Glenn, 283, 334, 344, 525, 540, 571-572, 947, 1065-1066
Atkins, James, 576
Atkinson, Brooks, 248, 933
Atkinson, John, 293
Atkinson, William Walker, 342
Attwater, Donald, 473, 495
Atwater, Lyman H., 152-153
Aubrey, Edwin Ewart, 558, 586, 645-646, 1046, 1059, 1065, 1069, 1144-1145
Auer, Johannes A. C. F., 1128, 1134
Aurand, A. Monroe, Jr., 315
Ausubel, Herman, 25
Ayer, Alfred Jules, 1128
Ayres, Anne, 734
A'Zam, M. A., 538

Baber, Ray E., 576
Babson, Roger Ward, 651, 709
Bach, Marcus, 274, 335, 345, 346, 376, 540
Bach, Marcus Louis, 1149
Bach, R. F., 758
Bachman, Calvin George, 317
Bachmann, Ernest Theodore, 490
Backlund, Jonas Oscar, 288
Backman, Melvin, 909
Bacon, Benjamin Wisner, 632, 1062, 1103
Bacon, David Francis, 42
Bacon, Leonard Woolsey, 58, 123, 127, 128, 130, 218, 283, 284
Bacon, Mary Schell (Hoke), 770
Bacon, Thomas Scott, 629
Badger, Joseph, 422
Baer, Kurt, 795
Bagby, Grover Carlton, 1090-1091
Bailey, Albert Edward, 754, 827
Bailey, Alvin Keith, 423
Bailey, Elmer James, 917
Bailey, James Henry, 458
Bailey, James Martin, 750
Bailey, Wilfred C., 332-333
Bailley de Barberey, Helene (Roederer), 468
Bainton, Roland Herbert, 67, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 592, 639, 1107
Baird, Charles W., 82
Baird, George Washington, 306
Baird, Henry Martyn, 74, 650
Baird, Robert, 60, 169
Baird, Samuel John, 300-301, 1106
Baker, Blaisdell Nelson, 982
Baker, Carlos Heard, 196, 859, 909, 924
Baker, Ernest Albert, 895
Baker, Max, 512-513
Baker, Newton Diehl, 554-555

Baker, Richard Terrill, 645
Baker, Robert A., 424
Bakke, N. J., 362
Balch, Thomas, 624
Balch, William Monroe, 729
Baldwin, Alice Mary, 45, 206, 226, 622-623
Baldwin, Charles C., 763
Baldwin, James, 943
Baldwin, Leland D., 57
Baldwin, Simeon Eben, 25, 90-91
Baldwin, Stephen Livingston, 405
Baldwin, Thomas, 157
Bales, James D., 1150
Ball, Rachel, 892
Ballard, Adela J., 433
Balleine, G. R., 279
Ballou, Hosea, 215, 1029
Ballou, Maturin Murray, 216
Bancroft, George, 81
Bancroft, Hubert Howe, 815
Banks, Charles E., 100
Banks, Louis Albert, 41
Barber, Jesse Belmont, 363
Barbour, J. Murray, 823
Barclay, Wade Crawford, 420, 680
Bargy, Henry, 568
Barker, John Marshall, 701-702
Barker, Leo Vaughn, 575
Barker, Robert Andrew, 287
Barlow, Joel, 196
Barnard, Floyd Merwyn, 937
Barnes, Albert, 170-171, 686, 691
Barnes, Calvin Rankin, 277
Barnes, Gilbert H., 684
Barnes, Roswell P., 601
Barnes, William Wright, 287
Barnett, Mother Patricia, 548
Barnhouse, Donald Grey, 1159
Baron, Salo Wittmayer, 511, 615
Barrett, E. Boyd, 851
Barrow, John Graves, 5, 16, 19, 38, 228, 435, 823, 958
Barrows, John Henry, 524-525
Barry, Colman J., 472, 474
Barry, David W., 552, 581
Barth, Karl, 961, 1080, 1082, 1083
Bartholomew, Alfred Clinton, 305
Bartlett, Samuel Colcord, 426
Bartlett, William I., 924
Bartol, Cyrus Augustus, 259
Barton, Bruce, 708-709
Barton, George, 628
Barton, George Aaron, 1056-1057
Barton, Rebecca Chalmers, 368
Barton, William Eleazar, 283, 844
Basanoff, V., 496
Basden, James, 1017
Baskett, Sam S., 895
Baskette, Floyd K., 871
Basler, Roy P., 620
Bass, Althea L. B., 427
Bass, Archer Bryan, 273, 385
Bassage, Harold, 933
Bassett, Ancel H., 294
Bastible, James Canon, 1042
Bates, Elisha, 171
Bates, Ernest Sutherland, 339, 556
Bates, M. Searle, 593
Batten, J. Minton, 366, 398
Battenhouse, Henry Martin, 917
Battenhouse, Paul Frederick, 700
Battenhouse, Roy, 854-855
Baumgartner, Apollinaris William, 456
Baxter, Norman Allen, 287-288
Baxter, Richard, 127
Bayles, George James, 25
Bayne, Stephen Fielding, 1088
Bays, Alice Anderson, 802
Beach, Harlan P., 400
Beahm, William McKinley, 403-404
Beale, Howard K., 671, 684
Bear, James E., 326
Beard, Augustus Field, 357, 403, 417
Beard, Charles A., 56, 80
Beard, Clarence M., 937
Beard, Mary R., 56, 80
Beardslee, Alvord M., 440
Beardsley, Eben Edwards, 280, 1031
Beardsley, Frank Grenville, 59, 182, 678
Beardsley, Harry M., 333
Beary, Thomas John, 885

Beasley, A. Roy, 580-581
Beasley, Norman, 340
Beatty, E. C. O., 321
Beck, Walter Herman, 447
Beckelman, M. W., 646
Becker, Carl L., 66, 185
Becker, Howard, 310
Beckman, Peter, 465
Beckwith, Clarence Augustine, 1154
Beecher, Edward, 681-682
Beecher, Henry Ward, 1056
Beecher, Lyman, 169, 178, 697, 997
Beer, George Louis, 80-81
Beers, G. Pitt, 419
Beers, Henry Putney, 7, 18, 38, 42, 400, 562, 958
Beets, Henry, 304
Behney, John Bruce, 1067
Beissel, Conrad, 818
Belcher, Hannah Graham, 894
Belcher, Joseph, 32, 147
Belden, Albert David, 147
Belkin, Samuel, 514
Bell, Bernard Iddings, 553, 1149
Bell, George Kennedy Allen, 393, 397-398
Bell, Mellicent, 902
Bell, Sadie, 668
Bell, Stephen, 720-721
Bellamy, Joseph, 990-991
Bellows, Robert Peabody, 771
Bellwald, Augustin M., 340
Belote, Theodore Goodwin, 436
Belvin, Benjamin Franklin, 427, 429
Beman, Lamar Taney, 668
Benard, Edmond Darvil, 1124
Bender, Elizabeth Horsch, 871
Bender, Harold Stauffer, 316
Bendix, Reinhard, 607
Benedict, Ruth, 549
Benjamin, Asher, 762
Bennett, George Henry, 1137
Bennett, John Boyce, 1028
Bennett, John Coleman, 64, 262, 601, 705, 1069, 1076, 1086
Bennett, Mary Angela, 890
Bennett, Richard M., 785
Bennett, William W., 167, 628
Benneville, George de. *See* De Benneville, George
Bennion, Lowell L., 602
Bennion, Milton Lynn, 451
Bensin, Basil M., 497, 504-505
Benson, Adolph B., 110, 491
Benson, Louis Fitzgerald, 825-826, 827
Benson, W. H., 723
Bentall, J. O., 712-713
Bente, F., 488
Berg, Axel Erickson, 421
Berg, Joseph F., 683
Berg, Kenneth Paul, 1002-1003
Bergen, James J., 122-123
Bergendoff, Conrad J. I., 70, 73
Berger, Max, 564
Bergstraesser, Arnold, 547
Berkeley, George, 202
Berkhof, Louis, 965
Bernard, L. L., 546
Bernesderfer, James O., 318
Bernhard, Harold Ernest, 150
Berry, L. L., 359
Berthoff, W. B., 924
Bertocci, Peter Anthony, 1109-1110
Best, Mary A., 198
Besterman, Theodore, 4, 7
Bestor, Arthur, 324
Beth, Loren Peter, 584
Betts, Darby Wood, 788
Bezanson, Walter E., 925
Biederwolf, William E., 345
Bilheimer, Robert S., 309
Billing, Einar, 1079
Billingsley, Amos Stevens, 628
Billington, Ray Allen, 159, 475, 887-888
Bilon, Peter, 498
Binder, Louis Richard, 334-335
Bingle, E. J., 34, 401
Binkley, Luther John, 1009
Binkley, Olin Trivette, 706
Binns, Leonard Elliott, 279
Binsfield, Edmund L., 16
Binyon, Gilbert Clive, 710
Birchard, Ford G., 574-575
Bird, Ruth Holmes (Scott), 817
Bisceglia, John B., 430
Bishop, Charles Cager, 33

Bishop, Isabella Lucy (Bird), 166, 566-567
Bittinger, Lucy Forney, 313
Bittner, William Robert, 875
Bixler, Julius Seelye, 261, 1020, 1075, 1124
Bjerring, Nicholas, 502
Blachly, Clarence Dan, 731
Black, M., 922
Blackmur, Richard P., 920
Blackwood, Andrew Watterson, 634, 800
Blackwood, Carolyn Philips, 575
Blackwood, James R., 787-788
Blaikie, Alexander, 60, 174
Blair, Winfred Dyer, 439
Blake, Peter, 790-791
Blake, Silas Leroy, 114, 151
Blakely, William Addison, 596
Blanck, Jacob Nathaniel, 847
Blankenbuehler, Lorenz, 883
Blanshard, Paul, 479, 483
Blau, H., 922
Blau, Joseph Leon, 195, 595-596, 648, 702, 983, 1014, 1018, 1022, 1024, 1111, 1113, 1114
Blauch, L. E., 450
Blegen, Theodore C., 492
Blied, Benjamin J., 626
Bliss, Edwin Munsell, 400
Bliss, William D. P., 678
Bloch, Joshua, 508-509
Bloesch, Donald George, 1090
Bluestone, George, 900
Bluhm, David Rodney, 799
Boardman, George Nye, 973
Boas, George, 776
Boas, Ralph Philip, 522
Bockelman, Wilfred, 750
Bodein, Vernon Parker, 704
Bodensieck, Julius, 335
Bodo, John R., 648
Boehm, Anton Wilhelm, 131
Boggs, Wade H., Jr., 345
Bohn, Frank, 653-654
Bois, Jules, 329, 530, 535-536
Boisen, Anton Theophilus, 549
Bokser, Ben Zion, 1144
Boland, F. J., 479
Bollig, Richard Joseph, 444
Bolshakoff, Serge, 497
Bolster, Arthur S., Jr., 234
Bolton, Charles Knowles, 83
Bolton, Herbert Eugene, 461
Bomberger, John Henry Augustus, 1006
Bond, Horace Mann, 369
Bonderud, Omar, 488
Bonham, John Milton, 1143
Bonnar, Alphonsos, 589
Bonner, Carey, 831
Bonniwell, William R., 808
Bookstaber, Philip David, 521
Boon, Edward P., 39
Boorman, John Arthur, 1061
Boorstin, Daniel Joseph, 208, 649
Bornhausen, Karl, 570
Boroff, David, 875
Bosher, Robert S., 9, 276
Bosley, Harold Augustus, 1160
Bosquet, G. H., 538
Bost, George Henry, 592
Boudin, Louis B., 599-600
Boulding, Kenneth E., 600-601
Bourne, Randolph, 106
Bouyer, Louis, 806
Bowden, Robert John, 448
Bowdoin, James Laurence, 1102
Bowen, Howard R., 601
Bowen, Trevor, 612
Bower, William Clayton, 665
Bowerman, George Franklin, 9
Bowers, David F., 452
Bowers, Roy Edwin, 744
Bowler, George, 782-783
Bowler, (Sister) Mariella, 446
Bowman, Archibald Allan, 1109
Bowman, B. L., 635
Bowman, Clarice Margurette, 800-801
Bowman, John Wick, 326-327
Bowman, Rufus David, 643

Bown, Louis John, 580
Bowne, Borden Parker, 1112, 1117, 1159
Boyd, E., 794
Boyd, Ernest A., 106
Boyd, Malcolm, 900-901, 935
Boyd, Thomas M., 794
Boyer, Edward Sterling, 662
Boynton, P. H., 868-869
Boynton, Richard Wilson, 1132
Boyum, Arnold E., 739
Brabham, Mouzon William, 786
Braden, Charles Samuel, 64, 335, 340, 345, 346, 525, 536
Bradford, Alden, 194, 226
Bradford, Amory H., 724
Bradlaugh, Charles, 1143
Bradley, David Henry, Sr., 359
Bradley, Dwight, 610
Bradley, Joshua, 158
Bradshaw, Marion John, 397, 631
Bradshaw, William, 968
Bradstreet, Anne, 921
Brady, Cyrus Townsend, 424
Brady, Joseph Hugh, 590
Bragg, George F., Jr., 363
Brain, Belle Marvel, 428
Braithwaite, William Charles, 318
Braithwaite, William Stanley Beaumont, 916, 942-943
Branagan, Thomas, 31
Branch, E. D., 899
Brandreth, Henry Renaud Turner, 392, 494-495
Branscomb, Bennett Harvie, 551
Brasch, Frederick E., 978, 1044
Braswell, William, 903-904, 1023
Bratton, Theodore DuBose, 1034
Brauer, Jerald C., 273, 617-618
Braumbaugh, Lewis Henry, 718
Brawley, Benjamin, 367-368, 939
Brawley, Benjamin Griffith, 826
Bready, John Wesley, 143
Bredemeir, Harry C., 676
Breed, David Riddle, 825
Breed, William Pratt, 624
Brehmer, Robert George, Jr., 722
Bremer, David Henry, 1154
Bremond, André, 1137
Brémond, Henri, 912
Brenner, Scott Francis, 799, 800, 1007
Brentano, Frances, 852, 880
Bretall, Robert W., 1091
Brewer, Clifton Hartwell, 442
Brewer, David Josiah, 584
Brewster, Chauncey B., 719
Brewster, Edward Eldredge, 715-716
Bricker, Garland Armor, 744, 747
Brickett, Elsie F., 924
Brickley, Charles N., 277
Bridenbaugh, Carl, 159, 761
Bridgeforth, Med, 943
Bridges, Horace James, 268-269, 900
Bridgman, Raymond L., 250-251
Bridston, Keith R., 1102
Briggs, Charles Augustus, 299, 1102
Brightman, Edgar Sheffield, 1117
Brill, Earl Hubert, 933
Brings, Lawrence Martin, 936-937
Brinton, Clarence Crane, 184
Brinton, Ellen Starr, 288
Brinton, Howard Haines, 451
Britten, Allen P., 812
Britten, Emma Hardinge, 341-342
Brittin, Norman A., 241
Brock, Henry Irving, 773
Brock, Robert Alonzo, 307
Brockunier, Samuel Hugh, 112
Broderick, Robert Carlton, 760
Brodie, Fannie M., 509
Brodie, Fawn McKay, 333-334
Brokhoge, Joseph Delfman, 693
Brooks, Arle, 642
Brooks, Charles Alvin, 430
Brooks, Charles Burnell, 867
Brooks, Charles Mattoon, Jr., 765
Brooks, Cleanth, 910
Brooks, David Marshall, 1149-1150

Brooks, Henry Mason, 811
Brooks, John Graham, 563
Brooks, Obed, 891-892
Brooks, Walter H., 361
Brosnan, Cornelius J., 424
Brotherston, Bruce W., 1029
Brown, Alexander, 81
Brown, Charles Ewing, 309
Brown, Charles Reynolds, 630, 701
Brown, David, 683
Brown, Forrest R., 716
Brown, Herbert Ross, 890
Brown, Ira V., 326, 1050-1051, 1056
Brown, J. A., 119-120
Brown, J. Douglas, 558-559
Brown, James Haldane, 422-423
Brown, John Thomas, 291
Brown, Marianna C., 440-441
Brown, Nicholas C., 669
Brown, R. W., 854
Brown, Robert McAfee, 886
Brown, Robert R., 614
Brown, S. G., 1120
Brown, Samuel Windsor, 664
Brown, Stephen J., 412
Brown, Stephen J. M., 880-881
Brown, Sterling A., 939, 941
Brown, Sterling Wade, 450
Brown, Thelma Sharman, 936
Brown, Theron, 826-827
Brown, Wallace C., 922
Brown, William Adams, 391, 393-394, 586, 589, 601, 649, 1004, 1065, 1066, 1104
Browne, E. Martin, 935
Browne, Henry Joseph, 455, 732
Browning, Willis Paul, 1154
Bruce, Philip Alexander, 92
Brumbaugh, A. J., 450
Brumbaugh, G. Edwin, 772-773
Brumbaugh, Martin Grove, 315
Brun, Elizabeth, 888
Brunner, Edmund deS., 744-745, 746, 749
Brunner, Heinrich Emil, 1080, 1159-1160
Brush, John W., 400
Bryan, Gerald B., 338
Bryce, James Viscount, 118, 567
Brydon, G. MacLaren, 93-94, 116, 160, 278, 625
Brynestad, Lawrence E., 153-154
Bryson, Lyman, 654
Buchanan, Annabel Morris, 835
Buchanan, Joseph, 1014
Buchler, Joseph, 521
Buchler, Justus, 1122
Buck, Charles, 31
Buck, Pearl S., 407
Buck, Solon J., 562, 563
Buckham, John Wright, 697, 975-976, 1064, 1120
Buckley, James M., 138, 293
Bucklin, Dorothy O., 427
Buehrer, Edwin T., 219
Buell, Samuel, 157
Buffinton, Arthur H., 100
Buhlmaier, Marie, 433
Bulfinch, Ellen Susan, 762
Bulfinch, Stephen Greenleaf, 914
Bulgakov, Sergius, 495
Bultmann, Phyllis Wetherell, 826
Bultmann, W. A., 90
Bunting, John J., Jr., 884
Burckhardt, Jacob, 1077
Burgess, Ernest W., 310
Burgess, G. A., 287
Burgess, Thomas, 499
Burke, John James, 634
Burkhardt, Frederick Henry, 1128
Burkhart, Charles, 934
Burkhart, Roy Abram, 391, 636-637
Burleson, Hugh Latimer, 419
Burnet, Thomas, 1010
Burns, James Aloysius, 443
Burr, Nelson R., 18, 97, 121, 657
Burrage, Champlin, 78, 79
Burrage, Henry Sweetser, 72, 287, 831
Burritt, Carrie Turrell, 420
Burrows, Millar, 559
Burtner, Robert W., 141
Burton, Katherine Kurz, 485
Burton, Malcolm King, 284-285, 306

Burton, Richard F., 332
Burtt, Edwin A., 1039, 1066, 1110, 1132
Bury, John Bagnell, 255
Bushnell, Horace, 697, 1060, 1114
Buszin, Walter E., 809
Butcher, Margaret Just, 842, 843, 939
Butler, James Donald, 1074, 1142
Butler, Joseph, 138, 201, 1011
Butler, W. J., 674
Butsch, Joseph, 365
Butt, Elsie Miller, 439
Butterfield, Kenyon Leech, 749-750
Butterworth, Hezekiah, 826-827
Buttrick, George Arthur, 1147
Butts, Charles A., 792
Butts, R. Freeman, 667
Byington, Ezra Hoyt, 100, 102, 132, 133
Byrne, Edward John, 479
Byrne, John F., 467

Cable, William Arthur, 451
Cabot, James Elliot, 248
Cabot, Richard Clarke, 796
Cadbury, Henry J., 363, 621, 925
Cadden, John Paul, 454-455
Cadman, H. W., 725-726
Cadman, S. Parkes, 586
Cadwallader, Edward Miles, 451
Cady, E. H., 945
Caine, Hall, 897
Cairns, Fred L., 1020
Cairns, William B., 913
Caldecott, Alfred, 1112
Calder, Isabel MacBeath, 101, 138
Caldwell, Cleon Carthue, 674-675
Caldwell, Daniel Templeton, 635
Calhoun, Arthur W., 104
Calhoun, Robert L., 662
Calvin, John, 964-965
Cameron, Kenneth Walter, 254, 893-894
Cameron, Richard M., 141, 392
Cammann, Henry, 735
Camp, H. N., 735
Campa, A. L., 937-938
Campbell, Alexander, 382-383
Campbell, Harry Modean, 858-859, 905-906, 907, 928
Campbell, James Mann, 343
Campbell, John Lorne, 1099
Campbell, Thomas H., 301
Candler, Warren Akin, 182
Canfield, Francis Xavier, 905
Cannon, James, 111, 420
Cannon, M. Hamlin, 167
Cannon, William Ragsdale, 141
Cantrell, Clyde H., 850
Cantril, Hadley, 609
Capers, Thomas Stacy, 125
Carlson, Edgar M., 1080
Carlson, John Roy, 653
Carlson, Stan W., 506
Carman, Harry James, 18
Carnegie, Andrew, 708
Carnell, Edward John, 1090
Carpenter, Frederick J., 246, 247
Carpenter, Joseph Estlin, 235
Carpenter, R. C., 906
Carr, James McLeod, 748
Carrier, Warren, 930
Carriger, Thomas Pinckney, 941
Carrigg, John Joseph, 633-634
Carroll, Henry King, 35, 58
Carroll, J. M., 355
Carruth, W. H., 918
Carter, E. Russell, 429
Carter, Manfred A., 911
Carter, Paul Allen, 362, 705
Cartland, Fernando Gale, 642
Cartwright, Peter, 164
Carus, Paul, 527, 1148
Case, Adelaide T., 670
Case, Carl Delos, 574
Case, Shirley Jackson, 6, 76, 326, 662
Cash, Wilbur Joseph, 1093
Casserley, Julian Victor Langmead, 1012
Cassidy, Francis Patrick, 446
Casson, Herbert Newton, 1136
Castañeda, Carlos E., 461
Catharine Frances, Sister, 445
Cathcart, William, 624
Cather, Willa, 878, 879
Cattell, Jaques, 41

Catton, William R., Jr., 335
Cause, John Martin, 425
Cavarnos, Constantine, 506
Cavert, Inez M., 575
Cavert, Samuel McCrea, 1163
Cayton, Horace R., 372
Chadwick, John White, 230, 630
Chaffee, Edmund Bigelow, 731
Chakerian, Charles Garabad, 746
Chalmers Thomas, 1011
Chamberlain, Joshua Lawrence, 48
Chamberlin, John Gordon, 637
Chambers, Samuel Tinsley, 565
Chambers, Talbot Wilson, 165
Chambers, Theodore Frelinghuysen, 121, 123
Chandler, Elizabeth Lathrop, 866
Channing, Edward, 81
Channing, William Ellery, 230, 237, 1018
Channing, William Henry, 151, 710-711, 1018
Chapell, Frederick Leonard, 153
Chapman, Stuart W., 627
Charters, Jessie Allen, 659
Charvat, Charles C., 879
Chase, Gilbert, 814
Chase, Mary Ellen, 879
Chase, Richard Volney, 881
Chase, Wayland J., 663
Chauncy, Charles, 150, 184, 212, 226
Cheek, John L., 1057
Cheesebro, Roy Alan, 681
Cheeseman, Lewis, 171
Cheever, George Barrell, 617, 686, 689
Chepeleff, John, 501-502
Cherrington, E. H., 650
Cherry, Fannye N., 867
Cheshire, Joseph Blount, 277
Cheville, Roy Arthur, 333
Cheyne, T. K., 1057
Cheyney, Edward P., 65, 81
Cheyney, Mary A., 1061
Child, Lydia Maria, 524, 526
Child, Sargent B., 16
Childs, John L., 671
Chiles, Robert E., 141
Chitwood, Oliver Perry, 57
Chorley, Edward Clowes, 92, 97, 278, 279, 419, 945, 1033
Christensen, Merton A., 196
Christian, John T., 286
Christian, William, 1073
Christie, Francis Albert, 25, 1021, 1027
Christy, Arthur, 925
Christy, Arthur Edward, 246, 522, 524
Christy, Wayne H., 387
Church, Avery Milton, 1050
Church, Brooke Peters, 59, 309
Churchill, Allen, 888
Churchill, Winston, 893
Ciesluk, Joseph E., 470
Clapham, H. Sheffield, 864
Clark, Barrett Harper, 932, 934
Clark, Carl Anderson, 750
Clark, Elmer Talmage, 294, 323, 378, 420, 431, 1155
Clark, George Pierce, 908
Clark, Harry Hayden, 196, 197-198, 856, 867-868
Clark, Henry W., 78
Clark, John Franklin, 1134
Clark, John Spencer, 1054
Clark, Joseph B., 416
Clark, Kenneth McKenzie, 776
Clark, Robert B., 680
Clark, Thomas Curtis, 914
Clark, Walter H., 346
Clarke, Basil Fulford Lowther, 776, 781
Clarke, Emily Smith, 1064
Clarke, James Freeman, 526
Clarke, William B., 174
Clarke, William Newton, 1063
Clausen, Bernard C., 732
Cleaveland, George Julius, 281-282, 803
Clemens, Samuel C. *See* Twain, Mark
Clement, Rufus E., 369
Cleveland, Catharine C., 160
Cleveland, Charles Dexter, 915

Clinchy, Everett Ross, 594
Clinchy, Russell James, 1065
Cline, John, 861
Clyde, Walter R., Jr., 1000
Coan, Otis Welton, 880
Coate, Lowell Harris, 643
Cobb, Sanford Hoadley, 113, 591
Cochran, Thomas C., 26
Coddington, Herbert G., 711
Code, Joseph Bernard, 459, 467, 468
Coe, George Albert, 1153
Coffin, Henry Sloane, 802, 1050, 1068
Cogan, (Sister) Mary de Paul, 414
Cogley, John, 484
Cohen, Israel, 515
Cohn, Werner, 338
Cohon, Samuel Solomon, 641
Coit, Stanton, 797
Colby, Robert A., 929
Cole, Alfred Storer, 214, 218
Cole, Charles C., Jr., 697
Cole, Eva A., 47
Cole, Marley, 338
Cole, Stewart Grant, 1097
Coleman, Edward D., 874, 875
Coleman, Frank Guy, 576-577
Coleman, George William, 728
Coleman, Henry E., Jr., 12
Coleman, Robert Emerson, 293
Coleridge, Samuel Taylor, 242, 1024
Collins, Anthony, 190, 192, 203
Collins, Varnum Lansing, 656, 1001
Collison, Robert L., 4
Colloms, Lester Hubert, 1058
Colton, Calvin, 169
Colwell, Ernest Cadman, 1104
Colwell, Stephen, 668, 698
Come, Arnold Bruce, 1142
Commager, Henry Steele, 11, 57, 239, 690
Conant, William C., 166
Condit, Ira M., 431
Condon, Richard A., 865
Confrey, Burton, 676
Conn, Charles W., 329
Conn, Howard, 741
Connelly, Marcus Cook, 942
Conner, Frederick William, 918
Connolly, Thomas E., 902-903
Conover, Elbert Moore, 787, 788
Considine, Robert Bernard, 414
Constant, G., 77-78
Constantinides, Michael, 495
Conway, Joseph P., 482
Conway, Moncure D., 197, 198
Conwell, Russell Herman, 708, 899
Conze, Edward, 526
Cook, Harold, 821
Cook, Joseph, 239, 252
Cooke, George Willis, 221, 227, 253, 547-548, 696
Cooper, A. R., 781
Cooper, Anthony Ashley, 191
Cooper, Charles Henry, 52
Cooper, James Fenimore, 888
Cooper, Lane, 562
Cooper, Thompson, 52
Cope, Edward Drinker, 1049
Cope, Henry Frederick, 440
Cope, Jackson, 849
Coppée, Henry, 276
Corelli, Marie, 896
Corey, Stephen Jared, 291
Corey, William A., 1151
Cornelison, Isaac Amada, 584
Cornell, Julien, 644
Corrigan, (Sister) M. Felicia, 720
Corwin, Charles E., 110, 123, 303
Corwin, Edward Tanjore, 303
Corwin, Samuel Tanjore, 121
Coss, John J., 134
Costain, Thomas, 901
Costello, H. T., 1139
Cotter, Joseph S., Jr., 941
Cotton, John, 127
Cottrell, Beekman W., 907
Coulter, Ellis Merton, 563
Courtney, Janet Elizabeth (Hogarth), 256
Cousin, Victor, 1025
Cousins, Norman, 618
Coutts, Alfred, 315
Covey, Cyclone, 815
Cowell, Maude E. C., 562
Cowie, Alexander, 881
Cox, F. A., 58

Coyle, Robert Francis, 724
Crabites, Pierre, 537
Crafts, Wilbur Fisk, 714-715
Cragg, G. R., 386
Craig, Clarence Tucker, 394-395
Craig, Samuel G., 1040
Craighead, J. G., 299
Cram, Ralph Adams, 755, 764, 780-781, 784-785
Cramer, Clarence H., 260
Cranmer, W. S., 122
Cranz, David, 119
Crawford, Benjamin Franklin, 831
Crawford, Francis Marion, 879, 897
Creighton, James Edwin, 1118
Crismon, Leo T., 285, 1095
Crittenden, Harriet, 376
Crompton, Arnold, 229
Cromwell, John W., 367
Cronin, A. J., 901
Cronin, John Francis, 722-723
Crooker, Joseph Henry, 235
Cross, Arthur Lyon, 91, 624
Cross, Barbara M., 1061
Cross, George, 385
Cross, Robert D., 481
Cross, Whitney Rogers, 177, 323
Cross, Wilford Oakland, 102
Crouse, Nellis M., 82
Crow, Martha Foote, 915
Culemans, J. B., 462-463
Cullen, Countee, 851, 939, 943
Culver, Dwight Wendell, 373, 611
Culver, Raymond B., 664
Cummins, Robert, 212, 218
Cuninggim, Merrimon, 439, 593
Cunningham, Homer F., 663-664
Curley, Michael J., 462
Curran, Francis X., 65, 676
Curti, Merle E., 196, 638, 665, 706, 978
Curtis, Anna L., 635
Curwen, John Spencer, 824
Cushing, Caleb, 697
Cushman, A. B., 435
Cushman, Robert Fairchild, 672
Cutten, George B., 328

Dabney, Virginius, 651, 652
Dahle, John, 832
Dakin, Arthur Hazard, 965, 1134
Dakin, Edward F., 339-340
Dallmann, Wm., 1035
Damrosch, Frank, Jr., 281
Dana, Ellis Huntington, 660
Dana, James, 1150
Danforth, John, 824
Danhof, Ralph J., 1002
Daniel, John, 729
Daniel, Robert, 918
Daniel, Vattel Elbert, 610
Daniel, William A., 369
Daniels, Earl, 950
Dargan, Marion, 39
Dark, Sidney, 1151
Darken, Arthur H., 646-647
Darling, Charles David, 1145
Darrow, Clarence Seward, 1148
Darwin, Charles, 1047, 1146
Das, R., 1073
DaSilva, Owen, 814
Dau, W. H. T., 1035
Davenport, Frances G., 88
Davenport, Frederick Morgan, 143, 175, 176, 327
David, Hans Theodore, 817
Davidson, Elizabeth H., 88
Davidson, J., 927
Davidson, Philip, 622
Davies, Arthur Powell, 553
Davies, David Richard, 1090, 1144
Davies, Horton, 311, 346, 536, 796, 798-799
Davis, Alexander Jackson, 764
Davis, Arthur K., 603
Davis, Arthur P., 939
Davis, Helen E., 409
Davis, Henderson Sheridan, 843
Davis, Jerome, 607-608, 706, 709, 725
Davis, Joe Lee, 1155
Davis, John W., 361
Davis, Kingsley, 676
Davis, Mary Dabney, 438
Davis, Otis B., 849
Davis, Ozora Stearns, 284, 946-947
Davison, Archibald Thompson, 810, 819
Dawber, Mark A., 434
Dawley, Powel Mills, 281
Dawson, Christopher, 589

Dawson, Joseph Martin, 587, 591
Day, Richard Ellsworth, 426
Dearmer, Percy, 753
De Benneville, George, 211
De Benneville, K. Ludwig, 124
DeBilio, Francis D., 431
Deferrari, Roy J., 443
DeGroot, Alfred Thomas, 289, 290, 291
Dehey, Elinor Tong, 468
Deitz, Reginald W., 489
DeJong, Jerome Bernard, 449
DeJong, Peter Ymen, 971
Delacroix, S., 413
Delanglez, Jean, 462
Dellenbaugh, Frederick S., 562
Demant, Vigo Auguste, 603
Demarest, David D., 121, 303
Demarest, William, 122
DeMille, George Edmed, 277, 281, 1033
Dennis, James Shepard, 405, 406
Denzinger, Heinrich, 1040
De Onis, José, 565-566
Deploige, Simon, 548
Derby, George, 40
Derby, Josiah, 515
De Remer, Richard Ward, 665
Des Champs, Margaret Burr, 1096
De Schweinitz, Edmund, 314, 426
Desmond, Humphrey Joseph, 476
Desroche, Henri, 325-326
Dett, Robert Nathaniel, 845
Deutsch, Babette, 910
Devamata, Sister, 533
Devan, Samuel Arthur, 801-802
Dewey, John, 1025, 1126, 1127, 1128-1129, 1140, 1168
Dewey, Orville, 172
DeWolf, L. Harold, 1092
Dexter, Franklin Bowditch, 51
Dexter, Henry Martyn, 169-170, 282, 734
Dexter, O. P., 43
DeZoysa, Agampodi Paulus, 527
DeZurko, Edward Robert, 782
Dickenson, W. G., 76
Dickinson, A. T., Jr., 895-896
Dickinson, Edward, 809-810
Dickinson, Charles Henry, 1133
Dickson, A. F., 355
Diehl, Katharine Smith, 5, 9, 20, 30
Dietrich, John Hassler, 1131
Diggs, Margaret Agneta, 446
Dike, Samuel W., 175
Dillenberger, John, 71, 962-963, 1084
Dillett, James, 345
Diman, J. Lewis, 61
Dimond, Sydney George, 177
Dinin, Samuel, 519
Dinkins, Charles R., 941
Dirks, John Edwards, 1019, 1022
Dittemore, John V., 339
Dix, Dom Gregory, 805-806
Dix, Morgan, 820, 1135
Dixon, William Hepworth, 323
Dobbins, Gaines Stanley, 437, 577
Dobson, Ruth Lininger, 871
Dodd, Charles Harold, 386
Dodd, William E., 26, 687
Doddridge, Philip, 200
Dodge, David Low, 638
Dohrman, Henry Theodore, 337
Dombrowski, James, 713
Dominguez, Francisco Atanasio, 461
Donnell, Edna, 777
Donoghue, Daniel C., 596-597
Dorchester, Daniel, 58
Dorey, Frank David, 611
Dorfman, Joseph, 103
Dornbusch, Sanford M., 1159
Dorosh, John T., 494
Dorough, Charles Dwight, 1094
Douglas, Anne, 835
Douglas, Donald, 307
Douglas, Lloyd C., 897, 900
Douglas, Winfred, 810
Douglass, Harlan Paul, 273, 357, 385-386, 390, 417, 609, 636, 739, 740
Douglass, Paul Franklin, 296
Douglass, Truman B., 418, 1166
Dowden, John, 202

Dowey, Edward A., 965
Dowey, Edward A., Jr., 74
Dowis, Solomon F., 735-736
Dowling, Enos E., 289
Downing, Antoinette Forrester, 762
Doyle, Arthur Conan, 342
Drake, St. Clair, 372
Drake, Thomas E., 687-688
Draovich, Michael B., 505
Dreer, Herman, 939
Dresser, Horatio Willis, 343, 345
Drewes, Christopher F., 362
Drinan, Robert F., 677
Drucker, Peter F., 616
Drummond, Andrew Landale, 272, 759, 883
Drummond, Edward J., 877
Drummond, Henry, 1012
Drummond, Robert Rutherford, 817
Drury, Augustus Waldo, 295
Drury, Clifford Merrill, 423, 530
Dubbs, Joseph Henry, 120, 305
DuBois, William Edward Burghardt, 349, 371, 842, 939
DuBose, William Porcher, 1034
Duclos, R. P., 307
Duker, Abraham G., 522-523
Dulles, John Foster, 620
Dumond, Dwight L., 684
Dun, Angus, 392, 796
Dunbar, Paul L., 939
Dunham, Arthur, 635-636
Dunkel, Wilbur Dwight, 929
Dunkelberger, Harold Aberley, 804-805
Dunkley, E. H., 73
Dunlap, Knight, 549
Dunlap, Mollie E., 938
Dunn, William Allen, 772
Dunn, William Kailer, 437
Dunning, Albert Elijah, 283
Durfee, Calvin, 51
Durfee, Harold Allen, 698-699
Durham, Chester Forrester, 627
Durick, Jeremiah K., 879
Durnbaugh, Donald F., 317
Durrie, Daniel Steele, 42
Duskie, John A., 473
Dutcher, George Matthew, 4, 16, 20, 37
Duvall, Sylvanus Milne, 449
Dwight, Henry Otis, 400, 425
Dwight, Timothy, 991, 1146
Dwyer, W. W., 344-345
Dykstra, D. Ivan, 706
Dymond, Jonathan, 638

Eakin, Eugene Kenneth, 1161
Eakin, Frank, 438, 576
Eakin, Mildred Olivia Moody, 438, 576
Earnest, Joseph B., 356
Earp, Edwin Lee, 749
Easby-Smith, James S., 49
Eastlake, Charles Locke, 776
Eastman, Elaine Goodale, 428
Eastman, Fred, 754, 931, 935-936
Easton, Emily, 112
Easton, William Burnet, 1160
Eaton, Clement, 1093
Ebaugh, John S., 32
Eberlein, Harold Donaldson, 767
Ebersole, Luke E., 650
Eby, Kermit, 732
Eckardt, A. Roy, 1166
Eckenrode, Hamilton James, 115
Eddy, G. Norman, 324
Eddy, George Sherwood, 551
Eddy, H. H., 892
Eddy, Mary O., 829
Eddy, Richard, 217, 227
Eddy, Sherwood, 67
Eddy, T. M., 163
Edge, Henry T., 536
Edidin, Ben M., 521
Edman, Irwin, 1130, 1140-1141, 1168-1169
Edmonds, Edwin Richardson, 701
Edwards, Bela Bates, 400, 401
Edwards, Boyd, 660
Edwards, Dana W. (pseud.). *See* Wright, Conrad
Edwards, Jonathan, 132, 133, 134, 945, 980, 982, 983, 1152
Edwards, Jonathan, Jr., 991
Edwards, Lyford P., 611
Edwards, Maldwyn, 142

Edwards, Martha L., 62
Eells, Myron, 425
Effendi, Shoghi, 540
Egbert, Donald Drew, 324, 781, 791
Eggleston, Edward, 81
Eggleston, Percy Coe, 991
Ehrensperger, Harold Adam, 936
Ehrenstrom, Nils, 615
Einstein, Albert, 1046
Eisan, Leslie, 643
Eisenach, r George John, 313-314, 432
Eisenstein, Ira, 518-519, 595
Eisenstein, J. D., 513
Eister, Allan W., 346
Eldredge, Lucy M., 735
Eliot, Christopher R., 696
Eliot, Samuel Atkins, 231
Eliot, Thomas Stearns, 853, 909, 918-919
Ellard, Gerald, 807-808
Eller, Paul Himmel, 296
Ellerbee, A. W., 356
Elliff, Nathan T., 644
Ellingwood, Francis, 1148
Ellinwood, Leonard Webster, 809, 811-812, 830-831, 832, 835
Elliott, Agnes M., 39
Elliott, Charles, 686
Elliott, Ernest Eugene, 575
Elliott, Marian Grace, 39
Elliott-Binns, Leonard Elliott, 962
Ellis, Charles Mayo, 241
Ellis, George, 232
Ellis, George E., 81, 99
Ellis, John Tracy, 455, 456, 457, 460, 484, 485
Ellis, William T., 180-181
Ellsworth, Clayton Sumner, 626
Ellul, Jacques, 386
Ellwood, Charles A., 549-550
Elsbree, Oliver Wendell, 401, 416
Elson, Edward L. R., 1164
Elwood, Douglas J., 980
Ely, Ezra Stiles, 994
Ely, Richard T., 702, 719
Embury, Aymar, II, 762, 768
Emerson, Everett H., 970
Emerson, Ralph Waldo, 243, 247, 248, 249, 1022, 1023
Emerton, Ephraim, 24, 235
Emery, Julia C., 419
Emhardt, William Chauncey, 501, 503-504
Emmet, Dorothy M., 1073
Emmons, Irvin Willetts, 182
Emmons, Nathanael, 992
Emrich, Richard Stanley, 1081
Engelder, Th., 1035
Engelder, Theodore E. W., 1137
Engelhardt, Charles Anthony, 461, 814-815
Engelhardt, Zephyrin. *See* Engelhardt, Charles Anthony
Englebert, Omer, 461
Englert, Clement C., 473
English, George Bethune, 1135
English, Jack, 878
Engstrom, Theodore Wilhelm, 949
Ensign, Chauncey David, 118, 313
Enzel, Josef, 36
Eppstein, John, 589
Erb, William H., 1006
Erbacher, Sebastian Anthony, 446
Erdman, Charles R., 180
Ericksen, Ephraim E., 332
Ernest, Brother, 466
Ernst, James Emanuel, 112
Erskine, John, 847-848
Ertz, Susan, 333
Ervin, Spencer, 94, 95
Esch, I. Lynd, 669
Essex, R. S., 1151
Essig, Montgomery F., 33
Esslemont, J. E., 540
Estournelles, Paul Henri Benjamin, 568
Eubanks, John Bunyan, 1128
"Evangelist" (pseud.), 840
Evans, Augusta Jane, 889
Evans, John Henry, 333
Evenden, E. S., 448
Evennet, H. Outram, 589
Everett, Charles Carroll, 1020, 1118
Everett, John Rutherford, 604
Evermeyer, Florence E., 525-526
Exman, Eugene, 899

Fagley, Frederick Louis, 283, 284
Fahs, Charles Harvey, 406, 409
Fahs, Sophia Lyon, 310
Fairbanks, Henry G., 879
Fairchild, Hoxie N., 439, 909
Fairchild, James H., 682
Falkenstein, George N., 315
Fallaw, Wesner, 576
Farace, Charles, 1057
Faris, Ellsworth, 310
Faris, N. A., 539
Farish, Hunter Dickinson, 294
Farmer, John, 43, 48
Farrell, Alfred, 942
Farrenc, Edmund, 888
Fast, Howard Melvin, 197
Faulkner, Charles Draper, 789
Faunce, William Herbert Perry, 406, 632
Fauset, Arthur Huff, 375-376
Faust, Albert Bernhardt, 82
Faust, Clarence H., 132, 133, 865, 867, 979, 981, 985
Fawcett, Edgar, 1147
Fay, Jay W., 1114
Featherstun, Henry Walter, 883-884
Feaver, John Clayton, 983
Feeman, Harlan Luther, 748
Feigl, Herbert, 1123
Felch, William Eugene, 1127
Fell, (Sister) Marie Leonore, 474-475
Felton, Ralph Almon, 367, 745, 748, 749, 750
Fenn, William W., 965
Fenner, Thomas P., 844
Fenton, Joseph Clifford, 1041
Ferguson, Adam, 1015
Ferguson, Charles W., 336
Ferguson, Rowena, 578
Fergusson, E. Morris, 441
Ferm, Vergilius Ture Anselm, 28, 212, 218, 219, 272, 318, 338, 489, 533, 540, 1037-1038, 1069, 1085-1086
Ferrando, Guido, 532
Ferrater Mora, José 1078
Ferré, Nels F. S., 439, 559-560, 646, 654, 1079, 1092
Fevold, Eugene Lysne, 492-493
Fey, Harold E., 477, 746
Fichter, F. J., 471
Fichter, Joseph Henry, 444, 548, 742
Field, Henry Martyn, 1147
Fieldbrave, Theodore, 530
Fifer, Duane Virgil, 788
Fillmore, Charles, 345
Filthaut, Theodor, 793
Finck, William John, 487
Finkelstein, Louis, 41, 515
Finley, James Bradley, 163, 580
Finley, Samuel, 132
Finn, Brendan A., 459
Finney, Charles Grandison, 170, 178-179, 681
Finney, Theodore M., 809
Fisch, Max Harold, 196, 199, 981, 1014, 1015, 1073, 1111
Fischoff, Ephraim, 602-603
Fish, Henry Clay, 165, 171
Fisher, Galen Merriam, 398, 660
Fisher, George Park, 23, 1012, 1112, 1136
Fisher, J. A., 6
Fisher, L. B., 218
Fisher, Miles Mark, 336, 371, 843
Fisher, Reginald G., 766
Fisher, Robert Cameron, 640
Fisher, Vardis, 333
Fisher, William Arms, 844-845
Fisk, Margaret Palmer, 802-803
Fiske, George Walter, 800
Fiske, John, 39, 99-100, 1053
Fitch, Parker Albert, 658-659
Fitchett, William Henry, 1137
Fitt, Frank, 175-176
Fitts, Margaret, 738
Fitz-Gerald, Aaron Boyland, 923
Fitzpatrick, John C., 619
FitzRandolph, Anson Davies, 914
Fitzsimmons, M. A., 720
Fleming, Sandford, 105, 435
Fletcher, Joseph F., 548, 605, 719-720
Fletcher, Miriam, 889
Fletcher, Robert S., 682

Flew, Antony, 1047, 1139
Flory, John S., 451
Flournoy, Theodore, 1125
Flower, Charles E., 329
Floyd, William, 262, 1132
Foakes-Jackson, F. J., 141-142
Foerster, Norman, 1129-1130
Foik, Paul Joseph, 456, 476
Foley, Albert S., 365-366
Folsom, F. G., Jr., 598
Foner, Philip S., 511
Foote, George William, 1143
Foote, Henry Wilder, 210, 283-284, 795, 823, 824, 825, 828
Foote, William Henry, 307
Forbush, Bliss, 320
Ford, David B., 114
Ford, Edward, 598
Ford, Henry Jones, 83
Forman, Henry Chandlee, 773
Forrest, Aubrey Leland, 329
Forrest, William Mentzel, 861
Forsyth, J., 32
Forsyth, Nathaniel Frederick, 438
Fortenbaugh, Robert, 488-489, 692
Fortescue, Adrian, 473
Fortney, Edward L., 292, 1028
Fortune, Alonzo W., 1100
Fosdick, Harry Emerson, 70, 1065, 1066, 1157
Fosdick, Lucian J., 82, 306-307
Fosselman, Harold, 742
Foster, Edward, 868
Foster, F. H., 231
Foster, Frank Clifton, 1105
Foster, Frank Hugh, 973-974, 989-990, 999, 1029, 1049, 1067
Foster, George Burman, 1070
Foster, Joseph, 52
Foster, Ruel E., 907
Fothergill, Gerald, 44
Fowler, Henry, 46
Fox, Arnold Benjamin, 894
Fox, Columbia, 460
Fox, Dixon Ryan, 56
Fox, Gresham George, 620
Foy, Valentine, 611
Frances, (Sister) Catharine. *See* Catharine Frances, Sister
Francis, John Junkin, 168
Francke, Kuno, 118, 131
Frank, Emma Lucile, 636
Frank, Henry, 1136
Franklin, Benjamin, 1013-1014
Franklin, John Hope, 355-356
Fraser, Alexander Campbell, 984
Frazier, E. Franklin, 381
Frederick, (Sister) Mary. *See* Mary Frederick, Sister
Freehof, Solomon Bennett, 517, 520
Freeman, John Davis, 748
Freeman, Wendell K., 581
Freeman, Z., 1102
Frei, Hans, 1084
Frelinghuysen, Peter H. B., 122
French, Warren G., 899-900
Frere, Walter H., 77
Fretz, Joseph Winfield, 317
Friedel, L. M., 844
Friedenberg, Albert M., 509
Friedman, Lee M., 873-874
Friedman, R., 315
Friedman, Theodore, 512
Friedmann, Robert, 72, 73
Friesenhahn, (Sister) Mary Clarence, 446
Friess, H. L., 1130
Frisbee, Jay Graham, 1125
Fritchman, Stephen Hole, 237
Frodsham, Stanley J., 328
Fromm, Erich, 1156
Frothingham, Octavius Brooks, 232-233, 234, 252, 259-260, 685
Fry, B. St. James, 835
Fry, Charles Luther, 33, 572, 745
Fulghum, Walter Benjamin, Jr., 926
Fullam, Raymond B., 580
Funk, Henry D., 299-300
Furniss, Norman F., 1097-1098

Gabel, Richard James, 674, 676
Gabriel, Ralph Henry, 427, 557-558, 695, 707, 1120
Gaddis, Merrill Elmer, 327, 680
Gairdner, James, 77

Gallaghan, (Sister) Marie Patrice, 444
Gallagher, Buell G., 610, 613
Gallie, W. B., 1126
Galpin, W. Freeman, 637
Gambold, J., 140
Gambrall, Theodore C., 95
Gambrell, Mary Latimer, 1102
Gandhi, V. R., 532
Gardiner, Harold Charles, 857-858, 882
Gardiner, Harry Norman, 136, 985
Gardner, E. Clinton, 1061
Gardner, Eugene Clarence, 783
Garofalo, Salvatore, 1040
Garraghan, Gilbert J., 467
Garrison, Curtis Wiswell, 14
Garrison, Lucy McKim, 841
Garrison, Winfred Ernest, 62, 290, 383, 396, 571, 704, 884
Garvan, Anthony, 767
Gates, Errett, 290
Gates, Helen Dunn, 178
Gatling, Eva Ingersoll, 775
Gauss, Christian Frederick, 439, 662
Gaustad, Edwin Scott, 130, 135
Gavigan, Walter V., 878
Gavin, Frank Stanton Burns, 407, 583
Gebhard, Anna Laura (Munro), 750
Gee, Henry, 76
Geer, Curtis Manning, 992-993, 1107
Gegenheimer, Albert Frank, 204
Geier, Woodrow, 933
Geiger, C. Harve, 448
Geiger, Joseph Roy, 1127
Geiger, Maynard, 462
Geismar, Maxwell David, 882
George, Charles, 603
George, Henry, 733
George, Katherine, 603
Gerhard, Alexis, 986
Gerhard, Frederick, 1136
Gerstner, John H., Jr., 1052
Gerth, Hans H., 602
Gerth, Hedwig I., 602
Gewehr, W. M., 154, 162
Geyer, Denton Loring, 1126
Gibbs, James, 762
Gibbs, Norman Brantley, 194-195
Giddings, Edward J., 41
Giese, Vincent J., 578-579
Gifford, Frank Dean, 622
Gifford, William Alva, 77
Giguere, Robert Joseph, 806
Gilchrist, Agnes Eleanor (Addison), 763, 775, 776
Gilkey, Charles W., 659, 662
Gilkey, James Gordon, 1065, 1066
Gill, Charles Otis, 744
Gillard, John T., 365
Gillespie, James M., 659
Gillies, John, 147
Gillin, John L., 310
Gilman, Arthur, 914
Gilman, Chandler Robbins, 888
Gilmore, G. W., 6, 399
Gilpin, Thomas, 642
Gilroy, William E., 386
Gilson, Étienne, 1039
Ginger, Ray, 1099
Gingerich, Melvin, 317, 641
Ginzberg, Eli, 523
Giovannini, G., 905
Gittelsohn, Roland Bertram, 641
Gladden, James Walter, 640
Gladden, Washington, 631-632, 701, 711, 724, 725, 1064-1065
Glanz, Rudolf, 513
Glasgow, William Melancthon, 301
Glass, Henry Alexander, 823
Glauner, George Lease, 386
Glazer, Nathan, 519
Gleason, George, 579, 582
Glicksberg, Charles I., 934
Gloster, Hugh Morris, 939, 942
Glover, Christopher, 395-396
Glover, Robert Hall, 401
Glover, Willis B., 172
Godbold, Albea, 657
Goddard, Dwight, 527-528
Goddard, Harold Clarke, 252
Godecker, (Sister) M. Salesia, 444
Godwin, George, 177
Goebel, Edmund Joseph, 444-445
Goen, C. C., 984

Gohdes, Clarence Louis Frank, 249, 253, 849, 1093
Goldberg, Isaac, 875
Goldberg, Israel, 519
Goldberg, Martin Lloyd, 517
Golden, Harry Lewis, 510
Golder, Frank A., 496
Goldman, Irving, 1010
Goldschmidt, Walter R., 610
Gooch, George Peabody, 79, 556
Good, James Isaac, 24, 305
Goodall, George, 36
Goodenough, Caroline Louisa (Leonard), 825
Goodloe, Robert W., 297
Goodrich, Samuel Griswold, 178
Goodspeed, Edgar Johnson, 179
Goodspeed, George Stephen, 531
Goodwin, Edward Lewis, 92
Goodwin, R. Dean, 418
Goodwin, William A. R., 55, 93, 1109
Goodyear, W. H., 774
Goodykoontz, Colin B., 421
Gordis, Robert, 512, 515
Gordon, Albert I., 522
Gordon, Arthur, 1158
Gordon, George Angier, 1064, 1132
Gordon, M. L., 527
Gorham, Donald Rex, 438
Gorrie, Peter Douglas, 32
Goss, Charles F., 180
Goudge, Thomas A., 1122
Gould, Frederic A., 429
Gould, Nathaniel Duren, 811
Gould, W. D., 209
Graebner, Theodore Conrad, 388, 709, 1151
Graham, Aelred, 928
Graham, James McMahon, 479
Graham, John E., 1146
Graham, William Franklin (Billy), 1159
Granger, Bruce Ingham, 923
Grant, Brewin, 1143
Grant, Elliott M., 565
Grant, Percy S., 711
Gratacap, Louis Pope, 803
Graves, William Whites, 426
Gray, Henry David, 237, 238, 242, 248, 253-254, 1022-1023
Gray, Joseph M. M., 47
Gray, Lloyd J., 1161
Gray, Stanley, 99
Greek, Betty Louise, 919
Greeley, Andrew M., 485
Green, Ashbel, 157
Green, Beriah, 685-686
Green, Elizabeth Atkinson (Lay), 939-940
Green, Fletcher M., 357
Green, J. Brazier, 138-139
Green, John Richard, 143
Green, Richard, 144
Green, Robert W., 602
Greenberg, Simon, 560
Greene, Amy Blanche, 429
Greene, Evarts Boutell, 18, 88-89, 583
Greene, M. Louise, 114
Greene, Theodore M., 1140
Greer, Thomas H., 693
Gregg, H. C., 450
Gregory, Daniel Seely, 182, 871
Gregory, Horace, 913
Gregory, W. E., 1155
Grider, Rufus A., 818
Griffin, Joseph A., 465
Griffin, Lloyd W., 893
Griffin, Martin Ignatius Joseph, 463, 625
Griffith, Frank Clark, 904
Griffiths, Carl Warren, 726
Griffiths, Olive M., 223-224
Grimm, Harold John, 70
Grinstein, Hyman B., 511
Grissom, Mary Allen, 845
Griswold, Alfred Whitney, 344
Griswold, Clayton T., 581-582
Griswold, Hervey DeWitt, 531
Griswold, Rufus Wilmot, 913-914
Grose, Howard Benjamin, 429
Grossman, Jonathan, 104
Grubb, Kenneth G., 34, 401
Gruber, L. Franklin, 68
Grueningen, John Paul von, 439
Grumbine, Jesse Charles Fremont, 343
Guild, Roy Bergen, 389
Guilday, Peter Keenan, 455, 457, 459, 467

Guinan, J. W., 878
Gummere, Amelia Mott, 319, 321
Gunther, Erna, 428-429
Gup, Samuel Marcus, 522
Gurvitch, George, 547
Gustafson, James M., 1105
Guterman, Norbert, 652
Guthrie, Dwight Raymond, 423
Guthrie, Thomas, 734
Gysan, William Herman, 1017

Hackett, Alice Payne, 898
Hackett, Horatio Balch, 628
Hackman, George G., 550
Häusermann, H. W., 908
Haeussler, Armin, 832
Hageman, Howard G., 801
Hagood, L. M., 362
Hagstrum, Jean H., 945
Haines, Wesley Northridge, 1125
Haldeman-Julius, Emanuel, 1136, 1147
Hale, Edward Everett, 893
Haley, Olga, 579
Halich, Wasyl, 498
Hall, Clarence Wilbur, 274
Hall, Francis Joseph, 1033
Hall, G. Stanley, 1118, 1154
Hall, Jacob Henry, 836
Hall, T. Leslie, 209
Hall, Thomas Cuming, 66, 78, 154, 592
Hallenback, Wilbur Chapman, 740, 741
Hallett, Paul Haberer, 1042
Halliday, Samuel Bryan, 182, 735
Hallock, Frank H., 1032
Hallock, Gerard Benjamin Fleet, 950, 951
Halloway, Vernon Howard, 640
Hallowell, C. H., 78
Halverson, Marvin, 937
Hamilton, Clarence Herbert, 527
Hamilton, John Taylor, 119, 314
Hamilton, Kenneth Gardiner, 625
Hamilton, Raphael N., 464
Hamilton, Robert, 427
Hamlin, Talbot Faulkner, 759, 763, 774-775, 781
Hammar, George, 705, 1087, 1092
Hampton, Vernon Boyce, 619
Hampton, William Judson, 618-619
Handlin, Oscar, 7, 453, 471, 521, 563
Handy, Robert T., 10, 11, 418, 699, 714, 1098
Haney, John Louis, 834
Hanna, Charles A., 82-83
Hansen, Marcus Lee, 80, 452-453
Hansen, Wendell Jay, 670
Hanzsche, William Thomas, 124, 300
Harbaugh, Henry, 1008
Harbaugh, Linn, 1008
Harbeson, Georgiana Brown, 794
Harbison, Elmore Harris, 70
Harder, Robert, 576
Harding, F. A. J., 142
Hardon, John A., 273, 309
Hardy, Edward Rochie, Jr., 280, 502, 1032
Hardy, Edwin Noah, 147, 658
Hardy, William J., 76
Hare, Lloyd Custer Mayhew, 426
Hargreaves, J. Robert, 391
Harkey, Simeon Walcher, 171-172
Harkness, Georgia Elma, 430, 964, 1144
Harkness, R. E. E., 113
Harland, Gordon, 1090
Harlow, Ralph Volney, 685
Harlow, Victor Emmanuel, 1074
Harmon, Nolan B., 295
Harner, Nevin Cowger, 668
Haroutunian, Joseph G., 231, 974, 986, 989
Harrington, Edward T., 458
Harrington, John Beattie, 1124
Harris, Samuel, 697, 1075, 1112
Harris, Sara, 376
Harris, William T., 250
Harrison, Frederic, 1138-1139
Harrison, W. P., 355
Hart, Albert Bushnell, 56
Hart, Hornell Norris, 1147

Hart, James D., 898-899
Hart, William John, 828
Harte, Thomas J., 374, 470, 742
Hartman, Edward R., 713
Hartmann, Willam C., 341
Hartshorne, Charles, 1072, 1133
Hartshorne, Hugh, 438
Hartt, Julian N., 907, 1128, 1134
Hartzell, Joseph C., 362
Hartzler, John Ellsworth, 451
Haskin, Frederic Jennings, 760
Hastings, Hugh, 121
Hastings, James, 5, 28
Hastings, Thomas, 812
Hatfield, James Taft, 834
Hathcoat, Horace Carlton, 439
Hauge, Osborne, 388
Hauser, Conrad Augustine, 437
Haussmann, William August, 829
Hawkins, John R., 359
Hawkins, Maude Miller, 885
Hawkins, Richmond Laurin, 1137
Hawks, Francis Lister, 98, 149
Hawley, Hattie L., 864
Hawthorne, Nathaniel, 858
Hay, Clyde Lemont, 437
Hayes, Carlton J. H., 554-555
Hayes, John Russell, 773
Hayes, Roland, 843
Hayes, S. P., 130
Haygood, Atticus G., 357
Haynes, Emery J., 892-893
Haynes, George E., 351
Haynes, Leonard L., 364
Hayward, John, 31
Haywood, Charles, 840
Hazard, Paul, 185
Headley, Joel Tyler, 622
Headley, Phineas Camp, 178
Heard, Gerald, 1012
Heathcote, Charles William, 627
Heaton, Katherine May, 865
Hecker, Isaac Thomas, 481
Hedge, Frederic Henry, 243, 1026, 1112
Hedin, Naboth, 110, 491
Hedley, George Percy, 59, 663, 802
Hefelbower, Samuel Ging, 189
Heffernan, Arthur James, 444
Hefley, John Theodore, 952
Heinemann, F. H., 1078
Heininger, Harold Richel, 1061
Helen Margaret, Sister, 877
Helming, O. C., 176
Hempstead, Joshua, 152
Henderlite, Rachael, 435-436, 1160
Henderson, G. D., 76
Henderson, Phillips, 577
Henderson, Samuel, 849
Hendricks, Robert J., 324, 711
Hendrix, E. R., 141
Henke, Frederick Goodrich, 798
Henline, Ruth, 562
Henry, Carl Ferdinand Howard, 961, 1050, 1100
Henry, Stuart Clark, 147-148
Henshaw, R. Townsend, 97
Henze, Anton, 793
Herberg, Will, 555, 1166
Herbert, Edward, 188
Heringman, Bernard, 930
Herrick, Everett C., 573
Herrick, Robert, 893
Herring, Hollis W., 399
Herringshaw, Thomas William, 46
Herschberger, Guy Franklin, 641
Hertzel, Leo J., 909
Hesburgh, Theodore Martin, 722
Hess, Albert G., 818
Hester, Hubert Inman, 450
Heusinger, Edward W., 461
Heuver, Gerald D., 708
Hewitt, Arthur Wentworth, 750
Hewitt, Edgar Lee, 766
Hewitt, Theodore B., 829-830
Heyer, William Carl, 617
Hibben, Paxton, 1056
Hick, John, 1123
Hickey, Edward John, 409-410, 464
Hickok, Laurens P., 1113, 1115
Hickok, S. P., 683
Hicks, John D., 57

Higginson, J. Vincent, 822
Higginson, Thomas Wentworth, 524, 840-841
High, Stanley, 181, 649
Higham, John, 475, 476
Hildrup, Jesse Stephen, 765
Hill, Frank Pierce, 932
Hill, Marvin S., 330
Hill, William, 300
Hillman, Arthur, 738
Hills, George Morgan, 48
Hiltner, Seward, 1105
Hinds, Allen Banks, 78
Hinds, William Alfred, 324
Hine, Robert V., 324-325, 530
Hinke, William John, 304
Hinman, George W., 428
Hinman, Royal R., 128
Hinshaw, David, 320
Hinson, Arthur, 287
Hinty, H. W., 870
Hintz, Howard William, 661
Hirsch, Arthur Henry, 307
Hirsch, Emil G., 520
Hirschowitz, Abraham Eber, 630-631
Hirshler, Eric E., 513
Hirst, Margaret E., 642
Hitchcock, Henry-Russell, 758
Hitti, K., 500
Hitti, Philip K., 539
Hittell, John Shertzer, 1134
Hix, Clarence E., Jr., 1096
Hoagland, Hudson, 1046
Hobart, John Henry, 1033
Hobey, J., 58
Hobson, Laura Keane, 901
Hock, Cassie Hyde, 872
Hockett, Homer Carey, 7
Hockey, Dorothy C., 898
Hocking, William Ernest, 1119
Hodge, Archibald Alexander, 1002, 1003
Hodge, Charles, 300, 1001, 1002, 1003, 1051
Hodgson, Leonard, 394, 1081
Hoelty-Nickel, Theodore, 820
Hoes, Roswell Randall, 630
Hoffman, Frederick J., 106
Hoffman, James W., 417
Hoffman, M. M., 465
Hoffman, T. J., 908
Hofmann, Hans, 1090
Hofstadter, Richard, 1049
Hogan, Peter E., 482
Hogarth, Charles Pinckney, 450
Hogg, William Richey, 393, 408
Holbrook, Clyde Amos, 984
Holbrook, Z. Swift, 726
Holden, Vincent F., 481, 589-590
Holisher, Desider, 274, 761, 791
Holley, Horace, 539
Hollis, Sophie, 905
Holloway, Mark, 324
Holly, Henry Hudson, 783
Holm, Bernard J., 67-68
Holmes, Arthur, 1137
Holmes, Dorothy P., 16
Holmes, Ernest Shurtleff, 343
Holmes, John Haynes, 236, 390, 632, 1020, 1131
Holmes, Oliver Wendell, 890
Holmes, Stewart H., 525
Holroyd, Stuart, 917
Holst, John H., 429
Holt, Arthur E., 649
Holt, Luther Myrick, 789
Holtz, Adrian Augustus, 665
Holyoake, George Jacob, 1143
Holzhauer, Jean, 878
Home, Henry, Lord Kames, 1011
Hong, Howard, 1144
Hood, Edwin Paxton, 143
Hood, George, 823
Hood, J. C. F., 73
Hood, J. W., 359
Hoogstra, Jacob Tunis, 965
Hook, Sidney, 1126
Hooker, Elizabeth Robbins, 389, 433, 745
Hooker, Richard James, 277, 584
Hooker, Thomas, 127, 970
Hope, Norman Victor, 395
Hopkins, Charles Howard, 351, 577, 694, 698, 699-700, 710, 711, 714, 723
Hopkins, John Henry, 777
Hopkins, John Henry, Jr., 777

Hopkins, Samuel, 136, 993
Hopper, Myron Taggart, 579
Hopper, Stanley Romaine, 852
Horder, William Garrett, 834, 915
Hordern, William, 961
Horn, Henry E., 820
Hornaday, Clifford, 829
Hornberger, Theodore R., 203, 979, 1031, 1044-1045
Horne, Dórothy, 838
Horsch, John, 73, 314, 641
Horstmann, Julius Herman Edward, 305
Horton, Walter Marshall, 284, 394, 645, 1046, 1068, 1075, 1077, 1087, 1092, 1128, 1160
Hoshor, John, 376
Hoskins, John Preston, 118, 121, 123, 124, 140, 145, 154
Hosmer, William, 690
Hosny, Hasan, 538-539
Hostetler, Lester, 832
Hotson, Clarence Paul, 925
Hotten, John Camden, 43
Hough, Lynn Harold, 1132-1133, 1134
Houston, G. David, 688
Houston, William, 659
Houtart, Francois, 470, 485
Howard, John Tasker, 811
Howard, Leon, 195
Howe, Daniel Wait, 100
Howe, Irving, 907
Howe, Mark De Wolfe, 585
Howe, Paul Sturtevant, 284
Howells, Rulon Stanley, 29
Howells, William Dean, 894
Howison, G. Holmes, 1120
Howlett, Duncan, 262, 1020
Hoyles, J. Arthur, 580
Hoyt, Arthur Stephen, 801, 946, 1103
Hoyt, John Williams, Jr., 389
Hromádka, Josef Lukl, 961, 962
Hubbard, Genevieve C., 565
Hubbell, Jay B., 848, 849, 858
Huber, Milton John, Jr., 716
Huber, Raphael M., 68
Hudson, Robert Lofton, 944-945
Hudson, Winthrop Still, 167, 556, 586-587, 602, 741, 1067
Hügel, Friedrich, Freiherr von, 1109
Huggard, William A., 924-925
Hughes, Agnes Lockhart, 529
Hughes, Emmet John, 1065
Hughes, Philip, 722
Hughley, J. Neal, 700
Huizinga, Arnold vanC., 1127-1128
Hulbert, Archer Butler, 423-424
Hulbert, Dorothy Printup, 423-424
Hulbert, Henry Woodward, 576
Hulen, Amos B., 598
Hull, William J., 678
Hulme, Edward Maslin, 68
Hume, Paul, 821
Humensky, John Joseph, 581
Humphrey, Edward Frank, 615
Humphrey, Griffith Henry, 1150
Humphrey, Heman, 176
Humphreys, David, 90
Humphreys, Mary Gay, 425
Hunsberger, Willard D., 641
Hunt, Joel Ranson Ellis, 421
Hunt, John, 240
Hunt, R. N. Carew, 964
Hunt, Theodore Whitefield, 915
Hunter, A. Mitchell, 965
Hunter, Allan Armstrong, 432
Hunter, Edwin, 745
Hunter, Irene Louise, 915
Hunter, Margaret Adair, 448
Hunter, Robert, 191
Hunter, Stanley Armstrong, 810
Huntington, Frederic Dan, 232, 696
Huntington, Joseph, 1028
Huntington, William Reed, 630
Hurley, Leonard Burwell, 883
Hurst, Fannie, 878
Hurst, John Fletcher, 6, 24, 58, 145, 293, 958, 1137
Hurston, Zora Neale, 939, 943
Husslein, Joseph, 721, 733, 734
Hutcheson, Francis, 978
Hutchinson, John, 384

Hutchinson, Paul, 1165
Hutchinson, Woods, 1052
Hutchison, William R., 252
Hutten, Kurt, 311
Hutton, J. E., 314
Hylan, John Perham, 795-796
Hyma, Albert, 303-304

Inch, Morris Alton, 670
Ingalls, Harold B., 660
Ingersoll, Anna Josephine, 533
Ingersoll, Jared, 148
Ingersoll, Robert G., 260
Ingraham, Joseph Holt, 896, 900
Ingram, George H., 125
Inkersley, Arthur, 497
Inman, Elinor, 581
Ireland, John, 482
Irvine, Ingram N. W., 502
Isely, Bliss, 619
Isserman, Ferdinand Myron, 517-518
Ives, Hilda Libby, 743-744
Ives, J. Moss, 592

Jackson, Elizabeth, 867
Jackson, George Pullen, 818, 838-839
Jackson, Henry Ezekiel, 391
Jackson, Joseph Francis Ambrose, 767-768
Jackson, Joseph Julius, 361
Jackson, Luther P., 356
Jackson, Samuel Macauley, 6, 9, 46, 58, 75, 399
Jackson, Sheldon, 423
Jacob, Caroline N., 319
Jacob, Heinrich Eduard, 875
Jacobs, Charles Michael, 69
Jacobs, Henry Eyster, 139
Jacobs, Leo, 270
Jacobus, Donald Lines, 43
Jaeger, Werner Wilhelm, 1134
Jagadiswaranda, Swami, 533-534
Jahsmann, Allan Hart, 447
James, David Gwilym, 192
James, Henry, 711, 890
James, Henry, Sr., 1024
James, Walter Thomas, 1113
James, William, 176, 1123-1124, 1152
Jameson, John Franklin, 25, 29, 46
Jamieson, William F., 648
Janowsky, Oscar Isaiah, 519
Janson, Florence Edith, 491
Janssen, Johannes, 69
Jantz, Harold S., 921
Jarrett-Kerr, Martin, 853
Jefferson, Charles Edward, 630
Jefferson, Thomas, 207-208, 210, 1015
Jeffrey, Lloyd N., 862
Jenifer, John T., 358
Jenkins, Daniel Thomas, 284, 397
Jenkins, William Sumner, 686-687
Jenness, Mary, 367
Jennings, Henry C., 297
Jennings, Walter Wilson, 290
Jensen, Howard Eikenberry, 702, 952
Jensen, Therald N., 331-332, 588
Jent, John William, 745
Jernegan, Marcus W., 353
Jessett, Thomas E., 97-98
Jessop, T. E., 202
Joan of Arc, Sister, 815
Johanson, E. Jerome, 1046
Johnson, Allen, 40
Johnson, Alvin Walter, 584-585, 672
Johnson, Amandus, 110
Johnson, Charles A., 161-162
Johnson, Charles D., 450
Johnson, Charles S., 381
Johnson, David K., 1093
Johnson, Edgar A. J., 103
Johnson, Frederick Ernest, 66, 645, 669, 672-673, 704, 705, 791, 1085
Johnson, Guy Benton, 842
Johnson, James W., 1099
Johnson, James Wager, 153
Johnson, James Weldon, 845-846, 941
Johnson, Marjorie, 52
Johnson, Mary Parker, 309
Johnson, Richard M., 648
Johnson, Samuel, 203-204
Johnson, Thomas, 981

Johnson, Thomas Cary, 115, 301, 344
Johnson, Thomas Herbert, 102, 132, 133, 134-135, 865, 866, 927, 980, 985
Johnson, William Hallock, 236, 1112, 1133
Johnston, George Alexander, 995
Johnston, Howard Agnew, 1151
Johnston, Ruby Funchess, 380
Jolly, Ellen Ryan, 469
Jones, Adam Leroy, 203
Jones, Bayard Hale, 281, 803
Jones, Charles Colcock, 354-355
Jones, E. Alfred, 793
Jones, Edgar DeWitt, 944
Jones, Eli Stanley, 64
Jones, Gerald Harvey, 975, 1064
Jones, Harold G., 792
Jones, Howard Mumford, 241, 848, 868, 869
Jones, Ilion Tingnal, 801
Jones, John G., 163
Jones, John William, 167, 628-629
Jones, Joseph Huntington, 158
Jones, Kenneth, 338
Jones, Marc E., 1118
Jones, Raymond J., 335, 375
Jones, Rufus Matthew, 319, 320, 642, 1069
Jones, T. H., 930
Jones, Thomas Jesse, 1103
Jones, William, 1011
Jones, William H., 444
Jordan, Philip D., 949
Jordan, W. K., 591
Jorgenson, C. E., 1014
Journet, Charles, 1041-1042
Jorns, Auguste, 321
Joseph, Oscar Loos, 859
Joseph, Samuel, 513
Josephson, Matthew, 707-708
Joy, James Richard, 1109
Judah, Stillson, 525
Judd, Bertha Grimmell, 419
Judson, Edward, 737
Judy, Martin T., 748
Jung, Leo, 514

Kahn, Robert I., 516-517
Kaiser, Laurina, 444
Kalassay, Louis A., 307-308
Kallen, Horace Meyer, 520-521, 1125, 1145
Kaloustian, Shnork Vartabad, 500
Kamphoefner, Henry L., 785
Kane, Hope F., 562
Kane, John Joseph, 477, 484-485
Kant, Immanuel, 244
Kaplan, Mordecai Menahem, 518, 519
Karpf, Maurice Joseph, 512
Karpovich, Michael, 501
Karraker, William Archibald, 629
Kashevarov, A. P., 497
Katonen, Taito Almar, 395
Keable, Robert, 897
Kearns, Francis E., 716
Keen, Quentin Begley, 96
Keen, William Williams, 406
Kegley, Charles W., 550, 1091
Keinath, Herman Ottomar Alfred, 487
Keiser, Albert, 428
Keiter, Charles R., 487
Keller, Adolf, 570, 571, 1083
Keller, Arnold F., Jr., 886
Keller, Charles Roy, 156, 678
Keller, Edward A., 606
Keller, James Gregory, 437
Kelley, Alden Drew, 1070
Kelley, Francis Clement, 410, 411
Kelley, John F., 770
Kelly, Caleb Guyer, 75
Kelly, G. A., 471
Kelly, Mary Gilbert, 469
Kelly, Robert Lincoln, 1103-1104
Kelsey, George Dennis, 606
Kelsey, Rayner Wickersham, 427
Kennedy, Gail, 707, 1053, 1127
Kennedy, Gerald, 946
Kennedy, William H. J., 463
Kenney, Virginia Arville, 445
Kent, Ralph McVety, 812
Kerlin, Robert T., 940
Kernodle, George B., 932
Kerr, Hugh Thomson, 309, 918, 965
Kerr, Phillip Stanley, 837
Kershner, Frederick D., 1086

Ketcham, William Ezra, 950
Kettleborough, Charles, 597
Kherbawi, Basil M., 505-506
Kieffer, George Linn, 71
Kieran, John, 28
Kilian, Thomas Randolph, 739
Killeen, (Sister) Mary Vincent, 1134
Kilmer, Joyce, 916
Kimball, John Calvin, 1052
Kimball, Sidney Fiske, 759-760
Kimber, Thomas, 871
Kincheloe, Samuel Clarence, 328, 572, 740, 741
King, Irving, 1156
King, William Peter, 702, 1133
King, William Robert, 416-417
Kingman, Ralph Clarke, 761
Kingsley, Charles, 709
Kingsley, Florence, 896
Kingsley, James Luce, 128
Kinsey, James E., 582
Kinsman, Frederick Joseph, 482-483
Kinzer, Donald Louis, 476
Kirby, Ethyn (Williams), 90
Kirk, Edward Norris, 170
Kirk, Jane, 575
Kirkham, E. Kay, 18
Kirkpatrick, Clifford, 549
Kirtley, James Addison, 727
Kiryluk, Nicholas T., 505
Kisch, Guido, 513
Kissman, Joseph, 513
Kistler, Charles E., 618
Kite, St. Alban, 463
Klaiss, Donald S., 1058
Klann, Norman H., 338
Klapp, Orrin Edgar, 798
Klein, Harry Martin John, 305
Klett, Guy S., 299
Klingberg, Frank Joseph, 89, 90, 97, 353-354, 426, 586, 718
Kloetzli, Walter, 738
Knapp, Forrest L., 646
Knapp, Jacob, 178
Knapp, M. W., 179
Knappen, M. M., 79
Knauff, Christopher W., 819
Knight, Frank H., 601
Knight, William Allen, 897
Knittle, Walter Allen, 312
Knole, George Harmon, 209
Knorr, N. H., 338
Knox, Israel, 516
Knox, John, 634, 639-640
Knox, William, 353
Knuth, Helen, 477
Kober, Adolf, 513
Koch, Adrienne, 208, 1015
Koch, G. Adolf, 197, 199
Koehne, John B., 1146
Koenker, Ernest Benjamin, 806
Kohlbrenner, Bernard J., 443
Kohnova, Marie J., 314
Kolb, John Harrison, 746
Kolb, William L., 547
Koller, Katherine, 885-886
Kollomergen, Walter M., 317
Konvitz, Milton R., 676
Koppman, Lionel, 512
Korn, Bertram Wallace, 512, 627
Korper, Ruth, 503
Kraeling, Emil G., 1057
Kraft, Celia, 337
Kramer, Alfred S., 612
Kramer, Ellen W., 782
Kramer, George W., 784
Kramer, Leonard John, 624
Krasinski, Valérian, 76
Kraus, Michael, 26, 56, 194
Krauth, Charles Porterfield, 1006, 1037
Krebs, Ervin E., 363
Krehbiel, Henry Edward, 812, 842
Kreider, Harry Julius, 116, 490
Kremer, A. R., 174-175
Kretzmann, Paul E., 388
Krikorian, Yervant Hovhannes, 1139
Krishnamachari, V., 247
Kromminga, Diedrich Hinrich, 303
Kromminga, John Henry, 304
Krout, John A., 650
Kruener, Harry H., 634
Krummel, Carl F., 481
Kubler, George, 756, 766
Kuhns, Frederick Irving, 421-422

Kuhns, Oscar, 312-313
Kull, Irving Stoddard, 691
Kuntz, Paul Grimley, 1130
Kuyper, Abraham, 608, 1135
Kyles, L. W., 377
Kynett, Alpha Jefferson, 597

Lacey, T. J., 504
Lacy, Benjamin Rice, Jr., 182
Ladd, George T., 683
Ladd, William, 638
Ladu, Arthur J., 237-238
Laetsch, Theodore Ferdinand Karl, 1036
La Farge, John, 467, 611, 1144
Lakeberg, Arvid P., 296
Lambert, Richard D., 64
Lamech, 818
LaMotte, Louis C., 1108
Lamprecht, S. P., 1139
Landis, Benson Young, 433, 555, 572, 706, 743, 747
Lane, Alfred C., 1046
Lane, Isaac, 367
Lane, Ortha May, 404
Lane, Raymond A., 413-414
Lanier, John J., 926
Lankard, Frank Glenn, 441
Lanning, John Tate, 462, 766
Larned, Josephus N., 7
Larrabee, H. A., 1139
Larson, Ernest S., 318
Larson, Elizabeth A., 849
Larson, Roger Marshall, 604-605
Lash, John S., 938
Laski, Harold J., 567
Lathan, Robert, 301-302
Lathrop, Elsie L., 770
Latourette, Kenneth Scott, 10, 59, 65, 67, 71, 72, 74, 76, 394, 397, 400, 404, 405, 409, 526, 962, 1021, 1057, 1163
Latta, Maurice C., 695
Lattey, C., 589
Laubach, Frank Charles, 409
Laubenstein, Paul F., 713
Laurence, Una Roberts, 431
Laurie, Thomas, 406
Lavengood, Lawrence, 153
Law, William, 139, 201
Lawrence, Edward A., 178
Lawson, Evald B., 296
Lawson, Hilda Josephine, 941
Lay, Henry C., 173
Lazell, J. Arthur, 423
Leach, Robert J., 642
Leach, William Herman, 736, 788
Leary, Lewis Gaston, 848, 849, 902
Leary, Mary Ancilla, 444
Leask, George Alfred, 827
Leavitt, Percy Metcalf, 771
Lebeson, Anita Libman, 508, 511
Ledbetter, Robert Edgar, 424-425
Lee, Alfred McClung, 649, 651
Lee, Chauncey, 157
Lee, Grace Chin, 1122
Lee, John D., 934
Lee, Rose Hum, 432
Lee, Sidney, 39
Lee, Ulysses, 939
Lee, Umphrey, 141, 142, 639
Leete, Frederick DeLand, 737
Le Fever, Ernest Warren, 647
Leffingwell, C. W., 915
Leftwich, Lacey Lee, 546, 659, 660
Leidecker, Kurt F., 524
Leiffer, Murray Howard, 661, 735, 738, 739
Leighton, Isabel, 653
Leighton, Walter Leatherbee, 245
Leisy, Ernest Erwin, 848, 849, 895, 902, 908
Leland, John, 193, 200-201
Lenhart, John Mary, 625
Lentz, Harold Herbert, 717
Leo XIII, Pope, 721, 733
Leonard, Robert Josselyn, 448
Lerner, Max, 561
Lerrigo, Peter Hugh James, 407
Leslie, Charles, 200
Leslie, Charles Whitney, 1124
Letts, Harold C., 715
Leuba, James Henry, 1020, 1131, 1154
Levenson, J. C., 251
Lever, Oscar William, 699
Levinger, Lee Joseph, 510
Levy, Babette May, 103
Levy, Beryl Harold, 516
Levy, Leonard W., 593

Levy, Marion J., Jr., 676
Lewis, Edwin, 1087
Lewis, Frank Bell, 1096
Lewis, George, 566
Lewis, Joseph, 261-262, 1150
Lewis, Leicester C., 1032
Lewis, R. W. B., 907
Lewis, Sinclair, 883
Lewis, Tayler, 1115, 1141
Lewis, Thomas Hamilton, 294
Lewisohn, Ludwig, 520
Lichtenberger, Frédéric Auguste, 962
Liebman, Joshua L., 1157
Ligutti, Luigi, 466
Lillard, Richard G., 880
Limbert, Paul Moyer, 658
Limouze, Arthur Henry, 417
Lindquist, Gustavus Elmer Emanuel, 428-429
Lindquist, Maude Lucille, 388
Lindsay, Alexander Dunlap, 550
Lindsay, Thomas Martin, 69
Lindsay, Vachel, 918
Lindstrom, David Edgar, 748
Lindstrom, Harold, 679
Linfield, Harry Sebee, 35, 512
Link, Henry C., 1157
Linn, William A., 330-331
Lintner, G. A., 171
Lippman, Walter, 755-756
Lipset, Seymour M., 607
Liptzin, Solomon, 521
Lisca, Peter, 908
Lissner, Will, 928
Littell, Franklin Hamlin, 314-315
Little, Bryan D. G., 762
Little, Lewis Peyton, 115
Livingood, Frederick George, 449
Livingstone, William Daniel, 1003
Lloyd, Alfred H., 1118
Lloyd, Frederic E. J., 813
Lloyd, Henry Demarest, 726-727
Loane, Marcus L., 77
Lockard, E. Kidd, 656
Locke, John, 189, 237, 978
Lockwood, Frank C., 460-461
Loescher, Frank S., 373-374
Loetscher, Lefferts Augustine, 11, 168, 298-299, 302, 1003-1004, 1101
Loewenberg, Bert James, 1048, 1051
Löwith, Karl, 1077
Lonergan, William I., 1151
Long, Edward LeRoy, 637
Long, Edward LeRoy, Jr., 1045
Long, Jacob Avery, 433, 578
Long, (Sister) Judith, 445
Long, Mason, 859
Loomer, Bernard M., 1072
Loomis, H., Jr., 166
Loper, Joseph Norris, 700-701
Lord, Daniel Aloysius, 469
Lord, J. C., 682
Lord, Percy Eustace, 75
Lord, Robert H., 458
Lotz, Philip Henry, 438
Loud, Grover C., 160, 167, 183
Loudin, J. F., 841
Love, James Franklin, 617
Love, William DeLoss, 426
Lovelace, Austin C., 810, 835
Loveland, Clara O., 278
Loveless, Wendell Phillips, 581
Lovi, Henrietta, 341
Lowden, Joseph D., 168
Lowder, Virgil, 598
Lowe, Samuel Franklin, 581
Lowe, Victor, 1073
Lowens, Irving, 812, 813, 837
Lowenthal, Leo, 652
Lowrie, Walter, 1083
Lowry, Charles Wesley, Jr., 144-145, 280
Lubac, Henri de, 1041
Lucas, George Joseph, 1149
Lucas, Henry S., 68, 303
Lucas, Sidney, 319
Luccock, Halford Edward, 293, 408, 852, 857
Ludwigson, C. Raymond, 326
Lund, Doniver A., 638-639
Lund, Gene Jessie, 491
Lunger, Harold Lehman, 550, 588

Lunger, Irvin Eugene, 605, 1141
Lunn, Arnold, 346
Lunt, Paul S., 609
Lutz, Charles, 488
Lydekker, John Wolfe, 89
Lynd, Helen Merrill, 573
Lynd, Robert S., 549, 573
Lynn, Rita LeBille, 636
Lyon, William H., 311
Lyons, Adelaide Avery, 687
Lyttle, Charles H., 229

McAfee, Cleland B., 728-729
McAfee, George Fletcher, 427-428
McAll, Reginald Ley, 830
McAllister, Lester G., 289
McAlpin, William Barr, 587
McAvoy, Thomas Timothy, 465, 482
McCaffrey, Brother Augustine, 579
McCaleb, Walter Flavius, 765
McCann, (Sister) Mary Agnes, 468, 469
McCarter, Neely D., 439
McCarthy, John William, 1139
McCarthy, Thomas Patrick, 467-468
McCarty, Fern, 603
McClendon, Gene, 1144
McClennen, Joshua, 906
McClinton, Katharine (Morrison), 786
McClure, Archibald, 453
McClure, Edmund, 89
McCluskey, Neil Gerard, 664
McCollum, Vashti (Cromwell), 674
McConnell, Francis John, 1117, 1133
McCorkle, Donald M., 809, 817, 818-819
McCosh, James, 995, 1012, 1051, 1148
McCown, Chester C., 694, 1079
McCoy, Charles S., 439
McCoy, Isaac, 427
McCrossan, (Sister) Joseph Marie, 937
McCrum, Blanche, 11-12
McCulloch, Samuel Clyde, 89, 90, 146
McCutchan, Robert Guy, 813, 827-828, 831-832
McDonald, Lloyd Paul, 1042-1043
McDowell, John, 728-729
McElhinney, Robert Stewart, 669
McEniry, Blanche Marie, 626
McEwen, Robert Ward, 326
McGarry, William J., 962
McGee, Theron Charlton, 440
McGeehon, Carl Wilson, 1018-1019
McGiffert, Arthur Cushman, 24, 186, 262, 960, 1065, 1067-1068
McGiffert, Arthur Cushman, Jr., 136, 684-685, 697, 754
McGill, Anna Blanche, 814
McGowman, Raymond Augustine, 721
McGranahan, Ralph W., 420
McGucken, William Joseph, 443
McGuire, Constantine E., 458
McIlhenny, Edward Avery, 845
McIlvaine, Charles P., 171
McIntire, Carl Curtis, 384, 397
McIntyre, Clarence C., 1066
McKay, Paul Leonard, 1120-1121
McKee, David Rice, 187
McKee, Elmore McNeill, 951
McKee, Irving, 896-897
McKee, William Wakefield, 970
McKenzie, John G., 1155
McKim, J. Miller, 840
McKinney, Richard I., 370
McLachlan, Herbert John, 189, 222, 223, 224, 225
McLanahan, Samuel, 429
McLarney, James John, 1117
McLaughlin, Andrew C., 557
McLaughlin, Henry Woods, 749
McLean, Archibald, 403
McLean, Robert, 431
McLeister, Ira Ford, 295
McLeister, William, 1058
McLoughlin, William Gerald, 181
McLoughlin, William G., Jr., 183

McMahon, Francis E., 589
McMillan, Homer, 420
McMullen, Horace M., 937
McNamara, Robert F., 1043
McNamara, William, 465
McNaugher, John, 1106
McNaughton, Ruth F., 927
McNeill, John T., 66, 74, 393, 645, 964, 965, 1046
McNemar, Richard, 161
McNiff, William J., 332
McPherson, George Wilson, 1098-1099
McQuade, Vincent Augustine, 733
McSorley, Joseph, 481, 676
McVickar, John, 280

Maass, John, 781-782
MacArthur, Kathleen Walker, 143-144
MacArthur, Kenneth C., 744
Macartney, Clarence Edward Noble, 943-944
MacDonald, Allan H., 905
MacDonald, George E. H., 1136
Macdonald, Loren Benjamin, 1127
Macdougall, Hamilton Crawford, 823
MacFarland, Charles Stedman, 59, 384-385, 632, 1160
MacFarlane, Kenneth B., 78
MacGowan, Robert, 1150
MacGregor, Geddes, 754
Machen, J. Gresham, 1100-1101
Macintosh, Douglas Clyde, 1075, 1089
Mackintosh, Hugh Ross, 961
MacIntyre, Alasdair, 1047, 1139
MacIver, R. M., 549
Mackay, John, 1082
Mackay, John Alexander, 1160
Mackinnon, James, 68, 71-72, 74, 964
Mackley, Mary Elizabeth, 661
MacLean, J. P., 833
Macmillan, A. H., 338
MacNaughton, Douglas, 664-665
MacQueary, Howard, 1052
Macy, Paul Griswold, 391-392, 397
Madden, William Joseph, 1149
Madison, James, 210, 1015
Maes, Camillus P., 464
Magoun, George F., 422
Magruder, Edith Clysdale, 450
Maguire, William P. A., 446
Mahan, Asa, 682
Maher, (Sister) Mary Gratia, 446
Malcolm, M. Vartan, 500
Malcom, Howard, 5
Malone, Dumas, 40, 1094
Mampoteng, Charles, 18, 624
Mandeville, Bernard, 190
Manifold, Orrin Avery, 679
Manion, Clarence, 560
Mann, Horace, 664
Mannix, Edward J., 485
Manross, William Wilson, 88, 276, 277, 278, 718-719
Manschreck, Clyde L., 611
Manuel, Frank Edward, 185
Manwell, Reginald Dickinson, 309-310
Marcelline, Sister, 415
Marcus, Jacob Rader, 511, 515
Marden, Orison Swett, 1157
Margano, Antonio, 430
Margaret, Sister Helen. *See* Helen Margaret, Sister
Margolis, Max Leopold, 517
Maria Alma, Sister, 469
Maritain, Jacques, 483, 962, 1041
Markham, Edwin, 918
Marks, Harvey Blair, 826
Marlatt, Earl, 853
Marlowe, George Francis, 770
Marsh, J. B. T., 841
Marsh, James, 1024
Marsh, W. H. H., 174
Marshall, Charles C., 478-479
Marshall, John Sedberry, 1034
Marshall, Thomas F., 849
Martin, Clarence E., 597-598
Martin, David, 456
Martin, Helen R., 871
Martin, James Alfred, 1110
Martin, James Luther, 1091

Martin, (Sister) M. Aquinata, 465
Martin, Portia, 915-916
Martin, Renwick Harper, 438
Martin, Walter R., 336, 338
Martin, William Wallace, 784
Martindale, Cyril C., 1041
Martineau, James, 1138
Marty, Martin E., 262, 1166
Martyn, Carlos, 75
Marvin, A. P., 182
Marx, Paul B., 805
Mary Frederick, Sister, 1052-1053
Mascall, E. L., 1123
Mason, George Carrington, 773-774
Mason, Henry Lowell, 829
Mason, J. M., 382
Masselink, William, 1101
Masserman, Paul, 512-513
Masters, Nick Arthur, 653
Masters, Victor I., 419
Maston, Thomas Bufford, 613
Mastricht, Pietro van, 978
Mather, Cotton, 131, 1010, 1013
Mather, Samuel, 132
Matheson, James, 60, 566
Mathews, Basil, 398
Mathews, Shailer, 5, 44, 181, 659, 1065, 1071
Mathison, Richard R., 309
Matlack, Lucius C., 690
Matsumoto, Toru, 432
Mattes, John Casper, 336
Matteucci, Benvenuto, 929
Matthiessen, F. O., 864
Mattingly, Mary Ramona, 464
Mauelshagen, Carl, 490
Maurer, Charles Lewis, 447
Maurer, Henrich H., 553-554
Maurer, (Sister) Hermana, 816
Maurice, Frederick Denison, 709-710
Maxson, Charles Hartshorn, 154
May, Henry Farnham, 694, 891
May, Joseph, 630
May, Mark A., 1104
May, Rollo, 1158
May, William Egli, 740-741
Mayer, Frederick Emanuel, 34, 71, 309, 345, 397, 487, 958, 964, 1039, 1065, 1084, 1154
Mayer, Herbert Carleton, 578
Mayhew, Jonathan, 623
Maynard, Theodore, 457, 458-459, 480-481, 484, 916
Mays, Benjamin E., 350, 940
Mead, Edwin Doak, 637
Mead, Frank Spencer, 34, 272, 417
Mead, George Herbert, 1122
Mead, Sidney E., 23, 27, 116, 210, 228, 272, 591, 996, 1165
Meadowcroft, Ralph S., 1147
Mears, John William, 725
Mecklin, John Moffatt, 323
Meehan, Thomas F., 365
Meland, Bernard Eugene, 552, 798, 919, 1072, 1082, 1084, 1110
Melcher, Marguerite Fellows, 325
Mellick, Andrew D., 82
Mellone, Sydney Herbert, 235
Melville, Annabelle M., 460, 468
Melville, Herman, 904, 1023
Menard, Edith, 875
Mencken, Henry L., 106, 1146
Mercier, Louis Joseph Alexandre, 1133
Merkens, Albert G., 447
Merle d'Aubigné, J. H., 76
Meredith, Thomas, 687
Mereness, Newton Dennison, 563
Merriam, Thornton W., 601, 662
Merrifield, Fred, 914
Merrill, George Ernest, 787
Merrill, Walter McIntosh, 192
Merrill, William Pierson, 1148
Mersand, Joseph, 872-873, 934
Mersch, Emile, 1041
Mervis, Leonard Judah, 718
Meserve, Harry C., 1166
Mesick, Jane Louise, 564

Messiter, Arthur Henry, 819-820
Messler, Abraham, 121, 122, 123
Metcalf, Frank Johnson, 812-813, 823
Metcalf, George Reuben, 977, 980, 1012, 1034-1035, 1110-1111
Metcalf, Priscilla, 771
Metcalfe, Harvey, 342
Metzger, Charles H., 622
Meyer, Carl, 546
Meyer, Carl Stamm, 447-448
Meyer, H. E., 836
Meyer, Isadore S., 514-515
Meyer, Jacob Conrad, 114
Meyerhardt, M. W., 265
Meynen, Emil, 312
Micek, Adam Andrew, 1040
Michael, Oscar Stewart, 441
Michaelides, George P., 506
Michaelson, Robert Slocum, 603-604
Michaud, Regis, 882-883
Michel, Virgil George, 721-722
Micklem, Philip Arthur, 1143
Middleton, Erasmus, 44
Miesel, Walter Emanuel, 717-718
Milburn, William Henry, 164-165
Mildram, Robert Cecil, 440
Miller, Arthur Leonard, 447
Miller, Edward Waite, 153
Miller, F. De Wolfe, 251
Miller, Francis P., 1089
Miller, James E., Jr., 903
Miller, Joaquin, 918
Miller, John C., 135, 622
Miller, Kenneth Dexter, 735, 1165
Miller, (Sister) Mary Janet, 445
Miller, Minor Cline, 438
Miller, Perry, 92, 100, 101-102, 113, 128, 130, 135-136, 148, 238, 239, 244, 245, 248, 284, 556, 860, 864, 865, 866, 904, 970, 971-972, 974, 979, 1023
Miller, Randolph C., 549
Miller, Raymon Clinton, 987
Miller, Raymond Joseph, 721
Miller, Robert Moats, 373, 654, 715
Miller, Samuel, 1021
Miller, Samuel H., 753
Miller, Spencer, 719-720
Miller, William L., 1164, 1165
Miller, William Lee, 594, 1158, 1159
Miller, William McElwee, 540
Millikan, Robert Andrews, 1049
Million, Elmer Garr, 1094
Millis, Walter, 629
Mills, Barriss, 865, 866
Mills, C. Wright, 602
Mills, Edward David, 786
Mims, Edwin, 851
Mininger, Paul Everett, 440
Mitchell, Mary Hewitt, 129, 153
Mitchell, Wilfred Manlove, 1121
Mitchell, William, 173-174
Moats, Francis I., 162
Moberg, David O., 607
Mode, Peter George, 11, 55-56, 160, 161, 386, 400, 657
Modlinger, Joshua, 514
Moehler, J. A., 1039
Moehlman, Conrad Henry, 340, 586, 587, 596, 671, 675
Moellering, Ralph Luther, 640
Moffett, Thomas C., 428
Monaghan, Frank, 564-565
Mondale, Robert Lester, 1131, 1139
Monk, Maria (pseud.), 888
Monod, Victor, 568-569
Montani, Nicola A., 822
Montay, (Sister) Mary Innocenta, 446
Montgomery, Henry C., 775
Montgomery, Riley Benjamin, 1106
Moody, Dwight Lyman, 179-180
Moody, V. Alton, 163
Moody, William Revell, 180
Moomaw, Ira W., 749
Moore, Edmund Arthur, 479
Moore, Edward Caldwell, 235-236, 960-961
Moore, Frank, 45, 623

Moore, Homer H., 1149
Moore, John F., 477
Moore, John Jamison, 359
Moore, John Milton, 417-418
Moore, John Monroe, 297, 386-387
Moore, Lelia Z., 926-927
Moore, William Hoyt, 605-606
Moorland, Jesse E., 351
Moorman, Charles, 929
Morain, Lloyd, 1132
Morain, Mary, 1132
Morais, Herbert Montfort, 200, 209
Moran, John W., 1042
More, Paul Elmer, 134, 1129, 1145
Morehouse, Clifford P., 22, 952
Morgan, Carl Hamilton, 1105
Morgan, Dale L., 872
Morgan, Edmund Sears, 104-105
Morgan, Kenneth W., 531
Morgan, Robert H., 870
Morison, Samuel Eliot, 52, 57, 103, 106-107, 655, 1045
Morize, André, 565
Morrell, Charles B., 168
Morrill, Milo True, 284
Morris, Benjamin Franklin, 616
Morris, Charles W., 558
Morris, George Sylvester, 1118
Morris, Richard B., 18, 104
Morris, William S., 135
Morris, William Stephen, 1043
Morrison, Charles Clayton, 274, 394, 395, 633, 675, 704-705, 948, 1087
Morrison, Hugh Sinclair, 761, 768
Morrison, John Lee, 1052
Morrison, William Brown, 428
Morrow, Ralph Ernest, 294
Morse, Hermann Nelson, 417, 418, 420, 434, 744, 745, 746, 1104-1105
Morse, James King, 228
Morse, Lemuel, 167
Mortensen, A. Russell, 331
Morton, Robert Kemp, 586
Moseley, Joseph Edward, 937
Moss, Lemuel, 628
Moss, Leslie B., 408
Motley, John Lothrop, 75
Mott, Frank Luther, 21-22, 897-898, 1014
Mott, John Raleigh, 408, 409
Mozley, John Kenneth, 962
Muelder, Herman R., 690
Muelder, Walter G., 197, 199, 601, 731, 1022, 1111
Muelder, William, 332
Mueller, John Theodore, 428
Mugridge, Donald H., 11
Muirhead, J. H., 1115
Mukerji, Girindra, 533
Mulder, Arnold, 82
Mulder, William, 331
Muller, James Arthur, 424, 1109
Muller, Wilhelm, 569
Mullins, Edgar Young, 1095-1096
Mullins, Helene, 878
Mulvey, Mary Doris, 462
Mumford, Lewis, 760, 782
Muncy, William Luther, 183
Munger, Theodore Thornton, 1061, 1062
Munier, John David, 733
Munro, John Josiah, 580
Murdock, Kenneth Ballard, 863, 865, 1013
Murphy, (Mother) Benedict, 445
Murphy, Carol R., 1148-1149
Murphy, George Lavelle, 581
Murphy, John L., 808
Murphy, Robert Joseph, 628
Murray, J. J., 449
Murray, John, 213
Murray, John Lovell, 399
Murray, John Owen Farquhar, 1034
Murray, Robert, 311, 346
Muss-Arnolt, W., 959
Musselman, G. Paul, 313
Muzzey, David Saville, 269
Myer, John Walden, 778
Myers, Alexander John William, 435, 745
Myers, C. Kilmer, 579

Myers, Edward DeLos, 1169
Myers, Gustavus, 594
Myers, James, 715
Myrdal, Gunnar, 350-351

Nairne, Charles Murray, 1135
Nash, Arnold Samuel, 26-27, 1085, 1088
Nathan, Marvin, 520
Nathanson, Jerome, 1127
Neal, Daniel, 127
Neff, Elizabeth Clifford, 793-794
Neider, Charles, 886
Neill, Stephen Charles, 393
Nelson, E. Clifford, 493
Nelson, Eugene C., 388-389
Nelson, John O., 1000
Nelson, Lawrence Emerson, 860
Nelson, Levi, 997
Nelson, Lowry, 636
Nelson, William, 91
Nelson, William Stuart, 613
Nemmers, Erwin Esser, 821, 822
Nervig, Casper B., 337
Nettels, Curtis Putnam, 66, 657
Nettleton, Asahel, 169
Neumann, Henry, 270
Neve, Jergen L., 29, 388, 488, 1039
Nevin, John Williamson, 1005-1006, 1008
Nevins, Albert J., 414
Nevins, Allan, 113-114, 564, 707, 708
Nevius, Blake, 893
Newcomb, Rexford, 764-765, 776
Newhall, Janette E., 575-576
Newman, Albert Henry, 285, 286, 1067
Newman, John Henry, Cardinal, 1039
Newman, Louis Israel, 670-671
Newton, Isaac, 1016
Newton, Joseph Fort, 944
Newton, Richard Heber, 1146
Newton, Roger Hale, 764
Nichol, Francis David, 326, 635
Nichols, James Hastings, 23, 27, 483
Nichols, Jeannette P., 56-57
Nichols, Robert Hastings, 1100
Nichols, Roy F., 56-57, 561
Nicholson, Marjorie H., 242
Niebuhr, H. Richard, 64, 310-311, 607, 694-695, 1081, 1089, 1091, 1105
Niebuhr, Reinhold, 396-397, 553, 560-561, 601, 639, 700, 1082, 1089-1090, 1164, 1168
Nield, Jonathan, 895
Niesel, Wilhelm, 965
Nikander, Viljo K., 550
Nikhilananda, Swami, 531, 533
Ninde, Edward Summerfield, 828
Nippold, Friedrich Wilhelm Franz, 569
Nivedita, Sister. *See* Noble, Margaret E.
Nixon, Justin Wroe, 634
Noble, David W., 700
Noble, Margaret E., 533
Noble, Shlomo, 873
Nodtvedt, Magnus, 492
Nolan, Hugh J., 460
Noli, Fan S., 499
Noort, Gerardus Cornelius van, 1040
Nordhoff, Charles, 711
Norlie, Olaf Morgan, 492
Norris, Frank, 894
Norris, K. T., 899
North, Frank Mason, 712
North, William E., 444
Northcott, William Cecil, 827
Norton, Andrews, 232, 1019
Norton, Charles Eliot, 1049
Norton, (Sister) Mary Aquinas, 465
Norwood, John Nelson, 294, 691
Norwood, Percy V., 504
Notestein, Robert B., 1051
Nottingham, Elizabeth K., 163
Noyes, Morgan Phelps, 828-829
Noyes, Rufus King, 1148
Nuermberger, Ruth Ketring, 688-689
Nuess, C. J., 470, 742
Nutter, Charles S., 831

Oates, Wayne E., 1158
Oberholzer, Emil, Jr., 104
Oberndorf, Clarence P., 890
O'Brien, F. William, 590
O'Brien, Joseph L., 480
O'Brien, (Sister) Mary Agnes, 446
O'Connell, John Berthram, 790

O'Connor, Thomas F., 454
O'Connor, William Van, 906-907, 910-911, 929-930
O'Dea, Thomas F., 331
Odegard, Peter H., 651
Odell, Joseph H., 175
O'Donnell, J. H., 459
Odum, Howard W., 552, 574, 842
Ogden, Uzal, 205
O'Halloran, James Vincent, 415
Olcott, Henry Steel, 535
Oldham, J. H., 549
Olds, Marshall, 730
Oliver, John Bernard, Jr., 323-324
Oliver, Peter, 62
Olmstead, Clifton E., 64
Olsen, M. Ellsworth, 326
Olson, Adolf, 288, 1109
Olson, John Frederick, 975, 1064
Olson, Virgil A., 1109
Olsson, Karl A., 318
O'Meara, William, 560
O'Neil, Maud, 98, 146, 149
O'Neill, Edward H., 38
O'Neill, Eugene, 933
O'Neill, James Milton, 443, 477, 483, 673
Ong, Walter J., 485, 876-877, 967-968
Opatoshu, Joseph, 873
O'Rear, F. B., 448
Orendorff, Charles, 1134
Orians, G. Harrison, 867
O'Rourke, Thomas P., 461
Orr, James Edwin, 1164
Orr, John, 193
Ortegon, Samuel M., 433
Osborn, Henry Fairfield, 1099
Osborn, Ronald Edwin, 274, 552-553
Osborne, Wesley Dennis, 396
Osgood, Charles G., 781
Osgood, Herbert L., 153
O'Shea, William J., 807
Ossmann, Ronald Eugene, 397
Osterweis, Rollin G., 1093
Otis, William Bradley, 912-913
Otto, Rudolf, 1141
Otwell, John H., 1087-1088
Outler, Albert C., 559
Overbeck, Franz, 1077
Overdike, W. Darrell, 476
Overstreet, Harry A., 1156
Overton, John Henry, 139, 201
Owen, Derwyn Randolph Grier, 1047
Owsley, Frank Lawrence, 57
Oxnam, Garfield Bromley, 729, 947
Ozment, Robert Varnell, 436

Padelford, Frank W., 419
Padover, Saul K., 208-209
Page, Elizabeth Merwin, 428
Paine, Gregory L., 849
Paine, Thomas, 197, 205
Paley, William, 1011
Palfrey, Thomas Rossman, 12
Pallen, Condé B., 472-473
Palm, Frank Charles, 75
Palmer, Albert Wentworth, 432, 1160
Palmer, Elihu, 199
Palmer, George Herbert, 1118
Palmer, Phoebe, 681
Palmer, R. R., 36
Pancake, Loral W., 1067
Pangborn, Cyrus Ransom, 717
Pannabecker, Samuel Floyd, 316
Pannill, H. Burnell, 1054
Paramananda, Swami, 532
Paré, George, 458
Parente, Pietro, 1040
Park, Edwards Amasa, 982, 992, 998, 999, 1061-1062, 1102
Park, Robert E., 310
Parker, Edwin Pond, 151, 422
Parker, Everett C., 552, 581
Parker, Irene, 223
Parker, Robert Allerton, 376
Parker, Theodore, 238, 239, 690, 1022, 1150
Parker, William Fullerton, 387
Parkes, Henry Bamford, 104, 112, 130-131, 136
Parkman, Francis, 462
Parrington, Vernon Louis, 44, 106, 136, 557, 856
Parsons, Edward Lambe, 281, 803

Parsons, Talcott, 545, 602, 612-613
Parsons, Wilfred, 590
Partridge, Claire E., 906
Pascal, Roy, 69
Pascoe, Charles Frederick, 90, 353
Pashkovsky, Theophilus Nicholas, 495
Paton, H. J., 1022
Patrick, Walton R., 850
Patten, Marjorie, 744
Patterson, Robert, 1135, 1136
Patterson, William B., 574
Pattison, Mark, 137
Patton, Carl S., 754, 1068
Patton, Cornelius Howard, 405
Patton, Jacob Harris, 115-116
Patton, Kenneth Leo, 1132
Patton, Leslie Karr, 658
Patton, Robert W., 369
Patton, William W., 686
Pauck, Wilhelm, 71, 1080, 1089
Paullin, Charles Oscar, 37
Payne, Daniel A., 358
Payne, Philip Francis, 432
Peabody, Andrew Preston, 232, 1138
Peabody, Francis Greenwood, 437
Peale, Norman Vincent, 343, 1157-1158
Pearce, Roy Harvey, 922
Peck, George, 681
Peck, George O., 682
Peck, Jesse Truesdell, 60-61
Peck, William George, 719
Peden, William, 1015
Peebles, Isaac Lockhart, 405
Peel, Robert, 340
Pegis, Anton Charles, 1040
Pegues, A. W., 361
Pehotsky, Bessie Olga, 430
Pekari, Matthew Anthony, 472
Pelikan, Jaroslav, 960
Pell, John, 198
Pellman, Hubert Ray, 99
Pemberton, Prentiss Lovell, 548, 605
Penick, Edwin A., Jr., 907-908
Pennepacker, J. S., 1141-1142
Pennington, Edgar Legare, 87, 91, 96, 139, 354
Penrod, James H., 886
Perkins, Haven P., 356
Perkins, Nathan, 157
Perkins, William, 968-969
Perluck, Herbert A., 102
Perry, H. Francis, 724
Perry, Ralph Barton, 100-101, 557, 1125
Perry, William Stevens, 88, 98, 276
Persons, Stow, 258, 324, 1049-1050, 1130
Perusse, Lyle F., 780
Peters, John Leland, 327, 680
Peters, Madison Clinton, 626
Petty, Orville Anderson, 406, 1112, 1141
Pfantz, Harold Winston, 340
Pfeffer, Leo, 586, 595
Pfleiderer, Otto, 962
Pfuetze, Paul E., 550
Phelan, Gerald B., 595
Phelan, Macum, 33
Phelan, Thomas P., 625-626
Phelps, Elizabeth Stuart, 868, 889, 892
Phenix, Philip Henry, 438, 1046
Philipson, David, 515-516
Phillips, Charles Henry, 360, 367
Pierce, Edwin Hall, 812
Pierce, William, 79
Piercy, Josephine K., 863
Pierre, C. E., 353
Pierson, George Wilson, 565
Pierson, Roscoe M., 289
Pike, Gustavus D., 841
Pike, James, 1160
Pillsbury, Dorothy L., 815
Pinchot, Gifford, 744
Piolante, Antonio, 1040
Piper, David Roy, 390
Piper, Otto, 1077
Pipes, William H., 379
Pitt, Malcolm, 531
Pittenger, W. Norman, 281, 504, 804, 1034, 1085, 1160
Pittman, Riley Herman, 436
Pius XI, Pope, 721
Pius XII, Pope, 1043
Place, Charles Alpheus, 762, 769-770
Platner, John Winthrop, 151
Plaut, W. Gunther, 522

Plummer, Kenneth Moses, 1007
Plympton, Charles W., 562
Pochmann, Henry August, 243, 250, 1021
Podmore, Frank, 341
Poe, E. A., 918
Polack, William Gustave, 488, 490, 1036
Poling, Daniel Alfred, 634, 899
Politella, Joseph, 667
Pomfret, John E., 657
Pommer, Henry F., 904
Pond, Edwin P., 174
Pope, Liston, 551, 607, 609, 649
Porter, David Richard, 659
Porter, Dorothy Burnett, 938, 940
Porter, Harold Theodore, 1161
Porter, Noah, 134, 769, 1113, 1115
Posey, Meredith Neill, 861
Posey, Walter Brownlow, 162, 287, 424, 656, 691, 692
Post, Albert, 257
Postal, Bernard, 512
Poteat, Hubert McNeill, 835
Potter, Charles Francis, 530, 1132
Potter, Henry C., 58
Potter, Russell S., 775
Powell, Adam Clayton, Sr., 943
Powell, Edgar Payson, 1052
Powell, Luther Phillip, 573
Powell, T. R., 673
Powell, Walter A., 284
Power, (Sister) Mary James, 912, 927
Powers, George Cornelius, 414
Powers, Grant, 173
Powers, William J. P., 463
Pratt, J. B., 1075
Pratt, James Bissett, 527, 796, 1141, 1153-1154
Pratt, John Barnes, 828
Pratt, Waldo Selden, 810, 816
Preece, Harold, 337
Prentiss, George Lewis, 1108
Preston, John, 967, 969
Preus, Johan Carl Keyser, 421
Price, Harry, 341
Priestley, Joseph, 1011
Priestly, Herbert Ingram, 80
Prime, Samuel Irenaeus, 165-166
Prince, LeBaron Bradford, 766
Prince, Thomas, Jr., 120, 152
Puckett, Garnett E., 286
Puckett, Newbell N., 378-379
Purcell, Richard Joseph, 114
Purviance, Levi, 161
Pusey, Nathan M., 1169
Putnam, Alfred Porter, 916
Putz, Louis J., 457
Pyper, George Dollinger, 833

Quaife, Milo M., 334
Qualben, Lars Pederson, 487
Qualey, Carlton C., 492
Quigley, Hugh, 888
Quillian, William Fletcher, 1142
Quinby, Hosea, 580
Quinn, Arthur Hobson, 881, 932
Quinn, Patrick F., 248
Quint, A. H., 170

Radhakrishnan, J., 549
Raeusch, Carl F., 206-207
Ragan, Allen Edgar, 51
Rago, Henry, 877
Ramsey, John, 732
Ramsey, R. Paul, 135, 981, 1084, 1121
Rand, Benjamin, 202
Randall, John H., Jr., 185
Randall, John Herman, 342-343, 1139, 1141
Ranke, Leopold von, 71
Raphing, Aaron Henry, 747
Ratcliff, John M., 1029-1030
Rathbun, Frederic G., 844
Ratner, Joseph, 1140, 1168
Rauschenbusch, Walter, 703-704
Raven, Charles Earle, 710, 1069
Raven-Hart, H., 52
Ray, Mary Augustina, 474
Raymond, Andrew VanVranken, 51
Raymond, Charles A., 378
Rayner, Menzies, 172
Read, Conyers, 77
Read, Herbert Edward, 755
Reckitt, Maurice B., 705

Reddick, De Witt Carter, 449
Redding, Jay Saunders, 940-941
Redford, Albert H., 294
Redford, M. E., 328
Redgrove, Herbert Stanley, 241
Reed, Andrew, 60, 566
Reed, Oscar Ferguson, 328
Reed, Richard Clark, 349-350
Reed, Thomas B., 708
Reese, Curtis Williford, 235, 1131, 1132
Reese, Lawrence M., 578
Reeves, Floyd W., 450
Reeves, Jeremiah Bascom, 826
Reichert, Irving Frederick, 518
Reid, Ira De A., 367, 612
Reid, J. M., 420
Reid, Thomas, 995-996
Reiser, Oliver Leslie, 1135
Reisman, David, 574
Relly, James, 212-213, 1028
Remy, Jules, 332
Renton, Margaret, 632-633
Reu, Johann, Michael, 71
Revesz, E., 76
Reynolds, Edward D., 365
Rhoades, Donald H., 986
Rhodes, Arnold B., 336
Rhodes, Daniel Durham, 115
Rian, Edwin Harold, 302, 665, 1100
Ribalow, Harold U., 872, 874
Rice, David, 161
Rice, Edwin Wilbur, 441
Rice, Madeleine Hooke, 692-693
Rice, Otis Radcliffe, 637
Rice, Wallace DeGroot Cecil, 1148
Rice, William C., 810
Rich, Mark, 579, 747, 749
Richards, Bernard G., 515
Richards, George, 1086
Richards, George Warren, 24, 1009, 1084, 1108
Richards, Henry Melchior Muhlenberg, 625
Richards, John, 540
Richards, Thomas Cole, 401
Richards, William Arthur, 1111
Richardson, Alice Marion, 825
Richardson, Cyril, 23
Richardson, Ernest Cushing, 20, 21
Richardson, Harry VanBuren, 380
Richardson, Robert, 289
Richardson, Robert D., 1066
Riches, Phyllis M., 37-38
Riddle, Donald W., 1058
Rider, Fremont, 42-43
Rider, George Thomas, 915
Rider, R. P., 424
Ridgely, Helen West, 773
Riegal, O. W., 334
Riegler, Gordon Arthur, 696
Riggs, R. M., 328
Riggs, Stephen Return, 425
Rightmyer, Nelson Waite, 94, 95, 97
Riley, Arthur J., 463
Riley, Benjamin Franklin, 287, 361
Riley, Isaac Woodbridge, 44, 196, 199, 257, 986, 1054
Rimius, Heinrich, 119
Rines, Edward Francis, 768-769
Ringe, Donald A., 926
Rippy, Mark Leo, 579
Rischin, Moses, 508
Ritter, Richard H., 792
Ritter, William E., 1049
Robbins, Howard Chandler, 828, 830
Robbins, Samuel D., 249
Roberson, Charles H., 1099
Roberts, Brigham H., 331
Roberts, David E., 262-263, 1156
Roberts, Guy L., 579
Roberts, J. Russell, 240
Roberts, Millard G., 871
Roberts, Peter, 453
Roberts, Preston A., Jr., 931-932
Roberts, Richard, 169
Roberts, Windsor Hall, 1049
Robertson, Archibald Thomas, 273
Robertson, Archie, 337
Robertson, Duncan, 1091
Robertson, Frank C., 333, 872
Robertson, Hector M., 602
Robertson, John Mackinnon, 193, 255-256

Robinson, Alfred, 815
Robinson, Elmo Arnold, 216-217
Robinson, Henry Morton, 878
Robinson, William, 1081
Roche, Richard J., 369
Rockwell, William Walker, 24, 26, 1106
Rodeheaver, Homer Alvan, 836-837
Roden, Robert F., 932
Roe, Edward P., 890
Roemer, Theodore, 457, 464
Rogers, Arthur Kenyon, 1075, 1109, 1120
Rohne, J. Magnus, 492
Rohrer, Mary E., 641
Rohrer, Peter Lester, 641
Rolland, Romain, 532
Romig, Edgar Franklin, 122
Rooney, William Joseph, 853, 919-920
Roos, Frank J., Jr., 774
Roos, Frank John, 758, 767, 775
Root, Robert, 613-614
Roscoe, James Ernest, 1102
Rosenbach, Abraham Simon Wolf, 507
Rosenberg, Ralph P., 12
Rosenthal, Henry M., 548, 1130
Roskolenko, Harry, 930
Rosmarin, Aaron, 514
Rosner, Christian, 821-822
Ross, A. Hastings, 101
Ross, E. Denison, 539
Ross, James, 164
Ross, Murray G., 578
Rossiter, Clinton, 557, 591
Rosten, Leo, 33-34
Roth, G. L., 922-923
Rothan, Emmet Herman, 472
Rothenstein, John Ernest, 458
Rotnem, Victor W., 598
Roulin, Eugene Augustin, 789, 792-793
Rouse, Michael Francis, 369-370
Rouse, Ruth, 393
Rowe, Henry Kalloch, 41, 63, 67, 743, 1107
Rowe, John, 466
Rowland, Stanley J., Jr., 1167
Roy, Ralph, 653
Royce, Josiah, 242, 1120
Roz, Firmin, 568
Rudisill, Dorus Paul, 983
Ruetinik, Herman Julius, 304
Runes, Dagobert D., 1123
Runyan, Mary Edith, 1119
Rupp, Ernest Gordon, 77
Rupp, Israel Daniel, 31-32
Rush, Benjamin, 1014
Rusk, R. L., 563
Russ, William A., 476
Russell, Daniel James, 360
Russell, Elbert, 319, 320
Russell, John Dale, 450
Russo, Paul Gia, 644
Rust, William C., 528
Ryan, Charles James, 534, 535
Ryan, John A., 479, 733-734
Ryan, Lee W., 565
Ryback, Martin B., 516
Rylance, Joseph Hine, 1136-1137
Ryrie, Charles Caldwell, 575
Rywell, Martin, 510

Sabine, Lorenzo, 45
Sachar, Abraham, 509
Sachar, Howard M., 509, 510
Sachse, Julius Friedrich, 120, 313, 315, 818
Sadlowski, Erwin L., 793
St. John, Burton, 400
Salpeter, Harry, 1129
Salter, William Mackintire, 268
Saltus, Edgar Everton, 1146
Sampey, John R., 55
Sampson, Ashley, 851
Sanders, Joel Pilant, 1154
Sanders, Paul S., 142, 387
Sanderson, Ross Warren, 715, 737-738, 741
Sanford, Charles L., 926
Sanford, Elias B., 383-384
Sanger, Homer F., 451
Sankey, Ira David, 836
Santayana, George, 1130, 1145
Sanville, George Washington, 837
Sarma, Dittakavi S., 534
Sasse, Hermann, 570
Satin, Joseph Henry, 1166
Satprakashananda, Swami, 533
Savage, James, 43
Savage, Minot Judson, 234, 1020, 1056

Savelle, Max, 66, 81, 206
Sawyer, Edwin Albert, 314
Scally, (Sister) Mary Anthony, 940
Scambler, J. H., 281
Scarborough, L. R., 1108
Schachner, Nathan, 675
Schafer, Thomas Anton, 982, 983
Schaeffer, Charles Edmund, 421
Schaff, David Schley, 24, 61, 1008
Schaff, Philip, 9, 28, 29, 44, 46, 58, 69, 75, 174, 914, 1005, 1007-1008
Schantz, Bradford Torrey, 198-199
Schappes, Morris Urman, 509-510
Schaub, Edward L., 1153
Scheeben, Matthias Joseph, 1041
Schem, Alexander Jacob, 28, 30
Schenck, Lewis B., 435
Schiavo, Giovanni, 472
Schiffman, Joseph, 702
Schilpp, Paul Arthur, 1074, 1075-1076, 1127, 1130
Schlegel, Dorothy B., 191
Schleiter, Frederick, 548
Schlesinger, Arthur M., 56, 522, 695
Schlesinger, Arthur M., Jr., 480, 593, 706
Schmauk, Theodore Emanuel, 489
Schmid, Calvin Flessner, 305-306, 388
Schmidlin, Joseph, 410
Schmidt, George P., 657
Schmidt, Herbert H., 487
Schmiedeler, Edgar, 466
Schmitt, Gladys, 897
Schmitz, Charles Henry, 581, 582
Schmucker, Samuel Simon, 171, 382, 1036
Schneider, Carl Edward, 305, 432
Schneider, Carol, 204, 1031
Schneider, Herbert Wallace, 62-63, 66, 100, 127, 130, 196, 204, 225, 253, 608, 811, 986, 989, 1017, 1018, 1031, 1050, 1054, 1111, 1113, 1116, 1120, 1125, 1163
Schneider, Louis, 1159
Schneider, Robert Edward, 1137-1138
Schofield, Charles Edwin, 295, 297
Scholes, Percy Alfred, 816
Schomburg, Arthur A., 940
Schroeder, Mary Agnes (Tynan), 582
Schroll, Agnes Claire, 721
Schrott, Lambert, 471
Schultz, Arthur R., 243
Schultze, A., 314
Schumacher, Henry, 722
Schurman, Jacob Gould, 1148
Schuyler, Joseph B., 470-471
Schuyler, Montgomery, 774, 779
Schwalm, Vernon Franklin, 656
Schwarz, J. C., 46
Schwehn, W. W., 346
Schweitzer, Albert, 1078
Schwiebert, Ernest George, 72
Scotford, John Ryland, 417, 785, 787, 792
Scott, Leland H., 1027
Scott, Nathan A., Jr., 852, 855-856, 911, 929
Scott, R. B. Y., 605
Scouller, James Brown, 301
Scriven, George R., 94-95
Scudder, Vida D., 711-712
Scully, Vincent Joseph, 782
Scully, Vincent J., Jr., 762
Seabury, Samuel, 1032
Searles, Herbert Leon, 661
Sears, Charles Hatch, 736, 737
Sears, Clara Endicott, 249, 326
Sears, Laurence, 197, 199
Sears, M., 1022, 1111
See, Ruth Douglas, 707
Seebach, Margaret Rebecca Hines, 430
Seeger, Alan, 918
Seeger, Charles, 838
Seeley, John, 268
Seidman, A. B., 583
Seifert, Harvey Joseph Daniel, 642
Seiler, William H., 93, 94
Seipt, Allen Anders, 833
Selbie, John A., 5
Selby, Thomas Gunn, 866
Selden, Charles Albert, 405
Seldes, Gilbert, 311

Sellars, Roy Wood, 1131, 1139-1140
Sellers, Horace B., 672
Senaud, Auguste, 391
Servetus, Michael, 219
Sewry, Charles Louis, 475
Sexton, George, 1143
Sexton, John E., 458
Seybolt, Robert F., 655
Seymour, Flora Warren, 429
Shambaugh, Bertha, 324
Shanks, Caroline L., 685
Shannon, James P., 466
Sharp, Frank Arthur, 385
Sharp, John K., 458
Sharpe, Dores Robinson, 704
Sharpless, Isaac, 319, 321
Shaughnessy, Gerald, 471
Shaver, Lillie Terrell, 814
Shaw, J. B. F., 362
Shaw, Plato Ernest, 327, 503
Shaw, Thomas Shuler, 868
Shea, John Dawson Gilmary, 456, 465-466
Shea, Leon Martin, 923
Shearer, Donald C., 455-456
Shedd, Clarence Prouty, 658, 660-661
Sheed, Francis J., 1042
Sheen, Fulton John, 413, 617, 634, 1042, 1110, 1157
Sheldon, Charles M., 893
Sheldon, Henry Clay, 256, 344, 1066, 1135
Sheldon, Walter Lorenzo, 266
Shelling, Richard I., 354
Shepard, Charles, 42
Shepard, Odell, 249, 860
Shepard, Thomas, 971
Shepherd, Massey H., Jr., 281
Shepherd, Massey Hamilton, 803-804
Shepherd, T. B., 144
Shepherd, William Robert, 36
Sherman, Stuart P., 847-848
Sherrill, Charles H., 565
Sherrill, Lewis Joseph, 448
Sherwin, Oscar, 620, 685
Shideler, Emerson Wayne, 318
Shields, Currin, 483
Shier, George Warren, 941-942
Shinn, George Wolfe, 783
Shippey, Frederick Alexander, 609, 738, 741
Shipton, Clifford K., 49, 107-108, 556, 655
Shirk, Evelyn, 1118
Shockley, Martin, 908-909
Shoemaker, Samuel M., Jr., 168
Short, Ernest Henry, 759
Short, Howard E., 291, 383
Shotwell, Louisa Rossiter, 418
Shriver, William Payne, 418
Shuck, Emerson Clayton, 886
Shull, Gordon Lichty, 588
Shurter, Robert L., 892
Shuster, George Nauman, 485
Sibbes, Richard, 969
Sibley, John Langdon, 49
Sibley, Mulford Quickert, 644
Siegfried, André, 568
Sienkiewicz, Henry K., 896
Silcox, Clarence Edwin, 594-595
Silver, James Wesley, 629
Simkins, Francis Butler, 611, 1093
Simmel, Georg, 546
Simms, James Meriles, 361
Simms, Paris Marion, 615
Simon, John Smith, 143
Simon, Yves R., 560
Simonitsch, Ronald Gerard, 446
Simons, Minot, 1020
Simpson, A. B., 329
Simpson, Alan, 99
Simpson, S., 75
Sims, David H., 370
Sims, Mary Sophia Stevens, 577-578
Sinclair, Upton, 895
Singer, Anna M., 704
Singleton, George A., 358-359
Singmaster, J. A., 173
Sisk, Glenn N., 379
Sixbey, George L., 925-926
Sizer, Theodore, 771, 775
Skinner, Clarence Russell, 213-214, 560, 801, 1029
Skirven, Percy G., 95
Sklare, Marshall, 515, 521-522
Slack, Elvira, 859

Slater, John Rothwell, 852
Slosser, Gaius Jackson, 393
Slosson, Edwin E., 665
Small, Albion W., 608
Small, Charles Herbert, 33
Smalley, Stimson Ronald, 1088
Smeale, Joseph, 849
Smedes, Lewis B., 1034
Smedes, Susan Dabney, 355
Smet, Pierre Jean de, 465
Smidt, Kristian, 928
Smirnoff, Eugene K., 497
Smith, Alson J., 651-652
Smith, Bernard, 1015
Smith, C. Henry, 316
Smith, Chard Powers, 101
Smith, Donald George, 945
Smith, Elmer Lewis, 316-317
Smith, Frederick Harold, 527
Smith, George D., 1039
Smith, Gerald Birney, 5, 44, 1071
Smith, H. M., 77
Smith, H. Shelton, 11, 238, 1088
Smith, Harvey Partridge, 765
Smith, Henry Augustine, 827
Smith, Henry Boynton, 58
Smith, Henry Lester, 669
Smith, Horace Wemyss, 204
Smith, John E., 1121
Smith, John Sylvester, 1023
Smith, John Talbot, 458
Smith, Joseph, 331
Smith, Justin Almerin, 287
Smith, Lewis, 974, 1112
Smith, Payson, 668
Smith, Preserved, 69-70
Smith, Ralph Dunning, 950
Smith, Rockwell Carter, 745, 748
Smith, Rodney ("Gipsy"), 181
Smith, Roland Cotton, 944
Smith, Samuel Stanhope, 1047-1048
Smith, Seymour A., 661
Smith, Sherman Merritt, 667
Smith, Stephen Rensselaer, 216
Smith, Thomas Vernor, 1122, 1145-1146
Smith, Timothy Lawrence, 327, 678, 680-681, 682, 683, 686, 689, 690, 694, 697, 735
Smith, Vincent Edward, 637
Smith, Wilbur M., 958, 1100
Smith, William, 204
Smith, William Carlson, 526
Smith, William Moorehead, 6
Smith, Winifred, 933
Smithson, R. J., 72
Smoot, Dan, 617
Smucker, Donovan Ebersole, 704
Smylie, James Hutchinson, 605
Smyth, Egbert G., 984-985
Smyth, Newman, 725, 1012, 1056, 1062
Smythe, Augustine T., 842
Smythe, Dallas W., 552, 581
Sneath, Elias Hershey, 632
Snell, Huey E., 581
Snethen, Abraham, 164
Snodgrass, Ernest L., 1140
Snow, Sydney Bruce, 635
Snyder, Louis Leo, 185-186
Snyder, Ross, 581
Soharb, M. A., 540
Soltes, Mordecai, 509
Sonen, Robert W., 236-237
Sonne, Niels Henry, 14, 276, 1094
Sonneck, Oscar George Theodore, 816
Sonnenschein, William Swan, 958-959
Soper, David Wesley, 41, 274, 619-620, 1085, 1147
Sorenson, Virginia, 333, 872
Soroka, Leonid, 506
Sorokin, Pitirim A., 550
Southall, Eugene Portlette, 355
Southard, W. P., 930
Spaeth, Adolph, 1037
Spalding, John Lancaster, 460, 1149
Spalding, Martin J., 464
Spangenburg, Augustus Gottlieb, 140
Spann, Anna Louise, 321
Spann, Edwin R., 594
Spann, J. Richard, 1143-1144
Spaude, Paul W., 488
Spaulding, Helen F., 579
Speare, Eva Augusta (Clough), 771-772

Speer, Robert Elliott, 406
Speer, William, 158
Spell, Lota M., 814, 815
Spence, Thomas H., Jr., 298, 301
Spence, Thomas Hugh, 22
Spencer, Claude Elbert, 289
Spencer, Harry C., 431
Spencer, Theodore, 932
Sperry, Willard Learoy, 63, 668, 795, 1086, 1162-1163
Spiers, Edward Francis, 445
Spiller, Robert E., 856
Spindell, Verne A., 1115
Spinka, Matthew, 69, 495
Spinks, F. Pierce, 536
Spitz, Leon, 861-862
Sprague, William Buell, 37, 44, 45-46, 123, 170, 172, 177-178, 231
Spring, Gardiner, 177, 422
Springer, Francis, 171
Squires, Radcliffe, 930
Squires, Walter Albion, 437
Srole, Leo, 453
Stace, Walter Terence, 1140, 1145
Stach, John Frederick, 447
Stacy, Nathaniel, 216
Stafford, Russell Henry, 741
Stafford, Thomas Albert, 792
Staiger, C. Bruce, 692
Stamouli, A. A., 498
Stanford, Donald E., 922
Stanley, Reva, 334
Stanton, Robert Livingston, 626-627
Stapleton, Ammon, 295
Starr, Edward Caryl, 286
Stead, William T., 893
Steadman, John M., 861
Stearns, Helen R., 438
Steele, George Renwick, 669
Steeves, Dimmock, 576
Stegner, Wallace, 653
Stein, William B., 867, 902, 905
Steinbeck, John, 908
Steinberg, Abraham H., 874
Steinberg, Milton, 519, 520
Steiner, Edward Alfred, 453
Steiner, (Mrs.) Lee R., 335, 536
Stelzle, Charles, 175, 552, 711, 715, 727, 728, 1103
Stephen, Leslie, 39, 186
Stephens, Alfonzo Theodore, 95-96
Stephens, John Vant, 300, 301
Stephenson, George Malcolm, 79, 108, 491
Stephenson, Harold William, 833
Sternberg, Levi, 171
Steuart, Justin, 651
Steuermann, Walter E., 338
Stevens, Abel, 690
Stevens, George E., 371
Stevens, James Stacy, 860
Stevens, Raymond Bradley, 656
Stevenson, Arthur Linwood, 829
Stevenson, Robert, 819
Steward, Theophilus Gould, 367
Stewart, Betty, 418
Stewart, Dugald, 996
Stewart, George, 442
Stewart, Randall, 855, 858, 865, 866
Stewart, Robert Laird, 423
Stewart, Walter Sinclair, 286, 424
Stewart, William Rhinelander, 779, 820
Stiansen, P., 288
Stibitz, Edward Earle, 319, 870
Stocker, Harry Emilius, 421
Stoddard, Solomon, 129, 134
Stoffer, Bryan Sewall, 534
Stokes, Anson Phelps, 51, 585, 667, 1103
Stone, Edwin Martin, 212
Stonehouse, Ned Bernard, 302, 1101
Stoops, Dashiell J., 550
Storer, James Wilson, 619
Storr, V. F., 962
Stowe, Harriet Beecher, 892, 902
Stowe, Lyman Beecher, 178
Stowe, Walter Herbert, 26, 91, 278, 280, 624-625, 1032
Stowell, Jay Samuel, 369, 420
Strachan, Malcolm, 440
Stratton, G. M., 1120
Straus, Roger Williams, 555
Strauss, Preston Franklin, 179
Streit, Karl, 36
Streit, Robert, 412

Strickland, Arthur B., 172
Strickland, Reba Carolyn, 583-584
Strickland, W. P., 163
Stromberg, Roland N., 224
Strong, Augustus Hopkins, 917
Strong, Josiah, 474, 701, 736
Strong, Nathan, 157
Strong, William Ellsworth, 402
Stroup, Herbert Hewitt, 338
Stroupe, Henry Smith, 22
Strout, Cushing, 975
Stuart, Moses, 998
Stuber, Stanley Irving, 309
Suckow, Ruth, 902
Sugden, Edward H., 144
Sullivan, W. R. Washington, 264
Summers, Clyde W., 598
Sunday, William Ashley ("Billy"), 180
Sundt, Edwin Einar, 745, 747
Surman, Charles, 282
Suter, John Wallace, 281-282, 398, 803
Suter, Rufus O., Jr., 986
Sutherland, Robert, 372
Swan, Charles Lundeen, 609
Swan, Howard, 821
Swancara, Frank, 674
Swander, John I., 1008-1009
Swartwout, Edgerton, 772
Swearingen, Tilford Tippett, 438
Sweet, William Warren, 17, 47, 63, 160, 162, 164, 183, 194, 283, 286, 292, 293-294, 299, 551-552, 555, 627, 648, 655, 656, 657, 684, 689
Swenson, David Ferdinand, 1083
Swift, David Everett, 975
Swift, Lindsay, 623, 950
Swiggert, Peter, 906
Swing, Raymond, 653
Sylvester, Harry, 885
Symington, Thomas Alexander, 1155
Symmes, Thomas, 824

Tait, M. D. C., 1129
Talbot, Francis Xavier, 880-881, 899, 916
Tallmadge, Thomas Eddy, 760
Talmage, James Edward, 761
Talman, Simon Arthur, 1160-1161
Talton, William C., 157-158
Tani, Henry N., 578
Tanis, Edward J., 310
Tannenbaum, Frank, 580
Tarbox, Increase Niles, 158, 986
Tate, Allen, 877, 918-919, 1094
Tauber, Maurice Falcolm, 899
Tawney, Richard H., 603
Taylor, Alrutheus A., 357
Taylor, Alva W., 727
Taylor, Douglas, 908
Taylor, Edward, 921, 922
Taylor, George B., 683
Taylor, Graham, 715
Taylor, Jeremy, 138
Taylor, Marvin J., 441-442
Taylor, Nathaniel W., 996
Taylor, Stephen Earl, 408
Tcherikower, Elias, 513-514
Teener, James W., 345
Telford, John, 144
Teller, Woolsey, 1149
Temple, Sydney Absalom, 1031
Tennent, Gilbert, 124, 126, 382
Terrien, Samuel, 1057
Terry-Thompson, Arthur C., 364
Tewksbury, Donald G., 655-656
Thacher, Peter, 824
Thacker, Ernest W., 716-717
Thaman, Mary Patrice, 22
Thayer, Thomas Baldwin, 1029
Thayer, Vivian Trow, 671
Thelen, Mary Frances, 1088
Theobald, Stephen L., 364
Theophilus, Anton, 581
Thielen, James A., 927-928
Thiessen, John Caldwell, 401
Thiry, Paul, 785
Thom, William Taylor, 115
Thomas, Allen Clapp, 319, 688
Thomas, Benjamin Platt, 689
Thomas, Edgar Garfield, 361
Thomas, Elbert Duncan, 618

Thomas, Evan Edward, 615
Thomas, George Finger, 550, 909-910, 961
Thomas, Isaac L., 362
Thomas, J. Wesley, 243
Thomas, Milton Halsey, 47, 49
Thomas, Wendell Marshall, 529, 532
Thomas, William I., 473
Thompson, A. E., 430
Thompson, Arthur W., 18
Thompson, Bard, 71, 75
Thompson, Charles Lemuel, 80, 182
Thompson, Clarence Bertrand, 724
Thompson, Claude Holmes, 679-680
Thompson, Ernest Trice, 301, 342, 421, 946
Thompson, Henry Post, 123
Thompson, James Westfall, 67-68, 75
Thompson, Joseph P., 686, 985
Thompson, Kenneth Leroy, 438
Thompson, Lawrance Roger, 904
Thompson, Manley Haun, 1126
Thompson, Ralph, 850
Thompson, Robert Ellis, 728
Thompson, William Oxley, 1106
Thoms, Craig S., 724-725
Thorning, Francis Joseph, 592-593
Thornton, John Wingate, 623
Thornwell, James H., 355
Thorp, Willard, 196, 197, 657, 856, 902
Thurau, Robert Henry, 442
Thurman, Howard, 843, 844
Thurneysen, Edward, 1083
Thwaites, Reuben Gold, 462, 465, 563-564
Tichy, Henrietta, 859
Tiffany, Charles C., 154
Tillich, Paul, 960, 1083, 1091, 1142
Tilson, Charles Everett, 613
Timasheff, N. S., 501
Tinckom-Fernandez, W. G., 503
Tindal, Matthew, 190, 192, 1011
Tingelstad, Oscar Adolf, 666
Titus, F. E., 1135
Tobin, James Edward, 916
Tocqueville, Alexis de, 567
Toland, John, 189-190
Tolles, Frederick B., 149, 245, 321
Tollino, John V., 472
Tolman, W. H., 678
Torbet, Robert G., 286
Torpey, William George, 597, 671-672
Torrey, Norman Lewis, 191
Toth, W., 76
Tourgee, Albion W., 893
Towell, Sherman E., 1095
Towlson, Clifford W., 140
Towner, Milton Carsley, 660
Townsend, Harvey G., 979, 981, 986, 1118, 1120, 1139
Townsend, Luther Tracy, 407
Townshend, George, 540
Tracy, Joseph, 152, 402
Tralle, Henry Edward, 787
Trawick, Arcadius McSwain, 737
Treacy, G. C., 721
Trefz, E. K., 945
Treharne, R. F., 36
Tremonti, Joseph B., 446
Trent, William Peterfield, 44, 252-253, 847-848
Trice, Allison Norman, 1099
Trine, Ralph Waldo, 343-344
Trinterud, Leonard John, 23, 149, 299, 656
Troeltsch, Ernst, 545
Trott, Norman L., 715
Trumbull, Benjamin, 127
Trumbull, Henry Clay, 440
Tucker, Robert Leonard, 128-129, 138
Tucker, Samuel Marion, 912
Tuckerman, Henry T., 563
Tuckerman, Joseph, 696
Tufts, James H., 978-979
Tufts, John, 824
Tulga, Chester Earl, 1101
Tupper, Henry Allen, 400
Tupper, Kerr Boyce, 285-286

Turkevich, Leontiĭ (Leonid) G., 504, 505
Turnbull, Agnes, 901
Turnbull, Ralph G., 945
Turner, Frederick Jackson, 159
Tuttle, Harold Saxe, 437
Twain, Mark, 894
Tweedy, Henry Hallam, 51
Twitchell, J. E., 170
Tyerman, Luke, 138, 144, 147
Tying, Stephen H., 171
Tyler, Alice Felt, 323, 683-684
Tyler, Bennet, 178
Tyler, Moses Coit, 863
Tyler, Randon Hebbard, 597
Tyler, Royal H., 697

Udy, James Stuart, 404-405
Uhden, Hermann Ferdinand, 129
Ulbrich, Armand Henry, 884
Umbeck, Sharvy Greiner, 490
Unamuno, Miguel de, 1078, 1082
Underhill, Evelyn, 796-797
Underwood, Benjamin Franklin, 1150
Underwood, John Curtis, 891
Underwood, Kenneth W., 573
Upham, Thomas C., 681
Uphaus, Willard E., 438
Upjohn, Everard Miller, 778
Upjohn, Hobart Brown, 769
Upjohn, Richard, 778
Upson, Stephen H. R., 495
Utter, David, 175

Vaiden, Thomas J., 584
Vail, James G., 646
Vail, Robert William Glenroie, 950
Van Baalen, Jan Karel, 337, 536
Vance, James Scott, 478
Vance, Silas William, 244
Vanderbilt, Paul, 756
Vanderlaan, Eldred C., 1098
Vander Velde, Lewis G., 627
Vandiver, Edward P., Jr., 209-210
Van Doren, Carl Clinton, 847-848, 881, 985
Van Dusen, Henry Pitney, 263, 394, 409, 439, 645
Van Dyke, Henry, 629, 889
Van Dyke, Henry Jackson, 965
Van Dyke, Joseph Smith, 1052
Van Halsema, Dick Lucas, 993
Van Kirk, Hiram, 291
VanKirk, Walter William, 639
VanNess, Thomas, 231
Van Rensselaer, Mariana G., 763
Van Trump, James D., 779-780
Van Tyne, Claude H., 622
Van Vleck, Joseph, 572
Vedder, Henry C., 72, 711
Venn, John A., 52
Verkuyl, Gerrit, 575
Vibert, Faith, 353
Vickery, O. W., 908
Vidler, Alexander Roper, 1144
Vidler, William, 212
Villaume, William J., 741
Virkus, Frederick Adams, 43
Visser't Hooft, W. A., 549
Vitelli, James Robert, 869
Vivekananda, Swami, 531
Vlastos, Gregory, 605
Vogel, Ettie Madeline, 469
Vogel, Stanley Morton, 243, 1021
Vogt, Von Ogden, 754, 780, 797
Voigt, Gilbert Paul, 856-857, 879, 885, 917
Vollmar, Edward R., 455
Von Wiese, Leopold, 310
Voss, Carl Hermann, 717

Wach, Joachim, 311, 546-547, 567-568
Wadsworth, Daniel, 152
Wadsworth, Lincoln Burdette, 736
Wagenknecht, Edward Charles, 881
Waggoner, Hyatt Howe, 855, 919
Wagoner, Walter R., 606
Waite, Edward F., 599
Wakeley, J. B., 146
Waldrop, W. Earl, 617

Walker, George Leon, 134, 146, 970
Walker, Leslie J., 1128
Walker, Robert Sparks, 426-427
Walker, Williston, 74, 127, 283, 798, 972-973, 1066
Wallace, Charles Longworth, 950
Wallace, David Alexander, 972
Wallace, Lew, 896
Wallace, Philip B., 772
Waller, George M., 108
Wallington, Nellie Urner, 760
Walter, Erich Albert, 661-662
Walters, Raymond, 818
Warburton, Clark, 651
Warburton, William, 201, 1011
Ward, Alfred Dudley, 600
Ward, Christopher, 110
Ward, Harry Frederick, 600, 649, 727
Ward, J. H., 276
Ward, Leo Richard, 443, 484, 485
Wardlaw, Ada, 644
Ware, Charles C., 290
Ware, Charles Pickard, 841
Ware, William, 896
Ware, William Rotch, 768
Warfel, Harry Redcay, 883
Warfield, Benjamin Breckinridge, 680, 965, 1003
Waring, Luther Hess, 727
Warner, Joel Wellman, 143
Warner, Lucien C., 387
Warner, W. Lloyd, 453, 609
Warner, Susan, 889
Warren, Austin, 108-109, 250, 866
Warren, Harold Collins, 665-666
Warren, Robert Penn, 930
Warren, Sidney, 260
Warrington, A. P., 536
Warrington, James, 823
Washington, Booker T., 349
Wasson, Woodrow Wilson, 619
Watkin, William Ward, 786
Watkins, Hortense, 927
Watson, E. L. Grant, 890-891
Watters, R. E., 905
Waugh, Dorothy, 927
Waxman, Meyer, 510, 514
Waxman, Mordecai, 515
Wayland, Francis, 1114
Wearmouth, Robert Featherstone, 143
Weatherford, W. D., 350, 374
Weatherhead, Leslie D., 345
Weathers, Willie T., 921
Weaver, R. M., 1094
Weaver, Raymond, 1023
Weaver, Rufus Washington, 616
Webb, [Muhammad] Alexander Russell, 537
Webb, Ina T., 821
Webb, Muriel, 579
Webb, Robert, 579
Webber, Christopher L., 713-714
Webber, Frederick Roth, 787
Weber, Edward Joseph, 789, 792
Weber, Julius A., 59
Weber, Max, 602
Weber, N. A., 469-470
Wecter, Dixon, 961-962, 1163
Weddell, Suzanne E., 421
Wedel, Theodore Otto, 395, 396, 948
Weed, Marguerite, 927
Weeks, Stephen B., 592, 689
Wegelin, Oscar, 880, 912
Weigel, Gustave, 595, 1042
Weigle, Luther Allan, 64, 560, 674
Weinberg, Albert K., 617
Weiner, Philip P., 1125
Weinlick, John Rudolf, 382
Weir, William Figley, 574
Weis, Frederick Lewis, 45
Weisberger, Bernard A., 183
Weiss, Charles, 306
Weiss-Rosmarin, Trude, 514
Welch, Claude, 963, 1084
Welch, Ranson Bethune, 1138
Weld, Theodore Dwight, 685
Welde, Thomas, 323
Wellek, René, 244, 1023
Weller, Philip T., 822
Wellesz, Egon, 506

Wells, George Frederick, 746
Wells, Ronald Vale, 242, 1026
Welsh, Herbert, 630
Wenger, John C., 73, 316
Wentz, Abdel Ross, 54, 488, 820, 1104, 1108
Wentz, Frederick K., 653
Werdermann, Hermann, 570
Werfel, Franz, 878
Wernecke, Herbert H., 305
Werner, Eric, 822
Werner, M. R., 334
Wertenbaker, Thomas Jefferson, 101, 127, 131, 159-160, 657, 769, 772, 773
Wesley, Charles H., 366, 380-381
Wesley, John, 140
West, Edward N., 819
West, James (pseud.), 574, 609-610
West, Ray B., 331
West, Robert Frederick, 199, 1011
West, William G., 290
West, William Garrett, 383
Westin, Gunnar, 309
Weston, M. Moran, 720
Weston, Samuel Burns, 630
Whalen, (Sister) Mary Rose Gertrude, 481
Whalen, William Joseph, 309
Wharton, Francis, 1146
Wheatley, Richard, 681
Wheeler, James M., 616
Wheeler, Joseph Mazzini, 256
Wheelwright, David Sterling, 820-821, 833
Wheildon, L. B., 673
Whicher, George Frisbie, 240
Whipple, Charles K., 172-173
Whipple, Maurine, 333, 872
Whitaker, C. H., 764
Whitaker, William, 967
White, Andrew Dickson, 1045
White, Charles L., 418-419
White, Edward Arthur, 1045
White, Eliot, 713
White, Morton G., 1126-1127
White, R. C., 22, 952
White, Walter, 941
Whitefield, George, 145, 146
Whitehead, Alfred North, 1073
Whiteman, Maxwell, 942
Whitmore, William H., 42
Whitney, Edson L., 638
Whitney, Janet Payne, 6, 319-320
Whyman, Henry C., 296-297
Whyte-Melville, George John, 896
Wickersham, James, 496
Wiederaenders, Arthur George, 272
Wieman, Henry Nelson, 1046-1047, 1071, 1072, 1075, 1082, 1084, 1086, 1092, 1110
Wiener, Philip Paul, 1048, 1054, 1139
Wiernik, Peter, 510
Wigglesworth, Michael, 864, 897
Wilbur, Earl Morse, 220, 221
Wilbur, Sybil, 339
Wilder, Amos Niven, 108, 662, 849-850, 853, 854, 910, 911, 920
Wilder, Mitchell A., 794-795
Wilder, Robert Parmelee, 403
Wilder, Thornton, 851, 879
Wilke, Harold, 637
Wilkinson, Wilfred R., 141
Wilkinson, William Cleaver, 944
Willard, Samuel, 972, 1016
Willet, J., 723-724
Willey, Basil, 186
Williams, Chancellor, 943
Williams, Daniel Day, 998, 1051, 1072, 1084, 1085, 1105
Williams, E. Virginia, 884
Williams, Francis Howard, 120
Williams, George Huntston, 26, 72, 73, 231-232, 1107
Williams, Gertrude Marvin, 535
Williams, Grace Petrie, 431
Williams, Hillman T., 716
Williams, J. Rodman, 1080-1081
Williams, John Paul, 65, 604
Williams, Mentor Lee, 903, 1046
Williams, Michael, 478, 876
Williams, Robin M., Jr., 552

Williams, Wayne C., 1099
Williamson, Geoffrey, 346
Williamson, Mary Heald, 579, 748
Williamson, Ralph, Leroy, 390
Willis, John Randolph, 422
Willis, Richard Storrs, 811
Willoughby, H. R., 1057
Willoughby, William George, 317
Willson, Lawrence, 864, 879, 974-975
Wilson, Edmund, 620-621
Wilson, Forrest, 892
Wilson, Gold Refined, 377-378
Wilson, J. Christy, 1105
Wilson, J. G., 39
Wilson, James Bright, 610
Wilson, John Moran Cochran, 727
Wilson, Karl Kenneth, 666
Wilson, Louis, 935-936
Wilson, Louis N., 1153
Wilson, P. W., 327
Wilson, Robert Sherer, 295
Wilson, Samuel Law, 854
Wilson, Thomas Benjamin, 73
Wilson, Warren Hugh, 747
Wiltsee, Herbert, 1147
Winchell, Constance M., 4, 12, 19, 20, 29, 36, 37, 42, 753, 915, 958
Winchester, C. T., 138
Winchester, Elhanan, 211-212, 1029
Winehouse, Irwin, 328-329
Winfield, Oscar Ahlenius, 1106
Winship, George P., 562
Winslow, Ola Elizabeth, 103, 112-113, 136, 769
Winsor, Justin, 82
Wintermeyer, Herbert Herman Henry, 802
Winters, Yvor, 858, 917-918, 923-924
Winthrop, John, 127
Wisbey, Herbert Andrew, Jr., 327-328
Wischnitzer, Rachel (Bernstein), 790
Wise, James Waterman, 517
Wise, John, 623, 1014-1015
Wise, Stephen Samuel, 516
Wisner, William C., 686
Withers, Frederick Clarke, 783
Witherspoon, John, 656-657, 1001, 1015
Withey, Elsie Rathburn, 761
Withey, Henry F., 761
Wittaker, Frederick William, 1074
Witte, Raymond, 466
Witte, Wayne W., 624
Wittke, Carl, 551
Wobus, Paul Albert, 421
Wolf, Edmund Jacob, 487-488
Wolf, Richard Charles, 489
Wolf, William J., 392, 620
Wolf, Simon, 627
Wolff, Samuel Lee, 45
Wollaston, William, 190, 203, 1010
Wolseley, Roland E., 953
Wolstein, Benjamin, 1140
Womer, Parley Paul, 727
Wood, Ernest, 536
Wood, R. C., 920
Wood, Ralph, 313
Woodman, Jean, 333
Woodmason, Charles, 96
Woodress, James, 848-849
Woodrow, Fred, 723
Woods, Leonard, 998
Woods, Robert A., 471
Woodson, Carter G., 350, 368, 688
Woodward, William W., 158
Woody, Thomas, 451
Woolridge, Nancy Bullock, 887
Wordsworth, John, 73
Work, John Wesley, 845
Work, Monroe N., 348
Worrell, Edward K., 437
Wouk, Herman, 514
Wright, Brooks, 526
Wright, Charles Albert, 770
Wright, Chauncey, 1049
Wright, Conrad, 227, 1017, 1027
Wright, Edward Needles, 642
Wright, Frank Lloyd, 755
Wright, George Frederick, 179
Wright, Harold Bell, 889
Wright, Louis Booker, 66, 80, 94, 551
Wright, Lyle Henry, 880

Wright, Richard R., 359
Wright, Richard R., Jr., 351
Wright, Richardson, 885
Wright, Mrs. Thomas G., 863
Wright, William K., 1155
Wyker, Mossie Allman, 575, 579
Wylie, Eugene C., 837

Xenides, J. P., 499

Yale, Cyrus, 178
Yarnale, John, 896
Yeakel, Reuben, 295
Yinger, J. Milton, 545, 547, 550, 603, 607, 649
Yoder, Donald Herbert, 387-388, 393
Yoder, Joseph W., 871
Yohannen, J. D., 247
Young, Charles A., 383
Young, Frederic H., 1024, 1139
Young, Jacqueline, 659
Young, Kimball, 333, 548-549

Zabriskie, Alexander Clinton, 138, 280, 398, 1083
Zahn, Adolf, 569-570
Zaichenko, Paul, 506
Zaturenska, Marya, 913
Zenos, Andrew Constantinides, 300
Ziegler, A. M., 173
Ziegler, Edward Krusen, 802
Ziegler, J. B., 1008
Zink, Harriet Rodgers, 860
Zinzendorf, Nicholas von, 834
Znaniecki, Florian, 473
Zollmann, Carl Frederick Gustav, 585, 672
Zumbrunnen, Albert Clay, 390-391
Zwierlein, Frederick James, 109-110
Zybura, John S., 1151